# Knowing bad and making good: Exploring consciousness of value with parents in a parenting programme

**Penny Fogg**

EdD (Educational Psychology)
School of Education
University of Sheffield

Part 2. Submitted May 2014

**List of contents**


| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Abstract | | 1 |
| **Chapter 1** | **Introduction to thesis** | 3 |
| 1.1 | Beginnings and coming to know my research questions | 3 |
| 1.2 | Defining the terms of this inquiry: value, values and ethics | 6 |
| 1.3 | Value, epistemology and reflexivity in psychology | 14 |
| 1.4 | Focus of study, parents' experience of value | 16 |
| 1.5 | Chapter summaries | 17 |
| **Chapter 2** | **A critique of 'good' parenting (how do we 'know' what's good?)** | 18 |
| 2.1 | Introduction to chapter | 19 |
| 2.2 | 'Parenting casts our whole being into uncertainty (Smith, 2011: 171)' | 19 |
| 2.3 | Cultural discourse: What is a 'good' childhood and 'good' parenting, anyway? | 25 |
| 2.4 | Psychological parenting literature: How are value purpose and personhood represented? | 30 |
| 2.4.1 | Introduction | 30 |
| 2.4.2 | Learning to behave: Social learning theory and behaviourism | 31 |
| 2.4.3 | Learning to love: the neuroscience of attachment | 33 |
| 2.4.4 | Psycho-dynamic perspectives | 41 |
| 2.4.5 | Critique of contemporary attachment paradigm | 42 |
| 2.4.6 | Living a life in complex environments | 45 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| **Chapter 3** | **Psychological theory relevant to the experience of change** | 49 |
| 3.1 | Summary of chapter content | 49 |
| 3.2 | Family therapy: cybernetics and the Milan group | 50 |
| 3.2.1 | Principles of Milan family therapy | 50 |
| 3.2.2 | Practice in the intervention examined in relation to the principles of Milan family therapy | 51 |
| Figure 2 | The staged model | 53 |
| 3.2.3 | Making sense of change: Dialogical process within and across systems | 56 |
| 3.2.4 | Knowing what's important: Destabilisation creates consciousness of value | 58 |
| 3.3 | Constructing agency and self-hood 'within the realm of meaning (Smith 2011)': writing change into systems | 59 |
| 3.3.1 | The absence of 'agency' within traditional psychological theory | 59 |
| 3.3.2 | Narrative, self-hood and experience | 59 |
| 3.3.3 | Consciousness of the 'good' as an aspect of change | 61 |
| 3.3.4 | Community: the crucible of change | 64 |
| 3.4 | Being and becoming: An ontological psychology accounting for the existence and the development of agency | 66 |
| 3.4.1 | Martin and Gillespie's theory of personhood (2010) | 66 |
| 3.4.2 | Parenting in the context of culture: to what extent does reflexivity in the intervention embrace the complexity of multiple perspectives in culture? | 68 |
| 3.5 | Dilemmas of practice: Accounting for ourselves | 71 |
| 3.5.3 | Introduction | 71 |
| 3.5.3 | Professional power | 72 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 3.5.3 | Engaging with culture: competitive claims about truth and value | 72 |
| 3.5.4 | What implications might an ontological psychology have for the EP role? | 74 |
| **Chapter 4** | **Researching experience: the ontological and epistemological issues** | 77 |
| 4.1 | Introduction: locating my practice and research within 'critical psychology' | 77 |
| 4.2 | Research which empowers those who are marginalised: facilitating the 'voice' | 80 |
| 4.3 | Researching practice: justifying 'insider' position within narrative research | 82 |
| 4.4 | Phenomenological and narrative approaches to practice and research | 85 |
| 4.4.1 | Taking a position about being human | 85 |
| 4.4.2 | Experience, selfhood and narrative | 85 |
| 4.4.3 | Phenomenology and narrative inquiry: exploring the space between a person and their world | 88 |
| 4.5 | Ideas of self which allow for agency and change through experience | 89 |
| 4.5.1 | Narrative theory and the embodied self: exploring worlds and searching for what matters. | 89 |
| 4.5.2 | Uncertainty in our 'knowledge' of selfhood gained through analysis of experience | 91 |
| 4.5.3 | A phenomenological ontology of selfhood | 92 |
| 4.6 | A phenomenological stance: ethical and empowering | 95 |
| 4.7 | Positionality in research and practice | 96 |
| 4.8 | The ontological and epistemological position of this research: critical realism | 96 |
| 4.9 | Social constructionist and critical realist positions in practice | 98 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 4.10 | Critical realism and research: generating theory within a therapeutic setting | 100 |
| **Chapter 5** | **Description of method: Theoretical rationale and procedures** | 104 |
| 5.1 | Eliciting narrative accounts | 104 |
| 5.2 | Analysis of narrative accounts | 104 |
| 5.3 | Analysis and authenticity | 107 |
| 5.4 | Validity: authenticity and fidelity by any other name | 109 |
| 5.5 | Research question | 110 |
| 5.6 | Structure of interviews | 111 |
| 5.7 | Recruitment of participants | 113 |
| 5.8 | Ethics | 114 |
| **Chapter 6** | **Analysis of accounts** | 116 |
| 6.1 | Research questions | 116 |
| 6.2 | The purpose of chapters 6 and 7 | 116 |
| 6.3 | Introduction to analysis of themes | 118 |
| 6.4 | Sally's story: first interview, over-arching narrative themes | 119 |
| 6.5 | Summary of Sally's story, organised into themes | 120 |
| 6.6 | Thematic analysis | 122 |
| 6.6.1 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'The good and the bad in relationships' | 124 |
| 6.6.2 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Contradictions and paradoxes around choice-making and responsibility, (no looking back)' | 130 |
| 6.6.3 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Troubling questions of identity (am I just being like my Mother)?' | 135 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 6.7 | Sally's story: second interview, over-arching narrative themes | 139 |
| 6.8 | Summary of Sally's account, organised into themes | 139 |
| 6.9 | Thematic analysis | 142 |
| 6.9.1 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'The search for value' | 143 |
| 6.9.2 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'The search for value undermined' | 148 |
| 6.9.3 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Identity (not being like my Mum) | 154 |
| 6.9.4 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Reflections on the process of change' | 157 |
| 6.10 | Elly's story: first interview, over-arching narrative themes | 165 |
| 6.11 | Summary of Elly's story, organised into over-arching narrative themes | 166 |
| 6.12 | Thematic analysis | 168 |
| 6.12.1 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Striving for the 'good life' and making the 'happy home' | 169 |
| 6.12.2 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Ideal relating, smooth, secure and loving' | 172 |
| 6.12.3 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Struggling with a sense of loss' | 177 |
| 6.12.4 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'Reflections on the process of change' | 181 |
| 6.13 | Elly's story: second interview, over-arching narrative themes | 183 |
| 6.14 | Summary of Elly's story, organised into over-arching narrative themes | 184 |
| 6.15 | Thematic analysis | 186 |
| 6.15.1 | Over-arching narrative theme: 'From discipline to nurture (a different view of children)' | 187 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 6.15.2 | Over-arching narrative theme: ‘A struggle with loss, depression, and other difficult feelings | 192 |
| 6.15.3 | Over-arching narrative theme: Reflections on the process of change | 198 |
| 6.16 | Rachel’s story: first interview, over-arching narrative themes | 205 |
| 6.16.1 | Comment on Labovian Analysis | 205 |
| 6.17 | Summary of Rachel’s story, organised into narrative themes | 206 |
| 6.18 | Thematic analysis | 208 |
| 6.18.1 | Over-arching narrative theme: ‘Making life good’ | 209 |
| 6.18.2 | Over-arching narrative theme: ‘Trying to make sense of Daniel | 219 |
| 6.18.3 | Over-arching narrative theme: ‘The stress of the situation with Daniel | 222 |
| 6.19 | Rachel’s story: second interview, over-arching narrative themes | 226 |
| 6.20 | Summary of Rachel’s story, organised into themes | 226 |
| 6.21 | Thematic analysis | 228 |
| 6.21.1 | Over-arching narrative theme: ‘Doing things differently and thinking differently’ | 229 |
| 6.21.2 | Over-arching narrative theme: ‘Still trying to make sense of Daniel’ | 236 |
| **Chapter 7** | **Discussion** | 243 |
| 7.1 | Introduction to discussion | 243 |
| 7.2 | Parents’ accounts: unique perspectives on value | 244 |
| 7.2.1 | Narratives examined for perspective on value | 244 |
| 7.2.2 | Each person’s emotional experience appears very bound up with what they value. Relationships with their children are embedded within this matrix | 245 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 7.2.3 | Parents valued different experiences but these could be linked to existential themes | 246 |
| 7.2.4 | Consciousness-raising supported agency/ choice-making | 246 |
| 7.2.5 | When experience is contradictory and confusing and perhaps overwhelms with emotion, narratives are dissociated and contradictory | 247 |
| 7.3 | Parents' experience of conflicting ideologies and narratives of parenting | 249 |
| 7.4 | Did the parents acquire knowledge which was emancipatory? | 251 |
| 7.4.1 | Introduction to this discussion | 251 |
| 7.4.2 | The oppressive potential of psychology | 251 |
| 7.4.3 | Learning to be powerful in non-aggressive ways in relationships with children | 253 |
| 7.4.4 | Becoming reflexive parents | 254 |
| 7.5 | Therapeutic change: a shift in ideology and a re-working of beliefs | 256 |
| 7.6 | An 'heuristic' theory of change: doing things differently and thinking differently | 257 |
| 7.6.1 | A summary of the theoretical perspectives explored in This study, informing the following hypotheses about Change | 257 |
| 7.6.2 | In order to experience the 'good' parents had to do things differently | 257 |
| 7.6.3 | Embodiment and narrative: Knowledge written into systems | 259 |
| 7.7 | The relationship context of change | 261 |
| 7.7.1 | Introduction | 261 |
| 7.7.2 | The experience of meaningful conversations (the narratives of others) provides hope that things can change | 262 |
| 7.8 | Implications for educational and child psychologists | 265 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 7.8.1 | Introduction to discussion | 265 |
| 7.8.2 | Working with parents: engaging with narratives of value | 266 |
| 7.8.3 | Particular contexts encourage commitments, as well as particular circumstances. What are we asking parents to commit to? | 268 |
| 7.8.4 | Towards a model of therapeutic change | 269 |
| 7.8.5 | Educational psychology and ideologies of parenting and childcare circulating in culture | 270 |
| 7.8.6 | Ontological positions: when we talk about 'person's what do we mean? | 271 |
| 7.9 | Limitations of this research | 272 |
| 7.10 | Recommendations for future research | 273 |
| 7.11 | Conclusion | 274 |
| **Epilogue** | | 277 |
| References | | 279 |
| Appendices | | |