

**Perceptions of identity, rights and duties: insights
from students' reading of fiction at a university in
Pakistan**

Ghazal Kazim Syed

PhD

University of York

Education

November 2016

Abstract

This project investigates university students' perceptions of identity, rights and duties in relation to four novels they study as part of their curriculum. The context of the study is an English department at a public-sector university in Sindh, Pakistan. The main research question that guides this study is, *What perceptions of identity, rights and duties are held by a sample of undergraduate students in Pakistan in the context of their study of fiction?* Semi-structured interviews and classrooms observations were used as the research instruments. Rosenblatt's (1938/1970, 1978/1994) reader-response framework and Cogan's (1998) model of citizenship are used as theoretical frameworks guiding this study. Following feasibility and pilot studies, data for the main study was supplied by twenty-six participants through interviews, comprising three members of curriculum designing board, three teachers of fiction and twenty students of final year undergraduate class. Background and stimulus data was provided by two classroom observations. The key arguments based on findings of this study are that participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties included types and examples of citizenship themes discussed by Cogan as well as the themes particularly relevant to the participants' context such as religion and caste issues. Furthermore, the participants discussed and connected to identity, rights and duties in the novels that were geographically, socially and temporally close in terms of their context which was as expected in light of Rosenblatt's framework. I make recommendations for further research to explore the role of context in learners' citizenship interpretations of novels along with other recommendations for research and professional practice.

List of Contents

Abstract	2
List of Contents	3
List of Tables	10
Acknowledgements	12
Declaration	13
1. Introduction	14
1.1 Purpose and research questions.....	15
1.2 Context of the study	16
1.2.1 Socio-political situation	17
1.2.2 Ethnic and religious identity	17
1.2.3 Family structure	19
1.2.4 The public sector university	19
1.2.5 Public and private school background	21
1.2.6 Situation of citizenship education in Pakistan	21
1.3 Structure of the thesis.....	22
2. Literature Review- relevant studies and theoretical framework	26
2.1 The Background- Literary theory.....	27
2.2 The Foreground- Teaching Citizenship through Literature	29
2.2.1 Teaching citizenship through other subjects	29
2.2.2 Teaching citizenship through English.....	30
2.2.3 The impact of teaching citizenship through literature.....	33

2.2.4 Teaching citizenship to young adults	34
2.3 Theoretical framework- Rosenblatt’s Reader response theory	35
2.3.1 Rosenblatt’s Reader-response theory- a rationale.....	35
2.3.2 Elements of Rosenblatt’s reader response theory	38
2.4 Theoretical framework- Cogan’s model of Citizenship.....	44
2.4.1 Citizenship-definition, models, and attributes	44
2.4.2 Identity	48
2.4.3 Rights	55
2.4.4 Duties	62
2.5 Conclusion	67
3. Literature review- exploration of four novels	69
3.1 <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	70
3.1.1 Identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	73
3.1.2 Rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	77
3.1.3 Duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	79
3.1.4 Conclusion	80
3.2 <i>The God of Small Things</i>	81
3.2.1 Identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	83
3.2.2 Rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	86
3.2.3 Duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	89
3.2.4 Conclusion	90
3.3 <i>A Passage to India</i>	90
3.3.1 Identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	93

3.3.2	Rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	96
3.3.3	Duties in <i>A Passage to India</i>	97
3.3.4	Conclusion	98
3.4	<i>Lord of the Flies</i>	99
3.4.1	Identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	102
3.4.2	Rights in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	103
3.4.3	Duties in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	104
3.4.4	Conclusion	105
3.5	Concluding remarks about the four novels	105
4.	Methodology	108
4.1	Research questions	109
4.2	Feasibility Study	110
4.3	Pilot Project.....	111
4.4	Research design.....	115
4.5	Sampling of the participants	116
4.6	Sampling of the novels.....	120
4.7	Data Collection.....	121
4.7.1	Interviews	121
4.7.2	Translation issues	126
4.7.3	Observations.....	129
4.8	Data Analysis	130
4.8.1	Familiarization with the data.....	131
4.8.2	Generating codes and themes.....	131

4.8.3	Reviewing themes	135
4.8.4	Producing a report	136
4.9	Validity and Reliability	136
4.10	Ethical issues	138
4.11	Methodological feasibility	139
4.12	Conclusion	140
5.	Findings.....	142
5.1	Participants’ perceptions of identity, rights and duties	142
5.1.1	Participants’ perceptions of identity	143
5.1.2	Participants’ perceptions of rights.....	146
5.1.3	Participants’ perceptions of duties	150
5.2	Perceptions on identity, rights and duties in the novels.....	152
5.2.1	Participants’ perceptions on <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	153
5.2.2	Participants’ exploration of <i>The God of Small Things</i>	159
5.2.3	Participants’ exploration of <i>A Passage to India</i>	165
5.2.4	Participants’ exploration of <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	170
5.3	Students making sense of identity, rights and duties through novels	173
5.3.1	Relating to citizenship themes in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	174
5.3.2	Relating to citizenship themes in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	179
5.3.3	Relating to citizenship themes in <i>A Passage to India</i>	184
5.3.4	Relating to citizenship themes in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	187
5.3.5	Conclusion	189
5.4	Facilitating factors.....	189

5.4.1 Curriculum as a facilitating factor.....	190
5.4.2 Teaching methods	193
5.4.3 External help	194
5.5 Conclusion	195
6. Participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties	197
6.1 Perceptions of identity	197
6.2 Perceptions of rights.....	204
6.3 Perceptions of duties	210
6.4 Overarching argument.....	215
6.5 Conclusion	218
7. Identifying citizenship themes in the novels.....	221
7.1 Discussion of participants' exploration of <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	222
7.1.1 Identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	222
7.1.2 Rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	225
7.1.3 Duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	226
7.2 Discussion of participants' exploration of <i>The God of Small Things</i>	228
7.2.1 Identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	229
7.2.2 Rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	232
7.2.3 Duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	234
7.3 Discussion of participants' exploration of <i>A Passage to India</i>	236
7.3.1 Identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	237
7.3.2 Rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	240
7.3.3 Duties in <i>A Passage to India</i>	240

7.4 Discussion of participants' exploration of <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	241
7.4.1 Identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	242
7.4.2 Rights in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	244
7.4.3 Duties in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	244
7.5 Perceptions of citizenship themes in the novels- an overarching argument	245
7.6 Conclusion	250
8. Making sense of citizenship themes in the novels	251
8.1 Making sense of identity, rights and duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	251
8.1.1 Identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	252
8.1.2 Rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	254
8.1.3 Duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	256
8.1.4 Conclusion	258
8.2 Making sense of identity, rights and duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	258
8.2.1 Identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	258
8.2.2 Rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	261
8.2.3 Duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	263
8.2.4 Conclusion	265
8.3 Making sense of identity, rights and duties through <i>A Passage to India</i>	265
8.3.1 Identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	265
8.3.2 Rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	268
8.3.3 Duties in <i>A Passage to India</i>	269
8.3.4 Conclusion	270
8.4 Making sense of identity, rights and duties through <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	270

8.4.1 Identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	271
8.4.2 Rights in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	272
8.4.3. Duties in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	272
8.4.4 Conclusion	273
8.5 Facilitating factors.....	273
8.6 Overarching argument.....	277
8.7 Conclusion	281
9. Conclusion	283
9.1 Overarching argument.....	283
9.1.1 Views on Citizenship Themes.....	283
9.1.2 Views on Themes in the Novels	287
9.1.3 Conclusion	293
9.2 Theoretical implications- some concluding reflections	294
9.3 Recommendations for future research	295
9.4 Recommendations for professional practice	297
9.5 Limitations and methodological feasibility.....	297
Appendix I Interview Schedule- Departmental BoS.....	299
Appendix II Interview Schedule- Teachers of Fiction.....	300
Appendix III Interview Schedule- Students.....	301
Appendix IV Consent form.....	303
References	304

List of Tables

Table 4.1 Participants' gender, language, religion and school background	113
Table 4.2 Participants' gender, language, religion and school background	119
Table 4.3 Initial NVivo codes	132
Table 4.4 Coding participants' views on duties	134
Table 4.5 Tree codes at the second stage	135
Table 5.1 Participants' perceptions of their identity, rights and duties	143
Table 5.2 Participants' perceptions of identity	144
Table 5.3 Participants' perceptions of rights	147
Table 5.4 Participants' perceptions of duties	150
Table 5.5 Participants' identification of themes in novels	153
Table 5.6 Explicit and implicit discussion of themes in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	154
Table 5.7 Participants' perceptions on identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	155
Table 5.8 Participants' perceptions on rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	156
Table 5.9 Participants' perceptions on duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	157
Table 5.10 Explicit and implicit discussion of themes in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	159
Table 5.11 Participants' perceptions on identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	160
Table 5.12 Participants' perceptions on rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	162
Table 5.13 Participants' perceptions on duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	164
Table 5.14 Explicit and implicit discussion of themes in <i>A Passage to India</i>	165

Table 5.15 Participants' perceptions on identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	166
Table 5.16 Participants' perceptions on rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	168
Table 5.17 Explicit and implicit discussion of themes in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	170
Table 5.18 Participants relating themes in fiction to everyday life and society	174
Table 5.19 Relating to identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	175
Table 5.20 Participants relating to rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	176
Table 5.21 Participants relating to duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	178
Table 5.22 Participants relating to identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	179
Table 5.23 Participants relating to rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	181
Table 5.24 Participants relating to duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	183
Table 5.25 Participants relating to identity in to <i>A Passage India</i>	185
Table 5.26 Participants relating to rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	186
Table 5.27 Participants relating to identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	188
Table 5.28 Facilitating factors	190
Table 5.29 Curriculum as a facilitating factor	191
Table 5.30 Discussion within the classroom as a facilitating factor	193
Table 5.31 External help	195

Acknowledgements

I acknowledge and am very grateful for all the support of my supervisor, Professor Ian Davies to whom I am greatly indebted. He was the one point of contact during the whole process and he was always there to answer all the queries I had. I feel privileged to have had him as my guide and mentor. I am also thankful to my Thesis Advisor, Dr. Amanda Naylor who gave invaluable feedback on my thesis. Her guidance has helped me improve the quality of my work tremendously.

I am thankful to all my friends at York and back home whose company kept me going during the process. A big thank you to all colleagues and peers in the Research Center for Social Sciences where I was based the last three years, for all the support and advice during the whole journey.

I am very thankful to all my family for their support and wishes. My mom and papa for bringing me so far, my sisters for bearing with me through the stress and Kazim for pushing me on and challenging me at every step.

Finally, this degree would not have been possible without the financial support I received from the Higher Education Commission Pakistan in the form of a four year fully funded scholarship. I am grateful for the chance. I would also like to thank Charles Wallace Trust for their very helpful grant towards the end of my PhD.

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is a presentation of original work and I am the sole author. This work has not previously been presented for an award at this, or any other, University. All sources used are acknowledged under “References”.

This thesis has been carried out according to the rules and regulations of the University of York. No journal articles or any other form of publication has been published from the thesis as yet.

1. Introduction

This study explored final year undergraduate students' perceptions of identity, rights and duties in relation to the fiction they study as part of their course. The context of this study was an English department of a public sector university in Sindh, Pakistan. The study's main objectives were threefold: to explore what identity, rights and duties meant to these undergraduate students; whether they thought the three themes of identity, rights and duties were there in the novels; and how did they relate their perceptions, their experiences and observations with the presence of the three themes in the novels, and if so, how were they helped to do so. The novels included in this research, selected from the university curriculum in light of the pilot study, are *A Tale of Two Cities* (Dickens, 1859/1994); *The God of Small Things* (Roy, 1997); *A Passage to India* (Forster, 1924/2005) and *Lord of the Flies* (Golding, 1954/1988). Rosenblatt's (1938/1970, 1978/1994) reader response framework and Cogan's (1998) models of citizenship were used as theoretical frameworks that guided the study. The feasibility study and pilot study conducted before the main study helped design and inform the research methods used in the main study. The main study, conducted in two stages, included at the first stage, semi-structured interviews with members of the Board of Studies who helped design the curriculum, with teachers of fiction who taught the novels selected for the purposes of this study. Two classroom observations were also conducted at this stage which helped form an informed background for the data collected at the second stage. The second stage included interviews with the final year undergraduate students who had studied the novels as part of their 'Fiction' and 'World Literature' modules.

The study found that participants talked about various aspects of the three themes of identity, rights and duties including national, ethnic, civic, political, moral, religious, social-caste and class related issues. These aspects were not necessarily the same as those

discussed in Cogan (1998) or other European or American concepts of citizenship. Citizenship in this project is defined in terms of the three citizenship themes of identity, rights and duties according to Cogan's (1998) model of citizenship. In relation to the discussion of citizenship in context of the novels, respondents discussed the novels that were contextually close to them such as *The God of Small Things*. The participants also related their experiences and observations more to the contextually and temporally close novels than the novels like *Lord of the Flies* which were not based in a setting they were familiar with. This is in agreement with what was expected in light of Rosenblatt's (1938/1970, 1978/1994) theory. In light of my findings, I argue that general elements of citizenship as discussed by Cogan as well as more socially and contextually relevant elements, such as caste, religion and morality, were important to these young people. Furthermore, the participants identified citizenship themes in and related their experiences and observations to novels whose geographical, social and temporal context was closer to their own. The word "identify" is used, throughout this thesis, to suggest respondents indicating that a given theme exists in a novel. Words "relate to" or "make sense of" are used when they make any connections between the events and characters in the novels and their experiences and observations.

This study hopes to contribute to the growing body of literature on teaching citizenship or social studies (a roughly equivalent American subject) through literature. It further hopes to initiate the possibility of exploring citizenship through literature at the university level in Pakistan.

1.1 Purpose and research questions

The purpose of the study is to explore undergraduate university students' perceptions of identity, rights and duties in relation to four novels they read as part of their curriculum. The study is not looking for causal links between fiction and participants'

perceptions rather exploring participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties in relation to fiction. Citizenship being a broad term was reviewed and defined in terms of Cogan's (1998) framework. The first three components of Cogan's idea of citizenship are identity, rights and duties which are used to define citizenship in this study. However, as this was a study about students' responses, the theoretical framework was completed by adding Rosenblatt's reader response theory (1938/1970, 1978/1994).

Questions that guided the study considered the students' limited knowledge of citizenship as a subject (discussed further in Section 1.2) and defined citizenship in terms of Cogan's framework for them. Their understanding of the three citizenship themes (identity, rights and duties) and their perceptions in relation to their study of fiction throughout the final year is explored through the research questions. The research questions are:

What perceptions of identity, rights and duties are held by a sample of undergraduate students in Pakistan in the context of their study of fiction?

- *What do students think identity, rights and duties mean?*
- *Do students think that identities, rights and duties are included in a sample of set fictional texts?*
- *Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?*

1.2 Context of the study

Crossley (2010) argues that contextual and cultural factors demand increased attention in education as they help relate educational theory to practice. The context of this study, Sindh, which is one of the four provinces of Pakistan and has historically been home to the Sindhi people, is thus discussed in this section. The contextual factors that affect this

project are discussed in the following paragraphs.

1.2.1 Socio-political situation

Pakistan, termed “a struggling nation-state” by Jan (2010), has had a very disturbed political history since its inception in 1947. Due to repetitive shifts between democracy and dictatorships, there have been changes in its education policy as well. Repetitive alterations in policies have led to instability in the educational system. The increase in literacy rate has been gradual, Pakistan’s literacy rate was 37.2% in 1995 (Khan, 1997), 54% according to Economic Survey of Pakistan in 2004 (Choudhry, 2006), and 54.9% in 2010 (Huebler & Lu, 2012). In terms of economic setting, Pakistan is a poor country with a large percentage of the population living below the poverty line. Access to education is implausible for families striving for basic amenities as they prefer sending children to earn rather than to study.

The participants of this study come from various sectors of society, however as this is a public-sector university most of them have a working or lower middle class background. The economic and educational setting that the participants have been part of and have witnessed are reflective of the ways they perceive society at large. It was expected at the beginning of the study that respondents’ socioeconomic backgrounds might affect the way they perceive identity, rights and duties as there is a huge divide between upper and lower class in Pakistani society.

1.2.2 Ethnic and religious identity

The perceptions that the participants in this study hold regarding identity will be based upon and shaped out of the contextual notions of Sindhi, Muslim, Sunni, Shia, Punjabi, Hindu etc. Their identities are being constantly shaped and reshaped by the changing contextual factors. The position of the group they belong to, majority or minority,

was speculated to have an impact on how they understand and perceive the notions of identity, rights and duties. Sindhis, in general, have a strong sense of identity as a nation (Shahriar, 2013). Most Sindhis identify themselves as Sindhi rather than Pakistani owing to their rich culture before the creation of Pakistan and their, arguably, suppressed state in the present. To date, there are many Sindhis who do not accept the partition of Pakistan and talk about an independent Sindh country (Siddiqi, 2012). These people call themselves ‘nationalist’ Sindhis, a phenomenon quite common in the young, mostly male, students at the university due to the presence of nationalist student political parties (more on this is discussed under Section 1.2.4). Moreover, these ‘nationalists’ blame Punjab, the largest province of Pakistan, for snatching away their rights and taking over the government, the army and most of the revenue of Pakistan, which Sindhis claim is generated within their province. Sindhis believe they are discriminated on every front. Punjabis living in Sindh, including young adults studying at the university, may suffer from the same discrimination as they are in a minority there.

A majority of Sindh’s population (91.32%) is Muslim, 93% of the country’s Hindus form 6.5% of the province’s population (Census, 1998). Other religious minorities include Christians, Qadianis and Zoroastrians though they form a very small percentage of the country’s population. Sindh, considered to be the land of Sufis, has been an abode to people of mixed religious identities for a long time. Religious tensions, however, have increased in Pakistan in the last couple of decades which has affected the province of Sindh as well (SATP, 2015). There is, in recent decades, religious intolerance in the province not just against Hindus but also against differing sects of Islam (Shaikh, 2013). There are primarily two sects of Islam in the context- Shia and Sunni. Many incidents of sectarian violence have been recorded in Sindh (SATP, 2014), more on this is presented in Section 2.4.2. These identity clashes were expected to be relevant as issues participants may address while expressing their views of identity.

1.2.3 Family structure

It is expected that participants' families play a significant role in shaping their perceptions of their identity, rights and duties. Families are closely knit in Sindh, as elsewhere in Pakistan. Many Sindhis live in extended families where the father (or grandfather) is the head of the family and his word is what matters. Pakistani society is based on a collectivist culture. Collectivist cultures are associated with interdependence of individuals and emphasize the importance of groups like families and tribes, whereas individualist cultures, as the name suggests, emphasise the independence of individuals (Triandis, 2001). Collectivist cultures are usually associated with in-group goals like goals of the neighbourhoods, goals of the class, goals of the family, while individualist cultures relate with personal goals, individuals here are more independent unlike their interdependent counterparts. Typically, individualism is associated with the western cultures of American and European nations, whereas the Asian cultures are supposed to be more collectivist (Oysermann et al., 2002).

The meaning of choice, essential beliefs that surround the self and the impact that these beliefs have on perceptions differs greatly across cultures. There can of course be exceptions in any setting but the general trend tends to be collectivist in Sindh. Participants of this study have grown up in a society where education, career, goals and performance are seen in relation to other people in family and social circle and are often a collective choice. This is expected to be reflected in the participants' perceptions and an understanding of the causes is hoped to benefit the reader.

1.2.4 The public sector university

The context of this study is a public-sector university in Sindh, Pakistan. An understanding of this context is expected to aid the understanding of participants' perceptions. The cost of education is fairly low here (on an average Rs. 8500 annually,

which is around £56.6 for Bachelors of Arts degree). Due to the low cost of education, the majority of students who attend the university come from low-income households of the rural areas of the province of Sindh that are underdeveloped and underprivileged. Most students who can afford to pay for education, opt for the private universities.

The university offers a four-year Bachelors Studies (BS) programme. The participants of this study are in their final year. The curriculum followed by all public sector universities in Pakistan is set by Higher Education Commission Pakistan. The literature included is not specific to an era and includes a variety of novels. Moreover, Fiction is taught as a separate subject to final year undergraduates, along with three other subjects. Classes at the institute are held five days a week. Every major subject gets a 50-minute class every working day. Another feature of the English department, that should be mentioned, is that English literature is defined widely here, it is not literature of England rather literature in English. This is the reason that the fiction taught to final year students is varied and diverse.

The existence of political parties in the university rather than a student union is also a factor that may influence the perceptions of participants. Most of the student political parties in the university are 'nationalist' advocating that the creation of Pakistan was inappropriate. It is not an uncommon sight at the university to hear slogans being raised against Punjabis. "*Jeko Punjabyun jo yaar aa ghadaar aa ghadaar aa*" [My translation: The one who befriends the Punjabis, he is a traitor, he is a traitor] is a very common slogan heard on a daily basis on campus. This attitude of nationalism has created not just support for itself but has also shifted some to the other end of the extreme, hating Sindh, and some to indifference towards these political issues.

Communism and left-wing literature is also being widely read at the university. This might be perceptible in some of the students' perceptions as they read fiction. However, that does not mean that all students look at texts from the perspectives of

preconceived notions or with a closed mind. There are also among the students some very critical thinkers who argue reasonably and form and change views as they are exposed to new knowledge, and are allowed to do so by most of the faculty, if not all.

1.2.5 Public and private school background

A vast majority of the students in public sector universities come from public schools. Most of them are from rural, underdeveloped areas where curriculum provided by the provincial Textbook Boards is followed. There are some students from private-sector schools as well. The medium of instruction in the public schools is often the mother-tongue, Sindhi or Urdu in some areas. Private sector schools, on the other hand, have great variation as they do not necessarily follow the government textbook curriculum. On the one hand, there are low-cost private schools which have a lower overall standard of education than public schools. On the other, there are some elite high-cost schools which have internal curriculum modelled on the national curriculum of developed countries like the UK (e.g., Beaconhouse, 2014) and have English as the medium of instruction. Students from the elite schools often have a clear advantage over those from other public/private schools as they have had exposure to an advanced curriculum. Linguistic advantage of command over English is also significant in the university setting as the medium of instruction and evaluation at the university is English in most departments including the department of English. The educational and rural or urban background were expected to affect the way students look at themes of identity, rights and duties.

1.2.6 Situation of citizenship education in Pakistan

The participants of this study have not had any formal education in citizenship as it is not part of any curriculum subject taught in Pakistan. The closest curriculum subject to citizenship education is Social Studies (as suggested by Dean, 2005). However, there is much debate, in Pakistan, regarding the unsuitability of the content of Social Studies

textbooks owing to its Islamised and partial content that hinders the growth of critical thinking amongst learners (Dean, 2005). What the participants have had though is some lessons of citizenship infused through other subjects. This might not meet the standard that western citizenship educators would like, owing to the many problems of the education system in Pakistan such as standard of curriculum (Nelson, 2006) and teacher training (Avalos, 1985). This background is considered when designing the interview schedules and defining citizenship for the participants. Moreover, the way they have been taught is also expected to affect their perceptions.

To conclude, these contextual factors are expected to affect students' insights into the three citizenship themes. Furthermore, an understanding of the context gives an informed view and helps relate the data back to the context.

1.3 Structure of the thesis

This thesis is divided into nine chapters. This first chapter includes the context of the study and structure of the thesis. Chapter Two is based on my analysis of academic literature related to teaching citizenship through literature. I discuss, in the background, debates around the purpose of art, emphasising the need for a social purpose of teaching literature. In the foreground, is the discussion of teaching citizenship through literature. In this section, I discuss the debates in literature around how to teach citizenship- as a cross-curricular theme or a separate subject. Moreover, I discuss studies conducted to teach citizenship through other subjects specifically English literature. This discussion is followed by the presentation of two theoretical frameworks, that of Cogan and Rosenblatt. A discussion of Rosenblatt's reader response theory includes explanation of the various elements of the theory such as the role of the learner and the teacher and the effect of different reading styles. Moreover, I discuss my rationale for choosing Rosenblatt's framework as it is about student response to literary work and takes into account various

factors that facilitate this learning and interpreting process. A discussion of Cogan's framework includes a rationale explaining why this framework was chosen. As this was chosen for students of literature, a framework which defined citizenship in terms of specific elements and had been used in a project exploring the perceptions of young people across various contexts (Cogan and Derricott, 1998) was the best choice. In individual sections, I discuss the concepts of identity, rights and duties in light of the literature. I also present the issues related to each theme in the literature based in the Pakistani context which indicates the importance of identity, rights and duties in the context and the need for this kind of study.

Chapter Three is my analysis of the literature on the four novels. Each section includes a short summary of the novel and introduction to the author followed by a specific analysis of the discussion of each citizenship theme in the text and in relevant academic literature.

Chapter Four discusses the methodology used in the research project. It explains the research questions the study was guided by. It is reported that the study was conducted at two stages. Background and stimulus data, through interviews with board members and teachers and two classroom observations, was collected at the first stage of the study. Main data was collected at the second stage, through semi-structured in-depth interviews with twenty final year undergraduate students at a public sector university in Pakistan. Sampling issues related to the participants and the novels are also discussed in this chapter. Data was collected in the Autumn of 2014 in Sindh, Pakistan. Interviews were conducted in three languages depending on the first language and choice of the participants. This raised several translation issues which are acknowledged and necessary measures taken to ensure trustworthiness of the data are also reported. Data analysis was performed through coding in NVivo and thematic coding techniques were applied. Validity and reliability, ethical issues and methodological feasibility are also discussed towards the end of the chapter.

Chapter Five presents the findings of the study presenting coding details and interview excerpts. The findings related to the first research question highlight that rights and identity were discussed more than duties. Moreover, the participants were aware of various issues related to identity, rights and duties in their society. The findings related to the second research question highlight that students were able to identify themes in the novels, most in *The God of Small Things* and the least in *Lord of the Flies*. The findings related to the third research question, “*Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?*” show that a lower number of students made sense of the novels by relating them to their experiences and observations in society, than those who indicated the presence of the themes in the novels. Moreover, participants felt that their learning was helped by the choice of the novels, discussions in the classroom and outside.

Chapter Six presents a discussion of the findings related to the first research question, “*What do students think identity, rights and duties mean?*” I argue that participants’ perceptions of identity, rights and duties were to some extent general as presented by Cogan but also regional and local. They discussed some aspects such as civic and political that are accepted features of identity, rights and duties. They also discussed religious and moral aspects which are contextual as they are relevant to Asian concepts of citizenship. Moreover, elements such as caste were local aspects of identity, rights and duties that were important for these participants.

Chapter Seven presents a discussion of the findings related to the second research question, “*Do students think that identities, rights and duties are included in a sample of set fictional texts?*” I present individual arguments related to the discussion of each theme in each of the novels in separate sections. My overarching argument is that students discussed the novels that were geographically and temporally more relevant to them.

Chapter Eight presents a discussion of the third research question, “*Do students*

make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?" My overarching argument is that the respondents made sense of the citizenship themes in the novels through their experiences and observations more when the novels were contextually closer to their own social and temporal context. Moreover, teaching methods and choice of the novels also helped their learning process. I also argue that the aspects of identity, rights and duties that were important to the participants were determined by the nature of the themes in the novel and participants' context. Individual arguments about each theme and novel are also presented in distinct section.

Chapter Nine is the concluding chapter which presents the overarching argument. This is followed by a discussion of limitations and methodological feasibility. The thesis ends with recommendations for future research and professional practice.

2. Literature Review- relevant studies and theoretical framework

In this chapter, I present the literature reviewed. Selecting and reviewing the literature was a dynamic process. Firstly, different types of literature were identified including literature on literary theory, citizenship frameworks, the four novels, studies on teaching citizenship and on the readers' response to learning citizenship through literature. Secondly, key databases were identified. British Education Index, British Humanities Index, ERIC, JSTOR were the four main databases used along with Google Scholar and the University of York library portals. Thirdly, each individual search was based on the use of keywords and parameters such as date of publications, peer-reviewed journals. For example, in case of the literature search on teaching citizenship through literature, five keywords were identified- teaching/learning, literature/ fiction, reader/learner, response/perception, citizenship/civics/social studies/ society. The searches were filtered through subject and kind of publications. Fourthly, abstracts were reviewed and further reductions were made based on relevance. Fifthly, papers were read and drawn upon as identified in the list of references.

An analytical strategy was applied to the reading of the material bearing in mind the key words and their meanings. I looked for gaps and tensions in the literature and paid attention to contextual matters including social and national contexts as well as pedagogical issues and theoretical trends. All these aspects were used in an interactive process considering the area of interest, defining the focus and formulating the research questions. The questions are attached to the initial area of interest and emerge from my review of the literature as well as the interest in the research area and the piloting process. Moreover, the literature review also benefited from a less formal process such as one list of references led me to another reading; comments from peers and colleagues and feedback

from conference presentations led to the work of noted names in the field and my own experience during Masters also helped identify relevant literature.

In Section 2.1, I present a brief background including the literary debate around the usefulness of art. Section 2.2 presents a review of studies on teaching citizenship through literature. Theoretical frameworks based on Rosenblatt and Cogan are discussed in Section 2.3 and 2.4 respectively.

2.1 The Background- Literary theory

Academic argument regarding the purpose of all art, in general, and literature, in particular, formed a background to this study. Bloom (1996) and Wilde (1974) believe art should not be made a means to a purpose as it is an end in itself. The focus of this school of thought, which was called Art for Art's sake (Singer, 1954) or aestheticism (Robinson, 1953), was on aesthetics and expression of art as opposed to its "use". Wilde's (1974) sarcastic remark, "all art is completely useless" is symbolic of his school of thought. However, authors like F. R. Leavis (1948), Guerard (1970), Dee (2004) and Albrecht (1954) argue that literature is beneficial for society and serves a purpose. Matthew Arnold (1884) for example, believes that literature, like all arts serves and should serve the purpose of moral good.

Relating this debate to the teaching of English literature in schools are theorists like Cox and Kermode. Cox (1991) believes that English literature plays an essential role in the school curriculum as it enables the pupils to 'grow' aesthetically and morally. Frank Kermode (1989) who is an advocate of teaching English in higher education believes that "reading as we ought to teach it can make not a good person, but a subtle, questioning one" (p. 56). Teaching literature, therefore, has an effect on the learners.

The art that might have been created for its own sake might lead to pleasure or

instruction depending on how it is perceived. Rosenblatt (1982) declares literature finds meaning only when the reader reads it. Connell (1996) argues Rosenblatt has put emphasis on both aesthetic and instrumental purposes of learning literature by highlighting the importance of reader's experience. Thus, I proceed with the notion that literature can provide both aesthetic and instrumental purposes when it is taught in the classroom.

In Pakistani context, artists have been using art purposively since the creation of Pakistan (Syed and Abdullah, 2015). Literature, for example, has been used to advance social, moral and political ideals in the poetry of Iqbal and Faiz among others. Malik (1967) talks about purposive art in a pre-partition context as well when literature was used for political awakening of the masses.

Orientations to learning are also discussed as a background to this study. Learning, be it literature or any other discipline, can have either of the three orientations: transmissional, transactional or transformational (Evans, 2004). Transmission occurs as knowledge is transferred from the text/ teacher to the readers or learners (Miller, 1996; Evans, 2004). Transaction is quite fundamental to literature according to reader response theorists like Rosenblatt (1938/1970) and Iser (1978) who argue that reading is a two-way transaction of meaning that takes place between the text and the reader, where both the reader and the text help in building the interpretation. Advocates of transformation believe that a transformation takes place in reader perceptions when they read or study fiction (e.g., Duke, Victoria, Leigh & Tower, 2006; Harvey & Gourdis, 2007; Martin et al., 2012). The nature, extent and value of this transformation is arguable. The possibility of empirical study of literature like a social science, has made it more realistic and plausible to understand the transmission, transaction and transformation based on literature (Schram & Steen, 2001). In this study, using Rosenblatt's transactional reader response theory I have looked at how, if at all, students' perceptions of citizenship have transformed through their transaction with the novels they read.

2.2 The Foreground- Teaching Citizenship through Literature

In the foreground, are the studies on teaching citizenship through literature. I argue, in light of the studies discussed below, that citizenship can be taught in many ways and English literature provides a good content for the teaching of citizenship. Most of the studies conducted in this area are based in school settings. Even though my research is in a higher education context, teaching citizenship through literature at school level might provide useful insights into teaching and learning of citizenship through fiction at the university level.

2.2.1 Teaching citizenship through other subjects

Citizenship can be taught in different ways- as a discrete subject; through all subjects as an infused theme; or through institutional ethos. As this project is about learning of citizenship through literature, I highlight the debate regarding teaching citizenship through other subjects. Arthur et al. (2001) suggest the propagation of citizenship through all subjects, as opposed to teaching it as a discrete subject, as it helps establish a better understanding through constant reminder. Citizenship links have been found in different subjects by different scholars: history and citizenship (Crick, 2000); geography and citizenship (Lambert & Machon, 2004); English and citizenship (Spurgeon, 1994; Stevens, 2005) as well as science and citizenship (Davies, 2004).

There is an argument against teaching citizenship as a cross-curricular theme. Brett (2005) suggests that cross-curricular thematic approach to teaching citizenship can be complicated and time-consuming. Faulks (2006) claims that citizenship issues become less effective when taught through other subjects. Stevens (2005) takes a more practical standpoint, informing that teachers of English, in the UK, are required to teach citizenship themes through their lessons. Though some evidence supports the view that citizenship is

understood better when taught as a separate subject (Ofsted, 2010), there is other research (such as Kerr et al., 2003) which shows that practically schools prefer teaching citizenship through other subjects such as history, English and geography. As a former student and teacher of English literature, I was interested in looking at how readers perceived specific themes in relation to the novels, and if and how, they could relate their understanding of the novels with their experiences and observations.

2.2.2 Teaching citizenship through English

Fiction as a subject offers good elements for bringing social reforms and teaching themes which are propagated through citizenship (Spurgeon, 1995). As the Crick Report declares, “drama, role-play and stories can be excellent means to help pupils develop the ability to consider and appreciate the experience of others” (QCA, 1998,p. 53). Pike (2011) argued that critical literacy in English and citizenship education promote the same values and education for democratic citizenship can be carried out through teaching English. Moreover, Martin et al. (2012) also believe that students’ awareness of the world can be raised through reading world literature.

Some examples of studies that used English literature to teach citizenship are presented here. Spurgeon (1994) in his doctoral work researched contribution of English towards education for citizenship. He conducted action research in two schools where he taught as an English teacher for Key Stages 3 and 4, to investigate how literary texts, like Watson’s *Talking in Whispers*, can be used to develop citizenship skills and strategies among young learners. He investigated on the basis of five citizenship foci- racism; alternative visions of society; insiders, outsiders and society, human rights; and citizenship in the context of Northern Ireland. He used different texts for each focus- racism was taught through *Roll on Thunder* and *Come to Mecca*; alternative visions through *Animal Farm* and *Brother in the Land*; insiders, outsiders through *The Outsider*; human rights through

Talking in Whispers. In order to examine students' response to certain texts, individually and in groups, each text was taught using different strategies as the level of the students and nature of the text varied. As the researcher himself was the teacher, he adopted an action research model and collected data from his students as part of their coursework in many ways including student tests, story writing, questionnaires and classroom discussions.

Spurgeon (1994) observed in different classroom situations that English provided ample opportunities for learning citizenship concepts provided the teaching strategies and outcomes were carefully designed. The researcher asking students to perform and develop a video of the key scene in Camus's *The Outsider*, was a useful strategy used in order to engage them in thinking about the motives of the protagonist. Spurgeon observed that the students who began reading novels with no knowledge of human rights became supportive of human rights and considered it worthy of being a cause, after taking the course. Their understanding was displayed in their perceptive comments in the classroom and in their coursework. He also observed the development in their skills such as in case of racism he observed that at the beginning there was racism present in students' remarks and a great number admitted to having stood by when racist remarks were made. Reading *Roll of Thunder*, according to them, had changed their perceptions. So, literature was seen to have an effect on learners' perceptions of citizenship.

Various other studies have been conducted in England to explore links between citizenship and literature. Martin et al. (2012) in their work have given an example lesson through which students can be taught citizenship through English literature. They speculate that reading powerfully narrated stories of the lives of oppressed people can generate respect and understanding among young learners. A small-scale study was conducted by Elbers (1996) to show that children discuss rights and responsibilities through Vygotsky's idea of pretend play. Elbers conducted a pretend play with elementary school children to

help them understand rights and responsibilities in adult-child relationship which the participants enacted. Hall (1994) conducted a practical study with elementary school children in an English urban setting. The study concluded that exposing students to literature that addressed citizenship issues helped develop conflict resolving strategies and decrease conflict occurrences among learners.

Several studies have been conducted in the United States to find out the links between teaching of citizenship and fiction at schools. McGowan and Guzzetti (1991) believe that teaching social studies through literature not only provides students with a variety in the mode of learning, arouses interest, increases comprehensibility, enables them to relate to the material but also prepares them for citizenship as they “can think of no better teaching resource to support the citizenship preparation process” (p. 18). McCarty (2007) found through her small-scale study with elementary school children in Iowa that literature is a close ally of social studies teaching. Other studies in the North American context are Lintner (2011), McCall (2010), Fry (2009) and Yokota and Kolar (2008), among others.

Literature is used in various contexts to teach citizenship themes. National Council for Social Studies (NCSS), USA, for example, an organization dedicated to social studies education at primary, secondary and college level in the country and suggests teaching social studies through literature. They publish various documents, including peer-reviewed journal *Social Education*, that reach a wide readership (NCSS, 2015b). The Partnership for 21st Century Skills (2004), an official document of NCSS, recommends that social studies’ themes should be integrated into and taught through the core subjects, especially fiction. NCSS publishes a list of notable trade books (books intended for general readership and published by a commercial publisher) for young people to identify the books that can be used as a literary aid to teach social studies (NCSS, 2015a). The NCSS recommended 2015 trade books list contains a variety of books from different genres and different cultural and

social backgrounds. They contain biographies, autobiographies, informational narratives but a wide number of the list is works of fiction (NCSS, 2015c). Saul and Dieckman (2005) support the use of trade books suggested by NCSS to teach citizenship.

2.2.3 The impact of teaching citizenship through literature

Besides these reinforcing studies about the positive impact of fiction on education for citizenship, discussed in Section 2.2.2, there are also some tensions in the literature regarding the impact of literature on citizenship education.

The moral effect of literature is a matter of debate. Critics such as Bloom (1994) believe that reading literature is merely getting to know a writer's point of view and it does not affect a reader's sense of good and bad or right and wrong. There are others such as F. R. Leavis (1948) who believe that the writer's version of reality is very sensitive and effects the readers' moral understanding. Pike (2003) in his book *Teaching Secondary English* argues that teaching English has an ethical and moral perspective. Reading stories through novels, short stories, poetry enrich the readers' understanding of society and instigate in them a sense of morality. Pike further argues that the moral teaching doesn't have to be direct. As he puts it, "Literary texts are so powerful because they enable us to reflect upon the way we live" (p. 170).

Crocco (2005), for example, argues that teaching social studies themes through global literature is a challenge. She taught a book called "Shabanu", about a teenage girl's life in Cholistan desert of Pakistan, to teacher education students in the USA. She argues that fiction carries the mark of its author, their philosophies and ideologies may not be acceptable for teaching in a class especially when controversial issues are being raised. The American author's portrayal of Pakistani culture in *Shabanu* was unacceptable to two Pakistani students in her class who showed the researcher views of Muslims on the cultural portrayal in the novel. Younger readers may accept the novel's depiction of Pakistani

culture to be the only reality. Crocco argues that the choice of literature needs to be more careful with young learners as they may assume all aspects of it to be factual. However, she continued to use the book in her class discussing the views of the Muslims to give a two-sided view of the book to her students.

Cox (1991) argues that different authors and texts have a different kind of effect on the students so curriculum choices need to be made carefully. There is also an argument that literature may have an anti-social or anti-civic effect on the learners (Stotsky, 1999). Stotsky argues that some novels with their “illiberal multiculturalism” have the tendency to affect young readers’ civic identity negatively. Stotsky (1994a) further argues that cultural stereotypes presented in some of the fiction tends to have lasting impact on minds on young learners. Moreover, she also argues that teachers can play a significant role in moulding the civic perceptions of their students while teaching multicultural texts. The choice of texts can thus, be a challenge. Stotsky (1994b) shares some guidelines, in the context of secondary schools in America, on choosing multi-ethnic and multicultural texts which avoid stereotypes and are inclusive.

2.2.4 Teaching citizenship to young adults

There is a research gap in terms of teaching citizenship to young adults. Crick report, the founding document of Citizenship education in Britain, mentions teaching citizenship in both schools and colleges (QCA, 1998). It goes on to state, “preparation for citizenship clearly cannot end at age sixteen just as young people begin to have more access to the opportunities, rights and responsibilities of adult citizenship” (p. 28). Therefore, this important part of education need not be limited to one subject and taught just in schools but through all subjects and at all levels.

The studies discussed in previous sections are based in the European or American setting in elementary schools. There is very little research on teaching citizenship to young

adults and teaching citizenship through other subjects in contexts besides European and American. This study was, therefore, aimed at exploring teaching citizenship through literature from the perspective of young adults and in the Pakistani context. Furthermore, there are important debates in relation to identity, rights and duties in Pakistan (as discussed in Sections 2.4.2, 2.4.3 and 2.4.4), which make this study relevant in the context of Pakistan.

2.3 Theoretical framework- Rosenblatt's Reader response theory

When examining the literature, I found Rosenblatt's (1938/1970, 1982, 1978/1994) Transactional Reader response theory and Cogan's (1998) framework of citizenship to be important resources. In this section, I present an analysis of my review of Rosenblatt's reader response theory. In Section 2.3.1, I explain my choice of Rosenblatt's reader response framework as the theoretical framework for my project. In the section that follows (2.3.2), I discuss the different elements of Rosenblatt's framework that affect the meaning making process, including the role of learners, role of the teacher, aesthetic impact of the text and style of reading. I also explain the connections between the frameworks and my research questions. The second theoretical framework by Cogan is discussed in the next section (2.4).

2.3.1 Rosenblatt's Reader-response theory- a rationale

Rosenblatt argues that creation of meaning of any literary work is a two-way process where transaction takes place between the learner/reader and the text where each affects the other. Rosenblatt argues that the learner's understanding of the novel is an experience that involves personal and social factors as well as classroom situations and relations. Rosenblatt also considers the reading style of the reader (for information or for

aesthetic experience) and the teacher's own interpretation and her role in classroom as factors that may affect students' interpretation of a text. This transactional reader-response model seeks a mature response or interpretation from the learners or readers of literature, in contrast to the correct response or interpretation of the earlier trends in literary criticism (Ali, 1993).

Rosenblatt (1938/1970) emphasises that a literary text is just symbols or ink on a paper until a reader reads it and generates meaning. This is not to say however, that the symbols do not contain any meaning at all and any random interpretation of the text would be true, Rosenblatt (1986) emphasises the importance of both the reader and the text in the process of meaning making. The meaning the reader interprets is the result of a transaction. Rosenblatt (1956: 73) believes that the basic question to ask for every learner of literature is "what in this book, and in me, caused this response?" This basic question necessitates the understanding of the factors relevant to both the text and the individual readers/learners. Connell (1996); Faust (2000) and Flynn (2007) argue that Rosenblatt's theory of transaction is based on Dewey's concept of transaction between the knower and the known. When the participants of this study will be asked regarding their citizenship perceptions after reading the four novels in their curriculum, Rosenblatt's Transactional reader-response theory will help provide an understanding of the issues involved in the process of reading and learning.

The choice of Rosenblatt as the framework for this study was based on a review of literary theory. Various literary theories such as Postcolonial literary theory (for example, Childs, 1999) and Feminist literary theory (for example Eagleton, 1992) were also considered. These literary theories though relevant to some parts of the project, such as in explaining gender and post-colonial elements in the novels or in participants' perceptions, did not provide an overarching framework that helped inform the whole project. However, reader-response theory was an over-arching framework that could help me understand the

perceptions of my participants. As Fogg (2009, p. 68) puts it, “reader response theory is as relevant to educationalists as it is to literary theorists and critics.”

There are various reader-response theories that could be considered as a framework for this project as they discuss the relation between a reader and his response to a literary text. According to Harking (2005), the five major reader response theorists are Rosenblatt, Bleich, Iser, Fish and Holland. Iser (as cited in Tyson, 2006) suggests the importance of both reader and text in the reading of literature and gives the concept of an idealized ‘implied reader’. Iser (1978) also explains the “repertoire”, including personal, socio/cultural and literary knowledge or experiences, which includes “all the familiar territory within the text” (p. 69). Bleich’s subjective reader-response suggests that the only interpretation can be in the form of written responses from the readers. Bleich suggests teaching strategies which are not suitable for this study as this project does not involve a teaching intervention. Fish’s affective stylistics suggests looking closely at the text often concentrating on the text’s each sentence (Tyson, 2006). Holland’s reader-response is more psychological and focusses on finding reader’s motivations and desires through their responses. Rosenblatt’s reader response theory is based around the philosophy of ‘transaction’, an exchange that takes place between the reader and the text. She asserts that the reader and the text both are affected by the process. Bleich with his written interpretations, Fish with his focus on affective stylistics and Holland with emphasis on psychological study of interpretations were not suitable for this project. Iser’s (1974) focus on the implied reader may not be relevant but his discussion of “repertoire” is similar to Rosenblatt’s views on the process of reading and has been drawn upon to understand data (discussed further in Section 2.3.21).

There are some theorists who believe that Rosenblatt did not receive her due share of credit in literary theory. Flynn (2007), for example, believes that Tompkins mention of Rosenblatt only as a footnote in his review is an example of the little credit she was given.

Willinsky (1991), on the other hand, claims that Rosenblatt is among four key theorists who influence the way literature is taught today. Naylor and Wood (2012) also suggest that the ideas presented by Rosenblatt, that reader has a role in the meaning-making process, are widely accepted now but were radically ahead of her own time.

It is argued that Rosenblatt's consideration of the learner's background is superficial (Connell, 1996). She does not get into the details of how social and personal factors influence and are influenced by the literary text. Rosenblatt's theory explains the process of interpretation and as the process is very subjective depending on the kinds of readers and texts involved it is difficult to predetermine the extent of personal factors' involvement. A second argument against Rosenblatt's transactional framework is her inability to define what qualifies as a valid interpretation. However, Connell agrees that Rosenblatt has made a primary contribution to literary theory and the process of transaction shows that literature can be used as a source of experience. Moreover, Rosenblatt's framework has been successfully used in many studies (see also Schaars, 1988; Taylor, 2011; Corrigan, Chiad & Echendu, 2015) which suggests that it is a widely used framework.

2.3.2 Elements of Rosenblatt's reader response theory

Rosenblatt (1938/1970, 1978/1994) emphasises four main factors that affect the process of interpretation- learner's personal, moral or social background; the teacher; aesthetic impact of the text and the kind of reading, discussed in the following subsections. Iser also explains that reader's repertoire affects the meaning making process which is similar to these elements by Rosenblatt. Rosenblatt (1938/1970) argues that learner's personal background or personality can impact their interpretations. The role of the teacher as "minister to the love of literature" is also a significant factor that affects students' interpretation of a literary work. While Rosenblatt accepts and ascertains that literature has

a social aspect, she also advocates that in emphasising the social aspect it should not be forgotten that literature is essentially a work of art and thus cannot be separated from its aesthetic factor. Another feature of Rosenblatt's theory is her idea of efferent and aesthetic reading which emphasises that not every reading has the same purpose and the same impact on the learners. Learners create meaning of a text in light of these factors. This is not to say however, that the text itself is of no importance. Rosenblatt gives equal importance to both text and the learner.

Rosenblatt (1960) mentions curriculum design as a facilitating factor in the reading experience as well. She states that the curriculum needs to be designed in light of two factors- the great world literature available to read and the needs of the learners. The inclusion of the members of the Board of Studies, who help design the curriculum, in the design of this study will help reflect on this aspect of Rosenblatt's framework (more on this in Chapter 4). Rosenblatt (1960) however, discourages over emphasis on the standard of books and encourages more focus on the quality of the experience of reading and learning through literature. The four major elements of Rosenblatt's model are discussed below:

2.3.2.1 Learners of literature

Learners create an experience while reading a literary text (Rosenblatt, 1938/1970, 1978/1994). The potential meaning of the text is only actualised by the presence of the reader. A learner's feelings, experiences and observations are important to the meaning creating process (Kadir, Maasum & Vengadasmay, 2012). Rosenblatt (1938/1970) highlights three main factors that influence students' literary development: community background; moral and religious code, social philosophy from family and community; other factors relevant to student's personality development.

Rosenblatt believes in an interactive role of the learner in the meaning-making process in which both learner and text add meaning to each other. Rosenblatt (1969)

conducted a small experiment with a group of readers in her college class. She gave them an excerpt from Frost's poem, asking them to interpret its meaning while writing their thoughts. She then records how they interpret the piece moving from one level of interpretation to another, some faster than others, based on their previous knowledge and understanding of various objects mentioned in the poem. She argues that this activity is a proof that readers are not "a blank tape" (1969, p. 34), are active and the process is a transactional experience.

Iser (1978), the German reader response theorist, also expresses a similar idea. He believes that a dynamic occurs when the reader brings their personal associations and experiences to the culture and repertoire of the text. When the elements within the learner interact with the elements in the text, the dynamics takes place. This is when meaning is created.

Rosenblatt (1960) argues that the experience of reading depends on what the text and the author have to offer and also on learner's experiences in the past and interests in the present. She further argues that in a literature classroom emphasis should be put on the quality of the works as well as on the experiences that the learner comes with in order to fully benefit from the experience. Lewis (2000) argues that in practice of reader response, more emphasis is given to the personal elements related to the learner than to the social and political factors. This over-emphasis on either of the factors- text or learner- needs to be avoided, to retain the balance of the meaning making process. Any response to literary texts cannot be held as a valued interpretation only because it is relevant to a reader's past experiences. The transaction between the text and the reader needs to be a two-way process where the student-readers relate what the novel has to offer to their personal, social and literary experiences. So, both the text and the reader affect the meaning making process.

Rosenblatt's interpretation of the reading process helped the formulation of two research questions in this study. The second sub-research questions in this project is "*Do*

students think that identities, rights and duties are included in a sample of set fictional texts?” The question is about what the text brought to the learners- the student participants will identify elements within the text that relate to the three themes. The third research question “*Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and if so, how are they helped to do so?”* asks how they make sense of these events and characters that they identify, which may be based on their past and current experiences, observations and interests. So the two questions are based on Rosenblatt’s idea of transaction of meaning being dependent on both the text and the learners. I understand that the process is two-way and not necessarily two-stepped. The participants may not speak about themes in the text and relate them to their experiences separately but for purposes of clarity the research questions have been divided into two. However, as will be seen in the presentation of findings, the readers could, and some of them did, choose to talk about the incidents in the novels and their past experiences simultaneously.

2.3.2.2 Role of the teacher

Rosenblatt (1938/1970) in her theory emphasises the role of the teacher. She argues that the teacher is very influential as the learners rely on her for formation of their views in many cases. Thus, it is essential that the teacher should let the learners rely on their individual interpretations and let them believe in the validity of such interpretations, provided they are mature interpretations based in the text.

As there are many sociological and psychological elements that form an integral part of all literature, Rosenblatt believes that the teacher of literature needs to be properly equipped to deal with the situation. She believes that teachers of literature need to be guided as to how to take and teach the social aspect of literature. Just as teachers of sociology cannot make a random statement on literary classics with their limited knowledge, teachers of literature are not well equipped to make random comments on sociological issues without proper knowledge. It is not possible to evade such topics from

literature, however, recognition of the fact that they are not to be dealt with casually will help the teachers take the responsibility to equip themselves better. The teacher of literature like all other teachers has the responsibility of providing the student with an education to perceive social issues. Rosenblatt (1938/1970) argues, “A philosophy of teaching based on a balanced recognition of the many complex elements that make up the literary experience can foster the development of more fruitful understanding and appreciation of literature” (p. 24).

Rosenblatt (1956) further argues that it is the teacher’s responsibility to ensure that the readers are able to look at the symbols in a certain text and relate it to their past experiences in order to make meaning from literary text. She believes that not all readers will be at the same level, some may have problems understanding based on their limited experiences. Furthermore, in a homogenous group, readers will be able to share openly their interpretations but the task will be difficult in a more diverse group with different cultural, social backgrounds and different levels of learners. This is where the teacher has to act as a bridge and be of help to the students. However, the teacher’s role is not to read and explain the work as Rosenblatt (1960) believes that reading is an experience and nobody can experience something on another’s behalf. Teacher’s role is that of a facilitator who should be there to act as a bridge during the learner’s meaning making process.

This aspect of Rosenblatt’s theory helped instigate my interest in the classroom situation. The third sub-research question is, “*Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and if so, how are they helped to do so?*” The last part of this question focusses on how the students were helped and facilitated throughout their course. Though this is not specific to the teacher’s role but it is aimed at covering all affecting factors, including the role of teacher and classroom discussions. The question is kept general and not specific to the help received by teachers as there may be other forms of help from the curriculum or outside the classroom that might have helped

inform the learners' views.

2.3.2.3 Aesthetic impact of Literature

The emphasis on transaction is based on the phenomenon of impact that the text has on the learner. Rosenblatt argues that text and its aesthetic elements are an integral part of the process of interpretation. Readers' emotions may be stimulated either by content or by style (Dijkstra et al., 1994). Rosenblatt emphasises that emotions aroused by the style are not to be neglected as they are what make the work a work of art. Therefore, interpretations of novels will be based in the text and may also include the aesthetic experience that the readers had as novels are a form of art.

2.3.2.4 Kinds of readings

Rosenblatt argues that even though a transaction of meaning takes place in both literary and non-literary texts, only literary texts can be read aesthetically. She argues that there are two different reading styles "efferent" from Latin *effere* meaning to carry away, and "aesthetic" from Greek word meaning to sense or to perceive. She further argues that during a reading of the literary texts "the reader's primary concern is with what happens *during* the actual reading event" (1978/1994: 24). Aesthetic readings are what contrast literary texts from the non-literary.

She expects the reader to be fully aware of the usage of words and their sequence in an aesthetic reading in order to create a relationship with the text in which transaction takes place. She believes that the reader is in such a state that words appear to her/him as auditory and visual symbols. However, this is the ideal situation and not every reader can be expected to get so fully involved in a text and experience every symbol as she ascertains that most readers' reading style is between the efferent and aesthetic. An understanding of Rosenblatt's idea of efferent and aesthetic readers will help within the project to understand the participants' style of reading the selected texts.

Rosenblatt's reader-response framework, in conclusion suggests a two-way transaction of meaning between reader and the text where teacher acts as an intermediary. Role of the text, the learners and the teacher are important in the process and so is the way the literature is read- for an aesthetic purpose or for information. The individual characteristics of learners will be of foremost importance in the case of this project. The choice of this framework for this project allows an understanding of participants' perceptions based on their social and personal backgrounds while also looking at the role of the text, the teacher and the way the books are read. The citizenship component of the project will be addressed through Cogan's (1998) framework discussed in the following section.

2.4 Theoretical framework- Cogan's model of Citizenship

The project was started as an exploration of teaching citizenship through literature. For the purposes of my project, citizenship needed to be defined not just for the framework but also for the participants of the study. Thus, I explored different models of citizenship to find one suitable for this study. This section explains the necessity of a citizenship framework for the project and defines the elements of identity, rights and duties in light of relevant literature.

2.4.1 Citizenship-definition, models, and attributes

The definition of citizenship is much contested. Various definitions have been given by different authors. Brett (2005, p. 9) defines education for citizenship as "equipping students with a set of tools which will enable them to participate effectively, actively and responsibly within their adult life". Osler and Starkey (2002) state "citizenship is a status, conferred by Nation States, which carries rights and responsibilities" (p.144). Some definitions are more widely known such as that of Marshall, "citizenship is a status,

bestowed on those who are full members of a community. All who possess the status are equal with respect to the rights and duties with which the status is endowed” (Marshall & Bottomore, 1992, p. 18).

Heater (1999) in his work *What is citizenship* gives civic republican and liberal perspectives of citizenship. Proponents of civic republicanism argue that citizenship is essentially a duty-based status, whereas those in favour of the liberal tradition argue that citizenship is about rights of the citizens. McLaughlin (1992) suggests that citizenship can be, “roughly mapped in terms of minimal and maximal interpretations of the notion locatable on a continuum rather than in terms of discrete conceptions” (p. 38). He further develops four measures of citizenship ‘identity’, ‘civic virtues’, ‘political involvement’ and ‘social prerequisites’. Kiwan (2007) argues that in order to understand people’s participation in citizenship, educators and policy makers need to understand what motivates individuals to participate as it combines the public with the private sphere of citizenship.

Cogan (1998) developed a model of citizenship giving five general attributes that he claimed to be the constituents of citizenship. The attributes are identity, rights, duties, involvement in public affairs and acceptance of societal values. The last two elements are an extension of social rights and duties as a citizen by definition should be entitled to involvement in public affairs and should be obliged to take part in some public affairs. Accepting basic societal values like living in unison with different identities and accepting citizen’s differences helps construct citizen’s identity as Cogan (1998, p. 5) wrote “such societal values are seen as helping to constitute the distinctive identity of a country”. So essentially Cogan’s model of citizenship is based on identity, rights and duties.

Citizenship in an Asian context is seen to have different meaning. Lee (2004) points out that even though Asia is diverse, there are three common features in the various Asian concepts of citizenship- harmony, spirituality and individuality. A focus on spirituality, the

condition of the inner self was the feature he claimed was the main difference between Western and Asian concepts of citizenship. Moreover, Kennedy and Fairbrother (2004) argue that Asian citizenship puts emphasis on moral education more than on political and civic virtues. The individual's character and its development are integral components of citizenship in Asia.

These different models are helpful for understanding the conception of citizenship. However, for the purposes of this study, I required the elements that constitute the concept of citizenship, the defining elements. Cogan's three main elements have been pointed out repeatedly by various authors such as Osler and Starkey (2002), Heater (1999), Evans (2004), Marshall and Bottomore (1992) - a sense of identity in some extended community, ranging from local to the global; a sense of rights in civil, political, social and cultural spheres; and a series of corresponding duties- obligations that a citizen must abide by. Moreover, Cogan (1998) has been used as the defining framework for citizenship in nine different research contexts – including two Asian countries. Therefore, identity, rights and duties which are the first three elements of Cogan's (1998) framework are taken as the defining elements of citizenship and have helped shape the research questions for this study. These elements have helped formulate the research questions, as the main research question is "*What perceptions of identity, rights and duties are held by a sample of undergraduate students in Pakistan in the context of their study of fiction?*" The first sub-research question, "What do students think identity, rights and duties mean?" is about citizenship perceptions of the participants while the second and the third relate these perceptions to the study of novels and designed in the light of Rosenblatt's framework (as discussed in Section 2.3).

This project is being conducted at a university in Pakistan to look into the participants' perceptions of citizenship themes in context of the four novels. Kennedy (2004, p. 10) argued that, "for nation-states whose history, culture and societal mores

derive from other sources, Western democratic values are neither natural nor necessarily consistent with local values and culture.” Moreover, Chong et al. (2016) also argue based on various case studies that citizenship ideals of people are determined by historical and social contexts. Importance of religion in civic or citizenship education discourse, for example, is different in European-American or Asian contexts. European and American concepts of citizenship are secular and exclude any religious thoughts from their philosophical or historical underpinnings. Arthur, Gearon and Sears (2010) argue that it is undemocratic and unwise to exclude religious ideas from civic education. Asian concepts of citizenship are based on religious, moral and philosophical foundations. Tan (2007) for example suggests that in the multi-religious society of Singapore the government should consider redesigning citizenship education to promote all different religions. Fearnley-Sander, Muis and Gistituati (2004) conducted a study of citizenship in Indonesia. They reported that religion was integral to Indonesian’s perceptions of citizenship.

It may be argued that Asian studies of citizenship are more suitable in the Pakistani context than the ones conducted in Europe and America. However, as Lee (2004) argues in his concluding chapter to the book *Citizenship Education in Asia and the Pacific*, Asia is a diverse continent and what is true for one context may not be for another. Moreover, as the concept of citizenship started in the West, it may be fair to say, like Lee (2004, p. 279) that the citizenship in Asia is “a hybrid combination of Western and Asian concepts”. I was aware of the need to understand the democratic values prevalent in the Pakistani society. At the basic level of defining citizenship in terms of themes, I have selected Cogan’s framework of identity, rights and duties. However, in terms of the aspects of identity, rights and duties, I have looked at the situation in Pakistan, including the Asian concepts as well, to be able to relate the literature to the context.

The concepts of identity, rights and duties are relevant to the context of Pakistan. The idea of suspending regional, ethnic and linguistic identities in favour of religion, which

was apparently the major reason of the partition from India, did not last very long afterwards and the nation felt divided on the basis of linguistic, regional and ethnic differences (Islam, 1981). Lall (2012) argues that identity is still an issue after 65 years of the creation of Pakistan and that the biggest divide is not among different ethnic groups, religions or between civilians and the army, rather it is between the common citizens and the state. Lall (2014) argues that despite the youth's excitement for the first democratic transition of government in the history of Pakistan, youth are not properly prepared for political participation- they have no awareness of their citizenship rights and duties. This project, thus, connects with the contemporary issues in the context.

It is necessary to determine the definition of rights, duties and identity in context of this study as they are very broad and debatable themes. In the following section, I discuss each of the themes individually. The literature relevant to citizenship in Pakistan was also referred in the context of identity, rights and duties.

2.4.2 Identity

Identity is used in this project in the sense of a person's conception or expression of their individuality or group affiliations. Identity, being an essentially psychological construct, has many different interpretations and can be difficult to research. There is a possibility of a variety of perspectives on one person's identity as it can be defined in terms of the individual's context, their own views of their person, other people's views of the individual's identity. For the purposes of this study, I have relied on the individuals' own perceptions of their identity, which they may perceive in relation to their context including socioeconomic background, religion, ethnicity, caste or nationality, or in relation to what others think of them. Furthermore, this project focusses on a 'citizenship' sense of identity, using Cogan as the theoretical underpinning. In this section, I explain the possible meanings of identity in light of Cogan and other researchers. I then relate this discussion

to issues relevant to identity in Pakistan, including ethnic, religious and caste related issues.

A citizen's identity can include a variety of aspects including national, global and ethnic. According to Cogan (1998), national identity is the most essential form of identity of a citizen. However, he does state further that multinational, ethnic and global dimensions are also worth consideration to explain the complex citizenship in the 21st century.

Proponents of cosmopolitan citizenship argue that a global, multi-national identity should be considered important as opposed to limiting citizenship within the nation-state (Osler and Starkey, 2008). Global citizenship can be abstract and aspirational hoping for a global unity with the same status and laws for all global citizens; it can be an economic integration as in the form of unions across countries and continents; it can also signify a necessity to come together where the ecological survival of the human race is in question (Falk, 1993). Oxley and Morris (2013) suggested different categories of global citizenship: political global citizenship- focussed on the individual's relationship with state and other polities (proposed by Carter, 2001); economic global citizenship- focussed on the financial aspect of international development (advocated by Waddock and Smith, 2000); moral global citizenship- focussed on the ethical aspects of how humans relate to each other (supported by Osler and Starkey, 2008; Nussbaum, 1996); and environmental global citizenship that focusses on promoting change in human actions in order to protect the environment (Richardson, 2008; Dobson, 2006).

Ethnic identity is another important component of a citizen's identity. A different ethnic identity mostly means a different language, a different culture and heritage-elements that form a strong sense of identity in an individual. Theorists such as Faulks (2006) and Banks (2008) argue that ethnic identities are part of the citizenship status and should be acknowledged as such to attain structural equality. This connects to the question of status of linguistic, regional or religious identities.

There is also an argument regarding the public and the private spheres of a citizen's

life to determine what should be considered part of citizenship. There are many theorists who propose that only the public part- the political, social and economic elements- should be considered part of citizenship. Proponents of feminist perspectives favour inclusion of both public and private spheres as they believe that excluding the private spheres of a citizen's lives affects the identity of female citizens (Kiwani, 2007; Prokhovnik, 1999). Prokhovnik (1998) further argues that women do not need to be liberated from the private sphere of their life to participate in public life and 'become' citizens, both men and women already act as citizens in both public as well as private spheres of their lives.

Lee (2004) while reporting the findings of a citizenship project in eleven countries, mainly Asian, commented that a collective identity and family values were emphasised in Asian contexts. Familial issues may be considered private affairs of a citizen in some societies but in Asian cultures they are an integral part of a citizen's identity and are built into their education systems.

National identity in Pakistan is a complex issue. Pakistan was formed by the union of different provinces (some of which were independent states in history) under the banner of Islam which was thought to be a unifying force (Verkaaik, 2001). After the partition from India in 1947 and Bangladesh in 1971, Islam was not the only identity. National identity was seen to be affected by the ethnic, linguistic and sectarian identities (Verkaaik, 2001; Ansari, 2005; Lall, 2014). Verkaaik (2001) argues that the feudal system created a social divide. He also considers caste (called 'zat' in the local languages) to be an important divide which was disliked due to its Hindu origin and was given up by many Muslims, in the initial years after partition, and a family name by profession or clan was chosen. Lall (2008) argues that a sense of national identity can be instilled through education but in the case of Pakistan the textbooks have usually been manipulated by the governing authorities to suit their own political agendas. The textbooks, specifically those of social studies and Islamic studies have been strongly criticised for trying to build a national identity based on

religion, denying recognition to the rights of the minorities (Ahmad, 2004; Dean, 2005). The religious and ethnic minorities in the country have therefore, remained dissatisfied with governing bodies, making these identities an important part of citizen's identities.

Cogan (1998) argues that in a multicultural context local and ethnic identities become important to citizens alongside their national identities. In this study ethnic identities, referred to as ethno-linguistic identities by Khan (2014), are based on groups of people speaking a different language such as Sindhi, Urdu-speaking, Balochi, Punjabi. Sindh, the province where this study is based, constitutes mainly Sindhi speaking natives and Urdu speaking immigrants who came in 1947. There are some Baloch and Siraiki speakers who have merged into the local culture and recognise themselves as Sindhis. Ethnic identity is an important identity issue in the context. Sindh is the most diverse of the Pakistani provinces owing to foreign immigrations at the time of partition and domestic movements since, and is home to many from Baloch, Punjabi and Pathan ethnic groups as well (Kennedy, 1991).

Within Sindh, Sindhis and Urdu-speaking ethnic groups have had a sense of alienation from one another. There have been various ethnic conflicts in Sindh, especially in Karachi which is home to a mixed ethnic population (Gayer, 2008). Researchers of different ethnic origins have looked at the situation from different perspectives. Kazi (1987), a Sindhi researcher, argues that Pathan, Baloch and Sindhi ethnic groups have been underrepresented in the armed forces, bureaucratic and other power positions whereas Punjabis along with the Urdu-speaking immigrants have dominated the country since its formation. Verkaaik (2001), a Dutch researcher based on his ethnographic research with the Urdu-speaking people of Sindh argues that the migrants do not get their due share in powerful positions including federal jobs. Ahmar (1996: 1032) argues that the Urdu-speaking population has been alienated from the rest of the Sindh and attributes three reasons to this divide: "the 1964 presidential elections, the 1972 language riots, and the

post-1985 ethnic clashes”. Sindhi scholars like Joyo (2005) conversely argue that Sindhis, along with Balochs, have been pushed back by the government by neglecting their culture and language while making major decisions for their provinces. Thus, both ethnic groups living in Sindh feel oppression at the hands of the other or a superior force.

Rahman (1997) after mentioning the political events that led to the clash of these two major ethnic groups in Sindh, concludes that language has been exploited by the leaders to create a pressure group and the root of the issue is who is going to rule Sindh. Khan (2014: 77) further comments that, “region-based political groups in Pakistan have historically mobilized for political power largely around ethnic and linguistic identities.” The presence of two distinctively Sindhi and Urdu speaking political parties in the province confirms Rahman’s hypothesis- the reason of conflict appears to be the question of power in the province which seems to have affected the perceptions of many in the province.

Another important aspect of identity to be considered in the context of Sindh, in particular and Pakistan, in general, is religious and sectarian identity. The South Asian Terrorism Portal’s (SATP, 2015) statistics of sectarian attacks in the country show that the number of attacks has increased from 2010 onwards. The presence of organizations such as Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan, who support one sect of Islam and have caused many terror attacks on people of other sects, is increasing the sectarian divide in the country. There are many such incidents reported in daily newspapers such as the suicide attack in Mardan for which Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan claimed responsibility (Hakeem & Akbar, 2015).

Sindh was always a peaceful land known for its religious tolerance, however, in recent years religious and sectarian turmoil has caused many conflicts in Sindh (Gayer, 2008; The Nation, 2015). The conflicts between Shia and Deobandi sects of Islam have increased recently- more than 60 Shia Muslims were killed in a place of worship in Shikarpur, Sindh in January 2015 (Shaikh, 2015); a bus full of Isamili Muslims, a minority Shia Muslim sect, was attacked in Karachi in May, 2015 killing 43 passengers and injuring

several others (Hassan, 2015). However, the attacks do not necessarily represent religious intolerance in the region, they only reflect the presence of violent organizations (Siddiqui, 2015).

Large-scale surveys with Pakistanis depict Pakistanis' opinions on these matters. PEW's (2013), an American trust that conducted large-scale surveys with Muslim populations of seven countries, data shows that 89% of surveyed Pakistanis oppose violence in the name of Islam. However, another survey (PEW, 2014) shows Pakistan as a country with "the highest level of social hostilities involving religion". According to PEW (2014) social hostility, "measures acts of religious hostility by private individuals, organizations or groups in society". In the light of these surveys, Siddiqui (2015) concludes that the future of relations among different sects in Pakistan appears bleak and people seem to have a sense of hostility towards people from the other sects.

The effect of schooling on religious views has been researched in the Pakistani context. Rahman (2007), for example, focussed on the views of school students on religious tolerance comparing madrassas (religious schools), Urdu-medium schools and elitist English schools. His survey results showed that the students of elitist English-medium schools were more tolerant towards religious minorities as compared to madrassas. The reason, Rahman argues, is the religiously intolerant curricula of madrassas. Yusuf (2014) argues that public sector schools, educating three quarters of the school-going population in the country, instil radical religious thoughts among students. He further argues that the elitist schools provide more liberal education but their students are considerably alienated from Pakistani society. Siddiqa's (2010) survey of the youth of elitist universities in three major cities of Pakistan, however, shows conflicting results. She argues that these students with better education and access to resources do not prove to be liberal thinkers and their views of religion were mostly conservative, lacking a good understanding and mostly reiterating the views prevalent in society and in media.

The role of religious minorities in the country and the perceptions of these minority religious groups has been looked into by various researchers. Malik (2002) presents a detailed picture of the situation of minorities in the country highlighting that the religious minorities in Sindh have faced severe circumstances in terms of socioeconomic status and religious violence in the last few decades. He further suggests that though Hindu minorities in Sindh do not enjoy equal status, they get protection from the feudal landlords in the rural areas. Leirvik (2008) argues that religion did not invade the entire education system until Zia's military regime in 1978. He compares Christian and Muslim perspective of interreligious relations and the role of schools in Pakistan and argues that the same problem from within the same country can be seen completely differently. There is also some criticism against the textbooks used in public sector schools that deny the minorities an identity as a Pakistani as they seem to take a Muslim as interchangeable with Pakistani (Ahmad, 2004; Nayyar & Salim, 2005).

The current Prime Minister of the country has made some efforts to reach out to the minorities. In November 2015, a Diwali ceremony was arranged by the PM's political party, to honour a Hindu Festival (Dawn, 2015). Before he was the PM, Nawaz Sharif in a media interview (Youtube, 2010) also stated about a controversial sect of Islam, "Qadyanis and Ahmadis are also our brothers" (my translation). His remarks however, were criticised by Muslim clerics (Tribune, 2010) and his party's spokesman had to defend his comments saying that he was saying only what Jinnah had already said on the creation of Pakistan (Dawn, 2010). Thus, Pakistan has various religious and sectarian identity issues that may affect the views of Pakistani youth due to factors relevant to their education and their experiences in the society in which they live.

In conclusion, a citizen's identity may have various aspects including national, global, ethnic, religious aspects. Furthermore, it is debatable whether citizenship is a solely public or private matter. Literature on identity in Pakistan shows that in addition to the

national identity, religious and ethnic identities are very important in the context. Identity, however, is not an isolated phenomenon, it is based on and is a result of many factors such as a citizen's rights and duties. People can connect their national, global, religious or ethnic identity with the amount of rights they get in their society or the duties they need to perform. So, while discussing the literature, some of the issues overlap and some arguments may be repeated under the three themes. As identity is one of the key themes in my research questions, an understanding of key identity issues in the context forms an important part of my analysis of academic literature.

2.4.3 Rights

Rights are entitlements that have been legally constituted most often in the membership of a state and sometimes recognised by international treaties. In this section, I explain the possible meaning of rights in the European context. I then relate this discussion to issues relevant to rights in Pakistan, including gender, religious, ethnic and human rights.

Different categories of rights have been included as citizen's rights by different theorists. Marshall (1950 as cited in Marshall & Bottomore, 1992) included civic, social and political rights as the major rights of a citizen and argued that this was a "historical design of the gradual achievement of full citizenship status" (Heater, 1999: 20). Civic rights are rights such as freedom of the person, freedom of association, freedom of speech, freedom to practice religion and so on. Social rights include entitlements to services such as education, health, housing, social services. Political rights include right to vote, right to political activity such as membership in political parties, freedom of expression in terms of politics and membership of certain pressure groups. Marshall's division of rights has been termed too simplistic as the division cannot be so neat and has been criticised for being limited to the English context and not including feminist

perspectives. Heater (1999) however, argues that Marshall's three categories still form the basis of a citizen's status, even though other useful categories have been added.

Various categories of rights have been introduced after Marshall's time. Turner (1993) and Roche (1992) added cultural rights which give individuals the right to preserve and maintain their culture which includes, but is not limited to, language, religion, ethnic norms, art. Prior, Stewart and Walsh (1995) further included environmental rights to a citizen's rights which consist of rights of future generations to inherit a heritable world and the rights of the natural world itself. Feminist perspective of rights is based on giving gender-specific rights to all as the same sets of gender-free rights to all is argued to be a neglect of women's rights in relation to their needs and circumstances (Prior et al., 1995). There are thus, different kinds of rights that form part of a citizen's rights.

Human rights are considered, arguably, a part of a citizen's rights. Some researchers (e.g., Alderson, 2000) go to the extent of arguing that human rights form the theoretical underpinning for citizenship itself. Kiwan (2005), in response, argues that human rights do not form the theoretical underpinnings for citizenship rather they are a component of citizenship rights. Kiwan argues that human rights are natural, they are a 'virtue of being human' (p. 45). Therefore, even though human rights may not be the theoretical underpinning of citizenship they can be argued to form a component of a citizen's rights.

In a study about transition to citizenship conducted in Britain, Lister et al. (2003) noted that the youth in Leicester was more articulate about their duties than about their rights. When asked about their rights almost half of the participants struggled to identify their rights. Sixteen out of 64 participants interviewed did not identify any rights they had. One fourth of the remaining participants talked about social rights (including housing, benefits etc) and political rights (such as voting). Two-thirds of the participants identified civil rights such as freedom of speech, movement, worship etc. Nine of these participants

were of Asian origin. These participants however were much more aware of their responsibilities (as discussed in Section 2.4.4).

Rights given to citizens in practice may differ from those stated in constitutions. As the context for this study is Pakistan, I discuss issues related to rights in Pakistani society. There are various issues relevant to rights in Pakistan including gender, religious, ethnic, social class and human rights which are discussed in the following paragraphs.

As per the constitution of Pakistan, every citizen is entitled to basic human rights including freedom of speech, expression, faith and basic political and legal rights (Tomar, 2001). However, practice does not reflect the legislation, for all. As Berberian (1986) argues there are some loop holes in the constitution which can be used against the provision of basic human rights for some groups. Moreover, some laws based on Islamic legislature do not necessarily comply with Universal Declaration of Human Rights (discussed further in the following paragraphs).

Khoja-Moolji (2014) argues that giving right human rights education can help improve situation of rights. Instead of trying to retain the same human rights education everywhere, it is important to reconceptualise human rights based on context. She further suggests that integrating communal and ethical issues into human rights education in the Global South, specifically in Pakistan, will help human rights educators gain more success.

Civic and social rights provision in Pakistan is uneven. Provision of education is one example. The constitution of Pakistan states that free education should be made accessible to all (Tomasevski, 2006). However, only 59% of the school-going population is enrolled in primary schools. Enrolment in schools and access to education, to even this limited population, do not necessarily mean a quality education. Tomasevski argues that public schools have failed to provide good, quality education due to the low budget set down for education sector in the country's annual budget. This in turn has resulted in the growth of a fee-charging private sector of education which tends to make quality education

a luxury rather than a basic right. The right to health care is also granted in the constitution of the country, but the ground reality is no better than education as Ahmed and Shaikh (2008) attribute a low budget as the cause.

Political rights have been discussed in literature in relation to views of youth and role of women. Lall (2012) conducted a wide-scale survey on political awareness in Pakistan with the youth in schools and universities of urban and rural areas in three provinces including Sindh. Her survey findings suggested that the youth are aware of their political rights but not many are politically active. Participating in politics is not seen positively due to the perceived corruption of the practitioners. Gine & Mansuri (2011) argue that women in the developing world, including Pakistan, usually do not exercise their political right to vote. When they vote, it is with consent and based on the views of the household males.

The status of rights of the minorities is a widely addressed rights related issue in Pakistan. Rahman (2001) argues that the religious minorities in Pakistan do not get their due rights and a few of the constitutional laws facilitate the process. He considers certain laws to be discriminatory towards religious minorities in the country. This includes the controversial Islamised laws introduced in the time of General Zia- Hudood Ordinance; the Blasphemy laws according to which punishment of insulting the Muslim prophet is death; and the laws of separate electorate. There is an argument that the school curriculum, specially textbooks of Social Studies, helps undermine the rights of religious minorities (Dean, 2005; Ahmad, 2004) by projecting a Pakistani citizen as a Muslim. Rights of ethnic minorities are also argued to be affected by the advocacy of a “monolithic Muslim identity” (Ali, 1999, p. 169). Ali explains that the different ethnic identities that came together as Pakistan in 1947 were not recognised in the constitutions- their languages are not the national languages. Furthermore, these cultural and linguistic differences have not been

acknowledged in the constitution as the word 'minority' is used only for religious minorities.

Recent government attention to minority groups' rights is noteworthy. The Sindh assembly passed a new bill regarding registration of marriages of Hindu, Sikh and Zoroastrian minorities (Dawn, 2016a). Earlier there was no formal method for registration of marriage for these groups and only Muslims and Christians could register officially as their religious practices had documents to show proof. The delay in passing this Hindu Marriage Bill had been criticised (see Dawn, 2016b) by many civil rights activists before it was finally passed. Furthermore, the country's PM has started demonstrating inclusiveness towards people of other faiths (more on this in Section 2.4.2). On a Diwali (Hindu religious event) ceremony arranged by his political party, the Prime Minister of the country vowed to protect rights of all minorities (Dawn, 2015).

Gender related rights are also important in the context. Cook (2007) establishes by quoting examples from various western writers that the common image of Pakistani women is that of suppressed individuals who do not have equal rights as men. Cook conducted an ethnographic study and explained how women in Pakistan worked as free agents and chose to live the way. She gave example of a purdah-observing woman who revealed that she had chosen to stay at home despite her husband's constant insistence to work outside home.

There is evidence to prove that higher education empowers women considerably in Pakistan (Malik & Courtney, 2011). However, there is a very small number of female population that reaches higher education. Lall (2009) conducted an ethnographic study with parents of school-going children to observe attitudes of parents from different ethnic groups towards girls' education. She held interviews with parents in the four provinces of Pakistan and concluded that attitudes of parents in rural Sindh were more traditional towards educating boys and girls- education of boys was considered more important than

those of girls. Lall's study suggests that there are cultural and ethnic reasons behind the inequality of rights between the genders. Shah (2006), Jamal (2006) and Hassan (2002), however, suggest that the root cause are the Islamic laws used in the constitution of the country.

Jamal (2006) highlights the attitudes of judicial bodies in Pakistan towards the rights of women in light of a legal case- 'Saima case'. Saima, an adult woman chose to marry a man of her choice against the wishes of her father, who filed a custody case arguing that he was her guardian and the marriage was void without his consent. Even though the final decision was given in Saima's favour, it was a long painstaking process and had she not had one of the foremost lawyers in the country- Asma Jehangir- that might not have been possible. The judgement took a long time because there was conflict whether the case "be judged according to legal precedent, prevailing social and cultural behavior, or religious law" (p. 301). Jamal argues that the state sublets authority over rights of women to family and tribes and thus women activists in the country have to fight for rights both in the public and private spheres of women's lives. The paper shows the intolerance of Pakistani society towards women marrying of their own accord by highlighting the judges' comments. Though they were bound by law to grant the woman the right to live with her husband, they implied in their official judgements that laws should be enforced which do not allow women to do so.

Hassan (2002) argues that the situation of gender rights in Pakistan is due to the fact that Islam has not been fully understood. As seen in Saima's case, religion was used to suppress the rights of an adult woman. Hassan feels that such attitudes are a result of a misunderstanding of Quran. She cites Quran and argues that it proposes gender equality and gives clear commands about rights of women but like all major religions it was revealed in a patriarchal society and the meanings assumed were suited to men and not women. She suggests developing a new discourse of human rights in Pakistan based on a

proper understanding of Quran, as that will relate more adequately to common citizens who believe in the faith but do not approve of extremism.

More recently, in February 2016 a bill called “Protection of women against violence bill” was passed by the Punjab government which was highly criticised by religious scholars (Zakaria, 2016). The PM discussed their reservations with head of the religious political party in the country in order to resolve the issue. The current PM also suggested a National Women Empowerment Policy in March (Pakistan Today, 2016). These bills however, were not popular among male proponents of various religious groups (BBC, 2016). So, gender rights in relation to women in Pakistan are a widely discussed topic in literature.

Social class is a significant factor in delivery of rights in Pakistan. Social class, in this project is used in terms of socioeconomic factors. The participants in this study identified their own social class. There is a clear disparity between the rights of upper and lower classes in Pakistan (Ebrahim, 2015). Hyat (2013) argues that the concepts of caste and social class are interconnected. She further argues that people in the country still talk about ‘good’ and ‘bad’ families which is a concept based on socioeconomic status of the families. There is segregation based on caste and social class, which further leads to difference in rights.

To conclude, rights of a citizen include various kinds of rights such as civil, political, legal, economic, environmental and human rights. The different categories of rights- social, civic, environmental, feminist- can overlap or complement each other. In the context of Pakistan, the constitution bestows various rights on all citizens equally, however literature suggests that there are various issues related to civil, political and gender rights as well as the rights of ethnic and religious minorities in the country.

2.4.4 Duties

Duties are obligations of an individual as a citizen. There can be various kinds of duties that an individual assumes. In this section, I discuss duties of citizens as seen through a historical lens. I, then, discuss different issues related to duties that a citizen needs to perform including performance of duties among young people, variations across different ethnic and gender groups. Lastly, I present literature on issues regarding duties in Pakistani society specifically with reference to young people.

Citizenship in its history was essentially a duty-based entitlement as suggested by the civic republican tradition of citizenship (Heater, 1999). However, whichever tradition of citizenship a state may pursue, duties form an essential component of a citizen's life. Even the liberal tradition which stresses rights does believe in citizens performing their duties. In ancient Sparta and Athens, citizens were given the status of citizenship in return for which they had to perform certain duties. Aristotle in his "Politics" mentions civic action and civic virtue as qualities of a citizen (Aristotle, 1948). Civic virtue was central to not just Aristotle but to Cicero and Machiavelli's philosophy of citizenship too. However, after Rousseau citizenship became fairly rights-centred. Modern states though look for a balance between rights and duties for a citizen. There may however, be certain citizens exempted from duties based on factors such as age or illness and be eligible for a citizen's rights. Thus, duties are considered important in all societies and duties often reciprocate rights even though the relationship between rights and duties is not always linear.

As in the case of rights, there are various sets of duties that a citizen needs to perform which includes civic, political, social, legal, cultural and environmental duties. Some proponents of civic republican tradition consider duties to be essential and to be enforced by law while other such as Kahne and Westheimer (1996) emphasise the need to

decide a purpose and direction of the service that is expected of a citizen. The youth may not necessarily understand the purpose of various duties and thus needs to be given a direction and purpose.

Sim and Low (2012) argue that character education should form an essential part of citizenship education as intellect alone will not make good citizens unless they are given good morals as well. There is also an argument about duties being an essentially public or private matter. Heater (1999) while discussing duties argues that duties towards family and neighbours are distinct from duties towards community and country and the latter fall into the public sphere of duties of a citizen. Kiwan (2007), on the other hand, argues that to comprehend involvement in citizenship motivation to participate needs to be focussed. She further suggests that looking at citizenship from the point of view of motivation combines the public with the private sphere of citizenship. Dahlgren (2006) argues that there are various motives behind the lack of participation in citizenship that can be catered through looking at the private sphere rather than the public as it will lead to the motives behind civic competence.

There can be differences in interpretation of duties across geographical contexts. Cogan and Derricott (1998) point out in light of CEPS project conducted in five European, two North American and two Asian countries that there may be an “East-West” difference in the perceptions of citizenship. Moreover, Morris and Cogan (2001) also argue that Asian civic education emphasises more on moral principles, based on their study in six different countries. Taiwan and Hong Kong’s educational systems emphasised moral responsibility. Furthermore, in Thailand Buddhism formed a strong theoretical underpinning for citizenship education- it was used a motivating force for citizens to perform their duties. In the European and American countries, however, nationalism and citizen’s status was seen as an adequate motivation. So, a moral and religious element is seen to be attached to duties in a more Eastern context.

Various studies have been conducted on perceptions of youth about their rights and responsibilities. Young people are seen in modern democracies as citizens-to-be who need to be made aware of their responsibilities. However, owing to low voting turnout and other evidence of lack of political participation, it is often argued that young people are unaware of their duties and need to be educated in order to achieve good citizenship practice (see also Vromen and Collin, 2010; Andolina et al., 2002). However, some recent studies (e.g., Henn et al., 2002) suggest that young people are interested in their responsibilities as citizens. One such study was conducted by Lister et al. (2003), in Leicester, UK, with 110 young people, including a mix of ethnic groups, about their transition to citizenship (also discussed in Section 2.4.3 in relation to rights). These young people (aged 18-23) articulated their responsibilities more as compared to their rights. The most often quoted responsibility of a good citizen was stated to be constructive towards community which included giving to the community, behaving in a socially acceptable manner and being respectable to other members of the community. They also talked about other duties such as obeying the law, taking care of their families, working, voting etc. Howe and Strauss (2002) conducted a study with young people in the US and argued that these young people see participation differently, they volunteer and focus more on the local community than on the bigger national scale projects. These study, thus, do not agree with the common assumption that young people are not aware of their responsibilities.

The younger generations' views on responsibilities are different from what is expected of them. Their political participation may be low in the expected, formal domain of voting and active political membership but they do get involved in various non-formal ways such as volunteering, signing petitions, protesting (Sloam, 2013). Vromen (2011) analysed the content of different websites regarding young people's citizenship duties. They found that the government websites promoted the idea of a dutiful citizen and those led by young people promote a self-actualizing kind of citizenship which allowed

independent action and expression. Andolina et al. (2002) conducted a multi-phase project with American youth. The findings suggested that the participants did not think of a citizen in conventional political sense. Their concept of citizenship duties was mainly passive which included obeying the law and taking care of themselves and their family which seemed to suggest that being a good person was the same as being a good citizen for these young people.

Martin (2012), based on his research with Australian youth argues that Australian young generation engage in non-political activities such as signing a petition or becoming part of a protest more often than political activities such as becoming member of a political party or voting. Similar findings were found in America by Dalton (2008). Robertson (2009) in her doctoral thesis on young adults in Poland and Romania suggests that young people in these considerably new democracies follow suit by not opting for traditional forms of participation. Youniss et al. (2002) believe that since young people's active political participation is seen to have decreased over time it is important to understand their motivations and interests and improve civic education accordingly. They believe that this responsibility lies with government schools, commercial sector as well as community organizations.

There is an argument over variation in performance of civic duties across different groups such as ethnic groups or genders. Zani and Barrett (2012) considered the issue of political participation among different groups. On the basis of their review, they suggest that minority ethnic groups are seen to be as politically active as the majority groups. They further claim that men tend to be more involved in economic matters whereas women tend to be more interested in social and environmental issues. Sanches-Jankowski's (2002) study conducted with different ethnic groups in America however, suggests that civic participation varies among young people of different ethnic groups due to different civic cultures. Acharya et al. (2010) conducted a study in Maharashtra, India about young

people's participation in civic life and their involvement in performing duties. The findings showed a huge difference in participation levels of men (55%) and women (21%). The researchers suggested that in the Indian context young people, especially women, have limited opportunities to get involved in civic action.

As the context for this study is Pakistan, the situation of citizen's duties in Pakistan is discussed. Research studies have shown that the participation of youth in political duties is very low (British Council, 2013; Jinnah Institute, 2013). According to the surveys by British Council and Jinnah Institute, political participation is low among youth, however they are more dutiful when it comes to other responsibilities. The British Council's survey findings also raise an issue about civic participation among women as they are less educated than men. The survey findings argue that women are less likely to perform their civic duties as they face exclusion at many levels in the society.

Ahmad and Sheikh (2013) conducted a study on Pakistani university students' political participation. Their study suggested that the Pakistani university students showed their political participation through social media as they discussed the political issues of Pakistani society on social media website like Facebook. There was a very small number who participated in traditional political activities.

Lall (2014) conducted a survey with young university students in different provinces of Pakistan regarding their political awareness including their perceptions of their duties. Her findings suggest that young people are aware of their rights and duties but do not participate in traditional political duties such as voting and consider it a rational choice in light of the country's flawed democratic system. They are more involved in other civic duties which influence their lives directly such as duties towards their family and local community. Lall concluded that the Pakistani youth is unaware of the power of their vote and significance of other civic duties which is a failing of the education system

coupled with the flawed political system in this fragmented democracy. Thus, social and moral duties are more important to the youth in Pakistan than legal and political duties.

Duties, therefore, form an essential part of a citizen's status. The situation of duties of a citizen has changed over time and varies across different contexts. There are various issues related to duties discussed in literature which include participation levels across different ethnic, gender and age groups. In Pakistan, social and moral duties towards family and local community are considered important. The youth of Pakistan is aware of their duties but negligent in practice of political duties according to various survey reports.

2.5 Conclusion

In this chapter, a background of theories of citizenship and literature was given. In the foreground, the studies on teaching citizenship through literature were discussed. Most of these theories have been conducted at the school level in the contexts of Europe and America. This creates a niche for the current study which is conducted in Pakistan at the university level.

In sections that follow, theoretical frameworks were explained. The first framework used is Rosenblatt's Reader Response Theory. The framework was chosen based on its suitability for the project. Rosenblatt argues that meaning-making process is a result of the transaction between the reader and the text. Role of the learner including her personal, communal and moral background; role of the teacher as an intermediary; the aesthetic impact of the text; and the kind of reading a learner does are factors that affect the meaning-making process.

A second citizenship framework by Cogan (1998) is also used. Cogan's attributes of citizenship include identity, rights and duties. These three elements are explained in terms of Cogan. They are explored further in light of literature based in the Pakistani

context. The literature reviewed provides a good background understanding of the research questions. In the next chapter, the four novels in this study will be reviewed in light of these frameworks.

3. Literature review- exploration of four novels

This study is based on students' perceptions of identity, rights and duties in the context of four novels. These four novels are: *A Tale of Two Cities* by Charles Dickens; *A Passage to India* by E. M. Forster; *Lord of the Flies* by William Golding and *The God of Small Things* by Arundhati Roy. This chapter presents a personal exploration of the four novels. It explores the aspects of the three key citizenship themes in this project- identity, rights and duties- as shown in the novels and academic literature on each novel.

The final year undergraduate curriculum at the Institute of English contained twelve novels (mentioned in Section 4.6). The number of novels needed to be narrowed for the purposes of this project to ensure manageability and an in-depth study. Four novels were therefore, selected from the twelve novels in the curriculum, for this project. The novels selected were considered a varied, coherent mix in terms of the era, the setting and the content of the novels, the location, social or political interest and gender of their authors. *A Tale of Two Cities*; *A Passage to India*; *Lord of the Flies* and *The God of Small Things* are written at different periods of time, in a variety of settings by male and female writers in England and India. Dickens from the Victorian period, Forster Edwardian, Golding from early twentieth century, and Roy being contemporary provide a good spread in terms of the era each novel belongs to (more on Sampling of the novels in Section 4.6).

There are deep connections between the research questions and the novels. The novels depict the themes of identity, rights and duties. My exploration of the novels, below is based on these three aspects of Cogan's framework. This is not to say however, that there are no other interpretations possible except the ones presented here. It is possible that some participants identify and interpret the novels in ways other than this as this project is not intended to test their knowledge rather explore their understanding of the novels in light of my research questions.

An exploration of each of the novels is given in the following sections. An introductory section giving a brief summary of the text and a general introduction to the writer has been added to each section to put the novel in context. This is followed by specific sections related to identity, rights and duties.

3.1 A Tale of Two Cities

This section begins with a brief introduction to Dickens and his works, followed by a short summary of the novel. This is followed by a personal exploration of the novel with reference to citizenship issues in the light of relevant literature and the novel's text. Issues relating to national, social-class and gender identity; violation of rights based on social class and the contrast between reality and intent during the revolution; civic and moral duties are discussed in these sections.

Charles Dickens (1812-70) was a Victorian social novelist. The impulse behind his writing is argued to be moral like other novelists of his era (Hardy, 1970; Orwell, 1940; Engel, 1956). He spent his early life in poverty. The sufferings of these days are reflected in his fictional work - in the depiction of poor child characters, and deprivation and injustice faced by the working class at the hands of the elite. As a child, Dickens had to leave school to work at a factory, experience death of his two younger siblings due to poverty, make frequent visits to his father in debtors' prison- events that many (like Tomalin, 2011) suggest left a deep impact on his life and his writings. Dickens's work on social reform has been acknowledged by critics such as Matthew Arnold (Collins, 1965). His "Household Words", the weekly literary magazine that he was editor of, contained articles on social reforms (Brown, 1982). His works, in general, present a social morality, question the duties of the upper-class and explore the deprivation and negation of rights of the poor (Diniejkó, 2009).

His personal life indicates certain contradictions to the beliefs he propagated, such

as his treatment of his wife, his extravagant life (Tomalin, 2011). However, like most writers he was a businessman and the content of his novels focussed on subjects that sold well. It is important to understand Dickens's life to understand his work as Margolyes and Fraser (2011, p. 7) argue, "more than any other writer, his life was in his work".

A Tale of Two Cities was written in 1859. It is set in the background of the French revolution and is the story of the events that took place between 1775 and 1790. Dr. Manette, Lucy's father and Charles Darnay's father-in-law, has been in prison for many years and is released at the beginning of the novel. He was imprisoned on false charges by two aristocrats- Evermonde brothers who had sent him to prison so that he would not be able to reveal their crimes of rape and murder which he had witnessed. Darnay, who is the son and nephew to the two Evermondes, does not like the ways of his forefathers, leaves France, comes and lives in England under a different name. He here falls in love with Lucy and marries her. However, he gets jailed due to his Evermonde identity and after a biased trial an execution is announced. That punishment however, is borne by Sydney Carton, who sacrifices his life for Darnay, due to his love for Lucy.

One exception to Dickens's being a moral, social writer is his stance on colonisation and the colonised 'race'. There is an argument in literature that Dickens avoided discussion of colonisation which shows his indifference, and possible prejudice, to the issue (Joshi, 2007). However, others such as Chesterton (1921) have argued against Dickens being racist in any of his works. *A Tale of Two Cities*, however, was written in the background of Indian Mutiny of 1857 and critics such as Peters (2013), Oddie (1972) and Joshi (2007) have found subtle connections in the novel and writer's views on colonialism. Peters (2013) argues that Dickens's views on race changed with time owing to different circumstances- an important political event of that time was the Indian Mutiny which influenced the writing of *A Tale of Two Cities*. Oddie (1972) further argues that the class revolution in *A Tale of Two Cities* is inspired by the Sepoy Revolution of the Indian

Mutiny. It is interesting and self-contradictory for a novelist of such an avowedly humane temperament to have wished “to exterminate the ‘Race’” (of Indians, after the Mutiny of 1857) as cited in his letters (Joshi, 2007, p. 49, quotes added). The colonial elements, however, have not been the direct subject of his novels.

I propose that *A Tale of Two Cities* is a novel about citizenship, alongside other themes, raising social issues of identity, rights and duties of the individual, through its events and characters. Dickens’s motive in writing *A Tale of Two Cities* was to raise a general awareness of rights of lower class and duties of the aristocrats. Critics argue that Dickens reminds the aristocracy of their duties and the rights of the common man, and asks them to be careful otherwise a destructive event such as the French Revolution could take place (e.g., Orwell, 1940; see also Brown, 1982).

Though the novel is the story of Dr. Manette and his daughter, it is influenced by political activities of the day. Moreover, as Orwell (1940) argues the strongest impression one leaves with from the book is that of the Reign of Terror. Woodcock (1970) sees in the depiction of the Reign of Terror, Dickens’s anger for the injustices faced in his childhood. Ferguson (2005) considers it an attempt to explain terrorism and its links with the individual. Schor (2001), on the other hand, believes it is an attempt to raise political questions in an imaginary setting.

Lukàcs (1969) argues that the novel has taken a political background but not used it to demonstrate political scenario or themes, rather changed the novel into a romance. For Lukàcs (1969), it is a limitation that the novel has been involved so much in the cause and effect of morality causing the links between the Revolution and lives of the characters to fade.

Dickens uses the historical context of the French Revolution in the novel. Authenticity of the facts in the novel are a subject of great controversy (Bloom, 2007; Stout, 2007; Ferguson, 2005; Lukàcs, 1969). However, as Stout (2007) argues, even

though French Revolution has not been used ‘historically’, with dramatic representations of actual events and key figures, it has been used ‘conceptually’ to put across the author’s message. Ferguson (2005, p. 52) takes it a step further and argues that Dickens was not “sacrificing the political for the individually and domestically moral” but he was “trying to come to terms with the concepts of terror and terrorism in the political world”. The critics do, however, agree that it is a highly political novel that raises questions related to individual citizens.

Dickens has been received well throughout the world and not just in England. He has been translated and discussed critically in many languages. Hollington (2013) presents an anthology of Dickens’s reception throughout the different countries in Europe. The works of Dickens have been translated in Urdu along with other languages in Pakistan. Even though the novelist is not from a culturally close context to the participants of this study but the readers may be able to connect to the novel as it has been received well throughout the world.

3.1.1 Identity in *A Tale of Two Cities*

In the following paragraphs I explore identity in *A Tale of Two Cities* in light of my analysis of the academic literature on the novel. Following a general discussion of identity in *A Tale*, three themes of national identity, social-class identity and gender identity are discussed.

A Tale of Two Cities depicts how people’s rights and duties change with their identities and how it affects their lives. Different characters are affected adversely due to their identities- Gaspard is treated badly by Marquis, before the revolt, due to being poor; Darnay is imprisoned due to his aristocratic affiliations after the revolution. Darnay’s familial identity- being from the Evremonde family who caused Dr. Manette’s imprisonment- is a cause of mental distress for the doctor (Bloom, 2007). Dr. Manette,

while in his imprisonment for eighteen years forgets his name, ethnicity, religion, and nationality. Towards the end of the novel, he uses his status as a French doctor, who has suffered at the hands of the aristocrats in prison, in his favour trying to get his son-in-law released.

National identity is a recurring theme in the novel. *A Tale of Two Cities* is the tale of two nations- French and English. Dickens deliberately leaves a mark of distinction between characters from each side- the Englishness of Miss Pross and Mr. Lorry even after a year after being in France (Bloom, 2007) and the unconventional use of words to depict a verbatim translation from French for the French characters (Stephen, 1961) are devices used to differentiate the French from the English. Dickens being a patriot, presents English characters as good, moral people. Even the body-digger (who digs dead bodies out of the graves) Mr. Cruncher, who has done no good all his life turns over a new leaf in the difficult times around the Reign of Terror. The French start referring to each other as “citizen” and “citizeness” during the troubled times making a distinction between their own and the “outsiders”. Immigration issues are raised; secrecy is adopted in crossing borders in the tumultuous time after the revolution. Even though Dickens himself did not face any difficulties in crossing the border and visited France many times, he has shown clash of the two national identities in his novel (Heitzman, 2014). National identity is shown to be of importance and supposed to have an effect on how people are viewed and judged.

Social class identity is another important theme in *A Tale of Two Cities*. A stark class difference is portrayed in the characters of Marquis Evermonde and the villagers that he ill-treats (Bloom, 2007). There is not much recent literature that focusses and discusses social class issues in the novel- a review of the issues of *Dickens Quarterly*, *The Dickensian*, *Dickens Studies Annual: Essays on Victorian Fiction*, *Victorian literature and Culture* and *Nineteenth Century Literature* from 2010 to-date showed that there was no article specific to the theme. Critics mention the theme briefly in a more general discussion

on the novel. Schor (2001, p. 64), for example, terms it a novel of ‘the revolution of a down-trodden populace’. Peters (2013, p. 116) writes, “it is a central image of a monstrous, uncaring and corrupt upper class in France contrasted with a wretched poor”.

A reading of the text of *A Tale of Two Cities* depicts the presence of the theme of a social-class identity. The speech of the village woman who wants a little piece of wood to mark her husband’s grave is paid little heed to by the rich aristocrat, Marquis. This speech is important in its indication of the aristocrat’s awareness of the conditions of the poor. The arrogance in the Marquis’s words after running his carriage over a poor boy and killing him is an example of the way he treated those from a lower social-class background: “you people cannot take care of yourselves and your children. One or the other of you is forever in the way. How do I know what injury you have done my horses?” (Dickens, 1859/1994, p. 116).

There is some contradiction in Dickens’s portrayal of the theme and his personal life. Gurney (2015) presents a general contradiction between Dickens’s life and works regarding his views on social class differences. Dickens lived an extravagant life while preaching Christian values of charity in his novels and depicting the rich with a negative connotation. Orwell (1940) goes to the extent of claiming that though Dickens has been called the champion of the poor, “the central action of Dickens’s stories almost invariably takes place in middle-class surroundings” (p. 12).

The gender roles in the novel are also important in terms of identity. Critics seem to disagree on the nature of treatment of women in Dickens’s novels. Katey Dickens, the novelist’s daughter as cited in Isba (2011, p. 1) believed, ‘my father did not understand women.’ Ayres (1998) argues that Dickens has presented a man’s belief of a woman- about her role in society, her aptitude and behaviour. She further argues that Dickens’s women characters can be easily classified in two types- little women (not fully developed characters which she also refers to as ‘child-women’) and She-dragons (evil characters-

the most evil of which is Madame Defarge). There are some other classifications such as religious zealots like Mrs Cruncher in *A Tale*. Byler (2013), on the other hand, argues that Dickens's female characters are always "little"- modest, sacrificing, compassionate, accommodating. Dickens has shown them to be morally superior to men but then also made them inhuman in the process, setting the standard of womanhood so high that no one could reach it. Despite critics' argument against Dickens not being able to understand women, Dickens has constructed unforgettable characters like Madame Defarge (Slater, 1983; Black, 2012).

Feminine elements are at the centre of the novel. Bloom (2007, p. 56) argues, "It is significant that that crime that has created Madame Defarge is a crime against the feminine, the noble raping the poor". The raped girl who dies at the hands of the Evremonde brothers symbolises the oppressed female gender and forms the basis of the revolution. Dickens's use of Madame Defarge's knitting as the symbol of the revolution is argued to be his way of expressing his disapproval of the Victorian values of domesticity and feminine identity (Waters, 2012). Madam Defarge's knitting on the guillotine counting "dropping heads" is Dickens's way of bringing together the public and private spheres, specifically in relation to reinventing female identity in the Victorian era. Ingham (1992) argues how gender and nationalism are combined in the presentation of characters of Madame Defarge and Miss Pross- Defarge being the 'ultimate Terror' (p. 5) is female but a foreigner; while the force that ends her is also a female- the virtuous and English Miss Pross.

The novel depicts various ways Dickens has portrayed women. This novel has varying female characters- from the compassionate Lucy to the evil and strong Madame Defarge, from the spiritual Mrs. Cruncher to the patriotic and dutiful Miss Pross. Dickens portrays the evil yet strong female in Mrs Defarge, the compassionate, emblematic wife and daughter in Lucy and the oppressed and abused yet God-fearing woman in Mrs Cruncher. Men throughout the novel are shown as the bread-winners, and the ones in

professional jobs. Doctor Manette is a doctor, Mr. Lorry is a banker, Sydney Carton is a lawyer. The female characters either do not work like Lucy Manette or stay in a homely environment like Miss Pross. Thus, different roles assumed by characters of different genders have been presented to portray gender identities.

Dickens has, thus, discussed different types of identity issues related to a citizen's social life in *A Tale of Two Cities*.

3.1.2 Rights in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Dickens has depicted a general exploitation of rights through the major events in the story. Violation of rights based on class and the ideal of rights as opposed to practice are the two themes discussed in the following paragraphs. The themes of identity, rights and duties are interconnected, and the events and characters discussed here may be relevant to other themes as well.

Violation of rights of the lower class by the aristocrats is a fundamental theme throughout the novel. Dickens portrays characters of the lower class whose rights are exploited by the aristocrats. Various incidents throughout the novel point to the violation of rights of the individual- the rape of the peasant girl, murder of her brother, unjust imprisonment and disappearance of Dr. Manette, murder of the little boy under Marquis's carriage, unjust trial of Darnay, massacre under the guillotine and the death of Carton. Hutter (1978, p. 448) argues that "the rape itself implies social exploitation" (as opposed to gender-based exploitation) where the Evremondes being aristocrats do not feel any pity, shame or kindness and deny the girl and her family basic human rights. The event is not identified as a gender issue as the targeted girl's brother and the doctor who helped also suffered severely and the cause was the arrogance and power that the Evremonde brothers enjoyed. There is evidence of Dickens's disapproval of inequality of rights in his life- he cut short his trip to Virginia because the obvious inhumanity of these slave-owning states

upset him (Tomalin, 2011). So, violation of rights of lower socioeconomic groups is an important theme in the context of this novel.

Another theme related to rights is that of the ideal of rights as opposed to practice. The state implies equality of rights but that appears only on paper and rights of individuals seem to be lost or ignored. Ferguson (2005) argues that Dickens was presenting ineffectual individuals, losing their rights and their identity in groups, as a way of being critical towards such prevailing social norms. Stout (2007) further claims that Dickens seems to present rights of the Republic through the rights of the individuals, thus nullifying the rights of the individual. The rights of the individual such as Darnay or Manette or Carton are unimportant, insignificant as compared to those of the state. The ideals of rights are raised but when it comes to the individuals they are deprived of their individual rights. Carton's character provides a good discussion on how far a common man's rights are affected by the political events of the day. A figure as "ahistorical" and non-political as Carton, gets involved in a trial but is denied his right to a fair trial which eventually leads to his death (Petch, 2002). Thus, the ones in power claim to be fighting for rights but in practice all individuals are being denied basic rights.

There are some issues regarding gender rights in Dickens's work in general but not much is said about gender rights in relation to this work in academic literature. Dickens, in life, always took charge of his relationship such as in case of his marriage with Catherine (Tomalin, 2011). Even though Dickens's attitude towards his wife is accused of being hypocritical (Slater, 2012), there is no more to it than a marriage separation (Callow, 2012). He was against oppression and degradation of women as is evident from his efforts to rescue prostitutes and give them a 'home' during his lifetime. Owing to the times he wrote in, he did not seem to believe in equality of rights between men and women but he has raised concern over oppression of women's rights (Tomalin, 2011).

3.1.3 Duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Duties are seen as an important theme in light of the characters and events depicted in the novel. With reference to critical literature, there are some implicit connections to duties- duties have not been explicitly discussed in academic literature related to the novel. The following paragraphs discuss the importance of duties in the novel followed by the specific discussion of civic and moral duties in academic literature on *A Tale*.

Dickens, in *A Tale of Two Cities*, depicts duties of the citizen through the characters' actions and their consequences. The events that result from their actions strengthen his argument about duties for the reader. Mr. Lorry, Miss Pross and Dr. Manette are shown to be conscientious, duty-bound citizens who meet, arguably, a good end. The Defarges, on the other hand, have their duty not towards the state but towards their own ideals, and Madame is seen to meet a silent end in a fight with Miss Pross. Not every character however, is presented as dutiful. Carton, for example, lacks a sense of social responsibility throughout the novel and is depicted as a rather irresponsible lawyer but towards the end of the novel his character alters into a very responsible individual (Hutter, 1978).

Civic duties are an important underlying theme in *A Tale of Two Cities*. Even though academic literature on *A Tale of Two Cities* does not directly relate to the theme of duties, there are subtle connections between Dickens's depiction of social class identities and their performance of duties. Peters (2013) for example talks about the novel being a depiction of a corrupt upper-class and miserable poor (as discussed in previous sections), which can be seen as an issue of the upper class not performing their due share of duties and causing an imbalance in the society. The question of importance of duties can be further reflected upon in the text through characters such as Mr. Lorry, who is very loyal to his duties. Mr. Manette was also imprisoned as a result of fulfilling his duties loyally and sincerely. Most of the characters who are depicted in a positive light are shown as

duty-abiding citizens. The Marquis brothers, who do not obey the law and take advantage of their position, carry a negative connotation in themselves. Sims (2005) discusses Darnay's lack of social responsibility- he goes through a trial not just once in the time of revolution but earlier as well- a case which is not very clearly explained. Furthermore, the Defarges who do not abide by the laws of the land and try to create laws of their own end up creating a miserable, lawless and bloody revolution. It is fair to argue, thus, that Dickens has advocated the rule of law by presenting law-abiding, dutiful citizens as the good characters and the lawless individual as the evil ones.

Moral duties of citizens are argued to rely on education. Dickens's interest in education of the young, for building of good moral character, as suggested by Brantlinger (2011) can be taken as a suggestion of his stance on duties. Dickens advocated education because he believed that ignorance could lead to sin and negligence of duties. Orwell (1940) contends that Dickens's work seems to argue that if you wish to make good people, you need to educate them while they are young- which points out the duties of the state and all citizens. Though the theme is more explicit in other novels by the author, the case of Cruncher (Junior) is an example in the novel, as he is shown to adopt his father's rude manners very easily and a proper upbringing is seen wanting.

To conclude, *A Tale of Two Cities* has some discussion of duties. A careful study of the text and critical literature highlights some discussion of duties with reference to civic and moral elements.

3.1.4 Conclusion

To conclude the discussion on *A Tale of Two Cities*, the novel is charged with the themes of citizenship. Even though there are overlaps among the themes of identity, rights and duties, individual sections on each theme help raises issues regarding each theme. The exploration of identity showed national, social-class and gender identity issues in the novel

and in academic literature. Violation of rights based on social class and the contrast between ideals and practices in the revolution were the two rights related themes discussed in academic literature. Civic and moral duties were discussed under duties more in relation to the text of the novel than academic literature as duties are not explicitly discussed much with reference to this novel. The novel, thus, presents opportunities to explore my research questions in light of the views from the participants.

3.2 The God of Small Things

The second novel chosen for the purposes of this project is *The God of Small Things* by Arundhati Roy (1997). This section begins with a brief introduction to Roy as a political and social activist, followed by a short summary of the novel *The God of Small Things*. This is followed by a personal exploration of the novel in light of citizenship issues. In the subsections that follow, identity is discussed with reference to social class and caste, gender and post-colonialism. This is followed by issues related to negation of rights on the basis of caste, class, gender and age. Legal and civic duties and attitude towards duties are issues discussed in the last subsection.

Arundhati Roy (1961-present) is a political activist who lives in India and writes political essays and books questioning the actions of the state. *The God of Small Things* is her first and only work of fiction, up to 2016, which was received very well and was awarded the Booker Prize. Amidst great fame, Roy was charged for spreading obscenity and immorality as the novel talks about an extramarital sexual affair between a high-caste woman and her low-caste handyman. A case was filed against her, by a lawyer in Kerala of which she was discharged after almost a decade (Naqvi, 2016). She was also accused of repetitiveness and over-writing by many critics like Ahmad (2007). Prasad (2004) quotes incidents from her life which are very similar to the incidents in the novel. Rofail (2008) argues that the novel is autobiographical in many ways- Roy's mother like Ammu was a

Christian who married a Hindu and divorced him soon after, Rahel, like Roy herself is of a rebellious nature, studied architecture and married an American. Thus, the novel is written in a personal and private manner to raise a voice against the injustice within society.

Following her success as a novelist, Roy turned to political activism and has written a number of political books and many articles addressing issues ranging from building of dams to nuclear blasts, becoming “India’s glamorous conscience” (as suggested in the title of Tripathi, 2001). She has boldly criticised the Prime Minister of the country, openly declared her views on controversial subjects such as occupied territory of Kashmir, for which she continues to receive life-threats (Elmhirst, 2011).

The God of Small Things, written in 1997, is the best-selling book by a non-expatriate Indian author. It is a story based in Ayemenem, India (where Roy herself grew up) of three generations of an Anglophile family of Syrian Christians. Roy describes the forbidden inter-caste love affair of Ammu, the divorced touchable (as opposed to untouchable) daughter of Pappachi and Mammachi, and Velutha, the untouchable carpenter who works for Mammachi and Chacko (Ammu’s brother). The love affair ends in Velutha being sent to jail on charges of rape which eventually results in his death from torture. The story is depicted largely through the point of view of Ammu’s twins, Rahel and Estha. After their mother’s affair goes public, Ammu sends Rahel off to his father and leaves her parents’ house and dies of illness and in solitude. The two twins meet after decades and the story culminates in their lovemaking. The story thus, brings forth the themes of class and caste relations, social discrimination, power hierarchies among men and women in the South-Asian society (Komalesha, 2008).

Within the cover of a love-story, Arundhati Roy raise issues of rights, duties and identity through gender, caste, social class and status of the characters in the novel. Ahmad (2007) claims that the familial relations and eroticism in the novel “dismisses the actually constituted field of politics as either irrelevant or a zone of bad faith” (p. 114). However,

Freed (2011) maintains that Ahmad fails to recognize that the personal events stemming out of the more political events actually strengthen her cause. Bose (1998) also asserts that in presenting the love affair, Roy has managed to raise important political questions. Roy herself has said in an interview with Terrence McNally that writing fiction or political essays is not that different for her since she has brought forth the same issues through both forms of writings (Kearney, 2009).

The novel was received very well in India and was translated in many world languages. Roy is a well-known author in Pakistan as well. In the following sub-sections, the themes of identity, rights and duties in relation to the novel are explained individually.

3.2.1 Identity in *The God of Small Things*

Identity issues are at the centre of the novel. Komalesha (2008) points out that Roy writes with religious, social, cultural as well as post-colonial identity issues at the centre of her novel. The following paragraphs discuss social identities in the context that are strengthened by the Hindu caste system that neither Christianity nor Marxism have been able to wipe out from the Indian society. Following a discussion of these socially constructed identities, gender-based identity and post-colonial identity are discussed in light of the novel and academic literature.

The caste identities in the novel are depicted as strengthened and accepted by religion and society. Komalesha (2008) argues that Roy shows that the caste-system is so deeply rooted in society that even Christianity and Indian Marxism could not rid the society of these values. Velutha is referred to, in the novel, as an ‘untouchable’- a casteless individual (also referred to as Paravan or Dalit, elsewhere). Even the Christians who have converted from Hindus, retain their castes becoming Brahman (upper class Hindus) Christians like Pappachi. Marxist leader Comrade Pillai is also shown to dislike Velutha due to his being a Paravan. Most characters in older generations like Vellya Paapen,

Velutha's father, acknowledge their identity and live within the boundaries assigned by the society. Younger generations, however, are not ready to follow without questioning the system- Velutha joins the Communist party, falls in love with a touchable (as opposed to 'untouchable'), which becomes a transgression due to his identity (Krishnamurthy, 2011; Bose, 1998). The death that Velutha meets, the way the love-affair ends within the novel and how it is received in society (with the writer being charged of 'corrupting public morality') depicts the deep-roots of these identities within South Asian society. The Article 17 of the Indian Constitution (National Portal of India, 2016) addresses untouchability and prohibits it but the practice is quite different- the untouchables exist in 21st century India and their identity is portrayed in Roy's novel as a symbol of injustice.

Gender identity is also an important theme. Roy has shown her views on the prevalent values of patriarchy by depicting the modern Indian woman's quest for identity in the characters of Ammu and Rahel (Bose, 2015). Women are portrayed as the perpetual givers in Indian folk stories. Religion also aids the process. Women fighting for their rights in the Indian sub-continent are considered to be influenced by Western ideals (Jackson, 2010). Modern writers like Roy have shown a revolt against such depictions through their female characters such as Ammu- she has the free will to go marry of her own accord, the need to be loved after a divorce and the desire to go against what she is told and fall in love with an untouchable.

Meyer (2013) argues that Ammu is a postcolonial female subject who has reacted to the indifference she has faced due to her female identity. When Ammu comes back to her family home after her divorce, Roy (1997, p. 43) writes the situation as, "Old female relations with incipient beards and several wobbling chins made overnight trips to Ayemenem to commiserate with her about her divorce. They squeezed her knee and gloated. She fought off the urge to slap them." The discriminative society that welcomes Chacko's ex-wife and denies Ammu a respectable place after her divorce is rebuked by

Roy and Ammu alike. Passos (2003) argues that the case of the British ex-wife versus Ammu is a case of the postcolonial overlapping gender issues. Margaret, a British woman divorced ex-wife of Chacko, the son of the family was treated much more respectfully than Ammu, the daughter who had married another Indian and got a divorce. In the dichotomy of Estha and Rahel, in the younger generation, interestingly Rahel is depicted as outgoing, rebellious, bold and vocal while her brother is depicted as the obedient and mute one (Friedman, 2005). Komalesha (2008) argues that through these reversed roles Roy is suggesting that identities are complex in the modern world owing to social and cultural factors.

Roy's work presents a postcolonial identity in many ways. Firstly, her use of English mixed with words from Malayalam (a language spoken in southern India), without her needing to explain each and every word or phrase, is a postcolonial element (Sohn, 2013; Rajeev, 2011; Nandi, 2010). This use of English in a modern, postcolonial manner is an outstanding feature of the novel acclaimed even by Aijaz Ahmad (2007), a well-known critic of Roy. Secondly, Roy's presentation of the Anglophile family as decadent and slowly regressing is a way of portraying how the colonies have moved from the impact of colonialism (see also, Friedman, 2005; Komalesha, 2008). Thirdly, the shift from generation to generation, shows the change in postcolonial trends. Ammu's father Pappachi, respects the English in every form- to the extent that he does not believe her that an Englishman can be of such low morals as to ask her husband to leave his wife with him for a night. The second generation Ammu makes fun of her brother's 'read aloud' manner of talking in English, that he probably adopted during his stay at Oxford, rather than being impressed by his British qualifications. The third generation has Rahel marrying an American and moving to the States- depicting the power shift from Britain to America for the current youth (Chu, 2006).

Postcolonial elements in the novel have been discussed by various critics. Rajeev (2011) argues that “we (Indians) are people who are forced into an anglicized pattern of thinking and practice which is enabled by the public school education established by the colonial rulers” (p. 53). He goes on to assert that the Elvis Presley hair style of Estha, at the age of nine, is an example of colonial impact. Tickell (2007) on the other hand argues that “the novel appears to acknowledge both [. . .] collective and subjective forms of postcolonial resistance” (p. 75). Tickell (2007) further gives the example of the twins “playful subversion of Anglophile texts” (p. 75). Identity, being a complex phenomenon is influenced by many factors at the same time and it is safe to say that in the times shown when the twins were kids, there were still some remnants of the colonial times, while people had also outgrown it to some extent and could see faults of the coloniser.

Roy’s novel and relevant academic literature present various issues related to identity. Socially constructed caste system is depicted to be deep rooted. Gender roles are shown to be influenced by patriarchal values but no so much in increasingly rebellious modern women. Postcolonial influences of not just the empire but other cultural entities also depict identity issues presented in the novel.

3.2.2 Rights in *The God of Small Things*

Roy has talked about different kinds of oppressions which lead to a struggle for rights among different groups. As Oslo (2011) writes, “in Roy’s description of Kerala in the novel, there are several layers of oppression stemming from colonialism, patriarchy, religion and caste” (p. 6). In the following paragraphs, I discuss the violation of rights based on social caste and class, gender rights and rights of children in society.

Negations of rights on the basis of caste is a strong theme in *The God of Small Things*. Roy has presented the exploitation and negation of rights of Dalits. Even though the constitution provides the rights to equality, the Indian society continues to treat this

group as 'subhuman' (Kumar, 2014). Komalesha (2008) asserts that Roy has raised a voice against this deep-rooted oppression in the society. The character of Velutha is depicted as an untouchable, who is not allowed to literally touch any touchable (those who belong to one of the other castes, above the dalits in the hierarchy), cannot go to school with the touchable children, cannot obtain professional education, and cannot have a relationship outside his circle. As the dalits are denied their rights to education and employability, they stay poor and downtrodden, having no influence in society. When Velutha breaks these norms by falling in love with Ammu- a touchable Christian- he is charged with rape and tortured to death in a prison with no legal rights to a fair trial or even a hearing (Roy, 1997).

Erwin (2012) argues that the fate that Velutha meets seems to warn others from his caste to stay away from such actions and "reconfirms the immutable status of 'untouchability'" (p. 334). This, however, can be denied on the basis that no dalits in India were supposed to be the readers when the novel was written in English- medium of instruction in elite schools in India only. Roy (1997) has chosen fiction as her medium of communicating her message to the Indian educated class (being the expected audience of an English novel, in India) and not trying to warn the Dalits.

Another rights theme in the novel is the difference between the rights of men and women. Women are shown to have no legal rights. Ammu as a divorced woman did not have the legal right to file a complaint, and was harassed at the police station when she attempts to do so. The pickle factory owned by their mother is jointly run by Ammu and her brother Chacko (also divorced), but is owned by Chacko alone with Ammu having no legal rights to it (Prakash and Sujata, 2014).

Women are also denied any rights within the house. Mammachi (Ammu's mother) is beaten by her husband regularly and she is helpless until her son, Chacko, is old enough to stop his father. Ammu is not given the right to an equal education as her brother Chacko who is sent to Oxford. This generation of women fight for their rights but the context is

not very accommodating as Ammu is shown to have met a helpless death after leading a struggling life. Rahel, in the third generation, however, does not face a problem of rights and leads her life in the way she deems appropriate.

The men of the first two generations are also depicted as patriarchal oppressing their women while being gentlemen outside of their homes (Alam, 2014). The patriarchal oppression is not just observed by the men- women play their parts as well. Mammachi and Baby Kochamma understand Chacko's 'needs' and let him bring women in the house from a door built specially for this purpose (Thakur, 2013; Roy, 2009). However, Ammu is largely despised by these same women (Mammachi and Baby Kochama) for marrying of her own accord and getting divorced- even the cook Kochu Maria reproaches Ammu's twins saying they should leave and go to their own house (Bee, 2014; Stockdale, 2008). Thus, gender rights are shown to be more problematic for older women than younger new generation with the oppressors being both men as well as other women.

Negation of rights to the children also comes up in the text and in academic literature. The novel presents many instances of how children are deprived of basic social and legal rights. Estha was sexually abused at nine, and lived in fear of the man who assaulted and threatened him and went unpunished as the crime was never reported. The twins were separated without being given any right to choose. Estha is made to be a witness against Velutha- a traumatic experience for such a young child (Roy, 1997). The rights of the Indian children, Rahel and Estha are shown as inferior to those of Sophie Mol, the English girl (Hopkins, 2011, connects to postcolonial identity issues discussed in Section 3.2.1).

There are issues regarding rights of different castes, gender rights and the rights of children raised in the novel. An understanding of these issues will help relate the participants' views on rights in *The God of Small Things* to debates in academic literature.

3.2.3 Duties in *The God of Small Things*

Even though duties are not explicitly discussed in critical discourse in relation to the novel, denial of rights throughout the novel leads the reader to think about the duties not being performed. Legal and civic duties of individual characters are reflected upon in the following paragraphs.

Legal duties are shown to be neglected by upholders of law. The policemen who harasses Ammu is unnoticed in most possibly a crowded police station. Ironically the sign behind him reads:

Politeness.

Obedience.

Loyalty.

Intelligence.

Courtesy.

Efficiency.

-(Roy, 1997, p. 8)

Velutha is falsely accused of rape, caught and imprisoned and tortured to death. The police are shown completely unaware of their duties with not a single responsible duty-bound individual. Arundhati Roy has shown a rather depressing situation when it comes to law and order in India.

A set of pseudo civic duties are constructed and followed by the society depicted in *The God of Small Things*. Friedman (2005) argues that it was Comrade Pillai's responsibility as party leader to save Velutha but he did not choose to do so as he wished to please the police and other upper caste members of his party. The duties are bound to the patriarchal and caste based norms- anyone who transgresses is punished accordingly (Krishnamurthy, 2011). Velutha being an untouchable who transgressed outside his caste faces death while Ammu is punished with seclusion.

It can, thus, be argued that through the events in the plot, Arundhati Roy has depicted the condition of legal and civic duties being performed in the Indian society.

3.2.4 Conclusion

In conclusion, the novel depicts social issues in the context of Indian society. Roy, being affected by many of the events presented in the novel, has depicted the injustice observed in full detail. The themes of identity, rights and duties have been considered in individual sections, though there is some overlap. Issues regarding identity discussed in relation to text and academic literature were those about social caste, gender and post-colonialism. Negation of rights was discussed on the basis of caste and class, gender rights and negation of children's rights. Legal and civic duties as portrayed in the context of the Indian society were also discussed.

3.3 *A Passage to India*

A Passage to India by E. M. Forster is based in colonial India. The novel discusses the theme of national identity in detail. The themes of social class identity, rights and duties are all connected to the central theme of national identity of Indians and the British. There are, however, non-political interpretations of the novel as well. In this section, I discuss the novelist briefly before giving a brief summary of the novel. The sub-sections that follow discuss the themes of identity, rights and duties in relation to the novel individually.

Edward Morgan Forster (1879-1970) was an English novelist, short-story writer and essayist, who was nominated for the Nobel Prize in thirteen different years. When one of his aunts died, she left him an inheritance, enough to provide for him for the rest of his life which allowed him to invest his time as a writer (Bradhsaw, 2007). Forster is known for the humanism in his writings; his best known novel was his last published (during his lifetime), *A Passage to India*. His posthumous publications, predominantly in the novel

Maurice, have revealed Forster's interest in homosexuality and have led to similar interpretations of earlier novels as well such as Davidis (1999) on *A Passage to India*. Forster lived through the glory and the decline of the British Empire and visited India thrice at different points in time which led to the creation of many of his characters and events in *A Passage to India* (Khan, 2013).

A Passage to India, is a story focussing the impossibility of a friendship between Indians and English in India (Woo, 2008), set in the town of Chandrapore (based on the actual Bankipore in India according to Kuchta, 2003). The book is divided in three sections- Mosque (symbolising desire for such a friendship); Caves (confusion, chaos and hostility); Temple (hope in the future) (White, 1953). The novel starts in the house of Hamidullah, an Indian Muslim, with his friends Dr. Aziz (based on Forster's friend Masood according to Khan, 2013) and Mahboub Ali having dinner and questioning the possibility of such friendship. The hostile attitude of the general Anglo-Indians, including officials such as Turton and Callendar, is portrayed throughout the first section, with the exception of the newcomers Adela Quested and Mrs. Moore and Mr. Fielding, who is declined the status of a 'sahib' by the Anglo-Indian women (Hawkins, 1983). These three intend to know the Indians and extend a friendly hand towards Aziz. In the second section, Aziz takes Mrs Moore and Adela for an expedition in the caves. This is where the confusion starts- Adela goes into a cave and gets scared assuming that Aziz came after her and attempted to assault her. She immediately, leaves for Chandrapore. Aziz is arrested for this insult and a case is filed against him. All Anglo-Indians, except Fielding, unite against Aziz. Indians are targeted and generalised in all their gatherings. This hostility culminates in Adela taking her case back in front of the court and declaring that Aziz never followed her. A misunderstanding also arises between Fielding and Aziz over Adela's compensation. In the last section, Aziz and Fielding are shown to meet in Kashmir, in the midst of Krishna's festival (which Forster had seen while he was serving a Maharajah).

The misunderstanding is cleared but they still cannot be friends- as Forster puts it “not yet...not there” (Forster, 1924/2005, p. 306)

The novel presents a rich variety of themes within its text. Different critics have talked about different aspects, for example, mysticism (Panda, 2006); Hinduism (Spencer, 1968); liberal-humanism (Parry, 1986); imperialism (Meyers, 1971); romantic love (Khan, 2013). Many critics argue that the main theme of the novel is the hostility that Indians experienced at the hands of English from an English perspective (Das, 1986). However, as White (1953) states the novel is rich in its variety and has many aspects, colonial elements being just one aspect. Burra (1966) a renowned critic on Forster, who Forster himself endorsed by saying Burra knew exactly what Forster was doing, claimed that the novel was about personal relation. He suggests that even though the racial identity appears to be the prime motive “at first sight” (p. 28), this portrayal cannot be Forster’s prime motive. Shaheen (2004), however, argues that Burra’s criticism was not very in-depth and left many topics to be discussed. She further argues that Edward Said’s criticism of Forster tackles many issues that were not raised in Burra’s criticism. Said (1994) discussed Forster’s *A Passage to India* in his work *Culture and Imperialism* talking about the political nature of Forster’s fiction.

As the context of this novel is colonial India (which included present-day Pakistan), it appears relevant to the participants of this study, in some ways. The novel has been a part of the curriculum in the English department for a long time and been studied in a postcolonial light. Thus, the participants are expected to be able to connect to the novel in various ways.

The themes of identity, rights and duties as depicted in the text and critical literature on the novel, are discussed in the following sections. There is some overlap as rights and duties are also related to the national, post-colonial and social class identity but the sections are made distinct for clarity.

3.3.1 Identity in *A Passage to India*

Various themes related to identity emerge in critical literature as well as in the text of the novel. The themes discussed below are national, colonial, religious, social-class and gender identity in relation to the novel.

National identity is seen as the sole identity of individuals- they are not seen as people but rather as either Indian or English. Said (1994) argues that the novel is about identity of British and Indians which is depicted as an identity that cannot merge as yet. When the Bhattacharyas forget to send their carriage to Adela and Mrs. Moore, Adela comments that the Indians are rather forgetful. Throughout the text, it is common for characters from either group to generalise those from the other.

The novel was written in 1920s when Britain was still a colonial power and exercised imperialist rights. The Anglo-Indians, the British in India, considered themselves a superior 'race' as compared to the native Indians (Vafa and Zarrinjooee, 2014). The colonial and colonizer identities are depicted to be more important than the Indian and English identities. It was not just a matter of being from two different nations, rather it is the colonial background that makes the difference significant and leads to post-colonial readings today.

The novel starts with the third person narrator's satiric tone in the description of the 'plain' Chandrapore which has 'nothing to offer'- Forster's way of emphasising the usual impression of India on an English mind. Further in the novel, terms such as 'inhabitants of the mud' are used for the Indians (Forster, 1924/2005, p. 5). Forster has shown the imperial nature of the interaction between British and Indian characters (Walls, 2007) which Shaheen (2004) argues depicts Forster himself as an anti-imperial writer. Friedman (2005, p. 248) terms his portrayal of the colonial times as "colonial paranoia". He has depicted the end of the empire where the Anglo-Indians were holding on to

whatever was left of the British glory in their colonies while the educated class among the colonised were becoming increasingly aware of the injustice and oppression caused by the British. There is an open hostility shown by the Indian superiors towards their subordinates- Callendar calls Aziz at his dining hour, and by the time Aziz reaches his superior's house- he has left without a note, and his wife takes Aziz's tonga without any acknowledgement. The Indians are considered so inferior that Mrs Callendar says, "the kindest thing to do to a native is to let him die" (Forster, 1924/2005, p. 25). Forster always looked at the possibilities of interaction between individuals of different cultures. The Bridge Party at the request of Adela and Mrs. Moore is unsuccessful in building a bridge between the two groups- the Indians end up standing, doing nothing on one side of the garden while the English play badminton and socialise with each other on the other side. Armstrong (1992) argues that it is not just the British who are prejudiced against Indians, Indians are also prejudiced against the English.

Critics offer different meanings of the way identities have been portrayed in the novel making national identity a major theme in the novel. Trilling (2007) believes the novel raises questions about the identities portrayed in the novel exploring whether the novel depicts Indian and the British honestly. Jay (1998) argues that the presence of English women in the sub-continent strengthened the racial identity. Their social presence kept the male-settlers limited to interaction with white women only. Nilsen (2011) argues that the social distance among the colonizer and the colonized forces the dichotomy of identities and various stereotypes have been used by the novelist to strengthen the difference among the identities. The following lines from the text (Forster, 1924/2005, p. 14) explain the difference between the two identities,

As he [Aziz] entered their [civil lines] arid tidiness, depression suddenly seized him. The roads, named after victorious generals and intersecting

at right angles, were symbolic of the net Great Britain had thrown over India. He felt caught in their meshes.

Woo (2008) argues that Aziz was annoyed by the tidy roads however, I argue that it was not the tidiness but the names of the victorious generals which bothered him more. It implied that everything was occupied by the British and strengthened the concept of imperialism. Kuchta (2003) further argues, that Forster has portrayed the end of the empire through the content and technique of his novel.

Forster portrays religious identity in his novel (Singh, 1985). Forster's concept of religion is very spiritual as shown through the symbolism of mysterious caves (Bloom, 2007). Koponen (2007, p. 87) says his portrayal of Hinduism is used "only to debunk Christianity and Islam." Edward Said (1994), on the other hand argues that Forster preferred Islam over Hinduism as it was understandable and closer to the West whereas Hinduism is mystical and unclear.

A clash of religious identity can be seen in the Hindu and Muslim characters. The hostility between Aziz and Dr. Lal after the confusion over going to the Bridge Party, when Dr. Lal comes to pick Aziz up who being lost in his own world forgets to leave him a note is not just shown as the envious grudge between two colleagues but also as a religious clash. Armstrong (1992) further points that Aziz who himself is targeted based on his identity is prejudiced about the Hindus even after the incident of Adela accusing him of rape.

Social class identity is also a prevalent theme. The rich and influential English ladies are shown to be snobbish towards those lower in status to them. Mrs. Summers, the Englishwoman who is wife of a lowly railway officer is shown to be neglected and not even invited to the club. However, when its time of a national crisis, all English become united and even Mrs. Summers is invited to the club. Social class identity is given up in favour of national identity (Davidis, 1999).

Gender identity is also discussed by critics in relation to this novel. Childs (1999) believes that feminine identity is central to the plot as the alleged rape of the British female protagonist is what connects the whole plot together. Silver (1999) further argues that Indian women are depicted as 'rapable' while English women are shown superior. As even the idea of an English woman Adela being raped disdains all British on the grounds that the lowly Indians can now dare to think such a thing. Homosexuality has also been argued in academic literature (e.g. Davidis, 1999) to be at the centre of the novel with Aziz representing Forster's beloved Masood from India and Fielding being an autobiographical character.

Thus national, colonial, religious, social-class and gender identity are some of the issues highlighted in the literature.

3.3.2 Rights in *A Passage to India*

Edward Said (1994) raises questions of rights and duties that are relevant to Forster's interpretation of British and Indians as well. He asks, "what are the cultural grounds on which both natives and liberal Europeans lived and understood each other? How much could they grant each other? How, within the circle of imperial domination, could they deal with each other before radical change occurred?" (Said, 1994, p. 241). Rights have not been discussed explicitly in critical literature but the themes of civic and religious rights come up in the text. The following paragraphs discuss civic and religious rights with reference to the novel.

Rights are not a dominant theme in critical literature but the text highlights civic rights of characters as influenced by their national identity. The English do not realize that Indians are regular people like them. Callendar calls Aziz at odd times assuming Aziz has no right to a social life, whereas Ronny, an English magistrate, considers it his right to be able to go to the club and relax after his work, a place where Indians have no right to go to

except when invited. Dolin (1994) argues that even ordinary decisions are tinted by political issues- when the incident in Marabar caves takes place Adela is immediately perceived as the innocent English girl while Aziz is referred to as “the defendant” or “the prisoner” (p. 336). Geis (2009) argues that since Indians were not given their due civic rights, they resorted to corruption. Thus, the Indians are shown to have less civic rights than the English in the novel.

Though Indians had limited civic rights, they do exercise religious rights. Indians coexist as Muslims and Hindus, with only minor grudges against one another. They have the right to practice their religion freely. When Mrs. Moore enters the mosque in chapter two (Forster, 1924/2005), Aziz feels it his right, as a Muslim, to question her and asks her to remove her shoes. Even though English ladies do not find Aziz’s asking an English lady to take off her shoes admirable, there are no consequences of the action and his religious right is not exploited. The Muslims are also free to take their Muharram processions through town, even though it causes inconvenience for others. Similarly, Hindus have their eight-day Krishna festival, in which they perform all their rituals freely. Thus, the text can be used as an evidence of free practice of religious rights in the novel.

Therefore, civic and religious rights emerge as two possible themes related to rights in this novel.

3.3.3 Duties in *A Passage to India*

As with rights, duties are not a prominently discussed theme in critical literature. However, a number of events in the novel point out the importance of duties to the characters as citizens of India, or residing in India, in case of the British. The incidents highlighting civic and moral duties are discussed in the following paragraphs.

Civic duties are observed differently by the Indian and the English characters. The English, though in a position of power are shown to be responsible when it comes to their

jobs. They consider it their duty to keep peace. Mr. Turton, for example, ensures that there are no riots and asks everyone to act normally in midst of Aziz-Adela case; the judge makes a fair decision after Adela takes her case back. Geis (2009) and Armstrong (1992) argue that even this aspect of their lives was influenced by the arrogance of their political situation. An example of this is Heaslop's behaviour, he justifies his mistreatment of the Indians by claiming that he is here to do his duty and not to be nice to people. The Indians on the other hand, are shown to be well-known for corruption and bribery. Forster's attitude appears satirical here as on the one hand, he shows that English characters perceive Indians as corrupt and on the other hand, Indians like Hamidullah and Aziz are always shown to be concerned about their duties. It can therefore, be argued that Forster depicts that the way people perceive and perform duties varies.

Moral aspect of duties are also highlighted in the text. The Indians like Aziz felt morally bound to provide for their families and extended families. The Indians feel morally bound towards the English- Aziz feels the need to provide for them when Adela and Mrs. Moore are his guests. It was inexplicable to the Indians how an English man like Fielding could travel around the globe with no moral or familial responsibilities attached.

Civic and moral duties, though not discussed explicitly in academic literature appear in the text of the novel.

3.3.4 Conclusion

Written in the background of colonial India, *A Passage to India* presents content for exploration of the themes of citizenship. The most important and recurrent theme is that of national identity, while there are other issues related to identity such as colonial, religious, social class and gender identity issues discussed in academic literature. Rights are discussed in the text and relevant literature with reference to civic and religious issues. Duties related issues in literature are civic and moral.

3.4 Lord of the Flies

Lord of the Flies, written in 1954 is a dystopian novel by Nobel Laureate William Golding. Written in the aftermath of World War II, *Lord of the Flies* presents a critique of democratic society. In this section, I present a brief sketch of the author, followed by an introduction to the novel and a discussion of identity, rights and duties in the light of the text and literary critique on the novel.

Sir William Gerald Golding (1911-1993) was born in Cornwall. He started studying science at Oxford, and later changed to Literature. Carey (2012) quotes various childhood elements and incidents in Golding's life that left an impact on the author's thoughts and writings. Carey cites his mother as a negative influence on his life, as she was violent with him throwing things at him multiple times, avoided all form of physical contact with her son and told him superstitious, horror stories as a child. Golding had an irrational fear of cellars and graveyards even as an adult which according to Carey might be due to his disturbed relationship with his mother. While a student he got his first collection of poems published. He served in the navy for five years during the Second World War and experienced first-hand the atrocities of war. Those years left an impression on his personality and his work, and provided the background for many of his works (McCarron, 2006). Having had first-hand experience of the atrocities of the war may be a reason to his pessimistic portrayal of life in *Lord of the Flies*. He taught at a boys' public school in Salisbury which may have led to the choice of public school boys as his characters (McCarron, 2006; Al-Saidi, 2012). He wrote other works, arguably better works (Bloom, 2008) and received a Nobel Prize and a Booker prize and was knighted in 1988, but *Lord of the Flies* remains his best-known work and is read widely today. When film versions were released a decade after the publication of the novel, they continued to drive crowds to the cinema (Mae, 1964).

Lord of the Flies is about British public-school boys shipwrecked and alone on a deserted island, with a nuclear war going on in the background. The reader is not told much about the war except that the boys are stranded due to the war. As with many island-based novels like *Robinson Crusoe* or Ballantyne's *The Coral Island*, this novel presents an idealistic setting- a fertile, isolated, beautiful, uninhabited island. The beginning is as expected, the boys gather, choose a leader, assign duties and try to build means of survival such as shelter and fire. As the story progresses however, the 'natural evil' within them starts taking over- duties are forgotten, clashes are held over leadership, pleasures like hunting are pursued, loyalties are divided and eventually some boys are even killed (O'Hara, 1966). The novel ends with a navy boat stopping on the island and the navy officer approaching who is expected to rescue the boys. *Lord of the Flies*, thus, is a grim, pessimistic novel which portrays how in the absence of a democratic society, evil takes over everyone, even young boys.

The descent of the boys into chaos and tyranny is allegorical highlighting Golding's belief that human nature is inherently evil. Bloom (2008) strongly criticises the unlikelihood of the circumstances where boys kill each other and claims, "*Lord of the Flies* matters, not in or for itself, but because of its popularity in an era that continues to find it a useful admonition" (p. 2). The voting process is a mockery of the democratic system. The boys who vote for Ralph do not know him at all and the ones who vote for Jack do it out of fear. Some critics have argued that *Lord of the Flies* presents a Christian allegory (Aleyeva, 2004) with pride as the original sin (Fitzgerald & Kayser, 1992) while others have argued that it depicts Golding's pessimism after having experienced the war (Al-Saidi, 2012) with character representing political leaders (see also Li & Wu, 2009).

The novel is based on a universal theme and is very well-received among all types of audiences. Sunderman (1999) suggests by example, a method of teaching *Lord of the Flies* using a reader-response approach. She says, "the literature naturally arouses a

response. The challenge is helping the students communicate their reactions in a meaningful way” (p. 51). While teaching the novel to eighth graders, Sunderman devised a unique method letting the students go into the wood within school premises to experience occurrences similar to the first chapter of the novel. After three sessions in the woods, the students were given the novel in the class where they read and interpreted it using a reader-response approach. Having gone through the same experience as the characters, it was easy for the readers to interpret the novel and to relate it to their own experiences. Sunderman contends that the novel if taught with an appropriate technique can help the students form various interpretations letting them understand their own and others’ experiences. She further argues that interpretations need to be formed independent of the teacher, be examined, challenged and justified and not dictated.

Martens-Baker (2009) presents a study where students from two high-schools collaborated online to understand the novel and the collaboration helped enrich their experience and understanding of the novel. The pupils were also then taken on a school field trip where students from both school designed a camp. Students recruited each other and put into practice the life skills learnt from the novel. This is also a unique way of teaching collaboration through the novel. Similar strategies can be used to teach citizenship as well.

Wigger (2013) suggests that Golding’s novel can be used in a second language classroom to teach democratic values such as the right to free speech using reader-response theory. Swedish curriculum requires that democratic values be taught through each subject. Based on his experience, Wigger suggests that students can be taught about democratic values through classroom discussions and writing assignments based on the novel. The perceptions of the participants in this study will depict how far this has been possible in the context of these Pakistani undergraduate students.

In line with the parameters of the project, I discuss how the three themes of identity, rights and duties in relation to the novel, in the following subsections.

3.4.1 Identity in *Lord of the Flies*

Identity is not an explicitly discussed theme in critical literature on *Lord of the Flies*. The issues of identity discussed are not in traditional citizenship sense as the novel is an allegorical reference to the civilization. There are some issues regarding a universal human identity, identity formation and gender in the novel, discussed in the following paragraphs.

The process of identity formation is an identity related aspect in the novel. Ralph assumes the identity of a leader and Piggy becomes his assistant. As the novel progresses, the boys evolve into two rival groups on the island. Jack forms his tribe and Ralph finds some followers thus creating a sense of belonging within the groups. Keith (1984) argues that *Lord of the Flies* is essentially a depiction of clash between primitive society, as seen in Jack's tribe, and rational society, as seen in Ralph's group. Jack's tribe, developing their identity, paint themselves and set a guard on the entrance to their cave, which they call their Fort, so the other group cannot enter. Another form of identity on the island that runs throughout the novel, is the difference between the "littluns" (little ones) and the "bigguns" (big ones). The little ones cannot be asked to do physical work, while the big ones have to take responsibility for them. Thus, even in the isolated setting the boys find means to create their own sets of identities.

Critics argue that *Lord of the Flies* is about a universal human identity. The boys are all introduced as British public school boys- a homogenous group who will ordinarily be considered to be well-behaved boys from middle class families. Since the writer and characters both are British, Bloom (2008) argues that the story depicts a British dilemma and not a universal allegory of moral depravity. However, O'Hara (1966) argues that *Lord*

of the Flies is a universal depiction of human psychology where Golding is talking about the innate evil in all humans. Aleyeva (2004) claims that the allegorical journey of man presented is religious in nature.

Gender identity issues can be raised with reference to their being no female characters in the novel. There is some mention of an aunt by Piggy. Apart from that no women are mentioned (Saxton, 1996). There can be various possible explanations of why Golding did not include any women. Firstly, it may be because he was presenting an allegorical civilization and did not consider women to be an important enough part. Secondly, he did not believe women were inherently evil. Thirdly, he wanted to keep it simple and having female characters might have complicated the story and deviated its focus. Lastly, it may be because public schools in those days were separated and he had to keep either boys or girls and he had more knowledge of boys having been a teacher to them himself. Ellis (2009) while giving an example of a possible conversation between teacher and student, argues that the absence of themes such as gender and sexuality in *Lord of the Flies* can be used in the English classroom to generate an understanding of the themes.

There is some indication of identity elements in the novel including the processes of identity formation, a universal human identity and issues related to presentation of gender.

3.4.2 Rights in *Lord of the Flies*

Rights are not a very explicitly discussed theme in relation to the novel. Right to free speech and the importance of group rights and individual rights in relation to the novel have been mentioned in academic literature.

In absence of a state or higher authority to bestow rights, the boys on the isolated island focus on duties more than rights. Right of speech is the only right explicitly discussed in relation to the novel. When Piggy finds the conch and Ralph uses it to call a

meeting, it is decided that whoever has the conch will have the right to speak. The boys ask each other for the right to speech in the assemblies called by Ralph (Wigger, 2013). However, whether they listen depends on the identity of the speaker as a “littlun” or a “biggun”.

Another theme with reference to rights discussed in the novel is the importance of group rights versus rights of the individual. The novel begins with the sense of group rights and group duties but as the novel progresses the characters start to think in more individual terms. Thus, Golding appears to claim that group rights are only thought about in civilized society, innately humans are individualistic and think only of personal rights.

To conclude, rights to free speech and the relationship between group and individual rights have been discussed to some extent in academic literature and the text of the novel.

3.4.3 Duties in *Lord of the Flies*

Duties are discussed explicitly within the novel and in literary criticism in reference to the novel *Lord of the Flies*. In the following paragraphs, neglect of duties and importance of civic duties are discussed.

Duties are meant to be performed but Golding appears to argue that it is in human nature to neglect duties. Rahman (2014) argues that duties, rules and order are central to the novel. Duties are assigned from the very beginning as the boys feel responsible for themselves in absence of any adult. Ralph is chosen, through voting, to be the chief. He assigns duties of building shelters, lighting a fire for smoke and possible rescue, keeping fresh water in the coconut shells etc. However, as the novel moves on, the duties lose their meaning and Ralph’s insistence on performing them seems “almost mindless” (O’Hara, 1966, p. 144). As early as the third chapter in the novel, the boys start shirking from their

duties, shelters are not being built as agreed earlier and eventually the fire keepers do not fulfil their task as well.

Golding has shown the importance of civic duties through the actions of the boys in the novel. The rational characters- Piggy, Ralph and Simon- all agree on performing duties, while the other who indulge in hunting and follow no rules are shown to be savages (O'Hara, 1966). The issue of keeping a smoke going for signal is insisted to be the most important duty on the island. It is a duty not to be done for an immediate outcome but for an ultimate goal (Al-Saidi, 2012) which can be related to the concept of civic duties. When that duty is not performed by the boys who were assigned it, a ship passes by without noticing them and their chance of rescue is missed. This results in a fight and eventually leads to chaos on the island (Aleyeva, 2004). So, while criticising the innate evil within mankind, Golding is also pointing out the importance of every individual's duties.

3.4.4 Conclusion

Lord of the Flies is seen as an allegorical novel that presents a critique of political norms in contemporary society. Several studies suggest that it can be used in the English classroom to teach democratic values using reader-response frameworks. Identity and rights are discussed rather implicitly while duties are discussed more explicitly in relation to the novel. The three themes related to identity that are discussed in relation to this novel are the process of identity formation, universal human identity, gender identity. Right to freedom of speech and issues related to group rights and individual rights are discussed in relation to the theme of rights. Issues related to duties raised in literature are neglect of duties and importance of civic duties.

3.5 Concluding remarks about the four novels

The four novels included in this project are explored in this chapter in light of

academic literature. Each novel is introduced with short summaries of plots and brief introduction to their authors. The themes of identity, rights and duties are then explored in relation to each novel to justify the choice of the novels in relation to the research questions.

National, social-class and gender identity issues are portrayed in academic literature on *A Tale*. Violation of rights based on social class and the contrast between ideals and practices on the revolution were the two rights related themes discussed in academic literature. Duties are not discussed explicitly but civic and moral aspects were mentioned implicitly in some literature.

In academic literature on *The God of Small Things*, identity is discussed in relation to social caste, gender and post-colonialism. Rights are discussed in relation to exploitation on the basis of caste, class and gender. Children's rights also came up in a couple of papers on the novel. Duties are discussed as civic and legal aspects.

Literature on *A Passage* discussed national, colonial, religious, social class and gender identity issues. Moral and religious aspects of rights and moral and civic aspects of duties were also discussed.

An exploration of the literature on *Lord of the Flies* showed that identity is discussed in terms of a universal human identity and gender. Moreover, the processes of identity formation are also explored. Right to free speech and civic duties are also explored.

Identity is discussed in more ways than the other themes in all four novels including aspects as varied as nationality, gender, religion, caste, social class, universal human identity. Rights and duties were discussed in civic, political, religious and moral aspects. There is also some focus on negation and exploitation of rights in the novels. To conclude, the literature on the novels shows that the novels are rich in citizenship themes. The novels, thus, present an opportunity to explore my research questions in light of the views from the participants.

4. Methodology

This chapter presents a description and analysis of the methodological approach used in this project. The chapter begins with a discussion of the research questions that inform this study. The feasibility study and pilot study conducted for this project are then discussed in the light of their importance in developing the research design for the main study. This is followed by the discussion of the research design for the main study, approaches to sampling of participants and novels, data collection through interviews and observations including a discussion of translation issues encountered due to the use of three languages in the interviews. Data analysis through thematic coding in NVivo is then outlined, followed by a discussion of validity, reliability and ethical issues involved. Methodological feasibility is discussed next, highlighting the suitability and limitations of the methods used for the project. The chapter ends with a summary.

This research is guided by the research question, “*What perceptions of identity, rights and duties are held by a sample of undergraduate students in Pakistan in the context of their study of fiction?*” The project was developed through a feasibility study (informal discussions with teachers and students in the context) and a pilot study (interviews with three students who maintain diary notes) which helped guide the main study. Semi-structured interviews and classroom observations were used to collect data for the main study. Three interviews with members of board of studies and three with the teachers of fiction along with two classroom observations were used as background and stimulus data. Twenty interviews with final year undergraduate students of English literature at a university in Sindh, Pakistan were conducted as the main data. The data was analysed through thematic coding in NVivo and results were reported in the thesis.

4.1 Research questions

This section discusses the research questions as they were developed through literature reviewed and the pilot study. Lewis (2003) identifies seven qualities of research questions based on her review of literature on the subject. She suggests that research questions should be- clear, focussed, capable of being researched, relevant and useful, informed by or connected to theory, feasible in specific circumstances, and of interest to the researcher. I designed my research questions keeping these attributes in consideration. Based on the literature review, I identified a gap in research about the connection of students' perceptions of identity, rights and duties of university learners in Pakistan and their learning of fiction. Clear, focussed and researchable questions based on theoretical frameworks discussed in the previous chapter were designed for the pilot study. The main and sub-research questions are:

What perceptions of identity, rights and duties are held by a sample of undergraduate students in Pakistan in the context of their study of fiction?

- *What do students think identity, rights and duties mean?*
- *Do students think that identities, rights and duties are included in a sample of set fictional texts?*
- *Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?*

These research questions were designed after reading methodological literature on the subject and after the pilot study. The main research question helps focus on what are the issues in relation to identity, rights and duties and students' learning of fiction. The main research question is further divided into three sub-research question the first of which focuses on perceptions of the three themes, second on participants identifying the themes

in the novels and the third on participants making sense of the themes in the novels through their experiences and observations. I use the term “identify” to talk about participants’ response to the second sub-research question. This indicates that the participants spotted or identified the themes in the novels. The terms “make sense of” or “relate to” are used to talk about participants’ response to the third sub-research question in which participants relate the incidents in the novel to their experiences and observations.

4.2 Feasibility Study

This section presents details of a pre-pilot feasibility study that was conducted to explore the suitability of the study. It is an initial exploration of the area of research, initial reflections on its meaning in the selected context and practical issues about developing the project. This was a pre-pilot study to explore the views of the people in the university to see if it was a suitable context to conduct research on the identified research area. I met staff and students, engaged with them in informal talks to explore their views about my topic. My intention was to come up with a clear plan for my pilot study.

I talked to three students of final year literature- two females and one male. I also talked to two teachers who had taught fiction during the last semester to these students. The discussions were held after the exams so the participants had completed all study modules. The aim was to explore the possibility of a study relating literature taught at undergraduate level with ideas of citizenship.

The talk with students indicated that there is some civic element in the teaching of fiction that is already taking place in the classroom as the students thought their perceptions were shaped and reshaped while they read fiction. One of the female students said she did not know about the concept of ‘untouchables’ before reading Roy’s *The God of Small Things*. She thought now that she had read about it she could relate it with the negation of

rights for different sects of Muslims in the society around her. The other female student believed that *The Picture of Dorian Gray* was a novel that gave them awareness about their duties in life to come. These young women argued that it was only some novels which provided such awareness while others were just for enjoyment. The male student suggested that it was only a small percentage of students who were influenced by novels and the majority only concentrated on their grade and not on the civic effect. He himself, however, believed his own perceptions had changed. He attributed the change to a variety of other factors like family influence, other reading apart from the syllabus, and political interests. This brought me to consider facilitating factors in the study. The discussions with the teachers also focussed on whether the books taught to the literature students had a citizenship element. They suggested that it might be worth exploring participants' perceptions through interviews and classroom observations.

In light of this feasibility study, I concluded that the main study would be about participants' citizenship perceptions in light of the novels. However, I also realised that citizenship as a term was complex and for these students of literature and I needed to simplify it.

4.3 Pilot Project

In this section, I present my pilot study, highlighting the data collection and analysis procedures followed and lessons learnt for the main study. The pilot helped review the methods and helped change the focus from a simple cause and effect study about the effect of literature on participants' views to a more exploratory study looking at the participants' perceptions in relation to fiction

Piloting is recognised as an important part of a research design. Cohen et al. (2007) consider it an essential step of their framework for planning research. Bryman (2012) also suggests that a pilot study should be conducted to test the instruments wherever possible.

A pilot study for this project was therefore, designed and carried out to study the effect of teaching literature on citizenship perceptions of students studying literature at an undergraduate level at a public-sector university in Sindh, Pakistan. The design was reshaped after the pilot as the focus of the study changed. The pilot proved to be very useful in shaping the research design for the main study. The research questions at the pilot stage were:

How does learning fiction, as part of an undergraduate degree, affect student perceptions of their identity, rights and duties in society?

- a. How are students' perceptions of their own religious or ethnic identity affected while learning fiction?
- b. How are students' perceptions of their civic/social rights as citizens affected by learning fiction?
- c. How are students' perceptions of their civic/social duties as citizens affected by learning fiction?

The pilot project was developed based on the literature review and the feasibility study. Invitations to participate were circulated through a lecturer at the department. Three final year undergraduate students volunteered to participate (details regarding the participants are presented in Table 4.1). The data collection was planned to include two interviews each with these three participating students, alongside the diary notes that the students were asked to maintain throughout the fiction course. The concept of interviewing before and after the course was developed as the focus of the study at the pilot stage, was to gauge impact of fiction on participants' perceptions. However, through the first interview and the diary notes it became clear that participants talked about how their perceptions were connected to the novels and to other factors such as curriculum design, classroom discussions, teachers' methods and it was not a matter of simple cause and effect. So, the focus of the main study was changed to a more exploratory study.

Table 4.1

Participants' gender, language, religion and school background

Pseudonym	Religion	Language	School	Gender
Shoaib	Muslim	Siraiki	Public	Male
Zainab	Muslim	Siraiki/Punjabi	Private	Female
Kanwal	Muslim	Sindhi	Private	Female

The interviews at the pilot stage involved participants' discussion of identity, rights and duties in general and how they identified them in literature. Identity issues discussed were national and ethnic identity. Kanwal related to her ethnic identity whereas the other two looked at themselves in terms of their national identity as Pakistani. Rights issues that the participants mentioned were basic human rights, gender and social rights. The discussion of duties was related to religious and moral issues by all three of the participants. The participants showed an awareness of basic issues in their society.

During the discussion of citizenship themes in the novels, the participants gave examples from different genres of literature and not just novels. As these interviews were conducted at the beginning of the term, the participants had not yet finished reading the novels so their answers included examples from works such as Milton's *Paradise Lost*, Beckett's *Waiting for Godot* or Marlowe's *Doctor Faustus*. They argued that literature can have a revolutionary effect on its readers if read deeply.

Talking specifically in relation to fiction, students reported that they are studying Fielding's *Tom Jones* and Faulkner's *Sound and Fury* in their fiction module. They believed the issue of identity is raised in both of the novels. Tom in *Tom Jones* struggles to find an identity and Shoaib, one of the participants, related it to the identity crisis in the society around him. Zainab said that *Sound and Fury* increased their awareness of rights

as Mrs Thomson does not entitle all her children to the same rights which leads to disruptions in their lives. The participants believed that the novels they would read in that term would enable them to widen their understanding of these themes and would affect their social understanding in general.

The diary notes maintained by the participants were more in relation to all the subjects they studied than fiction. This was basically because these students had four lectures back to back and were only able to write their diaries at the end of the day. At this point in the project, I was getting more interested in the participants' perceptions in relation to the fiction rather than the cause and effect process that I had assumed at the beginning. The second interviews planned to be held at the end of the term with the same participants were therefore not conducted. Instead the main study was planned for the same year.

After the pilot, the links between students' perceptions of identity, rights and duties and learning did not seem anything like the causal links they were assumed to be at the beginning of the project. Students who participated in the pilot study, talked about the aspects of rights, duties and identities that they connected with the learning of fiction such as gendered rights, environmental duties and linguistic identities. They also talked about levels of their understanding of different aspects of these three themes. Furthermore, the participants also talked about the pathways that helped them gain that kind of meaning from the texts. Shoaib explained his understanding of Shakespeare's *Hamlet* (participants mentioned dramas as well as novels in the pilot interviews) by saying that he first listened to it in the class, then he read it in order to understand its meaning, but then the third time he interacted with the text he found in it a deeper meaning a sense of 'identity crisis'. The project gained a more exploratory direction after the pilot study as there were many intertwining factors involved in the process of learning fiction and students' perception of the themes. The research questions were changed to make them more feasible (as suggested by Lewis, 2003) for the project.

The pilot study as a trial project brought forth many methodological issues worth consideration. The data was gathered over the internet, which resulted in many practical problems due to the time difference between Pakistan, where the participants were, and the UK. There were also some problems of poor internet connection and power shortages in Pakistan. So, for the main study, it was decided to conduct interviews in person, in order to avoid these practical problems. The diary notes were time-consuming for the busy final year students and as the students were not able to give them much time they did not provide very relevant data. The diary notes were also dropped for the main study as the focus of the study had changed from checking the impact of literature on citizenship perceptions of participants to an exploration of participants' citizenship perceptions in relation to fiction. The data collection point at the beginning of the term also needed to be modified as they had not completed any works at that point in time which also resulted in irrelevant data since students gave examples from drama, poetry and other modules that they had studied literature in. Moreover, the plan to look at the effect of literature on participants' views was changed to looking at the participants' perceptions in relation to fiction. These and related points will be made a reference to in later sections to explain the choices made for the main study.

4.4 Research design

In this section, I present the research design for the main study. The study was conducted in two stages. First stage was an understanding of the background through interviews with members of Board of Studies, teachers of fiction and two classroom observations. Second stage was interviews with twenty students. This also served as a means of triangulating the views of the students. The second stage included interviews with twenty student participants which formed the main data for this study.

The first stage included what has been termed, “additional, corroborative data” by Cohen et al. (2007, p. 105). This stage included interviews with three members of the Board of Studies (who are responsible for selecting the curriculum) and three teachers who taught fiction (Madam Kiran who taught *A Passage to India*, *A Tale of Two Cities*, Sir Umair *Lord of the Flies* and Madam Nadia who taught *The God of Small Things*) and observation of two fiction classes (by Madam Kiran and Sir Umair, pseudonyms used).

Interviews with faculty members and classroom observations were included in the research design based on critical and methodological literature and the pilot study. This was considered important due to four reasons. Firstly, the participants referred to the role of the teachers, classroom discussions, and choice of novels during their interviews at the pilot stage. Secondly, Rosenblatt (1978/1994) emphasises the role of the classroom discussions and the teacher (as stated in Section 2.3). Thirdly, Stotsky (1999, 1994a, 1994b) emphasises the choice of the novel as a relevant factor in developing readers’ perceptions. Lastly, triangulation of data through different sources and instruments is considered a useful tool to enrich findings in research (see Denzin, 1970).

The second stage of the study involved interviews with students who are the main source of data as the focus of this study lies with the students. The choice of the research instruments and sampling details are discussed in the following sections.

4.5 Sampling of the participants

Sampling decisions need to be made cautiously as they help shape the data and findings. This section highlights the sampling decisions involved in the first and second stage of data collection for this study.

The first stage of research involved interviews with board members and teachers of fiction (justification for including these groups is given in the previous sections). There

were six members of the board of which three were from the department of English and dealt with departmental curriculum. These three university board members were contacted and, after their consent, were interviewed in order to have an insight into the purpose of the choices made in the curriculum. As for the teachers to be interviewed, the teachers who had taught the four selected novels were requested and all three of them consented to take part in the research.

Sampling concerns were more demanding at the second stage involving the students who are the focus of the study. Size, representativeness, access and sampling strategy used were the factors considered during the sampling process as these are key factors to consider in the sampling process (Cohen et al. 2007). The participants were to be selected from a group of 85 students in the final year undergraduate class at the department of English at this Pakistani university, as these were the group who had read the novels. The size of the sample was decided to be twenty participants as it is usually a smaller number in in-depth qualitative studies (Ritchie, Lewis and Elam, 2003). As this is a qualitative study involving intense and long interviews of approximately an hour, self-selective sampling (termed *Volunteer Sampling* by Cohen et al. 2007) was chosen as it allows students to volunteer after being invited. It was hoped that this strategy would be useful in finding a willing group of student readers leading to rich data. Moreover, I intended to have a varied and coherent group that is a mix of the population it is derived out of, though I do not claim to make it a representative group which is generalizable (as suggested by Hammersley, 1992).

Based on the issues discussed in the literature review relevant to identity, rights and duties in Pakistan, I believed that religion, language/ethnic group or gender might affect participants' perceptions. Moreover, Lall (2012) in her survey showed that public or private school background has also had an influence over citizenship perceptions of young adults in Pakistan. Therefore, the students were asked these details on the volunteering

invitations and these factors were considered while inviting the volunteering students for interviews, in order to ensure a coherent and varied group (Flyvbjerg, 2006).

After a classroom observation at the first stage of the study, students were invited to participate in the research. They were given short demographic forms to fill in their personal data including their name, contact number or email, religious affiliation, public/private schooling background, language and gender. Forty-four students initially volunteered and filled the demographic forms. Six of the forms did not have any contact details. The announcement was repeated in the next classroom observation but no more students volunteered. So, 38 prospective participants were contacted, 12 of them did not respond, 26 committed to the interview. However, not everyone kept their commitment, some did not turn up on the set time while others called and cancelled. I continued asking for volunteers, encouraged the participants to spread the word to get the final twenty participants.

Owing to practical reasons of time and availability, the sample obtained was not as varied it would ideally be, but varied enough to give a mix of opinions. Details of the twenty student participants interviewed are explained in terms of these four factors in Table 4.2.

Table 4.2

Participants' gender, language, religion and school background

Name	Religion	Language	School	Gender
Shoaib	Muslim	Siraiki	Public	Male
Zainab	Muslim	Siraiki/Punjabi	Private	Female
Haider	Muslim	Sindhi	Public	Male
Aabid	Muslim	Sindhi	Public	Male
Ali	Muslim	Sindhi	Public	Male
Imran	Buddhist	Sindhi	Public	Male
Nazia	Muslim	Sindhi	Private	Female
Rida	Muslim	Sindhi	Private/Public	Female
Aaqil	Muslim	Urdu	Private	Male
Shehryar	Muslim	Urdu	Private/Public	Male
Raj	Hindu	Sindhi	Public	Male
Jamshed	Muslim	Baloch	Public	Male
Waleed	Muslim	Siraiki	Public	Male
Adnan	Muslim	Sindhi	Public	Male
Babar	Muslim	Sindhi	Public	Male
Saeed	Not religious	Sindhi	Public	Male
Subhan	Muslim	Sindhi	Public	Male
Kanwal	Muslim	Sindhi	Private	Female
Sonia	Muslim	Sindhi	Public	Female
Yasir	Not religious	Sindhi	Public	Male

4.6 Sampling of the novels

Another key sampling decision involved the novels to be chosen for the main study. Choice of the novels in the context was dependent on various factors outside the project. The Higher Education Commission (HEC), Pakistan has developed a wide curriculum for all public sector universities. At this particular university, the members of the Board of Studies selected the particular books to be taught in the department from the HEC prescribed curriculum. Final year undergraduate curriculum included twelve novels- *The Sound and the Fury* by William Faulkner, *A Farewell to Arms* by Ernest Hemingway, *The Sorrows of Young Werther* by J. W. Goethe, *The God of Small Things* by Arundhati Roy, *The History of Tom Jones, a Foundling* by Henry Fielding, *To the Lighthouse* by Virginia Woolf, *A Tale of Two Cities* by Charles Dickens, *A Passage to India* by E. M Forster, *Sons and Lovers* by D. H. Lawrence, *Ulysses* by James Joyce, *Kim* by Rudyard Kipling and *Lord of the Flies* by William Golding.

At the pilot stage, it was planned to keep the whole range of novels as part of the study. However, during the feasibility study and the pilot stage it was observed that participants did not manage to talk about any work in detail when they were given the option to talk about any work. In order to make the project more focussed and manageable, it was decided that the main study be limited to four novels.

The four novels that were selected are, *A Tale of Two Cities*, *A Passage to India*, *Lord of Flies* and *The God of Small Things*. The novels were selected based on a variety of criteria. Firstly, the literature suggests that these novels talk about certain aspects of identity, rights and duties (as discussed in Chapter 3). Secondly, these novels came up in the discussions with staff and students during the feasibility study. Thirdly, these novels are representative in nature being from different contexts, written at different times and by both male and female authors.

4.7 Data Collection

Data was collected through two main research instruments- interviews and observations, for the main study. Before going to Pakistan for the fieldwork, the head of the department was contacted to acquire permission to collect data. After permission was acquired, teachers were contacted to seek consent for interviews and classroom observations. The data collection was started with three interviews with the members of the board and three with the teachers of fiction. This was followed by two classroom observations. After each observation, students were informed about the research and invited to participate. Brief demographic forms were given out (as discussed in Section 4.5) so relevant information from the volunteering students could be acquired. Twenty students were then interviewed. A review of the data collection process, the justification of the choices made and the challenges involved is given below. As interviews were conducted in three languages and translated, translation issues are also considered in detail in the following sections.

4.7.1 Interviews

In this section, I highlight the steps followed to develop interview schedules. This is followed by a discussion of the processes followed during data collection and challenges faced.

4.7.1.1 Designing the interview schedules

Data was collected through semi-structured interviews with teachers and members of BoS at the first stage, and with students at the second stage. As social science research investigates the perceptions of the participants as social actors (see Miller and Glassner, 2004; Charmaz, 1995), interviews which provide rich insightful data are the most commonly used instrument in qualitative research (Bryman, 2012).

Kallio et al. (2016) argue that semi-structured interview data should be collected rigorously following a five-step process- identifying the prerequisites of a semi-structured interview; retrieve and use previous knowledge; develop an interview schedule; pilot the schedule and present the complete semi-structured interview guide.

Firstly, I understood that semi-structured interviews are the most appropriate tool in the study of perceptions (as suggested by Barriball & While, 1994). Secondly, I reviewed literature and understood the general trends in the field of citizenship through literature and the current situation of Pakistani society focussing on the issues of identity, rights and duties was also reviewed (as discussed in previous chapters). Thirdly, I developed the interview questions for board members, teachers and participants reflecting on research questions, literature review and discussions during the pilot and feasibility study. Barriball and While (1994) argue that the interview guide needs to be participant-oriented. I ensured that the questions were not leading and allowed room for rich data. Fourthly, I piloted my schedules with three participants in the UK, two of whom were from Pakistan and one from India. These participants had studied the same novels during their undergraduate in English Literature in their home countries and were working towards their PhDs at that time. Even though it had been some time since they had read the novels, they were able to answer my interview questions and helped pilot the schedule suggesting changes where questions were not clear and allowing me to record the time for future. Finally, the final interview schedules (as shown in Appendices I, II and III) were developed.

The final interview schedules included probes. These could be used to help participants answer questions in case they did not understand the question. For example, during questions about perceptions of their identity, most student participants needed clarification for the questions. Answering a question ‘who do you think you are’ or ‘what is your identity’ is not easy, and the participants asked me to explain the question and I

told them that in the light of my project, I am interested in how they identify themselves and which identity is more important to them than others. I gave them examples of national, ethnic, human, global, religious, linguistic identities as possible answers in line with the citizenship nature of the project.

4.7.1.2 Collecting the data through interviews

The interviews with board members lasted ten to fifteen minutes. The project was explained and their role in the choice of the curriculum was asked. The interviews with the teachers lasted twenty minutes on average. They talked about their methods and classroom discussions involved when teaching the chosen novels. The board members and teachers were also asked what they thought the views of the students might be on the themes of identity, rights and duties in relation to the novels. The answers of the board members were more general as compared to those by the teachers.

The interviews with the students lasted around an hour on average. Before the interview formally started we set down to chat about the participants and discussed if they recalled the stories of the novel. Two of the participants chose to reschedule their interviews after these chats as they understood the nature of the questions and wished to think about the novels before answering. The interviews with the students were divided in five parts. In the first part, they were asked about themselves, their familial, social, religious background and positive and negative influences in their lives. This was followed by a discussion of how they chose to study literature and what was its impact on their lives as this could be an influencing factor in understanding their perceptions. The three subsequent sections were about the three themes of identity, rights and duties where they were asked their views on the theme in general, followed by a discussion of if they saw any issues related to it in chosen novels and if they could relate the instances in novels with anything from their experiences and observations. They were also asked about how they developed this understanding and if they were helped in the process.

During the data collection, I noticed that most of the participants in the sample were enthusiastic about the interviews and eager to contribute to the discussion. Even though there had been cases of unwilling participants (as discussed in Section 4.5 on sampling), most of the ones who participated were excited to take part and wanted to be listened to. One of the teachers, while helping me invite students for interviews, told them that the interview was their chance to express themselves and be listened to. It relates to what Jansen (2015) says about her own participants- children were willing to talk to the researcher because they saw their status as a resource in the situation rather than a problem. The participants in my study may have been willing to talk as they considered this as their way of helping out- it was a reverse power situation. They might have thought that they were helping a former teacher rather than the normal case of the teachers helping them out. Another possibility may be that they felt it as a chance to raise their voice and be listened to or they might have seen it as an opportunity to engage with somebody from the staff. Their motives may not be certain, but the participants showed an eagerness in the discussions held.

4.7.1.3 Challenges in the process

Caution was taken to not lead the participants to a certain aspect. Many different aspects of identity, for example, were given. I asked for example, “What do you think about your rights? What are the rights you have or should have?” and not about civic, ethnic or political rights specifically. I was aware that rich data could be acquired about a specific aspect by asking direct questions about that. However, that was not the purpose of the study and therefore, the questions were asked more generally.

The only broad boundary that was given while asking them to define their identity, rights and duties was that of keeping it relevant to citizenship. The participants were told what the project was about and most of the participants talked about, arguably, citizenship related issues. While defining their identity for example, most participants talked about

civic, ethnic, political issues. Under different probes and in a different project, the answers may have been different such as participants might have identified themselves in terms of their relationships or their professions. In this case, with the exception of two participants who identified themselves in terms of profession and ambition.

The use of probes was also kept varied but guided by citizenship concepts. For example, when the respondents were asked what they thought their rights were, some of the participants answered right away but others asked what kinds of rights I wanted them to talk about. This was a fairly open option and I told them they could talk about any rights they thought they had or should have including social, civic, environmental or any basic human rights. It was similar in relation to duties. There were other questions about relating identity, rights and duties to the novels and in such cases examples from incidents and characters in the novel were quoted. I reminded them of the story of the novel at times when they couldn't recall it as they had read a large number of novels and got mixed up in the names. I had a list of incidents and characters for each novel written down which they could see as a reminder and it usually helped them recall the novel. As the interviews were meant to be an exploration of their views and not a test of their memory, the probes were considered a help and not a hindrance to the interview process.

Kvale (2006) argues that the interviewer has more power in the interview setting as they are the ones ruling the whole process. The question of who decides the setting and who dictates the process are important and were considered during the process of the data collection. I had worked at the department as a teacher and some of the participants were aware of this role. I was aware of this and ensured that the participants were aware of the option to take part in the research and had the right to withdraw at any point or retract information even after the interview. Considering that twelve of the contacted participants who volunteered did not respond to my invitation to interview and some others who committed did not turn up (as discussed in Section 4.5), I think they understood the concept

of voluntary participation. When planning the interviews, I asked them the time and place they would like to meet for interview- most of them wished to do them at the university during office hours. There was an exception- one of the female participants wished to meet in the evening and that was also arranged.

In conclusion, interviews were chosen as the mode of data collection in this project as this is primarily a study of perceptions. The schedules were semi-structured to leave room for any important points that the participants wished to discuss in detail while also having enough structure to keep the discussion to topic. When interviews were being conducted some questions needed further explanation and students asked for probes which were given for clarification. The probes and reminders of novels' incidents and characters helped the students understand and answer the questions. Interviews were conducted in Sindhi, Urdu and English depending on the language participants chose to speak in and were comfortable with which for most but not all meant their first language. I understand the issues involved in translation, the details of which are discussed in the following section.

4.7.2 Translation issues

In this section, I present a discussion of the translation issues involved in the process of data collection. I highlight four issues that were considered during the process of translating interview schedules and later the interview transcripts. Finally, I discuss the challenges faced during the interviews despite necessary caution.

The interviews were conducted in Sindhi, Urdu as well as English depending on the language the participants chose to speak in. Even though the context is the department of English literature and English is an official language in the context, not every participant is an equally proficient user of English. As explained in the context (Section 1.2), most of the students at the university (who later become teachers as well) come from public-sector

and English remains a foreign language to them as they learn it very late in life. The issues discussed in the interviews were identity, rights and duties, quite sensitive especially in the Pakistani context today (more on this in Section 3.9) and the participants were deemed to be more comfortable in their native language. The participants therefore, were given a choice to speak in Sindhi, Urdu or English whichever they were comfortable with.

Using three different languages, Sindhi, Urdu and English in the interviews while presenting the findings in English makes this quite similar to what Temple (2002) defines as a cross-language research. Even though I speak the same language as majority of the participants, speakers of more than one language were involved and there was the need of translation. There are several methodological challenges of conducting such a study as translation forms an important part of the interpretation (Birbili, 2000; Temple & Young, 2004). While conducting the interviews and transcribing and translating, I was aware of the challenges and adopted various strategies described below.

First challenge was making authentic translation related decisions (Fersch, 2013). Temple (1997) suggests that preference should be given to conceptual decisions rather than focussing on lexical equivalence. So, when I came across such decisions I focussed on the meaning. For example, Waleed used Siraiki words in his interview which is a language very close to Sindh. In this case, I focussed on the concept rather than lexical equivalence.

Secondly, special consideration needed to be given to the time of translation- before or after data collection as Santos et al. (2015) argue that it affects the quality of data. Before I went for my data collection, I translated all the interview questions in Sindhi and Urdu. The interview data, including student responses, however were obviously transcribed and translated after the data collection.

Thirdly, piloting in different languages needed to be considered (Squires, 2009). The interview questions were piloted in Sindhi and English when piloting for time with participants in York. This helped check and verify my translations against those of peers

who were also doing their PhDs here. For example, the word “identity” can be translated as “سڃاڻپ” but that has a slightly different connotation and the Urdu words “شناخت” or “پهچان” used commonly by Sindhi speakers are a better match to “identity”. In such cases, I talked to other multilingual speakers in order to reach the final decision. After consulting with other multilingual speakers, it was decided to use “identity”, rather than “سڃاڻپ”, “شناخت” or “پهچان” with all students so as to retain the meaning the word.

Lastly, translation needed to be authentic and be verified to retain the reliability of data. My native language is Sindhi but having grown up in Hyderabad which has mixed Sindhi and Urdu speaking population, I perceive myself to have a near-native proficiency in Urdu as well. I have also learnt English from a very young age and felt comfortable and confident translating the interviews myself. Birbili (2000) suggests that the researcher’s knowledge of the people and context helps in this situation. Being from the same context as the participants helped understand the participants. However, I did not solely rely on my interpretation. Help with translation decisions was taken from other multilingual speakers who had conducted cross language research in the same context in order to make a reliable decision. Peer translation for part of the interview data was also carried out in order to ensure that my translation is valid and meaningful. I asked a native Sindhi speaker, who is a proficient speaker of English as well to partly transcribe one of the interviews. The translations matched in meaning and context and thus, the translation was considered reliable.

Despite taking these cautions, there appeared certain unforeseen issues. Firstly, there were Balochi, Punjabi and Siraiki students (as shown in Table 4.2) in the group whose native languages I did not know or did not speak proficiently. They therefore, did not have the option of speaking in their native language like most participants. They chose the language they felt most comfortable with. The hesitation at some points in their interviews showed that they were not able to express themselves as fully as other participants could.

This was an unavoidable circumstance as speakers of six languages were involved. Secondly, four students chose to speak in English even when they had the option to speak in their mother tongue. English is the official language at the university and my status as a former teacher might have compelled them to speak in English. In cases of Zainab and Kanwal, it was not problematic because they went to an elite private school and could speak the language very well. Ali and Jamshed however, were not as fluent and speaking in their mother tongue might have helped get richer data. It might be worth considering whether giving a choice of three languages is appropriate or should students be encouraged to speak only in their mother tongue. Also, how far is it appropriate to offer a native language choice to some participants when native languages of a few are not an option. This issue might be worth considering for future research.

4.7.3 Observations

In this section, I discuss observations, which were used as a tool to gather background and stimulus data at the first stage of the main study. Observations are useful to collect data that cannot be collected through interviews or questionnaires (Bryman, 2012). As a researcher I felt that it was essential to see the classrooms and be inside one, so as to understand the practices and behaviours that were part of students' reading process. I also wanted to look at the teaching practices used at the institute to be able to understand participants' responses when they referred to teaching practice. Though I was aware of the context having been a former teacher at the same institute, I did not wish to base my understanding of the responses on prior knowledge but on well-informed data. Background and stimulus data was, therefore, collected through two classroom observations at the first stage.

The teachers of fiction were approached and classroom observations on fiction courses were arranged. One of the classes was on *Lord of the Flies* but the other class was

about another novel (*To the Lighthouse*), which is not a part of this study but was taught by the teacher who taught *A Passage to India* and *A Tale of Two Cities*. These were the classes available at the time I was in Pakistan. As the content of the class was not the basic purpose of observing, it was considered appropriate to observe these two classes.

The observations were open-ended semi-structured in nature (Cohen et al. 2007). I had a rough idea that I wanted to be aware of the teaching and learning practices used in the classroom in order to be able to better understand the context of the study. However, I did not have an observation schedule or specific objectives. It was like an “ethnographic observation” (as termed by Bryman, 2012) where I sat in the class and took notes of everything I observed. The notes were primarily about the appearance including infrastructure seating arrangement, teacher’s positionality; level of interaction between teachers and students; teaching methods used; and the content where relevant.

These observations helped reflect on what is going on in the classroom. I was able to reflect on the teaching practices and the nature of interactions in the classroom. The observations also provided information to probe students while interviewing them. References from the classroom observations helped connect with the students. In the case of Rida, for example, who was a rather quiet participant, it helped to talk about the classroom. So, the classroom observations were helpful in understanding the context in which the students learnt the novels.

4.8 Data Analysis

In this section, I explain the data analysis strategies adopted for this study. I divide the process in six steps according to Braun and Clarke’s (2006) comprehensive guide to qualitative data analysis- familiarization with data, generating initial codes, searching themes, reviewing themes, defining and naming themes and producing the report.

Qualitative data has a number of strengths as it is based on social reality and contains rich details. The strengths, however, are accompanied by challenges and complexities of qualitative data analysis. The researcher is required to make careful decisions regarding methods of analysis as these will influence questions of the quality of the analysis, research's validity and reliability.

4.8.1 Familiarization with the data

After the data was collected and saved, interviews were transcribed and translated. Braun and Clarke (2006) argue that transcription is the first stage of data analysis as it helps the researcher familiarise herself with the data. The interviews were transcribed and translated manually (translation issues discussed in Section 4.7.2). I had approximately 25 hours of audio which took around four months to transcribe and translate. This generated more than a hundred thousand words of data. Once all interviews were transcribed, I read them alongside the field notes and notes from classroom observations. Initial thoughts and reflections on data were recorded as memos in NVivo (Bazeley and Jackson, 2013).

4.8.2 Generating codes and themes

After familiarizing myself with the data, I started coding using NVivo. The use of NVivo in qualitative data analysis is greatly helpful as it allows room for multiple coding and record keeping without taking the researcher away from the data (Bazeley and Jackson, 2013).

Table 4.3

Initial NVivo codes

Code	Description
Ai	awareness of identity issues in society
Dc	themes discussed in class
Dd	development in thoughts related to duties
Di	development in awareness of identity through novels
Dn	duties in novels
Rdn	relates to duties in novels
Ri	relating identity issues from novels to society
Rrf	relates to Rosenblatt's framework

Bryman (2012) suggests starting with deductive codes and generating inductive codes as the coding process progresses. Looking at the interview schedules and reflecting on what I expected to find in the data, I designed a list of 29 deductive codes to begin the coding process. Some of these initial codes are shown in Table 4.3. Inductive coding was then initiated by looking at transcripts and coding every new idea under a different code in NVivo. This helped generate a rich variety of new data-based codes.

As I coded further, I realised some categories were repeated. NVivo helps see lists of codes with their descriptions which helped working on eliminating unnecessary codes. I also realised in the process that some of the codes could be sub-codes under one main code. Thus, initial categories of codes were built up. The main code with sub-codes is referred to as “tree” or “parent” codes while the sub-codes are referred to as “child” codes. Coded categories were developed further, introducing more analytical codes and comprehensive categories. For example, all facilitating factors were combined under one category and it included further tree codes such as ‘external help’; ‘discussed in classroom’ etc. This helped categorise the data further and helped develop distinct categories.

Richards (2015) divides codes into three main categories- descriptive, topical and analytical. The initial codes were mostly descriptive and topical. Descriptive codes helped record personal backgrounds of the participants. Topical codes such as “duties in novels” were used to represent the topic of the coded passage. As the coding process proceeded, some analytical codes were also included which involved interpretation and reflection such as “critical of teaching methods” was a code that needed reflection on when the participants were being critical and suggesting a change.

Analytical decisions were required at every stage of coding. For example, when assigning participants’ views on duties to different categories, some of the categories were easy to decide as they had precedence in literature such as civic, political, environment duties. When the participants talked about following the law such as getting a license, following the traffic rules, it was easy to mark that as ‘civic duties’. However, at times it was difficult to decide such as when participants talked about managing their time, being regular to class as their duties. These did not fall into the sub-categories of duties discussed in Section 2.4.4. I wanted to put these views under ‘awareness of duties’, however, I realised this was not about their duties in society and needed to be categorised separately. So, I formulated a new code, ‘personal duties’. With increasing number of people talking about value-based decisions, I put a sub-code under ‘personal duties’ and called it ‘moral duties’, which included quotes such as “we should help people whose rights are being snatched”. There was some overlap between personal and moral as views on what one should do for their family could be both personal and a moral duty, thus I coded it under both categories. The parent and child codes related to duties are shown in Table 4.4, as an example.

Table 4.4

Coding participants' views on duties

Code	Description
sense of citizenship	participants' views on citizenship
awareness of duties	participants' perceptions of their duties in society
- environmental duties	awareness of environmental duties
- civic duties	awareness of civic duties
- political duties	views on political duties
- education as a duty	imparting education is seen as a responsibility
personal duties	participants talk about personal duties
- moral duties	moral responsibilities towards others.
- religious duties	duties based on religious ideology
- ethnic identity	duties based on ethnic identity
practical implication	on how they have practically implemented their views on duties

Comparisons were made between coding patterns in different transcripts, “summary reports” option in NVivo proved very useful at this stage. Categories were built and edited. More categories were formed within categories. This was easier to do in a software than it would have been on paper. As main codes and sub-codes started to grow, there began emerging clearer categories that could potentially lead to themes or arguments in light of literature and research questions. Some tree codes at this final stage of coding are shown in Table 4.5.

Table 4.5

Tree codes at the second stage

Codes	Description
citizenship in novels	Participants' views on themes of citizenship in novels
contextual factors	possibly impacting contextual factors
development in sense of citizenship through novels	development in thoughts related to themes through the four novels
facilitating factors	how students have been helped
personal background factors	participants personal background factors that may possibly impact their views
relating to citizenship in novels	when participants make connections between themes in novels and issues in society
sense of citizenship	participants' views on citizenship
stored codes	might be relevant stored for later
views differing with specific novels	different novels have different effect on participants' perceptions

4.8.3 Reviewing themes

The coding categories displayed in Table 4.5 show that the participants were talking about themes of citizenship in relation to society and in relation to the novels. They were also then making sense of novel through society and personal life. I started reviewing all the categories and comparing different transcripts. This led me to the argument that participants' perceptions were based on their own cultural context. I began to identify and review themes based on the findings from the coding. Though Braun and Clarke (2006) suggest reviewing and defining themes as two distinct steps, due to the nature of the project I treated it as a single step.

4.8.4 Producing a report

Writing the findings and discussion chapters were also part of the analysis. Writing about my argument required going back to codes and themes generated in order to be able to report the findings. The findings were primarily based on NVivo codes depicting the “Sources” (people who talked about a code) and “References” (number of times a code was mentioned (see also Bazeley and Jackson, 2013). I differentiated between implicit and explicit mentions in reporting my findings. I considered a mention as implicit when the mention of a theme was brief and passing. In case of novels, for example, when characters and events were not mentioned and a general comment was made without making any specific connections, it was counted as implicit. However, when characters and events in the novels were mentioned and specific connections were made, mention was considered explicit. A discussion of the findings based on the research questions was presented in different chapters. The findings were discussed in light of the academic literature reviewed and results were interpreted to find meaning in the data.

4.9 Validity and Reliability

In this section, I discuss the importance of validity and reliability in my research. As this study is qualitative and specific to its context, the concepts of validity and reliability in their meaning of replication and generalisability as in quantitative research, are not acceptable here. The concepts have been defined differently for qualitative research (Bryman, 2012). Long and Johnson (2000) for example, define validity in terms of trustworthy, authentic, rich and accurate data and reliability as dependable, confirmable and transferrable results. Lincoln and Guba (1999) suggest the concepts be termed as trustworthiness and dependability as they are more suitable constructs for qualitative research.

In this study, four steps were taken to ensure that the data and results were valid and reliable. Firstly, I was aware of the context as a student and former teacher and was aware that this may lead to certain assumptions about the context. I tried to eliminate this researcher bias by taking caution at every step of the research journey. I interviewed teachers, board members and observed the classes to be able to determine the context in light of the data and not just my own knowledge of it. I also had translations peer-reviewed even though I am a proficient user of the three languages. Moreover, I maintained notes and memos throughout the process to record my observations while I was collecting data. This helped strengthen the trustworthiness of my data.

Secondly, I used interviews with teachers and board members as a means of triangulation of data. I did not just collect data from students but also from faculty members asking them about the core issues in the project.

Thirdly, I used “peer-debriefing” (as termed by Lincoln and Guba, 1999) at various stages of the research. I asked a PhD colleague to check coding I had done for my transcripts and incorporated their feedback. I presented my findings to peers in different seminars and conferences to get feedback on the nature of my argument. Critical perspectives offered by my supervisor and colleagues were also a crucial means of ensuring rigour in the research.

Fourthly, I have presented a detailed description of data at every stage of the study for readers to be able to judge the dependability of the analysis based on data. I kept records of all field notes, interview transcripts and observation notes. Effort was taken to present the data as clearly as possible. NVivo coding tables are used to present the findings so the reader knows the number of mentions are reliable as they have been obtained through a computer software.

So on the basis of these four steps, I ensured that the study remained valid and reliable.

4.10 Ethical issues

Social research dealing with human participants gives rise to various ethical issues at every stage (Bryman, 2012). As the discussion of identity, rights and duties is a sensitive issue, especially so in Pakistan owing to the political turbulence the country is going through at the moment, ethical issues have been dealt with very carefully throughout the study. In this section, I present the ethical issues considered during this study.

Various organizations such as the BSA (British Sociological Association) and the SRA (Social Research Association) have provided ethical codes that need to be complied with in social research. The first requirement of all ethical codes (e.g., Diener and Crandall, 1978) is that the participants should not come to any harm, be it psychological or developmental, through the procedures of the study. This code of ethical practice was complied with at every stage of the study. Besides getting an approval of the ethics committee here at University of York, the participants of this study were given the option to volunteer for the research so it didn't affect their coursework. Self-selective sampling was used primarily for this purpose so that students may not feel compelled to participate if they are asked directly as it may cause them some stress if they are unwilling to talk about these issues. Moreover, they were able to choose a suitable time.

The second ethical procedure that was observed during the pilot and the main study was that of seeking an informed consent. The participants were given consent forms providing them information about the project, assurance of voluntary involvement, anonymity in data and points of contact if needed at any point of the study (Consent forms attached as Appendix V). Participants were assured that they can withdraw any information even after the interviews. Some of the student participants asked to see the transcripts after the interview and they were emailed a copy. Though given the option, they did not wish to retract any information.

The third ethical procedure followed was that of anonymising. The students' names were changed and non-recognisable pseudonyms were used. Pseudonyms were used throughout the thesis to protect the participants' identity and to follow the legal requirements under UK Data Protection Act (1998).

Thus, the study can be said to have complied with essential social research ethical codes guided by the University of York, Research Code of Ethics.

4.11 Methodological feasibility

In this section, I discuss the suitability of the chosen methods for this study and also highlight the limitations of the study. Collecting the main data through interviews was methodologically feasible. Being an interpretivist, qualitative study on perceptions, interviews as main research instrument seem an adequate choice. Observations of the classrooms to provide background and stimulus data adds to the richness of the data.

This study is not of course without its limitations. Firstly, as it is a qualitative study, it has a very small sample size and is not generalisable or representative. However, as it is the first study of its kind in Sindh, it hopes to provide an insight into this research area which will be an original contribution to knowledge.

Secondly, due to practical concerns of access, the sample obtained was not as varied as it would ideally be. The student participants were all part of the final year undergraduate group at the department of English who had read the four novels in the study. However, within this group I perceived four factors that could affect their perceptions- religion, language, gender and schooling. I hoped to include students in the sample who could give a good mix of these factors. I wished to include more representatives of Hindu religious group and Punjabi ethnic group in my participants. Only

one Hindu and none of the Punjabi students agreed to participate. I did, however, get a varied enough group to give a mix of opinions.

Thirdly, due to time constraints on the participants, I had to do one long interview. It would have been better for the research design if interviews were conducted at two stages to allow participants time to think about the issues between the interviews. The first interview could be on their understanding of identity, rights and duties and the second on their relation with the fiction they are reading, giving them time to think between the interviews. However, these were final year students with four to five sessions a day and it might not be practically possible for them to give so much time to my research. Thus, for practical reasons primarily, interviews were conducted at one stage only.

There are, therefore, some limitations of this study but provided the context and issues of time and access, the methods and techniques used were the most feasible ones.

4.12 Conclusion

In this chapter, I explained the choice of methods for this study. The research questions were pointed out at the beginning of the chapter highlighting how they had changed over the course of the pilot study. A pilot study was conducted with three participants from the same department in which the main study was conducted. The pilot was started with the intention of checking the before and after perceptions of the participants on the themes of identity, rights and duties through interviews while they were expected to keep diaries during the whole semester. During the course of the pilot it was realised that diary notes were providing data on all the different subjects rather than just fiction as participants had all classes consecutively and were only able to maintain diaries at the end of the day. Also, the focus of the study started to shift from a simple cause and effect study to a more exploratory one. The research questions and instruments were thus

developed for the main study.

During the main study, data was collected at two stages. At the first stage interviews were conducted with three members of the Board of Studies who chose the curriculum and the three teachers of fiction who taught the four novels. Two classroom observations were also conducted as background and stimulus data. At the second stage, semi-structured interviews were conducted with twenty participants sampled through self-selective sampling. The interviews lasted an hour and were conducted in three different languages. Translation issues were acknowledged and understood and caution was taken while translating. To increase reliability part of the data was given to a fellow researcher to translate and the transcripts were verified against each other.

Following data collection, data analysis procedures were explained. Data was analysed using coding in NVivo. Thematic analysis was carried out after the coding. Furthermore, validity and reliability of the study were explored. Ethical approval was obtained for this study following the procedures followed at University of York. Methodological feasibility of this design was also analysed in the last section.

5. Findings

In this chapter, I present the findings of this study. The first section presents findings on participants' perceptions of their identity, rights and duties with individual sub-sections on each theme. The second section presents findings on participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties in the four novels, each of the themes as seen by participants in each novel is discussed in separate sub-sections. The third section provides an overview of students making sense of the themes in daily life through fiction. The fourth section presents findings on perceptions on facilitating factors that helped the learners understand the themes through fiction. The chapter ends with a summary. The presentation of findings in this chapter is, to some extent, descriptive and will be followed by more explicitly framed analytical discussion in the following chapters.

5.1 Participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties

The first sub research question is, '*What do students think identity, rights and duties mean?*' The student participants were asked what they thought about each of the three themes identity, rights and duties. Their perceptions were varied and they talked about different issues which were coded through NVivo for the purposes of analysis. In this section, I present student participants' views on identity, rights and duties as seen through NVivo codes. Table 5.1 presents the broad codes on participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties, giving the Sources (number of participants) and References (the number of mentions) for each code.

Table 5.1

Participants' perceptions of their identity, rights and duties

Codes	Sources	References
Awareness of identity issues in society	17	44
Defining personal identity	20	36
Awareness of rights	20	73
Rights they have/should have	20	97
Awareness of duties	15	27
Personal duties	15	39
Practical implementation of duties	5	6

The following sub-sections give details of what the participants said regarding each of the themes.

5.1.1 Participants' perceptions of identity

In this section, I present the findings on the participants' views of their own identity, followed by their awareness of identity issues in society. The participants were asked to express their views on their identity. They defined their own identity and then talked about issues relevant to identity in society. An overview of the issues the participants talked about is given in Table 5.2.

Table 5.2

Participants' perceptions of identity

Codes	Sources	References
Awareness of identity issues in society	17	44
- Ethnic issues in society	12	14
- Caste issues in society	3	5
- Religious or sectarian issues in society	2	2
- No awareness of identity issues before reading of literature	2	2
Defining personal identity	20	36
- Identity as a human being	9	9
- Ethnic identity	7	7
- National identity	6	6
- Personal identity varies with context	5	5
- Caste identity	3	4

The participants defined their identity as a “human” (explained in the following paragraph), others talked about it in terms of ethnicity, nationality or caste. Seventeen out of twenty participants talked about issues relevant to identity in society most of whom talked about ethnic issues in society, while some also commented on religious or sectarian and caste related identity issues in society.

Participants considered identity to be a difficult topic to define and when asked to express their views on their personal identity, most of them asked me to explain the question. Once probes were given and the questions were rephrased such as “do you consider your nationality, ethnicity, language, religion, family, education to be part of your identity” or “which aspect of your identity is more important to you”, they talked about their identity in terms of nationality, ethnicity, caste and as a human. Nine out of twenty participants thought that the most important identity for them was that of a human.

Different participants put it in different ways, one of them referred to it as “being a humanist”, another talked about it in terms of defying labels and said, “I am only a human” while a couple of others talked about being “a good human being”. They thought considering oneself and others as humans will solve all identity clashes and decrease bias and discrimination. As Ali pointed out:

Identity of being a human is superior to all other identities. First of all, we should consider ourselves as human then only we are Pakistani, we are Sindhi, we are... means ... any state is after that. First of all, we should be a good human being then only we will be Pakistani and Sindhi.

Ethnicity- being a Sindhi, Muhajir or Baloch- was a defining element of their identity for seven of the participants while nationality, as a Pakistani, was important to six participants. Three participants, interestingly all women, considered their family name or caste as a defining element of their identity. Five of the participants also pointed out that identity was not fixed and that it changed with the context. They suggested that when people asked them questions such as who are you, they defined themselves considering the context in which the question was asked.

Students also talked about a variety of ethnic, sectarian and caste based identity issues that they had witnessed around themselves in society. Twelve out of the seventeen respondents talked about ethnic clashes in society- narrating incidents when they had experienced inequality based on their ethnicity. The non-Sindhi speaking participants quoted incidents of racism against them within the university from Sindhis, while Sindhi speaking students talked about discrimination at the hands of non-Sindhis when they went to other cities or provinces within Pakistan. As Yasir said, “If you talk in Sindhi to shopkeepers in Hyderabad, Karachi they will not respond to you very well, with Urdu speaking shopkeepers.”

Three female students, two of whom defined their identity in terms of caste, talked about caste related issues in society. They thought that people discriminated and favoured one another in the workplace and elsewhere based on caste. Two male participants talked about sectarian issues in society. Talking about the religious groups in Islam, the two of them said that people of one sect did not accept the others as Muslims which created problems in society in general. Two of the respondents also said that they had no awareness of identity issues before reading literature and their knowledge of these issues had been formed after their interaction with literature.

5.1.2 Participants' perceptions of rights

In this section, I discuss participants' perceptions of the rights they feel they have and should have and their awareness of issues related to rights in society. All of the student participants talked about their own rights and issues related to rights in society. An overview of the kind of rights the participants talked about is given in Table 5.3.

Table 5.3

Participants' perceptions of rights

Codes	Sources	References
Awareness of rights issues in society	20	73
- Gender rights	8	10
- Religious rights	11	18
- Ethnic rights	3	3
- Negation of rights	10	18
Personal rights	20	97
Civic rights	11	18
- Right to education	8	8
- Right to health services	4	4
Basic human rights	14	31
- Right to practice religion	4	4
- Gender related rights	2	2
- Right of choice	3	4
- Freedom of expression	7	7
Political rights	14	20

The respondents talked about a variety of rights including political rights, basic human rights and civic rights when asked about the rights they have or think they should have. Fourteen out of twenty student participants talked about political rights. All fourteen of them talked about right to vote as an example. They were asked if they exercised their right in the last elections and the responses were of three kinds- three of them said they cast their vote of their own accord without being influenced by anyone else, three of them did not cast their vote as they did not think any of the candidates was worthy of their vote, seven respondents said they cast their vote on their family's suggestion as vote is always a

collective decision for them. As Haider said, “It is the family’s decision.” He further added, “my eldest brother tells us and he is told by my uncle like we do not have freedom of choice”.

Fourteen respondents talked about basic human rights such as the right to practice religion (four responses), freedom of expression (seven mentions), right of choice (talked about by three people). Eleven participants talked about civic rights, focussing on government and state to provide everyone with the rights to proper health services (four responses) and right to education for all (eight responses). Even though most participants talked about education and health being made available to all, some of them also talked about the quality of the service being provided and improvements needed. Some participants while talking about the state’s responsibility to provide basic civic rights also mentioned the rights to proper infrastructure (one respondent) and the right to peace (two participants).

Following the discussion about personal rights, the participants talked about different issues regarding rights in the society around them. They talked about religious, gender and ethnic rights issues in their society and they also talked about negation of rights for different groups. Eleven of the participants talked about violation of religious rights in society- seven of them, including six Muslim participants, talked about violation of rights of minority religious groups at the hands of the Muslims in the country. Two of them said they had participated in protests against religious violations and two others talked about the violations of rights among different sects of Muslims. Subhan said:

Like we do the call for prayers on loudspeakers very loudly without knowing that there might be a patient in the surrounding who might be feeling hurt because of that and he might refute that religion because of this [...] This is Muslim dominated society there are Muslims in majority here so no one can say this.

Gender was also considered a defining feature in delivery of rights to an individual- eight participants talked about how gender affects rights in their society. Four of these respondents were female and they said society including people at the university and even parents considered girls' rights to be inferior to or different from those of the men. However, there was an acceptance in their attitude towards this difference which was not how the four male participants looked at this inequality of rights. Kanwal for example said (emphasis added):

*Sometimes, **sometimes**, biased treatment of parents like they say this is good for you in society, that treatment has injected certain amount of negativity in me. Why my brother is doing it and I can't do it. Even though from a social point of view **they are right** but that has started a sort of rebellion in me.*

On the other hand, when Haider discussed that his sisters were not allowed to go to school as it was outside their village, he seemed to accept the inequality much lesser. An excerpt from that conversation is shared below:

R: My own belief is that women should have freedom but my family does not think that.

I: Will you help your younger sisters get education then?

R: Yes, I have thought about it like this, I would not be able to get my sisters but may be my daughters.

Three of the participants talked about ethnic rights- highlighting the exploitation of rights of Sindhis at the hands of other ethnic groups. Ten participants talked about negation and deprivation of rights in society, in general, focussing on basic human rights such as education, health, electricity, water, fair treatment that are not received by the common people in Pakistani society. They also talked about the lack of accountability in society

which meant that there were less rights for those who did not have the right connections and more for those who did.

5.1.3 Participants' perceptions of duties

In this section, I discuss participants' views on personal duties and on awareness of duties and practical implementation in their society. Table 5.4 shows the number of participants and number of responses on each aspect of duties.

Table 5.4

Participants' perceptions of duties

	Codes	Sources	References
Awareness of duties		15	27
- Environmental duties		5	6
- Civic duties		5	8
- No duties		5	5
Personal duties		15	39
- Education as a duty		5	5
- Religious duties		2	2
- Political duties		4	4
- Moral duties		8	13
- Ethnic duties		2	2
Practical implementation of duties		5	6

Fifteen respondents chose to talk about their personal duties talking about their moral, educational, religious and ethnic duties. Eight participants talked about moral duties such as respecting their elders, speaking for the right causes and helping people in need. Five students considered education to be their foremost duty at this stage of their lives. Two respondents talked about religious duties saying that as a Muslim, one should fulfil

his/her religious duties. Two other participants considered ethnic duties as important personal responsibilities arguing that belonging to a certain ethnic group meant a responsibility to represent the group well. Five participants talked explicitly about how they practically implemented their duties towards the society. One of the students gave free tuition to deserving students and considered it an execution of his social responsibility. Others talked about putting in their share to keep the society clean.

Fifteen students chose to talk about issues relevant to duties in society mentioning civic, environmental and political duties as problematic. Five participants talked about civic duties of citizens such as following the traffic laws and paying bills and taxes properly. They mentioned how people around them did not follow their civic duties. They mentioned incidents where the police had asked them for bribe as Subhan told of his encounter with a policeman, “He (the policeman) said in the end, ‘ok then give me 20 rupees, 50 or 100.’ He wants to be bribed, he doesn’t want to implement the law as it should be.”

Five participants talked about environmental duties focussing on how people threw rubbish around and smoked inside buildings without caring about keeping the environment clean for others. Four of them talked about political duties talking about vote as a duty that should be used carefully but is generally cast based on group affiliations such as ethnic affiliation of the candidate or influence of elders in one’s family. Five of the participants also talked about the issue of people in society not wanting to perform duties, they reported that everyone wanted rights but no one seemed to worry about duties. As Saeed said, “We talk about rights all the time, never talked about duties.”

To conclude, the participants talked about their personal duties, how they implemented them practically and issues related to duties in society. The categories of duties that were important to them included moral, educational, religious and ethnic duties. When talking about issues related to duties in society they talked about environmental,

civic and political duties to be significant while some also talked about a complete negligence of duties in society.

5.2 Perceptions on identity, rights and duties in the novels

Following the findings on participants' views on identity, rights and duties, this section presents findings on students' perceptions on identity, rights and duties in the four novels to answer the second sub research question, "*Do students think that identities, rights and duties are included in a sample of set fictional texts?*" The sub-sections that follow discuss participants' exploration of identity, rights and duties in each of the novels in individual sections.

The participants made a variety of connections between the themes, and the characters and events of the novels. An overview of the codes along with the number of participants and mentions for each code is presented in Table 5.5- details of each theme will be presented in relevant sections.

Table 5.5

Participants' identification of themes in novels

Codes	Sources	References
Duties in Novels	20	43
- Duties in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	8	10
- Duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	10	10
- Duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	10	13
- Duties in <i>A Passage to India</i>	4	4
Identity in Novels	23	61
- Identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	9	10
- Identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	8	9
- Identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	15	15
- Identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	15	21
Rights in Novels	22	76
- Rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	14	17
- Rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	14	21
- Rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	19	28
- Rights in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	3	3

5.2.1 Participants' perceptions on *A Tale of Two Cities*

The participants were asked if they thought the themes of identity, rights and duties were there in any of the four novels. They chose to talk about any number of novels. Seventeen out of the total 26 participants chose to talk about *A Tale of Two Cities*. However, not everyone talked about the themes to the same extent- some of the participants talked about the themes explicitly connecting themes of identity, rights or duties to specific events or characters from the novels while some of the mentions were implicit, casually

mentioning the presence of themes in the novels without making clear connections. An overview of the explicit and implicit mentions is given in Table 5.6.

Table 5.6

Explicit and implicit discussion of the three themes in A Tale of Two Cities

Codes	Sources	References
Themes discussed in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	17	40
Explicit discussion of themes in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	16	32
- Explicit discussion of duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	8	10
- Explicit discussion of identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	8	9
- Explicit discussion of rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	13	15
Implicit discussion of themes in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	7	8
- Implicit discussion of duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	2	2
- Implicit discussion of rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	4	4
- Implicit discussion of identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	1	1

In the following sections, the three themes of identity, rights and duties are dealt with individually as they were seen by the participants in context of *A Tale of Two Cities*.

5.2.1.1 Identity in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Nine student participants talked about identity in *A Tale of Two Cities*. While talking about the theme of identity, four student participants discussed national identity and five of the respondents talked about social class identities of the characters in *A Tale of Two Cities* (coding detail shown in Table 5.7). There was one implicit mention. As implicit mentions did not highlight any specific aspect of the themes they are not highlighted in this or any of the following tables (implicit and explicit mentions are

discussed further in Section 4.8.4).

Table 5.7

Participants' perceptions on identity in A Tale of Two Cities

Codes	Sources	References
Identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	9	10
- Social class identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	5	5
- National identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	4	4

The theme of national identity was perceived by the participants in the French and English characters. Students perceived a clash being shown between the national identities, of the English and the French in the novel. As Kanwal said, “In *A Tale of Two Cities* it was discussed, the people from both the sides were banned or barred in both the cities because of their particular identity.”

Social class identity was also an evident theme to five of the reader-participants. They talked about the privileges of the elite, aristocratic class who used their power to oppress the lower classes. Rida narrated the events of the novel in this manner:

When the woman is raped then the doctor is put the blame on. The people are from aristocratic family they put their influence through and get the doctor to prison. When he is released after many years then the psychological disorder stays in his mind.

5.2.1.2 Rights in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Rights were discussed with reference to *A Tale* by fourteen participants who mentioned it twenty-one times among them. The themes discussed were gender rights, legal rights, rights of the different social classes and negation of rights, the relevant coding

details are presented in Table 5.8. The following paragraphs present the related findings elaborated through quotes from interview transcripts.

Table 5.8

Participants' perceptions on rights in A Tale of Two Cities

Codes	Sources	References
Rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	14	21
- Negation of human rights in society in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	5	6
- Gender rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	2	2
- Inequality of rights in social classes in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	8	9
- Legal rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	1	1

Five of the students talked about basic human rights being denied to the individuals in the two countries. As one of the participants put it:

I don't think each and every person got their actual rights. As we mentioned the boy who came under the cart, then he throws him the money as if he was not a man, as if he was not a man, as if it was a thing who was not taking breath, who did not have any power, any significance.

These participants, however, did not report rights under any categories, they only talked about 'basic rights' and their negation in general. Participants discussed different events and characters from the novel such as Darnay being refused his right to a normal life due to his identity. Sonia, for example, talked about the right to report crime in a democracy, which is denied to Dr. Manette as he was punished for it.

Rights were also connected to social class identity in context of the novel. Eight of

the students argued that social class identity is a key factor that causes inequality of rights among individuals. Saeed, identifying himself as a Marxist, argued that Dickens’s purpose in writing the novel was to present the social class scenario depicting how the upper class snatched the rights of the rest of the population and oppressed them. Imran was also of the same view as he said, “If I consider *A Tale of Two Cities*, rights are discussed that upper class violates and lower class is oppressed.”

Two of the students also saw gender rights in the novel. Both female participants stated that women were shown to be deprived of rights in the novel. However, neither of them made any explicit connections to any incident or characters in the novel.

Rights were discussed more than identity and duties by the student participants. None of the faculty members talked about rights in the novel which might be because they were not asked questions directly about rights as interview schedules were different for students and faculty members (discussed in Section 4.7.1.1). The students identified various rights related themes in the novel.

5.2.1.3 Duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Duties were discussed with reference to this novel by ten participants. The themes of civic and moral duties were identified as shown in Table 5.9. The following paragraphs discuss relevant findings.

Table 5.9

Participants’ perceptions on duties in A Tale of Two Cities

Codes	Sources	References
Duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	10	13
- Civic duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	5	7
- Moral duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	4	4

The participants were asked explicit questions regarding what they thought about the discussion of duties in the four novels. Though they all agreed that duties had, explicitly or implicitly, been discussed in the four selected novels, ten out of twenty participants talked about duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*. This was less than the number who talked about identity and rights. Five out of these students talked about civic duties and four mentioned moral duties while one mention was implicit.

Civic duties, duties of a citizen, were identified by students in the characters of Dr. Manette and Mr Lorry. The participants talked about the way Dr. Manette raised his voice against atrocities, and how Mr Lorry was true to his job and his responsibilities. Aabid mentioned the lack of civic sense in the novel saying, “In *A Tale of Two Cities*, government laws are not there, there is no traffic system- like that person is killed.” The participants also pointed out that those who abided by their duties did not always get rewarded for it. Dr. Manette, for example, had to face imprisonment as a result of performing his civic duty.

Moral duties such as Carton’s duty to sacrifice for his love or Lorry’s duty to stay loyal to the Manettes were also identified by these readers. Haider talked about duties in the following words, “Carton sacrifices himself, this is a great duty as well, to sacrifice your own self to save someone else.”

To conclude the participants talked about civic and moral duties of the characters in the novel.

5.2.1.4 Conclusion

Thus, the participants made connections between the themes of identity, rights and duties with the characters and incidents in the novel, *A Tale of Two Cities*. Identity was discussed in terms of social and national aspects. Rights were discussed under themes of negation of basic human rights and inequality of rights based on social class and gender. Kinds of duties discussed were civic and moral. Rights were the most discussed theme,

while duties were discussed the least.

5.2.2 Participants' exploration of *The God of Small Things*

The God of Small Things was the most talked about novel among the four novels. The participants while identifying the themes of identity, rights and duties talked about this novel 57 times. Not all the mentions were equally explicit. A summary of the number of explicit and implicit mentions of each of the themes is given in Table 5.10.

Table 5.10

Explicit and implicit discussion of the three themes in The God of Small Things

Codes	Sources	References
Themes discussed in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	20	57
Explicit discussion of themes in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	15	38
- Explicit discussion of duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	4
- Explicit discussion of identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	11	13
- Explicit discussion of rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	12	19
Implicit discussion of themes in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	14	19
- Implicit mentions of duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	6	6
- Implicit mention of identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	4
- Implicit mention of rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	8	9

As shown in the table, *The God of Small Things* was discussed by all participants at least once, which shows a higher interest in this novel as compared to the others. When I asked one of the participants why she had been more interested in this novel as compared

to the others, she replied, “I like it because it’s well written its subject gives a true depiction of our society.”

In the following sub-sections, the three themes are discussed individually as they were seen by the participants in relation to this Indian novel.

5.2.2.1 Identity in *The God of Small Things*

Identity issues highlighted by participants, in relation to this novel, included gender, religious and social-class identity (for coding details, see Table 5.11).

Table 5.11

Participants’ perceptions on identity in The God of Small Things

Codes	Sources	References
Identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	15	15
- Social class identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	4
- Religious identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	8	8
- Gender identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	1	1

Fifteen participants including the lecturer identified the theme of identity in Roy’s novel. Four out of these participants talked about social class identity, while eight talked about the religious identities presented in the novel and only one referred to the gender identity issues in the novel.

The oppression of the lower caste Hindus was identified as a social-class identity issue by four participants. As Adnan said, “Yes of course there are different clashes shown like in *The God of Small Things*, there is class and caste system.” The participants who talked about the inequality and deprivation attached to the untouchables in India. Addressing the case of Velutha, they sympathised with his character. They reported that

with all his qualities he was not appreciated in society and tortured to death for loving somebody from another class. They considered Velutha's doom connected to his being from a lower social class as well as lower caste. He is seen as the poor man who stayed poor because he was untouchable and was not allowed to pursue his dreams, such as that of becoming an engineer.

While some participants talked about it as a social class difference, six of the participants connected it to the Hindu religion. Waleed claimed that Roy's purpose in writing the novel is to ensure a global criticism of the Hindu religion:

She says that my religion is such which has this requirement, there are such hollows which cannot be filled that this person is smaller, you cannot eat or sit with them else you will become untouchable as well. She threw it out globally for criticism.

Gender was discussed as an identity issue by only one participant, Subhan, implicitly. More participants considered it a rights-based issue (as discussed in Section 5.2.2.2). Thus, identity was discussed in terms of social class, religion and gender in *The God of Small Things*.

5.2.2.2 Rights in *The God of Small Things*

The God of Small Things was discussed in relation to rights by eighteen student participants. The teacher who taught this novel also talked about it providing examples of instances when rights were explicitly discussed in the class (coding details shown in Table 5.12). Gender rights were discussed by four respondents, inequality of rights in society by seven, inequality of rights in religion by four and negation of basic human rights by two.

Table 5.12

Participants' perceptions on rights in The God of Small Things

Codes	Sources	References
Rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	19	28
- Negation of basic human rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	2	2
- Gender rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	4
- Inequality of rights in society in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	7	7
- Inequality of rights in religion in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	4

The negation of rights depicted in the novel is identified by participants as a rights related issue. Six of the participants talked about the deprivation of rights in terms of social class. While talking about the character of Velutha they explained the deplorable living conditions the untouchables are made to live in. They reported that the social class differences created such depravity that these people had no freedom or rights. One of the participants, Saeed said that Roy had written about rights from a Marxist perspective, as she talked about equal rights for all classes.

Three of the participants attributed the inequality, among characters, to religion rather than social class. They argued that the Hindu religion divided the society such that the lower castes and untouchables did not get their due rights. A couple of participants also termed it as the negation of basic human rights. They talked about the same incidents and characters but considered it a denial of basic rights that should be given to all humans. Thus, the negation of rights of Velutha was seen from different perspectives by these participants.

Another feature related to rights that participants talked about is gender rights. They

pointed out how Roy depicted gender differences within the same family. Ammu and Chacko, two siblings, had completely different rights. Interestingly, this was pointed out by both male and female participants, as shown in the example quotes below:

She is bound to live the life that has been given to her. She has no right to live because she is a woman.

-- Zainab

When we talk about rights here then one person is fully aware of their rights and the other person is aware as well but if she tries to take them then she is told that you are not even worth living with. She is thrown out of home.

-- Shoaib

To conclude, the participants talked about negation of rights from the perspective of social class differences as well as religious and human rights points of view. Some of the participants also talked about gender rights issues depicted in the novel in characters of Ammu and her brother.

5.2.2.3 Duties in *The God of Small Things*

The least discussed theme in relation to this novel was duties, coding details are shown in Table 5.13. Ten of twenty student participants discussed duties in relation with the novel. Even though the teacher who taught the novel said they had discussed duties explicitly in relation to the novel within the classroom, and quoted instances, not all students connected the theme with incidents from the novel.

Table 5.13

Participants' perceptions on duties in The God of Small Things

Codes	Sources	References
Duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	10	10
- Moral duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	3	3
- Civic duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	4
- Gender duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	2	2

Four of the eight participants talked about civic duties, three of whom quoted the incident of the police officer not performing his duties, pointing to the incident where the officer mistreated Velutha and Ammu. Three participants talked about moral duties saying that it was the moral duty of all characters not to exploit Velutha. Comrade Pilai who refused to help Velutha was also mentioned. It was argued that it was Pilai's moral duty to help since Velutha was a party worker and Pilai was the leader of the Communist Party in Kerala.

A male and a female participant talked about gender-based duties presented in the novel. They made strong comments which have been resonated by other participants elsewhere. They talked about the inequality between the two genders, and how the men misused their powerful position in patriarchal societies. The duties of Ammu and Chacko differed due to their gender. Ammu was expected to live with her husband and not get divorced no matter what her husband asked of her. The participants argued that being a woman, it was assumed to be Ammu's duty to keep her family's honour from getting disgraced by not getting divorced. Chacko, on the other hand, did not have any such duty, was divorced and respected- as he was a man.

5.2.2.4 Conclusion

The God of Small Things, in conclusion was discussed by a majority of the participants with more explicit mentions than other novels. Different aspects of all three themes were identified, rights discussed more than the others. Identity was discussed in terms of gender, religion and social class. Rights were discussed with reference to negation of human rights, inequality of rights based on religion, social class and gender. Duties were discussed as civic, moral and gender duties.

5.2.3 Participants' exploration of *A Passage to India*

A Passage to India, written in the context of colonial India by an English author was discussed by the participants. An overview of explicit and implicit discussion of the novel is given in Table 5.14.

Table 5.14

Explicit and implicit discussion of themes in A Passage to India

Codes	Sources	References
Themes discussed in <i>A Passage to India</i>	20	39
Explicit discussion of themes in <i>A Passage to India</i>	17	28
- Explicit discussion of duties in <i>A Passage to India</i>	2	2
- Explicit discussion of identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	14	17
- Explicit discussion of rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	8	9
Implicit discussion of themes in <i>A Passage to India</i>	10	11
- Implicit mention of duties in <i>A Passage to India</i>	2	2
- Implicit mention of identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	3	3
- Implicit mention of rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	6	6

In the following sections, the three themes are discussed, in separate sections, as they were seen by the participants in context of *A Passage to India*.

5.2.3.1 Identity in *A Passage to India*

The theme of identity in *A Passage to India* was talked about by twelve out of twenty student participants, one member of BoS and two of the teachers- a total of fifteen people (see Table 5.15). Since the novel was written in colonial India which Pakistan was part of before its independence from India, the comments on colonial clashes and national identity clashes were separated as they might imply different meanings.

Table 5.15

Participants' perceptions on identity in A Passage to India

Codes	Sources	References
Identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	15	21
- Colonial identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	7	8
- National identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	9	9
- Gender identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	3	3

Nine out of these twelve student participants talked about the clash of national identities of British and Indians shown in the novel. Seven of these participants including the staff members also resonated the same idea of clashes of national identities, though they linked it more explicitly to the colonial aspect of the novel. Three participants talked about gender identity in the novel.

The participants who commented about national identity mentioned the status of the Indian and British identity as presented in the novel. Shoaib said, “If we take *A Passage to India*, there is the identity of British and Indians. British are portrayed superior to the Indians.” The participants gave examples of incidents and characters from the novel to cite

the difference among the British and the Indians. The court case that Adela, an Englishwoman, was able to file against Dr. Aziz, an Indian, who was in turn imprisoned without any proof; the unequal friendship between the English teacher Fielding and Aziz; the barrier between the Indians and the British during the Bridge Party were few of the more commonly cited references from the novel that the participants mentioned.

Issues related to the colonial identity were also discussed by a few participants including four students, two of the teachers and one board member. These participants still talked about the difference in the two national groups but they attributed the difference to the coloniser and colonised status of the two groups. The teacher who taught the novel argued, “*A Passage to India* is ... based on colonial power and supremacy in the third world and the gap that is there between the rulers and the ruled.”

Many of the responding participants discussed identity of the British and the Indians in relation to their rights. British are shown to have more rights due to their national identity and their status as the ruler or colonizer. There is quite an overlap between identity and rights here, like Zainab said, “when you have identity then you get to know about rights you don’t get to know about it otherwise”.

Gender identity was discussed by three participants, two of whom talked about it explicitly. These two male participants made explicit connections between the attempted rape case by Adela Quested and her gender identity. They argued that she could file such a case because she was a woman. As Shoaib put it:

In that case we see the gender identity, it’s said that you have tried to seduce her, it’s said for a woman but it’s never said about a man that he has been seduced. So Miss Quested who is a female and a weak character, she is given preference over Dr. Aziz.

There is some overlap here as well between rights and identity as these issues can

be considered issues of gender rights. However, since the participants discussed this as an identity issue it is discussed only under identity. The view in relation to this novel is quite different from that discussed in relation to Roy’s novel as both of them argued that women are depicted to have an advantage over men in this novel in case of Adela and Aziz as Subhan said, “When she accuses him but she doesn’t have its proof that he did something like that or not but since she is a woman and is British as well that is why she is shown dominant.”

Thus participants relate national, colonial and gender identity with incidents and characters in the novel.

5.2.3.2 Rights in *A Passage to India*

The theme of rights in relation to *A Passage to India* was discussed by fourteen of the twenty student participants (details of the codes is given in Table 5.16).

Table 5.16

Participants’ perceptions on rights in A Passage to India

Codes	Sources	References
Rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	14	17
- Civic rights in a colonial context in <i>A Passage</i>	5	6
- Civic rights of different nations in <i>A Passage</i>	8	8
- Religious rights related issues in <i>A Passage</i>	2	2

The discussion revolved around the civic rights of different nations and the civic rights of the coloniser and the colonised (the difference between the two categories is the same as discussed in Section 5.2.3.1 in relation to identity), and the religious rights of Hindu and Muslim characters in the novel. The discussion of religious rights was rather implicit and is not discussed in further detail.

Seven of the participants discussed the status of the British as a superior nation and Indians as inferior having less civic rights. Incidents such as the court case against Aziz were cited by students as an example of unlawful rights exercised by the British. The British were all present in the court and were seated which Waleed identified as their superior rights even within the court. The rights of Aziz and Ronny were compared by Shoaib, who argued that Aziz, the Indian character, was held answerable when he did not show up at the Bridge Party while the English character had the right to miss any social commitments and was not answerable to anyone about it. One of the participants summarised the situation of rights due to the national identity and its status in the following words:

There are issues of rights in A Passage to India as well, it shows the, like between the British and the local that how the locals were deprived of rights, they could not get jobs in higher services, they are not provided good food, they do not have education.

Five of the participants connected civic rights to the British and Indian identities as the coloniser and the colonised respectively. The British were argued to have superiority due to their coloniser status, which they used throughout the novel to their advantage.

5.2.3.3 Duties in A Passage to India

Duties was the least discussed of the three themes in connection with this novel. Only four of the students mentioned duties. These participants, all Muslim males, discussed duties in relation to the character of Dr. Aziz and saw him as a duty-bound citizen. Three of them argued that Aziz performed his civic duties fulfilling his responsibilities as a citizen such as being sincere to his job under all circumstances. One participant said Aziz performed moral duties as a good father and a good family man.

5.2.3.4 Conclusion

In this novel, identity was the most discussed theme followed by rights while duties were discussed the least. National, colonial and gender identity issues were identified by the participants. Rights were discussed in the light of civic and religious aspects. Duties were discussed in relation to civic and moral elements.

5.2.4 Participants' exploration of *Lord of the Flies*

Lord of the Flies was the fourth novel in this study. One of the classes that was observed was also on *Lord of the Flies*, so, some instances were used from the class to stimulate the discussion. An overview of explicit and implicit discussion of the three themes in *Lord of the Flies* is given in Table 5.17.

Table 5.17

Explicit and implicit discussion of themes in Lord of the Flies

Codes	Sources	References
Themes discussed in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	13	22
Explicit discussion of themes in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	10	17
- Explicit discussion of duties in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	6	8
- Explicit discussion of rights in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	2	2
- Explicit discussion of identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	6	7
Implicit discussion of themes in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	5	5
- Implicit discussion of duties in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	2	2
- Implicit discussion of rights in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	1	1
- Implicit discussion of identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	2	2

Participants' views on identity, rights and duties in the novel are discussed individually in the following sections.

5.2.4.1 Identity in *Lord of the Flies*

Identity was discussed in *Lord of the Flies* by eight respondents including one teacher, four male and three female participants. Seven participants talked about the process of constructing an identity in the isolated island while two of them talked about issues of gender identity in the novel.

Identities were constructed by the young boys in the novel when they were left alone after the shipwreck on the island. The participants made connections between the physical characteristics of the boys and their identities- for example the 'bigguns' (big ones) are considered higher as compared to the 'littluns' (little ones). The participants also talked about the groups the boys formed on the island under Jack and Ralph's leadership, in an attempt to create identities for themselves in their isolated island.

Two of the participants, one male and one female, talked about gender identity in *Lord of the Flies*. They pointed out that there was no female character in the novel. They claimed that the writer was conveying a point about gender identity by not introducing any female characters. As the male participant said, "It is evident from the expression of the writer since he has not introduced any female character. All characters are male that means the male gender is more dominant."

5.2.4.2 Rights in *Lord of the Flies*

Rights were the least discussed theme in relation to this novel (as opposed to duties in the other three novels). Only three participants, including the teacher who taught the novel, related the theme of rights to *Lord of the Flies*. One of the participants looked at the struggle between Jack and Ralph as a fight for rights where Jack did not get the right to a fair election and thus fought for his rights. Another participant talked about how Jack

negated other people's rights and became powerful by snatching others' due share. The other mentions of rights, by the teacher, was rather implicit. He said the novel taught "do's and don't's, that is something that is very relevant there." He did not connect the theme to incidents or characters in the novel and the conversation shifted to other themes in the novel.

5.2.4.3 Duties in *Lord of the Flies*

Eight participants discussed the theme of duties in relation to *Lord of the Flies*, seven of whom talked about civic duties while one discussed duties implicitly.

Civic duties in the novel were discussed by seven student participants, including one female. Four of them talked about civic duties that everyone was assigned and they performed such as Jack was responsible for hunting, Ralph had to build shelters and they all needed to play their part. Three of the participants identified the consequences of not performing civic duties in the incidents of the novel. As Sonia put it:

It was duties which caused a big disaster because it is not just a story, it tells us that if you get a chance to develop society and then you get certain duties which you do not perform then you will destroy that society, you won't be able to build it.

5.2.4.4 Conclusion

Different aspects of identity, rights and duties were discussed in the four novels. Identity in relation to the novel was discussed by eight participants; themes included factors relevant to identity formation and gender identity. Rights were discussed by three participants only. Duties in relation to the novel were mostly identified as civic.

5.3 Students making sense of identity, rights and duties through novels

The third sub research question is, '*Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?*' This section presents findings that answer the first part of this research question- students making sense of the three themes through fiction, relating how they see identity, rights and duties in their everyday lives with how they appear in the four novels (coding details presented in Table 5.18 below). The second part of the research question regarding facilitating factors is discussed in Section 5.4.

Table 5.18

Participants relating themes in fiction to everyday life and society

Codes	Sources	References
Relating duty related issues to society	16	25
- Relating to duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	7	7
- Relating to duties in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	7	9
- Relating to duties in <i>A Passage to India</i>	2	2
- Relating to duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	6	7
Relating identity issues to society	19	49
- Relating to identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	9	16
- Relating to identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	5	6
- Relating to identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	4	4
- Relating to identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	9	12
Relating rights to society	21	48
- Relating to rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	8	10
- Relating to rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	16	21
- Relating to rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	8	10
- Relating to rights in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	1	1

The sections that follow provide details of how the participants related to each theme in each of the novels.

5.3.1 Relating to citizenship themes in *A Tale of Two Cities*

The participants made sense of the themes they identified in the novel (discussed in Section 5.2.1) by relating them to their experiences and observations. The following sub-sections present findings about each theme in context of *A Tale of Two Cities*.

5.3.1.1 Relating to identity in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Six participants related to the themes of national and social class identity in *A Tale of Two Cities* with their everyday lives (coding details given in Table 5.19).

Table 5.19

Relating to identity in A Tale of Two Cities

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to identity in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	6	7
- Relating to social class identity in <i>A Tale</i>	3	3
- Relating to national identity in <i>A Tale</i>	3	4

Three of the respondents, two Sindhi and one Baloch, related to national identity in the novel. They talked about issues of ethnic identity that they had experienced in society connecting and comparing their experiences with national identity issues in the novel. Shoaib, for example, compared the English and the French with Sindh and Pakistan. While talking about France and Sindh, he said:

Like the lower class French wanted everything for themselves (in the context of the revolution). If we relate this thing to our context, being Sindhi we want this thing and same thing would happen with us. What happened is that after the revolution the French kept doing the same thing, it means that the revolution cannot change the fate of people, or nation of any state.

Three participants, including the lecturer who taught the novel, talked about social class identity in *A Tale of Two Cities* and connected it to the Pakistani scenario. It was only the teacher who made explicit connections with the upper and lower class in society while the two students only said that such things exist in our society as well.

5.3.1.2 Relating to rights in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Table 5.20

Participants relating to rights in A Tale of Two Cities

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	10	11
- Relating to negation of rights in society in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	3	3
- Relating to inequality of rights among different social classes in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	4	5
- Relating to gender rights in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	1	1
- Relating to legal rights	1	1

Ten participants made sense of right-related issues in *A Tale of Two Cities* through their everyday lives (coding details given in Table 5.20). Three participants talked about a complete negation of human rights in society, four related to the inequality among different social classes in society while one of them related to gender rights and another related legal rights issues in the novel to real life situation.

The participants who related to the inequality of the rights of different classes compared different groups in the society around them and related them to the social classes in the novels. As Yasir said,

If we talk about A Tale of Two Cities, like the aristocratic class exploits lower class we can see that in Sindh. The 'wadera' system and politicians who cheat us and take our votes, take work from us, get us to farm their lands, get us to do their security work in their houses, over their rooms, like one keeps dogs they keep people like that too.

The connections made varied from person to person. Imran, for example, related to the events of the novel at a national level, finding examples of how political leaders of the country had failed to create a balance in the society and rights were not being delivered to the citizens. He said:

There is a lower class, middle class and upper class. Dickens has told no doubt of the upper class like the Evermonde brothers, they belong to the upper aristocrat class. Then middle class you can see Mrs Defarge or lower class, you can look at Gasper or the girl and her brother that Evermondes kill. So these atrocities in the name of upper class or power as you said, we do find that in Pakistan.

Aabid, on the other hand, related the novel to his context, Sindh, relating the aristocrats with the feudals in the rural areas of Sindh. Jamshed made the same connections to his Balochi context.

Three participants did not compare different groups but related to the complete negation of basic human rights for the common citizens. The negation of rights of individuals presented in the novel was made sense of through their everyday life making connection between what happened in the Dickensian France and what happens in their context today. One participant each related to gender rights and legal rights issues in the novel to their observations of their society.

5.3.1.3 Relating to duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Six participants, including one teacher, one female and four male students, related the theme of duties as presented in *A Tale of Two Cities* to their society (coding details shown in Table 5.21). Three participants each made sense of civic and moral duties through the events and characters in the novel.

Table 5.21

Participants relating to duties in A Tale of Two Cities

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	6	6
- Relating to moral duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	3	3
- Relating to civic duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	3	3

Civic duties such as reporting a crime were discussed in relation to the novel. The students said that the person performing such duties, as filing a complaint against violence, can get into problems like Dr. Manette. They used the novel as a means to understand patterns in real life as Rida said:

This happens in our society as well that when someone performs their duty and helps someone then what the others do is go against that same person like what happened with Dr. Manette. And then that kind of sets an example in society and then everyone is scared to do such a thing in future.

The students further made connections to moral duties in the novel and incidents in real life. They pointed out moral duties from their reading of *A Tale of Two Cities* and believed that people needed to and should perform their duties. One of the students, Nazia, also pointed out that though such characters were portrayed in this work of fiction who fulfilled their duties even at high costs, there were very few such people in real life.

The teacher who taught *A Tale of Two Cities* was also asked if the students discussed duties in *A Tale of Two Cities* and connected it to daily lives. She stated that whenever a discussion took place, which according to her was not often due to large class size, such connections were made. She did not, however, cite any examples of the connections made.

The student participants thus, related to the themes of identity, rights and duties in *A Tale* and made connections of events and characters in the novel with their life.

5.3.2 Relating to citizenship themes in *The God of Small Things*

The second novel to be discussed is *The God of Small Things* which was the most quoted novel when participants made sense of theme in the novels through their experiences and observations. These views respond to the first part of the third sub-research question, “Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?” The following sections provide details of how the participants related each theme in the novels to how they perceived the themes in society.

5.3.2.1 Relating to identity in *The God of Small Things*

Seven participants, including the teacher of *The God of Small Things*, two female and four male students, related to the theme of identity in the novel (coding details shown in Table 5.22). Four of these made sense of religious identity in society through the novel. Social caste identity was related to by three participants.

Table 5.22

Participants relating to identity in The God of Small Things

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	7	9
- Relating to religious identity in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	4
- Relating to caste issues in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	3	5

Student participants talked about the caste identity issue presented in the novel and

made connections between the Indian society and the Pakistani. There was slight disagreement as to how far the situation was similar in Pakistan- some believed it was exactly the same while others believed it was less obvious in Pakistan. The participants who connected *The God of Small Things*'s caste system with the Hindu religion, believed that as the caste and class system in Pakistan is different from that presented in the novel, it is obviously less problematic in Pakistan. As Ali said, "Here also there is a caste system- it is there, but it is more in India." Sonia gave an example of being discriminated at a school where she worked due to her caste and related that to Velutha while acknowledging that the discrimination was not of the same degree.

Four of the participants made sense of religious identity through the novel and talked about the religious differences among the different castes in Hinduism. They cited examples of Hindus in their society and made sense of their identities through the novel. One of them however, presented a connection between Pakistani society and the Indian society presented in *The God of Small Things*- comparing Hindu castes with Muslim sects. The killing of Shias in recent times based on their sectarian identity was related to how Velutha was killed based on his untouchable caste. Furthermore, the participants also related social class and caste identity to social inequality in society and connected it to Pakistan. As Imran said:

If we talk about social inequality in The God of Small Things and relate it to the injustice in Pakistani society then we ourselves must be doing such things at many places [...]sometimes it happens that the social inequality that is with Velutha and Baby, we do it in our lives when we don't even like looking at the beggars, we just take our hand up [refuse to contribute]. Now what is that? This is the social inequality, but it's like we want the other to feel that you are inferior.

5.3.2.2 Relating to rights in *The God of Small Things*

Eighteen participants made 23 comments making sense of rights in society through issues of rights presented in *The God of Small Things* (coding details given in Table 5.23). The aspects of rights discussed included inequality of rights among different social classes (by eight participants), gender rights (mentioned six times by four participants), religious rights (related to by three people), negation of basic human rights (mentioned twice).

Table 5.23

Participants relating to rights in The God of Small Things

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	18	23
- Relating to inequality of rights in society in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	8	7
- Relating to negation of basic human rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	2	2
- Relating to gender rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	4	6
- Relating to religious rights in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	3	3

Student participants talked about deprivation of basic social rights- the rights to freedom of expression, right to education and to basic amenities of life- for some groups as opposed to others who enjoyed all rights due to their affluent status. The participants related the theme of rights presented in the novel to the Pakistani society comparing the class differences present in the society around them with the caste differences in the Indian society presented by Roy. As Aaqil said:

Like Arundhati Roy, she has talked about untouchable, I see even today in society, if I have a nice personality, if I have money in my pocket people give you preference [...] if instead I am in bad condition, I do not have money then I would be treated like an untouchable because I do not have a good personality.

As discussed in the earlier section on identity, the participants argued that the deprivation of rights on the basis of identity was present in Pakistani society as well but to a lesser degree. They related to different kinds of people they have met, who were discriminated in the society. As Aabid put it,

There are some people like beggars, or who we call 'baagri', people do not like to shake hands with or eat using their plates, if they sit in the seat then they would leave that seat and sit on another, this also happens. They do not respond to him, they do not treat him as human.

Rida gave an example of the difference among Muslim and non-Muslims. Reflecting on her personal experience she told about a time when her mother would not let them use the same plates as those of non-Muslim, Kulhi peasants who worked on her father's lands.

While relating to gender rights in *The God of Small Things*, respondents related to the family structure presented in the novel and how that structure hinders individual liberty of characters. They talked about Ammu whose life was ruined due to what his family considered right or wrong. The participants claimed that this was especially relevant to the Pakistani society as most of them came from large, extended families and had experienced difficulties when it came to personal freedom. Relating to gender rights, Haider said:

The whole family status that I told you about, it is to be found in The God of Small Things. They have no rights, no freedom of expression, no

freedom of choice. So The God of Small Things is completely full of that stuff. This whole background, what happens inside the families.

Male participants while talking about gender rights in general, said they felt sorry for their female family members like their sisters and mothers who were not given due rights. This personal experience was seen to be reflected in the novel as well. Three out of five female participants said they related to the character of Ammu and felt bound by the rules for women that society dictates. As Sonia said, “Ammu wants to marry him but society does not give her that right. I can relate that to my own character.”

Thus, the participants made connections between the negations of rights presented in the novel and those in the society based on their personal experiences.

5.3.2.3 Relating to duties in *The God of Small Things*

Nine participants related to the theme of duties in *The God of Small Things*, including one teacher, six male and one female student participants (for details on coding, see Table 5.24).

Table 5.24

Participants relating to duties in The God of Small Things

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to duties in <i>The God of Small Things</i>	9	9
- Relating to moral duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	2	2
- Relating to civic duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	4	4
- Relating to gender duties in <i>A Tale of Two Cities</i>	2	2

Four of the respondents related to the issues of civic duties presented in the novel through the character of the police officer. The participants who talked about police, related the fictional police officer with actual officers they have had encounters with. As Adnan said:

Yes, in The God of Small Things, police don't perform their duties, it's shown to be corrupt, same here. In our society the police are corrupt to some extent. They perform their duties when asked by the elected members or by some influential feudal. They do not care at all about the lower class.

Two of the students talked about moral duties and said that the novel showed that everyone including the poor, should be given their due share and be treated well. Two other participants, one female and one male, identified gender issues in the novel and related them to gender-based duties in society. They related the character of Ammu to present-day women in Pakistan. Kanwal said she could relate herself to Ammu while Haider related the situation of Ammu with that of his sisters.

Thus, the students related the fiction with the contemporary society and made sense of duties in the novel through events in their lives.

5.3.3 Relating to citizenship themes in *A Passage to India*

Many participants made sense of citizenship themes through *A Passage to India*, the novel based in colonial India. The following sections provide details of how the participants made sense of the three themes through this novel.

5.3.3.1 Relating to identity in *A Passage to India*

Nine participants related to the theme of identity in *A Passage to India*, including two teachers and seven male student participants (for details on coding, see Table 5.25). The issues they talked about were divided into colonial (mentioned ten times by six participants); and national identity (mentioned by six participants). Though there is an overlap between the two categories, they were made distinct based on how the participants referred to the issue.

Table 5.25

Participants relating to identity in A Passage to India

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	9	16
- Relating to national identity in <i>A Passage to India</i>	6	6
- Relating to a colonial identity through <i>A Passage to India</i>	6	10

Six participants, including two teachers, related the theme of colonial identity in the novel with their own postcolonial identity. They related to the Indian characters in the novel with themselves in the present. As Imran explains, “*A Passage to India* gave me an identity in a way that what was I before and what am I now. I came to know that before partition I was colonised but now I am a Pakistani.” The participants talk about colonial India and compared it with present day Pakistan commenting on the progress the English had made and how they, as Pakistanis, had lagged behind. The teachers connected the colonial identity in the novel to more complex postcolonial issues such as the presence of English as the official language.

Six participants related to the national identity issues portrayed in *A Passage to India* and talked about how the English considered themselves superior to the Indians. While talking about the issues of superiority of the rulers in every sphere of life, they made connections between the fictional incidents they cited and the real life scenarios they had observed. They compared the privileged British with the upper class, influential people in their own society and the Indians with the people with lesser resources. As Adnan said:

Like it is shown in the novel that the British rulers have more protocol, better living standard as compared to Indians, Indians are put into certain boundaries. Similarly, if we look at our society, if we trace the same things, they are still present to-date like let's suppose the poor class that is there in our society today they are put into boundaries and the rulers, politicians, MNAs, MPAs or the Nazims from the Nazim system they have a different standard of living. We have boundaries, they do not have any boundaries, we get a different set of rights while their rights are different. The same thing can be identified in the novels as in our society.

5.3.3.2 Relating to rights in *A Passage to India*

Eight students made connections between the situation of rights in the novel, *A Passage to India*, and the situation of rights in their everyday lives. Three of them talked about national rights, three about postcolonial and two of religious rights and made connections with society and their lives (for coding details see Table 5.26).

Table 5.26

Participants relating to rights in A Passage to India

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	8	10
- Relating to religious rights in <i>A Passage to India</i>	2	2
- Relating to civic rights in a postcolonial context	3	3
- Relating to civic rights of different nations in <i>A Passage to India</i>	3	4

While relating to civic rights of the two nations in *A Passage to India*, the participants connected the hierarchy of rights among the British and the Indians in the

novel to the hierarchies present in society. As Jamshed, a non-Sindhi participant, put it: “If I compare with the Indians from *A Passage to India* then in real life I was like an Indian here. In group discussions, during food mela (*a food festival*) they (classmates) will start speaking Sindhi, and I won’t understand anything.” Another student, Yasir, related to the Bridge Party in the novel and talked about a time when he went to a political minister’s house. He reported that people sat in different rooms depending on their social status.

Three participants connected the situation of civic rights presented in the novel to the post-colonial reality. They argued that the novel has helped them understand the effect of the history on their present. As Saeed perceived, “earlier there was colonialism, now there is imperialism”. He further explained that in the time of colonialism the society was influenced by the British due to their physical presence in the sub-continent and today, even though they have left the region physically, their influence still exists.

5.3.3.3 Relating to duties in *A Passage to India*

Only two participants related the instances of duties in the novel to the society and their lives. One of the participants talked about civic duties relating to Dr. Aziz as a person who was sincere to his work and did what his superiors asked of him. The other participant talked about moral duties relating to how Dr. Aziz took care of his family.

5.3.4 Relating to citizenship themes in *Lord of the Flies*

Lord of the Flies was the least discussed novel in response to this part of the third sub research question. The following sections provide details of how the participants made sense of the themes of identity, rights and duties in their lives through the novel.

5.3.4.1 Relating to identity in *Lord of the Flies*

Four participants, including one teacher and three male students, made connections between the issues of identity in the novel and identity issues in their everyday lives. Two of them related to identity formation in the novel and the other two talked about gender

identity in the novel (shown in Table 5.27).

Table 5.27

Participants relating to identity in Lord of the Flies

Codes	Sources	References
Relating to identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	4	4
- Relating to factors relevant to identity formation in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	2	2
- Relating to gender identity in <i>Lord of the Flies</i>	2	2

Talking about how the boys in the novel formed their own identities two participants, one a male student and another a teacher, related the instance from the novel to their lives. They argued that the portrayal of identity formation in the novel showed how they built their own identities through their actions. While talking about gender identity, two participants- one male and the other a female student- pointed out that there were no female characters in the novel which was a hint at the subordinate status of women in society.

5.3.4.2 Relating to rights in *Lord of the Flies*

There was only one participant, the teacher who taught *Lord of the Flies*, who related to rights in the novel. He made an implicit and casual mention saying it was possible to relate to both rights and duties in the novel.

5.3.4.3 Relating to duties in *Lord of the Flies*

Seven participants related to the theme of duties in *Lord of the Flies*, six of whom related to civic duties in the novel and one, the lecturer, talked about duties implicitly. Three of the participants who related to civic duties in the novel talked about the duties

that were assigned to the boys by Ralph as their leader and the chaos that was created on the island as a result of the boys not performing their duties. They related it to civic duties in society saying people needed to understand that it was important for every citizen to perform their duties. The other participants talked about Ralph performing his duties as a leader and related it to how they would perform their duties if they were in his place. One of them thought Ralph was a good leader and they should follow in his footsteps. Kanwal on the other hand was more analytical and said Ralph did not perform his duties well as he did not encourage freedom of expression. She thought if she ever became a leader, she would listen to the whole group and adopt a more democratic approach.

5.3.5 Conclusion

In relation to the first part of the third research question “*Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?*”, participants made sense of different aspects of the themes in relation to different novels. The novel that participants could relate most to was *The God of Small Things* where they made connection between social class, caste and religious issues in the novel and their experiences and observations. A number of participants related to national and colonial aspects of rights and identity in *A Passage* which was the second most quoted novel. Participants who related to *A Tale* contextualised their understanding of the novel by relating to issues such as national identity in the novel to ethnic identity in their society. *Lord of the Flies* was the least referred novel when participants discussed the connections between novels and their lives.

5.4 Facilitating factors

This section focuses on the last part of the third sub research question- ‘*Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are*

they helped to do so?’ The participants were asked about the facilitating factors, if any, that helped the students understand and make sense of the three themes in the novels. Views on this aspect were taken from teachers, board members as well as students. The students were asked if they thought they were helped in their understanding of the themes within or outside the classroom. The members of the Board of Studies, who chose the exact novels to be taught within the department from a wider curriculum for all universities, commented on how the choice of the novels might affect understanding of identity, rights and duties. The teachers talked about facilitation through discussion in the classrooms. The views of the three groups of participants are presented in the following sections to show how all of them viewed teaching, curriculum and any other external factors as helpful for students to identify and relate to the themes in the novels (coding details presented in Table 5.28).

Table 5.28

Facilitating factors

Codes	Sources	References
Curriculum as a facilitating factor	20	29
External help seen as a facilitating factor	6	10
Discussion of themes in class	22	47

5.4.1 Curriculum as a facilitating factor

The students and faculty members expressed their views about the choice of the curriculum and in what ways, if any, it had been helpful in understanding the themes of identity, rights and duties in fiction. Some of them considered it very helpful while others thought it was partially helpful and yet others believed it was not helpful at all. Table 5.29 provides an overview of the codes relating to curriculum as a facilitating factor.

Table 5.29

Curriculum as a facilitating factor

Codes	Sources	References
Curriculum as a facilitating factor	20	29
- Curriculum seen as partially helpful	3	4
- A different curriculum choice will be more useful	4	4
- Curriculum choice is considered helpful towards understanding themes	8	8
- Participants viewing teaching methods as more important than curriculum	5	5
- Consideration of social themes while forming the curriculum	3	4

Twenty participants including faculty members mentioned curriculum as a facilitating factor. Eight of these participants considered curriculum as a helpful factor. Some of these respondents just said that the curriculum is very helpful without giving details. However, others explicitly talked about the different novels and said how the curriculum choices had helped them understand the themes. Those who made explicit connections talked about the variety across different eras that were represented in their curriculum. They argued that this helped them understand the themes from different points of view. As Raj said:

First of all we should see history, if we do not check history if we do not read the old novels and directly take the modern novels then we would not be aware of the background, we would reach the final point then how will our understanding develop. When we read the old novels then obviously we get an understanding from them. We are reading step by step from old to modern, it gives a more mature understanding.

Three participants thought the chosen curriculum was only partially helpful, arguing that only some of the novels selected were helpful to their understanding of the themes while others were not so helpful. These three participants considered *A Tale of Two Cities* and *The God of Small Things* to be more helpful than other novels chosen in the curriculum. There were four participants, including Sir Umair, who thought a different choice of curriculum would be more helpful towards understanding of the themes and quoted some modern and widely known books that could be a better choice. Five of the participants, including one member of the board and two teachers of fiction, thought that it did not matter much which novels were part of the curriculum as long as the teaching methods were properly designed to help understanding of the themes.

The members of the board of studies were explicitly asked if the themes were taken under consideration when the curriculum was decided. Two of the board members said that the social themes such as identity, rights and duties were considered along with many other factors such as author, age and critical acclaim of the books. The third board member, recently included into the board, was of the view that these issues were only considered by the Higher Education Commission when they designed the overall curriculum for all universities. She argued that at the university, not much thought went into the choice of the curriculum.

5.4.2 Teaching methods

The participants talked about classroom discussions and teaching methods as two facilitating factors within the classroom. The participants were asked if the discussion within the classroom including any discussion with peers helped them understand the themes through fiction. Twenty-two participants talked about different issues (overview of the codes given in Table 5.30).

Table 5.30

Discussion within the classroom as a facilitating factor

Codes	Sources	References
Extent of discussion of themes in class	22	47
- Explicit discussion	11	17
- Implicit discussion	9	13
- No discussion	5	8
Teaching method as a facilitating factor	6	10

Eleven participants, including one member of the board and three teachers, said there was explicit discussion of themes within the class. The teachers thought they had charged discussion around the themes in which majority of the students participated and that helped their understanding of the themes. Seven of the students also agreed with this opinion of the teachers and cited examples of various incidents in the class when discussion was held around the themes. As Ali quoted one teacher's example:

Yes they were discussed in the class by Madam Nadia, she is a very nice teacher she tried to generate discussion so that we could get as much perceptions as so we were able to write in the paper. She tried to generate discussion and I participated in it.

Nine other participants however, believed that even though the themes were discussed in class the discussion was often very implicit. They thought the themes could be discussed in further detail and were not discussed as much as was necessary to help them understand the themes. These participants were not satisfied with the amount of discussion around the themes as Kanwal said about the discussion in class, “Not so well, in a proper manner. They (the teachers) just discussed the characters, their attitude, the way they mould. Such sort of things, not like their duties and identity.” Five other participants on the other hand believed that the themes were not discussed at all in the class. Haider said, “No we have not seen this activity in class like it should be seen practically.” The participants thus, felt helped due to the discussion of the themes within the classroom, only when they considered the extent of discussion appropriate.

Six participants, including four staff members considered teaching methods an important facilitating factor in participants’ understanding of the themes of identity, rights and duties. Even though they talked about there being explicit discussion within the classroom as a conducive teaching tool, they also generally considered teaching methods to be of help in participants’ understanding of the novels.

5.4.3 External help

Six of the participants talked about being helped to understand the themes through fiction, outside of the classroom and the curriculum (coding details given in Table 5.31).

Table 5.31

External help

Codes	Sources	References
External help seen as a facilitating factor	6	10
- Attended seminars	2	2
- Other help	4	8

Out of the six participants who said they had external help in understanding the themes, two female participants said they attended awareness seminars outside university that helped them understand the themes better. As Rida said, “I had attended a lot of seminars they give a lot of information about seminars in that. I had attended a pilot conference that was also, there were many politicians who were telling about rights and duties.” The other four participants talked about a variety of other sources of help such as discussion with family members, help from seniors or hostel-mates etc. Thus, there were some participants who got external help that they believed had helped them understand the themes of identity, rights and duties in fiction.

5.5 Conclusion

The chapter began with an introduction signposting the subsequent sections. The following sections presented findings acquired through NVivo- coding details were presented in tables- for each of the sub research question. In response to the first research question, the participants spoke more about rights than about identity and duties- duties being the least discussed theme. The participants emphasised religious, moral and caste issues of the citizenship themes based on their context in addition to the more general national, political and civic aspects. In response to the second research questions,

participants identified themes of identity, rights and duties in the four novels. The participants identified themes in *The God of Small Things* more than the other novels and *Lord of the Flies* was discussed the least. In response to the third research question, participants discussed how they made sense of the themes of citizenship in the novel through their experiences and observations. The findings presented show that the participants could relate more easily to issues in novels based in the Indian context as compared to those in the English context. These findings are further discussed in relation to literature in the following three chapters.

6. Participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties

In chapter 5, findings related to each sub research question were presented. In this chapter, I critically discuss the findings in light of literature answering the first research question, “*What do students think identity, rights and duties mean?*” Firstly, I discuss participants' perceptions of identity exploring their views on human, ethnic, caste and religious aspects of identity. Secondly, I discuss respondents' views of human, political, civic and religious rights. Thirdly, participants' views on moral, political and religious duties are discussed. The arguments in these three sections are developed further in Section 6.4, where I argue that these undergraduate students' perceptions of identities, rights and duties were dependent on the context of their society. Their ideas of these three citizenship themes did not necessarily match with what Cogan (1998) or other studies proposed but as Kennedy (2004) suggests the contextual factors are important in a study of perceptions of citizenship. The participants' discussion of themes such as moral, caste and religious aspects of identity, rights and duties alongside civic and political issues shows that their perceptions of citizenship are based in and informed by their context as well as more generally accepted aspects of citizenship. The chapter ends with a summary.

6.1 Perceptions of identity

In this section, I present four arguments about participants' perceptions of identity. Firstly, the participants said being human is the most fundamental aspect of their identity. Secondly, participants' ethnic identity was triggered in social conflicts. Thirdly, a caste identity (roughly equivalent to family name in Pakistan) appeared to be important to some of the participants which had not been discussed much in literature and not at all by Cogan

(1998). Fourthly, the current situation in Pakistan and relevant literature suggested that religious and sectarian issues would be important but these young people, all but three, did not define their identity in terms of religion.

Student participants chose to define their identity as being first and foremost a human. A “human identity” was considered by participants to be more important than a national, ethnic, religious or any other form of identity. The participants perceived a human identity from a moral and ethical perspective considering it as a single identity that connected all human beings with each other. They defined this “human identity” in different ways. For example, Babar said, “I see myself as a humanist”; Ali believed, “we should try to be a good human”; Zainab believed being a human was superior to other identities. Nationality, ethnicity and other identities were less important to them as compared to their identity as a human being (coding details presented in Table 5.2, p. 144). They were aware of various issues in society and considered “being human” important as they believed that will stop all the identity related conflicts. As Sonia said, “if you have a humanitarian approach then you will never discriminate among people because of mother tongue, or because of religion.”

Considering that these are students of literature and not citizenship, it can be assumed that they might not have been aware of the term ‘global citizenship’. The concept of a “human identity” that they talked about was however, similar to the moral or aspirational global citizenship mentioned by Osler and Starkey (2008) and Falk (1993) (discussed in Section 2.4.2). Though only one of these participants mentioned the term “global citizenship”, the idea of an identity that connects every human is similar to the concept of aspirational global citizenship of Falk (1993) and the moral global citizenship of Osler and Starkey (2008) and Nussbaum (1996). These participants argued that all other identities had been attached to them due to being in a certain context while being human was the foremost identity that everyone should associate with. Seven out of these nine

participants belonged to a rural background and had had government schooling. As there are more identity related crises in rural, underdeveloped areas of Sindh, these participants appeared more aware of the identity clashes. This might have led them to look for a solution, even when it is only aspirational. They considered a human identity, a global citizenship, as their approach to solve the clashes in their society based on ethnic, linguistic and religious divides.

Cogan (1998) considers national identity as the defining element of a citizen's identity but in the context of Pakistan, it is believed that nationality as a Pakistani is not important to Pakistani youth. Pakistan being a mixture of ethnic groups has never been looked at as one nation (Lall, 2009; Dean, 2008 discussed in Section 2.4.2). It was expected in the light of this literature that these young Pakistanis would not define their identities in terms of nationality. Three male and three female participants representing a mix of genders, schooling background and urban or rural origins related to Pakistan as their foremost identity, while three others also mentioned nationality as part of one's identity. It was quite obvious that they should consider their national identity as a defining element of their identities. As Imran said, "I am Pakistani, because I have an NIC (National Identity Card)" so he considered being a Pakistani as an identity since he had this status in his country. There was however, one participant who said he did not wish to be identified as a Pakistani, and he preferred his ethnic identity rather than his nationality.

Ethnic identity was important to participants but it was only prompted as result of a conflict. The participants did not necessarily identify themselves in terms of their ethnicity as much as was expected in the light of literature (discussed in Section 2.4.2). However, they did feel discriminated on the basis of it and considered it an important reason of conflict in their society. According to my analysis of literature, ethnic identity is the most important point of identification among youth in Pakistan. Lall (2014), for example, argues that the partitions of 1947 and 1971 gave rise to regional and ethnic

consciousness in the country. My data, however, shows that the participants did not necessarily identify with their ethnic identity but felt affected by ethnic issues in their society. They did not say they considered themselves a Sindhi, for example, but they did suggest that they felt discriminated by other ethnic groups. Seven out of twenty student participants considered ethnicity as a defining element of their identities and of these seven, five considered it to be less important than other elements such as their nationality or caste. However, when talking about issues related to identity twelve of them talked about clashes and disputes based on ethnic differences.

In the case of all of these participants, whether Sindhi, Baloch or Urdu speaking, they considered their own ethnic group to be the one that was affected by prejudice from the other groups. One of the Urdu speakers narrated an incident where he was harassed in the administration building of the university since he could not speak Sindhi. Another participant, a Sindhi speaker said he was mistreated because he could not speak Urdu very well while shopping in the metropolitan cities. There is a conflict (e.g., Ahmar, 1996; Joyo, 2005; Kazi, 1987) as to the cause of the disputes among different ethnicities. Each group, in academic literature, considers their own ethnicity to be under represented and mistreated by the other ethnic groups. Each group strengthens their argument with evidence that supports their propositions. My data also reports that individuals from different ethnic groups (Sindhi, Urdu-speaking and Baloch) believed their own ethnic group to be mistreated at the hands of others.

There can be three possible explanations to why the participants did not consider ethnicity when defining their identity but felt affected by and concerned about ethnic conflicts in their society. Firstly, it is possible that they considered ethnicity to be such an obvious part of their identity that they did not think it needed to be mentioned. However, they did consider being human a part of their identity and mentioned it, as stated in earlier paragraphs, which was more obvious than an ethnic identity. Secondly, they might have

considered it a very sensitive issue and did not feel comfortable discussing with the researcher. Considering that both Urdu and Sindhi speaking participants discussed incidents where they were harassed due to their language, comfort level did not seem to be a problem with these participants. The third possibility is that ethnicity might not be important to them as an identity but important in its social and cultural aspect. These participants cared more about other things such as being human, being a Pakistani national but if a conflict arose their ethnic identities were triggered. Thus, it is possible that ethnic identity might not be perceived as a part of their identities but in a social and cultural perspective and in times of crisis, the participants considered it important.

A caste identity was important to some of these participants, even though this concept does not appear in definitions of citizenship as seen in light of my analysis of literature (e.g., Cogan, 1998; Lee, 2004; Tan, 2007). Four of the five female participants who considered caste as the defining element of their identities and talked about inter-caste marriages as an issue related to caste in society (for coding details see Table 5.2, p. 144). They talked about inter-caste marriages and the discrimination one had to face being from different castes. None of the male participants identified with caste and family name or talked about issues related to caste whereas the females considered it a part of their identity and believed that there were issues related to caste in their society. Even though there has not been a wider survey on young people's perceptions of caste in Pakistan, it is possible that the male participants considered it an obvious part of their identity as most of them quoted their caste when introducing themselves or talking about their background. The female participants, however, did not talk about it in an obvious manner in their introduction and felt the need to consider it when asked about their identity. It is also possible that caste did not impact the men as much as the women. This is however, merely a speculation and further research on the relation between gender and caste can prove very useful in exploring this area further.

The participants' discussion of caste suggests that they considered caste as an identity and inter-caste marriages as an issue to be part of a citizen's life. While most of the students talked about nationality and ethnicity these four participants considered caste to be relevant to citizenship issues. It is debatable whether caste forms part of a citizen's identity and issues such as inter-caste marriages should be discussed in a project of this nature, as it is more of a private issue within a family. Kiwan (2007) argues that in order to understand what happens in the public sphere, the private sphere needs to be brought into the realm of citizenship. In the context of her argument, caste identity and inter-caste marriages are part of a citizen's identity in relation to these young women in Pakistan.

Caste is not mentioned as a feature of a citizen's identity neither in literature reviewed in context of Pakistan or elsewhere. Cogan (1998), for example, does not consider caste as part of a citizen's identity. Neither do researchers who focus on citizenship in Pakistan like Lall (2012) or Dean (2008) mention caste as an important feature in Pakistanis' identity. Verkaaik (2001) mentions 'zaat' (Sindhi/Urdu word for caste) as one of the features that was considered by Muslims to be a differentiating factor from Hindus at the time of Pakistan's partition. The Hindus followed a religious hierarchical caste system whereas Muslim castes were merely based on professions or family-names. However, looking at the responses of these young Pakistanis, it is evident that there is some form of caste-based identity conflict in their society. Even though there were only four participants who talked about caste when asked explicitly about identity, five others mentioned it elsewhere in the interview. Specially while introducing themselves they showed pride in their caste and explained its origins in detail, like Jamshed and Ali did. Therefore, caste was an important element of these young people's identity in Pakistan.

In light of the current situation in Pakistan (as discussed in Section 2.4.2), it might

be assumed that religion will be an important aspect of the identities of these young people. However, none of the participants termed religious identity as a defining aspect of their personal identities. There were three participants who talked about religious identity issues in society. The only Hindu participant in the sample said that the religious minorities were harassed to the extent that they had to start thinking of leaving the country. As there was only one Hindu participant, his statement cannot be generalised but as a Hindu in the Muslim majority society he felt discriminated and this treatment of minorities was acknowledged by two of the Muslim participants as well. The other two participants, both male Muslims, talked about religious issues in society in relation to the issues within different sects of Islam.

In light of the Pakistan based surveys discussed in Section 2.4.2 (e.g., PEW 2013, 2014), research papers on religious violence in Karachi (e.g., Siddiqui, 2012) and recent terror attacks in the region as shown on the South Asian Terrorism Portal's website (SATP, 2015), it was expected that the participants would show a high level of interest in religious and sectarian issues. However, most of these university students did not seem to consider it as one of the most important issues in their society as only three of them mentioned religion. A possible explanation is that these educated young people chose not to talk about religious identity as it is a cause of conflict in the country. Another possible explanation is that the geographical regions that these young people belonged to may not have a history of sectarian issues as rural Sindh is still a considerably religiously tolerant region (for contextual details, see Section 1.2). It may be that these particular young people had not had any experience of such issues around them. It is equally possible, however, that young, educated people in Pakistan did not consider religion to be as important an issue as it is made to be in literature and media sources cited above.

In conclusion, these young Pakistanis considered a human identity to be more important than any other form of identity as they believed that all other kinds of identities

led to divides and clashes in society. They did not identify themselves in terms of their ethnic identity explicitly but they did feel discriminated on the basis of it and saw ethnic issues in society. Caste, though not mentioned significantly in literature, was fairly important to these participants when defining their identities. Religious and sectarian issues, moreover, were considered really important in literature and media but did not seem to be important for these young people. These aspects of participants' identities are strongly based in their context (this argument will be further discussed in the overarching section 6.4).

6.2 Perceptions of rights

In this section, I argue that the participants appeared aware of their rights and talked about different kinds of rights including contextual and universal dimensions. They discussed aspects of rights that were important for a citizen according to Cogan (1998) like political and civic rights. They also discussed rights that were more important in their context than they would be elsewhere such as right to choose in marriage, or inequality of rights among different religious groups and social classes. I present six arguments in the following paragraphs. First, human rights were discussed as part of a citizen's rights. Second, the right to free expression was important to both male and female participants whereas right to choice was only discussed by female participants. Third, high interest was shown in political rights but voting decisions were considered, by most participants who talked about it, to be under the domain of heads of the family, usually older men. Fourth, participants discussed civic rights explicitly which was not expected in the light of literature. Fifth, Muslim participants showed an awareness of negation of religious rights of the minorities which was against what literature showed. Sixth, the participants showed an awareness of rights issues in society specially inequality of rights among different social classes and men and women.

The participants chose to include human rights as part of citizen's rights, alongside other categories of rights. The participants were aware of the nature of the project as they were given a detailed introduction before the interview. Human rights are seen as part of citizen's rights by many researchers such as by Kiwan (2005; discussed in Section 2.4.3). Kiwan (2005) argues that even though human rights do not form the theoretical underpinnings of citizenship, they can be considered a part of a citizen's rights. The participants talked about right to practice religion, right to choose in terms of marriage, right to equal opportunities and freedom of expression. While discussing their rights the participants considered both public and private spheres of life. They argued that the rights in the private sphere such as right to marry of their own choice, or practice their religion should be given to everyone in society. As a male participant, Shehryar said "basic right of a common man is that his personal life should not be disturbed, he should have freedom to practice his religion". They also talked about rights in the public sphere such as freedom to express oneself in media or equal rights for both men and women in society.

Seven participants, including male and female students, considered freedom of expression to be important while the right of choice in terms of marriage was discussed by three female participants only. Participants perceived that every individual should have freedom of expression. It is interesting that the three participants who talked about right to choose were all females and considered the right to choose their life partners as an example of this right. While describing her rights, Kanwal said, "I also have a right to marriage, the right to choose my partner. I have the right to say no, to negate anything." Another participant, Rida, associated the right to marry of her choice with the will of her father saying, "My father is very friendly, if we tell our own choice then he will agree but of course after asking around about the people, how they are." This reflects how much the understanding of rights is based on contextual norms in the case of these participants. It is customary in the context for families to meet and decide about the marriage so even when

they have the right of choice, it has to be approved by elders in the family.

The female participants' emphasis on right to choose in marriage is an interesting example of a citizen's right. Jamal (2006) presents the legal case of Saima, an adult woman who chose to marry a man her father did not approve of and whose father filed a custody case as her legal guardian. Legal cases such as that of Saima explained in Jamal (2006, for details see Section 2.4.3), show that the freedom to choose in case of marriage is not just a private affair in the country. Such cases have been dealt with publically in courts of law and have involved serious exploitation of a citizen's rights. It is therefore, understandable that these young women were concerned for their rights of choice in the matter and considered it an essential human right.

High awareness of political rights, as suggested in literature, was represented by the high number of participants who talked about these rights explicitly. Fourteen participants, including all five female participants, talked about their political rights showing high awareness. Most of the participants talked about their right to vote. This finding corresponded with Lall's (2012) findings in her survey which suggested high awareness of political rights among the Pakistani youth. There was some discussion of political parties and participants' involvement in them- only one male participant said he had the right to join a political party while the two others who talked about it, one male and the other female, said they were not given the right to join a political party by their families. There were two participants, both male, who did not exercise their right to vote because they thought there was no use and the candidates were not worthy. Apart from these two participants, the rest showed interest in political rights.

Political rights such as voting were considered to be under the domain of heads of the family, usually older men, by many participants. Even though females were aware of political rights, voting and other political activities were decided by certain male members of the family. Seven participants- three male and four female- said voting was considered

a collective decision of the family. This reflects what Gine & Mansuri (2011, discussed in Section 2.4.3) found about women in the developing world arguing that in countries such as Pakistan females voted as per the wishes of the household males. It is interesting to note however, that in my sample, it is not just the females but male participants as well who decide to vote in accordance with the wishes of the family elders. So it is not usually any and every male who decides but those specific ones who are in-charge of the household decisions. This also reflects the characteristics of a collectivist culture (Triandis, 2001 as discussed in Section 1.2.3). There was only one female, of the five, who thought vote was an individual choice and that she voted for someone she thought appropriate, even though she was told to vote for someone else by her father. This may be a case of what Malik & Courtney (2011, discussed in Section 2.4.3) termed as empowerment through higher education.

The participants showed an awareness of civic rights issues in their society. They talked about the right to education and right to health services. These appear as important rights issues in Pakistan in my analysis of literature (discussed in Section 2.4.3). They were more aware of their rights than the participants in the study by Lister et al. (2003 as discussed in Section 2.4.3). Right to education was discussed as a civic right by eight participants, five of whom thought it should be given to everyone. The other three participants looked at education as a civic right they already had, two of whom believed government had played its part well in providing them with this right. There was one participant who talked about the standard of education and said it was not just about providing access to education but also about maintaining a quality of education which was not seen in government schools. So, they seemed to be aware of the basic right to education that a citizen should have and were aware of the actual situation in their society. The literature discussed in Section 2.4.3, shows that the constitution bestows these basic rights on all citizens but in practice not many in the population get access to education or

healthcare (as suggested by Tomar, 2001 and Tomasevski, 2006).

Four respondents mentioned the right to proper health care services and believed that the government had failed to provide this right to everyone. These participants were all males from villages of Sindh- three of them were from lower middle class backgrounds and the fourth one's father was a doctor at whose clinic he had volunteered for some time. Literature on situation of civic rights in Pakistan (e.g., Ahmad and Shaikh, 2008; discussed in Section 2.4.3) suggested that right to health services is also an important civic rights issue. These participants' interest in health services may be owing to the fact that they had seen lack of proper health care in the villages they were from. This is however, not applicable to all as many other participants from villages did not talk about health services at all.

Muslim participants showed a high awareness of religious rights of minorities in their society, even though my analysis of literature suggests that these young people have been schooled to develop religious intolerance. Dean (2005) and Ahmad (2004) argue that the youth are being instilled with a non-accommodating ideology of Muslim being parallel to Pakistani, through social studies textbooks in public-sector schools (as discussed in Section 2.4.3). However, eleven participants, including one teacher who mostly came from public sector schools, talked about violation of religious rights of minorities in their society (coding details given in Table 5.3). These participants, mostly Muslims, said that religious rights of minority religious groups were violated in their country. This corresponds to Rahman's (2001) argument that religious minorities do not get their due rights in the country. Even though these participants had not experienced any religious rights violation personally, except for two who talked about sectarian discrimination, they were fully aware of the experiences of others around them. It is possible that these Muslim participants who talked about the rights of the minorities may be more sensitive to their plight as a result of their exposure to literature.

The inequality in provision of rights in society was discussed by ten male participants. They argued that the provision of rights was based on social class of individuals. None of the five female students talked about inequality of rights. It is interesting to note here that the female participants in this group were all from higher income backgrounds and most of these male participants who talked about negation of rights were from low income backgrounds. This suggests that having been denied the rights themselves these young people have become more aware of the injustices in their society.

There were also eight participants, including four male and four female, who talked about issues related to gender rights in their society. As suggested by Jamal (2006), Shah (2006) and Lall (2009), Pakistani society experiences a great gender disparity when it comes to provision of rights. It was expected in light of this literature that more of the participants would consider gender a rights-based issue. Seven of the eight people, who talked about gender rights, believed that women were being deprived of their basic rights. Male participants from rural areas argued that women were being deprived of rights such as access to education and right to employment. On the other hand, the rights quoted by the female participants from the urban areas included the right to stay out late, appearing on recorded media etc. Lall's (2009) ethnographic study suggested that there is a greater gender disparity in rural areas as compared to the urban areas. As the females were from the urban areas, it is possible that they did not experience a great deal of difference in rights as compared to their male counterparts. As Rida said they (herself and her sisters) had more rights in their house as compared to their brother but at the same time she was also aware of the disparity of rights between men and women in the society, in general.

A small number, three participants, also mentioned issues regarding ethnic rights in their society. They expected to get a recognition as an ethnic group. As suggested by Ali (1999), this is not accommodated in the constitution of the country as ethnic minorities are not recognised.

In conclusion, these young people talked about their human, political and civil rights. They also talked about issues regarding rights in society including religious rights, negation of rights and gender rights. Exploitation of religious rights of minority religious groups was recognised by Muslim participants, contrary to what literature suggests, as illustrated above. The students also showed an awareness of negation of rights and disparity between genders in their society. Thus, these young people were aware of various kinds of rights that they should have and discussed what they considered rights-related issues in their society.

6.3 Perceptions of duties

In this section, I discuss the participants' perceptions of their duties based on the findings presented in Section 5.1.3 and in light of the literature discussed in Section 2.4.4. In the following paragraphs, I present four arguments. Firstly, moral duties were more important to these participants than any other form of duties which corresponds with literature on citizenship in Asia. Secondly, political duties were not discussed by most of the participants which may imply that the participants were not aware of their political duties. It may also suggest that the respondents chose to discuss political participation as a right and not as a duty. Thirdly, religious duties were not discussed by these participants even though literature on citizenship in religious countries like Indonesia suggests that religion helps shape people's ideals of citizenship. Fourthly, the participants were aware of a neglect of duties in their society, five of the participants argued that civic duties are not performed while five others talked about environmental duties.

Moral duties appealed more to these young people than any other forms of duties. Moral duties were mentioned thirteen times in total by eight participants including both male and female students. The participants considered being respectful to elders, being honest, standing up for what is right, taking care of parents as duties that everyone should

perform. They included moral duties as part of a citizen's duties. This corresponds to Sim and Low's (2012) argument that character building is part of citizenship as intellect alone cannot make good citizens. Cogan (1998) did not consider moral duties to be part of a citizen's duties but Cogan and Derricott (1998) did point out on the basis of their case studies across the world that the understanding of citizenship may vary in Asia as compared to Europe. Morris and Cogan (2001), for example, while discussing the differences in civic education across six different societies emphasised that Taiwan and Hong Kong's education systems highlight moral responsibility in civic education. So, moral aspects of citizenship and duties in particular are emphasised in various Asian cultures which is noticeable in the views of these young men and women as well.

The interest in moral duties can also be connected to these young people's interest in their close communities. Five participants gave examples of how they had fulfilled their duties practically, giving examples of when they had provided free tuitions to help deserving students, volunteered in the local schools, helped clean the village or university. Various studies also suggest that youth are more connected to their local societies and concerned about duties in their own communities rather than broader political or civic duties (e.g. Lister et al., 2003; Vromen, 2011). Surveys conducted in Pakistan about civic participation of youth (e.g., British Council, 2014; Lall, 2014, Jinnah Institute, 2013) also suggest that moral and social duties are more important to Pakistani youth as compared to duties that require direct involvement in state-run institutions. Thus, the participants seemed to take part in activities which they considered directly relevant to their lives.

Being truthful to their jobs and study was also seen as their duty as citizens. Five participants considered education to be their foremost duty. Since they were students, education was currently the most important job they had. Being at a public-sector, low-fee university they thought it was their duty as a responsible person to fulfil their educational duties. Two thirds of Pakistan's population are people aged between 18 and 29 (as

suggested by Jinnah Institute, 2013) and most of them do not have access to education. In this collectivist culture, these privileged young people who had access to education, considered it a moral duty to fulfil their educational commitments.

These participants did not discuss political duties- only four of them mentioned voting and raising their voice in political matters as their political duty. This resonates with Lall (2014) and British Council's (2013) argument that young people in Pakistan are disillusioned with their political duties. There is however, another possible explanation. These participants had already talked about voting as part of their rights and it may have seemed a repetition to them to talk about political duties. While discussing voting as a political right, when these participants were asked why they had not considered voting, their answer was they did not consider any one worthy of their vote, as suggested by Jamshed. This corresponds with what Lall (2014) says about these young people not performing their duties and considering it a rational choice. However, there were only two participants who had not cast their votes, eleven others had done so- some based on their own choice while others influenced by family (discussed in further detail in previous Section 6.2.2). Therefore, I conclude that these young people do perform their political duties even though they may not have labelled them as duties when asked.

Religious and ethnic duties were not important to these young people. These aspects of duties were mentioned by two participants each and were not considered important by most of these young people. Lall (2014) suggests that Pakistan is fragmented on the basis on religion and ethnicity which suggests that these duties should have been important to these young people. However, as these educated young adults showed in their perceptions of identity as well as duties, being a good human and performing moral duties was more important to them.

Participants believed that civic duties were not being performed in their society. While discussing issues related to duties in society, participants talked about general

unwillingness to perform civic duties, mentioned eight times by five participants- four male, one female. They talked about civic duties such as following traffic laws, holding licenses, paying taxes and bills. They cited incidents to show that many people did not perform their duties well. They also reflected on their own selves and saw that they had become part of the system, and owing to the lack of accountability had not performed their duties well enough themselves. For example, when I asked Subhan why had he not got a driver's license even though he drove a motorbike, he said, "I would, I have never thought about it, it's like a chain (in society)" meaning that since no one does it, everyone just gets into the same trend.

Even though there are various issues related to performance of duties in their society, the considerable realisation that these young people had, is significant. For some of these participants, this realisation was only a result of the questions being asked in the interview like in the case of Subhan as quoted above. For some others, who quoted practical examples of how they had tried to fulfil their duties, this realisation had been there as a result of their education or familial influence. It is also possible that these participants had become sensitive towards social acts as a result of their studying fiction but had not yet reached the point of practical implementation (more on this will be discussed in the light of the novels in the following chapters). These young people were thus, to some extent, aware of their civic duties and in some cases willing to bring some change in practice as well.

Participants argued that there were issues related to environment in their society. Five participants-three male, two female- including three participants who talked about civic duties, talked about the negligence of environmental duties, discussing that keeping the city clean, planting trees or avoiding smoking was not even seen as an individual's duty by many people. This does not correspond with what Zani and Barrett (2012) said about gender divisions across sets of duties. According to them women consider social and

environmental duties more important whereas men consider economic issues more important. In the case of these participants both men and women were interested in a variety of issues. Economic and legal duties however, were not discussed by any of the participants which form an essential part of a citizen's duties as they are students and have not yet experienced legal or economic issues. The participants do, however, understand that their duties will change as their roles change in life. Economic and legal duties may become more important after they acquire full-time jobs.

There was some difference in how male and female participants talked about duties. The female participants expressed environmental duties with reference to their own selves whereas with regard to civic and political duties they expressed them in relation to their male household members as shown in the following excerpt from Rida's interview:

I: Do you drive?

R: No, I am not interested.

I: There are many issues around duties like people talk of rights all the time but duties...(cut off by the participant)

R: And to a great extent, I have seen my brother drive as well. If there is a car in front and behind he would just overtake and go ahead, he would not care of traffic laws, with loud music on which takes most of his concentration.

This corresponds with what Acharya et al. (2010) observed in their study in Maharashtra, India. Women in these societies do not get directly involved in civic action as much as men. This explains the female participants relying on their brothers and fathers for understanding issues in society (more on this in Section 6.4).

To conclude, these young people considered moral duties to be more important than any other forms of duties. Being responsible towards their education was also

considered important. Political duties were not mentioned by many under duties but had been discussed as rights by around two-thirds of the participants. Literature suggested that religious and ethnic duties might be important to these young people, however only a couple of them even mentioned them. The participants were also aware of various issues related to duties in their society. They observed that civic duties were not considered important and were not performed by many around them including themselves. They also showed concern about negligence of environmental duties. Thus, these participants were reasonably aware of various sets of duties and issues related to duties in their society.

6.4 Overarching argument

In the three preceding sub-sections, I presented the arguments in relation to each theme. In this section, I discuss the overarching argument that connects the discussion in previous sections and answers the first research question, “*What do students think identity, rights and duties mean?*” In response to this research question, I argue that these Pakistani undergraduate participants perceived identity, rights and duties in relation to their personal context and their societal norms as well as in line with the some generally accepted aspects of identity, rights and duties. This related more to the Asian concept of citizenship than to the more well-known Western models including Cogan (1998). They talked about political and civic aspects which appear in Cogan but they also talked about moral and religious issues which are closer to the findings of citizenship studies conducted in Asian contexts (e.g., Lee, 2004; Tan, 2007). The issue of caste is particular to South Asia and has not been studied much in light of the literature reviewed.

The arguments presented in the sub-sections all relate to one overarching argument. These Pakistani undergraduate participants looked at identity, rights and duties in relation to their context and their perceptions were influenced by their societal norms. The issues that were important to these participants were not necessarily those that were highlighted

in Cogan's (1998) model of citizenship. These participants talked about political and civic issues which are very important aspects of citizenship elements according to Cogan. They however, also talked about moral, caste and religious aspects of identity, rights and/or duties that are not discussed in Cogan. For example, Cogan considered national identity to be the most important identity to a citizen but to these participants their 'human identity' was more important. The participants defined their human identity from a moral perspective talking about it as an identity that brought every human being together, suggesting that there should be no conflict based on national or regional identities as we all share one human identity. Moreover, four participants identified themselves in terms of their caste identity which has not been discussed in any western models of citizenship. In summary, the participants understood wider issues such as political and civic rights and duties but their understanding of their own citizenship was highly dependent on their own contexts in which moral, caste and religious identity, rights and/or duties were important as well.

The participants' perceptions of citizenship, in terms of their interest in a moral identity and moral duties, can be explained in relation to Asian models of citizenship (see also Lee, 2004). The participants in my sample were very interested in explaining their perceptions from a moral point of view. They discussed identity in terms of a moral perspective as explained in the previous paragraph. The most talked about duties were also moral in nature including respecting elders, being honest, being truthful to their studies, taking care of one's parents. Some researchers have considered familial duties to be separate from moral duties but my participants talked about them together as moral duties. The moral and familial duties have been seen to be considered part of a citizen's duties in Asian cultures. Lee (2004), for example, looks at citizenship from an Asian perspective and argues that familial and collective values form part of citizenship norms in many Asian countries. Western models alone cannot help understand citizenship perceptions in various

contexts. Perceptions of citizenship are contextualised and studies from similar contexts can help understand some aspects more than general western studies.

There were some elements, such as caste, that were specific to the Pakistani society and have not come up in Asian citizenship models. Four of the five female participants in the sample talked about a caste identity as an important aspect of their identity. They also discussed issues related to caste identity in their society highlighting the resistance young people experience from families and society in general when opting for inter-caste marriages. As suggested by Kennedy (2004), citizenship tends to be affected by the societal and cultural norms prevalent in a society. Jamal's (2006) paper on inter-caste marriage and marriage without family approval are issues that have been dealt with in courts of law and form part of the public sphere in the participants' society. The participants' interest in a caste identity when it is not mentioned in western or Asian literature can therefore, be explained in terms of the significance of the participants' society.

Religious rights were discussed by some of the participants. The religious aspect of identity, rights and duties have not been mentioned in Cogan's model of citizenship. Citizenship in European and American contexts is considered to be a secular phenomenon though some religious scholars like Arthur, Gearon and Sears (2010) argue that it is undemocratic to exclude religious ideas from citizenship education. Religion however, appears significant in studies of citizenship in religious countries such as Indonesia (Fearnley-Sander, Muis and Gistituati, 2004) and Malaysia (Tan, 2007). Fearnley et al. (2004) argue that the Indonesian concept of citizenship is based on Islamic conventions. Religious aspects of the themes were expected to be very important to the participants in light of these studies but the participants did not talk much about religion in terms of identifying with it or taking it as a duty. However, they did talk about religion in terms of rights and discussed rights of minority religious groups. Therefore, it is not possible to generalise all Asian societies as Lee (2004) states there is a huge element of diversity in

Asia and citizenship ideals differ from country to country.

The participants also talked about issues that were mentioned in Cogan such as political and civic rights and duties, human rights and ethnic identity issues. These issues are of a more universal nature and apply to all contexts. However, the participants' views were based on examples from their society. For example, to women from the cities, the right to choose in marriage was a basic human right whereas to men from rural backgrounds right to education was the most basic civic right. These examples of rights will differ from society to society. In summary, even in the expression of more universal themes of citizenship, participants' understanding was contextualised.

To conclude, the participants showed an understanding of identity, rights and duties that was based in their context. The citizenship issues that were important to them included themes that have been highlighted in Cogan such as political and civic rights and duties. Their views also included themes such as moral, caste and religious aspects of identity, rights and duties that were not a part of Cogan's model. These views were closer to Asian models of citizenship but could not be completely explained by the Asian models owing to the diversity in the region.

6.5 Conclusion

In this chapter, I presented my arguments regarding participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties. The participants discussed various different aspects of the three themes and a discussion based in literature was presented. These sub-sections were followed by an overarching discussion that presented the overall argument in relation to the first research question.

In relation to identity, I made four arguments: the participants considered a human identity as the most important form of identity; ethnic identity was only important to the

participants in times of conflict; caste identity is important to these participants but it is not mentioned much in literature; and religious identity is not discussed by any of the participants even though it is an important identity issue in Pakistan according to relevant literature.

Several arguments were discussed regarding participants' perceptions of rights. First, the participants discussed human rights as a citizen's rights. Secondly right to choose in relation to marriage was important to the female participants but none of the men discussed it. Thirdly, participants showed a high interest in political rights and voting was considered a collective decision usually taken by older men in the family. Fourthly, participants talked about civic rights which was not expected in the light of literature. Fifthly, participants expressed a concern over religious rights violation of minority religious groups which was not expected in the light of literature. Lastly, the participants talked about inequality of gender rights and on the basis of social class.

Four arguments were presented in relation to participants' perceptions of duties. Firstly, more participants talked about moral duties than any other sets of duties which does not correspond with Cogan (1998). Secondly, the participants did not talk about political issues under duties as much as they discussed them as a right. Thirdly, religious duties were not discussed much by these young men and women. Fourthly, the participants discussed neglect of civic and environmental duties in the society.

The overarching argument stated that the participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties are highly contextualised. The participants talked about civic and political issues that were important in western models of citizenship such as Cogan (1998). However, at the same time they also talked about three other issues morality, religion and caste that are not discussed in the western frameworks. This relates more to the East Asian concept of citizenship which brings morality and religious issues into consideration. The issue of caste is more specific to the South Asian context and therefore, has not been

discussed in Asian literature. This supports the overall argument that participants' perceptions of citizenship were based in and affected by their society.

7. Identifying citizenship themes in the novels

This chapter discusses the findings related to the second sub-research question, ‘*Do students think that identities, rights and duties are included in a sample of set fictional texts?*’ The discussion presented in this chapter is based on the literature discussed in Chapter 3 and the findings presented in Section 5.2. The students were asked if and, if so how, they identified the three themes of identity, rights and duties in the four novels- *A Tale of Two Cities*, *A Passage to India*, *Lord of the Flies* and *The God of Small Things*- in this study. The participants expressed their perceptions in relation to some or all of the novels. Therefore, as the findings (presented in Section 5.2) showed, the number of participants choosing to speak about each novel differs. The sections that follow (7.1-7.4) present participants’ perceptions of identity, rights and duties with reference to each novel. The overarching section (7.5) brings together the analyses presented in all sub-sections with an overarching argument. My overarching argument is that though participants identified citizenship themes in all novels, they discussed the novels contextually close to them more than those whose geographical, social or temporal context was not close to their own. The chapter ends with a summary.

It may be reiterated here that the participants’ views of the novels were not expressed in isolation. They connected their views on identity, rights and duties in the novels with society (which is discussed fully in Chapter 8). They also based their views on their understanding of the themes of identity, rights and duties (discussed in Chapter 6). Thus, the discussion is not meant to imply that there are no links between the three sub-research questions. The findings and discussion are presented in separate chapters (from Chapter 5 to 8) in terms of research questions for better understanding and where necessary connections will be suggested to relevant sections.

7.1 Discussion of participants' exploration of *A Tale of Two*

Cities

A Tale of Two Cities is the first novel to be discussed here. Seventeen participants discussed the three themes of identity, rights and duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*. Identity was discussed by the participants with reference to social and national issues whereas in my analysis of academic literature gender issues were also mentioned besides the two issues cited by the participants. Themes related to rights discussed by participants were negation of human rights, gender rights and inequality of rights among social-classes. However, in the academic literature reviewed the issues discussed were violation of rights due to social class; and the concept of ideal of rights as opposed to practice in the novel. Civic and moral aspects of duties were discussed both in academic literature on *A Tale* as well as in participants' responses. In the following subsections, I discuss the findings (presented in Section 5.2.1) on students' perceptions of identity, rights and duties in relation to this fictional work, in the light of my review of academic literature on the novel (discussed in Section 3.1), individual arguments are detailed in each section.

7.1.1 Identity in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Identity in *A Tale of Two Cities* was discussed by nine participants of whom eight discussed it explicitly and one implicitly (explicit and implicit mentions are discussed in Section 4.8.4). In this section, I present three arguments regarding participants' perceptions of identity in this novel. Firstly, social class identity was important to some participants in relation to the novel though none of the participants talked about social class as an identity issue in their society. Secondly, participants discussed national identity from a different perspective than that discussed in academic literature (such as Bloom, 2007 and Heitzman, 2014). Thirdly, there were some aspects of identity such as gender identity that were

discussed in academic literature related to the novel (e.g. Ayres, 1998) but the participants did not identify them.

Participants identified social class identity in the novel, even though they did not discuss this aspect of identity while discussing their views outside of the novel. The portrayal of a strong social class identity in the novel has been depicted in academic literature on the novel (e.g. Peters, 2013; Schor, 2001). The participants, four male and one female, identified the differences in the privileges enjoyed by the aristocrats as compared to the oppression faced by the poor. Critical discussion by Bloom (2007) as well as textual references (Dickens, 1859/1994 as presented in Section 3.1.1) denote that Dickens portrayed social class identities of aristocrats and the poor in a way that presented a sympathetic picture of the poor being oppressed by the upper-class. When the participants discussed their perceptions of identity in society (in general and not in relation with novels), they talked about different issues in society including national, ethnic and caste identity, not mentioning social class issues at all. This however, does not mean that they had no experience or observations about social class identity in their lives. It can be argued that the novel helped heighten their awareness of social class identity. They would not ordinarily talk about this aspect of identity but looking at it in a novel made it easier for them to talk about it.

The participants saw a clash of national identities in the novel which was a different perspective on national identity from that presented in the academic literature on the novel. In my analysis of academic literature (e.g. Bloom, 2007 and Heitzman, 2014), Dickens is seen as biased towards the representation of French and English national identities. He is argued to have presented English characters in a more positive light than the French characters. The participants, however, talked about national identity in terms of rules about nation-states and borders in the novel. The participants may have focused on the clashes and not the issues presented in literature because they were thinking about the identity

clashes they face in their society (discussed in Section 2.4.2). This is likely since the participants had been talking about issues related to identity in their society earlier in the interviews. Therefore, national identity appeared in the views of the participants as suggested in the light of literature but the perspective taken was different from that of the critics. This is a possible implication for using Rosenblatt and Cogan together- if given a chance to interpret themes of citizenship such as those given by Cogan, participants can infer an understanding of identity that is not based on academic literature but provides an alternative view.

Gender identity appeared significant in light of the academic literature on *A Tale* but the participants did not discuss it. The participants did not identify any gender identity issues in the novel. The characters such as Lucy, Mrs. Defarge, Miss Pross and Mrs. Cruncher have been discussed by feminist critics like Ayres (1998) in light of their strong feminine identity. There were events in the novel that highlight gender identity issues, such as the cases of Mrs. Cruncher who was abused by her husband and Mrs. Defarge's sister who was raped by the Evermonde brothers, but they were not reported by the participants. It is possible that the participants did not look at these gender issues as relevant to identity and connected them more to rights. However, as discussed in Section 7.1.2, they only made implicit mentions of gender when talking about rights. It can also be speculated on the basis of this that the responses were based on an efferent reading and not really an in-depth aesthetic one. Another possible explanation is that the participants living in a patriarchal system expected a gender inequality and that is why they did not identify this as a possible issue (discussed further in Section 7.2.2).

In conclusion, literature suggested three aspects of identity were important in the novel, some of which have been identified by the participants. Social class identity is discussed by some of the participants as suggested by the literature. National identity, however, has been discussed in both literature and participants' responses, but from

different perspectives. Gender identity is discussed in the literature but was not identified by the participants of this study.

7.1.2 Rights in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Fourteen participants talked about rights in the novel. The respondents identified social exploitation and inequality of rights which are also mentioned in critical literature. Gender and legal rights issues were only implicitly mentioned by one or two participants and not discussed in details. These two arguments are further discussed in the following paragraphs.

The participants' perceptions on inequality of rights among different social classes in the novel were similar to the perspective shown in academic literature on the novel. As pointed out by different events in the novel (Dickens, 1859/1994) and by critics (such as Hutter, 1978 and Schor, 2001), exploitation and inequality of rights on the basis of social class is a recurrent theme in the novel and is discussed in critical literature as well. Social class exploitation in the novel was seen by eight participants who talked about events such as the cart of the aristocrat driving over and killing the little boy, the poor girl being raped and the aristocrat brothers escaping punishment. These events were seen as a negation of basic human rights in society by five of the participants. The participants discussed the theme of inequality of rights with reference to characters such as Darnay, Manette, Gaspard's son and events such as the Marquis running over the boy and throwing a coin at his father in exchange. All of these participants felt very strongly about such denial of rights and as will be seen in the next chapter of this thesis they related it strongly to their society.

The participants who identified the theme of negation of rights in the novel were also those who identified such issues in their lives and in their societies. The discussion of rights in relation to *A Tale* relates to what they said about exploitation of rights in their

society (as discussed in Section 6.2.2) and as Rosenblatt (1978/1994) argues the readers' background affects their understanding of the novel. With the exception of two participants, Sonia and Jamshed, all the other eleven participants talked about basic human rights and relevant issues in the society (more on this in Section 7.5).

Apart from the theme of social exploitation, the participants' views did not necessarily concur with what was depicted in academic literature on the novel. The contradiction between the ideals of rights and practice depicted in the background of the French revolution was an important theme related to rights in academic literature (e.g., Stout, 2007; Ferguson, 2005). However, it does not appear in discussion with the participants. This might imply that the participants were not aware of this critical discourse. It is also likely that they did not consider this as a point relevant to the discussion and considered issues relevant to their society to be more relevant to the nature of the project.

There is an overlap between what the participants identified in the novel and how they related it to their lives. These two aspects are dealt with in two different research questions but many of them talk about it simultaneously. Yasir for example said, 'if we talk about *A Tale of Two Cities*, like the aristocratic class exploits lower class we can see that in Sindh.' For the purposes of clarity, I have kept their views on relating novels to their lives and society for discussion in Chapter 8.

In conclusion, the participants identified negation of rights portrayed in the novel which has been pointed out in literature as well. These participants all talked about similar issues when expressing their views on their personal rights and issues in society. They did not however, identify the difference in the ideals of rights during the revolution and the practices followed which was pointed in academic literature.

7.1.3 Duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*

Ten participants identified civic and moral duties within the text. The issues

regarding civic and moral duties were discussed from different perspectives as compared to those in the literature on the novel.

Civic and moral duties were discussed to some extent with reference to the characters from the novel but from different perspectives from those suggested in the literature review (presented in Section 3.1.3). Civic duties were seen as an important theme as identified in the literature review but were discussed by five participants only. The participants talked about dutiful citizens who performed their civic duties such as Mr. Lorry and Dr. Manette. However, they did not seem to agree with my interpretation of the text that the characters who did not perform their duties well were portrayed negatively (as presented in Section 3.1.3). Rather, they argued that the ones who performed their duties were not rewarded well as in the case of Dr. Manette. They also did not identify Darnay as an irresponsible citizen as pointed by Sims (2005).

Four of the participants identified the duties that Mr. Lorry and Dr. Manette performed as moral. The participants' understanding of neglect of moral duties is not similar to that of Orwell (1940) who suggests that education improves a sense of moral duties. The participants identified the social class distinction as the cause of negligence of duties, for example the participants suggested that the Evremonde brothers did not feel morally bound because they knew they would go unpunished because they were aristocrats. The respondents also cited class difference as the cause for negation of civic duties. As Ali put it, 'it is due to class system that, like if the doctor would have gone according to the wishes of the aristocrats then his status would have been different.' So, the participants discussed civic and moral duties as they identified them in the text rather than as they were depicted in academic literature.

The participants who discussed civic and moral duties with reference to this novel were not the same as those who discussed the themes with reference to society. This stands in contradiction to what Rosenblatt argues- personal experiences being the prime source

of students' interpretation of a text. There are however, various explanations to this. Firstly, apart from personal experience there are various other factors, such as time spent reading a novel, classroom discussions, influence of teacher's interpretations, time given in the interview to discussion of personal duties, that affect readers' interpretations. Secondly, it cannot be assumed that since they did not mention civic and moral duties in this interview they did not care about these at all in their lives. As discussed in Section 7.1.1, this might mean that this novel heightened their awareness of citizenship ideas that they might not think about without the help from the novel. Also, as will be discussed in Section 8.1.3, the participants did relate these duties identified in the novel with their life and society even when they had not mentioned that civic and moral duties are important to them while discussing their lives. Thus, the explanation that the novels invoke in them a better understanding of their own experiences is quite likely.

To conclude, the participants identified civic and moral duties in the novel. They discussed the themes in relation to the different characters and events, and did not necessarily showed the same views as those in critical literature on the novel. Their understanding of the two themes in the novel did not necessarily correspond with their views on the two themes with reference to their society.

7.2 Discussion of participants' exploration of *The God of Small Things*

The second novel to be discussed is Arundhati Roy's *The God of Small Things*. The level of interest in *Small Things* was noticeably more than in the other novels. The issues discussed in literature and in participants' responses corresponded to some extent but there were some contradictions as well. Identity was discussed in relation to social-class, gender and postcolonial themes in literature whereas the participants talked about social-class and

religious issues. Rights in relation to the novel were discussed as rights of different social classes, genders and of children in literature whereas in literature rights were discussed in relation to society, religion and gender. Duties in literature were discussed as civic and legal and participants' responses mentioned moral, gender-based as well as civic duties. In the following paragraphs, I discuss the three themes of identity, rights and duties individually as discussed by the participants in relation to this novel.

7.2.1 Identity in *The God of Small Things*

In this section, I present two arguments expanded in the following paragraphs. Firstly, participants talked about caste identity related issues that are depicted in academic literature even though caste is not considered a citizenship issue. Secondly participants did not identify gender or postcolonial identity in the novel though they were discussed in academic literature related to the novel.

Caste was not an important identity issue in terms of a citizen's identity in general, in the literature, but it was important in participants' views and in literature related to this novel. Caste identity issues with reference to the novel were discussed by twelve participants, four discussed caste as a social class issue and eight identified it as a religious identity issue. Even though the character of Velutha in the novel is from both lower class (socioeconomic status) and lower religious caste (religious hierarchical divisions in Hinduism), class and caste do not necessarily correspond with each other.

Cogan (2000) considered nationality and ethnicity as more relevant issues to a citizen's identity as compared to social class and caste identity. My participants saw caste as a religious and social class identity issue to be a relevant aspect of identity in context of *The God of Small Things*. As Heater (1998) pointed out, the definition of citizenship may be considered differently in different contexts. As the context of this novel is India, the issues related to citizenship in the context need to be considered. Article 17 of the Indian

Constitution (National Portal of India, 2016) addresses untouchability and forbids it, as it is a prevalent identity and rights issue in the Indian subcontinent. Even though Cogan may not have considered caste issues as part of citizenship, academic literature on *Small Things* (e.g., Komalesha, 2008; Bose, 1998; Krishnamurthy, 2011) suggests it is a big identity issue in the novel.

Roy presents caste as a deep-rooted issue which the participants realised existed in the society regardless of religious and Marxist ideologies. The participants identified the strong roots of the caste system. The characters, Ammu, Chacko, Mammachi and Pappachi, in the novel are all Christians but being from Hindu descent have a strong inclination towards Hindu caste system. Pakistan is not a Hindu-majority area but Hindus are the largest minority in the Sindh province (as discussed in Section 1.2 and 2.4.2) where this study was based. So, the participants had some background information to the norms of a Hindu society which may be the reason caste identity was an easily identifiable issue in the novel. One of the students, a Muslim, argued that untouchability is presented as such a curse that not even Marxism could save Velutha which corresponds with what Komalesha (2008) suggested as well.

Gender identity, though important in literature, was not talked about as a very distinct issue of identity by the participants. Subhan was the only participant who mentioned gender identity saying “men are shown superior in the novel”. As he did not mention any characters or events specifically, this was counted as an implicit mention. There are two possible explanations for this lack of mention of gender identity. Firstly, as represented in academic literature on the novel (e.g. Komalesha, 2008; Krishnamurthy, 2011) caste issues were much more prominent in the novel and participants have focussed on that aspect of identity in relation to this novel. Secondly gender may have been considered more of a rights issue than identity. This, however, is unlikely as the respondents did not discuss gender rights very explicit in relation to this novel (discussed

further in Section 7.2.2).

Post-colonial identity was not as important to these participants in the postcolonial context as expected in light of my analysis of academic literature on the novel. Critics such as Passos (2003), Friedman (2005), Komalesha (2008) discuss *The God of Small Things* as a postcolonial novel. It is argued by these critics that Roy's style including vocabulary and sentence structures are postcolonial in nature. Moreover, the changing social trends have also been seen as part of a postcolonial identity (Komalesha, 2008). However, these participants in the post-colonial context did not discuss any postcolonial issues while talking about identity in relation to the novel. There may be various possible explanations. Firstly, they did not consider it a part of the project assuming it was about citizenship. However, this is unlikely as some of them had discussed postcolonial issues elsewhere. Secondly, it may be because they had not studied post-colonial theories of literature and were not familiar with the issues as suggested by one of the teachers in his interview. The participants, however, had been taught literary theory and showed some awareness of colonial and postcolonial issue while discussing *A Passage to India*. A third, and the most likely, explanation may be that post-colonialism in literature is more obvious to literary critics whereas to people living in that culture it does not mean much. The participants did not consider themselves "postcolonial" and that may be the reason these participants talked about other issues and not postcolonial identity in relation to the novel. So, the concept of a postcolonial identity appears more important in light of the literature than it was to these young men and women.

To conclude, caste identity with reference to the novel was discussed as a major issue. Connections were made to social class and caste which were supported by academic literature on the novel. Even though literature suggested that gender and post-colonial identity may be significant issues, they did not appear in the discussion with the participants.

7.2.2 Rights in *The God of Small Things*

In this section, I present three arguments regarding participants' perceptions on rights in *Small Things*. Firstly, the participants talked about different rights issues in the same events and characters in the novel. Secondly, unequal rights based on caste were discussed by the participants from a different perspective from that presented in the literature. Thirdly, gender rights appeared important in light of the literature but were not discussed by many participants.

The participants identified negation of rights in relation to Velutha's character from different perspectives. Velutha's rights were talked about very emphatically. Ali's response is a typical one when he said, "was Velutha not a human being why was he put into the jail, without knowing the facts, without a proper investigation ... It was his right that he should have got free and fair, legal way should have been followed". Seven students talked about the negation of rights to Velutha as a social class issue, two considered it a negation of human rights while four others considered it a religious rights issue. Those who related this to the problems of social caste argued that the influence used against Velutha by Ammu's family to be possible due to their superior social class privileges. Two participants, including Ali quoted above, looked at these incidents from the novel as a simple negation of human rights. Those who identified it as a religious identity issue talked about Velutha being regarded as untouchable due to the religious beliefs in the region. These participants considered different reasons of the exploitation of rights.

The discussion of inequality of rights based on caste has been discussed in the academic literature on the novel differently from what the participants talked about. Kumar (2014) for example talks about the "subhuman" attitude towards the untouchable community in the country. The literary critics focus on the purpose of the author in presenting this unjust treatment of the lower caste population. Erwin (2012) calls it an example for other untouchables. Komalesha (2008) believes that Roy is raising a voice

against the atrocities. None of the participants, however, talked about Roy's purpose in depicting this negation of rights as discussed in academic literature (e.g. Kumar 2014; Erwin, 2012). They might not have identified the purpose of the author but their responses show that they were thinking about and discussing rights issues in relation to the novel.

A review of the literature (in Section 3.2.2) suggested that gender rights are important in relation to the novel but only four participants talked about this aspect of rights. Prakash and Sujata (2014), for example, talk about Ammu being denied all legal rights due to being a woman. Alam (2014) talks about the patriarchal oppression depicted in the first two generations of women shown in the novel. Only four participants identified gender rights as a theme in the novel. They talked about the identifiable difference between the rights and privileges enjoyed by the siblings Ammu and Chacko. Only one female participant expressed her views on this theme and none of the others identified the theme.

In the context of Pakistan, with the given situation of gender rights (as discussed in Section 2.4.3), it was expected that there will be more discussion of gender. The presentation of situation of rights by Lall (2009) and Jamal (2006) help understand the disparity of rights between genders. Furthermore, in light of Rosenblatt (1978/1994) arguing that personal experience and observations have an impact on understanding of a work of fiction, it was expected that the young, educated women, in the sample, would identify gender issues.

There may be three possible explanations to this lack of discussion of gender rights. Firstly, caste differences are more obvious and the issues discussed in class may have centred around caste discrimination as suggested during the interview with the lecturer. Secondly, it may be that the gender differences shown in the novel represent extreme cases and were not relevant to the lives of these women being from educated families acquiring higher education themselves. Third, and the most likely, explanation is that there is an acceptance of gender rights differences in these participants. Having grown up in the same

culture, there was a degree of acceptance of the patriarchal system among these students. Kanwal for example (as quoted in Section 5.1.2) while explaining how her parents differentiated between the amount of freedom she and her brother can have, said, “Even though from a social point of view **they are right**”. Thus, even though literature suggests there are gender issues they are not discussed by a majority of the participants.

Negation of rights of children also came up as a relevant issue in literature (e.g. Hopkins, 2011) but did not appear at all in discussion with participants. Critics such as Hopkins talked about Estha being dragged into a court case as a witness as a violation of the child’s rights. None of the participants however, talked about this as a rights’ violation. Academic literature thus discusses some issues that the participants did not see as significant. This may be due to their lack of interest in those subjects, lack of help directing them towards an understanding of those themes or a more obvious interest in others that they have identified.

To conclude, the participants talked about negation of rights as a relevant issue and assigned religion, social class or human rights violation as the cause. Gender rights were discussed by some participants mostly male and not as much as would have been expected in light of the literature.

7.2.3 Duties in The God of Small Things

In this section, I argue that even though duties were discussed only implicitly in literature on the novel, the participants identified civic and moral duties in the events of the novel. Moreover, duties were discussed by men only, with the exception of one female participant. This may be coincidental or it may relate to what literature says about women in South Asia being less involved in civic and social duties. Lastly, gender was expected to be important in relation to my analysis of the context but the participants did not talk about it.

Duties appeared only implicitly in literature on the novel but the participants identified civic and moral duties in the events of the novel. Even though there is not a lot of literature explicitly about duties, there is some mention of negation of duties portrayed in the novel in Friedman (2005) and Krishnamurthy (2011). The text and these references in literature were predictors that some participants might identify civic duties issues in literature. Civic duties were indicated by the participants in relation to the role of the police. The respondents highlighted that the police did not perform its duties as it should.

The participants also discussed moral duties which did not come up in the literature reviewed (in Section 3.2.3). Three of the participants highlighted various events such as Velutha and Ammu were humiliated, Velutha was not helped by Comrade Pillai. They argued that the characters were not as sincere and honest as they should be. There is also some indication of a violation of legal duties in the text of the novel (as suggested in Section 3.2.3) but the participants did not discuss this legal aspect. Thus, even though there is not much explicit literature in relation to duties in the novel, almost half of the student participants identified some duties related references in the novel.

Duties were discussed by eight male participants, one female participants and the lecturer who taught the novel. It is interesting that only one of the female students talked about duties in the novel. Even though there were very few females in the sample but the ratio of eight to one in case of duties is rather low. It can be argued that the issue discussed mostly with reference to the novel was civic duties and the female participants might not have been interested in that (suggested by Acharya et al., 2010), which seems plausible because they had expressed explicit views with reference to identity and rights in the same novel. This is discussed in further detail in the following section.

In light of literature on the novel it was expected that gender-based duties (as well as rights) will be fairly important to these young people. Gender duties were identified by only two participants implicitly. These two, one male and another female, talked about the

difference in the duties of Ammu and Chacko. What was expected of the male was very different from what was expected of the female character in the novel. The literature on the novel brings forth a strong presentation of difference of rights and duties between men and women. Even though this is a strong issue in the novel (as discussed in Section 3.2.2 with reference to rights), the participants did not talk about gender duties or rights as much as was expected. The possible reasons have been discussed in the previous section in relation to rights.

To conclude, duties were discussed in relation to civic and moral issues as expected in the light of my analysis of academic literature. The female participants did not contribute to the discussion of duties. Gender duties were only discussed by two participants even though they were expected to be discussed more in the context.

7.3 Discussion of participants' exploration of *A Passage to*

India

A Passage to India is the next novel to be discussed with reference to participants' responses to identification of themes of identity, rights and duties in the novel (presented in Section 5.2.3) in light of the academic literature and text of the novel (presented in Section 3.3). The participants discussed colonial, national and gender identity issues with reference to the novel from perspectives different from those presented in academic literature. Religious and social-class identity issues discussed in academic literature on *A Passage* were not mentioned by any of the participants. In relation to rights, the participants continued to discuss civic rights in light of colonial and national issues similar to the perspectives presented in my review of academic literature on the novel. Duties, though not discussed much in academic literature, were discussed by the participants with relevance to civic and moral issues in the novel. In the following sections, I discuss issues

raised in relation to each of the themes individually.

7.3.1 Identity in *A Passage to India*

In this section, I argue that the respondents discussed identity issues in the novel from perspectives different than those presented in relevant literature (e.g. Said, 1994; Trilling, 2007). Forster's view on Indian colonisation is discussed as the national and colonial identity issue in academic literature (e.g. Woo, 2008) whereas the participants only discussed the superior colonial identity of the British. Religious identity issues in the novel were not identified by the participants as related to citizenship. The participants referred to the alleged rape of Adela as a gender identity conflict even though literature on the subject suggests it is a colonial dispute.

Participants discussed national and colonial issues that were mentioned in critical literature on the novel from a different perspective. In academic literature (e.g. Said, 1994; Vafa and Zarrinjooee, 2014), the hostile attitude of the British characters towards Indians is taken as Forster's critique of the colonisers. Such a depiction by an English author is seen as Forster's sympathy towards the colonised nation (Trilling, 2007) and his opposition of colonialism and the way the British treated the Indian (Nilsen, 2011; Kuchta, 2003; Friedman, 2005). The participants, however, did not mention the author's intent and identified this as the superiority British presumed due to their national and colonial identity.

The participants believed that the Indians were disliked by the English and that is why they were mistreated. However, literary critics (e.g. Armstrong, 1992; Woo, 2008) argue that the dislike was mutual and Indians did not wish to socialize with the British as much as the British did not. The participating students talked about identity in *A Passage to India* mostly in terms of the hierarchy of power attached with the British national identity in the novel, relating it to the hierarchy of power in society. Some of them

discussed identity in a postcolonial aspect with reference to the novel but it is discussed more explicitly by the teacher than by the students. Thus, participants talked about some identity issues in the novel that appear in academic literature as well but their views on each aspect differed from the ones presented in literature.

Religious identity issues are discussed in academic literature but were not mentioned by any of the participants. Religious identity is a widely discussed issue in literature, critics such as Koponen (2007) argue that Forster prefers Hinduism while others such as Edward Said (1994) argue he prefers Islam in his writings. The participants however, did not identify any religious identity issues in the novel. Rosenblatt's (1982) discussion of efferent and aesthetic reading styles may be relevant here. It is possible that the participants had read this novel only efferently for the purposes of their exams and assignments and not understood the true meaning of the text. This might be true in case of some participants as Ali himself said "I have not read that novel in detail yet" but not all participants can be considered efferent readers, most of them would have read the novel aesthetically. So, I argue that the nature of critical literature on the religious and spiritual issues in the novel shows that Forster's treatment of religion in the novel is more metaphysical and spiritual than citizenship-related. Forster's ideals of this religion and his depiction of religion would not have appeared to the participants as the kind of theme they would talk about in relation to a citizenship related project.

The participants did not discuss social-class identity which is not a very explicitly discussed theme even in literature. It is more highlighted in novels such as *A Tale of Two Cities* and *The God of Small Things* and it is discussed by the participants in relation to those novels. So, not all issues discussed in literature have been important to these participants.

The alleged rape in the novel was seen as a gender identity issue by the participants rather than a colonial identity theme as discussed in the academic literature. The alleged

rape of Adela Quested is discussed by Childs (1999) and Silver (1999). Silver argued that the English women are shown as superior to the Indian women presented in the novel and the rape is argued to be more about the colonial identity of the woman rather than her gender. Gender identity issue was briefly mentioned by three participants. Two of the participants, both male students, took a completely different perspective on the incident. They argued that since she was a female she could blame the man of seducing or raping and that is why everyone believed her and in that context, it is a gender identity issue. The participants did not talk about various colonial elements but referred to it a gender issue. This perspective on gender in a country where women do not have an equal right to education (Lall, 2009) and have to fight in a court of law for their right to marry of their own choice (Jamal, 2006) is quite unexpected. This might imply an unsympathetic attitude of Pakistani men towards women's rights. However, as these were only two instances and there are other participants like Haider (quoted in Section 5.1.2, p. 148) who were very sympathetic and concerned towards women's rights' situation in the country, the implications cannot be generalised. A future research study that looks specifically at young Pakistani men's perceptions on women's rights will be useful in understanding this phenomenon. Moreover, the discussion of the rape as gender issue and not a postcolonial issue might suggest that the respondents' analysis of the novel was not sophisticated enough to grasp various layers of analysis. However, this is merely speculative as I did not test their ability to analyse literary text and do not have data to support this claim.

In conclusion, the participants discussed some of the issues highlighted in the literature review including national, colonial and gender identity issues but from different perspectives from those in the critical literature. Religious identity in the novel was not identified as a citizenship related topic possibly due to the spiritual and metaphysical nature of the religious elements in the novel.

7.3.2 Rights in *A Passage to India*

In this section, I argue that participants' discussion of civic rights was similar to the perspectives presented in most academic literature on the novel. The participants identified inequality of civic rights between the Indians and the English and looked at it as coloniser's oppression of the colonised. The case of English dominating the Indians has been discussed in academic literature with reference to colonial identity (e.g., Said, 1994; Trilling, 2007). Trilling (2007) argues that this depiction of the characters, highlights Forster's sympathetic attitude towards the colonised nation. Geis (2009) has also mentioned this inequality of rights while talking about the reasons of corruption among the Indians. The participants however, did not consider this perspective and sympathised with the Indian characters as they were oppressed by the English. This view is quite similar to that presented by Edward Said (1994) who argues that these two identities could never have merged as they did not understand each other's cultures (quoted in Section 3.3.2).

The participants talked more about civic rights than religious rights. Religious rights were mentioned only implicitly by two participants. As discussed in the previous section, religious issues were important in the novel highlighted in text and in academic literature (such as Koponen, 2007), but they were not talked about by the participants. This may be due to the nature of the discussion of religion in the novel and in academic literature on the novel (discussed in further detail in Section 7.3.1).

To conclude the discussion of rights in *A Passage*, the participants identified civic rights issues in the novel sympathising with the Indian characters. The civic rights were discussed more than other themes which had been discussed in academic literature.

7.3.3 Duties in *A Passage to India*

In this section, I argue that participants' limited (in terms of both quantity and depth) discussion of duties in the novel was expected in light of the literature on the novel.

The importance of Aziz in the limited discussion might imply that they preferred to talk about characters that they could easily relate to.

Duties were discussed very briefly in academic literature (e.g., Geis, 2009; Armstrong, 1992) and as expected the responses level was low as well. Most of the participants did not identify duties in the novel. The limited number of responses to the theme may be due to the implicit discussion of the theme in the novel as suggested by limited discussion of duties in academic literature as well. It is also possible that duties are more obviously highlighted in other novels and were discussed more in relation to those. A third possibility may be that these young adults were more interested in rights and identities than in duties. This supposition is supported by the number of responses received while discussing their perceptions of their own identity, rights and duties (discussed in Chapter 6).

Only four respondents identified civic and moral issues in relation to Aziz's character. Even though there were only four participants, it is interesting that only the character of Aziz was chosen to be talked about. There can be two possible explanations. Firstly, the respondents all Muslim males, found Aziz's character easy to relate as a Muslim character. Other characters such as Heaslop or Fielding may not be easy to interpret. Secondly, it is also possible that this character was highlighted more in the classroom, as Rosenblatt (1938/1970, 1956) argues the classroom discussion and teacher's comments influence a reader's response.

7.4 Discussion of participants' exploration of *Lord of the Flies*

The participants' responses in relation to identifying themes of identity, rights and duties in the novel *Lord of the Flies* (presented in Section 5.2.4) are discussed in this section in light of academic literature and text of the novel (presented in Section 3.4). Identity was discussed in academic literature and in participants' responses in relation to

factors relating to identity formation and gender. Right to free speech and relation between group and individual rights were highlighted in literature whereas participants' response to rights was rather limited and implicit. Civic aspect was the most important duties-related theme in the novel in both academic literature and participants' responses. The theme of rights was the least discussed theme in relation to this novel. Identity and duties which were discussed more than rights, were still discussed by less than half of the participants. The following sub-sections discuss each theme individually.

7.4.1 Identity in *Lord of the Flies*

In this section, I argue that participants' perceptions of identity in the novel are quite different from the perspectives shown in the literature. They expressed their views on developing a new identity and a gender identity which have been discussed in academic literature only briefly. Moreover, the aspect of a universal human identity discussed in academic literature is not mentioned by any of the participants, explained further in the following paragraphs.

The theme of forming an identity, discussed by seven participants, is also mentioned in text and in academic literature (such as Keith, 1984) briefly. The participants talked about how the boys started developing new identities living on a secluded island, dividing themselves into tribes and then developing clashes based on those identities. This theme of identity formation may be important to the participants because of the central nature of the theme in the novel's text and relevant literature, possibly prompted further by discussions within the classroom. However, only two of the participants related to the concept of identity formation in the novel. It is possible that the participants talked about identity formation because they were asked to talk about identity in the novel and they could not relate this idea with the common themes of national, ethnic, religious identity with the novel as such elements do not exist in this work.

The participants' views on gender indicated that there was a possibility to teach gender issues through the novel. Only two participants, one male and the other female, related to the concept of gender identity. As pointed out in Section 3.4.1, there are no female characters in the novel but on the basis of this a point can be made about the depiction of the genders (Saxton, 1996). The male participant argued that Golding seemed to argue that males were superior to females in society. Even though there were not many participants talking about these issues, it is worth considering that the novel can be used to promote these themes if highlighted in the class and during discussion by the teachers as suggested by Rosenblatt (1986).

My analysis of the academic literature on the novel suggests the presence of a universal human identity in the novel. O'Hara (1966) argues that the novel depicts a universal image of human psychology and is not about specific era or nationality. Aleyeva (2004) moreover, argues that it represents the allegorical journey of man. However, none of the participants talked about this as a theme related to identity. There is some mention of novels being universal in nature by a few of the participants but they did not relate this to identity in *Lord of the Flies*. Nine of the student participants talked about a universal human identity when expressing their views on identity issues in their society (discussed in Section 6.1). It was expected that this theme will be discussed in relation to this novel as well. As the participants did talk about other aspects of identity, it is assumed that since they did not find this novel relatable to them they did not agree that it was universal in nature. This assumption is based on a relatively low number of participants (four in total) who related to the novel (findings presented in chapter 5).

To conclude, the participants talked about two themes- identity formation and gender identity- which have also been discussed in the academic literature in relation to the novel. The theme of universal identity, however, was not mentioned by any of the participants even though it was discussed in literature.

7.4.2 Rights in *Lord of the Flies*

Rights were mentioned implicitly by only three respondents even though some literary critics talked about rights in relation to the novel. Even though Wigger (2013) talks about the right to freedom of speech and the text (Golding, 1954/1988) presents the relationship between group rights and individual rights, the participants did not talk about these issues. The three participants, including the teacher, mentioned rights rather implicitly not making any explicit connections to the novel's characters and events. Firstly, it may be because rights are not very explicitly discussed in the novel, as suggested in Section 3.4.2. Secondly, it may be due to the influence of the teacher. As quoted in Section 5.2.4.2, the teacher did not explicitly comment on rights in the interview or in the class, on 'themes in *Lord of the Flies*', that was observed.

7.4.3 Duties in *Lord of the Flies*

In this section, I argue that the participants discussed civic duties more than any other theme in relation to the novel as was expected in the light of academic literature on the novel. The participants discussed the theme of civic duties arguing that it was important for every individual to perform their share of duties as neglect of duties is shown to have drastic effects (Golding, 1954/1988). A similar argument is presented in academic literature by Al-Saidi (2012) and Aleyeva (2004). The participants discussed civic duties more because it is the most evident in the text as well as in the academic literature. It may also have been discussed in the classroom, however no such arguments were observed in the class observed. As there was just one class observation for this novel it cannot be assumed that a discussion was not held in some other classes. However, even though civic duties were discussed more than other themes, they were still discussed by only seven participants. It can be implied that duties were not as important as identity and rights as it is a recurrently less discussed theme in relation to all novels (more on this in Section 7.5).

To conclude, even though duties were not discussed much, participants identified the theme of civic duties in the novel.

7.5 Perceptions of citizenship themes in the novels- an overarching argument

In light of the arguments discussed in individual sections, I discuss some overarching arguments to answer the second research question, “*Do students think that identities, rights and duties are included in a sample of set fictional texts?*” I argue that student respondents thought all the three themes were included in the novels but to different degrees in each novel and in relation to different aspects of each theme. Rights were identified more than identity, and duties were identified the least which relates to what literature says about youth being more interested in rights than in duties (discussed in detail in the following paragraphs). Moreover, participants identified citizenship themes more in *The God of Small Things* that has similar context, and less in *Lord of the Flies*. This suggests the importance of context for these young Pakistani men and women. This relates to what Rosenblatt (1984) says about the readers interpreting literary texts in light of their past experiences. In the light of these arguments and the evidence, I make some suggestions for teaching and research at the end of this section.

Rights were discussed more explicitly than identity and duties in all novels except *Lord of the Flies* (see Table 5.5). The responses in relation to rights were more detailed and explicit mention was made of the events and characters in the novels. The novels (those by Roy, Forster and Dickens) highlight issues of oppression as suggested in Peters (2013) and Schor (2001) among others. This directs readers’ attention towards rights more than towards identity and duties. Moreover, the participants discussed rights more, in relation to their views of rights in society as well. So, rights were generally more thoroughly

discussed by these young people. This relates to Vromen's (2011) argument that young people are more interested in getting rights than performing duties.

Duties were the least discussed theme by the participants in relation to the novels. Duties are not discussed explicitly in academic literature, with the exception of *Lord of the Flies*, apart from some brief mentions such as those discussed in Sections 3.1.3, 3.2.3, 3.3.3. The brief discussion by both participants and in my analysis of academic literature suggests that duties are not a very explicit theme with reference to these novels. It is also possible that due to the way the novels were taught, in the Pakistani context, more attention was paid to other themes such as the colonial theme in *A Passage*, class discrimination in *Small Things* and inequality of rights in *A Tale*. This may be the reason why the participants did not make relevant connections where possible to duties. Many researchers (e.g., Vromen and Collin, 2010; Andolina et al., 2002) argue that interest in civic participation has decreased among the youth in the developed countries. Limited discussion of duties by these young people in Pakistan suggests that this might be the case in the Global South as well.

Duties, though discussed by less than half of the participants, were discussed explicitly and more than rights in relation to *Lord of the Flies*. This may be because duties are more noticeable in this work. Duties are discussed by a small number of participants here as well but it is the other two themes that have been discussed less. Identity and rights were not identified much in relation to this novel which may be because of the implicit nature of the themes in relation to this work or it may be that they had not been discussed much in context of the novel.

The novels that the participants talked about more, were the novels that were closer to them in context and content. Lewis (2000, as discussed in Section 2.3.2) argued that emphasis on reader response might result in over emphasis on readers' personal backgrounds removing attention from the text. However, these participants connected the

text and their own social and personal backgrounds. All of the participants talked about Roy's Indian novel, the discussion was explicit and detailed. *A Passage to India* written in the context of the pre-partition India got the second highest mentions, followed by *A Tale of Two Cities*. *Lord of the Flies* was the least discussed novel of the four, probably because the participants could not understand and identify themes in that different context.

The God of Small Things was the most discussed novel in terms of identification of themes. It was quoted by all of the participants at least once. The discussion was detailed demonstrating the participants' deep interest in the novel. The discussion of rights and identity was much more than those of duties but even duties were discussed by half of the student participants. The participants were interested in the novel and appeared to like the teacher's teaching methods which was a significant facilitating factor in the process as suggested by Rosenblatt (1938/1970). The teacher, herself, was very involved and eager to talk about the novel during her interview. The participants' interest, including the students and the teacher, was helped by the social scene being closer to that of the participants. Rosenblatt (1978/1994) argues that a reader's understanding of a work of fiction can be related to the issues in participants' society and lives. The participants felt the fiction was based on real life and talked about these characters as if they were people from real life, and took life lessons from the novel. As Babar mixed the incidents from the novel with real-life while saying, "like it's shown in *The God of Small Things*, it's our duty to give everyone their due and not mistreat the poor but we are still doing it." Thus, *Small Things* appears more relevant to these participants. There is a possibility that such novels that are closer to the context of the students can be used to teach citizenship values (more on this in recommendations).

While talking about the novel, *A Passage to India*, the participants referred to the fiction as if it were history of colonised India. Another key difference in their discussion of *A Passage to India* as compared to the other novel was they referred to it as 'their'

history. As Imran said, “an image arose that in the era of colonialism, how were our rights seized then, we did not have legal right, we were seen as an inferior in society, which I came to know through Dr. Aziz and Ronny”. This treatment may be because of the context-post-colonial Pakistan. It is also possible that the teacher took more interest in making historical connections. This interest in the novel as piece of personal history proved to be useful in their understanding of national and colonial elements as these were prominent themes in student discussion. Moreover, the participants could develop a possible connection between themselves and the novel by talking about colonial India. This historical connection was their way of understanding the text and helped them talk more about it as compared to novels where there was no such connection.

A Tale of Two Cities was the third most discussed novel. Seventeen participants including the teacher discussed this novel. There were some implicit mentions but the novel was still discussed fairly well. Even though participants did not share the context used in the novel, they identified the themes of national identity, inequality of rights among different social classes and civic duties. The exploitation of rights situation was specifically talked about a lot. Therefore, even when the context is not similar participants can identify themes due to the content.

It was noticed during the interviews that other novels were preferred more as compared to *Lord of the Flies*. The students were not particularly interested in this novel as Dijkstra et al. (1994) argue that the readers’ interest is raised by content or style of a literary work (discussed in Section 2.3.2). So it may be due to the style of the novel, the teacher or the nature of the content. Some of the participants talked about teaching methods related to *The God of Small Things* and *A Passage* being very effective and the novels being discussed well within the classroom so teaching methods may be a relevant factor. Another possible explanation may be that the context presented in the novel was not as relevant as some other novels and therefore the students could not identify themes as easily.

It is also possible that this may be because this was being taught at the time when research was conducted and some of the students admitted not having read the novel in detail. Saeed even expressed his dislike for the novel, “I don’t know how they were blind to give an award to this novel. A six-year-old! This age is not old enough to produce anything! This is fiction I know but still!” Saeed’s response shows a lack of understanding of the novel’s basic metaphor and theme. The same student however, understood the other novels and as discussed in Chapter 8, was able to relate to them. I argue that this is due to a lack of such experience that the reader could identify citizenship themes in the novel, as that is the reason the readers found it easier to interpret the novels from a similar context. This relates to Rosenblatt’s (1938/1970) argument that readers base their interpretations of the text in the context of their own experiences.

It can be argued in light of students’ responses that these novels can all be used to teach themes of citizenship as students do identify the themes in them. The discussion of themes such as gender identity in relation to *Lord of the Flies*, for example indicates that even the least discussed novel of the four can be used for teaching purposes. Wigger (2013) believes *Lord of the Flies* can be used to teach democratic value using reader-response framework. It is worth discussing how far is this true in the context of this study, even though the teachers did not follow a reader-response framework as suggested by Wigger (2013) and Sunderman (1999) (discussed in Section 3.4). The number of participants talking about this work is lower than those talking about other novels. It is possible that this may be true for other contexts but not for undergraduate students in Pakistan. Another explanation may be that since the novel was not taught with a reader-response approach and for any citizenship understanding, that is why it did not serve that purpose. Thus, the novel may be useful in teaching citizenship provided the right framework and focus is kept within the classroom. Therefore, if *Lord of the Flies* is to be used to teach democratic values, it should be used with the right framework and with proper focus as suggested by

Wigger (2013). Other novels can also be used to teach specific themes. The participants took high interest in contextually close novels and this may imply that the context of the novel should be considered by the Board of Studies while selecting the curriculum. Further research needs to be directed towards the right choice of curriculum (more on this in Chapter 9).

7.6 Conclusion

In this chapter, I discussed arguments in relation to each individual theme and novel and then discussed the overarching arguments in the previous section. The participants identified various themes in the novels including national, social class, caste, religious, gender and civic aspects of identity, rights and duties. The participants were able to make sense of the novels by identifying citizenship themes in the novels. The aspects of identity, rights and duties identified differed with each novel corresponding with the content of the fictional work. Social class and caste were explored in relation to *Small Things* and national identity in *Two Cities*. These themes also came up in academic literature. However, there were themes like postcoloniality in *Small Things* or religious identity in *A Passage* that were not discussed by the participants. This may be because other issues such as caste in Roy's novel and national identity in Forster's work appear more significant. Rights and identity were identified more in the novels than duties which was in general the least talked about theme. Moreover, in the overarching section I argued that participants are more likely to identify themes in the novels that are contextually closer to them. *The God of Small Things* was the most discussed novel followed by *A Passage to India* while *Lord of the Flies* was the least discussed novel of the four.

8. Making sense of citizenship themes in the novels

The participants' responses to the third research question "*Do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?*" are discussed in this chapter. The participants relate various aspects of identity, rights and duties in the novel with their experiences and observations. The details relevant to each novel are discussed in sections 8.1-8.4. Following this, I present my discussion of perceptions of factors that facilitated the development of their perceptions of identity, rights and duties in relation to the novels (in Section 8.5). In section 8.6, I bring all the arguments developed in the sub-sections together through overarching arguments. I argue that the participants related more to the novels that were socially close to their own context such as *Small Things* and *A Passage*, which is in agreement with what is suggested by Rosenblatt (1938/1970). It was difficult for the participants to relate the novels with their experiences when the context of the novel was not one that they were familiar with, such as in case of *Lord of the Flies*. I further argue that participants discussed and related to different aspects of identity, rights and duties which were not always the same as those discussed by Cogan (1998). This section includes views of the board members, teachers and students on curriculum choice, teaching methods and any forms of external help. The chapter ends with a summary.

8.1 Making sense of identity, rights and duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*

In this section, I present my arguments in four subsections. The first three subsections discuss arguments about how participants relate to the themes of identity, rights and duties in *A Tale of Two Cities* to their experiences and observations (a more detailed

explanation of the terms relate and identify as used here is given in Section 4.1). These sub-sections are followed by a conclusion which summarises the discussion on this novel.

8.1.1 Identity in *A Tale of Two Cities*

In this section, I discuss an overarching argument that students made sense of identity in *A Tale of Two Cities* based on their personal experiences and observations. This is broadly in line with what was expected from my understanding of Rosenblatt's Reader response theory. The academic literature related to the novel or the views of the lecturer did not necessarily correspond with the views of the participants. There are two arguments about participants relating to identity in *A Tale of Two Cities* that support this overarching argument and they are expanded in the following paragraphs. Firstly, the students related national identity issues in the novel to ethnic identity issues in their society even though ethnic identity did not come up as an issue in my analysis of the academic literature on *A Tale of Two Cities*. Secondly, the student participants did not relate to social class identity issues in the novel even though they appeared important in my analysis of academic literature related to the novel and in the views of the faculty members involved.

The participants were able to relate to the theme of national identity in the novel and contextualise it by making sense of it through ethnic identity issues in their societies. Three of the four participants who identified issues of national identity in the novel related these issues to ethnic identity issues in their lives (see findings in Section 5.3.1.1). Even though ethnic identity did not emerge as part of my analysis of academic literature related to the novel (presented in Section 3.1.1), the participants took the theme of national identity in the novel and contextualised it according to their context. Kanwal, for example, after suggesting that there was a conflict of a national identity among French and English in the novel said she saw a similar conflict among Sindhis and Mahajirs: "I am Sindhi or I belong to the interior part of Sindh. I feel discrimination- not only inter-provincial but inter-cities-

then I realize certain people judge you from your dressing, your status, your family status, and certain people do judge you from Sindhi and Mahajir identity perspective.” These student participants quoted incidents of English and French characters from the novel who were on the other side of the border and were mistreated because of their origin. After identifying this national identity issue in the novel, the participants related it to how the people of one ethnic group were mistreated or alienated when in another province (for example, Shoaib quoted in Section 5.3.1.1). The concept of national identity was related to ethnic identity perhaps because ethnicity was important to these particular participants- they termed being Sindhi and Baloch as an important component of their own identity (according to findings discussed in Section 5.1.1). Ethnic identity was specifically important to these participants as these two ethnic groups, Sindhi and Baloch, consider themselves oppressed in today’s Pakistan as discussed by Joyo (2005) and Kazi (1987, details presented in Section 2.4.2, p. 50).

Participants did not relate their experiences and observations with social-class identity issues in the novel, even though social-class identity was mentioned in academic literature related to the novel and by faculty members. Social class identity issues are an important theme in relation to the novel (Dickens, 1859/1994) and academic literature related to the novel (such as Bloom, 2007; Schor, 2001 and Gurney, 2015). Only one of the student participants (and two faculty members) made a connection between his own life and social-class identity issues in *A Tale of Two Cities*. It is interesting that the faculty members, including the lecturer who taught the novel and one of the board members, related social class identity issues in the novel to real-life situations in the society. The participants however, did not seem to have been influenced by the views of the lecturer. This can be understood on the basis of Rosenblatt’s (1978/1994) reader-response framework- interpretation of a literary work is personal and can be created as a result of personal encounter with the text. Even though Rosenblatt (1938/1970) considered the role

of the teacher as important, she emphasised that each interpretation is individual and based on personal factors. Another possible explanation may be that the participants looked at social-class issues in relation to rights (as discussed in the following section) and not in relation to identity. In summary, the participants did not relate to social class identity issues in the novel even when they appeared important to the lecturer and in academic literature.

Identity issues in *A Tale of Two Cities* are related to real-life events based on what is important to the participants and not based on what is most important in academic literature on the novel. This corresponds to Rosenblatt's idea of personal interpretation by every reader. National identity issues in the novel are related to ethnic identity issues in society and participants do not relate to social-class identity issues in the context of *A Tale*.

8.1.2 Rights in *A Tale of Two Cities*

In this section, I present two arguments about participants relating to rights in *A Tale of Two Cities*. Firstly, the participants connected the issues of social rights exploitation that are represented in the novel with the exploitation of rights in their own society. Secondly, it is argued that the participants' personal views of rights helped them identify and relate to rights as represented in the novels.

The participants identified exploitation of rights in the novel and related it to the exploitation of rights in their own society. As discussed in Section 2.4.3, my analysis of academic literature suggests that there are various problems related to provision of equal rights to all in Pakistani society (e.g. Gine & Mansuri, 2011; Rahman, 2001; Tomasevski, 2006). The participants identified the issue of rights being usurped by aristocrats in the novel and made sense of it by comparing the fictional aristocrats with real-life politicians and feudal lords (as evident in Yasir's quote in Section 5.3.1.2, p. 176). The participants named present day Pakistani politicians and compared them with the negatively portrayed aristocrat, Marquis, in the novel. Similarly, three of the five participants who discussed

negation of human rights made sense of the theme through real life situations explaining how similar things were happening in present day Pakistan. As one of them said, “if we relate the condition of *A Tale of Two Cities* to Sindh then we have the same thing here.” Therefore, the participants were able to relate to the themes in the novel by comparing fictional characters and scenarios to actual people and their experiences in society.

Participants’ perceptions of rights based on their experiences and observations may have helped them make sense of the issues of exploitation of rights in the novel. Exploitation of basic human rights and negation of rights on the basis of caste were the two main issues participants made sense of through the novel along with single mentions of legal and gender rights each. More than half of the participants who identified the exploitation of rights in the novel were able to make sense of the issues through their observations and experiences of exploitation of rights in their own society novel (see also Section 5.2.1.2 and Section 7.1.2). Exploitation of rights in Pakistani society has been discussed widely in academic literature (for example, Tomasevski, 2006; Dean, 2005; Jamal, 2006 and Rahman, 2001 as discussed in Section 2.4.3). The theme of exploitation of rights based on social class has also been discussed in relation to *A Tale of Two Cities* and Dickens (e.g., Schor, 2001 and Tomalin, 2011 as discussed in Section 3.1.2). Since my respondents saw issues related to rights as being based on social class and power positions, the same issues in the novel made sense to them. The issue was important to the participants as it was vividly presented in the novel and was part of their personal lives.

A low number of participants making sense of exploitation of rights in *A Tale of Two Cities* may suggest lack of interest in the novel or a number of efferent readers. Not all of the participants who identified the theme were able to make sense of it through observations and experiences. The theme of exploitation of rights had been discussed in participants’ perceptions of rights in society and in academic literature related to Pakistan and the novel. This may be because the participants were talking about all four novels at

once and made connections to one or two of the other novels and did not consider it important to make connections to each novel. It may also be because these participants considered the other novels to be more immediately relevant to their society than *A Tale of Two Cities* (more on this in Section 8.6). Another possible reason may be that some of the readers who identified the themes in the novel only read the novels for information and were efferent readers as suggested by Rosenblatt (1978/1994) (discussed further in Section 8.1.4). So, the low response rate to making sense of rights through *A Tale of Two Cities* may be due to lack of interest or reading for information only.

My central argument in this section is that participants made sense of themes related to exploitation of rights in the novel based on their own experiences. They might have been assisted in the development of that perspective by the presence of these themes in relevant academic literature and their own experiences. The number of students making sense of rights in *A Tale of Two Cities* through their experiences and observations was lower than those who identified the theme as being there in the novel. This may be because of lack of interest in the novel or lack of an aesthetic reading.

8.1.3 Duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*

In this section, I argue that the participants made sense of civic and moral duty issues in the novel by taking them as lessons to be applied to the real world. I further argue that the participants were able to relate to their observations of civic and moral duties through the novel even when the themes did not appear explicitly in academic literature.

Making sense of civic and moral duties, the participants applied the fictional lessons to their personal lives. The participants talked about the civic duty that Dr. Manette performed by trying to inform the authorities of a crime and the results he met. They related these events from the novel to their observations that people in real-life may not be willing to perform such duties because of being afraid of the consequences. They appeared to have

concluded that present-day Pakistani society was similar to the society presented in the novel and the results of performing a civic duty may turn out to be as negative as were experienced by Dr. Manette. The lecturer commented that the discussion in class often revolved around how the doctor was punished for his honesty and students argued that similar things happened in their society. Regarding the moral duties that are represented in the novel the respondents looked at how Lucy, Miss Pross, Sydney Carton and Mr. Lorry performed moral duties and said it was a lesson teaching them as individuals to perform such duties in real life. Thus, the participants took the issues of duties from the novel and took them as lessons to be implemented in real life.

The participants were able to make sense of duties through the novel even when duties had not come up in the literature about the novel. Duties have not been discussed very explicitly in academic literature about *A Tale of Two Cities* (details in Section 3.1.3). Moreover, in the context of Pakistan, some surveys (e.g., Lall, 2014; British Council, 2013; Jinnah Institute, 2013) suggest that the youth in Pakistan are not active in performing their civic and political duties and are more focussed on volunteering in their local communities or helping with familial duties (duties that correspond with my definition of moral duties; see Section 2.4.4). Of the nine participants who identified civic and moral duties in the novel, six made sense of the theme through real life situations. These were not the same participants who identified civic and moral duties while expressing their duties in general (findings presented in Section 5.1.3). The participants may not have mentioned civic and moral duties when asked in general but when they identified civic and moral duties in the novel, they were able to connect it to their observations as well. In summary, even though there were no strong links to duties in academic literature about *A Tale of Two Cities*, the participants identified civic and moral issues and related them to their own observations of society.

To conclude, the student participants made sense of duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*

by taking the issues presented in the novel as lessons to be applied in life. It has also been argued that the participants were able to make sense of duties in the novel even when there was no explicit literature on the subject and when participants had not talked about civic and moral issues while expressing their perceptions of duties in general.

8.1.4 Conclusion

In the previous sections (8.1.1, 8.1.2 and 8.1.3), the following points were made about students relating to identity, rights and duties in *A Tale of Two Cities*. The student participants made sense of national identity in the novel by relating the theme to ethnic identity issues in their society. Social class identity was not related to much even though it appeared in literature. The exploitation of social and civic rights in the novel were related to the exploitation of rights in society. These views about rights in the novel were affected by their views of rights in general. The participants were able to relate to civic and moral duties in the novel even when the themes did not appear in the literature on the novel. The civic and moral duties in the novel were made sense of by taking these themes as lessons for real life.

8.2 Making sense of identity, rights and duties in *The God of Small Things*

In this section, I discuss my arguments about participants relating their experiences and observations to the themes of identity, rights and duties presented in *The God of Small Things*. The following section (Section 8.2.1-8.2.3) present arguments about participants' perceptions on each of the themes. The section ends with a summary.

8.2.1 Identity in *The God of Small Things*

In this section, I present three arguments about participants relating to identity in

The God of Small Things, which are expanded in the following paragraphs. Firstly, I argue that student participants related the identity issues in the novel with caste and religious identity in their society. Secondly, participants related their experiences and observations to the themes that were important in their context. Thirdly, they did not relate to the theme of a postcolonial identity which is mentioned specifically in the literature on this novel, as discussed below.

The participants identified caste and religious identity issues in the novel and related them to the caste-based and religious discrimination in Pakistan. Some of the participants identified religious issues in the lives of characters such as Velutha and Ammu and related the incidents in the novel with religious issues in their own society. On the other hand, other respondents looked at the same issues as caste-based and related the incidents in the novel to caste identity in their own country. Three participants identified Indian religious caste identities in the novel and made sense of them through the family-based caste system in Pakistan. They said the caste hierarchy presented in the novel was similar to what was seen in their society. Verkaaik (2001) wrote about Muslims disliking and abandoning the Indian caste-system at the time of partition of Pakistan from India (discussed in Section 2.4.2). Even though the Hindu castes were to some extent abandoned at the time of the partition, these participants believed that discrimination on the basis of caste, similar to what is shown in *The God of Small Things*, is experienced in present-day Pakistan. The participants did, however say that the problem of caste discrimination in Pakistan was not as severe as that in India.

The participants who identified the mistreatment of Velutha in the novel as a religious identity issue made sense of it through religious issues in the Pakistani society (as discussed by Gayer, 2008; Siddiqui, 2015; Leirvik, 2008; for details see Section 2.4.2). One of the participants talked about the identity of religious minorities in Pakistan saying the issues made more sense to him after reading the novel. Another participant made sense

of the caste issues in the novel through the disputes within different sects of Islam comparing the Muslim sects with Hindu castes. Thus, participants identified identity issues and made sense of them through social class or religious issues in their own society.

The novel *The God of Small Things* helped the participants relate their experiences to those themes in the novel that were important issues in their context. The participants who related the caste system in India with caste based discrimination in Pakistan were the participants who had mentioned their own caste in their introductions and elsewhere in their interviews, not necessarily as an element of their identities. One of them, Nazia, said explicitly that it was important to be from a 'good' caste as people respect you in society for that. One other participant, Jamshed, while introducing himself told the meaning of his caste and added that in his area his caste was considered superior to others. He also, later in his interview, compared the situation with that presented in the novel. Even though family name and caste are not seen as citizenship identity by Cogan (1998), the participants considered them important in their context and made sense of the issues related to caste in their society through the novel. The participants, Imran and Yasir, who made sense of religious issues in Pakistan through the novel had not talked about religion in relation to their own identity. However, as shown in the literature review (e.g. Siddiq, 2010; Hassan, 2015 discussed in Section 2.4.2) religious and sectarian identity issues are important in the context. In summary, participants were able to make sense of those themes in the novel which were important in their society.

The participants did not relate to a postcolonial identity through the novel even though some of the academic literature about the novel explicitly mentions postcolonial identity. My analysis of the academic literature suggests that Roy has used many postcolonial elements in her novel. For example, Sohn (2013), Rajeev (2011), and Nandi (2010) argue that use of Malayalam words in an English novel is her way of expressing her postcoloniality- a way of personalising and owning the language (Malayalam is not

spoken or understood in Pakistan). Moreover, Komalesha (2008) argues that Roy presents the decadent Anglophile family and the new generation's love of America instead of England like the previous generation which is also a postcolonial element. However, these participants did not relate to these aspects of the novel and did not discuss a postcolonial identity in relation to the novel. It may be because a postcolonial identity did not affect them as identity issues related to caste and religion. Therefore, participants did not consider a postcolonial identity when relating to identity in *The God of Small Things*.

To conclude, the participants were able to relate the theme of identity in the novel to caste and religious identity issues in their society. The novel helped them make sense of themes that were important in their society. Even though the literature suggested postcolonial identity was important, the participants did not relate to that as the other issues were more relatable in their context.

8.2.2 Rights in *The God of Small Things*

In this section, I present two arguments about participants relating to rights in *The God of Small Things*. Firstly, I argue that the participants made sense of social class issues in the novel by relating them to inequality of rights in society through specific experiences from their lives. Secondly, participants made sense of gender rights in the novel through the issue of women's right to marry of choice in their society and not in relation to other gender issues discussed in the literature.

Issues related to social inequality of rights in society were related to the inequality of rights based on social class in the novel. Issues related to inequality of rights were identified by seven participants (discussed in Section 7.2.2) and all of these participants made sense of these fictional incidents through real life experiences saying the novel had increased their awareness (findings presented in Section 5.3.2.2). Even though rights of different social classes did not come up as a prominent theme in the literature reviewed in

the context of Pakistan (discussed in Section 2.4.3), Hyat (2013) and Ebrahim (2015) talked about segregation and inequality based on social class in the country. These participants quoted examples of times when people from a lower social-class had been mistreated in their presence. They further quoted incidents where they themselves had been treated differently due to their social-class status. Such direct relevance may have been possible because the novel was about a society culturally very close to their own. Thus, the participants were able to make direct connections to daily-life events from their own experience and not just make sense through observations of society in general.

Participants made sense of gender issues by relating it to women's right to marry of their own choice in their society. The participants did not relate gender rights issues in the novel to any other issues in Pakistani society. Gender rights issues in relation to the character of Ammu were identified in the novel by four participants (findings presented in Section 5.2.2.2). Four participants, including two who saw the theme in the novel related it to the rights of females in their society (findings presented in Section 5.3.2.2). They connected the issue presented in the novel to women's right to marry of choice. The right to choice in marriage appeared as a theme in the literature reviewed in the context of Pakistan. Jamal (2006) for example presented the case of Saima whose father filed a custody against her when she married against his consent. Even though she won the case, the remarks of the members of the jury suggest the intolerance to women marrying without family's consent. These participants, including both male and female participants, argued that the case of Ammu was similar to what happened to women in present day Pakistan. The women participants compared their own condition with Ammu when she chose to marry of her own choice and was rebuked for it. The male participants related Ammu's life to their female family members. The participants related to gender rights in *Small Things* on a personal level.

The participants did not make sense of any other gender rights mentioned in

academic literature on the novel and on Pakistan. Literature on gender issues in Pakistan refers to access in education (Lall, 2009), empowerment through higher education (Malik & Courtney, 2011), impact of religious laws on situation of women's rights (Shah, 2006; Hassan, 2002). Moreover, other issues related to gender were discussed in academic literature related to the novel such as legal rights of Ammu and Chacko (Prakash & Sujata, 2014) or patriarchal oppression by men in a family (Alam, 2014) but the participants did not choose to talk about these issues. It may be argued that the level of sophistication in the reading may be responsible for the overlook. However, a more likely explanation may be that the participants chose to speak about right to marry of choice as it was a much more visible issue to them and they might not have come across legal and other gender rights issues in their experience.

To conclude, the participants made sense of social issues through specific personal experiences. Gender rights issues in the novel were discussed only in light of women's right to marry of choice while other issues related to gender rights in their society or in academic literature were not discussed.

8.2.3 Duties in *The God of Small Things*

In this section, I present two arguments regarding participants relating to duties in *The God of Small Things*. Firstly, the participants made sense of civic duties in the novel by relating their observations of the police in Pakistan to the policeman in the novel. Secondly, the participants made sense of moral and gender-based duties in the novel even though they are not explicitly mentioned in the literature.

I argue that students related to civic duties, even though they were only implicitly mentioned in literature because the corrupt policemen shown in *The God of Small Things* were a regular sight in their own society. The four participants, including the lecturer who taught the novel, made sense of civic duties in the novel through real life events. They

talked about the policeman who misbehaved with Ammu in the novel and did not perform his duties and related this fictional incident to the experiences they had had with the police. The participants shared instances when they had been harassed by the police for bribe money. Furthermore, two of these participants also connected the performance of these duties with the class system as suggested by Krishnamurthy (2011, as discussed in Section 3.2.3). They suggested that the policemen would perform their duties only if influential, rich people were involved and the situation was the same as that presented in the novel. The students were able to easily relate to this discourse because as suggested in their comments as well as in those of their teacher the situation, in relation to the police portrayed in the novel, is more or less the same in their own society.

Even though there is almost no explicit literature on moral and gender-based duties in the novel, most of the participants who identified the themes were able to make sense of them through their experiences. Two of the three students who identified moral duties made sense of them through real life situations. They talked about Velutha and how he was mistreated by everyone including Comrade Pillai who should have protected him. They then related to how people were mistreated in society and the situations in the novel were compared to daily life events. Similarly, the two students who identified the theme made sense of gender-based duties in the novel through their experiences. They talked about how it was assumed that Ammu would have different duties from what Chacko, her brother, had. They compared the situation with their own, in case of Kanwal, and to female family members in case of Haider. In summary, even though literature on duties in *The God of Small Things* (as discussed in Section 3.2.3) had no explicit mention of moral or gender-based duties, the participants were able to make connections of the issues in the novel to their everyday experiences.

To conclude, the situation of police in their society enabled these young people to easily relate to the concept of civic duties in the novel. Moreover, they were able to make

connections between moral and gender based duties in the novel with their daily lives even when there was almost no mention of these issues in academic literature related to the novel.

8.2.4 Conclusion

In the previous sections (8.2.1, 8.2.2 and 8.2.3), the following points were made about students relating to identity, rights and duties in *The God of Small Things*. The participants related caste identity in the novel with caste and religious identity issues in their society. Furthermore, the participants related only to the themes that were important in their context and not to themes such as postcolonial identity which were discussed in literature about the novel. In relation to rights, I argued that the participants related their personal experiences with rights of different classes presented in the novel. Moreover, gender rights issues in the novel were related to the issue of right to choice while marrying in the society. Regarding duties in the novel, I argued that, firstly, the participants related the concept of civic duties in the novel to the police in their society. Secondly, the participants talked about moral and gender issues even though they were not explicitly mentioned in the literature.

8.3 Making sense of identity, rights and duties through A

Passage to India

In this section, I present arguments about participants relating their experiences and observations to the themes of identity, rights and duties presented in *A Passage to India* in individual sections followed by a summary.

8.3.1 Identity in *A Passage to India*

In this section, I argue that the participants made sense of the identity issues in the

novel based on personal experience rather than relating to issues mentioned in academic literature or those expected by the teachers. I present three arguments to support this overall argument, which are expanded in the following paragraphs. Firstly, even though my analysis of academic literature (see Section 3.3.1), has shown many different sets of identities in *A Passage to India*, the participants only discussed colonial and national identity issues possibly due to the historical relevance. Secondly, teachers had a different perception of students' manner of relating to a colonial identity as compared to what the students said. The teachers perceived that postcolonial connections would be made by the students but the students only compared the situation of the Muslim characters with their own conditions. Thirdly, student participants were able to contextualise their understanding of national identity in the novel by making sense of it through social class identity issues in their society.

The participants discussed only colonial and national identity issues when making sense of identity in *A Passage to India*. They did not relate to religious and social-class themes in relation to this novel. The academic literature (discussed in Section 3.3.1) includes consideration of other issues such as religion (for example Singh, 1985; Koponen, 2007) and social-class (e.g., Davidis, 1999) as important identity issues in the novel. This does not however, mean that religion, social-class or gender issues are not important or less important to the participants in general. Religious and social-class identity were discussed in relation to other novels. It is possible that participants chose to discuss national and colonial issues as they are more obvious in relation to *A Passage to India*. Moreover, it is also possible that the participants chose to discuss national and colonial identity as these issues are historically relevant in the context. In summary, the participants did not necessarily relate to all the themes discussed in the text and academic literature relevant to the novel.

The views of the students differed from the teachers' views regarding colonial

identity. The teachers suggested that during classroom discussions the colonial identity issues in the novel were connected to the postcolonial identity issues in the present society. However, the four students who talked about it only referred to the Muslim characters and compared the characters' situation with their own. The four students who talked about postcolonial identity said that this novel made them connect to the pre-partition Muslims. Like Imran put it, "*A Passage to India* gave me an identity, in a way that what was I before and what am I now" (complete quote in Findings presented in Section 5.3.3.1). They compared the situation of Muslims as presented in the novel with their current situation. They showed a mixed opinion on whether the past "colonial" identity of Muslims in the subcontinent was better or the present postcolonial one. The teachers however, suggested that the students would relate the colonial identity issues presented in the novel with the post-colonial identity issues. They suggested that the presence of the English language as the remains of the colonial identity was discussed in class. However, none of the participants mentioned such postcolonial issues in relation to this novel. In summary, the staff members had a different idea of how the students related to the colonial identity issues in *A Passage to India* as compared to what the students thought.

The participants contextualised their understanding of national identity issues in the novel by comparing them to social class identity issues in society. The five student participants who identified national identity issues in the novel compared them with social class identity in their society. They saw national identity of Britain and India as a hierarchical power identity. The British characters were seen as the power holders who ruled the Indians, who had limited power. This 'power hierarchy' was then compared, by the student respondents, to the power control between the upper and lower class in the country. As Yasir put it, "British and India have this power identity, in Pakistan there is the same problem of lower and upper class" (more quotes presented in Section 5.3.3.1). This also connects to what was said by Said (1994 as discussed in literature review Section

3.3.1) regarding the two national identities being unable to merge together. So, national identity in the novel was made sense of by relating it to social class identity in society.

To conclude, the participants related more to the issues that were contextually close to them rather than those mentioned in academic literature or those expected by the teachers. For example, they talked about colonial and national identity issues more than religious, social-class or gender identity issues discussed in academic literature on the novel. Furthermore, the teachers perceived that they would relate national identity with postcolonial issues however, they did not make such connections. They contextualised their understanding of national identity by relating it to social class identity.

8.3.2 Rights in *A Passage to India*

In this section, I discuss two arguments about students relating to rights in Forster's novel. Firstly, participants identified civic rights in the novel and related this aspect of rights to different aspects of rights in society. Secondly, religious rights were not discussed as explicitly as expected in light of the academic literature.

The participants who related to civic rights in the novel made sense of this theme through different perspectives. Some of the participants related it to oppression in society while other made a temporal, postcolonial connection talking about the Indian characters as their pre-partition counterparts. Three of the participants made sense of the lack of civic rights for Indian characters in the novel through the oppression faced by them in society. They talked about institutionalised oppression giving examples of how politicians or policemen snatch the rights of the common people. One of the participants also compared the situation of rights between Indian and English characters in the novel with the situation of rights between the upper and lower class in society. One example quote is "when you will go to a Minister's house or a landlord's house then you will be made to sit in a different room. Their social class would be sitting in a different room altogether; you will be sitting

in a different room like the local people.” Three other participants made sense of the clash of rights between the two nations in a postcolonial context. They compared the situation of rights the characters had at that time with the rights they have now. As Imran put it, “now if we look post-partition that what rights do we have now, no doubt we have freedom, and we exercise it. In Britain, in terms of religion and freedom of expression we didn’t have rights.”

Religious rights were mentioned and related to implicitly, by only a couple of participants. The academic literature related to the novel discussed religious identity in relation to the characters of the novel (see Section 3.3.1) but religious rights had not been explicitly mentioned (as discussed in Section 3.3.2). The participants however, did not relate much to religious issues in this novel. As discussed in Section 8.3.1, this does not mean that the religious issues are not important to the participants. Many of the participants considered issues of religious identity and rights as important issues in their society (discussed in Section 6.2.1 and 6.2.2). It can then be concluded that the participants found religious rights connections easier to relate in the context of other novels such as *The God of Small Things*.

8.3.3 Duties in *A Passage to India*

Duties were not discussed by participants as an important theme in relation to *A Passage to India*. There were only two participants who related to duties in *A Passage to India*. Four participants identified the theme of duties in *A Passage to India* (findings in Section 5.2.3.3). As discussed in Section 7.3.4, duties were the least discussed theme in relation to *A Passage to India*. As most of the participants did not see it as a relevant theme in the novel, they did not make sense of it by relating it to any daily life experiences or observations. This may be because duties are not a prominent theme in the novel as is suggested by the literature reviewed related to the novel (Section 3.3.3). It may also be

because national and colonial identity and rights issues are more important in relation to this novel. In conclusion, the participants did not relate much to duties in the novel *A Passage to India*.

8.3.4 Conclusion

I presented three arguments regarding identity in the novel. Firstly, participants made sense of identity issues in the novel by relating it to personal experience. These were not necessarily the same views as those presented in some of the academic literature or those expressed by the teachers. Secondly, the participants discussed postcolonial and colonial identity more than gender and religion when relating to identity in the novel. Thirdly, teachers' views on relating to a colonial identity differed from the readers' perceptions. The student participants were able to contextualise their understanding of national identity in the novel by making sense of it through social class identity issues in their society. Two arguments regarding rights in this novel were presented in Section 8.3.2: firstly, participants identified civic rights issue in the novel and related it to different aspects of rights in society; secondly, religious rights were not discussed as explicitly as expected in light of the academic literature. Duties were not discussed by participants as an important theme in relation to *A Passage to India*.

8.4 Making sense of identity, rights and duties through *Lord of the Flies*

In this section, I argue that even though the novel has many themes related to identity, rights and duties, these participants did not relate to any of them. I support this main argument by individual arguments about the three themes in each of the following sections. I end this section with a summary.

8.4.1 Identity in *Lord of the Flies*

In this section, I argue that even though there were only a couple of participants making connections to gender identity in the novel, it suggested the theme can be potentially taught through the novel. Moreover, the participants made connections to the novel regardless of what is suggested in the academic literature.

Gender identity in *Lord of the Flies* was made sense of by relating the situation to their lives. Two participants commented that the absence of any female characters in Golding's novel means something in terms of society in general (findings presented in Section 5.3.4.1). As Shoaib put it, "all characters are male that means the male gender is more dominant." This theme was not discussed by the lecturer. Gender identity is briefly mentioned in the academic literature related to the novel (as discussed in Section 3.4.1). Ellis (2009) suggested that the absence of gender identity issues can be used to teach about the theme in the classroom. The discussion of the theme by a couple of participants suggests that there is potential for this theme to be explored in the context of these undergraduate students as well.

The participants did not necessarily observe all the issues in literature as relevant to their lives. A universal human identity in *Lord of the Flies* was a common theme in the academic literature related to the novel (see Section 3.4.1). Bloom (2008) and Aleyeva (2004) discussed that the novel talks about a universal identity. However, the participants in this study did not make any connections to this issue. Even though the participants mentioned a human identity as an important component of their own identities (discussed in Section 6.2.1), they did not relate these views with the novel. The participants, in summary, chose to discuss the themes they saw relevant to their lives regardless of their presence in academic literature.

In conclusion, participants relating to the gender identity issues showed that the

novel can be used to teach certain themes. Additionally, the participants only related to themes that were relevant to their lives and not necessarily those mentioned in academic literature.

8.4.2 Rights in *Lord of the Flies*

There was only one participant who made any connection between rights in the novel and their experiences and observations. This participant was the lecturer who taught the novel and the connections made were rather implicit. Rights in relation to this novel were not a significant theme in relevant literature (as suggested in Section 3.4.2). The only rights related issue mentioned in relevant academic literature was about the right to free speech (Wigger, 2013). Most of the participants did not identify rights issues in the novel (findings presented in Section 5.2.4.2). As discussed in Section 7.4.2, it may be due to the implicit nature of the theme in this novel or because rights-related issues are discussed more explicitly in other novels.

8.4.3. Duties in *Lord of the Flies*

In this section, I argue that the novel helped some of the participants make sense of civic duties. Six participants related the concept of civic duties in *Lord of the Flies* to their experiences and observations (findings presented in Section 5.3.4.3). They emphasised the importance of performing civic duties by quoting incidents from the novel. For example, Sonia said, “it was duties which caused a big disaster because it is not just a story, it tells us that if you get a chance to develop society and then you get certain duties which you do not perform then you will destroy that society, you won’t be able to build it.” Duties with reference to *Lord of the Flies* have also been discussed in academic literature related to the novel (see also Section 3.4.3). Rahman (2014) talked about Golding’s emphasis on neglect of duties and Al-Saidi (2012) also discussed the issue of keeping the fire going. So, the issue of civic duties was discussed in literature as well as in participants’ responses. This

implies that even though the novel was not taught with the purpose of teaching citizenship, the fictional work helped readers understand and relate to certain citizenship themes. Novels can therefore, be used to teach citizenship themes such as civic duties.

8.4.4 Conclusion

The number of students relating identity, rights and duties in *Lord of the Flies* with their experiences and observation was very low. However, the fact that some of them related to this novel implies that the novel can potentially be used to teach citizenship themes (more on this in Section 8.6). In relation to identity, I argue that participants connect to the novel regardless of what is suggested in some of the academic literature on the novel. Moreover, two of the participants suggested that they could relate to gender identity in the novel which implies that the novel can be used to teach about gender identity issues in the context. Rights were not discussed in relation to *Lord of the Flies*. Moreover, participants related the concept of civic duties in the novel with their society.

8.5 Facilitating factors

This section helps answer the second part, “how are they helped to do so”, of the third sub-research question, “*How do students make sense of identities, rights and duties through these fictional set texts and how are they helped to do so?*” I argue that three factors- curriculum choice, teaching methods and discussions outside the classroom- affected how participants developed their perceptions of identity, rights and duties in the novel. As the study was not on pedagogical issues or curriculum and I did not have the data about teaching and curriculum design, I have only looked into this aspect as a facilitating factors and not included academic debates related to teaching methods or curriculum design.

Participants believed that the choice of the curriculum, specific novels included,

affected the extent of understanding of citizenship themes. Most participants commented on the usefulness of their current curriculum and said how helpful or unhelpful it had been in the process of their understanding of the themes of identity, rights and duties (findings presented in Section 5.4). The participants, including students and staff members, believed that the choice of the curriculum affected students' understanding of the themes as some novels might be more suitable for them to discuss the themes than others. Participants' views towards the helpfulness of the same curriculum differed. Fifteen participants' comments on whether this curriculum was helpful or not helped ascertain that they did consider curriculum to be an important facilitating factor.

Even though Rosenblatt (1982, 1978/1994) did not mention curriculum choice as a facilitating or affecting factor in reader's response, others such as Stotsky (1999) and Cox (1991) suggested that different novels have a different effect on the readers (as discussed in Section 2.2.3). Stotsky (1999) believes that teaching a novel may have a negative effect on some readers and multicultural and multi-ethnic texts should be carefully selected when designing the curriculum. As would be expected in light of the discussion in the previous section, the respondents liked inclusion of novels that they could relate to, based on their context. *The God of Small Things* was the most talked about novel and the participants liked the inclusion of the novel in the curriculum. Novels such as *Lord of the Flies* were not generally liked. However, as depicted in the study by Crocco (2005) on the impact of teaching the novel *Shabanu*, different respondents react differently to the same text and the teaching methods need to be adapted to suit the needs of all learners. As this was not the only factors they considered important, I am not recommending including only contextually relevant novels in the curriculum (more on recommendations and implications in the next section and in Chapter 9).

The second facilitating factor, classroom discussions, was considered an important facilitating factors by the participants. As presented in the findings (Section 5.4.2), twenty-

two participants talked about discussion of themes in the class making connections between the discussions and their understanding of the themes. Most of the student participants considered classroom discussions to be a useful teaching tool and an important facilitating factor. As, Waleed said, “when you are in class, you gain something (from the discussions)”. Moreover, the role of the teacher had been emphasised and mentioned time and again throughout the interviews by these participants. Rosenblatt (1938/1970) put great emphasis on the role of the teacher and exchange of ideas (as discussed in Section 2.3.2.2). Crocco (2005) shows by example how teaching methods and classroom discussion can change the effect of novels on citizenship perceptions of learners. Connell (2000) suggests teaching through Rosenblatt’s transactional theory to encourage discussion of personal experiences as that will enrich their aesthetic experience. Sunderman (1999) shows through example how using a reader-response framework can arouse readers’ interest in *Lord of the Flies*. Moreover, Martin et al. (2012), Elbers (1996) and Spurgeon (1994) present action studies where the researcher has acted as a teacher and helped learners understand citizenship concepts. These studies emphasise the importance of a teacher in participants’ understanding of citizenship themes. In summary, teaching methods were considered an important facilitating tool in understanding of the themes.

Though all participants agreed that classroom discussion were useful for them to understand citizenship themes in the novel, the amount of facilitation needed in the classroom differed from participant to participant. The teachers seemed to think that the help provided in the classroom, in terms of teacher input and classroom discussions, was enough and the learners understood the themes well and participated in the classroom. However, not all participants expressed a similar level of understanding. The responses participants had towards the discussion of themes in the class were also varied. As shown in Table 5.30 (in Section 5.4.2), eleven participants thought that the discussion in their classroom had been explicit which helped them understand the themes. Other participants

however did not think the themes were discussed so much, some considered the discussion rather implicit while others said there was no discussion specific to the themes, specifically in the context of duties. Since the students were in the same class, taught the same novels by the same teachers at the same time, this difference in their views suggests that the level of facilitation needed by each student differed considerably. For the discussion to be helpful in the understanding of the themes of identity, rights and duties in the novels some participants needed more while others were okay with the extent of discussion held.

I further argue that dialogues related to the themes of identity, rights and duties outside the class were also beneficial for the participants who engaged in such discussions. While discussing facilitating factors participants talked about a variety of external sources that had helped them develop an understanding of the themes through the novels. Six participants talked about help outside the classroom such as external seminars, youth conferences, discussions with seniors or colleagues from other departments. These were experiences that become part of participants' experiences. This can be related to Rosenblatt's (1969) argument that learner's base their interpretations of fiction on their experience. The learner is not 'a blank tape' (p. 34 as quoted in Section 2.3.2.1) and everything in their experience forms a part of how they interpret the literature they read. In summary, help from outside the class was also a facilitating factor in participants' understanding of the themes in fiction.

So, I argue that various factors including choice of the novels, classroom discussions and any external help can facilitate participants' understanding of identity, rights and duties through the novels. Classroom discussions and role of the teacher were greatly important to these participants. This implies that rather than teaching a different set of novels, teachers could include more discussion around novels that are not contextually relevant. Moreover, teachers should encourage peer discussions outside the classroom to ensure better understanding of the novels.

8.6 Overarching argument

In this section, I argue that the participants related to the citizenship themes in the novels more when the novels were contextually closer to the participants' own context. *The God of Small Things* and *A Passage to India* were discussed and related to more than *A Tale of Two Cities* and *Lord of the Flies*. Moreover, the themes discussed by the participants were not necessarily those discussed by Cogan but varied according to participants' background and experiences.

The response rate to the novel *The God of Small Things* was the highest among all four novels. The length of the discussion and the level of interest in this novel were much greater than the other novels. As this was the only novel from a contemporary time and with a closer geographical location than the three others, it can be inferred that the context of the novel- the one in the story and the one in which it was written- was important for these readers. It is easier for the readers, at least in the case of my participants, to relate to a fictional work that is closer to them. All of the participants showed interest in this Indian novel by talking about it with explicit mentions of characters and events in the novel. The novel being the only one from a South Asian context was contextually and conceptually close for the participants. The participants could easily relate the incidents in the novel with incidents from personal experiences. The cases of corrupt policemen, incidents of opposition to inter-caste marriages (cited by Jamal, 2006), social class exploitation (as suggested in Hyat, 2013) are phenomena that are common in the Pakistani context. The presence of these themes in the novel helped the participants understand and relate to the novel.

Rosenblatt (1969) and Iser (1978) argue that the readers' community background plays a role in how they interpret a work. The discussion of similar contextual events in the novel made it easier for the participants to relate to the novel. The two-way transaction

that Rosenblatt (1938/1970) proposes, occurs, during the reading process, when the participants have experiences to base their interpretations on. In the case of this novel by Roy, the participants had similar experiences and therefore, they understood and interpreted the novel based on their experiences.

The number of participants relating to *A Passage to India* was higher than those who related to Dickens's or Golding's works. The participants related to this novel more easily as compared to some other novels possibly because of the historical and social setting used in the novel. As Rosenblatt (1984) suggested readers relate their readings with their past experiences and knowledge. I argue that in case where there is ample experience related to a fictional work, it is easier for a participant to relate to it. That is why participants talked about the Indian characters more than the English ones in case of this novel- they could relate to them based on their knowledge.

A lower number of participants discussed *A Tale of Two Cities* as compared to the other novels. Some of the participants talked about all novels at the same time identifying the theme in all novels and then related only to one or two of the novels. A lower response rate as compared to other novels may be because the participants were not able to relate to the novel on a personal level. As it was written in the context of a historical time, in the background of France and England, it might have been difficult for these Pakistani undergraduate students to find a connection between their societies and the novel. Furthermore, the participants' views did not correspond with each other or with the teacher's. This relates to what Rosenblatt (1984) argued that every reader formed their own opinion of a literary text which was influenced by personal background. This proposition holds true in relation to the novel, *A Tale of Two Cities*. In conclusion, *A Tale* may have had a lower response because the participants found it less relevant to their own societies as compared to the other novels in this study.

The response rate to *Lord of the Flies* was lower than other novels which may be

due to the setting used in the novel. The number of participants who made sense of duties through this novel is not very high, only the lecturer talked about rights and there were just four participants who talked about identity. The participants did not relate the novel *Lord of the Flies* to their experiences (see also Section 5.3.4 for a presentation of the findings). This may be due to the novel being under discussion at the time of the research. Moreover, the context and author of the novel or time the novel was written at were not particularly related to these participants. The participants may have therefore, found it difficult to relate to any themes in the novel. It is possible that if this research was conducted at a different time in a different setting, the themes in *Lord of the Flies* may have been more relatable to those participants.

In the light of these four novels it can be concluded that the context of the novel impacts the participants' understanding of the novel. Furthermore, the level to which the participants could relate to the citizenship themes in the novels was determined by how much the participants could understand and relate to the novel. This, in turn, was determined by the novel's contextual setting. Therefore, novels from similar context and with a setting that was close to the readers' own social setting helped reader-participants relate the novels to their society. This significance of context in participants' interpretation of a novel and relating their experiences to it can be further explored through more research. In the case of this study, there were only four novels and none of them was from Pakistan. More studies with contextually close novels will help determine whether context has an impact on how much the participants can relate their experiences to a novel. In light of the data however, it can be suggested that contextually closer novels helped these participants relate the fiction with their experiences which enhanced the reading experience. The transaction that Rosenblatt talks about becomes more meaningful when the participants understand the novel. This is specifically in context of the learners' understanding of Cogan's (1998) citizenship themes of identity, rights and duties.

The number of participants relating fiction to real life situations was lower than the number of participants who identified the themes in the novel. More participants talked about the themes that were included in a novel than those who made sense of the themes through the novel. This may be explained through Rosenblatt's (1994) suggested reading styles. The participants had not been observed in the process of reading so any discussion of their reading styles here is speculative and not data-driven. A possible explanation, therefore, may be that some of the students read the text superficially, efferently and therefore were only able to quote incidents when asked if there were any. However, those who might have read the novels more aesthetically suggested connections with real-life scenarios quoting their experiences and observations and connecting them with the characters and events in the novel, showing a deeper understanding of the novel. There may however, be other explanations such as it may be difficult for some participants to connect fiction to real life or that the connections between real life and fiction were not always possible even when the themes were included in the set texts.

The response to duties was generally lower in relation to all novels, rights and identity were discussed more. Participants talked about various aspects of identity and rights including moral, political, national, ethnic, social-class, caste, religious etc. However, in terms of duties only civic and moral aspects were discussed in relation to all novels. It is possible that more emphasis is being put on rights and identity in the classroom and therefore participants talked more about these two themes. The classroom observations and discussions with teachers however, showed that not much emphasis was being put on any of the three themes in the classroom and therefore, it was the participants' choice and interest. The emphasis on rights and lack of emphasis on duties can be explained in light of literature and the current situation of Pakistani society. This has been further discussed in Section 7.5.

The issues discussed by the participants did not necessarily include those or were

limited to the themes discussed by Cogan (1998). Cogan (1998) suggested, for example that national identity is the most important identity of a citizen. However, these participants related the national identity issues in *A Tale of Two Cities* with their ethnic identity. Moreover, political rights were not mentioned at all and legal rights were only referred to by one participant in relation to this novel, which are important aspects of a citizen's rights according to Cogan. Similarly, while discussing duties, moral duties were discussed by the participants but not mentioned by Cogan among duties of the citizens. Therefore, contextual elements were discussed more by these participants than the more generally accepted elements suggested by Cogan. This is, however, not to suggest that Cogan has made no consideration of context. Cogan (1998) has mentioned, for example, that local, religious, cultural and ethnic identities may be important in multicultural societies. The context in this project is different from those used in CEPS project. Therefore, the elements of citizenship that are important to these participants are very different from those suggested by Cogan (more on this has been discussed in the previous chapter's overarching section, Section 7.5).

In conclusion, the participants made sense of the novels closer to their context more than other novels. Furthermore, their understanding of citizenship themes was different from that expected in light of Cogan's framework.

8.7 Conclusion

In this chapter, I discussed my arguments regarding participants' perceptions on relating to the themes in the four novels. My main argument is that students were able to relate more to the novels that were contextually close to their own social setting such as *Small Things* and *A Passage*. It was difficult for them to relate to the metaphorical setting in *Lord of the Flies* and therefore, they were not able to relate to identity, rights and duties in the fictional work. Individual arguments on each theme were discussed in sub-sections

under each novel. In the previous section on facilitating factors, I presented my arguments regarding participants' perceptions on various facilitating factors. The participants talked about the choice of curriculum, teaching methods and any forms of external help that facilitated understanding of citizenship. They argued that choice of curriculum and teaching methods were potentially good facilitating factors if properly utilised but had not been focussed towards understanding of these citizenship issues.

9. Conclusion

9.1 Overarching argument

In the last three discussion chapters, I have presented discussion on each individual section about the themes of identity, rights and duties and the four novels. In this chapter, I present the overarching argument that connects the last three chapters, answering my main research question, “*What perceptions of identity, rights and duties are held by a sample of undergraduate students in Pakistan in the context of their study of fiction?*” My overarching argument, which is further explored in the following paragraphs, is that the participants’ perceptions of the citizenship themes through the novel were based in their personal and social context. Furthermore, geographical, social and temporal context of the novel helped the participants identify the themes and relate them to their society. The number of participants who identified and related to identity, rights and duties in the novels differed with the kind of novel. The closer the novel was to the participants in terms of context, the more the number of participants who could relate to citizenship themes within it.

9.1.1 Views on Citizenship Themes

The participants’ perceptions of identity, rights and duties were based on universal, social and personal context. The conceptual framework used to understand citizenship in this project was Cogan (1998). Cogan defines citizenship in terms of attributes, namely identity, rights and duties. However, this conceptual framework was based in England, even though it was tried in different contexts most of the contexts in the CEPS project were European and American. As pointed out in the literature review (e.g. Kennedy, 2004; Lee, 2004; Chong et al., 2016), the basic concept of citizenship may remain the same across

different geographical contexts but the context determines certain characteristics within a nation's citizenship ideals. The participants in this study understood citizenship in terms of the three themes- identity, rights and duties, although to different extents and from different aspects. Their understanding of the three themes was based on universal, social and personal perspectives.

The participants discussed some aspects of identity, rights and duties that are universally accepted components of citizenship. They discussed national identity, civic rights and duties, political rights and duties as part of their perceptions on the themes. National, civic and political aspects of citizenship have been emphasised as essential constituents of citizenship since Marshall (1950 as cited in Marshall & Bottomore, 1992) and have been discussed in Cogan (1998) as well. So, the participants did not only talk about contextual elements but were also interested in certain general elements. As Lee (2004) suggested citizenship in Asia is a hybrid of Western and Asian concepts, this seems to be the case with my participants. The participants therefore, included both conceptual and contextual

Certain aspects of identity, rights and duties were more important to these participants than was expected in the light of Cogan's framework. These can be explained in terms of their social and personal contexts. The participants talked about various issues including moral, political, religious, civic, ethnic and caste related issues. The moral, religious and caste aspects were not described as attributes of citizens by Cogan. Some Asian researchers do look at moral and religious education as part of citizenship, as discussed in the following paragraphs. However, caste being a South-Asian concept has not been discussed by other researchers. Therefore, it is suggested that participants' understanding of citizenship themes was based on personal and social context.

Morality forms an important part of participants' perceptions of identity, rights and duties. The participants argued that a moral, human identity is the most important identity

everyone should be concerned about. They believed in moral duties towards families and their local communities. Kennedy (2004) concluded his book based on studies in various contexts in Asia arguing that moral values form an essential part of citizenship education in Asia. Lee's (2004) concept of harmony can also be related to moral, human identity that the participants talked about, as discussed in Section 6.1. The participants argued that there should be an acceptance of a human identity so there are no clashes on basis of religion, ethnicity, national identity. This relates to what Lee (2004) said about Asian communities emphasising on the need for living in harmony with each other. The participants therefore, emphasised moral aspects of citizenship which is in line with other Asian communities and their ideals of citizenship education.

I argue in relation to religion that religious freedom was important to the participants but religion was not discussed as much as was expected in light of literature on Asian citizenship and on Pakistan. Religious issues came up in discussion with some participants- two participants discussed religion in terms of identity, four in relation to rights and two talked about religious duties. Religion was not mentioned by Cogan and would not be expected to be part of a citizen's identity, rights and duties in a European or American concept of citizenship. Arthur, Gearon and Sears (2010) have responded to this exclusion of religion from civic education arguing that it is undemocratic to exclude religious ideas. However, in Asian studies of citizenship, religion is considered an important element of citizenship education. Fearnley-Sanders et al. (2004) for example, in their study on Indonesian concept of citizenship, argue that it is difficult to separate what is Indonesian from what is Muslim. Tan (2007) in their study on Islam in Singapore suggest that the government should consider including religious education as part of citizenship education. Moreover, literature on Pakistan (e.g. Siddiqa, 2010; Siddiqui, 2015; Rahman, 2007) suggests that religion is an important issue in the context. However, the only argument that can be made in light of the few comments made by the participants is that

they were concerned about the freedom and safety of religious minorities in the country. There was no discussion of how important religion was in terms of their identity or that they should be given more rights as a religious group.

This limited discussion of religious issues can be explained in light of the context to which these participants belonged. The participants belong to the province of Sindh, which has the highest Hindu minority. The two ethnic groups have lived in peace for centuries. Therefore, Sindhis are, religiously, a tolerant group (as discussed in the Introduction). The religious differences may not have been so important to these young people. In light of the findings presented by Leirvik (2008) and Malik (2002) highlighting the growing religious intolerance and poor conditions of religious minorities, the participants appear to be neglecting the current situation of religion in the country. Four of them however, showed concern over the rights of minorities acknowledging the growing religious intolerance in the country (as depicted by newspaper articles Dawn, 2015; Dawn, 2010; Tribune, 2010). I attribute this concern for minorities to their Sindhi background as well. However, this concern was shown only by four participants including one Hindu participant while the majority remained quiet. Another speculative explanation to this behaviour can be that other more pressing issues such as moral, social class and caste issues affected their personal lives more than religious issues. This may be another explanation of the fact that religious aspect of identity, rights and duties was not discussed by most of the participants.

Caste was a contextual issue discussed by the participants that was specific to their concept of citizenship. Caste as an identity issue has not been mentioned in other Asian studies of citizenship. Caste is basically an Indian religious phenomenon which gives a social hierarchy, that found its way into Pakistan and has stayed even after almost 70 years of partition (explained in Section 2.1). Verkaaik (2001) claims that the Muslims post-partition shunned their castes as they were thought to be a Hindu trend and adopted family

names. However, even within these family names in Pakistan today there appears to be a social hierarchy that the participants acknowledged and discussed as an issue in their society.

The female participants were more concerned about caste identity issues as compared to the male. The sense of pride in one's caste was noticeable in both male and female participants but interest in issues related to caste was more common in the female participants. Four out of five female participants discussed issues related to caste while discussing their perceptions on identity. Families prohibiting inter-caste marriages is a common phenomenon in Pakistan and the female participants raised the issue of marrying of their choice, out of their castes. Jamal (2006) explored the implications of an inter-caste marriage in Pakistan where an adult woman was taken to court by her father for marrying without his consent. This was the case of an upper class family. In the middle class families that the participants belong to the fathers are more important figures and their permission is essential. Rida for example, repeatedly says, "my father allows us"; or Nazia who had elder brothers, "we are allowed by our family"; or the case of Zainab who is forcefully engaged to a less educated cousin she doesn't like just because her father believes it is better to have proposals from within the family. In this situation, the female participants' emphasis on caste as an identity issues in their society highlights that caste affects their lives more than it affects their male counterparts.

9.1.2 Views on Themes in the Novels

The participants identified and related to citizenship themes in novels that were geographically, socially and/or temporally close to their own society. Participants' perceptions of citizenship in relation to the novels showed observable links to participants' understanding of the context presented in the novels. They were given the choice to talk about each theme in relation to any of the four novels and most of the students chose to

talk about *The God of Small Things* in relation to each theme while very few chose to speak about *Lord of the Flies*. As Iser (1978) suggests culture and learner's personal background play a role in the meaning-making process. The context and culture used in the novel affected the level to which participants could relate to it. There may be other factors involved but I argue that contextual understanding of the novel leads to citizenship understanding among the readers.

The novel *The God of Small Things* was discussed the most by the participants. The aspects of identity and rights that the participants identified in the novel were related to social class and caste. Even though Cogan (1998) does not discuss caste as a citizenship theme, the literature on the novel such as Komalesha (2008) and Krishnamurthy (2011) discuss caste portrayal in the novel. The participants in this study were able to relate incidents in this novel to the discrimination based on caste in their society. They were able to connect Velutha, like Imran did, to the Kohlis in rural Sindh. Another participant, Aabid talked about the way people discriminated among lower castes in his village by not eating in the same utensils as them.

Some of the participants were able to relate closely to the novel due to its portrayal of social class. The presentation of the theme in the novel and the participants' contextual background both were important in forming their interpretations. This answers Lewis's (2000) criticism against overemphasis on either the text or the learner (discussed in Section 2.3.2). Exploitation of rights based on social class is observable in the novel *Small Things*. Kumar (2014) for example, argues that "subhuman" attitude towards the lower class has been portrayed in the novel. Similar views were expressed by Ali who very emotionally said about treatment of Velutha, "was he not a human?" The participants further connected the situation to events in their society. Waleed, another male participant, gave an example of how his family had to leave their village because the upper class landlord was not fair with them and they did not have the right connections to be able to fight back. It was

therefore, easier for the participants to make connections between the novel and their lives about these themes as they could compare the two social settings.

Duties were also discussed in relation to this novel. Even though the literature reviewed does not make any explicit mention of duties, the participants were able to talk about civic and moral duties. The character of the policeman was very important to the participants in this regard. All the participants who related to the theme of civic duties made connections between the policeman in the novel and his real-life Pakistani counterparts. They quoted incidents where they themselves or an acquaintance had been harassed by the police. They argued that the characters in the novel were not performing their civic duties as they should and similar instances were observable in their own society. In this way, the participants were able to make sense of what they had read.

The participants were able to connect with the novel due to its social resemblance to their own context. The Indian setting used in the novel was understandable for the participants. I further argue that it is not just the social context but also the temporal context that is important. Roy wrote the novel in 1997, which is not as long ago as some of the other novels. Some of the other novels were centuries old like Dickens about which Saeed said, “the novel (*A Tale*) is centuries old, we are not able to relate to the same level.”

The level of interest in novel was also affected by different facilitating factors as curriculum choice, teaching methods and other external factors. This was the only novel by a South Asian author in the curriculum. The participants were interested in it as it aroused their interest as the odd book that was not by an English author. As Stotsky (1999, 1994a, 1994b) suggests choice of the novels can affect the civic values learned through them. So, along with being contextually close the novel also had the benefit of being the only novel from such a context in the curriculum and therefore secured readers’ attention.

The teacher who taught the novel was also very enthusiastic about her teaching methods. The participants had a good rapport with this teacher as sixteen of them

mentioned her by name and appreciated her teaching methods. Two of the participants also mentioned that they had chosen to do their dissertation on this novel because they had enjoyed the classes. There was also some interest in this novel due to the author Roy's interest in communist philosophy which was of interest to some of the participants.

Teaching methods and curriculum choice are important affecting factors but I argue that contextual proximity to the novel is the most important when participants identify citizenship themes. *A Passage to India* was the second most discussed novel by the participants which was not taught by the same teacher and is written by an English author Forster like most of the other novels in the curriculum. The only similar factor in *The God of Small Things* and *A Passage to India* is the South Asian context.

The participants discussed various themes in *A Passage to India*, the most common was the national identity. Nelson (2011) argues that the dichotomy of identities was presented to strengthen the social contract between Indians and the English. Trilling (2007) argues whether the author has honestly depicted the difference in two groups. The participants however, did not discuss the author's intention in depicting the differences in the two national identities. The theme was understood in light of its historical relevance. As Imran said, "*A Passage to India* told me what we were in the days of colonial power". Two of the lecturers perceived that the students will make postcolonial connections but the participants made sense of national identity by connecting it to social class identity in their own society. The differences in rights and status that they saw among the characters of the two nationalities were only evident to them in their society among members of different social classes. The participants were able to easily make the connections because they understood the context in which the novel was written.

A Tale of Two Cities was also related to by participants on various grounds. They identified themes such as national identity which was identified in academic literature on the novel as well (e.g. Bloom, 2007; Heitzman, 2014). While trying to relate the themes of

identity to their society, they related national identity with ethnic identity in their society. So even when the novel was not contextually close they made sense of citizenship themes through issues they were familiar with.

Social-class identity was a theme discussed in literature on this Dickensian novel. Schor (2001) and Peters (2013) argue that it is about clash of two social classes. The participants however, do not identify or relate to the theme of social-class identity. In case of *Small Things* the participants identified the social class differences among characters and related the fictional incidents to their personal experiences and observations. I argue that the difference in context made it difficult for the participants to identify the theme. Therefore, I argue that curriculum should be designed in accordance with the context in which it is to be taught.

The least discussed novel was *Lord of the Flies*. The novel has a metaphorical context which is acclaimed to be universal. The participants in this study however, did not find it relatable. Thirteen participants identified the three themes in the novels while only six of them related the incidents in the novel to their society. I argue that it is because of the contextual presentation of the novel that the participants were not able to connect the themes in the novel to personal experiences and observations.

There can be a counter-argument that *Lord of the Flies* was not important or widely discussed because it was not taught well. Sunderman (1999) taught the novel to his eighth graders by taking them out in the woods and they made connections to the novel from their experiences in the woods. She argued that the participants can be taught and facilitated in a way that they are able to relate to the novel. This can be possible by letting them experience what the characters experience. This novel was taught by Sir Umair whose class was one of the classes observed. The discussion was open ended and students participated in the discussions. Moreover, the other class observed taken by Madam Kiran who taught *A Passage* and *A Tale* was also not very different. Even though this was just one class but

no such demotivating factors were observed in the classroom. It can therefore, be argued that novels of all kinds may be interpreted by students of literature using a reader-response approach like Sunderman (1999) but when understanding citizenship themes through the novel a contextually close novel helps. Crocco's (2005) example of teaching *Shabanu*, a novel based in the context of Pakistan, in the USA can be useful here. The teacher used the perceptions of Muslim students on the novel to give her student a two-sided view of the novel which helped them understand the novel not just from the author's point of view or theirs but also from that of those who understood the context better. Such strategies can be applied to broaden the horizons of these Pakistani students as well to help them understand novels such as *Lord of the Flies*

This is not to say however, that *Lord of the Flies* cannot be used to teach citizenship themes. Even though the novel does not have any female characters in the novel, two of the participants identified and related to the theme of gender in the novel. This discussion by two participants suggests that there is a potential to teach gender through the novel. Ellis (2009) also suggests that *Lord of the Flies* can be used to teach gender identity through the discussion of no female characters in the novel. Therefore, some aspects such as gender identity can be taught through this novel but proper focus will be required on citizenship in the classroom.

The participants chose to connect the issues that were relevant to their own personal and social observations. They did not necessarily talk about the issues that the teachers discussed or were highlighted in academic literature on the novels. Some of the issues that would be expected to be important in their context were not identified and related to by these participants. Postcolonial identity in relation to *The God of Small Things* for example was expected to be important in light of the comments of the teachers and academic literature on the novel. Meyer (2013) for example highlights Ammu as a postcolonial female character but none of the participants who identified gender in the novel looked at

the character in a postcolonial light. Religious or gender issues were not so important to these young people. Other researchers (e.g. Sohn, 2013; Rajeev, 2011; Nandi, 2010) argue that the novel explores postcolonial identity through the author's use of language in the novel. This, however, was not discussed by the participants. Though they are aware of their colonial background, as explained in relation to *A Passage to India*, these young men and women do not identify themselves as postcolonial as would be expected in the light of literature. Other such issues include the discussion of religious issues in relation to *A Passage to India* (discussed in Section 7.3.1). To conclude, the participants chose to discuss the themes that they could make sense of through their experiences and observations which were not necessarily those expected in light of academic literature.

9.1.3 Conclusion

In this chapter, I have presented my overarching argument regarding participants' perceptions of citizenship themes and how they identify and relate to the themes in the four novels. I argue that participants' understanding of the three themes of identity, rights and duties was based on their understanding of the universal concept as well as their personal and social concept. While discussing the universal aspects of the themes, the participants highlighted national, civic and political aspects of the three themes which are also discussed by Cogan (1998). On the other hand, they also discussed moral, caste and religious issues which were not discussed by Cogan and were more familiar to Asian concepts of citizenship.

Following the discussion of perceptions on themes, I discussed the participants' views on the themes in the novels. The participants identified and related identity, rights and duties to those novels that were contextually closer to their social setting. *Small Things*, for example, the novel based in contemporary India was discussed the most while *Lord of the Flies* was discussed the least. The contextual closeness was not just in terms of the

novels but also in terms of the aspects of the themes that the participants talked about. The participants chose to discuss the themes that they could relate their experiences and observations with and not those that were discussed in academic literature on the novels or highlighted by the teachers.

9.2 Theoretical implications- some concluding reflections

In this section, I present some theoretical implications. I understand that this study is data-driven and arguments based on the data have been made in previous sections. However, I speculate some possible theoretical contributions that this study might suggest and expand them in the following paragraphs.

My first theoretical suggestion is regarding the importance of post-colonial understanding of English fiction in the sub-continent. Many literary critics, such as Sohn (2013), Rajeev (2011), Komalesha (2008) and Nandi (2010), consider *The God of Small Things* to be a post-colonial novel and it is argued that the novel explores a post-colonial identity. In light of the limited evidence from this study, it seems that young people in so-called 'post-colonial' contexts do not really look at themselves or the works they read as 'post-colonial'. There are various important issues in their society and they make sense of the novels through those issues and do not talk about post-colonialist identity. It is possible that post-colonial elements may not be as important to young people in these previously colonised contexts, as it is assumed in literary or academic circles.

My second theoretical suggestion is about the importance of context in understanding citizenship. Various studies of citizenship, such as Cogan (1998), acknowledge the need for a contextual understanding. However, the level of sophistication adopted in understanding different contexts is often limited. Elements such as caste, were not seen to be important even in the Asian studies of citizenship because the many distinct ethnic, cultural and national groups within Asia do not have the same conception of

citizenship. As suggested by Lee (2004), Asia is very diverse and no one framework of citizenship can be applied to the whole continent. Therefore, I suggest that a more sophisticated understanding of local context is necessary in order to understand citizenship concepts in different geographical contexts.

My third theoretical implication is regarding the importance of religion in Asian societies' concept of citizenship. Many Asian studies (e.g., Lee, 2004, Tan, 2007) point out that religion is an important element of citizenship in Asian cultures. Moreover, studies in the Pakistani context such as Dean, 2005, Lall, 2008, and current situation of Pakistan suggest that religion might form an important form of the Pakistani youth's idea of citizenship. Responding from my data to reflect on this important issue, I argue that religion may not be as important in forming young educated Pakistani's ideal of a citizen's identity, rights and duties. Importance of religion in the state textbooks (as pointed out by Dean, 2005; Ahmad, 2004) does not necessarily mean that religion is part of every citizen's idea of his identity, rights and/or duties.

In light of these speculations and my arguments in the previous sections, I make some recommendations for research and professional practice in the following sections.

9.3 Recommendations for future research

During the process of my research, I came across many unexplored areas that could be explored through future research. In the light of my study, I make a few recommendations for future research:

It was interesting that these participants in a postcolonial context did not see themselves as postcolonial. The respondents did not talk a lot about postcolonial issues. As this was not a study that looked at postcolonial aspects of identity specifically, it is recommended that this area be explored in future research. Research exploring Pakistani

students' perceptions about postcolonialism and postcolonial identity will help explore interesting aspects.

My data showed that female participants were interested in caste identity more than the male participants. As caste is an important but unexplored part of identity in the context, a study of the role of gender in formation of a caste identity will help explore and understand important issues.

The most significant finding of this research is that participants chose to speak about contextually relevant novels whereas the novels that were not close to them contextually were not discussed much. This however, is only in light of the specific participants and at one university. The significance of context in participants' interpretation of a novel and relating their experiences to it can be further explored through more research. These could take the shape of comparative studies in different contexts to see if the cultural factors remain affective.

Teaching methods were only looked at as a facilitating factor in this research. A study into the teaching methods and their importance in learning of citizenship can help explore any related pedagogical issues. This could be an action research on teaching novels with a specific methodology or using a framework such as reader response.

Reading about research in different languages, the translation issues during data collection, and their discussion in methods helped raise interest in working with different languages. It will be of interest to many working in cross-linguistic contexts to see the impact of using different languages in research. An exploratory research into the effect of giving option to participants to speak in one of three languages might be an interesting exploration.

There could also be some further research into curriculum design and research on children's rights in relation to *Small Things*.

9.4 Recommendations for professional practice

Besides the recommendations for future research, I also have a few recommendations for professional practice. As the participants found it easier to identify and relate to themes in novels that were contextually relevant, it might be worth considering adding more contextually relevant novels in the curriculum. In the case of the curriculum at this specific university there were very few novels that had the same geographical or temporal context as the students. So including more might help raise students' interest and understanding. This is not, however to recommend that novels that are contextually different should be excluded from the curriculum. As in the case of *Lord of the Flies*, more effort should be put into teaching these novels. Students should not be limited to specific context rather they should be introduced to versatile literature. So, recognising the need for more effort in case of contextually different novels, teaching methods should be made more innovative. Furthermore, it is also recommended that teachers should be trained, or at the least, acquainted with reader response perspectives. This will enable more acceptance of different types of interpretations from the learners and will aid the learning process. This will help encourage more discussion inside and outside the classroom as learners will feel confident in their interpretations.

9.5 Limitations and methodological feasibility

This study has the usual limitations of a qualitative study in the sense that it has limited in terms of context and the number of participants. It was carried out with 26 participants at one university in Sindh, Pakistan. Through it represents very interesting views of these young people from this context they cannot be generalised to represent young people in Pakistan or young people in Sindh. The study does however, provide in-depth data.

There were also some limitations in terms of the time and resources spent on the project. I was studying in UK and had to fly to Pakistan to carry out the study so I had to carry out the research within the five weeks I had in the context. If I had more time and resources, I might have considered interviewing student participants in two stages.

Interviewing the students about their perceptions of identity, rights and duties in general and interviewing them about the themes in relation to the novels could be done at two stages. The interview schedule was very long and students were getting tired towards the end. Giving a break, of say a week, between two interviews would have given the students time to think. This might have enabled me to collect richer data.

Conducting an action research or having a participant-observer position as a teacher of fiction teaching the novels would also have affected the quality of data received and the interactions with the participants might have been enriched. However, this situation would raise other questions of researcher bias and social desirability effect.

Appendix I Interview Schedule- Departmental BoS

- i. Consent
- ii. Introduction to the project, purpose of the interview
- iii. Did you consider social issues like identity, rights and duties while designing the curriculum? If so in what ways?
- iv. What do you think about identity, rights and duties in relation to these books? Are the themes discussed in the books and in the classrooms?
- v. Do you think the fiction they are learning will affect students' perceptions of these social issues? If so, in what ways?
- vi. Thank you for your time and views.

Appendix II Interview Schedule- Teachers of Fiction

- i. Consent
- ii. Introduction to the project, purpose of the interview
- iii. What would you say is your teaching methodology? Why do you choose to teach this way? Do you think there are any other possible alternatives?
- iv. Do you feel fiction has any affects on students' social life?
- v. Do you consider students' perception of society (citizenship or identity, rights and duties) when you teach them fiction? Does it come up in the classroom?
- vi. What do you think about identity, rights and duties in relation to these books? Do you think the fiction they are learning will affect students' perceptions of these social issues?
- vii. What do you think students think about identity, rights and duties in relation to these novels you teach?
- viii. Thank you for your time and views.

Appendix III Interview Schedule- Students

Introduction

- i. Consent
- ii. Introduction to the project, purpose of the interview

Section 1: Personal sketches

- iii. Tell me about yourself, where were you born and grew up, your education, family? (ask one at a time)
- iv. How will you define your religious commitments?
- v. Any social or philosophical stance that you believe in?
- vi. Are there any factors or people that you think are responsible for your personality development?
- vii. Any factors or people who have had a negative impact on your personality development?

Section 2: Literature- choice and impact

- viii. Why did you choose to study literature? How do you feel about the choice now?
- ix. Do you think literature has an impact on reader's life? [stimulus: social, psychological emotional or aesthetic impact?]
- x. How will you say literature affects your life?

Section 3: Rights and Literature

- xi. What do you think about your rights? What are the rights you have or should have? [stimulus ethnic, linguistic, social, human, religious, national etc]
- xii. Which rights are more important to you than the others? Why?
- xiii. Do you feel rights are mentioned in any of the novels you are reading? Can you make a reference to any instance in class, or event or character in novels that you have read? [stimulus/probes: names of novels/ characters in novels, any instances from novels]
- xiv. Do you think your views of your or other people's rights have changed after reading fiction? Have you started thinking about it, become more sensitive to it, emotionally or socially aware?
- xv. How would you relate the development of your perceptions regarding rights with the fiction you have read in the classroom?
- xvi. Do you feel there are any issues with the way rights are being delivered to you, would the situation be different if say teaching methodology, teaching philosophy or choice of novels were different?
- xvii. Are there any other issues regarding rights in literature that you would like to discuss?

Section 4: Identity and Literature

- xviii. How will you define your identity? Who are you apart from your name of course?
- xix. Which identity is more important to you ethnic, linguistic, national, religious, national, global etc?
- xx. Do you feel identity is mentioned in any of the novels you are reading? Can you make a reference to any instance in class, or event or character in novels

- that you have read? [stimulus: names of novels/characters, instances from novels]
- xxi. Do you think your views of your or other people's identity have changed after reading fiction? Have you started thinking about it, become more sensitive to it, emotionally or socially aware?
[probe: through characters or instances in the novels like, say for example reading about Velutha made you see untouchables differently?]
 - xxii. How would you relate the development of your perceptions regarding identity with the fiction you have read in the classroom? Any developmental phase or instance that you remember?
 - xxiii. Do you feel there are any issues with the way identity is being learned by you in the fiction class? Would the situation be different if say teaching methodology, teaching philosophy or choice of novels were different?
 - xxiv. Are there any other issues regarding identity in literature that you would like to discuss?

Section 5: Duties and Literature

- xxv. What do you think about your duties? What are the duties you perform and should perform? [stimulus ethnic, linguistic, social, human, religious, national etc]
- xxvi. Which duties are more important to you than the others? Why?
- xxvii. Do you feel duties are mentioned in any of the novels you are reading? Can you make a reference to any instance in class, or event or character in novels that you have read? [stimulus: names of novels/ characters, instances from novels]
- xxviii. Do you think your views of your or other people's duties have changed after reading fiction? Have you started thinking about it, become more sensitive to it, emotionally or socially aware?
- xxix. How would you relate the development of your perceptions regarding duties with the fiction you have read in the classroom?
- xxx. Do you feel there are any issues with the way duties are being delivered to you, would the situation be different if say teaching methodology, teaching philosophy or choice of novels were different?
- xxxi. Are there any other issues regarding duties in literature that you would like to discuss?

Conclusion and thanks

- xxxii. Do you think literature affects your social perceptions in any other ways?
- xxxiii. Is there anything you would like to do differently to relate literature to society better?
- xxxiv. Any other general comments about the themes we have discussed in relation to literature?
- xxxv. Thanks.

Appendix IV Consent form

Area of Study	Literature and citizenship education
Researcher	Ghazal Kazim Syed PhD student Department of Education University of York YO10 5DD
Purpose of Study	An investigation into the research question: ‘How does learning fiction, as part of an undergraduate degree, affect student perceptions of their identity, rights and duties in society?’
Procedures to be followed	You will be asked to answer questions related to identity, rights and duties and the novels included in your curriculum and how you relate your perceptions to learning of fiction.
Duration	The interview will take approximately 60 minutes to complete.
Statement of Confidentiality	All data will be kept confidential and the reporting will be anonymous, so the researcher hopes you can be as frank as possible. No quotations will be attributed directly to you because all data are collected anonymously.
Right to Ask Questions or any make comments	Please contact the researcher on gs729@york.ac.uk with questions, comments or concerns about this study.
Voluntary Participation	Your decision to be included in this research is voluntary. You can stop at any time. You do not have to answer any questions you do not want to answer. If you wish to be contacted for further help with the project, if needed, please provide your email id below.
Name
Signature
Email

References

- Acharya, R., Singh, A., Santhya, K. G., Ram, F., Jejeebhoy, S., Ram, U., & Mohanty, S. (2010). Participation in civil society and political life among young people in Maharashtra: Findings from the Youth in India-Situation and Needs study. *Journal of adolescence, 33*(4), 553-561.
- Ahmad, A. (2007). Reading Arundhati Roy politically. In A. Tickell (Ed.), *The God of Small Things: A Routledge Study Guide* (pp 110-119). Oxon: Routledge.
- Ahmad, I. (2004). Islam, Democracy and Citizenship Education: An Examination of the Social Studies Curriculum in Pakistan. *Current Issues in Comparative Education, 7*(1), 39-49.
- Ahmad, K., & Sheikh, K. S. (2013). Social Media and Youth Participatory Politics: A Study of University Students. *South Asian Studies, 28*(2), 353-360.
- Ahmar, M. (1996). Ethnicity and state power in Pakistan: The Karachi crisis. *Asian Survey, 36*(10), 1031-1048.
- Ahmed, J., & Shaikh, B. T. (2008). An all time low budget for healthcare in Pakistan. *Journal of the College of Physicians and Surgeons Pakistan, 18*(6), 388.
- Alam, F. (2014). Inside the Wedding: A critical study of relationships in The God of Small Things and Brick Lane. *Bangladesh Research Foundation Journal, 3*(2), 158- 168
- Alderson, P. (2000). Citizenship in Theory and Practice: Being or Becoming Citizens with Rights. In D. Lawton, J. Cairns and R. Gardner (Eds.), *Education for Citizenship* (pp. 114-135). London: Continuum.
- Albrecht, M. C. (1954). The relationship of literature and society. *American Journal of Sociology, 59*(5), 425.

- Aleyeva, E. (2004). The Function of the Anonymous and Irrational in the Novel by W. Golding "The Lord of the Flies". *Interlitteraria*, 9, 368-374.
- Ali, S. S. (1999). The rights of ethnic minorities in Pakistan: a legal analysis. *International journal on minority and group rights*, 6 (1), 169-195.
- Ali, S. (1993). The reader-response approach: An alternative for teaching literature in a second language. *Journal of Reading*, 37(4), 288-296.
- Al-Saidi, A. A. H. (2012). Savagery and the Heart of Darkness in William Golding's Lord of the Flies. *Studies in Literature and Language*, 4(1), 129-134.
- Andolina, M. W., Jenkins, K., Keeter, S., & Zukin, C. (2002). Searching for the meaning of youth civic engagement: Notes from the field. *Applied Developmental Science*, 6(4), 189-195.
- Ansari, S. (2005). *Life after partition: migration, community and strife in Sindh 1947-62*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Aristotle. (1948). *Politics* (Translated and Edited by E. Barker). Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Armstrong, P. B. (1992). Reading India: EM Forster and the politics of interpretation. *Twentieth Century Literature*, 38(4), 365-385
- Arnold, M. (1884). *Essays in Criticism*. London: Macmillan.
- Arthur, J., Davies, I., Wrenn, A., Haydn, T. & Kerr, D. (2001). *Citizenship through Secondary History*. London: Routledge Farmer.
- Arthur, J., Gearon, L and Sears, A. (2010). *Education, Politics and Religion: Reconciling the civic and the sacred in education*. London: Routledge.
- Avalos, B. (1985). Training for better teaching in the third world: Lessons from research. *Teaching & Teacher Education*, 1(4), 289-299.

- Ayres, B. (1998). *Dissenting women in Dickens' novels- the subversion of domestic ideology*. London: Greenwood Press.
- Banks, J. A. (2008). Diversity, group identity, and citizenship education in a global age. *Educational researcher*, 37(3), 129-139.
- Barriball, K.L., & While, A. (1994). Collecting data using a semi-structured interview: a discussion paper. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 19(2), 328–335.
- Bazeley, P., & Jackson, K. (Eds.). (2013). *Qualitative data analysis with NVivo*. London: Sage Publications Limited.
- BBC. (2016, 17 March). *Why is a Pakistani bill to protect women unpopular*. Retrieved September 13, 2015 from <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-asia-35811180>
- Beaconhouse. (2014). Curriculum: Beaconhouse School System. Retrieved June 24, 2014 from http://www.beaconhouse.edu.pk/cms_main.php?id=6.
- Bee, S. (2014). The God of Small Things: a tale of a young mother's desire, dream, discrimination, and death. *Research Scholar*, 2(1), 429-432.
- Berberian, L. J. (1986). Pakistan Ordinance XX of 1984: International Implications on Human Rights. *Loyola of Los Angeles International & Comparative Law Review*, 9(3), 661-692.
- Birbili, M. (2000). Translating from one language to another. *Social Research Updates*, 31(1), 1-7. Retrieved June 19, 2014 from: <http://sru.soc.surrey.ac.uk/SRU31.html>
- Black, B. (2012). A Sisterhood of Rage and Beauty: Dickens' Rosa Dartle, Miss Wade, and Madame Defarge. In L. Nayder (Ed.), *Dickens, Sexuality and Gender* (pp 3-18). Surrey: Ashgate.
- Bloom, H. (2008). *William Golding's Lord of the Flies*. New York: Infobase Publishing.
- Bloom, H. (2007). *Bloom's guides: A Tale of Two Cities*. New York: Chelsea House.

- Bloom, H. (1996). An interview with Harold Bloom by J. A. Gurpegi. *Revista Alicantina de Estudios Ingleses*, 9, 165-181
- Bloom, H. (1994). *The Western Canon – the Books and School of the Ages*. New York: Harcourt Brace.
- Bose, B. (1998). In Desire and in Death: Eroticism as Politics in Arundhati Roy's "The God of Small Things". *ARIEL: A review of International English literature*, 29(2), 59-72.
- Bradshaw, D. (Ed.). (2007). *The Cambridge Companion to EM Forster*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brantlinger, P. (2011). Educating the Victorians. In S. Ledger and H. Furneaux (Ed) *Charles Dickens in Context*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Brett, P. (2005). Citizenship through history, what is good practice? *International Journal of Historical Learning, Teaching and Research*, 5 (2). Retrieved February 15, 2013 from http://www.citized.info/pdf/commarticles/PB_citizenship_through_History.pdf
- British Council. (2013). *Pakistan: The next generation goes to the ballot Box*. Islamabad: British Council Pakistan. Retrieved February 11, 2016 from https://www.britishcouncil.pk/sites/default/files/next_generation_goes_to_the_ballot_box.pdf
- Brown, J. (1982). *Dickens: Novelist in the Market-Place*. Totowa, New Jersey: Barnes & Noble Books.
- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social Research Methods* (4th Edition). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Burra, P. (1966). The novels of E. M. forster. In M. Bradbury (Ed.), *Forster: A Collection of Critical Essays* (pp. 21-33). New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.
- Byler, L. (2013). Dickens's little women; or, cute as the Dickens. *Victorian Literature and Culture*, 41(2), 219-250.
- Callow, S. (2012, 23rd November). The great Charles Dickens scandal by Michael Slater- review. *The Guardian*. Retrieved March 22, 2016 from <http://www.theguardian.com/books/2012/nov/23/great-charles-dickens-scandal-michael-slater-review>
- Carey, J. (2012). *William Golding: the man who wrote Lord of the Flies*. London: Faber & Faber.
- Carter, A. (2001). *The Political Theory of Global Citizenship*. London: Routledge.
- Census. (1998). Pakistan- population by religion. Retrieved November 5, 2016 from <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/content/population-religion>
- Charmaz, K. (1995). Between positivism and postmodernism: Implications for methods. *Studies in symbolic interaction*, 17(2), 43-72.
- Chesterton, G. K. (1921). *Appreciations and Criticisms of the Works of Charles Dickens*. London: J. M. Dent.
- Childs, P. (Ed.). (1999). *Post-colonial theory and English literature: a reader*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Chong, K. M., Davies, I., Epstein, T., Peck, C. L., Peterson, A., Ross, A., ... & Sonu, D. (2016). *Education, Globalization and the Nation*. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Choudhry, M. A. (2006). *Pakistan: where and who are the world's illiterates*. Background paper prepared for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report. UNESCO.

- Chu, Y. R. (2006). *Recasting India: Caste, Trauma, and the Politics of Transgression in Arundhati Roy's The God of Small Things*. Doctoral thesis: National Tsing Hua University.
- Cogan, J. (1998). Citizenship for the 21st century. In J. Cogan & R. Derricott (Eds.), *Citizenship for the 21st century: An international perspective on education*. London: Kogan Page Limited.
- Cogan, J. & Derricott, R. (1998). *Citizenship for the 21st century: An international perspective on education*. London: Kogan Page Limited.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research Methods in Education*. (6thEd.). London: Routledge.
- Collins, P. (1965). *Dickens and Education*. London: Macmillan & Co.
- Connell, J. (2000). Aesthetic Experiences in the School Curriculum: assessing the value of Rosenblatt's Transactional Theory. *The Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 34(1), 27-35.
- Connell, J. (1996). Assessing the influence of Dewey's epistemology on Rosenblatt's reader response theory. *Educational Theory*, 46(4), 395-413.
- Cook, N. (2007). *Gender, identity and imperialism: Women development workers in Pakistan*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Corrigan, P., Chiad, M. & Echendu, N. (2015). Using Reader Responses and Discovery Responses with Tertiary Students in Three Countries. *Teaching American Literature*, 8(1), 11-22.
- Cox, B. (1991). *Cox on Cox: an English curriculum for the 1990s*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Crick, B. (2000). *Essays on Citizenship*. London: Continuum.

- Crocco, M. S. (2005). Teaching Shabanu: The challenges of using world literature in the US social studies classroom. *Journal of curriculum studies*, 37(5), 561-582.
- Crossley, M. (2010). Context matters in educational research and international development: Learning from the small states experience. *Prospects*, 40(4), 421-429.
- Dahlgren, P. (2006). Doing citizenship- the cultural origins of civic agency in the public sphere. *European journal of cultural studies*, 9(3), 267-286.
- Dalton, R. (2008). *The Good Citizen: How a Younger Generation is Reshaping American Politics*. Washington: CQ Press.
- Das, G. K. (1986). A Passage to India: a socio-historical study. In J. Beer (Ed.), *A Passage to India: Essays in Interpretation* (pp 1-15). Totowa: Barnes & Noble Books.
- Davidis, M. M. (1999). Forster's Imperial Romance: Chivalry, Motherhood, and Questing in A Passage to India. *Journal of Modern Literature*, 23(2), 259-276.
- Davies, I. (2004). Science and citizenship. *International Journal of Science Education*, 26(14), 1751-1763.
- Dawn. (2016a, 15 February). *Sindh Assembly approves Hindu marriage bill*. Retrieved February 15, 2016 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1239719/sindh>
- Dawn. (2016b, 29 January). *Delay in Hindu marriage laws a denial of basic rights*. Retrieved February, 15 2016 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1236105>
- Dawn (2015, 12 November). *PM vows to protect rights of all religious communities*. Retrieved February, 15 2016 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1219105>
- Dawn. (2010, June 10). *PML-N defends Nawaz's comments about Ahmadis*. Retrieved February 15, 2016 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/850096/pml-n-defends-nawaz-s-remarks-about-ahmadis>

- Dean, B. (2008). The Changing Face of Citizenship Education in Pakistan. In J. Arthur, I. Davies, & C. Hahn, (Eds.), *A Sage Handbook of Education for Citizenship and Democracy*. London: Sage.
- Dean, B. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities. *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education*, 1(2), 35-55.
- Dee, T. S. (2004). Are there civic returns to education? *Journal of Public Economics*, 88(9), 1697-1720.
- Denzin, N. K. (1970). *The Research Act in Sociology*. Chicago: Aldine.
- Dickens, C. (1859/1994). *A Tale of Two Cities*. London: Penguin books.
- Diener, E., and Crandall, R. (1978). *Ethics in Social and Behavioural Research*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Dijkstra, K., Zwaan, R. A., Graesser, A. C. & Magliano, J. P. (1994). Character and reader emotions in literary texts. *Poetics*, 23(1), 139-157.
- Diniejko, A. (2009). Charles Dickens as Social Commentator and Critic. *The Victorian Web*. Retrieved July 27, 2015 from <http://www.victorianweb.org/authors/dickens/diniejko.html>
- Dobson, K. (2006). " Struggle Work": Global and Urban Citizenship in Dionne Brand's What We All Long For. *Studies in Canadian Literature/Études en littérature canadienne*, 31(2), 88-104.
- Dolin, K. (1994). Freedom, uncertainty, and diversity: A Passage to India as a critique of imperialist law. *Texas studies in literature and language*, 36(3), 328-352.
- Duke, N. K., Victoria P., Leigh A. H. & Tower, C. (2006). Authentic Literacy Activities for Developing Comprehension and Writing. *The Reading Teacher*, 60(4): 344–355.
- Eagleton, M. (Ed.). (1992). *Feminist literary theory: a reader*. Cambridge: Blackwell.

- Ebrahim, Z. (2015). *50 shades of inequality in Pakistan*. Dawn. Retrieved August 10, 2016 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1178703>
- Elbers, E. (1996). Citizenship in the Making: Themes of citizenship in Children's Pretend Play. *Childhood*, 3(4), 499-514.
- Ellis, V. (2009). What English can contribute to understanding sexual identities. *English Journal*, 98(4), 52-55.
- Elmhirst, S. (2011). *Arundhati Roy- "Every day one is insulted in India"*. Retrieved August 8, 2015 from <http://www.newstatesman.com/asia/2011/07/arundhati-roy-india-book>
- Engel, M. (1956). The Politics of Dickens' Novels. *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*, 71(5), 945-974.
- Erwin, L. (2012). Domesticating the subaltern in the global novel in English. *The Journal of Commonwealth Literature*, 47(3), 325-339.
- Evans, M. (2004). *Citizenship Education Pedagogy: Teacher's Characterization*. Doctoral Thesis: University of York.
- Falk, R. (1993). The making of global citizenship. In J. Bletcher, J. Childs & J. Cutler (Eds.), *Global Visions: Beyond the new world order* (pp 39-50). Boston: South End Press.
- Faulks, K. (2006). Education for citizenship in England's Secondary Schools: A Critique of Current Principle and Practice, *Journal of Education Policy*, 21(1), 59-74.
- Faust, M. (2000). Reconstructing Familiar Metaphors:" John Dewey and Louise Rosenblatt on Literary Art as Experience". *Research in the Teaching of English*, 35(1), 9-34.
- Fearnley-Sander, M., Muis, I. & Gistituati, N. (2004). Muslim views of citizenship in Indonesia during democratisation. In W. O. Lee, D.L. Grossman, K, J. Kennedy

- and G. P. Fairbrother (Eds.), *Citizenship education in Asia and the Pacific: concepts and issues* (pp37-56). Hong Kong: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Fersch, B. (2013). Meaning: lost, found or 'made' in translation? A hermeneutical approach to cross-language interview research. *Qualitative Studies*, 4(2), 86-99.
- Ferguson, F. (2005). On Terrorism and Morals: Dickens's A Tale of Two Cities. *Partial Answers: Journal of Literature and the History of Ideas*, 3(2), 49-74.
- Fitzgerald, J. F., & Kayser, J. R. (1992). Golding's "Lord of the Flies": pride as original sin. *Studies in the Novel*, 24(1), 78-88.
- Flynn, E. A. (2007). Louise Rosenblatt and the Ethical Turn in Literary Theory. *College English*, 70(1), 52-69.
- Flyvbjerg, B. (2006). Five misunderstandings about case-study research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 12(2), 219-245.
- Fogg, V. (2009). *How do different methods of response allow students to engage with narrative fiction? A study of year 9 students reading Philip Pullman's Northern Lights*. PhD thesis: University of York, UK.
- Forster, E. M. (1924/2005). *A Passage to India*. Penguin Classics: London.
- Freed, J. L. (2011). The Ethics of Identification: The Global Circulation of Traumatic Narrative in Silko's Ceremony and Roy's The God of Small Things. *Comparative literature studies*, 48(2), 219-240.
- Friedman, S. S. (2005). Paranoia, Pollution, and Sexuality: Affiliations between EM Forster's A Passage to India and Arundhati Roy's The God of Small Things (pp 245-61). In L. Doyle and L. Winkiel (Eds.), *Geomodernisms: Race, Modernism, Modernity* (pp. 245-261). Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

- Fry, S. W. (2009). Exploring Social Studies through Multicultural Literature: Legend of the St Ann's Flood. *The Social Studies*, 100(2), 85-92.
- Gayer, L. (2008). A history of violence: ethnic and sectarian conflicts in Karachi (1985-2005). In M. Boivin (Ed.), *Sindh through history and representations: French contributions to Sindhi studies* (pp. 52-63). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Geis, G. (2009). The Depiction of Corruption in English-Language Indian Fiction. *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice*, 25(2), 170-185.
- Gine, X., & Mansuri, G. (2011). Together we will: experimental evidence on female voting behavior in Pakistan. *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series*. The World Bank, Development Research Group.
- Golding, W. (1954/1988). *Lord of the Flies*. Faber and Faber: London.
- Guerard, A. L. (1970). *Literature and Society*. Cooper Square Publishers.
- Gurney, P. (2015). "The Age of Veneer": Charles Dickens and the antinomies of Victorian consumer culture. *Dickens Quarterly*, 32(3), 229-246.
- Guzzetti, B., Kowalinski, B. & McGowan, T. (1992). Using literature-based approach to teaching social studies. *Journal of Reading*, 36 (2), 114-122.
- Hakeem, A. & Akbar, A. (2015, December 29). 21 killed in a suicide attack near Nadra office in Mardan. *Dawn*. Retrieved December 21, 2015 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1229406/21-killed-in-suicide-attack-near-nadra-office-in-mardan>
- Hall, O. L. (1994). *Enhancing Conflict Resolution Strategies with Prekindergarten Students through Children's Literature and a citizenship Program*. Doctoral thesis: Practicum Papers.
- Hammersley, M. (1992). *What's Wrong with Ethnography?* London: Routledge.
- Hardy, B. (1970). *The moral art of Dickens*. London: The Athlone Press.
- Harkin, P. (2005). The reception of reader-response theory. *College Composition and*

Communication, 56(3), 410-425.

Harvey, S. & Goudvis, A. (2007). *Strategies That Work* (2nd Ed). Portland: Stenhouse Publishers.

Hassan, R. (2002). Islam and human rights in Pakistan: a critical analysis of the positions of three contemporary women, *Canadian Foreign Policy Journal*, 13 (1), 131-155.

Hassan, S. (2015, May 13). Gunmen Kill 43 in Bus Attack in Pakistan's Karachi, *Reuters*. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-pakistan-attack-idUSKBN0NY0FH20150513>.

Hawkins, H. (1983). Forster's Critique of Imperialism in "A Passage to India". *South Atlantic Review*, 48(1), 54-65.

Heater, D. (1999). *What is citizenship?* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Heitzman, M. (2014). "A Long and Constant Fusion of the Two Great Nations": Dickens, the Crossing, and A Tale of Two Cities. *Dickens Studies Annual: Essays on Victorian Fiction*, 45(1), 275-292.

Henn, M., Weinstein, M., & Wring, D. (2002). A generation apart? Youth and political participation in Britain. *The British Journal of Politics & International Relations*, 4(2), 167-192.

Hollington, M. (2013). *The Reception of Charles Dickens in Europe*. London: Bloomsbury.

Hopkins, L. (2011). 'What Will Sophie Mol Think?': Thinking Critically about the Figure of the White Child in Arundhati Roy's the God of Small Things. *Global Studies of Childhood*, 1(4), 280-290.

Howe, N., & Strauss, B. (2000). *Millennials rising: The next great generation*. New York: Random House.

- Huebler, F., & Lu, W. (2012). *Adult and Youth Literacy 1999-2015: Analysis of data for 41 selected countries*. Montreal: UNESCO.
- Hutter, A. D. (1978). Nation and Generation in A Tale of Two Cities. *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*, 93(3), 448-462.
- Hyat, K. (2013). *Pakistan: the effects of class segregation*. South Asia Citizens Web. Retrieved August 10, 2016 from <http://www.sacw.net/article6774.html>
- Ingham, P. (1992). *Dickens, women and language*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Iser, W. (1978). *The act of reading*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Isba, A. (2011). *Dickens's women- his great expectations*. London: Continuum.
- Iser, W. (1974). *The implied reader: patterns of communication in prose fiction from Bunyan to Beckett*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Islam, N. (1981). Islam and National Identity: The Case of Pakistan and Bangladesh. *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 13(01), 55-72.
- Jackson, E. (2010). *Feminism and Contemporary Indian Women's writing*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Jamal, A. (2006). Gender, citizenship, and the nation-state in Pakistan: Willful daughters or free citizens? *Signs*, 31 (2), 283-304.
- Jan, F. (2010). Pakistan: a struggling nation-state. *Democracy and Security*, 6(3), 237-255.
- Jansen, A. (2015). Positioning and subjectivation in research interviews: why bother talking to a researcher? *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 18 (1), 27-39.
- Jay, B. (1998). *E M Forster: A Passage to India*. Cambridge: Palgrave Macmillan

- Jinnah Institute. (2013). *Apolitical or depoliticised? Pakistan's youth and politics*. Islamabad: Friedrich Naumann Stiftung and Jinnah Institute.
- Joshi, P. (2007). Mutiny Echoes: India, Britons, and Charles Dickens's A Tale of Two Cities. *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, 62(1), 48-87.
- Joyo, M. I. (2005). *The betrayal: Sindh bides the day for freedom* (Vol. 2). Hyderabad: Sindhi Adeeban jee Sahkari Sangat.
- Kadir, K. H., Maasum, T. N. & Vengadasmay, R. (2012). Transactional Reader Response and Foregrounding Theories in ESL Classroom. *Procedia: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 69, 1684-1692.
- Kahne, J., & Westheimer, J. (1996). In the service of what? The politics of service learning. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 77(9), 592-606.
- Kallio, H., Pietilä, A. M., Johnson, M., & Kangasniemi, M. (2016). Systematic methodological review: developing a framework for a qualitative semi-structured interview guide. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*. 1-12.
- Kazi, A. (1987). *Ethnicity and education in nation-building: the case of Pakistan*. Lanham University press of America.
- Kearney, J. A. (2009). Glimpses of agency in Arundhati Roy's The god of small things. *Kunapipi*, 31(1), 116-131.
- Keith, S. (1983). Golding's Lord of the Flies. *Explicator*, 41 (3), 57-59.
- Kennedy, C. (1991). The politics of ethnicity in Sindh. *Asian Survey*, 31(10), 938-955.
- Kennedy, K. (2004). Searching for citizenship values in an uncertain global environment. In W. O. Lee, D.L. Grossman, K, J. Kennedy and G. P. Fairbrother (Eds.), *Citizenship education in Asia and the Pacific: concepts and issues* (pp. 9-24). Hong Kong: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

- Kennedy, K and Fairbrother, G. (2004). Asian Perspectives on Citizenship Education. In W. O. Lee, D.L. Grossman, K, J. Kennedy and G. P. Fairbrother (Eds.), *Citizenship education in Asia and the Pacific: concepts and issues* (pp. 289-301). Hong Kong: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Kermode, F. (1989). *An appetite for poetry: essays in literary interpretation*. London: Collins.
- Kerr, D., Cleaver, E. and Ireland, E. (2003). 'Citizenship Education Longitudinal Study: first year findings - establishing a baseline for developing citizenship education.' Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association Annual Conference. Retrieved January 25 2015 from www.nfer.ac.uk
- Khan, A. (1997). Education in Pakistan: fifty years of neglect. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 36 (4), 647-667.
- Khan, M. S. (2014). Ethnic Federalism in Pakistan: Federal Design, Construction of Ethno-Linguistic Identity & Group Conflict. *Harvard Journal of Racial & Ethnic Justice*, 30, 77.
- Khan, S. A. (2013). *William Wordsworth, James Joyce and EM Forster: the romantic notion of education and modern fiction*. Doctoral thesis: University of Sussex.
- Khoja-Moolji, S. (2014). Producing neoliberal citizens: Critical reflections on human rights education in Pakistan. *Gender and Education*, 26(2), 103-118.
- Kiwan, D. (2007). Uneasy relationships? Conceptions of 'citizenship', 'democracy' and 'diversity' in the English citizenship education policymaking process. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*, 2(3), 223-235.
- Kiwan, D. (2005). Human rights and citizenship: An unjustifiable conflation?. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 39(1), 37-50.

- Komalesha, H. (2008). *Issues of identity in Indian English Fiction*. Oxford: Peter Lang.
- Koponen, W. (2007). Krishna at the garden party: Crises of faith in *A Passage to India*. In Bloom, H. (Ed.), *E. M. Forster's A Passage to India* (pp. 87-98). New Delhi: Viva Books Private Limited.
- Krishnamurthy, S. (2011). *Cognitive stylistics and petit recit: An examination of the narrative consciousness in the " God of Small Things"*. Conference paper: Poetics & Linguistics Association Conference, Windhoek.
- Kuchta, T. (2003). Suburbia, "Ressentiment", and the End of Empire in *A Passage to India*. *Novel: A forum of fiction*, 36(3), 307-40.
- Kumar, M. (2014). A Sordid Reality in the World of Dalits-A Critical Study of Mulk Raj Anand's *Coolie* and *Untouchable* with An Evaluation of Wretched Condition in Arundhati Roy's *the God of Small Things*. *International Journal of Research*, 1(7), 795-800.
- Kvale, S. (2006). Dominance through interviews and dialogues. *Qualitative inquiry*, 12(3), 480-500.
- Lall, M. (2014). Engaging the youth—citizenship and political participation in Pakistan. *Commonwealth & Comparative Politics*, 52(4), 535-562.
- Lall, M. (2012). Citizenship in Pakistan: state, nation and contemporary faultlines. *Contemporary Politics*, 18 (1), 71-86
- Lall, M. (2009). Gender and education in Pakistan: The shifting dynamics across ethnic groups. *Studies in ethnicity and nationalism*, 9(1), 114-121.
- Lall, M. (2008). Educate to hate: the use of education in the creation of antagonistic national identities in India and Pakistan. *Compare*, 38(1), 103-119.

- Lambert, P. & Machon, D. (2004). *Citizenship through Secondary Geography*. London: Routledge Falmer.
- Leavis, F. R. (1948). *The Great Tradition: George Eliot, Henry James, Joseph Conrad*. London: Chatto & Windus.
- Lee, W. O. (2004). Emerging Concepts of Citizenship in the Asian Context. In W. O. Lee, D.L. Grossman, K, J. Kennedy & G. P. Fairbrother (Eds.), *Citizenship education in Asia and the Pacific: concepts and issues* (pp. 25-35). Hong Kong: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Leirvik, O. R. (2008). Religion in school, interreligious relations and citizenship: the case of Pakistan. *British Journal of Religious Education*, 30(2), 143-154.
- Lewis, C. (2000). Critical issues: Limits of identification: The personal, pleasurable, and critical in reader response. *Journal of Literacy Research*, 32(2), 253-266.
- Lewis, J. (2003). Design Issues. In J. Ritchie, and J. Lewis (Eds.), *Qualitative Research Practice* (pp. 47-76). London: Sage Publications.
- Li, X., & Wu, W. (2009). On Symbolic Significance of Characters in Lord of the Flies. *English Language Teaching*, 2(1), 119-122.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. (1999). Establishing Trustworthiness. In A. Bryman & R.G. Burgess (Eds.), *Qualitative Research* (Vol. 3) (pp. 397-444). London: Sage.
- Lintner, T. (2011). Using “Exceptional” Children's Literature to Promote Character Education in Elementary Social Studies Classrooms. *The Social Studies*, 102(5), 200-203.
- Lister, R., Smith, N., Middleton, S., & Cox, L. (2003). Young people talk about citizenship: empirical perspectives on theoretical and political debates. *Citizenship studies*, 7(2), 235-253.

- Long, T., & Johnson, M. (2000). Rigour, reliability and validity in qualitative research. *Clinical effectiveness in nursing*, 4(1), 30-37.
- Lukàcs, G. (1969) *The Historical Novel*. Translated by Hannah and Stanley Mitchell. Middlesex: Penguin Books.
- Mae, T. (1964, February 16). Lord of the Flies continues to draw crowds as the Sleeper Film of the Year. *Chicago Tribune*, p. 15. Retrieved November 7, 2016 from <http://archives.chicagotribune.com/1964/02/16/page/115/article/lord-of-the-flies-continues-to-draw-crowds-as-the-sleeper-film-of-year>
- Malik, H. (1967). The Marxist literary movement in India and Pakistan. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 26(04), 649-664.
- Malik, I. H. (2002). *Religious Minorities in Pakistan* (Vol. 6). London: Minority Rights Group International.
- Malik, S. & Courtney, K. (2011). Higher education and women's empowerment in Pakistan. *Gender and Education*, 23(1), 29-45.
- Margolyes, M. & Fraser, S. (2011). *Dickens' women*. London: Hesperus Press Limited.
- Marshall, T.H. & Bottomore, T.B. (1992). *Citizenship and Social Class* (Vol. 2). London: Pluto Press.
- Martens-Baker, S. (2009). Fantasy Island Meets the Real World: Using Online Discussion Forums in Collaborative Learning. *The English Journal*, 98 (5), 88-94.
- Martin, A. (2012). Political participation among the young in Australia: Testing Dalton's good citizen thesis. *Australian Journal of Political Science*, 47(2), 211-226
- Martin, L. A., Smolen, L. A., Oswald, R. A. & Milam, J. L. (2012). Preparing Students for Global citizenship in the Twenty-First Century: Integrating Social Justice through Global Literature. *The Social Studies*, 103 (4), 158-164.

- McCall, A. L. (2010). Teaching powerful social studies ideas through literature circles. *The Social Studies, 101*(4), 152-159.
- McCarron, K. (2006). *William Golding* (2nd Ed.). Devon: Northcote House Publishers.
- McCarty, D. M. (2007). Using multicultural National Council for the Social Studies notable books in the elementary classroom. *The Social Studies, 98*(2), 49-53.
- McGowan, T. & Guzzetti, B. (1991). Promoting Social Studies understanding through literature based instruction. *The Social Studies, 82* (1), 16-21.
- McLaughlin, T. (1992). Citizenship, Diversity and Education: A Philosophical Perspective. *Journal of Moral Education, 21*(3), 235-250.
- Meyer, K. (2013). Overturning Colonial Indifference: Female Desire and Sexuality in Modern Postcolonial Novel. Conference paper: *Gender, Sexuality, and the Body*. Retrieved March 17, 2014 from <http://commons.pacificu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1027&context=cgeconf>
- Meyers, J. (1971). The Politics of "A Passage to India". *Journal of Modern Literature, 1*(3), 329-338.
- Miller, J. (1996). *The Holistic Curriculum* (2nd Ed). Toronto: OISE Press
- Miller, J., & Glassner, B. (2004). The “inside” and “outside”: Finding realities in interviews. In D. Silverman (Ed.), *Qualitative research. Theory, method and practice* (pp. 125–139). London: Sage.
- Morris, P., & Cogan, J. (2001). A comparative overview: civic education across six societies. *International Journal of Educational Research, 35*(1), 109-123.
- Nandi, M. (2010). Longing for the lost (m) other—Postcolonial ambivalences in Arundhati Roy's *The God of Small Things*. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing, 46*(2), 175-186.

- Naqvi, S (2016, January 31). *The trials of Arundhati vs the Lit-Fest crawl*. The Tribune. Retrieved March 16, 2016 from <http://www.tribuneindia.com/news/sunday-special/columns/the-trials-of-arundhati-vs-the-lit-fest-crawl/189804.html>
- NCSS (National Council for the Social Studies). (2015a). *Notable trade books for young people*. Retrieved December 17, 2015 from <http://www.socialstudies.org/notable>.
- NCSS (National Council for the Social Studies). (2015b). *About the National Council for the Social Studies*. Retrieved December 17, 2015 from <http://www.socialstudies.org/about>
- NCSS (National Council for the Social Studies). (2015c). *Notable Social Studies Trade Books for Young People 2015*. Retrieved December 17, 2015 from <http://www.socialstudies.org/system/files/publications/notable/notable2015.pdf>
- National Portal of India. (2016). *The Constitution of India*. Retrieved March 17, 2016 from https://india.gov.in/sites/upload_files/npi/files/coi_part_full.pdf
- Naylor, A. & Wood, A. (2012). *Teaching Poetry*. Oxon: Routledge.
- Nayyar, A. H., & Salim, A. (2005). *The subtle subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan Urdu, English, Social Studies and Civics*. Sustainable Development Policy Institute.
- Nelson, M. J. (2006). Muslims, Markets, and the Meaning of a Good Education in Pakistan. *Asian Survey*, 46 (5), 699-720.
- Nilsen, S. R. (2011). *Power, Distance, and Stereotyping Between Colonizer and Colonized and Men and Women in A Passage to India*. Masters dissertation: The University of Oslo.

- Nussbaum, M. C. (1996) Patriotism and cosmopolitanism. In M. C. Nussbaum & J. Cohen (Eds.), *For Love of Country: Debating the Limits of Patriotism* (pp. 2-17). Boston: Beacon Press.
- O'Hara, J. D. (1966). Mute Choirboys and Angelic Pigs: The Fable in Lord of the Flies. *Texas Studies in Literature and Language*, 7(4), 411-420.
- Oddie, W. (1972). Dickens and the Indian Mutiny. *The Dickensian*, 68 (366)- 3-17.
- Ofsted. (2010). *Ofsted subject reports 2008/09: Citizenship in secondary schools*. London.
- Orwell, G. (1940). Charles Dickens. In *Inside the Whale and Other Essays* (pp. 9-85). London: Victor Gollancz Limited.
- Osler, A. and Starkey, H. (2008) Education for cosmopolitan citizenship. In V. Georgi (Ed.), *The Making of Citizens in Europe: New Perspectives on Citizenship Education* (pp. 204–212). Berlin: Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung [BPB] [German Federal Agency for Civic Education]).
- Osler, A., & Starkey, H. (2002). Education for Citizenship: mainstreaming the fight against racism? *European Journal of Education*, 37(2), 143-159.
- Oxley, L., & Morris, P. (2013). Global citizenship: A typology for distinguishing its multiple conceptions. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 61(3), 301-325.
- Oyserman, D., Coon, H. M., & Kimmelmeier, M. (2002). Rethinking individualism and collectivism: Evaluation of theoretical assumptions and metaanalyses. *Psychological Bulletin*, 128 (1), 3–72.
- Pakistan Today. (2016, March 6). *PM to unveil National Women's Empowerment Policy on Tuesday*. Retrieved 16th March, 2016 from <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/03/06/city/islamabad/pm-to-unveil-national-womens-empowerment-policy-on-tuesday/>

- Panda, R. N. (2006). Forster's A Passage to India. *The Explicator*, 64(4), 233-236.
- Parry, B. (1986). The Politics of Representation in A Passage to India. In John Beer (Ed.), *A Passage to India: Essays in Interpretation* (pp. 27-43). Totowa: Barnes & Noble Books.
- Passos, J. F. (2003). *Micro-universes and Situated Critical Theory: Postcolonial and Feminist Dialogues in a Comparative Study of Indo-English and Lusophone Women Writers*. Doctoral thesis: Utrecht University.
- Partnership for 21st Century Skills. (2004). *Core Subjects and 21st Century Themes*. Retrieved February 18, 2015 from <http://p21.org/index.php?option=comcontent&task=view&id=57&Itemid=120>
- Petch, S. (2002). The Business of the Barrister in A Tale of Two Cities. *Criticism*, 44(1), 27-42.
- Peters, L. L. (2013). *Dickens and Race*. Manchester University Press: Manchester.
- PEW. (2013). *Muslim publics share concerns about extremist groups*. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://www.pewglobal.org/2013/09/10/muslim-publics-share-concerns-about-extremist-groups/>
- PEW. (2014). *Religious hostilities reach six-year high*. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://www.pewforum.org/2014/01/14/religious-hostilities-reach-six-year-high/>
- Pike, M. (2011). Ethical English Teaching: Learning Democratic Values or Living by the Tao? *Changing English*, 18 (4), 351-359.
- Pike, M. (2003). *Teaching Secondary English*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Prakash, S. & Sujata. (2014). Women as the oppressed lot in The God of Small Things. *ISOR Journal of humanities and social sciences*, 19 (6), 74-78.

- Prasad, A. N. (2004). *Arundhati Roy's The God of Small Things: a critical appraisal*. New Delhi: Sarup & Sons.
- Prior, D., Stewart, J. & Walsh, K. (1995). *Citizenship: rights, community and participation*. London: Pitman.
- Prokhovnik, R. (1998). Public and private citizenship: From gender invisibility to feminist inclusiveness. *Feminist review*, 60(1), 84-104.
- Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QCA). (1998). *Education for citizenship and the Teaching of Democracy in Schools: The Final Report of the Advisory Group on citizenship (The Crick Report)*. London: QCA
- Rahman, J. (2001). Minority rights and constitutional dilemmas of Pakistan. *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights*, 19 (4), 417- 443.
- Rahman, M. (2014). Thematic Evaluation of William Golding's Novel, Lord of the Flies. *Language in India*, 14(4), 225-240.
- Rahman, T. (2007). *Pluralism and Intolerance in Pakistani Society: Attitudes of Pakistani Students towards the Religious 'Other'*. Conference paper: Conference on Pluralism at the Aga Khan University Institute for the Study of Muslim Civilization, London, UK. Retrieved February 16, 2016 from <http://www.tariqrahman.net/olddocs/language/Pluralism%20and%20Intolerance%20in%20Pakistani%20Society.htm>
- Rahman, T. (1997). Language and ethnicity in Pakistan. *Asian Survey*, 37(9), 833-839.
- Rajeev, G. (2011). Arundhati Roy's The God of Small Things – A Post-Colonial Reading *IRWLE*, 7 (2), 1-6.
- Richards, L. (2015). *Handling Qualitative Data: a practical guide* (3rd Ed). London: Sage.

- Richardson, G. (2008). Conflicting imaginaries: Global citizenship education in Canada as a site of contestation. In M. Sullivan & K. Pashby (Eds.), *Citizenship education in the era of globalization: Canadian perspectives* (pp. 53-70). Rotterdam: Sense Publishing.
- Ritchie, J., Lewis, J., & Elam, G. (2003). Design and Selecting Samples. In J. Ritchie, & J. Lewis (Eds.), *Qualitative Research Practice* (pp. 77-108). London: Sage Publications.
- Robertson, F. M. (2009). *A study of youth political participation in Poland and Romania*. Doctoral thesis: University College London.
- Robinson, J. K. (1953). A neglected phase of the aesthetic movement: English parnassianism. *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*, 68(4), 733-754.
- Roche, M. (1992). *Rethinking citizenship: welfare, ideology and change in modern society*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Rofail, L. S. (2008). From God to Marx:(Meta) Physicalities in Arundhati Roy's The God of Small Things. *Sydney Studies in Religion*, 203-212.
- Rosenblatt, L. M. (1986). The aesthetic transaction. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 20(4), 122-128.
- Rosenblatt, L. (1982). The Literary Transaction: Evocation and Response. *Theory into Practice*, 21(4), 268-277.
- Rosenblatt, L. (1978/1994). *The Reader, The Text, The Poem: The Transactional theory of a literary work*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press
- Rosenblatt, L. M. (1969). Towards a transactional theory of reading. *Journal of Literacy Research*, 1(1), 31-49.

- Rosenblatt, L. M. (1960). Literature: the reader's role. *The English Journal*, 49(5), 304-10.
- Rosenblatt, L. M. (1956). The acid test for literature teaching. *The English Journal*, 45(2), 66-74.
- Rosenblatt, L. M. (1938/1970). *Literature as exploration*. New York: Modern Language Association.
- Roy, A. (1997). *The God of Small Things*. New Delhi: India Ink.
- Roy, B. (2009). The Title of The God of Small Things: A subversive salvo. *ANQ: A Quarterly Journal of Short Articles, Notes and Reviews*, 22(3), 56-64.
- Said, E. (1994). *Culture and Imperialism*. New York: Vintage.
- Santos, H. P., Black, A. M., & Sandelowski, M. (2015). Timing of translation in cross-language qualitative research. *Qualitative health research*, 25(1), 134-44.
- Saul, E. W., & Dieckman, D. (2005). Theory and research into practice: Choosing and using information trade books. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 40(4), 502-513.
- Saxton, A. (1996). Female Castaways. In L. Spaas & B. Stimpson (Eds.), *Robinson Crusoe: Myths and Metamorphoses* (pp. 141-147). London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Sanchez-Jankowski, M. (2002). Minority youth and civic engagement: The impact of group relations. *Applied Developmental Science*, 6(4), 237-245.
- Schaars, M. J. (1988). Teaching "My Antonia," with Guidance from Rosenblatt. *The English Journal*, 77(1), 54-58.
- Schor, H. (2001). Novels of the 1850s: Hard Times, Little Dorrit, and A Tale of Two Cities. In J. O. Jordan (Ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Charles Dickens* (pp. 64- 77). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Schram, D. & Steen, G. (2001). *The Psychology and sociology of literature: In honour of Elrud Ibsch*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing.
- Shah, N. (2006). *Women, the Koran and international human rights law: the experience of Pakistan*. Boston: Martin Nijhoff Publishers.
- Shaheen, M. (2004). *E. M. Forster and the Politics of Imperialism*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Shahriar, A. (2013). *Making a better life: The stories of people from poor rural backgrounds in Sindh, Pakistan*. Doctoral Thesis: University of London.
- Shaikh, N. (2013, July 3). No end to Turmoil, *Dawn*, p. 10.
- Shaikh, U. (2015, January 13). At least 60 killed in blast at Shikarpur imambargah. *Dawn*. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1160444>
- Siddiq, A. (2010). *Red Hot Chilli Peppers Islam—Is the Youth in Elite Universities in Pakistan Radical?*. Lahore: Heinrich Boll Stiftung.
- Siddiqi, H. F. (2012). *The Politics of Ethnicity in Pakistan: The Baloch, Sindhi and Mohajir Ethnic Movements*. London: Routledge.
- Siddiqui, N. (2015). Sectarian violence and intolerance in Pakistan. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from http://www.mei.edu/content/map/sectarian-violence-and-intolerance-pakistan#_ftn2
- Silver, B. (1999). Periphrasis, power and rape in A Passage to India. In Childs, P. (Ed.), *Post-colonial theory and English literature: a reader* (pp. 363-376). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Sim, J., & Low, E. L. (2012). Character and citizenship education: conversations between personal and societal values. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 32(4), 381-394.

- Sims, J. S. (2005). Dickens's A Tale of Two Cities. *The Explicator*, 63(4), 219-222.
- Singer, I. (1954). The Aesthetics of "Art for Art's Sake". *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 12(3), 343-359.
- Singh, F. B. (1985). A Passage to India, the National Movement, and Independence. *Twentieth century literature*, 265-278.
- Slater, M. (1983). *Dickens and Women*. London: J. M. Dent & Sons.
- Slater, M. (2012). *The Great Charles Dickens Scandal*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Sloam, J. (2013). Young people are less likely to vote than older citizens, but they are also more diverse in how they choose to participate in politics. *EUROPP Blog*. Retrieved March 16, 2016 from <http://www.democraticaudit.com/2013/07/24/young-people-are-less-likely-to-vote-than-older-citizens-but-they-are-also-more-diverse-in-how-they-choose-to-participate-in-politics/>
- Sohn, S. J. (2013). *Strategic Transgressions and Agency in Postcolonial Indian Literature in English: Rohinton Mistry, Arundhati Roy, and Salman Rushdie*. Doctoral thesis: University of Sydney.
- South Asian Terrorism Portal (SATP). (2015). Sectarian violence in Pakistan: 1989-2015. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/database/sect-killing.htm>
- South Asian Terrorism Portal (SATP). (2014). Sectarian violence in Sindh 2014. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/sindh/datasheet/Sectarianviolencesindh2014.htm>

- Spencer, M. (1968). Hinduism in EM Forster's A Passage to India. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 27(2), 281-295.
- Spurgeon, C. (1994). *Teaching and Learning about Citizenship Issues through English*. Doctoral Thesis: University of York.
- Spurgeon, C. (1995). Aristotle, Camus and Teaching and Learning about Citizenship. *Westminster Studies in Education*, 18(1), 15-26.
- Squires, A. (2009). Methodological challenges in cross-language qualitative research: A research review. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 46(2), 277-287.
- Stephen, S. J. F. (1961). A Tale of Two Cities. In G. H. Ford and L. Lane (Eds.), *The Dickens Critics* (pp. 38- 46). New York: Cornell University Press.
- Stevens, D. (2005). Literacy and Citizenship: an intercultural perspective. *Changing English*, 12(2), 253-263.
- Stockdale, E. (2008). *Language and the creation of characters in Arundhati Roy's The god of small things*. Masters Dissertation: University of North Carolina.
- Stotsky, S. (1994a). The changing literature curriculum in K-12. *Academic Questions*, 7(1), 53-62.
- Stotsky, S. (1994b). Academic guidelines for selecting multiethnic and multicultural literature. *The English Journal*, 83(2), 27-34.
- Stotsky, S. (1999). The uses of literature in education for democratic citizenship. In C. Bahmueller and J. Patrick (Eds.), *Principles and Practices of Education for Democratic Citizenship: International Perspectives and Projects* (pp. 209-230). Bloomington: ERIC.
- Stout, D. (2007). Nothing personal: Decapitation of character in 'A Tale of Two Cities'. *Novel: A Forum on Fiction*, 41(1), 29-52

- Sunderman, W. L. (1999). Reading, Living, and Loving "Lord of the Flies". *The English Journal*, 89(2), 49-54.
- Syed, K., & Abdullah, S. (2015). Chronicling Pakistan's Art Movements from Traditional to Contemporary: 1960–2011. *Journal of Arts Discourse*, 4, 31-58.
- Tan, C. (2007). Islam and citizenship education in Singapore challenges and implications. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*, 2(1), 23-39.
- Taylor, S. (2011). The pragmatist reader: reading as a meaning-making transaction in the English classroom. *Changing English*, 18(2), 151-160.
- Temple, B. (2002) 'Crossed Wires: Interpreters, Translators, and Bilingual Workers in Cross-Language Research', *Qualitative Health Research*, 12(6), 844–854.
- Temple, B. (1997). Watch your tongue: issues in translation and cross-cultural research. *Sociology*, 31(3), 607-618
- Temple, B., & Young, A. (2004). Qualitative research and translation dilemmas. *Qualitative Research*, 4(2), 161-178.
- Thakur, B. (2013). Portrayal of Women in the Novels of Desai, Deshpande, Markanday and Roy. *Research Journal of English Language and Literature*, 1 (2), 208-211.
- The Nation. (2015, January 31). Sectarian violence in Sindh. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://nation.com.pk/editorials/31-Jan-2015/sectarian-violence-in-sindh>
- Tickell, A (2007). *The God of Small Things: A Routledge Study Guide*. Oxon: Routledge.
- Tomalin, C. (2011). *Charles Dickens a Life*. London: Penguin.
- Tomar, S. (2001). Human Rights in Pakistan. *India Quarterly: A Journal of International Affairs*, 57(2), 121-132.

- Tomasevski, K. (2006). *The State of the Right to Education Worldwide: Free or fee-Global Report*. Retrieved January 25, 2016 from http://munoz.uri-text.de/20060800_KatarinaTomasevski_FreeOrFee_Global_EducationReport.pdf
- Triandis, H. C. (2001). Individualism and collectivism: Past, present, and future. In D. Matsumoto (Ed.), *The handbook of culture and psychology* (pp. 35–50). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Tribune. (2010, June 7). *Sharif's statement on Ahmadis angers clerics*. Retrieved February 15, 2016 from <http://tribune.com.pk/story/19379/sharifs-statement-on-ahmadis-angers-clerics/>
- Trilling, L. (2007). A Passage to India. In Bloom, H. (Ed.), *E. M. Forster's A Passage to India* (pp. 11-28). New Delhi: Viva Books Private Limited.
- Tripathi, S. (2001, April 30). The goddess against big things, *New Statesman*. Retrieved November 7, 2016 from <http://www.newstatesman.com/node/199912>
- Turner, B. (1993). *Citizenship and Social theory*. London: Sage.
- Tyson, L. (2006). *Critical theory today-a user-friendly guide*. London: Routledge.
- Data Protection Act. (1998). *UK legislation*. Retrieved November 3rd, 2016 from <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1998/29/contents>.
- Vafa, S. N., & Zarrinjooee, B. (2014). Orientalising India through Stereotypical Images: Edward Morgan Forster's A Passage to India. *Journal of Novel Applied Sciences*, 3(7), 793-799
- Verkaaik, O. (2001). The Captive State: Corruption, Intelligence Agencies, and Ethnicity in Pakistan. In T. B. Hansen and F. Stepputat (Eds.), *States of imagination: ethnographic explorations of the postcolonial state*. Durham: Duke University Press.

- Vromen, A. (2011). Constructing Australian youth online: Empowered but dutiful citizens? *Information, Communication & Society*, 14(7), 959-980.
- Vromen, A., & Collin, P. (2010). Everyday youth participation? Contrasting views from Australian policymakers and young people. *Young*, 18(1), 97-112.
- Waddock, S., & Smith, N. (2000). Relationships: the real challenge of corporate global citizenship. *Business and Society Review*, 105(1), 47–62.
- Walls, E. (2007). An Aristotelian reading of the feminine voice-as-revolution in E. M. Forster's *A Passage to India*. In H. Bloom (Ed.), *E. M. Forster's A Passage to India* (pp. 171-184). New Delhi: Viva Books Private Limited.
- Waters, C. (2012). A Tale of Two Cities. In L. Nayder (Ed.), *Dickens, Sexuality and Gender* (pp. 255-284). Surrey: Ashgate.
- White, G. M. (1953). A Passage to India: Analysis and Revaluation. *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*, 68(4), 641-657.
- Wigger, J. (2013). *Teaching Democratic Values in the ESL classroom through William Golding's Lord of the Flies*. Dissertation: Halmstad School of Teacher Education.
- Wilde, O. (1974). *The picture of Dorian Gray*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Willinsky, J. (1991). *The triumph of literature*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Woo, C. (2008). *Cross-Cultural Encounter and The Novel: Nation, Identity, And Genre In Nineteenth-Century British Literature*. Doctoral thesis: The Ohio State University.
- Woodcock, G. (1970). *Introduction to A Tale of Two Cities*. New York: Penguin.
- Yokota, J., & Kolar, J. (2008). Advocating for Peace and Social Justice through Children's Literature. *Social Studies and the Young Learner*, 20 (3), 22–26.

- Youtube. (2010). *Nawaz Sharif's stance on Ahmadis*. Retrieved February 15, 2016 from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=L-dKvZ9HSBQ>
- Yusuf, M. (2014). Radicalization among youth in Pakistan: Human Development gone wrong?. *National Human Development Report, UNDP*. Retrieved December 29, 2015 from <http://nhdr.undp.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/Moeed-Yusuf-Youth-Radicalisation.pdf>
- Zakaria, R. (2016, March 16). Between intent and reality. *Dawn*. Retrieved March 16, 2016 from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1245923/between-intent-and-reality>
- Zani, B., & Barrett, M. (2012). Engaged citizens? Political participation and social engagement among youth, women, minorities, and migrants. *Human Affairs*, 22(3), 273-282.