"Moments We Strive For":
Creatively Reimagining Historical Sound in Contemporary Roleplay, Re-enactment and Revival

Helen Jane Hawa-Diggle

Doctor of Philosophy

University of York

Music

December 2020

Contents

Abstract

"Moments We Strive For" presents a theoretical framework for reimagining historical sound and music in re- enactment, live action roleplay and indigenous cultural revival.[1] Using three case studies of Viking re-enactment, festival LARP, and the contemporary movement of revived Sámi music, it is established that re-enactment and reimagining exist on a spectrum of activity, and that the sequence of historically informed musical creation can be mapped by a model of desire, process and result. Using a theoretical foundation of hauntology, simulacra, semiotics and somaesthetics, the concepts of authenticity and immersion are unpacked and analysed using case study examples and the above framework. The primary research aims of this thesis are to determine how the past is viewed through the present when considering musical works intended to immerse participants and observers in cultures involving historically informed or inspired roleplay and/or re-enactment. The thesis also aims to clarify the relationships between the desire to create, the process of creating and executing a historically informed musical work, and the result of the work's exposure to observers and fellow participants. Alongside this, the thesis demonstrates how attitudes towards authenticity and immersion in recreation are both unfixed and evolving as these traditions gain popularity and develop new histories of their own.

Using participant-observer fieldwork methodologies, as well as semi-structured interviews with musicians from a variety of backgrounds, the qualitative data illustrates some key examples from across the discipline of historically informed recreation in many guises. The presentation of a sequential model of desire, process and result paired with a spectrum of activity representing re-enactment and reimagining in musical contexts. These theoretical models demonstrate scope for application to many other fields of aesthetic recreation, particularly regarding contemporary forms of historically influenced expression. Both authenticity and immersion in contemporary historical recreation relate to each other and isolate the practices from linear views of "past versus present" and bring new meaning and significance to revived traditions.

---

[1] Quotation from James Smart, Appendix B, Interview 4, p. 215

Acknowledgements

This thesis is dedicated to the loving memories of my Jorvik comrade Nathan Wade and fellow historian and roleplayer John Rieck. Your stories will never be forgotten.

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is a presentation of original work and I am the sole author. This work has not previously been presented for an award at this, or any other, University. All sources are acknowledged as References.

Chapter 1

Introduction and Personal Motivation

This thesis presents two original theoretical frameworks which can help to assess the creative reimagining of historical sound in roleplay, re-enactment and cultural revival contexts. Many cultures and sub-cultures today have been born of historically informed or inspired aesthetics and performance. This takes many forms: continuity of cultures still in existence after generational or circumstantial displacement, researched and controlled revivals of extinct ethnic groups and cultures based on archaeological and historical evidence, and entirely new simulated or created traditions based on a combination of historical, fantastical or mythological sources. Each of these circumstances share common roots: creating or honing a particular experience of a "past" or an "imagined past" *through* the present. Many of these practices have existed for several centuries, but at present there is an unprecedented rise in interest and engagement with the concepts of re-enactment and immersive roleplay specifically. Therefore, there exists within academia potential for a developing field of revival in a more generalised sense. Any developing field requires consideration of how uncategorised information may be more effectively understood. Consequently, it is the objective of this thesis to present options for categorising contemporary reimagining of music and sound in historical settings, as well as to assist in mapping and contextualising the creative practices and processes behind these activities. Through a concentration on practice and process, it is possible to understand the relationship between culture and revival in new ways; a set of case studies explores these issues. This chapter will detail the origins of these ideas, provide established definitions of key concepts to be referred to throughout the rest of the work, and introduce three primary case studies to be utilised through every element of the thesis. This includes personal context from previous employment and academic experience within the relevant fields, a summary of the basic research questions of this project and what they aim to achieve, and a summary of all case studies being referred to throughout this thesis.

After several years' professional experience as costumed front-of-house staff in the world -famous Jorvik Viking Centre, it became clear that a progressively increasing interest in both the public's consumable idea of "the past" and its subsequent interpretations had developed in recent years. This phenomenon was most clearly witnessed during discussions with visitors to

the museum regarding particular artefacts that allow for artistic interpretation. The 10th century Coppergate panpipes in particular, excavated on the same site as the museum between 1976 and 1981, illustrate a rare and valuable link between the popular notion of "Viking" music and the actual empirical information available from archaeological contexts.[2] Due to the unusually well-preserved condition of the site – because of the continued presence of moisture and peat throughout the centuries - many items fashioned out of wood, textiles or metal survived over 1000 years without the usual deterioration.[3] These panpipes, made from aged boxwood, still played a recognisable diatonic scale, as initially demonstrated by Richard Hall, the Coppergate site director, when they were first excavated.[4] This is one of an exceedingly rare number of instrumental finds within archaeology from the Viking Age (860-1066) and is possibly unique in that it is still capable of playing recognisable pitches. However, it became apparent that there was a discrepancy between the empirical information available about music from the period, and the actual styles of music often heard within these settings. The fact that empirical and physical proof now existed of diatonic scales used in the Viking age has seemingly not managed to fully permeate through re-enactment and roleplaying communities, judging by often-purported reluctance to fully embrace the "challenge" of reviving ancient musical cultures accurately.[5] In other words, it became clear that a **generated culture** existed around these archaeological finds, as well as commonly held and accepted implications of what "Viking" music was in public consciousness, without the level of physical proof implied. Customers to the Jorvik Centre can often be heard asking "how do we know what this music sounded like"? Arguably, this question can (and should) be extended to mean "why do we think we know what this music sounded like, and how are these decisions formed?" This initial line of questioning formed the basis for the following main research goals established in this thesis.

---

[2] Richard A. Hall, *The Viking Dig: Excavations at York* (London: The Bodley Head Ltd, 1984)

[3] Letty Ten Harkel, 'Anglo-Scandinavian Occupation at 16-22 Coppergate: Defining a Townscape',
Yorkshire Archaeological Journal, 89: 1 (2017) pp. 202–3

[4] Ibid.

[5] Stephen Gapps, 'Authenticity Matters: Historical Re-Enactment and Australian Attitudes to the Past', *Australian Cultural History,* 22 (2003) pp. 105-16

1.1: Aims and Research Questions

This thesis examines the following research aims, doing so through the methodologies presented in Chapters 2 and 3. The primary research aims of this thesis are to determine how the past is viewed through the present when considering musical works intended to immerse participants and observers in cultures involving historically informed or inspired roleplay and/or re-enactment. The thesis also aims to clarify the relationships between the desire to create, the process of creating and executing a historically informed musical work, and the result of the work's exposure to observers and fellow participants. Alongside this, the thesis demonstrates how attitudes towards authenticity and immersion in recreation are both unfixed and evolving as these traditions gain popularity and develop new histories of their own.

- To what extent can the process of reimagining and reviving historically informed content be mapped onto a theoretical model that allows for varied approaches to both authenticity and immersion?
- To what extent is "historical correctness" relevant in assessing the cultural situation of re-enactment, revival and roleplay activities?
- How can these theoretical frameworks contribute to a better understanding of the role of creative practice within re-enactment communities?

Definitions and Terminology

The main research findings of this thesis consist of two philosophical models established using the three differing case studies. The first involves visualising all creative practices ranging from re-enactment to more creative reimagining as a spectrum of activity, demonstrating that many elements of these seemingly far-flung musical cultures relate to one another in surprising ways. This model will be referred to as the *Reimagining Activity Spectrum*. The second proposed model resulting from this thesis has been named the *Desire-Process-Result* model. Throughout the remainder of this work, any of these three words *italicised* are specifically indicating a reference to the D-P-R model, rather than an arbitrary definition of any of those words. Similarly, any italicised reference to the *spectrum* will concern the Reimagining Activity Spectrum.

It is also necessary to establish chosen definitions for key terminology used frequently throughout the rest of this work. This is due to a significant variation in usage and implication within different fields of re-enactment and roleplay (and indeed among differing academic fields). The following lists the most common concepts and phrases used throughout this thesis to identify different areas and subjects of the proposed theoretical frameworks.

Re-enactment

The term 're-enactment' in this thesis will be used as the general descriptor for any activity, event or organisation that seek to accurately resemble a particular period or event in history, usually with the intent of providing education and/or entertainment to the general public.[6]

Reimagining

The use of 'reimagining' as both a verb and noun in this thesis refers to a piece of creative content that has been directly intended to resemble or present inspiration from a historical period, event, figure or other circumstance. However, 'reimagining' here refers specifically to content that does not intend to directly recreate history.

Revival

This refers to a deliberate desire to practice an element of an existing culture which has been previously discontinued in some manner. Rather than a re-enactment of a historical event or period, a revival refers specifically to practices recreated by **members of that original culture.** An important distinction to draw attention to is that re-enactment could be designed and executed by people not of the "original" culture. Therefore, this will be the term principally used in this work for indigenous populations such as the Sámi. However, later discussion will concern the implications and consequences of displaced ownership and claims within re-enactment practices.

Authenticity

Authenticity, which will be the main focus of Chapters 4 and 5, is used in this thesis as a term for all issues and concepts pertaining to levels of accuracy or evidence provided when

---

[6]Alexander Cook, 'Practices of Re-enactment', in *The Routledge Handbook of Re-enactment Studies: Key Terms in the Field*, ed. by Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb, and Juliane Tomann (London: Routledge, 2019) pp. 183-187

recreating historical content. It may also refer to "self-contained" authenticity within organisations, such as the adherence to briefs (see below) or rules set out by an authority (academic or otherwise).

Immersion

Immersion will be the primary focus of Chapter 6, and in this thesis will be used specifically to describe a level of intensive personal engagement with other re-enactors, audiences, participants within a historically informed context.

Living History

The term "living history" refers to a specific style of re-enactment that seeks to represent a static fragment of time from a historical period, usually involving daily or domestic life.[2] For example, "living history" displays are often presented alongside battle re-enactments or days which mark a particular historical event. The aim of these displays is to demonstrate a particular activity or general outlook of a person's day in a specific period (commonly the daily life of the communities surrounding significant events and/or battles). It is important to note that this differs from roleplay (see below) in that there is an implication of educational and/or heritage-oriented context when living history is presented.

Roleplay (Including LARP)

This refers to activities intended for participants to engage in immersive roleplaying at a scheduled event and/or festival. This can apply to both historically informed and fantastical/science fiction settings. The emphasised distinction for the purposes of this thesis is that this is an activity which focuses primarily (or exclusively) on the experience of the players/participants, rather than an emphasis on public/audience engagement. In other words, roleplay as an activity is *participant-focused* rather than *audience-focused.*

Brief

For the purposes of this study, the word "brief" will be used specifically in reference to the reference material, historical source, game plan or structure, or direct advice from an expert practitioner used to develop and execute a historically informed recreation or reimagining. It is also used this way within public re-enactment activities.

1.2: Introduction to Case Studies

Case Study Origins: The City of York and its Viking Identity

Due to its inherent historical significance and presence, the city of York is home not only to a variety of historical sites of note, but also a vibrant and well-respected re-enactment community. Many employees of the Jorvik Viking Centre have simultaneously been involved in larger voluntary groups such as Volsung, The Vikings and Historia Normannis.[7] It is compelling to consider why they were continuing to engage in costumed interpretation - that is to say, what they were being paid to do - during their home and personal lives as well. Their answers to this query were highly intriguing; many had honed a deep and complex persona with which to complement their costumed interpretation. Their at-work personas retained identity, background, quirks and skillsets both inside and outside the workplace; many chose to use their characters' names while at work rather than real names. Consequently, it was unsurprising to discover that some staff retained these carefully honed identities for re-enactment groups outside the Jorvik Centre. Some even created their own costume, researched period-accurate methods of spinning, weaving and dyeing fabric, learned associated crafts such as blacksmithing and antler work, and others wrote skaldic poetry or stories about their personas and their deeds.

Witnessing the immersion and attention to detail among many fellow members of staff at Jorvik, it was fascinating to determine if either they or others within their wider re-enactment groups, had incorporated musical composition and/or performance into these carefully crafted personas. The answers given by many colleagues and friends were equally intriguing in an entirely different way; among much of the initial social circles approached for this project within the re-enactment world, this particular area was often avoided. The reasons usually given for this included the "difficulty in mastering instruments of the period", "lack of archaeological evidence available", or perhaps most interestingly and concerningly of all, "fear of being criticised by experts".[8] While these insights were given in response to personal

---

[7] Volsung Vikings Re-enactment Society, 'The Volsung Vikings', *Google Sites* (2018), https://www.sites.google.com/site/thevolsungVikings [Accessed 8 December 2020] and The Vikings (charity 1062495), 'Home', *The Vikings!* (2010) https://www.vikingsonline.org.uk [Accessed 8 December 2020] and Historia Normannis Re-enactment Society, 'Historia Normannis', *Historia Normannis* (2015) https://normannis.co.uk/wp/. [Accessed 1 April 2019]

[8] Personal communication in conversation both while employed at Jorvik and within social circles surrounding re-enactment and roleplay groups, 2014-2017

curiosity rather than as a structured part of the research, it cemented a need to undertake workto better understand the role recreation plays in understanding music from pre-notation periods in history. It has also become apparent throughout further investigation that, among general social spheres of re-enactors and roleplayers, this area of historically informed creativity is often considered "out of bounds" to those who are not musically trained in predominantly classical settings.[9]

One of the initial questions that preceded this research project in its earliest stages was "what is our contemporary idea of a Viking"? Generally, as well as musically, the identity of 8th-10th century Scandinavian (specifically Danish and Norwegian) settlers in northern Britain has been highly elaborated and developed over later centuries, with much Victorian popular culture focusing around the barbarism and satanism of pagan religions and cultures, including old Norse material.[10] This means it could be argued that the "Viking" aesthetic has (historically) been engineered for religious or political purposes. More contemporarily, this has branched into archaeological investigation and re-enactment. Historical re-enactment, by its very nature, is the revival of an extinct culture by a distinct and chronologically separated demographic. The shift in social and contextual environment results in any emotive response to the original historical content being either retrospectively or artificially created for the purpose of display and/or immersion. It could also be argued that all "communication" between archaeological finds and those who interpret them is indirect and unintentional, as we are applying our own contemporary codes to its implicit meaning.

To explore this further, I decided to incorporate cultural revivals within Nordic countries. The cultural revival of the indigenous Sámi population, which will be introduced later in this chapter, produces a series of related ideas which are used to help situate reimagined and displaced cultures, as with historical re-enactment. However, the key difference between these two circumstances is the people who are conducting this revival. Sámi people are reviving their own traditions and culture after a generational and chronological displacement following external upheaval and interference, whereas British re-enactors are reviving a culture that is either not recognisably their own or maintains a distant historical basis and has undergone both geographical and historical displacement.

---

[9] Chris Halewood and Kevin Hannam, 'Viking Heritage Tourism: Authenticity and Commodification', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 28: 3 (2001) pp. 565–80

[10] Andrew Wawn, *The Vikings and the Victorians: Inventing the Old North in Nineteenth-Century Britain*, new edn (Woodbridge: D.S.Brewer, 2002)

These two case studies are linked yet also show polarised examples of creative reimagining on different scales, such as the fashioning of a new culture from old material. The polarising element of these case studies concerns the intent and purpose behind those experiences. This is predominantly due to the need for a "middle ground" in the *spectrum of activity between re-enactment and reimagining* that rapidly appeared between the two examples throughout this project, allowing for the eventual full spectrum model. It was at this point that Live Action Role Play, commonly referred to as LARP, was introduced into this project. This is a series of events and festivals popular throughout the UK, Europe and north America, which feature generated worlds or situations and fully immersed players or characters. In particular, "festival LARPs" such as Profound Decisions' *Empire,* which is the main focus of the third case study, produce entirely new cultures with evolving traditions and aesthetics, often based on historical or fantastical material referred to as "briefs".[12] As such, this combines several elements of the other two case studies in a fascinating way. Ultimately, what both links and differentiates them is the process and result of how historical material is treated within these settings, and the relationships that the individuals involved hold with that material. These features lie at the centre of this thesis and connect all disparate elements within a wider network of experiencing the past through the present.

1.3: Case Study 1) Historically Informed Re-enactment and Performance

Historical re-enactment and the creative reimagining of our past has gained much contemporary interest throughout the world, particularly in heritage sectors in western Europe (including the UK) and North America. Much of the recent discourse on re-enactment and revival studies has illustrated a divide between reimagining and re-enactment, as many re-enactment groups are heavily invested in the idea of authenticity and historical accuracy while also maintaining as full an immersive experience as possible.[11] Creators who work within historical parameters, but do not strictly refer to their work as "re-enactment", retain a looser and more flexible approach to their process, retaining influences and inspirations rather than true accurate reproduction. Authenticity in many contemporary re-enactment cultures is often

---

[11] Ibid.

framed as a "problem" to be overcome or a solution sought for, rather than a goal to be achieved or an added benefit of the overall experience. For example, an annual commemoration of an important historical event in the local area may need to be meticulously planned for many months beforehand to ensure that all aspects of the event adhere to legal standards for safety and wellbeing of both participants and audiences; this may involve alterations to materials or combat techniques. This will, in later chapters, establish entry into an overall discussion of what elements of the process enable a shift on the proposed spectrum model. It will therefore be necessary to evaluate the definitions of both "re-enactment" and "reimagining", establish the existence of at least one central point between these two poles before ultimately considering where and how a linear shift occurs from one point of the spectrum to another. Finally, a consideration of its application as an analytical tool to particular historical art forms will be applied, with music as the primary focus.

It is clear that historical re-enactment has evolved into its own subculture over at least the last century, however, the practice of re-enacting or reimagining significant historical events is considerably more ancient, stretching back to pitched battles of historical significance played with tremendous dramatic licence in Roman amphitheatres. Today, it has evolved into a combination of education and entertainment spectacles, both for public viewing and for individual enjoyment. This can range from larger organisations such as the National Trust staging medieval tournaments at castles which operate as tourist attractions, to University re-enactment societies devising and staging their own displays, with emphasis on participation and socialising for student members of the groups. Re-enactment communities across the world have become closely knit and have even established new traditions of their own, but an important distinction to make is the desire to create an authentic simulation, as opposed to the use of original items, materials or artefacts. There is a deliberate shift in thinking towards the motions of authenticity being the main focus of re-enactment, rather than a concentrated desire to truly "use" the material history. In other words, it has become far more important authentically to "feel" as if one is immersed in a historical environment; a Viking re-enactor would not use one-thousand-year-old materials from the real Viking age for their display, because it is not plausible to use such delicate materials. The re-enactor instead seeks to achieve the "feeling" of the Viking age, to exist and to use materials which an individual in the 10th century would view as "current". If this can be relied upon as being the case for all re-enactment groups a fluid and working definition of "authenticity" is the goal, and thus provides grounds for a spectrum as a valid analytical result for this project. If "authenticity" can be interpreted differently among separate groups of re-enactors, this would point to varying degrees of

immersion and allowances.

In light of this idea of going through the process of revival as opposed to a true physical revival of history, which will be unpacked further through case studies, we can begin to map out an initial starting point of the proposed re-enactment to reimagining spectrum model by way of measuring the need and/or willingness to immerse oneself in varying degrees of simulated authenticity. The "past" can be packed to consumers as a collection of contemporary experiences, calling upon "historicalness" to achieve certain emotive, entertaining or educating settings. The packaged experience of "the past" requires an emphasis on something being *perceived as of the past*, rather than *truly of the past.* The proposed Re- enactment Activity Spectrum can therefore be tested by examining the varying purposes for which re-enactment groups gather, the scalic significance of achieving true authenticity, and taking into account the further end of the spectrum. This pole features reimagined historical content without a predisposed premise for authenticity, and merely wishes to draw upon the "historicalness" of the content. Ultimately, for a broader historical context, further fieldwork concerning living history communities, educational workshops and choreographed events will be required in order to map the differing points between the ends and centre of this spectrum. However, when examining its use strictly in relation to the devising, performance and response to music with historically charged associations, case studies surrounding particular ensembles can be used here.

If the re-enacted and the reimagined can exist on a spectrum, which this thesis proposes as a model, and can be thus classified in quantities of immersion, then we must also consider the implications of this kind of classification. Namely, what does it tell us about the way we use our past to help us understand and embellish our present existence? Jean Baudrillard uses the example of antiques here, examining their double meaning as both "survivals from traditional symbolic order" and yet also playing an important part in modernity.[12] Historical sources, and items from particular periods in history, resonate with us in contemporary settings as objects which are essentially "timeless", as they will eternally be saddled with the double meaning of "of the past" and "an artefact promoting contemporary responses". Another important issue is our relationship with our sources, and more particularly the manner in which we communicate their implications. Re-enactors, to some extent, must make peace with the living andinseparable anachronisms surrounding their own personal age, lifestyle and

---

[12] Jean Baudrillard, *The System of Objects* (London: Verso 2005) p. 73

even general health which prevents them from "authentically" portraying an individual from a particular period of history. This will result in a willingness to communicate these unavoidable anachronisms with audiences, fellow re-enactors and recipients of a workshop; the awareness of these differences in historical sources such as written records, skeletal evidence of particular levels of health, and even drawings and paintings, is arguably an integral part of the revival of the historical context itself. On the other hand, deliberately breaking immersion can be wielded as an extremely useful tool in public facing re-enactment displays. Participants often demonstrate this by facing the audience and explaining why something in the display has been adapted for modern allowances. This not only provides more insight and information for the spectators, but also draws them further into this sphere of "historicalness" inhabited by the participants.

Ultimately, a spectrum would encompass all these considerations concerning authenticity, ease of process and the need for immersion, as the relationships which are shared between significant historical artefacts, concepts and identities are continually fluid. Musically speaking, the spectrum would encompass the use of "original" instruments, whether they are truly "of" the period from which they originate, or whether they have been constructed with precise reference to the period concerned. It would also account for the allowances made for ease and accessibility of playing, and far more significantly the change in tuning and frequency present compared to the time in which most "early music" is focused. The concept of reimagining, particularly in the case of music, will never remain constant or adhere to an unmovable set of rules. As time naturally progresses, our ideas of what is contemporary will undoubtedly change, and thus a spectrum would have to evolve accordingly. However, a recurring theme of the personal and emotional is already beginning to appear, and arguably suggests a recurring human tendency to want to re-imagine and re-enact for the same reasons irrespective of time period. A selection of small case studies, both musical and non-musical, will now be examined in order to provide examples of the notions and considerations discussed here.

A surprisingly simple but fascinating example of contemporary allowances and alterations being made in the context of general historical re-enactment is the use of necessary modern technology so as not to impede the enjoyment and participation of the re-enactors themselves: most particularly, glasses. Throughout my employment at the Jorvik Viking Centre in York, many costumed colleagues have been informed by visitors that they "didn't know Vikings wore glasses in the 10th century". This does indicate scope for allowance within the eye of the general public, and yet it is clear that an anachronism does remain present, otherwise

glasses would never be remarked upon in a costumed setting. I have also witnessed a number of voluntary re-enactment groups approaching this question in a variety of ways, from actively not allowing glasses to be present in "living history" contexts (offering participants the option to wear contact lenses as an alternative) to allowing glasses to be worn without comment. The solution of contact lenses provides rather more layers of meaning than one may initially expect; this particular example offers immersion to the public spectators, but not necessarily to the re-enactor themselves. The re-enactor is therefore operating through an identity steeped in "historicalness", but remains partly on their own contemporary terms, as they are wilfully enhancing their own experience by ensuring clear, safe and comfortable vision during the event.[13] The nationally renowned Norman re-enactment group "Historia Normannis", which refers to its units across the countries as "cells", has a series of rules governing the visibility of anachronisms to the general public for the purposes of displays, pitched battles and living history demonstrations.[14] The York cell, currently run by University of York and York St John graduates, employs what is informally known as a "wimples on, wimples off" policy during public events (though despite the nickname, this saying applies to all historical artefacts in this setting as well as head coverings) . This means that participants will camp at the event, with all personal supplies present alongside historical costume and props. When the "wimples on" rule is applied, all personal effects must be removed from view of the spectating public, and participants must be fully immersed in their chosen roles with any anachronisms, including eyeglasses out of sight. At the conclusion of each day of the event, the leader of the cell will declare the start of the "wimples off" period, where participants can break immersion, remove historical costume and apply any desired anachronisms, but nonetheless remain situated at the encampment, retaining elements of the historical display, but with a shift in process to partial immersion and personal enjoyment, without a view of entertaining and educating the public. The application of the "wimples" rule is indicative of outward appearances of authenticity being the primary goal for the re-enactment display. This would imply that to therefore apply this type of disciplined, staged historical re-enactment to a spectrum, movement along it must incorporate not just changes in process, but in projected result and authenticity for the sake of spectators, but not always necessarily the performers or participants.

The first specifically musical element of this case study concerns the work of re-enactor, musician and instrument-maker Corwen Broch, who operates with partner Kate Fletcher under

---

[13] Ibid.

[14] Historia Normannis Re-enactment Society, 'Historia Normannis', *Historia Normannis* (2015) https://normannis.co.uk/wp/. [Accessed 1 April 2019]

the company name "Ancient Music".[15] They are not only performers and composers in their own right, but also provide a series of historical educational workshops centred around archaeological musical finds, reconstructions entirely based on documented evidence and as full an immersion as possible by the demonstration of these instruments in costume and appropriate settings. These are from a range of time periods, but mostly focus upon pre-Norman conquest archaeological finds of string, woodwind and percussion instruments. These finds are not limited to the United Kingdom, but predominantly concern the Nordic countries. This has subsequently been extended into a multi-faceted performance which Broch and Fletcher market to museums, private groups and schools, featuring elements of storytelling, theatre and interactive participation. Broch has indicated that he uses blueprints based upon academic publications of archaeological finds, as well as using documented and pictorial evidence made available from museums and archives and refers to a community of UK re-enactment based instrument-makers who consult with one another on finer details and updated research.[16] However, Broch refers to the difficulty of tuning for live performance when demonstrating his Finnish *jouhikko* (a bowed horse-hair stringed instrument similar to a lyre), so clarifies that he will often replace the horse-hair with nylon strings when fashioning instruments for theatrical use, a prime example being the lyres he made for the *Lord of the Rings* West End stage musical.[17] This, again, indicates the presence of allowances, and the wider range of definitions surrounding "authenticity". Many contemporary scholars from the newly developing field of re-enactment studies have provided insights into these nuances of definition.[18] Broch is clearly striving for a significant degree of authenticity, but makes the distinction between true historical accuracy, and the appearances and practicalities of historical accuracy for the purposes of staged performance. The presence of a defined subculture within re-enactment that also transcends into its own genre of musical performance indicates the ownership with which the participants within these subcultures have sealed new meaning. This results in the original historical contexts being invested with new layers of meaning, which were hitherto absent.

Examining another more loosely and intently creative musical case study is necessary to

---

[15] Kate Fletcher & Corwen Broch, 'Ancient Music ~ Kate & Corwen's Homepage', *Ancient Music* (2010) http://ancientmusic.co.uk/string.html. [Accessed 15 April 2019]

[16] Ibid.

[17] Ibid.

[18] Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb, and Juliane Tomann, 'Introduction: What is Re-enactment Studies?', in *The Routledge Handbook of Re-enactment Studies: Key Terms in the Field,* ed. by Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb and Juliane Tomann (London: Routledge, 2019) pp. 1-10

ensure this spectrum analyses effectively across both polarities. The Norwegian folk project and musical ensemble Wardruna, founded by Einar "Kvitrafn" Selvik, is an ongoing group which responds creatively to Norse runes from the Elder Futhark, one of the older established sets of runic alphabets from the region.[19] Wardruna's *Runaljod* trilogy of albums features a calculated and immensely creatively complex response to each of the runes in turn. The runes are interpreted personally by Selvik, who consults many different sources throughout the process, including poetic Eddas, Icelandic sagas and archaeological finds. The historical and archaeological implications of the runes' meanings are then brought into a more practical approach. This has ranged from the extraction, manipulation and percussion of 5000-year-old glacial ice for the rune "*Isa*" (ice) to Selvik personally fasting for 3 days and allowing himself significant exposure to cold in rural Norway for the rune *Naudir* (need). In the case of Isa, Selvik sought out columns of glacial ice, but maintained the distinction that he was not endeavouring to capture a particular sound "from the ice", but rather that the ice had its own sound, and he was the instrument for communicating this sound more widely. Selvik specifies that, in his creative process, such compositional methods remain "tools which are applied to a modern soundscape, for modern ears to respond to".[20] He also elaborated in the same interview that the reimagining of musical ideas from ancient Nordic traditions remains very much a "living tradition", and that if he were interested in true, historically and archaeologically informed, unmovable accuracy, he would preserve these ideas in a museum.[21] In his words, for a historical idea to "deserve the right of life, so to say, it needs to continue carrying relevance".[22] In this case, "carrying relevance" can be taken to mean adaptation to contemporary ideas of musical and creative worth, process and intended result. This is particularly relevant in the case of the Wardruna project, which focuses on the Elder Futhark of old Norse runes, Selvik emphasises that a true "reimagining" of this tradition is to respond to the runes as he has done; he has allowed himself an organic, creative and emotional response, while simultaneously remaining historically informed and researched.

This type of structured, methodical but creative reimagining is indicative of room on the spectrum for very personal and emotive, spiritual interpretation. Ultimately, the difference here between the work of Selvik compared to Fletcher and Broch, is that of intended result, or

---

[19] Einar Selvik, 'About', *Official Wardruna Website* (2020), http://www.wardruna.com [Accessed 15 December 2020]
[20] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 193
[21] Ibid.
[22] Ibid.

intended appearance of result. In other words, different types of authenticity are being striven for in these examples. Fletcher and Broch strive for academically informed authenticity of the displayed result, Selvik strives for a personally faithful authenticity which focuses on the process of that creative work. No emphasis on historical accuracy exists in the work of Wardruna, but that is not to say that it is ungoverned by rules. The difference is that these rules are centred around far more individual questions of truth or integrity, rather than a communal or organisational standard. Wardruna's boundaries exist to ensure integrity surrounding historically informed inquiry, and an appropriateness in the subsequent creative response. It has been argued that historical inquiry exists as an inherently creative process, particularly concerning music, as the evidence one works with can be shaped in particular ways in order to illustrate certain expressive points. This would point to our spectrum needing to consider both the creative purposes of individual historical inquiry, and the outward effect on the reimagining's final results.

Many more case studies exist as examples of either re-enactment or creative reimagining, in both music and broader living history traditions. They would all maintain a place upon the proposed re-enactment to reimagining spectrum. Through examination of contemporary historical re-enactment guidelines (such as the communally agreed definitions laid out by a variety of academics examining this growing field in the *Routledge Handbook of Re-enactment Studies)* the work of Fletcher and Broch's "Ancient Music" as well as more creatively flexible groups such as Wardruna, it can certainly be established that differences in revival of the past most commonly stem from a focus on *desire, process, and result*.[23] These concepts form the basis of the Desire-Process-Result model to be examined later in the thesis. The starkest of differences lies among those who are intending to produce an authentic product and those who, instead, focus upon an authentic process. The spectrum encompasses both heavily invested re-enactors who wish to maintain the utmost rigidity with regard to documented, evidence-based re-enactment, travelling towards a central point of a desire to maintain a significant portion of the authentic process, with as much of an authentic result as can be visible to the audience or spectators. Finally, individuals and groups who remain thoroughly invested in the process of reviving pieces of history, but who do not intend to produce a historically accurate result, present a significant challenge when categorising re-

---

[23] Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb, and Juliane Tomann, 'Introduction: What is Re-enactment Studies?', in *The Routledge Handbook of Re-enactment Studies: Key Terms in the Field*, ed. by Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb and Juliane Tomann (London: Routledge, 2019) pp. 1-10

enactment and reimagining into an academically transferable model. In between these three points lies a tremendous variety of interpretations and allowances, which will continue to evolve. In conclusion, a gap in the current field exists in which an analytical tool can be applied to live musical and historical practices such as re-enactment, living history, and early music performance. Theoretically, this could continue to be applied indefinitely to popular representations of "historicalness" within contemporary media, with the focus remaining on the human process, and allowances are made for potential future changes in societal and cultural structures. It therefore became significant during the earliest stages of the project to incorporate further case studies which allow for this broadened ideal of both manufactured "historicalness" and a compelling engagement with present-day cultures and subcultures. This line of thought followed on to incorporate of a creatively active and flourishing indigenous population as the next case study for this project.

1.4: Case Study 2) The Continuity of Reimagined *Joik* in Modern Sápmi

As one of the oldest European indigenous populations, the Sámi have maintained a rich cultural heritage for many centuries, even in the face of outlawed practices, industrialisation and shifting national borders. Since the late 1960s, guided by newly inspired younger Sámi communities, the distinctive vocal technique of *joik,* an ancient tradition, has been revived and repurposed.[24] When you perform a *joik,* you are not *joik*ing about a subject, you are *joik*ing that subject. A *joik* is an evocation, and can be a person, animal, object, idea, feeling, or landscape. It is an extraordinarily versatile technique, and can be heard in a variety of contexts, ranging from solo *joik*s used historically for herding reindeer or for private reflection or prayer, to a *joik* directed at another person or persons, whether for enjoyment of performance, or to honour or interact with them. In previous fieldwork and research, the continuity of pagan and matriarchal themes and imagery within contemporary Sámi folk music has been examined by the current author, but this thesis will concern the music's continuity and reimaginings, considering its evolution as a technique in order to incorporate the new political and cultural significance that traditional Sámi culture now must encompass.[25] It will also be

---

[24] Vuokko Hirvonen, *Voices from Sápmi (*Kautokeino:DAT, 2008) p. 130
[25] Helen Diggle, 'To Be, To Tell, To Know: The Continuity of Matriarchy and Paganism in Contemporary Sámi

necessarily to briefly examine its potential as a musical technique further afield than Sápmi (the Sámi name for the wider region of northern Norway, Sweden and Finland known as Lapland previously).

Due to the political and environmental issues faced by the modern Sámi community, *joik* has had to evolve as a means of empowerment, representation and indigenous identity, as it is one of the most distinctive and well recognised elements of most ancient Sámi cultures, and historically has been one of the most persecuted techniques. Unfortunately, as a result of this long standing bias, many Sámi have trouble "owning" the technique now, due to reported associations with devil worship by Laestadian settlers in the 18th century, although the Christianization of the Nordic countries had been steadily taking place since the 11th century.[26] This has resulted in a widespread bias towards practising what they call the "old religion", particularly by older generations for whom the practice was completely outlawed. This means that Sámi tradition, including *joik,* has had to adapt its practices and purposes as time has passed. This, perhaps, is what makes the technique particularly remarkable; that its role as folk song differs considerably from many other European traditions, in that it evolves and serves new purpose, without the specific aim or desire to revive the past. The following will introduce historical accounts of *joik* and the subsequent Laestadian persecution of the technique, before drawing from fieldwork at the *Riddu Riddu* indigenous culture festival in July 2017, and examining contemporary *joiks*, and the technique's evolution in two areas of Sápmi: the coastal Troms region of Norway, and the Lulesámi region of Sweden. These two regions were chosen due to their hosting key events in the Sámi cultural calendar, as well as due to logistical considerations for fieldwork.

The vast majority of sources on *joik* prior to its displacement from northern Nordic culture are both fragmented, and based on reports by Christian missionaries and authority figures; in other words, all by etic observers to the culture, often with their own agendas in place. Elin Margrethe Wersland[29] tells us that an association with devil worship pervades 18th century attitudes towards *joik*, and suggests that the reason for the association is the function of the technique in Sámi shaman practices, known as *noaidi*.[27] She also tells us that in his 1906 work, Finnish priest Jacob Fellman, almost exclusively blames the missionaries for "making the Sámi believe that it was the devil that had taught humans to *joik*".[28] This perhaps helps to

---

Folk Music' (unpublished undergraduate dissertation, Royal Holloway, University of London, 2014)

[26] Neil Kent, *The Sámi Peoples of the North: A Social and Cultural History* (London: Hurst, 2019)

[27] Elin Margrethe Wersland, *Yoik in the Old Sami Religion* (Norway: Forlaget Vett & Viten, 2006)

[28] Ibid.

account for the tremendous generational divide in attitudes towards *joik* since its revival truly took hold through the course of the 1970s, as well as the schisms within Sámi communities and even families, which will be discussed in further detail later. There is also earlier source material available from the 17th century, such as Samuel Rheen, Isaac Olsen and Hans Skanke, all of whom collectively cover a lengthy period from Swedish-Finnish missionary work at the end of the 1600s, to the periods both prior to and during the Danish-Norwegian missionary work in the early 1700s. They respectively shed some light on particularly the shamanic practices of the Sámi during this time, and the role of *joik* within said practices, but it is vital to mention that the vast majority of these accounts had a view of delivering their religion and ideologies to the communities which they were observing.[29] The first known Sámi author to publish writing about his own culture in a Sámi language did not appear until much later: Johan Turi in 1910, a nomadic reindeer herder and hunter from Kautokeino, in Norway. Turi's book *Muitalus sámiid birra* (An Account of the Sámi) is the first known published account of an inside observer to the earlier cultural practices of the Sámi, in spite of it having been made after Christianisation of the region.[30]

Since 1860, Norway underwent intense "Norwegianization", a nationalist policy put forward by the Norwegian government which had the effect of stifling the teaching of Sámi language and practices in schools.[31] As of 1980 the policy is no longer in operation, but had become far more extreme between 1900—1940, as land ownership, agricultural rights and the mining of resources all became compromised, exploiting Sámi-populated areas. This occurred most acutely in Norway but these movements also put tremendous pressure on the economic stability and political status of the Swedish Sámi in the Lulea and Narvik regions. This resulted in at least two generations of Sámi people to whom it has been implied that their traditions and indigenous languages are shameful, unwelcome and play no part in the nationalist and industrialist movements within northern Norway and Sweden, before even considering the continued oppression of the ancient Sámi religion in centuries beforehand. This is the attitude and scenario which the cultural revival beginning in the late 1960s had to battle against.

Pioneering Sámi artists, musicians and educators began to demand further representation of Sámi culture throughout the latter half of the 20th century, resulting in many

---

[29] Ibid.

[30] Johan Olafsson Turi, *An Account of the Sámi: A Translation of Muitalus Sámiid Birra* (Chicago: Nordic Studies Press, 2011)

[31] Katherine Schuster and David Witkosky, *Language of the Land: Policy, Politics, Identity* (Charlotte, North Carolina: IAP, 2007)

hitherto forgotten practices and cultural aesthetics to be revived into new iterations within popular culture. This cultural revival of these dislocated and ultimately disenchanted Sámi communities spread across the region, started through several different paths: representation in government, education and awareness of Sámi traditions, and the publication of literature and poetry in the Sámi languages, as well as radio broadcasts. One of the most well-known figureheads of this multi-national cultural revival was the legendary *joik*er, poet and painter Nils-Aslak Valkeapää (1943-2001). Originally from a family of nomadic reindeer herders in Finland, he spent most of his life either close to the Swedish border, or in Skibotn in Norway. His former residence, Lássagammi, has essentially become an unofficial museum of contemporary Sámi art and tradition. Valkeapää was among the first Sámi to achieve publication in one of their own languages, with Johan Turi preceding him. He was also one of the first to begin setting *joik* to popular musical instruments in the late 1960s, and it was through his enrapturing performances that an international awareness of the Sámi plight was formed. He travelled to Japan to demonstrate the tradition and performed at the 1994 Lillehammer Winter Olympics.

As a figurehead of cultural revival recognisable to both older and younger members of the Sámi community, the memory of Nils-Aslak Valkeapää continues to be revered and beloved by artists, poets and musicians alike from the Sápmi region. Valkeapää's work continues to play a crucial role at the *Riddu Riddu* festival; a multicultural festival now celebrating continued and reimagined indigeneity in all its forms throughout the world but was founded with the specific focus on celebrating Sámi culture, which it continues to do. The posthumously made film 'Solens Son' (Son of the Sun) is the story of Valkeapää's life and career, featuring interviews with many of his friends and contemporaries.[32] It was celebrated at the International Film Festival of Tromso in 2017, and following this was played at the *Riddu Riddu* festival, as part of a series of empowering films from various cultures. The tone of the film was almost reverential, featuring interviews with a number of Sámi musicians, as well as Valkeapää's friends and relations, all of which demonstrated the sacred place he still holds within many Sámi communities.

Riddu Riddu also featured a three-day *joiking* workshop, open to both Sámi and non-Sámi alike, led by Norwegian Sámi *joik*er Berit Alette Mienna. It was not only a fascinating insight, but a sheer privilege, to be allowed to share in this technique that has been so precious to Sámi communities for centuries. Mienna's instruction and demonstration consisted of much interactive participation; a prerequisite of the course was that you were not allowed to sit in

---

[32] 'Solens Son', dir. by Gunilla Bresky (Filmpool Nord, 2017)

silence. She reiterated what has been previously stated, that you simply *joik*, you do not "*joik* about*", and added that a part of you becomes whatever it is you are *joiking.* One example of an exercise in this course was Mienna *joik*ing animals, and encouraging us to work out which animal she intended to evoke, based on certain melodic characteristics, but also on the nature of the overall musical cell. Its speed, rhythm and pacing can all represent slightly anthropomorphised ideas of animals, such as a bear steadily plodding across a tundra, or a mosquito flitting through the air. Mienna indicated that many of these animal *joik*s are taught to Sámi children, which she and her contemporaries have been working towards since the 1980s. She later stated (through translation by Tromsø University researcher Soile Hamäläinen) that there have always been changes in communities and environments prior to now, some more extreme than others, and *joik* has always remained present in some form, though it is almost impossible to determine how that process may change in the future.

As a standard first set by Valkeapää and his contemporaries, *joik's* fusion into both rock and electronic music proves to be a popular way of extending the technique further, allowing greater awareness among not just young Sámi generations, but globally. This was clear at the Jokkmokk Winter Market in the Swedish Lulesámi region, from traditional performances to herald the reindeer race on the frozen lake, to larger concerts incorporating *joik* with both rock and folk bands from different areas of Sápmi.[33] While this also took place at *Riddu Riddu*, a wider variety of exclusively Sámi artists attended the Jokkmokk Winter Market, due to its focus on Sámi culture. Here, *joik* was treated very much as an observed performance, whereas the *joik*s experienced at *Riddu Riddu* were not out of bounds to learn and participate in. Arguably, for reasons of simplicity which encompass both these styles of *joik*, the melodic and rhythmic setting of contemporary *joik*s will have evolved to maintain accessibility to unfamiliar listeners and participants.

Therefore, in an ethnographic setting, how would we begin analysing *joik*, and creating what would essentially be a topography of the technique in a manner which can encompass its timelessness and great potential for variety? The semiotician and musicologist Jean-Jacques Nattiez claims, albeit with Inuit throat singing vocal games in northern Canada, that a semiotic approach is one of the only justifiable ways to analyse this type of musical content without referring too heavily back to an "external perception, a construction by a scholar, whatever his

---

[33] Helen Diggle, 'To Be, To Tell, To Know: The Continuity of Matriarchy and Paganism in Contemporary Sámi Folk Music' (unpublished undergraduate dissertation, Royal Holloway, University of London, 2014)

degree of familiarity with the culture".[34] In other words, our unchangeable role as etic observers when documenting and analysing these musical cultures, renders it, while not impossible, certainly difficult to justify our own symbolic constructs of the musical tradition with our own familiar definitions. It therefore becomes necessary to rely on a practice that focuses specifically on the basics of human communication and meaning: a semiotic approach. Nattiez describes the semiotic practice of Inuit vocal games as:

> A kind of host-structure, susceptible to absorbing sound sources of various origins: meaningless syllables and archaic words, names of ancestors or of old people , animal names, toponyms, words designating something present at the time of the performance, animal cries, natural noises, and tunes borrowed from petting-songs, drum-dance songs, or from religious hymns.[35]

He also states that it is possible that these games also had some relationship with shamanism, which is rather more difficult to discern given the length of time since shamanistic practices have been present within the region. Nattiez uses examples of paradigmatic chart analysis in "Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games", indicating the melodic morphemes themselves, whether these sounds they are exhaled or inhaled in breath, voiced or voiceless, the number of their occurrences and their intonation contour.[36] This system informs elements of archiving and ownership throughout this investigation; the separation of small isolated elements of the vocal technique can potentially be utilised to trace the origins of particular techniques.

Based on this methodology, we can already see some distinct topical similarities with Sámi *joik* in terms of the "host structure" idea, as *joik* can be used very widely to incorporate a range of purposes, ideas and emotions, and different *joiks* have evolved for different purposes; the fact that there are still private *joiks* among Sámi individuals and communities is a testament to this. Moving forwards in this study, a paradigmatic analysis of *joik* recordings from both pre- and post-cultural revival would serve well in this venture, focusing on the lower tones such as the guttural sounds from the throat, as well as the rapidity of melodic movement and the simplicity of the melodic cells. This would provide an excellent template for mapping the reimagining of the technique for the purposes of use in popular music, and accessibility to a wider international audience and enable us further to map the overall evolution of the

---

[34] Jean-Jacques Nattiez, 'Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games', *Ethnomusicology*, 27: 3 (1983) pp. 457-475 (p. 471)
[35] Ibid, p. 473
[36] Ibid, p. 464

technique, and provide the framework to establish patterns within its reimagining.

This has been a brief examination of both the history and continuity of *joik* within Norwegian and Swedish Sápmi, with a view to extending the analytical implications of the technique and allowing for further understanding of its role as a reimagined indigenous tradition. This demonstrates a different region of the Re-imagining Activity Spectrum – a culture that retains historic presence and chronology, but is reviving ancient and often naturalistic creative material through contemporary popular media.[37] Throughout the following chapters, this particular case study will focus on the continued revival and repurposing of *joik* since the cultural revival and will also consider the need for representation and empowerment of indigenous people in modern society. This will be a vital part of examining how a musical culture uses elements of its past in order to reinvent the present, see it more clearly, and celebrate what has passed. Ultimately, as previously stated, this is a valuable case study as it is a reimagined ancient musical culture which has continued to exist, albeit in the fringes of its old communities. This will take its place on my proposed spectrum of activity, examining other examples of contemporary reimagined historical sound. It is now therefore necessary to examine areas in which entirely new perceptions of culture and subculture are established through performance and historically inspired creativity.

1.5: Case Study 3) Festival LARP and Newly Generated Contemporary Culture

Thus far, the case studies presented in this thesis have represented polarities on the proposed spectrum of reimagining and recreation activity. Reimagined Sámi musical traditions can be classified as an ancient culture reimagined by its own people. Historical re-enactment, however, is an old or ancient culture recreated for the purposes of accuracy and education, more often by those who do not share ethnic or genetic roots with that culture. Between these extremes, the world of fantasy LARP, or Live Action Role Play, inhabits the middle ground on this spectrum of activity. Not only is it an example of an entirely new culture created for the purpose of immersion, storytelling and entertainment, but it also both creates its own community of cultural instigators and recreates the notions of tradition and trends present in historical

---

[37] Thomas Hilder, *Sámi Musical Performance and the Politics of Indigineity in Northern Europe* (Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2015)

cultures. This case study particularly features one of the largest festival-based LARP events in the United Kingdom, Profound Decisions' Empire, though references will also be made to one of the other major festival LARPs in Britain, the Lorien Trust.[38] Empire was founded by Matthew Pennington in 2012 following the success of previous festival game Maelstrom.

The fictional "Empire" consists of ten "culturally distinct nations", with political unification and established traditions and customs designed to interact with each other and create plot devices.[39] Players must create their own personas choosing their nationality, race and class or role within the wider game. Often these characters will be extensions of the players themselves, but with key elements of their personality altered or removed entirely. The players, the number of which can exceed 2500 per event, meet four times a year at the Dadford Road campsite in the East Midlands, which is temporarily redesigned as an immersive region of the "Empire" known as Anvil. Within Anvil, camps representing each of these nations are set up, and players may travel between these camps to socialise with and learn about others. The in- game premise for gathering these camps together is that Anvil is a central location within the "Empire" of both political and religious significance for all nations, providing a believable reason for the nations to interact and for traditional elements of their cultures to be showcased so deliberately.

The concept of LARP has no distinct origin, having been developed independently since the 1970s in Europe, the United States and Australia.[40] However, it is often perceived as a natural extension from fantasy-based tabletop roleplaying games, such as the well-known *Dungeons and Dragons*.[41]The idea of "extension" derives from players wishing to see their created roles become physically personified and manifested within an appropriately designed context. It is often an opportunity to extend certain elements of one's personality, or to forget certain limitations or insecurities present within one's "out-of-character" self. This has since evolved into a myriad of styles globally, ranging from festival LARPs such as Empire, which feature thousands of players and lasts for several days, to specifically designed and scripted "one-shot" LARPs intended to tell an interactive and immersive story. The genres of these stories and settings also vary considerably, often blurring the lines between historical re-enactment

[38] Nikita Mathur, 'The Lorien Trust'. *The Lorien Trust.* (1991) https://lorientrust.com/. [Accessed 15 December 2020]

[39] Andy Raff, Harry Harrold and Matthew Pennington, 'Game Overview - Empire.', *Empire Wiki* (2013) https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire-wiki/Game_overview. [Accessed 11 March 2019]

[40] Lizzie Stark, *Leaving Mundania: Inside the Transformative World of Live Action Role-Playing Games* (Chicago: Review Press, 2012)

[41] Wizards of the Coast, 'D&D Official Homepage', *Dungeons & Dragons*, https://dnd.wizards.com/. [Accessed 15 December 2020]

and game-based roleplay, as the desire to create an immersive and contextually authentic environment is married with the desire to deliver narrative. Systems such as Allied's "A Wing and a Prayer" aim to tell an immersive story within a British RAF base during the Battle of Britain, but very clearly states that it does not intend to re-enact that section of British history, detailing on their website that "it should feel like stepping into a miniseries of the period, not like being there."[42] This is somewhat akin to the recent phenomenon of Nordic LARP, a style of LARPing popular in the Nordic countries which emphasises full immersion and artistic integrity. Any rules or "briefs" are stripped down to a minimum during the game to allow for the most heightened realism possible.[43] Nordic LARP emphasises "naturalistic emotion" and many of its stories concern educationally or politically motivated material, such as nuclear fallout and dystopian futures.[44] Saitta, editor of *The Foundation Stone of Nordic Larp*, also states in their introduction that the cornerstone of storytelling in Nordic LARP is "collective rather than competitive".[45]

LARP (particularly fantasy and/or science-fiction based systems) maintains a strong relationship with fandom, cosplay and convention cultures within Europe and North America. Many systems are created from the basis of particular fandoms - some of the most popular early LARPs having been based on fantasy and horror material pertaining to vampires - and they maintain links with the original "fandom" of that material. This has resulted in many aesthetic aspects of these sources being pseudo-translated into accurate material for the imagined constructs of a LARP system. Music naturally falls into these constructs, often being called upon as an aid for full immersion within LARP games. However, a strongly established culture of altering musical material in order to fit within a new systemic context already exists. This process is known as "filking" by British LARPers, and a well-established genre of "filk music" has existed within science fiction and fantasy fandom communities since the 1950s. The "filk" genre and the musical process of "filking", while closely linked, do differ slightly in execution. Filk music generally, according to *Interfilk*, refers to folk music with lyrics to a science-fiction or fantasy based theme.[46] The process of filking, while often associated most strongly with folk, does not necessarily require the end result to be classified as folk music. Theoretically, most

---

[42] Allied Games, 'Setting the Tone', *A Wing And A Prayer* (2017) https://www.wingandaprayer.org.uk/setting-the-tone [Accessed 15 December 2020]
[43] See Chapter 4 for full definition of "brief" in the context of this study.
[44] Eleanor Saitta, Marie Holm-Andersen, and Jon Back, *The Foundation Stone of Nordic Larp* (Sweden: Knutpunkt, 2014)
[45] Ibid.
[46] Kathleen Sloan, 'Interfilk', *Interfilk* (1992), http://interfilk.org/ [Accessed 12 March 2019]

forms of parody, satire or stylised cover within musical contexts could be defined as filking in the strictest sense.

LARP systems within Europe have eagerly embraced the concept of filking, particularly in the United Kingdom. LARP in itself within the UK has resulted in a nationwide community of players who are involved with multiple systems and settings, and consequently a certain transference of musical traditions and filked material occurs. Much of this musical culture revolves around drinking songs and pieces or covers intended to provoke positive memories of discontinued or "one-shot" LARP systems. Some musicians within the UK LARP community have chosen to extend certain characters beyond the confines of systems or games; Lou Sutcliffe, High Bard of the Empire as of 2018-19, routinely conducts Facebook livestream videos as their character, answering questions and sharing thoughts about the upcoming events, playing musical requests and introducing new "filks" or adapted musical material. This contribution to the section of the LARP community in their acquaintance may seem incidental, but Sutcliffe's videos illustrate a communal willingness to extend this manufactured musical culture beyond the parameters of the original game. The musical cultures within many LARP systems appear to transcend the respective games' settings, as many LARPers contribute to multiple systems and often bring further ideas and aesthetic material between them.

The musicianship within Empire itself is both varied and considered an integral part of the game and its developing traditions by its players. As Empire is a large festival based LARP with a variety of activities and events available, many players with families attend. Consequently, an educational tool known as the Academy is in place for children of the "Empire" to learn about the mechanics of the game and the history and cultures of the fictional Empire. This also involves memorising the details of in-game spellcasting, the pseudo-religious "Virtues" and the defining cultural features of all ten nations. The non-playable characters (NPCs) in the Academy, arranged by the game's organisers, work with children of the Empire using what are designed to be childhood/nursery rhymes. This method of educating serves two purposes: to ensure that younger players are aware of the main facets of the game and are able to operate convincingly "in-character", and to establish an artificial tradition of childhood rhymes culturally familiar to all within the Empire. This creates the illusion that such pieces of music have always existed and provide a certain degree of pre-determined background history for players encountering difficulties with character creation. This practice also translates well into the illusion of players either having travelled between different nations or having perhaps not done so and therefore excusing lack of awareness about nations which are not their own. Many of the popular pieces of music sung during scripted battles and in-character "festivals"

within the main events are established either within the Academy or during the "out of character" period the night before scheduled events begin. Furthermore, musical elaboration is encouraged between events through use of the online database run by Profound Decisions in which all references, rules and "briefs" are contained.[47] Every nation and its historical and fantastical counterparts have been meticulously researched by the Profound Decisions organisers and a distinct soundworld has been designed for each. Often, .mp3 files of musical examples are provided on the database, and specific instructions are given with regards to tonality, rhythm and instrumentation. However, it is compelling to note that many of the most popular songs performed between nations in Empire remain in a simplistic diatonic form, often filked from British folk songs. It could be argued that this allows for accessibility of performance within the LARP community, as more players are statistically likely to enjoy and repeat these pieces if they are already known entities.

This particular case study will focus specifically on the musical practices of one nation within the Empire: the somewhat Nordically influenced Wintermark. The most striking featureof the introduction page to Wintermark on Empire's online database is the declaration that they are "not Vikings". The nation brief states that "the Steinr [tribe within Wintermark] are inspired by the Anglo Saxons and the Rohirrim from [JRR Tolkien's] *Lord of the Rings* and they follow the "Imperial Religion".[48] There are no longships, raiders or horned helmets, and Thor and the rest of the Norse pantheon are actively excluded from the brief."[49] The implication that this distinction has had to be made to avoid confusion between players is rather noticeable, as it implies that a frequent misinterpretation of the Wintermark brief occurs among new players. Indeed, due to the continued contemporary popularity of Norse-inspired material such as Michael Hirst's History Channel series *Vikings* and the ongoing success of Norwegian group Wardruna, it is unsurprising that many new players may be drawn to the aesthetics of Wintermark due to the close relationship between Viking and Saxon historical material. Many elements of Wintermark's costume design, traditions, and beliefs are features which are stereotypically associated with contemporary Norse re-enactment culture. This generally refers to the use of tunics and furs within costume, notions of heroism and sagas/epic poetry to describe deeds and actions, and the aesthetic imagery associated with cold

---

[47] Ian Thomas, Matthew Pennington and Dave Young, 'Empire', *Empire Wiki* (2013) https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire- wiki/Main_Page. [Accessed 15 December 2020]
[48] Matthew Pennington, David Kibblewhite and Andy Raff, 'Wintermark', *Empire Wiki* (2013) https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire- wiki/Wintermark. [Accessed 15 December 2020]
[49] Ibid.

harsh climates. The musical traditions within Wintermark are inspired directly by both Anglo-Saxon *scops* (from where the name of the character role has been acquired) and Viking *skalds,* both of which refer to both musical and non-musical performing storytellers.

The Scops of Wintermark play a significant role in the transmission of information and sentiment throughout their nation, as according to their brief they provide drum beats and oration during battles.[50] This serves the simultaneous role of providing immersive morale boosts for the players, as well as communicating to the rest of the field what has occurred in different areas of the battle. In the Wintermark cultural brief, Scops are seen as important figureheads who bestow new names to players who have conducted particularly heroic deeds. They also compose alliterative rhyming poetry, often accompanied, in the style of a skald, to describe an account of a battle or commemorate a player whose character has died. This role of orator, storyteller and cultural influencer is vital not only to the Scop player's own immersion, but also that of the players who are represented and honoured by these orations/sagas. Adapting this style of storytelling to a LARP setting is an ideal tool to develop an ongoing sense of history and past actions for players to elaborate on and commemorate.This role of orator, storyteller and cultural influencer is vital not only to the Scop player's own immersion, but also that of the players who are represented and honoured by these orations/sagas. Adapting this style of storytelling to a LARP setting is an ideal tool to develop an ongoing sense of history and past actions for players to elaborate on and commemorate. This is an integral part of reimagining any form of culture, particularly oratory or musical, as it ensures the continuity of narrative and familiarity of material between players. Within a game setting, the role of a Scop also provides an opportunity for fame or even notoriety within the current in-game community, which allows for further plot and character development. Overall, this multi-faceted role provides an insightful case study of a deliberately manufactured cultural figurehead who both provides and reacts to content generated by other members of that culture. The role of the Wintermark Scops, culturally speaking, is akin to a living archivist. This places the musical traditions of Wintermark within the setting of the Empire LARP on our re- enactment/reimagining spectrum in the role of a culture which has been created and owned by a growing and fluctuating community, that is providing further cultural output outside the parameters of its original setting.

---

[50] The difference in italicisation from the old English *"scops"* is deliberate, as the word "Scops" has now been reimagined in the context of *Empire*.

1.6: Summary of the links between case studies, their role in this thesis and their connection to the proposed research aims

These three case studies - historical re-enactment, indigenous cultural revival, and fantasy based cultural roleplay complement each other well with regard to a spectrum of activity between the polarities of re-enactment and reimagining. Many elements of these case studies, such as the generation or origin of the musical culture and its continuity through emic or etic observers of said culture, interweave themselves throughout this spectrum. Each of these studies will be used to evidence further links and relationships between them with regard to authenticity, immersion and creative process. These links are integral to determining the intertwining relationships between *desire, process* and *result* in the proposed theoretical model that encompasses the full spectrum of activity between re-enactment and reimagining.[51] There will be particular occasions where the content of these case studies must remain distinct from the others, particularly when the question of indigenous politics in the Sámi case study is concerned, but otherwise they will be referred to together, with the aim that they will support one another to achieve wider understanding of the process of creative reimagining.

The aforementioned 2019 volume, the *Routledge Handbook of Re-enactment Studies*, represents a significant threading together of disparate elements of study over the course of many decades. In its introductory chapter, the volume highlights a responsibility of re-enactment studies as a discipline to "tend to its own disciplinary history".[52] Many past works incorporating academic consideration of re-enactment and/or roleplay view them through a narrowly focused lens – usually an emphasis on the specific historical or cultural context that the re-enactment is taking place in commemoration of. While entirely understandable, this historic approach has resulted in a lack of opportunities to establish more widely-functioning working theories and philosophical models. This thesis demonstrates a careful selection of theories not only involving how this focus can continue to be widened, but also how the entire process and practice of studying re- enactment and recreation can be made more individual-centric. This therefore allows us to engage with the first research question in an effective and accessible manner; a widening focus allows for more varied approaches to both authenticity and

---

[51] See Chapter 2, section 1.1

[52] Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb, and Juliane Tomann, 'Introduction: What is Re-enactment Studies?', in *The Routledge Handbook of Re-enactment Studies: Key Terms in the Field*, ed. by Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb and Juliane Tomann(London: Routledge, 2019) pp. 1-10 (p. 8)

immersion. That focus will naturally complement the second and third aims of this project: to place relevance upon the concepts of correctness and validity when placed in a context of historical authenticity, as well as to establish an adaptable theoretical method for understanding and engaging creatively with cultures that practice these forms of re-imagining.

Ultimately, this thesis intends to answer the proposed research questions by demonstrating a selection of ways in which the Re-enactment Activity Spectrum and Desire-Process-Result models can be utilised to contribute to the relatively young field of re-enactment studies. To demonstrate the robustness of these models, it is necessary to bring examples from further afield than the "traditional" notions of what re-enactment and roleplay tend to look like. This not only displays the viability of the models as academic tools, but also encourages a wider association of key theoretical concepts within re-enactment studies with other related disciplines. The next chapter will demonstrate a key selection of such concepts as these, their role within this thesis, and the potential for incorporating them into further study. This will not only provide a strong foundation for the theoretical framework of this project, but also demonstrate the necessity of broadening the different fields considered in relation to historically informed reimagining and recreation.

Chapter 2

Theoretical Implications of Reimagining

The study of sound and music in Nordic historical re-enactment and reimagined settings will concern inter-disciplinary analysis and exploration, particularly in the case of the most contemporary examples present in future case study chapters. The following two chapters will introduce my primary methodologies and assess wider bodies of literature and their efficacy at implementing these. First, it will be necessary to unpack the different theoretical implications of this study, which I have defined here as the placing of re-enactment and reimagining on a spectrum of activity. As established in Chapter 1's Research Questions section, the *Reimagining Activity Spectrum* is one of the key research findings of this thesis and will be frequently referred to throughout the duration of this thesis along with the Desire-Process-Result model. This spectrum will incorporate the viewing of historically informed and inspired settings as simulations of various levels of engagement, and finally the relationship and communication between historically informed sound and wider cultural implications of authenticity, immersion and ownership. Following this, it will be prudent to analyse the current work already completed in each discipline, and ultimately select which approaches are most appropriate for use in the theoretical framework constructed here. The study of the creative processes behind reimagining and re-enacting historical music in contemporary settings begins with a selection of analytical groundwork on which to place all findings in this chapter. This many-layered consideration and criticism of both literature and methodology will lay a solid foundation for the examination of the new case studies I will be introducing within this thesis, as it is this continuity of knowledge between them that results in an effective theoretical framework being established.

For the purposes of this study, relevant existing literature on the topics of semiotics, topic theory, authenticity, nostalgia, hauntology, structural anthropology and archaeomusicology will all be combined with proposed methodologies, using some examples of context from this project's fieldwork settings, to bolster understanding of the links between each. It is necessary not only to fulfil the traditional purpose of a literature review - to evaluate, criticise and justify existing work within these fields - but also to present their evaluation for use in practical and analytical contexts. Consequently, the following chapters will evaluate chosen literature while demonstrating their implications to justify viable methodologies.

The principal aim in bringing these theories and topics together is to provide groundwork for the Reimagining Activity Spectrum theory – the goal of this theory ultimately being to categorise the different practices present today, and to enable exploring the suitability of different semiotic and analytical tools for different areas of this spectrum. Exploring the reimagining and re-enacting of creative historical content in this way enables much more freedom and in-depth analysis of reasons, inspirations and consequences for displacing and altering reimaginings of pre-existing cultures. Much of the variety in the spectrum relates to either deliberate or unavoidable changes in process. For example, this spectrum would begin with entirely faithful, authentic and disciplined re-enactment of a piece of content. However, many variable factors result in further movement along this spectrum. This would include contemporary allowances such as participants in living history displays requiring glasses or hearing aids. This could progress to deliberate conscious alterations for ease or capability, such as replicas of historical stringed instruments using nylon strings instead of horse-hair for reasons of tuning.

Both ideas lead to contemporary assumptions in the creative process, causing the reimagined content to inhabit an entirely new sphere of reality non-existent in its original historical period. This brings us to the idea of living history, or procedurally-generated fantasy settings with historical inspiration, as simulated microcosms of a real or fictional historical period. The idea of a simulated microcosm can then be incorporated into analysis of L.A.R.P. and historically informed creative content, such as media from historical fantasy genres. Considering these settings as examples of new spheres of reality will allow us to consider both ideas of accuracy and authenticity and the concept of full or partial immersion.

In the case of stricter, historically informed re-enactment settings, what must next be unpacked and examined is the process behind truly and accurately recreating sound that would have been heard during certain historical periods. However, that is not and cannot be the point in which the question would end; as R.G. Collingwood says in his theory of history.[52]

> The historian[…]is investigating not mere events but actions, and an action is the unity of the outside and inside of an event…His work may begin by discovering the outside of an event, but it can never end there; he must always remember that the event was an action, and that his main task is to think himself into the action, to discern the thought of its agent.[53]

---

[53] R.G. Collingwood, *The Idea of History* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1946)

As Collingwood states, the examination of a historical event, in this case a sound, cannot end with the outside impression. The implication from such a statement is that we must aim to recreate or at the very least simulate the event or action in some manner to gain some understanding of its interior. Karsten Stueber supports this notion, detailing in his article "The Psychological Basis of Historical Explanation" that "re-enactment is of essential importance for our understanding of rational agency".[54] Once we have established the identity and role of "true" history and the place of a historian's analysis in this study, we can then move on to examine the particular relationships between the sounds themselves and the wider cultural and historical contexts in which they exist.

This need for a closer analysis will lead us to the placing of these cultural relationships and interactions with historically informed and inspired settings in the world of semiotics and communication. Particularly in the Sámi case study and its place as a historically revived contemporary culture, the relationship between its musical techniques and the evolution of wider Sámi culture must be examined through the lens of semiotics to establish patterns, topographies and to some extent a genetic graph of the wider processes and creative implications of *joik* and its fusions and evolutions. In this instance, an examination of contemporary ethnomusicological study of the region will be necessary, as well as an investigation of research concerning the wider cultural revival and its relationship with modern semiotic consideration.

This chapter will identify three main philosophical frameworks with which to examine the respective main elements of historical reimagining: desire, process and result. As the concept of historical reimagining is vast when encompassing all areas of re-enactment, roleplay and revival, a correspondingly wide variety of frameworks is required. Separating the elements of desire, process and result will allow us to apply differing areas of aesthetic and creative philosophy to provide a clear illustration of the theories behind reimagining. The desire to create something new from something "of the past" is a significant feature of the field of hauntology – a philosophical discipline that theorises nostalgia and longing for the past, making it ideal to use as an analytical tool for understanding the desires and motivations behind recreating historical content.[55] This will also be beneficial to understanding more delicate areas of indigenous cultural revival and maintaining an appropriate distance between true revival of existing cultural practices and the simulation of historical practices for the purposes of entertainment or roleplay. Hauntology will allow us to consider further areas of structural and

[54] Karsten R. Stueber, 'The Psychological Basis of Historical Explanation: Re-enactment, Simulation, and the Fusion of Horizons', *History and Theory,* 41: 1 (2002) pp. 25–42

[55] Mark Fisher, 'What Is Hauntology?' *Film Quarterly* 66: 1 (2012) pp. 16–24

social anthropology to provide a sound theoretical baseline for analysis of our Sámi case study. Similarly, the process of communicating that something is "of the past" but also recreated into something new involves the understanding and examination of a series of encoded cultural and aesthetic signs, thus necessitating the need for a semiotic analysis as described above. This field of study will enable us to parse the creative process behind historical recreation as well as the organic considerations of performance and setting.

Finally, the theory of simulacra will assist us in analysing the result of this reimagining process. Operating with the assumption that, when created, the content leaves the hand of the creator, it is then liable to become something other than its original intent when exposed to other participants or audiences. This post-creation process, in other words, allows simulations of the original content to be perpetuated, illustrating the need for an understanding and consideration of simulacra theory. As this is a vast topic with considerable history, it will be necessary to chronicle and explain the process of this concept's evolution and select specific philosophers with which to form an analysis for the purposes of this study.

It will be necessary to unpack brief histories of each discipline and demonstrate which areas will be most appropriate for use in this study; it is significant to note that certain areas of musicology will be carefully and deliberately selected throughout this process due to the differences in case study material and theoretical intent. Following these sections, an initial framework of how each philosophical discipline will be applied to different elements of our chosen case studies will be demonstrated, illustrating both the necessity of different theoretical approaches for different areas, as well as the efficacy of placing these concepts on a spectrum of activity to map their movement and evolution as the different industries involving historical reimagining continue to grow.

As a final introduction to this chapter, it is necessary to consider some prior examples of theoretical models for musical revival. The introductory chapter of the *Oxford Handbook of Music Revival* provides compelling reasons for delving into the past in an academic manner.[56] However, the model focuses on just that – the past. The opportunity to develop this further into the effect of this investigation into revival on ongoing practices. The opportunity to develop the model further and use it to investigate ongoing revival practices does not appear present. This could be construed as a reluctance to assess creative consequences of musical revivals and the validity of the subcultures born from such practices. The authors concentrate on the concept of

---

[56] Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill, 'An Introduction to Musical Revival as Concept, Cultural Process and Medium of Change', in *The Oxford Handbook of Music Revival*, ed. by Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016) pp. 3-43

musical revival as an intended "product", referring to specifically product-oriented criteria. This does not effectively evaluate the personal contribution of individuals to the process of musical revival. Vargo & Lusch (2008) determine in *On Value & Value Co-Creation* that to value something, in this case a musical revival, as a "product", one has to also value the networks and relationships that have caused that product to exist. The creation of value can be viewed as a personal responsibility that is shared among individuals when devising a "product". [57]

The *Oxford Handbook of Musical Revival* recontextualizes this concept (as later set out by Ronstrom in chapter 2) by referring to the process as a "shift". Hill & Bithell define the "shift" in chapter 1 as a "comparatively neutral, depoliticized concept that is suggestive as much of a natural process as of individual intention or institutional strategy".[58] While this interpretation works effectively when examining revivals in musicological contexts, there is a further need for clarity when placing this in the context of revived cultures and subcultures born of historically informed inspiration.

My proposed models are similar to Hill & Bithell's model in that all are multi-dimensional. The work also illustrates that revivalist discourse remains imbued with possibility for further exploration. Tamara Livingston in particular proposes compelling questions about how the study of musical revivals in participatory contexts can be extended:

> The participatory music making perspective may also reveal interesting findings about how ideologies of authenticity and historical continuity become personally meaningful to revival participants. What happens when the sonic bonding that occurs during participatory music making is associated with revivalist discourses of historical continuity and authenticity? Or, conversely, just because participatory music making is framed with a particular ideology, does this mean that participants will accept or internalize these meanings? How do the motivations of players differ from those not directly involved in performance? Are there tensions between these music fields within revivals that result in individual and cohort shifts during the revival process? Clearly there is still much we do not know about the revival process, and I hope that future

---

[57] Stephen L. Vargo, Paul P Maglio, and Melissa Archpru Akaka. 'On Value and Value Co-Creation: A Service Systems and Service Logic Perspective', *European Management Journal,* 26: 3 (2008) pp. 145-152

[58] Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill, 'An Introduction to Music Revival as Concept, Cultural Process, and Medium of Change', in *The Oxford Handbook of Music Revival*, ed. by Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016) pp. 3-43 (p. 15)

researchers will take up the challenge in studying this aspect.[59]

Livingston's demonstrated querying of links (or lack thereof) between participatory bonding and interaction and historically loaded discourse is a particularly relevant point of consideration in this thesis. Ultimately, the Reimagining Activity Spectrum and the Desire-Process-Result model present an opportunity for these links to be examined in such a way as to encourage continued academic discourse on reimagined musical cultures without necessarily compromising the inherent social and/or cultural underpinnings of those cultures. Furthermore, the *Oxford Handbook of Musical Revival* concludes with M. Slobin's open-ended encouragement of "tactile, tactful and tactical strategies from our own ethnomusicological understandings".[60] Therefore, moving forward, this study's underpinning theoretical frameworks and methodologies will be unpacked in the following two chapters with this philosophy firmly in mind. Slobin's trifecta of "tactile, tactful and tactical" is only too appropriate for the variety in case studies, inherently communal and human-led nature of the practices, as well as the malleability needed to ensure the resulting two theoretical models are functional and appropriate for future use.[61]

2.1: Hauntology

It is important to distinguish between the two primary "branches" of hauntology currently in existence prior to applying them to this study. While the original philosophical concept was developed in 1993 by Jacques Derrida in his work *Spectres of Marx,* many other authors have gone on to use derivations of the original term. In its simplest form, hauntology refers to the continuation or revival of some element of the past, often described as akin to a ghost, resulting in the "haunting" concept of the neologism. More recently, the word "hauntology" has since been used to describe a loose category of electronic music from the early 2000s, which principally drew upon notable (or notorious) pieces of media from the 20th century, with an intent to evoke familiarity or sometimes shock.

Both the loose genre of music and the original deconstructive concept as coined by

---

[59] Tamara Livingston, 'Revivals As Cosmopolitan Participatory Music Making', in *The Oxford Handbook of Musical Revival* ed. by Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014) pp. 60-72 (p. 68)

[60] Mark Slobin, 'Re-Flections', in *The Oxford Handbook of Musical Revival,* ed. by Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014) pp. 666-72 (p. 671)

[61] Ibid. p. 671

Derrida have places in the analysis of revival, re-enactment and roleplay. The theory of hauntology has a significant role in indigenous cultural revival (particularly in the context of the Sámi, who have dealt with generational displacement and inherited trauma in a variety of forms). All efforts and initiatives to revive various elements of Sámi culture are inherently affected by the past history of the region; for example, many older aesthetic traditions are only partially recorded (if they are at all) due to the historic outlawing of many elements of these traditions by Christian settlers. Therefore, all attempts to piece together these practices will inherently be affected by a different historical period, resulting in them being "haunted" by something "of the past" that is not the intended period at which the cultural revival or recreation is aimed. This can also be seen in contemporary interpretations of Viking aesthetics and culture across northern Europe, due to historic associations with far-right extremism colouring the outward impressions of this imagery. This section will elaborate further on the anthropological implications of hauntology in the context of the Sámi cultural revival, as well as illustrating the more overtly hauntological elements of historical re-enactment and roleplay using both the philosophical and contemporary musical definitions of the term.

An important consideration of hauntology is that many works that could be classified as "haunted" by theoretical definition - or indeed could be steeped in nostalgia - do not contain explicit references to the past. Mark Fisher in "What is Hauntology?" refers specifically to nostalgia for modernism in "futuristic" electronic music of the 20th century. He describes the genre as bringing us into a "time beyond history".[62] This concept can be brought easily into re-enactment and roleplay, particularly the latter, as a "time beyond history" is arguably the whole intention of playing out a particular historical scenario, whether in period-accurate or fantasy settings. Fisher also refers to lingering reminders, or "curses" from universally vilified or notorious periods of history, using the setting of Yorkshire and depictions of Peter Sutcliffe's crimes in British film and television as his primary example.[63] Implementing culturally recognisable themes from that setting, while not explicitly referring to that period or those events, produces the effect of "haunting", as audiences are indirectly reminded of a particular era or circumstance.

This is a phenomenon often seen in contemporary Viking re-enactment, particularyl the troubling associations with neo-Nazi symbolism and ideology that many old Norse symbols and aesthetics are now saddled with. These associations can also be seen in the anachronistic

---

[62] Fisher, Mark, 'What Is Hauntology?' *Film Quarterly* 66:1 (2012) pp. 16–24 (p. 10)
[63] Ibid, p. 24

interpretations of Viking patriarchy and military ethic stemming from the popular imagery of Norse mythology prevalent in Victorian England. Faroese metal group Tyr specifically highlight these associations in their song "The Shadow of the Swastika" (2011) after a controversy with German news media erroneously reporting their work as extreme right-wing propaganda.[64] Despite the fact that these references are typically illegal in much of northern Europe, it appears the association continues to persist. As a result, this situation is a prime example of a culture which is simultaneously displaced as well as haunted by a series of associations and symbolisms that exist "beyond time". As Nazism has continued to exist in new guises since the initial historical period associated with it, this is another example of recipients of these cultures being indirectly reminded of something else; in other words, a "haunting". Therefore, the concept of timelessness is exceptionally useful when analysing creative content stemming from newly generated cultures such as re-enactment and roleplay. It is a compelling source of insight into how and why certain elements of an older culture or familiarised associations are appealing to creators and recipients of this content.

While Derrida did not often explicitly use the term "hauntology" in *The Specters of Marx*, he introduces the concept of haunting and spectrality as an ongoing phenomenon that can be triggered by association, process or idea.[65] He refers to three key elements of a philosophical spectre (mourning, language and "work") and uses these principles to specifically analyse Marxism. However, these concepts can reach rather further and be used to analyse many elements of aesthetic culture, as well as social or political. Interestingly, Derrida also engages with the characterisation of ghosts or "spectres" as simulacra, a philosophical concept which will be further examined later in this chapter.

Ultimately, this initial philosophical framework and those which have followed since 1993 are an integral part of establishing the motives and unconscious biases or tendencies behind the desire to recreate historical content in a creative setting. It is not only useful but vital to consider hauntological implications of the evolution of Sámi culture, given the historical trauma passed between generations. As established in this section, there is also compelling evidence for the "haunting" of previous cohorts of re-enactors, of historical and/or cultural attitudes, as well as that of seeking comfort in known and established tradition, in many different forms of re-enactment and roleplay. These considerations place hauntology as

---

[64] Catherine Hoad and Samuel Whiting, 'True Kvlt? The Cultural Capital of "Nordicness" in Extreme Metal', *M/C Journal*, 20:6 (2017) pp. 1-10

[65] Derrida, Jacques, *Specters of Marx: The State of the Debt, the Work of Mourning and the New International* (New York: Routledge, 2006)

one of the ideal theoretical frameworks for the "desire" element of our desire-process-result model, as well as its use as a tool for establishing a practice's place on the re-enactment-reimagining spectrum.

Hauntology will also be valuable in determining the validity of displaced (or seemingly displaced) nostalgia in different forms of historical recreation. In other words, examining the theories behind why different individuals and groups are "haunted" by various aesthetic or cultural concepts and/or objects will enable us to explain why some groups may feel a longing for kinship to an element of the past which, at first perception, does not seem to even be tangentially related to that group. For the purposes of music, this branch of philosophy will lend itself well to establishing sound-based historical associations, as well as key features of musical processes and creation in attempting to create something both familiar to those with relevant specialist knowledge and to the general consuming public with societally encoded ideas. Many of these pre-determined notions of what history "ought to sound like" have a significant basis in the core theories of hauntology; the public's perceived idea of "Viking music" predominantly being based on drones, animal horns and frame drums are a good example of this.

Overall, hauntology gives us the tools to determine which elements of the past are "seen" by both audiences and participants in historical recreation, as well as which elements are most compelling for conversion into a present-day process for creative content. This theoretical framework is also particularly valuable when examining the effects of global events on different areas of creativity. Finally, the theory of aesthetic hauntology places a great deal of significance on both symbols and signs, which makes it ideal to be paired with semiotics when analysing historical musical content, as this next section will elaborate.

2.2: Semiotics, Topic Theory and Historical Musicology

Many different philosophers, musicologists and semiologists have approached the concept of semiotic analysis as a practical investigative tool in recent academic discipline. As such, when particularly referring to musicology and music analysis, there has been a considerable variation in terms used, and in the definition of particular theories and models. It will therefore be necessary to adopt the ideas and terminologies of Peirce, Agawu and Monelle in order to do justice to the varied points of historical connection and activity on our spectrum. I will be

focusing on two distinct sides of semiotic analysis: Saussurean and Peircean. Saussurean semiotics (or semiology) is more commonly used among musicologists, including Jean-Jacques Nattiez. This system is traditionally favoured amongst musicologists due to its effectiveness in establishing clarity in relationships. The second system is more complex, featuring threefold semiotic analysis (sign, object and interpretant), including Charles Sanders Peirce and those who reference him, such as Raymond Monelle. This chapter will conclude with a reasoned and well-evidenced consideration of the most appropriate set of semiotic and theoretical tools and analysis with which to understand the wider relationship between re- enactment, culture and sound in contemporary historically informed and inspired settings.

Raymond Monelle: Introducing Peircean Semiotics in a Musical Context

As one of the pioneering scholars in contemporary music semiotics and signification, Raymond Monelle's work was particularly important during the initial theoretical research of this project. In beginning to establish the most suitable analytical processes for examining contemporary Nordic music such as Wardruna, I commenced with Monelle's book *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music*[59]*,* with particular focus on iconism.[66] In *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music,* Monelle refers to Charles Sanders Peirce's idea of threefold signs to establish layers of meaning between objects and ideas, as well as the fashioning and establishment of "icons" – this became a key analytical tool in the later stages of this thesis. Monelle's work provided an ideal starting point when examining the place of a semiotic analysis in the study of reimagined musical cultures from ancient historical periods, as Monelle refers to a wide variety of disciplines and outlines their relations to specifically musical semiotics and the boundaries thereof.

Monelle intended his work to be viewed as a comprehensive guide to many of the varied practices within the world of music semiotics, including that of Peirce and his contemporaries.[67] This provides a useful departure from the reasonably established norm of music semiotic studies; threefold semiotics is often eschewed in contemporary studies of the topic. In its simplest form, Monelle describes semiotics as a new, radical and "rigorously scientific" theory as a basis for the analysis and criticism of signs and meanings within

---

[66] Raymond Monelle, *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music* (Harwood: University of Edinburgh, 2014)
[67] Ibid, p. 30

societies.[68] The discipline of music and semiotics is widely agreed to have been born in the fifties and sixties. Since then it has become clear that for the study of ethnomusicology, particularly as part of the wider anthropological study, required "powerful general theories" similar to that of linguists, as the general methods and technical language used in musicology prior to this discipline were unbefitting in encounters with unfamiliar musical styles from cultures hitherto unresearched.[69]

This initial comparison, made by Monelle in his introductory chapter of *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music*, illustrates perfectly the need for a rigorous semiotic approach in the study of musical cultures which have been reimagined from something we can no longer tangibly study. In the case of examining a culture from a long past period of history, archaeological evidence and historical sources and documentation require strict and to some extent uncompromisingly scientific procedures to produce a well-reasoned and researched interpretation of that area of the past. Following this, the examination must be unfettered by conjecture and prejudice from later centuries; it is exceptionally important to consider a source's validity and ulterior motives. So, by the logic at work here, it would seem to make sense that a similar level of pure theoretical groundwork is required for the objective and accurate study of musical cultures no longer able to be accessed or experienced by modern ears.

Monelle goes on to illustrate the opposition to this very clinical conclusion that pure scientific theory must remain at the root of all anthropological study of arts and humanities. He states that analytical criticism of the arts "must be sensitive to the unique qualities of each work, and that theory is a combination of self-indulgent hot air and clandestine propaganda".[70] He quickly follows this extreme notion by examining the sensitivity and exclusivity/elitism of what he refers to as "Western critical theory", and the "defending of entrenched and therefore unrevealed canons".[71] This, therefore, leads Monelle to the conclusion that information about a culture or form of art must be formed on deductive and inductive logic, study and empirical observation. He refers to Christopher Norris' concept of making the "epistemological break that marks the transition from lived ideology to genuine theoretical knowledge".[72] In other words, we cannot have objective information or study without the presence of theory, as without it

---

[68] Ibid, p. 24
[69] Ibid, p. 21
[70] Ibid, p. 22
[71] Ibid, p. 22
[72] Christopher Norris, 'Utopian deconstruction: Ernst Bloch, Paul de Man and the politics of music', in *Music and the Politics of Culture*, ed. by Christopher Norris (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1989) pp. 305-47 (p. 306)

there is no substance to measure. This indicates a requirement for a measured and tempered approach in this study of reimagined Nordic musical traditions: the rigorous application of scientifically and linguistically grounded theory in the study of music semiotics, but not to the exclusion of the unique qualities of the cultures in question.

This initial exercise of examining the wide range of semiotic principles and ideas put forward by Monelle in the context of historical reimagining indicates that the relationship between musical signs of this nature and iconism, as well as the beginnings of a threefold (sign, object and interpretant) approach, can indeed be a reasonably harmonious one. Monelle's chapter on icons, index and symbols introduces us swiftly to the work of Charles Sanders Peirce, who based many theoretical and philosophical principles on a threefold model, linguistics and semiotics included.[73] It will, therefore, be necessary to carry the example of the Kirkehelleren performance further and place it within the context of Peirce's work itself to truly analyse the potential for a more unusual threefold approach in semiotic methodology when unpacking these contemporary reimagined musical ideas further in fieldwork. The consideration of Peircean *qualisigns* and *sinsigns* in particular will prove both relevant and invaluable when determining the foundations of an authentic historical process.

Charles Sanders Peirce: Unpacking Threefold Semiotics

Raymond Monelle refers heavily to Charles Sanders Peirce in Chapter 7 of *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music*. A particular feature of Peircean semiotics is the importance of a threefold system. Peirce considered the semiotic functioning of something – the point at which it becomes a sign – to be present when three levels of meaning were functioning at once: the sign, the object and the interpretant. These complement Peirce's other trichotomies well in his assorted philosophical writings, as well as the three basic foundations of his study: Firstness, Secondness and Thirdness. Respectively, these refer to possibility, reality or experience, and finally understanding or cognition, which is the plane on which most studies of sign and meaning reside. Thirdness, more specifically the interpretant of Peirce's trichotomy, is what interests us in this particular study, as the entire concept of historical re-enactment and creatively informed historical reimagining depends on the presence of an interpretant. In other words, a historically informed creative concept in a musical performance requires all participants, audience and performers alike, to interpret the performance within the context

---

[73] Raymond Monelle, *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music* (Harwood: University of Edinburgh, 2014) p. 193

of "historicalness". All issues of authenticity and immersion require a level of prior understanding and awareness in order to convey their full message, and the following section will consider the place of the threefold principle, particularly that of interpretants, within the wider context of our chosen case studies. This will assist us in determining the place of this particular brand of semiotic study in the examination of further data from these case studies.

In his 1897 essay "Logic as Semiotic: The Theory of Signs", Peirce begins to classify the large number of definitions by which a standard sign can exist; in total he provides ten assorted classes of signs.[74] In his continued correspondence with Lady Victoria Welby in 1904, he provides a precursor for these classificiations.

> A sign has two objects, its object as it is represented and its object in itself. It also has three interpretants, its interpretant as represented or meant to be understood, its interpretant as it is produced, and its interpretant in itself. Now signs may be divided as to their own material nature, as to their relations to their objects, and as to their relation to their interpretants.[75]

However, for the purposes of this study, the focus will be on the definitions present in Peirce's first trichotomy: qualisigns, legisigns and sinsigns. A historical re-enactor in period costume, who is immersed in the environment created by this attention to historical detail, is operating under all of these signs simultaneously in some manner. The "qualisign", which only becomes a sign once it is embodied with meaning, is a "quality which is a sign", by Peirce's own description.[76] A re-enactor will wear a tunic, belt and turned leather shoes in order to represent the standard dress of the Viking age in England, and we can describe this costume as a "qualisign"; the clothes themselves, and the fabric they are made from, are not imbued with any distinct meaning of "historicalness", but once they are worn by a re-enactor who is immersed and actively representing a historical period to a spectating audience, they become qualisigns of that historical period. Following this chain of thought, by Peirce's definition, and Raymond Monelle's later elaboration of it in *Linguistics and Semiotics in Musi¹*, a sinsign is an

---

[74] Charles Sanders Peirce 'Logic as Semiotic: The Theory of Signs [1897]' *The Philosophical Writing of Peirce* (Dover: Buchler, 1945) pp. 98-120

[75] 'Letter from Charles Sanders Peirce to Lady Victoria Welby [1904]', in *Semiotic and Significs: The Correspondence between Charles S. Peirce and Lady Victoria Welby*, ed. by Charles S Hardwick and James Cook(Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977) p. 101

[76] Charles Sanders Peirce, 'Logic as Semiotic: The Theory of Signs' in *The Philosophical Writing of Peirce* (Dover: Buchler, 1945) pp. 98-120 (p. 101)

"actual existent thing or event which is a sign".[77] By this implication, it can be made up of multiple qualisigns in order to exist imminently as a sinsign. This fits well with the concept of historical re-enactment, as in order to develop a fully immersive environment free of visible anachronisms, a huge amount of attention to detail is required. That is to say, the wider display of a re-enactment group is the sinsign, and the costumes, weapons, props and modes of speech and interaction are its collective qualisigns.

Ultimately, Peirce's highly distinct view of semiotics in his philosophical writings, particularly those during the 1931–1938 period that are the primary concern of this chapter, offer a great deal of insight and potential for useful and compelling methodology in the categorising and topographical study of historically informed and creatively re-imagined Nordic musical traditions. This is particularly evident as an effective process when these traditions are placed on our spectrum of activity between historically informed re-enactment and creatively looser re-imagining. The exceptionally detailed categorising and classification of different signs, and their interpretants thereof, provide enough of a wide range of scenarios and appropriate ideas to accommodate a moving spectrum of traditions, immersion and authenticity. Conversely, this insight does indicate an encouragingly positive justification for the use of threefold semiotic analysis in such case studies as these. This is demonstrated in the position of an interpretant present between a sign and its object, as this is seemingly integral when examining differing levels of immersion within re-enactment and LARP settings, and the intentional and necessary anachronisms – the small but deliberate breaches of historical accuracy – in order to achieve a more "natural" seeming performance or setting. It is therefore important to consider Peirce's contributions to modern semiotics, although much further work in the discipline has taken place since these original sources were published. Raymond Monelle, Danuta Mirka and Kofi Agawu have all utilised these core Peircean principles in their own more contemporary work, some of which will be discussed here in relation to this project. While all of these authors use these principles throughout their work in ways that are relevant to this study, a particularly elegant comparison of the differing levels of immersion within any one setting can be made by combining the principles of threefold semiotics with examining the moving parts of an immersive sonic environment – in other words, a soundscape. It is therefore useful to examine the work of R. Murray Schafer in immediate conjunction to Peirce's initial principles.

---

[77] Raymond Monelle, *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music* (Harwood: University of Edinburgh, 2014) p. 24

R. Murray Shafer: The Soundscape as a Tool for Deconstructing Immersion

Peirce's interpretation of semiotic study allows us to place a significant emphasis on both the context of a sound and constituent parts of that context, when examining the relationship between signs, meaning and historical re-enactment and creative re-imagining. It is therefore a fairly natural step towards examining the semiotic and musicological study of that context itself; in other words, the study of the soundscape of these performances and traditions. Raymond Murray Schafer has spent several decades, through both composition and musicology, enabling us to have a greater understanding of relationships between sounds and their environments; in other words, the signs and meanings surrounding these sounds and contexts. Schafer's insights will become of particularly remarkable significance when considering the reimagined Arctic soundworlds present in almost all contemporary Sámi folk music, as *joik* is so inherently intertwined with the natural environment of the northern Nordic countries. Barry Truax supports many of Schafer's interpretations of these relationships in his work *Acoustic Communication.*[78] Truax purports that all sound operates, not through signals but as a form of semiotics, resulting in the eponymous phenomenon of "acoustic communication". He also highlights how the meaning of this communication changes in different contexts, and emphasises the need to bridge the gap between these meanings, which according to him does not happen often enough. Arguably this "gap" is being bridged in the case of historical reimagining, as the meaning is having to noticeably change. This idea of communication through semiotic form as opposed to physical signal is integral to the creative process of all our main case studies, as the embodiment of what is a potentially long lost culture must rely on a tangible relationship between the sound and its recipients to imbue said sound with "historicalness". Both of these authors have indicated the further relationship between sound and listener and identified the need for a flexible process in interpreting the meanings within this relationship, which renders their findings exceptionally relevant for the purposes of this research.

Schafer has previously been linked to Saussurean semiotics owing to the aforementioned parallels between "sound events" as a sound within context, and the Saussurean concept of "signifier" and "signified".[79] In many of his works, Schafer highlights the significance of sound (and more particularly soundscape) achieving new and heightened meaning when placed within different contexts. Schafer's theories on acoustic environments

[78] Barry Truax, *Acoustic Communication,* 2nd edn (New York: Ablex, 1994)

[79] Gabriele Proy, 'Sound and Sign', *Organised Sound*, 7: 1 (2002) pp. 15–19

reveal further insights regarding the societies and cultures which are existing within these acoustic environments. This project also considers the creative reimagining of pre-recorded sounds within historical contexts, which works effectively alongside Schafer's concept of "schizophonia" – the splitting or separating of a sound from its original environment and context – and the implications thereof when repurposing these split sounds as Peirce's idea of qualisigns for a wider sinsign of a historically informed performance.[80]

Raymond Murray Schafer engages with a wide variety of acoustic environments in his iconic work on soundscape, *The Tuning of the World.*[81] His overriding sentiment throughout is the idea of immense musical and musicological possibility through sound and soundscape; that is to say, how all sounds exist in a realm of possibility for the purposes of music-making. Throughout the work and specifically in Chapter 1: The Natural Soundscape, he purports a distinct wistfulness for the continuing lack of identification and recognition of specific sounds within modern acoustic environments; the specific example he uses is when referring to bird sounds in modern acoustic environments, observers are more often than not expected to remark that they hear "a bird" rather than naming a specific species, or seeking out the exact source of the sound.[82] This idea of "wistfulness" is a concept which relates to many other sources relevant to this project, as it resonates strongly with the concept of historical or cultural immersion, and the idea of blending individual components into a wider experience which invokes particular feelings or ideas in its participants.

It appears that Schafer's research method and ideas remain ideal tools with which to dissect the relationship that sounds have with their environment and the interpretation or immersion observed and experienced by both the spectator and the performer. As all of our major case studies feature *a desire* for "authenticity", which can potentially lead into a desire to siphon certain features out of a sonic environment. As most of the traditions and situations we will be examining in this study feature live performance in some capacity, it will be necessary to examine how these soundscapes are built up with the "correct" sounds, rather than focusing on the removal of the unwanted sounds. Schafer's principles almost bridge the gap between Peircean semiotics and semiology purported by Saussure and Nattiez, but certain features remain at odds with this particular project's investigation, which will be

---

[80] Raymond Murray Schafer, *The New Soundscape: A Handbook for the Modern Music Teacher* (Vancouver: BMI Canada, 1969) p. 43

[81] Raymond Murray Schafer, *The Soundscape: Our Sonic Environment and the Tuning of the World* (Vancouver: Destiny Books, 1977)

[82] Ibid.

examined in the following section.

Jean-Jacques Nattiez: Studying an Indigenous Tradition Using Semiotics

Jean-Jacques Nattiez is a figurehead of one of the two main branches of music semiotics, namely the "structuralist" tradition. In his well known works *Fondements d'une sémiologie de la musique*, and the subsequent English translation and reworking *Music and Discourse: Toward a Semiology of Music,[77]* he applies semiotic patterns originating from structural linguistics to musical analysis.[83] This is with the intention of comparing Saussurean and Peircean disciplines and providing a topographical discourse on the continued discussion of music semiotics, since these two figureheads of the discipline have left their respective work on the topic open to continuation. Nattiez's form of semiotic musical analysis relies, in a manner not dissimilar to C.S. Peirce, on a tripartition: the poietic, the neutral, and finally the esthesic or aesthesic. In other words, this respectively refers to the modes of creation such as the composer, the immanently tangible material such as a musical score, and finally the interpretation by a listener or spectator.[84] This section will investigate Nattiez's approach to the analysis of musical activity in indigenous cultures, most particularly his analytical and semiotic work with *katajjaq*, Canadian Inuit vocal throat games, as well as his ethnographic approach to categorising and studying this aural tradition. Following this, his approach in both semiotic analysis and advanced ethnography will be examined in relation to the oral vocal tradition which is the subject of this particular investigation; the Sámi tradition of *joik*. In particular, it is significant to consider Nattiez's choices in methodology – namely, the similarities and differences between studying Inuit vocal throat games and *joik* in terms of analysing, transposing and relating back to cultural processes and relationships.

In his article specifically on the topic of *katarjjaq*, "Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games", as well as his comparison paper "Inuit Throat-Games and Siberian Throat Singing: A Comparative, Historical and Semiological Approach", Nattiez begins to illustrate the significance of semiotic study and analysis within an ethnographic process.[85] In *Music and Discourse*, he advises the reader on the "schism between music and noise in the twentieth century", and refers

---

[83] Jean-Jacques Nattiez, *Music and Discourse: Toward a Semiology of Music* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1990)

[84] Ibid.

[85] Jean-Jacques Nattiez, 'Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games' *Ethnomusicology,* 27:3 (1983), pp. 457-475 and Jean-Jacques Nattiez, 'Inuit Throat-Games and Siberian Throat Singing: A Comparative, Historical, and Semiological Approach' *Ethnomusicology,* 43: 3 (1999) pp. 399–418

to the illustration of "the mobility of interpretants that separate musical from nonmusical".[86] He culminates his argument in this section by referring to the complications which then occur, in light of the above, when moving from score-based "Western" musical traditions, to oral traditions more commonly featured in "non Western" musical settings.[87] Following this idea through his "Musics and Cultures" section in Chapter 2 of *Music and Discourse,[84]* Nattiez refers to both early and contemporary ethnomusicologists such as Gilbert Rouget and Carol Robertson, and the continuing discussions of semantic concepts of "music" between different cultures.[88] Namely, he underlines the importance of considering the wider definitions of "music" that transcend the concepts and ideas outlined in a western European tradition of music. He refers to "musical phenomena" as opposed to purely "musics", and in reference to Inuit traditions, including the drum dance and throat games, highlights the absence of the word "music" in indigenous Inuit languages; though he indicates that these activities "can be bound together through other articulations, specific to that culture."[89]

As previously referred to in Chapter 1, Nattiez swiftly introduces the idea that a semiotic approach is eminently appropriate in studying these musical cultures without reliance on "external perception".[90] In other words, our unchangeable role as an etic observer when documenting, transposing and analysing these musical cultures, renders it, while not impossible, certainly difficult to justify our own symbolic constructs of the musical tradition with our own familiar definitions. It therefore becomes necessary to rely on a practice that focuses specifically on the very basics of human communication, symbolism and meaning: that is to say, a semiotic approach, or practice. This is due to Nattiez's postulation that his studies into Inuit music suggest entirely different "continuums" between word, music, song and dance in comparison to "Western" musical cultures and traditions. For example, in the case of *katajjaq*, these vocal throat games – and in this case, the word "game" is the closest thing we have in English to approximate this definition – maintain a decidedly ludic element we do not often see present in what we, within "Western" culture, would describe as "music".[91] These ideas are drawn primarily from Molino's definitions of anthropological forms of art, which considers the

---

[86] Jean-Jacques Nattiez, *Music and Discourse: Toward a Semiology of Music* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1990) p. 54

[87] In this particular instance, the dichotomy between "Western" and "non Western" is being referred to and used purely in quoting Nattiez's standpoint.

[88] Ibid, p. 55

[89] Ibid, p. 59

[90] Jean-Jacques Nattiez, 'Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games', *Ethnomusicology,* 27:3 (1983) pp. 457-475

[91] Ibid.

varied interlying connections between such forms as word, music, song, dance and game, and their abilities to be combined differently depending on cultural setting.[92] In the case of Inuit katajjaq, these vocal games require endurance, competition, teamwork and an innate sense of playfulness between participants. The performers face each other, often holding onto each other's arms, and exchange what Nattiez describes as "morphemes" of melody,[89] with the intent of continuing for as long as possible until one performer is forced to stop for whatever reason; often these performances will cease due to one of the performers running out of breath or breaking into laughter.[93] This indicates a cultural practice which transcends our more standard definition of "music" and cements the notion that a more extended discipline of linguistic study such as semiotics, is required in order to fully appreciate the depths of implication in this culture. Nattiez describes this practice as follows:

> a kind of host-structure, susceptible to absorbing sound sources of various origins: meaningless syllables and archaic words, names of ancestors or of old people , animal names, toponyms, words designating something present at the time of the performance, animal cries, natural noises, and tunes borrowed from petting-songs, drum-dance songs, or from religious hymns.[94]

This implies an immensely complex level of analysis required to pick apart the precise structure of these "pieces" if they can indeed be called "pieces of music" in the "Western" sense. He also states that it is possible that these games also had some relationship with shamanism, which is rather more difficult to discern given the length of time since shamanistic practices have been present within the region. Nattiez uses examples of paradigmatic chart analysis in "Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games", indicating the melodic morphemes, whether they are expirated or inspirated in breath, voiced or voiceless, the number of their occurrences and their intonation contour. Due to the distinct topical similarities with Sámi *joik* in terms of the "host structure" idea, it will be necessary to further examine this form of analysis and its appropriateness for use in this particular study.

Nattiez and other ethnomusicologists and analysts who have documented and transposed Inuit Vocal Games, such as Saladin d'Anglure, have been able to extrapolate from the acquired field data that there are no two completely identical vocal game pieces, or

---

[92] Ibid.
[93] Ibid, p. 459
[94] Ibid, p. 460

katajjait. Nattiez remarks that this is a particularly exceptional feat considering that the basis for creativity within this tradition lies within the diversity of combining a comparatively small number of basic elements.[95] He then goes on to describe this description of compositional process, which is based on transcription and analysis, as a "model for the poetical processes that has been induced from neutral analysis".[96] In other words, that form of transcription and analysis acts as a methodological structure with which to examine the processes behind the actual creative input, while referring primarily to what is audible in recordings and live performances,and visible in the transcribed scores. This practice of transposition and analysis has been applied in several instances when studying Sámi *joik*s, particularly contemporary *joik*s which have been constructed and designed around popular music.[9793] Further exploration into how contemporary Sámi musical practices have presented both questions and revelations in the field of ethnography will be presented in Chapter 3.

The parallels between the two indigenous oral traditions, as well as subsequently the styles of analysis which are most appropriate to be applied, also come into play when considering "timelessness". Nattiez states that a *katajjaq* does not begin or end; it does not have a defined beginning theme and conclusion. This is similar to the attitudes in *joik* performance; it does not start or end at any particular point in the structure of the *joik*, there is simply a "morpheme", in Nattiez's terms, that becomes repeated and embellished as the *joik* continues. However, Nattiez also illustrates the importance of not defining the Inuit concept of time, and subsequently the culture as a whole, by examining an approach to one musical phenomenon. He isolates the requirement for timelessness in indigenous oral traditions and presents a specific example of a structured process. This point elaborates the need for a semiotic approach; these traditions can be considered "specific symbolic forms", and the ability to question this hypothesis on the grounds of causality and mediation becomes possible. Additionally, this illustrates the need for a flexible theoretical method; the objective 'purely scientific' form of semiotics described by Monelle in *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music* will not allow for nuances in culture which transcend linear levels of meaning.

Jean Jacques Nattiez's examination of semiotics, or semiology, has provided us with a wide and immensely helpful examination of both Saussurean and Peircean schools of thought, similarly to Murray Schafer, but has also taken the discipline that step further by linking it with

---

[95] Ibid, p. 468
[96] Ibid, p. 468
[97] Richard Jones-Bamman, 'Following in the Footsteps of a Giant: When Fieldwork Past Influences Field-work Present, Karl Tirén and Die Lappische Volksmusik'. *British Journal of Ethnomusicology,* 12: 1 (2003) pp. 35–54

ethnomusicological study, and the meaningful and appropriate analysis of musical cultures which would not necessarily be familiar to those used to the "Western" ideas of musical signs and semiotics. In the case of contemporary Sámi musical vocal traditions, Nattiez's approach can be applied in many ways; most specifically the paradigmatic analysis he favours in the study of Inuit vocal games. The separation of musical and extramusical features into categoriesof morphemes, rhythms, breaths and voice or voicelessness, enables us to create a helpful hypothetic topological graph, illustrating the combinations of musical cells and features used to infer certain evocations and ideas. Nattiez states at the conclusion of his article "Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games" that "music generates music",[94] meaning that any given musical style would draw features from a former style, which has been reborn through societal, cultural or environmental changes and upheavals. He also states that "a musical genre is a product of a history of forms".[98] It therefore stands to reason that the study of a tradition such as *joik,* which has documented historical evidence of having been reinvented through societal necessity, is in fact best approached through treating its analysis as forms, signs, and examples of true semiosis. The following will apply this concept of analysis as a form of communication and symbolism by discussing Kofi Agawu's interpretation of semiotics as a discipline for musical analysis.

Kofi Agawu: Semiotics in the Context of Music Analysis

As well as significant commentary surrounding colonial perspectives and critiques thereof that are invaluable to several areas of the case studies in this thesis, V. Kofi Agawu has penned several key works which are important to consider in any context of contemporary semiotics. In his book *Playing with Signs* he begins by asserting that semiotics require "demystifying" in the realm of Classic music and that a semiotic awareness was implicit in previous studies prior to music semiotics evolving as a fully recognised discipline.[99] The work calls for a listener-oriented process in analysing the structure and expression of what Agawu describers as "Classic music" (which predominantly refers to "Western art" music of the 19th century). He summarises the key question of this process as "instead of what does it mean, HOW does it mean?", though states that semiotics "provides a useful searchlight for understanding the

---

[98] Jean-Jacques Nattiez, 'Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games', *Ethnomusicology,* 27:3 (1983) p. 472

[99] Kofi Agawu, *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1991) p. 5

nature and sources of meaning" but manages to evade the meaning itself.[100] The nature and source of meaning is a fundamental element to the question of how the past can be determined and viewed through the present, along with how the disparate elements of desire, process and result can interact with each other to produce creatively expressive content. A reimagining or reconstruction of a past culture, musical or otherwise, relies on the nature of a certain historical meaning to be clearly communicated both to participants within the culture and any external observers such as visitors or audiences. Furthermore, as previously discussed in Chapter 1, much of our contemporary aesthetic of 'Vikings' stems from predominantly 19th century sources. Therefore, despite the seemingly unrelated musical content which Agawu focuses on both in this work and others, one can extrapolate that a similar attitude and approach is required to understand the nature and source of this inherited meaning which persists today.

In the years following its 1991 publication, *Playing with Signs* provoked many responses and critiques. This included "Playing with 'Playing with Signs'", the critical response article by Jonathan Berger, which noted the "absence of analytical methodology" in addressing musical topoi and observed that the musical meaning uncovered in said work 'deserves a more cohesive system'.[101] Berger addresses the risks of placing what he calls the 'bi-dimensionality' of the particular semiotic system constructed by Agawu, by only using 'introspective semiosis'.[102] Following this, he addresses the general limitations and considerations of implementing a semiotic approach to musical analysis, highlighting that it can narrow the sphere of meaning by placing overt importance onto particular areas of a piece of music that may never have been originally intended. He 'question[s] the blanket assumption that because a work is tonal, it follows that tonality is the primary feature of structural import'.[103] Finally, he compares Agawu's concept of 'introspective semiosis' to C.S. Peirce's concept of a symbol, that is defined in itself by a signified attribute, and criticises discounting what he calls 'non-absolutisms' with regard to incorporating nationalism and one's ethnic identity into musical expression and topoi.[104]

Again, we reach the obvious difference in repertoire between the Classic and Romantic art music which both these works focus on, and the reimagined folk traditions predominantly

---

[100] Ibid.

[101] Jonathan Berger, 'Playing with "Playing with Signs"': A Critical Response to Kofi Agawu', *Journal of Music Theory,* 38: 2 (1994), pp. 293-313 (p. 296)

[102] Ibid, p. 310

[103] Ibid, p. 294

[104] Ibid, p. 303

examined in this study. However, these criticisms bear significant relevance to the flexibility required in this study's analytical process, to allow for the malleability of the principal meaning in a piece of historically informed or inspired music. Berger also introduces a compelling analytical methodology by which he demonstrates how further layers or alternative interpretation of analysis can be applied to work previously done by another critical musicologist.[105] This provides a useful insight into the implications of varied interpretation andviewpoints when applying a semiotic or topic-based analysis to processes and transference of musical meaning, which we turn to in more detail in the following section.

Topic Theory

It is necessary for the purposes of this study to also examine the brand of critical musicology born from modern semiotics known as topic theory. Topic theory also primarily stems from 18th and 19th century musical sources and examines the metaphorical musical "signatures" used by many composers in Europe during that period. It is an exceptionally important element to consider in relation to historical reimagining, because many of our learned associations of certain physical and aural tropes with certain historical periods are directly related to this exact style of meaning designation and referential communication which topic theory is primarily concerned with. The term "topic" was first coined in academic publishing by Leonard Ratner in his work *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*.[106] The theory has evolved in several 'waves' since the initial coining of the term, with Ratner, Agawu and Allanbrook using it to promote what they collectively described as a new form of music semiotics – the "second wave".[103] This "second wave", including Hatten and Monelle, began to unpack the socio-historical and cultural implications of signs and meaning rather than the more strictly theoretical approach of previous decades, and provide more analytical processes for the inclusion of a wider range of expressions, gestures and historical or cultural contexts.

In "On Topics Today", Nicholas McKay reminds us that semioticians are concerned with "the relation among signs, not the signs themselves" as generating meaning, and this is one of the principles on which modern topic theory is founded.[107] He concludes with a plea to newer generations of academics to ensure that a fuller cultural study is applied to original

---

[105] Ibid, p. 309

[106] Leonard Gilbert Ratner, *Classic Music Expression Form and Style* (New York: Wadsworth Publishing Co Inc, 1985)

[107] Nicholas McKay, 'On Topics Today', *Zeitschrift Der Gesellschaft Für Musiktheorie [Journal of the German-Speaking Society of Music Theory],* 4: 1-2 (2007) pp. 159-183 (p. 161)

principles of topic theory, to allow for the field to incorporate further scope for expression and creative interpretation.[108] This expected and desired movement is an exceptionally important consideration for the study of creative historical reimagining, as not only is it necessary to fully understand the historical context of musical topoi, but also to demonstrate the need for a flexible analytical methodology which has evolved from the initial explorations of music semiotics.

One of the most comprehensive volumes of insights into the exploration of topic theory is the work edited by Danuta Mirka, the *Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*.[109] She provides an insightful evaluation of the overall field and its evolution of several decades, with many of the significant contributors to the discipline providing chapters. The volume aims, in her words, to "clear away discrepancies in order to turn topic theory into an efficient tool of analysis".[110] For the purposes of this study, Section V ('Listening to Topics') will provide considerable insight into themes of immersion. An understanding of immersion relies on a detailed working knowledge of listeners' mindsets and attitudes during the initial development of the musical styles and topoi in question, as well as the competency of amateur musicians during the style's time of popularity, as Melanie Lowe points out in her chapter in Section V, "Amateur Topical Competencies". It is essential to examine semiotic and topical theoretical frameworks surrounding amateur performance as well as from the viewpoints of listeners and composers, as the vast majority of historically reimagined folk content from the Nordic countries, particularly in our LARP case study, concerns amateur performers to at least some extent. Now that we have some theoretical framework in place to provide compelling analysis within the examples present in case studies, it is now necessary to start examining the theories needed for the consequential issues that arise surrounding the concept of authenticity. It is therefore prudent to move towards the treatment of historicalness and authenticity within musicology.

---

[108] Ibid, pp. 167
[109] Danuta Mirka, 'Introduction', in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. by Danuta Mirka (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014) pp. 1-61
[110] Ibid, p. 43

2.3: Authenticity in Historically Informed Music: Imagined and Curated

The process of recreating historical music using authentic instruments and/or performance settings is not new to musicology. Since as early as the late 19th century, this practice has evolved into a unique industry and academic discipline of historically informed performance, with much time, resources and study dedicated to recreating early music. Much of the original impetus for the modern early music industry stems from the work of Arnold Dolmetsch, whose recreations of lutes, viols and recorders became internationally renowned in the early 1900s.[106] His descendants continue to promote early music through festivals and workshops as part of the Dolmetsch Foundation. Dolmetsch himself was particularly recognised for his attention to immense physical detail in his recreations and his pedagogical stances at his school in Haslemere rendered it a highly respected centre for study and performance, with many of Dolmetsch's students (such as the American viol performer Robert Donington) going on to extend the movement.[111] More recently, this practice has emerged to include archaeomusicology and experimental archaeology, as well as continued adoption of performance practice as a valid research tool on par with that of musicological analysis.[112]

Until these alternative approaches became more widely accepted, styles of historical performance stemmed from an authoritative view on "correct" historical content; there is a perceived value in art objects which can be traced towards areas of authority. These systems of authority were trusted among performers, musicologists and historians in earlier stages of the early music movement. Not only did they dictate how this music is performed and marketed to the general public, but also how this music is analysed and examined academically. By "authority", I am referring to something with established academic evidence and/or precedent. This could be the remains of an instrument, or picture evidence from the appropriate period, or an original score or printed text. This "authority" can consequently result in a codified response to an object, such as a perceived obligation to follow a score as written, or to use particular systems of tuning or specially crafted instruments. This could also refer to the space in which the music is performed, such as certain sacred music only being

---

[111] Peter Holman, *Life After Death: The Viola da Gamba in Britain from Purcell to Dolmetsch* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2013)
[112] Ibid, p. 96

performed at certain points in the liturgical calendar, or in certain spaces within a church or cathedral. Leech-Wilkinson suggests in *The Modern Invention of Medieval Music* that historical study can often be "nothing more than a modern hypothesis created in accordance with its author's ideology".[113] In other words, the perceived "authority" in historical re-enactment and informed roleplay can be viewed as a version of Leech-Wilkinson's classification of a "modern invention".[114]

There is a compelling argument that both defaulting to a codified response to an object and the need to justify a performance or recreation by seeking an authoritative statement could theoretically hinder a "true" reimagining or recreation of a piece of historical content, as the participant may feel pressure to "fall in"with these systems of authority. Contemporary philosophers such as Lydia Goehr and Paulo de Assis have begun examining why we place so much trust in the systems of curation within historically informed performance, as well as highlighting a lack of "push back" from prior traditional musicological approaches to this content. The "traditional approach" towards historically informed performance may in fact be more about the self-affirmation of the process and the satisfaction of being "correct" than of truly historically informed performance, that takes into account context, evolution and experimentation. Other work in this field has highlighted a need for further counterfactual argument in historical performance literature; namely, some more questioning of how a performance may be altered by choosing to reinterpret the available historical and archaeological sources. For example, Kivy provides the compelling argument that there is often an assumption of the original musicians from the relevant historical period being "right".[115] He argues that "why should [the performer] think that one period is immune from the 'mistakes of history'?[116] This idea translates well to Goehr's conclusion in *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works* that "the most dangerous of beliefs [is that], we have at any time got our practices absolutely right".[117] The following will give indications of both Assis' and Goehr's more recent insights into historical performance, the encouraging of alternative views of authenticity and immersion within this field, and a summary of how the "traditional approach" to historical performance would be rendered tenuous and limited for the purpose of this study.

---

[113] Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, *The Modern Invention of Medieval Music: Scholarship, Ideology, Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002)
[114] Ibid, p. 9
[115] P. Kivy, 'On the Historically Informed Performance', *The British Journal of Aesthetics* 42: 2 (2002) pp. 128–44
[116] Ibid, p. 132
[117] Lydia Goehr, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music* (Oxford: Oxford University Press. 2007) p. 284

Paulo de Assis has contributed a number of investigations into ontological discipline with regards to musicology. In his chapter "Virtual Works - Actual Things", he calls for a reimagining of musical ontology by placing further value on experimentation and creativity, as well as moving away from a traditional definition of a "musical work" by proposing a redefinition towards an "image of work".[118] Rather than a static view of an immovable work that transcends linear time –in other words, Assis' view of the traditional definition of musical works – he proposes an "exploded continuum" of objects and ideas which continue to form new relationships with one another and from which musicians can make analytical and/or experimental decisions for their chosen interpretation of the work.[119] In the concluding section of the chapter, Assis states that "this perspective offers a methodology for unconventional, critical renderings that expose the variety and complexity of the music materials available today. More than repeating what one already thinks one knows about a given work, it claims the pure unknown as the most productive field for artistic practices. Rather than accepting a reproductive tradition, it argues for an experimental, creative and vitalist attitude".[120]

In other words, it can be argued that, based on this claim, providing a more experimental baseline for musical reproduction would expose further potential for historically informed exploration. Earlier in this section, he uses a compelling historical example by theorising the following:

> If one's goal is the passive reproduction of a particular edition of a musical piece from the early 19th century, one is indeed better advised to remain within the "classical paradigm", with all its associated practices of survey, discipline and control. But if one is willing to expose the richness of the available materials that irradiate from that piece, one has to move towards new ontological accounts, such as the one proposed in this chapter[121]

In a more abstract sense, this identification of "passive" and "active" reimaginings is key to many of the primary theoretical frameworks in this study. Not only do Assis' statements apply to the traditional reproductions of music from, in his words, the "classical paradigm", but can also be transferred further into the domain of historically informed and reimagined content for live

---

[118] Paulo de Assis, David Davies, Andreas Dorschel, Lydia Goehr, Gunnar Hindrichs, Kathy Kiloh, Jake McNulty, and John Rink, 'Virtual Works—Actual Things', in *Virtual Works – Actual Things: Essays in Music Ontology,* ed. by Paul de Assis (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2018) pp. 19-44

[119] Ibid, p. 41

[120] Ibid, p. 42

[121] Ibid, p. 40.

display and roleplay. A recreation of an ancient musical tradition could remain within "safe" traditional paradigms by following an authoritative system of passive reproduction. Alternatively, examination of the wider context and possibilities of the content can provide, in the words of Assis, "an experimental, creative and vitalist" practice. This theory can also be applied to our working definitions of authenticity and immersion, as this line of ontological philosophy supports historical authenticity existing within smaller "pockets" of creative content rather than following a linear timeline. This results in historically reimagined musical content potentially being viewed as a "living" entity with potential for growth, experimentation and variety.

Paulo de Assis examines the struggles of experimentalism in musicology in the introductory chapter of *Experimental Affinities*.[122] He discusses many research groups at the Orpheus Institute, their work on artistic experimentation, and the willingness of the artistic community to embrace an "experimental attitude" and the difficulties currently present in musicology when attempting to execute this. This idea can also seen in Gilmore's chapter in *Artistic Experimentation in Music: An Anthology.*[123] He highlights that "an experimental tradition does not happen by itself but must be constructed in various places and by various individuals".[124] This idea, it logically follows, cannot take place unless there is a willingness by individuals to commit to some inherent level of experimentation. Paulo de Assis questions the implicit attitude that there has not been experimentation in music before the recognised 20th century genre was established, as well as highlighting the risks of placing "experimentalism" in its own category beyond that of other practices - namely the potential for an authoritarian "ivory tower" view of experimental music. This line of questioning can be seen in the following:

> What, then, is music that is inherently experimental? Reflecting on this question triggers many other related questions: Is there an experimental attitude recognisable in different times, styles and place? Are there any detectable "experimental affinities" throughout music history? How do new artistic paths emerge through experimental performance or compositional practices? What is the character, function and potential of experimentation in musical practice? How does experimentation shape artistic

---

[122] Paulo de Assis, 'Introduction', In *Experimental Affinities in Music*, ed. by Paulo de Assis (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2015) pp. 7–14

[123] Darla Crispin and Bob Gilmore, *Artistic Experimentation in Music: An Anthology* (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2014)

[124] Ibid, p. 28

identity and expertise?[125]

The preceding questions were all covered at the *International Orpheus Academy for Music and Theory* in 2011 and 2013 (an annual conference held by the Orpheus Institute). Assis takes care to define "experimental" very specifically as "an adventurous, compositional, interpretive or performative attitude that might cut across different ages and styles" for the subsequent collection of essays in the rest of the work.[126] In other words, Assis sets a clear framework for a new definition of "experimental" that can be applied effectively to historical recreation of musical performance and interpretation.

The questions Assis asks of contemporary attitudes to experimentalism do not have to travel far to meet similar questions asked of both historical re-enactment and cultural revival. It is equally significant not only in determining how far historians and archaeologists are willing to go in their interpretation of "traditional" history and curation, but also what perceivedboundaries and "rules" lie in place for those who wish to participate in that culture to any significant capacity. The "character, function and experimentation" of musical practice are vitally important elements to determining the desire, process and result of historical reimagining.[127] Similarly, Assis' reference to "new artistic paths" being born of experimentation can be easily attributed to the formation of new "cultural" paths within roleplay and re- enactment; this refers to the generation of unintentional "new" cultures from pre-established hobbies or activities. To conclude, the work of Paulo de Assis, particularly concerning his identification of "ivory tower" traditional approaches and reluctance to move into experimentalism for fear of being deemed "incomplete" or "unverified", are both significant and relevant to many of the issues befalling historical recreation today.

Lydia Goehr has also embraced and investigated the concept of moving beyond an immovable definition of a musical "work" or tradition. Her philosophical essay *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works* unpacks the history of this loaded term and concept, examining when we started referring to "musical works" and why, along with some analysis of the subsequent behaviours and attitudes born of this concept. Her work predominantly refers to classical musical practice, but as with Paulo de Assis' work on experimentalism, there are many overlapping theoretical ideas that complement theories behind historical recreation and

---

[125] Paulo de Assis, 'Introduction', In *Experimental Affinities in Music*, ed. by Paulo de Assis (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2015) p. 9
[126] Ibid, p. 10
[127] Ibid, p. 9

reimagining, along with our approaches towards historically informed performance and the nuances involved in producing content deemed both authentic and immersive. Overall, Goehr's considerations throughout her career of governed practices within musical works and the power dynamics therein will prove invaluable to complementing the new theories in this study.

Goehr considers examples of musical works intended for instruments no longer in existence in her section "A Platonist Theory of Musical Works".[128] She states "If a musical work is written for an instrument that ceases to exist before the work is performed and instrumentation is essential to a work, the work cannot be performed correctly. But surely, the objection goes, there are works performed long after the specified instruments have ceased to exist".[129] She goes on to highlight that "precise instrumental specifications for individual works did become central to musical practice, however, as I pointed out earlier, in the late eighteenth century, concurrently with the so called emancipation of instrumental music".[130] She concludes this section by indicating that the problem is resolved by our chosen attitudes to what constitutes a true "version" of the work. For example, whether the work has been transcribed accurately or whether the work is an arrangement with deliberately different instruments for availability or logistical reasons. These distinctions are essential for establishing the pre- existing attitudes of musicians and composers when encountering historical re-enactment and revival of ancient traditions for the first time. If precise instrumental specifications are a relatively new phenomenon (as Goehr states) then the most straightforward counter-claim that it is inauthentic to propose specifications for historically informed performance. Unpacking this still further, one then begins to rethink the use of the word "inauthentic" altogether. Goehr examines the risks of committing to an "ideal" of authenticity in Chapter 9 of *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works.*[131] She describes the naivety of a belief that "a pure understanding of the past can be obtained untainted by an understanding formed by the present".[132] In other words, that it is erroneously presumed possible to cast aside any contemporary influences and fully immerse oneself in, as Goehr puts it, "practices and concepts that existed only long ago".[133]

---

[128] Lydia Goehr, 'Virtual Works—Actual Things', in *Virtual Works – Actual Things: Essays in Music Ontology*, ed. by Paulo de Assis (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2018*)* pp. 19–44

[129] Ibid, p. 58

[130] Ibid, p. 59

[131] Lydia Goehr, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music* (Oxford, Oxford University Press. 2007)

[132] Ibid, p. 282

[133] Ibid, p. 282

When placed into the context of reliance on physical objects – the determination to remain fully embedded in what tangible evidence is available – the desire to remain "authentic" ultimately begins to work against itself. For example, if only fragments of an instrument are discovered on an archaeological site, then not only is it impossible and implausible to designate "works" to such scant evidence but it is also arguably much more authentic to ensure that enough of an idea of instrumentation is pieced together to provide a complete "version" for performers and listeners to engage with. Overall, Goehr has highlighted one of the key issues in reimagining historical sound; the issue of when these sounds started being quantified into curated artefacts. Her 'museum' analogy is appropriate not just in terms of direct relevance to archaeomusicology, but also regarding the aesthetic considerations of bringing these concepts to audiences.

What makes *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works* so significant to this study is Goehr's proposed methodology of defining musical works for the duration of her second chapter, "The Historical Approach". Goehr utilises elements of linguistic theory to propose the option of referring to musical works as "concepts" as opposed to objects, and goes on to establish the defining features of these "concepts" and how they both can and cannot be examined, treated and/or analysed in musicology. This can be unpacked further to demonstrate a twofold use of the term "concept": that of a composition constituting a "work" in itself, compared to the concept of a particular piece being thought of as a "work". She also introduces "conceptual continuity" into the argument, indicating that by defining musical works as a concept implies a linear progression and evolution of that concept, and therefore cannot be supposed to have an "end".[134] She goes on to explain further that concepts are often thought about as absolute and unchangeable and suggests a further openness in musical theory for observing the trajectory of a concept over a period of time. Goehr states that:

> The stability of our practices requires that their central concepts retain their regulative force. This is achieved […] by agents suspending the belief that concepts artificially emerge, that their identity and stability depend on the demands and theoretical underpinnings of the practices.[135]

In other words, there is an ontological need for concepts to be considered as naturally forming entities that do not necessarily require a governing set of rules in order to function. She goes

---

on to elaborate this central claim of her work later in the chapter with the following:

> The most significant difference between any other approach and my own is that I devote considerable time to sorting out the implications of describing the work-concept in terms characteristic of late eighteenth-century thought. If the central claim is correct, what conclusions are to be drawn about musical practice prior to this time? What kinds of understanding did musicians have? How did they think of their musical production?[136]

These proposed questions, in particular, reside at heart of recreating historical musical cultures in any context along the proposed Reimagining Activity Spectrum. One of the key questions that initially prompted this thesis concerns how authentic a practice can claim to be if it is held as a static object for historical and/or archaeological analysis. Goehr's call to redefine musical works as "concepts" as opposed to "objects" is vital to determining the place of authenticity in recreating historical content. For the purposes of the main theoretical framework in this thesis, we must shift our thinking in a very similar way with regards to putting on displays or roleplay settings based on historical contexts. If we are relying on empirical physical evidence to produce different settings or practices, what can be said about how this setting or practice actuallyexisted during the original period of history in question? Is it even possible to ascertain? Perhaps not, but an openness to considering alternative ways of viewing historical objects is, as highlighted by both Goehr and de Assis, vital in broadening our view of building new musical cultures or adding to existing ones.

Historically Informed Performance: Practically Approaching Authenticity

Examining the study of historically informed performance itself is important to consider in this chapter. John Butt's *Playing with History: The Historical Approach to Musical Performance* examines how historically informed performance has become popular since the late 1960s, initially comparing the highly polarised opinions of Paul Hindemith and Theodor Adorno.[137] Perhaps unsurprisingly, Adorno was highly scornful of the idea of a historically reconstructed performance, but Butt points out that, rather more surprisingly, Adorno was somewhat accurate in his predictions of a musical culture which favours the recycling and restoration of past traditions as opposed to ever-striving modernity. Further to this, an introduction to

---

[136] Ibid, p. 119

[137] John Butt, *Playing with History: The Historical Approach to Musical Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)

Richard Taruskin's later viewpoint on historically informed performance proclaimed that very little about HIP is in fact truly historical in nature, and that it is an invention imbued with "20th century modernity".[138] This pronouncement, along with John Butt's later defense of Taruskin's position, indicates that "all he intends is to show its [HIP's] shortcomings".[139] Butt goes on to indicate that Taruskin's suggestion for the improvement of historically reconstructed music consists of returning classical music's value to that of popular music, as that is how they will have been viewed at the initial point of composition and release. This suggestion holds some fascinating implications for the musicological standpoint of this study. Taruskin, along with many of his contemporaries, viewed the relationship between listener and performer as a vital element of creating a piece of musical content which is truly 'historically informed'; he highlights the significance of how a listener views historical recreation. For example, Taruskin argued that:

> Historical reconstructionist performances are in no sense recreations of the past. They are quintessentially modern performances, modernist performances in fact, the product of an esthetic wholly of our own era, no less time-bound than the performance styles they would supplant.[140]

Taruskin's idea of a "product of an esthetic wholly of our own era" complements later work as recent as the *Handbook of Re-enactment Studies,* in which Kate Bowan highlights the uniqueness of historically informed performance as a discipline. Bowan states:

> It [HIP] has radically questioned mainstream practices and offers an alternative mode of performance that through the combination of imagination, creativity and fine-grained historical research seeks to reveal the unknown and make new what we already know.[141]

Bowan's suggestion that HIP "makes new what we already know" heavily supports the idea of symbol and meaning embedded intrinsically in historical recreation, as does Taruskin's idea

---

[138] Ibid, p. 15
[139] Ibid, p. 17
[140] Richard Taruskin, 'On Letting the Music Speak for Itself: Some Reflections on Musicology and Performance', *The Journal of Musicology* 1: 3 (1982) pp. 338-349, (p. 346)
[141] Kate Bowan, 'Historically Informed Performance', in *Routledge Handbook of Re-enactment Studies*, ed. by Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb and Juliane Tomann (London: Routledge, 2019) pp. 106-110 (p. 107)

that the resulting performance becomes something that cannot exist in isolation as something "historical". There must be meaning imbued within said performance. This is directly relevant to the arguments which will be further elaborated on throughout the rest of this study, as the relationships between all active components of the culture and the processes which they undergo to transmit symbol and meaning is at the heart of this investigation. Butt's exploration of both contemporary viewpoints and the concept of 'heritage' and the cultural importance which heritage now holds, both musicologically and otherwise, are highly relevant to the fields explored in this study. Throughout the rest of the work, he covers the widely varied issues of what he describes as "truth to the work"(which will fit into our many layered definition of 'authenticity' that will be explored further in Chapter 4), reactionary culture, intention, modernism vs postmodernism and more. As well as the aforementioned assessment of previous and contemporary viewpoints and theoretical considerations, the vast scope covered in Butt's volume renders it a highly valuable resource for many areas of this investigation, but particularly for unpacking the practical elements of musically analysing historical performance. This allows us to place the chosen case studies for this thesis into a familiar context while also beginning to engage with wider areas of interest within musicology.

2.4: Structural Anthropology and Archaeomusicology

It is necessary to introduce some of the key theoretical frameworks from other disciplines, the first of which also originates from early 20th century linguistics, sharing common Saussurean roots with modern-day semiotics. This is the discipline of structural anthropology, founded predominantly by well-known French anthropologist Claude Lévi-Strauss. In his work, *Structural Anthropology*, Lévi-Strauss begins to introduce how traditional anthropology has been restrained in previous centuries by the over-theorising of different cultures, as well as, according to his translator Claire Jacobson, "fallacious generalisations", and presents original suggestions for "establishing categories and concepts which will be cross-culturally valid".[142] Given the distinct cultural differences between my primary case studies, it was necessary to identify a discipline in anthropology which allows for this cross-cultural evolution, as generalising the differences between these cultures would, ironically, work against the strength of the argument that the process of their historically reimagined traditions bear

---

[142] Claude Levi-Strauss, *Structural Anthropology*, new edn (New York: Basic Books, 1974) pp. 12-15

distinct theoretical similarities. Lévi-Strauss himself highlights the importance of imbuing any anthropological theory with an appropriate amount of historical context and vice versa, stating that "any good history book[...]will be saturated with anthropology".[143] He particularly emphasises the hitherto (at the time of publication) unappreciated similarity of process between history and anthropology; he implies that the only key difference was the historian's reliance on written data, the anthropologist the unwritten. This difference has resulted in an "undue separation" of both disciplines and Lévi-Strauss calls for collaboration between the two as, according to him, one cannot progress without the help of the other.[144] It is clear that this amalgamation of history and anthropology advocated by Lévi-Strauss is an essential component for the selection of an appropriate anthropological context with which to frame the literary field this particular investigation should concern.

Structural Anthropology covers a vast array of anthropological considerations, not all of which are wholly relevant to this particular study, but Lévi-Strauss' commentary on both the symbol and the myth are especially pertinent in this instance. In his chapter 'The Effectiveness of Symbols', he examines a shamanistic birth chant and underlines the correlations between shamanistic technique and modern psychoanalysis. In particular, the concept of an effective symbol requires two factors – myth and action – in order to successfully transmit its meaning or implication. This duality, compared with the similar duality of patient and healer in both psychoanalytic and shamanistic contexts, results in an organic process in the mind of the recipient or 'patient' to achieve a reality through a lived out myth.[145] Much of this concept can be conversely applied in this study, albeit not in the context of "patient and healer", but theoretically in "historical context and re-enactor", "cultural participant and cultural observer", or in as simple a term as "listener and performer". The duality of myth and action and the effectiveness of their corresponding symbols will ultimately underpin the transmission of any piece of reimagined historical content, and it is through this particular investigation of Lévi- Strauss' that the anthropological element of this study's theoretical framework will be established.

---

[143] Ibid, p. 23
[144] Ibid, p. 25
[145] Ibid, p. 201

Archaeomusicology

The theoretical approach to historically informed music and performance can only bring us so far with regard to real-time physical representations of these past cultures. It is therefore necessary to introduce a parallel discipline into this review of theoretical literature; that of archaeomusicology,[129] an interdisciplinary process where musicological principles are applied to archaeological finds for the purposes not just of interpretation, but also for experimental archaeological processes. It is an understandably diverse field, given the highly complex nature of its two respective parent fields, but predominantly concerns the study of music-making in past cultures, the knowledge of which is only accessible through archaeological finds. However, the implications of the discipline are not as straightforward as they may seem. Arnd Adje Both counsels the importance of remembering that 'it cannot always be assumed that a particular context of 'music' existed',[130]and offers a general research model for the specific discipline of 'music archaeology' recognised since the 1980s, following many experimental introductions and panels at conferences throughout that period. The author concludes with a poignant statement that musical history 'might simply reflect our present views of the musical past', a notion which is returned to repeatedly throughout the examination of the attitudes and behaviour at work in the phenomenon of historical reimagining.[146]

The specific term 'archaeomusicology' was first coined in 1981 by Cajsa Lund[132] who investigated the musical and archaeological implications of prehistoric Scandinavia; a study highly relevant to my research, the methodology of which will be examined in further detail in Chapter 3.[147] Arnd Adje Both, along with Dale Olsen, Rupert Till, and other interdisciplinary researchers over the past decade have succeeded in channelling the many disparate strands of archaeomusicology into a standardised discipline. Till links music archaeology discussion to both that of sound (or auditory) archaeology and soundscape theory, warning of the underlying issues of associating the term 'music' with archaeology.[148] This leads coherently towards Steve Mills' more recent work *Auditory Archaeology*, which provides a comprehensive methodology intended for use across many archaeological and heritage contexts – some of the more significant elements of this include perception psychology and intentionality.[149] While further

---

[146] Arnd Adje Both (2009) 'Music Archaeology: Some methodological and theoretical considerations' *Yearbook for Traditional Music,* 41 (2009), pp. 1-11 (p. 1)
[147] Casja Lund, 'The Archaeomusicology of Scandinavia', *World Archaeology,* 12: 3 (1981) pp. 246–65
[148] Rupert Till, 'Sound Archaeology: Terminology, Palaeolithic Cave Art and the Soundscape', *World Archaeology*, 46:3 (2014) pp. 292-304
[149] Steve Mills, *Auditory Archaeology: Understanding Sound and Hearing in the Past* (Cardiff: Routledge, 2016)

specific methodology within this discipline will be examined in Chapter 3, it is nonetheless necessary to introduce the field of archaeomusicology here among my chosen theoretical frameworks. This is because all theoretical considerations explored thus far in this investigation deeply concern the relationships between people, sound and meaning. Music and auditory archaeology provide a fresh insight into methods for managing to examine these same relationships but without a living example always being present. Given the innately historical and archaeological context in which much of the content of the case studies exists, it is of the utmost importance to identify theoretical disciplines, as well as methodologies, which allow for 'missing links' and a lack of present living content to draw insights from.

2.5: Simulacra and Absence of Profound Realities

As hauntology and semiotics have respectively provided theoretical frameworks for examining the thought behind the process of reimagining, and the process itself, it is now necessary to draw upon simulacra theory to set the scene for interpreting the finished content and/or results of these processes. The concept of simulacra generally, by most standard dictionary definitions, refers to an imitation of an object that, for any reason, is not an exact replica of the original content. The following will examine the history of the term simulacra as well as the distinctions between "copies", "imitations" and "representations" For the purposes of this investigation, the word "copy" will be taken to mean a faithful and intentionally identical replica of a piece of original content. There has been a considerable amount of discourse historically on the precise role and moral value of the simulacrum; the concept is highlighted by both Plato and Socrates and continues to be examined in later centuries by philosophers such as Nietzsche, Descartes, Baudrillard and Deleuze. By that definition of "copy", we can interpret historical re-enactment as working towards that concept but inherently remaining a simulacrum due to the logistical impossibility of a true historical recreation. Therefore, it is necessary to map the trajectory of philosophical attitudes towards the now varied definitions of "true" simulacra, beginning with moral judgements of their validity as content and culminating in Baudrillard's concept of hyperreality coupled with pragmatist ideas of genuine "copies" no longer being possible.[150]

A reimagined form of historical content would not satisfactorily fit into the strict

---

[150] Daryl Y. Mendoza, 'Commodity, Sign, and Spectacle: Retracing Baudrillard's Hyperreality', *Kritike* 4: 2 (2010) pp. 45–59

definition of a "copy". Even as faithful retellings of particular events or periods of time, there are knowingly altered features for the purpose of ease or modern standards of correctness or ethics. In this context, "faithful" refers to a deliberate attempt to adhere to any and all historical knowledge and context attainable for the purposes of interpretation. This means that, from a philosophical perspective, it is necessary to consider the further implications of these types of content - more specifically, their role as simulacra and their place in historical interpretation. Furthermore, there is a need to identify the place of reimagined historical content within the context of "hyperreality", as first coined by Baudrillard.[151] This line of inquiry is vital in determining the role of deliberate simulations and altered copies in the evolution of a culture which is principally drawn from historical content. At which point does an evolving tradition cease to be a simulacrum of something long past and become its own distinct object? The following section will demonstrate the appropriateness of simulacra theories for the analysis of reimagined historical content. This will be done by unpicking varying philosophical definitions and explorations of simulacra and will identify the most appropriate contemporary rendering of these concepts for investigating how the past is interpreted through the present in a musical and historical context. In this circumstance, the "past" can be defined as the original source material from which a piece of historical and or/musical content is derived, whereas the "present" concerns any subsequent reimagining and recontextualising of that content. For example, the "past" could represent archaeological finds, a known period of history or an original piece of creative content. The "present" is the settings and drives from which a recreation is rendered necessary and/or desirable.

The academic need to encapsulate reality and simulation in a theoretical context stems as far back as Ancient Greece, as in Plato's *Sophist* he indicates the presence of 'appearance-making art' and the concept of "'idea" versus "image".[152] There has been an innate philosophical awareness of reality and its copies for millennia, and in *Sophist*, Plato provides a determination of "imitation" as being inherently simulative in its nature. However, he spends much of the dialogue decrying imitation as pejoratively lesser and, as Deleuze states, he "strives for the triumph of icons over simulacra" - implying an innate hierarchy of identical copies over imitations or simulacra.[153] An identical copy does not utilise any external or additional interpretation in order to exist and therefore is, by the definitions in *Sophist*, objectively of higher value. The distinction at its deepest level concerns the purpose behind the recreation: to

[151] Jean Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994)
[152] Plato, *Sophist*, trans. by Benjamin Jowett (Maryland: Arc Manor, 2011)
[153] Gilles Deleuze and Rosalind Krauss, 'Plato and the Simulacrum'. *October,* 27 (1983) pp. 45-56 (p. 50)

actively replicate it, or to simulate the idea of it. Plato claims that active replication of every element of an identified reality is of more moral value than a simulated idea of that reality. This becomes more evident in Deleuze's interpretation of Platonism, as he goes on to imply that, strictly by Platonic definition, humankind has become a simulacrum of God due to holding his image but being altered through sin - in other words, an "image without resemblance".[154] For this reason, he indicates a societal reversal of the concept of Platonism throughout the advancement of Christianity in history. In later work, Deleuze goes on to interpet Platonism as having "good" images (icones) and "bad" (phantasmes - Deleuze's chosen word for simulacra). He places the distinction between faithful adherence and "false pretenders to the Idea".[155] This value system placed on objects can be applied to the question of reimagining historical sound in several ways. The environment in which that sound exists will have its own needs and nuances that will affect the intended result (arguably the 'icon').

This will be extremely relevant to consider when examining both re-enactment and roleplay settings, as often the signs and symbols pertaining to certain traits within the imagined culture need to be replaced with other symbols to make allowances for the difficulties of that setting. Deleuze's questioning of the "genuine" and the "fabricated" in much of his work also raises several pertinent questions to ask of our chosen case studies; arguably, are these not all fabricated by his definition? Is a culture that has remained in existence in some form but reinvented through sake of necessity or aesthetic freedom no longer "genuine"? Those who are seeking to recreate a culture that inherently belongs to them, in the case of Sámi cultural revivals, would vehemently disagree and perhaps even take considerable offence at the idea that this reimagined culture is "fabricated". This value system, while certainly problematically binary and polarising, will nonetheless be an invaluable tool for theorising the attitudes and perceptions held (or indeed stifled) by creators and listeners/audiences of this content. It will be necessary to map the evolution of attitudes towards 'copies' versus 'simulations' in each separate case study, as well as how intentional these processes are.

Nietzsche took this initial concept further by purporting a mission to "reverse Platonism" and "usher in a new era of simulacra".[156] He begins to address the concept of the simulacrum

---

[154] Ibid, p. 48

[155] David Lane, 'Deleuze and Lacoue-Labarthe on the Reversal of Platonism: The Mimetic Abyss'. *SubStance* 40: 2 (2011) pp. 105-126 (p. 109)

[156] David La Rocca, 'The False Pretender: Deleuze, Sherman, and the Status of Simulacra', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism,* 69: 3 (2011), pp. 321-29 (p. 322)

in his work *The Twilight of the Idols*.[157] An aphorism of particular relevance to simulacra is Nietzsche's second question of conscience: "Are you genuine? Or merely an actor? A representative? Or that which is represented? In the end, perhaps you are merely a copy of an actor."[158] This statement begins to unpack the difference between "representative" and "copy". A "representative" can be summarised as being something that is knowingly different, but still maintains a direct ontological link to whatever the original concept or object was. Furthermore, the role of the "actor" must also be examined; in the context of this study, the "actor" is arguably the individual who is knowingly producing or, through their actions, "being" a copy or representation. The actor intends to project maximum reality to the receivers of the content but while doing so, sacrificing their own capability to become fully immersed in that reality. The phrase "are you genuine? Or merely an actor?" in Nietzsche's second question of conscience automatically, but perhaps not entirely fairly, polarises the genuine and the acted, and implies that the two cannot coexist in this particular model. However, his use of the phrase "in the end" in the closing words of the question potentially implies a universal removal from the genuine - that this content is already so distanced from whichever source it originated that the distinction of "actor" and "genuine" is no longer contemporarily relevant.

Nietzsche then brings the aphorism to a close with the introduction of the concept "a copy of an actor". This highlights the idea that a "representative" and "copy" are not only inherently linked, but actively feed into one another; the concept that "genuine" may potentially only be a copy of something that started out as a representation is at the core of this study's theories surrounding authenticity. Arguably this, to an extent, validates the "genuine", as it implies an innate tracing back of value to the original source of the copies and representations. However, it also illustrates a natural gap between a piece of re-enacted content and its original source; there is an inherent divide between the content and any replications, sometimes twofold if we incorporate the "copy of an actor" idea. A basic example of this would be the interpretation of any piece of archaeological evidence; for instance, the boxwood panpipes from the 1976-81 Coppergate excavation in York.[159] These have since been replicated by luthiers such as Corwen Broch, as well as interpreted, displayed and used in educational contexts by the York Archaeological Trust. What remains irretrievable to archaeologists is the true situation of this

---

[157] Friedrich Wilhelm Nietzsche, *Twilight of the Idols, or, How to Philosophize with the Hammer,* trans. by Walter Kaufmann and R.J. Hollingdale (Indianapolis, Indiana: Hackett, 1997)

[158] Ibid, p. 7

[159] Richard A. Hall, *The Viking Dig: Excavations at York* (London: The Bodley Head Ltd, 1984)

object in the 10th century, when it was actively in use by a resident of Viking age York. This is an element of the "original" that both archaeologists and re-enactors almost never have access to, so therefore it is necessary to interpret from the "actor"; in this instance, the context of discovery and excavation. Of further interest, Nietzsche's commentary in the Twilight of the Idols on "How The True World Finally Became a Fable" provides more philosophical framework for understanding perceptions of the past and its copies and simulations.[160]

Using these concepts as a framework for examining re-enactment and reimagining of historical content enables us to identify the evolution of our attitudes towards a practitioner and a receiver of content and/or knowledge. According to Plato, the practitioner and receiver are two distinct entities.[161] This theory's relevance in the context of historically informed music is supported by prior insights from music semiotics, as Jean Molino presents a similar system for parsing music as a symbolic form.[162] The following section will examine the contemporary blurring of these two entities and how the generator and receiver have since achieved an unprecedented closeness in both philosophical and practical terms.

Baudrillard and Shusterman: Hyperreality & Somaesthetics

Throughout the various systems of contemporary philosophy applied to this project thus far, there remains significant gaps which can be addressed through the combined works of Jean Baudrillard and Richard Shusterman – in particular, that of hyperreality and somaesthetics.[163] Both of these concepts follow on naturally from the historical discussion of simulacra, as together they advance the discussion of aesthetic experience and that experience's anchoring in reality. In somaesthetics, this system of philosophy deals particularly with the validation of lived experience and conscious feeling – in other words, elements of the human experience which are essential for creating and undergoing true immersion. Hyperreality, as defined by Baudrillard in *Simulacra and Simulation*, refers to "the generation by models of a real without origin or reality".[164] In other words, hyperreality is the result of the exaggerated simulation of society through elements of culture. This, Baudrillard argues, becomes "more real" than true

---

[160] Friedrich Wilhelm Nietzsche, *Twilight of the Idols, or, How to Philosophize with the Hammer*, trans. by Walter Kaufmann and R.J. Hollingdale (Indianapolis, Indiana: Hackett Pub, 1997) p. 10

[161] Plato, *Sophist*, trans. by Benjamin Jowett (Maryland: Arc Manor, 2011)

[162] Jean Molino, J. A. Underwood, and Craig Ayrey. 'Musical Fact and the Semiology of Music', *Music Analysis, 9: 2* (1990) pp. 105–56

[163] Richard Shusterman, 'The End of Aesthetic Experience', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 55: 1 (1997) pp. 29–41

[164] Jean Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994) p. 1

reality. The theory of hyperreality can be applied to a variety of contexts, the starkest example perhaps being the feeling of being more akin to known media personalities than the actual people around you. This concept will be extremely useful when examining the theoretical implications of immersion in later chapters – particularly in the case of roleplay and characterisation. Empire's Wintermark nation[150] promotes skald-like storytelling traditions that retell the various deeds of players.[165] These serve a similar purpose to "real" heroic myths and enhance the experience of the named player, the musician in question, and anyone else who encounters the song while in play. This is arguably an example of hyperreality, as the process functions to create an exaggerated overblown character through song, creating another layer of immersion for the player's character. The theory of something feeling "more real" than "true reality" can also be applied to issues surrounding authenticity, as much of the debate in re-enactment focuses on true historical accuracy versus the comfortable known and lived experience of historical accuracy. In other words, certain logistical considerations, while perhaps less authentic, provide a more authentic experience for the participant. The "hyperreal" is the resulting image of both authenticity and immersion, with the hidden mechanics of the functional underneath. This consideration will be vital in forming a theoretical framework of how the past can be viewed through the present, as it is necessary to differentiate the functional and the hyperreal in examples drawn from the case studies.

Jean Baudrillard has also examined the concept of simulacra in much more societally relatable contexts than many of his predecessors in the discipline. He commonly uses metaphors involving theme parks – namely Disneyland – to provide commentary on simulated societies created for entertainment. In Simulacra and Simulation, he refers to contemporary ideas of history as "nostalgia for a lost referential".[166] This refers to the idea that history as a concept has become tangibly less "real" since the advent of cinema. Baudrillard highlights cinema as a tool for celebrating lost objects, though focuses on how it also causes history to disappear from public consciousness by filling the population's collective minds with hyperrealism. This theoretical consideration is valuable when placing historical significance on certain cultural representations of creative content. This is particularly useful when placing historical re-enactment in a context for displaced nostalgia.

Scheduled events that recreate particular historical events such as battles and

---

[165] Matthew Pennington, David Kibblewhite and Andy Raff, 'Wintermark', *Empire Wiki* (2013) https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire- wiki/Wintermark. [Accessed 14 March 2019]

[166] Jean Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation* (Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press, 1994) p. 44

coronations provide a new significance for that event. The emphasis shifts from what truly happened in the past, to how accurately and sufficiently celebrated the re-enactment is – as well as its success regarding audience response. The commemoration of a significant date in history becomes far less about the historical event itself, as the focus will move towards the audience's perception of how the re-enactment was produced and executed. Any further alterations or enhancements to the re-enactment display's performance or aesthetics will arguably be determined through that feedback rather than a consideration of historical context or accuracy. Baudrillard's treatment of cinematic responses to public consciousness almost runs parallel to the desire to celebrate and enhance the narrative of historical events.

One of the key contemporary criticisms of Baudrillard's work with systems of behaviour is that, by its very nature, it deals with sequences of global and/or corporate thought and general societal patterns rather than individual people. This means that, while his broader examinations of simulacra and historicalness are irrefutably valuable to reimagining historical sound, there is a point where his questioning ends. Beyond this point are inherently human questions: who has the power to conduct these changes in one's realised perception of historical content, and whose reality is being altered as a result? A simulacrum cannot merely be corporately engineered; it must be embedded within a sense of self that allows for it to be recognised. A solution for this apparent dead end can be found in the work of Richard Shusterman, a contemporary pragmatist philosopher who coined the term "somaesthetic".[167][152] This refers to a need for aesthetic and pragmatic philosophy to incorporate recognition of the physical body as a basic medium for both existence and experience; in other words, the recognition of the need to step back and recognise a person underneath the patterns and systems of behaviour and thought. The need for a somaesthetic-oriented branch of aesthetic philosophy is certainly highlighted throughout this project's case studies, particularly concerning the individualistic nature of Sámi vocal practices and the emphasis placed on evocation of self through musical performance. A *joik* for a person is intended to embody as much about that person as possible, which is why creating a *joik* for somebody is considered such a precious gift. Many of the instructive features in *joik* tuition, both individually and in groups, feature inherently physiological components similar to that of vocal warmups in western choral traditions.

Often, an immersive setting, such as being outdoors or in a traditional *lavvu* or *goahti*

---

[167] Gustavo Guerra, 'Practicing Pragmatism: Richard Shusterman's Unbound Philosophy', *Journal of Aesthetic Education,* 36: 4 (2002) pp. 70–83

tent with an open fire, is implemented for *joik* workshops and demonstrations at festivals or markets. Participants are encouraged to engage with those surroundings in a proactive physical way, such as warming themselves near the fire or running hands through nearby rivers or streams. This is just one example of the variety of physiological considerations within *joik* practices. Evidence from fieldwork at the *Riddu Riddu* festival in 2017 and 2018 has indicated that creating a *joik* for an individual is a surprisingly physiological process, with great care and attention given to sonically evoking the gait, mannerisms and attitudes of the individual. Somaesthetics is one of Shusterman's most celebrated theories. He describes the concept further in *Body Consciousness* as "experiencing and using the living body as a site of sensory appreciation and creative self-fashioning".[168] As stated previously, the process of creative self-actualisation can be directly witnessed in the crafting and performance of Sámi *joik*s. A *joik*, particularly when evoking a person, relies heavily on calling upon lived experienced and awareness of one's living body.

As can be seen throughout this section, our historical need to apply analytical processes to aesthetic experience has a perhaps unintended result of objectifying that aesthetic experience. This in turn results in a separation of that experience from the cultures that originally produced this content. Therefore, it is necessary to incorporate branches of contemporary philosophy such as pragmatism, hyperreal simulacra and somaesthetics to bring experience back into the objective analysis of aesthetics. This process will be vital for connecting the processes of reimagining ancient music with the overall evolution of existing cultures, as well as with the genesis of new ones. It will not be possible to gain a true theoretical understanding of the process of reimagining historical content if it is treated as merely a process; the desire, process and result of historical reimagining raises inherently human questions.

---

[168] Richard Shusterman, Bo*dy Consciousness: A Philosophy of Mindfulness and Somaesthetics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012)

2.6: Conclusion

One of the most significant difficulties lies within definitions of signs, meanings, semiosis, and the relationships thereof between different sources from different stages of a discipline's evolution. This is primarily due to the tendency of separate semioticians to redefine words in their own terminologies. However, I believe it is necessary to maintain a mixture of differing terms, depending on the context and semiotician in question. The only occasion in which I will deviate from this decision is my decision to refer to the discipline exclusively as "semiotics", as "semiology" more often refers specifically to music semiotics, and in this particular study we will be examining many semiotic features of historical and ethnographic settings, including extramusical features. Therefore, I shall proceed with the American termof "semiotics".

Peircean semiotics are undeniably complex to the point of, for want of a better phrase, "splitting hairs" in the variety of definitions he provides for interpretants and meanings. However, it is my firm belief that his threefold approach of sign, object and interpretant is by far the most appropriate for examining historically informed or inspired performance, and musical displays in historical re-enactment display settings. This is due to the threefold nature of the performances themselves; spectators and listeners are obliged, by the nature of the performance, to consider the wider implications of the historical context. In a simple example, if a musician plays a restored lyre based on archaeological finds in front of an audience, three points of signification are at work here. The musician themselves, performing some form of musical feature, stand as the sign. The musical feature itself, which the listener or spectator perceives, is the object. The interpretant, however, is rather more than the relationship between the two. It also stands for the understanding between the listener and the lyre; this is a reconstruction of something from a past age, which is being approximated for the purposes of historical immersion. This means that a correspondingly complex layer of semiotic study is required, in order to do justice to this further layer of meaning in any kind of musical or ethnographic analysis. Conversely, it will be necessary to incorporate insights from Lévi-Strauss' brand of structural anthropology to these theoretical proceedings, as his duality of myth and action through the communication of effective symbols lies parallel with the idea of sign, listener and interpretant, and enables us to place the semiotic study into a wider extramusical and cultural context. Furthermore, from a strictly musicological point of view, this threefold approach will assist us in unpacking John Butt's summaries further, as the relationship between listener and performer which he describes must be at the centre of achieving a truly 'historically informed' musical context and performance, returning to

appropriate attitudes and values to befit the social and cultural context in which this music would have originally existed.

Moving briefly from the listener-performer relationship to the specifically listener-based attitudes of both today and past periods of history, Agawu and Mirka's insights into the evolution of topic theory and its role in understanding the original listener base of eighteenth and nineteenth century Romantic music, hold many relevant places in the framework of this study, even when applied to a wholly contemporary context. This is because, as examined both here and in Chapter 1, the need for applying topoi in order to recognise a specific historical or cultural trope is the very reason for which we view old Norse aesthetics and imagery in the manner that we do. Therefore, it is necessary to travel to the source of these tropes to understand their origins and process, which will assist us in understanding the further work built on these tropes today by modern recreators of historically informed or inspired sound and music.

As for beginning to examine ethnographic approaches towards the three main case studies throughout the course of this thesis, Raymond Murray Schafer, Jean-Jacques Nattiez and all recent contributions to the field of archaeomusicology provide exceedingly compelling ideas and approaches, not only when analysing the content of these musical traditions themselves, but also to provide templates for constructing one's own creative examples of the re-imagining practices at work in this instance. Schafer provides us with extremely useful insights into this idea; his approach to structuring a soundscape and isolating its particular features which illustrate signs and meaning within that culture. This will prove invaluable when we begin to examine our procedurally generated "constructs of authenticity" in both LARP and re-enactment. Nattiez, and most specifically his work with Inuit vocal throat games, meanwhile, will enable us to not only consider wider themes of authenticity and immersion, but also provide an appropriate method for the categorising, transcription and analysis of an indigenous musical culture which does not necessarily fit our generally held definitions of musical phenomena. In turn, the field of musical archaeology provides not just practical and methodological, but theoretical and attitude-based insights, complementing Nattiez's approach to categorising phenomena which transcend our standard definition of 'music', with its own frameworks for considering a wider cultural approach to organised sound rather than attempting to fit fundamentally different contexts into present terms with which we are familiar. Nattiez's insights also lead us into the following chapter, which continues to examine the literature present in relation to the study of historically informed and inspired folk music, but from a more specifically ethnographic and historically documentative approach.

Chapter 3

3.1: Methodological Overview

The methods for investigating the three main case studies of this thesis are grounded in a variety of ethnologies originating from established ethnomusicological techniques and considerations, particularly when designing and analysing the study of contemporary Sámi musical revivals. A considerable portion of this study's methodology derives from the understanding that participant observation is an extremely important cornerstone of the majority of the ethnographic processes required.[169] Therefore, the principles of participant-observation have been applied wherever possible and ethically approved.[154][170] However, during the crafting of the Sámi case study methodologies (particularly when preparing for the fieldwork trips) it was vital to ascertain appropriate levels of participation for somebody not of that culture. Therefore, an emphasis was placed on finding Sámi-centred opportunities to participate to an extent with which the musicians and other participants were comfortable. Therefore, it was necessary to arrange a variety of activities during the Sámi-oriented fieldwork trips, including the attendance of festivals and participation in scheduled workshops and events that are designed specifically for non-Sámi people to engage respectfully with appropriate elements of the culture.[171]

The three primary case studies used in this project all derive from the idea of a culture which has been reinvented after a lapse of time or a displacement of cultural context. In order to establish the most effective and compelling examples, a need was identified for variety in circumstance, source material and external influence. The research strategy for this project was developed by considering historical and/or societal depictions and attitudes towards each of the case studies, before locating key contemporary influencers for observation or interview. Finally, significant events or festivals were established, and an analysis of the event itself andits subsequent reviews would be used to complement the previous insights drawn from historical

---

[169] Chou Chiener, 'Experience and Fieldwork: A Native Researcher's View', *Ethnomusicology* 46: 3 (2002) pp. 456–86

[170] See Appendix C for interview consent form and specific information available to participants

[171] John Fenn and Lisa Gilman,*Handbook for Folklore and Ethnomusicology Fieldwork* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2019)

depictions. The wider structure of this thesis follows three main themes in Chapters 4-6, respectively: authenticity, immersion and creative output/performance. This will culminate in some focused examination of particular performances and output in Chapter 6, demonstrating contemporary examples of the interwoven relationships between authenticity and immersion. The data used in this study is exclusively qualitative data, which is due to the process of creative reimagining being highly individual, not to mention virtually impossible to objectively quantify. All feedback from informants and interpretations of performances are subjective in their very nature, thus a constructivist qualitative approach is more appropriate, especially concerning questions around immersion.

As detailed in Chapter 1, these case studies were selected as initial examples of early iterations of the Reimagining Activity Spectrum and Desire-Process-Result models. As the fieldwork for this project was developed around existing familiarity with Sámi musical traditions from previous research, employment at the Jorvik Viking Centre and personal experience as a re-enactor and LARPer, data could be accessed predominantly through previously established contacts and social media calls. For gathering data pertaining to LARP and historical re-enactment, social media groups relevant to musicians were targeted, provided with a summary of my project and issued an open invitation to contact the project should anyone wish to share their thoughts. Several of these individuals were already known acquaintances and familiar with the research present in this thesis, so a considerable portion of the data was obtained through word of mouth. This particular approach is especially relevant to LARP culture, as word-of-mouth and social media are the primary methods for any LARP system to communicate or create interest. This also applied to historical re-enactment, as data collection required a thorough working knowledge of active re-enactment groups within the United Kingdom, and of individuals placed in the appropriate roles to provide the information needed for this study. The Sámi informants were accessed through attendance at key cultural and societal events such as the *Riddu Riddu* festival and the Jokkmokk Winter Market.[172][156] The *Riddu Riddu* festival in particular featured opportunities to introduce oneself to informants easily, and due to the close proximity of the rest of the festival, chance encounters were very common.

There were also opportunities to access other sources of data, such as the *joik* archive at

---

[172] ' Riddu Riđđu'., *Riddu Riddu Festival*, https://riddu.no/en. [Accessed 16 December 2020] and 'Jokkmokk Winter Market a Unique Festival', *Jokkmokkguiderna*, https://jokkmokkguiderna.com/en/lapland-info/jokkmokk-winter-market. [Accessed 16 December 2020]

Riddu Riddu operated by Ola Graff and Johan Máhtes Skum. This was set up as a "drop-in" *lavvu* tent where festival attendees were offered refreshment, could listen to the archive through headphones and take part in the ongoing discussions as other attendees moved in and out of the tent. This allowed for an easy comfortable setting in which to engage with this material, which promotes authenticity in both discussion and response.

The data collected for this study consists primarily of one-to-one interviews and fieldwork observations through audio recordings and journaling. All interviews which took place for the purpose of this study were conducted with the full awareness and consent of the participant. These interviews were semi-structured with opportunities for development of particularly interesting points and did not adhere to a strict time limit. They were conducted as reasonably informal conversations to assist in the participants' feeling at ease and willingness to elaborate further on potentially delicate or controversial points – such as indigenous politics and LARP/re-enactment disagreements regarding historical/game accuracy respectively. Some of the collected data from fieldwork in Norway and during re-enactment and LARP events are personal observations, or (in the case of re-enactment and LARP) documented instances of my own participation. This has resulted in some careful consideration of the role of the field researcher as a participant, rather than merely an emic observer. When considering the question of educative, ludic or creative immersion, it could be argued there are particular insights to be gained from being an active participant, to produce appropriate data in a study such as this project.[173] Therefore, my own experiences playing characters within LARP settings and providing historically informed interpretation to either the general public or fellow re-enactors have been incorporated into the wider data used for this investigation. All data has been securely recorded, stored and transcribed, and is included here as Appendices. With regards to anonymity, while this was offered to all participants in the study, many of these individuals wished for their full names to appear in this thesis.

Chronologically speaking, while much of the content examined throughout the course of this thesis is historical, the main setting of this study is contemporary. While historical data will be continuously consulted, the focus of the research questions (see Chapter 1) are on the contemporary reimaginings themselves rather than their original influences. As a result, the process for analysing insights from the case studies will remain consistent; all data will be considered with historical or (if applicable) archaeological context, before being critically

---

[173] Daniel Bradburd, 'Review of *Review of Anthropologists in the Field: Cases in Participant Observation*, by Lynne Hume and Jane Mulcock', *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 12: 1 (2006) pp. 264–65

examined in a present-day setting, for the involvement of contemporary audiences and performers. This process will determine each case study's place on the proposed re-enactment and reimagining spectrum, allowing us to more readily examine their implications regarding authenticity and immersion in process and result.

3.2: Sámi Cultural Revival; Literature and Fieldwork

Concerning the cultural revival of Sámi culture, it is necessary to include contemporary relevant examples of a culture which has been revived by its own people in its original setting but following an irrevocable displacement for political and religious reasons. Adapting a research methodology here involves a multi-faceted process of considering historical depictions and stereotypes of Sámi people, mapping the most significant contemporary contributions to their cultural revival and examining the presence of Sámi culture in festival and tourism settings. As an indigenous population that has undergone a series of unpleasant upheavals and suppression of their traditions, any fieldwork must be conducted with full awareness of indigenous concerns and current geographical and political tension within the region. This section will discuss the most significant resources for determining historical attitudes towards Sámi culture and the earliest examples of its repurposing by tourism. Following this, an examination of the most relevant events and creators will complement a consideration of appropriate fieldwork and observation techniques. As this culture is being revived by its own people rather than being repurposed by outside - or etic - observers, it is necessary to consider how to approach questions of authenticity and immersion while also respectfully and appropriately engaging with the observed material from a fieldwork perspective. This analytical process shall be repeated for the other principal case studies within this project, followed by a summary of methodological techniques and considerations throughout the wider thesis. A summary of the ethical considerations have been incorporated into the final section of this chapter, examining the different variations of emic and etic observation in respectively participatory or observatory settings.

Historically, the Sámi have undergone a regrettable displacement of their ancient culture and tradition. Many contemporary Sámi still, within living memory, recall the practices being either outlawed or associated with religious disapproval. For this reason, it was important during fieldwork to ascertain that participants in the study were comfortable with discussing older elements of their culture's traditions. Throughout the 19th century, there have been

references to "displays" of Sámi (or Lappish, as they were referred to by southern Europeans) people and their ancient customs for the purposes of exoticism and tourism.[174] As well as a stifling and outlawing of many of the traditional practices of the Sámi such as *joik*ing and shamanic drumming, this has resulted in a simultaneous caricature of Sámi culture displayed in controlled environments. There was a great deal of fascination surrounding the indigeneity of the Sámi, and their subsequent roots with other populations throughout Europe; they were made the subject of "ethnographic shows" in Hungary between 1880-1900 to investigate the relationship between Hungarian and the Sámi ethnic roots, as they are both from the Finno-Ugric family of linguistics. This dismayed many Hungarians who attended these "human zoos" in Budapest during that period, as the Sámi were considered second-class citizens by many throughout northern Europe. This coincides with the process of "Norwegianization" taking place throughout the western regions of Sápmi, where Sámi people were also considered inferior to Norwegians and were in some cases forbidden from speaking their own languages in school and employment settings. This has resulted in an inward feeling of shame and self-loathing among many Sámi communities, even lasting into the present day. Much of the cultural revival of Sámi traditions since the 1960s-70s has been focused around debunking much of the stigma associated with these traditions, even among Sámi people themselves. This has somewhat derailed the original intentions of the more ancient elements of the culture and has resulted in the purpose of reimagining these traditions being altered.

Further to this shift in purpose and consequently process, new methods have been developed by contemporary Sámi musicians and artists to help the general awareness and continuity of their traditions. An emphasis on education (or indeed, re-education) has been placed within school curricula, beginning with an initial push to incorporate *joik* into education starting in the 1980s, by figureheads such as Berit Alette Mienna (a participant in this study) and Ulla Pirttijarvi, who has published educational material for this purpose.[175][159] Additionally, while an emphasis on tourism and the showcasing of Sámi culture has remained prominent among travellers to the Nordic countries, control of this industry is being steadily acquired by Sámi people, who are able to display their traditions in a much more balanced and authentic manner. Furthermore, this study has considered the role of wanting to attract tourists in how Sámi musical traditions, particularly *joik*, are incorporated into popular music and universally accessible contexts, such as Eurovision and the Olympics. It has been vital to

---

[174] Istytut Archeologii I Etnologii, 'Information', *Staged Otherness: Human Oddities in Central and Eastern Europe c. 1850-1939* (2017) https://stagedotherness.wordpress.com/information/.

[175] Ulla Pirttijarvi, *Honkon Dohkka* (Kautokeino: DAT Publishing, 1995)

incorporate these insights into the analysis of the data collected for this project, as the desire by many Sámi artists to extend their audience to a global scale has doubtless affected both the creative process and result of their work.

To immerse oneself in the context of *joik* involves adapting to certain controlled contexts and engaging with the material in the manner intended for outside participants by the people of that culture. Many festivals, such as *Riddu Riddu*, offer a variety of workshops and demonstrations of *joik*. These can range from "drop-in" sessions lasting over a single afternoon, to day-length courses over two to three days during the festival. Participants of both Sámi and non-Sámi origin are invited to join these, as there are many contemporary Sámi who are disconnected from many of the older elements of their culture due to religious and political stigma perpetuated by previous generations. Consequently, the workshops are viewed as an opportunity not only to introduce non-Sámi people to the technique, but also to reacquaint displaced Sámi people with lost, forgotten or perceived "shameful" elements of their culture and traditions; the displacement of the Sámi people has resulted in a tremendous cultural disconnection over several decades. As the technique of *joik* itself has been revived over the last 50 years specifically to ensure a continuation of tradition, the methods of teaching *joik,* as well as reasons and allowances for doing so, have also been repurposed to allow for a wider dynamic of people to experience them. Within the fieldwork for this project, this was achieved by maintaining a steady line of communication with the course leaders, ensuring that suitable translation was available to avoid any misunderstanding.

Generally, the considerations when conducting fieldwork among an indigenous population need to follow certain ethical principles. These will be re-visited in the context of other case studies later in this chapter. Furthermore, as this musical culture exists within a specific ethnic context, it is of course not possible for any researcher who does not belong to a Sámi culture to achieve true emic observation. This includes potential appropriation of significant religious or spiritual imagery or concepts, as well as contribution to debates or discussions regarding indigenous politics and potential racism issues. Such opportunities as workshops at *Riddu Riddu* often receive media attention and are often showcased as encouraging examples of how Sámi traditions are being extended to reach a global audience. This increase in media attention and global accessibility undoubtedly raises the risk of appropriating, or indeed misappropriating, key features of certain traditions, particularly those which have remained significant within contemporary Sámi spirituality. Therefore, this project's research design aimed to minimise these risks by ensuring that its participants had time and opportunity to retract, revise and/or omit any areas of the discussion they chose.

Throughout the interviewing process, significant emphasis was placed on the thoughts and feelings of the individuals themselves, and the conclusions drawn from any fieldwork involving indigenous populations have been drawn exclusively from discourse with individuals within those populations.[176]

Similarly, an appropriate standard of translation must be accessible for an English-language project involving Sámi participants. Indigenous Sámi people principally learn Norwegian, Swedish, Finnish or Russian as a second language depending on location, therefore English is often learned much later. During the project's practical fieldwork in Norway, assistance was sought from fellow researcher Soile Hamalainen, a research fellow at the Arctic University of Tromsø studying the health and healing properties of *joik*. Hamalainen's research carries significant relation to themes of reimagining investigated in this study, as the use of *joik* as a healing tool among Sámi communities is an inherently contemporary usage which has not been documented prior to the Sámi cultural revival. As a result of this connection, she was an ideal interpreter for this fieldwork due to her own personal and academic interest in the subject matter. Beaudry's chapter in *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology* became an invaluable guide for conducting a realistic assessment of risks regarding the use of an interpreter. She highlights the multi-faceted importance of interpreters within the field during her work with sub-Arctic and Arctic communities in her chapter.[177] She illustrates the potential loss of quality in content from working through an interpreter, particularly when the interpreter and participant already know each other and are having to communicate in a language native to neither. Awareness of this issue prior to engagement with both the participants and the interpreter has therefore meant allowances can be worked into the initial research design for the questions, manner of interviewing and interpretation of responses. In the case of conducting fieldwork within Sámi communities, these allowances include the identification and encouragement of mutual interest in the topics being investigated, as well as ensuring a comfortable unpressured environment was available.

Certain allowances also must be made for pauses in interviews, to allow the interpreter to relay information either back to the interviewer or to the participant, which carries the risk of the participant becoming either less interested or distracted by proceedings. There were two principal solutions to this issue. The first was to ensure that both the whole interview and its

---

[176] See Appendix B, introductory statements, for summary of interviewing technique and aims, and Appendix C for consent forms and information made available to participants.

[177] Nicole Beaudry, 'The Challenges of Human Relations in Ethnographic Inquiry', in *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) pp. 71-72

questions were semi-structured; that is to say, with allowance for pauses, changes in direction and a certain degree of "back-and-forth" between interviewer and participant, even through an interpreter.[178] The questions were formed surrounding general themes of inquiry, with opportunity for open answers rather than closed. Secondly, a comfortable and malleable setting was established, where the participants remained in a familiar environment with access to any needed facilities, and ability to access translators. During *Riddu Riddu*, participants were interviewed either in their own lodgings for the festival, or in the communal *goahti* (a firelit wood and earth structure resembling a hilltop). Due to the fact that *Riddu Riddu* is a significant event in the communal Sámi calendar, engaging with participants was initially challenging, due to much of the population still being semi-nomadic and festivals such as *Riddu Riddu* being an ideal opportunity for long lost friends to reacquaint themselves with one another. Therefore, some time needed to be taken at the beginning of the festival to make introductions and allow time for these more commonplace interactions. These considerations allow for a comfortable and informal semi-structured interview to take place, as well as ensuring that opportunities for both participation and observation remain both natural and encouraged.

3.3: Historical Re-enactment & Norse Influences; Shifting Attitudes and Fieldwork

The considerations of applying ethnographic fieldwork principles to live historical re-enactment are somewhat different compared to engaging ethnographically with a living indigenous population for several reasons. As re-enactment generally represents cultures that are no longer in existence or have evolved considerably past the point being re-enacted, fewer concerns of appropriation or overstepping political/ethical boundaries appear in this kind of fieldwork. However, different issues arise instead, predominantly surrounding participants' relation to and involvement with their re-enactment identities and their feelings towards different levels of authenticity and immersion. Re-enactment communities often become saddled with complex social politics, mostly involving disagreements surrounding precise levels of authenticity, social and class dynamics between re-enacted characters or personas, and controversy surrounding

---

[178] Sue Arthur and James Nazroo, 'Designing Fieldwork Strategies and Materials' in *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers*, ed. by Jane Lewis, Rachel Ormston, Jane Ritchie and Carol McNaughton Nicholls (Newbury Park: SAGE, 2003) pp. 109-137

modern allowances for the sake of accessibility. This section will discuss Viking re-enactment in particular, for the purpose of relevance to this study, but will also refer to wider issues within other re-enactment communities. Firstly, a brief overview of the historical depictions of Vikings from the two previous centuries will be complemented by an analysis of the subsequent attitudes and biases that have evolved about Viking or Norse aesthetics contemporarily as a result. Following this, attitudes towards re-enactment in general Western society will also be examined, which will then be applied to a context of fieldwork and how these attitudes may affect participation and/or observation. Finally, a consideration of museum displays will conclude this section, and the use of tourism and educational tools to complement a fieldwork methodology surrounding historical re-enactment. This will summarise the implications of studying both contemporary Viking imagery and re-enactment culture within an ethnomusicological fieldwork context.

Since the rise in popularity of Norse imagery in Western opera and theatre throughout the 19th century, there has been a continuous misinterpretation of Viking aesthetics by the general populace. This has resulted in many interested parties approaching re-enactment communities with a certain degree of misinformation, which has produced a culture of "re-educating" being an inherent part of the process of becoming a re-enactor. The imagery of Vikings was often associated with Satanism and barbarism due to the Church's disinclination towards Pagan beliefs. This is what has perpetuated the idea of Viking raiders traditionally wearing horned helmets until today, with many of the general public still erroneously believing that this is historically accurate. There is also a general association with barbaric practices and violence, particularly towards women and other marginalised demographics, that remains firmly embedded in contemporary opinions of Viking aesthetics. Similarly, an association with extreme right-wing or neo-Nazi material has also emerged in recent decades, due to the popularity of many aspects of Wagnerian Norse imagery within the National Socialist party of Germany during the 1930s.[179] This has resulted in a degree of nervousness about engaging with Norse-inspired material, particularly in Norway, as even decades later, certain unpopular connotations persist. This was acutely observed in Norway following the attacks carried out by right-wing extremist Anders Breivik, who engaged with a variety of historical material and during his rambling manuscripts proclaimed that he was proud to be

---

[179] Steven Ashby & John Schofield, 'Hold the Heathen Hammer High: Representation, Re-enactment and the Construction of Pagan Heritage', *International Journal of Heritage Studies,* 21:5 (2015) pp. 493-511

"descended from Vikings".[180] During our interview for this project, Einar Selvik of folk ensemble Wardruna stated that the group encountered a certain amount of media attention within Norway during its founding years. As Wardruna were responding to Norse imagery and material, many questions were asked about the group's members, their political affiliation and their potential condoning of right-wing extremism. As a result of this, much of Wardruna's initial artistic message was altered to ensure a clarity in political viewpoint and a desire to debunk much of the misinformation surrounding contemporary Viking imagery. This media attention and misinformation has also been witnessed surrounding the Viking metal industry, with bands such as Tyr and Heidevolk encountering similar connotations. This raises many compelling questions surrounding the reclamation of neopagan ideologies and the lack of control musicians and artists can experience in how their material is distributed and subsequently interpreted within wider contexts. Ashby and Schofield at the University of York Archaeology department examine these implications as part their overview of pagan metal and its role in re-enactment in their article "Holding the Heathen Hammer High".[181] As a result of these considerations, the approach to studying this material in an ethnomusicological context must be carefully measured and executed with delicacy to avoid polarisation and causing offence among participants.

When applying these fieldwork principles to re-enactment displays or festivals, the purpose of these events and the response and expectations of the audiences affects the fieldwork process considerably. This varies greatly among different styles of re-enactment; for staged battles/re-enactment of certain events, audiences tend to expect a linear storyline which is at least somewhat scripted. Alternatively, in the context of a "living history" display involving immersive and interactive demonstrations audiences expect more spontaneity and a freedom of movement among different elements, with the participants/re-enactors continuously available for interaction. This style of re-enactment relies on a desire on the participant's part to maintain a consistent persona while visible by the audience; the participant must possess enough insight into historical context and relevant aesthetics to present a believable simulation of a certain individual or role from a period of history. They must also harness not only the relevant theatrical skills to maintain a convincing character for the audience, but also, depending on the particular style of event, have the ability to switch between performing a

---

[180] Philip Longman, 'A Murderer's Manifesto and Me' *Foreign Policy*, (2011) https://foreignpolicy.com/2011/08/01/a-murderers-manifesto-and-me/ [Accessed April 5, 2019.]

[181] Steven P. Ashby and John Schofield, 'Hold the Heathen Hammer High: Representation, Re- Enactment and the Construction of 'Pagan' Heritage', *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 21: 5 (2015) pp. 493–511

role and interacting on a non-immersive level with the public to answer questions and provide explanation or insight. As such, fitting a fieldwork methodology around these fluctuating roles within a living history display is a logistical challenge. As someone with a considerable background in re- enactment and living history experience, I deemed it especially important to acknowledge the risk of "insider" or emic observer bias and complacency.[182] It is often argued that "insiders" studying their own culture are often less receptive to small social or cultural nuances due to familiarity and conditioning. There is also an inherent risk of injecting a biased or unbalanced view into the collected data and subsequent subjective analysis. This issue can be addressed through careful choice of interview participants, ensuring that the questions provided remain open and impartial and that the interview setting is both secure and comfortable for these participants. Furthermore, selecting appropriate times during these displays to approach active re-enactors is of paramount importance. Ideally a researcher would establish a meeting with a re-enactor post display to conduct an interview.

This detracts from the considerable risk of breaking any established immersion between either re-enactors themselves or the audiences of their displays. This is a particularly sensitive issue to consider, as these displays often involve sponsorship from wider companies or paid entry for members of the public, so potential disruption should be avoided.

Finally, from a practical perspective, it is necessary to examine the use of other live interpretations of historical settings within a fieldwork and research methodology context. In the case of Viking and Norse inspired re-enactment and informative content, this project has predominantly examined museum displays and educational workshops surrounding those particular periods of history. Within local case studies of York and the archaeological finds pertaining to musical cultures of the 8th to 10th centuries, a public fascination with the Coppergate boxwood syrinx or panpipes is still often seen both in media surrounding new excavations in York and in existing literature and museum displays. The panpipes themselves are on prominent display in the final gallery of the Jorvik Viking Centre, in a case dedicated to finds believed to be or relating to musical instruments dating from approximately 960 CE. An emphasis is placed within the introduction gallery that these panpipes could still be played with recognisable diatonic pitches following its recovery from over 1000 years of accumulated soil and detritus, complete with imagery of Coppergate site director Richard Hall playing the

---

[182] Lisa Gilman and John Fenn, 'Defining Fieldwork', in *Handbook for Folklore and Ethnomusicology Fieldwork* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2019) pp. 7-22 (p. 18)

instrument himself. The musical instrument display case also contains the bone tuning peg and bridge of what is believed to be a six-string lyre, as well as assorted pig knuckle "buzz-bones" and hollow bird bone flutes. This case is adjacent to an interactive touchscreen display with a built-in speaker which features Kate Fletcher and Corwen Broch. They appear on the screen to visitors in period clothing from the 10th century, demonstrating a wide variety of instruments in short videos which are associated with the generally agreed "Viking Age" of 860-1066. Each of the videos is accompanied with informative text about the history of the instruments and some technical insights into performance. Visitors to the Jorvik centre may scroll through the names of instruments and select videos which interest them. Costumed staff interpreters also occasionally provide further insight for visitors, with live demonstrations of six-string lyres and replica boxwood panpipes and bone flutes. From a methodological perspective, it is necessary to experience the centre from the viewpoint of both customer, front-of-house staff andmarketing staff to gain a fully rounded view of the reimagining of historical traditions within this educational context. Attention must be paid to the original intention of this display and the interactive touchscreen, how staff regularly engage with this content and communicate it to the public, and finally how the public themselves are able to imbibe and interpret this content.

Overall, a robust and malleable methodology is needed for examining reimagined or re-enacted content from established historical periods, particularly when considering the general public's involvement and how they consequently view the individuals who bring this content to life. A considerable quantity of informal discussion with re-enactors local to York and members of staff at the Jorvik Viking Centre took place during the early stages of this project, while certain methodological considerations were made for personal familiarity with both the historical content itself and the informants. This was resolved by ensuring an appropriate line of questioning was maintained and that key principles of participant-observation in ethnographic field settings was followed when appropriate.

3.4: Live Action Role Play; Fieldwork within an Immersive Game

Our final case study concerns the application of fieldwork and participation/observation in Live Action Roleplay for the purpose of ethnographic study. Since LARP's conception and evolution from tabletop roleplay and science-fiction/fantasy literature, it has gained the interest of many ludic and sociological researchers.[183] Following this initial conception, a subculture has evolved with a vast network available for collaborations in different games and incarnations of artistic material. This has resulted in a great deal of investigation into the ludic implications of LARP, along with the evolution and continuity of certain traditions both in and out of game settings in different styles of LARP. This section will evaluate the contemporary history of that scholarly interest and documentation, followed by a more general methodological consideration of fieldwork within a game or roleplay setting. This will have an emphasis on the blurred lines between emic and etic observers while being immersed in a game setting. Finally, this section will conclude with some logistical and methodological considerations of interviewing in a game setting, allowing for data to be collected while still maintaining full character and immersion, as well as the ethical issues surrounding potentially breaking immersion.

LARP has been documented by researchers within the UK since the early 2000s, with the commonly agreed origins of the pastime beginning both in Europe and North America in the 1980s within tabletop roleplaying communities such as *Dungeons and Dragons*.[184] Generally, most original academic interest came from etic observers; the culture was predominantly observed from an outside perspective, and an innate curiosity and subtle disbelief was often apparent throughout scholarly writing on the subject.[185] However, more recently, there has been much more insight into the ludic implications of LARP, focusing on how it is principally not a "spectator sport" as it was initially treated by many academics (see above).[186] Much emphasis is also traditionally placed on the "storytelling" features of LARP and

---

[183] Markus Montola and Jaakko Stenros, *Playground Worlds Creating and Evaluating Experiences of Role-Playing Games* (Helsinki: Solmukohta, 2008)

[184] B. O. Hamm and J. Becker. 'Live-Action Role-Play or the Performance of Realities'. In *Simulation and Gaming in the Network Society*, ed. by Toshiyuki Kaneda, Hidehiko Kanegae, Yusuke Toyoda, and Paola Rizzi (Singapore: Springer Singapore, 2016) pp. 35-51

[185] David Owen, 'Performing the Game: Demystifying Live Action Role-Play (LARP)' *Canadian Theatre Review,* 178 (2019) pp. 32–37

[186] Celia Pearce 'Playing ethnography: participant engagement in roleplay', in *Impacting Theatre Audiences: Methods for Studying Change*, ed. by Dani Snyder-Young and Matt Omasta (New York: Routledge, 2022) pp. 151-63

its ability to operate with either a strict, scripted linear narrative or more malleable and player-centred plot designed to prompt autonomous thought and action from participants. Much of the research into LARP, particularly festival LARP such as Empire, concerns the interviewing of participants and game developers/content creators. There remains a window of opportunity for compelling ethnographic insight into LARP using a participant-observation model of fieldwork. Essentially, LARP was not inherently designed for audience spectatorship or engagement, it therefore naturally follows that a methodological approach to studying LARP should incorporate some player-based immersion. That is to say, researchers of LARP should play the game they are studying, in order to achieve a full sense of immersion and insight into player experience. Furthermore, the observation of LARP's evolution has altered along with thehobby itself. Following several decades of establishing LARP "traditions", many aesthetics and attitudes have transcended the setting of the "game" and have become known tropes within the wider LARP community, even among different events. There are many references within contemporary games to older systems of LARP which are no longer active, and there is much shared expertise particularly among musicians across different systems. This is an element of fieldwork which requires a familiarity of not just the system of this case study, but also the wider community and its implications within that system.

When studying a LARP system such as Empire in a fieldwork context, it is important to establish a consistent method of both partipation and observation within the game setting. Particularly from a musical perspective, it is necessary to engage with the material provided by other players and game developers in the manner in which it was intended to be consumed. For example, when examining the skaldic style heroism laments popular in Wintermark, a worthwhile discussion of the music's response to the system brief as well as the efficacy of immersion at play would only be achievable through experiencing it in context. In this case, that level of immersion would be playing a character who understands the implications of these laments and can engage convincingly and immersively with both the simulated grief and celebration inherent in the occasion for players. Many characters within Empire choose to adopt an "in-character researcher" persona, where a significant portion of their personal plot devices revolve around discovering the cultures and traditions of other nations within the Empire. This is utilised as an effective game mechanic to not only help expand one's knowledge of the system lore in an immersive non-intrusive way, but also present opportunities for further interaction with characters and scenarios that would otherwise be difficult to access for new inexperienced players. This technique can consequently be employed effectively by researchers, as in the case of this project when the character "Zlata" was used to covertly attend performances of

Wintermark musical traditions without intruding on the game experience of other players. This serves the simultaneous purpose of experiencing the music as "intended"; the researcher becomes an observer within the same fictional universe who is utilising deliberate game mechanics to explore all the cultural and aesthetic possibilities and experience that the game is designed to offer. Therefore, during periods of active roleplay at Empire throughout the fieldwork for this project, my own Empire identity "Zlata" was incorporated into these settings in a non-intrusive manner such as spectating and taking part in larger in-character festivals and parades. This allowed an organic, uninterrupted and unforced opportunity for the performers being studied and interviewed in this project.

To address the ethical and appropriate conducting of interviews within a LARP setting requires a rather more measured and careful approach within the methodology for this project. Not dissimilarly to considerations for the Sámi case study, LARPers too are a community of people who spend a great deal of the calendar year in far-flung locations from one another. This means that there is a similar exchange of socialising during LARP events, as many players wish to circulate around the field prior to the start of official gameplay. Consequently, an awareness of this social process is necessary in order to approach potential interview candidates in an appropriate manner. This is the principal reason for contacting potential interviewees prior to Empire events and using social media to prompt interest in the project. This way, the risk of potential interruption of other social interaction for the players is considerably lessened. If a researcher were to approach players during the game for requests for interview or observation, this would not only compromise the experience of the targeted player, but also the surrounding atmosphere of the camp itself and any others present. Furthermore, a wider issue of consent pervades the circumstance of an observing outside researcher. As stated previously, LARP is not intended for external spectators, and this is a considerable part of the reason stated by many participants for choosing LARP over re-enactment. These players have paid and consented to roleplaying in a secure setting among game developers/referees and other players, not any other outside spectators. In smaller systems, this type of consent can be easily attained through contacting all members of the group concerned, but due to large and fluctuating numbers of attendees at Empire, this is difficult. This is the most significant reason for choosing to observe players through participating in the event, and for establishing potential interest in interviews and conversations beforehand. As the thoughts and reflections of the performers themselves is paramount to this data collection, rather than their live reactions or responses, providing access to the topics for discussion and interview questions in advance did not compromise the process.

3.5: Summary of Methodologies

Thus far, all three case studies have been considered from the perspective of research techniques (principally participant/observation and semi-structured interviewing) for conducting ethnographic study within their respective communities. Ethnomusicology has historically demonstrated distinctly varied methods for both executing and writing musical ethnography.[187]Therefore, it has been necessary to ensure that the methodologies for this project have remained both dynamic and appropriate. When presenting ethnography concerning each of the case studies, it has been necessary to refer to as much primary evidence from these case studies as possible due to the highly inter-personal nature of the practices. After having acquired this interview data, the methodology for incorporating these insights into the theoretical framework outlined in Chapter 2 has been crafted to suitably incorporate these primary sources in a compelling and delicate manner. As this thesis aims to display, each of these case studies fits along a spectrum of activity regarding intention, process and perception by fellow performers or spectators. For the purposes of the Sámi case study, the data represents a culture which has been revived by its own people to achieve new purposes. Therefore, all further analysis must concern that altered purpose and whether this potentially complicates the question of "authenticity" within this practice. In a different place on our spectrum, Viking- age re-enactment and inspired creative material must be examined with consideration of how the culture has been re-invented by outsiders to that original culture. Finally, the LARP case study and its associated data must consider these questions from the perspective of newly generated culture from a variety of sources that has organically involved into an entirely unique cultural phenomenon that has managed to transcend the structured events from which it originated. The further chapters in this thesis draws from all three case studies to address much wider questions surrounding the place for "authenticity" and "immersion" in a contemporary world of content creators and consumers. Finally, these ideas will be applied to some experimental creative scenarios to act as live examples of how this musical content can be manipulated and reinvented to demonstrate a need for an immersed experience.

Much of the fieldwork in this thesis has relied on a self-regulated and participatory procedure, with as much allowance given for ethics and non-intrusion as possible. There has

---

[187] Bruno Nettl, *The Study of Ethnomusicology: 31 Issues & Concepts,* 2nd edn *(*Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2005)

been a considerable amount of literature on the subject of effective fieldwork methodology, particularly in the discipline of ethnomusicology, over recent decades. As Gillman and Fenn indicate, adaptability and flexibility are two of the key principles for any brand of ethnographic study and provide a compelling endorsement of the participant-observation model of fieldwork.[188] They illustrate the lack of verbal description present in many of the nuances witnessed by researchers in unfamiliar cultural settings, as well as emphasising the idea that participation. will place you in better favour with those you are trying to reach and come to understand. They also consider the difficulties of initially introducing oneself to participants and establishing a natural level of conversation and social interaction that allows for a fuller participation for the researcher. For the purposes of this study, particularly in the case of re- enactment and LARP, the majority of participants are highly enthusiastic about the content being examined. This enables researchers to approach many contributors with considerable ease, as there is often a great excitement surrounding opportunities to talk about one's hobby or creative output. This also relates to the question of rapport between the interviewer and interviewee, also discussed by Gillman and Fenn.[189] A familiarity and willingness to engage fully in activities surrounding the musical culture being studied will naturally result in a greater rapport between oneself and one's informant, as they are able to see the researcher's willingness to participate and therefore understand the full experience and implication of what is happening, rather than potentially pandering to an agenda. This line of thinking can be applied to all three case studies but is particularly significant to consider for the Sámi case study, as issues surrounding indigeneity and the risk for cultural appropriation result in a duty of care from etic observers and researchers to engage with creative material with the full consent and in some cases under the control of the owners of this culture.

Finally, a comprehensive statement about compliance with current ethical guidelines within this project is necessary to conclude this chapter. All interviewed participants were issued with a clear consent form (which can be viewed in Appendix C) in the presence of the researcher, who explained (through an interpreter when necessary) the full implications of the consent form and facilitated the solution of any confusion or disagreement from the participants. All interviewees were given the option of remaining anonymous, using a pseudonym such as a LARP character name or stage name, or using their full name. The vast

---

[188] Lisa Gilman & John Fenn 'Participant Observation', in *Handbook for Folklore and Ethnomusicology Fieldwork* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2019) pp. 118-39
[189] Ibid.

majority of interviewees chose to use their full name, due to the opportunity of expanding public awareness of their individual musical content. As the researcher, I took great care to familiarise all involved in the project with current political and societal associations surrounding certain areas of this musical content. This attention to detail ensured that, as the researcher, I was able to reassure participants that they were not required to elaborate on any topics they found sensitive or distressing. This is also reiterated in the consent form, along with all necessary contact details for the participants to receive transcripts if requested or make their own requests for withdrawal or alteration of certain facts or opinions given during interview. Overall, prior introduction and social interaction, initial briefing of questions and interview content, as well as an informal semi-structured interview setting with access to assistance or interpreters, ensured that all participants remained comfortable and fully informed throughout the process in all three case studies.

All three of these case studies were selected due to their relation to Nordic inspired musical aesthetics with an emphasis on historically informed interpretation and performance. To engage fully with these case studies, it was necessary to establish multiple examples across a variety of circumstances under the common denominator of identity, immersion and ownership. Examples of how this material has been manipulated and evolved into new musical cultures may be the primary feature of this project, but it is vital to also seek insight into what the Nordic cultures perceived by those outside them as authentic are choosing to revive and re-imagine, which is what makes the Sámi case study so significant here. The case studies of re-enactment and LARP co-exist compellingly around the realist anchor of Sámi musical revival, as they provide rather polarised examples of what happens when this creative content is manipulated, one for the purposes of achieving "true authenticity", and the other for creating an immersive story or setting. It became evident that utilising personal connections, as well as assorted musicological contacts, would be a key factor in the selection of case studies for this project. This background affiliation enables a thorough and in-depth examination of these case studies, and previous fieldwork into Sámi communities has also ensured that the process of ethnographically studying an indigenous culture is not an unfamiliar one. Therefore, these case studies were selected through a combination of theoretical justification, logistical sense and ease of accessibility to contacts and informants within the respective cultures. The careful selection of case studies, the careful approach to ethnography and methodology and the establishment of a suitable theoretical framework have ensured that we may now examine wider concepts surrounding historically informed reimagining and begin to incorporate direct examples from the case studies to test different areas of the two proposed frameworks. The

following three chapters will investigate the concepts of authenticity, immersion and ownership while following the trajectory of the Desire-Process-Result model in relation to each chapter's theme.

Chapter 4

Authenticity and the Desire to Create

The following three chapters will lay out the author's *Desire-Process-Result* model of historically informed musical recreation, with continued reference to the identified spectrum between re-enactment and re-imagining. As established in the introductory chapters, the main theoretical framework of this thesis relies on unpacking authenticity and immersion as our two principal themes. The next two chapters will deconstruct authenticity into its evolution, some parsing of the literal definition of the word, and how it plays a vital role in both the desire to create new content based on historical inspiration, and the process in which this new content is delivered. Firstly, it is necessary to examine authenticity's role at the very start of our model: that of "desire". Through examples from across the entire spectrum presented as an analytical model, this chapter will present an alternative view for defining authenticity and how it works in the initial stages of a creative process, demonstrating that our view of "the past" and how we feel it should be presented in these contexts are both malleable and inherently "experimental" in the most literal of definitions.

As noted in the personal context from which this thesis arose, there are few words heard more often within historical re-enactment and roleplay communities than the word "authenticity". The first question to leave the lips of spectators, traders or participants upon the addition of any new piece of material into a display is frequently "is this authentic?". In related areas of historical interpretation, the question most often heard in many museum displays from the mouths of both children and adults tends to involve the phrase "is this real?". It appears that an additional level of satisfaction is attained through the simple knowledge that something one has engaged with is "real", irrespective of any ability (or lack thereof) to fully appreciate all the archaeological and scientific implications of that "realness". Often, that very realness seems to be enough to provide consumers and/or spectators with what they attended the event or display for.

This chapter will focus on several questions surrounding the idea of authenticity within historically informed musical performance, using primary data from this project's case studies as examples. Firstly, a necessary consideration of authenticity's place within discussions of hauntology and nostalgia theory will take place. Specifically, the implications of Derrida's

original hauntology model upon our present definition of authenticity within historical contexts will feature in this discussion. This will travel into an analysis of the term "brief" within the context of both re-enactment and LARP and examine whether a cultural equivalent exists within Sámi musical revivals.

After many years of both museum employment and personal experience among the participants of our first case study, Viking-age historical re-enactment, there is a seemingly notorious opinion held among many re-enactors across the United Kingdom that historically informed musical performance is something that should not be approached lightly when performing displays or living histories. An innate fear of being "questioned" about the authenticity of what they are providing seems to continuously loom during these performances. There are several areas to parse in this scenario: who is doing the "questioning" and by what authority is this "questioning" coming to light? This perceived idea of hierarchy within historically informed material is at the beating heart of our authenticity problem. Not only do participants in these subcultures feel pressured to research their content as thoroughly as possible prior to displaying it to the public, but they must also bow that content gracefully out of circulation, should any query or contradiction arise. The most common explanation for this necessity is the duty re-enactors have to the general public: to provide an accurate andauthentic display of what life during a certain period of history was like. As consumers, attendees of either museums or living history events are often greatly concerned with the authenticity of what they are seeing.

The mindset of the participant in this scenario is more difficult to ascertain, but it can certainly be argued that these creative interpretations and/or allowances are a high priority in the minds of many re-enactors. When we consider the problem of hierarchy within authenticity theory, there is also the matter of justification. In other words, the participants must feel *justified* in their presentation of this content, that the academic and/or experiential *hierarchy* (or, importantly, the *perceived hierarchy*) have laid out as instructions or advice for them.[190]

This need for both justification and recognition of hierarchy present in the recreation of historical content can be witnessed in all areas of the Desire-Process-Result model. The participant begins with a *desire* to create or contribute to a re-enactment performance or display and engage with that historical content. They move into a *process* by which they carefully address anachronisms and, in many cases, conduct research into their personal roles

---

[190] Deepak Chhabra, Robert Healy and Erin Sills, 'Staged Authenticity and Heriage Tourism', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 30:3 (2003) pp. 702-719

or activities. Finally, they seek a *result* which both silently justifies the necessity of certain allowances to be made for logistical, medical, societal or spiritual reasons, and recognises the authorities from which this information originated.

All of these processes are governed by a recognition of or need for authenticity. However, for the DPR model to be applied to a variety of creative contexts and to justify the validity of the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum, this fraught and many layered word needs to be unpacked and its implications fully examined. This chapter will start the discussion of authenticity's role in hauntology, displaced nostalgia, the establishing of "briefs" and narratives, culminating in an examination of the cultural implications of these roles while ascertaining the place of authenticity within the chosen case studies. Authenticity has existed as a concept for many centuries, but this does not necessarily mean it moves seamlessly with those centuries. There is also argument among scholars regarding the theorised "replacement" of the word "authentic" with "informed" to allow for an implied openness to alternatives.[191]

Authenticity as a term has saddled itself with different implications throughout different periods of history and even in more recent decades, has been called into question in a growing number of creative industries. In fact, it is sometimes even critiqued as a "commercial" term which places insincere importance on "appropriate" philosophies of performance.[192] This chapter will argue a need for redefining historical authenticity in particular; that is to say, authenticity which does not move like a linear timeline as traditional historiography would naturally imply. There is an argument for stepping aside from the notion that time produces innately more propensity to achieve true "authenticity" with regard to accuracy and preciseness. Instead, for the purposes of determining authenticity's role in placing content on the Reimagining Activity Spectrum, as well as the cultural implications for when its meaning or purpose is called into question, this thesis will subscribe to the notion that authenticity, unlike the linear notion of time, moves in smaller dispersed microcosms of activity, appearing at different points throughout linear timelines.

---

[191] P. Kivy, 'On the Historically Informed Performance', *The British Journal of Aesthetics* 42: 2 (2002) pp. 128–44

[192] Richard Taruskin, 'The Pastness of the Present and the Presence of the Past', in *Authenticity in Early Music*, ed. by Nicholas Kenyon (Oxford: Oxford University Press. 1988)

4.1: The role of hauntology and nostalgia in the authenticity of historically informed music

The concept of authenticity in musical performance depends greatly on how an individual, whether participating or consuming, feels able to take prior knowledge and context into account. Kivy suggests an alternative idea of considering the performer themselves that which is "historically informed", as opposed to the performance. In other words, a "historically informed performance" can be thought of as "a performance by somebody who is historically informed".[193] This places an onus on the performer to ensure that they are indeed informed. For example, if a re-enactor wishes to feel they are delivering an authentic experience during a display, they will ensure that some element of a prepared environment or prior research has been carried out to enable this. This desire for a certain type of experience or setting will result in the individual turning to their own lived experience for what reminds them of this association. This is why the theoretical framework of both nostalgia and hauntology is so vital for determining the "desire" element of historical recreation. The vast majority of this initial desire to produce content will stem from actively experienced associations and popular and/or cultural stereotypes and exposure to a particular historical era or trope. However, it is necessary to underline the subtle differences between displaced nostalgia and hauntology in these particular contexts. For the purposes of this thesis and this chapter's specific examination into the authenticity of desiring to recreate, displaced nostalgia will principally refer to elements of a musical culture that are being both longed for and recreated by individuals who did not directly live through this culture. This particular application of hauntology, on the other hand, delves more into the initial creative stages of historical musical content; there are many elements of hauntological theory in the initial hesitations, alterations, and sometimes even reluctance to commit to something that may be criticised for its lack of authenticity later in the process.

Routledge et al. have indicated, in their study of nostalgia and its relation to meaningfulness within daily life, that there is a corrigible link between music-evoked nostalgia and the sense of being loved as well as the concept of nostalgia being used as a psychological barrier in defence of one's fear of death; that is to say, believing that you are "more" than your

---

[193] P. Kivy, 'On the Historically Informed Performance', *The British Journal of Aesthetics* 42: 2 (2002) pp. 128–44

physical self will naturally imbue you with reassurance when facing your own mortality.[194] It is particularly interesting to note their statement in their concluding remarks (p. 650) that "the past can[...]be a vital resource on which one might draw to maintain and enhance a sense of meaning".[195] While this project and its case studies predominantly concern nostalgia within the lived and remembered past of individuals, this idea of the past as a "resource" can easily be transferred into the context of the historical past. However, it could be argued that the "historical past" is not the past. Re-enactors and others who wish to revive ancient cultures are not seeking to recreate lived experiences, but to create a simulation of an imagined previous reality. Therefore, attempting to link these practices with nostalgia by its strictest definitions is inadequate for purpose. However, there is no denying that participants within reimagined historical cultures feel a displaced longing for a time that has passed. Therefore, it is necessary to introduce hauntology into the theoretical framework of this project, as true nostalgia arguably does not fit into the parameters of the alternative present that uses the historical past as a resource.

For similar reasons, the following investigation into documented examples of "displaced nostalgia" is necessary to unpack their theoretical role in our definition of "authenticity". Using the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum and the case studies contained therein, we can demonstrate that traditional musical practices such as these can both withstand this idea of displaced nostalgia, as well as flourish and utilise the ever-changing environment in which they exist. Those who are a generation or more apart from what may be deemed the "original" versions of these traditions [180] continue to feel a desire to engage with this content in such a manner that makes it their own.[196] This is the case both in indigenous Sámi folk music and musical content recreated from archaeology from the Viking age, in both the Nordic countries and the British Isles. However, does "displaced nostalgia" necessarily mean the same thing as hauntology? Is this a branch of hauntology, or something that works against Derrida's original theory? The following section will answer these questions, along with examining the idea of curated works and their role in creating these nostalgic and hauntological concepts. This, in turn, will demonstrate the potency of nostalgia and hauntology to facilitate the desire present in the proposed Desire-Process-Result model,

---

[194] Clay Routledge, Jamie Arndt, Tim Wildschut, Constantine Sedikides, Claire M. Hart, Jacob Juhl, Ad J. J. M. Vingerhoets, and Wolff Schlotz, 'The Past Makes the Present Meaningful: Nostalgia as an Existential Resource', *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 101: 3 (2011) pp. 638–52 (p. 639 & p. 647)
[195] Ibid, p. 650.
[196] By "version" we are indeed referring to Lydia Goehr's discussion of "versions" of musical works, as well as demonstrating that *joik's* role as a "work" is rather more complicated to identify.

indicating how both these feelings are compelling enough in a participant to promote a cogniscant difference and drive to produce creative historically informed content in innovative ways.

As will be further examined in the discussion on *joik* and spirituality in Chapter 6, the role of displaced nostalgia in Sámi music is a significant one. One small but extraordinarily telling example can be seen in a solo performance by renowned *joik*er Sofia Jannok uploaded to YouTube under the title "Yoik of the Wind" from what appears to be an individual's personal account in Argentina.[197] [181] The video has been viewed approximately 750,000 times and features a great deal of social interaction from viewers. There are many comments on the video indicating that this was the viewer's first experience of Sámi folk music and how moved they were upon hearing it. However, one individual providing a full name of Sámi origin indicated that "this Sami *joik* is a copy of the original version and personal *joik/* chant of the Sami reindeer herder of Mikkel Mikkelsen Buljo, "Mihkkelas Mihkkal" from Kautokeino, Norway.", with 18 positive responses visible for this comment.

This is one interaction out of many thousands in response to Sofia Jannok's work, but its wording touches on several of the key questions surrounding contemporary use of *joik*. Do *joik*s indeed have "versions"? Was this comment intended as a criticism, indicating that Sofia Jannok should not be "copying" the "original version"? Or, alternatively, was this intended as an educational piece of information for the account that uploaded this video and those who watch it? It is not possible to discern which of these is true with the information available, but it begins to indicate the discrepancies between "originals" and "copies" present in Sámi musical culture.

During her interview with me at the Riddu Riddu Festival, (2017), Berit Alette Mienna alluded to this shift in perceived ownership and discussed how "for my parents and that generation, it wasn't important [to know who had created individual *joik*s]".[198] She refers to the generation of Sámi adults in the early 20th century who were less aware of the majority of their older traditions,[183] prior to the initial revival piloted by cultural activists in the late 1960s.[199] It would therefore appear that the listeners' desire to attribute identity to the works is a relatively new phenomenon. This relates to the theory of displaced nostalgia well, as it

---

[197] Sofia Jannok,'Yoik of the Wind', Youtube user micaelaluna1, *YouTube* (2012) www.youtube.com/watch?v=aPqKAuzo0tk. [Accessed 20 November 2020]
[198] Berit Alette Mienna, Appendix B, Interview 2, p. 212
[199] Thomas Hilder, *Sámi Musical Performance and the Politics of Indigeneity in Northern Europe* (Washington DC: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2014)

suggests an innate desire to feel "connected" to an element of the past by being able to correctly identify the origins of a musical work. The fact that this occurs even though the tradition was not originally designed around this desire reflects both the shifting of authenticity parameters in this practice and the willingness of Sámi musicians to allow their content to endure in new and previously unprecedented forms. Mienna recognises the somewhat contemporary desire to attribute ownership to *joik*s and treats that desire as another method of learning. This philosophy also applies to her welcoming of non-Sámi participants in her *joik*ing workshops and lessons. She indicated her view that *joik* is "a big gift, and I want more and more people to share it".[200] She is referring to the process of transferring knowledge and opening the opportunity to interested parties whether Sámi or otherwise in this section of the transcript, stating that "it breeds tolerance when you share and when you create understanding around these things".[201] This would indicate that certainly in the case of the internationally renowned *Riddu Riddu* festival that focuses primarily on the transference and development of indigenous culture, there is an overall willingness to encourage engagement with this musical content outside the region of Sápmi. Mienna elaborated that many are drawn to "indigenous cultures and indigenous ways of living", because they are looking for more tangible spiritual connections with the natural world.[202] This is a direct example of somebody feeling nostalgia and longing for something that is either not theirs or that they have felt removed from in some capacity.

The "desire" to recreate historical content in a creative manner interacts heavily with feelings of longing, wanting to acquire that which no longer exists, and the concept of belonging to a culture or system that one either was not naturally from or did not live at the appropriate point in time. A sense of belonging as well as a desire to connect with some form of external creative stimulus appears to be at the root of this desire to recreate. This is what our desire-process-result model arrives at when defining "displaced nostalgia", differing from hauntology at the point of "desire" itself. Hauntology as an aesthetic phenomenon, as will be examined in the following section, occurs irrespective of the "desire" or lack thereof present in the creative process. Displaced nostalgia will act as a direct and deliberate drive with which to execute the desire to create (or indeed recreate) content. It will inform the context and immersion in which this content will be created, as well as potentially dictate the work's reach

---

[200] Berit Alette Mienna, Appendix B, Interview 2, p. 210
[201] Ibid.
[202] Ibid.

after creation.

This difference can be seen clearly in the aforementioned Sámi case study; the *joik*ing workshop setting acts as a foundation for those wishing to connect with Sámi culture on some creative level. What is perhaps most significant about that is the fact that "displaced" modern Sámi also exhibit curiosity and engage with the learning process in settings like festivals and workshops.[203] Berit Alette Mienna's course featured a considerable mix of nationalities and social backgrounds, and even included individuals from other areas of Sápmi who grew up without the direct influence of the old religion or *joik*.[204] One particular individual remarked that their immediate family displayed disappointment, shock and even anger at the spark of interest this person began to show in *joik*, resulting in their attendance at the *Riddu Riddu* festival. When asked to explain further, the individual stated that their family were religious and considered an interest in the old Sami religion to be against principles of Christianity.[205]

This is a particularly significant and unusual example of displaced nostalgia, as despite being of the correct geographical and ethnic background, these "displaced" Sami are wishing to belong to a culture that by every right should be their own, but for a variety of reasons they have been raised outside the immediate influence of this culture. It is very important to underline that this is a deliberate desire to access this information and engage with this culture. This does not remove hauntological aspects of this process –as will be explored in the next section, the "spectre" of Sámi cultural displacement plays a passive but significant role in their contemporary cultural revival –but the desire to seek these elements of Sámi culture out for one's own self-betterment is its own distinct phenomenon that would theoretically be perfectly capable of existing without the presence of spectres. To summarise, the desire to recreate traditional or historical content in new and/or culturally immersive settings occurs for both active and passive reasons in the mind of an interested individual.

---

[203] The individual in the following example shared their experiences during the workshop (which all participants were aware was being documented) but declined to comment directly on their experiences for this specific project, so will be kept fully anonymous.

[204] Elin Margrethe Wersland, *Yoik in the Old Sami Religion* (Norway: Forlaget Vett & Viten, 2006)

[205] Appendix A, Field notes from B.A. Mienna's three day Joiking Course, *Riddu Riddu* Festival. (note: the individual source is being deliberately kept anonymous and not being quoted directly as per their request).

4.2: The Haunted Past of Indigenous Displacement

The principles of hauntology feature heavily in cultures that are created from the gathered remnants of older ones, which relates directly to that new culture's view of authenticity (or perceived authenticity). The contemporary Sámi cultural revival displays some particularly poignant examples of hauntological influences in recent years. There is an overarching and tangible awareness of the interference of external forces over previous centuries, resulting in the decimation and fracturing of the "original" culture. This has resulted in several generations of indigenous Sámi being either uninformed or only partially or anecdotally aware of their heritage and creative features of their cultures. However, there are some surprising similarities between the drive behind this deliberate revival of a tangible historical culture and the creation of new worlds and settings for live action roleplay. Both instances of reimagining seek to make a tangible connection with the surrounding world, whether it is real or fictional. *Joik*s are inherently imbued in associations with the environments and ecosystems of Sapmi,[189] and generated LARP cultures seek to interact either with the "brief" or with another chosen element of the setting.[206] This can be seen in a great deal of the popular source material used for creating *joik*s predominantly natural elements such as local landmarks, geographical features and fauna.

Berit Alette Mienna alluded to this in her *joik*ing workshop at *Riddu Riddu*; she placed great emphasis on learning and discussing *joik*s both inside the *goahti* (a traditional Sami hut covered with peat moss and foliage) and outside next to the local river. Each morning of the course, she would lead us in what she described as a "good morning" *joik,* encouraging us to greet individual elements of the surrounding landscape as part of this process. While this may, on the surface, seem a far-flung comparison, musicians at LARP events undergo surprisingly similar processes for a variety of reasons. At PD's Empire, the Varushkan nation will gather together at the beginning of every evening (this nation's traditions involve only beginning storytelling or songs after sunset) and "ward" the camp.[207] This means simulating the casting of a protective enchantment around their section of the playing field and will similarly draw upon surrounding elements of the local area to provide musical stimulus to the participants. While the settings and origins of these practices are indeed vastly different and do not

---

206 Tina K. Ramnarine, 'Acoustemology, Indigeneity, and Joik in Valkeapää's Symphonic Activism: Views from Europe's Arctic Fringes for Environmental Ethnomusicology', *Ethnomusicology* 53: 2 (2009) pp. 187–217
207 Matthew Pennington and Andy Raff, 'Varushka Hearth Magic', *Empire Wiki* (2013)
https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire-wiki/Varushka_hearth_magic. [Accessed 16 December 2020]

necessarily exist to achieve similar purposes, there nevertheless remains a desire to engage with one's landscape.

How, then, does this style of content creation relate to the notion of being "haunted" by something? The answer to this lies in the tangible need to recognise, verify or legitimise the reality of that culture through creative expression. In other words, both these disparate groups are haunted by opportunity. There is a continuous drive to ensure that the engagement displayed to outside audiences (and indeed between participants) has a traceable link to key foundations of that tradition. This ensures the continuity of the culture, as well as providing a basis for myth-making, creative growth and further engagement.

Historical re-enactment, despite being a relatively new industry, features a number of unintentional and powerful hauntological influences throughout the initial stages of its process. Interestingly, re-enactment's "spectres" are not where one would perhaps imagine them to be. Many re-enactment groups (and consequently roleplay groups) are governed by systems of inherited knowledge and hearsay, sometimes even potentially stunting the development and extension of their displays and/or activities. This is particularly true in university-based societies in Britain, due to the inherently temporal nature of student-led organisations.[208][191] Usually, no single society is governed for more than two to three years by the same group of people, due to societies being marketed as extra-curricular while students move through the process of an undergraduate programme. As such, in the case of running a historical re-enactment society, there is considerable pressure to maintain a perceived authenticity based on what was learned prior to that student becoming the society's leader. This is also particularly pertinent if there are "lifetime members" (whether alumni or interested locals) of these societies present at the meetings, who have become accustomed to whatever has been deemed acceptable by previous committees. This circumstance results in a "shadow" left in the wake of past committees of graduates, in which a new committee must adhere to live up to. Due to the structure of undergraduate life in the UK and the intensive study schedule of many students, it can become difficult to break past established patterns of activity, as it is all too easy to fall back on existing plans.

While this is not the element of hauntology traditionally expected to be foremost in the mind of a re-enactor, data gathered from re-enactment societies from a variety of UK universities does indicate that participants are, to an extent, governed in the presentation of

---

[208] Royal Holloway Students' Union, 'Royal Holloway LARP and Historical Re-Enactment Society', *Facebook Groups* (2020) https://www.facebook.com/royalhollowaylarp/ [Accessed 16 December 2020]

historical content by past expectations and compromises from governing committees.[209] Derrida's suggested structure of "mourning, language and work" can be applied here with a particular emphasis on the first two stages of this structure.[210] Re-enactors can be argued to "mourn" a mythical "more authentic" time in their organisations, by the tentative harkening back to "how the process occurred the previous academic year" or similar. The concept of "authenticity" is automatically placed on a pedestal (in many cases, rather an intimidating one) by those who are uncertain of executing that recreation process. This perceived pedestal also affects language surrounding the content, much in the same way a death alters the language used by those who knew the individual. An emphasis on "how things used to be done" is often visible in re- enactment groups, rather than that of reliance on documented evidence. That is not to say the word "evidence" is not used; following our theme of "language", this is in fact something of a "buzz word" for many re-enactors. A standard rule in many societies is the freedom to include whatever content one wishes, as long as one provides "evidence". The discrepancies lie within the precise nature of this evidence; there is generally an element of trust that individual re- enactors can research their own content.

This raises some interesting questions about the precise nature of authenticity as a facet of the desire to create within cultural revivals, historical re-enactment and live roleplay groups. While the historical or societal circumstance resulting in that desire to create will be markedly different in each case study, a familiar overriding principle of hauntological desire remains present when theorising authenticity in these contexts. To further extend this line of inquiry, it is necessary to examine the other main facet when formulating a desire to create a piece of historically informed musical content; as well as the innate hauntological desire that has been established as present in a variety of ways, there usually must also exist some form of external prompt. The following section will examine the concept of "briefs" and their role in both adding to the overall narrative of the process and facilitating the desire to create.

---

[209] Stephen Gapps, 'Authenticity Matters: Historical Re-Enactment and Australian Attitudes to the Past', *Australian Cultural History*, 22 (2003) pp. 50-62
[210] Jacques Derrida, *Specters of Marx: The State of the Debt, the Work of Mourning and the New International* (New York: Routledge, 2006)

4.3: A Brief as a Narrative

For the purposes of this study, the word "brief" is used in a much wider context than its typical application in re-enactment and roleplay settings. Many of these settings feature some form of written prompt, containing background information of the historical period and/or fantastical setting of the event. This "brief" will potentially also instruct participants on what to wear, how to behave, what should and should not be visible to the spectating public/other participants for the purposes of authenticity and immersion, as well as providing creative inspiration for participant-created characters while remaining in the parameters of the described setting. These "briefs" exist for a number of reasons. Predominantly their purpose is to inform new participants regarding character creation and preparation of costume and/or activities. Following this initial introduction to the hobby or event, the participant is then expected to refer to the brief for further development of their character, in order to maintain the parameters agreed by participants and organisations. These parameters can refer to a particular historical period, resulting in deference to documented facts and/or archaeological evidence.

However, when examining authenticity in the contexts of hauntology, simulacra and semiotics, the concept and definition of a "brief" can arguably go much further than a mere set of instructions for a participant of historical recreation. The following will assess exactly how far this definition can go in a philosophical sense, providing examples from Sámi educational and instructional contexts, some theoretical considerations of briefs in historical re-enactment and its implications for historically inspired musical re-imagining, and how a brief is engaged with in a live roleplay setting. Briefs play a vital role in establishing how the *desire* in our DPR model both manifests and continues in musical practice throughout these disparate practices. A brief can instruct and provide inspiration, but it can also dictate socio-cultural expectations and in some cases stifle creation of certain material in the name of "authenticity". The following will examine how far this extended definition of a "brief" can go, applying this theory to three different examples from along the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum. Finally, the role of a brief will be analysed regarding the Desire-Process-Result model, demonstrating how the content and perceived authority of a brief can inform the desire of a participant to create or extend.

How far can the definition of a brief travel?

The predominant question in the following section is how far, theoretically speaking, the definition of a brief can travel in these contexts? With regard to the perpetuation of authenticity across a wide spectrum of activity in historical recreation, a "brief" can act as a placeholder in our established Desire-Process-Result model with regards to "desire". An effective brief can both create an inherently new desire in a musician or other content creator, as well as continue fuelling an existing desire to recreate content from the past. In other words, a brief for a historical recreation acts as a set of specifications to ensure authenticity and immersion for both participants and observers. While ensuring that continued recognisable tropes of that setting are present in creative content, the brief also has the potential of inspiring and encouraging innovative use of this historical material. However, to progress this line of thought, we must establish what form briefs usually take, how the people in these cultures interact with them, as well as how they can be thought of in a musically expressive manner.

A successful historical brief relies on the drawing together of recognisable signs and symbols of a particular era of the past. When considering the placement of briefs with regards to the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum, one finds that the level of external awareness greatly affects both the purpose of the brief and how it is responded to by participants. In the case of contemporary Sámi musical revivals, that information exists outside any particular instruction or specification given by an expert, teacher, or archivist. That is to say, one can access the fundamental principles of *joik* through external research and there are rarely settings in which a specific set of instructions are issued for participation. Re-enactors, while also able to access external information, rely on the concept of a brief rather more due to the specific nature of their events and performances; usually a re-enactment display focuses intently on a specific period in history, which requires specialist knowledge. LARP, however, is almost entirely brief-reliant, as the culture and setting often does not exist outside the determined brief. This means that players have responsibility to adhere to the original creators of the system and maintain a basic working knowledge of where the original inspiration of the brief came from.

As a result, when considering a specifically musically inclined brief for a historically informed event, performance and/or culture, a theoretical framework can be applied as follows. A brief can be designed to inform the desire of musicians to instruct on the continuity of an existing culture, recreate or simulate content based on a particular historical period, or

designed to represent a specifically created culture using real-world historical inspirations. It can vary in levels of detail in its specifications; actual scores from the appropriate period/setting may be available, otherwise prompts for instrumentation, styles of melody and common tonalities/modes could be included. This means that any kind of "brief" for historically reimagining music exists on a spectrum of its own – that of how involved with the process the brief is, and to what extent the desire of the participant is informed by availability of material. To summarise, the definition of a 'brief' can extend, theoretically speaking, beyond that of simply a set of specifications used by performers and/or participants. Musical briefs exist to provide instruction but also to provide a basis in setting and immersion, resulting in a healthier creative environment. By "musical brief", this study refers to a form of prompt that instructs in a specifically musical manner, such as a songbook written for a specific event or display, or even simply knowledge of the capabilities of certain historical instruments.

Briefs in Case Study 2: Indigenous Revival

When considering the role of a cultural "brief" in an indigenous revival setting, it is important to recognise the inherent differences in the drive behind recreation compared to that of re-enactment or roleplay. Due to the uniquely interrupted creative practices of the Sámi and their history, the matter of what and who dictates the parameters of these creations have become somewhat complex in a contemporary setting. The emphasis instead shifts onto Sámi people feeling as empowered as possible to want to create new content. This results in a rather looser version of a cultural "brief", with much more freedom for experimentally creative expression. Due to the uneven dispersal of information and historical sources available today regarding the origins of *joik* and its musical applications prior to the 18th century, there does not appear to be a firmly agreed wider authority on the subject of authenticity within the creation of traditional Sámi music. Sámi musicians are able to maintain musical traditions such as *joik* with a fairly creatively loose brief but are able to remain culturally informed and recognisable. This is an unusual application of the "brief" concept but nevertheless remains effective in establishing a theoretical framework behind the desire to create historically informed content. Johan Mahtte Skum alluded to elements of this during discussions at the 2017 *Riddu Riddu* festival. He remarked that "if a tradition, a *joik*, is going to live further, it has to change constantly; you can't stop it [...] it [the tradition] would stop and die

[otherwise]".[211] This indicates towards, certainly in the minds of younger Sámi adults, an acceptance of creatively forward thinking as a method for extending the tradition rather than hindering it. Therefore, what content creators would view as a form of "brief - that is, the parameters surrounding what defines a *joik* and which of its musical signs are most recognisable both to those within Sámi culture and those outside it - needs to be correspondingly open to wider interpretation.

Johan Mahtes Skum refers to a "*joik* competition like Eurovision" that takes place in his hometown each year – an opportunity for new musicians to present *joik*s as a staged entertainment.[212] This in itself is an example of the "brief" of *joik* being altered with modern considerations; *joik*ers must now established what can be transferred to a stage format. If a "Eurovision-style" setting is being applied, this implies a level of value judgement to the proceedings, which raises new questions of how a *joik* can be assessed and under what parameters. Traditionally, *joik*s are timeless and can be started and finished at the leisure of the performer, so there must be either discontinuation of this element of the tradition or a way of simulating a feeling of "timelessness" in newer versions.[213] These new methods of defining reference and instruction in the creation of new musical material in contemporary Sami culture are fundamentally born out of necessity for a new system of instruction. Because the information is often no longer accessible or unknown to contemporary researchers, the "brief" of creative Sámi expression must therefore become correspondingly wider. This ultimately raises questions of what (or indeed who) gets to decide how wide this "brief" becomes, which will be covered in the later section on cultural gatekeeping in this chapter.

Briefs in Case Study 1: Historical Re-enactment

Traditionally, the concept of a "brief" for historical re-enactment organisations, particularly those intending to represent specific past events such as famous battles or festivals, is an integral and rigid part of the re-enactment process. As a result, it is the first port of call for anyone desiring to employ creative skills within their role as a participant. In many organisations, such as Historia Normannis, a large hierarchy of members exists, and specific

---

[211] Johan Mahtes Skum, Appendix B, Interview 2, p. 208

[212] Ibid, p. 208

[213] Tina K. Ramnarine, *Ilmatar's Inspirations: Nationalism, Globalization and the Changing Soundscapes of Finnish Folk Music (*London: University of Chicago Press, 2003)

roles given to those wishing to specialise in historical research.[214] This ensures that the specifications given to participants continue to evolve and space can be ensured for newer material to eventually be circulated into the organisation's regular displays. This both maintains order within the group of re-enactors, ensuring they match the intended setting, as well as provides the re-enactors themselves with a basis for building their identities and deciding to what extent they work within the brief's parameters to create musical content. The difficulty of adding music to a historical re-enactment brief escalates the further into the past the organisation intends to go. American Civil War re-enactors, for example, arguably face an easier task in this respect, as many well known secular folk songs from that period are still in circulation in the modern United States.

The same can be suggested for World War re-enactments, as this is recent enough for audio records to still exist. However, when creating a brief for the Viking or Norman age, archaeology and the sparsely available fragments of scores written centuries later become the main sources for an organisation's research. Often, a certain degree of that responsibility is placed upon the musicians themselves. Many historical re-enactment groups are open to the concept of introducing hitherto unplayed creative content into their displays, but there is an expectation of the participants to explain its place in that world, both to their fellow re-enactors and to any curious spectators. In other words, if a re-enactor can provide their own, independently researched claims for why a certain piece of content or instrumentation would feasibly exist during that period, it becomes acceptable for circulation within re-enactment. Such a specific and potentially academically challenging brief can certainly be daunting to less experienced or younger re-enactors, but this style of specification acts as a tool for amplifying the desire to recreate in several different ways. Firstly, the participants maintain an active wish to contribute to the setting and therefore the overall immersion of the display. However, they also retain a sense of satisfaction from "staying on brief". The knowledge that the academic and historiographic criteria have been met become a part of the re-enactor role and ultimately act as a rewarding inspiration. Being able to both meet that criteria and work within it to create engaging creative content, while challenging, provides an integral part of both a re-enactor and an audience member's experience.

---

[214] Historia Normannis, 'Historia Normannis – The Leading 12th Century Living History Society', *Normannis* (2018) https://normannis.co.uk/wp/. [Accessed 16 December 2020]

Briefs in Case Study 3: Live Action Roleplay

As mentioned above, briefs in live action roleplay enjoy a heightened importance throughout all aspects of the culture. This is because of the inherent nature of LARP itself; the culture that has been created does not exist anywhere else, even if parts of it are informed by real historical periods or existing cultures. While this may be the case, it is common for these inspirations to either be partial or to have key elements altered to fit the laws of that game's chosen universe - or indeed, to avoid being insensitive or accidentally appropriating precious elements of other cultures. Therefore, rather than the potentially restrictive view of historical re-enactment briefs, festival LARP briefs tend to hold slightly more similarities with how indigenous cultures such as the Sámi choose to affirm their desire to create. Both these types of cultures, despite being worlds away from one another, employ a "brief" as a set of specifications to inspire participants in that culture to create, rather than control the parameters within which that content is created. In other words, LARP briefs are intended to lay out ideas for players and give them agency for shaping their own character identities.

At the Summer Solstice Empire event in 2018, James Smart, a musician belonging to the Wintermark nation within the game, specified that "before the system actually started, we got together and started writing some music. We'd read the Empire Wiki and picked out a few interesting parts."[215] Smart goes on to explain that the finer details of the musical briefs for the Wintermark nation felt "constraining" to him and other musicians in his group that were not classically trained. While this does indeed raise some questions about the overall accessibility of this particular brief, it is important to note that this particular process described by Smart occurred before Empire ran its first event. This means that the brief was the only source of information for potential players. After the game had run for a number of years and musicians began circulating popular works between themselves during events, Smart's initial description of "picking out interesting parts" seems rather more relevant and inclusive. As the system has continued to grow, it has become clear that the purpose of the initial brief has evolved into something enabling rather than constraining. While there is indeed a wealth of detail for those with enough of a musical background to challenge themselves with it, it seems to have become an unwritten rule within that system that this level of detail is entirely optional. Far more musicians opt to engage with the roleplaying itself and choose for themselves an effectively immersive method of composing and performing. In other words, briefs in this type of live

---

[215] James Smart, Appendix B, Interview 4, p. 213

action roleplay evolve into tools for developing an atmosphere of inclusivity and productivity. This directly informs a player's desire to create reimagined content, whether through filking[199] or utilising constituent elements of the brief to provide instrumental accompaniment to significant moments in the game.[216] Once again, a spectrum of activity can be observed here: that of choosing to engage fully with a detailed and intricate brief, and that of using it as a creatively looser form of inspiration to inform and engage with tropes that have naturally evolved within the game.

Briefs and the DPR Model

Summarising the varying roles of briefs within different forms of historical reimagining, it can be ascertained that along with the cultures themselves, briefs exist on a spectrum of activity depending on the availability of external information and the state of evolution that culture is currently in. Therefore, it can be argued that briefs (or specifications/instructions if they are not specifically referred to as "briefs") can play an active role in informing the desire of a participant. It can also potentially alter and shape that desire to create content over a period of time; adhering "to the brief" becomes part of the overall desire of a participant. In other words, they are creating not simply because they want to create, but because they want to fulfil the criteria of that brief and/or demonstrate the source of their creative inspiration.

This can be seen in all the examples considered in the above section. LARP musicians such as James Smart have indicated the movement of their creative process from being exclusively brief-led to somewhere between brief-led and being informed by the natural evolution of the process.[217] This shapes the participants' desire to create content as well as find innovative ways to honour the original brief. This is true to a certain extent of historical re- enactment organisations, but the brief brings a sense of security to its participants in that context, giving them set parameters with which to achieve authenticity (or at least, perceived authenticity as far as the audiences are concerned). Finally, in the case of indigenous cultural revival, while a tangible "brief" cannot be said to exist in most creative contexts, there are efforts to educate younger generations of Sámi such as Ulla Pirrtijarvi and Berit Alette Mienna's respective efforts over the decades to incorporate *joik* in early schooling.[218]

---

[216] See Chapter 6, Section 6.4 for further discussion of filking.
[217] Ibid.
[218] Ulla Pirttijarvi, *Honkon Dohkka* (Kautokeino: DAT Publishing, 1995)

What, then, does this imply for the formation of desire via brief-based exposure? The answer to this is twofold; a set of specifications organised as a "brief" can create a sense of perceived authority among participants of a culture, particularly if they have entered into that culture from elsewhere. This creates a sense of responsibility within the participants to remain educated and aware of elements of the brief, which therefore involves adhering to authority figures within those contexts. Additionally, however, this setting of parameters within creative content does not necessarily "restrict" this process. It instead adds a new layer of satisfaction to the overall experience of the participant; the desire to create a piece of music becomes intertwined with the desire to acquire the achievement of satisfying a specific brief. By doing so, the participant demonstrates both to their fellows and to any observers that they have spent the time and resources necessary to engage with this brief, thus showcasing the full extent of the care and deliberation that has gone into this process.

4.4: Cultural gatekeeping and inheritance of tradition

The consideration of a brief for creatively reimagining historical content leads to an inevitable question of where this brief originates from and who is responsible for its creation. By establishing that briefs play a significant role in the shaping of a re-enactor or role-player's desire to produce creative content for their chosen setting, it is therefore accepted that the organisations responsible for these events hold a certain level of authority regarding how participants engage with these ideas. However, this sequence of *perceived authority* is rather more difficult to ascertain in other areas of the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum. In the case of reviving older cultures that have been displaced or otherwise lost to history, a level of authority does continue to exist with regards to how authenticity in that culture is perceived. However, in Case Study 2, when considering the example of Sámi cultural revival, this is not so clear cut; if the Sámi have spent multiple generations being derailed from practising their ancient traditions, who is given that authority to issue the equivalent of a "brief" for those who wish to revitalise this content for a contemporary setting?

Johan Mahtte Skum briefly alluded to this question in his remarks on feeling "allowed" to *joik*.[219] He referred to a contemporary evolution of authoritative attitude; similarly to value

---

[219] Johan Mahtes Skum, Appendix B, Interview 2, p. 207

judgement placed upon popular American and European media, he questions whether *joik* has come under similar scrutiny by modern Sámi. This would suggest a level of perceived authority attributed to those considered "experienced", "trained" or otherwise imbued with contemporary signs of expertise. When asked if he, as a young Sámi musician, felt there was an innate hierarchy in this process today, he stated that it "may be more in our minds than in reality", going on to specify that the work of the UiT Arctic University of Norway and their archive of coastal Sámi *joiks* would assist in dispelling this attitude. Those who access the archive, Skum indicates, would be able to source *joiks* by older family members or from regions to which they have historical ties. This would then create a sense of empowerment and accessibility, thus further enabling the desire to create new musical content.

Whether this initial hesitance is born of a true authority held over the creation of new *joik*, or simply of natural insecurity through the continuous consumption of highly trained content, it is clear that it has an innate effect on what, in creative contexts, gets recreated and how. In other words, what is allowed to start existing under the name of that particular musical culture, and who gets to decide its existence? While this may not be so clearly cut in the case of the Sámi, due to the enormous variety of geographical and political issues surrounding the continuity of their creative expression, it is certainly clear that the efforts of younger generations of Sámi to reclaim perceived authority over their historic traditions are having a tremendous effect on the circulation of their culture to wider audiences.

Following this discussion, it can therefore be determined that the authenticity present in the desire to recreate historical content can be governed by a perceived authority in all areas of the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum. This form of "cultural gatekeeping" is visible on wider national scales and in smaller organisations. Furthermore, it is important to note that this gatekeeping may not be consistent and may occur in different forms depending on context. Einar Selvik refers to wishing to connect to something perceived as "better" in relation to why the desire to recreate historical or archaeological content is sought out by so many and has become such a vibrant industry today.[220] This points to an area of authenticity in which the pastand present are inexorably tangled; the present will seek to authentically revive the past because it is perceived as authoritatively "better" than the present. This is a key element of understanding how authenticity is both perceived and worked with in the creation of historically informed music in the chosen settings for this study.

---

[220] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 197

4.5: Can Authenticity Work in "Pockets" of Time?

Through this investigation, it can be determined that briefs exist outside a usual linear timeline for many of these historically informed cultures. They are intended for indefinite use, as historical re-enactment is designed to evolve as more information becomes available through analysis or archaeological finds. As they are intended for eventual extension by the broadening of historical knowledge, they cannot then be fixed at a particular point in time. This means that the point of authentic process itself is not fixed; that very idea of what makes a process "authentic" has to be left with room to grow if further information and/or physical evidence is uncovered over time. The previous sections of this chapter have investigated how desire can be formed and altered through a process of hauntology, displaced nostalgia and the fashioning of specifications to ensure immersion, accessibility and inclusivity. Therefore, it can begin to be concluded that the relationship between creative historical recreation and authenticity does not necessarily move seamlessly from the past to the present.

Regarding more traditional historical re-enactment, it can be observed that the *desire* to recreate musical content in display or "living history" settings exists for a variety of reasons, not all to do with the innate wish of displaying the past to a present-day audience. University societies, often the setting where contemporary re-enactors are first exposed to the hobby, exist under a tentative and hauntological consideration of what previous cohorts had already established as "authentic". In other words, prior to these newer iterations even beginning, there is a consideration of multiple elements of the past brought into a single occurrence in the present. In the case of Sámi cultural revival, a desire for the future to become part of the tradition can be observed. In other words, modern Sámi musicians seek to broaden the reach of *joik* both in terms of education and its role in the creative evolution of the region. While an element of hauntology continues to apply in terms of loosening the hold of generational bias for many Sámi, this again demonstrates a fragmented idea of the perceived past. Modern Sámi are entirely aware that there has been a drastic interruption in the evolution of their ancient traditions, whereas older generations have had to essentially "unlearn" rhetoric of these traditions being undesirable. LARP, on the other hand, relies exclusively on the present for drawing upon briefs to create new musical content. While elements of the past may (albeit optionally) be drawn upon for inspiration, the nature of live action roleplay systems themselves is that they are usually created for a lasting playable experience intended to be repeated. Not dissimilar to the Sámi, this reflects a desire to incorporate the future into the process of

authentic creation. Summarising all the previous evidence of this chapter, a distinct trend for dispersal rather than linear consideration can be witnessed. The path to recreating the past using elements of the present is not a clear-cut process in the slightest, as authenticity itself does not exist as a linear concept.

An alternative to a linear view of authenticity is that of "pockets". In other words, both participant and observer views of what makes a creative work "authentic" are dispersed across a wider spectrum of thought, inspiration and intended result. This chapter has demonstrated a trend of manufactured pockets of authenticity, and that this framework could be applied to a creator's desire as well as the process of establishing authenticity itself. The desire of a creator to produce content does not always follow a specific trajectory, and often considers the longevity of that creative desire and how it may manifest for future participants. This is a novel concept in historical recreation, as the phenomenon is now existing to perpetuate itself as well as to showcase desired elements of the historic past. This presents a strong foundation for the author's proposed Desire-Process-Result model. If we are to assume this dispersal of authenticity exists within the desire to create, then this means that the *desire* now also exists to help perpetuate that ability in others. This adds another element of *desire* to the overall sequence of *desire, process and result*. The following chapter will investigate the concept of an authentic *process* further, as well as continuing the theory that authenticity exists outside a linear historical timeline.

Chapter 5

Authenticity and the Shaping of Process

5.1: Items and Experience

Theories of how authenticity both manifests and influences the creative decisions of re-enactors, role-players or those who revive historical cultures do not cease to be relevant after the *desire* element of the DPR model. The *process* of creative content's entry into consumption is paramount in determining its perceived authenticity. The following chapter will build upon our prior investigation into how historical recreation is desired in the initial steps of creation, by investigating how the application of authenticity continues to evolve and change throughout a practical creative process. This will commence by examining the differences and discrepancies between our views of authenticity with regards to objects versus experiences and the past versus the present. After this, the analysis will involve establishing the existence of a mythos surrounding authenticity and whether it pervades throughout the entirety of the process, examining how our idea of history and time can be quantified and encapsulated for consumption, and finally investigating what these analyses of authenticity as a theoretical concept can give us as researchers, observers, and participants.

Firstly, it is necessary to ascertain the differences in attitudes when considering items compared to experiences in historical contexts. Immense importance can be placed upon individual items from certain historical periods, but this is not always due to the tangible objective significance of the item itself. There are often other considerations such as the organisation responsible for the uncovering and curation of the object, the level of media coverage surrounding the object and the translation of this object into material for popular consumption. This carries over with regards to an authentic experience or process, such as a historical re-enactment event, a staged performance in a historically informed setting or an educational living history display. As established in the previous chapter, our concept of what makes something authentic often becomes dispersed into smaller pockets of activity, and this theory holds for both items and experiences. To establish the differences in perceived authenticity of process between items and experiences, the process of curating and rebuilding

historical instruments will first be examined. This will lead into a discussion of how the need to "trace back" both items and experiences, placing objective value on their "historicalness", is a relatively new phenomenon in folk-based traditions. This will culminate in the argument that a shift from "object" to "process" is desirable theoretically speaking and can be consequently applied to the chosen case studies of this project.

Recreating Historical Instruments

One of the clearest examples of the discrepancies and questions surrounding what an authentic process looks like for an object compared to an experience is that of historical instrument making - an industry that is continuing to enjoy a considerable vogue following the popularity of Viking and Anglo Saxon based media such as the television series *Vikings (History Channel)*, *Norsemen (Netflix)*, and more recently the Ubisoft game *Assassin's Creed: Valhalla*.[221] Einar Selvik's involvement in many of these pieces of media is not a coincidence; the global success of Wardruna and the perpetuation of Selvik's image as a *skald* (Viking storyteller or bard) armed with a plucked lyre has become synonymous with the contemporary idea of "Viking music". However, the process behind the creation of instruments such as lyres, bone flutes, jaw harps and other popular ancient instruments based on archaeological finds also contains its own parameters of authenticity, and both the creators and consumers are inherently affected by the process of these instruments' creation and distribution, in the eventual hope of adding to an immersive environment.

In discussion of his creative process during an interview with the author in February 2017 at the Jorvik Viking Festival, Selvik elaborated on how he makes a concentrated effort to follow instrumentation, poetic structure and musical techniques from particular periods of Norse history while remaining conscious of the entire process being transmuted into a different more contemporary context. He refers to sound and musical ideas that are "not built for our ears" [206] demonstrating a conscious awareness of the differences in what is perceived authentic in the past compared to the present (see the following section for further elaboration).[222] His focus remains on the experience of creation rather than the use of any particular item. The idea that a piece of work can be "built for our ears" has strongly evocative notions of

---

[221] UBIsoft, 'Assassin's Creed Valhalla - Ultimate', *UBIsoft store*, (2020) https://store.ubi.com/uk/assassin-s-creed-valhalla-ultimate-edition/5e84a5065cdf9a21c0b4e737.html. [Accessed 16 December 2020]

[222] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 197

immersion and a carefully honed authentic *desire* and *process.*[223]

As discussed in earlier chapters, Selvik's creative process for the pieces *Naudir* and *Isa* are distinct and compelling examples of this focus on the experience. Selvik isolated himself and placed himself in a stressful physical situation that required him to feel "in need", which is how he personally responded to the meanings implicit in the Elder Futhark rune "*naudir*". On the other hand, *Isa* ("ice") features the repeated rhythmic sample of percussion played on 5000-year-old glacial ice in the north of Norway. The significance in this instance lies on the object (the ice), and yet a process of isolating that object and adapting its properties as an "authentic" sound for accessible use still features heavily in Selvik's performances. Rather than utilising what, on the surface, would seem like a more authentic process by emulating the sound through physical instruments, Wardruna choose to use the recorded sample of the glacial ice to preserve the authenticity of the original object as a sound source.

Many of Selvik's historical instruments are made by Orkney-based folk musician and luthier Corwen Broch, of Ancient Music.[224] Broch publicises his creative process both on his website and on social media, providing detailed demonstrations of how his instruments are made and what they are capable of musically. He makes no secret of the small tweaks to these instruments to render them more easily playable in a contemporary setting, but often makes the point of explaining what is and is not an alteration for accessibility. The most significant example of this is the use of nylon "nyl-gut" strings for his lyres. In his recreations of the Coppergate boxwood panpipes, Broch features an interpretation of how the pipes may have looked had the original archaeological find not been broken along the fifth hole; it has been debated among archaeologists how many holes the original panpipes were intended to contain.[225] Broch also refers to using beeswax inside the holes of the pipes to tune them, which is a fascinating example of striving for an authentic experience using appropriate materials, even if the tangible physical evidence of this occurring in the Viking age is not immediately available.

Ultimately, it can be easily ascertained from these examples that the process of building, tuning and performing with instruments based on archaeological finds, as well as adapting them for a fully immersive performance that is relevant to present-day expectations, is in

---

[223] Ibid, p. 197

[224] Kate Fletcher & Corwen Broch, 'Ancient Music ~ Kate & Corwen's Homepage', *Ancient Music* (2010) http://ancientmusic.co.uk/string.html. [Accessed 15th April 2019]

[225] Richard A. Hall, *The Viking Dig: Excavations at York* (London: The Bodley Head Ltd, 1984)

itself an authentic process. This is not least due to the reason that somebody of any historical period would be conducting the very same process: ensuring that the instrument performs as effectively as possible for their own setting – as Selvik states, "built for their ears".[226]

This brings the discussion of an authentic process in historical musical recreation to the region of "tracing back" particular items or traditions in order to retain some form of authority or ownership over the piece of creative content. This in itself is a relatively new phenomenon, as the notion of ownership in many secular and folk traditions (to be elaborated further in Chapter 6) is not something that played an integral role in many ancient cultures. This is predominantly due to these cultures existing prior to printed musical notation, and therefore a reliance on oral retelling and transmission of musical content. Now that many of these cultures are being revived, whether for entertainment and education or for indigenous empowerment, the contemporary need for authenticity has driven a newfound emphasis on where the "original sources" of many of these musical works are, and how to honour them in the most effective manner in one's own interpretation and performances. This reflects more than a mere adaptation for the demands of observers and audiences; this is a tangible change in that original tradition and a shift in priorities for its participants.

Berit Alette Mienna expressed considerable encouragement of this shift in Sámi musical expression, stating that teaching non-Sámi people to *joik* is an "opportunity to reflect on what it is to be Sámi when it comes from people who have no idea". In other words, Mienna illustrated the value to Sámi musicians of adjusting their creative process for wider audiences hitherto unfamiliar with *joik*. She describes these opportunities to teach *joik* as "a new experience of how to be Sámi, how to express my Sámi-ness".[227] This illustrates an additional sense of empowerment that has evolved naturally from the further development of that process. Sámi musicians have not only revived *joik* since the 1970s; they have repurposed its role as a tool of self-expression to both reach wider audiences and enable further healing in their individual selves. This appears to be simultaneously self-less and yet self-caring interpretation of *joik*, and Berit Alette Mienna is a compelling example of a truly dedicated and creatively refreshing musician.

This has wider implications for the movement of tradition in contemporary recreation of historical material. This broadening of the process for the purpose of both accessibility and self-empowerment illustrates a trend of "reimagining traditions" as these practices gain in

---

[226] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 197
[227] Berit Alette Mienna, trans. by Soile Hämäläinen Appendix B, Interview 2, p. 212

popularity and resources. Both the tradition and its intrinsic values become reimagined in the process of reviving it, and as will be examined later in this chapter, this becomes part of the mechanism that sustains contemporary myths.[228][209] Modern ideas of authenticity centre heavily around one's ability to trace original "versions" of a creative object or process, but as the previous examples have established, this remains a relatively new phenomenon and indicates the potential for an alteration of process to allow for evolution and change in a tradition's surroundings and/or purpose.

As established in Chapter 2, the notion of calling for a shift in "process" rather than "object" with regards to defining musical works is not unheard of in contemporary musicology. Both Lydia Goehr and Paulo de Assis[210] have previously investigated the process of experimental creativity in music, with Goehr specifically calling for musical works to be thought of as "concepts" to allow for the continuing validity of experimental new versions of established musical ideas and pieces.[229] [211] This theory is highly fitting with regards to historically informed performance in the context of re-enactment, roleplay and cultural revival. As will be elaborated further in Chapter 6, the idea of a musical work as a concept rather than an object unwittingly fits directly with the contemporary popular tradition of filk, along with the natural dispersal of popular choruses within large-scale roleplay settings. However, this line of thinking can also be attributed to the honing of an authentic experience. Not only is an authentic experience built through the *desire* to create, but through a series of *processes,* as well as *versions of processes* in near-experimental fashion.

This theory can be applied to all three case studies in a variety of forms, as authenticity of *process* is a vital element to achieving an authentic experience. This has been demonstrated throughout this section through the use of case study examples. Einar Selvik indicated a use of reactive somaesthetic responses to his chosen "brief" of Elder Futhark runes, with an emphasis on how his chosen process was to engage authentically with how that creative stimulus made him feel. Multiple Sámi *joikers* indicated a willingness to teach and utilise the sharing of *joiks* with interested non-Sámi observers to further develop and reflect on their own authentic processes. Meanwhile, live action roleplayers continually indicate a willingness to engage in a series of processes to engineer an authentic experience by both engaging with the

---

[228] Claude Levi-Strauss, *Structural Anthropology*, new edn (New York: Basic Books, 1974)

[229] Paulo de Assis, David Davies, Andreas Dorschel, Lydia Goehr, Gunnar Hindrichs, Kathy Kiloh, Jake McNulty, and John Rink, 'Virtual Works—Actual Things', in *Virtual Works – Actual Things: Essays in Music Ontology,* ed. by Paulo de Assis (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2018), 19-44 and Lydia Goehr, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music* (Oxford University Press. 2007)

chosen brief, seeking out opportunities to perform and ensuring that an audience is able to both access and consume their resulting work.

Possibly the most ironic element of creative historical reimagining is that any of the "original" processes of these case studies will have been discovered by accident by the very nature of creative growth. The deliberate nature of historical recreation (in other words, the conscious desire to recreate something precisely as it was) betrays its own drive for authenticity. The initial "accident" has now become embodied as an authentic practice in many of these cultures, and it is no longer possible to discern amidst the rest of the evolved traditions. Therefore, it is arguably impossible to truly recreate a historical process because the efforts to do so will never be truly accidental. Therefore, it must be concluded that the only plausible way of creating an authentic process for creative historical recreation is to engineer an experience that allows a participant to stumble across enough "accidents" to discover a preferred aesthetic.

Following on from this line of inquiry, it is also important to ascertain the role of deliberate action in an authentic experience, or more specifically, the potential lack thereof. Based on the examples provided in this section, could it be argued that the accidental steps of a process render it more authentic? Through experimenting with materials made available by the initial desire to reimagine sound or music from a certain historical period, it logicallyfollows that someone of that period would be engaging with this content in a similar manner. The concept of researching the past to inform a present creative activity would not have been a significant driving factor in the creation of content in, for example, Viking age England. An overheard piece of music in a communal setting would be organically picked up by a listener and quite possibly altered for their own aesthetic tastes, availability of instrumentation, or indeed simple human error. Therefore, it stands to reason that a contemporary authentic process for reimagining the past would also involve drawing upon one's own capabilities, tastes and individual creative decisions. This is just one example of many potential demonstrations of "accidental authenticity", but this is an integral element of determining how an authentic experience is carried out in modern-day historical recreation. Significantly, this is a process that would not be tangibly carried out in the case of an individual historical item (with exception given to the building and curation of archaeologically based instruments). Therefore, it will be necessary to further examine this concept of a difference between authenticity of the past and present.

5.2: Authenticity of the Past and Present

Authenticity as an active process cannot hope to be truly understood if it is considered a static phenomenon that only exists within the context of the, according to Baudrillard, "antiquated" past.[230] This would imply an innate level of control over what culminates in being viewed as an "authentic" object. For example, if the 1976 Coppergate dig in York had not uncovered the only complete set of Viking boxwood panpipes ever discovered, would we necessarily use them as a contemporary benchmark for archaeomusicology in the Viking age?[231] This illustrates the inherently accidental nature of an authentic process and the coincidental meeting of the past and present. When examined in the context of music semiotics and topic theory, Jonathan Berger places criticism on the "detracting and diminishing" of a work in its entirety by viewing what he describes as "surface detail" as signs and the placing of significance.[232] This can in turn refer to the arguably problematic nature of placing signs and topoi on elements of a musical work that were not originally intended to have significance placed upon them. However, this criticism simply does not work in the context of historically informed musical performance, especially in secular folk traditions. A work (and by extension its creator) cannot hold responsibility centuries into the future for which elements of its aesthetic creation are seized upon for meaning and significance, as demonstrated by the inevitably random nature of archaeological finds. The accidental and unintentional transference of signs from the past to the present is part of the process of an authentic experience of historical recreation; we cannot and should not control what happens to transfer with regard to meaning.

In the case of Sámi revival, an element of necessity and a drive for cultural survival has governed the process of recreation due to the continual suppression of the past. Vuokko Hirvonen describes in *Voices from Sápmi* how "missionaries and clergymen […] outlawed a central part of the Sámi world-view and broke a cultural tradition which had existed for centuries, perhaps even thousands of years; they also invalidated an important part of the ontological basis of Sámi culture".[233216] This process, rendered virtually uncontrollable by the culture at whom it was directed, started a stifling and inward turning of *joik* within Sámi people

---

[230] Jean Baudrillard, *The System of Objects* (London: Verso Books, 2005), p. 51
[231] Richard A. Hall, *The Viking Dig: Excavations at York* (London: The Bodley Head Ltd, 1984)
[232] Jonathan Berger, 'Playing with "Playing with Signs": A Critical Response to Kofi Agawu', *Journal of Music Theory* 38: 2 (1994) pp. 293-313 (p. 310)
[233] Vuokko Hirvonen, *Voices from Sápmi: Sámi Women's Path to Authorship (*Kautokeino: DAT, 2008), p. 129

all over the region, which continued until well into the 20th century. Historical records consulted by Hirvonen indicated some instances of *joiks* being rarely heard in remote areas of Sápmi, but with their creative process often being altered by fear of being caught performing them. Following this, Vuokko Hirvonen's remarks regarding the semiotic[217] nature of *joik* demonstrate a recognition of how the creative process has transferred to Sámi poetry – the main focus of Hirvonen's thesis.[234] This in turn demonstrates that for the revival of a displaced musical culture, authenticity in process can be achieved by faith in both one's own identity and in one's perceived authority over the evolution of that culture.

When considering the implications of semiotics in the context of music in historical re-enactment displays and events, this combination is what results in an inherent authenticity in process between the past and the present. When also combined with the aforementioned *desire* to recreate from a chosen brief, it is necessary for this *process* to be made up of recognisable signs and topics. Using Peirce's semiotic system, the disparate elements of a historical re- enactment performance can be analysed thusly. Peirce's letters to Lady Welby dictate the presence of multiple *qualisigns* to form a *sinsign* – that is to say, an existing singular event. The *qualisigns* must be embodied in order to communicate an actual sign, implying that the elements which make up the singular event do not individually attribute meaning to each other.[235] If we apply this notion to a recreated Kravik lyre, reconstructed from partial finds from Norwegian archaeological sources, adapted with nyl-gut strings to ensure accessible playability, the following relationships can be witnessed. The archaeological contexts (stratigraphic layers and geographic location), as well as the properties of the materials used to create the instrument, as well as accessibility considerations such as nyl-gut, all qualify as Peircean *qualisigns*, as in combination they become the *sinsign* of a practical recreation of an archaeological find. These disparate elements have been placed together through a *desire* to create in order to achieve the specific result of a playable instrument that can be demonstrated to a contemporary observer. Therefore, the process must be made up of recognisable signs and topoi, when placed within the context of contemporary musicological theory and semiotic topical signification.[236]

As demonstrated through case study examination, it can be suggested thus far that the

---

[234] In *Voices from Sapmi,* Vuokko Hirvonen focuses on the Julia Kristeva linguistic theory of semiotic chora; a twofold system of "semiotic" and "symbolic" to demonstrate the differences between the subconscious and the body, and the order of language and culture respectively.

[235] Charles Sanders Peirce and Lady Victoria Welby, *Semiotic and Significs: The Correspondence between Charles S. Peirce and Lady Victoria Welby* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977)

[236] Danuta Mirka, *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014)

authentic process of sign transference between the past and the present can operate in accordance with the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum theory. However, in the case of live action roleplay aimed to run in game format, the luxury of calling upon a recognisable past tradition with which to shape one's idea of authentic process is not present. Therefore, it becomes part of the present-day process itself to ensure that a convincing and genuine-feeling simulation (or indeed, simulacrum) of past events and/or traditions is present for an authentic roleplaying process. This means that a series of past events must be simulated and represented in *hyperreality* as similarly to Baudrillard's comparison of the "historic real" versus the "classical real", the simulated versions of past events must also be lurid and hyperreal in quality to ensure an exaggerated presence in the minds of players.[237] This means less mental effort on the part of the players to sustain belief, as much of the "work" involved to recognise these signs of fictional past events is placed in stark contrast with the rest of the game. In terms of real gameplay, this translates to a deliberate exaggeration and significance placed on events that have occurred prior to the agreed upon timeline of the live game. Players are then able to contribute artistic expression as if responding to recent historical events. This means that the feeling of having been part of that creation of myth feels more authentic as a process. In other words, being aware of that culture's origins and feeling secure in the aforementioned "brief" directly informs a more authentic process. To summarise the question of how authenticity can be viewed with regards to the past and present, it has been established throughout this section that the past informs the present through an effective and compelling simulation of the *idea* of past events (sometimes bordering on hyperreality if necessary to transmit belief). This, as well as recognisable signs and topoi, followed by an allowance for and acceptance of natural growth within the chosen culture, informs an authentic process, as the transferral of circumstance informs reactions and behaviour. The transmission of belief, security and a sense of simulation results in an innate confidence to create and continue said creation. However, it is important to follow this line of thought a little further to establish how one might "grow into" this process to the point of beginning to quantify it.

---

[237] Jean Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994) p. 41

5.3: Commercialising and Quantifying History

How has quantification of history affected the process of historical recreation?

Following a newly established commercial interest in the depiction and authentic display of different periods of history throughout the 20th century, those who attend these displays have developed what could be described as a "static expectation of historicalness". This has ultimately shaped the expectations of the entire historical re-enactment industry; consumers have become accustomed to commercialised and quantified views of history. The packaging and consumption of an experience that is both educational and entertaining follows a Baudrillardian idea of "antique" and "historical".[238] For example, visitors to the Jorvik Viking Centre in York would expect to see, according to the centre's marketing,[222] a static and established view of what one particular street in 10th century York would have looked, sounded and smelled like through a detailed recreation of the exact archaeological plots on that site.[239] In actuality, the street would have been bustling with activity in the 960s due to York being a major trading centre for international traders. However, due to the set-up of this style of reimagining, visitors are met with one static collection of artefacts uncovered in archaeological digs from that specific area. This is by no means a negative view of the experience; this is precisely what visitors to the museum pay to access and observe. What this idea of static observation actually implies from a theoretical perspective is that the authentic process of historical recreation now has an antique-like value in the eyes of observers and audiences.

Arguably, these static expectations of modern audiences could be said to render the process of historical recreation easier and more accessible. Einar Selvik refers to museums as places of "preservation"[223] and specifies that his style of reimagining elements of the Viking age treats it as a "living tradition", as it would not be "relevant to today's audiences" otherwise.[240] These two examples represent two distinct types of Viking-based recreation. One is based upon a commercial formula intended for public consumption and education, the other works with the idea that the tradition remains alive and fluid rather than intended to be preserved. However, the "historicalness" present in the signs displayed by this style of reimagining means

---

[238] Ibid.

[239] The JORVIK Group, 'JORVIK Story', *JORVIK Viking Centre*, (2017) https://www.jorvikVikingcentre.co.uk/about/jorvik-story/. [Accessed 16 December 2020]

[240] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 197

that there are still quantifiable elements to this process. The recreation of sound from the historic past can be said to be a simulacrum of actual history. The true past is utterly unattainable due to the inherently fluid nature of passing time. The only access to the past we as observers will ever achieve is simulations and simulacra of that past.

While it is certainly true that both the concept of history and the feeling of being "historical" has indeed been quantified and commercialised, it is just as easy to assume that this must be a negative element to the journey for an authentic process and experience. However, this is not necessarily the case. All forms of reimagining, revival and re-enactment, whichever place on the spectrum the different cultures inhabit, exist to provide an immersive environment for their participants and observers. If, in order to do this, the culture and its process must be translated and, in some cases, quantified into a series of tangible static objects for the purposes of public interest and consumption, then the culture is still achieving its intended purpose of providing a source of perceived authenticity and immersion to those who observe it.

5.4: Authenticity as a Contemporary Myth

Levi-Strauss and the Structure of Myth

As the process of historically informed creative expression progresses, it is necessary to determine its authenticity with regards to its place as a contemporary myth. Claude Levi-Strauss set out clear semiotic and anthropological definitions of mythology in *Structural Anthropology*.[241] Much like the accidental nature of what is remembered and valued from the historic past, myths too retain a degree of the accidental. In essence, they create themselves and the majority of human history is formed around these self-created ideas of narrative. The concept of historical authenticity can often begin, based on the experiences relayed by participants of the chosen case studies, as something that one is "told", whether by joining an organisation and gaining access to a brief, or verbally by a re-enactor at a display, or passively by exhibitions in a museum. However it is communicated, the same principle that Levi-Strauss sets out remains true: "myth is language: to be known, myth has to be told; it is a part of human

---

[241] Claude Levi-Strauss, *Structural Anthropology*, new edn (New York: Basic Books, 1974)

speech".[242] Levi-Strauss goes on to conclude that "the function of repetition is to render the structure of the myth apparent". In other words, in the context of this study, the repetition of what is deemed authentic by perceived authorities of historicity creates the outline of its own myth. However, as Levi-Strauss continues to state, the growth is a "continuous process".[243] This means that our idea of what becomes and remains authentic and how it has been mythologised can exponentially grow the more times it is repeated and perpetuated by different organisations and individuals. In other words, as content creators and consumers, we would not have this structure of myth today if it was not able to support itself through exponential growth. The following section will lay out the most common instances of self-supporting structured mythology within each of the three main case studies for this project, followed by a summary of how myth creates authenticity by its very existence. However, while the authenticity of the structured myth becomes increasingly encoded through repeated transmission and aforementioned growth, ultimately the status of myth in contemporary ideas of historical accuracy render it little more than an artefact by the culmination of the process.

Myths in Case Study 1: Re-enactment

The myths inherent in historical re-enactment range from the tropes of rigid historical authenticity to the ritual-like traditions present in socialising and annual scheduled events throughout the year. Both Volsung and Historia Normannis feature regular trips for members to retail events such as The Original Re-enactor's Market, [227] and large-scale events organised by English Heritage or the National Trust, which feature residential camping and opportunities for living history displays to the public.[244] These events are repeated annually, and while the element of structured myth surrounding them is subtle and almost imperceptible to outside observers, re-enactors themselves within these societies are often heavily influenced by these significant events. Many of these annual events are treated in a manner akin to pilgrimages, and this has created a "myth" of ongoing contemporary tradition. This is layered over the original intended process of historical recreation and provides a new level of meta- narrative for the participants of the group.

---

[242] Ibid, p. 209

[243] Ibid, p. 229

[244] The Original Reenactor's Market, "TORM', *The Original Reenactor's Market* (2020). https://www.re-enactorsmarket.co.uk/. [Accessed 16 December 2020]

Myths in Case Study 2: Revival

While the Sámi have an extensive history of oral traditions going back thousands of years, the geographical and political displacement of their population throughout the previous three centuries has rendered a great deal of this history lost. As has been previously established in Chapter 4, the phenomenon of placing significance on the name of an original *joiker* and the first source of a piece of music is relatively new to the Sámi. This is predominantly due to *joik* historically being an oral tradition, with a corresponding lack, therefore, of written records to assist their descendants in tracing creative material. However, many elements of the contemporary Sámi cultural revival feature repetition of the idea that there is now importance placed on "original" versions of *joiks*. This would align with Levi-Strauss' definition of a structured myth; the idea that these notions of ownership are ancient is a myth in itself. That is not to say archives are unheard of; Ola Graff and Johan Mahtte Skum keep an extensive archive of coastal *joiks* at the Arctic University Museum of Norway.[245] This archive is featured in a bespoke *lavvu* at the *Riddu Riddu* festival each year, where visitors can listen to *joiks* from the archive and potentially contribute additional information about them if known, or even add new ones to the archive themselves.[246] According to the archivists, there have been many instances of Sámi individuals coming into the tent, hearing a particular *joik* and identifying the voice as that of a relative, or are familiar with the melody and subject of the *joik* from having learned it through other means. The archive does not just specialise in collecting coastal *joiks*; it helps map the relationships festival attendees and coastal Sámi of northern Norway have with the musical content of their region. It can also act as a tool for tracing the trajectory of different styles of *joik*, as certain melodies or *joiks* for animals (taught to children in Sámi schools or in workshops run by educators such as Berit Alette Mienna), may have circulated through different populations as families migrate between homes – something that is still done by those Sámi who still rely on reindeer husbandry for livelihood.

However, Johan Mahtte Skum indicated a tendency for anxiety amongst young Sámi regarding contributing new *joiks* to their communities and the archive. Skum stated that many young people in his hometown place importance on what he referred to as "the new phenomenon of talent programmes".[247] This has created a form of mythical "hierarchy" within Sámi music. A sense of heroism is placed upon those who are able to bring *joik* to what is

---

[245] Ola Graff, 'Nordnorsk Folkemusikksamling Består Av Flere Delsamlinger', *University of Tromsø* (2017) https://en.uit.no/om/enhet/tmu/vis?p_document_id=416732. [Accessed 16 December 2020]
[246] Johan Mahtes Skum, Appendix B, Interview 3, p. 206
[247] Ibid, p. 206

deemed as "mainstream audiences" by Sámi communities, particularly the young. This perceived hierarchy of talent is perpetuated by the continued success of Sámi musicians on national talent programmes and larger scale international contests such as Eurovision (the latest iteration of Sámi Eurovision success being Keiino's successful entry in 2019 and winning a considerable popular vote across Europe with their piece "Spirit in the Sky"). The continued repetition and likely reiterations of these successes in local news media act as the starting structure of the hierarchy myth in young Sámi people. Similarly to the ownership of *joiks* being repurposed as significant by the modern iterations of Sámi culture, an unprecedented emphasis on prestige appears to also create myths of authenticity surrounding contemporary Sámi musical performance.

Myths in Case Study 3: Roleplay

In a similar manner to that of British re-enactment organisations and their emphasis on social cohesion and arranging trips, live-action roleplay has created an entire series of traditions and meta-traditions around the original process. This, perhaps unsurprisingly, has resulted in a considerable number of perpetuated myths, by Levi-Strauss' definition. Being heavily governed by briefs and relying on in-game interaction to advance different areas of the culture, festival LARP also seeks out deliberate mythos through the repetition of crucial material to ensure as many players as possible become aware of new elements of the game's plot, or a particular opportunity for certain types of players. A particular example within PD's Empire consists of the Wintermark brief and the strict assertion that the players of Wintermark are "not Vikings".[248] James Smart and Roger Finn spoke about this element of the brief, both stating that the main reason for this particular rule is the frequent "bleeding over" of costume and image – in other words, that many players "cut corners" with the Saxon-inspired brief due to the similarities and crossovers with many elements of known Viking aesthetics.[249] James Smart alluded to the wide variety of the player base in Wintermark as the cause of this; as the largest nation in Empire by a margin of several hundred players, it stands to reason that there are many types of player within the nation, from more "casual" players who attend primarily for the social aspect of the game, and those who study the brief and wish to roleplay seriously throughout the event. Through the process of repeated perceived "infringement" of the original Wintermark brief, as

---

[248] Matthew Pennington, David Kibblewhite and Andy Raff, 'Wintermark', *Empire* (2013) https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire- wiki/Wintermark. [Accessed 14 March 2019]
[249] See Appendix B, Interviews 4 & 7 for specific discussion with James Smart & Roger Finn concerning working around LARP briefs.

well as the long-standing jokes between players about "not being Vikings", it is perhaps unsurprising that a form of mythology has surrounded the entire nation. Many other nations within the game, such as Varushka who are heavily Rus inspired, ensure a tighter adherence to their own specifications as a result, as many players are concerned about being tarred with the same brush as those considered to not be "trying hard enough" and ending up adopting a Viking aesthetic. Similarly to the current situation befalling many young Sámi content creators, a sense of hierarchy in brief adherence can also be witnessed in multiple LARP organisations.[250]

These examples of traditions within traditions born of organic social interaction between the participants of the different case studies demonstrate the power of "accidental" meta-cultures, as well as the perpetuation of structured myth that grows with repetition and attention. The sustaining of myth is a process-based formation that creates an authentic process by its very existence. If a process is permeating through a culture to such an extent that myths are being built up around it, the fact that it is even being questioned and mythologised at all legitimises the entire process causing the myth. This adds a layer of foundation to the overall sequence of creation within these historically reimagined cultures and their content.

5.5: What does authenticity give us, and how does it challenge creativity?

Throughout the course of this chapter, it has been established that authenticity of a historically informed *process* does indeed provide a basis in creative growth, but the manner by which creativity is challenged by perceived authenticity among participants must also be addressed. Not only does a sense of authentic *process* bring creative challenges to content creators in historically reimagined cultures, but it also provides wider initiative for participants to feel part of a collective effort. The following will summarise the main elements of authenticity in process that result in both challenges and rewarding experiences for the respective three cultures in the chosen case studies of this project. This will demonstrate an overarching theme of an authentic *process* governing the *desire* and *result* of a piece of historically re-imagined content, tying together more elements of the D-P-R model as a research goal of this thesis.

---

[250] In fact, there is some controversy between the three main LARP companies in the UK (Lorien Trust, Curious Pastimes and Profound Decisions) with regards to which game harbours more "serious" players. This could be an area for future study.

Case Study 1: Re-enactment

In most forms of large-scale historical re-enactment in the UK, establishing an authenticity of process gives both serious and hobbyist re-enactors a tangible goal of adhering to a brief and exhibiting an accurate display which entertains, immerses and educates both themselves and an audience. From smaller local organisations like the Volsung Vikings to large nationwide groups with smaller cells in multiple regions such as Historia Normannis, this allows participants to feel a sense of satisfaction at having followed a set of specifications to achieve said goal, but also provides a series of challenges and barriers, particularly regarding the production of creative content within a re-enactment setting. In a musical performance, for example, the participant is often obliged to have conducted their own research on the types of instrumentation suitable for their chosen time period, as well as the challenges present in acquiring and/or building the instrument, locating or formulating a piece which falls into the parameter of any brief given by the organisation, as well as all the usual challenges of performing to an audience with a historical instrument. These challenges can also involve the perceived hierarchy of "trained" versus "untrained" musicians, and the establishment of "ownership" over the rights to experiment openly with creative historical expression. The perceived hierarchy of the "right" to musical expression in historical settings is a phenomenon encountered in this study all across the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum. It is born of an inherent fear of the implications of authenticity, and the idea of second-guessing one's own ability to assess facts and make a compelling interpretation of the available material within the *process.*

However, due to the previously discussed uncertainty surrounding both ownership of content within re-enactment societies and the authority surrounding one's own "historicalness", many amateur re-enactors find this concept of authenticity as a working creative process rather intimidating. At the Jorvik Viking Festival in February 2017, Einar Selvik discussed the emphasis on finding one's own sense of authenticity within a live performance and achieving a sense of timelessness in order to create a greater impact with an audience. He indicated that it would be much more difficult to retain the type of "power" from a recorded piece of music than that which would be gained from a live performance in which one can directly interact with an audience. While Selvik is not specifically trying to achieve an overarching sense of historical authenticity with his performances, he is seeking to achieve immersion for his audiences. This willingness to attain closeness with observers is a further demonstration of an authenticity within the creative process. Audiences seek

immersive and engaging experiences, and the attention paid to them by a performer with a challenging and unusual series of instruments and musical concepts is certainly both of those. Selvik and Wardruna provide what is essentially a canvas for their audiences to attach their own sense of meaning and musical expression to. There is no obligation on the group's part to push any kind of significant ideology to their listeners and audiences, other than a creative interpretation of an ancient form of writing. Therefore, to summarise two strikingly different forms of reimagined Viking content, an authenticity in process exists to strengthen immersion in both cases and to reassure the individual participants of the validity of their own contribution to the continuing tradition.

Case Study 2: Revival

The concept of authenticity in Sámi cultural revival provides a sense of legitimisation and cultural belonging for the indigenous members of the community who are re-engaging with the content after potentially an entire lifetime of believing the practice to be inherently sinful.[251] This sense of re-establishing one's identity is not only empowering for Sámi people themselves, but also provides a wider education for interested non-Sámi parties. The confident demonstration of a perceived authentic process by those who appear to outsiders to possess the authority to do so is a singularly empowering and educational event. Because both Sámi and non-Sámi are encouraged to feel as if this process is "correct" and deserved, they feel part of a wider initiative to contribute positively to this new version of an old tradition which, in their view, was unfairly and unlawfully disrupted. In essence, this process of delivering an authentic experience of *joik* to anybody with an interest to learn is considered by many Sámi to be "righting the wrongs" of many elements of their disconnected past. As societies globally become more aware of the plights of indigenous populations, particularly with regards to the changing geographical environment in many regions, the ability to both demonstrate and distribute a unique musical technique has become an immensely valuable tool for bolstering the Sámi sense of identity. Berit Alette Mienna stated during her interview with the author that she believed "bonding and social relationships" would cause joik to endure indefinitely; as long as something continued to exist which required a human response, she believes there would be some form of *joik* present within Sápmi.[252] Mienna

---

[251] Henry Minde, 'Assimilation of the Sami – Implementation and Consequences', *Acta Borealia* 20: 2 (2003) pp. 121–46
[252] Berit Alette Mienna, Appendix B, Interview 2, p. 212

spoke briefly about her own healing journey and how "as an individual I have not been allowed to be myself".[253] This was shared with the author to

emphasise that for Mienna, the oppression of this region of northern Europe is not exclusively reserved for the Sámi as a whole. She encouraged the consideration of how "many individuals that have been under hard pressure", and the idea that "you are able to give something to other people who are curious, and you encounter it with loving kindness. This lifts up the self and being that way helps me to process my own things".[254] The role of authenticity as a process within Sápmi illustrates a nationwide desire for growth and evolution in the tradition, even if the precise direction of that evolution is not always agreed upon between Sámi people.

Case Study 3: Roleplay

The role of authenticity in roleplay, particularly live action roleplay, varies slightly from the other case studies with regard to *process*, as LARPers must find ways to create their own microcosms of temporary authenticity and immersion in their roleplay settings. Indefinitely living and playing as a character is somewhat untenable, so LARPers must find shortcuts to ensure that the process feels authentic and immersive for the duration of the brief period of time said process is active at any given event. This is predominantly achieved through the use of semiotic signs and the aesthetic equivalent of musical topics.[255][238] Certain indicators of authenticity that act as immediate signs to participants often includes extensive use of the musical briefs in Empire. One of the most significant examples, which technically qualifies as a Peircean *sinsign,*[239] is the start of every event as the two nations who reside in the forested area of the Dadford road campsite begin their welcoming proceedings.[256] The Navarr and Imperial Orcs respectively have specifically designed musical briefs. Both feature loud drums, chorus-based chants and call-and-response songs, and both nations make a point of beginning the festivities of every event with the loudest pieces of music possible.[257] The resulting deluge

[253] Ibid.

[254] Ibid.

[255] Danuta Mirka, 'Introduction', in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. by Danuta Mirka (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014)

[256] Charles Sanders Peirce and Lady Victoria Welby, *Semiotic and Significs: The Correspondence between Charles S. Peirce and Lady Victoria Welby* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977)

[257] Daisy Abbott and Mark Chilvers, 'Imperial Orcs Music', *Empire Wiki*, (2013) https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire-wiki/Imperial_Orcs_music. [Accessed 16 December 2020]and Jamie Wakefield, Daisy Abbott and Katie Rogers, 'Navarr Music', *Empire Wiki*, (2013) https://www.profounddecisions.co.uk/empire-wiki/Navarr_music. [Accessed 16 December 2020]

of sound bellowing from the Dadford Road campsite forest is a clear sign to the rest of the 2500 players on the field that "time-in" for all characters has commenced. Because LARPers rely on these recognisable signs to signpost what is intended to "feel" authentic in roleplay settings, the stages of creating an authentic *process* in which to produce creative content become layered and complement the various meta-traditions and structural myths as explored in the previous section. The challenge in authenticity for live action roleplay lies within producing a compelling level of *result* swiftly enough for an event usually lasting approximately two days.

5.6: Conclusion

As this investigation progresses towards re-thinking the nature of immersion and ownership as recreative processes, it is necessary to reflect briefly on what the implications are for maintaining an authentic process moving forwards in the desire-process-result model. Authenticity gives us an informed and justified process for historical recreation and both the revival and simulation of new creative cultures. However, the parameters of what authenticity is (particularly with regards to who is perceiving what as authentic) must be both flexible and dispersed, rather than being transferred in a linear fashion by those who inherit traditions. This ultimately allows for these processes to grow and, in many cases, survive entirely.

Through a process of utilising semiotics and topic theory, it has been established here that the initial image of authenticity can be quite a daunting concept to many re-enactors and roleplayers, as they feel pressure to adhere to a continuing tradition of accepted practice. However, it has also been demonstrated throughout the course of this chapter that a significant shift in attitude has been occurring in several of these communities. As festival LARP events become established annual traditions that see growth in participants and continuation of the game's plot and mechanics with every new addition, so too grows the need for a more flexible approach to authenticity. As the creative process shifts further towards accessibility and inclusivity, the emphasis on "correctness" becomes less pronounced. That is not to say that it is no longer present, but the satisfaction of being correct and "following the brief" seems to dissipate over time. LARPers look for recognisable signs and topoi in the creative content surrounding them in a game setting to achieve the desired *result* of feeling immersed and

involved with continuing that processThis feeling of wider communal initiative also applies to historical re-enactment, as the satisfaction of accurately following a brief (see Chapter 4) as well as using one's own research skills to provide additional material for both oneself and the rest of the organisation to use becomes a part of the re-enactment process itself. This also adds to the authenticity of the process in that it enables participants to learn from one another; something that historically would have been happening organically already. Sámi *joiks* have similarly evolved to achieve a wider and more inclusive process, through the opening of the tradition to non-Sámi participants in the context of music festivals, workshops or spiritual retreats. This has developed from a need to widen the creative process of *joik* to ensure its survival in a significantly altered environment, indicating the dispersal of its perceived authenticity in favour of a malleable *process*. To conclude, all these case studies, however disparate in origin they may appear, share a desire to disperse their notions of authenticity. They demonstrate that a theoretical model can exist for mapping and studying the behaviours, thoughts and feelings behind these creative processes, and a precedent exists for locating patterns between far flung communities. The *process* of recreating historically informed creative content remains authentic to its participants, but the process itself evolves out of necessity and the opportunity to develop. The cumulative *result* of this sequence of activity and final element of the proposed Desire-Process-Result model can be observed in the following chapter.

Chapter 6

Immersion and Ownership

6.1: Living Personas: Re-enactment Displays & Roles

This Desire-Process-Result model has laid the groundwork thus far for an understanding of authenticity behind the desire and process of historically informed musical recreation. The following chapter will begin to unpack the result of these two stages through a theoretical lens of immersion, simulacra and the notion of ownership and evolution of scope and capability. The following will break down a series of case study examples demonstrating the lived result of immersive creative content in both re-enactment and roleplay settings, demonstrating that the relationship an individual has with their own level of immersion brings new views of creative consciousness. The result of this desire and process by definition of the DPR model is a natural conclusion of all the different considerations, allowances, research and practice put into the two prior stages.

Therefore, it is now prudent to map how this content is transferred after the point of creation, as well as what happens to the notion of ownership in each of the different case studies upon leaving the hands of the original creator. Finally, a consideration of the inadvertent results of this process must be considered. This will primarily be demonstrated by an investigation into the "filk" genre, something that has been repurposed and utilised to further immersion in entirely new settings. For the purposes of this section of the study, immersion and ownership are treated, theoretically speaking, from the perspective of a finished product, rather than the process itself. This will assist the demonstration of reimagined historical sound continuing to exist on a spectrum upon the point of release to observers and consumers.

Is re-enactment for the participant or the audience?

For the purposes of historical re-enactment, our interpretation of the "result" in the context of the Desire-Process-Result model is a finished, rehearsed and sometimes commercialised display of a particular period or event in history. Often, this can occur on significant days of the year if a battle or other marked event is being demonstrated, or similarly to LARP, re-enactment displays can take place at annual festivals with a similar emphasis on socialising. This process

of putting on a "display" is intended to promote immersion for an audience, but the very act of doing this can also be argued to promote a feeling of inclusivity and satisfaction in the re-enactor themselves. From a somaesthetic point of view, self-knowledge in this instance occurs when the re-enactor provides a performance that is researched and immersive for their audiences.[258] This results in an awareness of somatic feelings of satisfaction and the achievement of a purpose, thus rendering them more keenly aware of their own lived experience. It can be argued that a living history display, through the use of sets, costume, historically accurate food and drink and the adoption of characters or identities by one's fellows, can promote a stronger lived experience, thus strengthening one's own immersion, even if focused on the task of educating or providing a performance.

To unpack this idea even more minutely, the act of playing an instrument based on an archaeological find while wearing naturally sourced materials such as wool and linen will all contribute to the lived somatic experience of a body placed in a particular historical period. If the instrument is unfamiliar or newly acquired, a player may experience discomfort, calluses or pain in the mouth or hands. To summarise, re- enactors must adopt what could be described as a form of co-consciousness; they must simultaneously nourish their own sense of immersion and belonging to a wider task to recreate a particular event or setting, while also ensuring that they display only the "approved" imagery and content to anyone who may be watching. Because they must immerse both themselves and somebody else in the displayed content and setting, this demonstrates a transferral of influence from the re-enactor to the visitor. As will be further elaborated in the following section, this also takes a degree of preparation and thought on the part of the re-enactor as they must often also fulfil the role of an educator. Similarly, to the process of a LARPer in creating and honing a character (see section 6.2), the re-enactor must maintain an awareness of how that transferral of information and sensation is manifesting in the minds of the observer. In other words, a somaesthetic connection to their own feeling and sense of immersion can only assist in communicating this desire externally.

---

[258] Richard Shusterman, 'Somaesthetics: A Disciplinary Proposal', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 57: 3 (1999) pp. 299-313 (p. 299)

Remaining immersed while educating

The task of remaining immersed is an additional post-creative process for a musician in a historical re-enactment context, whether it is festival-based or educational. Unlike a storytelling roleplay, a re-enactment display does not usually contain a distinct narrative; it exists to showcase a static image of a historical period. This allows space for the participants to assume the role of an educator when recreating their historical content. As can be seen in the following examples, this demonstrates a split in immersion between the audience and the re-enactor, but conversely it could also be argued that the role of an educator becomes an integral part of the immersion for the re-enactor for very similar reasons as described above. The process of informing the public about something that a re-enactor cares about enough to immerse themselves in, as well as the potential of a member of the public introducing hitherto unconsidered questions and ideas should the display incorporate living history, means that the re-enactor can find even more ways to manipulate the result of prior two stages of their historical recreation.

The task of remaining immersed is an additional post-creative process for a musician in a historical re-enactment context, whether it is festival-based or educational. Unlike a storytelling roleplay, a re-enactment display does not usually contain a distinct narrative; it exists to showcase a static image of a historical period. This allows space for the participants to assume the role of an educator when recreating their historical content. As can be seen in the following examples, this demonstrates a split in immersion between the audience and the re-enactor, but conversely it could also be argued that the role of an educator becomes an integral part of the immersion for the re-enactor for very similar reasons as described above. The process of informing the public about something that a re-enactor cares about enough to immerse themselves in, as well as the potential of a member of the public introducing hitherto unconsidered questions and ideas should the display incorporate living history, means that the re-enactor can find even more ways to manipulate the result of prior two stages of their historical recreation. Kate Fletcher and Corwen Broch provide a Viking Music educational workshop as part of their overall offer as re-enactors and musicians, indicating that it is "a hands-on workshop, and although we demonstrate and perform different styles of playing and various instruments, the emphasis is on allowing the children to try things out and become involved in performance and dance".[259] Allowing their audience to experiment with these

---

[259] Kate Fletcher & Corwen Broch, 'Ancient Music ~ Kate & Corwen's Homepage', *Ancient Music* (2010)

concepts themselves, particularly at young ages, allows for the creation of historically informed soundscapes.

This provides the audience with an opportunity to feel both authentic and immersed; they have been instructed and demonstrated to and given an opportunity to use objects that are unfamiliar and often novel to them. Theoretically speaking, this acts as a simulacrum of a re-enactment display in the minds of the observers - in this case, children taking part in an interactive musical workshop. The end result will inevitably be markedly different from the initial demonstration given by the workshop leaders but will serve a similar purpose of immersion and inclusivity. This idea of executing a process as a result also relates to elements of Einar Selvik's view of immersive performance. At previous Jorvik Viking Festivals, Selvik has provided a semi-structured talk and performance called "Wardruna: Thoughts and Tools Behind The Music", allowing audiences to listen to elements of how he combines historical instruments and inspiration from sagas, runic systems and natural sounds to create his music.[260] In other words, he is sharing elements of the creative process in order to create a tangible result out of it, able to be experienced by audiences.

The role of an audience member

After having examined the role of the re-enactor as both a performer and an educator in a variety of contexts, it is also necessary to investigate the role of an audience member. To what extent do audience members at re-enactment displays contribute to or hinder the immersion of participants? Are they, in fact, to be considered participants or remain as observers? It will be shown in the following examples that audiences of this type of historically informed content arrive with an inherent desire to "be shown" what a particular element of the past was like, in a simulated form that they are able to consume and enjoy. Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that most audience members will cooperate with demonstrations, in the sense that they will, for want of a better phrase, "play along" with what is happening. Audiences wish to be educated and entertained; therefore they will cooperate and assist with the delivery of immersion by taking part in offered activities, asking questions where pertinent and in some cases being included in elements of the display.

Carnegie and McCabe demonstrate the role of re-enactment as forms of self-celebration

http://ancientmusic.co.uk/string.html. [Accessed 15 April 2019]
[260] Einar Selvik, 'Wardruna: The Thoughts and Tools Behind the Music', *JORVIK Viking Festival* (2018) http://jvf.digitalwelly.com/event/einar-selvik-wardruna-the-thoughts- and-tools-behind-the-music-2/.[Accessed 16 December 2020]

as well as educational festivals with a specific purpose of drawing in audiences.[261] The authors state "that re-enactment events include elements of both affirmation of community/culture and celebration for its own sake, to provide a means of escape from the modern through dramaturgical performance which requires the participation of many to achieve these ends." The experiential element of audience participation in a living history display can involve, for example, being taught songs or a simple rhythm. The willingness of an audience member to engage compellingly with this style of content is integral to the perceived "success" of the event. Whether this responsibility falls principally on the audience members themselves or the re-enactors is uncertain. However, Carnegie and McCabe go on to conclude that "these types of events were predicated on both an affirmation of cultural identity and provided a celebratory experiential context for a range of consumers including locals, tourists and re-enactors. We further argued that the co-presence of all these groups of audiences and performers allowed us to challenge and develop theorising on the nature of identity and authenticity in the production and consumption of touristic experiences."[262] In other words, the role of an audience member informs and complements the role of the re-enactor, and while the presence of an audience might, on the surface, hinder immersion for a re-enactor, the highlighting of differences, mutual celebration and affirmation of identities, as well as the position of educational authority in which the re-enactor is placed, all contribute to the idea that audience members, their participation and the feeling of having educated them strengthens the result of the overall process. This allows the re-enactor to feel a further sense of completion, as well as having satisfied a brief in prior stages of the process and conducted significant effort to reach the point of a re-enactment display.

Musical performance in immersive historical locations

In addition to the respective roles of participants and observers in producing a result by way of the Desire-Process-Result model, it will also be necessary to examine the significance of immersive locations in the efficacy of historically informed musical performance. It is often integral to delivering what can be perceived as an effective result. However, it will be necessary to ascertain in the following section to what extent an immersive (or otherwise) setting can help or hinder an authentic process and delivery of an immersive result to audiences of

---

[261] Elizabeth Carnegie and Scott Mccabe, 'Re-Enactment Events and Tourism: Meaning, Authenticity and Identity', *Current Issues in Tourism,* 11: 4 (2008) pp. 349-368 (p. 352)
[262] Ibid, p. 364

historically reimagined musical performance. It is necessary to establish how locations and settings carry relevance for audiences as well as the somaesthetic result of placing oneself in such a provocatively immersive setting as a performer and participant.

A particularly compelling example of this theory in action is the performance Wardruna gave in July 2017 at the *Traenafestivalen*, on a series of remote islands in northern Norway.[263] This performance took place in an ancient cave named Kirkehelleren, a place of archaeological significance and with unique acoustic properties making it ideal for musical performance. Described by multiple sources of news media as an "ancient natural cathedral", Kirkehelleren cave acted as a seemingly ideal setting for Wardruna to perform. Through personally witnessing this performance during a fieldwork trip, it was clear that Wardruna were experiencing high levels of immersion in such an evocative environment. While there is no direct historical link between the history of the cave and the periods of musical history investigated by the band, their emphasis in their work remains on a connection with ancient feelings and concepts. Einar Selvik had previously explained his view of the importance of signs and symbols in the understanding of audiences when delivering evocative and immersive content. He stated that "a lot of people try to copy the past with a modern mindset, and this is like squeezing a square into a round hole because a lot of these old things simply don't fit into our world. [...] Carrying around a heavy sack of empty symbols is just meaningless".[264] He also highlights the importance of remaining "humble" when performing Viking music, due to the lack of availability of every element of musicality needed to produce a full picture of what it truly would have sounded like.

Therefore, a gesture of willingness to provide as full an immersive experience as possible by the use of a natural landscape, as well as the acceptance of what does and does not fit with regards to utilising recognisable signs to communicate a particular evocation to audiences. These considerations all add to a hypothesis of "collective immersion". In other words, both the audiences and the settings in which the performance takes place can simultaneously help or hinder the immersion of all involved, including the performers. However, in this circumstance, the role of the performer shifts to that of aiding this proposed collective immersion when placed in an educational and/or performative context. The full implication and power of collective immersion will be examined further in the following section.

---

[263] 'Contact', *Trænafestivalen*, https://www.trena.net/kontakt. [Accessed 16 December 2020]
[264] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 197

6.2: Living Personas: The Musicianship of Self-Generated Characters

In the context of live action roleplay, particularly annual festival-based events, the concept of a collective immersion as a result of a process of creation carries a great deal of significance for the success of the event. The identities or "characters" that players create are intended not only to provide a strong basis of immersion for themselves but also all the other players around them. Creating a character integrates many elements of the desire and process stages of the theoretical D-P-R model, such as the utilisation of a player's "real-world" strengths and skills, including that of musical ability. Experienced roleplayer and musician Mark Chilvers has created a number of characters through multiple years of attending LARP events, including Profound Decisions' game Maelstrom (the predecessor to Empire). He stated during a 2018 interview that musicianship was a significant motivator in his process of character creation, due to the inherent enjoyment of contributing to the experiences of other players by providing informed musical content. He referred to the work of musicians Daisy Abbott and Jude Reid, who created the original musical briefs for every nation within the Empire system, specifying that the musical briefs were created alongside the corresponding briefs for costumes, traditions and mannerisms for the respective nations. This was, according to Chilvers, to ensure that music (or at the very least, an awareness of what music would naturally be familiar in that getting) became an element of character creation.[265]

Another Wintermark based Empire musician, Roger Finn, similarly created his character with the direct intention of providing a bard/storyteller inspired role to assist in the immersion of others on the field. This included ensuring that he had awareness of the nation's background, and therefore the simulation of past events to give the system a feeling of historicity. Interestingly, however, Finn offered an alternative view of the exceptionally detailed musical briefs available to players of Empire. He indicated that through asking other players, he discovered that some individuals were daunted by the "storytelling element" of the musical brief of Wintermark (the inspiration behind this being the linear narrative structures of sagas and epic poems in a large amount of Nordic folk music). However, Finn also stated that he personally liked this element of the brief, as it is "what I'd imagine it to be like, [...] a person

---

[265] Mark Chilvers, Appendix B, Interview 6, p. 216

who tells stories and how that's tied into the tradition of the game".[266] Therefore, it can be ascertained that the creation of a musician-based character in this style of festival LARP can support the theoretical notion of collective immersion very effectively, as through using the example of Wintermark and its saga-based musical brief, musician-based characters are created with the in-built intention to continue a field-based tradition and adding to it with storytelling from cumulative events within the game. Therefore, the musical and storytelling background of the real-world individual certainly plays a role in the assistance or halting of full immersion in a historically inspired roleplay setting.

One potential explanation for how LARPers are able to retain a sense of immersion while providing rehearsed and researched musical content that they are obliged to practice during out-of-character portions of their daily life, is that they place themselves in what could be described as a state of willed co-consciousness. This refers to the obligation they have as both a musician and a player to maintain a sense of what their generated character would think, feel or do in response to ongoing elements of the game, but also that of their own musicianship and recollection of what they have rehearsed, prepared and how fellow players are reacting to it. However, it is necessary to establish whether this proposed sense of co-consciousness does in fact assist in the immersive experience of an individual player simultaneously providing music for their chosen setting.

Fine explored in the introductory chapters of *Shared Fantasy* how collective experiences for roleplayers (both tabletop and live action) provide considerable meaningfulness and an opportunity to "collectively construct history and biographies".[267] This collective construction of a history and the mythology of the nation to which you and your fellow players belong resounds strongly with the idea of collective immersion and the cooperation of players to create a more widely effective setting for their roleplay. Therefore, if we are to assume that LARP musicians simulate a notion of co-consciousness in order to remain immersed in their role within the game as well as maintaining their musicianship, it will be necessary to determine how much of a crossover exists between those states, and to what extent it can be combined so that both oneself and one's character are seeking the same goals and feelings. Roger Finn illustrated this very effectively in describing his character to the author: his character earns in-game money by travelling between camps and providing songs and stories for paying customers. According to Finn, musical performance is also what he does as a real-world

---

[266] Roger Finn, Appendix B, Interview 7, p. 226
[267] Gary Alan Fine, *Shared Fantasy: Role Playing Games as Social Worlds* (Champaign: University of Chicago Press, 2002) p. 2

occupation. Therefore, he goes on to explain how both he and his character would naturally be asking themselves the same questions: "which verse am I doing next? Is my instrument tuned? Am I in the right setting?" as well as being conscious of remembering words and having a songbook accessible and potentially even creating meta-characters for individual performances.[268] The level of effort both he and his character place into these performances depend on the value attributed to them by the in-game "customer".

This awareness of both the self and the generated character self is an integral principle to collective immersion. Participants in festival roleplay settings are continually working to achieve greater immersion by interacting with the setting in a measured and calculated manner. While this initially may seem creatively stifling, the fact that players are able to alter the roles of their characters so that interacting with the setting that way then becomes authentic, is testament to the malleability of roleplayers in creatively expressive settings. However, more questions of musicianship within roleplaying become relevant when considering the specific responsibilities that musicians hold over both their own characters and the fulfilment of other players.

It has already been established by this investigation into collective immersion that individual characters are integral to making a whole experience for a group of players in a LARP setting. Players and their characters will often naturally form groups; Empire alone boasts a large number of wizards' covens, political and pseudo-religious movements, as well as several in-character "bands" featuring musicians from either the same or multiple nations. Experienced LARPer and musician Su Wainwright highlights the innate desire of many players to formulate collective experiences: "most performances are not solo; in my experience, people do like the 'let me bang on the tables and join in" variety of songs".[269] In other words, players often enjoy the feeling of organically participating in chorus-based songs that feel spontaneous within the setting of the game. This can often mean that certain characters are sought after for providing this specific style of experience for many other players, and both their in-character and out-of-character musicianship. James Smart supported this notion by indicating how he and fellow musicians of the Stormspire faction of Wintermark have ended up creating a formula for their in-character songwriting. "We probably do four verses and four or five choruses, and the chorus is quite easy, so certainly by the end or midway through a song you'll have picked the chorus

---

[268] Roger Finn, Appendix B, Interview 7, p. 240.
[269] Su Wainwright, Appendix B, Interview 5, p. 211

up, so it's easy for people to join in if they want to".[270]

This indicates that players will not only retain responsibility for their musicianship and its role as an immersive tool for fellow players; they will even go as far as to formulate their compositional techniques around the notion of accessibility for fellow players and their ability to join the collective immersion of roleplay- based musical performance. Through this process, characters become an owned entity, both by those who created them and those with whom the characters interact in an in-game setting. Players have used energy and specialist skillsets as musicians to ensure that their identities within the game are as immersive and believable to other players as possible. Therefore, similarly to the process of a re-enactor preparing for an educational display, the immersion of having achieved a goal adds a further layer of authenticity to the eventual result of this process.

As established in the previous sections, as LARPers, musicians face the additional challenge of transferring their out-of-character musical skills into an immersive setting, as well as the rest of the considerations that go into creating a functional, authentic and believable identity within the game. This means that the responsibility of providing immersion both for themselves and other players is keenly felt by musicians in these settings, but the question of whether this helps or hinders the personal immersion of that character is rather clearer. The psychological effects of rehearsing, practicing and ultimately performing their work, often having adapted or filked (see section 6.4) material, contributing not only to the theory of a willed co-consciousness between a character and a working musician, but also the notion of a collective immersion made up of many individuals each interacting with a piece of creative expression as organically and authentically as possible. In the case of Empire, because this type of performance tends to involve large groups singing easy choruses with recognisable melodic lines and patterns deliberately made accessible, it could be argued that deliberate collective immersion has essentially been worked into the process of content creation itself. Many of the tools used in other forms of historically informed expression are repurposed for the sake of effective roleplay and a conducive environment with which to feel as much a part of the game as possible. However, there are other examples along the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum of traditions which are repurposed entirely and provide a new sense of immersion and ownership to entirely unfamiliar audiences, as will now be examined in the following section.

---

[270] James Smart, Appendix B, Interview 4, p. 204

6.3: *Joik* & Shamanism: "New Age" Musical Traditions

Contemporary evolution of joik

As the contemporary role of *joik* becomes more and more established in the world of indigenous politics and the process of self-empowerment for the Sámi people, it is quite clear that *joik* has evolved into something much more than its "original idea". Due to the considerable evolution of what the technique represents (identity for a displaced population and awareness of potentially catastrophic geographical changes for the region), *joik* now produces an entirely different *result* than pre 18th-century sources would have us believe. Vuokko Hirvonen explores the implications of this revitalised position of joik in *Voices from Sápmi: Sámi Women's Path to Authorship.* Hirvonen investigates the role that joik plays in the formation of new feminist literature from the region and specifies how it has played a significant role in the "building of a positive Sámi identity".[271] The historic outlawing of *joiking* in the Sápmi region imbued many Sámi people with an overwhelming sense of ambivalence or even disapproval of *joik,* which, as seen in chapter 4, has perpetuated in many Sámi families to this day. This has resulted in an inherent shift in the purpose of joik and its utilisation as a positive tool of re-establishing Sámi identity. On the surface, this may seem like an effort to inform the global population of thestruggles and environmental crises faced by indigenous people. However, there is a significant indication that this shift towards repurposing such a controversial and beleaguered tradition has done more than that: it has assisted in showing Sámi people a new version of their own identity, similarly to Hirvonen's tracing of the significance of poetry in enflaming the hearts and minds of Sápmi's population. Tina Ramnarine supports this notion in *Ilmatar's Inspirations: Nationalism, Globalization and the Changing Soundscapes of Finnish Folk Music* by describing how Sámi musicians used central regions of Helsinki to *joik* and how by doing so they "reinforced their own Sámi identity".[272] These examples demonstrate the power of a tangible *result* from a historically informed creative process. A form of the prior "collective immersion" theory also perpetuates these scenarios; Sámi people have sought solidarity from one another and from well-known musicians within their communities such as Ulla Pirttijarvi and Nils-Aslak Valkeapäa.

---

[271] Vuokko Hirvonen, *Voices from Sápmi: Sámi Women's Path to Authorship* (Kautokeino: DAT, 2008) p. 25

[272] Tina K. Ramnarine, *Ilmatar's Inspirations: Nationalism, Globalization and the Changing Soundscapes of Finnish Folk Music (*London: University of Chicago Press, 2003) p. 182

The contemporary development of joik as "New Age"

As different cultures across the world become more interrelated and new religions, subsects of religions and iterations of spiritual practices are created and distributed, it is unsurprising that *joik*, arguably the most recognisable element of Sámi culture to anybody outside it, has fallen under some scrutiny as a potential source of "new age" spiritual purpose. As this new series of traditions continues to emerge over time, many musical practices across a number of populations (indigenous or otherwise) are being repurposed and reimagined for the spiritual advancement of those seeking alternative worldviews. While the response from many Sámi musicians interviewed and observed for this study has not been universally positive or negative and a wide variety of opinions exist among the population as to whether this is a desirable result for their ancient tradition, the potential utilisation of *joik* as a tool for creative spiritual growth brings both new meaning and opportunity to the practice. In a process not dissimilar to Einar Selvik's description of ancient traditions needing to evolve to remain alive and functional for "modern ears", *joik* too should hope to evolve accordingly to ensure its continuity and longevity on a growing musical stage.[273] This evolution brings new possibilities for evolution, originality and purpose within the technique, potentially also widening its accessibility for both Sámi and non-Sámi musicians.

Perhaps the most significant contemporary example of this new established utilisation of *joik* is that of its propensity as a potential tool for healing. New research at the Arctic University of Norway (UiT) in Tromso piloted by Soile Hamalainen and Ola Graff within the University has been shown to demonstrate the hitherto under-researched relationship between healing, health and traditional and/or ceremonial healing practices.[274] These investigations range from the assessment of spiritual healing from an academic and scientific perspective to practical usage in the care of dementia patients as a form of music therapy.[275] Hamalainen et al. discovered that many of their interviewees, particularly in their article on the use of joik in dementia care, described joik as "like having a friend" or "as a culture-specific form of self-

---

[273] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 197

[274] Soile Hämäläinen, Frauke Musial, Anita Salamonsen, Ola Graff, and Torjer A. Olsen, 'Sami Yoik, Sami History, Sami Health: A Narrative Review', *International Journal of Circumpolar Health* 77: 1 (2018) pp. 145-178

[275] Soile Hämäläinen, Frauke Musial, Ola Graff, Torjer A. Olsen, and Anita Salamonsen, 'Yoik Experiences and Possible Positive Health Outcomes: An Explorative Pilot Study', *International Journal of Circumpolar Health,* 76: 1 (2017) pp. 1-10 (p. 5)

expression", or simply as "everything".[276] These emotive responses to the technique, as well as the indication that in these instances *joik* was utilised as a means of controlling and recognising emotions during medical situations where this was no longer an easy feat, suggest the continuity of an immersive and beloved tradition even among older Sámi, who have had many years of displacement and overwhelmingly negative attitudes towards the technique for the majority of their younger lives. This is a wholly reimagined example of *joik* in a seemingly unprecedented manner, indicating another area of the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum and *result* within the proposed model that shows a tangible evolution of a musical tradition married with its repurposing for the sake of cultural advancement.

However, how can these discoveries continue to be applied to new musical traditions within the region of Sápmi? *Joik* is being utilised as a conduit for Sámi people to feel more connected to themselves and their identities, as well as one another and their natural environment. Many Sámi musicians, politicians and activists are welcoming this shift in *process* and *result* and are continuing to find ways of opening this conduit further. This provides a further strong example of how the reimagining of a historical musical practice can not only retain a sense of authenticity in both desire and process for its participants, but also deliver an immersive result for both them and any observers to the tradition. Educators and *joikers* such as Berit Alette Mienna and Johan Mahtte Skum are welcoming this growth in tradition. Mienna stated that "there are so many people who are looking for ways to connect spiritually with their surroundings, and both Sámi and other indigenous cultures still live with and kind of cultivate this connection, and that is why a lot of people are drawn to it".[277] In other words, ancient musical traditions can be applied in a myriad of new ways to create further immersion for both spirituality, events and indigenous and non-indigenous populations seeking further connections with each other or natural landscapes. However, as well as the evolution of reimagined musical traditions into encapsulation of spiritual healing and closer connections with natural environments, a further *result* of the process of recreation can be witnessed in evolving ideas of ownership and inheritance. As this can be seen in all three of this project's chosen case studies, the following section will consider the role of archives, inheritance and "filking" from a predominantly theoretical viewpoint.

---

[276] Soile Hämäläinen, Frauke Musial, Ola Graff, Henrik Schirmer, Anita Salamonsen, and Grete Mehus, 'The art of yoik in care: Sami caregivers' experiences in dementia care in Northern Norway', *Nordic Journal of Arts, Culture and Health,* 2: 1 (2020) pp. 22–37

[277] Berit Alette Mienna, trans. by Soile Hamalainen, Appendix B, Interview 2, p. 213

6.4: "Filking", Archives and Inheritance: The Transferred Ownership of Musical Ideas

It could be suggested that the newfound ownership of musical ideas and the placement of their significance upon individuals has, in the case of historical recreation, created a sense of cultural legitimisation of these objects. This potentially carries the effect of "glossing over" more problematic aspects of the past in certain traditions; this could be seen in the examples given by Einar Selvik of the repurposing of Viking and Norse imagery by both early 20th century and contemporary far-right extremist organisations. In his 2017 interview at the Jorvik Viking Festival, Selvik described how he had to "basically defend his music" on Norwegian national television upon first experiencing some success as a musician. He had to render himself abundantly clear to Norwegian media that his repurposing of Viking aesthetics was not politically motivated and had no relation to any far-right ideologies, such was the concern of the public over use of these aesthetics. As Selvik states:

> I know there are certain movements who like my music that I wish didn't, but on the other hand, I am very clear on these matters and always will be. So it's out of my control, and I don't feed the beast by focusing on it.[278]

Selvik indicates the fact that personal tastes towards his music are "out of his control". This raises several interesting questions about how reimagined musical material transfers in ownership on its own small spectrum. This ranges from belonging to "the historic past" without a specific name associated with the content, to the middle ground of whoever is reviving it for contemporary consumption and entertainment, and finally the result of who lays claim to that musical content after it is released into the public domain. This almost acts as a microcosm of the larger Desire-Process-Result model throughout this thesis but illustrates a significant trend: the ownership of historical material in music can be transferred and undergoes its own process of evolution.

One of the most significant modern examples of a transferral in ownership of something historic is the genre of "filk" music. This refers to a tradition that began with folk music (hence the play on words present in the genre's title), and the initial onset of the science-fiction genre.

---

[278] Einar Selvik, Appendix B, Interview 1, p. 189

The tradition originated as short comedic songs using popular folk melodies with deliberately altered lyrics that became versions set in science-fiction universes. This was most popular in early *Star Trek* fandoms initially, but the concept of "filk" has evolved far beyond it. Since the growth of the internet and the ability to share, rearrange and cover media more easily, filk has become its own standalone meta-community and tradition with its own cultures, subcultures and "briefs".[279] This has carried over into now decades-long traditions in both contemporary fandoms and in tabletop and live action roleplay.

When it comes to applying filk to other cultures and determining its potential as a tool for historically informed reimagining, a surprising observation occurred. In many of these historically informed cultures, where ownership did not necessarily play a significant role in the past, the equivalent of filk has begun to happen on its own in all but the name. The genres of filk and modern parody have overlapped each other over the most recent decades, but filk has appeared as a defined and respected tradition within many LARP communities, and that of Profound Decisions' Empire is no exception. Richard Shusterman illustrates the need for trusting in one's implicit reactions to aesthetic content in his work on somaesthetics, and this theory can be applied to the sense of familiarity and indeed immersion that filk in live action roleplay strives to create.[280] Filk conjures familiarity by retaining known and loved melody lines, song structures and percussive rhythms, but adds enough contrast to render the piece of music entirely reimagined, usually by altering lyrics or changing instrumentation. In essence, a "filk" of a popular song is a form of simulacrum in the strictest sense: an object which has been recreated as an intentionally recognisable but notably unoriginal "version".[281] Bringing this concept into contemporary musicology, Lydia Goehr's definition of a "concept" fits appropriately with filk, as a filk is designed to endure through multiple "versions" and remain recognisable irrespective of its evolution, additions or alterations to lyrics and changes in structure or instrumentation.[282] As a result, the concept of a filk retains its own individual authenticity, as it can be viewed as its own private trajectory of creative evolution. However, as with other forms of authenticity in both *desire* and *process* within the theoretical model, this form of authenticity disperses into discernible pockets rather than travelling in a

[279] Melissa L. Tatum, 'Identity and Authenticity in the Filk Community', *Transformative Works and Cultures* 3 (2009) pp. 1-5

[280] Richard Shusterman, 'Somaesthetics: A Disciplinary Proposal', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism,* 57: 3 (1999) pp. 299-313 (p. 299)

[281] Jean Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation (*Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994)

[282] Lydia Goehr, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music (*Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994)

chronologically linear fashion. As with the other broader forms of historically informed authenticity investigated in this thesis, the authenticity of filk also contributes to the sense of collective immersion and co-conscious content creation. Several of the LARPer musicians interviewed for this project indicated hearing different versions of their own material at multiple points during different Empire events, indicating that the content was being dispersed, retold and reperformed by other musicians around the field. This indicates a simulation of an entirely organic aural tradition; rather like the ancient cultures by which much of the Empire brief was inspired, other musicians have heard elements of songs and accompanied sagas which they found aesthetically appealing enough to replicate and create their own "version" of, perpetuating Goehr's idea of the original song (or filk) existing as its own individual concept. This discovery indicates a continuity of *result* within roleplaying traditions and the cultures that manifest as a result of them; much in the manner of re-enactors seeking to disperse education through living history displays and the encouragement of sending indigenous musical traditions further across multiple cultures to reap hitherto untapped spiritual and potentially even holistic benefits.

6.5: Conclusion

Through this discussion, it can be surmised that the intended *result* of a historically informed performance in a re-enactment, revival or roleplay setting is an immersive experience that observers, audiences and/or participants can feel either that they "belong to" or that this culture "belongs to them". However, this sense of belonging in the majority of these instances has not resulted in an isolation of these forms of creative expressions. On the contrary, a renewed sense of ownership and established (or in some cases re-established) immersion has actually encouraged the musical traditions examined in this study to disperse further than they potentially would have done had the purpose of the original tradition not been rerouted by external factors such as societal, sociocultural and geopolitical changes. It has been a significant element of all three case studies, as both roleplay and re-enactment have demonstrated the roles of potential co-consciousness and the splitting and prioritising of one's identity as a performer versus one's chosen role or character within the display and/or system. Similarly, a renewed sense of purpose has been injected into Sámi *joiks* since the 1970s but particularly in more recent years, when unprecedented research around holistic health has demonstrated even more of a potential for *joik* than initially expected.

Much like what has been observed in the *desire* and *process* behind these creations, the *results* of the creative experience operate accordingly with the proposed DPR model. This can range from an almost co-conscious measured immersion that must be actively perpetuated, or a full immersive experience that diminishes the feeling of responsibility for its own existence. This solidifies the framework of the re-enactment and reimagining spectrum, as another element of the *Desire-Process-Result* model has now been proven to exist on a spectrum of activity; immersion and ownership range from targeted inheritance and repurposing for specific new ideas, to being widely dispersed and freely reimagined by anybody with access to any existing version of the work. These historically informed "concepts" continue to travel throughout all these cultures and place further significance on the theoretical transference of meaning within and between different forms of historical reimagining.

Chapter 7

Conclusions

7.1: Presentation of Final Theories

In setting out to determine whether a theoretical framework can be applied to contemporary historical reimagining, the initial research questions of this thesis concerned determining methods for mapping and observing historically informed musical traditions in re-enactment, roleplay and revival settings. The principal aims were to gather insight as to the role of perceived authenticity and/or "correctness", immersion and its relation to ownership, as well as the underpinning desire behind these practices. It was necessary first to establish to what extent historically informed or inspired content was used as the starting point of creative processes within the cultures of the chosen case studies. Following this, it was equally significant to determine the question of how and why modern society latches onto contemporary and somewhat static ideas of the past. That was the initial theme at the start of this project: why we think we know what the past sounds like (or is expected to sound like) and how we have moved forwards creatively from that notion. The earliest iterations of this project were centred around the paradoxical question "can we know a sound without actually knowing it?". This was a foundation upon which to construct the framework of further enquiry and quickly evolved into an investigation into whether the "knowing" of a sound actually mattered at all in this context, and to what extent the actual creation *process* (as well as underpinning *desire* and hard-won *result*) nourishes itself in such an environment and, on a wider scale, provides the participant with an innate sense of immersion and self-fulfilling authenticity. As detailed in Chapter 1, contemporary re-enactment studies have begun to identify ways of adapting existing discourse on historically informed creative content for use in other academic disciplines, which is what this thesis intends to contribute to.

Previous professional museum experience along with the innately historically imbued location of York brought this investigation forwards for academic consideration, but the primary impetus of examining historical music recreation arose from aspects of my undergraduate dissertation at Royal Holloway, University of London. Principally, these were

comprised of the continuity of an ancient tradition and its corresponding practices, as well as an introduction to indigenous Sámi musical cultures. These initial stimuli, along with prior experience of running the Historical Re-enactment Society of Royal Holloway, were the main starting points of this investigation into reimagining historical sound.

When selecting the case studies most appropriate for these types of questions, it was necessary to consider my own familiarity and prior experience with each of them, remaining sensitive and appropriate in the case of indigenous cultures, and establishing how one might practically conduct fieldwork potentially as both an observer and a participant. Due to prior research ties, the unique examples of cultural and generational displacement and eventual empowerment of the Sámi were already present within the main foundations of this project's initial research questions, so they were among the first of the pieces of practical work undertaken. The addition of both historical re-enactment and live action roleplay as the subsequent case studies broadened the scope of the project, enabling the new theoretical framework of a re-enactment to reimagining spectrum, which became one of the main tenets of this thesis. The argument centres around the idea that contemporary historical reimagining of music (as well as potentially other creative processes, to be discussed in later sections) can be viewed on an active and malleable spectrum.

As will be explained below, this spectrum has been shown to consist of inspiration, execution, and perception of audiences in historically informed musical composition and performance. As this framework developed, the corresponding Desire-Process-Result model (see following section) became an integral element of this new theoretical framework. These two proposed models of contemporary theory formed the two main arguments of this thesis; between them, they illustrate hitherto unexplored relationships between multiple forms of historically informed musical expression.

I have proposed in this thesis that different forms of historical recreation and reimagining can be viewed by way of a spectrum. This spectrum has been proven not to follow chronologically linear sequences, but to demonstrate how elements of authenticity and immersion inform different parts of the creative process. Initially, the first end of the proposed spectrum consists of evidence-based re-enactment and the limits of creative productivity available from evidenced historical and archaeological sources. As discussed in Chapter 1, this encompasses heavily invested re-enactors and their parent organisations who wish to maintain the utmost rigidity in documented, evidence-based re-enactment, travelling towards a central point of a desire to maintain a significant portion of the authentic process, with as much of an authentic result as can be visible to the audience or spectators. This element is significant; an

161

unspoken knowledge of authenticity and dedication to delivering an educational and immersive display exists between re-enactors and their audiences. Both re-enactment groups (such as Volsung, Historia Normannis and university-based societies), as well as individuals and businesses who create workshops, instruments and educational material (such as the Jorvik Group and Ancient Music) all contribute to this point of the spectrum with regard to that often-unspoken agreement of perceived authenticity existing between observers and participants. They actively desire to create an image of the past that, at the very least, is immersive and engaging to audiences. This may or may not incorporate the participants' own identities and involve "living history" roleplay. This can be theorised as a "displaced authenticity"; an acceptance on the part of the participants that elements of the process and result will remain "inauthentic" to them, as this element is sacrificed to provide a fully immersive experience for those who are observing and/or consuming this content. An individual who wishes to showcase historically informed music in an immersive costumed setting is innately aware of their role as an educator, which maintains a psychological divide between their own "real world" Identities and that of being fully immersed in a character designed to interact with that environment.

Conversely, the opposite end of the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum concerns those who remain thoroughly invested in the process of reviving pieces of history, but who are not intending to produce a historically accurate result. These can include historically inspired musical groups such as Wardruna and Heilung as well as indigenous Sámi musicians such as Ulla Pirttijarvi, Nils-Aslak Valkeapaa and Mari Boine. These musicians undeniably respond to similar historical "briefs" (see Chapter 4) to re-enactors, but in a much more creatively loose way with a direct intent to provide growth and evolution in the tradition, (footnote: it is important to distinguish that re-enactors also do this but through the process of education and display rather than creative interpretation. In fact, re-enactors often inspire musicians such as these). Einar Selvik and Wardruna respond directly to an ancient source of creative inspiration (the Elder Futhark runic system) but choose to use both ancient and contemporary musical techniques and instrumentation to provide a creative interpretation of that system. As both this and the examples in the rest of this thesis have demonstrated: this is, in many ways, an authentic process, even if the result becomes something beyond an authentic simulacrum of historical content. This also assists in proving that authenticity can exist in dispersed pockets of time, rather than be intended to reflect a linear timeline.

In between these three points lies a tremendous variety of interpretations and allowances, which will continue to evolve. This thesis has demonstrated the role of live-action roleplay in festival settings as a compelling example of one of these central points of the re-

enactment to reimagining spectrum. This system of creative historical re-imagining relies on authenticity and immersion as much as the rest of the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum. However, the crucial difference is that LARP's authenticity must exist and manifest internally. In the case of Profound Decisions' Empire, the participants' brief was formed through the selection of different cultures, historical periods and fantastical settings to create entirely new cultures and subcultures. While this negates the requirement of individual authenticity for each of these respective inspirations, the creation of an entirely new culture means that the result of this process must maintain an authenticity of its own. LARP musicians seek to contribute to this new culture by interacting organically with the environment created in these settings. In doing so, they are both investigating and contributing to a growing authenticity of process and result, which culminates in an immersive cultural environment both for themselves and other participants.

To summarise this element of my proposed theoretical framework, evoking a spectrum as an analytical tool can be applied to live musical and historical practices such as re-enactment, living history, and early music performance, and could continue to be applied indefinitely to popular representations of "historicalness" within contemporary media, with the focus remaining on the human process, and allowances being made for potential future changes in societal and cultural structures. This study has proven the existence of relationships between disparate forms of historical recreation in creative contexts, demonstrating how historical re-imagining can travel from a desire to represent, educate and empower to an intent of creative expression pushing the boundaries of how the initial inspirational content is understood and manipulated.

The secondary part of my proposed theoretical framework concerns the sequencing of the three main cornerstones of historically informed reimagining: desire, process and result. Separating the elements of desire, process and result has allowed the application of different areas of aesthetic and creative philosophy alongside the established re-enactment to reimagining spectrum (see above) to provide a clear illustration of the theories behind historical recreation. This model of analysis has illustrated that recreation can be catalogued and viewed as a series of stages, even if the precise nature and background of the creative cultures involved are vastly different from one another. As a brief overview, the desire consists of creative inspirations behind composition or arrangement as well as any pre-existing settings, environments or contexts which play an inherent role in the participant's drive to produce creative content. The process consists of the composition and/or performance itself, or the activity surrounding the musical content (such as an educational workshop or living history

demonstration). The result represents the audiences (if any) and their response and interaction to this reimagined historical content. Each of these stages has been analysed alongside the chosen case studies with complementing philosophical disciplines to demonstrate how they relate to each other and inform the further understanding of historical reimagining.

The desire to create something new from something "of the past" is a significant feature of the field of hauntology, which made it the ideal philosophical discipline to theorise nostalgia and a longing for the past. In this thesis, hauntology and displaced nostalgia were used correspondingly as an analytical tool for the desires and motivations behind recreating historical content. This also enabled a further understanding of more delicate areas of indigenous cultural revival, maintaining an appropriate distance between the true revival of existing cultural practices and the simulation of historical practices for the purposes of entertainment or roleplay. Hauntology also allowed for the consideration of further areas of structural and social anthropology to provide a sound theoretical baseline for the "desire" element of the DPR model on all areas of the spectrum.

Moving onto the secondary stage of the Desire-Process-Result model, the process of composing and performing historically informed music while communicating that something is "of the past" but also recreated into something new involves the understanding and examination of a series of encoded cultural and aesthetic signs. This necessitated the need for a semiotic approach to the theories behind the creative process in historical reimagining. Use of this field of study enabled the parsing of the creative process behind historical recreation as well as the organic considerations of performance and setting. The semiotic analysis of such activities as recreating historical instruments, teaching a joiking workshop or providing musical accompaniment for a roleplay setting, enabled this study to identify the relationship between those processes, the desire and inspiration whence they came, and the resulting interpretation and response by audiences and other participants. This was achieved by identifying signs and topoi that communicated markers of perceived authenticity and immersion to those receptive to these processes.

Finally, the theory of simulacra assisted in analysing the result of this proposed reimagining model. Having operated with the assumption that when the content has been created, it thus leaves the hands of the creator, it is then liable to become something other than its origin when exposed to other participants or audiences. This post-creation process, in other words, allows for simulations of the original content to be perpetuated, illustrating the need for an understanding and consideration of simulacra theory. An examination of immersion as well as perceived ownership and the propensity for further interpretation has demonstrated

that, as well as being grounded in *desire* and *process,* historically informed traditions can evolve to develop new meaning and purpose. This was especially evident in Sámi cultural revival, as the role of joik has now evolved to combat the threat to a highly altered natural environment, as well as to provide a conduit for raising awareness to non-Sámi communities to assist in this empowerment of indigenous identity. This is a direct example of the result of historically informed recreation drastically altering the direction and purpose of that tradition through a necessity of process alteration and a desire to recall displaced content. While the original pre-18th century purpose of joik was to build relationships with the natural environment, it was also used to assist in religious and magical workings, rather than the targeted role in social commentary that joik plays in modern-day Sápmi.

These elements of cultural theory and musicological analysis have, along with consideration of the chosen case studies, produced a robust theoretical model with which to analyse the behaviour and reactions of historically informed content when placed in a variety of contexts. This Desire-Process-Result model, with the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum alongside, provides a set of analytical tools with which to understand how and why the past is reimagined in creative contexts today.

7.2: Potential Uses of the Re-enactment-Reimagining Spectrum and the Desire- Process-Result Model in Future Studies

These theoretical frameworks provide a strong foundational basis with which to examine historically informed creative content. Both the Desire-Process-Result model and the Reimagining Activity Spectrum allow for considerable variation in the treatment of both authenticity and immersion. As has been proven in the Sámi case study, it has been possible to conduct this investigation while maintaining respect and sensitivity for the indigenous population and the political and geographical concerns they face.[283] This implies that the frameworks could be used for cultures with similarly fractured sociocultural foundations, such as those who have also had different forms of creative expression suppressed for religious, political or war-related purposes.

There are also many varied forms of roleplaying in circulation across the world, many

---

[283] See Appendix B, interviews 2 & 3 for further discussion of indigenous concerns in context.

of which rely on creative expression to provide immersive environments for their players. Using this study's theoretical frameworks for investigation of those cultures not only allows for analysis of the game, but of the genres of music and other forms that spring up around these roleplaying settings. Since the advancement of social media, and particularly that of Dungeons and Dragons and other online/remote tabletop roleplaying games (which has only increased in popularity since the global Covid-19 pandemic of 2020), many complementary forms of musical expression have evolved. This includes the recent YouTube-based phenomenon of "Bardcore", the process of reimagining popular songs using what a modern audience deems to be "medieval" sounds and instrumentation, often humorously altering the original lyrics to approximations of Old or Shakespearean English.[284] As new methods of interacting with historically informed creative content have evolved through the exploration of new technological possibilities as well as through the necessity of the recent global changes.

Finally, there is much scope for advances in the theories behind all elements of the Desire-Process-Result model, as well as the re-enactment to reimagining spectrum. From a psychological point of view, it may be compelling to further examine the neuroscientific steps of "accidental" creation and experimentation. This could potentially be linked to the theory of cryptomnesia (buried and/or suppressed memories being fronted as new or original) could be applied to both the process of reimagining and the desire behind wanting to recreate or revive a culture - particularly if that culture has been previously displaced in some way. This also bears scope for the popularised notion of racial and/or genetic memory; as language is already considered a partial element of genetic memory, if musical techniques such as joik can be shown to provide alternative forms of communication it could also be said to have some basis in genetic memory. Overall, the scope for future study through the use of these case studies as well as the Reimagining Activity Spectrum and the Desire-Process-Result model is considerable. They are demonstrably capable of application and adaptation for use in multiple cultures and environments.

---

[284] Vanessa Hughes, 'Interview with Hildegard Von Blingin', *Classic Drive* (2020)
https://www.abc.net.au/classic/programs/classic-drive/hildegard-von-blingin/12657340 [Accessed 10 April 2022]

7.3: Concluding Statements

I began this project by asking why we think we know what music sounded like in the past. This, on the face of it, would seem to be a simple question but proved to hold complex layers of meaning for multiple forms of historically informed recreation and creative expression. This thesis has demonstrated clear causality between the desire to recreate historical content and the implications of creating this content both authentically and in an immersive manner. The process has been shown to be non-linear, capable of dispersal across multiple generations, geographical regions and populations. I have shown that the past can be interpreted through the present in a variety of expressive ways that provide authenticity and a form of truth to both their observers and their participants. The Desire-Process-Model was initially set out to provide a basis for analysing historically informed reimagining. This has proven to be an effective design, with scope for use in multiple cultures and settings, and has demonstrated a new multidisciplinary approach to the musicological analysis of historically informed performance. This thesis was a unique blend of what appeared to be highly disparate case studies, but it has been shown that these far-flung groups and organisations shared a surprising amount in common with regards to the drive behind the revival of their historical content, the process undergone in bringing it to life and the result of sharing this content with the wider population.

Having extracted the two principal theoretical frameworks born from this thesis, demonstrated how it can be applied to wider case studies, and shown its scope for future use, I present this thesis as an alternative view of historically informed musical performance and its propensity for growth, immersive storytelling, education of etic cultural observers in matters of indigeneity and exploration of how to create and maintain an individually authentic view of the past. This research is significant in uncovering how contemporary cultures evolve through manipulation of their pasts, as well as the continuation of a globalised world and the formation of newer subcultures from new needs and desires to create meaningful creatively expressive content. It lends itself to a deeper understanding of how we process and execute creative expression, and what isolating elements of history can reveal with regards to individual potential. Ultimately, the work of this thesis can, as demonstrated above, stretch much further than musicology; it can act as a template for the examination of many different cultures and forms of aesthetic expression based on iterations of the historic past (or perception of). The past can indeed be viewed, manipulated and reimagined through the present by use of the principles of authenticity and immersion. The recreation and reimagining of historical music

and sound in contemporary re-enactment, cultural revival and fantastical roleplay demonstrates effectively how creative material is passed through and between cultures, and much can be learned about our own propensity for education, self-immersion and expression in the process.

Bibliography

Agawu, Kofi. *Music as Discourse: Semiotic Adventures in Romantic Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008)

Agawu, V. Kofi, *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1991)

Agnew, Vanessa, Jonathan Lamb, and Juliane Tomann, *The Routledge Handbook of Reenactment Studies: Key Terms in the Field* (London: Routledge, 2019)

Allison, David B, 'Iconologies : Reading Simulations with Plato and Nietzsche', *Recherches Semiotique/Semiotic Inquiry*, 16: 1-2 (1996) pp. 89-111

Almen, Byron, *A Theory of Musical Narrative* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2008)

Ashby, Steven P., and John Schofield, ''Hold the Heathen Hammer High': Representation, Re-Enactment and the Construction of 'Pagan' Heritage.' *International Journal of Heritage Studies,* 21:5 (2015) pp. 493-511

Assis, Paulo de, David Davies, Andreas Dorschel, Lydia Goehr, Gunnar Hindrichs, Kathy Kiloh, Jake McNulty, and John Rink, 'Virtual Works—Actual Things', *Virtual Works – Actual Things: Essays in Music Ontology*, ed. by Paulo de Assis (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2018) pp. 19-44

Assis, Paulo de, ed., *Experimental Affinities in Music* (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2015)

Bærenholdt, Jørgen Ole, and Michael Haldrup, 'Mobile Networks and Place Making in Cultural Tourism: Staging Viking Ships and Rock Music in Roskilde', *European Urban and Regional Studies*, 13:3 (2006) pp. 209–24

Barnouw, Jeffrey, 'Signification and Meaning: A Critique of the Saussurean Conception of the Sign', *Comparative Literature Studies,* 18:3 (1981) pp. 260–71

Barz, Gregory F., and Timothy J. Cooley, eds, *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)

Baudrillard, Jean, and Arthur B. Evans, 'Simulacra and Science Fiction (Simulacres et Science-Fiction)'. *Science Fiction Studies,* 18:3 (1991) pp. 309–13

Baudrillard, Jean, *The System of Objects*, (London: Verso, 2005)

Baudrillard, Jean, *Simulacra and Simulation*, trans. by Sheila Glaser (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994)

Berger, Jonathan, 'Playing with "Playing with Signs": A Critical Response to Kofi Agawu', *Journal of Music Theory,* 38:2 (1994) 293–313

Bevir, Mark, 'Why Historical Distance is Not a Problem', *History and Theory,* 50:4 (2011) pp. 24–37

Bienia, Rafael, 'Exploring Nonhuman Perspectives in Live-Action Role-Play', *Transformative Works and Cultures,* 18 (2015) pp. 1-2

Bithell, Caroline, and Juniper Hill, eds. *The Oxford Handbook of Music Revival*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016)

Boote, David N., and Penny Beile, 'Scholars Before Researchers: On the Centrality of the Dissertation Literature Review in Research Preparation', *Educational Researcher,* 34:6 (2005) pp. 3–15

Both, Arnd Adje, 'Music Archaeology: Some Methodological and Theoretical Considerations' *Yearbook for Traditional Music,* 41 (2009) pp. 1-11

Boym, Svetlana, *Future of Nostalgia* (New York: Basic Books, 2002)

Bradburd, Daniel, 'Review of *Review of Anthropologists in the Field: Cases in Participant Observation*, by Lynne Hume and Jane Mulcock', *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute,* 12:1 (2006) pp. 264–65

Bryman, Alan, 'The Disneyization of Society', *The Sociological Review,* 47:1 (1999) pp. 25–47

Butler, Richard, and Thomas Hinch, *Tourism and Indigenous Peoples: Issues and Implications* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2007)

Butt, John, *Playing with History: The Historical Approach to Musical Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)

Carnegie, Elizabeth, and Scott Mccabe, 'Re-Enactment Events and Tourism: Meaning, Authenticity and Identity', *Current Issues in Tourism* 11:4 (2008) pp. 349–68

Chattah, Juan Roque, 'Semiotics, Pragmatics, and Metaphor in Film Music Analysis' (unpublished doctoral thesis, Florida State University, 2006)

Chhabra, Deepak, Robert Healy, and Erin Sills, 'Staged Authenticity and Heritage Tourism', *Annals of Tourism Research* 30:3 (2003) pp. 702–19

Chhabra, Deepak, 'Positioning Museums on an Authenticity Continuum', *Annals of Tourism Research* 35:2 (2008) pp. 427–47

Chiener, Chou, 'Experience and Fieldwork: A Native Researcher's View', *Ethnomusicology* 46:3 (2002) pp. 456–86

Christensen, Thomas. 'Monumental Theory', in *Experimental Affinities in Music,* ed. by Paulo de Assis, (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2015) pp. 197-212

Clayton, Martin, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton, *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction* (London: Psychology Press, 2003)

Collingwood, R.G, *The Idea of History* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1946)

Crispin, Darla, and Bob Gilmore, eds., *Artistic Experimentation in Music: An Anthology* (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2014)

Deleuze, Gilles, and Rosalind Krauss. 'Plato and the Simulacrum', *The MIT Press: October*, 27 (1983) pp. 45–56

Derrida, Jacques, *Specters of Marx: The State of the Debt, the Work of Mourning and the New International* (New York: Routledge, 2006)

Deterding, Sebastian, and José Zagal, *Role-Playing Game Studies: Transmedia Foundations* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2018)

Enders, Jody, 'History Trouble: Re-enactment and Pseudoperformativity at the Witch Festival of Nieuwpoort.' *Theatre Journal, Johns Hopkins University Press,* 65:2 (2013) pp. 235–51

Gnecco, Cristóbal and Tracy Ireland, *Ethical Archaeologies: The Politics of Social Justice* (2020) http://www.springer.com/series/7559. [Accessed 1 April 2020]

Filitz, Thomas, A. Jamie Saris, and ProQuest, *Debating Authenticity: Concepts of Modernity in Anthropological Perspective* (New York: Berghahn Books, 2013)

Fine, Gary Alan. *Shared Fantasy: Role Playing Games as Social Worlds* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002)

Fisher, Mark, 'What Is Hauntology?' *Film Quarterly* 66:1 (2012) pp. 16–24

Freitas, Elizabeth de, and Matthew X. Curinga, 'New Materialist Approaches to the Study of Language and Identity: Assembling the Posthuman Subject', *Curriculum Inquiry* 45:3 (2015) pp. 249–65

Funk, W, 'Aesthetics of Authenticity: Representing Self and Other in Literature and Culture' *The Aesthetics of Authenticity: Medial Constructions of the Real*. (Hanover: Leibniz University, 2016)

Gapps, Stephen, 'Authenticity Matters: Historical Re-Enactment and Australian Attitudes to the Past', *Australian Cultural History*, 22 (2003) pp. 50-63

Gapps, Stephen, 'Mobile Monuments: A View of Historical Re-enactment and Authenticity from inside the Costume Cupboard of History.' *Rethinking History* 13:3 (2009) pp. 395–409

Gilman, Lisa, and John Fenn. 'Defining Fieldwork'. In *Handbook for Folklore and Ethnomusicology Fieldwork* (Indiana: Indiana University Press, 2019) pp. 7-22

Gilman, Lisa and John Fenn. 'Participant Observation'. In *Handbook for Folklore and Ethnomusicology Fieldwork* (Indiana: Indiana University Press, 2019) pp. 118-39

Goehr, Lydia, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007)

Goehr, Lydia. 'Explosive Experiments and the Fragility of the Experimental'. In *Experimental Affinities in Music*, ed. Paulo de Assis (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2015) pp. 15-41

Guerra, Gustavo, 'Practicing Pragmatism: Richard Shusterman's Unbound Philosophy', *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 36:4 (2002) pp. 70–83

Hagen, Rune Blix, 'Sami Shamanism: The Arctic Dimension', *Magic, Ritual, and Witchcraft*, 1:2 (2006) pp. 227–33

Halewood, Chris, and Kevin Hannam, 'Viking Heritage Tourism: Authenticity and Commodification', *Annals of Tourism Research, 28:3* (2001) pp. 565–80

Hall, Richard A, *The Viking Dig: Excavations at York* (London: The Bodley Head Ltd, 1984)

Hamilton, Mary Lynn, Laura Smith, and Kristen Worthington, 'Fitting the Methodology with the Research: An Exploration of Narrative, Self-Study and Auto-Ethnography', *Studying Teacher Education* 4:1 (2008) pp. 17–28

Hämäläinen, Soile, Frauke Musial, Anita Salamonsen, Ola Graff, and Torjer A. Olsen. 'Sami Yoik, Sami History, Sami Health: A Narrative Review'. *International Journal of Circumpolar Health,* 77:1 (2018) pp. 145-178

Hämäläinen, Soile, Frauke Musial, Ola Graff, Henrik Schirmer, Anita Salamonsen, and Grete Mehus,'The art of yoik in care: Sami caregivers' experiences in dementia care in Northern Norway',*Nordic Journal of Arts, Culture and Health, 2:1* (2020) pp. 22–37

Hämäläinen, Soile, Frauke Musial, Ola Graff, Torjer A. Olsen, and Anita Salamonsen, 'Yoik Experiences and Possible Positive Health Outcomes: An Explorative Pilot Study', *International Journal of Circumpolar Health,* 76:1 (2017) pp. 1-10

Hilder, Thomas, *Sámi Musical Performance and the Politics of Indigeneity in Northern Europe* (Washington DC: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2014)

Hirvonen, Vuokko, *Voices from Sápmi: Sámi Women's Path to Authorship* (Kautokeino: DAT, 2008)

Inwood, Brad. *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy, Volume 47* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014)

Jamal, Tazim, and Steve Hill, 'Developing a Framework for Indicators of Authenticity: The Place and Space of Cultural and Heritage Tourism', *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research,* 9:4 (2004) pp. 353–72

Johnson, R. Burke, and Anthony J. Onwuegbuzie, 'Mixed Methods Research: A Research Paradigm Whose Time Has Come', *Educational Researcher*, 33:7 (2004) pp. 14–26

Jones-Bamman, Richard, 'Following in the Footsteps of a Giant: When Fieldwork Past Influences Fieldwork Present, Karl Tirén and *Die Lappische Volksmusik*', *British Journal of Ethnomusicology*, 12:1 (2003) pp. 35–54

Joy, Francis, 'What influence do the old Sámi Noadi drums from Lapland play in the Construction of New Shaman Drums by Sámi Persons Today?', *Folklore*, 56 (2014) pp. 117-158

Keeling, Richard, 'Animal impersonation songs as an ancient musical system in North America, Northeast Asia, and Arctic Europe', *Ethnomusicology,* 56:2 (2012) pp. 234-265

Kent, Neil, *The Sámi Peoples of the North: A Social and Cultural History* (London: Hurst, 2019)

Kenyon, Nicholas, ed., *Authenticity and Early Music: A Symposium* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988)

Kivy, P. 'On the Historically Informed Performance', *The British Journal of Aesthetics,* 42:2 (2002) pp. 128–44

Kjellström Rolf, 'On the Continuity of Old Saami Religion', in *Saami Religion: Based on papers read at the Symposium on Saami Religion held at Åbo, Finland, 16-18 August 1984*, ed. by Ahlbäck T. (Stockholm, Almqvist & Wiksell International, 1987) pp. 25-33

Kus, Susan, 'Archaeologist as Anthropologist: Much Ado about Something after All?', *Journal of Archaeological Method and Theory,* 4:3 (1997) pp. 199–213

La Rocca, David, 'The False Pretender: Deleuze, Sherman, and the Status of Simulacra', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism,* 69:3 (2011) pp. 321–29

Lagerlund, Henrik, and Benjamin Hill, *Routledge Companion to Sixteenth Century Philosophy* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2017)

Laitinen, Heikki, 'Music-Making as a Research Method.' *Ethnomusicology* 38:3 (1994) pp. 408–10

Lane, David, 'Deleuze and Lacoue-Labarthe on the Reversal of Platonism: The Mimetic Abyss', *SubStance,* 40:2 (2011) pp. 105–26

Leddy, Thomas, 'Shusterman's Pragmatist Aesthetics', *The Journal of Speculative Philosophy,* 16:1 (2002) pp. 10–16

Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel, *The Modern Invention of Medieval Music: Scholarship, Ideology, Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002)

Leonenko, Anastassia, 'A Study of *Riddu Riddu* Festival and its role as a cultural tool for ethnic revitalization' (unpublished masters thesis, University of Tromsø, 2008)

Lévi-Strauss, Claude, *Structural Anthropology* (New York: Basic Books, 1974)

Lévi-Strauss, Claude, 'The Structural Study of Myth', *The Journal of American Folklore,* 68:270 (1955) pp. 428–44

Lindholm, Charles. *Culture and Authenticity*, (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2008)

Lüderwaldt, Andreas and Thomas Sebastian Köhn, 'Sámi music', *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online,* (Oxford University Press, 2001) http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/24461. [Accessed 13 March 2017]

Lund, Cajsa, "The Archaeomusicology of Scandinavia." *World Archaeology, 12:3* (1981) pp. 246–65

Mackay, Daniel, *The Fantasy Role-Playing Game: A New Performing Art* (Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 2017)

Martyn-Hemphill, Richard, and Henrik Pryser Libell, 'Who Owns the Vikings? Pagans, Neo-Nazis and Advertisers Tussle Over Symbols', *The New York Times*, 19 March 2018, Section: World

McCalman, Ian, and Paul Pickering, *Historical Re-enactment - From Realism to the Affective Turn* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010)

McKay, Nicholas, 'On Topics Today', *Zeitschrift Der Gesellschaft Für Musiktheorie [Journal of the German-Speaking Society of Music Theory]*, 4: 1-2 (2007) pp. 159-183

Mendoza, Daryl Y, 'Commodity, Sign, and Spectacle: Retracing Baudrillard's Hyperreality', *Kritike* 4:2 (2010) pp. 45–59

Mills, Steve, *Auditory Archaeology: Understanding Sound and Hearing in the Past* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2016)

Minde, Henry, 'Assimilation of the Sami – Implementation and Consequences1', *Acta Borealia,* 20:2 (2003) pp. 121–46

Mirka, Danuta, *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014)

Mitchell, Laura, 'Materiality, Magic and Belief: Framing the Countryside in Fantastical Live-Action Roleplay Games', *Ethnography* 17:3 (2016) pp. 326–49

Mitchell, Laura, 'Volunteers as Monstrous Workers: "Monsters" in UK Live-Action Roleplay Game Organizations', *Culture and Organization*, 25:3 (2019) pp. 233–48

Molino, Jean, J. A. Underwood, and Craig Ayrey, 'Musical Fact and the Semiology of Music', *Music Analysis,* 9:2 (1990) pp. 105–56

Monelle, Raymond, *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music* (Chur, Switzerland: Routledge, 1992)

Morgan, Deirdre. 'Cracking the Code: Recordings, Transmission, Players, and Smiths in the Norwegian Munnharpe Revival', *Ethnomusicology Forum,* 27:2 (2018) pp. 184–212.

Moško, Matej, 'The Peacemaker: LARP game with a political agenda', *Slovenské Divadlo* 63: Special Issue (2015) pp. 87–103

Müller, Dieter K., and Stina Kuoljok Huuva, 'Limits to Sami Tourism Development: The Case of Jokkmokk, Sweden', *Journal of Ecotourism,* 8:2 (2009) pp. 115–27

Nattiez, Jean-Jacques, 'Some Aspects of Inuit Vocal Games', *Ethnomusicology,* 27:3 (1983) pp. 457-475

Nattiez, Jean-Jacques, 'Inuit Throat-Games and Siberian Throat Singing: A Comparative, Historical, and Semiological Approach' *Ethnomusicology* 43:3 (1999) pp. 399–418

Nattiez, Jean-Jacques, *Music and Discourse: Toward a Semiology of Music* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1990)

Nehamas, Alexander, 'Richard Shusterman on Pleasure and Aesthetic Experience', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism,* 56:1 (1998) pp. 49–51

Nettl, Bruno, *The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-One Issues & Concepts,* 2nd edn (Champaign, Illinois: University of Illinois Press, 2005)

Nietzsche, Friedrich Wilhelm. *Twilight of the Idols, or, How to Philosophize with the Hammer*, trans. by Tracy Strong (Indianapolis, Indiana: Hackett Publishing, 1997)

Odom, Amanda, 'An Examination of Living through Enjoyment: Live-Action Role-Play', *Transformative Works and Cultures,* 2 (2009) pp. 1-2

Olsen, Dale A, 'The Complementarity and Interdisciplinarity of Archaeomusicology: An Introduction to the Field and This Volume', *The World of Music*, 49:2 (2007) pp. 11–15

Olsen, Kjell, 'Authenticity as a Concept in Tourism Research: The Social Organization of the Experience of Authenticity', *Tourist Studies,* 2:2 (2002) pp. 159–82

Østern, Anna-Lena, *Dramatic Cultures* (Vasa: Faculty of Education, Åbo akademi, 2004)

Östersjö, Stefan. 'SHUT UP "N" PLAY! Negotiating the Musical Work' (doctoral thesis, University of Malmo, 2008)

Owen, David, 'Performing the Game: Demystifying Live Action Role-Play (LARP)', *Canadian Theatre Review,* 178:1 (2019) pp. 32–37

Peirce, C.S, 'Logic as Semiotic: The Theory of Signs,' in *The Philosophical Writing of Peirce* (Dover: Buchler, 1945)

Peirce, Charles Sanders, and Lady Victoria Welby, *Semiotic and Significs: The Correspondence between Charles S. Peirce and Lady Victoria Welby* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977)

Pietikainen, Sari, and Helen Kelly-Holmes, *Multilingualism and the Periphery* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013)

Pirttijarvi, Ulla, *Honkon Dohkka* (Kautokeino: DAT Publishing, 1995)

Plato, *Sophist*, trans. by Benjamin Jowett (Maryland: Arc Manor, 2011)

Proy, Gabriele, 'Sound and Sign', *Organised Sound,* 7:1 (2002) pp. 15–19

Ramnarine, Tina K, 'Acoustemology, Indigeneity, and Joik in Valkeapää's Symphonic Activism: Views from Europe's Arctic Fringes for Environmental Ethnomusicology', *Ethnomusicology* 53:2 (2009) pp. 187–217

Ramnarine, Tina. *Ilmatar's Inspirations: Nationalism, Globalization and the Changing Soundscapes of Finnish Folk Music (*London: University of Chicago Press, 2003)

Ratner, Leonard Gilbert, *Classic Music Expression Form and Style* (New York: Wadsworth Publishing Co Inc, 1985)

Reed-Danahay, Deborah, *Auto/Ethnography: Rewriting the Self and the Social* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2021)

Routledge, Clay, Jamie Arndt, Tim Wildschut, Constantine Sedikides, Claire M. Hart, Jacob Juhl, Ad J. J. M. Vingerhoets, and Wolff Schlotz, 'The Past Makes the Present Meaningful: Nostalgia as an Existential Resource', *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology,* 101:3 (2011) pp. 638–52

Saitta, Eleanor, Marie Holm-Andersen, and Jon Back, *The Foundation Stone of Nordic Larp* (Sweden: Knutpunkt, 2014)

Schafer, Murray, Raymond, *The Soundscape: Our Sonic Environment and the Tuning of the World* (Vancouver: Destiny Books,1977)

Schlehe, Judith, Michiko Uike-Bormann, Carolyn Oesterle, and Wolfgang Hochbruck, *Staging the Past: Themed Environments in Transcultural Perspectives* (Bielefeld: Transcript Verlag, 2010)

Schofield, John, 'The Archaeology of Sound and Music', *World Archaeology, 46:3* (2014) pp. 289–91

Schuster, Katherine, and David Witkosky, *Language of the Land: Policy, Politics, Identity* (Charlotte, North Carolina: IAP, 2007)

Sexton, Randall, and Ellen Anne Buljo Stabbursvik, 'Healing in the Sámi North', *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry* 34:4 (2018) pp. 571–589

Shelemay, Kay Kaufman, *History, Definitions, and Scope of Ethnomusicology* (New York: Garland, 1990)

Shepherd, John, and Peter Wicke, *Music and Cultural Theory* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1997)

Shusterman, Richard, 'Interpretation, Intention, and Truth', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism,* 46:3 (1988) pp. 399–411

Shusterman, Richard, 'The End of Aesthetic Experience', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism,* 55:1 (1997) pp. 29–41

Shusterman, Richard, 'Somaesthetics: A Disciplinary Proposal', *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 57:3 (1999) pp. 299-313

Simkins, David, *The Arts of LARP: Design, Literacy, Learning and Community in Live-Action Role Play* (Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 2014)

Smith, Daniel W, 'Klossowski's Reading of Nietzsche: Impulses, Phantasms, Simulacra, Stereotypes', *Diacritics,* 35:1 (2005) pp. 8–21

Sørensen, Bent, ed., *5 Faces of Derrida* (Aalborg: Aalborg University, 2005)

Stark, Lizzie, *Leaving Mundania: Inside the Transformative World of Live Action Role-Playing Games* (Chicago: Chicago Review Press, 2012)

Stromberg, Joseph, 'Ancient Migration Patterns to North America Are Hidden in Languages Spoken Today', *Smithsonian* (2014) https://www.smithsonianmag.com/science- nature/ancient-migration-patterns-north-america-are-hidden-languages-spoken-today- 180950053/ [Accessed 29 January 2019]

Stueber, Karsten R., 'The Psychological Basis of Historical Explanation: Re-enactment, Simulation, and the Fusion of Horizons', *History and Theory,* 41:1 (2002) pp. 25–42

Tan, Yi Ting, Gary E. McPherson, Isabelle Peretz, Samuel F. Berkovic, and Sarah J. Wilson, 'The Genetic Basis of Music Ability', *Frontiers in Psychology* 5: 658 (2014) pp. 1-19

Tarasti, Eero, and Thomas Sebeok, *A Theory of Musical Semiotics*, abridged edn (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994)

Taruskin, Richard, 'On Letting the Music Speak for Itself: Some Reflections on Musicology and Performance', *The Journal of Musicology,* 1:3 (1982) pp. 338–49

Tatum, Melissa L, 'Identity and Authenticity in the Filk Community', *Transformative Works and Cultures* 3 (2009) pp. 1-5

Taylor, Charles, *The Ethics of Authenticity* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992)

Till, Rupert, 'Sound Archaeology: Terminology, Palaeolithic Cave Art and the Soundscape', *World Archaeology* 46:3 (2014) pp. 292–304

Timothy, Dallen J., and Stephen W. Boyd, 'Heritage Tourism in the 21st Century: Valued Traditions and New Perspectives', *Journal of Heritage Tourism,* 1:1 (2006) pp. 1–16

Truax, Barry, *Acoustic Communication*, 2nd edn (Westport, Conn: Praeger Publishers Inc, 2000)

Turi, Johan Olafsson, *An Account of the Sámi: A Translation of Muitalus Sámiid Birra* (Chicago: Nordic Studies Press, 2011)

Tychsen, Anders, Michael Hitchens, Thea Brolund, and Manolya Kavakli, 'Live Action Role-Playing Games: Control, Communication, Storytelling, and MMORPG Similarities', *Games and Culture* 1:3 (2006) pp. 252–75

Van Broekhoven, Laura, and Alexander Geurds. *Creating Authenticity: Authentication Processes in Ethnographic Museums* (Leiden: Sidestone Press, 2013)

Vargo, Stephen L, Paul P Maglio, and Melissa Archpru Akaka. 'On Value and Value Co-Creation: A Service Systems and Service Logic Perspective', *European Management Journal*, 26: 3 (2008) pp. 3-43

Vaught, Carl G. 'Semiotics and the Problem of Analogy: A Critique of Peirce's Theory of Categories', *Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society,* 22: 3 (1986) pp. 311–26

Wang, Ning. 'Rethinking Authenticity in Tourism Experience', *Annals of Tourism Research,* 26:2 (1999) pp. 349–70

Wawn, Andrew, *The Vikings and the Victorians: Inventing the Old North in Nineteenth-Century Britain*, new edn (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2002)

Wersland, Elin Margrethe & Rognli, Gjert, *Yoik in the Old Sámi Religion* (Norway: Forlaget Vett & Viten, 2006)

Appendix A: Summary of Fieldwork

1. Jorvik Viking Festival, York, UK. February 2017.

Talk by Einar Selvik: "Wardruna: Thoughts and Tools behind the Music"

Interview with Einar Selvik during the author's professional duties while employed by the York Archaeological Trust.

2. Traenafestivalen, Traena Archipelago, North Sea near Bodø, Norway. July 2017

Attendance by the author as an audience member for Wardruna's performance at the festival.

3. Riddu Riddu Festival, Manndalen, Troms, Norway. July 2017

Attendance by the author as a festival participant, including joik workshops run by Berit Alette Mienna.

Interviews with Johan Mahtes Skum and Berit Alette Mienna.

4. Empire Festival LRP, Dadford, UK. April 2018, June 2018, July 2018 and September 2018.

Attendance by the author as an "in-character" player.

Out-of-character interviews with Roger Finn, Mark Chilvers, James Smart & Su Wainwright

5. Riddu Riddu Festival, Manndalen ,Troms, Norway. July 2018

Attendance by the author as a returning festival participant, including revisiting joik workshops run by Berit Alette Mienna and updating her on how the project was progressing due to her personal interest.

Note on interviews: with the exception of Einar Selvik's interview, which adhered to a stricter structure due to scheduling limitations, all the interviews were semi-structured and were both allowed and encouraged to develop into more natural conversations as the interviews continued. All participants were offered multiple opportunities to follow up with the status of the project, and many have continued to show interest and have inquired as to its later development.

Appendix B: Interview Transcripts

Interview 1: Einar Selvik, 25th February 2017, Jorvik Viking Festival

HD: first of all, I wanted to talk about the general conflict between the popular Viking sound and more historically informed interpretation of Viking sound. So in other words, I'd love to hear your thoughts on what you feel audiences and listeners are generally expecting when they're coming into this kind of environment and whether there's a particular kind of sound they're more comfortable with when, that they associate with Norse imagery?

ES: Yeah well, conflict is perhaps not the word I would use but, of course there is a difference, I think people are going for feeling. There are certain instrumental elements, certain sounds and I would say perhaps also techniques of instrumental techniques that automatically gives associations to both Norse music but also to historical music. Beyond Norse music, that I would say is quite universal, or at least you see it in many different countries, if you go far enough back in time. Music and musical techniques are quite closely related, and for instance, drone type instruments, where you have the continuity of sounds, where you have one note, for instance if it's a string instrument you have one string playing on one note, and you have a melody string going on top. That's a certain thing you see in most cultures, you find it in flutes, and various string instruments, even going back to Bronze age, you can see this continuity of sound where they always come in pairs, which is, in my personal belief, one of the reasons is precisely that- continuity of sound. But I don't know what people… I think there's a difference, some people... I remember when I started, not when I started, but when I released the first album, I remember reading or, I saw quickly that some people they automatically think it's "Viking music". For me, that has ever been my intention, nor to necessarily do it authentically at any cost, but certainly not to limit it to any time period. I would say, if it is related to a time period, it was way pre-Viking age. But you get people who automatically assume that this is Viking music, but you also get those who sort of, "er, what is this?! This is not Viking music!", thinking that that was my intention, because it definitely was not, I sort of, apply both the instruments, the tools, the thoughts, and apply it to a modern soundscape, and that is all. Made for modern ears to respond to.

HD: So, it doesn't affect your creative process as a composer or a group, you're not thinking

about that while [working]?

ES: No, but I am, this is something I've quite extensively studied, so, even though I say that my aim is never to necessarily make authentic music, a lot of what I do is authentic, or quite close to being authentic. But of course I mix old and modern, so, but I do find it important in my work to build on solid grounds, I do a lot of research on different things, and try out many different things, and speak to experts and do a lot of background research, both when it comes to poetic structures or... yeah, instrumental techniques, it's a lot of it's based on authentic things but sort of adapted and to a contemporary context and soundscape

HD: There's no pressure to remain authentic during that?

ES: No, I think that I could do that, I could try and re-enact, which I sometimes do when I create for *Vikings [television series]*, I sometimes create authentic sections of music, but me personally, I think that by doing that, it would make the project quite uninteresting, it would sort of be a statement that "this is the past", and for me, it's not the past: it's something that is relevant today now, it's a living tradition and in order to make it interesting again, you need to- well in order for certain ideas to deserve the right of life, it need to carry a relevance, or else we can put it in a museum or preserve it. I'm not doing preservation in that sense

HD: I suppose music is never really designed to remain fixed as one thing, is it?

ES: no, and there is a difference between traditional music and folk music. Folk music is something that always evolves and in many ways, so much of the material I work with and dig in, is very fragmented, and spare, I would say- it's a huge fragmented puzzle, so there's bound to... you can chisel this in stone or be very... it will, in any case, if you're trying to make Viking music again, if that was the case, you would have to be quite humble in the sense that there's a lot of things we don't know- and that's fine!

HD: That's how I approach a lot of my research- accepting that there are some things that we just won't know, and so you have to make peace with that, in a way.

ES: Yeah, you see it even in modern pagan religious cycles- that you have a lot of people who are trying to copy the past, with a modern mindset, and many of these are sort of squeezing a square into a round hole, in a sense because a lot of these old things are simply not relevant anymore- they don't fit into our world, and ...

HD: their purpose doesn't exist in the same way?

ES: No, they don't, and so carrying around a heavy sack of empty symbols is just meaningless, and you don't get any... like the example I gave yesterday with the sailor ritual- if I'd done what I described, people would instantly fear me and respect me because they would have understood the power of the relics I had, and the symbolic rite...

HD: So if you were setting out purely to re-enact and to maintain a very strict definition of what we view Viking music as, how do you think audiences would respond to that, based on how you've interacted with them so far- do you think they would react in the same way? If you were to do that?

ES: No, because our modern ears are adjusted to a certain soundscape, we're accustomed to certain things, so what might have carried power, or more power, back then, doesn't carry the same power. That being said, I would say that in a phonogram this would at least apply as to

releasing music- a CD, it would be difficult to have the same impact. But of course in a live setting, like I talked about yesterday also, that it also comes down to performance, because the format of which I performed yesterday is quite close to what you can call "authentic". Many people experience it as authentic as well, it is quite close to it, so in a live interaction, I think it's different and I think it potentially can carry the same reaction, or can cause the same reactions. But then it comes down to various other things and lies within performance. And that is timeless things- how you interact, what you give, that melding between what you are and what you sing. When those things meld together, that's when you create change. That's when you create impact. That's when people react- when you are what you sing, and I wouldn't limit that to any time period, that's universal.

HD: That's something that's always existed.

ES: Yes, and it comes down to the quality of the performance. And, so potentially, same impact in a live interaction but on a CD, I don't think it would carry the same power.

HD: I have a couple more questions about that side of things, the changing of a location or a sound, - I mean a wider meaning of "location", I'm interested in the idea of our modern ears being very attuned to a certain soundscape and I'm wondering how far that goes in order to create what we would deem as a popular Nordic sound, so what I'm thinking about here is mainly fantasy based media- that uses a lot of very heavily influenced Norse/Viking ideas, so mostly I'm talking about Tolkien, and I'm talking about things like the Elder Scrolls games, and Game of Thrones and things like that- more specifically the sound tracks and the composers who work with them, whether they are holding that perhaps even subconsciously in their creative process when they're trying to conjure a certain image of "Norseness" as it were.

ES: I think that many of them miserably fail; and because the problem with, I would say that film scores- there are, they are, I think many people like film scores, because they do push boundaries, they are instrumental, they do welcome in the native instruments, but very often it's sort of a… it is sort of a profession where things are, where art is compromised, in very large scale, because the tempo and amount of music that you have to produce in such a limited amount of time is so big that these composers have huge teams, just almost making the music for them, and they come in and sort of do the final touch on things. But I think the problem with that is that we've become accustomed to almost hearing what's going to happen on the screen before it happens, because they do these clichés and I think the problem with it also is that they tend to paint with the same palette whether or not it's Star Wars or Iron Age- it's the same clichés, it's the same orchestral palate. But on the other hand, people are accustomed to hearing it, so I do think they, a lot of people think it's authentic.

HD: They think they're getting the image that they want, whereas perhaps more a degree of comfort than anything else.

ES: Yeah, but that goes for the director as well- it's safe, they're safe basically, and working with Vikings has been sometimes pushing through, or sometimes channelling that has been interesting and challenging in itself. Because, yeah, no but I think Vikings realise that they get a lot for free by buying these authentic textures at least to indicate some sort of authenticity.

HD: So, the next topic is to do with the politicisation of the Viking aesthetic, and I'm speaking more on broader terms here, not just musically- I'm referring mainly to the historic politicising of it so what I'm thinking of mostly here is, the kind of things Wagner perpetuated while he

was composing and while his operas were being circulated publicly, and I remember what you were mentioning yesterday about misuse of Viking tradition since, well, pre, during and since WW2. And that there's perhaps a sense of shame post WW2 in associating yourself too strongly with this imagery. What I'm interested in is whether that particular historic attitude permeates within these kinds of musical circles now, whether these people are still wary of it, even today?

ES: Yes, the last 15 years I have, or quite instantly, I remember the first TV interview I did on Norwegian national TV, the day we released our first album, and the first thing I had to do was defend my music, basically. The seriousness behind it, and I had to be clear on this not being some right-wing approach to it, or political at all! But that's fine, that's something I'm prepared for doing, and something I have strong opinions upon, and it's about reclaiming our heritage and getting past this Nazi ghost- clinging to these symbols. When it comes to Wagner of course, he didn't have control over who liked his music, nor do I. I know there are certain movements who like my music that I wish didn't, but on the other hand, I am very clear on these matters and will always be. So it's out of my control, so I don't feed the beast by focusing on it or on that part. But what was your question, really?

HD: it was mostly on your thoughts on how far it permeates among your fellow musicians, so who work in similar circles to yourself?

[section omitted; off topic]

ES: oh, well I feel that in this, I feel that there is a movement where people want the real information, and information is more available now than ever, and I feel that even going to runic studies, people don't want the modern rune law anymore, they want to know the real thing, they want to study the sources, they want to- so I feel there is a movement, a healthy movement I would say, also, countering the polarised stereotypical, these right wing movements that cultivate things still, there is a counter movement to this, which is healthy, because the fact is that if you want to be taken serious, you have to be clear on these matters, you cannot play these festivals where all of these, where you possibly can get associated with these movements, but I have to say it is difficult and it is a challenging part of navigating here, because if you get that stamp on your art, it's difficult to fight it!

HD: it's difficult to control where your work goes, and how it can be parcelled off and reinterpreted, which I imagine is what happened to Wagner, really, at the end of the day

ES: Yes, so it's something I'm really wary about, and since I've sort of done a bit of pioneering in that, I get a lot of people who ask me advice on these matters, so it is, like I said there is a movement of serious people who are actually, yeah, generally, it's a cultural thing, it's for sure a cultural thing, it's not a political thing, and that is healthy. And like I said, if you want to be taken seriously, you need to be clear on these matters. Same goes for festivals- I recently was asked to perform at a festival in France, quite big festival that did a stupid mistake of inviting, last year, a band which is known for being right wing, having a huge right wing audience, so they ended up in the newspapers all over France in that period and they want to get me to perform there again and of course- I cannot do that. I said if you want to be taken seriously- if you want serious acts, you cannot, I'm sorry, because in this type of thing you cannot, unfortunately you only get one chance.

HD: once it's happened once, that's it

ES: yes, you have the anti-right and these people who are basically just as bad as the far right, in a sense- they're looking for any reason whatsoever to fight, or to… something to be against, and unfortunately they are blocking serious acts as well because they don't care if it's true, if people have been unfortunate to get a certain rumour, so you have to be careful these days.

HD: but you say there's a general cultural shift now, that people are being more encouraged to think about where things are coming from and where things are really originating from and whether they've been repurposed or not

ES: Yeah, it's not only the subcultures that have interest in these things any more, like in Norway, it's families, it's people of all ages, of different cultural backgrounds and there is a, "we are more than they" now, which is a good thing- we can take it back now, so the interest that the popular culture has, the opportunity that has given us is quite interesting to watch really. Just going back 10 years, it wasn't like this; So to see people in Norway finally being proud of their history and viewing it, not through the eyes of British and German Christian monks, or nor through the sort of, yeah getting past that Nazi or right wing misuse of our culture, getting past that is really something that is important. A tree without roots falls. I don't think that your roots are important just because they are your roots, it needs to carry relevance still, but there are a lot of things that are worth remembering. It's a tradition that was shaped by our land, by the people living in our land which is the premise of any nature based religion, so, and we live in the same land still, which is why many of these things do carry relevance still. And also I would say that, in terms of what we can learn from our past, that the whole idea of a poly-theistic way of viewing the world is that your personal belief, or your family's personal beliefs are sort of shaped by your surrounding nature, your mountain, your creek, your field, your forest, your profession, and your neighbours. Their beliefs are sort of shaped by the same governing laws, so accepting differences- that is fine. If that's something completely different than what you believe, that's fine, because…

HD: Your beliefs are being shaped by everything around you.

ES: yeah, they're bound to be different, that's my point, and in a time, in an age where we yet again are being challenged by different cultures and beliefs merging together in the same society, we have something to learn from the past, from that open mindedness towards thinking differently, which is, yeah, we've been taught for the last 1000 years to fear anything that is different, to look down upon on anything that is different, and that is the premise of the universal religion such as Christianity or many other universal religions, it's based on the thought that your own faith is superior to others, which is something we don't need, we need to respect that belief is something personal

HD: Next, I just wanted to talk about, as I briefly mentioned to you before, changing the "location" of a sound, so that can be either in space or in time, so in other words, what the effect on listener and performer relationships with that sound would be, bearing in mind the location of specific sound that was intended for a certain place and time, has been changed. So in other words, the wider meaning of "location", for example the recording of an instrument in a space that it was not ever intended to be recorded in when it was first built. I'd just like to hear your thought on that, and how you approach those kinds of questions in your own creative process?

ES: So you mean by taking it out of its natural element?

HD: That and just taking it out of its historical element as well, so the deliberate act of using

historical instruments in contemporary music for example.

ES: well, I would say that it depends of course upon the quality of them, but in my experience, a lot of these old instruments have a very cinematic quality to them that you can hear when you perform them in their natural element as well, be it on a

hill, or in a cave or whatever, so, I would say it depends. Some of the instruments I use you can sort of instantly hear that they do fit very well into a modern more visual cinematic soundscape. So I think that the fact that I hunt for these soundscapes that compliment them, which is the goal- to create a new natural element for them, in a sense. I apply that to when performing as well. Ever since the very beginning, where we perform has been important to perform in a setting that somehow compliments the music where it feels right, whether it's directly and very obviously something that compliments it or it can be more subtle, but it's my experience that that enhances both the experience for the audience and for us, and it creates this special atmosphere, this more sacred space, in a sense. I think that probably a bit off the topic, but I think that s lot of people connect to the music in a personal sense, and I think a lot of people react very strongly when we do perform live as well, emotionally, and I think one of the reasons is that a lot of people who are not Christian or go to the mosque or church or wherever you go to these sacred spaces, we don't get to experience that holy ritual solemn space anymore where you feel connectedness or connect to something bigger than yourself whether it's a spiritual thing or just a philosophical thing, or emotional thing, and creating that sort of framework is a bit what we're doing when we perform with Wardruna, it's something neutral and very much connected to nature I would say, not in any specific religious direction, or yeah not limited to any specific direction, it's more about nature. Human nature and nature itself.

HD: perhaps something to give listeners the conduit with which to feel whatever it is to feel whatever it is that they want to feel

ES: Exactly, and that is something I think a lot about when I create music- that there is room for the listener. I don't serve any "truths" or preach any specific things, it's more about throwing out questions and ideas and images for people to find their own self within.

HD: to respond to?

ES: Yes

HD: So, do you feel that that level of connectedness and that conduit for people to respond to in whatever way they want or need, do you think that also translates when you're recorded as a CD?

ES: Yes, I do. And something I'm very wary of- that there is space, that the music is not to colour with my own stuff, or that is it, that it has the purpose of being something that you can find your own version of.

HD: so with the work of, I'm thinking mainly of Wardruna's work here, creating pieces surrounding each different rune in the wider system of runes, I'm interested in the special context of when particularly that is being recorded, when you're working on those particular projects, what happens to a sound or a musical idea that is meant for particular runic circumstances or that is meant for outdoors or something like that, when it's then moved to a studio?

ES: well I try to process it as little as possible, and rather work around it work on those premises given at the space where I'm recording, rather than trying to force it into a shape, and a lot of the idea is to interpret each rune as closely as possible, on their own premises. So many of the runes are sort of my starting point are these sounds created in a certain space, be it ice, that I have pulled out from a glacier, several thousand year old ice tuned and sampled the sound,

and that's the starting point. Or torches, being swung in the air so it tears the air and creates a certain sound, that has been a starting point, be it the playing on the trees or, so on these songs where this has sort of being a natural premise, where you have these obvious audible qualities that you can play on, that has been the starting point, that I start with that and then I, the rest is basically supporting it and cultivating it, giving it the space it needs, so I try to let that environment be the composer, and have me being he instrument.

HD: So, it's always started with the rune, in its most basic form, and it's allowed to evolve in whichever way.

ES: Yes, but of course, some of these are very obvious in that some have a symbolic meaning, that is more direct, it's easier, it's a very tangible idea that you can easily see or connect to a sound, so you get the strong associations right away. But you have also the runes that are connected to ideas that are more difficult to capture.

HD: more loosely interpreted

ES; yes, but of course I've done, I've gone to some extremes in that sense as well, like for instance when working with the Naudir rune which is if you translate the word, it means "need", not as in "want", but as in "being in the deepest need", like "you're never as strong as you are when you are in deep, deep need", the fire that ignites when you're at the crossing point between either succumbing to death or finding the power to survive. That is Naudir, and trying to recreate that feeling, I fasted for between 2 and 3 days, and I went into the mountains and I had almost no clothes on and it was snowing sideways and I started to walk, and I reached that point, where it was dangerous, where I had to, and then I started to record some of the vocals for that. And, I decided at a very early stage, that on these matters, I didn't want to cheat. I could easily cheat for comfortable reasons, but I strongly believe that subconsciously or consciously, the receiver or listener will know the difference. There is nourishment behind this sound, nourishment is perhaps a good word for it.

HD: Ok, I'm interested in the use, and the sort of repurposing of the archaeological remains of instruments that we've got from that period, so I'm looking more specifically at what we would usually deem as the Viking ages so like 8th-10th century, so in the strictest definition…

ES: You want to specify it, specifically

HD: yeah, it applies to any archaeological remains really but that the areas I'm focusing on, in its strictest definition it's a situation where the context is present, the instrumental find is present but, the expression isn't. So, it's been in the ground for however many years- a thousand years, it exists as pieces of an instrument or an instrument that was discarded for whatever reason but has been neglected over the thousand years it's been in the ground so, hypothetically, it's a situation in which context is present without expression- how is expression therefore subsequently added?

ES: Well, it can be various things, for instance, the horn instrument we have, you have instruments like long horns, found from Viking age, they are quite limited in what you can and cannot do, they are limited, depending on the length, if they're long enough, you can produce 8 tones of the harmonic scale, which you see in later use also, being quite unchanged. So that gives you a quite clear idea. Also, you have cow horns, found from Swedish mountains, one from 500s, one from 7-800s, which we have been able to reconstruct quite identically, so we know that they have 3 finger holes, so we know what notes they had…

HD: you know the exact tuning? What notes are capable etc?

ES: Yes, so if you can compare it to, this is a living tradition of using these instruments, so, and it's quite unchanged actually, tuning wise, so this also can give you quite a… that's also quite a strong indicator of the use and also we know its function- it's about communicating over vast distances so this calling tunes are, they've changed little throughout time. When it comes to string instruments, of course it's more difficult to say, exact tunings, you have to base it on these other elements, where you have melodic reference, where we have notation that is quite old, but also within these instruments described, there are notations so and the oldest material we have from traditional tunes also indicates a connectiveness with these old findings so, it's, the list is longer of elements to take into account, like …flutes and poetry, which again we have later references connecting these poetic structures to specific melodies and rhythms that were normally applied when written in this poetic structure, you use this melody and this rhythm etc. That also can indicate something when you compare the rhythms to the oldest folk music we have, there also seems to be connectedness. My point is, in any case, that to be able to recreate or, you need to have a broad overview of sources. You need to sort of see the lines that are possibly connected and then what you find on paper will only take you this far, but me having the nerdiness of the, the scholarly nerdiness to what I do, but I'm a practitioner also, so I can take many of the thesis that musical archaeologists throughout, and I can see quite effectively if this, if they are supported by nourishment, or if it simply wouldn't work in a practical sense. Because sources will only take you so far, and then it comes down to a more practical, intuitive, because any performer at any point in time doesn't cultivate what works, when it front of an audience, and space comes into this, there are elements that you need to account for when you sort of applying all of these theories into practical use, so sometimes it becomes quite obvious, and sometimes it becomes more blurry and you basically have to just make a decision and go for it. Luckily, I don't have to defend my songs in any sense. In the scholarly world, are sort of opening their eyes more and more to what I'm doing, because they see that there is nourishment behind it, they see that I base what I do on quite solid ground and I can defend quite a lot of it and also, I would say foremost, it is about the feeling it creates- that feeling is authentic, I think also they perceive it as something that, "yes, this might work, and if it works now, it works- that's a timeless thing", and I've been lucky enough to speak in front of some of the biggest experts in Norse poetry and at Oxford University, last year, and I've done so in… so it's interesting to see that the scholarly world are also opening up for combned practical, where theory and practice is sort of merged, and you see the effect of that, and it should be interesting. Thankfully it is, and I think if more of these professions would speak more to each other, the archaeologist and the literature people, should speak more often, I think we could save some time.

HD: I'm really interested in the idea of you using the word "nourishment", which is a word I've not thought of really in relation to this area of discussion, and it does work really well. Which leads nicely into the last thing I want to discuss which is that, speaking in more general terms,

the power of, what I guess we could call "displaced nostalgia", and its ability to emotionally colour artistic interpretations of cultures that, for want of a better phrase, are no longer there- so for example, essentially it's wanting to belong to something that essentially you weren't born into, that you're not a part of and nobody is a part of because it's not there any more, so I'm thinking more specifically of re-enactors here and the importance that they hold on their identities as re-enactors and the characters that they're creating through what they do in living history settings and the like. I'd just be really interested to hear your thoughts on that from the kind of work you do?

ES: I think that people have a need today to collect to something else and to something they perceive as better. I've, personally I don't have a nostalgic relation to history, not at all. I don't believe that living was so much better before, but to me I have to say, personally, I don't find the Viking age very interesting. I think it's represented a period of migration, where people are moving out, where people are losing their ways, where people are forgetting their tradition. They are industrialising, they are cutting down the forests, they are at war all the time, so for me I don't, especially the Viking age, I don't see it as a period that I find very interesting in a contemporary setting. That's where I work. I'm focusing more on what's interesting and useful today, the Viking age does not represent something that is useful today, in my opinion. Even if you go further back in time, back to the bronze age where you have these traditions that are more nature based, more circular, more balanced in a sense, I do, that's of course difficult, and you have to hunt for information, but I like hunting. But I don't know, the displaced nostalgia, I see it as a very natural thing and in a sense I think it's more healthy than unhealthy because I think history is important. I think if people know history more, more about their ow history and other people's history, religious history, especially perhaps, I think we would have fewer problems, because when you see this, you don't have to know a lot about religious history to understand how religion has been used for politics, the last 5000 years, and how these go in circles, and shift shape, and these modern grand religions are just based on other patterns which have been there for thousands of years, just shifted a shape, so I think it's a good healthy thing, I think it's a part of the re-enactment tradition that not only focuses on religion, a lot of it is about craftmanship, about art, aesthetics, about poetry and history, which is something I think we need more of. And also, I think people want to feel proud of something, and having good feelings makes you a better person, quite simply. If you feel good, you are good, and vice versa, so I think it's a positive movement. I have more problems with some of the displaced nostalgic religious where some of them are sort of connecting problems within their own society to their version of the old ideas, and then it becomes problematic. For instance, a lot of American pagans are sort of applying that whole identity crisis to that displaced nostalgia, and then it becomes a problem. Then they're sort of nourishing that right wing unhealthy approach to history, in my opinion. So there is a difference in this modern movements I would say. I think the biggest movement is healthy.

HD: So contemporary re-enactors are responding to a feeling that is very natural and has always existed?

ES: yes, and in a sense, it's also about playfulness, about playing out certain sites, be it the warrior or be it… it can be many different things, and I think that's a healthy space to be in.

HD: a lot of re-enactors' characters are basically just extensions of themselves, the ones that I know personally anyway, they're basically half and half as their re-enactment identity and themselves, you can't really separate the two.

ES: Yeah, but that's a good point, because at any point in history we can't only cultivate these stereotypical images of it, people have always been people, so, no but it's, just sitting around a fire is a normal form of therapy, actually, so connecting with a natural element once again is,, I think a lot of people scoff at the re-enactment movement as something not serious or they think it's a bit silly or childish, but I don't know, I think it has some very good aspect to it and I think if more people tried it, which more and more people are doing, I don't know about here but in Norway this movement is growing, it's huge, so and I think people start out thinking it's silly but they come to these markets every year and the next time they buy some clothes and these borders are slowly moving, but boiling it down, I think it's a good thing, more so than not. I think the positive effects of it is for, is good.

Interview 2: Johan Máhtes Skum, 15th July 2017, Riddu Riddu Festival

HD: this project that you've been working on for the festival and with the museum, it's to encourage people to come and listen to old joiks, and to provide new ones, is that correct?

JM: yes, it's for people to have the opportunity to come and listen joiks from the archive, and then also as you say, if they have any additional information about these joiks, or joiks that are new to the archive, that they think would be necessary or important to have in the archives

HD: have you experienced many new joiks being offered to the project during this festival?

JM: I have experienced that there are people who come by and they listen to joiks and they have stories about these joiks, and they have they have, I don't have the full archive, but what it includes or what's in the whole archive, so I am unsure if these joiks I have recorded these days, if they are new, or if they exist in the archive already but I will take these recordings with me to my boss and he will decide if they are already in the archive or if they are new

HD: ok, and how, personally, how would you like to see an archive such as this developing? I remember earlier when you were discussing what kind of joiks are continuing today, you mentioned an emphasis on wanting to see more storytelling.

[section omitted; short discussion clarifying language]

HD: how would you want to see an archive such as this being used?

JM: I think it's important that people, that the archive is available for people that want to, like yesterday, there came a man and he listened, he saw in the catalogue "oh that's my grandfather's joik! I never heard that- can I listen to it?!", yes of course, and it's a beautiful joik and I never heard it and it was very interesting to hear, and that is also one of the best happenings, what happens when I sit there and people come and discover joiks that the, of people they know, but haven't heard before, that have been forgotten. But that, I think it's important that the archive is available for people to listen, or also, of course, it's already available for researchers that would want to do research and so on, but I also think it's important that everyone on the street, well, if they have the desire to see the archive, they should be able to, at least to contact the museum and ask for permission

HD: And would you say it would be good to, a resource like this would be good for encouraging people to keep the tradition going in the future?

JM: of course, I this is more like throwing a stone in a glass house, but there are, this x-factor, they're, there's a new phenomenon that I've been thinking about is, all this talent progammes on TV, all these idols, American idols or yeah, all these contests where only the best singers are on top and they can sing, and if you're not on the talent programme then you can't sing and I think that's a problem for our society- that me and you, we are not good enough to sing, and also I think that is a parallel to the joik, that if you're not good enough at joiking then you're not allowed, or, "allowed" is maybe not the right to say, but you're not good enough to joik

HD: so you feel there's a hierarchy there?

JM: yeah, maybe, but not as maybe more in our minds than reality I think, and also that, I think, maybe the archive could be a good help to have to help people to still have joik as part of their life [and make it more accessible].

HD: so, for example with the joiking course that you alluded to briefly earlier, what are your thoughts on course like that that actually seem to instruct people on how to joik, and more specifically, the idea of instructing non-Sami people how to joik- what are your thoughts about that? Is it something that you think is to be encouraged? How do you feel about non-Sámi people learning to joik?

JM: well, that is a question that has been discussed a lot around in media and social media- there are many thoughts on that, but I think that maybe if more and more people know about joik, know, because if you are on a course like this, you will learn some joiks, but you can't say that you are a joiker, and I don't think that would be any threat to the traditional joiking, because there are still tradition joikers around, so I don't think there is any threat to the traditional joiking but that will also make people and non-Sámi people more aware of the Sámi joiking, what it is and how it could sound, and maybe also kill some myths and this is what we call educating people and society.

HD: and that's something to be encouraged?

JM: yes.

HD: I think that's something that seems very much in Sámi consciousness right now, is to help dispel some of these myths and intolerances that have existed throughout the past

JM: yes, because we can have as much political parties and issues to work with, but we need to educate people on the ground floor, we can't only work up on top with political systems and so on- people need to know more, because there are a lot of myths that exist that maybe are not true, but some of them are maybe true but with additions

HD: and in terms of how, thinking more about how joiks are made, and the process of them coming into existence, when they're being recorded, either whether they're being recorded for an archive or whether they're being recorded for CDs or just any kind of digital file, do you think this could start changing the way joiks are made, when people are making them knowing them that is the result- knowing that they will end up recorded in that way?

JM: There are people, especially elderly people, that already have criticised the way of, nowadays, joiking, that is not the old way of joiking, and that, they're but on the other hand you can't, I think that if something is going to live- a tradition, a language, a joik, it is going to live further, it has to change constantly, you can't stop it, if you stop it I think it would stop and die because of course some people will know it, to a point, and then if they are gone, it's gone, so there are of course this me myself, I am influenced by the western music we hear it all day on the radio- pop music is this tempered musical system with equal notes and equal distances, but like all folk music they are natural toning scale and those things disappear more and more and that is maybe natural because we have all the time we hear western pop music all day long, and I don't know if we can stop that or we can get away from that, but I think maybe something new comes.

[section omitted; short discussion clarifying language & question specifics]

HD: Something else that I wondered about, people's mindsets when they're creating joiks, something else I wondered about, something that Berit mentioned about its now a bit more important to know who made the joik, that you're joiking previously they would sort of travel between communities, you would hear them and you would perform them but you wouldn't necessarily know exactly who first made it whereas now you do tend to- now they tend to be named- to have names associated with them, and I wonder if now, when people are creating joiks, if their creative process is different, because they know their name is going to stay with it, and I wondered what you thought about that?

JM: yeah, I have been, I've seen that, more and more, myself I have composed or made 2 joiks in my life, and both of those joiks are registered with my name. I don't know what to think about that but of course maybe that also has made me more drawn back, or not as much offensive in making joiks, because I know that it's not necessary but it could happen that my name possibly would be on that joik, me as a composer and I think that "oh, I am not good enough", for making a joik that could live so long, but maybe if that wasn't an issue I maybe would be more offensive.

HD: so to clarify, that you're saying is you feel a little bit more reluctant, to put material out there knowing that your name would be attached to it? Ok, so do you think that joik has kind of evolved into its own form of communication, kind of separate to any language or culture, or if not, could you see it doing that, in the future?

JM: It has always been a kind of set of communication, because it has been used by reindeer herders for example for keeping wolves or predators away from reindeer herds, and it also has been a form of communication like when you're travelling, skiing over the mountains so you can, especially within cold winter days, sound goes far and you can hear far away who's coming when he's joiking, and also this joik has been kind of memorising other people for example, so it has already been a king of communicative musical form

HD: And it will stay that way?

JM: hopefully, I think so, and I hope so, but nowadays, more of the joik has been more like a because they have this, like my home town, they have this competition like similar to Eurovision and there is a joik competition and there, so the joik has been more like a stage thing that you perform on stage, whereas before, in the past, it was more like you could be in a group, or when you were gathered, like at weddings, you could joik

HD: So it could come and go in its own time?

JM: yes, but now it's more like, you're on the stage, you have 2 minutes and then you're done

HD: so in personal joiks, when you were mentioning the 3 different types of joiks, the personal, storytelling and the spiritual ones, in personal joiks, are there sort of when you're settling down to actually create one, are there many pre-determined ideas or goals in your head already or do you just let it come to you?

JM: because the joik is kind of describable, the joik melody and rhythm will describe your joik, so to make create a joik, you need to know the person or the object that you're making the joik for, you need to know it quite well. For example, someone would say that they can make a joik for you now, but I wouldn't. I couldn't do that because I don't know you well enough, I could make a kind of joik, but, I wouldn't be happy about it.

HD: because that's quite a gift to give somebody, isn't it?

JM: yes it is, because I wouldn't be satisfied that you get a joik that is not done properly so yes you have to know the person quite well- how the person walks, how the person speaks, or makes gestures, o if you are a kind person or if you a fast person, a slow person, a big person, a small person, all these things you need to know, and then you can sort of hear it- the joik.

HD: I have one more question- when, again it's to do with the process of joik and its potential for sort of changing as circumstances change, but I', thinking more of when the natural environment for a joik in its most natural tradition setting changes, so for example so, when areas are deforested, when things to do with country borders and issues to do with climate change come into play, is there a, is there much of a change in the creative process when performing or creating joiks when those kind of changes impede on the lifestyle of Sámi people in that area? Does it evolve in response to that?

JM: I mentioned a bit earlier, I think joik or any cultural thing needs to evolve and needs to change so I think it will change in time, it will come to a, it will not stop, but it will come to a, it will evolve with any other change that is because, nowadays, even, taxi has a joik, and a motorbike has its joik, so that's also a sign of it evolving or changing.

HD: there was one last thing I forgot, actually, it's very closely related to that, so we've established that joik will keep evolving and it has kept evolving- do you think it will stay very much imbedded as a part of Sami culture, or could it evolve on its own as a method of emotional or spiritual output, for example, in general more in new age settings- do you think there's a chance that it could reach those kind of platforms?

JM: I never thought about that but, then we can ask the question, will the Sami keep being some or will they change to something else? Because I think that every culture is evolving and changing, so I don't know. There are like this hippy movement in the 70s, in solidarity you pick things part of any culture and mix them together and at that time is was more in solidarity to enlighten and get cultures up to show them but maybe nowadays we've forgot them and its more cultural appropriation.

Interview 3: Berit Alette Mienna, 15th July 2017, Riddu Riddu Festival

Note I: Berit Alette Mienna communicated principally in Norwegian and North Sámi. The following transcript excerpts are taken from the English translation provided by Soile Hamalainen from UiT, who also translated the interviewer's questions into Norwegian for Ms Mienna. Ms Hamalainen was present for this interview, and all translations were made in real time throughout the conversation. Ms Mienna was fully aware that the interviewer would be predominantly using the English translations for the purposes of this project and verbally consented to this prior to signing her copy of the consent form (See Appendix C, Document 5).

Note II: Ms Mienna's passages begin in 3rd person due to Ms Hamalainen translating them this way. As the conversation progressed, Ms Hamalainen directly translated using 1st person.

HD: so, first of all, I wanted to ask about your thoughts when you first started doing this… course for adults, and what were your feelings initially about teaching non-Sámi people how to Joik?

BM: she [Berit] wanted to wake up the "Joik" inside, residing within other people, and at the same time she also wanted to inform about several things at the same time, like some of the history, some of the language, some of the … thinking, so that this information should come out.

HD: So, you viewed it as an opportunity to help people understand more about the Sámi?

BM: this is one of the things- to spread information, but also for her, Joik is also her way back to her own culture and then teaching it to the non-Sámi people- teaching these things is also a way of reflecting what is the Sámi thing- it is an opportunity to reflect on these things when it comes out of other people who have no idea. There is this discussion and has been discussion in some communities- why should non-Sámi people learn Joik, and also this thing that is the person learning Joik is Sámi enough so and all these questions have helped her to find her own point of view and where she stands in relation to these questions, and what does she really want with this thing? She perceives it as creating, understanding and bonding between the cultures by learning Joik by non-Sámi people, that this is something that basically everybody can do and by doing it they can understand what it is about- it is a Sámi tradition. Also, between individuals- so not only cultures but between individual people. Because there has been a great, great, intolerance towards the Sámi-whatever- the Sámi Culture, the Sámi people, the Sámi expressions, that you share something that is very basically Sámi, it contributes to understanding more about, and it contributes to counteract this intolerance, it breeds tolerance when you share and when you create understanding around these things.

HD: So, when you hear a non-Sámi person that you have taught making a Joik, how does it make you feel?

BM: For me it's a gift, that somebody do it, and want to share it, it's a big gift and I want that more and more people share. One example is a man who is performing his own joik and there is no greater gift than when someone like him comes and opens himself and shares because it's a very intimate experience.

[section omitted; specific discussion of individual who had not consented to be part of this project]

BM: of course, I could have started analysing what he was doing and those parts were not that "Joik-y", but this was his first step and how can this thing grow if not in allowance and in loving atmosphere around that someone wants to share and you have to be allowing and you have to be loving and welcoming when someone starts developing this kind of thing.

HD: So yesterday, you mentioned that melodies and pitches within Joik stay fairly simple in the cycles- is this so that everybody can learn easily and make the technique more accessible to people? Do you think that's why it has stayed that wasy through the tradition?

BM: It's rather so that life is simple, nature is simple and we complicate things. And Joik is simple as life and as nature and it is about being present and that is actually a very simple thing and that it what it's all about- we don't need to make it very… we don't need to make a big embroidery about it, that's because it is about being simple, it is about being present basically and that is what life requires. In the simpleness, the simplicity, the greatness lies.

[section omitted; brief off-topic conversation]

BM: Going back to the first question, before the next one- the Sámi have been very oppressed-under a lot of pressure but it's not only about Sámi, it's about individuals that have been under hard pressure. As an individual I have not been allowed to be myself. It's like a healing journey, when you are able to give something to other people who are curious about what is this, and you encounter it with this allowance, with this loving kindness and it lifts up the self and being that way helps to also process my own things- meeting those other people with the skilled space and giving space to their own expression and their curious and their willingness to approach this thing. The skills are a new experience of how to be a Sámi, how to express my "Sámi-ness", so it also lifts up the Sámi-ness to something new.

HD: That does relate to a wider question I was going to ask though actually; you mentioned it's innate reflection of your Sámi-ness, since Joik has become more revived in recent decades, would you say that it's continuing to evolve still as a part of wider Sámi culture, or could the vocal style of Joik on its own be separated and evolve separately from that? For example, as a method of emotional or spiritual output. Do you think it could evolve separately from the rest of Sámi culture in that regard?

[section omitted; language clarification]

HD: So, the method of Joik itself, its use as a tool for healing and for spiritually charged connection with one's natural environment- is that something that you think can only stay within the context of Sámi culture, or is that something that you think could evolve with a more "new age culture" throughout the rest of the world?

BM: Yes, it's absolutely possible that this could evolve also outside the Sámi context, because there are so many people who are looking for something, who are looking for ways to connect spiritually with their surroundings, with the world or whatever, they are looking for some kind of connection. And not only Sámi, but generally, the indigenous cultures- they still live with this connection and kind of cultivate this connection and that is why a lot of people are drawn to indigenous cultures and indigenous ways of living.

HD: Ok, in relation to that-in relation to the connectedness with one's natural surroundings, when performing Joiks now, older Joiks, in light of the changes that are undergoing the environment that they originally came from, whether it's deforestation or the changing climate,

or something similar, would you say that the creative and emotional process or making Joiks has changed or been compromised because of that?

BM: It's not easy to answer that question, because in earlier times, people have always had some kind of challenging things. Other people have come to their areas and they have had to defend themselves or fly away and there has been climate changes and natural catastrophes and there have been these famines because of bad weathers and bad fishing. All that stuff has been there before as well. The difference is that today we're doing it all ourselves, we are changing the nature and destroying it too much, but Joik will always be there like it always has been there- it will always be there, whether the process of creating it changes, that's not really easy to answer!

HD: I understand- it's a big question!

BM: The basic things are there- the trees are there, the mountains, the sun is there, the earth is there and the human relationships are there, and then it's like we've always felt that sorrow when something gets broken, or something gets destroyed, that has also always been there and, so it's the basic element that Joik is about, and other people- it is the same. Bonding and the social relationships, it's there.

[section omitted; brief off-topic conversation]

HD: And as for Joiks now being recorded, either digitally for CDs or Joiks that are being performed in staged settings like concerts and things, do you think that could start changing the way Joiks are made with people knowing that's how they're going to end up?

[section omitted; language clarification]

HD: What are your thoughts about Joiks now being recorded on CDs or on digital files, could this start changing the way that Joiks are made?

BM: This recording, basically it's a tool for… in earlier times we were sitting around by the fire or we were sitting all together and Joiking together, and then it kind of sticked more easily, but now as we're not- our life forms have changed so we're not doing those things so much, so it's a good thing that we can have the recorders, because otherwise we forget very easily. Also, because when I know I can record it, then I don't struggle as much to remember, I can relax with it. It's a good tool to remember the Joiks and also to transmit it to other people.

HD: and finally, because I remembered I had one last question when I was listening to you yesterday, now that you mentioned that before it was less important to know who made the Joik that you're performing, but nowadays now that it has become more important for people to know who came up with it in the first place- do you think that could change the way people make Joiks, now that they know that that could happen?

BM: yes, as people we have such big egos. So maybe we must use the Joik to… Yes, I believe that because before the Joik, my parents and that generation, they don't know, they don't remember who made the Joiks, and it wasn't important to know that. But now it's different. I see when people made the CDs with Joik, and they have written that "he has made" or "she has made" the Joiks. And I also see that, even with people who publish traditional Joiks, the people put their name on it. So already this thing is there.

Interview 4: James Smart, Empire Summer Solstice, June 2018

HD: So I'd like to hear, first, about your role within this group and faction, and any performance contexts of your music at these events, or previous events.

JS: OK well, I play a character called Raknar Ravenstorm, I'm the Thane of this group, the Stormspire, that's a part of Wintermark.

HD: so have you ever played or composed music for this group and if so, in what situations do you usually do that?

JS: Well there's 3 of us in the group, there's myself, I play guitar and do a little bit of singing, there's my friend Dan who plays a hurdy-gurdy and guitar and there's John, who's our virtuoso performer and singer. Before the system [Empire] actually started, we got together quite a bit around Nottingham and started writing some music, so after we'd read the Empire Wiki, and picked a few interesting parts out that we thought were quite good, and just wrote a few bits to ourselves. We didn't really listen to the music briefs that much because we thought they were quite constraining, with the nature of how they wanted us to play and the modes they wanted us to play in and so on and so forth.

JS: I've got some level of music theory training, I did a little bit at university and did music A level, whereas John and Dan are very much, as you'd describe, "folk musicians" that have learned along the way, so when we read the music brief, we thought that's a little bit scary, and kind of put John off a little bit, so we just decided to do our own thing and play our own music and write our own songs, and the content of them would make it a song and it's seemed to have written one or two that people seemed to quite like.

HD: So how would you, so in the setting you've descried with yourself and Dan, was it? And John, how would you guys go about creating a specifically Wintermark ish sound- what would you say are its defining features that the rest of the nation would recognise?

JS: Well in the brief it says we write music which has it droning notes on there and stuff like that, however the hurdy-gurdy lends itself incredibly well because it's an instrument which has drone strings so it's a constant noise happening all the time, it's mainly the lyrical content that's made our songs more Wintermark inspired. There's probably the first popular one that we made was a song called [3:32], and in the game world, that is a magical storm in the far north of our territory that anybody that ventures into it, never comes back, and we decided it'd be quite nice if, in our culture, old warriors that haven't been able to find themselves a good heroic death on the battle field, march into [the storm] to find their maker- our old mythical thane walked into the ice storm and some of us live in fear that he may come back out again, because he was a hard man, but, yes I'd say it's the lyrical content more than anything else. And our sound has become a, the sound the Wintermark does.

HD: because the songs have become popular and they circulated round?

JS: yeah, I'd say so, I'd hope so!

HD: Do you think that's because they're accessible for other people to play, they're not too complicated, maybe they're easily recognisable? They can be used on a lot of different instruments?

JS: It's not particularly complicated, however it's the, John's, we quite formulate with how we write, we're very much "verse, chorus, verse, chorus", we probably do 4 verses and 4 or 5 choruses, and the chorus is quite easy and certainly by the end of a song, or mid way through a song you'll have picked the chorus up and, so it's quite easy for people to join in if they want to

HD: OK, interesting, so, conversely, having read the Wintermark wiki with a fine tooth comb, myself, it has become apparent to me that there is quite a Nordic vibe to this nation, so conversely, based on what we've just been discussing, would you say that you go about creating music in order to establish a Nordic style sound, and if it isn't Nordic, can you tell me what the inspiration is instead?

JS: well, it's quite a funny thing cause, in the nation we are, we're Nordic flavour, but we're constantly reminded that we're not Vikings, we are a combination of Saxons and Rohirrim from Lord of the Rings,

HD: yeah, I notice some Sami references, especially in some of the cow herding stuff that's on the Empire wiki.

JS: oh yeah, well there's 3 cultures, in Wintermark, there's, Steinr, there's Kallavesi and Suaq. The Steinr are very much your Rohirrim, classic Viking-esque looking things, very close in the look.

[section omitted; off topic]

JS: the style of music we play, it stems from when I first started LARP, I went to a system call the Lorien Trust, and we played in a fraction called the Wolves, who were complete Viking fantasy rip offs, really, and all the music we made around there was very much about the gods, you know, Thor, Loki etc.

[section omitted; off topic]

JS: and the style of music we wrote, I used to write with a chap called [redacted] who was a fantastic musician, used to play the whistles and recorders and was an absolutely fantastic singer, and very, very good at writing lyrics, and he had a large influence from playing in church, and a lot of his songs were very church orientated, but the more sort of the zion church, the more uplifting, powerful, strong chords, and we kind of used that sort of style with a more, you know, more folk based instruments and guitars, in a style that we dubbed amusingly as "power folk", very loud acoustic guitars,

HD: this was for that system?

JS: for that system, yeah and we played that a lot, and we spent a long time performing those tunes and it's, a lot of that style has come, it's the sort of music I write when I start writing- I write in that style now, it's what I've grown up with

HD: Do you just, when you performed it, is that usually just in social settings, or did you actually set up mini concerts, as it were?

JS: We did, we did a few gigs where, on fields, cause the gathering, the big events of the Lorien Trust at the time were up to 4000 people, so it was quite a big one. And we spend up to 6/7 hours in the evening sometimes, going around different camps, because we did quite well out

of it, we got well watered, we got well fed.

HD: so almost like a Viking *skald* really?

JS: absolutely, yeah, we did quite well and we were very popular and so on and so forth, and occasionally they set stages up and once or twice we did play on stage, and got together with other people and, you know, did that quite a fair amount, but we played a lot, to the point that my fingers started to bleed on occasion, we played too much! I would say, which is probably why I don't play so much these days, play a little bit.

[section omitted; off topic]

HD: and it's [Lorien Trust] still just as "Viking" oriented, is it?

JS: well the Wolf faction, I believe is, I have some friends who are trying to get me to go again this year, actually, which I might do, but, it' a long time, I stopped going, sort of the, the early 2000s, and I did Curious Pastimes for a bit, and did a bit of playing there as well with another group of people that had Jambi drums, we did more of the same sort of music there because they had a Nordic faction in there as well, we used to go and WOW them with our Viking songs and so on and so forth, so we've always, I've always played a character that can perform and likes to, cause I like to sing, it's really good

HD: and there's always been something of a Nordic flavour to it, perhaps just from where you've learned and what inspirations you've…

[section omitted; off topic]

HD: Coming back to Wintermark though, cause I am really interested in this insistence of not being Vikings, and in the general brief, and I imagine among a lot of players as well, especially the more well established ones, who've come for some time, why do you think, however mistakenly, that people compare this nation's aesthetics to Vikings?

JS: I think Vikings are, there a very popular culture, especially at the moment, you know, Tolkien, when Lord of the Rings came out, when the films came out, most of us have read all the books any way, and what have you, but there's the Vikings TV series as well, that became very popular whilst, I mean, as it happened, I started Empire and then I started watching the Vikings, but also, there's our group, Stormspire, and there's the big group called the Dunnings, who I used to RP with at the Lorien Trust, a lot of those guys, years ago who were playing Vikings, and between us, there's probably about 120 people, which is a significant part of the nation

HD: so there's a lot of vestiges, of that role playing style.

JS: yeah, a lot of people use the same kits, and I think it's very easy to see a culture bleed. Someone that might do Viking re-enactment might look at some of the kit that we wear and go, "oh that's Viking kit they can wear in…."

JS: The differences are… because there's Varushka which are significantly more of the Rus style of Viking with the baggy trousers and the hates and so on, and then there's our style which are more straight trousers and leg wraps, but again, Vikings wore that stuff anyway, as well as Saxons, so…

205

HD: yes, it's more of a contemporary idea of Vikings, and people see what they expect to see in that…

JS: I think also we're, there's a small amount of it as well is when Profound Decisions made the nations up, they were quite scared of people all turning up wearing horned helmets and so on. If you look at the wiki, when it says what Wintermark are, there's a picture of the kind of comedy plastic.

HD: why do you think they were so worried about that?

JS: There's multiple levels of the effort that people are willing to put into roleplaying, sometimes people just want to turn up and have a drink with their mates and go and have a battle, but they're really not that invested in the game, the politics about the game of the brief o anything like that, they just want some gear so they don't look out of place, and get involved. Other times, people really really get into the briefs and the wiki, and read into it multiple times and you know, can quote verbatum, certain pages. I mean, myself, I'd say I'm probably in the middle of that- I've read the Wintermark brief, in detail, I've read a little bit of all the other nations' brief, but not to much so it's nice to be able to discover things when talking to people from those nations.

HD: I think, cause something's left to be new, some things left to be a mystery,

JS: yeah, you know, and some time being ignorant can lead to an interesting game, and you might make a mistake that if you knew the culture of that nation, they, you know, you might…

HD: so… they didn't want people to immediately think that they knew all about the Wintermark culture?

JS: yeah, I think they were very keen to make unique nations, but a lot of people in, it's very common in RP circles to go "oh right yeah, that nation there, they're a bit like Winterfell from GoT, they're a bit like Rohirrim, they're a bit like Vikings, right that's them sorted. That lot there, they're a bit sort of like ancient Japanese samurai, right yeah no problem, and for some people that can be enough to know what a nation is

HD: yeah, and others might want a bit more to it?

JS: yeah, and it can be, as a game designer, it can be a bit annoying sometimes for people to generalise and stereotype the nation that you've spent hours making

HD: well, you moved into briefs really well, actually, cause that was my next question, do you have any particular thoughts or opinions regarding the musical brief or the Wintermark, or any thoughts on how these briefs are responded to by other players?

JS: When I read the musical briefs, the one I liked the look of most was the marches one, because that very much struck me as midlands, English folk music, which is really more where my taste tends to lie. The Wintermark music brief, honestly, I found it a little confusing, it said we like to flatten our sevens and the modes we like to sing in, and I can't quite remember now, and throat singing as well, which is an art form

HD: it's very difficult to do, yeah

JS: there's a chap in our group, [redacted], he can do a little throat singing, and it seemed very, for me, to somebody that's done a level of music theory, I wouldn't describe myself as

an expert by any means, but I understand modes and scales and that, and so on and so forth, at a pretty low level, I found it a little bit off putting, I found it quite constricting, quite constrictive, and the people that wrote the guides, are very accomplished musicians and absolutely fantastic, I think it was [redacted], who are, if you get the chance to listen to them, absolutely fantastic performer. But they very much wrote the briefs to inspire rather than restrict people. So, that's when we decided, "ok, well we'll try and pay some sort of service to that, but ultimately, we'll write our own music", and do what we enjoy playing because at the end of the day, it's us performing, and that's what we want

HD: an enjoyment in immersion is an important factor, of this game, and if you're obsessing over a very complex piece of music and making it or wanting to make it sound a certain way, your immersion is theoretically broken then, isn't it, because you're in completely another place, aren't you, in your mind?

JS: yeah, and that's very much a, the music plays very much a living and breathing thing if, but there's some very wooden … that have been written, there's the imperial song, it's kind of like of a hymn or the high guard singing, but it sounds like something you're forced to sing as a child in church or something. It's why I never got on with church, it was not like the soul churches in America, where the music is living and more exciting, but this is very much music that you make to sing. Whereas the stuff we like to write, is music that affects people, I wrote a paper at university about what constitutes good music, and I surmised in that, that music is good when the person listening to it has an emotional reaction. It can be any emotion- it can be happy, sad, anger, sorrow, anything like that. If it alters that emotion while you're listening to the music then it's good music, because it's affected you in a way, and any music that enhances or amplifies one of your emotions has to be good music on some level. It can be annoying, it can be repetitive,

HD: but it's instilled a reaction.

JS: yeah, that's the thing about it.

HD: and that's what you try to do with the music you perform here- you want to get reactions out of people?

JS: absolutely- we want good songs with good lyrics, that people can enjoy and people can join in with.

HD: to help people, perhaps, get in, to set the scene a little bit more for themselves if they're new players or something like that?

[section omitted; off topic (talked about the weather)]

JS: there was 2 hours on the Saturday night, we were sat around the camp fire, and we sang a few songs, and for those 2 hours, I was somewhere else. I wasn't James in a muddy field waiting for some day when I could pack up and go home, and go to McDonalds and get a bath, I was a thane in the hall of Wintermark and I was there and I felt it and I breathed it for a while, and it was the music and the comradery that did that, and it's a great way to treat your imagination

HD: so how would you compare, say you're, this is a bit of a wordy question, just thinking of how to phrase this question in the best way for it to make sense; when you compare immersion when you're in character vs when you're perhaps, coming up with music, between events and

in your down time, how would you compare those levels of immersion? Is there in fact any difference for you? Do you like to get into the feel of your character while you're creating music?

JS: a little, a little, though I've done it for quite a long time now, and there's one song we wrote which we decided we wanted to be quite political, there's a nation of barbarians in Empire- our enemies, called the Thule, and we decided as our group, that they were going to be our arch enemies, come what may, we hate those guys, and if we can we'll try and eradicate them if possible, and the empire signed a peace treaty with them, much to our dismay, so we wrote a song called "death to the Thule" and every first line in the chorus is "death to the Thule", and when we were writing that, we were saying "yeah, I can imagine we'll be in a big group of people just going into battle when we're singing this and we'll get everybody shouting" and getting really revved up and in for a fight and we were planning the emotional response, that's what we wanted, then a few events after we wrote that song there was a plot line about a Thane of Wintermark who was being he was an enemy of the Thule, a chap called Doggery Thulesby, was his name, and he broke/wrote the empire law and the empire went in to arrest him and a number of Wintermark players stood with him and tried to defend him and ultimately he was taken to trial and sentenced to death, and after the sentencing we sang Death to the Thule, and there was probably 200 people standing around, at least half of them were shouting Death to the Thule during the chorus, and you could see people with tears in their eyes, and they really meant, they really felt what they were singing and at that moment you could see everybody there, they were in the Empire. They weren't in a muddy field near Silverstone, where you could hear race cars driving around, we could hear "death to the Thule" and you could see Wintermark winter folk there, in solidarity and unity

HD: that's brilliant.

JS: you know it was an amplifier for the feelings that were there, there was a lot of emotion there, and it was because of the songs we were doing A lot of us, I will admit, a lot of us, we couldn't sing all the words in the chorus from time to time, because we had to kind of stop and have a sniff, or just take an extra breath, because it was…

HD: oh gosh, because it was heavy?

JS: it was heavy, but they're the moments that we struggle for, that we strive to find.

HD: though you seem to be second guessing what my next points are going to be, cause I was going to ask about whether the content you create changes or gains further influence or meaning after plot progressions or alterations? I mean, did that song evolve to mean something else after that event, or is it now, has it now because something that's used in particular circumstances, when the plot changes…?

JS: we sing it quite a lot, the peace treaty with the Thule is now up for renewal, and from the Empire's point of view, it probably would be a good idea to sign a peace treaty with the Thule, from keeping our lands, it's probably a good idea to sign a peace treaty with the Thule- we want to be at war with them because that's the game, and the song that we've written is a very political song, intended to make people hate our enemies and join with us, and yes, from a psychological PoV that will make, that will be performed in front of certain audiences because, either to make a point

HD: this does go back to what we were talking about before that, but do you ever rekindle your immersion in between events, like I'll, for an example, there is one Varushkan musician who will occasionally do FB live streams as their character and will perform songs if requested, I just wondered if you ever did anything like that, whether it's live streams or whether it's just some of you getting together in between events?

JS: sometimes we'll get together and sing a song or two whilst we're there. Years ago we used to get together every Sunday in a local pub and we'd sing our songs, we'd sing LARP songs, definitely. My first ever character was called Mead because I couldn't think of a name and someone tipped half a bottle of mead over me, so that's where I got the name from.

HD: that's as good a way as any to get a name.

JS: that became my nickname in real life for year, for many years, and it's only, I'd say, ah, I feel old now, over the last 15 years or so where people have started calling me by my real name again, or by my surname. But I was called Mead for a long, long time, and every Sunday we're organise our own events and get together and, you know, just do our own thing and just enjoy the social aspect more than anything else, but yes, certainly, never done any live streaming, but…

HD: it's a good idea, I've never seen anyone else do it apart from them… yeah, it's really fun! The last thing I wanted to ask is, how would you categorise the ownership of your work once it's circulated into the community, would you say it's your own, or would it then become collective?

JS: Right, long answer now- we, ultimately it's folk music and one of the largest forms of flattery is when other people perform your music. From time to time you're maybe sat in a tent or you might walk past a camp and you'll hear someone performing a tune that you wrote, or a tune that you were known for performing quite a lot and these days, I find it, it makes me smile a lot of the time. Years ago, when I was younger, I got quite sensitive over the entire thing, cause we, at the LT we wrote some pretty significant songs, that were very popular and somebody asked us if we were interested in recording them, and this was back in 2001, around that sort of time, and we always said yes ew were interested in recording them but we could never nail down a date when we were all together and we could all go and record them so time passed, and the next year's events started up, and I got to the event and someone said "oh I've been listening to your CD, it's really cool!"- ok, so that was interesting, and then I walked down into the main arena and they'd got the big ritual circle set up and the big sound system and everything and I could hear a song being played on the tanoy off a CD and it sounded familiar and when I got a bit closer, it was one of my songs, and it wasn't me playing it and it wasn't [redacted] that was singing it…

HD: but they'd made a CD of it…

JS: and somebody had gone and recorded our stuff, and without our permission, and I got, incandescent is probably the best word, and the CD was a collection of songs that other people had done as well, and what have you, and I had an option, I could have made them recall it, which seemed a little harsh, but at the time I knew a very good sound engineer by the name of [redacted], and he had a home studio and he was a very, very good engineer. So we said well let's record our own, let's do it properly- let's do it to a proper, professional level, and we'll get

the CDs properly stamped and recorded and the masters made up and everything, so we spent about 9 months recording our songs, doing it all properly, this was me, [redacted] and [redacted] for a little bit, one or two others and a few guest musicians, and we recorded a CD called No Sleep Til Ragnarök, under the name of Chilled Mead, cause I was Mead and [redacted] was a character called Chilldress so we were Chilled Mead, and we recorded this CD which to this day is one of the best things I've ever produced, and we made the CD and we sold 200-300 of them we did quite well actually, and had somebody else not recorded the song, we wouldn't have done the CD in the first place, so that explains why I was quite sensitive, so that

explains why I was quite sensitive about other people doing my stuff for a while. Now, I'm a little bit older, little bit wiser, I appreciate that people playing and performing your songs is absolute flattery, and the fact that someone's taken the time to learn your music, is absolutely fantastic- I grew up learning how to play the guitar, learning how to play other people's music and…

HD: do you particularly care about them knowing it was specifically you that wrote it or…?

JS: it's nice to know that I did write it, but if someone says they don't know who did it- then I'll quite happily tell them! But ultimately, it's nice to know that it's, it becomes a form of immortality. It's my ambition as this character here is to become immortal, and that's through people telling stories about what they've done, long after he's died.

HD: that's a very Viking idea, there's a verse in the Havamal that "cattle die, friends die, but the deeds of men never die".

JS: Well that's the thing that Wintermark is to be heroic and be a hero, and a hero does things that people talk about for years, so the pursuit of immortality in that way…

HD: and that's one way of doing it- by hearing people perform your music

JS: yeah, if you write a song, and it's performed years down the line, then you know, that's a really nice thing and, whereas years ago I got wound up and defensive, these days it gives me a nice warm feeling, and it's a nice thing, it's a nice thing when people perform your music, it means you've done it right!

Interview 5: Su Wainwright, Empire Summer Solstice, June 2018

HD: So if you could just briefly describe your persona and role within this group that you're playing at the moment?

SW: So as far as Wintermark is concerned, I play... I am a fortune teller, I have a tent in the market, I have cards, I scare the living crap out of people.

HD: excellent!

SW: I don't use Tarot cards because people think they know what that means, and occasionally you'll get some poor soul who thinks you're telling their actual life story, rather than their IC life story, so I keep away from sort of the actual, anything that's real world, you don't want to suck people in, and of course, in the real world, cold reading is regarded as a terrible thing to do... and here, I'm afraid to say, it's perfectly legal so, if you say "I'm thinking of a name that begins with M..." some poor soul says "oh! My mother" and you go "YES", where of course, in the real world, that's somewhat frowned upon so...

HD: and are there any music or performance in that?

SW: no. so basically, any music I do is, as it were, after hours, so, I'll stop fortune telling in the market, come back here for an evening meal, then grab the guitar, or I've got an auto-harp, and just go out and then find a corner and sing at people.

HD: so it's normally within social settings, it's not like a sit down performance that you, you're giving to a group of people

SW: I have been in, in LARP situations where I've done that, at the Lorien Trust, as part of the Bards' Guild, where I spent a lot of time teaching vocal technique, and here, every so often I will get somebody who will come up to me and go "I can't speak!" and I go "that's cause you're doing it wrong", and so I have been known to do shouting lessons, or dish out vocal zones.

HD: fantastic, so, you're performing, is it songs that you've learned, or songs that you've written?

SW: a combination, there are some things I've written myself- I specialise, because we have a lot of solo performers, at LARP, most performances are not solo, we get very little chorus songs, and in my experience, people do like the "let me bang on the tables and join in", variety of songs, so I do a lot of slightly doctored sea shanties, slightly doctored songs of the Napoleonic wars, anything to do with drinking and fighting, so that's where I tend t come at it from, because .. solo performance, loads of people stand up and sing, but then everybody has to sit and listen, and, as I'm sure we'll get on to in a minute, this is a social exercise, and performance becomes a slightly more challenging thing to so, basically, oh, I'm going to be unkind now, so if this gets out I'll probably be in trouble, but obviously, because we have, because there's nearly 2000 people on site here, so we have varying degrees of talent, we have varying degrees of people's perceptions of their own talent, and therefore, it's quite difficult, I think, I wish I could remember 2 psychologists at the college my daughter attends, there was 2 of them, and it's this idea that someone who's really really good at something tends to be quite self effacing, so, "well, I can sing a bit, I've got a cabinet full of trophies", and that's manifestly not the whole of it, so, I will say "I can sing a bit", somebody who might be less able, is inclined to tell you that

they're unbelievably fantastic. However, when drink becomes involved, because that's another thing that rather clouds the way music is presented on LARP sites, is the fact that most people have been drinking by the time you get around to getting any singing done, and everyone is extraordinarily confident… My experience is, of course, that my ability and my alcohol consumption tend to diverge; my opinion of my ability and my alcohol consumption tend to be going in opposite direction,

HD: so you mentioned the varying levels of talent, and ability- would you say that the brief given to Wintermark by PD, allows for that variation of ability, or is it quite inaccessible, what do you think?

SW: I think that very few people on site, I mean, you would have to be competent, and obviously because I know who the brief was drawn up by, and they are extraordinarily competent musicians, I was going to say, for the rest of us, some things are very difficult to follow so for example, the brass coast's brief is the Cantigas de Santamaria, and those sorts of things, so if you've done some early music and you know they exist, you're well in. If you haven't, and you don't, it comes as a nasty surprise because if you're into modern heavy metal, or you're into modern pop music, getting yourself into the cantegas is going to be really hard going, and it doesn't work from that point of view, so people go off and do what they like.

HD: is that a similar situation here in Wintermark?

SW: I think so. I think Wintermark is slightly more on top of it, because it's an easier brief, we are mostly, if this in politically incorrect, you can cross these bits out, but we're mostly white, we're mostly anglo Saxon, and for the nations that are comprised of white anglo Saxons like us in the marches, have a much easier time of it, because we're already dealing with a set of musical traditions that we understand. At the marches of course, it's all, you know, English folk song, and therefore you're in a really good state of affairs already. Wintermark has it slightly more rought because we have …for that Nordic music, but what you will find, is that you get a lot of standard British folk songs still, or variations of a standard British folk song, you know, I'm in A minor, I go G, then I go back to A minor then I go to G, then I go back to A minor, then I'm done,

HD: so how do you go, when you enter these after hours performances, as you call them, how do you go about creating a specifically Wintermark-ish sound, what would you say are its defining features? That make it recognisable from the other nations?

SW: I   don't

HD: you don't?

SW: no, this is the short answer- that I take my guitar and I go somewhere, and I sing some stuff, by the time I get round to people, they're mostly drunk and like to bang table. I would say that from the PoV of bearing in mind the brief, I'm inclined to change, obviously we change place names, process known as filking- you must be aware, changing the place names, I'm fine with, songs called "fear of the orc", I am not, because I think that hauls me back into the 21st century faster than anything, so if I'm going to sing in Wintermark, I will sing shanties that are very plain, if you know what I mean, doing things like, see I can't think of an example, but we have … we'll go and sing things that are very, things about whaling, you know.

HD: so basically Nordic…

SW: yeah, so fitting that way, in fact actually, there's a massive great, exciting, set of shanties and those sorts of sea songs that are in fact associated with the whaling industry in Finland, so a cold environment, you know, "and the ice shall grow on Greenland's shores before I change my mind"- that thing, obviously, you'd take out Greenland and put something else in.

HD: so, conversely, you go, there is a concentrated effort to create a Nordic inspired sound, or whether in lyrical content or in the actual musical content

SW: yes, yes, I would say that was fair, my daughter's a drummer, so we tend to take a lot of drum/banging noises with us as well.

HD: so, why do you think, however mistakenly it may be, people often compare this nation's aesthetic to Vikings?

SW: I think it's basically because that's how we're written up; I mean it says painfully obviously we're not Vikings, and yet there you are, in your Viking style tunic and your Viking style leggings, with your Viking style chainmail... there is a massive confusion between, and always has been, in the modern perception, I've done a lot of re-enactment, a massive confusion in the modern psyche between Vikings and Saxons. We're supposed to be Saxons, but if you stand the two side by side historically, you'd be hard pressed to tell the difference. And therefore, and of course the minute you then put that kind of aesthetic- so "looks like celtic knots but isn't; tunic, leggings, thing, cloak, fur..." once we've got to that point, the assumption, in spite of the fact that we are Saxons, the assumption is that it's cold and we are Vikings

HD: kind of fuels that fire.

SW: I was going to say, it probably doesn't do anything to put that to bed, and I would imagine that quite a number of people here, I would say there's probably some re-enactment crossover here, from the Saxon and Viking groups, much as there is in and then what used to be referred to as the British Plate and Spoon Society, or the... are lurking indoors, because armour, arming..., all the rest of these things is pretty expensive stuff, so if you can get double time out of your kit then you're laughing.

HD: so, I'm just thinking about this confusion here, would you say there's much of a crossover musically speaking? Between re-enactment communities and here?

SW: re-enactment communities, you see, nowadays anyway, because they didn't used to- we didn't have the batteries, but, batteries- don't laugh about whatever I say, but batteries were … has changed the musical landscape of re-enactment enormously. Or the fact that you can get a speaker to run on 2 batteries for an entire weekend, you know, that's changed the musical community and the fact that you can stand a speaker that kind of size, you know about 6 inches long, in the corner of you tent and fill the whole tent with sound- and of course, in front of the public in re-enactment and away from the public are 2 very separate things, so you're sort of on duty, off duty, you do your bit in front of the public, and then you go and get pissed and go and see what you like if you're going to sing.

Interview 6: Mark Chilvers, Empire Summer Solstice, June 2018

HD: ok so, if you could just start of by telling me about your role within this particular faction, and you character a little bit, that'd be great?

MC: ok, at the moment I'm playing Wolfmere Dunwold, who is with the Dunnings, and he's a scop, which is the Saxon version of a bard, and I do a bit of medical now, I've just taken up a Healer role, but I've been a warrior and everything for years, I've been coming to events for quite a while so…

HD: and what sort of, so do you create and perform a lot of music at these events? Is that part of your character?

MC: yeah, it is yeah, I've always been interested, and I've been playing for about 25 years now, in events, so this is just one of- I've created a bunch of songs for, Empire,

HD: in terms of your performance contexts, is it usually more in social settings or do you tend to organise performances?

MC: yeah, no, it's usually in the hall, we just sit around the hall and entertain everybody

HD: so does it tend to be something going on in the background?

MC: well people get involved because they know the words and lot of the songs- they enjoy it so we sing stuff they know, or it might happen around a camp fire, or there might be a more official, we've had a couple of things where we've gathered together all the Scops and taken turns, or you know, I think that'll be happening this time, and I've played in, like the theatre and at contests and things like that so

HD: so, do you, so with regards to the musical brief that's been established for this nation, and indeed if you have any thoughts about any of the others, do you have any particular thoughts about these briefs and about how they are responded to by other players?

MC: well I like to think I was fairly instrumental in creating the briefs, because when Matt started creating Empire, I was going to Maelstrom and Odyssey, and I think I spoke to him beforehand, and he said he was creating these character briefings, and descriptions for all the nations, and I said you need to do one for music as well, because otherwise you'll end up with a generic lot of songs that don't fit anywhere or anything, so that's why chose to not only do costumes and everything brief, but they also put the music in. And then they talked to [redacted[and various other people, and [redacted], who were heavily involved in it at the time, and are very good musicians- knowledgeable about medieval music and stuff like that so they contributed a lot of stuff to the webpages, and a lot of the stuff that's on those pages and in those briefs comes from them, cause there wasn't that much stuff around at the time and also at the beginning, I was going to be an orc, so I was the bard of the orcs, and then we created the 3 refrains as well to bring the plot in to the whole thing, which is another bardy thing, and then it got too plotty for me so I left, but yeah, so I had quite a lot of ideas about what people should and shouldn't play, and you know, the thing is, about Empire, you've got all these really strict briefs and you've got these nation identities so therefore you do want to have, that's part of it, same as costume is a part of the nation and things, so is the music that you hear, and if you're just going to let it disintegrate into folks that aren't appropriate, people

don't think about it before they do it, then you can end up having just a mish mash like of other systems.

HD: so how do you feel people have responded to that brief since?
MC: I think people try quite hard, because there's a whole lot of songs that've come out and material that you're hearing a lot in different camps, that are very "in style", I know there are choirs and things like this, and [redacted] and [redacted] are in Varushka for quite a while and they created a whole song book there and had that style, there's a guy that I helped start, in the orcs and he's created a whole, cause I was in the orcs but my style didn't quite work, so well, I found it quite difficult. But then when I was … I got quite folky sort of style, and ballady song with a guitar sort of and they wanted more chanting.

HD: I guess it works for that kind of..

MC: well to a certain extent but you've got to have a certain style as well, so things like… would be great for the orcs as well, and then if you got there and listened to them and they have got some songs and things like that

HD: does Wardruna have much of a presence here in Wintermark? I would imagine it probably does?

MC: well it's meant to have, I've thought about learning some, yeah I have used one or 2 tunes, but I haven't used songs that I'm meant to use one of their tunes .. and change the words, because it's the sort of thing we do, cause it's within the style, but I mean, I have seen all this sort of very Nordic stuff, like them, and there's another one that I occasionally see on youtube that's related to them, I don't particularly like it, to be honest, it's just too chanty for me,

HD: so how would you say you go about creating a specifically Wintermark-ish sound? What would you say are its defining features that differentiate it from the other traditions on the field?

MC: I think, well really, we should be using chants and iterative poetry, but the styles got to go with the people you've got in it, so like these guys, behind me, they've got a lot of folk songs, that are sung unaccompanied, and that's kind of quite a good style for Wintermark, so I think the thing that makes RP songs work for different factions is the content, and you've got to sing about the factions, and that kind of brings out the context and the idiom for it, and that creates, helps you create the style of it so obviously you're not going to create a Spanish style song for Wintermark like you would for the ?brascos, and then you talk about deserts and flowers and oceans and blossoms and what have you and all that.

HD: so you go about creating Nordic inspired set of ideas when you…

MC: yes, I do, for a couple of songs, I do … I wanted… did I do it… there's one I do that's stolen from a Swedish thrash band, Pagan Heroes, I can't remember now, but it's very Nordic, it's too Nordic for here, it talks about Odin and Valhalla and that so you need to change it.

HD: so what defines "too nordic"?

MC: well, talking about gods, Valhalla, but that style is, I think I did change it actually, so it was (singing), so I changed it to "Winter's hero…", instead of Valhalla, … (singing), something, so I tweaked it like that. Yeah, I didn't do it last time, I meant to do it and I forgot to, oh well, I've done another one.

HD: so, I'm interested in this "Nordic", this idea of "Nordicness", the biggest thing I saw when I read through the Wintermark wiki on the Empire website, the biggest, most significant part of it I saw was the fact that Wintermark are not Vikings, so I'd be curious to hear, especially from a musical perspective, why do you think that people, however mistakenly, compare this nation's aesthetics to Vikings, as often as they do?

MC: because it is similar, it's actually based … is what it should be, and then if you think about Saxon music, you're talking about things like lyres and the kind of chanted poetry, isn't it with the chords and the strumming, and that sort of thing, and the epic poetry, like the battle of … and things like that, which are quite good, but people have to.. it's just because you're talking about people in tunics and trousers and chainmail and it looks Norse, really, that's why you've got that cross over, but actually, people have been quite good with it and have donned more of the Saxon style, but in terms of costume, even though you've still got the more fantastical and the Kallavesian, so you've got the crows and the bones and the feathers and all that, but you can certainly look around a camp and go "that's Steinr and that's Kallavesi", so you've got three kinds of aesthetic.

HD: isn't one of the groups within Wintermark, one of them's based around some Sámi traditions, I think.

MC: yes, it's the suaq, so yeah they're kind of the reindeer hunters… Wintermark of the 3 peoples that joined as one- the Kallavesi, the Suaq and the Steinr, so the Steinr are the more Saxon/Viking, in their look, but it does say, you know, they're more like the Rohirrim from LOTR, than Viking , so it does, it is a lot more like that, or Winterfell, you know, in Game of Thrones, so you can go for that aesthetic.

HD: so I guess it's quite a popular idea, right now, so that's probably what draws people to it initially.

MC: it is, and then you've got things like Vikings on TV, … things like that, I mean, if you want that then there is a game called Norsemen, and that's totally be a norseman- dress up as a Viking, kill Saxons.

HD: so, I'll move on to immersion now, I'm really interested in musicians at these kind of events, and their levels of immersion that they experience when they perform, so I wonder if you could tell me a little bit about the comparison between your immersion level, just as a character, interacting with the game, vs, when you're performing in the game- would you say you're immersive experience changes at all?

MC: well no, it's, for me, it's all part of it, that's why I, it's one of the reasons I've been coming for years and years and doing music because I enjoy that aspect of it and that's what I like doing, so I come and make songs and I entertain people, so I can do as an orc, or I can do it as a Wintermark, and that is part of the immersion for me, and so that's why I make an effort to make the songs work, you know, and I don't like people who you can do any folk song you really want and then change the lyrics, but still break, take you back to England if you, for instance take Scarborough Fayre and change the lyrics, which people have done, it's still Scarborough Fayre.

HD: it's still very recognisable.

MC: it's terribly recognisable, and then there's other people who've come and don Iron Maiden,

between that and they've played it in a folky way, but it's still Iron Maiden, you know.

HD: and that sort of thing brings you out .
MC: it does, it can break- it can be funny, or it could just be like no. and there are other songs that people do, and that are just rude and unpleasant, so a couple, like the dirty goblins who- have you heard of this?

HD: yes I think I was talking to Su [Su Wainwright] about this

MC: yeah, so she would know all about that, and that came from another system that we are all in, and then it was written and basically everyone went "well it's a song about rape so just don't…", but I heard it… I heard somebody singing it around a camp fire on the way to bed so… yeah. But so I try and ignore and avoid that, I try and do stuff that's a)either about the faction and the system, and also I try and do stuff, I do quite a lot of improvisations, which obviously is not going to be in a Nordic style, it's going to be me with my guitar and just strumming a few chords, but I will make a song about a warrior, who's done something that day, and I can make, I'm fairly good at improvising so I can just bang out a song and it'll be about them and everyone will join in so it'll be quite successful, but it will be about that single person, and it'll be in the idiom…

HD: that actually leads really well into the next point I was going to make- which is about whether the content you create or perform changes or gains new influence or meaning after natural plot progression or alterations -do you find that the content that you create does respond to changes in in the game, changes in the plot, specific events that happen?

MC: well yeah, that's where you take a lot of the inspiration from, originally that was part of the problem when we wrote the original brief, there was no, not much background and stuff, because it's not been played, so you don't know what it's about, so you have to go with, but now there are stories, someone's written about Doggery Thulebrain or whatever his name is, and that was a whole episode that was created within it, I think, you know, there's songs been written about… you know, the orcs, so there's things that do happen, and events that you do take, so Tony's written as we go along the way which is about how he lost his friend in the battle,which was the first battle, so yeah, it is influenced a lot by what happens

HD: yeah, and outside of events- in between events, does creation of content for this event remain an immersive experience when you're between events, so to give you an example, I know of one person in Varushka who likes to do Facebook live streams as their character, performing songs in between events and things, I'd never seen anyone doing that before, and I thought it was brilliant; I just wondered if you'd ever done anything similar, whether it's a live stream or whether you'd done anything in between events?

MC: no, not really, I mean I do spend time in between writing stuff, and learning stuff, because that's a bug bear I have about people reading stuff before, and I don't like that, so I do spend time learning, I've just spent the last couple of weeks learning 3 songs that I brought this time so, creating the new songs ripped off from… you know' a Scottish band, so they got mangled crow feathers and it works really really well- a song called Crow Feathers, cause it's an old reference to the crows and the stormcrows, so I tweaked that, and am quite pleased with that so, will probably do that this weekend, and then there's another one that I did last week, at the event, need to revisit it to make it work…

HD: but you're not really thinking in character, when you're doing that? It's more a

preparation…

MC: not really, it sort of pulls it out of you, you know, I'm working as Mark trying to create a song that fits, so I don't try and put myself in character or anything like that,

HD: and the last thing I wanted to ask about, is to do with ownership, so I'm interested in how you categorise the ownership of your work once it's circulated into the community- so if you were walking past a tent, and you heard somebody playing a song that you'd written, what would you think about that?

MC: I'd be quite pleased! I wouldn't mind that

HD: so it's more collective, once it goes out into the community?

MC: oh yeah, I don't mind -yeah.

HD: you're happy for it to be circulated?

MC: yeah, yeah, I mean it happens at the other events that we do, so for years and years we were writing them, and they're sort of based around Scottish folklore and things like that and then I stopped going for a little bit for various reasons, and then when I went back I'd find that you could hear them all singing all the songs that we used to do, some that I'd written and some that [redacted] had written, so yeah but, I'm not going to say "you can't sing that, it's my song", that's a bit childish really- you do it for performance so it's great if people do want to learn it, which some people do, or songs that I've tweaked and made into folk musical songs, that's great, you know I like that

HD: ok, so you like hearing it circulated around, with your name and…

MC: yeah, I mean I don't think it's happening very much at the moment, but no I don't mind.

Interview 7: Roger Finn, Empire Summer Solstice, June 2018

HD: so Roger, if you could start off by just describing your role in this game, within your faction, and the kind of music that you create and perform please?

RF: sure, well the role I perform is a scop- so a bard and sing song and entertain but also tell tales about stories that things people have done, maybe in character, or maybe even of background things that have happened in, the things that have happened on paper, so the winds of war, the winds of fortune, quests, when something happens to players- you know, when you turn that into a song it really creates that level of immersion, sorry what was the second part again?

HD: just what sort of music do you…

RF: it's mostly folk music that I sing so, and, but I do filking as well, so I'll filk a song and fit it into the game, so yeah it's a medieval ones, and ballads and songs- old Scottish and Irish really

HD: so do you have any particular thoughts about the musical brief provided by the founders, and how these briefs are responded to by other players in your nation?

RF: a little bit, I mean about the actual brief and its creation, I had quite a few people who didn't really appreciate the storytelling element to it, and thought it should be a little bit broader- you know, the … it takes quite a lot of effort to learn and remember all the lines for the… so, you know, can play all the lines that you need in the stories and tales and some, so trying to tell the song, like Beowulf or something like that- it's just going to take so long, like, in the way that you're doing it so there's some people where they're a bit confused whether it should be just that or whether it's songs or… I really like the brief, I think it works, it creates a, what I'd imagine to be like a Celtic bard, you know, in that kind of way, a person who tells stories and how that's tied into tradition of the game and how our nation uses those songs to give a hero their name…

HD: excellent- so how do you feel, how do you think other people, other scops, other bards, respond to it- what kind of different interpretations have you seen and which ones do you like? Which ones do you not agree with, if any?

RF: I don't know, I quite like the stuff in Stormspire, a guy called [redacted], I believe his name is?

[section omitted; recognition of shared acquaintance]

RF: He's a wonderful singer, I really like, there's a couple of songs he does, they get stuck in my head and I really enjoy those, like, hearing him play, this is why- should I go into what I was saying about Mark, shall I…?

[section omitted; brief off topic discussion]

RF: He was one of the reasons why I started singing in the first place, like, hearing someone sing n an environment, I think he was playing an orc character but he had panflutes, and was playing and then and his guitar, and you know, meeting someone in a tavern who's asked for a song, and he says "how do you feel? What do you want me to sing about?"- you know, that was something that I just wanted and I think, learning so many songs and getting to the position

that I am now, I can ask people the same thing, and it was almost like I wanted to get to that level of someone that was so good.

HD: So to be able to, essentially to be able to heighten the immersion of other players, as well as yourself, that's the goal there, is it?

RF: yeah, I mean, in my own words- yeah, it was to tap into something that I really enjoyed as a character myself, as a players, finding such that level of immersion, that enjoyment, within the game, and just yeah, I really like this and I wanted to create that for others.

HD: ok, we'll be getting back to immersion in a little while, I just wanted to talk a little bit more about the brief and about the idea of a Wintermark sound, so when you're making music for this event, how do you go about creating a specifically Wintermark ish sound- what would you say are its defining features, that make it instantly recognisable from the other nations' styles?

RF: I don't know, that's quite a difficult one, but in my own sense, probably for my own mind, it's probably the , a little bit the tone of the song, so if it was a little bit more of a folk song, it's very muddied, like in the sense of how, of what it'll actually entail, but having I suppose that's part of the filking though, and putting the elements into the songs that make it more relate to a specific nation, but that deep singing, or like the subliners- the deep voice, when you're singing like an old Irish song- that kind of "twang" on a voice, like, kind of thing, to me, that sounds very folky/Wintermark in my mind, and that level of emotion within the song, about singing something that's passionate about I suppose everyone's very passionate…

HD: do you think there's generally an agreed sound among the whole nation of what you would all agree are "sounds of Wintermark".

RF: probably, but I don't think in the same way it would be categorised in the same way, I don't think everybody could point to something and go "yeah it's a pretty Wintermark sing" but then every body would go "I like something a bit different", or "I like playing this instrument", or, you know, there's a person who's done a copy of a rap, that's changed into a Wintermark version, so that's very different to a folk song, but it works in character as well, so changing the tone of a song, so changing old heavy metal songs, but in a slower fashion- people know the song so they sing along, but it varies from what it was, but I mean, an actual definitive noise, I don't know, there could be something, cause I guess that's the … of Empire- each nation, it's like the virtues, you could argue all day about which ones are correct, saying probably well, what is correct? Each way, you could prove that it be, you could prove every single way that that's your nation's psyche or singing or playing a guitar or something different, every single one of those could be Wintermark, but probably the mountainous songs, and things that are Wintermark, cold, you know, in character.

HD: so Wintermark is a decidedly Nordic inspired nation, that would be correct to say, wouldn't it? So in creating music for it, I would imagine that there is somewhat of an inclination to try and create a Nordic set of sounds for it to try and make it sound, well our idea of "Nordic", so how do you conversely from what you were saying there, how do you create a Nordic set of ideas for this kind of music, and if it isn't Nordic, can you tell me what it is?

RF: the Nordic element to it is one part of it, but the Rohirrim is a really big influence on that so it's not just- that fantastical element of a world things that you would sing about, obviously you know, there's no horses in Empire, or the Rohirrim aren't there, but that kind of artwork within their work of songs, and I don't know how to describe that, that's how someone would

create a… not entirely sure actually? Could you read it back again?

HD: (repeat)

RF: I think, when I go about creating a song, I don't necessarily go about creating it to be on that kind of brief, the songs that I learn are something that I feel mean something to me, a little bit and hope that that feeling that I can put in that song, and that emotion or that, the way that I deliver it, can make somebody else feel that kind of way, but I look for the songs in the way that they fit the brief in that respect, so I'm looking for the medieval songs, songs in other languages, Gaelic songs but by hearing rather than hearing…

HD: so you're more about the interpersonal effect of what you can do, rather than sticking rigidly to the brief and creating a certain kind of sound world- you're more about the player experience, is that right?

RF: yeah, so the way that I sing is, but I haven't had a person tell me it's not on brief yet.

HD: well that's a really interesting point actually, because I've spoken to a few different people now and everybody's purpose is slightly different. There have been one or two who like, yourself who focus more on the player experience and what they can do in order to help immerse another player, whereas others are a bit more invested in creating a specific style of sound world and neither of those approaches are either right or wrong, it's just different ways of doing it, and it's just interesting to see how it varies.

RF: definitely, and that's something I really like doing- I go around Empire rather than just staying Wintermark as well, so there's a lot of people that know me as a Wintermark scop, like before they see you as a, they see you as… sorry go on.

HD: So based on that, cause I agree that Wintermark is made up of a lot of different sources of inspiration, I knew of the Rohirrim, I knew about the other fantastical elements of it, I understood the Saxon connection, so I'm interested to hear, from a musical perspective if at all possible, why do you think that people, however mistakenly compare this nation's aesthetic to the Vikings?

RF: it's the fur shoulders and the Norse hats, I think that's why it's known as a Viking nation to be honest, there's lots of axes, there's lots of the runes, I know they're not the same but the runes- I know they're not the same, but as a person just looking in, you know, Vikings are what runes are, so, Viking stuff, you know, the thing about Norse mythology, and stuff is in there, but you know, there's Thor's hammer but there's people wearing the helmets that look exactly like it, you have all the other symbolism or Norse mythology, so the types of things about birds and the things about the ravens and you know, they're the same thing with Odin and the ravens, and you've got the creatures, like the Krampus, you've got the storm will never break, set in the snow, you know, you've got the idea of the fur clad … of the Steinr, that's very stereotypical Rohirrim Viking kind of look, you know, with the borders that go round, the trim around the kit…

[section omitted; off topic]

RF: and it's that overlap, I believe, and then we've the other traditions within it, so there's the Suaq and the Kallavesi and each one as well have, you know, fill in a very similar role, so like the Seers, like the TV show as well about the Vikings, so the guy who's the very much looks like a Kallavesi i in the kind of role with feathers, you know and going back to Odin and the

221

idea of having the wings and the … and stuff and the birds… I think that's a big influence on people

HD: so it's just, for those who are used to the popular image of Vikings, they see the surface of this and go "oh, well it's Viking, ok".
RF: Not Viking, in that kind of way, there's very quickly, there's ongoing jokes in some online forums about how "is this on brief or Wintermark?", you know, horned helmets and you know the …Viking stuff, but it's all in good humour, but it is quite open because it's got 3 nations, pretty much within 1, so the briefs are a bit mixed, in that sense, say compared to Dolum.

HD: Wintermark has got a lot of new players, hasn't it in the last few years, do you think it's due to the new found popularity of Norse style aesthetics, and essentially Viking aesthetics that a lot of new players have seen that this game encompasses some of those elements and want to join in?

RF: possibly, yeah, I mean there's been a couple of people who have worked really hard to get quite a lot of … out there for Wintermark, specifically, there's… Mark… there's one of the guys who ran the podcast, to make… Mark Holmes is it? He was over and did the podcast and people saw that and things and got all involved and but yeah, I reckon Viking culture in that sense has probably rubbed off on a lot of people going. But looking at the briefs- this is my personal thoughts on it, one of the, you'd think one of the simplest ones, to make things for, Viking? I can find a Viking kit.

HD: and it's just triangles and rectangles when you make the kit.

RF: so when you're looking at it- I mean, for myself, you might be like "yeah but this is much easier for me to make", but I, that's probably why they chose that nation to go for! And for new people, not having to buy kit, and just being able to alter like, a fur coat to play, is something, it's…

HD: so it's accessible?

RF: I reckon so yeah, it gives you a little bit more variety in the ways that you can approach your character .

HD: I've heard a lot about, from all different angles, a lot about accessibility… it's very interesting. So going onto immersion, again, cause that's what I'm really interested in, how would you compare your immersion while you're in character vs your immersion as a performer while in the game? Is there any difference between the two?

RF: not really, in respect to Empire, but at CP [Curious Pastimes, other LARP system] it's different

HD: oh yeah- feel free to talk about other things you've done!

RF: yeah, well in Empire it's not much different cause my character is a performer, and that's what I do- I do that as my job as well, so I go around the camps and sing for everybody, and earn money from the hall to do that.

HD; and so your character would be thinking of "ok, which verse am I doing next, am I, is my instrument tuned, am I in the right setting"- your character would be thinking all of those things, as the real life you would be in that situation, so it fits, yeah.

RF: … and that in character, the person who I am is, that is the performance that I'm doing at the time, so I'm conscious of not drinking too much, I am conscious of having a song book, of being able to check words if I need it but if I haven't created it in character- you know, props and stuff, … to hand it out to someone to select a song they want me to sing, you know, for a certain price or what not.

HD: that's a way of connecting it with the inner workings of the game- yeah?

RF: yeah, but at CP it's slightly different, so that's curious past times, the role of the bard is very different, so the role of the bard there is protected, in that, if you're talking as a bard, you can talk over somebody else, so that they want to hear what the bard says because it's a level of respect, in that kind of world, so if you're singing a song, and someone interrupts you, you're very acknowledged to have a go at them, and my character there is not a nice person, I play a religious zealot, basically, so it's the shouting about the Morrigan and doing all kinds of shouty shouty stuff about things, but it's a very different character to play, so there it's more about the songs, its more about creating the, like we were saying before- it's not about the players, necessarily enjoying that singing, it's about me putting across a persona of regret underneath the character, so it was more within the character, so because he's so officious and shouty and angry, but he sings quite a lot of sad and melancholic songs so it's a nice balance in that kind of way

HD: so, does the content that you create and perform, change or gain new influence and meaning after certain plot progressions or alterations within the game? So if something really big happens, in the field, will that affect the way your song's considered, or does it ever inspire you to write new material or…?

RF: oh yeah it does, definitely, there was a couple of things that happened with Doggery, and sometimes songs just fall into making it work, so you'll be singing about something that is not actually a nailed idea, it's just a song, and when you sing it again and suddenly that song reminds you of that so that situation has, as songs do, you know, they're very relatable in certain ways, so just adding a word or two into that song really makes it seal that, fits that scenario, if you know what I mean?

HD: yes, I do, and again it helps other people, bring that into their own history of the nation

RF: I do like bringing a little bit of my own element, you know, if I'm doing that to something, you know, to put my own opinion on it, so if there was the situation, so the one with Doggery, it was a very melancholic song that I sung about that because of the way that my character thought about that situation, so in that kind of way I suppose I'm leading the long and how to influence in that kind of way again.

HD: so, the other thing I wanted to ask about immersion, is, to what extent, if any, does your content creation remain in an immersive experience for you, in between events, so when you're writing outside of the field, when you're practising outside of the field, how are you thinking, are you thinking as your character, are you thinking as yourself?

RF: Like I said, I'll look for a song, so I'll listen to loads and loads and loads of songs, just plowing through, and I'll find something and go "oh, I really like that", and I'll store it and you know, keep listening to it, and all the ones that I find I'll just keeping listening to till I find one that really gets me going, if you know what I mean? So as a, and then I'll practise at home, I also practise in the car, I do busking in my outfit as well in Leeds, and it's one way to just get…

HD: do you mean as your character or…?

RF: well not AS my character but wearing my character's outfit, I mean when, because you're allowed to busk in the centre of Leeds and you're allowed to wander around without a licence if you're singing, so I'll just do that, it's a little bit of a way to keep me on my toes, and there's always an audience that I've never met before so it's …

HD: oh okay! That's really interesting! Cause there's a, similarly to that there's a player in Varushka who does Facebook live streaming as their character, and who takes requests for songs and responds to people about things. I've yet to meet anybody else who engages with an audience in that particular way between events, but I would say that what you do comes quite close to that, except it's not with a familiar audience, it's with complete strangers, which is very brave actually! I wouldn't do it, I'm very nervous about performance

RF: On that note, I think that actually LARP in general, I was just talking to my friend actually about this one, increases confidence, and that when I first came to Empire, I wasn't a singer, ever at all, I don't play an instrument, I just sing, and that song from that first, my brother invited me to the … came along and I went on a skirmish and I wrote a story about it, posted it up in the group online and they went "right, well you can tell that next event then" and I was like…; got to the next event and my brother said "well, go on, tell the story then", so well, no-there's loads of people here, and he went "tell the story or I'll tell it badly!", I was like "fine", so I told the story and then right "now you're the scop- learn some songs", so every single event I've been learning more and more songs, but all, ever since then my confidence has risen, so much so, I used to do all kinds of different jobs, driving, delivering all kinds, social policy, and I'd found an escape route, where I have to do stuff on brief, and tell stories, and you know, that, I don't think I would ever had the confidence if I hadn't been a scop at this event, and that building of that confidence, in the way of, not even as the character necessarily but that's seen the reflection of me becoming more confident in myself as a person through that.

HD: that's brilliant. I'm really happy! So, I've just got one last thing for you, it's about, it's to do with the ownership of your work, I'm interested in how you would categorise the ownership of your work when you perform here, when you go around these nations performing your songs; once it's circulated into the community, is it your own, or is it collective? Are you happy with other people recycling your work and repeating it? How does it make you feel when you hear?

RF: I really like it but, just to go back a little bit, I don't write, I haven't written any of mine, I will filk songs that happen, so I'm, I would be very apprehensive to tell anybody they can't sing my songs because they're really, in my mind, somebody else's songs anyway, but if I'm singing them and I've changed some of the words around, I'm not doing it for profit, I'm not selling any of those things, but my version of it, of a very old folk song for example, for this Dunmain type of thing, or singing an old folk song that everybody knows and it's then put in my own way, I really don't mind that, and filking songs actively encourage that, that in some respects people, I've had quite a lot of people asking me about certain songs that get stuck in their head that are filks or something they know, but they don't quite know all the extra ins and outs of the words, so there's a split as well in the people that think "oh well we'll share them online" or whatever, or give me the lyrics and I'll send them to you, but Stormspire in particular are the ones where they want you to learn it in character- they don't want you to learn outside character, you know, they want you to visit them in character to learn the song, which I think is really cool, but again, in the end of the day- having other people sing it, not as helpful cause it means that not your wider audience, you know, people singing it in a different nation, or,

you know, someone likes that song so they will do that. So yeah, there's been a few like that, like, you know, the Brass Coast Privateers, getting songs and learning them in the field, but I'd like that, I'd like the idea of someone messaging me going "I really like that song, it was great, I couldn't get that out of my head, you know, what… oh, do you know what the lyrics are?" and I'll send them so that if they ever do sing it themselves, if they could say that they, either learnt it from a scop in Wintermark, it doesn't necessarily have to be my name, just something that's saying …

HD: just the knowledge that it came from Wintermark?

RF: something like that, or if they were going to then post it online, "filked by Roger" or whatnot, not even in a "made" or any kind of way, cause obviously, if you've heard of an old sea shanty and suddenly someone's like "yeah, Roger wrote it" (laughter), no I didn't, as long as it actually says "filked by" or whatnot then I don't mind, and I'd actively encourage it, I'd love people to sing some of the things that I sung.

HD: because you want to be able to communicate that level of immersion into other people.

RF: yeah, and make them feel the same thing that I felt by learning that song.