Exploring the Tip of the Iceberg:

The Representations of Trafficking in Persons in UK National Newspapers

Jennifer Marie Reynolds

Doctor of Philosophy

University of York

Sociology

April 2016

Abstract

Trafficking in persons (TIP) has continued to captivate media attention in the United Kingdom (UK). These portrayals consistently include narratives of trafficked persons brutally exploited by traffickers. The representations of TIP also consistently indicate that the issue is widespread geographically and extensive in size. Academic literature suggests that the way in which the media represents an issue is influential in persuading public opinions and government policies (Ahmad, 2016; Baker et al., 2013; van Dijk, 1991, Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). Therefore, the main purpose of this thesis was to examine the way in which newspapers within the UK represented the issue of TIP, trafficked persons and traffickers. A total of 121 newspaper articles comprised the data-set from four national newspapers and their Sunday counterparts, which included: *The Guardian*, *The Observer*, *The Times*, *The Sunday Times*, *Daily Mail*, *Mail on Sunday*, *The Sun* and *Sunday Sun*. The timeframe of the data-set spanned the year 2011. Through a social constructionist lens, thematic analysis identified several key findings. The themes were explored in four empirical chapters, which can be summarised by the following: 1) TIP was represented as a form of modern day slavery, as a particularly abhorrent social issue, and as a pervasive social issue in terms of incidence and geographical location, 2) Representations of trafficked persons' victimisation were equated to being *acted upon* (powerless victims) by means of dominance rather than to *act* by free will (active agents), 3) Representations of traffickers incorporated stereotyped portrayals of minority ethnic perpetrators, and 4) Representations of the trafficked person were objectifying through the emphasis on the (female) body. A wider implication of the commodification of the trafficked person was also discussed. Limitations of the study and directions for future research are suggested. Finally, potential applications of this research are discussed.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

List of Figures

Acknowledgments

Thank you to the many people who have supported, guided and advised this thesis. I could not and would not have done it without you. It would take many pages to specifically thank each person who has helped, encouraged and inspired me along this journey, and that is something for which I consider myself truly blessed.

Specifically, I would like to extend a profound sense of gratitude to my supervisors: Dr. Kelly Benneworth-Gray and Dr. Paul Johnson. Your guidance, patience, and support have been incredibly generous and beyond helpful. I truly appreciate both of your academic insights, coaching, and wisdom. In addition to this, your personal approach and kindness throughout the past several years has kept me going even when the process has felt difficult. I have the utmost respect and admiration for you both and am truly grateful for your supervision.

To my Thesis Advisory Panel: Professor Stevi Jackson and Dr. Rowland Atkinson, thank you for the many scholarly insights and direction you both provided. To the Sociology Office, and specifically Alison Taylor (who first received my application and passed it along) and Carole Nicholson: thank you both for all of the (immense) help in completing paperwork throughout the years.

Finally, thank you to all of my family and friends for the support and encouragement. Thank you, especially, to Luke, Tyler and Benjamin who had to endure the long hours, stress, and roller coaster of emotions with me: I love you with all that I am. To Tyler, who was there from the beginning, and to Benjamin, who came towards the final years: you are my joy and inspiration. You are the sunshine that kept me going when it was hardest. To Luke, who is my rock, my bull's eye: thank you for believing in me, for encouraging me, for working beside me and for never, *ever* wavering. Forever, I will be grateful.

Author's Declaration

This thesis has been submitted to the University of York in York, England to fulfil the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Sociology. The work that has been presented is the author's original work and has been conducted under the supervision of Dr. Kelly Benneworth-Gray and Dr. Paul Johnson. The work within this thesis has not been used for other research or presented elsewhere.

Introduction

In my first year as a Doctoral Researcher, a peer inquired about my research interests. When I responded with "human trafficking" a conversation ensued, including a question about whether or not the film *Taken* (2008) accurately portrayed the reality of trafficked persons' experiences. The film follows the fictionalized storyline of an American girl who is kidnapped while vacationing in Paris by Albanian traffickers. Her father, Bryan (played by Liam Neeson), is an ex-CIA operative who seeks to rescue his daughter and take revenge on the perpetrators. As Bryan is determining what happened to his daughter, a work friend (Sam) describes the traffickers:

> **Sam**: They were speaking Albanian, based on their accents and dialects, they must be from a town called Tropoja. The place is ground zero for scummers like this, even the Russians give these guys a wide berth. The one you spoke to, his name is Marko. We have information that a mobster boss by the name of Marko Hoxha moved to Paris about six months ago. If he's the one, he's a big fish. The tattoo, by the way, is a group ID…The specialty of the groups coming out of this area is trafficking in women…their previous m.o. was to offer women from emerging East European countries like Yugoslavia, Romania, Bulgaria, jobs in the West as maids and nannies. Once they smuggled them in, they'd addict them to drugs and turn them into prostitutes. Lately, however, they've decided that it's more economical just to kidnap traveling young women. Saves on transportation costs…Based on the way these groups operate, our analyst says you have a 96-hour window from the time she was grabbed.
> **Bryan**: To what?
> **Sam**: To never finding her.

The portrayals of the issue within this film reflect problematic ideologies through what has been identified as a gendered masculine lens (Jozwiak, 2012). Additionally, it is likely that *Taken* (2008) is *not* representative of the issue. Indeed, there is much academic literature which suggests that the representations within popular portrayals (such as the film *Taken*) do not reflect the vast majority of trafficked persons' experiences (Agustin, 2003a, 2003b, 2007; Anderson, 2007; Anderson and Andrijasevic, 2008; Andrijasevic, 2007; Desyllas, 2007; Doezema, 2004, 2010, 2011; Kempadoo et al., 2005; Mai, 2009; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

However, the conceptualisation that the issue is particularly abhorrent is also deeply entrenched in representations of trafficking in persons (TIP). Indeed, in my own experience, people with whom I have shared a conversation about TIP commonly use terms such as "awful" or "horrendous" to describe or comment on the issue. For example, the day after my second son was born we had a visit from the paediatrician in my hospital room. After a bit of small talk I revealed I was a research student and my thesis topic was on the representation of TIP in newspaper articles. While her immediate response was, "it isn't covered enough", she quickly followed this with comments that revealed she believed the issue was inhumane and "just awful". She also acknowledged that she knew "very little" about the topic and what she did know came from media sources. I have heard these types of comments over *and over* when people find out my research involves the issue of TIP.

It is also consistent that within these conversations there were acknowledgments that the media was one of the main sources (in some cases it was the *only* source) of information on the issue of TIP. I found this fascinating, and it is similar to the beginning of my own journey with this topic. The media commands a significant role within the construction of social issues (such as TIP), particularly in the way it determines what information is distributed to the mass public (Baker et al., 2013; Entman, 2007; Jenks, 2006; McCoombs, 2004; McShane and Williams, 1994; van Dijk, 1993; van Dijk, 1995; Wanta et al., 2004). Research has shown media

messages impact change in individual behaviours (for example: Dessaix et al., 2016; Kaistha et al., 2016). Further evidence shows that the media is important in instigating change within powerful companies in areas such as corporate social responsibility (Ghoul et al., 2016). Van Dijk (1995) has also argued that the media's power reaches into the spheres of politics, economics, and culture. In essence, the media shapes society (Cohen, 2002). In this regard, the way in which TIP is represented within media depictions is influential in how the public interprets and responds to the issue.

Yet, there is minimal academic literature in this area.

Further, the way an issue is represented in the media is more than merely informative or entertaining. As mentioned above, the media has the power to shape society in areas such as politics, economics, and culture. This notion has driven my research interests with this thesis. The purpose of my research has been motivated by the *way* the issue is represented: how are trafficked persons, traffickers and the issue constructed in media depictions? What are the assumptions underlying these representations?

Within popular, mainstream texts the definitions can be simplified and the narratives of trafficked persons are commonly portrayed as brutal experiences of violence. This will be briefly introduced in the following section in regards to how encountering these types of representations impacted the direction of this research.

TIP within Mainstream Texts: Simplified Definitions and Brutal Portrayals

This thesis has changed fairly dramatically from my initial direction. At the onset my intentions for research were to "help" trafficked persons, especially the vulnerable women and children I had seen and read about in various media portrayals. Once interested in the issue, I sought out NGOs and anti-trafficking

literature. I was convinced that the issue was clear-cut. There were victims, there were perpetrators, and the issue was massively widespread. I was not fully cognizant of my assumptions until sifting through the academic literature in greater depth during the first year of my doctoral programme. The academic debates on the issue of TIP sent me into an abrupt tailspin. What did I have left if, as Doezema (2010) writes, the issue of TIP was a modern day myth? My hope was to change the world, but given the debates surrounding the issue, was there still a cause in which to advocate?

To begin, I searched for official definitions, the first of which was the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime's (UNODC) Palermo Protocol (this definition as well as other official definitions of TIP will be discussed in greater depth in Chapter One, section 1.3). The UN's Palermo Protocol definition is widely accepted, and is as follows (UNODC, 2004, Article 3):

> "Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.

Before beginning this research, I understood TIP through the portrayals presented in mainstream books such as *Not for Sale* by David Batstone (2007) and *Half the Sky* by Nicholas Kristof and Sheryl WuDunn (2009). In these books, the definitions are simplified. Take for example the way trafficking is defined by Kristof and WuDunn (2009, p. 10):

> Technically, trafficking is often defined as taking someone (by force or deception) across an international border. The U.S. State Department has estimated that between 600,000 and 800,000 people are trafficked across international borders each year, 80 percent of them women and girls, mostly for sexual exploitation…As the U.S. State Department notes, its estimate doesn't include "millions of victims around the world who are trafficked within their own national borders."

The focus within this mainstream text is an abbreviated and simplified version of the Palermo Protocol definition of TIP as is evidenced by the wording of each. Kristof and WuDunn's definition includes a summarized version of TIP ("Technically, trafficking is often defined as taking someone (by force or deception) across an international border.") followed by numerical/statistical representations of trafficked persons depicting the size ("between 600,000 and 800,000 people are trafficked across international borders each year", "80 percent of them women and girls, mostly for sexual exploitation", and "'millions of victims around the world who are trafficked within their own national borders'").

In their book, there is also a focus on gruesome anecdotes of trafficked persons. Kristof and WuDunn, in one instance, make reference to the story of a girl named Long Pross. Her story is described in their book in a caption underneath her photo. The caption is as follows, "Long Pross was thirteen when she was kidnapped and sold to a brothel in Cambodia. When she rebelled, the female brothel owner punished her by gouging out her eye with a metal rod" (p. 11).

The story of Long Pross was then picked up by media guru Oprah Winfrey. The show aired on 1 December 2009, two months after *Half the Sky* was released. Details of her story also included that her captors forced her to have sex with many men, stitching her up three different times to resell her as a virgin (for whom a greater payment can be obtained). A picture showing her scars was posted to *Oprah*'s website along with a written explanation of Pross's story. It describes how, "when she asked for a few days to rest, her eye was gouged out with a piece of

metal" (*Oprah*, 2009a, para. 6). The differences between the two descriptions of what happened to Pross's eye are particularly telling. While appearing to relate the same gruesome event, the details of what seemingly initiated the attack and the description of the object used are distinct. "Rebelled" and "asked for a few days to rest" portray different connotations of what occurred. The first suggests Pross was in dissent and perhaps acted in a way that would be considered defiant: ran away, fought against her situation, or vocally protested. The latter suggests a compliant request: she is not rebelling, but merely asking for a break. These descriptions are a simple example of how words create divergent meaning and understanding by the diction employed. This is of particular importance when considering the way the media represents the issue of TIP, as it is the media's portrayals that will arguably be the main (if not only) source of information for most people.

The story of Long Pross is no doubt disturbing, and more recent developments in the validity of her past circumstances will be discussed further in Chapter Four (pp. 164-167). However, it matters how trafficked persons, traffickers and the issue is represented. This thesis is focused around this concept.

Making Sense of TIP "By Means of a Patient, Critical Analysis" (Zizek, 2008)

With this lens, it is of utmost importance to take time to reflect on issues which the mass public recognizes and interprets predominantly as passive recipients of information. By this, I mean that the information received by the mass public regarding TIP is often through a secondary source such as: the media or NGOs. Secondary sources such as these can present issues as simple and clear rather than acknowledging and addressing the complexities which accompany social issues. As Zizek (2008, p. 2) writes:

> When the media bombard us with those "humanitarian crises" which
> seem constantly to pop up all over the world, one should always bear in

mind that a particular crisis only explodes into media visibility as the result of a complex struggle.

In essence, the reader or viewer of a story represented in the media covering a social issue such as TIP is a simpler version of the complex realities of these circumstances (i.e. the individuals involved, cultural beliefs, norms and values, national and international laws, regulations and processes). At first glance it may even seem counterproductive to question these kinds of assumptions within the anti-trafficking discourse portrayed in the media. However, it is this very hesitancy to question that makes it imperative to do so. As Vivien Burr (2003, p. 3) writes, "Social constructionism cautions us to be ever suspicious of our assumptions about how the world appears to be". With this notion at the forefront, it is initial suspicion that helps to guide the analytical process: even when the topic under investigation is one which involves issues of human rights.

Further, critiquing these assumptions within media and government representations of trafficked persons "invites us to be critical of the idea that our observations of the world unproblematically yield its nature to us" (Burr, 2003, p. 3). It is representations of the issue, and particularly portrayals of the people involved, that must be scrutinized, though *not* because the intentions of those who produce these representations are malevolent, but quite the opposite. It is *because* the objectives of anti-trafficking discourse appear benevolent that it must be examined closely. Motivation to better the world does not always translate into the systemic changes that enable social progress to occur.

Further, as Zizek (2008, p. 7) writes, sometimes the imperative task is to analyse the issue and circumstances:

> There are situations when the only truly "practical" thing to do is to resist the temptation to engage immediately and to "wait and see" by means of a patient, critical analysis. Engagement seems to exert its pressure on us from all directions.

In essence, sometimes the most important contribution research can make is to challenge the social concerns which call for immediate action. It was this notion which shifted my interest in the issue of TIP towards the very source which drew me to it in the first place: the media. How had my own assumptions of the issue been shaped by the depictions and descriptions within the media? How is the issue of TIP constructed within the media? Further, where is the proverbial line between informing readers about TIP to further exploiting the trafficked persons represented in the articles? These are the questions that formed my initial exploration into the representations of TIP within the media. Specifically, I have chosen the medium of national newspapers within the United Kingdom (UK) to form the basis of this inquiry (a rationale for this decision is included in Chapter Two).

The Research Questions and Outline of Chapters

The way TIP is represented in the media is significant. Wallinger (2010) explains that the media is a powerful source of information for social justice issues. Since most people do not come into contact with traffickers or trafficked persons in their day to day lives, a majority of what people know will come from the media. This is why it is not only interesting but essential to analyse representations of TIP as they appear in the news.

Academics have argued that newspapers are influential in persuading public opinion (Baker et al., 2013; van Dijk, 1991). John Hartley writes, "it is not the event which is reported that determines the form, content, meaning or `truth' of the news, but rather the news that determines what it is that the event means" (1982, p. 15 as cited in Wallinger, 2010, p. 8). In this way it is imperative to address *what* is being represented within articles on trafficked persons as it has the potential to influence the way the issue is understood by the reader. With this in mind, my aim is to address the following research questions:

1) How is the issue of TIP as it occurs within and into the UK represented in UK national newspapers?

2) How are trafficked persons who are trafficked within and into the UK represented in UK national newspapers?

3) How are traffickers who traffic persons within and into the UK represented in UK national newspapers?

As a result of the inquiry guided by these research questions, the following chapters were developed. Included below is an outline of these chapters, which comprise this thesis:

Chapter One gives an overview of the issue. First it outlines the theoretical background and approach I take with this research. It also introduces key legislation which has defined TIP in modern times. It then moves into addressing key conceptualizations, positions and issues within the literature on TIP. The chapter ends with a rationale for choosing media representations for this study.

Chapter Two gives an overview of the methods and methodology of my research. It explains the data collection process through the use of Nexis UK and gives an overview of the data-set. This is achieved by identifying the newspapers included, providing the rationale for search terms and explaining procedural decisions. Further, it outlines the chosen method of data analysis and describes the presentation of data extracts as they will appear throughout the thesis.

Chapter Three, the first of four empirical chapters, aimed to explore the first research question. Through analysis three main themes were identified which are as follows: 1) TIP was represented as a form of modern day slavery, 2) TIP was represented as a particularly abhorrent social issue, and 3) TIP was represented as a pervasive social issue in terms of incidence and geographical location. Implications of these themes are discussed throughout the chapter.

Chapter Four, the second empirical chapter, aimed to explore the second research question. It argues that representations of trafficked persons focused on their lack of agency. Three main themes were identified as the following: 1) Trafficked persons were represented as powerless through stories of force, 2) Representations of trafficked persons' escape/rescue narratives involved an overlap between agency and powerlessness, and 3) The representation of trafficked children was characterised by innocence. Through these, I argue that trafficked persons' victimisation is equated to being *acted upon* (powerless victims) by means of dominance rather than to *act* by free will (active agents). This either/or dichotomy severely minimizes the complexities of the lived experiences of trafficked persons.

Chapter Five, the third empirical chapter, aimed to explore the third research question. It argues that representations of traffickers incorporated stereotyped portrayals of minority ethnic individuals. An overarching theme of xenophobia was identified within the representations of minority ethnic internal sex traffickers. Specifically, three subthemes were identified as evidence for this theme, and they are as follows: 1) The cultural heritage and beliefs of minority ethnic populations (most specifically the Asian Pakistani population) are suggested to be contributing factors to the actions of the minority ethnic (again, predominantly Asian Pakistani) internal sex traffickers, 2) The invisibility of the ethnicity of white internal sex traffickers in the newspapers descriptions, and 3) Cultural sensitivity is suggested to be a hindrance to justice in the cases involving ethnic minority perpetrators.

Chapter Six, the fourth and final empirical chapter, argues that the articles include objectifying representations of the trafficked body. This issue is addressed within two areas: first, the trafficked person's body is objectified and re-victimised through its solicitation to the public via newspaper articles; and second, these representations are limited to minimal examples, many of which are depicted as particularly abhorrent narratives in the way that violence is conducted against the trafficked person's body. Both of these concerns are brought together under the concept of the Reader's Gaze based on Mulvey's (1975) conceptualization of the gaze. Further, a

wider implication, which is identified as the commodification of representations of trafficked persons, is addressed through the example of *Oprah*'s "Save a Slave" campaign.

Chapter Seven addresses final conclusions as well as identifies limitations and suggests possible directions for future research.

Chapter One: An Overview of the Issue of Trafficking in Persons

1.1: Introduction

The first time I was confronted with the issue of TIP was in reference to sex trafficking. I read an article that was required reading for a class I was taking. Originally published in *The New York Times Magazine*, it described little girls who were trafficked over the border from Mexico to California and detailed how they were being held as sex slaves (Landesman, 2004). I was outraged. My first thoughts centred on the question: how could this be happening? After the class discussion, the descriptions in the reading remained but became background to the other habitual areas of my life. The shock value of the reading was filed away in my memory and I moved on with the details of my day to day schedule.

Over the next couple of years I continued to hear stories similar to the one assigned in my class although the countries in which the events took place varied: India, Thailand, Cambodia, Romania, Albania, Russia, and so on. The descriptions of the victims contained consistent themes: young girls being sold, kidnapped, or tricked into sexual slavery and then forced to service several men a day. These girls were raped, severely beaten and eventually left for dead or killed when they were no longer capable of earning a profit. Occasionally narratives would focus on other forms of TIP: labour exploitation, servitude, children forced to be soldiers, but among the stories that I encountered the focus was mainly on sexual exploitation, particularly the sexual exploitation of children (predominantly girls) and migrant women. These narratives gripped my attention *and* emotions, but also propelled me to explore the way in which the issue is socially constructed within the media, specifically newspapers, as was discussed in the Introduction.

This chapter aims to outline ways in which TIP has been socially constructed. After outlining the theoretical framework, the second section places the issue in a historical context. The third section explores the way in which TIP has been constructed in official definitions and legislation. The official definitions of TIP have been accused of creating ambiguity rather than establishing clarity as to what constitutes TIP (Doezema, 2005; Hoang and Parrenas, 2014; Segrave et al., 2009). To address this, the fourth section seeks to explore this ambiguity through the following: the interchanging of the terms "slavery" and "trafficking" and the epistemological differences which shape varying positions on what constitutes TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation. This is followed by the review of ways in which the issue has been constructed through representations including: 1) the extent of the issue, 2) trafficked persons, and 3) traffickers. Finally, the last section seeks to discuss and review the role and significance of news discourses in examining representations of TIP.

To begin, it is crucial to outline the theoretical background of this research. This will be covered in the following section.

1.2: Theoretical Background: The Social Constructionist Lens

My approach to this research is through a social constructionist lens. Though this theoretical positioning is not easily defined, there are several "key assumptions" that are unique to it (Burr, 2015, p. 2, referencing Gergen, 1985). These assumptions, as Burr (2015, pp. 2-5) identifies and labels in her book *Social Constructionism*, include "a critical stance toward taken-for-granted knowledge", "historical and cultural specificity", "knowledge is sustained by social processes", and "knowledge and social action go together".

The social constructionist perspective suggests that truth is not objective but subjective. It suggests that what we know and what we believe is influenced by

more complex processes than truth that is already in existence waiting to be discovered. Social constructionism suggests that the "truth" is consistently changing based on the historical and cultural contexts in which it finds itself. Knowledge, it claims, is created through interaction or through "social processes". Within these interactions, language is emphasized to be of particular importance (Burr, 2015).

Therefore, this thesis does not seek to discover objective truth regarding TIP in any capacity, but rather it is engaged with the issue of TIP in order to explore ways in which it has been constructed. In particular, it is interested in the ways in which the issue has been constructed through representations within the media. What themes recur within depictions of TIP and the people involved (traffickers, trafficked persons)? I seek to examine this within this thesis.

Further, within my analysis of the representations of TIP within British national newspapers, the theoretical implications of social constructionism are "localized" rather than "overarching", as Hacking (1999, p. 6) articulates in his book *The Social Construction of What?*:

> …a primary use of "social construction" has been for raising consciousness. This is done in two distinct ways, one overarching, the other more localized. First, it is urged that a great deal (or all) of our lived experience, and of the world we inhabit, is to be conceived of as socially constructed. Then there are local claims, about the social construction of a specific *X*. The *X* may be authorship or Zulu nationalism. A local claim may be suggested by an overarching attitude, but the point of a local claim is to raise consciousness about something in particular. Local claims are in principle independent of each other.

In this way, this thesis aims to make "local claims" about the social construction of TIP as it is represented in the media. The purpose of this thesis is to identify and explore ways in which British newspapers' representations have constructed TIP as a social issue, trafficked persons, and traffickers. As briefly identified in the

Introduction, some ways in which the issue of TIP is constructed are from popular portrayals which use simplified definitions (i.e. the definition of TIP in *Half of the Sky*, see Introduction, pp. 12-13), descriptions which include stereotyped portrayals of traffickers (i.e. the example of *Taken*, p. 9), and/or narratives of severe experiences of trafficked persons (i.e. the example of Long Pross, p. 13).

Analysing the media representations of a social issue within the social constructionist framework is not new. Cohen (1972; 2002) developed the concept of a moral panic based on his case study analysing British media representations of the Mods and the Rockers in the 1960s. In his work he cites social constructionism as a useful means to address social problems regardless of whether or not they meet the criteria of a moral panic. Similar to Hacking (1999), Cohen (2002, p. xxviii) acknowledges the varying commitments to social constructionism:

> In the 'strong' or 'strict' version there are constructs and nothing but constructs all the way down; the sociologist is merely another claims-maker; in 'weak' or 'contextual' constructionism, the sociologist can (and should) make reality-checks (to detect exaggeration) while simultaneously showing how problems are socially constructed.

This thesis takes a "weak" constructionist perspective and seeks to examine the way in which TIP is socially constructed within representations of British newspapers. As Cohen advocates the importance of analysing social problems through this context (and makes a case for the influence of the media) so his work on the Mods and the Rockers has also been deemed "among the most influential" as well as been said to have "shaped British criminology in a singular and unrivalled way" (Times Higher Education, 2010, para. 1).

Additionally, in the influential work *Policing the Crisis*, Hall et al. (1978) address the issue of mugging in the UK. Their work addresses the importance of historical context regarding a sudden focus on a particular social problem. According to Hall et al. (1978) of particular importance to address is *why* an issue creates an increased

amount of attention with the media and mass public. With mugging it was not because the issue was new, and this is also the situation with TIP (as will be discussed further in the empirical chapters).

Further, Meyer (2007) examined the social construction of paedophilia through her research involving analysis of media representations and focus groups. In her book, *The Child at Risk: Paedophiles, Media Responses and Public Opinion*, Meyer (2007, p. 1) asserts that, "Paedophilia is not a 'natural' problem but a socially constructed one, i.e. the ways in which paedophilia and paedophiles are understood, constructed and responded to are thoroughly social." When replacing "paedophilia" with "TIP" and "paedophiles" with "traffickers", my argument is similar. TIP as an issue is not naturally occurring, rather it is through social means and the historical and cultural context in which an issue is situated that the issue itself is assigned meaning. For example, representations or popular commentary on social problems commonly attach morally evaluative categories within them. Terms such as "right" and "wrong" or "good" and "evil" are not universal or natural. Rather, they are constructed through language. These ideas are produced and transmitted to others by people in positions of power who have considerable influence over how an issue and those involved within the issue are represented (Cohen, 2002; Hall et al., 1978; van Dijk, 1995).

To better demonstrate this a newspaper article from *The Guardian* is included on the following page (See Figure 1).

Figure 1 Excerpt from *Special Report: Minister issues child grooming warning: Children as young as 10 being trafficked in the UK* printed in *The Guardian*, 18 May 2011 (Extract 38, para. 2-9)

The children's minister, Tim Loughton, announced that an action plan will be devised to tackle child sexual exploitation, which experts say involves British children as young as 10 being trafficked for sex around the UK. "This isn't something that has just appeared, but the extent of it hasn't been recognised and we are underestimating the problem," Loughton said. "The cleverer we are about it, the more horrified we are likely to be by what we discover." People sometimes struggled to believe that such cruelty could exist in the UK, he said. But he added: "Exploitation is happening here and it is happening now." The government has launched an investigation into the extent of the problem and would use the findings to devise the action plan, which is due for publication in the autumn, he said. Loughton pledged that gathering data and evidence would be a "first major step" to tackling child sexual exploitation and putting it at the heart of policing. The UK's biggest children's charity, Barnardo's, welcomed the move, but said the government had to "pick up the pace" as it examines better ways to protect children. The action plan is likely to look at raising awareness of sexual exploitation and how it could be prevented, as well as addressing how more prosecutions could be secured and how children could be better protected once they were in the justice system. Loughton said the government would not shy away from looking at whether certain ethnic groups in specific areas were more likely to be involved in sexual exploitation. "If there has been a reluctance to (look at the problem) because of a fear of opening a can of worms, then we have to expose that." But he stressed that sexual exploitation was not confined to one ethnic group.

Within the article TIP is represented as an urgent social issue that needs more attention and resources. Further, it is projected as a particularly emotive and abhorrent social issue ("The cleverer we are about it, the more horrified we are likely to be by what we discover") involving young British children ("as young as 10") potentially by ethnic perpetrators ("Loughton said the government would not shy away from looking at whether certain ethnic groups in specific areas were more likely to be involved in sexual exploitation."). Articles such as this example from *The Guardian* (Figure 1) are sources through which representations of the issue, the perpetrators and the victims can be analysed to better determine the way in which these are socially constructed. Further, it is the approach through which the identified themes in this thesis were identified and explored. In Figure 1, for instance, the issue is identified as the sexual exploitation of young British children by particular ethnic groups in particular regions of the country. It is also mentioned that "the extent of [the issue] hasn't been recognised and we are underestimating the problem". Analysis through a lens of social constructionism assumes these statements and assertions are not "essentialist explanations" but rather "products of social constructions" (Meyer, 2007, p. 2). The research conducted and contained within this thesis takes an initial step to determine particular ways in which the issue, the perpetrators and the victims are socially constructed.

Again, Meyer's (2007) work is applicable in this context. The lens through which I approach this research is similar to Meyer's (2007, p. 2) explication of paedophilia as a socially constructed issue. Inserting "TIP" instead of "paedophilia" and "traffickers" instead of "paedophiles" the inherent ideology to which this approach entails is exemplified:

> [TIP] as a social problem is not fixed or inevitable. It is not high up on the agenda because of any inherent features such as [traffickers] being evil, or [TIP] being particularly horrific, or a threat of huge proportions. Rather, these 'natural', essentialist explanations are the very products of social constructions and discourses.

Further, Hacking (1999, p. 6) indicates a particular purpose of a social constructionist perspective is one which challenges the status quo.

> …Social construction work is critical of the status quo. Social constructionists about *X* tend to hold that:
>
> *X* need not have existed, or need not be at all as it is. *X*, or *X* as it is at present, is not determined by the nature of things, it is not inevitable. Very often they go further, and urge that:
>
> *X* is quite bad as it is.
>
> We would be much better off if *X* were done away with, or at least radically transformed.

From this perspective, this thesis takes the approach of the localized claim. It seeks to examine the social construction of TIP, the trafficker, and the trafficked person through the way in which these are represented in the media. To clarify this approach even further, Hacking's (1999, pp. 9-10) example of Moussa's (1992) work on women refugees in Canada is useful to highlight:

> Why would someone use the title *The Social Construction of Women Refugees* (Moussa 1992), when it is obvious that women are refugees in consequence of a sequence of social events? We all think that the world would be a better place if there were no women refugees…What is socially constructed is not, in the first instance, the individual people, the women refugees. It is the classification, *woman refugee*. Moussa addresses the idea of "the woman refugee" as if that were a kind of human being, a species like "a whale." She argues that this way of classifying people is the product of social events, of legislation, of social workers, of immigrant groups, of activists, of lawyers, and of the activities of the women involved. This kind of person, as a specific *kind* of person, is socially constructed. Or simply: the *idea* of the woman refugee is constructed.

In the same way, academics have shown how the "idea" of TIP, of the trafficker and/or the trafficked person have been socially constructed (Aradau, 2004; Doezema, 2004, 2005, 2010; Hoyle et al.; 2011; Kelly, 2005; Weitzer, 2007b).

Weitzer (2007b, p. 448) has made a case that many attempts to eliminate sex trafficking are "moral crusades" by activists who "seek to generate widespread public concern about a problem and lobby political elites to either intensify punishment of offenders or criminalize acts that were previously legal." He argues that the alliance forged between right wing conservative politicians and abolitionist feminists in anti-trafficking initiatives is also linked by their shared anti-prostitution stances. He argues that these shared interests have resulted in a "remarkable osmosis between crusade and government ideology, claims-making, and policy preferences" (p. 467). In essence, his argument claims that as a social issue TIP (specifically, he addresses sex trafficking) has been constructed through a lens of moral agendas and priorities, which he asserts loses sight of the lived realities of those who work daily within it. As well, Weitzer argues that the brutal narratives and large statistics that emerged within the activist campaigns are exaggerated, his own claims based on his and others' scholarly work (Chancer, 1993; Monto, 2004; Weitzer, 2005).

Doezema (1998; 2000; 2002; 2004; 2005; 2010; 2011) has written extensively on the social construction of sex trafficking. Utilizing the concept of myth, she argues that the recent legislative debates concerning TIP is reminiscent of (what Doezema labels) "the 'moral panic' of white slavery" which originated in the 1880s in Great Britain (2004, p. 70). Her arguments highlight the historical context of this modern-day issue, which are important to consider in order to understand the way in which this issue has been constructed over time. Therefore, the following section will review the historical background of the issue of TIP.

1.3: A Historical Background of TIP

This section links the way in which the issue was represented historically to the current day issue of TIP. Specifically, research suggests there are links between modern day portrayals of TIP and the portrayals of the White Slave Trade from earlier in the twentieth century. In essence, the issue of TIP is far from new (Doezema, 2000; 2004, 2010). Perusing legislative history in the twentieth century, this is made evident from the trail of UN treaties, conventions and agreements formed to address forced labour, trafficking in women and children, slavery and sexual exploitation (see Table 1).

Reflected in this timeline of legal documents are several roots of the present day issue. TIP is not new in terms of the movement of coerced persons for the purposes of exploitation. Rather, the UNODC's development of an official definition in 2000 was a continuation in the process of socially constructing the issue (this definition, the process involved in its formation and several issues which emerged with terminology will be covered in the following sections).

Similarities have been identified between the discussions of contemporary TIP and those of White Slavery in the early to mid-twentieth century (Doezema, 2002; 2004; Zhou, 2015). Doezema (2004) suggests both issues represent exaggerations and inaccurate portrayals of trafficked persons. Contrary to popular representations, Doezema argues that the use of vast numbers and particularly abhorrent narratives which focus primarily on contemporary sex trafficked women are examples of modern myth. Her own experience as an observer of the UNODC's negotiations to define TIP highlighted a set of political agendas between opposing groups which worked to construct and shape the final outcome of the Convention, particularly the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children*.

Table 1: History of UN Conventions and Treaties Concerning TIP or Slavery[1]

Year	Name of UN Convention or Treaty
1910	International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic
1921	International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children
1926	Slavery Convention
1930	Convention Concerning Forced or Compulsory Labour
1933	International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women of Full Age
1948	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
1949	Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others
1956	Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery
1957	Convention Concerning the Abolition of Forced Labour
1966	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
1973	Convention Concerning the Minimum Age for Admission to Employment
1979	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
1989	Convention on the Rights of the Child
1998	Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour
2000	Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime
2000	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child

---

[1] Dates and names of conventions and treaties retrieved from the United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women website at: http://www.endvawnow.org/en/articles/536-united-nations-treaties-conventions-and-general-recommendations.html

These observations and findings are particularly relevant when comparing the modern day discussions and portrayals of TIP to the efforts made to address what was perceived as "white slave traffic" (Doezema, 2002; 2004). The first legislation emerged in 1910 through the Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic. This expanded on an earlier draft from 1902 which gained a mere 16 signatures of states (Doezema, 2002). In her work, Doezema (2002) traces the historical evolution of the inclusion of prostitution in the definitions of trafficking, and links these debates to the contemporary debates on defining TIP, particularly in the area of sexual exploitation. Doezema (2002, pp. 23-24) writes:

> It was not until 1933 that an international agreement was drafted that reflected the abolitionist position. The International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women condemned all recruitment for prostitution in another country…In international law, the abolitionist standards of the 1933 Convention were reiterated in the 1949 UN Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others. In this agreement, prostitution is considered incompatible with the dignity of the person. Until the adoption of the Trafficking Protocol, this was the only international document to deal comprehensively with trafficking and prostitution. Though signed by few countries, the 1949 Convention served as a model for much domestic legislation.

The 1949 Convention for the Suppression of Traffic and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others was the first international legislation that handled TIP as forced prostitution (Desyllas, 2007; Saunders and Soderlund, 2003) and disregarded the consent of the victim (which can be read in the definition below as limited to women and girls). As noted by Doezema (2002) above, the impact of this legislation has spanned across decades and it has been used as a model for other legislation (Desyllas, 2007; Saunders and Soderlund, 2003). The Convention was amended and signed in 1949, entering into force in 1951. Articles one and two outline what constitutes the offence:

Article 1: Any person who, to gratify the passions of others, has hired, abducted or enticed, even with her consent, a woman or a girl who is a minor, for immoral purposes, even when the various acts which together constitute the offence were committed in different countries, shall be punished

Article 2: Any person who, to gratify the passions of others, has by fraud or by the use of violence, threats, abuse of authority, or any other means of constraint, hired, abducted or enticed a woman or a girl of full age for immoral purposes, even when the various acts which together constitute the offence were committed in different countries, shall also be punished (UN, 1951, p. 103).

There are similarities between this earlier Convention and the modern day portrayals of trafficked persons for the purposes of sexual exploitation. The modern-day conjured images of women and girls seduced and kidnapped by others and held against their wills, forced by one means or another to engage with the "immoral" practice of prostitution echo the concerns of the "white slave traffic" (Doezema 2004).

In current times, women and girls are considered to be the predominant victims or potential victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation (Segrave et al., 2009; UNODC, 2004). The forming of the UN's definition of TIP in 2000 was in many ways shaped by activist groups on either side of the "sex work" divide (Anderson, 2007; Doezema, 2004; 2010). Abolitionists and sex workers' rights groups advocated for oppositional positions through heated debate over what should be and should not be included in the wording of the definition of TIP (Gallagher, 2001).

Within current representations of TIP, international movement across borders is often the predominant focus, particularly as it is a condition in the UNODC's Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime (many nations, however, including the UK, also extend the definition to include persons who are trafficked

domestically). In this way the idea of movement, particularly border crossing, has been significant in the construction of TIP as an issue. It's important to note that it has only been since World War I that the modern passport system was initiated in order for countries to keep track of their citizens and non-citizens (Home Office, 2013). This arguably acts as a social control mechanism over the movement of the population in general. In the current day, globalization, instability in economically deprived countries, and increased mobility have led greater numbers of people to attempt to migrate to areas with perceived opportunities. Many Western countries— including the UK—have implemented stricter immigration policies as a result. With laws making it more difficult to immigrate into popular destination countries and with people willing to migrate regardless of the legality of their movement, the opportunity is ripe for smugglers and traffickers to provide the means to migrate across borders for a price (Chuang, 2006). In essence, the issue of TIP is partially in response to the legal obstacles for persons in a country in which they no longer wish to reside to migrate freely to the country of their choice.

The way in which TIP is defined within official definitions contributes to the construction of the issue (Hacking, 1999). The next section will outline the key definitions and legislation of TIP as formed by the United Nations and the United Kingdom. Also included in this section is an outline of TIP policy in the United States, and specifically, an explanation of the annual US TIP Report, which has been identified as one of the "most influential frameworks" regarding TIP in addition to the UN's Palermo Protocol (Segrave et al., 2009, p. 20; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

1.4: From Person to Commodity: Defining TIP and Key Legislation

The way in which the issue of TIP is currently constructed in official definitions is important to explore and is the basis for the following sections. Social constructionism suggests that the process of how certain issues develop into recognised social problems is through the process of social action (where members

of a society bring attention to the issue) and the development of definitions to determine what constitutes the social problem (Clarke and Cochrane, 1998; Hacking, 1999). These definitions, regardless of their clarity and effectiveness, offer a reality to the issue as one that exists in the law, can be prosecuted and therefore treated as "official". In this way, TIP as it is represented officially through definitions in international and national legislation is important to review in order to effectively deconstruct representations of the issue.

When looking for a definition of TIP, one must withstand a variety of descriptions that, depending on what source is referenced, offer decidedly different interpretations of what circumstances do or do not constitute a trafficked person (Aronowitz, 2004; Hodge and Lietz, 2007; O'Connell Davidson, 2006; Segrave et al., 2009).

TIP is a phenomenon with a relatively new definition, officially defined by the UNODC in 2000 in the Palermo Protocol (UNODC, 2004). This definition, a brief overview of the background of its formation and its implications will be discussed further in the next section.

1.4.1: The UNODC and the Palermo Protocol

Academics and others have argued that the definition of TIP as determined by the UNODC in the Palermo Protocol is both an important and helpful construction as well as ambiguous and problematic (Bhaba, 2005; Doezema, 2002). Despite criticisms, the definition outlined by the Palermo Protocol is an influential reference for TIP (Gallagher, 2001).

Therefore, it is an important starting place when reviewing influential legislation on TIP. It was created during the Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime in 2000 in Palermo, Italy (UNODC, 2004). What emerged was the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and*

Children, in which TIP was given an official definition. According to this Protocol, TIP is defined as follows (UNODC, 2004, Article 3):

> (a) "Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;

> (b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph *(a)* of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph *(a)* have been used;

> (c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered "trafficking in persons" even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph *(a)* of this article;

> (d) "Child" shall mean any person under eighteen years of age

The very first element of part (a) of the definition addresses movement: "recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons." Further, movement within the framework of the Palermo Protocol is specified in Article 4 as one that is transnational in nature and conducted by organized criminal groups:

> This Protocol shall apply, except as otherwise stated herein, to the prevention, investigation and prosecution of the offences established in

accordance with article 5 of this Protocol, where those offences are
transnational in nature and involve an organized criminal group, as well
as to the protection of victims of such offences.

This frames the issue as one which is international in context, and yet the definition
as it is determined in Article 3, was written in a way that does not mandate that
borders be crossed (Gallagher, 2001). It is, perhaps, therefore not coincidental that
many states interpret the issue of TIP through the lens of immigration and border
control. As Chuang (2006, p. 147) writes, "Viewing trafficking as a border and
crime control issue, governments seized the opportunity to develop a new
international counter-trafficking law in the form of a trafficking-specific protocol to
a new international cooperation treaty to combat transnational crime".

It is important to note that the purpose of the Convention is not to address the human
rights of trafficked persons, but to address offences related to transnational
organised crime (Anderson, 2007; Anderson and Andrijasevic, 2008). This is not a
trivial detail as the framework of the convention is focused entirely on transnational
organised crime. A by-product of this is that the treatment and provisions for
trafficked persons were pushed to the periphery as evidenced by the non-compulsory
suggestions included in the Palermo Protocol (UNODC, 2004, Article 6). As
Anderson and Andrijasevic (2008, p. 136) write on this, "actual obligations are
minimal and protection provisions are weak."

The second element of the definition involves coercion. However, coercion and
intending to exploit someone is only hearsay until after it occurs (Segrave, et al.,
2008). Further, the Palermo Protocol's element of coercion in the definition of TIP
encompasses a vast area of possibilities, and this is reflective of the debates which
helped to form it (Bhaba, 2005; Doezema, 2002). Bhaba (2005, p. 3) writes on this:

Coercion is not simply brute physical force, or even mental domination,
but includes "the abuse of a position of vulnerability." This can
potentially encompass a very broad range of situations, since poverty,

hunger, illness, lack of education, and displacement could all constitute a position of vulnerability. Whether a particular arrangement constitutes "abuse" may be as much a question of assessing the market or "going" rate for pricing a particular migration service as of characterizing a personal interaction.

Additionally, the element of coercion combined with the context of transnational movement reinforces the popular conceptualization of TIP involving illegal migrants being tricked or duped into their circumstances (Anderson and Andrijasevic, 2008). Arocha (2010, p. 32) identifies difficulties with the concept of coercion in the following, "Coercion is a normative concept with serious methodological challenges that are exacerbated when considering different cultural and ideological contexts."

Further, the concepts of coercion as well as an *intent* to exploit are particularly difficult to identify in persons lived experiences. In essence, they are open to interpretation (Aronowitz, 2001). Andrees and van der Linden (2005, p. 58) identify this as one of the key weaknesses to the UNODC's definition:

The key of the Palermo definition is the purpose of the activity, which relates to the intention of the perpetrator. However, with trafficking, as well with other crimes, intention, or mens rea, is highly subjective and difficult to prove in court proceedings. Though determining intention is perhaps an avoidable problem, the Palermo definition of trafficking is further complicated by the fact that there is no standard definition of exploitation.

This assumes that those who are trafficking and/or smuggling persons choose one or the other category. The separation between the two labels does not account for the trafficker and smuggler being the same person. It also assumes that exploitation must be planned and intended beforehand, whereas the intention to exploit may actually occur at any point of assisted or forced movement. In essence, providing convincing evidence that a trafficker/smuggler had the intention to exploit is difficult (Skilbrei and Tveit, 2008).

The Palermo Protocol's definition avoids defining important key concepts and terms such as exploitation (Andrees and van der Linden, 2005; Gallagher, 2001). This can be problematic as the distinction between who does and does not meet the criteria for exploitation has critical legal consequences. Demleitner (2001, p. 262) states, "Although many migrants, and especially those who are undocumented, become the victims of crime, including forced labor and forced prostitution, in the countries of destination, generally undocumented migrants are portrayed as *lawbreakers*". The difference between being deported and receiving government benefits is often reliant upon authority figures interpretation and understanding of what constitutes exploitation.

Further, the Palermo Protocol definition of TIP does not account for differing levels of abuse and exploitation. Anderson (2007) reflects on this in her article *Motherhood, Apple Pie and Slavery: Reflections on Trafficking Debates*. She indicates that extreme forms of abuse do occur within the lived experiences of some trafficked persons. However, she also indicates that there are cases occurring simultaneously in which persons are cognisant of what the work involves, receiving pay, and working in decent conditions. However, Anderson (2007, p 11) writes, "between the two poles lies a range of experience. Ideas about the precise point on this continuum at which tolerable forms of labour migration end and trafficking begins will vary according to our political and moral values." In essence, the determination of who is to be labelled within each particular category including but not limited to: trafficked person, smuggled person, sex worker, or migrant is potentially the result of political and moral leanings. This is of particular concern when it is the political and moral leanings of those who maintain the power to assign labels of which repercussions (i.e. legal consequences, jail time, fines, deportation) or benefits (i.e. living allowances, therapy, health benefits, visa/residence status) are at stake.

In the next section of the definition, Part (b), close attention is drawn to the issue that if intimidating means are utilised, as outlined in part (a), then consent of a person is not factored into whether they are legally a trafficked person: "The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used" (UNODC, 2004). This section does not mention the timing or sequence of events, which is crucial for many reasons. For instance, it does not distinguish *when* the exploitation must take place regarding whether the person's consent is considered important or not. A person who consents to being smuggled across an international border in order to work is by definition a smuggled person and is subject to penalties by law. However, this same person may find that the conditions agreed to before crossing the border are not met and may face exploitative circumstances that meet the requirements in part (a) of the definition (for example: physical assault, withholding of pay, abuse of power). A trafficked person is then potentially entitled to help from the destination country including possible legal protection, the option to reside in the country and/or benefits (UNODC, 2004).

A key in determining what is meant by "exploitation" is not found within the Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, but rather, it is described through the listing of examples of exploitative practices (Gallagher, 2001). The TIP definition states, "Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs." One predicament with this description is that, even in the formation of the definition, there were disagreements as to what actions should be included as exploitative, particularly around the area of sexual exploitation and prostitution (Anderson and Andrijasevic, 2008; Doezema, 2002; Miriam, 2005). A particularly highly contested area involved determining what "the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation" included (Gallagher, 2001).

The formation of this definition, particularly this section regarding sexual exploitation was highly contested among a variety of interest groups, including government agencies and NGOs (Gallagher, 2001). Much of the dialogue focused on what constitutes sexual exploitation, particularly within the context of prostitution (Gallagher, 2001). As Gallagher (2001, pp. 984-985), a researcher and legal expert who was involved in its formation writes:

> The first major stumbling block to agreement was the question of whether non-coerced, adult migrant prostitution should be included in the definition of trafficking. One group of states, supported by a coalition of NGOs, argued that any distinction between forced and voluntary prostitution is morally unacceptable and that a coercion requirement in the definition would lend legitimacy to prostitution. Those opposing this position pointed out that to include non-coerced adult migrant sex work would blur the distinction between trafficking and migrant smuggling. The debate quickly came down to a question of whether the offense of trafficking could occur "irrespective of the consent of the person." On one side it was argued that inclusion of the phrase: "irrespective of the consent of the person" would ensure traffickers could not escape conviction by using the victim's so-called consent as a defense. Those contesting this claim pointed out that issues of consent should not arise because according to the non-contested parts of the definition, trafficking necessarily involves the presence of some kind of consent-nullifying behavior (use of force, abduction, fraud, deception, etc.).

The result of these discussions was a definition which aimed to clarify the distinction between smuggled and trafficked migrants. The difficulties of this within the context of sexual exploitation was highly debated as acknowledged in the above reference. The final inclusion of "exploitation of the prostitution of others" aimed to circumvent the differing views on prostitution as an issue among individual states, and rather sought a wording of the definition which could bring agreement between

states on how to distinguish trafficked persons from smuggled persons. Further discussing this process Gallagher (2001, p. 986) writes:

> The proposal that "use in prostitution" be included as a separate end purpose was discarded in favor of a more narrowly focused reference to "exploitation of the prostitution of others" (pimping). While the anti-prostitution lobby hailed these decisions as victories (and their opponents lamented the outcome as a defeat), it would be incorrect to view the final result as indicative of a majority sentiment on the issue of prostitution. As the debates made clear, states merely agreed to sacrifice their individual views on prostitution to the greater goal of maintaining the integrity of the distinction between trafficking and migrant smuggling. The *travaux preparatoires* will indicate that the protocol addresses the issue of prostitution only in the context of trafficking, and that these references are without prejudice as to how states address this issue in their respective domestic laws.

Regarding this outcome, Anderson (2007, p. 8) notes that this wording, which highlights sexual exploitation and yet emphasizes the role of states to safeguard the rights of persons who have been trafficked into a variety of forms of exploitation, "can be read as taking a neutral stand on 'the prostitution debate'".

Additionally, the phrases "other forms" and "practices similar to slavery" do little to provide clear guidelines for *what* qualifies as an "other form" or "practice similar to slavery" within the lived experiences of trafficked persons. Without a clear consensus, it becomes extremely difficult to determine what constitutes exploitation in potential trafficking cases, and therefore potentially inhibits the protection and prevention of further abuses to trafficked persons. The vague terminologies allow signatories to the Convention room to make interpretations. This ambiguity in regards to what constitutes exploitative circumstances has been criticized by several academics (Anderson, 2007; Aronowitz, 2001; Kelly, 2005; Quirk, 2008).

The issue remains that the ambiguity within the definition may result in trafficked persons being missed or viewed simply as illegal immigrants or perpetrators of other criminal activities (i.e. illicit sex work). When this occurs the trafficked person is left unprotected, unaided and subjected to penalties, criminal charges or deportation (Demleitner, 2001). In essence, there is room within the official definitions of the issue to interpret what constitutes TIP: an interpretation that will likely vary depending on who is responsible to make this determination (Anderson, 2007).

With a lack of clarity and much room for interpretation, representations of TIP through other avenues (such as the media) are especially influential in the way they construct the issue of TIP, trafficked persons and traffickers. This will be addressed further in the empirical discussions in this thesis (Chapters Three through Six).

This section has reviewed the Palermo Protocol's definition of TIP and established that there are ambiguities within the way it was defined. It is also important to review legislation within the UK regarding the way TIP has been constructed within official definitions as a social issue/problem. This will be covered in the next section.

1.4.2: TIP Legislation within the UK

In 2007, the UK signed the Council of Europe Convention (CEC) on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings. It was ratified on 17 December 2008, and came into effect on 1 April 2009 (Lipscombe and Beard, 2014). The purpose of the convention was written as the following (Council of Europe, 2005, Article 1):

> (1) The purposes of this Convention are:
> (a) to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings, while
> guaranteeing gender equality;
> (b) to protect the human rights of the victims of trafficking, design a
> comprehensive framework for the protection and assistance of victims

and witnesses, while guaranteeing gender equality, as well as to ensure
effective investigation and prosecution;

(c) to promote international cooperation on action against trafficking in
human beings.

(2) In order to ensure effective implementation of its provisions by the
Parties, this Convention sets up a specific monitoring mechanism.

The definition of TIP within the convention eliminates the necessity for the element
of movement to be transnational. The first UK Action Plan notes this by stating
"trafficking can take place both within and across national frontiers" (UK Home
Office & Scottish Executive, 2007, p. 14).

Since the Palermo Protocol, the UK has implemented several key legislation which
are listed in Table 2 below.

Table 2: Key UK Legislation for the Issue of TIP

Year	Name of UK Legislation
2002	Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act
2003	Sexual Offences Act
2003	Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act
2004	Asylum and Immigration Act
2009	Coroners and Justice Act
2015	Modern Slavery Act

In 2002 the UK passed the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act of 2002, which
came into force in February 2003 (Crown Prosecution Service (CPS), n.d.). Section
145 made trafficking for prostitution a criminal offence. Approximately a year after
the Nationality, Asylum and Immigration Act of 2002 came into effect, the Sexual
Offences Act of 2003 was passed. This legislation repealed the Nationality, Asylum
and Immigration Act as of May 2004 (CPS, n.d.).

The Sexual Offences Act of 2003 states that it is illegal to transport anyone into, within, or out of the UK for the purposes of sexual exploitation. If caught, this crime has a penalty of up to 14 years in prison (Sexual Offences Act 2003). The only aspect of sex trafficking that differs from the descriptions of pimping and brothel keeping (which are also illicit activities in this act) is transportation as outlined below (Sexual Offences Act 2003, section 57):

> Trafficking into the UK for sexual exploitation
> (1) A person commits an offence if he intentionally arranges or facilitates the arrival [or the entry into,] the United Kingdom of another person (B) and either--
> (a) he intends to do anything to or in respect of B, after B's arrival but in any part of the world, which if done will involve the commission of a relevant offence, or
> (b) he believes that another person is likely to do something to or in respect of B, after B's arrival but in any part of the world, which if done will involve the commission of a relevant offence.

Section 58 of the Act follows with outlining trafficking within the UK for sexual exploitation ("A person commits an offence if he intentionally arranges or facilitates travel within the United Kingdom by another person (B)…"), and section 59 continues with outlining trafficking out of the UK for sexual exploitation ("A person commits an offence if he intentionally arranges or facilitates the departure from the United Kingdom by another person (B)…"). The wording for parts (a) and (b) of each section outlines respective explanations. What qualifies as "sexual exploitation," especially in relation to TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation remains vague, though the explanatory notes offer examples of what may constitute an offence. What is particularly unique to the Sexual Offences Act of 2003 is that it not only makes it an offence to traffic for the purposes of sexual exploitation within the UK regardless of nationality, but also makes it an offence for British nationals to

traffic for sexual exploitation outside its borders anywhere in the world (Lipscombe and Beard, 2014). The offences outlined here do not apply in Scotland, however, the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act outlines similar offences of trafficking for the purposes of prostitution in section 22 (Lipscombe and Beard, 2014).

The Sexual Offences Act 2003 also goes beyond the Palermo Protocol's definition in that it does not necessitate the use of force, coercion or deception by a trafficker in order for it to be considered TIP (Goodey, 2008). In combination with the Sexual Offences Act 2003, the Asylum and Immigration Act 2004 (section 4) fulfils the requirements outlined by Article 3 of the Palermo Protocol. The Asylum and Immigration Act 2004 covers forced labour, benefits fraud and organ removal/trafficking, and is active in all of the United Kingdom, including Scotland (Lipscombe and Beard, 2014). Though the requirements outlined by the Palermo Protocol had been met, the legislation on TIP was criticised by NGOs and activists for relying on an organised crime/illegal immigration framework rather than a more victim-centred and human rights based approach (Goodey, 2008).

In 2009 new efforts were made to bring greater legal clarity to the offences of servitude and forced labour. Specifically, Baroness Young of Hornsey introduced new clauses written by the organisations Liberty and Anti-Slavery International which sought to criminalise servitude and forced labour (Lipscombe and Beard, 2014). It was argued these clauses would better meet the provisions set forth in Article 4 on forced labour and slavery of the European Convention on Human Rights (Lipscombe and Beard, 2014). In Section 71 of the Coroners and Justice Act 2009 "slavery, servitude and forced or compulsory labour" are offences identified as follows:

> A person (D) commits an offence if— (a) D holds another person in slavery or servitude and the circumstances are such that D knows or ought to know that the person is so held, or (b) D requires another person to perform forced or compulsory labour and the circumstances are such that D knows or ought to know that the person is being required

to perform such labour.

Most recently, the UK has passed the Modern Slavery Act 2015. It aims to eradicate all forms of labour exploitation and slavery. Further it requires businesses that fall into the large organisation category within the UK to produce an annual Slavery and Human Trafficking Statement (Howse and Whitaker, 2015). It does not, however, require businesses to ensure slavery and/or human trafficking is not occurring within their supply chains (Howse and Whitaker, 2015). Within the Modern Slavery Act 2015 (section 2) human trafficking is defined as the following:

> (1) A person commits an offence if the person arranges or facilitates the travel of another person ("V") with a view to V being exploited.
> (2) It is irrelevant whether V consents to the travel (whether V is an adult or a child).
> (3) A person may in particular arrange or facilitate V's travel by recruiting V, transporting or transferring V, harbouring or receiving V, or transferring or exchanging control over V.

The Modern Slavery Act 2015 combines the definition of TIP for sexual exploitation and non-sexual exploitation, replacing all previous definitions. The explanatory notes of the Act state that this will simplify the process of prosecuting offenders (2015, section 2), "Introducing one offence for all types of trafficking will make it administratively simpler for investigators and prosecutors to bring forward human trafficking prosecutions".

Of particular importance to note about this legislation is that it increases the previous maximum penalty of 14 years imprisonment to the potential for life imprisonment (for those with a previous conviction of a sexual or violent offence the sentence is automatically life imprisonment) (College of Policing, 2015). Due to its recent integration into UK law, critiques of the Act are currently sparse though time will most likely provide evidence as to whether or not its provisions are effective.

Much of the UK legislation on TIP has been critiqued for using a framework of illegal immigration and organized crime rather than of human rights (Goodey, 2008). These critiques were at least partially responsible for the enactment of the UK Action Plan on Tackling Human Trafficking as well as the UK's decision to sign the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (Goodey, 2008). These events in partial response to criticism are also an example of the way in which the construction of a social problem is a process and subjected to change (Saraga, 1998).

Further to this point, the US has been cited as influencing international change within the issue of TIP through its policies and framework of the issue (Chuang, 2006; Segrave et al., 2009; Soderlund, 2005). Specifically, it produces an annual TIP Report which researchers Wilson and O'Brien (2016, p. 30) described as "a key contributor to knowledge and perception of human trafficking." The report ranks and evaluates anti-trafficking policies of countries around the world, including the UK. Therefore, it is important to briefly cover this, and the way in which the UK's efforts to combat TIP are addressed within it.

1.4.3: The International Influence of the annual US TIP Report

This section will discuss the influence of the US on international TIP policies, specifically it will review key legislation with a predominant focus on the annual TIP Report. This annual report has been cited as internationally influential in anti-trafficking policies (Segrave et al., 2009; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

In 2000 the US passed the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA). Within this legislation "severe forms of trafficking" is defined in section 103 as the following:

> (a) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force,
> fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act

has not attained 18 years of age; or

(b) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.

Within this definition the TVPA (2000, section 103) defines a "commercial sex act" as "any sex act on account of which anything of value is given to or received by any person".

The notable difference in the TVPA definition is the specific definition for sex trafficking as well as including a definition for "commercial sex act". In this way, someone who solicits sex as a minor (under the age of 18) is automatically a trafficking victim. The US definition differs from the Palermo Protocol in that TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation is extended to include anyone under the age of 18 who engages in a commercial sex act. When trying to evaluate the issue on a global scale, discrepancies between varying constructions of how TIP is defined have the potential to cause confusion. This is of particular relevance in the case of the US through the implementation of its annual TIP Report, which will be discussed next.

As part of anti-trafficking efforts, the US surveys and ranks the anti-trafficking efforts of countries around the world. Annually, the US Secretary of State publishes the TIP Report, which ranks countries around the world in their efforts in preventing, combating and suppressing human trafficking. Countries are assigned to one of three tiers, and a brief summary is included in the report to outline why each is included in the designated tier. The rankings are determined by the US, and consequences of falling into the third tier may result in full or partial foreign assistance sanctions (Wyler and Siskin, 2010). Additionally, many of the TIP reports included estimates of the numbers of trafficked persons (see Table 3), which vary considerably in their sources and the actual numbers.

The methodology through which these statistics were obtained (particularly in the lack of transparency in which methods were used) and the numbers themselves have been subject to criticism (Anderson and Andrijasevic, 2008; Kelly, 2005). For instance, Kelly (2005, p. 239) writes:

> These adjustments can be related to both the widespread critique of the absence of documentation accompanying such figures and the development of more evidence-based approaches to estimation. The lack of detail about the shifts and why estimates continue to fall is regrettable because it precludes academic exploration and permits continued speculation about advocacy numbers. Adding to the lack of clarity is the fact that while the overall framing of the report is trafficking in persons, most of the content and data are confined to sexual exploitation.

While Kelly's insights are limited to the early years of the TIP Report, Table 3 shows how the numbers have remained inconsistent throughout the years. In more recent years the numbers of estimated trafficked persons have increased to the millions, and the sources of those numbers are largely NGOs with anti-trafficking agendas or vague references to "estimates of social scientists" (US Department of State, 2013, p. 7). Within the reports the lack of clarity in *how* the numbers were obtained remains consistent.

Further, the TIP Reports have been criticised for the way in which countries have been placed in each tier category. As Soderlund (2005) identifies, some rankings appear to match the foreign policy agenda of the U.S. more than they do by the anti-trafficking parameters put forth by the TVPA.

Table 3: Number of Trafficked Persons according to US TIP Reports

Year	Persons Trafficked Annually (emphasis added)
2001	"estimated that **45,000 to 50,000 people**, primarily women and children, are trafficked to the U.S. annually" (p. 3)
2002	(worldwide) "**at least 700,000** and possibly **as many as four million women and children**" (p. 1)
2003	(worldwide across international borders) "**approximately 800,000—900,000 people** annually" (p. 7)
2004	(worldwide across international borders) "**an estimated 600,000—800,000 men, women, and children**" (p. 15)
2005	(worldwide across international borders) "**estimated 600,000 to 800,000 men, women, and children** trafficked...approximately 80 percent are women and girls and up to 50 percent are minors" (p. 6)
2006	(worldwide across international borders) "estimated **600,000 to 800,000 men, women, and children** trafficked...approximately 80 percent are women and girls and up to 50 percent are minors" (p. 6)
2007	(worldwide across international borders) "**approximately 800,000 people** are trafficked across national borders, which does not include millions trafficked within their own countries. Approximately 80 percent of transnational victims are women and girls and up to 50 percent are minors." (p. 8)
2008	(worldwide across international borders) "**approximately 800,000 people** are trafficked across national borders, which does not include millions trafficked within their own countries. Approximately 80 percent of transnational victims are women and girls and up to 50 percent are minors." (p. 7)
2009	(worldwide) "**at least 12.3 million adults and children**"; "**at least 1.39 million** are victims of commercial sexual servitude, both transnational and within countries" (Numbers are cited from ILO, p. 8)
2010	(worldwide) **12.3 million "adults and children"** (p. 7)
2011	"**as many as two million children** are subjected to prostitution in the global commercial sex trade" (Numbers are cited from UNICEF, p. 9)
2012	(worldwide) "It is estimated that **as many as 27 million men, women and children**" are trafficked (p. 7)
2013	(worldwide) "social scientists estimate that **as many as 27 million men, women, and children** are trafficking victims at any given point" (p. 7)
2014	(worldwide) "the **more than 20 million** victims of trafficking" (p. 2)
2015	No number mentioned for estimates of trafficked persons worldwide

While the 2015 TIP Report stated the UK was in full compliance with minimum standards, it also identified areas in which the UK needs to improve (US Department of State, 2015, p. 350):

> The Government of the United Kingdom fully complies with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking. In 2014, the government issued its first modern slavery strategy, reviewed and made recommendations to improve its victim identification mechanism, and launched a pilot program to strengthen protections for child trafficking victims. The government prosecuted and convicted an increased number of traffickers, appointed an antislavery commissioner to coordinate anti-trafficking efforts, and passed the Modern Slavery Act in March 2015. While authorities continued to identify a large number of potential trafficking victims, the victim identification and referral system failed to assist many victims of trafficking, particularly children. Government funding for specialized services remained limited. Some victims were detained and prosecuted for crimes committed as a result of being subjected to trafficking.

References to the TIP Report were identified in the data-set. The references identified this critique as well as figures within the report. This exemplifies a way in which the TIP Report bears international influence. Further, Wilson and O'Brien (2016) conducted an analysis on the representations of trafficked person and traffickers contained within the TIP Reports. They found that the portrayals (depicted through anecdotes/narratives of trafficking from around the world) emphasised attributes of ideal trafficked victims and ideal traffickers. They argue that these idealized notions of victim and perpetrator influence the way in which the issue is constructed in policy, therefore having significant implications for the way in which the issue is dealt. They conclude that the idealized representations shift the focus towards criminal policy and prosecuting offenders and away from the structural and systemic root causes of the issue. Indeed, the way in which the issue is represented matters. Wilson and O'Brien (2016, p. 31) write:

> The representation of problems in policy discourse has practical consequences for government, as language sets the agenda for political action. Political language is imbued with normative and empirical assertions, which influence the perception of individual citizens and collectively inform the dominant perspectives within society. Thus, problem representation directly contextualises social policy.

The representations of TIP within official definitions and legislation are influential in the way the issue is understood and enforced. I would also argue that the way in which the issue is constructed through terminology used to describe and depict TIP also includes (problematic) assumptions of the issue, trafficked persons and traffickers. These assumptions, as they were identified through thematic analysis will be explored in the empirical chapters of this thesis (Chapters Three through Six). However, certain terms were consistently used as interchangeable and/or synonymous to representing TIP. This will be explored in the following sections.

What continues to remain evident is the difficulty in determining a precise and universal definition. This has contributed to ambiguity in determining what the issue includes and who it involves. This ambiguity is evident within areas including: 1) the terminology used to describe TIP, 2) the way in which certain forms of TIP (specifically sexual exploitation) have dominated academic and popular conversations/portrayals, and 3) the varied and inconsistent numerical representations used to depict the scale of TIP. These issues will be reviewed in the following sections, beginning with the specific issue of the synonymous use of "modern-day slavery" and "trafficking".

1.5: Navigating the Ambiguity: Issues in Terminology and Representations

The representations of TIP depicted within the media, anti-trafficking campaigns, political discourse and popular culture impact the way in which the issue is

conceptualised (Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). This thesis seeks to examine representations of TIP as they are constructed within UK national newspapers. In order to set the groundwork for this it is essential to unpack official and lay assumptions of TIP. In addition to the official definition and legislation previously discussed, this section will explore issues which arguably contribute to the notion of TIP as an ambiguously understood social issue, despite the intense reactions it invokes (Farrell and Fahy, 2009; Goodey, 2008).

As previously recognised, the modern-day issue of TIP has received widespread attention in popular and official arenas as well as acknowledgement that efforts are necessary to prevent it, combat it and help those who have been exploited through it (Wylie and McRedmond, 2010). However, despite its familiar recognition among government officials and the general public, it is also an issue wrought with ambiguity (Hoang and Parrenas, 2014; Munck, 2010; Wylie and McRedmond, 2010). Hoang and Parrenas (2014, p. 1) articulate this in the following:

> Although human trafficking is treated as a high-profile issue, we actually know very little about trafficking as a social problem. Despite hyperbolic claims in the media, we have no accurate account of human trafficking. As the U.N. Office on Drugs and Crime, which is responsible for monitoring trafficking, explains, "It is very difficult to assess the real size of human trafficking because the crime takes place underground, and is often not identified or misidentified." The issue is further complicated by competing definitions of trafficking. Some activists equate trafficking with prostitution, others do not; some distinguish labor and sex trafficking, others do not; some perceive child prostitution as a severe form of trafficking and others do not.

Through the variations of definitions (as evidenced within legislation in the previous sections), the overlapping of terminology and the way in which various aspects of the issue are represented, the meaning and understanding of TIP will vary considerably based on an individual's and/or group's interpretation of the

information. The following sections will give an overview of several of these areas of this ambiguous terrain. To begin, the next section will discuss the distinctive and yet overlapping uses of the terms "slavery" and "trafficking".

1.5.1: The Use of the Terms "Slavery" and "Trafficking"

The terms "trafficking" and "modern day slavery" have been used interchangeably as synonyms and yet each maintain distinctive differences. Referring back to the UN's definition of TIP, slavery is included as a form of trafficking, however, trafficking is not limited to slavery. In addition, slavery is not necessarily trafficking. However, popular representations of TIP have been identified as equating the two terms. For example, the A21 Campaign (n.d.) is a NGO that seeks to prevent TIP. On their website the issue is described in the following way, "Did you know that more than 200,000 women—one-quarter of all women trafficked globally—are smuggled out of Eastern Europe each year and end up working as sex slaves?". It is clear from this question that the terms TIP and sexual slavery are being treated as equivalent and the conditions associated with slavery are meant to represent the 200,000 women indicated.

This interchanging of terms is also represented within government documents such as the UK Action Plan on Tackling Human Trafficking (UK Home Office and Scottish Executive, 2007, p.2) which states, "Trafficking in human beings is an abhorrent crime. Many describe it as modern-day slavery, where victims are coerced, deceived or forced into the control of others who crudely and inhumanely seek to profit from their suffering". The connections between slavery and TIP are made clear, and are prevalent within academic trafficking literature (see for example: Bales, 2004; Herzfeld, 2002; Kara, 2009; Scarpa, 2008). Along with the connection between TIP and slavery, it is not uncommon to find sentiments of the general gravity of the situation, as Scarpa (2008, p. 1) writes in a book based on her PhD research:

While slavery and the slave trade were abolished long ago, new and more subtle forms of slavery-like practices are alarmingly on the rise in many parts of the world. Among them, in the last decades the international community has focused its attention on trafficking in persons, which must be one of the most worrying phenomena of the XXI century.

There is little to acknowledge that "slavery-like practices" are not always classified within the same category as TIP, and likewise not all situations of TIP will resemble slavery. The concepts, while overlapping in some trafficked persons circumstances, are still distinct. Vijeyarasa and Villarino (2012, p. 39) highlight concerns in this area:

The increasing tendency by academics and researchers, journalists, the United Nations, governments, civil society organisations and other policy makers to label human trafficking as a form of modern-day slavery is a powerful tool to attract support for this objective; but is also a concerning trend. In this conflation of trafficking and slavery the key elements that distinguish the two concepts are often lost, including in efforts to raise public awareness; to implement policies and programs designed to prevent trafficking; and to protect and provide reintegration assistance to its victims.

It is within the combining of these terms that those who do not fit the circumstances of slavery are overlooked. Further, though the Palermo Protocol has not changed, the continual and persistent representations of TIP as modern-day slavery through several sources of information (as identified by Vijeyarasa and Villarino in the above excerpt) construct the issues as interchangeable. This becomes problematic when officials need to determine who is and who is not a trafficked person. It is not as simple as demarcating categories of slavery-like conditions and non-slavery-like conditions, and as Andrijasevic and Anderson (2009, p. 154) argue:

> Hierarchies of suffering may reflect more the preconceptions and
> feelings of those who devise them than those who experience them. But
> workers, migrant or not, cannot be divided into two entirely separate and
> distinct groups—those who are trafficked involuntarily into the misery
> of slavery in an illegal economic sector, and those who voluntarily and
> legally work in the happy and protected world of the formal economy.
> Violence, confinement, coercion, deception and exploitation can and do
> occur within both legally regulated and irregular systems of work.

The central issue in the way that the terms of trafficking and slavery are used interchangeably is that this simplifies the complexities inherent within trafficked persons' experiences of exploitation. In their work on this issue, Anderson and O'Connell Davidson (2002, p. 12) identify that a person's interpretation of what level of exploitation is sufficient to be deemed trafficking is likely to "vary according to our political and moral values". They continue by asserting that this is due to the use of the term TIP as an "umbrella term" (p. 8) rather than a specific definition for a specific crime. Rather, there is a range of experiences which are included as TIP, and slavery-like circumstances are included when there is an aspect of movement involved (see Palermo Protocol definition in section 1.3.1).

The Palermo Protocol definition of TIP and other definitions based on the UN's framework of the issue lack clarity, which Anderson and O'Connell Davidson (2002, p. 8) attribute to, "so many different agencies, organisations and lobby groups [seeking] to address such radically different concerns and agendas through a focus on 'trafficking'". Many of these groups have a staunch position in eradicating sex work, which is that of the abolitionist position. This particularly strong influence on governmental positions and policies on TIP will be covered in the next section. Another, often opposing, position is that of the sex workers' rights perspective. Kempadoo (2005, p. xix) is positioned within this perspective and has also written on the problematic use of the term slavery in reference to TIP:

(Slavery) is a condition that is held up as the worst possible that humankind knows and immediately summons to mind the Atlantic slave trade with the capture and enslavement of Africans, the horrors of crowded vessels with men and women in chains and squalor, human markets and auction blocks with captive bodies on parade or for sale as merchandise, the whip and hanging-noose, rape, and torturous labor conditions. However, despite the violent and brutal history that the term (slavery) invokes, most researchers in the field of contemporary trafficking, even those who wish to incite moral indignation, acknowledge that debt-bondage, indentureship, and hyperexploitative contractual arrangements are the most common forced labor practices.

What Kempadoo also alludes to within this excerpt and explicates further on in much of the book from which this is taken (*Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work and Human Rights*) is the prevalence of representations of TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation despite research that suggests other forms of TIP are predominant. This is inconsistent in representations, as much of the literature suggests TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation is predominant. In particular, these representations of TIP were identified within the data-set and will be discussed further in Chapter Three (section 3.4.1).

Additionally, Bales (2004) is a researcher who is commonly credited with establishing these direct links between "modern-day slavery" and/or "new slavery" to the "old" Atlantic slave trade (Bales, 2004). However, the definitions and comparisons made within this conceptual framework are problematic in that they tend to oversimplify the definitions and the complex realities of exploitative circumstances (O'Connell Davidson, 2006). Further, there is an element of choice and free will that is absent in popular portrayals. As Hoyle et al. (2011, p. 326) write:

…constructing notions of ideal trafficking victims within a framework that draws heavily on the language and images of slavery can have unintended and adverse consequences for those whose cases do not so readily fit our ideas about slavery and about what it means to consent or choose to migrate and what it means to be coerced.

While specific portrayals of "ideal" trafficked persons will be addressed in greater depth in Chapter Four, it is important to note the associations with slavery have contributed greatly to the understanding of TIP as a whole: one that is often presented as an innocent/guilty dichotomy.

Recognising the way in which the issue is constructed does not mean that the afflictions which trafficked persons have endured are fabricated or that their circumstances are not physically and mentally gruelling. Rather, it is the idea of TIP, including the term itself that is the social construction. It is the categories of TIP, trafficker and trafficked person that have particular meanings which have been assigned to them. For example, research has found that people who fit the label of trafficked person do not necessarily describe themselves that way (Brennan, 2005). Additionally, those in positions of power to determine whether or not a particular person qualifies as trafficked (i.e. police, UK Border Agency, asylum officers) may miss properly identifying a person as trafficked if they do not fit preconceived notions of the ideal victim (Hoyle et al., 2011; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). Further, it has been noted that the point at which a person's experience transitions from being smuggled (crossing a border illegally without being coerced/forced or exploited) to trafficked is notoriously difficult to determine and will vary depending on who is interpreting the situation (Anderson, 2007; Kelly, 2005). What these examples convey is that the meaning of TIP is produced by factors such as the language used to define it, the circumstances which contributed to determining its definition, and the legislation that has developed in an attempt to deal with TIP.

As previously mentioned, there are divergent epistemological positions within the issue of TIP particularly in regards to sexual exploitation. The next section seeks to

give an overview of the discrepancies through the lens of the activist groups which have heatedly debated the issue of sex work in the context of TIP. The way in which these positions have influenced government policies will also be integrated into the discussion.

1.5.2: Epistemological Differences within Perspectives on TIP (for sexual exploitation) and its Influence on Policy

Within the academic literature on TIP, contrasting epistemological stances between researchers has resulted in stark differences (and at times conflicting) representations of what it means to be trafficked and who is a trafficked person. Wilson and O'Brien (2016, p. 29) identify the "epistemological divide" as occurring between researchers who view the issue as socially constructed (i.e. Doezema, 2004; Soderlund, 2005) and those who determine the issue to be "objective and observable" (i.e. Farley, 2004; 2006; Raymond and Hughes, 2001). This difference in epistemological approach is significant. As Wilson and O'Brien (2016, p. 30) write, "This definitional fissure has implications for the international policy response to the crime of human trafficking, both within a normative and practical context." The representations which emerge from these approaches have stark differences, and yet each side has influenced policy on the issue of TIP. These approaches and their representations as well as examples of ways in which they have impacted policy will be explored in this section.

When I started looking through research on TIP in the spring of 2010, I used the academic journal database EBSCO (through the library at Boston College, in Massachusetts, US) and typed in the search term "sex trafficking." At the time, I was more interested in researching trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation. In retrospect, I believe this was due to the attention it was receiving in the media. It has been noted that though people are trafficked for many reasons, the dominant focus in legal and popular constructions is that of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation (Alvarez and Alessi, 2012; Kinney, 2015). In my

initial article search, many of the results involved the work of researchers such as Farley (2004), Hughes (2004), and Raymond and Hughes (2001): radical feminists and leaders in the US movement against sex trafficking and prostitution. This is important, as initially, it framed what I understood about the issue from an academic standpoint.[2] When I arrived at York and engaged in more rigorous academic searches it became clear that this "objective and observable" epistemological approach (the abolitionist position) was highly contested by other academics who approached the issue as socially constructed (Wilson and O'Brien, 2016, p. 29). To navigate this terrain further, we will first explore the abolitionist approach and its influence on TIP policy in the US. Following this, the approach of the sex workers' rights position will be examined. Next, the way in which these positions influenced the development of the UN's Palermo Protocol and (as a result) UK policy will be discussed.

The primary position within the abolitionist approach to TIP is that prostitution is inherently exploitative (Barry, 1979; Jeffreys, 1997; Raymond and Hughes, 2001). Saunders (2005, p. 351) comments on the way in which this representation of the issue remains appealing to many individuals, groups and governments:

> Abolitionist representation of the horror of prostitution and the absolute violation of victims of prostitution therefore resonate with contemporary, widely accepted forms of women's human rights activism. It is also the means by which much older representations of victimhood from the epoch of White slavery have currency today.

On a broader scale, the partnership between radical feminists and evangelical Christians on the issue of TIP and sex work has been commented on by scholars (Anderson, 2007; O'Connell Davidson, 2003; Weitzer, 2007b). O'Connell Davidson (2003) suggests that the unlikely pairing could be more hindering than helpful.

---

[2] I recognize that the work of Hughes, Raymond and Farley has been criticized by academics as lacking empirically (for instance, see Anderson (2007), O'Connell Davidson (2003), Warren (2012), Weitzer (2007b)).

Strong views on the topic abound, and the position of the abolitionists (as previously mentioned) is that all sex work is inherently exploitative (Barry, 1979; Farley, 2004; Hughes, 2004; Jeffreys, 1997; Raymond and Hughes, 2001). For example, in her article *Prostitution, Trafficking and Cultural Amnesia*, Farley (2006, p. 102) states, "Like slavery, prostitution is a lucrative form of oppression". In addition, abolitionists have heavily influenced government policy on TIP, such as that in the United States. Raymond and Hughes, two radical feminist abolitionists, worked closely with the Bush administration in developing trafficking policy and practice (Weitzer, 2007b). In 2001, they conducted a report funded by the National Institute of Justice titled, *Sex Trafficking of Women into the United States,* in which descriptions of sex trafficking and prostitution overlap. For instance in the table of contents there is a section labelled "Health Effects of Sex Trafficking and Prostitution." Elsewhere, Raymond and Hughes (2001, p. 13) claim, "Trafficking cannot be separated from prostitution. Anti-trafficking policies and programs must address organized prostitution and domestic trafficking." The National Institute of Justice is the research agency for the U.S. Department of Justice. The implication of the U.S. government funding research which focuses primarily on one stance or position is that it creates a narrow, biased approach within legislation and policy on the issues of sex work and TIP.

Under the George W. Bush administration, the US government worked closely with abolitionist activists. Hughes (2004) was funded by the Department of State to conduct research and report titled *Best Practices to Address the Demand Side of Trafficking* (Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, 2009). It is also reported that abolitionists including Donna Hughes, Laura Lederer, Linda Smith, Michael Horotwitz, and Gary Haugen were involved in the process of the developing the US's TVPA (Weitzer, 2007b). Further, the report by the Global Alliance Against the Trafficking in Women named *Collateral Damage* (2007, p. 231) highlights the US position on prostitution as it was quoted in a government response to OSCE in 2005, "…prostitution is inherently harmful for men, women, and children, and that it contributes to the phenomenon of trafficking in persons".

The separation between the abolitionist stance on sex work and the government's position is unclear. The imbalance is of particular concern, as the other side of the spectrum—activists who advocate for sex worker's rights—is largely absent within U.S. and international legislation and discussions on the topic of TIP, particularly for the purposes of sexual exploitation (Miriam, 2005; Weitzer, 2007b).

Another predominant position in the sex work debates is that of sex workers' rights groups. They uphold the idea that sex work is not equivalent to exploitation, trafficking or slavery. These occur, as they do in other areas of work, but it is not exclusive to or a determinant of sex work. Rather, women who decide to work selling sex are risking their reputation, other vocational options, safety, health and social stigma (Bindman, 1998). Their position suggests a way to reduce these risks is to change the perception within society and advocate for rights that ensure fair treatment and safety. As Bindman (1998, p. 68) writes, "These are women considering all the dangers to which social exclusion will expose them, and the economic exploitation that they may face, and still calculating that this is their best available option".

Both ends of the spectrum are insistent that they are advocating women's rights and their protection within a legal framework, however, the abolitionist position advocates that all prostitution is exploitative and choice is irrelevant. In contrast, the sex workers' rights position advocates to decriminalize prostitution, reduce stigma of sex workers, and train officials such as the police to protect sex workers who have been exploited or abused.

A concern addressed by those who advocate for sex workers' rights is that legislation addressing human rights abuses does not properly protect or include people who have chosen to work in the sex industry (Doezema, 1998; Kempadoo, 1998). International and individual state laws, when discussing sexual exploitation or abuses within sex work, are primarily concentrated on forced prostitution. Doezema (1998, p. 42) writes, "This reluctance to address sex workers' rights can

also be attributed to the fact that it is easier to gain support for victims of evil traffickers than for challenging structures that violate sex workers' human rights".

Within the UK, research suggests that reasons why people enter sex work are complex. Mai (2009) found that, for migrants, sex work was not imposed upon the workers, who often had other options available to them. In addition, he found that of the 100 migrant sex workers he interviewed in London, only 13 percent of the females interviewed had faced exploitative circumstances, and of this group, 6 percent expressed that they were forced to enter sex work. While the sample size of the study cannot be considered representative of the entire migrant sex worker population, the indications show that there is a discrepancy between popular assumptions that the majority of migrant sex workers have been trafficked or exploited in some way. Mai's research *involved* the migrant sex workers in the process of relaying their narrative and *analysing their own* histories which were diverse. The majority of the workers exhibited agency over their life choices and were motivated individuals who were willing to take risks. Mai's findings also reaffirms the complexities within the issue of migrant sex work and the trafficking. This differs greatly from the representations provided in the media. The disparity between the lived experiences of the sex workers in Mai's research and representations within the media is important to recognise. As previously noted, the media plays an imperative role in the construction of the issue in their potential influence on people's understanding of the issue and policy formation (Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). Despite the influential impact of media representations, there is a gap in the academic literature in this area.

Additionally, while Mai's (2009) research study found few cases of exploitative sex work within the London area, other research suggests that trafficking for sexual exploitation is a pervasive issue (Chase and Statham, 2005; Kelly, 2002; Kelly and Reagan, 2000). As noted, Mai's research depicts an alternative representation of issues and lived experiences involving migration and sex work compared to popular constructions on the issues. For instance, a documentary focusing on sex trafficking

titled *Demand* (2006) is self-classified as investigative reporting. It is produced by Shared Hope International (a faith-based NGO) and the Chronicle Project. Conclusions shared during the documentary suggested that, of the 785 people in prostitution who were encountered, 89 percent wanted to escape. While the report is not empirical, it is a representation of the issue and a source of information that was broadcast to the mass public. This contributes to the way in which the issue is socially constructed, as Goode and Ben-Yehuda (1994, pp. 151-152) write, "the reality of social problems can be measured or manifested in some of the following ways…public discussion of an issue in the media in the form of magazine and newspaper articles and television news stories, commentaries, documentaries and dramas".

As Goode and Ben-Yehuda (1994) recognise the way in which social problems infiltrate society through popular representations, it is important to discuss the way in which these representations are constructed. Representations of TIP as they were identified in UK national newspapers will be discussed in depth in later chapters. However, the next section will identify ways in which TIP has been constructed in popular culture, and discuss relevant academic literature on this topic.

1.5.3: The Focus on TIP for Sexual Exploitation within Popular Portrayals

Through my process of surveying the academic and popular literature on TIP, many of the representations of trafficked persons relayed brutal narratives with similar circumstances: trafficked persons were repeatedly raped, beaten, and shamed; clearly forced or tricked into their circumstances; and held in prison-like circumstances and/or threatened with death if they tried to escape (Batstone, 2007; Hughes, 2000; Kristoff and WuDunn, 2009; Landesman, 2004; Raymond and Hughes, 2001).

Additionally, within a broader cultural context representations of TIP have been synonymously linked with sex trafficking. For example, in the popular fictional

mini-series entitled *Human Trafficking* the only featured storylines were those of women who had been trafficked for sexual purposes, and in the popular film *Taken*, human trafficking is viewed primarily as the sexual exploitation of women and girls (in the movie's plotline: abduction and auction of young women). This is also a particular issue within anti-trafficking efforts. As Warren (2012, pp. 106-107) writes of her own research experience:

> My ongoing research on transnational human trafficking focuses on anti-trafficking efforts and explores how international norms to combat human trafficking, global monitoring frameworks, anti-trafficking media, and activist groups have constructed a moral economy of gendered violence and transnational crime with a genealogy of discourses. In this social imaginary, innocent young women and children (most often minors) are captured and sexually exploited by sociopaths and predators, gendered male, who force them into prostitution far from home. Suicide, escape to a safe haven, or rescue and redemption are portrayed as the only exits from this terrifying situation. This morally driven and individualized construction informs the work of many international and national nongovernmental organizations (NGOs)…The result has been a widely circulating moralization of human trafficking as an exceptional form of transnational, sexualized violence, one that denies its gendered victims any sort of agency or voice in the matter.

While the "moralization of human trafficking" may influence the work of several NGOs and anti-trafficking efforts, it also has influenced the discussions surrounding trafficking legislation, most notably the Palermo Protocol.

The formation of the Palermo Protocol's definition of TIP involved heated debates surrounding what should be included, particularly focused on trafficking for sexual purposes (Bhaba, 2005; Gallagher, 2001)**.** Anderson (2007, p. 8) comments on this in reference to the Protocol's avoidance of defining what sexual exploitation is:

Since the protocol makes particular and special reference to prostitution and sexual exploitation, but simultaneously places a responsibility upon governments to protect the human rights of persons trafficked into sectors other than the sex industry, it can be read as taking a neutral stand on 'the prostitution debate'.

The implications of this neutrality and ambiguity within the definition risks jeopardizing the rights of those who do not fit the stereotypical examples of a trafficked victim (Bhaba, 2005). In the report by the GAATW, Skrivankova (2007, p. 216) writes about how in the UK, policy did not allocate for police protection for trafficked persons and left them vulnerable to deportation:

Under policies in force in early 2007, the police could not guarantee them protection, such as a 30-day reflection period, access to services or an opportunity to regularise their status. They could only try to negotiate protection for them with the Immigration Service. While this was happening in some instances, the Immigration Service often attempted to deport victims who the police regarded as witnesses and expected to be treated as victims of crime. The Immigration Service works on a quota system for deportations. So, for immigration officials, there is limited incentive to stop the deportation of victims of trafficking even if it assists police inquiries. Trafficked persons, including those who have been subjected to slavery, are caught in a Catch-22 of the government's making.

Policy dilemmas such as this as well as vague definitions (such as that of "exploitation" within the Palermo Protocol) disservices those who are trafficked.

Further, the stigma linked to sex work, one which implies immorality and deviance, risks isolating many migrant sex workers who have experienced coercion and exploitation on a less dramatic scale than kidnapping and complete deception (Warren, 2012). As O'Connell Davidson (2006, p. 17) writes:

Indeed, the immigration official or police officer who has read nothing about prostitution save the horror stories that are presented as typical by groups such as CATW (stories featuring girls locked in filthy rooms and variously burned with cigarettes, slashed with razor blades, whipped, punched, drugged, etc., etc.) may perhaps be forgiven for assuming that where there is no evidence of this type of physical assault, no rights violations have taken place. Equally, anti-slavery campaigners who define modern slavery as a condition in which a person is *totally* controlled by another person are not well placed to challenge the authorities to work with more complex readings of terms like 'force', 'deception', 'coercion' or 'exploitation'.

O'Connell Davidson's point suggests the significant impact of representations of the issue in influencing people's understanding of TIP and potentially the way authorities identify trafficked persons. Simplifying a complex, diverse and large group of people risks isolating (and therefore leaving them susceptible to harm) persons who are exploited but do not meet the extreme criteria promoted in textual and visual representations of trafficked persons.

Another way in which the complexity of the issue is simplified is through numerical representations. This will be discussed next.

1.5.4: Constructions of the Extent of the Issue of TIP

Statistics are used to depict a particular topic and provide information regarding quantitative characteristics. These statistics are numerical representations and contribute to the way the issue is constructed. While numbers are often accepted as objective, statistics have also been argued to be a form of rhetoric with specific motives (Best, 2012; Potter, 1996; Potter et al., 1991). As Best (2012, p. 7) writes:

Social statistics describe society, but they are also products of our social arrangements. The people who bring social statistics to our attention

have reasons for doing so; they inevitably want something, just as
reporters and the other media figures who repeat and publicize statistics
have their own goals. Statistics are tools, used for particular purposes.

In this way, the representations of statistics as utilised to describe and depict TIP
construct the issue in a particular way that is arguably working towards particular
agendas. Therefore, it is imperative to explore the way in which TIP is represented
through numbers and statistics to better grasp the way in which the issue is
constructed in this manner.

The Palermo Protocol focuses attention on dealing with TIP as an issue which
predominantly involves women and children, as noted in its title. This assumption
that women and children are the main victims is supported by statistics and reports
from a variety of sources (Aronowitz, 2009; Farr, 2005; ILO, 2008; Kelly, 2005;
Segrave et al., 2009; UNODC, 2009). According to the UN's Office of Drugs and
Crime (UNODC) there are approximately 2.5 million trafficked persons at any given
time (UNODC, 2011). Of these, it is estimated that 66 percent are women, 13
percent are girls, 12 percent are men, and 9 percent are boys. These numbers are
based on data from identified victims collected from 61 countries in 2006 (UNODC,
2009).

The UNODC's Global Report on Trafficking in Persons also reports that sexual
exploitation is the most frequent form of TIP, estimating that it constitutes 79
percent of cases. The next most common type of TIP is forced labour at 18 percent
(UNODC, 2009). However, there is an acknowledgement on the UNODC's (2011,
section 4) website that these percentages which suggest that sex trafficking is the
most predominant form of TIP could be due to a "statistical bias" in that a higher
number of cases of sex trafficking are reported and therefore more are recorded. The
UNODC's (2011) website also suggests that the recording of much higher
percentages of sex trafficking is potentially because "sexual exploitation is more
visible" (UNODC, 2011, section 4). Details regarding the number of cases reported
as well as any other data used to determine the statistics are not provided on the

website. The importance of this acknowledgment of potential "statistical bias" is that it indicates that there may actually be a *misrepresentation* in the way the issue is depicted in these statistics. Writing on the methodological issues within TIP research, Tyldum and Brunovskis (2005, p. 24) identified "representativity" and "bias" as two problematic areas:

> Since the ratio of cases identified by law enforcement or non-governmental organizations (NGOs) to the total number of trafficking cases in an area is seldom known, it is difficult to determine to what extent the identified cases are representative of the universe of trafficking cases, and which biases they introduce to our data. Focusing a study on these groups will not only be problematic in terms of developing estimates and analysing trends, but perhaps even more so in terms of producing data for description of basic characteristics of victims of trafficking.

In essence, there is a risk in constructing (mis)representations of the issue through biased numerical data. This is particularly evident when findings from studies which are not intended to be generalised to the greater population are used as representative regarding who is trafficked and who is doing the trafficking. This was identified in the data-set (i.e. Extract 5; Extract 10), and will be discussed further in Chapter Five.

Additionally, the UNODC (2009, p. 7) notes that "most trafficking is national or regional, carried out by people whose nationality is the same as that of their victims". While it continues to say that TIP does take place over routes that span the globe, the indication that the majority of cases occur within a national or regional area is important to note and is also acknowledged elsewhere (Bales, 2004; Quirk, 2008). The International Organization for Migration (IOM) estimates there are approximately 800,000 people trafficked over international borders each year, and makes note that others are trafficked within the borders of their own country (IOM, 2011). The International Labour Organization (ILO) is an organization of the UN

focussed on addressing labour regulations and issues around the world. The ILO (2008, p. 3) estimates that "out of 12.3 million forced labour victims worldwide, around 2.4 million were trafficked". Of the estimated 2.4 million trafficked people, the ILO (2008, p. 3) also approximates that 1.2 million of those trafficked are children or under the age of 18. The recognition that forced labour is not necessarily equivalent to TIP is an important one that is often glossed over in the popular media and even, at times, in the communication media of non-governmental organisations. For example, the terms of "slavery" and "trafficking", as previously mentioned, are commonly conflated and represented as synonymous.

As mentioned above, in a 2006 report the UNODC approximates 79 percent of trafficking cases to be ones of sexual exploitation and 18 percent to be involving labour exploitation. However, the ILO's 2008 (p. 3) report states that "32% of all victims were trafficked into labour exploitation, while 43% were trafficked for sexual exploitation and 25% for a mixture of both". The numbers here, while in some ways are similar, do portray a different message than those of the UNODC. The ILO's figures show labour trafficking as much more of an equal problem to sex trafficking than UNODC's figures. Both of these groups report for the UN, albeit in different areas, which exemplifies the difficulties in determining representative numbers and statistics for this issue.

Another source for statistics is the US TIP Report, which was discussed in Section 1.3.3. Within it, the reported statistical number of trafficked persons has varied significantly over the years (See Table 3). Seelke and Siskin (2008) note that the Department of Justice estimated an annual average of 14,500-17,500 people trafficked into the US. At the same time, there has been a lack of numbers for convictions and identified trafficked persons. According to a later report compiled by the Congressional Research Service, between 2002 and 2009 (the same years where there were high estimated numbers of trafficked persons into the US) a total of 1431 T-visas were issue (Wyler and Siskin, 2010). A T-visa is a special visa issued to trafficked persons that allows them to stay in the United States for a period

of 3 years and makes them eligible to apply for permanent resident status. By law, up to 5000 are with T-visas are permitted to stay in the US per year. This in itself should be critiqued since the estimate of 14,500-17,000 persons represents significantly more than the number of T-visas allowed. Secondly, the lack of issued T-visas suggests several issues within the process of identifying trafficked persons and/or suggests qualifying for this type of visa is difficult. As Desyllas (2007, pp. 67-68) notes the process of determining who receives a T-visa puts the potential recipient on the defensive through utilising a criminal approach:

> The T-visa allows "victims of severe forms of trafficking" to remain in the U.S. provided that they cooperate with law enforcement and assist federal authorities in the investigation and prosecution of human trafficking cases. While this law seeks to 'protect' and 'prosecute,' it places the burden of proof on the migrant to 'prove her innocence' and 'coercion,' as well as information about the organized criminal network that is assumed to be responsible for human trafficking. This stipulation appears to be counterintuitive to what this policy supposedly stands for, to primarily "protect victims," as stated in its title.

Chapkis (2003) also stresses that this type of legislation benefits the state more than it does the trafficked person in the way that protection for the victim is conditional upon the requirements of first helping to convict the perpetrator.

Additionally, the Bureau of Justice Statistics (BJS) provides statistics on any investigations involving TIP. Between 2008 and 2010 a total of 2515 alleged occurrences of human trafficking were examined. Of these, a mere 389 were considered to fit within the definition of human trafficking, determined by "high data quality task forces." The incidents included 488 suspects and 527 victims (Bureau of Justice Statistics, 2011, p. 1). Additionally, it was found that "More than half (62%) of the confirmed labor [sic] trafficking victims were age 25 or older, compared to 13% of confirmed sex trafficking victims" (Bureau of Justice Statistics, 2011, p. 1). It is worth noting that there is an emphasis on the age of victims in

reports of TIP. The issue of the representation of age of trafficked persons will be explored more in Chapter Four.

Labour trafficking is addressed within popular media and non-government organisations, but not to the same extent as trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation. There is an assumption that TIP, and especially trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation, affects women and children to a greater extent than it does men. This can be seen even in the Palermo Protocol which includes "especially women and children" in its title in reference to TIP.

More recently, the idea of internal (within country borders) TIP has been discussed within popular media in the US, particularly relating to trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation (which includes *any* person soliciting sex below the age of 18 *regardless of consent or treatment*). The reasons for this are, perhaps, reflected in the finding that "Four-fifths of victims (83%) in confirmed sex trafficking incidents were identified as U.S. citizens, while most confirmed labor trafficking victims were identified as undocumented aliens (67%) or qualified aliens (28%)" (Bureau of Justice Statistics, 2011, p. 6). An issue that was and is largely perceived to be one affecting countries across the globe, but not US citizens, it comes as a shock to some that the sex trafficking victims within the United States are predominantly American citizens (Fang, 2005; Khan, 2010). Within the data-set, the representation of internal trafficking was identified. It was found to be conflated with the issue of grooming, in particular on-street grooming by Pakistani gangs and at times referred to numerical representations as evidence for the significance of the issue. This will be discussed in depth in Chapter Five. Further, Ahmad (2016, p. 23) argues that numerical representations are "a social product":

> Statistics…are a social product. They often reflect the culture, structure and practices of the organizations producing them. Even when produced by experts – which they often are – they involve myriad choices that shape the final outcome. They are necessarily a simplification – and,

> sometimes, they can contribute to a simplified, even superficial,
>
> understanding of complex political realities.

An example of this can be found in the statistics put forth by UK Action Plan. In the 2007 UK Action Plan, it is noted that the scale of the issue within the UK is difficult to determine. It is also noted that trafficking for sexual exploitation is the most identified form of TIP and, in 2003, this involved around 4000 victims (Home Office and Scottish Executive, 2007, p. 14). However, this figure can easily be taken out of context. For instance, in a newspaper article printed in *The Independent* titled, *Think slavery is a thing of the past? Think again,* it is stated that "4,000 people, mostly women...are trafficked annually into the UK, to work in the sex trade" (Dugan, 2010, para. 5). The figure was based on data from the single year of 2003 and yet it was represented in the article as an *annual* figure. Further, the UK Action Plan estimates that there were a total of 4000 women trafficked for sexual exploitation, *not* as the number of women trafficked *into the country that year*. In other words the UK Action Plan indicates that the figure represents the *total* counted number of trafficked women present in the country at in the year 2003, not the number brought into the country (which would indicate a much larger total number when including the addition of trafficked women already in the country) that particular year. This misrepresentation of the data by *The Independent* suggests a much higher number than indicated in the UK Action Plan.

Furthermore, numerical representations of TIP within the data-set also referenced the UK Human Trafficking Centre (UKHTC), which is heavily involved in developing strategies to combat human trafficking and works with a number of government and NGOs, including charities and police agencies. The UKHTC was also behind Operation Pentameter 2, which sought to identify trafficking victims and arrest traffickers (UKHTC, 2011). This operation launched in October 2007. Results indicated there were of 164 victims identified and 406 suspected traffickers brought into custody (UKHTC, 2011). Interestingly, the results represented in subsequent news coverage on the operation indicated different numbers than the UKHTC. For example, *Police Oracle* reported the following on 3 July 2008:

The largest ever police crackdown on human trafficking resulted in police recovering 167 victims and arresting 528 criminals associated with one of the worst crimes threatening our society.

Human trafficking victims are brought into the UK and sold as commodities for the purposes of sexual exploitation, domestic servitude or forced labour. In the fight to make the UK a hostile environment for trafficking and protect victims and potential victims from this abhorrent crime police carried out six months of targeted operations.

Pentameter 2 is a coordinated campaign of activity aimed at disrupting those who engage in trafficking for sexual exploitation throughout the UK, involving all UK police forces, other law enforcement agencies, the UK Human Trafficking Centre, and other voluntary and statutory agencies (Association of Chief Police Officers, 2008, para. 1-3).

Additionally, two years later on 31 August 2010 the *Gloucester Citizen* reported the following:

Tonight a TV investigation will reveal the truth behind a murkey Cheltenham underworld linked to a network of brothels across the UK.

Gloucestershire police coordinated the country's biggest ever strike against people trafficking—leading to dozens of criminal convictions...

…Dubbed Operation Pentameter II, the coordinated swoops resulted in 528 arrests across the country.

They uncovered 167 victims, many of whom were trafficked into the country from China and eastern Europe.

Armed units burst into more than 800 premises, many of them massage

parlours and saunas, recovering victims as young as 14 and seizing more

than £500,000 in assets (This is Gloucestershire, 2010, para. 1-2, 11-13).

These misrepresentations also turned up in the data-set, for example:

The last major crackdown, Operation Pentameter 2 in 2008, saw 822

premises visited and the arrest of more than 528 individuals (Extract 13,

The Observer, 6 February 2011, para. 7).

The repeated misrepresentation of the number of victims and offenders identified is problematic and worth noting. Particularly, the use of numerical representations is influential. Best (2012, p. 4) recognizes how there is a tendency to accept statistics without question and that even erroneous numerical representations have the potential to "live on" as evidenced through the above examples. Ahmad (2016, p. 21) notes, "statistics are an authoritative way of describing the scope of a social or political problem. Numbers convey a sense of precision." In this way, the utilization of statistics within media representations of TIP is significant. While empirically based statistics can be useful in creating social change, "bad" statistics also influence change as Best (2012, p. 5) writes, "bad statistics are potentially important: they can be used to stir up public outrage or fear; they can distort our understanding of our world; and they can lead us to make poor policy choices." This is a significant implication and one that is considered in this thesis.

Additionally, the operation mentioned above indicated that of those arrested 57 percent were female and 25 percent received no further actions, penalties or consequences (UKHTC, 2011). In other words, *the majority arrested were female*. The articles mentioned above do not include this detail in their representations of *who* was arrested. While this statistic doesn't indicate that there are fewer male traffickers, it does show that the popular representation of the male trafficker is constructed on particular information (Bindel, 2004; Wiehl, 2006).

This finding was also corroborated by data within the 2009 UN Global Report (p. 6). It states that "a disproportionate number of women are involved in human trafficking, not only as victims (which we knew), but as traffickers (first documented here)". A UN Global Report (2012, p. 30) published three years later elaborates on the possible reasoning for this:

> …women traffickers are normally placed in low-ranking positions of the trafficking networks in order to carry out duties more exposed to the risk of being caught and prosecuted. As a consequence, a large share of women traffickers may also reflect the higher likelihood of this group being identified compared with male traffickers, as well as a possible investigative and prosecutorial focus on low-level perpetrators in some countries.

This is not to say that all or even a majority of numerical representations of TIP within the media are "bad statistics" or misrepresentations. Rather, it is meant to highlight how numerical representations can be used to construct validity within a particular representation despite the potential of bias, misrepresentation or error. As Potter (1991, p. 190) writes, "There is always a temptation to see [calculations] and representational practices as simply clear and obvious ways to capture what is there; that is, to see them as merely descriptive rather than rhetorically constructive." The way in which numerical representations appear within media representations of TIP, and in particular UK national newspapers, is significant in the way they construct what is known about TIP (and then, what this information rhetorically suggests). Instances where numerical representations were used to describe TIP are identified and their significance in how they construct the issue of TIP, trafficked persons and traffickers are discussed within the empirical chapters of this thesis.

The following sections give an overview on the issues and assumptions inherent within the representations of trafficked persons and traffickers as discussed in relevant academic literature. To begin, the next section will address the representations of trafficked persons.

1.5.5: Constructions of the Ideal Trafficked Person

The notion of innocence guides much of this discourse on trafficked persons, and in particular the data-set of this thesis (this was identified as a theme and will be discussed in Chapter Four). Innocent victims are constructed as "ideal victims" in that they are "weak compared to the unrelated offender, as well as having put a reasonable energy into protecting [themselves] against being a victim" (Christie, 1986, p. 19). Representations of the ideal trafficked person are consistent in portraying trafficking victims as predominantly women and children. Further, TIP is represented as a particularly abhorrent crime. This was identified as a theme and will be discussed in greater depth in Chapter Three. However, it is helpful to acknowledge here that *who* is represented as being trafficked is significant in the construction of TIP as an issue, and particularly the way in which it is represented as abhorrent. Therefore, this section will provide an overview of the way in which trafficked persons are represented as recognised and discussed in academic literature.

Indeed, Bastia (2006) notes that trafficked women are depicted as powerless victims in media reports, NGOs and other international organisations. The consequences of these types of representations are far-reaching. First, portrayals of trafficked persons as powerless dismisses their agency (Andrijasevic, 2010; Bastia, 2006, Doezema, 2004; 2010). Second, it detracts attention away from working conditions in fields of employment where there is high risk of TIP occurring (Bastia, 2006). Third, it makes it more difficult for governments to uphold and safeguard trafficked persons' human rights (Bastia, 2006; O'Connell Davidson, 2006). Finally, these representations too easily ignore vulnerabilities within the circumstances of trafficked persons' which led to their victimisation (i.e. economic instability) (Bastia, 2006; Srikantiah, 2007). As Srikantiah (2007, p. 163) notes, "Trafficked persons often leave situations of economic, political, religious and military

instability or tension." Arguably, it is through taking risks that are characteristic of empowerment that many persons find themselves trafficked.

Further, many trafficked persons know they will be working in the sex industry but do not expect the level of exploitation that occurs. As Doezema (2000, p. 24) writes:

> The majority of "trafficking victims" are aware that the jobs offered them are in the sex industry, but are lied to about the conditions they will work under. Yet policies to eradicate "trafficking" continue to be based on the notion of the "innocent," unwilling victim, and often combine efforts designed to protect "innocent" women with those designed to punish "bad" women: i.e., prostitutes.

Other research has shown similar findings (Agustin, 2002; Agustin, 2005; Mai, 2009; Peach, 2005). However, the media, NGOs and some government organizations more commonly promote representations that suggest those who were trafficked were unaware of potentially exploitative circumstances, especially if it involved sex work. Again, it is the notion of innocence that determines who are the ideal victims, and willing sex workers are excluded from this category.

In essence, the sex worker is conceptualized as socially deviant. This takes for granted the complex realities of those who choose sex work as a temporary or long-term vocation. The dichotomy between the forced/victimised sex worker and the agentic/criminal sex worker simplifies the diverse reasons and situations of those involved in prostitution. Ditmore (2005 pp. 109-110), a sex work researcher, critiques this in the following:

> The association of trafficking with victimization is commonly reflected in the language used, where the term 'victims of trafficking' is frequently encountered... problem with the use of the term 'victim' is that it fails to reflect the complexity of this issue or the experiences of all people who have undertaken to leave their homes and families to pursue a better future via economic migration …Trafficked persons are

not simply and solely victims; they are often the go-getters of their home communities. It is ironic that in this framework the ambitious and industrious poor who undertake migration are unrewarded, while 'pathetic' victims garner greater sympathy.

Ditmore makes a crucial point: simply referencing trafficked persons as victims is not accounting for more complex circumstances. In essence, the use of the word "victim" may impose an array of assumptions that hinder rather than help trafficked persons.

The choice of the word "victims" is a common one in relation to people who are trafficked. However, it is important not to gloss over the term without briefly considering its implications. In her work with abused women, Leisenring (2006, p 307) found that some women rejected the label of victim due to perceptions that being a victim also implied being "blameworthy or…weak and powerless". Similarly, Kara (2009) found that women who had been trafficked feel burdened with a sense of responsibility for their situation. This shows that assigning the label of victim to those who are mistreated or harmed will not remove a potential stigma that they could have prevented their own victimisation. The responsibility in these circumstances risks transferring the focus and consequently the blame of the exploitative circumstances from the trafficker to the trafficked person. Tverdova (2011) found that it is not uncommon for the general public to blame trafficked persons for their situations.

Of all the forms of TIP, trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation arguably receives predominant attention as previously mentioned (Hoang and Parrenas, 2014). Definitions of who is considered to be trafficked for sexual exploitation legally varies from country to country, and in the case of the UK will be determined by a limited number of people, usually a police officer or immigration official (Hoyle et al., 2011). However, even when a case fits the definition of trafficked person, a decision to declare victim status is still arbitrary. Hoyle et al. (2011, p. 317) report, "…we found that, in making the move from conceptualizing trafficking

to operationalizing it, people responsible for identifying individual cases continue to employ a much narrower understanding of what trafficking involves…only the 'ideal victims' seem to be legitimate". How authorities interpret who a victim is will be rooted in the way the issue and persons involved are constructed. As mentioned earlier, two influential sources in developing these constructions are the media and definitions.

According to Oxford Dictionaries (2013) a 'victim' is defined as:

> a person harmed, injured, or killed as a result of a crime, accident, or other event or action
> a person who is tricked or duped
> a person who has come to feel helpless and passive in the face of misfortune or ill-treatment

Someone who is "tricked" or "duped" is often someone who maintains a degree of responsibility in the situation. Education and knowledge can be seen as antidotes to these circumstances, suggesting that victims can have power rather than "feel(ing) helpless and passive in the face of misfortune or ill-treatment" if they have the right information. This can be seen in anti-trafficking strategies in Eastern Europe. Anti-trafficking campaigns are used to warn people, particularly young women, to not trust promises of jobs, money or fame as they may be ploys of traffickers, but often inadvertently promote gender and ethnic stereotypes (Andrijasevic and Anderson, 2009). While the focus on providing education for threats and dangers in the form of human traffickers seems worthwhile and helpful, the issue of providing support for those who have been trafficked remains. Anti-trafficking awareness campaigns set the stage for those who fit the "tricked or duped" definition of victim to be seen as bringing the plight upon themselves. It has been shown among the general population and law enforcers the belief that because a general awareness of the human trafficking exists men and women who still decide to pursue a job opportunity abroad are responsible for the risks that this choice entails (Tverdova, 2011).

A victim needing to defend themselves against the notion that they are responsible for their exploitative circumstances relates to the conceptualization of the Cult of True Victimhood. Cole (2007) developed the concept of the Cult of True Victimhood, naming it after Welter's (1966) influential paper on the Cult of True Womanhood. Cole (2007, pp. 5-6) outlines characteristics that she determines to define a "true victim," and names innocence as the most important:

> First with respect to his victimization, the victim's innocence must be complete and incontrovertible. True victims have not contributed to their injury in any way. Second, the victim is morally upright; he must be pure. This totalizing conception of innocence encompasses every facet of the True Victim's character.
>
> The Cult of True Victimhood's construction of innocence serves to limit victim claims. Accordingly, philosopher James Bayley argues that the designation 'victim' should be reserved for individuals who vigorously resisted their injury and were entirely powerless to prevent it (pp. 5-6).

This description, and particularly the representation of innocence, is seen within the portrayals of trafficked persons (this will be explored more in Chapter Four). Cole's conceptualization of the Cult of True Victimhood focuses the attention on the victim and removes the perpetrator from being centre stage.

Within this particular conceptualization of victimhood is that it is the victim's character and actions which are evaluated, not the offence. In many circumstances, trafficked persons must give evidence and/or convincing testimonies in order to prove that they were forced, coerced or deceived into a situation that involved exploitation. If the story is unconvincing it is likely that the person will be considered complicit in their own victimisation. Demleitner (as cited in Koslowski & Kyle, 2001, p. 274) relates the process of determining a sex trafficked person to date rape:

Akin to the attitude frequently displayed toward (date) rape victims,
police and prosecution often doubt that the women were forced into
prostitution. Rather, they view the migrants as complicit in the
trafficking and prostitution, especially when the women do not show any
signs of physical abuse. As is the case with other sex offenses, often the
victim is blamed because she 'should' have known what was going to
happen or because she 'should' have acted differently. This attitude fails
to appreciate that these women reacted to the economic and social
situation in their home countries in the only way possible.

It is exploitation that is the main focus of most human trafficking definitions, and to
judge whether or not a trafficked victim "should" have known what has already
taken place is irrelevant. The responsibility is placed on the victims rather than the
perpetrators, suggesting that the victims in some ways deserve the treatment they
received because in one of many ways it could have been avoided. Further, it is
irrelevant to consider how trafficked persons "should" act in their circumstances. As
is similar with rape victims, those interrogating trafficking situations frequently
attempt to discern how vigorously the victims attempted to escape the circumstance
and fight off the perpetrator. Physical signs of resistance are the kinds of evidence
that bolsters the claims of victims. In many ways, the victims of sex trafficking are
also expected to prove that they resisted their circumstances by either refusing to sell
sex to some degree and/or attempting to escape. These details are often reported in
personal accounts of trafficked victims (For example see: Townsend, 2011). If
neither of these takes place, the account may be questioned, especially if persons are
in the country illegally.

In order to fully expound on this further, a brief example from a newspaper story is
included. Within the media coverage of trafficked persons the discourse is
constructed from the trafficked person's perspective. Descriptions of attempts to
escape, or evidence as to why escape was impossible are common. To exemplify
this, an excerpt from an article in *The Guardian* is included in Figure 2 below.

Figure 2 Excerpt from *Trafficking Victims Lured to the UK: Locked Up and Raped at £30 a Time* by Mark Townsend, printed in *The Guardian* 14 May 2011

They drove north during the night, up from Nice, through the Channel tunnel and into London. Abina remembers stopping outside a tower block, her boyfriend guiding her into a tiny flat and then a back room where she was locked inside. The first British man to rape her arrived the following morning in mid-December 2009, the next that afternoon. The only time she was allowed to leave the room was to use the shower or the toilet next door. She had no phone, no television; food was brought to her room by her boyfriend. Abina, 26, from Ghana, says she could do nothing but wait, "miserable", for the next man. "It was my first time to England, my boyfriend said it was east London but I have no idea. I never ever went outside. There was a street below but the window was locked." For more than 300 days, Abina was incarcerated in the apartment, during which time hundreds of men visited, some black, some Asian, most white, and paid her boyfriend £30 to have sex with her. Men were allowed to beat her, she says, but most were not as aggressive as her boyfriend. He told visitors that they need not use a condom, and when she fell pregnant he punched her so hard Abina lost her baby. "He says they can do things without a condom, he says they can beat me because they pay a lot of money for me. I can't decide what I can do, I have no say. When he beat me and I lost the pregnancy, he said that I cannot be pregnant because I was a prostitute."

Within the above excerpt, references to Abina's behaviour and the conditions in which she were held do more than neutrally describe the scene: they present Abina as *a true victim*. This is accomplished by suggesting that she could not escape in references such as "she was locked inside," "the only time she was allowed to leave the room was to use the shower or toilet next door," "she had no phone, no television; food was brought to her room," and "I never ever went outside. There was street below but the window was locked." Despite the trafficker being her 'boyfriend', Abina is portrayed as powerless in her circumstances, and without

agency. Her story is the central focus: the trafficker is never named and described only secondarily in the way he interacts with Abina. This particular representation exemplifies how an analysis of news articles would offer important insights into the assumptions within depictions of trafficked persons.

In addition to trafficked persons, the construction of traffickers is also important to discuss. This will be the focus of the following section.

1.5.6: Constructions of the Ideal Trafficker

This section will discuss ways in which traffickers have been constructed within academic literature, political discourse and media reports. Constructions of trafficked persons, as explored in the previous section, facilitate the notion of the ideal victim. In a similar way, representations of traffickers depict ideal perpetrators. As Wilson and O'Brien (2016, p. 39) write that "The presence of an ideal victim necessitates the presence of an ideal offender." This will be explored in this section through reviewing several ways in which the trafficker is depicted and constructed.

Within academic literature, political discourse, and media reports, TIP is commonly referred to as an issue involving organised crime. Certain anti-trafficking groups, including CATW (Coalition Against Trafficking in Women), support the notion that most trafficking is conducted by organised criminal networks. Specifically, leaders of CATW, Raymond and Hughes (2001), suggest that this is the case in the United States. Segrave et al. (2007) report that there is a similar belief in Australia that traffickers are from foreign organised crime groups. A third example is Serbia where research suggests that many of the traffickers are male, involved in crime groups, and between the ages of 30-50 (Nikolic-Ristanovic et al., 2004 as cited in Segrave et al., 2007). However, it would be assumptive and problematic to draw vast conclusions based on localized research or general projections of the issue. Traffickers are difficult to track down, and legal reports show that there are minimal arrests and judicial proceedings in comparison with the estimated numbers of those

involved. For instance, in the UK there have been minimal convictions of traffickers. This is evident within the data provided in Table 4.

Table 4: House of Commons Report, *Human Trafficking: UK Responses*
(as referenced in Lipscombe and Beard, 2014, p. 8)

Defendants found guilty at all courts for human trafficking offences, England and Wales, 2005-2011[1][2]							
Offence	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011
Trafficking for sexual exploitation[3]	12	15	15	24	23	10	8
Trafficking for exploitation[4]	--	6	8	--	2	6	--
Total	12	21	23	24	25	16	8

(1) The figures given in the table on court proceedings relate to persons for whom these offences were the principal offences for which they were dealt with. When a defendant has been found guilty of two or more offences it is the offence for which the heaviest penalty is imposed. Where the same disposal is imposed for two or more offences, the offence selected is the offence for which the statutory maximum penalty is the most severe.

(2) Every effort is made to ensure that the figures presented are accurate and complete. However, it is important to note that these data have been extracted from large administrative data systems generated by the courts and police forces. As a consequence, care should be taken to ensure data collection processes and their inevitable limitations are taken into account when those data are used.

(3) Includes offences under the Sexual Offences Act 2003, Sections 57, 58 and 59.

(4) Includes offences under the Asylum and Immigration (Treatment of Claimants) Act 2004, Section 4. (Source: Justice Statistics Analytical Services - Ministry of Justice)

What is particularly interesting is the lack of statistical representations with which to compare them. In contrast to trafficked persons—where ample estimates are available from a variety of agencies—estimates on the number of traffickers are minimal. The scale of the issue of TIP is primarily based on quantifying those who are trafficked, not those doing the trafficking.

What can be concluded is that, similar to trafficked persons, there is a tendency to oversimplify the issue. Weitzer (2007b) highlights this popular 'villain' portrayal a symptom of a moral crusade. A moral crusade involves the simplification of an issue, and will often avoid acknowledging the complexities of the issue. This is evident in the descriptions of traffickers as evil. Weitzer (2007b, p. 452) states:

> As in other moral crusades, the perpetrators are presented as 'folk devils'…traffickers are vilified as predators, rapists, and kidnappers involved in organized crime and sexual slavery. A leading coalition member, Michael Horowitz of the conservative Hudson Institute, says of traffickers and clients, 'We want to drive a stake through the heart of these venal criminals. This is pure evil'.

Portrayals such as these suggest that there is a common enemy: "venal criminals" that orchestrate "pure evil." What is important to note in the popular descriptions such as the example from *Taken* (see Introduction, p. 9) is the nationality of those who are portrayed as traffickers. This conceptualization—that foreigners are the main perpetrators and particularly those from eastern European, Asian or African countries—lends itself to the promotion of immigration control. Segrave et al. (2009, p. 8) address this issue, "Within this framework [trafficking as organised by criminal groups] the danger comes from the outside: traffickers are believed to be associated in ethnically based transnational organised crime networks".

Traffickers are commonly portrayed as from Eastern Europe (as demonstrated in *Taken*), Asia, the Middle East, or Africa. Research has shown these groups to operate with distinct characteristics. Stoecker and Shelley (2005, p. 74) state:

> Russian traffickers do not depend on the women they presently control
> to obtain subsequent trafficking victims. In contrast, Chinese smugglers
> cannot stay in business if their abuses are too great because they are
> dependent on individuals agreeing to conclude 'contracts' with the
> traffickers. Chinese who contract to be smuggled rationally calculate
> their decision based on the experience of their compatriots.

The generalisations formulated show the tendency to funnel entire groups of traffickers into simple patterns. While at first this may seem effective, it can be counterproductive in that it is simplifying "who" the traffickers are by not identifying particular instances, thereby potentially hiding traffickers who do not operate according to this popularized norm. These descriptions also run the risk of stereotyping ethnicities and nationalities, rather than those involved in criminal activities who happen to be from a particular area. An example of this was the representation of research on internal sex trafficking in the UK. While the study (Cockbain et al., 2011) itself was minimally referenced (i.e. there was no indication of the study's methodology, data sample, type of analysis, details of findings), what was indicated was that the study identified Asian gangs and particularly Pakistani gangs as predominantly involved in trafficking British (white) minors. This was covered in the news (i.e. Extract 5; Extract 10). There were also a series of stereotyped and charged comments by political leaders, NGOs and the general public on this topic (i.e. BBC, 2011b; BBC, 2011c; Extract 1; Extract 9), exemplifying how the media's portrayals are influential in contributing to the way in which an issue and those involved are constructed. This will be covered in more depth in Chapter Five.

Further, as discussed in section 1.4.1 depictions of TIP which interchange "slavery" and "trafficking" draw on emotive connotations. Just as the association between slave-like conditions invoke images of people held in oppressive circumstances, these associations also draw on depictions of traffickers as brutal oppressors. This synonymous use of terms is evident within government documents. For instance, in the UK Action Plan against Trafficking (2007, p. 2), the introduction states, "we

must not forget the plight of the thousands of people who are still forced to live in slave like conditions as a result of the inhuman criminal practices perpetrated by 21st century traffickers".

The UK Action Plan against Trafficking (UK Home Office and Scottish Executive, 2007, p. 7) further outlines what is determined to be an important approach to the issue of trafficking into the UK:

> As human trafficking often involves crossing international borders, it is essential that measures to address it are mainstreamed into the UK's immigration system. Dealing effectively with human trafficking will be an integral part of the new Border and Immigration Agency's business, delivering the Agency's objectives laws. A strategy for Securing the UK Border will set out what we intend to do to strengthen our borders and ensure and enforce compliance with immigration over the next decade to respond to the main threats and challenges to our borders. The measures in that strategy will increase our knowledge and control over those who enter the UK. A number of improvements to our border control function such as the use of biometric identifiers and the development of e-borders will make it harder for traffickers to bring victims to the UK to be exploited. It is important to deter them at that stage as identifying victims and traffickers at the border can be difficult.

The idea of securing the UK border conflicts with the previous sentiments mentioned in the introduction. Securing a border as a means to prevent TIP is crime centred, not human rights centred. The mixed messages of needing to address TIP for the benefit of those who are trafficked (human rights centred) conflicts with the strategy proposed. How can an approach be human rights centred if the main solution is merely attempting to keep the issue out of the country? This does not help those who are being trafficked as it is naïve to assume that if it is difficult to legally enter a particular country people will merely give up trying by other means.

In addition, much trafficking occurs by legally crossing a border. An increase in requirements to enter the UK does not directly address the issue of exploitation after arriving. Quirk (2008, p. 111) writes, "The majority of victims entered the country legally, with traffickers making use of debt-bondage, the removal of relevant documents, and the uncertainty of many migrants about their residency status to exploit their labour".

An increase in immigration laws and requirements, based on Quirk's observations, runs the risk of further isolating trafficked persons rather than helping them. Police and immigration authorities are trained to view a foreigner without documents as illegal immigrants, based on the way the law is configured.

Alpes (2010) conducted interviews with trafficked women, and made the claim that the way immigration laws and systems are operated creates a demand for trafficking and smuggling. While a trafficker may exploit others, they may also be viewed as a resource to enter another country and/or a person who may provide or connect someone to an employment opportunity before exploitation occurs. The cost of the transportation or other services can be an amount that people are unable to pay upfront so an agreement may be made for the person to pay the debt off gradually over a period of time through labour or sex work. Those who are trafficked may take ownership of their debt and find it necessary to work until it is paid off. Alpes (2010, p. 127) writes:

> What is framed by the paradigm of trafficking as 'perpetrator' and 'victim' is hence in effect a complicated set of relations of dependency, reciprocity and obligation between actors that are all part of the same economy of the margins created by legal frameworks. Internal patterns of obligation and reciprocity cannot be seen from the perspective of a state that polarizes actors into victims and perpetrators.

This illustrates the overlapping similarities between "smuggler" and "trafficker", which are outlined separately in the UN Palermo Protocol. In the description above,

the exploitation within trafficking (working to pay off a debt) could also be viewed as a service-oriented loan. In smuggling the cost is often affordable by those who are hiring the services and payments are negotiated between the smuggler and those being smuggled. In the case of trafficking, it is the debt that forms the basis for exploitation. The differences between the smuggling and trafficking are not easily distinguished. Likewise, smugglers and traffickers can be the same person.

While the distinction between smuggling and trafficking is made in the Palermo Protocol and domestic law, the terms are used as synonyms without appropriate explanation. For example, Stoecker and Shelley's (2005, pp. 72-73, emphasis added) write:

> A large scale American investigation into a group of Chinese *human smugglers* permitted law enforcement personnel to gain enormous insight into the financial operations of the criminals. The confiscated records contained information from the recruitment stage through to the money laundering at the end of the operation. They revealed that this group of *traffickers* made a 90 percent profit on the 'business.' The largest expenses of the *traffickers* were the costs of corruption in both the transit countries and the United States, their final point of destination.

This confusion of terms is also found in the media's representations of the issue. For example, on 12 October 2011, the BBC posted an article called "African children trafficked to UK for blood rituals". The article states, "Over the last four years, at least 400 African children have been abducted and trafficked to the UK and rescued by the British authorities, according to figures obtained by the BBC. It is unclear how they are smuggled into the country but a sinister picture is emerging of why" (Rogers, para. 1). 'Smuggled' and 'trafficked' are used interchangeably, and while both hold similar meanings, the distinctions are important. The implication of this discrepancy is that authority figures who deal with these cases may also have

difficulties distinguishing between those who are smuggled and those who are trafficked.

Representations in the media, such as the examples previously given, construct the issue of TIP, which arguably influences the way the issue is understood by the public as well as the way the issue is reflected in government policy. In this way, an analysis of media representations is critically important. The following section discusses the influence of news discourses.

1.6: Representation, the Media and the Social Construction of Reality

This section seeks to conceptualize the way in which language socially constructs reality, and how this is achieved through representation. In particular, it begins by providing a rudimentary to influential contributions within the field of semiotics, which served as a general theoretical framework for this research.

Originating with the work of Ferdinand de Saussure (1966, p. 15), semiotics understands language as socially constructed or as "a system of signs". In this way, language is an entity that can be studied and analysed in its own right. Saussure (1966, p. 67) understood signs as being composed of two distinct parts: the "signifier" (the words designated to represent an object or concept) and the "signified" (the object or concept). His influential premise within this field draws on the idea that the connection between these parts moves beyond a simple naming process and is rather an *arbitrary psychological* relationship As commented by Saussure (1966, pp. 67-68):

> The bond between signifier and the signified is arbitrary. Since I mean
> by the sign the whole that results from the associating of the signifier
> with the signified, I can simply say: *the linguistic sign is arbitrary…*

> …Signs that are wholly arbitrary realize better than the others the ideal

of the semiological process; that is why language, the most complex and
universal of all systems of expression, is also the most characteristic…

What Saussure suggests is that language is not simply a reflection of reality, but
rather constructs reality. In other words, the sign does not merely assign a logical
name to an object/concept but rather, through the relationship between the signifier
and the signified, the meaning of an object/concept is constructed.

Also influential within the field of semiotics is the work of Roland Barthes. Barthes
(1972) wrote about the concept of myth as it applies to representations of reality
which are presented as timeless or natural rather than as constructions of reality
situated in specific historical and cultural contexts. This framework has previously
been applied to research on sex trafficking (for example: Doezema, 1999; 2004;
2010). In his work, Barthes also expanded on the denotative and connotative
functions of symbols and signs (Allen, 2003). Denotative meaning refers to the
literal meaning. In contrast, connotative meanings refer to meanings assigned to
symbols/signs through cultural, emotional or other means. Connotative meanings
can have positive, negative or neutral influence, but are often hidden and/or
overlooked. In this way, myths as dominant ideologies maintain power (Barthes,
1972). Allen (2003, p. 34-35) explicates what is meant by ideology in the following,
"Ideology…is the process whereby what is historical and created by specific
cultures is presented as if it were timeless, universal and thus natural". One means
by which ideologies are perpetuated are through representations in the media.

Stuart Hall is renowned for his work on media representations within the field of
cultural studies. In Hall et al.'s (1978, pp. 56-57, original emphasis) influential
work, *Policing the Crisis*, the social problem of "mugging" is contextualized within
a wider historical framework and the influential role of media representations are
discussed:

> What…is the underlying significance of the framing and interpretive
> function of news presentation? We suggest that it lies in the fact that the

media are often presenting information about events which occur outside the direct experience of the majority of society. The media thus represent the primary, and often the only, source of information about many important events and topics. Further, because news is recurrently concerned with events which are 'new' or 'unexpected', the media are involved in the task of making comprehensible what we would term 'problematic reality'. Problematic events breach our commonly held expectations and are therefore threatening to a society based around the expectation of consensus, order and routine. Thus the media's mapping of problematic events within the conventional understandings of society is crucial in two ways. The media define for the majority of the population *what* significant events are taking place, but, also, they offer powerful interpretations of *how* to understand these events. Implicit in those interpretations are orientations towards the events and the people or groups involved in them.

What Hall et al. argue is that representations of social problems, topics and/or events are not providing reflections of objective facts, but are constructing reality through representations in the news reporting. Meaning is produced within the articles through choices such as: the language used within the news articles, the events/topics/issues the newspaper chooses to print, the sources retrieved within the reports, and the quotes selected to emphasize a particular point. Further, Hall et al. (1978, p. 60) argue that "the media, effectively but 'objectively', play a key role in reproducing the dominant field of the ruling ideologies." This veneer of objectivity lends itself to news representations being more readily accepted as reliable (Best, 1997; Cohen, 1972; Hall et al., 1978). In order to determine what 'ruling ideologies' are being reproduced within the context of modern-day social issues such as TIP, it is imperative to continue conducting research on media representations.

The social construction of social issues extends as well to the representation of the issue through statistics. These statistics are often reported within the context of evidence within a news article or media source. Statistics are commonly used to

describe a wide-range of issues and make sense of the world (Potter et al., 1991), and TIP is no exception. There is an almost mystical aura around numerical. This is due to the popular notion that quantifiable information is reliable and incontrovertible (Best, 1997, 2012; Hall et al., 1978). Hall et al. (1978, p. 9, original italics) discuss this in the following:

> Statistics—whether crime rates or opinion polls—have an ideological function: they appear to *ground* free floating and controversial impressions in the hard, incontrovertible soil of numbers. Both the media and the public have enormous respect for 'the facts'—*hard facts*. And there is no fact so 'hard' as a number…

What Hall et al. identify is the ability for numbers, particularly in the form of statistics, to evade proper scrutiny. Numbers and statistics are not always represented in accurate ways. They can be taken out of context and/or misrepresented. As mentioned previously in Section 1.5.4, Best (2012, p. 5) indicates that "...bad statistics are potentially important: they can be used to stir up public outrage or fear; they can distort our understanding of the world; and they can lead us to make poor policy choices". Within research on TIP, it has been noted that determining accurate assessments of the scale of TIP is notoriously problematic and wrought with methodological difficulties (Jahic and Finckenauer, 2005; Kelly and Regan, 2000; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). Academics have argued that reliable quantitative data on TIP is non-existent (Doezema, 2000; Goodey, 2008). While determining whether the numerical representations of TIP are "bad statistics" is beyond the scope of this research, investigating the way in which they are utilised within the data-set is imperative to gain clarity in the way the issue is constructed. In addition, regardless of an academic acknowledgement that there is a lack of reliable quantitative data on TIP the inclusion of statistics within the media coverage of TIP constructs this information as reliable and newsworthy.

Further, Baker et al. (2013) suggest that newsworthiness is achieved through the act of reporting on a particular topic, event or issue. This determination of the journalist

and newspaper to prioritise certain stories, issues or events over others has been termed agenda-setting (Protess and McCoombs, 2016, p. 2), "Agenda-setting is a relational concept specifying a positive connection between the emphases of the news media and the perceived importance of these topics to the news audience." Protess and McCoombs identify this as the first stage of public opinion formation. In this way, what the media chooses to report has the potential to influence the public agenda.

The information included within a news article is influential in that it prioritises certain details, issues and perspectives over others. This occurs even if the journalist/newspaper attempted to remain unbiased as the inclusion and exclusion of information constructs the story. One way in which the construction of a news story can be particularly problematic is when a people group is Othered or when stereotypes are utilised to depict people groups or circumstances. Gorham (1999, pp. 231-232) conducted research on stereotypes within media representations and writes the following:

> Scholars of the critical and cultural schools…approach the importance of stereotypes in the media from the perspective that they signify racial understandings and social relations in the society at large, as well as signify the power relations within society… "Signify" is used because the word suggests a process of selection and exclusion, as well as the *re-presentation* of something. Crucial to this is the idea that there is no absolute reality in the empirical sense. Instead, our idea of what is "real" is constructed from the social world around us, a social world that includes different social groups, with different power relations between them, and the media…Stereotypes can be thought of, then, as a particular subset of social reality beliefs: they are understandings about particular social groups that we have learned from our social world.

Language is critical to these understandings. The way an issue, such as TIP, is depicted within the media intersects with beliefs regarding "particular social

groups". This is evident through depictions of the persons involved with social issues, which in the case of TIP includes trafficked persons and traffickers. Coverage of the issue regarding who and what is involved within media portrayals has the opportunity to impact the reader's perspective simply from the exposure to the details represented in featured news stories (however, this does not imply *how* the reader will interpret the available information or *what* they believe about the information represented) (Protess and McCombs, 2016).

Further, the media plays a significant role in the social construction of modern-day social issues, such as TIP. It is essential to conduct research on the ways in which media representations socially construct social issues as well as victims and perpetrators in order to as Barak (1994, p. 4) writes, "there is an important need for analysts of media to deconstruct culturally taken-for-granted factuality". Through this process it is possible to identify problematic stereotypes and/or limiting discourses within the representations of a social issue such as TIP. Further, this type of research also allows for identifying ways in which the representation of social issues, such as TIP, can improve and become more effective in creating public awareness and promoting social justice.

 The role of the media in the social construction of social issues will be discussed in further depth in the following section.

1.7: The Role of the Media in the Social Construction of TIP as a Social Issue

This section will address the role of media discourse in the social construction of TIP as a social issue. In particular, this section will argue that these representations of TIP within news discourse are influential in determining public opinion, laws and policies. Academics have recognised that TIP is a social issue which has received ample attention from the media. As Anderson and Andrijasevic (2008, p. 135) write:

> Trafficking is in the news. It is on the political agenda, both nationally
> and internationally. Thousands of individuals, hundreds of groups,
> dozens of newspapers are determined to stamp it out. This focus on
> trafficking consistently reflects and reinforces deep public concern about
> prostitution/sex work, and also about immigration and the abuse and
> exploitation it so frequently involves.

The social constructionist approach views a social issue or problem as a process. This process is initiated through claimsmakers who highlight something as a particular issue in an effort to draw attention to it and/or achieve some level of change in the area (Best, 1997). TIP is an example of a social issue, and its process of becoming a social issue has been discussed in previous sections. Activists, government officials, authorities (i.e. police, border security forces) and academics were involved in the initial claimsmaking process of TIP. However, within this process the campaign efforts from different activist groups as well as political agendas contributed to the production of a definition of TIP which has been aptly accused of being vague and ambiguous (Bhaba, 2005; Doezema, 2002). This ambiguity leaves open a discursive space which allows other claims-makers (such as the media) to further (and often more narrowly and explicitly) socially construct the issue of TIP including who is a trafficked person and who is a trafficker.

For example, as discussed previously, TIP has been equated with the term modern-day slavery, and while under the UN definition "slavery or practices similar to slavery" is included as a form of trafficking, the terms are not synonymous. The inclusion of several types of exploitation may first appear to be productive as it accounts for most, if not all, possible circumstances of TIP. However, this is arguably also a weakness of the official definitions, including the Palermo Protocol. In essence, this extensive variation among forms of TIP opens the door for more emotive and abstract factors to influence authorities' decisions regarding who is trafficked. One such abstract and/or emotive factor includes TIP's representation as a particularly abhorrent social issue.

In a similar argument, Ronaldo Munck (2010, p. 19) addresses the inclusive and unclear modern definition of slavery:

> By broadening the definition of slavery… [as done in the UN's High Commissioner for Human Rights, 1991] the meaning of slavery as a specific relation of production involving direct ownership of the worker is dissipated. Nor is there any particularly coherent rationale to lump together such diverse abuses of people. What seems to unite them rather in Western liberal political discourse is a particular perception of these abuses as being horrendous and abnormal.

This is similar in regards to TIP. The broad definition of TIP "lumps together" a range of exploitative practices. One way these various forms of TIP can be united together is through the representation that the issue is particularly abhorrent. While this may appear to be unproblematic (a person's experience of being trafficked may be considered abhorrent by many people) when the label serves to *construct* the issue it is significant as it is nearly impossible to operationalise. In this way, determining whether or not a person has been trafficked or has acted as a trafficker is left to the jurisdiction of those who have power to govern these cases. Authorities whose perception of the issue is that it is particularly abhorrent will likely determine the status of potentially trafficked persons and/or traffickers through this lens. This lens will vary on an individual basis influenced by each person's beliefs, values and political stances. Commenting on this, Anderson (2007, p. 11) suggests there is a continuum of migrant working conditions that ranges between extreme mistreatment and exploitation to a freedom of choice and adherence to human rights. Through this she illustrates the inherent subjectivity of determining trafficked persons:

> At one pole of the continuum, we can find people who have been transported at gunpoint, then forced to labour through the use of physical and sexual violence and death threats against them or their loved ones back home. At the other pole, we can find people who have not been charged exorbitant rates by recruiting agencies or deceived in any way about the employment for which they were recruited, and who

are well-paid and work in good conditions in an environment protective
of their human and labour rights. But between the two poles lies a range
of experience. Ideas about the precise point on this continuum at which
tolerable forms of labour migration end and trafficking begins will vary
according to our political and moral values.

This is a critical concept when considering representations of trafficked persons.
Narratives that portray persons in which there is clear evidence of force and/or
physical/sexual/emotional abuse represent the extreme end of the continuum which
Anderson identifies. However, there is a large gap between the narratives which
include details that could be considered particularly abhorrent and other experiences
of exploitation which do not. This has the potential to impact the way others who
have been exploited and meet the criteria of trafficked are identified and treated
(Skrivankova, 2010). Thus, trafficked persons who have not experienced the same
level of mistreatment/abuse/exploitation but have nevertheless been trafficked are at
risk of being overlooked or sceptically questioned because they do not fit the
category of the ideal victim (Christie, 1986; Cole, 2007; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

Within the media, these representations of TIP can be viewed as agenda-setting. As
Protess and McCombs (2016, p. 2) write, "The concept of agenda-setting is an
assertion that the audience learns what issues are important from the priorities of the
news media and incorporates a similar set of weights in their own personal
agendas". While the media does not control the way people respond or feel about a
particular issue or event, they do control what is and is not reported. This power to
heavily influence and determine what information is disseminated to the mass public
is crucial to examine. This is especially important to study within the context of
social issues where human rights and social justice are at stake. The way in which an
issue is represented and the (dominant) discourse which is utilised in this process to
socially construct it has the potential to influence the policies, attitudes and actions
of a society (Best, 1997; Protess and McCombs, 2016; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

This is corroborated by many academics who have made convincing arguments suggesting the media maintains a strong influence in the way information is disseminated and interpreted by the mass public (Baker et al., 2013; Entman, 2007; Jenks, 2006; McCoombs, 2004; McShane and Williams, 1994; van Dijk, 1993; Wanta et al., 2004). In particular, the representation of news has been labelled as "the most significant communication by which the average person comes to know the world outside his or her immediate experience" (Barak, 1994, p. 3). Further, Jenks (2006, p. 1) discusses the historical context of news within the UK:

> Historically news has had multiple functions in the exercise of power, both within Britain and as an extension of British power overseas. Since the mid-nineteenth century Britain had a strong tradition of press liberty. The growth of journalistic professionalism and its claim to objectivity gave the press greater credibility, the emergence of an advertising-supported mass circulation press made the media profitable and their presumed influence over the newly enfranchised masses made them powerful. Monopoly public service radio later added to the mix. By the mid-twentieth century Britain was saturated with news media commercial, political and public service.

It is this "exercise of power" which makes the news an important medium to analyse, particularly in its "claim to objectivity". Van Dijk (1988, 1991, 1993, 2001) has worked extensively within the field of news analysis. He argues that in newspapers, each word is chosen with precision to convey the most important information, according to the journalist or editor (van Dijk, 1991). Van Dijk (1991) has notably used critical discourse analysis to identify the racist tendencies within the reporting in British newspapers. Similarly, Teo (2000) analysed Australian newspapers and found racist language/tendencies within the articles.

Cohen (2002, p. xx) also suggests that the influence of the corporate news is one which is particularly significant, "The powerful, increasingly homogenized and corporate news media blame other media forms. But their own effect is the most

tangible and powerful, shaping the populist discourse and political agenda-setting". By analysing the thematic content within newspaper articles it will be possible to identify key ways in which the issue of TIP, trafficked persons, and traffickers are represented to the public. In this way, it will be possible to identify ways in which "the populist discourse and political agenda-setting" are potentially influenced in regards to assumptions and information available on TIP.

The news is not an objective source for facts, but rather the language used to communicate the news is value-laden as van Dijk (1988, p.177) notes, "…lexical choice is an eminent aspect of news discourse in which hidden opinions or ideologies may surface." Congruently, Fowler (1991, p. 4) writes:

> News is a representation of the world in language…it imposes a structure of values, social and economic in origin, on whatever is represented; and so inevitably news, like every discourse, constructively patterns that of which it speaks. News is a representation in this sense of construction; it is not a value-free reflection of 'facts'…There are always different ways of saying the same thing, and they are not random, accidental alternatives. Differences in expression carry ideological distinctions (and thus differences in representation).

Lexical choices such as who is mentioned and which details are given mirror an inherent ideology of the journalist and newspaper (Teo, 2000). These decisions are not glossed over by the journalist or news editor, and it is due to this intentionality implicit in the construction of news stories that analysis is not only worthwhile but essential to understanding the biases and prejudices hidden beneath the surface of news articles on TIP. As Wallinger (2010) asserts, the news is the primary source of information for international issues, particularly atrocities. Regardless of whether or not a person has come into close personal contact with trafficked persons or traffickers (though it is presumable that the majority of people have not knowingly interacted with either), the phrases "human trafficking" and/or "trafficking in persons" are frequently used and referenced. For example, a Google search for the

term "human trafficking" conducted on 16 April 2016 turned up 20,400,000 results. Similarly, a Google search for the term "trafficking in persons" conducted on the same day turned up 45,800,000 results. The use of the terms are pervasive.

The media, through the process of reporting news, construct versions of reality, despite their framework of seeking objectivity. Therefore, the coverage this issue receives in the news is arguably highly influential in shaping the way people understand and (for some) interact with the issue. As Best (1997, p. 74) writes:

> ...research on the news media shows that a variety of conventions and constraints shape the construction of news stories (Altheide 1976; Epstein 1973; Gans 1979; Molotch and Lester 1974; Tuchman 1978). The media do not merely transmit claims; they translate and transform them. The media are *secondary claims makers*....every story seeks to offer a convincing construction of reality. Moreover, stories about claims-making very often accept the essential accuracy of the claims being reported. The rhetoric of secondary claims in the media, shaped by the conventions and constraints of news work, deserves examination, since claims usually reach the largest share of the population through media coverage.

For example, media portrayals have associated TIP with slavery rather than a complex spectrum of exploitative experiences (Hoyle et al., 2011). These portrayals minimise the complexities inherent within the lived experiences of trafficked persons, many of whom have to navigate the ambiguous and inconsistent line between being identified as a trafficked person or a criminal (Aradau, 2004). The implications of these "construction[s] of reality" involve influencing policy on TIP as well as issues dealing with victim identification. These and other issues identified within the representations of TIP in UK national newspapers will be explored in this thesis.

As Best (1997) argued, it is important to conduct analysis on secondary claims which exist in the media. TIP is a social issue for which the media has served as "secondary claims-makers". Therefore, it is imperative to explore the ways in which the media's representations of TIP have constructed the issue. Further, it is important to identify and critique any assumptions within the representations of TIP that minimise and/or over-simplify the issue.

The media has been recognised as an influential source when it comes to social issues, and arguments have been made that suggest there is a significant implication of media representations influencing government policy (Ahmad, 2016; Farrell and Fahy, 2009; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). Farrell and Fahy (2009, p. 618) state this clearly in the following:

> Since most people have little, if any, personal experience with crime, it is not entirely surprising that media coverage shapes the public's attitudes and perceptions about crime problems and the most appropriate solutions to criminal problems. The media has provided a vehicle for anti-trafficking stakeholders to convey messages to the public...As a result, media representations of human trafficking problems, both in response to and in furtherance of claims makers at different stages illustrate publicly accepted definitions of and solutions to the problem.

Therefore, it is essential to examine the ways in which TIP is represented within media reports. It was determined that a logical initial step to examining media representations was through a thematic analysis of UK national newspapers. A rationale for this choice as well as an overview of the decisions and process undertaken during analysis is covered in Chapter Two.

Chapter Two: Methods and Methodology

2.1: Introduction

This chapter will provide an overview of data collection and data analysis. To begin, this chapter provides a rationale for the use of newspapers as data. Second, it introduces the data-set in the following ways: the process of data collection, research decisions that were made during this process, and the final make-up of the newspaper articles which comprise the data-set. Third, a rationale is provided for the decision to use thematic analysis for this research. The methodological approach I followed throughout my analysis is also outlined and discussed in this chapter.

2.2: Using Newspapers as Data

For my data, I chose to work with newspapers. As a medium, newspapers are an influential and important source in which to learn information. Baker et al. (2013, p. 2) write that they maintain "an important role in shaping opinions as well as setting agendas regarding the importance of certain topics".

Newspapers, and the media in general, construct reality through the way in which they represent the topics that they cover (Baker et al., 2013). The representations of events, issues, and persons within newspapers are not neutral or unbiased (Baker et al., 2013; van Dijk, 1991). Baker et al. (2013, p. 3) write:

> As it is never possible to present a completely impartial, accurate and full account of an event, instead the media offer *representations* of events…Such representations are often restrained by space and time limitations; journalists need to prioritise particular events, as well as

certain people's perspectives or opinions, over others. Additionally, summaries of events may be coloured by the political priorities of newspapers or the abilities of the journalists who are writing for them. In the United Kingdom, national newspapers function as more than mere 'mirrors' of reality. Instead, they have the role of constructing ideologically motivated versions of reality, which are aimed at persuading people that certain phenomena are good or bad…Thus, British national newspapers attempt to exert (often successfully) social and political influence, though…newspapers must also balance this aim with reflecting the views of audiences.

Newspapers are the means by which many people are informed about issues they would otherwise know very little. TIP is an issue that fits this mould: most people do not (knowingly) encounter people involved in the issue on a daily basis or at all.

For these reasons, analysing the way British broadsheets and tabloids represented and described the issue of TIP, trafficked persons and traffickers seemed not only reasonable but logical: it was a useful way to gain an initial grasp on what many in the general public use as a way to determine what TIP is, who is involved and what to make of it. Further, conducting a thematic analysis on the articles allowed for the identification of ideological assumptions and key conceptualizations incorporated into the representation of TIP and those involved. This is essential in addressing the issue. Identifying these themes and discussing their implications contributes to recognising the complexities of the issue and enables an understanding of various ways in which the issue is portrayed by this particular form of media.

2.3: An Overview of the Data-set

In this section, an overview of the decisions which guided the criteria for the final data-set will be provided. This will include details regarding the make-up of the data-set: the newspapers, the types of articles, the timeframe, the search terms, and

decisions that corresponded to these details. The final section of the chapter will outline and discuss the analysis of the newspaper articles which comprised the data-set.

2.3.1: The Newspapers

A common way in which UK national newspapers are distinguished is between the categories of broadsheet and tabloid. Typically, broadsheets have been acknowledged as "larger, contain more text, have more focus on international news and political analysis, and generally use a more formal writing style" (Baker, 2013, p. 6). Tabloids, in comparison, are associated more with entertainment news, celebrity gossip, and sports. The writing style of the tabloids is typically casual, the size of the paper is smaller, and there is a greater emphasis on national news (Baker, 2013). However, as Baker (2013, p. 7) notes, this binary distinction is simplistic and does not fully emphasize the way in which differences between newspapers can be determined:

> Distinctions between newspapers are…made with regard to multiple factors and are gradient in nature rather than binary. As well as noting that the distinction between tabloid and broadsheet is impressionistic and personal, we also need to take into account the fact that newspapers can change style over time, or even within a particular issue.

 Other characteristics of newspapers that distinguish one from the next include: political alignment (which has been noted can vary over time and/or issue: see Baker, 2013; Conboy, 2004; Elgamri, 2008), circulation size, readership demographics (i.e. economic class), and even religious association.

As my purpose was to explore the way in which TIP was represented in British national newspapers, I aimed to select newspapers which would be varied in circulation size, political alignment, religious association, and classification as tabloid/broadsheet. Therefore, with these considerations, my selection included four

national UK newspapers: two broadsheets and two tabloids as well as their Sunday counterparts. The newspapers selected were the following: *The Guardian, The Times, Daily Mail,* and *The Sun*. The Sunday counterparts to these four newspapers included the following: *The Observer, The Sunday Times, Mail on Sunday,* and *Sunday Sun.*

In January 2012, *The Guardian* printed circulation data calculated by the Audit Bureau of Circulation (ABC)[3]. The ABC is a respected membership body which (as one of their functions) provides media data. Table 5 indicates circulation numbers for the newspapers in the data-set with the exception of *Sunday Sun*, which was not included in the reported numbers:

Table 5: Newspaper circulation figures

Newspaper	Circulation size between July 2011 - December 2011
The Sun	2,702,949
Daily Mail	2,019,076
Mail on Sunday	2,039,342
The Times	426,675
Sunday Times	978,770
The Guardian	234,845
The Observer	272,250
Source: ABC, as cited in *The Guardian* 13 January 2012	

---

[3] These statistics are only available through subscription, and therefore could not be attained except through a secondary source.

In regards to political alignment *The Guardian* is generally considered left-leaning whereas *The Times*, *The Sun*, and *Daily Mail* are considered right-leaning (Baker, 2013; Elgamri, 2008). As for religious association, Baker (2013, p. 9) discusses how British national newspapers can be situated on a "pro-/anti-religious continuum". For instance, he notes how *The Sun* and the *Daily Mail* are toward the pro-Christian end of the continuum, *The Times* is in the middle, and *The Guardian* is at the secularist end "which [was] sometimes more openly critical of religion".

On a final note, the *Daily Mail* and *The Sun* are similarly grouped in many of these categorizations. However, as Baker (2013, p. 7) writes, there are several distinctions:

> A newspaper such as *The Sun* could be thought of as being a typical tabloid, having its title in a red nameplate (tabloids are sometimes called 'red tops') and printing many stories about celebrities and sport. The *Daily Mail*, on the other hand, is of a similar size to *The Sun*, but contains longer articles and has a more formal writing style than *The Sun*, as well as having its title in black ink. However, while the *Daily Mail* seems to feature more political articles, it often appears to articulate a 'tabloid' world view, associated with populist politics or even a politics of fear, suggestive of attempts to create moral panic…

In this regard, the *Daily Mail* has been sometimes categorised as a "middle-market" newspaper (Baker, 2013). Though it still "articulates a 'tabloid' world view" the noted differences between the *Daily Mail* and *The Sun* (writing style, article content and newspaper categorisation) add to the diversity of the final newspaper selection.

Once the selection of newspapers was finalized, additional decisions involving the type of articles were considered. These considerations and what was determined are discussed in the following section.

2.3.2: Types of Newspaper Articles

In determining which newspaper articles to include in the data-set the following were excluded from the search: book reviews, television reviews, film reviews, law reports, commentaries, opinion pieces, and letters. The reasoning for these exclusions was that they did not fit the aims of the research, which was to analyse the hard news representations of the issue of TIP, the trafficked person and the trafficker. As Baker et al. (2014, p. 10) note:

> Another factor when considering newspapers also needs to be taken into account: newspapers contain more than 'hard news', or stories about important current political and social events. They also feature a great deal of 'soft news', consisting of celebrity gossip, 'human interest' stories (which often have little impact on anyone except for those directly related to the story) and reviews and commentaries about books, films, music, plays, gadgets, computer games, fashions, restaurants and holiday destinations. Such articles are also found in magazines and thus could be viewed as belonging to genres of entertainment, or even advertising, rather than news.

Letters were not included in the data-set as they are not written by journalists but by readers, which "provide less accountable opinions" (Baker et al., 2014, p. 10). The main focus of this research was to provide an analysis of how UK national newspapers represented the issue of TIP, the trafficked person and the trafficker, therefore, including letters and comments from people beyond those employed by the newspaper to report the news was beyond the scope of this study.

2.3.3: The Timeframe of the Data-set and Search Terms

My data-set included articles from the year 2011. I chose this year because it was the most recently completed year when I began collecting my data in January 2012. A

complete calendar year was considered sufficient for the purposes of this research as it provided a time period in which several instances of what was labelled as TIP occurred. This was confirmed after the initial search results were reviewed.

Nexis UK was used as a search engine to find relevant articles. It is widely respected as a comprehensive and efficient tool for electronic newspapers (Evans and Schuller, 205; Kaposi, 2014). The search terms included were as follows: "trafficking", "trafficked", and "trafficker". The search included any mention of these terms in the articles. This allowed for relevant articles to be identified while simultaneously reducing the number of irrelevant articles.

Initially, the term "traffic" was included in the search, which retrieved over 3000 articles in a one month period. To identify the relevance of the term "traffic" the search was limited to one week and included only the term "traffic". A total of 252 articles were retrieved and then reviewed for relevance. By carefully scrutinising the articles, it was found that the majority of articles related to vehicle or air traffic or other irrelevant subjects. Further, each one of the articles which did relate to TIP included at least one of the other search terms previously listed. Therefore, it was considered unnecessary to include "traffic" as a separate search term.

An issue that arose after reading through the results of the initial search (with the terms: "trafficked", "trafficking" and "trafficker") was the inclusion of an alternate spelling of "traffic" in one of the headlines: "traffick". In order to ensure that no relevant newspaper articles were missed, an additional Nexis UK search was conducted using this alternative spelling. The search found seven articles which included this term. Of these, three fit the criteria for the data-set (i.e. primarily that the "traffick" mentioned in the articles related to TIP into and within the UK). These three articles were already in the data-set as they also included at least one of the other search terms. Of the four that did not fit the criteria: two were on the topic of drug trafficking, a third was a duplicate article, and the final article was from the Irish edition of *The Sun*. The aim of this research was to examine depictions of TIP

into and within the UK, therefore, for this reason, any articles which included one or more of the search terms but did not focus on TIP into or within the UK were eliminated.

As my research was interested in the way the newspapers represented the issue of TIP, it was essential that the articles within the data-set label the issue as TIP through the use of one of the search terms. Therefore, common terms such as "sex slavery" were not included in the search terms. While the newspapers at times use the terms of TIP and "sex slavery" as synonyms, this is not always the case. In this research, it was imperative that the newspaper articles to be analysed were representing TIP. My research was focused on the way in which the newspaper interprets, defines and depicts what *the newspapers* identified as TIP within and into the UK. Therefore, it would be presumptive to determine whether newspaper articles using the term "sex slavery" also understood the issue as TIP without the articles clearly identifying this (i.e. through the use of the terms "trafficking", "trafficked" or "trafficker").

The complexities of this emerged after conducting an initial separate search of articles using the terms "sex slavery" and/or "sex slave". This was conducted as a separate search to explore whether or not terms that are at times used descriptively in regards to TIP should be included as additional search terms. Over 600 articles which referred to sex slave/ry were retrieved from Nexis UK, each of which was read through to determine whether or not it was an example of TIP. A small number of the articles also included references to TIP, which are presented by newspaper in Table 6. These articles were also retrieved in the search which included the terms "trafficker", "trafficked", and "trafficking". They are included in the final data-set.

Table 6: Newspaper articles using the terms "sex slave/ry"

Name of Newspaper	Number within Data-set
The Times	0
The Sunday Times	2
The Guardian	0
The Observer	3
The Sun	6
Sunday Sun	0
Daily Mail	1
Mail on Sunday	0

The remainder of these articles made no indication of the newspaper linking the case involving "sex slave/ry" to TIP. Determining whether or not the newspaper *meant* that sex slave/ry was synonymous with TIP would have been speculative. Many of these cases clearly involved exploitation, but details regarding whether coercion or movement/transportation took place were absent. In this way, it would be the researcher's interpretation and *not* the newspaper that would have been labelling these particular representations. As this was not the aim or purpose of the research, it was determined to only include articles which the newspaper itself labelled as TIP.

Finally, it was determined to include all instances of TIP as identified in the Palermo Protocol. For example, despite being contested, the trafficking of organs was included in the final version of the Palermo Protocol (Gallagher, 2001). Commenting on the inclusion, Gallagher (2001, p. 988, footnote) notes, "It is widely accepted that trafficking in organs necessitates the trafficking of the organ's host." Despite this definition there are States who choose to interpret the definition differently, particularly in this area. For instance, the US TIP Report (2010; p. 8) states:

> The trade in human organs – such as kidneys – is not in itself a form of human trafficking. The international trade in organs is substantial and

demand appears to be growing. Some victims in developing countries
are exploited as their kidneys are purchased for low prices. Such
practices are prohibited under the Palermo Protocol, for example when
traffickers use coercive means, such as force or threats of force to secure
the removal of the victim's organs.

For the purposes of this research, I followed the definition of the UN as outlined in
the Palermo Protocol and subsequent UK legislation outlined in Chapter One.
However, the coverage of trafficking in organs was rare, and the minimal number of
articles which did cover this form of TIP did not meet the requirements established
for the data-set.[4]

2.3.4: The Final Data-set

After the initial search results were retrieved, the articles were reviewed multiple
times. Using the search terms previously mentioned, the final sample included 121
articles, which are listed in Table 7.

Table 7: Overview of Data-set by Newspaper

Name of Newspaper	Number within Data-set
The Times	29
The Sunday Times	7
The Guardian	29
The Observer	14
The Sun	29
Sunday Sun	2
Daily Mail	11
Mail on Sunday	0

---

[4] The four articles involving organ trafficking which did mention TIP were covering instances in
Turkey and Bosnia and did not deal with TIP into or within the UK.

2.4: Analysis of the Data-set: Using Thematic Analysis

While academics have acknowledged that thematic analysis is conducted widely it is often overlooked as its own distinct method (Boyatzis, 1998; Braun and Clarke, 2006; Joffe, 2012; Roulston, 2001). However, its usefulness within qualitative research has also been noted, as Vaismoradi et al. (2013, p. 400) write, "...qualitative researchers should become more familiar with thematic analysis as an independent and a reliable qualitative approach to analysis."

My own process with this research, as mentioned earlier in this thesis (for example, see p. 10; p. 21), involved a metamorphosis of the way in which I personally process information. I began my initial inquiry as a person who "knew" the basics of TIP as an issue. This was based primarily on what I had read in media reports. After more in-depth academic reading, I realized the topic I had unwittingly processed as one with clear-cut categories of innocent and guilty persons was much more complex. This refocused my interests to the representations of TIP within the media. I was then fascinated by the way in which newspaper articles constructed the issue and the persons involved (i.e. traffickers, trafficked persons). Thematic analysis was the logical place to start as its process allowed for a broader overview of "key features" throughout the entire data-set (Braun and Clarke, 2006, p. 37). Other strengths of thematic analysis as recognised by Braun and Clarke (2006) were considered advantageous for this research, and include: this form of research is accessible to researchers from different backgrounds as well as the general public due to straightforwardness, and it has the potential to be useful for informing the development of social policies.

The process this research undertook for analysis was informed by Braun and Clarke's (2006) influential work on thematic analysis. Their approach differs from other thematic analysis approaches (see for example Boyatzis, 1998), specifically:

Other approaches to TA recommend the use of a coding frame precisely because this enables the calculation of inter-reliability scores. The use of inter-rater reliability scores is underpinned by the (realist) assumption that there is an accurate reality in the data that can be captured through coding. Our approach to coding is flexible and organic, and coding should evolve throughout the coding process – to some extent our approach to coding is similar to initial coding in grounded theory (Charmaz, 2006). We understand coding as an active and reflexive process that inevitably and inescapably bears the mark of the researcher(s). With no one 'accurate' way to code data, the logic behind inter-rater reliability (and multi-independent coders) disappears (Braun and Clarke, n.d., section 10).

This "active and reflexive process" to thematic analysis met the purposes and goals for this research, and therefore, it was a logical approach to analyse this particular data-set. Braun and Clarke (2006, p. 35) outline six key phases which are shown in Table 8.

Table 8: Key Phases for Thematic Analysis

Phase	Description of the process
1) **Familiarising yourself with your data**	Reading and re-reading the data, noting down initial ideas
2) **Generating initial codes**	Coding interesting features of the data in a systematic fashion across the entire data-set, collating data relevant to each code
3) **Searching for themes**	Collating codes into potential themes, gathering all data relevant to each potential theme.
4) **Reviewing themes**	Checking if the themes work in relation to the coded extracts (Level 1) and the entire data-set (Level 2)
5) **Defining and naming themes**	Ongoing analysis to refine the specifics of each theme, and the overall story the analysis tells; generating clear definitions and names for each theme
6) **Producing the report**	The final opportunity for analysis. Selection of vivid, compelling extract samples, final analysis of selected extracts, relating back of the analysis to the research question and literature, producing a scholarly report of the analysis.

(adapted from Braun and Clarke, 2006, p. 37)

After the data-set was finalized, each article was read through three times to familiarize myself with the data and to make notes regarding "initial ideas" (Braun

and Clarke, 2006, p. 37). Additionally, each headline (as well as information regarding the newspaper and author from which it originated) was printed and displayed in chronological order on my office wall. This allowed for another way in which to interact and gain familiarity with the data-set.

When I entered into the second phase of initial coding, I considered using NVivo and learned the basics of the software program. Through personal preference, it was determined that conducting analysis manually maintained greater proximity to the data. However, on certain occasions specific terms needed to be identified across the data-set. Reading through each article for specific words or phrases would have been time-consuming, therefore in these cases, the search features within Microsoft Word were utilised.

As codes were developed and corresponding data collated, potential themes were identified. These were color-coded throughout the data-set according to potential theme. After this was initially completed and potential themes had considerable evidence, drafts of themes with samples of coded extracts were discussed with my supervisors. Themes were refined through continuous revision and analysis. Finally, the written drafts of the empirical chapters offered opportunities for clarification, integration with academic literature and final analysis of the selections of extracts used to exemplify the themes.

In the four empirical chapters that follow, my data will be presented with the following identifying information: extract number, newspaper, date and paragraph number. Each article in the data-set was assigned an extract number (see Appendix A). Selections of text from the extracts are found throughout the empirical chapters. As the format of the newspaper articles provided by Nexis UK made it considerably difficult to determine the page numbers of the original newspaper articles[5], the

---

[5] By "original newspaper articles" I refer to the original print of the newspaper articles. As my data collection was conducted through Nexis UK, I did not see the original layout of the articles. In this way, identifying the paragraph number(s) of excerpts from the extracts was considered a logical way to identify specific selections of text.

paragraph numbers were deemed an appropriate way to identify the location of specific text selection in the extracts. The complete list of extracts is located in Appendix A with corresponding numbers, dates, newspaper name, author(s), and headlines.

The following chapters will identify the findings of this research as well as implications. Next, Chapter Three explores the themes identified during analysis which developed from the first research question: how is the issue of TIP as it occurs within and into the UK represented in UK national newspapers?

Chapter Three: The Representation of TIP as a Social Issue in UK National Newspapers

3.1: Introduction

This chapter aims to investigate how the issue of TIP is represented as a social issue within UK national newspapers. Through thematic analysis, three themes were identified and include the following: 1) *TIP was represented as a form of modern day slavery*, 2) *TIP was represented as a particularly abhorrent social issue*, and 3) *TIP was represented as a pervasive social issue in terms of incidence and geographical location*.

Each theme has distinct features which will be identified and discussed. At times, these themes overlap and this interconnectivity will be identified where it is relevant. To begin, this chapter will identify the ways in which TIP was defined within the data-set. This was the initial step taken during analysis as I sought to explore the first research question: How is the issue as it occurs within and into the UK represented in national newspapers? It was determined that identifying the ways in which newspapers established *what* TIP was as a social issue was a logical initial step. Therefore, a brief discussion of what was identified will be explored first.

Following this, the chapter will then explore the first theme, which was identified as *TIP was represented as a form of "modern day slavery"*. Next, the theme of *TIP as a particularly abhorrent social issue* will be discussed. Further, within this theme a subtheme was identified as *the predominant representation of TIP was for the purposes of sexual exploitation*. A discussion regarding this subtheme will be included in a separate subsection. Finally, the third theme of *the representation of TIP as a pervasive social issue* will be explored. Implications of these themes are also identified. In order to frame the discussions included in this chapter, the

following section will discuss the issue of defining TIP as it was identified within the data-set.

3.2: How TIP was defined in the Data-set

This section will address the ways in which TIP was defined in the data-set. It will begin with identifying the (sparse) occasions in which newspaper articles within the data-set provided an explicit definition the issue. Next it will identify ways in which newspaper articles within the data-set implicitly provided meanings of TIP as an issue.

The provision of official definitions of TIP within the data-set were limited (see section 1.3 for discussion of official definitions). Rather, it was found that instead of explicitly referencing official definitions of TIP, the newspapers' definitions were more implicit and complex. The construction of *what* TIP is appeared more within the context of descriptions, trafficked persons' accounts and references to experts (i.e. police investigations, NGOs' advocacy information and their experiences with victims). In this way, newspapers' representations were predominantly inferred and included connotative meanings of TIP more than denotative meanings.

Explicit definitions which contained all three elements of official definitions (such as an inclusion of the UN's definition) were sparse. The one which was identified as most closely resembling/summarising the UN's definition was the following:

> The definition of trafficking has long been controversial. The most favoured defines it as involving the use of force, fraud, deception or coercion to transport a victim into an exploitative context.

(Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 42)

This extract contains the three elements included in official definitions: transportation/movement ("to transport a victim"), coercion/force ("involving the use of force, fraud or deception"), and the intent to exploit ("into an exploitative context") (Gallagher, 2001; also see section 1.3). Additionally, it explicitly references the way in which TIP is defined ("The definition of trafficking has long been controversial. The most favoured defines it as..."). This reference to an actual "definition of trafficking" was rare.

Further, the definition in this particular extract was located in the last paragraph of the article, which suggests that this information was prioritised less than the other content provided. Traditionally, the structure of news places what it considers to be the most important information of the story at the beginning and the least important at the end (Carroll and Deephouse, 2014).

There were other instances where a newspaper would include a description of TIP as a definition, though the details were found to be incomplete and, at times, included problematic assumptions. For example:

> Apart from trafficking for sex, there is debt bondage, in which gangs
> bring people into the UK illegally to pay off debts, trafficking of
> children for crime or to beg, and of domestic workers.

> (Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 38)

Again, this extract was the last paragraph of the article suggesting it was prioritised less than the other content (Carroll and Deephouse, 2014). Additionally, this extract provides information about TIP through listing ways in which trafficked persons may be exploited ("trafficking for sex", "debt bondage", "trafficking of children for crime or to beg", and "domestic workers"). The element of transportation/movement is indicated in a brief explanation of "debt bondage" ("in which gangs bring people into the UK"). However, this description of TIP contains problematic assumptions. First, it limits the full scope of the issue of TIP through identifying perpetrators (of

TIP for debt bondage) as "gangs who bring people into the UK illegally to pay off debts". Traffickers are not limited to "gangs" but also work as individuals (Choi-Fitzpatrick, 2016). Second, TIP is not limited to cases where borders are crossed (Aronowitz, 2009; Jordan, 2002). Further, when the crossing of borders is involved, TIP occurs through both legal and illegal migration (Aronowitz, 2009; Gallagher, 2001). In Extract 26, the use of "illegally" to describe TIP for debt bondage ("gangs who bring people into the UK illegally to pay off debts") implies it *only* occurs through means of illegal migration as no other distinction is made (i.e. references to legal ways trafficked persons may be brought into the UK). Another example of the use of the term "illegal" to describe the issue of TIP occurs in the following:

> Human trafficking—which involves selling illegal immigrants for sexual exploitation, forced labour and slavery—is also high on the target list for the team [UK Border Agency's Immigration Crime Team].

> (Extract 8, *Sunday Sun*, 16 January 2011, para. 9)

This example limits the scope of the issue and how it is officially defined. The description that TIP "involves selling illegal immigrants" contains several assumptions. First, it isolates trafficked persons' to the categorization of "illegal immigrants". However, TIP occurs within or across borders (Aronowitz, 2009; Jordan, 2002) and affects both illegal and legal migrants (Aronowitz, 2009; Gallagher, 2001). Further, the assumption that those who are trafficked are automatically "illegal" simplifies the diverse and complex realities of trafficked persons. While there are many trafficked persons who have entered the country without proper documentation, there are those who *do* have the required visas and passports only to be exploited after legally crossing the border (Gallagher, 2001).

Additionally, this definition significantly narrows the variety of ways in which TIP can occur through only highlighting that it "involves selling" persons. A trafficked person is not necessarily sold, and this does not fully meet the criteria of TIP according to official definitions (see section 1.3). Rather, the three elements

included in these official definitions include: movement, coercion and exploitation
(or the intent to exploit). In other words, these elements can exist without the actual
"selling" of persons.

Eight months after Extract 8 was printed, *The Sun's* representation of an alleged
occurrence of TIP provides a different set of criteria for TIP. There is no mention of
illegal immigration or the involvement of "selling" persons. Rather, the following
extract provides a version of TIP without explicitly defining the issue:

> A TOP scientific researcher used a 21-year old woman she had flown in
> from Africa as her unpaid slave, a court heard yesterday.
>
> Rebecca Balira is alleged to have forced Methodia Mathias to cook and
> clean for her while also using her as a nanny to her three kids.
>
> Ms Mathias was promised a salary but was never paid, London's
> Southwark Crown Court was told. And jurors heard she was punched
> and had her bra cut off with scissors when she displeased her boss.
>
> The court was told the Tanzanian's six-month ordeal ended when she
> told her "only friend" and cops were called.
>
> Balira, 47—studying for a PhD degree at the London School of Hygiene
> and Tropical Medicine—denies trafficking for exploitation, holding
> another in servitude and common assault. The trial continues.
>
> (Extract 79, *The Sun*, 2 August 2011, para. 1-5)

In this case, the alleged trafficker (Rebecca Balira) was not represented as selling or
being accused of selling the trafficked person (Methodia Mathias). Rather, Balira
was accused of flying Mathias to the UK and exploiting her in a domestic residence
("A TOP scientific researcher used a 21-year old woman she had flown in from

Africa as her unpaid slave, a court heard yesterday"). Extract 79 provides an example of how TIP was implicitly defined within the data-set: through descriptions, narratives and references to experts. The three elements of the Palermo Protocol definition are evidenced in the extract: movement ("A top scientific researcher used a 21-year old woman she had flown in from Africa"), coercion ("Ms Mathias was promised a salary but was never paid"; "she was punched and had her bra cut off with scissors when she displeased her"), and exploitation ("her unpaid slave", "Rebecca Balira is alleged to have forced Methodia Mathias to cook and clean for her while also using her as a nanny to her three kids"). The definition of TIP, in the above extract, is not explicit but rather implicit. The alleged incidence of TIP in Extract 79 is *actively* defining the issue through the inclusion (and exclusion) of information. In essence, the elements explicitly outlined in official definitions of TIP are also *inferred* in the descriptions of TIP (Potter, 1996).

Within the data-set official definitions of TIP (such as the one included in the Palermo Protocol) were primarily inferred through the descriptions utilised in the newspaper articles. In contrast to this, explicit references were made across the data-set which identified the issue as a "modern form of slavery". This theme will be discussed in the following section.

3.3: The Representation of TIP as a "Modern Form of Slavery"

> "Trafficking in human beings is an abhorrent crime. Many describe it as
> modern-day slavery, where victims are coerced, deceived or forced into
> the control of others who crudely and inhumanely seek to profit from
> their suffering." –UK Home Office and Scottish Executive (in UK
> Action Plan on Tackling Human Trafficking, 2007, p. 2)

This section will outline the theme identified during analysis as: *the representation of TIP as a "modern form of slavery"*. It will be argued that equating TIP with

slavery limits the full scope of the issue. It also risks overlooking trafficked persons who face exploitative circumstances but do not meet the criteria of slavery (which will be identified in this section). In essence, it is a phrase which narrowly represents the diverse experiences of trafficked persons.

In international law, specifically within the 1998 Statute of the International Criminal Court, slavery is defined as, "…the status or condition of a person over whom any or all of the powers attaching to the right of ownership are exercised" (Allain and Bales, 2012, p. 3). While TIP may take the form of slavery, it is not limited to it. Indeed, TIP is complex and is a term which encompasses *several* variations of exploitation. These variations of exploitative contexts are on a "continuum" with slavery located at one end, as noted by O'Connell Davidson (2010, p. 10). A more helpful way to consider TIP is to go beyond the outcome of exploitation and rather consider the way it is officially defined: as a *process* with the outcome being "for the purpose of exploitation" (Skrivankova, 2010; UNODC, 2004, p. 42). Skrivankova (2010, p. 18) highlights how the term "exploitation" is ambiguously used in regards to TIP and why this is problematic:

> In the anti-trafficking discourse, forced labour is one form of exploitation. However, forced labour can also be seen as the extreme form of exploitation when compared to 'lesser' forms of exploitation (namely violation of labour laws). This is not only confusing, but in practice can lead to creation of a 'hierarchy of suffering' – which would not only be unhelpful, but also detrimental.

This "hierarchy of suffering" is also applicable to the conceptualization of TIP as a modern form of slavery. O'Connell Davidson (2010, p. 244) writes how TIP has been depicted as "one of the most serious human rights problem in the contemporary world". Research has shown that as an issue TIP has been constructed as a form of modern day slavery (Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). One consequence of this is that greater attention is given to the circumstances leading to and included in victimisation. In essence, the circumstances of slavery are connotatively linked to

extreme forms of victimisation, which associates TIP as a form of modern day slavery to "an idealised form of victimisation" (Wilson and O'Brien, 2016, p. 33). Therefore, the interchanging of "trafficking" and "slavery" contributes to the association of the issue with more extreme forms of exploitation. As O'Connell Davidson (2010, p. 256) writes:

> As objects and eternal victims, one can pity slaves more unreservedly than we can those whom we see as authoring and controlling their own destiny...Represented as the ultimate, suffering, premodern Other against which civility can be measured, the figure of the slave has been put to work in the service of a variety of political ends.

Representations of TIP as a form of modern day slavery connotatively associates severe circumstances of exploitation as defining trafficked persons' experiences. The problem with this is that narratives/anecdotes/examples of experiences of TIP as a form of slavery represents the issue in a narrow way. This also contributes to the construction of TIP as a particularly abhorrent issue (an identified theme which will be discussed in the following section).

While the terms "slavery" and "trafficking" have legally distinct meanings, within the data-set they were used synonymously. This is evident within the following extracts:

> United Nations figures indicate that 800,000 people a year are trafficked worldwide. There are more people in **slavery** today than in the 350-year history of the **slave trade**. One in eight is in Europe.
>
> (Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 37, emphasis added)

> Regardless of the technical difficulties, the consensus among the voluntary sector is that trafficking's political profile has slipped. Incentives to tackle it are few, as it is an invisible crime largely below the electorate's radar. [Timothy Brain, a senior police officer who dealt

with human trafficking] said that trafficking's underground nature
helped explain its position as "peripheral to what most Home Office and
police strategists see as core business". Anthony Steen, chair of the
Human Trafficking Foundation, said: "In William Wilberforce's day,
slavery could be seen. Now it is hidden from view but no less
prevalent."

(Extract 35, *The Observer*, 15 May 2011, para. 22, emphasis added)

A major inquiry into human trafficking will be launched this week amid
claims that **slavery** remains as much of a problem in modern Britain as
when it was abolished more than 200 years ago…

The Centre for Social Justice is to announce a 15-month investigation
into the issue following concerns over a lack of political will, policing
resources, low prosecution rates and flaws within the government
system for identifying trafficked victims.

The inquiry aims to put forward a series of recommendations on how the
UK could embrace a more effective strategy to tackle **modern slavery**.

(Extract 47, *The Observer*, 12 June 2011, para. 1-3, emphasis added)

While the comparison of the Atlantic slave trade to TIP as "modern day slavery"
conjures an image of exploitation, it is problematic. Quirk (2011, slide 21) identifies
the use of the term as descriptive, not to categorise a crime, but to construct an
emotionally charged comparison:

It is not uncommon for activists and other commentators to treating [sic]
"slavery" as little more than shorthand for virtually any form of
dominion and ill-treatment.

Framed in these terms, slavery ceases to be an analytical category and instead primarily functions as an *evocative concept*, building upon the iconography of human property, extreme exploitation and transatlantic slavery. From a political standpoint, the "contemporary" appellation, or similar variants such as "new", "modern", or "twenty-first" century slavery, can be best understood as an attempt to distinguish current events from "traditional" slavery, while harnessing the evocative imagery of slavery to prioritize cases of severe exploitation and abuse.

The association between slavery and TIP as synonymous forms of exploitation within the data-set establishes brutality and inhumane treatment as the norm within trafficked persons' experiences. This is problematic in that it risks isolating other circumstances of TIP which do not fit this representation.

Another way in which TIP was represented as a form of modern day slavery was in reference to official documents in which the term was used. One example of this was a reference to a report compiled by the Equality and Human Rights Commission. This was identified in the following extract:

Defining trafficking as "**a modern form of slavery**", the report [by the Equality and Human Rights Commission] recommends that there should be more done to raise awareness of the problem among individuals, the police, social services, health and other agencies.

(Extract 120, *The Times*, 28 November 2011, para. 4, emphasis added)

In the actual report produced by the Equality and Human Rights Commission, the term "modern slavery" is used synonymously to TIP. The use of the terms are found in the forward written by Baroness Helena Kennedy, which reads:

Human trafficking is substantially concerned with sex but by no means exclusively. **Modern slavery** takes many forms including the exploitation of migrant labour and domestic servitude.

(Equality and Human Rights Commission, 2011, p. 8, emphasis added)

The terms "human trafficking" and "modern slavery" are used synonymously, which is problematic. This suggests that *all* cases of TIP can be equated with modern day slavery which isolates many trafficked persons who *do not* meet this criteria (O'Connell Davidson, 2010).

Further, this way of representing the issue has the potential to impact government policies on TIP (O'Connell Davidson, 2010; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). For example, depictions of narratives which involve severe exploitation are evident in the TIP Report put forth annually by the US State Department and these reports are globally influential (Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). Within the data-set, Extract 64 references the TIP Report's use of the term "modern-day slavery":

> In its Trafficking in Persons Report, at more than 400 pages the most comprehensive survey of human trafficking worldwide, the state department lists examples of **modern-day slavery** ranging from trafficking for sex to child labour, and includes the abuse of embassy staff.

(Extract 64, *The Guardian*, 28 June 2011, para. 5, emphasis added)

This extract is also another example of newspapers reporting the term "modern-day slavery" as it is used in official documents. In the extract the reference is made to "examples of modern day slavery" within the TIP Report. These narratives/anecdotes are displayed throughout the annual document, and offer narrow representations of what it means to be trafficked and who is involved. Wilson and O'Brien (2016) conducted analysis on the TIP reports published between the years 2001-2012. They found that within the reports "human trafficking is predominantly represented as a crime committed by ideal offenders against idealized victims" (p. 29). These representations contribute to the over-simplification of the issue in that "ideal" trafficked persons are represented as

innocent and/or undeserving of their victimisation (this concept will be addressed in greater depth in Chapter Four).

Further, several academics have argued that the "trafficked (sex) slave" has been used to benefit politically conservative agendas on issues such as sex work and/or immigration policies (Agustin, 2007; Chapkis, 2003; Doezema, 2000; Kempadoo et. al, 2005; O'Connell Davidson, 2010; Weitzer, 2007b). O'Connell Davidson (2010) argues that it is limiting to construct TIP as an issue that is clear-cut as well as one that is easily able to distinguish trafficked persons from non-trafficked persons. Rather, she suggests that exploitation is experienced on a continuum rather than rigid, predetermined categories. As Anderson and O'Connell Davidson (2003) have noted, this means that authorities who seek to systematically measure and categorise persons' experiences as trafficked or non-trafficked will be determining where on this continuum each person's experience is located. This is arguably a subjective task for any person and one that brings with it a host of variables in regards to political and moral leanings. As O'Connell Davidson (2010, p. 249) writes, "'Trafficking' is an umbrella term for a process that can lead to a variety of outcomes...To ring fence 'trafficking' would therefore require us to make a judgment about what constitutes appropriate and inappropriate exploitation, and what counts as force, in a huge number of vastly different contexts". The variety of exploitative circumstances that meet the criteria of TIP was under-represented in the data-set. Rather, narratives identified were presented as clear examples of victimisation through the connection to terms such as slavery, details of physical and sexual violence, as well as implicitly and/or explicitly suggesting the included narratives were representative of larger numbers of trafficked persons (the latter two characteristics will be explored in the following sections). The following extract represents the victimisation of trafficked persons as clearly (and brutally) involving: a similarity to slavery, the use of physical, sexual and emotional force into trafficked circumstances, and large numbers:

> She had been raped thousands of times and was forced to dig her own
> grave. But this is not what worried her. What if they came for her

daughter? This week, the hidden lives of thousands of women in Britain will be laid bare in the High Court in a case that campaigners hope will lead to a new understanding of sex trafficking...

...In interviews lasting more than 20 hours, the woman has given a graphic account of why trafficked sex workers allow themselves to be brought to Britain, and why they cooperate with their captors once they are here. The answer is fear, maintained by levels of brutality that are hard to comprehend.

(Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 1; 6, emphasis added)

This excerpt indicates the trafficked woman suffered rape and physical violence ("She had been raped thousands of times and was forced to dig her own grave"; "the answer is fear, maintained by levels of brutality that are hard to comprehend"). However, the article also uses this particularly abhorrent trafficking narrative as an example to generalise the circumstances of "trafficked sex workers" in the UK by indicating "the hidden lives of thousands of women in Britain will be laid bare" as well as "the woman has given a graphic account of why trafficked sex workers allow themselves to be brought to Britain, and why they cooperate with their captors once they are here". The trafficked woman in this example is portrayed as a representative case of TIP.

In this way, references to TIP "as a modern form of slavery" arguably reduce the range of exploitative experiences of trafficked persons to a limited number of extreme circumstances. As O'Connell Davidson (2010, p. 245) writes:

In place of efforts to build political alliances between different groups of migrants, as well as between migrants and non-migrants who share a common interest in transforming existing social and political relations, 'trafficking as modern slavery' discourse inspires and legitimates efforts

to divide a small number of 'deserving victims' from the masses that remain 'undeserving' of rights and freedoms.

Further, within trafficking discourse, the issue is constructed as one in which women and children are particularly vulnerable to victimisation (Sanghera, 2005). This representation of TIP as a form of modern slavery affecting women and children is evident in the following extract:

Organised **sex slavery** is rife across Scotland and authorities have failed to combat it, a report will reveal today.

An official probe headed by top lawyer Baroness Helena Kennedy blames agencies—including cops—for a shambolic approach.

It reveals ruthless gangsters are making millions from **as many as 700 children and women sex slaves** imprisoned in flats across the country.

Other **trafficked slaves** are being forced to work under duress in choking cannabis factories and foul conditions on fruit farms.

Baroness Kennedy, 61, headed an 18-month investigation into the misery of human trafficking in Scotland.

(Extract 118, *The Sun*, 28 November 2011, para. 1-5, emphasis added)

The use of the terms "slavery" and "slaves" suggests extreme forms of exploitation. Bales (2004) introduced the concept of trafficking as modern-day slavery. Specifically, the concept has been outlined and includes three key factors that distinguish it from other forms of exploitation which are as follows: a lack of agency/being fully controlled by someone, a continuous subjection to violence or the threat of violence, and an absence or extreme limitation of pay for labour by the employer/person in position of power (Allain and Bales, 2012; O'Connell Davidson, 2010). This is suggested through phrases which add additional emphasis to terms

already associated with TIP. For example, children and women are not just slaves, they are "sex slaves". The association with TIP as *sexual* slavery draws on cultural anxieties involving sex work and female sexuality (Andrijasevic, 2009; Doezema, 2000) to construct the issue as one that is particularly abhorrent. This extract describes the issue as slavery, but not merely slavery. Rather, it is the slavery of *women* and *children* for *sexual means* which is said to be "rife in Scotland". The depictions of "imprisoned" victims as children (who are constructed as innocent and asexual) and women (who are under great pressure to conform to socially acceptable forms of (restricted) female sexuality) greatly contrast with the traffickers who are depicted as "ruthless gangsters" (Andrijasevic, 2009; Jackson, 1982). These representations of trafficked persons and traffickers construct clear categories, ones which Anderson and Andrijasevic (2008, p. 137) describe as "a simplistic and stereotyped binary of duped/innocent victim...and evil traffickers". Through this lens the issue is one that is primarily the result of "evil traffickers" taking advantage of the "duped/innocent victim" for profit or power; it avoids analysing systemic power and structural inequalities which contribute to the issue (Anderson and Andrijasevic, 2008; Wyle and McRedmond, 2010).

The association of TIP as a "modern form of slavery" constructs the issue as one which is severe. In essence, this representation implies that the circumstances of those who have been victimised through trafficking are able to be clearly determined. In addition to this, explicit references were made across the data-set which designated TIP as a social issue meriting particular disgust and shock. This was identified through thematic analysis and labelled as the following: *TIP is represented as a particularly abhorrent issue*. This theme will be explored in the next section.

3.4: The Representation of TIP as a Particularly Abhorrent Social Issue

"Human trafficking destroys lives and its effects damage communities. The transport and exploitation of vulnerable men, women and children

by predatory organised criminal groups is something that no civilised
country should tolerate. We need to do more to stop this horrific crime."
~Theresa May (UK Home Office, 2011, p. 3)

This section seeks to explore the theme: *the representation of TIP as a particularly abhorrent social issue*. The implications of this will also be identified and discussed.

The representation of TIP has been depicted as an abhorrent abuse of human rights (Hesford, 2011). As Doezema (2004, p. 3, footnote) acknowledged in her PhD thesis:

> When I have told people – many of whom are not in any way involved
> in the issue – that the topic of my thesis is trafficking in women, not one
> person has said 'what is that?'. Without exception, the response has been
> to affirm the horror of the problem, how good it was I was working on
> it, and often to recount a story...they had recently seen or read about in
> the media.

Doezema's experience to other people's reaction to her research is similar to my own. While this is perhaps coincidental, the parallels between people's reactions to the topic of TIP is worth noting. Indeed, the way in which the issue is constructed as abhorrent within the media is important to consider as it is likely to impact what people know about the issue (Wallinger, 2010).

As included in the previous section, Extract 26 is also a useful example of the way in which the narrative of a trafficked person is used to "typify" TIP as a particularly abhorrent social issue (Best, 1997, p. 82). As identified in Chapter One, the media serve as "secondary claims-makers" in that they "transmit", "translate" and "transform" claims regarding the issues on which they are reporting (Best, 1997, p. 74). In this way, the media actively construct versions of reality of the topics included as news.

Throughout the data-set descriptions of TIP as "horrific" or "horrendous" were identified. It will be argued that these terms contribute to the construction of the issue as particularly abhorrent. In addition graphic and/or violent details of trafficked persons' experiences also serve to construct the issue of TIP in this way. The following extracts include these terms and details:

> A flawed police investigation allegedly exposed vulnerable girls to a lengthy campaign of rape and sexual assault by a gang of older men who groomed them for **horrific** exploitation, The Times has learnt.
>
> (Extract 6, *The Times*, 11 January 2011, para. 1, emphasis added)

> The sex crimes unit of Greater Manchester police arrested her for prostitution –related offences, but at least Marinela was safe behind bars. Her first day in custody was the first since her arrival in England six months earlier that she had not been forced to have sex. She had been raped by different men 50 times a week on average, often violent, drunken strangers. And if she was released from prison, Marinela was convinced she would be murdered by the gang who trafficked her...
>
> ...Victims are notoriously reluctant to describe their experience because of the shame, fear and stress. It is even rarer for such women to agree to be identified. Motivated by a courageous desire to expose this **sordid, violent world,** Marinela has revealed the **full horror** of her ordeal in an account that should reopen the debate about how Britain deals with its sex industry.
>
> (Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 3, 5, emphasis added)

In the first example, "horrific exploitation" is emphasized: it is not merely exploitation taking place, it is "*horrific* exploitation". In this way, the description of

TIP as "horrific" typifies the issue as one that merits particular concern by emphasizing the severity of trafficked persons circumstances (Best, 1997). This is similar to the second example where the issue of TIP is portrayed as existing within a "sordid, violent world". Further, a narrative from a trafficked person (Marinela) "has revealed the full horror of her ordeal". These descriptions again work as typifying the issue as severe and one that is particularly abhorrent. Extract 14 suggests that this is a hidden issue ("*expose* this sordid, violent world", "*revealed* the full horror", emphasis added). The details of Marinela's story serve a double purpose: they hold the attention of the reader and serve as a "referent" through the remainder of the article (Best, 1997, p. 82). Her account that she had been "raped by different men 50 times a week on average, often violent, drunken strangers" provides a severe and graphic narrative. Additionally, her story serves as an example which typifies *all* trafficked persons for sexual exploitation through the lack of other (varied) narratives and through statements in the article which suggest that other sex trafficked persons' experiences are similar to Marinela's ("victims are notoriously reluctant to describe their experience because of the shame, fear and stress", "this sordid, violent world", "an account that should reopen the debate about how Britian deals with its sex industry"). There is no distinction made between Marinela's experience and other trafficked persons' experiences. Additionally, no separation is made between sex workers who are trafficked and those who choose to work: agency is overlooked. Take, for example, the following excerpt which appeared later in the article:

> In the saunas and brothels she was forced to inhabit, Marinela estimates she met more than 100 Romanians working as prostitutes in Birmingham alone, many of whom she says had been coerced. Her accounts provide a rare glimpse of the scale of off-street prostitution in Britain, which is notoriously problematic to quantify.
>
> Charities say Marinela's experience supports their belief that sex trafficking into the UK is significantly greater than officially recognised...

...In the UK, police found evidence that at least 400 women from eastern [sic] Europe have been trafficked, suffering a similar ordeal to Marinela's. But campaigners say the true number runs into the thousands.

(Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 24-26)

Best (1997) identified the media's use of typifying a social issue as abhorrent (in this case, through the details of Marinela's narrative) combined with references to the scale of the issue as rhetorically strategic: it is a call to action. In Extract 14, *The Observer* provides brutal details of Marinela's trafficking experience and then suggests the issue is one that "runs into the thousands". This is an ambiguous number and one that includes a wide range of possibilities, the implications of which will be discussed in greater depth in section 3.5. However, it is important to note that quantified accounts of TIP are not free from bias, but rather "there are a wide variety of mathematical procedures which allow a considerable flexibility in versions" (Potter, 1996, p. 191). This is evident in Extract 14 where the number of trafficked persons from Eastern Europe are reported as being "at least 400" though "campaigners say the true number runs into the thousands". The phrase "at least" suggests that the minimum figure of 400 trafficked persons is concrete. "At least" indicates a known starting point: the "least" amount of trafficked persons is 400 while simultaneously indicating that the number may be larger. This indication is then re-emphasized by stating "campaigners" (though we are not told which campaigners) believe this larger number is located in "the thousands".

Further, it is reported that the 400 trafficked persons identified by British police are "suffering a similar ordeal to Marinela's". In essence, this is insinuating that the experiences of the trafficked women are tantamount to the typified experience of Marinela who exemplifies an ideal victim. By ideal victim I am referring to someone who is blameless in their circumstances and victimised by a dominating perpetrator (Christie, 1986; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). This concept will be explored in depth

in Chapter Four. However, the indication that Marinela's experience of being trafficked is representative of the other 400 trafficked persons (all identified by the article as "women") contributes to the construction of the issue as particularly abhorrent as it equates TIP with violence, repetitive rape, and the loss of agency for the victim.

These descriptions are rhetorically strategic in the way they draw on emotive terminology to depict the issue of TIP. This is also evident in the following extracts:

> "[Sex trafficking of children] isn't something that has just appeared, but the extent of it hasn't been recognised and we are underestimating the problem," Loughton said. "The cleverer we are about it, **the more horrified we are likely to be by what we discover**."
>
> People sometimes struggled to believe that **such cruelty** could exist in the UK, he said. But he added: "Exploitation is happening here and it is happening now."
>
> (Extract 37, *The Guardian,* 18 May 2011, para. 3-4, emphasis added)

> Jenny Whittle, Kent's cabinet member for specialist children's services, said: "Unless we keep (children) under lock and key we can't guarantee they won't go missing and go into **a horrendous life of trafficking**."
>
> (Extract 107, *The Guardian*, 19 October 2011, para. 9, emphasis added)

In these extracts the issue of TIP is suggested to be particularly abhorrent through the reaction it will cause as more information is identified ("the cleverer we are about it, the more horrified we are likely to be by what we discover") as well as the issue itself ("a horrendous life of trafficking"). Oxford Dictionary defines "horror" as "an intense feeling of fear, shock or disgust". In essence, these extracts draw on emotion as a way to describe the issue. These descriptions construct the issue as one

that is emotively charged. They categorize the issue of TIP as one which invokes "intense feeling[s] of fear, shock or disgust". As Potter (1996, p. 177, original emphasis) writes, "It is through categorization that the specific sense of something is *constituted*". Therefore, these descriptions which contribute to the representation of TIP as particularly abhorrent construct the issue as one "constituted" by occurrences of victimisation which are "horrendous" or causing people to be "horrified". Arguably, this constructs the issue as one that is worse than other forms of victimisation, a claim which is suggested in the following extract:

> Abina and Gloria are two of the thousands of women trafficked into the UK every year, victims of a crime that **stirs revulsion** like few others.

> This Saturday marks the 224th anniversary of the inaugural meeting of the anti-slavery movement in London, the city where Abina was **enslaved** most of last year. Now Timothy Brain, the UK's most senior police officer dealing with human trafficking before his recent retirement, has decided to speak out about his mounting frustration over government policy on the issue, as well as the **abhorrent nature of the crime**. "We think back to the cotton plantations and sugar plantations of the 18th and 19th century and it wouldn't be as bad as what some victims go through. It's **inhumane**," he said.

> (Extract 35, *The Observer*, 15 May 2011, para. 8-9, emphasis added)

Paragraph 8 indicates that TIP is "a crime that stirs revulsion like few others". In this way it categorises TIP as a particularly abhorrent crime, one that is capable of invoking a strong emotive response "like few others". The following paragraph then quotes Timothy Brain, a retired senior police officer who worked with TIP as comparing old slavery to current-day TIP saying "We think back to the cotton plantations and sugar plantations of the 18th and 19th century and it wouldn't be as bad as what some victims go through. It's inhumane." In this way his statement emphasises the issue of TIP as worse than slavery of the past. As discussed in

section 3.3, the connotation of slavery is one which suggests severe exploitation, which also suggests that the categories of victim and perpetrator are clearly demarcated. Again these emotive terms are used to describe TIP in the following extract:

> Kenny MacAskill, the Justice Secretary, described trafficking as a "**horrific violation of human rights**" that the country could not tolerate.
>
> Mr MacAskill welcomed the inquiry's findings and said that trafficking was "**unacceptable and atrocious**". He added: "Human trafficking is a **particularly horrific** and **brutal violation of human rights**; it has absolutely no place in modern Scotland and the consequences it brings for trafficking victims and the communities touched by these crimes are incredibly damaging."
>
> (Extract 120, *The Times*, 28 November 2011, para. 8-9, emphasis added)

Best (1997) conducted research on the news as secondary claims-makers using stories on dangers to children (i.e. molestation, child pornography) as a case study. Best (1997, p. 83) argues, "stories about threats to children were stories about society's struggle with deviants...The typification of human tragedy, the frightening statistics, and the explicit statement of consensus made these stories about moral conflict." The consensus that Best is referring to is that of the media's presentation of the issue. In this way, TIP is an issue which received consensus in its portrayals within the data-set. In other words, there were no articles advocating that TIP is an issue which is *not* abhorrent. Further, the above extracts are criticizing the (lack of) government action on the issue (Extract 35: "[Brain] has decided to speak out about his mounting frustration over government policy on the issue, as well as the abhorrent nature of the crime") or advocating for changes in policy on TIP (Extract 120: "Mr MacAskill welcomed the inquiry's findings and said that trafficking was 'unacceptable and atrocious'"). The inquiry referenced in the above extract is the

main subject of this article, the headline of which was "Scotland urged to lead way in curb on human trafficking". The article clearly advocates new policy on TIP as shown in the following:

> Scotland should bring forward a new human trafficking bill, and pioneer a victim-centred approach to the problem, according to a new report.
>
> The recommendation is made by the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) as it published the findings of its inquiry into trafficking. It urges the Scottish government to put a strategy in place before the Commonwealth Games in 2014.
>
> Baroness Kennedy of the Shaws, QC, investigating commissioner for the inquiry, said that Scotland should "lead the way" with a new system that enables both the punishment of traffickers and the recovery of victims.
>
> (Extract 120, *The Times*, 28 November 2011, para. 1-3)

This inquiry eventually led to the passing of the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Scotland) Bill on 1 October 2015 (EHRC, 2016). As Best (1997) also identifies in his research, there is an absence of discussion around social factors contributing to the issue. Rather, the focus remains on the perpetrators and victims ("a new system that enables both the punishment of traffickers and the recovery of victims", "pioneer a victim-centred approach to the problem"). The newspapers' representation of TIP as a particularly abhorrent social issue is evident through descriptions of the abuse, violence and exploitation experienced by trafficked persons portrayed in the articles (i.e. individual narratives and references to trafficked persons in general). This arguably makes a more convincing case for why policies need to focus on "punishment of traffickers and the recovery of victims" as the focus throughout the descriptions centres on the victims and the perpetrators

rather than the underlying social and structural factors which contribute to its existence.

The representation of TIP as a particularly abhorrent social issue relied on narratives of trafficked persons which invoke consensus emotive responses. In particular, there was an emphasis of portrayals of persons (women and children) trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation. This was identified as a subtheme to this section and will be discussed next.

3.4.1: The Representation of TIP as Predominantly for Sexual Exploitation

> "But it is sex trafficking that is the most prevalent and pernicious manifestation of human enslavement." – Baroness Helena Kennedy (2011, p. 9)

This section will address how TIP is predominantly represented through the form of sexual exploitation. Further, once establishing this as the dominant representation of TIP within the data-set, I seek to explore the ways in which this contributes to the representation of TIP as a particularly abhorrent issue. Specifically, this will be achieved through linking the representations of TIP for sexual exploitation with what has already been established in academic literature: social anxieties involving women's (unrestrained) sexuality (Andrijasevic, 2009; Doezema, 2000).

The predominant focus on TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation does not exclusively appear within the media; this is similar to academic literature and anti-trafficking efforts (Bastia, 2006). Anderson and Andrijasevic (2008, p. 137) note that, "Media, policy and research on trafficking have for the most part focused exclusively on sex work, and trafficking is commonly associated with 'sexual slavery' and organised crime". In the data-set, 80 out of 121 articles specifically mentioned trafficking for sexual exploitation, whereas 45 articles specifically mentioned other forms of trafficking. In several articles more than one form of

trafficking was referenced. Other indications that trafficking for sexual exploitation is the dominant representation of TIP can be identified in the examples below:

> At least 80 children have been trafficked to Scotland to face sexual exploitation and other forms of abuse including forced labour, benefit fraud and domestic servitude, a report published today says.
>
> (Extract 21, *The Guardian*, 14 March 2011, para. 1)

> Apart from trafficking for sex, there is debt bondage, in which gangs bring people into the UK illegally to pay off debts, trafficking of children for crime or to beg, and of domestic workers.
>
> (Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 38)

In the first example, sexual exploitation is named as the dominant form of trafficking by listing it first and then by listing a variety of forms of additional types of exploitation: "and other forms of abuse including". Here "other" is quite significant, emphasizing sexual exploitation as the reporter's primary focus for trafficked children in Scotland. Using "other" also suggests that sexual exploitation is the predominant representation of TIP, and the reporter is making the readership aware of the other forms in which the trafficking of persons may appear. This mirrors common portrayals of the issue which represent an ideal victim as the sex trafficked woman or child (Srikantiah, 2007). However, this is not necessarily reflected in available data, as Srikantiah (2007, pp. 184) writes, "Available data and anecdotal accounts from service providers who assist trafficking victims suggest that non-sexual, labor trafficking comprises a large proportion of total trafficking cases."

Again, this can be seen in Extract 26. Stating "apart from trafficking for sex…" suggests that the additional forms of exploitation considered to be TIP may not be known to the readership. This is further emphasized by the reporter explaining debt bondage ("in which gangs bring people into the UK illegally to pay off debts").

Another example, included below, begins by discussing "trafficking" and yet further in the extract it is clear that by "trafficking" what is meant is "trafficking for sexual exploitation". Additionally, rather than making reference to trafficked persons there is a mention of "the trade in sex slaves." The narrowed version of what is included in TIP and who is trafficked promotes a specific and limited picture of the issue:

> Stepnitz said: "The focus on trafficking has been to remove immigration offenders or to prosecute organised criminal networks. From our experience the focus has not neccessarily [sic] been on addressing the presence of brothels that create an environment where trafficking can thrive. That has never been the focus."…
>
> …Shadow home secretary Yvette Cooper will condemn the government's decision not to sign up to the EU Directive on Human Trafficking. Cooper believes coalition leaders David Cameron and Nick Clegg are sending the wrong signal to traffickers by not endorsing the directive on common European efforts to combat the trade in sex slaves.
>
> (Extract 13, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 6, 9)

In this extract, TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation takes centre stage. In Extract 13, trafficked persons are also synonymously labelled as sex slaves. As discussed in section 3.3, while trafficked persons may experience slavery or slavery-like circumstances, not all situations of TIP fit this label. Further, there are trafficked persons who have been or are exploited for sexual purposes, however, referencing *only* these types of TIP limits the diverse experiences of trafficked persons. Representing the issue of TIP in this limited way risks isolating those who do not fit this category, as Choi-Fitzpatrick (2012, p. 17) writes:

> Not all prostitution is trafficking, not all smuggling is trafficking, and not all slavery is sexual. More heat than light has been generated in the explication of each of these relationships, and considerable confusion

persists within the general public (as well as within sectors that should know better).

Additionally, the strong emotive responses associated with TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation is connected, in part, with the public concern over (controlling) women's and children's sexuality in order to protect their "innocence" (Kitzinger, 2004; O'Connell Davidson, 2005). The construction of innocence in the depiction of trafficked persons is discussed in greater depth in Chapter Four. However, within the representations of children trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation, the concept of innocence plays an important role in how the issue is constructed as particularly abhorrent. For example:

> Northern police forces have investigated gangs of on-street predators for at least 14 years. In the most serious cases, children have been moved around the country in cars and used for sex by older men. This has led to abortions for girls as young as 12. In November, a court heard that when a South Yorkshire victim, aged 13, was examined by a nurse she appeared to have been raped more than 50 times.
>
> (Extract 1, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 4)

This extract emphasises the age differential between the victims and perpetrators through the use of the terms "children" and "girls" coupled with "older men". The phrase "as young as 12" highlights the youngest victims and the age that is furthest from the age of legal sexual consent. Details including "girls as young as 12" having abortions and a female "aged 13" who had "appeared to have been raped more than 50 times" indicate unprotected (the occurrence of pregnancies) and frequent, forced sex: the antithesis of perceived notions of "childhood innocence". As Kitzinger (2004, p. 33) writes: "The contemporary western concept of childhood innocence...is central to how assaults against children are interpreted. Sexual abuse is a 'violation of innocence' and 'robs children of their childhood'". These examples of girls aged 12 and 13 experiencing sexual exploitation through trafficking and rape contributes to the representation of the issue as particularly abhorrent. Further, this is

exacerbated by the volume of repetitive rape in the girls' experiences of TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation. These examples of TIP serve to typify *who* is trafficked as well as *what* an experience of trafficking includes. The use of narratives which include extreme examples (i.e. "appeared to have been raped more than 50 times", "led to abortions for girls as young as 12") is a strategy used by claims-makers. As Best (1997, p. 82) writes, "Typifications help claims-makers present their strongest case...when consensus surrounds social problems, typifications are more likely to receive uncritical acceptance." In the case of the victimisation of children (and especially the *sexual* victimisation of children) there is an absence of opposition: the general consensus is in strong opposition to the idea of children being victimised especially by sexual means. Therefore, the typification of trafficked children for sexual exploitation is a powerful one that invokes public sensitivities regarding the sexualisation of children. As O'Connell Davidson (2005, p. 1-2) writes:

> ...the idea of child sex abuse and commercial sexual exploitation carries such enormous charge—the fact that politicians, journalists and ordinary folk not only seem to be unanimous that the sexual use of children is intolerable, but also to wish to loudly and publicly advertise that unanimity, and yet seem so much less eager to publicly deplore the fact that there are children in the world who are malnourished, without access to clean water, dying from preventable diseases, exploited in sweatshops and on plantations, and so on. The elevation of phenomena such as child prostitution and pornography to a matter of international concern, deserving of two United Nations world congresses and a plethora of new laws and policies, reinforces this sense that the sexual exploitation of children is uniquely terrible.

Further, the youngest age of trafficked persons was highlighted in articles that addressed examples/narratives of children trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation. In essence, TIP is constructed as a particularly abhorrent issue through

emphasising the youngest age of those who are trafficked for sexual exploitation. The following extracts exemplify this:

> Since the sentencing this month of Mohammed Liaqat, 28, and Abid Saddique, 27, the ringleaders of a group of 13 men in Derby, for sexually abusing and trafficking girls **as young as 12**, public attention has focused on the abduction of young white girls by Asian gangs…
>
> …Barnardo's believes that children are being sexually exploited in every town in Britain. There are 53 services across the country, working with 3,000 boys and girls, some **as young as eight**.
>
> (Extract 9, *The Sunday Times*, 16 January 2011, para. 6, 9, emphasis added)

> The trafficking of British children around UK cities for sexual exploitation is on the increase with some **as young as 10** being groomed by predatory abusers, a report reveals today.
>
> (Extract 10, *The Guardian*, 17 January 2011, para. 1, emphasis added)

> The children's minister, Tim Loughton, announced that an action plan will be devised to tackle child sexual exploitation, which experts say involves British children **as young as 10** being trafficked for sex around the UK.
>
> (Extract 37, *The Guardian,* 18 May 2011, para. 2, emphasis added)

These passages indicate that young children are being trafficked/exploited for sex around the UK. Children as victims invokes a sense of particular abhorrence, as Best (1997, p. 82) notes in his discussion of news stories on subjects regarding "threats to children": "Young children are dependent, vulnerable, innocent; their exploitation is especially horrifying". These extracts emphasize the age of the youngest victims through the phrase "as young as" (featured in bold in each extract). This is significant as it is arguably the most evocative in that it is the age where the child is

the furthest from being sexual. In these descriptions, only highlighting the age of the youngest sex trafficked victims works to typify the youngest age as a point of reference (Best, 1997). These limited details then serve to construct the "typical trafficking victim" (Wilson and O'Brien, 2016, p. 30). Representing the issue of TIP as one in which children are sexually exploited at the prepubescent ages of eight and ten (as well as the age in which puberty may begin: age twelve) constructs the issue as one which is particularly abhorrent because it draws on (as previously referenced) "this sense that the sexual exploitation of children is uniquely terrible" (O'Connell Davidson, 2005, p. 2).

Further, these passages indicate that the issue is pervasive (Extract 9: "every town in Britain", Extract 10: "around UK cities...is on the increase"; Extract 37: "trafficked for sex around the UK"). The combination of young children trafficked for sex in "every town in Britain" is a formulation that arguably works to draw attention to the issue for a particular purpose. As Jahic and Finckenauer (2005, p. 28) indicate in their work on the representations of TIP:

> While service providers, NGOs and women's groups have been
> concerned primarily with the victimization aspect of trafficking in
> women, for the problem to get government attention, they had to present
> it in a sufficiently alarming way. As has been true with other social
> issues in the past, the issue in question must be adequately spotlighted so
> as to make ignoring it no longer politically feasible.

As has been previously mentioned, sexual exploitation, children and the pervasiveness of the issue of TIP work to represent the issue as particularly abhorrent. This representation arguably constructs the issue as one which is urgent, which needs immediate attention through government policy or other means.

Further, representing TIP as an issue which is particularly abhorrent is also interrelated to the third theme: the representation of TIP as widespread. Though it is commonly acknowledged that accurate statistics and figures of trafficked persons

and traffickers are incredibly difficult to ascertain (Jahic and Finckenauer, 2005; Kelly, 2005; Kelly and Regan, 2000), TIP is regularly portrayed with confidence as one that is far-reaching and insidiously present in every community. The way in which this is represented will be explored in greater depth in the following section.

3.5: The Representation of TIP as Pervasive

"In matters of truth and justice, there is no difference between large and small problems, for issues concerning the treatment of people are all the same." –Albert Einstein

This section will explore the theme: *the representation of TIP as a pervasive issue in terms of incidence and geographical location*. Implications of this will be discussed. In terms of incidence, newspaper articles provided varied numerical representations. Further, the use of metaphors, and in particular the phrase "tip of the iceberg", was utilised to suggest the magnitude of TIP despite the lack of reliable statistical data. Additionally, TIP was represented as a pervasive issue in terms of geographic location through the use of extreme case formulations (ECFs). It will be argued that these work to show the relevance and significance of the issue (Edwards, 2000; Pomerantz, 1986).

As an initial step, a table was developed to gain clarity of the extent of variation between numerical representations/statistics regarding trafficked persons in the data-set (see Appendix B). The statistics and numerical descriptions of trafficked persons in the data-set included a wide range of numbers and information. For instance the smallest numerical representation identified was as follows, "At least 80 children have been trafficked to Scotland" (Extract 21, *The Guardian*, 14 March 2011, para. 1). In contrast, the largest number included was the following, "An estimated 1.2 million children are trafficked worldwide each year" (Extract 42, *The Observer*, 29 May 2011, para. 27; this statistic is also cited in Extract 105, *The Times*, 18 October

2011, para. 21). The numerical and geographical range represented between "At least 80 children...trafficked to Scotland" and "an estimated 1.2 million...trafficked worldwide each year" is vast. However, both serve ideological roles which "ground" the concept of TIP (and arguably how it is related to the British population and/or readership of each newspaper) to "the hard, incontrovertible soil of numbers" (Hall et al., 1978, p. 9). For instance, the use of the phrase "at least" indicates that "80 children" is the minimum number of known trafficked children into Scotland. Further, it suggests that there is a (likely) possibility of more than 80 trafficked children.

While each number identified in the data-set provides unique information (i.e. the identified children trafficked to Scotland compared to the estimated number of children trafficked worldwide), it is evident that the numerical representations regarding trafficked persons are varied in *who* they aim to represent (see Appendix B). For example, the numerical representations included references to a range of types of trafficked persons including (but not limited to): children, women, migrants, trafficked sex workers, and trafficked forced labourers. The numerical representations also varied in the size of the group they represented. For example, in the case of child trafficking a range of quantifying numbers were identified including (but not limited to): "...an annual rate of 285 [child trafficking victims]" (Extract 107, *The Guardian*, 19 October 2011, para. 6), "...around 300 to 400 child-trafficking victims in the UK each year" (Extract 106, *The Times*, 18 October 2011, para. 10), "...more than 1,000 children...have been groomed, abused and trafficked for money and the problem is growing" (Extract 101, *Daily Mail*, 14 October 2011, para. 17), and "the thousands of victims of child trafficking in our towns and cities" (Extract 42, *The Observer*, 29 May 2011, para. 1). As these examples indicate, the numerical representations of TIP within the data-set were extensively varied (see Appendix B). Though statistics and numerical representations are often considered objective, they are arguably subjective as well. As Potter (1996, p. 191) writes:

> …quantification is often thought of as an especially precise and clear-
> cut form of description which is contrasted to value judgments and

vague qualitative assessment; however…there are a wide variety of mathematical procedures which allow a considerable flexibility in versions. And this conclusion meshes with a range of studies that have started to consider the rhetorical construction of quantity (Ashmore 1995; Ashmore et al., 1989; McCloskey, 1985; Porter, 1992).

When human beings are exploited, mistreated, or abused, the power of large numbers are often used to describe and represent the issue. The media coverage of TIP is no exception to this. Within the data-set, numbers were relied upon to describe the issue:

> She had been raped thousands of times and was forced to dig her own grave. But this is not what worried her. What if they came for her daughter? This week, the hidden lives of thousands of women in Britain will be laid bare in the High Court in a case that campaigners hope will lead to a new understanding of sex trafficking…
>
> ...United Nations figures indicate that 800,000 people a year are trafficked worldwide.
>
> (Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 1, 37)

> For those young people taken into the care of the state, the nightmare should be over. But the experience of Ling, Hien and hundreds of others reveals that the level of care is often patchy and sometimes downright negligent. A 2008 report by the Conservatives, then in opposition, described child trafficking as "an escalating problem with a weak support structure in place". One year into the coalition, ministers have shown little sign of doing anything about it.
>
> An estimated 1.2 million children are trafficked worldwide each year.
>
> (Extract 42, *The Observer*, 29 May 2011, para. 26-27)

In both of these examples, narratives of individual trafficked persons are included and then followed by large statistical representations of the larger issue (Extract 26: "the hidden lives of thousands of women in Britain", "United Nations figures indicate that 800,000 people a year are trafficked worldwide"; Extract 42: "hundreds of others", "an estimated 1.2 million children are trafficked worldwide each year"). In these cases, the newspaper articles are typifying the problem and then using numerical representations (general uses of "thousands" and "hundreds" as well as more specific, yet still estimated statistics). This strategy is identified by Best (1997, p. 83) as one in which serves "an obvious rhetorical purpose". He writes, "Big numbers mean we're talking about a big problem, one which demands our attention." The combination of a narrative which includes details that could be considered particularly abhorrent (i.e. the example in Extract 42 of Ling and Hien who were trafficked into the UK, abused/raped, identified by authorities, and went missing from care) with a large numerical representation of the issue are persuasive in ascertaining the importance of addressing the issue.

At times, when numerical data was referenced articles within the data-set would suggest that the *actual* number of trafficked persons was greater than the available statistics indicated. For example:

> …A source from with the centre [UKHTC] disclosed that there is evidence of 213 people being trafficked into, out of and within the UK by gangs between 2007 and early 2010. More than half were British.
>
> The figures were provided by police forces in Britain and abroad, but are not exhaustive. "This is an issue which has been under the radar for a while, and these figures are by no means conclusive," the source said. "The figure may well exceed this."

> (Extract 95, *The Times*, 24 September 2011, para. 6-7)

With the lack of reliable statistical data of the scale and scope of TIP, metaphor was utilised throughout the data-set to indicate the severity/magnitude of the issue. The notion that the majority of TIP is hidden from view is compounded when combined with the suggestion that the hidden aspects are large and in many ways beyond reach of authorities. Particularly, the use of the phrase "tip of the iceberg" was identified as a way to depict the size of TIP. This phrase suggests the number is much larger than is evidenced (Meyer, 2007). For example:

> According to the UKHTC Between [sic] April 2009 and March 20011 [sic], nearly 1,500 people were working as slaves in the country. But anti-slavery campaigners say those figures only take into account the number of people found by the police and the true scale of the problem could be much greater. In other words, these figures almost certainly are **the tip of the iceberg**.
>
> (Extract 92, *Daily Mail*, 17 September 2011, para. 17, emphasis added)

> Government statistics tell us that the number of victims of child trafficking in Britain is in the hundreds. Unfortunately, these figures are likely to be just **the tip of the iceberg**. We believe the true number to be in the thousands, writes Christine Beddoe, the UK director of Ecpat, the leading charity dedicated to preventing child trafficking and exploitation.
>
> (Extract 106, *The Times*, 18 October 2011, para. 1, emphasis added)

> The findings conclude that these [trafficking] cases are **the tip of an iceberg**, with many more child victims who have been sold, stolen and transported thousands of miles remaining unidentified.
>
> (Extract 21, *The Guardian*, 14 March 2011, para. 2, emphasis added)

Nobody knows how many children are trafficked into Britain every year. Home Office estimates put it at around 287, but the true scale of the problem remains unknown due to the secretive nature of the crime and the highly organised methods of those who perpetrate it. Mandy John-Baptiste, the manager of the Child Trafficking Advice and Information Line (CTAIL), has worked with 546 cases since CTAIL was set up in 2007 - it is run by the NSPCC and works closely with the Home Office. These figures are regarded as **the tip of the iceberg**.

Anthony Steen MP, the chairman of the Human Trafficking Foundation, said: "The true figure is much, much more, but it is a hidden crime and you can only guess at it. One thing we do know is that in the last year 1,012 children identified as having been trafficked, largely from Eastern Europe, were arrested in the City of Westminster taking part in street crime."

(Extract 29, *The Sunday Times*, 17 April 2011, para. 6-7, emphasis added)

In the first line of Extract 29, the absence of statistical data is indicated ("Nobody knows how many children are trafficked into Britain every year"). Despite the lack of *known* data on the full scale of the issue, the use of "tip of the iceberg" works as a metaphor. As Potter (1991, p. 180) writes, "metaphor is often considered as an area where descriptions are being used performatively. Literal descriptions may be just telling it as it is, while metaphorical ones are doing something sneaky". In the absence of clear numerical data regarding the actual scale of TIP in the UK, the use of metaphor works to establish the issue as large in incidence. Specifically, "tip of the iceberg", as previously mentioned, suggests that the data which is known regarding trafficked persons in the UK is only a small fraction of the entire number of victims. This indicates that the *actual* number is much greater (Meyer, 2007). In Extract 29, the quote stated by Anthony Steen, "The true figure is much, much more" establishes the issue as large without reliable data regarding the full-scale of TIP. What *is* known are the numbers tallied from the year's reports: officials

counted a total of 1,012 children as trafficked. The article is therefore suggesting that the number 1,012 trafficked children is the "tip of the iceberg". Stressing the scale of the issue in this way suggests that the issue is important *because* it is large as previously mentioned (Best, 1997). Further, as Tyldum and Brunovskis (2005, p. 24) identify, "In spite of the strong increase in identified cases of trafficking it remains difficult to determine if the identified cases represent a tip of an iceberg, or if all or close to all incidents of trafficking...are usually identified."

Another way in which the pervasiveness of the issue is represented is through geographic location in the UK. Extreme case formulations were identified, which indicate that TIP occurs everywhere in the UK:

> "People don't understand trafficking," said Anthony Steen, the former Tory MP who chairs the Human Trafficking Foundation, which is campaigning for greater awareness among judges, officials and the general public. "There are traffickers in probably **every community in Britain**."

> They are mostly invisible.

> (Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 14-15, emphasis added)

> "This country has to wake up to the fact that children are being sexually abused in far greater numbers than was ever imagined. It could be going on in **every type of community** and in **every part of the country**," (Tim Loughton, minister for children and families) said.

> (Extract 115, *The Guardian*, 23 November 2011, para. 3, emphasis added)

The assertions that "people don't understand" and "this country has to wake up" suggest the level of concern of the public is insufficient for the issue. Asserting that that TIP occurs in "every community in Britain" as well as "every type of community in every part of the country" works to legitimise TIP as an important

issue (Pomerantz, 1986). The message that *TIP is everywhere* works to advocate for the passing of appropriate legislation as well as increasing attention and prevention programs. For instance, in Extract 115, the main topic of the article was a proposed government plan:

> A far-reaching government plan to tackle child sexual exploitation will be unveiled today to prevent abusers going unpunished and victims unaided...
>
> ...The action plan will call for changes in the legal system to make giving evidence less intimidating for vulnerable young people. The move could include restriction of cross-examination of young witnesses. A victim of rape by a number of perpetrators can currently be questioned by several different barristers.
>
> (Extract 115, *The Guardian*, 23 November 2011, para. 1, 4)

By emphasizing that this issue occurs in "every type of community and in every part of the country" the article is suggesting this action plan is relevant to a wide-range of people. The use of extreme case formulations is justifying its importance (Pomerantz, 1986). The article further suggests, through a comment made by the chief executive of Barnardo's, that the pervasiveness of the issue is evidence of it being equivalent to the safety of children in general:

> Anne-Marie Carrie, chief executive of children's charity Barnardos whose campaign Puppet on a String informed much of the action plan, welcomed the move but said there had to be huge shift in culture so that the victims of grooming were not seen as somehow complicit in their abuse.
>
> Particular emphasis had to be given on protecting children in the care system and councils had to work together to ensure children were not being trafficked across county boundaries, she said. "If we start by

> recognising the size and the scale of this problem it is the first step to recognising it as a child protection issue that is happening **everywhere in the country**."

(Extract 115, *The Guardian*, 23 November 2011, para. 11-12, emphasis added)

The statement that there needs "to be a huge shift in culture" regarding the way victims are held responsible for the exploitative circumstances they encounter suggests a societal lack of sympathy for those victimised. In this way, extreme case formulations which suggest that TIP occurs "everywhere in the country" work to legitimise the issue's importance to a potentially unsympathetic audience (Pomerantz, 1986). The assertion that the "size and the scale of the problem" indicate its importance as well as several claims that it "is happening everywhere in the country" contribute to justifying the issue's significance and relevance to everyone.

Within the data-set the issue of TIP was represented as pervasive in both incidence and geographic location. This was achieved through combining particularly abhorrent narratives with numerical representations, through the use of metaphor, and through the use of extreme case formulations. These serve to construct the issue as one that is large which arguably establishes the issue as one which is in need of attention within the public's awareness and/or government policies. It is essential to note that there is a potential to do more harm than good when there are discrepancies in the interpretation and implementation of the definition utilizing statistics which are not methodologically sound (Dottridge, 2003; Tyldum and Brunovskis, 2005). One such possibility of this occurring, as suggested by Dottridge (2003), is the implementation of ineffective social policies based on inaccurate data (or mistaken perceptions of available data).

3.6: Conclusion

While it is problematic to say that there is a direct cause and effect relationship between the representations of an issue within the media and public understandings of the same issue, it would be naïve to assume there is no influence at all. In their classic text, *The Manufacture of News*, Cohen and Young (1973, p. 28) write, "…it is at least plausible that the selective portrayal of crime in the mass media plays an important part in shaping public definitions of the 'crime problem' and hence also its 'official' definition." Therefore, particular attention needs to be given to the way in which the media represents the issue of TIP as was explored in this chapter.

In efforts to establish TIP as an important and legitimate social problem, the articles which comprised the data-set relied on representations which constructed the issue as a form of modern day slavery, as particularly abhorrent and as pervasive in incidence and location. This risks isolating many trafficked persons' experiences who do not meet these arguably more extreme criteria for those who experience TIP. Additionally, representations of TIP within the media in regards to the themes identified have the potential to influence policy. If these representations only reflect more extreme circumstances, as Tyldum and Brunovskis (2005, p. 18) argue, they "may result in misinformation and hinder the creation of relevant policies and appropriate programmes".

Finally, within the data-set there was a deficit of reporting/discussion on related structural causes of TIP, rather, the primary focus remained on victims and perpetrators. Attempts to address the issue within government policy also primarily focused on punishing traffickers and giving more aid to trafficked persons. While this is essential, efforts to address TIP must go beyond this and also address root structural causes (Hoang and Parrenas, 2014; Segrave et al., 2009; Wylie and McRedmond, 2010). Further, the portrayal of trafficked persons needs to include a more diverse depiction of experiences, which covey the full range of exploitative circumstances within the trafficking spectrum. Through the process of thematic

analysis, the portrayals of trafficked persons in the data-set was determined to be limited.

Issues of agency and powerlessness within the representations of trafficked persons were identified within the data-set. This is the focus of the next empirical chapter.

Chapter Four: Agency and Powerlessness in the Representations of Trafficked Persons' Experiences in the British Press

4.1: Introduction

This chapter seeks to examine the ways in which trafficked persons' experiences of TIP are represented within British national newspapers. After initial analysis, it was identified that the articles within the data-set included details of trafficked persons' experiences that were attributes of an ideal victim (Christie, 1986; Cole, 2007; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). Based on this initial finding, this chapter seeks to identify the components which contribute to a trafficked person's portrayal as a legitimate victim. In essence, which experiences of TIP (according to UK national newspapers' representations) constitute those of legitimate/ideal victimisation?

A thematic analysis was conducted, and three main themes were identified as the following*: 1) Trafficked persons were represented as powerless through stories of force*, 2) *Representations of trafficked persons' escape/rescue narratives involved an overlap between agency and powerlessness,* and 3) *The representation of trafficked children was characterised by innocence*. Through these, I argue that the central tenet within each of these themes is that victimisation is equated to being *acted upon* (powerless victims) by means of dominance rather than to *act* by free will (active agents). The representations of an either/or dichotomy, which will be examined in this chapter, risk minimizing the complexities of the lived experiences of trafficked persons.

4.2: The Issue of Agency in TIP

The offence of TIP as it is outlined by UN and UK legislation is detected primarily through the identification of those who have been victimized by it (Segrave et al., 2009). This section introduces the concept of agency in the context of trafficked persons and their representations of victimisation within British national newspapers. In this chapter, when referring to agency I am referring to one's ability to freely make a choice (Dunn and Powell-Williams, 2007).

The issue of agency within the experiences of trafficked persons has been extensively discussed within the context of TIP (Agustin, 2003a; Agustin, 2003b; Ali, 2005; Andrees and van der Linden, 2005; Andrijasevic, 2010; Bastia, 2006; Doezema, 2002; Kelly, 2005; O'Connell Davidson, 2006; Weitzer, 2007). As previously discussed in Chapters One and Three, the issue of TIP was defined by the UNODC's Palermo Protocol. In order to fit the definition of a trafficked person, the element of movement ("recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons") must be combined with an element of coercion ("by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person") as well as the motive to take advantage of another person ("for the purpose of exploitation"). Therefore, according to this definition, persons who have been trafficked have been coerced for the purposes of exploitation. In other words, this definition equates a trafficked person with being a powerless victim or lacking agency (Doezema, 2002). However, as Kelly (2005, p. 254) writes, "…most trafficking victims continue to exercise agency, but in contexts where their options and possibilities are severely constrained". The issue of agency and where the proverbial line is drawn between exploitation and choice has been a contested discussion among academics (Agustin, 2005; Anderson, 2007; Doezema, 2002; Hughes, 2000). Although there is a lack of consensus and clarity on what agency means in the context of TIP, particularly within TIP for the purposes of sexual

exploitation, it is an important issue because it has ramifications for the way in which trafficked persons are identified, the rights they are given, and the way they are treated.

Mardorossian (2014) wrote about the issue of agency in the context of rape. While TIP and rape are legally identified as separate categories in the Sexual Offences Act 2003, there are similarities in the way in which representations of victims' highlight powerlessness as evidence of their victimisation while agency is downplayed. There is much scholarly debate in this area, particularly among feminists, as Mardorossian (2014, p. 66) writes:

> Postmodernists regularly remind us that feminist discourse often contributes to maintaining the very same unequal relations it seeks to undermine. We are told, for instance, that in representing women as victims, radical feminists often entrench powerlessness as an identity. Their emphasis on victimization denies women's agency and reinscribes a problematic victim/agent opposition. There are two problems with this critique. First it is self-contradictory. If the point of emphasizing women's agency is to help them not to be victims and to suppress the conditions (psychic or otherwise) that allegedly lead to their victimization, then agency continues to preclude victimization since one cannot both have it and be a victim. As such, the two concepts continue to exist in a dichotomous relationship to one another. Postmodern feminists denounce a focus on women's victimization on the grounds that such focus denies women's agency. Yet in focusing on agency as a solution to women's prevalent victimization in our culture, they keep the binary intact by assuming that agency equals an absence of victimization (which itself equals passivity).

However, in the case of TIP, agency and victimisation can occur within the same lived experience of a trafficked person (Doezema, 2011; Hoyle et al., 2011; O'Connell Davidson, 2005; Peach, 2005; Segrave et al., 2009; Soderlund, 2005).

Additionally, beyond the debates regarding agency and victimisation are the conceptions of the trafficked persons by the public and trafficked persons themselves. Research has shown that some public perceptions view trafficked women as maintaining some level of agency in the initial decisions which lead to their circumstances (Kleimenov and Shamkov, 2005; Tiuriukanova, 2005; Tverdova, 2011). This can develop into attitudes which blame the victim and ostracise trafficked persons within their communities (Buckley, 2009).

This chapter will argue that representations within UK national newspapers continue to rely on notions of victimisation which showcase stories of maliciously treated migrants who are portrayed as powerless as well as stories of trafficked persons whose child-like tendencies and/or numerical age (which by law defines them to be a child) are equated to powerlessness regardless of their actions. It will also be argued that these representations reflect an agent/victim dichotomy, the assumption that victims are powerless and those who maintain agency within their circumstances are not. It will be argued that this way of seeing trafficked persons' experiences is evident in representations within the data-set. However, this conflicts with many trafficked persons' accounts of their experience, as articulated by O'Connell Davidson (2005, p. 72):

> So far as definitions of trafficking are concerned the problem is further complicated by the fact that these abuses can vary in severity, which means they generate a continuum of experience, rather than a simple either/or dichotomy. At one pole of the continuum, we can find people who have been transported at gunpoint, then forced to labour through the use of physical and sexual violence and death threats against them or their loved ones back home…At the other pole, we can find people who have not been charged exorbitant rates by recruiting agencies or deceived in any way about the employment for which they were recruited, and who are well paid and work in good conditions in an environment protective of their human and labour rights, and/or women

and children who have migrated into private households as wives, au pairs or adopted kin with the assistance of agents, and who are well treated and living in conditions that allow them to realize their rights and aspirations. But between the two poles lies a range of experience.

Arguably, a range of experiences of trafficked persons was not the purpose of reporting articles on TIP within newspaper articles in the data-set. The purpose of the news is not necessarily to present all sides and circumstances of an issue, but rather editors and journalists seek to include stories which provide a sense of 'newsworthiness', as Jewkes (2004, pp. 60-61) writes:

> Since the British media went through a process of deregulation in the late 1980s and early 1990s criticism has intensified, and both broadcast and print media have been accused of 'dumbing down' their news coverage and measuring newsworthiness by the degree of amusement or revulsion a story provokes in an audience…[news values] illustrate that the news media do not cover systematically all forms and expressions of crime and victimization, and that they pander to the most voyeuristic desires of the audience by exaggerating and dramatizing relatively unusual crimes, while ignoring or downplaying the crimes that are most likely to happen to the 'average' person. At the same time, they sympathize with some victims while blaming others.

The way in which trafficked persons' experiences are represented in UK national newspapers was the central aim of this chapter. Further, the way in which (the lack of) agency is embodied within the depictions of trafficked persons' victimisations in British national newspapers has yet to be examined by means of an in-depth analysis. This will be examined throughout this chapter. Specifically, the next section will focus on the way in which narratives portraying examples of severe victimisation have been used in anti-trafficking discourse.

4.3: (Extreme?) Victimisation in the Representations of Trafficked Persons

The news is known for focusing predominantly on the most extreme and serious cases of victimisation (Greer, 2007). In addition, through the portrayals of victimisation the media, regardless of intention, engages in "blame narratives", as Friedman and Johnston (2013, p. 178) write:

> …news discourses about trafficking risk perpetuating a worldview characterized by masculine power and dominance in which women are both "property" and "victims." The causes and remedies of sex trafficking have become increasingly a topic of interest to journalists. In particular, blame narratives, whether explicit or implicit, and whether directed at groups, individuals, policies, or countries, manifest a society's moral aspirations as well as the role and influence of journalism in facilitating public discussion and encouraging participation in the public sphere.

Narratives which depict severe examples of TIP demarcate clear lines between the trafficked person and the perpetrator: the more abhorrent the narrative, the seemingly easier it is to identify the experience as one involving a legitimate victim. These narratives of trafficked persons consist of victims portrayed as passive and helpless (Bastia, 2006). In essence, they were (aggressively) acted upon and were shown to have little or no agency in matters which initiated their victimisation (in other words the question suggested is: how did the victim come to be in a position which resulted in victimisation?) and the actual victimisation (did they try to resist or escape?). This not only puts those who were victimized on a hypothetical trial, it turns attention/discussion/action away from the acts which were victimizing and towards the actions of the victim. This will be examined in subsequent sections.

Further, the relatively recent examples of Somaly Mam and Long Pross indicate the damage that can be done when the authenticity of a popular narrative involving

severe exploitation and violence is found to be exaggerated or containing false information.

Somaly Mam, a well-known purported trafficked person as well as a founder of a charity aimed at helping other trafficked persons, first published her memoir, *The Road of Lost Innocence*, in France in 2005. In it she writes about her experiences as a survivor of TIP. The book became an international success and propelled her to heroine status across the globe. Her work in Cambodia with other trafficking survivors was recognised and praised by many people and organizations. However, in May 2014 her story was brought into question by the magazine *Newsweek* (Marks, 2014). The article made accusations that much of her story was false. It also accused several of the rescued girls' stories as being false, including the story of Long Pross whose particularly gruesome narrative of victimisation was featured in *The New York Times,* the book *Half the Sky* and on the television talk show *Oprah* (2009a). An excerpt from the *Newsweek* article is included as follows (Marks, 2014, para. 17-21):

> Mam has done much for those girls, and a few of them have done much for her. Mam's success has been due to her energy, her fearlessness and her charisma. It is also due to the shocking stories she and her girls have told.

> In 2009, Nicholas Kristof wrote in *The New York Times* about a girl named Long Pross, who had finally summoned the strength to tell her stunning story of sexual slavery. He reported that a woman had kidnapped Pross and sold her to a brothel, where she was beaten, tortured with electric wires, forced to endure two crude abortions and had an eye gouged out with a piece of metal by an angry pimp. Pross, Kristof said, was rescued by Mam and became part of her valiant group of former trafficking victims fighting for a world free of sexual slavery.

Pross also told her disturbing story on *Oprah* and appeared in the PBS documentary *Half the Sky*. "Believe it or not, when I returned home, my mother and father didn't want me around. I wasn't considered a good person," she says in the documentary.

Equally hard to believe is the fact that Pross's family, neighbors and medical records all tell a different story. Dr. Pok Thorn says he performed surgery on Pross when she was 13, after her parents brought her to a hospital with a nonmalignant tumor covering her right eye. Photographs in her medical records clearly show the young girl's eye before and after the surgery.

So how did she come to be one of Somaly Mam's girls? Te Sereybonn, director of Cambodia's Takeo Eye Hospital back then, says his staff contacted AFESIP to see if they could admit Pross to one of their vocational training programs.

The accusation made against the inauthenticity[6] of this particular narrative is representative of larger issues within the area of victimisation within TIP. The severe physical violence which was associated with the story of Long Pross ("He reported that…she was beaten, tortured with electric wires, forced to endure two crude abortions and had an eye gouged out with a piece of metal") arguably attracted more attention *because* of the severe and explicit violence as it likely garnered both reactions of shock and emotion from those who heard and viewed pictures of the story (Barker, 2013).

---

[6] *The New York Times* responded to the *Newsweek* article with the following Editor's Note on 3 June 2014: "This column reported the story of Long Pross, who said that she was forced to work in a Cambodian brothel, where a pimp gouged out her eye. A *Newsweek* article has raised fundamental doubts about her story, citing medical records showing that a surgeon removed her eye because of a non-malignant tumor. Long Pross denies that account."

While the reliability of stories within the news is beyond the scope of this research, what is important to note about this case is the way in which it was portrayed across a wide variety of international media venues. Further, within Mam's organization multiple trafficked girls were purportedly helped and yet the gruesome nature of Long Pross's story was arguably one of the more popularly portrayed. The story in *Newsweek* claiming that many of the details were fabricated is perhaps an important reminder that the media's representations of severe accounts of victimisation are in need of analysis and reflective discussion. Even if Pross's story was not fabricated the question that needs to be asked is: what is the description of the severe circumstances of her account *doing* as a representation of victimisation within the issue of TIP? Arguably, beyond the shock value, Pross's popularised narrative was one which also showcased powerlessness both through her age at the time of the purported victimisation and through the explicit details of physical force through the use of violence. Again, establishing the veracity of her account is beyond the scope of this study. However, this case shows the level of interest in examples of particularly abhorrent experiences of TIP: to the extent that several international media sources published the story and overlooked/missed identifying it as fabricated or incorrect.

Further, representations of victimisation serve real-life functions such as initiating, implementing or changing government policy and advocating rights for trafficked persons (Hayes et al., 2012). In establishing the legitimacy of victimisation and/or the importance of a cause, representations of victims as powerless and forced into their circumstances are more persuasive than representations of victims as active agents. As Saunders articulates (as cited in Hayes et al., 2012, p. 111), "The story of a helpless migrant woman sold as a child into prostitution can become part of a successful campaign to change a nation's laws while the story of a young woman who travelled for adventure and a better life cannot."

Within TIP, persons who have been trafficked have the added challenge to make authorities aware (and convinced) of their circumstances. This is assuming that

trafficked persons are aware that any force, coercion, and/or exploitation they have endured is illegal and labelled under the term TIP. The reason in which making authorities aware of trafficked persons experiences is considered such a challenge is in part due to government legislation and definitions constructing what Srikantiah (2007, p. 187) terms an "iconic victim". In essence, the ideal victim is one who has been "forced, defrauded, or coerced into trafficking for forced sex, not forced labor." Additionally, the "iconic victim" is also one who lacks agency, and as Srikantiah (2007, p. 187) describes, "the victim must remain passive until rescued by law enforcement".

The notion of the ideal victim includes the following attributes: someone who is passive and/or powerless in their circumstances, can be perceived as blameless, and elicits sympathy from others (Christie, 1986; Greer, 2007; Valier, 2004; Winter, 2002). Representations of victims' powerlessness were identified within the data-set within the three themes outlined at the beginning of this chapter. The first theme, *trafficked persons were represented as powerless through stories of force*, will be discussed in the following section.

4.4: Representing Powerlessness through Stories of Force

Within the data-set, descriptions of force were used to depict the lack of agency of trafficked persons represented in the news articles. Through the utilization of force by perpetrators, victims are reprieved from responsibility for their circumstances (Holstein and Miller, 1997). Within this theme, force is depicted as physical (such as acts of violence) and non-physical (such as the threat of violence).

This is evident within *The Observer*'s account of a trafficked person from Romania named Marinela. Her account as reported by the newspaper includes many descriptions of physical and non-physical force. For instance, the following highlights the physical force used against Marinela by the traffickers and clients:

Marinela, 17, was terrified. Trafficked from Romania, she had been coerced into prostitution by a pimp who beat her with numbing regularity...

…She had been raped by different men 50 times a week on average, often violent, drunken strangers…

(Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 2-3)

The use of physical force by the pimp (also one of her traffickers, "…Marinela was an innocent victim of…a Romanian father-and-son trafficking team", para. 4) and clients is not occasional, it is consistent and intense ("a pimp who beat her with numbing regularity"; "She had been raped by different men 50 times a week on average, often violent, drunken strangers"). These examples work to produce a valid claim to Marinela's status as a victim. The elements of violence as part of the story make it particularly newsworthy, as Stuart et al. (1978, p. 68) write:

One special point about crime as news is the special status of violence as a news value. Any crime can be lifted into news visibility if violence becomes associated with it …

The inclusion of details describing the physical violence conducted against Marinela also lends credibility towards establishing her as a trafficked person.

Further, the newspaper sets Marinela apart from other trafficked persons who knowingly entered sex work through the sentence "she had been coerced into prostitution by a pimp who beat her with numbing regularity".

They invited her to a barbecue. "I said no because I had homework," said Marinela. "When Cornel heard that he just banged my head on the wardrobe and said, 'Put your coat on.'…

(Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 7)

In the case of Marinela, the article reports the traffickers extended an invitation ("They invited her to a barbecue"). The article indicates that she refused ("I said no because I had homework"). This particular action differs from the popular portrayal of the naïve and desperate migrant woman who is tricked into a job abroad, as Segrave et al. (2009, p. 10) write:

> Mobilising discourses of transnational crime have largely drawn on depictions of naïve, young, impoverished and disadvantaged woman from a developing country as the typical victim of sex trafficking. Poverty and lack of opportunity forces her to search for employment abroad, and in this process she is kidnapped, lured and/or forced into sex work and severely abused.

In this way, Marinela's narrative represents the ideal victim even more: she was not impoverished or disadvantaged (she attended school and was finishing homework, refusing recreational activities such as barbecues which exemplifies discipline and hard-working attributes). Her narrative is a representation of the tragic circumstances of an ideal victim in that she was forced in the most extreme sense: she did not want to travel abroad, and she is represented as content with her situation. It is the traffickers who *completely* force her into her circumstances. In essence, she epitomises what could be argued to be a 'gold standard' of victimisation.

Additionally, it was at Marinela's refusal to accept the (we can perhaps assume it was a false) barbecue invitation that the report indicates force was used through Marinela's description of physical violence ("he just banged my head on the wardrobe"), and in this context she is shown to lack agency. Therefore, through the physically violent use of force the trafficker's command to "Put your coat on" is one which is representative of the type of power and dominance the traffickers maintain over Marinela's actions. The article continues:

> "Marius saw my ID card on the table near the TV and took it and my phone. I asked him: 'Why are you taking my passport?' and he just

stared at me"…hours after being abducted, she was raped. "I said, 'I want to go home'—so they beat me up. After half an hour they brought his friend in and they forced me to sleep with him. From that day they kept me prisoner. They wouldn't even let me go outside in case somebody saw me."

In the days that followed, friends and family tried to find her, but there were no clues. Her teachers were baffled. She was in the third year of a course on food hygiene and considered a rising star.

The search intensified but a new identity was being forced on Marinela. She was given a fake passport that transformed her into a 21-year-old adult, then taken to Bucharest and forced on to the 4am coach to England…

(Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 8-10)

In this excerpt Marinela is constructed as acted upon through many passive phrases ("...took [my passport] and my phone"; "after being abducted, she was raped"; "they beat me up"; "they forced me to sleep with him"; "they kept me prisoner"; "they wouldn't even let me go outside"; "a new identity was being forced on Marinela", "She was given a fake passport", "then taken to Bucharest and forced on to the 4am coach to England"). These phrases exemplify passivity and powerlessness through their construction of Marinela as a victim who is the recipient of the actions of the traffickers. *The Observer's* repeated examples of the way in which traffickers used force against Marinela in order to traffic and control her is a strategy which relieves Marinela from personal responsibility in her own victimisation. This is discussed by Holstein and Miller (1997, p. 43)

Exoneration from responsibility accompanies victimization. The essence of being a "victim" resides in a person's perceived lack of control over the harm that he or she has experienced. Thus, to "victimize" someone

instructs others to understand the person as a rather passive, indeed helpless, recipient of injury or injustice.

In this way, the use of force through physical violence ("she was raped"; "so they beat me up"; "they forced me to sleep with him") constructs Marinela as a "passive, helpless" victim. She was *acted upon* by the traffickers through the use of force. Further, when she is depicted as verbally voicing her own will the traffickers' responses are physically violent ("They invited her to a barbecue. 'I said no because I had homework…when Cormel heard that he just banged my head on the wardrobe and said, 'Put your coat on'."; "'I said, 'I want to go home'—so they beat me up'."). This once again re-emphasizes her lack of agency.

Additionally, the dominance of traffickers who force an alternative identity on her ("transformed her into a 21-year-old adult") is juxtaposed with her identity known to her teachers as a "rising star" as a third year student in a food hygiene program ("Her teachers were baffled [at her disappearance]"). In essence, she was not pursuing sex work. She had other options, and promising opportunities. Additionally, the way in which the newspaper highlights her dedication to her studies through her refusal of the barbecue invitation ("'I said no because I had homework'") constructs Marinela as an innocent victim whose actions cannot be attributed to her circumstances of being trafficked and sexually exploited.

Another example of force is evident in the following excerpt as reported by *The Observer* (Extract 35, 15 May 2011, para. 1; 4-5):

> They drove north during the night, up from Nice, through the Channel tunnel and into London. Abina remembers stopping outside a tower block, her boyfriend guiding her into a tiny flat and then a back room where she was locked inside. The first British man to rape her arrived the following morning in mid-December 2009, the next that afternoon…
>
> …For more than 300 days, Abina was incarcerated in the apartment,

during which time hundreds of men visited, some black, some Asian, most white, and paid her boyfriend £30 to have sex with her. Men were allowed to beat her, she says, but most were not as aggressive as her boyfriend. He told visitors that they need not use a condom, and when she fell pregnant he punched her so hard Abina lost her baby.

"He says they can do things without a condom, he says they can beat me because they pay a lot of money for me. I can't decide what I can do, I have no say. When he beat me and I lost the pregnancy, he said that I cannot be pregnant because I was a prostitute."

This example portrays Abina as a powerless victim, and yet refers to her trafficker as her "boyfriend" several times. This membership category draws on associations of a consensual relationship, in essence it suggests there is an element of choice in Abina's decisions. The term boyfriend is commonly understood to mean (at least initially) a chosen relationship. This insinuation that there perhaps was an element of choice at some point with the interactions between Abina and her trafficker is illustrative of a more endemic issue within TIP and victimisation. Aronowitz (2001, p. 166) addresses this in the following:

In some cases 'victims' are willing collaborators…a woman is willingly smuggled to another country to knowingly work in prostitution because her wages are much higher in the destination country than in the country of origin. However, when this woman is not allowed to keep all of her wages but is forced to pay a higher percentage to her traffickers, or 'buy back' her passport at an exorbitant fee, then she too is exploited and is a victim of trafficking.

Abina's narrative, however, departs quickly from the characterization of a "willing collaborator". Rather, though the trafficker is described as a boyfriend the details of Abina as "locked inside" and "incarcerated in the apartment" implicate the dynamic of the relationship as one in which force is used, an abusive relationship. While indicating her lack of agency through physical violence and force ("the first British

man to rape her arrived the following morning"; "men were allowed to beat her"; "most were not as aggressive as her boyfriend"; "when she fell pregnant he punched her so hard Abina lost the baby"), the reference to her trafficker as her boyfriend implies a complexity within her portrayed experience. This complexity, beyond the reference to the term "boyfriend", is overlooked and left unaddressed. Rather, Abina is constructed as being acted upon and powerless in order to demonstrate her victimisation (Srikantiah, 2007). Her voice is absent, particularly in the way in which her trafficker/boyfriend is depicted as the one who determines what can or cannot be done to Abina's body such as: the use of condoms with clients ("'He says they can do things without a condom'"), physical aggression from clients ("'he says they can beat me because they pay a lot of money for me'"), and the choice of pregnancy and birth ("'When he beat me and I lost the pregnancy, he said that I cannot be pregnant because I was a prostitute.'"). What is shown as his complete dominance over her circumstances and body simultaneously emphasizes her lack of agency and therefore her victimisation. This is further evidenced by her statement, "'I can't decide what I can do, I have no say.'"

The element of extreme force through physical violence from her trafficker/boyfriend and clients, as well as her "incarcerated" living conditions, act to emphasize that her role as a prostitute was not a choice. Unlike the article of Marinela, Abina's narrative does not suggest she was kidnapped or tricked into sex work, however the description of her circumstances still work to construct her as powerless and without agency (Doezema, 1999). This is indicated through details including that she was forced to have sex, and severely mistreated during her ordeal. This is re-emphasized later in the article in the following excerpt:

> "I was so happy not working as a prostitute," she smiled last week, recalling her escape and rubbing her neck, which clients used to grip so hard that it bruised. For the first time in five years she was not being forced to have sex with strangers, her fate since arriving in southern France from west Africa and meeting the boyfriend who decided she could make more money in London.

Here it is clearly indicated that Abina's prostitution was not her choice, but "forced" ("For the first time in five years she was not being forced to have sex with strangers"). This is re-emphasized by her quote stating that she "was so happy not to be working as a prostitute". Additionally, the article used the way in which she relayed her experience (which the article determined to be trafficking, "…the Poppy Project charity assessed her, identified her as a trafficking victim…" (para. 13)) in order to identify further acts of physical violence used against her: "…rubbing her neck, which clients used to grip so hard that it bruised". This description is a clear example of the article constructing Abina as a victim of trafficking. There is no indication that Abina is rubbing her neck because of her memory of clients bruising it, however, this description links the physical act of Abina touching her neck and the physical violence she had endured. As Potter (1996, p. 98) indicates: language constructs reality through its "assembly, manufacture, the prospect of different structures at the end."

In this way the news article would convey an entirely different meaning if the act of Abina touching her neck was associated with something else. For example, Givens (2015, para. 2) researches nonverbal behaviours and indicated, "We unconsciously touch our bodies when emotions run high to comfort, relieve, or release stress…scratching, rubbing, or pinching the skin, increase with anxiety and may signal deception, disagreement, fear, or uncertainty." There are multiple *other* meanings that also could be associated with Abina rubbing her neck (i.e. the questioning from the journalist caused stress, she felt stress due to the potential repercussions of telling her story, or another explanation which could cause stress or high emotions: there are a myriad of possibilities). However, the journalist's interpretation focused on a specific act of physical violence she endured, which serves a purpose. It reiterates her lack of agency throughout her victimisation, in this example by emphasizing that physical force/violence was utilised as a tool to control her body and assert another person's will over her own. In essence, the way in which

the news article describes and interprets the details matters as this contributes to the meaning.

This was also evident in the article covering Abina's story in the following excerpt:

> The only time she was allowed to leave the room was to use the shower or the toilet next door. She had no phone, no television; food was brought to her room by her boyfriend.
>
> Abina, 26, from Ghana, says she could do nothing but wait, "miserable", for the next man. "It was my first time to England, my boyfriend said it was east London but I have no idea. I never ever went outside. There was a street below but the window was locked."

> (Extract 35, *The Observer*, 15 May 2011, para. 2-3)

Elements of force depicted in the excerpt above include the way in which Abina's body was controlled by her boyfriend/trafficker. This is evident through the details which convey what she was/was not able to do ("the only time she was allowed to leave the room was to use the shower or the toilet next door"; "food was brought to her room by her boyfriend"; "she could do nothing but wait, 'miserable', for the next man"). Other details depict an element of deprivation ("She had no phone, no television"; "'I never ever went outside'"). Combined together, these details provide reasons as to why Abina remained in her circumstances. In essence, the details work to construct Abina as a true victim. Hoyle, Bosworth and Dempsey (2011) conducted interviews with trafficked persons and found that there are problematic gaps between who is considered to be an "ideal victim" and a "real victim". This has ramifications in the way in which trafficked persons are treated and identified. The following excerpt is from the research of Hoyle, Bosworth and Dempsey (2011, p. 323) and links closely with the details included regarding Abina's trafficked circumstances:

As with victims of domestic violence, criminal justice and immigration authorities often have great difficulty in appreciating the extent and impact of such psychological control. In immigration interviews, for instance, one Poppy worker claimed that:

[UKBA staff] point their finger…'why couldn't you, was there a window in the room? Was it locked? Were you on the top floor?'…you know, some women are like 'I don't know. Yes, there was a window, it was a bit high, I didn't check', and it's like that indicates that they are not thinking how can I get out of here.

What this suggests is that the responsibility of escape, or the indication that escape was considered, is influential in determining whether or not someone is a true victim. The excerpt describing Abina's living situation could be answers to the questions in the interview excerpt from Hoyle, Bosworth and Dempsey's research, or: why didn't Abina try to escape? The newspaper excerpt answers this by revealing her lack of agency and powerlessness: she could not leave her bedroom, "she had no phone" in which to call anyone for help, "no television" in which to discover information on how to be helped, "'I never went outside'" indicates that she could not attempt to run away, "the window was locked" explains why she did not jump out of the window).

In this way, an account of victimisation is determined to be true by being blameless, and even beyond her/his victimisation is found to be flawless in her/his efforts to resist the events which were victimizing (Christie, 1986; Cole, 2007). The newspaper's emphasis on details which construct Abina as a true victim maintains the focus on her actions rather than those of her trafficker/boyfriend. In essence, despite her powerlessness and portrayed lack of agency she is the primary character in the news article. Her trafficker/boyfriend as well as clients are mentioned and present in the story but only as secondary participants in her victimisation. It is Abina that is inadvertently placed in a hypothetical trial, in order to determine whether or not the status of "true victim" is deserved. The issue with this is that it

could easily lead to victim blaming if the trafficked person does not meet the standards of an ideal victim.

Contrast this with the way in which the agency of the victims is shown in the following excerpt, the case of Craig and Beukan who were convicted of sex trafficking:

> A brutal gang boss and his vice girl enforcer were jailed yesterday after their multi-million pound sex trafficking empire was smashed.
>
> Sleazy Stephen Craig, 34, raked in at least £20,000 a week pimping out terrified women and men to punters as head of a UK-wide prostitution network.
>
> He ran a chain of brothels at luxury flats where he subjected sex workers to vicious intimidation—threatening to pour boiling water down one woman's throat when she quit.
>
> (Extract 99, *The Sun*, 4 October 2011, para. 1-3)

The indication here is that the sex worker maintained some agency as the article states "she quit", and it is at this point when Craig used non-physical force in the form of threats ("threatening to pour boiling water down one woman's throat"). Without knowing any details about the sex workers/trafficked persons/people who were victimized by Craig and Beukan it is difficult to compare their circumstances to those trafficked persons whose stories are portrayed with more details. However, what can be inferred is that there are circumstances where a person is considered trafficked and maintains a level of control over some of their decisions and circumstances. It is not all or nothing in terms of coercion and exploitation. In essence, a person can be exploited and considered trafficked while still maintaining some level of agency over their decisions. In this way, agency is not synonymous with free will; it is more complex (Agustin, 2005).

Control and power, maintained by traffickers, as in the case from the excerpt above, does not have to be through actual physical violence. This suggests that it is possible for agency to be compromised through the threat of violence. This is shown in another excerpt covering the same news material as the previous extract:

> "Craig controlled his victims for a substantial period of time through intimidation and fear," said [Detective Inspector Stephen] Grant. "For the most part it was implied violence, but we did have evidence of threats." Craig had threatened to use boiling water on one witness who stopped working for him but returned.

> (Extract 100, *The Times*, 4 October 2011, para. 6)

It is important to note that in these two extracts from *The Sun* and *The Times* respectively, it is made clear that Craig and Beukan were convicted of sex trafficking. Both extracts labelled the victims throughout the entire articles with the following terms: "victims", (Extract 100, *The Times*, para. 6), "sex workers" (Extract 99, *The Sun*, para. 3), "hookers" (Extract 99, *The Sun*, para. 16), "prostitutes" (Extract 100, *The Times*, para. 7-8; Extract 99, *The Sun,* para. 5), "desperate and vulnerable people" (Extract 100, *The Times,* para. 3), and "vulnerable people" (Extract 99, *The Sun*, para. 21). These particular labels exemplify the complexities inherent within the overlap between agency and powerlessness. The terms "sex workers", "prostitutes", and "hookers" are commonly connected to negative associations while at the same time fueling an ongoing debate regarding agency. Weitzer (2007a, p. 28) addresses several perspectives on sex work, and while there are academics who acknowledge the complexities inherent in sex as work, the view of sex work as "an unqualified evil" is prevalent. This particular view, termed the "oppression model" of sex work, aims to "erase workers' autonomy and agency" (Weitzer, 2007a, p. 28). In both *The Sun* and *The Times*, there are no distinctions made between the terms "sex worker" or "prostitute" and "desperate and vulnerable people". Further as O'Connell Davidson (2002, p. 84)

found, "In all the countries where I have conducted research, female prostitutes are legally and socially constructed as a separate class of persons, and as such are subjected (to varying degrees) to a range of civil and human rights abuses".

Within the articles there are also no indications that the victims are *not* trafficked; rather, the insinuation that they are trafficked is made through descriptions (such as those included in the above excerpts) which include evidence of force through the use of threats and evidence of exploitation. Additionally, the element of movement, a component required by the definition of TIP, was also indicated. For instance: "Stephen Craig, 34, and Sarah Beukan, 22, admitted moving women between Glasgow, Edinburgh, Aberdeen, Belfast, Cardiff and Newcastle upon Tyne for purposes of selling sex" (Extract 100, *The Times,* para. 2).

Further, despite the article from *The Times* indicating that the "witness…stopped working for him but returned" it is made clear that Craig, as a trafficker, maintained power over those who purportedly worked for him ("Craig controlled his victims for a substantial period of time through intimidation and fear"). This suggests that agency and victimisation are not on opposing sides of the spectrum, and that perhaps the two are not a clear-cut either/or dichotomy. The victim, in these excerpts, had the ability to "quit" (Extract 99, *The Sun*, para. 3) or "stopped working" (Extract 100, *The Times*, para. 6). However, the victims in these circumstances were also described as people who did not have total agency either by Craig ("he subjected sex workers to vicious intimidation", Extract 99, *The Sun,* para. 3; "'Craig controlled his victims for a substantial period of time through intimidation and fear'", Extract 100, *The Times*, para. 6). This confuses the more common conceptualization that agency and victimisation are mutually exclusive terms, as Mardorossian (2014, p. 32) writes:

> Agency and victimization are conceptualized in opposition to one
> another, and the presence of one automatically implies the absence of
> the other. Agency is valorized as a mark of self-reliance, resistance, and
> moral worth, a valorization that is increasingly enabled today through

the devaluation of victimhood's association with passivity.

This opposition is evidenced in the following excerpt:

> In interviews lasting more than 20 hours, the woman has given a graphic
> account of why trafficked sex workers allow themselves to be brought to
> Britain, and why they cooperate with their captors once they are here.
> The answer is fear, maintained by levels of brutality that are hard to
> comprehend…
>
> ….she was sold to a pimp, who raped her repeatedly, leaving her unable
> to stand or walk, before locking her in a flat near the Italian seaside to
> spend seven months as a prostitute. She was then sold to a second pimp,
> who put her to work on the streets, and sold again after she tried to
> escape.
>
> (Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 6, 10)

The indication in this excerpt is that the one main reason "why trafficked sex
workers allow themselves to be brought to Britain" (suggested through the use of
"the answer is" rather than acknowledging there are potentially multiple reasons) is
due to fear and physical violence ("fear, maintained by levels of brutality that are
hard to comprehend"). Further, the suggestion that trafficked persons "allow
themselves to be brought to Britain" exemplifies the dilemma and complexities of
the agent/victim dichotomy, what Mardorossian (2014) identified as the opposition
of agency and victimisation as quoted previously. Within this phrase the trafficked
sex workers are described as having agency over their circumstances ("allow
themselves") as well as simultaneously shown to be passive recipients of their
circumstances ("to be brought to Britain"). By someone else maintaining the power
of bringing them to a particular destination (in this case, Britain), they forego agency
in the actual transportation process ("brought to Britain"). However, as suggested
through *The Sunday Times's* excerpt, trafficked persons are asked to answer *why*

they were in the circumstances in the first place: in essence, why did they "allow" an opportunity for victimisation (through migration to the UK), and then upon realization of their circumstances, why did they "cooperate" with their "captors"? While agency is essential to recognize within accounts of TIP, it is also important to acknowledge the way in which the concept can be utilised to blame the victim by assigning responsibility for the perpetrator's acts. In essence, issues of agency/powerlessness must not be used as a means to question trafficked persons regarding their victimisations *after* they occur. As Kara (2009) found, trafficked women blamed their own actions for the way in which they were exploited. This correlates with what the excerpt above identifies: being victimized leads to questions of how they "allow[ed]" themselves to trafficked.

This is symptomatic of a larger issue: the responsibility placed on the victims' actions in their victimisation. In essence, the victim must defend their actions in order to determine whether or not they are blameless. It is the blameless victim who is determined to be the true victim. In terms of true victimhood, it is powerlessness that renders a victim blameless: if a trafficked person was taken by force, by deception, or by other means (which exonerate the trafficked person from actively choosing any aspect of her/his circumstances) then she/he is a true victim. Doezema (2000, p. 34) discusses this idea in the following:

> [The trafficked person's] "innocence" is established in a number of ways: through stressing her lack of knowledge of or unwillingness to accede to her fate; her youth-equated with sexual unawareness and thus purity; and/or her poverty.

As Doezema identifies, evidence of victimisation and "innocence" in the following excerpt is shown through lack of knowledge and suggestions of poverty-ridden lives of those who were trafficked:

> …once taken to Midland Road they were allegedly forced to become prostitutes, working in London, the Midlands and Bradford, West Yorks…

…A source said: "Most of the women were vulnerable. The network approached them and promised good jobs or a 'rest' from their troubled lives if they came over. But they were then traded around British brothels, sexually assaulted or raped. It was horrific.

(Extract 73, *The Sun*, 15 July 2011, para. 6; 11)

The physical force evident in this excerpt ("forced to become prostitutes", "sexually assaulted", "raped") is portrayed as a consequential result of "vulnerable" women being lured into the UK by false promises ("trafficked into the UK with the promise of jobs or cash for agreeing to sham marriages"; "The network approached them and promised good jobs or a 'rest' from their troubled lives if they came over."). The women who were trafficked were reported to be from Eastern Europe (Extract 73, *The Sun*, para. 2). This representation of the trafficked person (woman) as one who is easily duped due to impoverished and desperate circumstances is a consistent one and suggests a lack of agency which is attributed as a dominant characteristic of women from developing nations (Doezema, 1998; Hayes et al., 2012). Take for example the following:

Southwark crown court heard that Mwanahamisi Mruke, 47, was brought to the UK by Saeeda Khan with the promise of a domestic service visa and 120,000 Tanzanian shillings a month (£50). There was also £10 a month pocket money. Desperate to fund her daughter Zakia's college education, Mruke agreed.

But when she arrived in Britain in October 2006, Mruke was forced by Khan to work around the clock and sleep on the kitchen floor of her home in Harrow, London, for the next three years.

Mruke was fed just two slices of bread a day, and ordered around by a bell, which her captor kept in her bedroom.

(Extract 22, *The Guardian*, 17 March 2011, para. 2-4)

> A woman claiming to be a girlfriend of Nejloveanu took her to a large
> suburban house in Edgbaston where another two Romanian girls lived.
> "Then it dawned on me. I was asked: 'Do you know how to put a
> condom on?' 'What are you talking about?' I said." Marinela refused to
> accompany the girls to a nearby brothel and as a consequence received
> her first death threat. Unless she co-operated Nejloveanu would kill her,
> she was told, when he returned from Romania.

(Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 11)

In this excerpt Marinela asserts herself as an active agent by not going to the brothel. The description that follows indicates that agency and acting by her own accord resulted in a "death threat". The excerpt continues to emphasize that passivity is a means for Marinela's survival. This is depicted through the description which suggests if Marinela did not acquiesce to her trafficker's demands then he "would kill her…when he returned from Romania". In other words, Marinela's victimisation is confirmed through the extreme way in which passivity is a means of her survival: asserting her will in this circumstance is akin to having her life threatened. In essence, these descriptions construct Marinela as powerless.

Further, the above excerpt also suggests that Marinela is resisting compliance with the trafficker's demands because it is prostitution ("'Then it dawned on me. I was asked: 'Do you know how to put a condom on?' 'What are you talking about?' I said.' Marinela refused to accompany the girls to a nearby brothel…"). This refusal to attend the brothel (even through coercion and the forced nature of her circumstances) separates her from the trafficked persons who *were* migrating to the UK for sex work. Her resistance and attempts to assert agency continue, with what are represented to be dire consequences. As *The Observer* (Extract 14, 6 February 2011, para. 13-14) reported:

Nejloveanu eventually arrived and she took her first ferocious beating for refusing to have sex with men. "He beat me up and forced me to sleep with him—anal sex. It really hurt. He was pulling my hair and hurting my back. Sometimes he would bang my head right on the corner of the door. That really hurt."

Weeks into her ordeal, Marinela relented. Nejloveanu presented her with a lurid set of garish underwear and she was taken to a nearby brothel masquerading as a sauna. She could not speak a word of English. When the first "client" booked her she wanted to say "no" but could not. She wanted to explain her predicament, tell the man that she was trafficked. Instead she cried, hoping that the man would take pity on her. He did not. None of them did.

When Marinela continues to assert her agency ("refusing to have sex with men") it results in "her first ferocious beating". The article continues to document the details of the specific ways in which Nejloveanu physically assaulted her, the descriptions of which are arguably voyeuristic (this will be examined further in Chapter Six). What is of interest in this section is the way in which Marinela's victimisation is constructed through a lens of powerlessness and lack of agency. Even when she asserts her will she is assaulted with violence that could cost her life and at the very least are obvious forms of physical assault ("'He was pulling my hair and hurting my back. Sometimes he would bang my head right on the corner of the door. That really hurt.'") and rape ("forced me to sleep with him—anal sex. It really hurt.").

In addition to establishing that Marinela was a victim of severe physical violence and threats of violence, the article includes descriptions which indicate why she could not or did not successfully escape, which further work to construct her powerlessness within her circumstances (para. 8: "From that day they kept me prisoner. They wouldn't even let me go outside in case somebody saw me"; para. 20: "She made one escape bid. That precipitated one of her most brutal beatings by Nejloveanu: 'I got punched, a knife in my head, my hair was pulled until it came

out'."). Marinela's narrative is one in which exemplifies the ideal victim through the clear depiction of physical restraint, violence, and her efforts to escape/resist her victimisation (Christie, 1986; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

The inclusion of details which describe Marinela's resistance to her victimisation and her effort to escape her perpetrator indicate another theme which was identified during analysis: the overlap between agency and powerlessness in depictions of trafficked persons' escape/rescue. This will be discussed in the following section.

4.5: The Overlap of Agency and Powerlessness through depictions of Escape/Rescue

The second theme was identified as: *representations of trafficked persons' escape/rescue narratives involved an overlap between agency and powerlessness*. Within the data-set the representations of trafficked persons rescue and/or escape attempts exemplified the overlap between the concepts of agency and powerlessness. Narratives of trafficked persons, particularly women, referenced their efforts to escape or the circumstances where police or authority figures removed them from their trafficker (this was shown to occur primarily through arrest). Hayes et al. (2012, p. 115) write that, "The image of the victim of trafficking rests on the role of the west as 'rescuer'. However, once rescued, the majority of trafficked women and girls are not allowed to stay in the destination country." In addition to this, I argue that the representation of the trafficked person places priority on powerlessness within their victimisation while simultaneously focusing on their own initiative to escape their circumstances (with necessary help from others). Further, the overlap of these dichotomous concepts contributes to constructing the ideal victim of TIP.

While reports of police and law enforcement officers busting a brothel or arresting traffickers recurs within the data-set (i.e. Extract 31, *The Sun*, 21 April 2011; Extract

74, *Daily Mail*, 16 July 2011; Extract 110, *The Sun*, 3 November 2011; Extract 120, *The Times*, 28 November 2011), there are also many key examples of ordinary citizens identifying and aiding trafficked persons. Through these representations of rescue and/or escape the trafficked person's actions both exhibit agency and powerlessness, signifying the complexity inherent in their lived experiences.

On April 29, 2003 came potential rescue. Police raided the flat in Harrow, and Kira, by now 18, was arrested. She told police she had been forced to Italy and into prostitution.

She was held in Holloway prison, including a week in solitary confinement. David Blunkett, then home secretary, rejected her claim for asylum on the basis that Moldova was safe.

Britain deported her. She could not live with her mother, who feared the traffickers. So she slept rough. The traffickers soon found her. They had a score to settle: after she had gone to the police in Italy, people were imprisoned.

She was taken to a forest, made to dig her own grave and hanged from a branch above it. Then they cut her down, before gang-raping her. One man used pliers to pull out one of her teeth.

These events cannot be verified. But medical examiners have found injuries consistent with her story.

Kira was again forced back into prostitution. Britain had deported her, and soon it would be getting her back.

In 2004 [Kira] arrived via Ireland and Holyhead for her new, hidden life as a slave in London. But in a moment of inattention by her Israeli guards, she ran into the street in her pyjamas, waved down a passing car

and, at last, after a failed pursuit by her captors, she was free. In 2008
she was granted refugee status.

(Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 20-26)

Kira's powerlessness is exemplified in what is represented as a "potential rescue".
The authorities maintain power over her circumstances and, in ways, her story as
they determine whether or not it is believable. In Kira's case, it is not clear whether
or not she was determined to be a trafficked person (i.e. David Blunkett's rejection
of her asylum claim on the grounds that "Moldova was safe" indicates that there
perhaps was some recognition of her situation). What is clear is that she was held in
prison, solitary confinement and deported. In essence, she was powerless in this
situation.

Later, however, her second rescue/escape attempt as represented in the article is
successful, through no help of the state or authority agents. In this section the
dichotomy between agency and powerlessness is overlapped within Kira's
experience. Before describing how she escapes, her circumstances are described as
slave-like ("her new, hidden life as a slave in London"). "As a slave" indicates that
Kira lacked agency over her circumstances and was treated as property, and
according to the definition of slavery: someone who the rights of ownership by
another person were partially or fully exercised (as discussed in Chapter Three:
Allain and Bales, 2012).

Rather, it is Kira who (through her own agency) acts to save herself: she seizes an
opportunity to escape and flags down a car. The next part of the sentence reads,
"…at last, after a failed pursuit by her captors, she was free. In 2008 she was granted
refugee status." From the information given in the article, her ability to stay in the
UK was precipitated by her own actions to escape her situation, which she did
successfully. This brings into question the perception of trafficked persons as
powerless, and is related to what Warren (2012, p. 117) writes regarding the

simultaneous standards of trafficked persons as accountable for their actions while still needing help:

> In practice there is an interesting twist to this image of helplessness. In this paradigm, migrant women need the help of others to escape the "slavery" of their traffickers, but also in the current world of neoliberal values and social policy they are expected to be self-directed individuals responsible for themselves.

This is evident in Kira's example. She took advantage of an opportunity to escape, and yet she is simultaneously reliant on the "help of others to escape": first the people who picked her up in the passing car, and second the authorities with the power to determine where she lives and to which resources she has access.

This scenario is repeated in the representations of Abina's and Gloria's narratives:

> Abina escaped last October. As always, she tried the apartment door when her boyfriend left; this time, he had neglected to lock it. She recalls panicking, opening the drawer where he stashed the money she made, taking the £30 from her last client and running into the street.

> "I was terrified. I ran towards a train station and saw a couple, and I said that I needed to get out of there." The couple took her to Victoria coach station and bought her a National Express ticket to a northern city. There a woman found her weeping in the city centre and took her in…

> …Gloria, too, made a break for it one afternoon. She fled from the family in March last year, telling staff at a college nearby that her life was in danger.

> (Extract 35, *The Observer*, 15 May 2011, para. 10-11, 14)

The anonymous bystander is prevalent in both Abina's and Gloria's escape, which is evidence of the notion that Western societies have constructed themselves as "rescuers" within anti-trafficking discourse (Hayes et al., 2012). The bystanders play crucial roles in the difference between the represented trafficked persons' freedom and their captivity, and yet the initial escape is due to the self-direction of Abina and Gloria: they are both reliant on themselves (agency) and reliant on the bystander to rescue them (powerless).

It is important to note that research has found trafficked persons and exploited sex workers to be in the minority. As mentioned in previous chapters, Mai's (2009, p. 32) research on migrant sex workers in London found this to be the case within his data sample:

> …a minority of interviewees felt that they had been forced to sell sex
> and that they had been exploited. Only a very small minority of these
> were deceived and forced into selling sex in circumstances within which
> they felt they had no share of control or consent. In the majority of the
> cases of exploitation encountered, interviewees were aware that they
> would be selling sex, but not of the exploitative working conditions that
> they were required to endure, which led them to find ways to escape
> through the co-operation of clients, colleagues and, especially if
> documented or not intending to stay in the UK, the police.

The discrepancies between the representations in this research's data-set and Mai's research are indicative of the varied experiences of persons who have endured exploitation. It further shows that persons within these situations maintain different levels of agency and as evidenced by both Mai's findings and several representations within the data-set, regardless of the conditions they face those who were victimized were not powerless or passive and contributed to their own rescues.

Through the construction of childhood innocence, powerlessness (through the construction of the child as vulnerable) and lack of agency were also identified

within the representations of trafficked children. This will be explored in the following section.

4.6: The Child(like) Victim: Representations of Innocence

> "The innocent child is an asexual, pure and vulnerable figure…"
> (Meyer, 2007, p. 22)

The third theme was identified as: *the representation of the innocence of trafficked children*. It addresses the ways in which trafficked youth are portrayed as embodying innocence through being characterised as children. This was identified in the data-set through references to numerical age, descriptions of behavioural mannerisms as well as associations with innocence and vulnerability. My position is congruent with Jackson and Scott (1999, p. 86) who write, "childhood is socially constructed". Further, the 'child' is a "category produced within discourse" (Lawler, 2014, p. 85). In this way what it means to be a 'child' is socially produced and linked with certain attributes including asexuality and innocence (Jackson, 1982; Jackson and Scott, 1999; O'Connell Davidson, 2005; Robinson, 2008), which will be addressed in this section.

The category of child was used to show particular vulnerability. Take the following example where the trafficked person identifies herself as a child:

> Then the beatings began. "You had to do whatever they ask. They shout,
> blaming you for everything, sometime [sic] they bit me, they beat me.
> They say you are just a slave, you don't say anything, even though I am
> a child myself. I was scared all the time."
> (Extract 35, *The Observer*, 15 May 2011, para. 7)

In this example, the trafficked person self-identifies as a child and contrasts this with what the traffickers call her: "just a slave". The juxtaposition in this representation is

between idealized childhood (innocence, carefree, safe) and her lived childhood experience (slave-like, exploited/abused, "scared all the time"). Further, the trafficked child within the data-set was represented as an ideal or legitimate victim based on this construction of innocence as inextricably linked to childhood. As Woodrow (1999, p. 9) discusses:

> The innocence frame places children as weak and inevitably denies them agency, i.e. the capability of children to act and determine action for themselves. When this image is dominant, it inhibits the potential of children to explore the injustices and social realities of their existence and develop skills to deal with the moral inconsistencies and challenges they encounter in their lives and can work to reinforce power differentials between adults and children. Maintaining the image of the child as innocent usually works to reassert the power and control of the adult…

This construction of the children as vulnerable and innocent in need of "the power and control of the adult" is evident in the following extract:

> Children as young as 10 are being trafficked from far-flung countries including Vietnam, China and Nigeria to Britain for prostitution, forced labour and begging on the streets. Once these children have passed through immigration, the authorities will often lose all trace of them...
>
> ...Of the children involved in trafficking who do come to the attention of the authorities, many remain at considerable risk. They are very young, unable to speak English, often abused, disoriented and under the influence of their traffickers. They have no passport and more importantly they have no parental figures to ensure their wellbeing.

<div align="right">(Extract 106, The Times, 18 October 2011, para. 2-3)</div>

In this example it is stressed that the children trafficked into Britain "from far-flung countries" are particularly vulnerable and lack agency through the emphasis that they are "very young" and "as young as 10". The children's lack of agency is reiterated through the depiction that they are "unable to speak English, often abused, disoriented". Their vulnerability is further emphasized through the lack of caring guardians ("under the influence of their traffickers", "more importantly they have no parental figures to ensure their wellbeing"). Without adults to "ensure their wellbeing" these trafficked children are portrayed as in danger and in need of safeguarding. The indication is that they are unable to protect themselves, rather it is "parental figures" who would be able to make sure they are safe. Establishing foreign trafficked children's lack of agency and vulnerability in this area, this particular article then proposed "a system of guardianship":

> Should he or she come to the attention of the authorities, a trafficked child is likely to be put into local authority care, perhaps in a flat or a shared house. There is no system of safe housing, no one to look after them properly with the result that many of these "rescued children" go missing a second time.
>
> This is why we are calling for a system of guardianship for trafficked children. Today, Ecpat UK is launching its report on guardianship at Westminster, asking the Government for urgent action. A guardian would make sure that a trafficked child finds safe accommodation, gets an education and is protected from traffickers.
>
> (Extract 106, *The Times*, 18 October 2011, para. 4-5)

In the absence of responsible adult figures who can keep the trafficked children safe from traffickers, the article is advocating for the government to step in and assume control for the children. This suggests the children are passive and innocent and in need of a parent figure (in this case government officials) to "reassert the power and control" (Woodrow, 1999, p. 9).

This construction of the child as passive and innocent is also evident in representations of children who have been trafficked for sexual exploitation. This will be discussed in depth in this section.

> …Girls who fall victim to this model of grooming, where initial contact is made in town centres, on street corners, outside school gates, inside shopping malls or at bus and rail stations, come from a wide social spectrum. Some were under the care of social services or from troubled family backgrounds; others came from professional middle-class families. All, because of their age, were extremely vulnerable.
>
> (Extract 2, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 12)

This excerpt connects vulnerability with age ("All, *because* of their age, were extremely vulnerable", emphasis added). Further, age is the unifying factor between the girls as it is indicated they come from a variety of circumstances ("Girls who fall victim to this…come from a wide social spectrum"). In essence, the type of home the girls come from does not determine their vulnerability; it is how old they are that is the indicator. Earlier in the article this is also mentioned, "Some of the girls are from quite good homes but they're easily manipulated" (para. 4). The insinuation is that youths from "good homes" are not immune to the dangers of the sex trafficker/groomer.

Further, it renders the female youth completely passive in their actions. Vulnerable due to age and "easily manipulated" also indicate they are helpless to protect themselves from the threat of danger, in this case through the luring capabilities of the sex trafficker/groomer. Another example shows the way in which the representation of the trafficked/groomed female works to construct her youth and passivity:

> Sarah is 18 but looks much younger. Her tiny frame is engulfed by a tracksuit top, her hair scraped back, her huge eyes clear of makeup. In

the private room of a Barnardo's project, she nervously plays with a
heart-shaped cushion.

She was 15, she explains, when she and her 14-year-old cousin met a
group of men in a takeaway in a run-down area of their home town.
Over a few weeks, the men—who said they were 18 but were in fact in
their late 20s—showered them with gifts and attention. Before long, the
girls were going to "parties" around the north of England and further
afield where much older men would be waiting.

(Extract 38, *The Guardian*, 18 May 2011, para. 1-2)

Within this excerpt, the descriptions work to construct Sarah's innocence through
associations with childhood. Her age is written as "18 but looks much younger".
Eighteen years old is past the legal age of consent in the UK, which is 16-years old
(Sexual Offences Act 2003). The implication of a legal age of consent suggests that
people below the designated age are incapable of giving legitimate consent (Cocca,
2015). In essence, children (defined as below the age of 16 by British law) embody
vulnerability in a way that renders them passive regardless of their actions (Cocca,
2015). In this way, Extract 38 is emphasizing Sarah's vulnerability and innocence
through suggesting she has childlike physical features and behavioural mannerisms.
This is further accentuated through the descriptions that serve to link Sarah with
physical features and behaviours of a young child ("tiny frame", "her huge eyes
clear of makeup", "she nervously plays with a heart-shaped cushion"). Associating
Sarah with the physical and behavioural attributes of a child, as well as indicating
that her victimisation occurred when she was below the legal age of consent serves
to construct her innocence. As Jackson (1982) indicates, innocence and childhood
have become inextricably linked. Therefore, through descriptions depicting Sarah as
younger than her current age, her innocence is simultaneously emphasized.

Further, the age in which her victimisation began is indicated to be 15 years old,
which again, is under the age of consent. Age is further emphasized by indicating

her cousin, who was also victimized, was 14, and the "group of men" who groomed/trafficked them "said they were 18 but were in fact in their late 20s". Here an age gap between the female victims and male perpetrators is indicated to the reader. The "girls" believed the perpetrators to be closer to their own age, but the article reveals the men had lied. This numerical age gap accentuates the differences between the categories of the "girls" as children and the "men" as adults. Portraying Sarah as embodying characteristics of a child as previously mentioned combined with the categorical distinctions between herself as a girl below the age of consent and her perpetrator as an adult serve to construct her innocence within her victimisation. The legitimacy of her victimisation, in essence, is associated with the conceptualization of childhood innocence and its inherent vulnerability. As Hayes et. al. (2012, p. 64) write:

> The more sacred, pure or innocent the victim, the more profane the violation and the offender. Children are the most innocent group in contemporary society, and because of this are also perceived as the most vulnerable...

The portrayals of children as innocent are evident in the depictions of young trafficked person's narratives. Take the example of Chloe in the following excerpt:

> Chloe isn't in the mood for talking today. She hunches over her plate, the sleeves of her jumper pulled down to cover the scratches where she has taken out her rage on herself.
>
> "What do you want to do then, Chlo?" her youth worker asks. "Don't care," shrugs Chloe, who seems detached—from us, from the busy lunchtime crowd, from herself. But as we get up to go, she spots a Sylvanian Families figure belonging to my six-year-old in my bag and her face lights up. "Oh I love those!" she squeals. And a hand, tiny, with nails bitten to the quick, swoops to pick it up. "When I was a little girl…" she begins. And then she stops and her body slumps again. "Are

we going or what?"

Chloe is 14 now. At 11 she was an A-grade student at her private school in south Wales. By the time she was 12 she was being sexually exploited by the 27-year-old man she considered to be her "boyfriend" and his friends. To Chloe, kicking against what she perceived as restraints at home, the man she met in the town centre one Saturday represented freedom.

(Extract 9, *The Sunday Times*, 16 January 2011, para. 1-3)

Chloe's childhood innocence is accentuated through the description of her reaction to the journalist's child's toy: a Sylvanian Families figure. The reference to the journalist's own child's age being six-years old combined with the reaction from Chloe ("'Oh I love those!' she squeals") indicate her youth and innocence. The present tense "Oh I love those" suggests that despite her teenage age of 14-years-old her interests relate to those of a six-year-old. The childhood image being constructed in this excerpt is emphasizing frailty through size and body descriptions ("tiny"; "hunches over her plate"; "and then she stops and slumps again") and the stress of the events which she has been through ("sleeves of her jumper pulled down to cover the scratches where she has taken out her rage on herself"; "nails bitten to the quick"). This inclusion of her childlike interest in toys, physical size, and the stress-induced physical habits/coping mechanisms (nail biting, cutting) creates a stark contrast between the innocence of her childhood ("at 11 she was an A-grade student at her private school in south Wales") and her victimisation ("By the time she was 12 she was being sexually exploited by the 27-year-old man she considered to be her 'boyfriend' and his friends"). This theme of childhood innocence is accentuated again in the following extract:

Kira's seven years of prostitution began when she was 14, living in a children's home in Moldova. She was a virgin who knew nothing of sex.

She and her friend Angela, 15, went for a picnic in the forest with the men they regarded as their first boyfriends. They were kidnapped, waking from unconsciousness to find themselves on the Romanian border. Then they were driven to Hungary and marched at night through forests into Italy.

"I didn't think we would be prostituted," said Kira, who is now a refugee in London...

(Extract 26, *The Sunday Times*, 3 April 2011, para. 7-9)

The association with children/youth as pure is invoked through the detail that Kira, at the time of her victimisation "was a virgin who knew nothing of sex". This works to show that her childhood innocence has been lost through the sexual interactions of her trafficked circumstances. Robinson (2008, p. 116) discusses this in the following:

The notion of childhood innocence has been inherently enshrined within traditional theories of human development, which have also constituted understandings of sexuality. In terms of hegemonic discourses of sexuality, physiological sexual maturity is constructed as a distinguishing point between adulthood and childhood. Sexuality is generally represented as beginning at puberty and maturing in adulthood, correlating with developmentalist theories of the human, which reinforce biologically determined understandings of childhood and sexuality. Children's sexuality within this discourse is read as nonexistent or immature at the most. Thus, sexual immaturity is equated with 'innocence'—considered inherent in the child. Consequently, sexuality becomes the exclusive realm of adults; a space in which children are constructed as the asexual, naive and innocent 'other' and perceived to be vulnerable and in need of protection.

In essence, the sexual victimisation of the child violates what has been constructed as inherent vulnerabilities and in this way the "sexual immaturity...equated with 'innocence'" is taken away by a perpetrator. Further, the power of the traffickers is emphasized through the physical violence used to force Kira and her friend into prostitution ("They were kidnapped, waking from unconsciousness to find themselves on the Romanian border").

4.7: Conclusion

The construction of the passive, dominated victim simultaneously increases the likelihood of other not-so-passive trafficked persons being viewed as blame-worthy for their victimisation.

The key discussion present within this subject is the conceptualization of what it means to be a victim. Is passivity a necessary component to victimisation? What this chapter shows is that the representations within the data-set indicate that passivity is, in the very least, emphasized as a component of the ideal victim. This was constructed through acts of physical force against those who were indicated as trafficked persons. Additionally, this was constructed through the notion of childhood innocence, and specifically it was represented as an attribute which needed to be safeguarded.

Within these depictions of the passive trafficked person as someone who lacks agency over her/his circumstances, is the idea that there are certain persons who are more vulnerable than others. As Mardorossian (2014, p. 15) notes, "Victims are people whose vulnerability to others has been abused rather than people who, as they are now increasingly defined, let themselves fall prey to a condition (vulnerability) to which the rest of us are supposedly impermeable." In essence, vulnerability should not be represented as an indicator of the reliability of a trafficked person's victimisation. Representations of the issue must move beyond

highlighting characteristics of the ideal victim and include more diverse depictions of trafficked persons' experiences, ones which portray realities of agency without victim-blame.

Within the data-set, the representations of traffickers were also examined. This is the central focus of Chapter Five, in which relevant themes and findings are discussed in depth.

Chapter Five: Xenophobia and the Internal Sex Trafficker

5.1: Introduction

This chapter aims to explore the ways in which the trafficker was represented in UK national newspapers. A thematic analysis revealed an overarching theme of xenophobia within portrayals of minority ethnic (Asian, specifically Pakistani) internal sex traffickers. By xenophobia, I mean the following:

> ...attitudes, prejudices and behaviour that reject, exclude and often vilify persons, based on the perception that they are outsiders or foreigners to the community, society or national identity (UNESCO, 2016, para. 2).

The representations of traffickers in the UK were found to include references to ethnicity, religion, and cultural values when the perpetrators were Asian (Pakistani). Further, at times the acts of the perpetrators were portrayed as stemming from (problematic) cultural values of the entire Pakistani community: cultural values that were dissimilar to those of the (majority white) British community. In this way, the representations of the Pakistani trafficker exhibit xenophobic tendencies, in that "xenophobia implies behaviour based on the idea that the other is foreign to or originates from outside the community or nation" (UNESCO, 2016, para. 3).

Through analysis, three subthemes were identified and will be discussed as central tenets to the main theme. They include the following: 1) *The cultural heritage and beliefs of the Pakistani population in the UK are presented as contributing factors to the actions of Pakistani traffickers*, 2) *The ethnicity of the white perpetrators is overlooked* and 3) *Cultural sensitivity is presented as a hindrance to justice in cases involving ethnic minority perpetrators*.

To begin, I will briefly discuss what is meant by the term 'trafficker'. Following this, the remaining sections will address the main theme through the identified subthemes.

5.2: Unpacking the Term "Trafficker"

The term "trafficker" is considered a derivative of the term "traffic" (Oxford Dictionary, 2015). Therefore, a human trafficker is a person who engages in the act of human trafficking or TIP as defined in Chapter One. The way in which human traffickers are defined and understood is commonly in conjunction with juxtaposing the term to human smugglers. Iselin and Adams (2003, p. 4) address this in their following distinctions:

> For human traffickers, the purpose of moving people is the intended exploitation at destination. The intent ab initio on the part of the trafficker is to exploit the person and gain profit or advantage from their exploitation. This is an exploitative purpose.

> For people smugglers, the purpose of moving people is in furtherance of a contract with a migrant, to steal them across a national border. The intent ab initio is not to control the migrant, nor to extort or exploit, but to move the person. This is a facilitative purpose.

The purpose behind the actions of the human trafficker or human smuggler is the key characteristic in determining the correct label. One particular issue with this approach is that the label has the potential to be used as an indicator of a person being *either* a human smuggler *or* a human trafficker; however, both terms can apply to the same person or group of people depending on when exploitation does or does not occur (Aronowitz, 2001). It has been argued that rather than categorizing a person as either having been trafficked or smuggled a more useful approach is to conceptualize TIP as occurring on a continuum of exploitation (Anderson, 2007; O'Connell Davidson, 2006; Skrivankova, 2010). This spectrum approach could also

be a way of recognising various characterisations of traffickers. Greer and Jewkes (2005, p. 20) developed a "spectrum of deviance" based on their analysis of UK national newspaper articles which covered stories of offenders over a three-month period. They discuss the concept of "otherness" and deviancy in the following:

> …otherness can be broadly conceptualized as reflecting a spectrum of deviance. In other words, mediated constructions of otherness exist on a continuum separated by two polar extremes ("stigmatized others" to "absolute others"), which themselves are not fixed, but expand and contract with levels of tolerance and concern.

In particular, the ethnic minority internal sex trafficker could be placed on the "polar extreme" of the "absolute other". This concept will be further addressed later in this chapter.

Within official reports, descriptions of traffickers focus on the various roles and structures of trafficking groups: the size of the group, roles within the groups, and the nationalities of trafficking groups. For example, Europol's (2011, pp. 6, 11) report titled "Trafficking in Human Beings in the European Union" identifies these aspects in the following:

> Although there are some indications of hierarchically structured [organised criminal] groups, human trafficking networks are more likely to be organised in small groups, which operate both independently and in cooperation with other crime groups. The interaction between groups is often connected to the provision of a service that cannot be undertaken by another group.

> Whatever the structure or set-up, the roles are familiar: those who recruit and procure; those responsible for smuggling and transport; those providing false or counterfeit identity and travel documents; those seeking to corrupt law enforcement officers or other civil servants; those involved in the provision, management and control of safe houses;

pimps; owners of premises or properties where victims are exploited,
e.g. bars, nightclubs, brothels, factories, hotels, construction sites, farms;
gang masters; those involved in the collection, delivery and distribution
of the profits of trafficking; those knowingly involved in money
laundering and the management of assets and proceeds of crime;
complicit legal officers and legal service providers…

…The most frequently reported criminal groups involved in [TIP] in the
EU are, in descending order, ethnic Roma, Nigerian, Romanian,
Albanian speaking, Russian, Chinese, Hungarian, Bulgarian and Turkish
organised crime groups. Bulgarian and Romanian (mostly of Roma
ethnicity), Nigerian and Chinese groups are probably the most
threatening to society as a whole.

There were no statistics included in this report to provide evidence for these claims.
However, Eurostat (2014) conducted a statistical analysis of TIP within European
member states and found that approximately 75 percent of prosecuted traffickers'
citizenship was from within the EU. However, the report also indicated that only 13
Member States responded with data, and that "Because of the low response rate
provided by the Member States, the values presented are not representative for the
EU Member States and should be analysed with caution" (p. 54). A detailed
breakdown of the data is included in Table 9.

While there may be potential benefits to identifying which populations are more at
risk for TIP offences, there is an acknowledgement that information regarding
traffickers is in need of further research (Mai, 2010; McRedmond, 2010; Wylie and
McRedmond, 2010). The United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human
Trafficking (UN.GIFT) (2008, p. 10) reported:

A key point is that not enough research has yet been undertaken into
who traffickers were before they became traffickers, how they came to

Table 9 Number of Prosecuted Traffickers by Citizenship (Eurostat, 2014)				
	2010	**2011**	**2012**	**2010-2012**
EU-28 total	1657	1740	1941	5338
EFTA, EU candidate and potential candidate	74	50	74	198
Other European countries	39	38	33	110
Asia	112	116	99	327
North America	1	0	2	3
CELAC	46	64	62	172
Africa	137	167	193	497
LatAMCarib-nonCELAC	10	16	26	52
Oceania	1	0	1	2
Non-EU total	420	451	490	1361
Unknown, stateless and other	129	136	118	383
Non-EU (including Unknown) total	549	587	608	1744
Total	2206	2327	2549	7082

be traffickers, and who they are outside of being traffickers. What is
known reveals that the only unifying factor between traffickers of
differing economic, social, cultural and educational backgrounds is that
their motive for trafficking is almost always financial; some traffickers
hope to grow rich while others are merely struggling to make a living
and provide for their families.

The lack of empirical information on human traffickers suggests that identifying
certain nationalities and ethnicities as more involved in trafficking than others is
problematic. It risks isolating certain ethnic groups as perpetrators, potentially
contributing to stereotyping an entire community which can lead to xenophobia. The
potential to stereotype is endemic within the issue of xenophobia (Flückiger, 2006).
Further, Hall (2001, p. 338, original emphasis) indicates it is essential to recognise
that there is power in the act of representing events or people, what he calls "'a
regime of representation'… [which] includes the exercise of *symbolic power*
through representational practices. Stereotyping is a key element in [the] exercise of
symbolic violence."

Beyond general demographics, there is little detailed information known regarding
traffickers' personal identities. As Mai (2010, p. 5) writes:

In recent years, a number of publications and studies have attempted to
identify a psycho-social profile of the potential female 'victim' (i.e.
Lăzăroiu and Alexandrescu 2004). However, to this date, there have
been few attempts to undertake a parallel task with their male
partners/agents.

In this way, the media emerges as an influential secondary source in aiding the
general public to identify *who* is (assumed to be) a trafficker and what is known
(assumed) about them. The news reporting on ethnic minority Pakistani gangs
internally trafficking white British girls, and in particular the consideration it was

given as news, indicates that these events were deemed newsworthy (van Dijk, 1991). The newsworthiness of an event or issue, by its appearance within the print newspaper, has the power to influence people's perceptions about certain issues as well as highlight the issue as a priority (Baker et al., 2013).

Additionally, the portrayals of the British internal sex trafficker, particularly ethnic minority perpetrators are arguably constructed as modern day folk devils. This will be addressed further in the following section.

5.3: The Ethnic Minority Internal Sex Trafficker as Folk Devil

The portrayals of the trafficker arguably construct what Cohen (2002, p. 2) terms a folk devil, which are "visible reminders of what we should not be". The construction of a folk devil is a way to highlight attributes which are deemed unacceptable. In the case of human traffickers, the concentration on TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation speaks to the larger society's attitudes towards commercialized sex in addition to the portrayed greed associated with those who are in positions of control as pimps. Further, when an ethnic minority group is portrayed with animosity, it can be reflective of a society's anxieties surrounding immigration and an unstable economic climate (Lucht, 2012).

Testa and Armstrong (2012, p. 3) argue that when economic circumstances are unstable or uncertain the impact on migrant workers is reflected in citizens' attitudes towards migrants' inclusion within the society:

> [Migrants] can soon become unwanted. When stories abound about their morality, they become Folk Devils; people become moralistic. At some stage this can cause a panic.

I argue that this extends beyond the "migrant" and, in the case of TIP, includes those whose cultural heritage is considered to be different from that of the (white) British

population regardless of citizenship or residency status. White as an ethnicity constitutes the majority of the population within the UK (Office of National Statistics, 2012). Further, van Dijk (1991, p. 17) argues that "the news media are involved in the reproduction of racism and the subsequent maintenance and legitimation of white group power". I argue that this also extends to the "reproduction" of xenophobia.

Within the data-set, this can be applied to the reported incidences of ethnic minority men sexually grooming and trafficking young, white British girls. At times in the data-set, "on-street grooming" and trafficking were used to describe the same offence. These terms have also been used to describe aspects of the same issue of internal trafficking in anti-trafficking discourse (see for example: My Dangerous Loverboy, n.d.; Hope for Justice, n.d.). This difficulty in distinguishing the two offences as separate is perhaps due to TIP being an offence which involves a "process" (O'Connell Davidson, 2010, p. 249), which can include grooming. This construction of the issue is evident in the description of "internal trafficking" as explained by The Crown Prosecution Service (CPS) (2016, Internal Trafficking section):

> Whilst the UK is primarily a destination state for human trafficking, an emerging issue is the "internal trafficking" of children. This term is used to describe the trafficking of children born, or normally resident in the UK. Internal trafficking is characterised by the recruitment, grooming and sexual exploitation of young teenage girls in the UK by organised crime gangs. Investigations may arise in circumstances where a child has gone missing (often, but not limited to, children in local authority care). They may be sexually abused before being taken to other towns and cities where the sexual exploitation (prostitution) continues.

As the CPS indicates, "Internal trafficking is characterised by the recruitment, grooming and sexual exploitation of young teenage girls in the UK by organised gangs". Unlike other popular portrayals of TIP, which involve (often obvious)

aspects of movement, with "internal trafficking" it is not necessarily as obvious. In the cases of internal trafficking, as outlined in the above description, the characteristics are: "recruitment, grooming, and sexual exploitation of young teenage girls in the UK by organised crime gangs". This was the way in which internal sex trafficking was predominantly represented in the data-set, particularly when it involved young white British girls. Further, as discussed in Chapter Two, the data-set was comprised of articles which used the term "trafficked", "trafficking", or "trafficker" to describe the offence discussed in the article. Through the evidence of the newspapers' explicitly using these terms in discussing the issue in the articles, it was determined that the representations were indeed examples of internal trafficking (specifically, internal *sex* trafficking). One example of the way in which the issue of internal sex trafficking was portrayed in the data-set is as follows:

> Criminal cases and targeted police operations since 1996 have revealed a disturbingly similar pattern of collective abuse involving hundreds of girls aged 11 to 16 in Leeds, Manchester, Sheffield, Rotherham, Derby, Keighley, Skipton, Blackpool, Oldham, Blackburn, Rochdale, Preston and Burnley. Further police investigations into child sex rings are under way in different parts of the country and one major case allegedly involving the internal sex trafficking of several British girls will go before the courts this year.

> Girls who fall victim to this model of grooming, where initial contact is made in town centres, on street corners, outside school gates, inside shopping malls or at bus and rail stations, come from a wide social spectrum. Some were under the care of social services or from troubled family backgrounds, others came from professional middle-class families. All, because of their age, were extremely vulnerable...

> ...Fourteen years ago, Detective Chief Superintendent Max McLean, who has recently retired, led what seems likely to have been the first British police inquiry involving the grooming and sexual exploitation of

white girls by a gang of British Pakistani men.

It began with a plea for help from a Leeds mother whose young daughter was leaving her bedroom window whenever she was summoned by the beeping horn of a private-hire car that would stop outside their house in the early hours of the morning.

The investigation led to 23 arrests and the exposure of a sex-trafficking ring involving a network of privatehire [sic] taxi drivers and the sexual abuse of at least 20 girls. The victims had been groomed, held captive and some were driven as far as Newcastle upon Tyne to be used for sex by older men.

(Extract 2, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 11-12, 27-29)

The above extract indicates internal sex trafficking explicitly through utilising the term trafficking ("on major case allegedly involving the internal sex trafficking of several British girls"; "the investigation led to 23 arrests and the exposure of a sex-trafficking ring..."). Additionally, the CPS's characterisation of internal trafficking is evident through the references to recruitment ("where initial contact is made in town centres, on street corners, outside school gates, inside shopping malls or at bus and rail stations"), grooming ("Girls who fall victim to this model of grooming"; "The victims had been groomed"; "the first British police inquiry involving the grooming and sexual exploitation of white girls by a gang of British Pakistani men"), and sexual exploitation ("police investigations into child sex rings are under way in different parts of the country and one major case allegedly involving the internal sex trafficking of several British girls"; "the sexual abuse of at least 20 girls"; "held captive and some were driven as far as Newcastle upon Tyne to be used for sex by older men"). Aspects of movement are also indicated in this extract ("young daughter was leaving her bedroom window whenever she was summoned by the beeping horn of a private-hire car"; "a sex-trafficking ring involving a network of

privatehire [sic] taxi drivers and the sexual abuse of at least 20 girls"; "some were driven as far as Newcastle upon Tyne to be used for sex by older men").

These incidences of internal sex trafficking were "revealed" by *The Times* in January 2011 in Extract 1 with the headline: "Revealed: conspiracy of silence on UK sex gangs". The focus was on the internal sex trafficking of "hundreds of young British girls by criminal pimping gangs (Extract 1, *The Times* 5 January 2011, para. 1). Further, these articles identified the ethnicity and race of the perpetrators and trafficked persons (for instance, in Extract 1, para. 3: "Most of victims are white and most of the convicted offenders are of Pakistani heritage").

The representations of internal sex traffickers were portrayed as predominantly Pakistani. Further, these representations also suggested the Pakistani communities as a whole group have cultural values which are problematic. For example, in Extract 2 the following is reported:

> Important work is being done by both voluntary and statutory organisations to protect and support vulnerable girls and their families, and also to prosecute known offenders. Yet The Times has been able to identify only one town in which preventive work has been targeted on changing attitudes in the minority community to which most of the on-street gang perpetrators belong.

> (Extract 2, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 18)

This extract suggests that "preventive work" involves "changing attitudes" not just of the offenders but "in the minority community *to which most* of the on-street gang perpetrators *belong*" (para. 18, emphasis added). The origination of the offenders is identified as *part* of the problem through the insinuation that the attitudes which need to change are those of "the minority community" of which the offenders are affiliated.

The following sections will examine these representations in further depth. In the next section I will address the way in which the representations of the internal sex traffickers exhibit xenophobic discourse. To begin this discussion, it would be helpful to discuss the connection between Islamophobia and xenophobia within the portrayals of Pakistani (Islamic) perpetrators and the Pakistani (Islamic) community.

5.4: Xenophobia within the Portrayals of Pakistani Internal Sex Traffickers

This section will address the overarching theme of xenophobia within the representations of traffickers, and specifically within the articles portraying internal sex traffickers of with Pakistani ethnicity.

The term xenophobia was used to include all references which exhibited the definition as discussed at the beginning of this chapter in section 5.1. In several instances, xenophobic discourse specifically focused on the characteristic of the perpetrators as Muslim. In this way, it was also identified that a way in which traffickers were represented was through Islamophobic descriptions, a phenomenon closely linked with xenophobia. The connections and overlap between these concepts will be briefly discussed next, and followed with analysis in how they were identified within the data-set.

Xenophobia and Islamophobia within the UK are not new phenomena (Lambert and Githens-Mazer, 2010**;** Meer and Modood, 2009; Meer and Modood, 2010; Poynting and Mason, 2007). This remains consistent within the portrayals of internal sex traffickers within the data-set, which will be discussed in greater depth in this section.

Xenophobia and Islamophobia have been suggested to be closely linked terms (Stolz, 2006). Specifically, Helbling (2008) distinguishes the two concepts in the following way, "While xenophobia is defined as general hostility towards

foreigners, it might be argued that islamophobia stands for hostility towards specific aspects of foreignness". Additionally, Helbling (2008, p. 2) suggests that, "xenophobic people are nowadays mainly islamophobic, as Muslims constitute a very important immigration group". Both are provoked by fear and rely on negative assumptions and categorizations of broad people groups. These terms are also rooted in the concept of the Other, which is discussed by Elgamri (2008, p. 215) in the following:

> Given that most of people's social and political knowledge and beliefs about the world derives from the dozens of news reports they read or see every day, the negative representation of Islam/Muslims in the press might result in having negative perceptions, misconceptions and probably fear of Islam, or what the Runnymede Trust report termed *Islamophobia*. Examples of Islamophobia include viewing Islam as a single monolithic entity, static and unresponsive to new realities; viewing it as separate and an *Other* lacking common values and objectives with other cultures; viewing it as irrational, primitive, sexist and inferior to the West; and viewing it as aggressive, threatening, and supportive of violence and terror.

This is particularly problematic when the existing negative associations are linked to producing criminal deviants (or as noted earlier, what Cohen (2011) termed a "rule breaker"), such as the internal sex trafficker. Negative associations were produced in the portrayals of Pakistani Muslims through internal sex trafficking cases between Pakistani Islamic male perpetrators and the white female victims:

> Most child sex offenders are white, but 50 of the 56 men convicted in 17 street-grooming prosecutions from 13 northern towns and cities were Muslim, most of them members of the British Pakistani community.
>
> (Extract 6, *The Times* 11 January 2011, para. 13)

> White girls are being groomed on the street for sex abuse by Asian gangs, a shock new investigation reveals. It found that out of 17 cases

since 1997, 56 people were convicted of sex crimes against children. Of those, three were white and 53 Asian - 50 of them Muslim and most British Pakistani.

(Extract 3, *The Sun*, 6 January 2011, para. 1)

The identification of religious orientation of the perpetrators is worth noting. The association is made between the British Pakistani perpetrators and Islam. In contrast, no other religious affiliation is mentioned throughout the data-set (i.e. Christianity, Judaism, or Buddhism). Of particular interest is the way in which other religious associations are absent from numerical representations/statistics provided in the data-set. For instance, Extract 2 indicates that "in any other type of child sex offence...the overwhelming majority of offenders are white men. More than 82 per cent of sex offenders in jail are white; less than 6 per cent are Asian". Despite this, the religious affiliation of the majority of (white) offenders are not indicated. This difference in representation is perhaps a by-product of political unease and negative stereotypes regarding Islam in contemporary Western societies, as Elgamri (2008, p. 55) writes:

> The negative representation of Islam and Muslims in the press is arguably influenced by the age-old perception of both as an *Other*...The overall contemporary picture of Islam and Muslims depicted by the press reinforces the pre-existing negative image of both in the readers' collective memory. Central to this image is the view of Islam as a monolithic entity associated with violence, intolerance and hatred of everything Western; hence the blanket association of Muslim cultures with intolerance, anti-modernism, anti-pluralism, anti-liberalism, misogyny and patriarchalism.

The emphasis on "Muslim" combined with the absence of other religious identities, and in particular Christianity (as the religious identity of the majority of the British population) exemplifies the way in which Islam is negatively constructed. Research has consistently identified negative stereotypes and racist discourse within the

representations of Islam in the British press (Baker et al., 2013; Elgamri, 2008; Poole and Richardson, 2006; Richardson, 2004).

Additionally, the contrast between three white perpetrators and 53 Asian (50 Muslim) perpetrators for "sex crimes against children" suggests there is a greater tendency within the Pakistani Islamic population to offend in this area. In the first sentence of Extract 3 the primary issue is the on-street sexual grooming of white girls by Asian gangs, however, the statistics represent convictions of "sex crimes against children", a more general category. Potter et al. (1991, p. 334) conceptualization of "quantification as rhetoric" can be applied to the statistics within these excerpts. The numbers ("50 of the 56 men…were Muslim"; "53 Asian—50 of them Muslim") are not neutral. Rather, the function of the statistics in these cases is to construct the perpetrators as predominantly Muslim while appearing objective. These excerpts are utilizing what Potter et al. (1991, p. 336) identify as, "devices and procedures that are used to make a specific version appear independent of the speaker and thus a fact rather than an interested account".

Further, Extract 3 references "17 cases since 1997" but does not specify what the identified cases involved. Without more details it remains difficult to determine what the crimes involved. Rather, what remains clear is *The Sun's* determination that there is a connection between Pakistani Muslims and sex offences involving juveniles. These assumptions portray the Pakistani community as problematic and sexually deviant, which will be discussed in greater depth in the following section. Further, the assumption is made that "Asian" and "British Pakistani" is synonymous with "Muslim" in most cases ("53 Asian - 50 of them Muslim"). As Alexander (2008, p. 159) writes:

> Increasingly it seems that what it means to be a British Muslim is definable solely in terms of negativity, deprivation, disadvantage and alienation. It is worth noting here that the term 'Asian' in relation to the negative images and stereotypes has become synonymous with Muslim

communities, again drawing on the notion of an emergent Pakistani and Bangladeshi underclass.

The association of the perpetrators with Islam identifies an entire religious community as criminal. This form of stereotyping by the press has been shown to influence the way in which Western societies perceive and treat ethnic minorities as outsiders (King and Mai, 2004).

In the following excerpt, the Pakistani community is associated with Islam through the response from Muslim groups after Straw's comments associated the Pakistani internal sex traffickers as a "'specific problem' within the Pakistani community":

> The ethnicity of abusers came under the spotlight this year after a gang of Asian men in Derby were jailed for grooming girls as young as 12 for sex, and a group of nine mainly Asian men were arrested in Rochdale on suspicion of grooming a group of white teenage girls. The former home secretary [sic] Jack Straw said there was a "specific problem" in the Pakistani community. He was criticised by charities, police and Muslim groups, who said he was wrong to highlight one community, pointing out that the vast majority of convicted sex offenders were white males.

> (Extract 38, *The Guardian*, 18 May 2011, para. 9)

Again, as previously discussed, despite the information available that shows white males were "the vast majority of convicted sex offenders", it is the offences of the minority ethnic population which make more sensationalist news (van Dijk, 1991). In this way, the issue of internal sex trafficking is sensationalised through the characteristics attributed to the perpetrators ("Muslim", "Pakistani") and the victims ("white teenage girls"). Evidence of this is seen through the focus and attention given to the mentioning of non-white ethnicity and non-white cultural heritage within the newspaper articles ("The ethnicity of abusers came under the spotlight this year…").

Identification of the perpetrators religious heritage/identification is also suggested in the above extract. Criticism from "Muslim groups" identifies and associates the perpetrators as coming from an Islamic Pakistani community. Regardless of the perpetrators' religious affiliations the significance in identifying an ethnic minority, and particularly Pakistani minority perpetrators as Muslim men, is that it associates these groups with the issue of internal sex trafficking. In other words, it constructs the groups in which the perpetrators are identified as belonging (in this case: Pakistani Muslim men) as a danger to social order (Shain, 2011). This contrasts to the white male perpetrator who is portrayed as deviant as an individual as will be discussed in section 5.5.

As mentioned previously, within the data-set, there was no indication that criminal activity was associated with other common belief systems in the UK such as Christianity, which represents 71.1% of the population according to the 2011 Census (Office for National Statistics, 2012b). Rather, by highlighting that the perpetrators were Muslim (a religious affiliation which accounted for 3% of the British population (Office for National Statistics, 2012b)) the entire British Islamic community is Othered. The concept of the Muslim as Other in western cultures is far from new and dates back to the 8th century (Elgamri, 2008).

In the following section, the discussion of ways in which Islamophobia enter into the newspaper depictions of the Pakistani internal sex trafficker will be examined, specifically the ways in which the Pakistani Muslim perpetrator was represented as sexually deviant and violent.

5.4.1: The Representation of Pakistani Muslim Men as Sexually Deviant

In early January 2011, *The Times* reported a series of stories which addressed the issue of gangs of Pakistani heritage men internally trafficking young (white) girls. The former Home Secretary and then current Blackburn Labour MP, Jack Straw, made controversial statements on the BBC programme *Newsnight* (BBC, 2011).

These statements were reported and referenced in the following articles in *The Times*:

> Straw said: "These young men…act like any other young men—they're fizzing and popping with testosterone; they want some outlet for that—but Pakistani-heritage girls are off limits…So they seek other avenues and they see these white girls who are vulnerable…"
>
> (Extract 9, *The Sunday Times*, 16 January 2011, para. 7)
>
> David Cameron praised The Times investigation and Jack Straw, the former Labour Home Secretary, spoke of "a specific problem which involves Pakistani heritage men…who target vulnerable young white girls", viewing them as "easy meat" for sexual abuse.
>
> (Extract 6, *The Times*, 11 January 2011, para. 14)

Within these excerpts, the blame for the internal sex trafficking of "young white girls" is attributed to a culture which is sexually conservative within their own community ("they want some outlet for that—but Pakistani-heritage girls are off limits...So they seek other avenues..."). Cohen's (2011) conceptualization of deviant groups applies here as the entire Pakistani community, and in particular Pakistani men, are constructed as the deviant group whose cultural values clash with those of mainstream (white) British culture ("'a specific problem which involves Pakistani heritage men...who target vulnerable young white girls', viewing them as 'easy meat' for sexual abuse"). Representations such as this contribute to the construction of Pakistani internal sex traffickers as the "rule breakers" within the deviant group (Pakistani communities) (Cohen, 2011). Through this conceptualization the cultural heritage of Pakistani communities is constructed as a reason for why Pakistani men are committing internal sex trafficking.

In Extract 9 the quote from Straw identifies a masculinity that is hypersexual ("they're fizzing and popping with testosterone, they want some outlet for that").

While this statement appears to highlight the similarities in sexual hormones between "young men" it establishes a clear differentiation through the formulation "*these* young men". The formulation works to distance this group of Pakistani men from "any other young men". This contributes to the construction of Otherness.

Straw's remarks establish distinct boundaries between the cultural heritage of the Pakistani community and the white British community. Straw links his understanding of the universal hypersexual male and the stereotype of a sexually conservative Pakistani (Muslim) cultural heritage ("they want some outlet for that—but Pakistani-heritage girls are off limits") with the internal sex trafficking of white girls ("So they seek other avenues and they see these white girls who are vulnerable"). This also suggests there is a connection between repressed adult sexuality in Islam and paedophilia, a link which has been identified in academic literature as rhetorically occurring in pubic responses to terrorism (Filler, 2003). Again, the use of "these" works to establish distance between groups, however, this time it is the formulation of "these white girls who are vulnerable" that serves to establish distance between the Pakistani men ("they").

The disconnection between white British communities and Pakistani communities was further established with quotes from the leader of an Islamic organisation in the UK:

> Mohammed Shafiq, chief executive of the Ramadhan Foundation, a Muslim youth organisation, condemned the perpetrators, saying they believed "white girls have fewer morals" and are "less valuable" than Muslim girls.
>
> (Extract 5, *The Guardian*, 7 January 2011, para. 8)

While Shafiq's statements speak against the internal sex traffickers' actions, the quote also suggests that the perpetrators identify themselves as outside the white community ("[the perpetrators] believed 'white girls have few morals' and are 'less

valuable' than Muslim girls"). It suggests the issue is rooted in racist/xenophobic perceptions between the Pakistani (Muslim) and white British communities, and it is members of the Muslim community (the perpetrators) who hold these beliefs. This is an example of how quotations can be utilised to emphasize a particular viewpoint within newspaper articles without seeming subjective. As Jullian (2011, p. 767) writes:

> External voices 'are allowed' to speak their minds much more loudly than journalists, so a way in which authors may convey their views is through the choice of the informants they bring into the text and the information they choose to include or exclude. Such choices carry strong ideological implications, since the mere inclusion of a particular source is the first signal of subjectivity; it reflects who the reporter finds worth interviewing and what s/he finds relevant and reportable in the communicative event. Comments and judgements made through such sources cannot be attributed to the author him/herself, but they certainly tint the story in such a way that readers get the desired view, without strongly committing the journalist to the content and perspectives conveyed by others.

This "tint[ing] the story" is evident again in the following excerpt:

> The views of Pakistani men interviewed on the streets of Bradford last week appeared to confirm Straw's remark. One said: "I think, um…white girls are, like, more easier to have sex with." Another blamed the way "white women dress: miniskirts…", adding that white women also drink.
>
> (Extract 9, *The Sunday Times*, 16 January 2011, para. 7)

These statements from the Pakistani men also serve to differentiate the Pakistani community from the mainstream (white) British community. The views presented

by the Pakistani men construct an image of the way in which the Pakistani community views mainstream British culture: as sexually permissive ("easier to have sex with."). Further, the quotes juxtapose the portrayals of the Asian (Pakistani) community as having conservative values (sexually conservative, "Pakistani heritage girls are off limits") with a more permissive (white) British culture ("easier to have sex with", "white women dress: miniskirts", "white women also drink"). What this excerpt suggests, by quoting Pakistani men as sexually stereotyping "white" women, is that the Pakistani community, linked to Islam, see themselves as different and outside the majority (white) British community and culture. This contributes to the construction of this particular community as "the ultimate cultural 'other'" as described by Taras (2012, p. 114):

> [A] French scholar raised the vital question: 'What makes Muslims the ultimate "others?" Valerie Amiraux suggested that public receptivity to the clash-of-civilisations thesis was based on an acceptance of 'the assumption that Islam as a denomination and Muslims as believers constitute the ultimate cultural "other" that will never be able to cope with democratic and liberal values'. The supposed historical incompatibility of European and Islamic values is, therefore, central to the rise of Islamophobia.

It is Islamophobia, as discussed previously, which contributes to the way in which the stories covering the Pakistani internal sex traffickers are portrayed: associating their offences with the entire Pakistani community. This is achieved through the use of statistics and statements referencing a "cultural mind-set" as evidenced in the extract below:

> In total, 56 people, with an average age of 28, were found guilty of crimes including rape, child abduction, indecent assault and sex with a child. Three of the 56 were white, 53 were Asian. Of those 50 were Muslim and a majority were members of the British Pakistani community…

…In the Netherlands many groomers are of Moroccan heritage and a Dutch Muslim organisation has led a project seeking to challenge a cultural mindset [sic] that leads some young men to view non-Muslim girls with contempt…

…In reality, such crimes are abhorred by the vast majority of Muslims. Though most of the girls targeted have been white, among the victims of a Pakistani gang in one city were several Bangladeshi Muslim girls.

(Extract 1, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 7, 12, 15)

Within Extract 1, Asian ethnicity is identified as the same as Muslim ("53 were Asian. Of those 50 were Muslim and a majority were members of the British Pakistani community", "many groomers are of Moroccan heritage and a Dutch Muslim organisation has led a project seeking to challenge a cultural mindset [sic]"). This is consistent with what Alexander (2008) identified, referenced previously, that Asian has become synonymous with Muslim.

Islam is also constructed as a cultural group which is outside the majority (white) British group. This is indicated by the reference to Muslims as a distinct group ("In reality, such crimes are abhorred by the vast majority of Muslims"). Further, by only referencing the Muslim community the issue is associated as one that is within the Muslim community, not the larger British community.

Additionally, the use of "in reality" is evidence of assumptions linking the Muslim community as one which contributes to sexually deviant attitudes and/or behaviours. Oxford Dictionary's (2015) definition of "in reality" is as follows, "In actual fact (used to contrast a false idea of what is true or possible with one that is more accurate)". In particular, the use of "in reality" in conjunction with the subsequent statement ("such crimes are abhorred by the vast majority of Muslims") suggests that *The Times* is correcting an existing "false idea" that the internal sex trafficking of young (white) girls was *not* "abhorred by the vast majority of Muslims".

Beyond the construction of the attitudes of British Muslim communities towards the actions of internal sex traffickers, the perpetrators were constructed as sexually deviant folk devils. Take for example the following extract:

> One of her friends allegedly told police that they were sneaked into a house by the back entrance when the offence was supposed to have occurred because 'Asians can't hang around with white people'.

> The court also heard further details about Mohammed Younis and Abdul Rouf who are both accused of using their homes as brothels.

> Miss Gould said: 'Their premises were being used in effect as brothels, places where men could have sex out of sight with young females. The provision of those venues acted as an incitement to such girls to provide sexual services for payments of some kind.'

> The court heard the victims were the products of severely disrupted families and had no sense of self-worth, leaving them unable 'to distinguish between abuse and affection'.

> Miss Gould said they 'do not value themselves and ...have no expectation that they will be valued by others.'

> She added: 'When they receive attention from others, particularly what they see as exotic older males with money and cars, they soak it up, believing themselves to be the objects of genuine emotions and affections.'

> (Extract 52, *Daily Mail*, 16 June 2011, para. 25-30)

Again, Extract 52 suggests the Asian/Muslim communities are racist through references to the perpetrators not wanting to be seen with the girls ("they were sneaked into a house by the back entrance") due to their white ethnicity ("*because* 'Asians can't hang around with white people'", emphasis added). This further establishes a disconnection between the two communities as an issue stemming from the actions of the Asian/Muslim communities through not integrating British cultural values into their own cultural values (i.e. internal sex trafficking: having sex with white British girls, setting up brothels) and through *racism* towards the (white) majority of the British population. In essence, this is an example of the Asian/Muslim communities as *self-segregrating*. As Farzana (2011, p. x) discusses how the British Asian communities are often viewed "through current policy discourses of choice (self-segregation) and insularity (refusing to integrate into a British way of life or rejecting citizenship) [and therefore] responsible for [their] own marginality."

In essence, these representations are reminiscent of the construction of men of Asian/Muslim descent as modern folk devils, a construction which emerged in the mid-1980s as noted by Farzana (2011). Internal sex traffickers are clear examples of figures represented as "visible reminders of what we should not be" (Cohen, 2002, p. 2). In Extract 52, the victims were "teenage girls aged 13 to 16" (para. 4). The men are constructed as sexually deviant through depictions of internally trafficking young girls through prostitution ("Mohamed Younis and Abdul Rouf who are both accused of using their homes as brothels", "Their premises were being used in effect as brothels, places where men could have sex out of sight with young females"). This representation is further emphasized through the juxtaposition of the depictions of the internal sex traffickers and the vulnerability of the teenage girls ("the victims were products of severely disrupted families and had no sense of self-worth, leaving them unable 'to distinguish between abuse and affection'", "they 'do not value themselves and...have no expectation that they will be valued by others.', "'When they receive attention from others, particularly what they see as exotic older males with money and cars, they soak it up, believing themselves to be the objects of

genuine emotions and affections.'"). These descriptions establish the innocence of the girls through emphasizing their vulnerability as "products of severely disrupted families". In essence, through their age and circumstances they are disempowered and passive victims of "exotic older males with money and cars". O'Connell Davidson (2005, p. 44) discusses this simplistic conceptualization of the prostituted child:

> ...the discursive separation of adult and child prostitution through an emphasis on children's inability to *choose* prostitution [has] encouraged the popularizing of some extremely simplistic ideas about the nature of the problem and appropriate policy responses to it. For example, it is widely assumed that, since children are passive, dependent, vulnerable and incapable of choosing to prostitute, children who sell sex must have been forced to do so by an adult or adults. The individual morality of those who compel children to prostitute then becomes the focus of attention and concern, and the stage is set for a parade of the world's best-beloved folk devils...

In this way, the internal sex traffickers in Extract 52 represent modern-day folk devils whose sense of morality is emphasized as problematic. Again, this depiction also suggests that Islamic communities, particularly Pakistani Islamic communities, are ones in which traditions are not only different from traditional (western) British culture but are incongruent. As Salgado-Pottier (2008, para. 8) writes:

> …the contradiction lies in that the "Asian community" was at once upheld as contributing positively to the moral values of middle England, whilst equally being seen as a negative source of internal oppression over their young people (Alexander 2000:5). This "oppression" reverberated with echoes of the idea that Asian and Islamic culture were in innate contradiction to western values and norms.

Again this is reminiscent of what Salgado-Pottier's (2008) writes, as well as Taras's (2012, p. 114) notion that a way in which Islamophobia persists is through a

"supposed historical incompatibility of European and Islamic values". What is particularly problematic with this newspaper excerpt is what is highlighted: cultural incompatibility rather than the issues prevalent between a perpetrator and a victim. In other words, the relationship between a perpetrator and a victim is problematic in and of itself, regardless of cultural backgrounds.

In addition to the sexual deviancy of the internal sex trafficker, members of the Asian community are portrayed as involved or complicit with the actions. For example in the extract below *The Times* reported on the way in which other members of the Asian community dealt with the issue. Men from the community were interviewed but not named. The article states "the three men have agreed to speak on the condition of anonymity. They are so scared of reprisals that their town must not be named" (Extract 2, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 3). Their responses to those who were perpetrating internal sex trafficking suggest the larger Pakistani community is culpable:

> The voices of three young Muslim men climb in anger. They want to share their revulsion for fellow members of their Pakistani community who took a group of impressionable British schoolgirls and turned them into a collection of broken sex toys…

> "Half of the guys having sex with them can't speak a word of English. They're old school Asians or illegals working in restaurants. If a girl smiles, they think they're in heaven. They're all a bunch of dirty, filthy bastards."

> The men explain that some of the grooming was initiated on the instructions of older relatives. Other young men were seeking kudos. Some clients were paying customers—perhaps £10 for sex with a 14-year-old white girl...

> …One man confides that "a lot of people" knew of the abuse but that he

and others were "too scared to do anything about it". He points to a widespread view that betraying members of one's own community to the police would be an even greater sin than child sexual exploitation. White girls are targeted by such men because "if they did it to a Muslim girl, they'd be shot".

(Extract 2, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 1, 5-6, 8)

The perpetrators in this excerpt are identified as ethnic minority men who do not assimilate into (white) British society through their adherence to non-(white) British cultural heritage ("old school Asians") or citizenship status ("illegals working in restaurants", "can't speak a word of English"). Further, the men in this excerpt are identified as sexual perpetrators ("paying customers…£10 for sex with a 14-year-old white girl"). They represent what Greer and Jewkes (2005, p. 21) term "absolute otherness", their actions as categorizing them as "pure and unadulterated evil":

> …media representations of exceptional offenses construct the "outsider" status of perpetrators as unequivocal and incontestable. These deviants are the "others" with whom we share the least in common ("we" being that loose collective of media consumers who are usually referred to euphemistically as the "moral majority"…). They are offenders with whom we actively establish and outwardly maintain the greatest distance, and toward whom we are most punitive and vindictive. They are portrayed in terms of their absolute otherness, their utter detachment from the social, moral, and cultural universe of ordinary, decent people — their pure and unadulterated evil.

This "absolute otherness" is explicitly indicated through the quote from an anonymous man from the Muslim community when he states, "They're all a bunch of dirty, filthy bastards." This quote is also an ideological statement, as mentioned previously, representing more than sentiments from someone within the Muslim

community. Rather, its inclusion in the story suggests it may be indicative of the viewpoint of the newspaper and/or journalist (Jullian, 2005).

The linking of cultural background and heritage to internal sex trafficking is connected to xenophobia and Islamophobia as previously discussed. Again, the excerpt identified in Extract 2 links the Muslim community with sexual deviancy ("fellow members of their Pakistani community who took a group of impressionable British schoolgirls and turned them into a collection of broken sex toys"). It also connects Islam with violence ("'if they did it to a Muslim girl, they'd be shot'"). The association between Islam and violence is not a new one (Etienne, 2007; Milton-Edwards, 2011; Omar, 2003).

The inclusion of these references provides a stark contrast between the (white) British and Islamic Asian British communities. In this way, the community itself is blamed for the perpetrators actions as "fellow members of their Pakistani community". In essence, the Pakistani community maintains a sense of ownership over the perpetrators based on their similar cultural heritage. This is seen again in another quote from an anonymous "Muslim" man in Extract 52:

> "Our community is sick and tired of these people. Some of them are married, with children the same age as these girls. They don't deserve a place in society. Every community has its bad apples and these are ours."

> (Extract 2, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 7)

Despite the quote acknowledging that the general Pakistani community is "sick and tired of these people", it remains clear that the perpetrators belong to the Pakistani community more so than the (white) British community ("every community has its bad apples and these are ours"). The quote from someone who identifies as Muslim and is part of the Pakistani community is also significant. Van Dijk (1995, p. 19)

identifies the way in which a newspaper will readily include a minority source who agrees with the (white) position of the newspaper:

> Critical minority voices that do not confirm the prevailing white elite consensus are deemed to be less credible and are marginalized as being too "radical." On the other hand, those minority spokespersons who do happen to agree with the white elite perspective will be given special access to the media and prominently displayed as representing minority points of view.

This type of quote from people within the minority community at question reinforces boundaries between Asian Islamic communities as the Other, and mainstream (white) British communities. These depictions of the Asian Islamic community as its own entity ("our community", "these are ours") within the larger British community contribute to stigmatization and stereotyping. Particularly, descriptions such as the ones contained in the excerpts from this article ("They want to share their revulsion for *fellow members of their Pakistani community* who took a group of impressionable *British schoolgirls* and turned them into a collection of broken sex toys") reinforce clear impenetrable boundaries between cultural groups (Howarth, 2011). There is a clear distinction made between the groups of the "fellow members of their Pakistani community" and the (white) "British schoolgirls" despite both residing in the UK. Despite the men quoted in the article speaking out against the perpetrators, the point is made that the perpetrators have originated from *their* community: one which is separate from the larger British community. This contributes to a stigmatization of "us and them" as Hall (1997, p. 258) identifies:

> It sets up a symbolic frontier between the 'normal' and the 'deviant', the 'normal' and the 'pathological', the 'acceptable' and the 'unacceptable', what belongs and what does not or is 'Other', between 'insiders and 'outsiders', us and them.

Despite speaking out and rejecting the actions of the perpetrators, the identification of the perpetrators with belonging to the Pakistani community indirectly associates the entire community with the issue. In this way, these representations Other the Pakistani community through the depiction they produce internal sex traffickers.

Further, the quote in Extract 2 shows disapproval for the actions of the perpetrators ("Our community is sick and tired of these people"; "They don't deserve a place in society") at the same time as it accepts ownership of the perpetrators ("Every community has its bad apples and these are ours"). The inclusion of the quotes from men *within* the perpetrators' communities portray the community as taking responsibility for 'their' actions and again suggests collectivism. It is *Islamic men* who are recognising the cultural and religious belief systems as partially responsible for the trafficking and exploitation of white British girls. In essence, it is the cultural heritage and values which are blamed, which is clearly stated in another article as follows:

> The majority of suspected abusers that the centre encounters are non-UK nationals, including Sri Lankans, Kurds, and Afghans, Wendy [Barnardo's centre manager] said. "I'm not saying it is not different elsewhere, but here one of the models of abuser we see are people with different cultural beliefs that are sometimes not conducive to child safety."

> (Extract 38, *The Guardian*, 18 May 2011, para. 8)

The quote is recognising that it is *cultural* beliefs, not personal beliefs, that are "not conducive to child safety". Though the Barnardo's centre manager first states the disclaimer of "I'm not saying it is not different elsewhere" the remainder of her statement is a stereotype which condemns the entire community. In essence, the disclaimer makes explicit what the Barnardo's centre manager states she is striving to avoid, "but here one of the models of abuser we see are people with different cultural beliefs that are sometimes not conducive to child safety". Additionally, this

is further evidence of Hall's (1997) conceptualization of the "symbolic frontier". The Asian Islamic communities are cast as "deviant" juxtaposed to "normal" as (white) British cultural beliefs.

The next section will discuss how (white) ethnicity was overlooked within newspaper articles within the data-set reporting on Scotland's first convicted sex traffickers.

5.5: (Overlooking) Ethnicity in the Coverage of Scotland's First Convicted Sex Traffickers

This section will examine the coverage within the data-set of Scotland's first convicted sex traffickers, Stephen Craig and Sarah Beukan. Specifically, they were the first people to be charged under section 22 of the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2003 (as reported in Extract 84, the excerpt identifying this is provided later in this chapter). It will be argued that white ethnicity is overlooked. Specifically, unlike the representations of Pakistani internal sex traffickers where ethnicity and cultural heritage are linked to the actions of the perpetrators, representations of the white traffickers did not link ethnicity and cultural heritage to the actions of the perpetrators. Rather, the articles which covered this story represented Craig and Beukan as deviant outliers to the cultural heritage and values of mainstream (white) British society.

The newspaper articles which reported this case overlooked ethnicity; it was not mentioned. I was able to identify that the sex traffickers were white through an online newspaper image search using the names within the articles.[7] There were ten

[7] While the data did not include any photographs originally appearing in the news articles, a Google search provided photographic evidence that both convicted sex traffickers in this particular case (Craig and Beukan) were white (several sources included: BBC, The Herald Scotland, and Wales Online). This was the only case in the data-set in which I was able to verify that the alleged/convicted traffickers were white. This does not mean that any of the other alleged/convicted traffickers whose names appeared in the data-set were *not* white. However, it does indicate that if

articles in the data-set which covered the story of the white internal traffickers. In comparison, 25 articles covered the stories of Pakistani internal traffickers. While statistical data in the UK on internal trafficking is difficult to ascertain, information that was identified came from the Metropolitan Police (2014) and consisted of data on the ethnicity of traffickers in the UK. The dates where numerical data was able to be identified was for the time period of 1 October 2012 through 31 October 2013. This particular data shows evidence that there were no cases where action was pursued for trafficking *within* the UK for sexual exploitation. As for trafficking *into* the UK for sexual exploitation there were charges proceeded against 44 "White—Northern European" people and 25 "White—Southern European" people. While the statistical representations of internal traffickers' ethnicities were unable to be determined, what this data shows is that the majority of cases of people proceeded against with charges of trafficking were white. There are many aspects of quantitative data that need to be considered when they are utilised to represent reality (Potter, 1991). However, what can be suggested from this data is that the representations of internal sex trafficking were unbalanced in the way that the ethnicity of Pakistani internal traffickers was *highlighted* compared to the case of Craig and Beukan, where their white ethnicity was *not indicated*.

The case involving Craig and Beukan first appeared on 12 March 2011 in *The Sun* (Extract 20, para. 2) as the following:

> Stephen Craig, 34, of Clydebank, and Malcolm McNeill [sic], 47, of Hamilton, made no plea or declaration at Glasgow Sheriff Court. They are accused of trafficking, controlling prostitution for gain, brothel-keeping and converting criminal property. It is alleged the offences were carried out in Glasgow, other parts of Scotland and Belfast in 2009 and last year.

It was followed with coverage by *The Sun* on 22 June 2011 (Extract 58, para. 1):

---

there were more white perpetrators in addition to the case of Craig and Beukan, "white" as an ethnicity was not highlighted.

> Three men and a woman were in court yesterday to face one of the first
> prosecutions for sex trafficking in Scotland. Stephen Craig, Malcolm
> McNeil, Gordon Dryburgh and Sarah Beukan are accused of moving 14
> women and men…for prostitution.

Though it was not reported within the articles in the data-set, the Crown eventually
accepted pleas of not guilty from McNeil and Dryburgh (of whom the ethnicities
were unable to be identified) (BBC, 2011).

Within both of these initial reports in the case of Craig and Beukan, ethnicity is not
mentioned. This is continued throughout the remaining eight articles covering this
story. Their identities are linked to gender, age, where they reside and the crimes in
which they are convicted. Their ethnicity is not included in the story by the
newspaper:

> A man and a woman involved in a prostitution network have pleaded
> guilty to sex trafficking offences in the first case of its type to be heard
> in Scotland.
>
> Stephen Craig, 34, and Sarah Beukan, 22 admitted to moving 14 men
> and women to various addresses in Glasgow, Ediburgh, Belfast, Cardiff
> and Newcastle in order to sell sex.
>
> The couple are the first to be charged under section 22 of the Criminal
> Justice (Scotland) Act 2003.
>
> Both admitted the offences as their trial was about to start at Glasgow
> Sheriff Court. Some 200 witnesses were expected to be called to give
> evidence in the case.
>
> Craig, of Clydebank, now faces proceedings under the proceeds of crime
> act after making money from his part…

> …Advocate Paul Brown, for Beukan, also from Leith, told the court that
> she was a prostitute who was acting under the instruction of Craig.

> (Extract 84, *The Times*, 10 September 2011, para. 1-5, 9)

The white ethnicity of Craig and Beukan is overlooked and/or considered insignificant based on the lack of its inclusion in the articles. In addition, their ethnicity is not portrayed as a contributing factor to the sex trafficking crimes of which they are convicted. In this case of Craig and Beukan, it is significant that ethnicity is overlooked, *and* they are white. This is critically important because it is evidence of a dominant race ideology, as discussed by scholar and activist Jackson Katz (*Tough Guise*, 1999):

> When men of color rape women or shoot people or blow things up, race
> and culture move to the forefront of the story…All of this is partly a
> function of how dominant ideologies work linguistically to conceal the
> power of dominant groups…In other words, we always focus on the
> subordinated group and not the dominant one, and that's one of the ways
> the power of dominant groups isn't questioned – by remaining invisible.

In the example of Craig and Beukan, their race remains invisible within the text of the article. Within this context white is the dominant group. In other words, it is the standard against which other traffickers are positioned. Also as Katz identified, power is maintained by the dominant group "by remaining invisible". In essence, when white perpetrators are accused of TIP ethnicity is not suggested to be indicative of factors and/or cultural values that enable a particular mind-set to commit sex trafficking. Within the portrayals of Pakistani internal traffickers, this was shown to be vastly different.

Rather, when considering the portrayals of Craig and Beukan the opposite is true. Their actions are not linked to white British cultural heritage and values, as it is linked to Pakistani heritage and values. Craig and Beukan's arrest, court case and

conviction are evidence that their actions are criminal under British law, according to the Sexual Offences Act of 2003. They are named "crooks" and "despicable individuals" (*The Sun*, 10 September 2011); "a brutal gang boss and his vice girl", "sleazy", "the evil pair", "gangster", and "thug" (*The Sun*, 4 October 2011). These labels identify Craig and Beukan as acting *outside* (white) British values not as influenced by them.

In the data-set, the coverage of this case did not link Craig and Beukan's offences to cultural heritage and/or cultural values. This was unlike the links made between Pakistani internal traffickers which were clearly linked to cultural heritage and/or cultural values.

The influence of being white in connection with the crimes committed is able to be overlooked *because* it is the dominant ethnicity (Katz, 2006; Lucal, 1996). This also constructs Craig and Beukan as outliers to mainstream British society. Again, this contrasts to the representations of Pakistani internal traffickers, which as a story involving ethnic minority perpetrators is arguably more sensationalist (Poole, 2002), and thus more likely to garner readers' attention (Poole, 2002; van Dijk, 1991).

With the case of Craig and Beukan, it was their individual actions which were considered incongruous with (white) British values. It was the deviation from (white) British cultural values that lead to their arrest, trial and conviction. However, as explored in the previous sections, Pakistani internal traffickers within the data-set were represented as having different cultural values, ones which were incongruent with (white) British cultural values. Further, the representations attributed these incongruent values of the Pakistani internal traffickers to the cultural heritage of the British Pakistani communities rather than the individual perpetrators. In this way, the representations construct the Pakistani communities within the UK as Other. This is a form of "inferential racism", a concept which Conboy (2006, p. 94) identifies as occurring within news media descriptions:

> The language of this representation has a strongly normative inflection which aims to reinforce a reader identity and in turn a strong sense of national community based not only on a sense of what is shared in common but also on what is shared as a common perception of external challenge or threat to that community.

In this way the Pakistani internal traffickers are portrayed as the Other, embodying different and at times dangerous cultural values. This portrayal extends to the Pakistani communities as a whole group. Further, through these representations it is insinuated that the cultural values of this group are an "external challenge or threat to [the majority white British] community" (Conboy, 2006, p. 94). This was previously discussed in section 5.4.

These portrayals also lead to another sub-theme which emerged during data analysis: the notion that cultural sensitivity can be a hindrance to justice. With the repeated assumption and recognition within the articles that there, indeed, is an issue within the British Pakistani community the discussions turned to acknowledge the apparent fears of authorities and others being branded racist in addressing what was portrayed as an emerging and important issue within the topic of TIP. This will be discussed in greater depth in the following section.

5.6: Representations of Cultural Sensitivity as Hindrance to Justice

The aim of this section is to identify and discuss the way in which the concept of cultural sensitivity is portrayed negatively, as a hindrance to justice. Specifically I am interested in the way ethnicity is addressed by the newspapers through local authorities and community workers through this lens of cultural sensitivity and justice. This section will first address what is meant by cultural sensitivity. Second, it will identify instances where this theme occurs within the data and discuss the implications.

In the UK, police are responsible for maintaining civil order and upholding the authority of the law (Dammer and Albanese, 2010). The issue of TIP presents additional challenges, one of which is discriminatory practices. This can, at times, pose a particular issue when it appears certain minority ethnic groups are more involved in a particular criminal activity than the majority (white) population. Dammer and Albanese (2010, pp. 109-110) comment on this:

> In any legitimate society, especially one that espouses democratic values, the police are asked to treat all people with respect and in a fair and professional manner…When the police are called in to maintain public order and public safety they often encounter ethnic and cultural groups acting contrary to the norms of their society. In this way they are in a difficult situation because they are being asked to enforce the law but at the same being asked to question, arrest, or even incarcerate those that most often feel they are being discriminated against. How they handle these situations reflects their competence and their commitment to legitimate justice, and can even determine the future peace and tranquility within a society.

This is certainly the case within the specific issue of internal sex trafficking as reported by the newspapers within the data-set. As discussed in earlier sections, the entire Pakistani community is condemned through the actions of the Pakistani perpetrator. This has been contrasted to the case involving Craig and Beukan who are white but where ethnicity was not identified in any of the ten articles featuring their story. This is also despite the majority of identified traffickers in the available police data being identified as white. Further, the way in which internal sex trafficking is occurring in some British communities between older men and predominantly teenage girls needs to be addressed (just like *all* forms of TIP need to be addressed). However it is particularly problematic that within the data-set it was represented as an offence involving predominantly Asian/Muslim perpetrators whose ethnic minority communities held "different cultural beliefs that are

sometimes not conducive to child safety" (Extract 38, *The Guardian*, 18 May 2011, para. 8). This presents a dilemma to police and authorities who are responsible for upholding the law but also find themselves in xenophobic circumstances, or who are xenophobic. It is this predicament which is the basis for the third sub-theme and will be discussed in this section: the representation of cultural sensitivity as a hindrance to justice.

For the purposes of this research, I will use the following definition of cultural sensitivity, which is based on the research of Foronda (2008, p. 210):

> Cultural sensitivity is employing one's knowledge, consideration, understanding, respect, and tailoring after realizing awareness of self and others and encountering a diverse group or individual. Cultural sensitivity results in effective communications, effective interventions, and satisfaction.

Within the data-set, cultural sensitivity is constructed as something which could *potentially* be seen to hinder justice. This is seen in the extracts below:

> Mr Vaz insisted that racial and cultural sensitivities should not hinder any investigation…
>
> …"Cultural sensitivity is not the issue. Every single citizen has an interest in ensuring that those who perpetrate these terrible crimes are punished and these appalling activities are exposed and stopped." The Times's investigation found that most victims were white, aged 12-16.
>
> (Extract 4, *The Times*, 6 January 2011, para. 4-5)

In this extract, the use of "racial and cultural sensitivities should not hinder any investigation" acts as a cautious way to approach the issue and further indicates that the priority in these circumstances is "ensuring that those who perpetrate these terrible crimes are punished and these appalling activities are exposed and stopped."

However, what this extract *does not* do is *disagree* with the link established between the cultural and racial sensitivities potentially preventing successful investigations into the issue. This approach to cultural sensitivity within the investigations of Asian internal sex traffickers occurs again in the following:

> Loughton said the government would not shy away from looking at whether certain ethnic groups in specific areas were more likely to be involved in sexual exploitation. "If there has been a reluctance to (look at the problem) because of a fear of opening a can of worms, then we have to expose that." But he stressed that sexual exploitation was not confined to one ethnic group.
>
> (Extract 37, *The Guardian*, 18 May 2011, para. 9)

The suggestion that cultural sensitivity has hindered investigations is cautiously approached through the quote from Loughton. The use of "*If there has been* a reluctance to (look at the problem)" works to suggest rather than declare. The use of "if" implies that there is uncertainty and leaves open the possibility that there has not been reluctance within investigations on this issue. Further, the end of this paragraph includes that "he stressed that sexual exploitation was not confined to one ethnic group". In essence, this paragraph acts as a disclaimer (Poole, 2002). The disclaimer serves to refute the notion that the newspaper's position or those portrayed in the articles are racist or xenophobic, and works to achieve credibility for the claims presented with minimal evidence (Poole, 2002). This recurs in the following excerpt:

> All the girls in the case were white and their alleged abusers were from Rochdale's Pakistani community. The Times has been told, though this is denied by the police, that the original inquiry was crippled by misplaced fears about upsetting racial sensitivities.
>
> (Extract 6, *The Times*, 11 January 2011, para. 9)

The disclaimer identified is the phrase "though this is denied by police". Further, the *The Times* established that the "original inquiry was crippled by misplaced fears about upsetting racial sensitivities" through a vague indication of credibility ("The Times has been told"). However, the indication in this passage is that the police knew of the internal trafficking but racial tensions prevented police action. This is also an example of how details and descriptions are constructed to tell a particular story (Potter, 1996). As Potter (1996, p. 6) writes, "Descriptions are not determined by events but are worked up..." In this way, the descriptions of cultural sensitivity "are worked up" to imply that cultural sensitivity and political correctness are a hindrance to justice. For example:

> There is no room for political correctness in tackling the sexual exploitation of children and teenagers, the Children's Minister said yesterday, warning professionals that "denial" over racial grooming did nothing to help victims.

> Unveiling his plan to crack down on the men who groom and then sexually exploit children, Tim Loughton said that in some parts of the country, British Pakistanis were targeting white girls and there was no point in "sweeping it under the carpet"…

> …Mr Loughton praised The Times and in particular Andrew Norfolk, its North East correspondent, for highlighting the issue with a series of powerful reports and for being prepared to tackle difficult racial factors.

> "I pay tribute to him. He arrived early and has raised the lid on this. Trying to be in denial about the involvement, about any particular ethnic group, will not help the victims. There should not be political correctness around the perpetrators. This is a serious crime," the minister said.

(Extract 116, *The Times*, 24 November 2011, para. 1-2; 11-12)

The suggestion here is: ethnicity is important in identifying the perpetrators. The suggestion that there are appropriate exceptions to stereotyping and generalising groups ("Trying to be in denial about the involvement, about any particular ethnic group, will not help the victims."; "There should not be political correctness around the perpetrators.") is again problematic. As Conboy (2006, p. 119) identifies, criticism against 'political correctness' is an effort to "block out questioning the status quo". This is made clear in the above excerpt where allowing for "political correctness" within the cases of perpetrators is opposed by the minister because "this is a serious crime". The issue of internal sex trafficking is utilised as a catalyst to maintain the status quo. In this way, xenophobia exists within these portrayals. Race and ethnicity are portrayed as areas which have "no room for political correctness" within the issue child sexual exploitation, and specifically of internal sex trafficking as represented in these articles. *The Times* is indicating in this excerpt that political correctness must be put aside because both cultural sensitivity and combating the issue cannot co-exist.

However, cultural sensitivity in itself is aimed to promote social justice and reduce racism and xenophobia. It is therefore problematic to suggest that it is cultural sensitivity which is preventing justice. The "ethnicity factor" also appears in an earlier article by *The Times* in Extract 1 (*The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 8):

> A senior West Mercia detective has now called for an end to the "damaging taboo" surrounding gang-led on-street grooming, which he blames on a fear among police and child protection workers of being branded racist. Detective Chief Inspector Alan Edwards said: "These girls are being passed around and used as meat. To stop this type of crime you need to start talking about it, but everyone's been too scared to address the ethnicity factor. No one wants to stand up and say that Pakistani guys in some parts of the country are recruiting young white girls and passing them around their relatives for sex, but we need to stop being worried about the racial complication."

This article based much of its findings from a study as indicated below:

> The Times has seen a briefing document by researchers at the UCL Jill
> Dando Institute of Security and Crime Science, which notes that victims
> are typically white girls aged 13 to 16 and that "most central offenders
> are Pakistani"…

(Extract 1, *The Times*, 5 January 2011, para. 11)

Both of these extracts clearly identify Pakistani heritage men as the predominant perpetrators in these circumstances involving internal traffickers. It has been found that the media contributes to the construction of public opinion, and that news stories portray minority ethnicities/races more negatively than white ethnicity (Hartmann & Husband, 1974; Romer et al., 1998; van Dijk, 1991). Further, van Dijk (1991) has established that the news is influential in racist and xenophobic ideologies. Despite the offences (grooming/trafficking) identified in the article, the reporting found in these and previously mentioned excerpts embodies a xenophobic ideology. In Hartmann and Husband's (1974, p. 41) foundational work on racism in the media, they write, "…racial prejudice serves a function, among other things, of maintaining whites in an advantageous position…" In this way, the indication that "fear…of being branded racist" hinders addressing and preventing the grooming/trafficking of "white girls" enables prejudice to occur through the construction of the police officer as inhibited by "being worried about racial complication". In essence, it is the fear of being a racist that enables racism. The acknowledgement of the "fear…of being branded racist" is portrayed as unreasonable ("To stop this crime you need to start talking about it, but everyone's too scared to address the ethnicity factor"). "Talking about it" implies talking about the "ethnicity factor". In other words, in order to prevent this type of offence the "ethnicity factor" must be addressed. Further, the ethnicity of the perpetrators (Pakistani) is juxtaposed with the ethnicity of the (white) girls who were victimized ("No one wants to stand up and say that Pakistani guys…are recruiting young white girls and passing them around their relatives for sex").

This identification of race/ethnicity within crime reporting is what van Dijk (1991, p. 64) calls "one of the notorious 'classics' of racist reporting". The perpetrator's race/ethnicity is predominantly included in the article when it is a minority race/ethnicity. Further to this, the excerpts within this section identify how the newspapers identify racial and cultural sensitivity, which serve to alleviate racism and xenophobia, as hindering justice.

Extract 1 mentions a "briefing document from the researchers at the UCL Jill Dando Institute of Security and Crime Science" (para. 11). In the study to which this refers, the conclusions and claims are based on a data sample consisting of two cities. The results are unable to be generalised:

> Findings from an exploratory academic study were cited in support, despite the authors publicly emphasising that their (unpublished) work, focusing on two cases alone, had been de-contextualised and deliberately 'over-extended to characterise an entire crime type' (Cockbain, 2013, p. 27).

It was Cockbain's study (along with Helen Brayley), which is the research in question. An article appeared in *The Guardian* two days after the news first broke in *The Times* regarding British Pakistani gangs as internal sex traffickers of white British girls. Within it the article references the researchers and discusses an alternative view:

> Researchers into child sex trafficking within the UK have warned of the dangers of racial stereotyping amid claims of a widespread problem of British Pakistani men exploiting underage white girls.
>
> Authors of the first independent academic analysis of "on-street grooming", where girls are targeted outside, including at the school gates, said they were concerned that data from a small, geographically concentrated sample of cases had been "generalised to an entire crime

type".

> The authors, Helen Brayley and Ella Cockbain, from UCL's Jill Dando
> Institute of Security and Crime Science, said they were surprised their
> research, confined to just two English police operations in the north and
> Midlands, which found perpetrators were predominantly but not
> exclusively British Pakistanis, had been cited in support of claims that
> such offences were widespread.

> (Extract 5, *The Guardian*, 7 January 2011, para. 1-3)

The concern over the stereotyping and generalising expressed by the researchers is addressed ("Authors of the first independent academic analysis of "on-street grooming"…said they were concerned that data …had been 'generalised to an entire crime type'"). Cockbain (2013, p. 23) later published an article regarding the coverage about 'on-street grooming' based on her research and noted:

> Against a context of increasingly vocal disillusionment with
> multicultural Britain, the contention proved explosive that 'foreigners'
> were not only abusing 'natives' but also going unpunished due to
> misguided political correctness.

The response to their research included many opinions and accusations against Asian/Muslim communities; the articles within the data-set identified in this section are evidence of this. Cultural sensitivity was consistently depicted as a hindrance to social justice. Further, within the data-set a xenophobic ideology was identified and linked to Islamophobia.

5.7: Conclusion

This chapter aimed to consider ways in which the theme of xenophobia/Islamophobia was exemplified within newspaper portrayals of the internal sex trafficker. The three key components which were discussed included: 1)

Cultural heritage and beliefs of the Pakistani population in the UK as influencing internal sex trafficking actions, 2) White ethnicity was overlooked in the coverage of the case of Craig and Beukan, Scotland's first convicted sex traffickers, and 3) Cultural sensitivity was depicted as a hindrance to justice. Through these three subthemes it was identified that xenophobia/Islamophobia is prevalent in newspapers' representations of internal traffickers.

The final empirical chapter will explore the ways in which trafficked persons' experiences were objectified within the representations in the data-set. Mulvey's (1975) conceptualisation of "the gaze" will be used as a lens in which to explore relevant extracts. Further, as a wider implication of this theme, the chapter also considers the commodification of trafficked persons' experiences through the example of *Oprah*'s "Save a Slave" campaign.

Chapter Six: The Objectification and Commodification of the Trafficked Person

6.1: Introduction

Within this chapter I aim to examine the ways in which trafficked persons' bodies were represented in the data-set. Through thematic analysis, the central theme was identified as the following: *the objectification of trafficked persons' bodies*. This will be explored with examples from the data-set as well as relevant literature. Further, a wider implication of this theme, *the commodification of trafficked persons through charitable giving*, will be discussed using the example of *Oprah*'s "Save a Slave" campaign.

In order to critically explore the main theme, I will use Mulvey's (1975; 2009) conceptual framework of the gaze as it applies to the representation of the trafficked body. When considered within the context of trafficked persons' narratives depicted in newspaper articles, the reader's gaze is arguably voyeuristic and objectifies trafficked persons' bodies. This is particularly relevant within representations of trafficked persons who have experienced sexualised assault and/or exploitation.

Secondly, I will discuss a wider implication of the objectification of trafficked persons' experiences. I will suggest that one way in which the experiences of trafficked persons is further objectified is through commodification under the guise of charitable giving. An example utilising the "Save a Slave" fundraising campaign will be discussed to explicate this concept.

6.2: The Objectification of Trafficked Persons' Bodies in Newspaper Representations

Within this section I aim to identify the ways in which the reader's gaze privileges a male point of view and objectifies the bodies of trafficked persons portrayed in the articles. Several commentators have identified the relevancy and significance of the concept of "the gaze" (Cooper, 2000; Helford, 2006). Originally termed by Mulvey (1975; 2009), the theoretical concept of "the gaze" identified cinematic portrayals of female characters as privileging a male point of view. Similarly, newspaper accounts of personal narratives of trafficked persons, in particular women who have been sexually exploited, privilege a male point of view. Examples of this will be examined in this chapter. Further, Mulvey's conceptualization of the female character as a sexualised spectacle whose primary purpose serves the (male) audience has relevance within the portrayals of trafficked persons in British newspapers, which will be discussed.

Through Mulvey's conceptual framework of "the gaze", it will be argued that explicit descriptions of violence and exploitation within the narratives of trafficked persons' experiences serve to emphasize victimisation as well as "sell titillation under the cover of concern" (Doezema, 2000, p. 35). This is particularly relevant to (female) trafficked persons who were exploited for sexual purposes or experienced sexual exploitation. In order to exemplify this comparisons will be made between the narratives of female trafficked persons and male trafficked persons included in the data-set.

In many of the descriptions of trafficked persons, the bodies are literally stripped while descriptions convey details of violence, assault, rape and sexual exploitation. Take for example the following excerpt from *The Observer*:

> Nejloveanu eventually arrived and she took her first ferocious beating
> for refusing to have sex with men. "He beat me up and forced me to

> sleep with him—anal sex. It really hurt. He was pulling my hair and hurting my back. Sometimes he would bang my head right on the corner of the door. That really hurt."

> Weeks into her ordeal, Marinela relented. Nejloveanu presented her with a lurid set of garish underwear and she was taken to a nearby brothel masquerading as a sauna.

> (Extract 14, *The Observer*, 6 February 2011, para. 13-14)

The extent of detail in the above excerpt is unnecessary to relay the main points of Marinela's exploitation. For instance, Marinela reveals that she was raped by Nejloveanu and included are details that the rape was "anal sex" and that "it really hurt". It is arguable that these descriptive details are intrusive in the way in which they add shock value to the story. Marinela has endured quite extensive suffering at the hands of a trafficker, Nejloveanu. The detailed descriptions place the reader in the room of the abuse. The reader's gaze is present as the words describing her ordeal are read: as Marinela is beaten up, raped, her hair pulled, her back hurt, her head banged. The details of her trafficking experience are likely to have shock value, and as discussed in Chapter Three, construct the issue as particularly abhorrent. This continues with the inclusion of how her trafficker, Nejloveanu, gave her a "lurid set of garish underwear" before she was brought to "a nearby brothel". These details are arguably what Doezema (2000, p. 35) refers to when she argues that descriptions of sex trafficked women in the media "sell titillation under the guise of concern".

In the above excerpt, Marinela eventually submitted to the orders of Nejloveanu. The description of the physical violence she endured is evidence of the reader's gaze. The dominant actions of the male trafficker, Nejloveanu, privilege the male point of view as the descriptions emphasize the events through the lens of what he was doing to Marinela. Despite her resistance (which also works to showcase her innocence and purity) his dominant actions maintain power and control.

By not acknowledging that this particular portrayal of a trafficked person is extreme it is inadvertently made representative of the majority of trafficked persons. In the case of Extract 14, *The Observer* describes Marinela's trafficking experience, which is suggested to be a typical narrative (while also labelled as "extraordinary"). This is evidenced in the following:

> [Marinela's] **extraordinary story**, revealed here for the first time, offers a troubling insight into Britain's vast "off street" prostitution trade. It also raises questions about the apparent indifference of the authorities to tackling trafficking and protecting vulnerable women imported into Britain as sex slaves.
>
> Victims are notoriously reluctant to describe their experience because of the shame, fear and stress. It is even rarer for such women to agree to be identified. Motivated by a courageous desire to expose this sordid, violent world, Marinela has revealed the full horror of her ordeal in an account that should reopen the debate about how Britain deals with its sex industry.
>
> (6 February 2011, para. 4-5, emphasis added)

The implication that Marinela's severe (and brutal) experience of trafficking is representative of the majority of cases is indicated by the phrase in the first excerpt that her story "offers a troubling insight into Britain's vast 'off street prostitution trade'". Connecting this one story as "insight" into the "vast" numbers of other stories implies that *this* story can be generalised to others. In the second excerpt this continues as Marinela's narrative is said to "expose this sordid, violent world" followed by a statement that her story "should reopen the debate about how Britain deals with its sex industry". In essence, Britain should begin to discuss the policies and procedures relating to the sex industry *because* of the particularly abhorrent circumstances of Marinela's exploitation and abuse. What is implicitly suggested in

these excerpts is that it is *because* trafficking (though in the second excerpt the reference is also inclusive of the entire sex industry) is represented as "sordid", "violent", and horrific that debates and/or policy changes need to occur.

This use of specific narratives to exemplify the TIP as a brutal issue appeared particularly within articles written in a narrative journalistic style which tends to allow for a more conversational tone and have higher word counts compared to hard news articles which keep details and word counts minimal (Deahl, 2015). Another example is the case of Katya who was trafficked as a teenager from Moldova into the UK twice:

> Days after her removal from the UK, her traffickers tracked her down to the Moldovan village where she had grown up. She was gang-raped, strung up by a rope from a tree, and forced to dig her own grave. One of her front teeth was pulled out with a pair of pliers. Shortly afterwards she was retrafficked, first to Israel and later back to the UK...

> …"They took me to a forest and I was beaten and raped. Then they made a noose out of rope and told me to dig my own grave as I was going to be killed," Katya's court statement reads. "They tied the noose around my neck and let me hang before cutting the branch off the tree. I really believed I was going to die. They then drove me to a house where many men were staying. They were all very drunk and took turns to rape me. When I tried to resist, one man physically restrained me and pulled out my front tooth out using pliers."

> The attack ended only when her trafficker told the men they needed to stop as Katya was to be sold in Israel. "I think maybe they did not kill me because I was more valuable alive," her statement reads. Katya, 26, is thin and pale, but dentists have replaced her tooth, and her other scars are well hidden. "I didn't have too many scars or injuries as the traffickers wanted to keep me looking pretty," she said.

(Extract 30, *The Guardian*, 19 April 2011, para. 2, 15-16)

Similar to Marinela's narrative, Katya is the focus of attention compared to her traffickers who maintain a background presence. The reader is exposed to Katya's ordeal twice in the article by both the journalist's account of her story and then, later in the article, Katya's quoted personal account, both of which emphasize the brutality of the violence used against her: beaten, raped multiple times, hanged from a tree by the neck, dug her own grave, pulled her tooth out with pliers. Despite the brutality, however, the paragraph following Katya's personal account emphasizes the lack of permanent damage to her body, "dentists have replaced her tooth, and her other scars are well hidden". Katya corroborates this with, "I didn't have too many scars or injuries as the traffickers wanted to keep me looking pretty." The focus remains on Katya's body. Further, these details of severe physical violence emphasize her victimisation (Doezma, 2000; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

The descriptions of her recovery and healing reflect constructed notions of ideal beauty which deem scars and other abnormalities as undesirable flaws (Duncan, 1994; Spitzack, 1990; Wolf, 2002). Katya's perceived physical flaws are identified and descriptions of how they do not interfere with her beauty are emphasized: dental work fixed her missing tooth, no scars are visible to the proverbial onlooker ("her other scars are well hidden"). Reischer and Koo (2004), in referencing Wolf's concept of the beauty myth write, "a beautiful woman is and always has been more desirable to men than are her peers" (p. 301). In this way, Extract 30 represents a heterosexual male point of view as the notion of feminine beauty and its application to the violence inflicted upon Katya's body were central tenets of the news story.

In essence, the lens which the reader is given to view the physical brutality she has endured is centred on what it has done to her status as beautiful, and it is this which privileges the heterosexual male gaze. This is seen through the indication that permanent damage (to her body) is minimal. Katya states, "the traffickers wanted to keep me looking pretty" reemphasizing to the reader that it was her body, and the

ability to sell it, that made her valuable to her traffickers. In a similar way, the journalist re-exploits Katya in that her extreme story, and the potential to sell it to readers, makes her (and the portrayal of her body) valuable to the newspaper.

The importance of the ideal beauty image is also suggested in the following excerpt narrating the story of Katerina, a teenager from Bulgaria:

> About three years ago at a cousin's party a man approached me. He told me if I didn't go with him he'd hurt my family. I was put on a bus and told I'd be met at the other end. Next, I was put on a minibus, then taken on a ferry to Britain and on to London. I was taken to a house where they took pictures of me. I asked for food, but they said I needed to lose weight. I was so alone. They forced me to be a prostitute…I told them I wanted to leave and they threatened to cut my legs off and slapped me around.
>
> (Extract 29, *The Sunday* Times, 17 April 2011, para. 34)

The reference to the action that "they took pictures of me" places an emphasis on physical appearance. Further, when she "asked for food", a basic need, the traffickers "said I needed to lose weight" implying that they starved her to achieve the ideal body image of thinness (Duncan, 1994). Again, these details indicate the reader's gaze is the perspective of the heterosexual male gaze. The perpetrators are either invisible ("I was put on a bus and told I'd be met at the other end. Next, I was put on a minibus, then taken on a ferry to Britain and on to London") or remain an unidentifiable collective group ("*they* took pictures of me", "*they* said I need to lose weight", "*They* forced me to be a prostitute", "*they* threatened to cut my legs off and slapped me around", emphasis added).

The portrayal of the female trafficked person within the data-set had a propensity to be sexualized as evidenced by the previous excerpts. It is not uncommon for portrayals of women in general to be sexualized within British news (Conboy, 2006;

Fowler, 1991; Harcup and O'Neill, 2001; Wykes and Gunter, 2005). In the case of female trafficked persons, it is the body, and what was done *to it*, which receives the most attention. Further, just as punters violate trafficked bodies for sexual pleasure (regardless of whether or not they are aware of trafficked persons' circumstances), the reader's gaze violates the portrayals of trafficked bodies by perpetuating its objectification. Tanner (1994, p. 34) discusses the concept of the reader's gaze in her analysis of rape and torture in fiction, the findings of which are analogous to the portrayals of trafficked persons within these extracts of narrative news stories: "Insofar as the reader's gaze perpetuates the process of objectification, the reader, too, becomes a violator." The violation, I argue, is committed through the social power enacted when consuming voyeuristic portrayals of others.

In other words, Marinela, Katya, and Katerina are signifiers for the reader's gaze, as Mulvey (2009, p. 58) writes:

> Woman, then, stands in patriarchal culture as a signifier for the male
> other, bound by a symbolic order in which man can live out his fantasies
> and obsessions through linguistic command by imposing them on the
> silent image of a woman still tied to her place as the bearer of meaning,
> not maker of meaning.

In this way, inequality enacted by the dominant gaze of the reader is inherent in the extreme narrative depictions of trafficked persons. In the cases of Marinela, Katya and Katerina, the experiences of actualized or threatened violence they endured is dominated by the reader's gaze as the reader scrolls over the various details of their bodies and what was done to them, but beyond this their roles within this context are as a "bearer of meaning, not maker of meaning" (p. 58). Though she is quoted as speaking and relaying what has happened to her, she has little power in the construction of the story within the newspaper. Rather, it is the journalist and editors who are determining which aspects of her story will be reported. Through this process she becomes a character and a vessel in which other motives and messages may be portrayed to the reader through the voices of the journalist and editors.

The vivid and violent examples are uncomfortably similar to the descriptive content in Internet pornographic rape sites (Bridges, 2010; Gossett and Byrne, 2002; Neely, 2010). Gossett and Byrne (2002) researched sites which were specifically designed for consumers to experience sexual arousal through witnessing rape, abuse and/or exploitation. The above excerpts of trafficked women are similar in many ways to the following descriptions of Internet rape sites analysed in the study by Gossett and Byrne (2002, p. 696):

> Descriptive words (usually pertaining to the victim) and words with violent connotations often appear on the sites. Sometimes these words just appear on the text; other times, they are part of the caption to a picture. For example, one picture of a scantily clad woman who is tied up and has a frightened look on her face is next to the caption "Women in Pain!"…In addition to the word "rape," 21 of the sites have additional violent words such as "abuse," "torture," "brutal," and "pain" on the site. Other sites are extremely descriptive, using text to create an image. For example, one site in our sample includes a picture of a young-looking naked girl tied up and wearing an expression of pain and has the following accompanying caption: "These teenagers' hell is your pleasure. They are stretched, whipped, raped, and beaten. Their tits are crushed, twisted, pierced, thrashed, and tortured…they scream, cry, and plead."

While this research was conducted on internet rape sites serving pornographic purposes, the similarities in the types of violent acts described bears recognising. Specifically, the purpose of describing physically violent sexual exploitation in detail needs to addressed. I am not arguing that these representations of trafficked persons are examples of pornography (which was the subject of the above research), however, I do want to point out that portrayals of physical violence combined with sexual exploitation are used within this particular genre of internet pornography. In essence, the inclusion of explicit details within the portrayals of trafficked persons'

narratives needs to be critically scrutinized. These representations bring into question if reporting specific details of narratives involving particularly brutal sexualised accounts is helpful or merely titillation masked as an attempt to bring awareness to the issue (Doezema, 2000). This is similar to what Rothe (2011, p. 93) calls a "deeply unethical" relaying of violent stories in her book *Popular Trauma Culture: Selling the Pain of Others in the Mass Media*. When discussing this issue within the framework of memoirs, Rothe writes:

> It is clearly unethical for publishers to mass market [the pain of others] and reinforce the readers' seemingly insatiable quasi-pornographic appetite for other people's misery in the interest of profit margins. Or, as Sam Leith put it, 'there is an unappealing disjunction…between the vulnerable, damaged people whose stories the books tell, and the pound signs flashing up…in the eyes of their publishers…'. And it is likewise ethically untenable 'to get your kicks from devouring pages of grim detail about someone else's stomach-churning misery—[full of] details that offer no insight, that shine no light, but that merely confirm what you already knew: that some people are monstrous and that some people's lives are desperate.'

This concept is applicable to a newspaper reader flipping through articles portraying narratives of trafficked persons and "devouring" accounts "of grim detail about someone else's stomach-churning misery". Likewise, the intimate descriptions "offer no insight" into ways in which these particularly brutal cases of TIP could be prevented. Neither can these cases be interpreted as representative of the majority of trafficked persons. Each trafficked person's circumstances are unique to the individual. Research has shown that there are many trafficked persons who do not encounter such extreme circumstances and abuse (Aronowitz, 2001; Doezema, 1999; Kelly and Regan, 2000; Mai, 2009).

These explicit accounts emphasize trafficked persons' victimisation through the explicit descriptions of the violence and sexual assaults conducted against their

bodies. This may, as Andrijasevic (2007, p. 26) notes, "have paradoxical effects and even contribute to the objectification of women as they capture women's bodies within stereotypical representations of femininity and hence, demarcate the limits within which women can be imagined as active agents." This contrasts to the way in which (the limited examples of) male trafficked persons' circumstances were described. Unlike in the cases of female trafficked persons' where the focus centred on the way in which *the body* was exploited and abused, the cases highlighting male trafficked persons' focused on the severity/depravity of *the living conditions*. See for example the following extracts:

> Two dozen modern day slaves held in appalling conditions were rescued when police raided a gipsy camp yesterday.
>
> Hundreds of officers stormed the site where the men were being kept in filthy caravans, dog kennels and horseboxes.
>
> (Extract 87, *Daily Mail*, 12 September 2011, para. 1-2)

> The men lived in unsanitary conditions, said Jo Hobbs, a spokeswoman for Bedforeshire police.
>
> "There were up to four men living in tiny and filthy caravans which were unheated, and old. They had no access to running water, no toilet and no washing facilities," she said.
>
> (Extract 89, *The Guardian*, 12 September 2011, para. 16-17)

The examples show descriptions which focus on the depravity of the conditions the men faced. Extract 89 also indicates within the article that the threat of violence was present in their experiences, "If they complained they faced beatings" (para. 6). Yet the article does not give details regarding the physical violence (or threat of violence) that took place against their bodies. Again, this is evident in the following extract:

> Twenty-four malnourished "slaves" who were allegedly being held against their will in appalling conditions were found on a travellers' site yesterday.
>
> The group of mainly British men were covered in excrement and living four to a room in squalid conditions near Leighton Buzzard, in Bedfordshire...
>
> (Extract 90, *The Times*, 12 September 2011, para. 1-2)

The descriptions utilised in this description focus on the living conditions of the men ("held against their will in appalling conditions", "covered in excrement", "living four to a room in squalid conditions"). Yet, descriptions involving specific details of their bodies were not included in the articles. There were a limited number of examples of male trafficked persons in the data-set, and most of the cases involved circumstances of forced labour. However, one specific case of a boy trafficked for sexual exploitation[8] was identified and is as follows:

> Jay had never heard the words "child trafficking" when he came to this country from Chad. He was 16, and had scarcely been out of his village before. It was the first time he'd been on a plane, but he wasn't nervous. He was, he says, just following: "In African countries children are brought up to follow their elders." As the sole surviving member of his family, Jay had few to follow; all the others died when he was 15—he won't say how. Soon after, Jay's pastor introduced him to a white man from England who said he would be his sponsor. "He seemed like a kind man," recalls Jay. "I thought he was going to pay for my schooling. I was happy to follow him because I had nobody left in my country and thought he was going to help me."

---

[8] The case of Jay was a specific narrative of TIP for the purposes of sexual exploitation involving a male victim. While there were instances within the data-set where it is mentioned that "men" and/or "boys" are also trafficked for sexual exploitation, this was the only case where the name and details of a male victim of trafficking for sexual exploitation were included in the data-set.

A friend of the man met them at Heathrow and drove them to a city in
the north. Jay had been in the man's house less than 24 hours when the
man gave him alcohol. "I'd never had it before and didn't take too
much." The man then sexually assaulted Jay and when he had finished,
he locked the door. For the next year, the man brought Jay one meal a
day and only let him out of his room to use the bathroom or do chores.

Otherwise Jay was kept locked in that room, where the man, and
sometimes other men, used him for sex. Jay had believed he'd found a
guardian who was bringing him to a better life. Instead of which he'd
met a trafficker who had exported him for sexual exploitation.

(Extract 29, *The Times*, 17 April 2011, para. 1-3)

While the article makes clear that Jay was sexually exploited ("the man sexually
assaulted Jay", "the man, and sometimes other men, used him for sex", "a trafficker
who had exported him for sexual exploitation"), it does not include specific details
as to the ways in which his body was "sexually assaulted". Rather, it makes clear
that he was exploited but without explicit details of *what* was done to his body. In
this way, the representation of his body was not objectified to the same extent as the
examples discussed of female trafficked persons (i.e. Marinela in Extract 14 and
Katya in Extract 30). Jay's body was not subjected to the reader's gaze to the same
extent as Marinela's and Katya's. This was also consistent in a newspaper portrayal
of female trafficking victims from Nigeria. The teenage girls were trafficked for
sexual exploitation by a British council caretaker. Prior to being transported to the
UK they underwent a "Juju magic ritual" and the details of this ceremony are
depicted in the following extract:

The terrifying ceremony was performed in Nigeria by a Juju priest to
trap the girls into a life of sex slavery, it was said.

During the ritual, a 16-year-old girl was taken to a shrine where she was stripped naked by two men and slashed dozens of times with a razor so the priest could collect her blood which was placed in a coffin, Woolwich Crown Court heard.

In a terrifying ordeal 'little short of torture', the girl's body hair was shaven off, her arms were bound behind her back and she was forced to lie naked and covered in blood in another coffin, jurors were told.

The victim also allegedly had to eat the raw heart of a freshly slaughtered chicken as part of the spell by the priest who told her that he access to her soul and if she did not obey his commands he could visit her in her dreams and 'kill her from within'.

In another ritual, a 14-year-old girl was made to swear an oath of loyalty to a Juju medicine man who took her to a river and told her to eat some white clay, having passed a rock from his mouth to hers.

The youngster was also instructed to wash with black soap and given a raw chicken's heart to eat, it was said...

(Extract 59, *Daily Mail*, 23 June 2011, para. 3-8)

In this example there are several descriptions referring to the trafficked persons' bodies ("she was stripped naked", "slashed dozens of times", "the girl's body hair was shaven off, her arms were bound behind her back and she was forced to lie naked and covered in blood in another coffin", "having passed a rock from his mouth to hers"). These details are explicit and offer a brutal depiction of TIP. Their bodies, through the vivid descriptions, are subjected to the reader's gaze. Further, the use of these severe and particularly abhorrent trafficking narratives within the news is arguably voyeuristic. As Surette (2011, p. 16) writes:

> Contemporary news is essentially voyeurism. In crime-and-justice news, you are usually informed about real events and real people, but these events are often rare and distant. They display the lives of people caught up in extreme circumstances, involving bizarre crimes, spectacular trials, and extraordinary situations. News provides filtered, molded snippets of the abnormal criminal events of the world for voyeuristic consumption.

This "voyeuristic consumption" encourages the reader's gaze. Explicit details are reframed as eye-opening rather than objectifying, informative rather than voyeuristic. While some people are moved to action based on particularly abhorrent stories they read, heard or viewed (Kavanagh, 2011; Polaris, 2015; Symons, 2013), many people are not. However, regardless of whether persons are moved to action, the details included within the coverage of a news story maintain the power to influence and/or shape the reader's ideas, thoughts and views (Surette, 2011).

While additional research would benefit from exploring readers' reactions to these graphic accounts in news articles, I would argue that the inclusion of these narratives does more harm than good in that they subject trafficked persons to the reader's gaze for voyeuristic consumption. Further, these representations portray trafficked persons as lacking agency and as people in need of rescue, in other words as "vulnerable and passive objects" (Jordan, 2002, p. 30).

The representations of trafficked persons as victims who lack agency and are in need of rescue is problematic. It is recognised that many people who choose to migrate are ambitious individuals who are willing to take risks (Andrijasevic, 2010; Jordan, 2002). Portrayals that implicate victimisation of the (female) trafficked person through emphasizing the violence and exploitation inflicted upon their bodies further objectifies them as victims. The objectification of trafficked persons through the portrayals within the data-set has wider implications. The use of these narratives to rally support for anti-trafficking campaigns and government policy is persuasive but wrought with problematic conceptualisations of the issue (Andrijasevic, 2007; Soderlund, 2005; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016).

One implication of this objectification is that of the reader/viewer/campaigner as a participant in the commodification of the trafficked person through the guise of philanthropy. This will be argued in the following section through the example of *Oprah*'s "Save a Slave" campaign (2009b).

6.3: The Commodification of Trafficked Persons in *Oprah*'s "Save a Slave" Campaign

In 2009, Kristof and WuDunn, (authors of the book *Half the Sky* as mentioned in the Introduction, pp. 12-13), appeared on the well-known television talk show, *Oprah* (2009a). The story of Long Pross, which is included in the book (and discussed in the Introduction, p. 13, and Chapter Four, pp. 161-163), was described as an example of "modern-day slavery" (this term was used synonymously with human trafficking). Her story also featured in an article on *Oprah*'s website. At the end of the article there was a link to a fundraising page[9]. The description was as follows:

> In centuries past, slavery was abolished thanks to the efforts of everyday people starting grassroots movements. Nicholas says it's time to start another. "People want to help if they think they can make a difference," Nicholas says. "They get involved, and they just find it incredibly fulfilling and enriching for themselves. The truth is trying to help other people has a mixed record, but invariably you end up helping yourself."
>
> Find out how you can help girls like Pross from your living room. Visit our For All Women Registry and take action today (*Oprah*, 2009a).

The "For All Women Registry" included a variety of campaigns that dealt with different social issues. The indication here that "you can help girls like Pross from

---

[9] Since the *Newsweek* story broke (which exposed Somaly Mam's and Long Pross's stories as fabricated), many of the links from this website are no longer active.

your living room" juxtaposes the conditions of circumstances within developing countries and the viewer's/reader's conditions. Additionally, the message is one that suggests convenience ("from your living room") with a motivation of self-help ("The truth is trying to help other people has a mixed record, but invariably you end up helping yourself."). In essence, the emotion provoked when reading/hearing/viewing the particularly abhorrent circumstances of another can be put to charitable use *to help the reader/viewer*. In this way, the reader/viewer can enact the role of the hero or the rescuer:

> As Budd Boetticher has put it: 'What counts is what the heroine provokes, or rather what she represents. She is the one, or rather the love or fear she inspires in the hero, or else the concern he feels for her, who makes him act the way he does. In herself the woman has not the slightest importance' (Mulvey, 2009, p. 20).

This is evident in the way the individual trafficked person becomes invisible in the midst of anti-trafficking campaign efforts to bring awareness, prevent, combat the issue as well as help those affected. Further, it risks objectifying and even commodifying the trafficked person. For example, the "Save a Slave" campaign illustrates this concept (*Oprah*, 2009b). Specifically, it offered several donation options for web browsers to select including:

> $10 for psychological counselling
>
> $20 for adult education
>
> $30 for medical exams and HIV testing
>
> $30 to keep women safe
>
> $40 for skills training
>
> $250 for legal protection

It is the title of this campaign and the implications of the descriptions and actions which suggest commodification. To begin, the rhyming title "Save a Slave," while alliterative and memorable, is arguably problematic. The assumption within this title is that the viewer has the power to "Save a Slave" through the donation options on

the website. The commodification of charitable giving is controversial (Phu, 2010). There is a risk in making a product out of a person's exploitation and predicament. This risk holds the inherent possibility of resulting in objectification masked as a compassionate deed. Additionally, the process of donating a relatively small amount through the website towards someone's rehabilitation from particularly abhorrent circumstances develops a subtle hierarchy. Such a hierarchy reflects an ideological superiority complex that we, as the readers/viewers, are the saviours of those in need (Bruckner, 1983). We are powerful and can choose to help someone; a slave is helpless and cannot choose for anyone, especially themselves. The readers/viewers are vested with autonomy and agency, while those within the representations are projected as powerless and lacking agency.

The phrase "Save a Slave" also lacks a personal connection. Through the use of general terms and categories, it is possible to remain distant from the very humanity behind the "slaves" the campaign is trying to save. Perhaps the benefit is primarily for the viewers: the viewer must decide whether to take action, delay action, or perhaps do nothing. If action is taken, the viewer can click on an item, purchase a donation for as little as $10 and potentially feel better. They do not have to connect to the holistic humanity of the individuals who are categorised as "slaves". Bruckner (1986, p. 45) writes about this through the use of television, but conceptually it can be applied to stories accessed through the Internet:

> …the media has brought trouble to the center of our serenity; but it
> dilutes it, just as it aroused it. By bringing other peoples into our homes,
> it offers the illusory reflection of a common humanity with our
> neighbor. The reflection accuses us, but we are not harmed by threats
> made by a spectre. The television screen makes a display when it
> purports to communicate, and in this way the rest of the world penetrates
> our lives without doing any damage.

By being at a distance from the viewer's reality, the person who is purportedly helped from the donation is already objectified. Those who are helped are no more

human to the viewer than the electronic device which helped them to access the story. How can they be? The "slaves" are represented by charitable dollar signs, figures, and brief stories; they disappear as soon the viewer closes the browsing window. The people portrayed remain only, to use Bruckner's terminology, "a spectre."

6.4: Conclusion

Within reporting on TIP, narratives which include severe cases of exploitation are a focal point (Doezema, 2005). Representations which include explicit details of the physical and sexual violence conducted against the (female) trafficked body are objectifying. Further, the reader's gaze which privileges a heterosexual male point of view that in ways is arguably voyeuristic.

Additionally, the reader was identified as "a third party" whose involvement in the issue not only risks objectifying the trafficked person but also risks commodifying their experience of suffering. As Soderlund (2005, p. 78) writes, "Such narratives necessitate the introduction of a third party that not only witnesses but takes decisive action to end the sex slave's suffering and restore moral order to the world". In this chapter, the reader was identified as contributing to the objectification of the trafficked person through the concept of the reader's gaze. Further, one implication of "decisive action" is the commodification of trafficked persons' (particularly abhorrent) experiences through charitable giving.

Chapter Seven will explore implications and potential applications of the research findings identified in this thesis. Limitations and possible directions for future research will also be discussed.

Chapter Seven: Conclusions

7.1: Introduction

This thesis aimed to explore representations of the issue of TIP, trafficked persons, and traffickers within UK national newspapers. This was achieved through thematic analysis. Thematic analysis identified several key themes which were discussed in Chapters Three through Six. Specifically, Chapter Three identified representations which constructed the issue as a form of modern day slavery, as particularly abhorrent and as pervasive in incidence and location. Chapter Four identified issues of agency and powerlessness in representations of trafficked persons. Chapter Five found evidence of xenophobic representations of traffickers, particularly in the portrayals of internal trafficking with Pakistani perpetrators. Chapter Six explored the ways in which the portrayals objectified trafficked persons through the reader's gaze, and further discussed a wider implication of this through the commodification of trafficked persons' experiences through charitable giving. As previously discussed, the media contributes to the construction of social issues and is influential in shaping public perceptions and political discourse (Ahmad, 2016; Surette, 2011; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016). These findings suggest problematic portrayals of the issue of TIP, trafficked persons and traffickers. Overall, the representations were found to simplify the complexities and varied circumstances of trafficked persons and traffickers. Without more complex representations, simplified versions of the issue and circumstances of trafficked persons risks implementing ineffective policies as well as developing intervention and rehabilitation programmes that risk missing many of the people who should qualify for them and would benefit from their services.

This final chapter will first identify limitations of the study. Then, based on the research findings, this chapter will discuss several ways in which media representations and government policies could better address the issue of TIP.

7.2: Limitations and Possible Directions for Future Research

All research has limitations, and this thesis is no exception. Thematic analysis provided the appropriate tools for an initial exploration into the way in which TIP was represented and constructed within UK national newspapers. As newspapers are one form of media representations, future research would benefit from identifying the way TIP is represented in other forms such as fictionalized accounts (i.e. films/television series, novels), non-fiction popular literature (i.e. *Half the Sky*), anti-trafficking campaigns, documentaries and other relevant mediums. This would offer a more diverse spectrum of media representations and provide a greater understanding of the assumptions underlying portrayals of TIP.

Secondly, as the media has been argued to influence the public perception of a social issue (Ahmad, 2016; Wilson and O'Brien, 2016), future research would benefit from investigating public responses to media representations of TIP. While my aims centred on the representations as they occurred within newspaper articles, analysing responses of readers/viewers to media portrayals of TIP would add greater insights into the public perception of the issue and public responses to the media's representations of the issue.

Thirdly, an analysis of the ways in which representations of TIP within the media have occurred over time would also add to our understanding of the construction of the issue. For the purposes of this research, a more recent time period (at the time of data collection) was deemed appropriate for the aims of this research in analysing representations of TIP within UK national newspapers. However, this does not allow for a comparison of representations as they have occurred in different time periods

(i.e. before the Palermo Protocol, right after the Palermo Protocol). Ways in which depictions have changed and/or remained consistent would help to situate representations of the issue in a historical context.

7.3: Implications and Potential Applications of the Research Findings

TIP is a current issue in today's society that needs to be addressed more effectively. While there are characteristics that are reminiscent of what could be labelled a "moral panic", ending the discussion at this point would be overly simplistic. People *are* being exploited. People *are* being trafficked over borders and within borders for the purposes of exploitation. However, the representations of disempowered, naïve and vulnerable trafficked persons as the 'ideal victims' need to be expanded to include a more diverse depiction of trafficked persons' complex realities and situations. Additionally, traffickers need to be portrayed in a more representative light: xenophobic and Islamophobic representations do harm and risk scapegoating particular ethnicities. Further, these specific representations overlook the many traffickers who are not ethnic minorities and claims about cultural heritage and the propensity to commit trafficking offences neglect the root causes that contribute to TIP.

In order to better address the issue of TIP, there are several key areas where change must occur. First, we must revisit how TIP is defined and attempt to bring greater clarity. Second, we must stop assessing the gravity of the issue through quantification, particularly due to the difficulties in estimating its size. Third, we must move away from a victim-centred approach, including the way in which trafficked persons' bodies become objectified and commodified within the reader's gaze. Fourth, the depiction of traffickers must move away from xenophobic and Islamophobic representations. Finally, more work must be done to recognise the underlying structural issues that contribute to the issue of TIP.

These will be discussed in the following sections.

7.3.1: Revisiting how TIP is defined

The inclusiveness of the Palermo Protocol definition has been a starting point which has helped to clarify and determine what constitutes TIP, and yet revisiting the definition could potentially help clarify the parameters of TIP and lessen ambiguity. As previously mentioned in Chapter One, the Palermo Protocol does not define terms such as "exploitation" or "coercion". Clarifying what is meant by these terms would aid in the precision of what constitutes TIP, and could therefore also aid in more effectively identifying trafficked persons.

Furthermore, the definition of TIP needs to be universalised across agencies and organisations. Newspapers, other forms of media, NGOs, government agencies need to work to achieve a consistent conceptualization of what TIP is, what it means to be trafficked and what it means to be a trafficker. This would allow cohesiveness in efforts to help those who are exploited and work to prevent TIP from occurring. Further, anti-trafficking discourse needs to move beyond the simplistic portrayals of innocent/guilty and good/evil depictions of trafficked persons/traffickers to more fully represent the many complexities involved in individual narratives. One possible way to achieve this is through the development of a typology of TIP offences against which trafficking activities could be monitored and identified. Within this typology the use of a diverse spectrum of anecdotes could provide examples of the many varied lived experiences of trafficked persons and traffickers.

In essence, simplistic portrayals of trafficked persons and traffickers within the media and anti-trafficking literature must expand beyond the good versus evil dichotomy. As Anderson and Andrijasevic (2008, p. 137) write:

> Media, policy and research on trafficking have for the most part focused
> exclusively on sex work, and trafficking is commonly associated with

'sexual slavery' and organised crime. Journalists, politicians and scholars are quick to depict migrant women in the sex industry as victims of abuse and violence, and traffickers as Mafia-like individuals and/or organisations that enslave women in prostitution. This helps to install the image of trafficking within a simplistic and stereotyped binary of duped/innocent victim (foreign women) and evil traffickers (usually foreign men). Trafficking appears as an activity that takes place outside any social framework: it is criminal individuals that are responsible.

Additionally, academic literature recognises that many persons who have been trafficked do *not* fit the popular portrayals of disempowered/naïve/desperate, but rather exercise varying degrees of agency over their decisions (Agustin, 2005; Agustin, 2007; Andrijasevic, 2010; Doezema, 2010; Hoyle et al., 2011; Mai, 2009). Agustin (2003b, p. 84) makes this point in the following:

> All over the world, now, "trafficking for sexual exploitation" is major cause for denunciation. The point is not to deny that "trafficking" exists, far from it; rather, it is to say that the worst kind of "trafficking" happens to a minority of people and there is no single truth for all migrant women, whether they work in the sex industry or not, as there is none for all migrants in general. While we confront the possibilities for abuse and exploitation in this world, we need to keep our hands and be able to confront as well a wide variety of ambiguous situations where clear-cut good and evil do not exist.

The UN definition of TIP has been identified as ambiguous by academics, and this has been recognised as partly due to the controversy which surrounded the development of the Palermo Protocol (Gallagher, 2001; Saunders and Soderlund, 2003). The reason for this ambiguity was to allow individual states room to apply the definition according to the way they interpret it, however, these areas which are open to interpretation are, as Gallagher (2001, p. 995) notes, "at least partly ameliorated by a provision that the application and interpretation of measure pursuant to the protocol: 'shall be consistent with internationally recognized

principles of non-discrimination'". However, based on the findings of this research, which identified misrepresentations of terminology and simplified presentations of the definition, I would argue that the Palermo Protocol needs to clearly establish more parameters of what constitutes TIP. It would be beneficial to expand on the transnational organized crime framework in which TIP was defined in the Palermo Protocol. Particularly, the Council of Europe worked to establish TIP within a human rights framework, and it would be beneficial for the UN to adopt this approach, especially considering its position of influence within the international community. Specifically, the definition of TIP would gain clarity if the UN determined what is meant by "exploitation" as it is used in the Palermo Protocol.

Additionally, minimizing the way in which TIP is represented through empirically unreliable statistics and numbers is essential in working to address the issue. This is discussed next.

7.3.2: Stop Quantifying the Issue

Statistics dehumanise the experiences of trafficked persons. In many ways, statistics of TIP risk objectifying the diverse circumstances of trafficked persons in that the individuals represented disappear through the act of being combined into one larger number or percentage. Vast numerical (and highly variably) claims regarding the scope of the issue arguably disservices the many unique and complex lived experiences of trafficked persons.

Claims have been made that globally anywhere from 800,000 to 27 million people are trafficked on an annual basis but the reasons are often generalised in a simple way. For example on Anti-Slavery International's website (n.d., para. 7), a brief description answering "how does trafficking work" reads as follows:

> The vast majority or [sic] people who are trafficked are migrant
> workers. They are seeking to escape poverty and discrimination,

improve their lives and send money back to their families. They hear about well-paying jobs abroad through family, friends or "recruitment agencies". But when they arrive in the country of destination they find that the work they were promised does not exist and they are forced instead to work in jobs or conditions to which they did not agree.

When an issue is over-generalised, the diverse experiences of the individuals represented by these numbers become invisible, and therefore, dehumanised. Representations of TIP must account for the myriad of personal stories of trafficked persons and be able to distinguish what the numerical representations of the statistics represent (and how they were configured). While the stories are bound to bear similarities in themes, combining vast numerical representations with narrow generalisations of trafficked persons' narratives runs the risk of objectifying trafficked persons.

Rather than over-emphasizing the size of the issue, we need to focus on the trafficked persons who have been identified and the traffickers who are being prosecuted. Developing systems to address the "true scale" of TIP will most likely waste resources that would be better suited to serve the identified victims and prosecute the identified traffickers. Further, Segrave et al. (2009, p. xvii) recognised that anti-trafficking efforts must expand to include helping trafficked persons beyond removing them from trafficked circumstances and also analyse the way in which governments and other systemic factors contribute to the issue, specifically through policies which "prohibit women's mobility, their agency and their potential".

Further, representing TIP as a number/statistic without a discussion as to how it was calculated is problematic. On this, Anderson (2007) argues that between the issues of trafficking and smuggling (which are at times difficult to distinguish from each other) there is a continuum of experiences. Anderson (2007, p. 11) writes, "Ideas about the precise point on this continuum at which tolerable forms of labour migration end and trafficking begins will vary according to our political and moral

values." This is seen in the representations within the data-set: trafficked persons re-trafficked into the UK or "rescued" by the Poppy Project as they awaited deportation (See for example Extract 30: *The Guardian's* article on Katya, 19 April 2011, referenced in Chapter Six, pp. 250-251). In these cases, the persons who endured exploitation and trafficking were overlooked: their circumstances were determined by authorities to not fit the definition of trafficking, and they were labelled illegal immigrants and deported. Authorities must be able to identify trafficked persons more efficiently and successfully than is currently occurring. Additionally, western cultures must also move away from a "rescuer" ideology in anti-trafficking efforts. This will be briefly discussed in the next section.

7.3.3: Problematic assumptions within Rescuer Ideology

The image of rescuers raiding brothels and freeing enslaved women is a popular one in western culture (Soderlund, 2005). In the UK, the brothel raids as part of the police mission Operation Pentameter 2 illustrates "rescuer" ideology. As mentioned in Chapter One (section 1.4.4), the results of the raids were misrepresented in portrayals of the scope of TIP. Similarly, Soderlund (2005) writes about the organization International Justice Mission and their raid on a Cambodian brothel in an attempt to free the sex workers (who were portrayed as trafficked/enslaved). It was reported that 37 sex workers were freed from the brothel, and yet approximately 40 percent eventually returned to the same brothel to continue working. Soderlund also notes that the conditions in which the raid took place mirrored that of a criminal arrest.

Peach (2005) suggests there is a danger in carrying our own cultural ideologies into ones that differ. Her article further suggests that anti-trafficking discourse is severely deficient in varied religious approaches, noting that the predominant lens to view the issue is through western Christianity. This can be problematic when dealing with reasons why women may choose to migrate for the purposes of selling sex and choose to stay in exploitative conditions.

Additionally, Agustin (2007, p. 176) claims that rescuers take the centre stage, and often launch into "helping" without taking into account the opinions of those they seek to help, "…when [migrants, street children or sex workers] own words are not taken into account, helpers (including theorists) become ventriloquists occupying the main stage while the helped sit mutely in the wings". The voices of the "rescued" can be overlooked by those who are compelled to do the "rescuing."

One critical way to do this is to move beyond the victim-centred approach within anti-trafficking efforts. This will be discussed in the following section.

7.3.4: Moving away from a Victim-Centred Lens

It is essential that anti-trafficking efforts move away from a victim-centred approach to TIP. By primarily focusing on the situations, decisions and circumstances of the trafficked person the perpetrator moves to the background. Additionally, when attention is given to those responsible for trafficking persons, the focus easily turns to the organised criminal groups involved, which still leaves the individual perpetrators as invisible. Secondly, in regards to *who* is trafficking others, as discussed in Chapter Five, attributes such as ethnicity are highlighted and discussed as contributing factors to the trafficking of British (white) girls. This is also arguably a victim-centred approach as the main concern stems from the sexual exploitation of British (white) girls while focusing the blame on ethnic minority perpetrators.

Additionally, the victim-centred approach is also concerned with issues of immigration. In this way, the victim-centred approach concentrates on the intimate details of a trafficked person's scenario, and within the representation of their scenario makes a case for whether or not the trafficked person is a "true victim". This is an especially difficult case to make when the trafficked person is an undocumented migrant, as Srikantiah (2007, p. 205) argues:

The cultural discourse about trafficking victims is further shaped by existing stereotypes of undocumented migrants. Imperfect trafficking victims who fail to meet the restrictive legal (and cultural) definition are not only non-victims, but they are placed in the category of "illegal aliens." They are stereotyped as dangerous criminals who manipulate the law and drain…resources. These negative stereotypes influence the outer boundaries of the nascent cultural definition of trafficking victim, just as they shape the legal boundary between trafficking victim and undocumented migrant.

We must work to change the "true" victim-centred approach. However, this does not mean that we must deny that coercive and exploitative circumstances are prevalent within migrant workers' and citizens' experiences. Rather, it suggests that we must move beyond representing the issue from the perspective of select trafficked persons circumstances (which are often wrought with specific details of violence, abuse and sexual exploitation as shown in Chapters Four and Six), which was argued objectifies the trafficked persons.

Again, this does not mean that it is necessary to deny the highly exploitative circumstances of some trafficked persons. Weitzer (2007b, p. 467) writes on this in the context of sex work/trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation, however, the argument applies in the broader context of the overarching issue of TIP:

What is largely missing from crusade discourse is attention to the root causes of migration, such as poverty and barriers to women's employment in the Third World and Eastern Europe. Crusade leaders occasionally mention structural factors, but this has been overshadowed by the dominant moral discourse and by a focus on individuals and their immediate circumstances.

The "root causes of migration" are also largely absent from the representations within the UK national newspapers of all forms of TIP. Rather, the focus is on the exploitation and abuse of individual trafficked persons which is then commonly

combined with large general statistics/numerical representations of the issue. An analysis of the global economic structures and inequalities prevalent within it are left unaddressed.

Rather than focusing on the details which represent the trafficked person as powerless and a victim of violence/abuse/exploitation, we must promote more representations of trafficked persons that recognise agency in their situations. In order to move away from the victim-centred approach prevalent in representations of TIP, it is essential to focus on the underlying structural causes of TIP.

A structural issue that must be addressed are the political and cultural concerns surrounding international migration, which Weitzer (2007b) recognised in the previous reference. This also contributes to the xenophobic and Islamophobic representations of the trafficker as explored in Chapter Five. The overlap between concerns surrounding immigration and the prevalence of concerns regarding TIP is addressed in the next section.

7.3.5: The Overlap between Concerns Regarding Immigration and Trafficking

There needs to be more recognition in discussions of TIP regarding the disjuncture between the desire for people to migrate to another area of the world and the restrictions which do not allow them to do so. Rather than isolating the issue of TIP from an immigrant's desire—and perhaps need—to seek economic opportunity beyond their country of origin, we must begin to discuss the role of western countries immigration policies and restrictions in the issue of exploitative outcomes for migrant workers. Indeed, research has linked strict immigration policies as contributing to migrant workers' vulnerabilities to being trafficked (Andrijasevic, 2007; Jordan, 2002). Additionally, research has indicated hostile interactions between trafficked persons and authorities who view them through the lens of illegal migration. Jobe (2010, p. 171) conducted 23 interviews with women who had been identified as trafficked into the UK:

Overwhelmingly in the women's accounts of how they perceived the
UK authorities, they believed the authorities viewed and treated them as
criminals. One of the women recalled being treated as a 'criminal' or as
a member of a 'group of animals' and another as 'some sort of terrorist.'
The language used by these women reflects their perception that the UK
authorities regard them as outside the norm, as alien, and even as
potentially dangerous. These perceptions reflect the tenuous position
that trafficked women occupy: it is only much later in their accounts that
the same women are recognized by the same authorities as trafficking
victims/survivors.

A more empathetic view of migrant workers and their reasons for immigration (as
well as a more relaxed approach to immigration control) will directly benefit
trafficked persons and others who are exploited through the process of migration.
Further, this will also help in working against the hierarchy of victimisation of
trafficked persons and enable them to receive equal treatment, protection and
benefits without needing to persuasively show to an unreasonable extent (i.e.
demonstrate extreme levels of abuse, coercion and exploitation) that they are a
trafficked person.

The way in which TIP is represented as a particularly significant, increasing, and
abhorrent issue (as explored in Chapter Three) arguably distracts attention away
from the structural issues which contribute to its existence. In essence, these are
characteristics which resemble that of a moral panic, and as Anderson and
Andrijasevic (2008, p. 135) write:

…the moral panic over trafficking is diverting attention from the
structural causes of the abuse of migrant workers. Concern becomes
focused on the evil wrongdoers rather than more systemic factors. In
particular it ignores the state's approach to migration and employment,
which effectively constructs groups of non-citizens who can be treated
as unequal with impunity.

In essence, the state must not shy away from considering its own contribution to enabling the existence of TIP. An initial step to achieve this would be to seriously examine the way in which strict immigration policies leave migrant workers more susceptible to being trafficking (Andrijasevic, 2007; Jordan, 2002).

If TIP is to be more effectively dealt with as an issue, anti-trafficking efforts must move beyond problematic assumptions underlying popular portrayals of the trafficker/trafficked person dichotomy. Rather, representations of TIP must begin to include the role of societal structures that enable the existence of exploitative practices, poverty and systemic disparity. Additionally, anti-trafficking efforts must transform simplistic depictions of trafficking narratives to include representations which resemble *the diverse spectrum* of trafficked persons' experiences.

Appendix A: A Complete List of Extracts from Data-set

Extract #	Date	Newspaper	Author(s)	Title of Article
1	5 January	The Times	A. Norfolk	Revealed: Conspiracy of Silence on UK Sex Gangs
2	5 January	The Times	A. Norfolk	'Some of these men have children the same age; they are bad apples'
3	6 January	The Sun	S. Taylor	How to spot if your child is victim of a sex gang; UK Trafficking Horror
4	6 January	The Times	A. Norfolk; R. Ford; G. Hurst	Calls for action on 'grotesque' sex gangs
5	7 January	The Guardian	C. Davies; K. McVeigh	Child sex traffic researchers warn of race stereotyping
6	11 January	The Times	A. Norfolk; S. de Bruxelles	Botched inquiry left sex gang free to abuse for years
7	12 January	The Sun	Not listed	Judge in Fagin rap
8	16 January	Sunday Sun	A. Hughes	We'll find the foreign crime lords
9	16 January	The Sunday Times	C. Scott	A chat with boys at the arcade – and the grooming has begun
10	17 January	The Guardian	A. Topping	Child sex trafficking in UK on the rise as

				predators target even younger victims
11	19 January	The Guardian	H. Carter	Sex-trafficking pair lured women to UK: Romanians forced into prostitution
12	22 January	The Times	A. Norfolk	Men 'used girls in exchange for drinks and phone credit'
13	6 February	The Observer	M. Townsend	'Target brothels or sex trafficking in UK will rise': Campaigners warn that the government's rejection of a European strategy sends the wrong signal
14	6 February	The Observer	M. Townsend	Kidnap, beating, rape: my story of sex slavery in UK
15	10 February	The Guardian	A. Topping	Yvette Cooper warns of sex trafficking at Olympics
16	10 February	The Sun	Not listed	'Smuggle girl' held
17	12 February	Daily Mail	S. Wright	I'm not bothered about stopping people trafficking just burglary
18	16 February	The Guardian	A. Gentleman	Women's refuge chief returns OBE in protest over cuts
19	23 February	The Sun	Not listed	Drowned 'trafficker'
20	12 March	The Sun	Not listed	Pair's sex trade rap

21	14 March	The Guardian	B. Briggs	Call for action on hidden scandal of child trafficking in Scotland
22	17 March	The Guardian	A. Fallon	Woman told to pay £25,000 to Tanzanian she kept as 'slave'
23	17 March	The Guardian	Press Association	Woman forced to work as slave awarded £25,000
24	17 March	The Times	Not listed	Woman who kept 'slave' must pay victim £25,000
25	24 March	The Sun	J. Johnson	'Pimp gangs smuggle in 70 hookers'
26	3 April	The Sunday Times	T. Rayment	Trafficked, raped, deported: story of a sex slave
27	12 April	The Guardian	P. Butler; A. Travis	Sex traffic charity loses out to Salvation Army: New contract 'will reduce funding by 60% per victim'
28	17 April	The Observer	M. Townsend	'These women saved us' – victims of sex trafficking in plea to save centre: The Poppy Project is the best hope for countless victims of sex trade in Britain
29	17 April	The Sunday Times	B. Freer	The children who don't make a sound
30	19 April	The Guardian	A. Gentleman	Special report: Katya's story: trafficked to the UK, sent home to torture

31	21 April	The Sun	Not listed	Slave ring smashed
32	9 May	The Guardian	A. Hill	Human trafficking: Salvation Army takes over UK care for victims
33	15 May	The Observer	M. Townsend	Fears for UK retreat over human trafficking as key staff are lost
34	15 May	The Observer	M. Townsend	Human trafficking policy in disarray: Cameron pledge put into question after exodus of Home Office experts
35	15 May	The Observer	M. Townsend	Lured to Britain, locked up and raped at £30 a time: Thousands of women are brought into the UK every year and forced into prostitution or slavery
36	18 May	The Guardian	R. Booth	Suspected member of child trafficking ring jailed for £800,000 benefits fraud
37	18 May	The Guardian	A. Topping	Special report: Minister issues child grooming warning: Children as young as 10 being trafficked in the UK
38	18 May	The Guardian	A. Topping	Special report: Young victims, predatory gangs and the charity that tries to pick up the pieces

39	21 May	The Guardian	M. Taylor	Met told to pay women for failing to investigate trafficking causes
40	21 May	The Times	Not listed	Met 'ignored' slaves
41	29 May	The Observer	M. Townsend	Trafficked children disappear from care system
42	29 May	The Observer	M. Townsend	Human Cargo
43	1 June	The Sun	Not listed	Sex slave 'stop' line
44	8 June	The Sun	Not listed	Brit FBI in gang war
45	8 June	The Sun	M. Philp	Police chief's fear for 200 child slaves
46	9 June	The Guardian	H. Carter	Eight charged over chid sex offences in Rochdale
47	12 June	The Observer	M. Townsend	Inquiry into UK 'slavery' opens
48	15 June	Daily Mail	C. Ellicott	'Sex gang groomed girls of 13'
49	15 June	The Guardian	H. Carter	Inquiry into sexual exploitation of young girls leads to 10 arrests
50	15 June	The Sun	A. Parker	White girls 'sold for sex by gang'
51	15 June	The Times	A. Norfolk	Young girls lured with drink were 'sold for sex'
52	16 June	Daily Mail	C. Ellicott	She thought he loved her but he pimped her out to workers in pubs and chip shops, court hears
53	16 June	The Guardian	R. Williams	Coalition 'betrays anti-slavery legacy' over domestic workers:

				Ministers refuse to ratify UN rules on exploitation
54	16 June	The Sun	Not listed	'Rape girl groomed by Asian sex gang'
55	20 June	The Times	R. Ford	Police 'must be more aware of grooming'
56	21 June	The Times	A. Norfolk	Restaurant and chip shop workers would queue up for sex when I was 16, says girl
57	22 June	Daily Mail	J. Narain	ASBO for Romanian boy who preyed on cashpoint customers
58	22 June	The Sun	Not listed	4 on sex trade rap
59	23 June	Daily Mail	R. Camber	Voodoo terror of teen girls brought to UK as sex slaves
60	23 June	The Times	L. Dixon	Teenage victims of Juju rituals 'trafficked for sex by caretaker'
61	24 June	The Sun	Not listed	'Sex ring 9' nicked
62	25 June	Daily Mail	S. Greenhill	Whistleblower exposes a quango's cynical lie about child labour in an English onion field
63	25 June	The Times	A. Norfolk	'No hiding place' call over child-sex gangs
64	28 June	The Guardian	E. MacAskill; C. Davies	How Britain fails to help abused staff in embassies
65	29 June	The Guardian	S. Laville	Study finds 2,000 child victims of sex exploitation

66	30 June	The Guardian	S. Laville	How abused teenager's story shone light on hidden world of exploitation
67	3 July	The Observer	M. Townsend	New trafficking laws 'will harm slavery victims'
68	3 July	The Observer	M. Townsend	From the dark heart of Ukraine's sex trade to the streets of Britain
69	4 July	The Guardian	R. Booth	Trafficking victims will not be treated as criminals, says CPS
70	8 July	The Sun	Not listed	Voodoo beast rap
71	8 July	The Times	L. Dixon	Trafficker is jailed over girls groomed for sex by witchcraft
72	15 July	The Sun	A. France	The house of horrors
73	15 July	The Sun	A. France; J. Coles	Fred & Rose Home is Vice Gang HQ
74	16 July	Daily Mail	S. Wright	Wests' murder house 'turned into a brothel'
75	16 July	The Guardian	R. Booth	Alleged sex traffickers 'operated vice ring from Fred West's home'
76	17 July	The Sunday Times	T. Rayment	Women's promises lure girls into sex slavery
77	20 July	The Sun	Not listed	Cop blitz on traffick
78	20 July	The Times	Not listed	'Sex traffickers' held
79	2 August	The Sun	Not listed	Scientist 'kept girl of 21 as a slave'

80	4 August	The Times	A. Norfolk	Teenager sobs as she is forced to read out sex abuse details
81	13 August	The Guardian	M. McFadyean	'I won't be destroyed by what the kids tell me'
82	20 August	The Sun	Not listed	16 in ice lorry
83	10 September	The Sun	A. McAnally	Sex pair in traffic rap first; Vice-cop victory
84	10 September	The Times	Scotland Staff	Pair admit sex trafficking offences
85	11 September	The Sunday Times	Not listed	Sex trafficking
86	12 September	Daily Mail	Not listed	Tougher rules make punishment easier
87	12 September	Daily Mail	C. Greenwood	Slaves held in horseboxes and kennels are freed after police swoop on gipsy site in dawn raid
88	12 September	The Guardian	M. Kennedy	The law on slavery
89	12 September	The Guardian	A. Topping	Targeted in homeless shelters, starved and beaten – 24 'slaves' found on Traveller site
90	12 September	The Times	F. Hamilton	British 'slaves' rescued from squalid travellers' site
91	13 September	The Times	F. Schlesinger; J. Simpson; L. Bannerman	Travellers 'kept 100 enslaved across UK

92	17 September	Daily Mail	P. Bracchi	Slavery 2011
93	17 September	The Sun	Not listed	Gypsy site 6 freed
94	24 September	The Sun	Not listed	11 on sex ring raps
95	24 September	The Times	J. Simpson; F. Schlesinger	British men trafficked abroad by slave gangs
96	24 September	The Times	J. Simpson; F. Schlesinger	It is serious organised crime. Abuse is part of the lifestyle
97	24 September	The Times	J. Simpson	'I didn't want to be there – but had no choice'
98	4 October	The Sun	Not listed	Empire of depravity
99	4 October	The Sun	R. McAulay	The £20K-a-week sex slave trader
100	4 October	The Times	Scotland Staff	Prostitution ring couple jailed for sex trafficking
101	14 October	Daily Mail	C. Greenwood	10,000 children are being sexually exploited
102	16 October	The Observer	M. Townsend	Anger at 'broken promise' over missing children
103	16 October	The Observer	M. Townsend	Child trafficking: Joy vanished into Britain's child-sex trade why aren't we looking for her?
104	16 October	The Sunday Times	Not listed	Gang abuse 'rife'

105	18 October	The Times	L. Dixon	'Children are now more valuable than drugs to traffickers'
106	18 October	The Times	Not listed	What can be done to stop it
107	19 October	The Guardian	R. Booth	Children lost from care in trafficking cases
108	2 November	The Times	Not listed	'Snakehead' trafficking
109	2 November	The Times	A. Asthana; S. Kishtwari	Chinese staff in restaurants 'gang victims'
110	3 November	The Sun	Not listed	Benefits' £2m con
111	6 November	The Observer	J. Doward	Lured into a life of slavery: the misery of one Lithuanian's 'new future' in London
112	20 November	Sunday Sun	S. Doughty	Trafficked here to tend cannabis farm
113	20 November	The Sunday Times	S. Gadher	Security 'put at risk' by axeing visa interviews
114	22 November	The Sun	Not listed	Child sex gang war
115	23 November	The Guardian	A. Topping	Action plan targets legal reforms to stop sex abusers going unpunished
116	24 November	The Times	R. Bennett	End denial over grooming, says minister
117	28 November	The Guardian	S. Carrell	Trafficked people being treated as criminals by officials, inquiry says

118	28 November	The Sun	S. Houston	Secret shame of 700 sex slaves; shock truth of human trafficking is uncovered
119	28 November	The Sun	Not listed	Pair locked up for vile trade
120	28 November	The Times	M. Wade	Scotland urged to lead way in curb on human trafficking
121	10 December	The Times	B.T. Davies	Helping the police

Appendix B: Numerical Representations of Trafficked Persons in the Data-set

Extract #	Newspaper	Numerical Figures (emphasis added)	Source cited
9	The Sunday Times	"**3,000 boys and girls**, some as young as eight" sexually exploited (para. 9)	Barnardo's services around the UK
10	The Guardian	"**1,098 children**...groomed for sex" (para. 7)	Barnardo's Report: Puppet on a String
14	The Observer	"In the UK, police found evidence that **at least 400 women** from eastern Europe have been trafficked...But campaigners say the true number runs into the thousands." (para. 26)	Association of Chief Police Officers (ACPO)
21	The Guardian	"**At least 80 children** have been trafficked to Scotland" (para. 1)	Report by Scotland Commissioner for Children and Young People
26	The Sunday Times	"**30,000 women work as prostitutes** in **6,000 brothels**...Of these, **17,000 are migrants** and **2,600 of them are trafficked**, with half coming from China. The Human Trafficking Foundation says **the true number could be 20,000**" (para. 35-36)	ACPO research (conducted in August 2010) and the Human Trafficking Foundation

26	The Sunday Times	"**800,000 people** a year are trafficked worldwide...One in eight is in Europe." (para. 37)	United Nations
28	The Observer	"**More than 700**" women trafficked into the UK and received help from the Poppy Project since 2003 (para. 7)	The Poppy Project
29	The Sunday Times	"**around 287**" children trafficked into the UK each year (para. 6)	Home Office
29	The Sunday Times	"**546 cases**" of child trafficking dealt with by Child Trafficking Advice and Information Line (CTAIL) since 2007 (para. 6)	Mandy John-Baptiste, manager of CTAIL
29	The Sunday Times	"**1,012 children**...largely from Eastern Europe" trafficked into UK and identified in Westminster in 2010 (para. 7)	Anthony Steen MP, Chairman of Human Trafficking Foundation
29	The Sunday Times	"**at least 2,600** prostitutes in brothels in England and Wales who have been trafficked from abroad" (para. 24)	ACPO
35	The Observer	"**up to 11,800 women** may have been trafficked into England and Wales" (para. 22)	Operation Acumen
35	The Observer	"**at least 10,000 slaves** in the UK" (para. 22)	Peter Bone, Tory chair for all-party parliamentary group for TIP
35	The Observer	"Operation Acumen...identified **2,600 migrant women** who had been trafficked"; "**9,200 vulnerable women** who might	Operation Acumen and Timothy Brain, former chief constable

		include trafficking victims. Some senior figures, including former chief constable Timothy Brain, believe the combined total of **11,800 constitutes an accurate estimate of trafficked women**." (para. 30)	
41	The Observer	"Collated figures from the NSPCC...showed they had dealt with **549 trafficked children** in the past three-and-a-half years" (para. 3)	NSPCC
41	The Observer	"during the year to April [the NSPCC] child trafficking helpline dealt with **146 cases alone**, although experts say this is merely a fragment of the true picture." (para. 10)	NSPCC
42	The Observer	"the **thousands of victims of child trafficking** in our towns and cities" (para. 1)	The source of this statistic is unclear.
42	The Observer	"Of the statistics that do exist, most corroborate claims that **at least half of all trafficked youngsters** in state care disappear. Of **80 children** identified as trafficked over an 18-month period in northern England, **56% went missing**, according to one study" (para. 15)	Unspecified study

42	The Observer	"An **estimated 1.2 million children** are trafficked worldwide each year" (para. 27)	UN Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN GIFT)
45	The Sun	"**at least 249 kids** had been trafficked [to Scotland] in the past two years" (para. 8)	"a survey" mentioned by Tam Baillie, Children's Commissioner in Scotland
47	The Observer	"Between April 2009 and March last year, **706 potential victims of slavery** were formally identified in the UK. **Up to 18,000 women and children** are also believed to have been trafficked into the UK and forced to work as prostitutes" (para. 5).	The source of this statistic is unclear.
64	The Guardian	"**19 recent cases of alleged trafficking** of domestic workers by diplomats in London" (para. 9)	Kalayaan (NGO)
64	The Guardian	"It is **estimated 3.8% of diplomatic domestic workers in the UK** are trafficked, compared with 0.2% of migrant domestic workers in private households" (para. 17)	The source of this statistic is unclear
65	The Guardian	"**more than 2,000 young people**...have been raped, prostituted and internally trafficked" (para. 1)	Child Exploitation and Online Protection Centre (CEOP)

68	The Observer	"**up to 800,000 human beings** continue to be traded across borders" (para. 3)	U.S. TIP Report (2011)
69	The Guardian	"**181 children** [trafficked] into the UK for begging and theft" (para. 10)	Operation Golf (UK police)
76	The Sunday Times	"17,000 migrant women in the sex industry in England and Wales, of whom **12,200 show signs of trafficking**" (para. 18)	ACPO
92	Daily Mail	"Between April 2009 and March 20011 [sic], **nearly 1,500 people** were working as slaves in the country" (para. 17)	UKHTC
95	The Times	"...evidence of **213 people** being trafficked into, out of and within the UK by gangs between 2007 and early 2010. More than half were British." (para. 6)	UKHTC (SOCA and ACPO)
101	Daily Mail	"...**more than 1,000 children**...have been groomed, abused and trafficked for money, and the problem is growing" (para. 17)	Barnardo's
102	The Observer	"During the two years before March this year **895 cases of trafficked workers** were reported to the authorities" (para. 18)	The source of this statistic is unclear.
105	The Times	"**1.2m children** are estimated to be trafficked every year worldwide" (para. 21)	The source of this statistic is unclear.

106	The Times	"...**around 300 to 400 child-trafficking** victims in the UK each year" (para. 10).	Home Office
107	The Guardian	"**Some 202 suspected child trafficking victims** were referred to the Home Office centre and through the NSPCC up to 15 September this year. It suggests **an annual rate of 285 compared with 195** in the year to April 2011" (para. 6).	Home Office and NSPCC
110	The Sun	"The crooks brought **at least 230 victims** to London from Poland with a promise of work" (para. 2)	The source of this statistic is unclear.
118	The Sun	"...**as many as 700 children and women sex slaves** imprisoned in flats across the country" (para. 3)	Baroness Helena Kennedy, head of 18-month investigation of TIP in Scotland

Bibliography

ABC. (2012). *What we do*. [Online]. ABC. Available at: http://www.abc.org.uk/About-us/What-we-do/ [Accessed 15 July 2012].

Agustin, L. (2002). Challenging 'place': leaving home for sex. *Development*, 45(1), pp. 110-117.

Agustin, L. (2003a). Forget victimization: granting agency to migrants. *Development*, 46(3), pp. 30-36.

Agustin, L. (2003b). Sex, gender and migrations: facing up to ambiguous realities. *Soundings*, 23, pp. 84-98.

Agustin, L. (2005). Migrants in the mistress's house: other voices in the "trafficking" debate. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society*, 12(1), pp. 96-117.

Agustin, L. (2007). *Sex at the margins*. London: Zed Books.

Ahmad, M. I. (2016). The magical realism of body counts: how media credulity and flawed statistics sustain a controversial policy. *Journalism*, 17(1), pp. 18-34.

Alexander, C. (2008). Introduction to *the Asian gang*. In B. Spalek, (Ed.). *Ethnicity and crime: a reader*. Readings in Criminology and Criminal Justice series. Maidenhead: Open University Press, pp. 158-180.

Ali, A.K.M.M. (2005). Treading along a treacherous trail: research on trafficking in persons in South Asia. In F. Laczko and E. Gozdziak, (Eds.). *Data and research on human trafficking: a global survey* [Online]. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, pp. 141-164. Available at: http://-www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/IOM_Data_Research_Human_Trafficking.pdf#page=233 [Accessed 5 April 2011].

Allain, J. and Bales, K. (2012). *Slavery and its definition*. [Online]. Queen's University Belfast Law Research Paper No. 12-06. *Global Dialogue*, 14(2), pp. 1-15. Available at: http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2123155 [Accessed 13 January 2016].

Allen, G. (2003). *Roland Barthes*. London: Routledge.

Alpes., M.J. (2010). Escaping statism: from the paradigm of trafficking to the migration trajectories of West African sex workers in Paris. In T. Zheng, (Ed.). *Sex trafficking, human rights and social justice*. Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 117-133.

Alvarez, M.B. and Alessi, E.J. (2012). Human trafficking is more than sex trafficking and prostitution: implications for social work. *Affilia*, 27(2), pp. 142-152.

Anderson, B. (2007). *Motherhood, apple pie and slavery: reflections on trafficking debates*. [Online]. Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, working paper no. 48. Oxford: COMPAS. Available at: https://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/fileadmin/files/Publications/working_papers/WP_200 7/Bridget%20Anderson%20WP0748.pdf [Accessed 10 December 2010].

Anderson, B. and Andrijasevic, R. (2008). Sex, slaves and citizens: the politics of anti-trafficking. *Soundings*, (40), pp. 135–145.

Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J. (2002). Trafficking—a demand led problem? A multi-country pilot study. [Online]. Sweden: Save the Children. Available at: http://gaatw.org/publications/The%20Demand%20Side%20part1.pdf [Accessed 7 January 2011].

Andrees, B. and van der Linden, M.N.J. (2005). Designing trafficking research from a labour market perspective: the ILO experience. In F. Laczko and E. Gozdziak, (Eds.). *Data and research on human trafficking: a global survey* [Online]. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, pp. 55-74. Available at: http://- www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/IOM_Data_Research_Human_Traf ficking.pdf#page=233 [Accessed 5 April 2011].

Andrijasevic, R. (2010). *Migration, agency and citizenship in sex trafficking*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Andrijasevic, R. and Anderson, B. (2009). Anti-trafficking campaigns: decent? honest? truthful? *Feminist Review*, 92(1), pp. 151-155.

Ang, I. (2001). *On not speaking Chinese: living between Asia and the West*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Anti-Slavery International. (n.d.). *Human trafficking*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.antislavery.org/english/slavery_today/trafficking.aspx [Accessed 28 March 2012]

Arocha, L. (2010). Theoretical persepectives on understanding slavery: past and present challenges. In G. Wylie and P. McRedmond, (Eds.). *Human trafficking in Europe: character, causes and consequences*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 30-40.

Aronowitz, A. A. (2001). Smuggling and trafficking in human beings: the phenomenon, the markets that drive it and the organisations that promote it. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research,* 9(2), pp. 163-195.

Aronowitz, A. A. (2004). Victimization of trafficked persons and illegal migrants. *International Review of Victimology*, 11, pp. 11-32.

Aronowitz, A. A. (2009). *Human trafficking, human misery: the global trade in human beings*. Global Crime and Justice series. London: Praeger Publishers.

Association of Chief Police Officers (2008). *Pentameter Facts and Figures*. [Online]. Police Oracle. Available at: http://www.policeoracle.com/news/Pentameter-Facts-and-Figures_16691.html [Accessed 7 September 2011].

Asylum and Immigration Act 2004. (2004). [Online]. UK Policy Governance Association. Available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2004/19/pdfs/ukpga_20040019_en.pdf [Accessed 11 January 2016].

Baker, P., Gabrielatos, C. & McEnery, T. (2013). *Discourse analysis and media attitudes: the representation of Islam in the British press*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bales, K. (2004). *Disposable people: new slavery in the global economy*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Barak, G. (1994). Media, society, and criminology. In G. Barak, (Ed.). *Media, process, and the social construction of crime: studies in newsmaking criminology*. Current Issues in Criminal Justice Series (Volume 10). New York: Garland Publishing, pp. 3-45.

Barker, J. (2013). 'Shock': the value of emotion. In D. Berry, (Ed.). *Ethics and media culture: practices and representations*. Burlington, MA: Focal Press, pp. 192-207.

Barry, K. (1979). *Female sexual slavery*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall.

Barthes, R. (1972). *Mythologies*. Translated by A. Lavers. New York: Hill and Wang.

Barron, M. and Kimmel, M. (2000). Sexual violence in three pornographic media: toward a sociological explanation. *The Journal of Sex Research*, 37(2), pp. 161-168.

Bastia, T. (2006). Stolen lives or lack of rights? Gender, migration and trafficking. *Labour, Capital and Society*, 39(2), pp. 20-47. Available at: http://lcs-tcs.com/PDFs/39_2/Bastia.pdf [Accessed 12 January 2016].

Batstone, D. (2007). *Not for sale: The return of the global slave trade—and how we can fight it*. New York: HarperOne.

Batsyukova, S. (2007). Prostitution and human trafficking for sexual exploitation. *Gender Issues,* 24(2), pp. 46-50.

BBC. (2011a). *Great Yarmouth sex slave trafficker jailed for 11 years*. [Online]. BBC Mobile News. Available at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-norfolk-14732841 [Accessed 12 February 2012].

BBC. (2011b). *Jack Straw's comments on abuse 'are true'*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-lancashire-12167131 [Accessed 12 February 2012].

BBC. (2011c). *Jack Straw criticised for 'easy meat' comments on abuse.* [Online]. Available at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-12142177 [Accessed 12 February 2012].

Best, J. (1997). Secondary claims-making: claims about threats to children on the network news. In G. Miller and J.A. Holstein, (Eds.). *Social problems in everyday life: studies of social problem work*. Greenwich, CT: JAI, pp. 73-96.

Best, J. (2012). *Damned lies and statistics: untangling numbers from the media, politicians and activists*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Bhaba, J. (2005). *Trafficking, smuggling, and human rights.* [Online]. Washington, D.C.: Migration Policy Institute. Available at: http://www.migrationinformation.org/feature/print.cfm?ID=294 [Accessed 1 June 2011].

Bindel, J. (2004). *Tracking the traffickers*. [Online]. The Guardian. Available at: http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/2004/aug/12/ukcrime.prisonsandprobation1 [Accessed 8 September 2011].

Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). *Transforming qualitative information: thematic analysis and code development*. London: Sage

Braun, V. and Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3, pp. 77-101.

Braun, V. and Clarke, V. (n.d.). *Frequently asked questions*. [Online]. The University of Auckland. Available at: https://www.psych.auckland.ac.nz/en/about/our-research/research-groups/thematic-analysis/frequently-asked-questions-8.html#816a503c25cc71ba992470e1e9217fd6 [Accessed 15 June 2015].

Brennan, D. (2005). Methodological challenges in research with trafficked persons. In F. Laczko and E. Gozdziak, (Eds.). *Data and research on human trafficking: a global survey.* [Online]. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, pp. 35-54. Available at: http://-www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/IOM_Data_Research_Human_Trafficking.pdf#page=233 [Accessed 5 April 2011].

Bridges, A.J. (2010). Methodological considerations in mapping pornography content. In K. Boyle, (Ed.). *Everyday pornography*. Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 34-49.

Brown, T. L. (2001). *Sex slaves : the trafficking of women in Asia*. London: Virago.

Bruckner, P. (1986). *Tears of the white man: compassion as contempt*. New York: Free Press.

Brysk, A. and Choi-Fitzpatrick, A. (Eds.). (2012). *From human trafficking to human rights: rethinking contemporary slavery*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Boyle, K. (Ed.). (2010). *Everyday pornography*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Buckley, M. (2009). Public opinion in Russia on the politics of human trafficking. *Europe-Asia Studies*, 61(2), pp. 213-248.

Bureau of Justice Statistics. (2011). *Human trafficking/trafficking in persons*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/cshti0810.pdf [Accessed 7 September 2011].

Burgess, A. W. and Crowell, N. A. (1996). *Understanding violence against women*. Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press.

Burr, V. (2003). *Social constructionism*. 2nd ed. Abingdon: Routledge.

Carroll, C. E. and Deephouse, D. L. (2014). The foundations of a theory explaining organizational news: the VT^4 framework of organizational news content and five levels of influence on its production. In J. Pallas, L. Strannegard, and S. Jonsson, (Eds.). *Organizations and the media: organizing in a mediatized world*. Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 81-95.

Chancer, L. (1993). Prostitution, feminist theory, and ambivalence. *Social Text.* 37, pp. 143-171.

Chapkis, W. (2003). Trafficking, migration, and the law : protecting innocents, punishing immigrants. *Gender and Society,* 17(6), pp. 923-937.

Chase, E. and Statham, J. (2005). Commercial sexual exploitation of children and young people in the UK—a review. *Child Abuse Review*, 14(4), pp. 4-25.

Choi-Fitzpatrick, A. (2012). Rethinking trafficking: contemporary slavery. In A. Choi-Fitzpatrick and A. Brysk, (Eds.). *From human trafficking to human rights: reframing contemporary slavery*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, pp. 13-24.

Choi-Fitzpatrick, A. (2016). The good, the bad, the ugly: human rights violators in comparative perspective. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 2(1), pp. 1-14.

Christie, N. (1986). The ideal victim. In E.A. Fattah, (Ed.). *From crime policy to victim policy: reorienting the justice system*. London: Macmillan Press, pp. 17-30.

Chuang, J. (1998). Redirecting the debate over trafficking in women: definitions, paradigms, and contexts. *Harvard Human Rights Journal,* 11, pp. 65-107.

Chuang, J. (2006). Beyond a snapshot: preventing human trafficking in the global economy. *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies,* 13(1), pp. 137-163.

Clarke, J. and Cochrane, A. (1998). The social construction of social problems. In E. Saraga, (Ed.). *Embodying the social: constuctions of difference*. Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 3-42.

Cockbain, E. (2013). Grooming and the 'Asian sex gang predator': the construction of a racial crime threat. *Race & Class*, 54(4), pp. 22-32.

Cockbain, E., Brayley, H. and Laycock, G. (2011). Exploring internal child sex trafficking networks using social network analysis. *Policing*, 5(2), pp. 144-157.

Cohen, S. (1972). *Folk devils and moral panics: the creation of the mods and rockers*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Cohen, S. (2002). *Folk devils and moral panics : the creation of the mods and rockers*. 3rd ed. Abingdon: Routledge.

Cohen, S. (2011). *Folk devils and moral panics: the creation of the mods and rockers*. 4th ed. Routledge Classics series. Abingdon: Routledge.

Cohen, S. and Young, J. (Eds.). (1973). *The manufacture of news: social problems, deviance and the mass media*. London: Constable.

Cole, A. M. (2007). *The cult of true victimhood: from the war on welfare to the war on terror*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.

College of Policing. (2015). *Major investigation and public protection: Modern Slavery Act 2015*. [Online]. College of Policing. Available at: https://www.app.college.police.uk/app-content/major-investigation-and-public-protection/modern-slavery/modern-slavery-act-2015/ [Accessed 24 January 2016].

Conboy, M. (2006). *Tabloid Britain*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Cooper, B. (2000). "Chick flicks" as feminist texts: the appropriation of the male gaze in Thelma & Louise. *Women's Studies in Communication*, 23(3), pp. 277-306.

Coroners and Justice Act 2009. (2009). [Online]. UK Policy Governance Association. Available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2009/25/pdfs/ukpga_20090025_en.pdf [Accessed 22 December 2015].

Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings. (2012). [Online]. Foreign and Commonwealth Offices. Available at: https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/2360 93/8414.pdf [Accessed 12 December 2015].

Critcher, C. (2008). Moral panic analysis: past, present and future. *Sociology Compass*, 2(4), pp. 1127-1144.

Crown Prosecution Services (CPS). (n.d.). *Human trafficking, smuggling and slavery*. [Online]. London: The Crown Prosecution Service. Available at: http://www.cps.gov.uk/legal/h_to_k/human_trafficking_and_smuggling/ [Accessed 12 December 2015].

Dammer, H. and Albanese, J. (2010). *Comparative criminal justice systems.* Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.

Deahl, R. (2015). *What is narrative journalism?* [Online]. Available at: http://mediacareers.about.com/od/glossary/g/narrative_journ.htm [Accessed 17 May 2015].

Davies, C. and McVeigh, K. (2011). *Child sex trafficking study sparks exaggerated racial stereotyping*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.guardian.co.uk/law/2011/jan/06/child-sex-trafficking-racial-stereotyping [Accessed 12 February 2012].

Demleitner, N. V. (2001). The law at a crossroads: the construction of migrant women trafficked into prostitution. In D. Kyle and R. Koslowski, (Eds.). *Global human smuggling: comparative perspectives*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, pp. 257-293.

Dessaix, A., Maag, A., McKenzie, J., and Currow, D. C. (2016). Factors influencing reductions in smoking among Australian adolescents. *Public Health Research and Practice*, 26(1), pp. 1-4.

Desyllas, M.C. (2007). A critique of the global trafficking discourse and U.S. policy. *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*, 34(4), pp. 57-79.

Dines, G. (2010). *Pornoland: how porn has hijacked our sexuality*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.

Ditmore, M. (2005). Trafficking in lives: how ideology shapes policy. In K. Kempadoo, J. Sanghera and B. Pattanaik, (Eds.). *Trafficking and prostitution reconsidered : new perspectives on migration, sex work, and human rights*. London: Paradigm Publishers, pp. 107-126.

Doezema, J. (1998). Forced to choose: beyond the voluntary v. forced prostitution dichotomy. In K. Kempadoo and J. Doezema, (Eds.). *Global sex workers: rights, resistance, and redefinition.* Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 34-50.

Doezema, J. (2000). 'Loose women or lost women? the re-emergence of the myth of white slavery in contemporary discourses of trafficking in women'. *Gender Issues,* 18(1), pp. 23-50.

Doezema, J. (2002). Who gets to choose? coercion, consent and the UN trafficking protocol. *Gender and Development*, 10(1), pp. 20-27.

Doezema, J. (2004). *Sex slaves and discourse masters: the historical construction of trafficking in women*. Institute of Development Studies. University of Sussex, Brighton. PhD thesis.

Doezema, J. (2005). Now you see her, now you don't: sex workers at the UN trafficking protocol negotiations. *Social & Legal Studies*, 14(1), pp. 61-89.

Doezema, J. (2010). *Sex slaves and discourse masters : the construction of trafficking*. London: Zed.

Doezema, J. (2011). Labelling the victims of sex trafficking: exploring the borderland between rhetoric and reality. *Social & Legal Studies*, 20, pp. 313-329.

Dottridge, M. (2003). *Deserving trust: issues of accountability for human rights NGOs*. [Online]. International Council on Human Rights Policy. Available at: http://www.hapinternational.org/pool/files/acct-hr-ngos.pdf [Accessed 12 January 2016].

Dugan, E. (2010). *Think slavery is a thing of the past? think again.* [Online]. The Independent. Available at: http://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-

news/think-slavery-is-a-thing-of-the-past-think-again-2108981.html [Accessed 7 September 2011].

Dunn, J. L. & Powell-Williams, M. (2007). "Everybody makes choices": victim advocates and the social construction of battered women's victimization and agency. *Violence against women*, 13(10), pp. 977-1001.

Duncan, M. C. (1994). The politics of women's body images and practices: Foucault, the panopticon and Shape magazine. *Journal of Sport & Social Issues*, 18(1), pp. 48-65.

Edwards, D. (2000). Extreme case formulations: softeners, investment, and doing nonliteral. *Research on Language and Social Interaction*, 33(4), pp. 347-373.

Elgamri, E. (2008). *Islam in the British broadsheets the impact of Orientalism on representations of Islam in the British press*. Ithaca, NY: Ithaca Press.

Entman, R. M. (2007). Framing bias: media in the distribution of power. *Journal of Communication*, 57(1), pp. 163-173.

Equality and Human Rights Commission. (2011). *Inquiry into human trafficking in Scotland: report of the equality and human rights commission*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/documents/Scotland/Human_Trafficking_in_Scotland_/inquiry_into_human_trafficking_in_scotland-full-report_pdf_.pdf [Accessed 3 March 2012].

Equality Human Rights Commission. (2016). *EHRC Scotland welcomes human trafficking and exploitation (Scotland) bill after commission inquiry*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/ehrc-scotland-welcomes-human-trafficking-and-exploitation-scotland-bill-after-commission-inquiry [Accessed 17 April 2016].

Etienne, B. (2007). Islam and violence. *History and Anthropology*, 18 (3), pp. 237-248.

European Commission. (2004). *First report on the implementation of the internal market strategy 2003-2006*. [Online]. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities. Available at: http://www.lu.lv/materiali/biblioteka/es/pilnieteksti/ekonomika/First%20Report%20on%20the%20implementation%20of%20the%20Internal%20Market%20Strategy.pdf [Accessed 17 May 2012].

Europol. (2011). *Trafficking in human beings in the European Union*. [Online]. Europol Knowledge Product File # 2565-84, The Hague. Available at: https://www.europol.europa.eu/content/publication/trafficking-human-beings-european-union-2011-1507 [Accessed 17 May 2012].

Eurostat. (2014). *Trafficking in human beings*. [Online]. Statistical working papers. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/trafficking_in_ human_beings_-_eurostat_-_2014_edition.pdf [Accessed 12 August 2015].

Evans, M. and Schuller, S. (2015). Representing "terrorism": the radicalisation of the May 2013 Woolwich attack in British press reportage. *Journal of Language Aggression and Conflict*, 3(1), pp. 128-150.

Fang, B. (2005). *Young lives for sale: why more underage kids are getting into the sex trade--and the how feds are fighting back*. [Online]. US News and World Report. Available at: http://www.usnews.com/usnews/news/articles /051024/24sextraffickers.htm [Accessed 7 September 2011].

Farley, M. (Ed.). (2003). *Prostitution, trafficking, and traumatic stress*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Farley, M. (2004). "Bad for the body, bad for the heart": prostitution harms women even if legalized or decriminalized. *Violence against Women*, 10(10), pp. 1087-1125.

Farley, M. (2006). Prostitution, trafficking and cultural amnesia: what we must *not know* in order to keep the business of sexual exploitation running smoothly. *Yale Journal of Law and Feminism,* 18, pp. 101-136.

Farley, M., Lewis Herman, J. and Stark, C. (2003). Prostitution, trafficking, and traumatic stress. *Journal of Trauma Practice,* 2(3/4), pp. 1-332.

Farr, K. (2005). *Sex trafficking : the global market in women and children*. Contemporary social issues series. New York: Worth Publishers.

Farrell, A. and Fahy, S (2009). The problem of human trafficking in the U.S.: public frames and policy responses. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 37, pp. 617-626.

Farzana, S. (2011). *The new folk devils: Muslim boys and education in England*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books Ltd.

Filler, D.M. (2003). Terrorism, panic, and pedophilia. *Virginia Journal of Social Policy & the Law*, 10(3), pp. 345-382.

Flückiger, K. (2006). *Xenophobia, media stereotyping, and their role in global insecurity*. [Online]. Geneva Centre for Security Policy: Program on the Geopolitical Implications of Globalization and Transnational Security, Geneva. Available at: https://www.academia.edu/3187179/Xenophobia_Media_Stereotyping_and_Their_ Role_in_Global_Insecurity [Accessed 12 July 2015].

Foronda, C. L. (2008). A concept analysis of cultural sensitivity. *Journal of Transcultural Nursing*, 19(3), pp. 207-212.

Fowler, R. (1991). *Language in the news*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Friedman, B. and Johnston, A., (2013). Blame narratives: news discourses of sex trafficking. In C. Armstrong, (Ed.). *Media Disparity: a gender battleground.* Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, pp. 177-190.

Gallagher, A. (2001). Human rights and the new UN protocols on trafficking and migrant smuggling: a preliminary analysis. *Human Rights Quarterly,* 23, pp. 975-1004.

Ghoul, S. E., Guedhami, O., Nash, R.C., and Patel, A. (2016). *New evidence on the role of the media in corporate social responsibility*. [Online]. Social Science Research Network. Available at: http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2712239 [Accessed 18 March 2016].

Givens, D. (2015). *Self-touch*. [Online]. Spokane, WA: Center for Nonverbal Communication. Available at: http://center-for-nonverbal-studies.org/selftouc.htm [Accessed 5 August 2015].

Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women. (2007). *Collateral damage: the impact of anti-trafficking measures on human rights around the world*. [Online]. Thailand: Amarin Printing & Publishing Public Company Limited. Available at: http://www.gaatw.org/Collateral%20Damage_Final/singlefile_CollateralDamagefinal.pdf [Accessed 27 May 2011].

Goode, E. and Ben-Yehuda, N. (1994). Moral panics: culture, politics, and social construction. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 20, pp. 149-171.

Goode, E. and Ben-Yehuda, N. (2011). Grounding and defending the sociology of moral panic. In S. P. Hier, (Ed.). *Moral panic and the politics of anxiety.* Abingdon: Routledge.

Goodey, J. (2008). Human trafficking: sketchy data and policy responses. *Criminology and Criminal Justice*, 8(4), pp. 421-442.

Gorham, B.W. (1999). Stereotypes in the media: so what? *The Howard Journal of Communication*, 10, pp. 229-247.

Gossett, J. L. and Byrne, S. (2002). "Click here": a content analysis of internet rape sites. *Gender & Society,* 16(5), pp. 689-709.

Greer, C. (2007). News media, victims and crime. In P. Davies, P. Francis, and C. Greer, (Eds.). *Victims, crime and society*. London: Sage, pp. 20-49.

Greer, C. and Jewkes, Y. (2005). Extremes of otherness: media images of social exclusion. *Social Justice*, 32(1), pp. 20-31.

Hall, S., Critcher, C., Jefferson, T., Clarke, J. and Roberts, B. (1978) *Policing the crisis: mugging, the state and law and order*. Critical Social Studies. London: The Macmillan Press.

Hall, S. (1997). *Representation: cultural representations and signifying practices*. London: Sage.

Hall, S. (2001). The spectacle of the other. In M. Wetherell, S. Taylor, and S.J. Yates, (Eds.). *Discourse theory and practice: a reader*. London: Sage, pp. 324-344.

Harcup, T. & O'Neill, D. (2001). What is news? Galtung and Ruge revisited. *Journalism Studies*, 2(2), pp. 261-280.

Hartmann, P., and Husband, C. (1974). *Racism and the mass media: a study of the role of the mass media in the formation of white beliefs and attitudes in Britain*. Totowa, NJ: Rowman & Littlefield.

Hayes, S., Carpenter, B. & Dwyer, A. (2012). *Sex, crime & morality*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Helbling, M. (2008). '*Islamophobia in Switzerland: a new phenomenon or a new name for xenophobia?*'[Online]. Chicago: Midwest Political Science Association. Available at: http://www.unil.ch/files/live/sites/issrc/files/shared/8._Telechargement/Colloque_de_Recherche/Helbling_2010_Islamophobia.pdf [Accessed 8 July 2015].

Helford, E. R. (2006). The Stepford wives and the gaze. *Feminist Media Studies*, 6(2), pp. 145-156.

Herzfeld, B. (2002). Slavery and gender women's double exploitation. *Gender and Development*, 10(1), pp. 50-55.

Hier, S. (Ed.). (2011). *Moral panic and the politics of anxiety*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Hoang, K. K. and Parrenas, R. S. (2014). *Human trafficking reconsidered: rethinking the problem, envisioning new solutions*. New York: iDebate Press.

Hodge, D. R. and Lietz, C. A. (2007). The international sexual trafficking of women and children: a review of the literature. *Affilia: Journal of Women and Social Work*, 22(2), pp. 163-174.

Holstein, J. A., & Miller, G. (1997). Rethinking victimization: an interactional approach to victimology. In G. Miller and J.A. Holstein, (Eds.). *Social problems in everyday life: studies of social problem work*. Greenwich, CT: JAI, pp. 25-47.

Hope for Justice. (n.d.). Trafficking and exploitation: what happens to victims? [Online]. Available at: http://hopeforjustice.org/trafficking-exploitation/ [Accessed 25 April 2016].

Howarth, C. (2011). Representations, identity and resistance in communication. In D. Hook, B. Franks, and M. W. Bauer, (Eds.). *The Social Psychology of Communication*. [Online]. London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 153-168. Available at: http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/35983/ [Accessed 12 July 2015].

Howse, M. and Whitaker, P. (2015). *The UK Modern Slavery Act 2015*. [Online]. The National Law Review. Available at: http://www.natlawreview.com/article/uk-modern-slavery-act-2015 [Accessed 24 January 2016].

Hoyle, C., Bosworth, M. and Dempsey, M. (2011). Labelling the victims of sex trafficking: exploring the borderland between rhetoric and reality. *Social & Legal Studies,* 20(3), pp. 313-329.

Hughes, D. M. (2000). The "Natasha" trade: the transnational shadow market of trafficking in women. *Journal of International Affairs*, 53(2), pp. 625-651.

Hughes, D. M. (2004). *Best practices to address the demand side of trafficking*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/demand_sex _trafficking.pdf [Accessed 10 December 2011].

ILO. (2008). *ILO action against trafficking in human beings*. [Online]. Geneva: International Labour Office. Available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/ public/@ed_norm/@declaration/documents/publication/wcms_090356.pdf [Accessed 23 March 2011].

IOM. (2011). *Counter-trafficking*. [Online]. Available at: http://iom.ch/jahia/Jahia/activities/by-theme/regulating-migration/counter-trafficking/cache/offonce/lang/en [Accessed 24 March 2011].

Iselin, B. and Adams, M. (2003). *Distinguishing between human trafficking and people smuggling*. [Online]. United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, Regional Centre for East Asia and the Pacific, Bangkok. Available at: http://www.embraceni.org/wp-content/uploads/2006/06/Distinguishing[1]1.pdf [Accessed 14 July 2015].

Jackson, S. (1982). *Childhood and sexuality*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Jackson, S. & Scott, S. (1999). Risk anxiety and the social construction of childhood. In: D. Lupton, (Ed.). *Risk and sociocultural theory: new directions and perspectives*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 86-107.

Jahic, G. and Finckenauer, J.O. (2005). Representations and misrepresentations of human trafficking. *Trends in Organized Crime*, 8(3), pp. 24-40.

Jeffreys, S. (1997). *The idea of prostitution*. Melbourne: Spinifex Press.

Jenks, C. (2005). *Childhood*. Key Ideas. 2nd ed. Abingdon: Routledge.

Jenks, J. (2006). *British propaganda and news media in the Cold War*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Jensen, R. (2007). *Getting off: pornography and the end of masculinity*. Cambridge, MA: South End Press.

Jewkes, Y. (2004). *Media and crime*. London: Sage.

Jobe, A. (2010). Accessing help and services: trafficking survivors' experiences in the United Kingdom. In G. Wylie and P. McRedmond, (Eds.). *Human trafficking in Europe: character, causes and consequences*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 164-180.

Joffe, H. (2012). Thematic analysis. In D. Harper and A. Thompson, (Eds.). *In qualitative research methods in mental health and psychology: a guide for students and practitioners*. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, pp. 208-223.

Jordan, A. (2002). Human rights or human wrongs? the struggle for a rights-based response to trafficking in human beings. *Gender and Development*, 10(1), pp. 28-37.

Jozwiak, J. (2012). My father, the hero: paternal masculinities in contemporary sex trafficking films. In. K. Kempadoo and D. Davydova. (Eds.). *From bleeding hearts to critical thinking: exploring the issue of human trafficking,* pp. 20-25

Jullian, P. M. (2011). Appraising through someone else's words: the evaluative power of quotations in news reports. *Discourse and Society*, 22(6), pp. 766-780.

Kaistha, M., Kaistha, S., and Mahajan, A. (2016). A study of factors influencing decisions on organ donation among patient attendees in a Tertiary Care Hospital in North India. *CHRISMED Journal of Health and Research*, 3(2), pp. 101-105.

Kaposi, D. (2014). *Violence and understanding in Gaza: the British broadsheets' coverage of the war*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Kara, S. (2009). *Sex trafficking: inside the business of modern slavery*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Katz, J. (1977). Informed consent-a fairy tale? law's vision. *University of Pittsburgh Law Review*, 39(2), pp. 137-174.

Katz, J. (2006). *The macho paradox: why some men hurt women and how all men can help*. Naperville, IL: Sourcebooks.

Kavanagh, J. (2011). *Abolishing sex slavery by helping one girl at a time.* [Online]. Available at: http://thecnnfreedomproject.blogs.cnn.com/2011/06/16/abolishing-sex-slavery-by-helping-one-girl-at-a-time/ [Accessed 25 May 2015].

Kelly, L. (2002). *Journeys of jeopardy: a commentary on current research on trafficking of women and children for sexual exploitation within Europe*. [Online]. EU/IOM European Conference on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Human Beings: A Global Challenge for the 21st Century. Geneva: Research and Publications Division of IOM. Available at: http://childtrafficking.org/pdf/user/journeys_of_jeopardy.pdf [Accessed 16 January 2016].

Kelly, L. (2005). "You can find anything you want": a critical reflection on research on trafficking in persons within and into Europe. In F. Laczko and E. Gozdziak, (Eds.). *Data and research on human trafficking: a global survey.* [Online]. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, pp. 235-265. Available at: http://-www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/IOM_Data_Research_Human_Trafficking.pdf#page=233 [Accessed 5 April 2011].

Kelly, L. & Regan, L. (2000). *Stopping traffic: exploring the extent of, and responses to, trafficking in women for sexual exploitation in the UK*. [Online]. Police Research Series, Paper 125. London: Home Office, Policing and Reducing Crime Unit. Available at: http://www.atria.nl/epublications/2000/stopping_traffic.pdf [Accessed on 19 November 2010].

Kempadoo, K. (1998). Introduction: globalizing sex workers' rights. In K. Kempadoo and J. Doezema, (Eds.). *Global sex workers: rights, resistance, and redefinition.* Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 1-27.

Kempadoo, K., Sanghera, J. and Pattanaik, B. (2005). *Trafficking and prostitution reconsidered : new perspectives on migration, sex work, and human rights*. London: Paradigm Publishers.

Kennedy, H. (2011). Introduction. *Inquiry into human trafficking in Scotland: report of the equality and human rights commission*. [Online]. Scotland: Equality and Human Rights Commission, pp. 7-13. Available at: https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/human-rights-scotland/inquiry-human-trafficking-scotland [Accessed 10 May 2012].

Khan, H. (2010). *Child sex trafficking growing in U.S.: 'I got my childhood taken from me'*. [Online]. ABC News. Available at: http://abcnews.go.com/US/domestic-sex-trafficking-increasing-united-states/story?id=10557194 [Accessed 7 September 2011].

King, R. and Mai, N. (2004). Albanian immigrants in Lecce and Modena: narratives of rejection, survival and integration. *Population, Space and Place*, 10(6), pp. 455-477.

Kinney, E. (2015). Victims, villains, and valiant rescuers: unpacking sociolegal constructions of human trafficking and crimmigration in popular culture. In M. J. Guia, (Ed.). *The illegal business of human trafficking*. Switzerland: Springer International Publishing. pp. 87-108.

Kitzinger, J. (2004). *Framing abuse: media influence and public understanding of sexual violence against children*. London: Pluto Press.

Kleimenov, M. & Shamkov, S. (2005). Criminal transportation of persons: trends and recommendations. In S. Stoecker and L. Shelley, (Eds.). *Human traffic and transnational crime: Eurasian and American perspectives*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, pp. 29-46.

Koslowski, R. and Kyle, D. (2001). *Global human smuggling : comparative perspectives*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Kristof, N. and WuDunn, C. (2010). *Half the sky: turning oppression into opportunity for women worldwide*. New York: Vintage.

Laczko, F (2005). Introduction. In F. Laczko and E. Gozdziak, (Eds.). *Data and research on human trafficking: a global survey*. [Online]. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, pp. 5-16. Available at: http://-www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/IOM_Data_Research_Human_Trafficking.pdf#page=233 [Accessed 5 April 2011].

Lambert, R. and Githens-Mazer, J. (2010). *Islamophobia and anti-Muslim hate crime: UK case studies 2010*. [Online]. Exeter: European Muslim Research Centre and University of Exeter. Available at: http://studies.aljazeera.net/ResourceGallery/media/Documents/2012/1/8/2012189209731734Islamiphobia%20and%20Anti%20Muslim%20Hate%20Crime_UK%20Case%20Studies.pdf [Accessed 20 June 2015].

Landesman, P. (2004). The girls next door. In D. O'Connor, (Ed.). *The best American sex writing 2004*. New York: Thunder's Mouth Press, pp. 153-182.

Lawler, S. (2014). *Identity: sociological perspectives*. 2nd ed. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Lea, J. and Young, J. (2008). The race and crime debate. In B. Spalek, (Ed.). *Ethnicity and crime: a reader*. Readings in Criminology and Criminal Justice series. Maidenhead: Open University Press, pp. 91-112.

Lees, S. (1997). *Ruling passions : sexual violence, reputation, and the law*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Lipscombe, S. and Beard, J. (2014). *Human trafficking: UK responses*. [Online]. House of Commons Briefings Papers SN04324: Home Affairs. Available at: http://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/SN04324#fullreport [Accessed 10 December 2015].

Lucal, B. (1996). Oppression *and* privilege: toward a relational conceptualization of race. *Teaching Sociology*, 24, pp. 245-255.

Lucht, H. (2012). *Darkness before daybreak : African migrants living on the margins in southern Italy today*. London: University of California Press.

Mai, N. (2009). *Migrant workers in the UK sex industry*. [Online]. Institute for the Study of European Transformations, pp. 1-51. Available at: https://metranet.londonmet.ac.uk/fms/MRSite/Research/iset/Nick%20Mai/Migrant%20Workers%20in%20the%20UK%20Sex%20Industry%20Project%20Final%20Policy%20Relevant%20Report.pdf [Accessed 27 May 2011].

Mai, N. (2010). *The psycho-social trajectories of Albanian and Romanian 'traffickers'*. [Online]. Institute for the Study of European Transformations Working Paper 17, London Metropolitan University. Available at: https://metranet.londonmet.ac.uk/fms/MRSite/Research/iset/Working%20Paper%20Series/WP17%20N%20Mai.pdf [Accessed 27 May 2011].

Mardorossian, C. M. (2014). *Framing the rape victim: gender and agency reconsidered*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Marks, S. (2014). *Somaly Mam: the holy saint (and sinner) of sex trafficking*. [Online]. Newsweek. Available at: http://www.newsweek.com/2014/05/30/somaly-mam-holy-saint-and-sinner-sex-trafficking-251642.html [Accessed 21 July 2015].

McCoombs, M. (2004). *Setting the agenda: the mass media and public opinion*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

McRedmond, P. (2010). Defining organized crime in the context of human trafficking. In G. Wylie and P. McRedmond, (Eds.). *Human trafficking in Europe: character, causes and consequences.* London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 181-197.

McShane, M. and Williams, F. (1994). Series Forward. In G. Barak, (Ed.). *Media, process, and the social construction of crime: studies in newsmaking criminology*. Current Issues in Criminal Justice Series (Volume 10). New York: Garland Publishing, pp. xi-xv.

Meer, N. and Modood, T. (2009). The multicultural state we're in: Muslims, 'multiculture' and the 'civic rebalancing' of British multiculturalism. *Political Studies*, 57(3), pp. 473-497.

Meer, N. and Modood, T. (2010). Islamophobia as cultural racism? Martin Amis and the racialization of Muslims. In A. K. Vakil and S. Sayyid, (Eds.). *Thinking through Islamophobia.* London: Hurst & Co, pp. 69-84.

Meloy, M. L. and Miller, S. L. (2011). *The victimization of women : law, policies, and politics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Metropolitan Police. (2014). *People proceeded against by way of 'charge' for sexual offences between 01/10/2012 and 31/10/2013 by ethnicity, and whether offence was gang related*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.met.police.uk/foi/pdfs/disclosure_2014/october_2014/2013110002435.pdf [Accessed 22 April 2016].

Meyer, A. (2007). *The child at risk: paedophiles, media responses and public opinion*. New York: Manchester University Press.

Milton-Edwards, B. (2011). Islam and violence. In A. R. Murphy, (Ed.). *The Blackwell Companion to Religion and Violence*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

Miriam, K. (2005). Stopping the traffic in women: power, agency and abolition in feminist debates over sex-trafficking. *Journal of Social Philosophy*, 36(1), pp 1-17.

Modern Slavery Act 2015. (2015). [Online]. UK Policy Governance Association. Available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2015/30/pdfs/ukpga_20150030_en.pdf [Accessed 30 November 2015].

Monto, M. (2004). Female prostitution, customers, and violence. *Violence Against Women*, 10, pp. 160-168.

Mulvey, L. (1975). Visual pleasure and narrative cinema. *Screen*, 16(3), pp. 6-18.

Mulvey, L. (2009). *Visual and other pleasures (language, discourse and society)*. 2nd ed. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Munck, R. (2010). Slavery: exception or rule? In G. Wylie and P. McRedmond, (Eds.). *Human trafficking in Europe: character, causes and consequences*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 17-29.

My Dangerous Loverboy. (n.d.). My dangerous loverboy. [Online]. Available at: http://www.mydangerousloverboy.com/ [Accessed 26 February 2011].

Neely, S. (2010). Virtually commercial sex. In K. Boyle, (Ed.). *Everyday pornography*. Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 90-102.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2002). The rights and wrongs of prostitution. *Hypatia*, 17(2), pp. 84-98.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2003). 'Sleeping with the enemy'? some problems with feminist abolitionist calls to penalise those who buy commercial sex. *Social Policy & Society,* 2(1), pp. 55– 63.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2005). *Children in the global sex trade*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2006). Will the real sex slave please stand up? *Feminist Review*, 83, pp. 4-23.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2010). New slavery, old binaries: human trafficking and the borders of 'freedom'. *Global Networks*, 10(2), pp. 244-261.

Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (2009). *U.S. government funded research projects on trafficking in persons FY01-09 (by agency)*. [Online]. U.S. Department of State. Available at: http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/other/2009/127202.htm [Accessed 8 September 2011].

Office for National Statistics. (2012a). Ethnicity and national identity in England and Wales 2011. [Online]. Available at: http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20160105160709/http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/dcp171776_290558.pdf [Accessed 20 April 2016].

Office for National Statistics. (2012b). Religion in England and Wales 2011. [Online]. Available at: http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/dcp171776_290510.pdf [Accessed 13 August 2015].

Omar, A. R. (2003). Islam and violence. *The Ecumenical Review*, 55(2), pp. 158-163.

Oprah. (2009a). *Ending modern slavery*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.oprah.com/world/Ending-Human-Sex-Trafficking [Accessed 13 March 2011].

Oprah. (2009b). *Save a Slave*. [Online]. Available at:
http://www.oprah.com/oprahshow/How-to-Help-End-Sexual-Slavery [Accessed 13 March 2011].

Oxford Dictionaries. (2013). *Horror*. [Online]. Available at:
http://oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/horror?q=horror [Accessed 6 February 2013].

Oxford Dictionaries. (2013). *Victim*. [Online]. Available at:
http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/us/definition/english/victim [Accessed 6 February 2013].

Oxford Dictionaries. (2013). *Vulnerable*. [Online]. Available at:
http://oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/vulnerable [Accessed 1 May 2013].

Peach, L.J. (2005). 'Sex slaves' or 'sex workers'? cross-cultural and comparative religious perspectives on sexuality, subjectivity, and moral identity in anti-sex trafficking discourse. *Culture and Religion*, 6(1), pp. 107-134.

Peach, L. J. (2006). Victims or agents? female cross-border migrants and anti-trafficking discourse. *Radical Philosophy Today,* 5, pp. 101-118.

Polaris. (2015). *Founding story*. [Online]. Available at:
http://www.polarisproject.org/about-us/overview/founding-story [Accessed 24 May 2015].

Pomerantz, A. (1986). Extreme case formulations: a way of legitimizing claims. *Human Studies*, 9, pp. 219-229.

Poole, E. (2002). *Reporting Islam: media representations of British Muslims*. London: I.B. Tauris.

Potter, J. (1996). *Representing Reality*. London: Sage.

Potter, J., Wetherell, M. and Chitty, A. (1991). Quantification rhetoric—cancer on television. *Discourse & Society*, 2(3), pp. 333-365.

Poynting, S. and Mason, V. (2007). The resistible rise of Islamophobia: anti-Muslim racism in the UK and Australia before 11 September 2001. *Journal of Sociology*, 43(1), pp. 61-86.

Protess, D. and McCoombs, M.E. (eds.). (2016). *Agenda setting: readings on media, public opinion, and policymaking.* London: Routledge.

Quirk, J. (2008). *Unfinished business: a comparative survey of historical and contemporary slavery*. [Online]. France: UNESCO. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/culture/pdf/UnfinishedBusinessReport2008.pdf [Accessed 17 March 2011].

Raymond, J. G. and Hughes, D. M. (2001). *Sex trafficking of women in the United States: international and domestic trends*. [Online]. Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, pp. 1-141. Available from http://action.web.ca/home/catw/readingroom .shtml?cat_name=Reports [Accessed 22 November 2010].

Reischer, E. & Koo, K.S. (2004). The body beautiful: symbolism and agency in the social world. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 33, pp. 297-317.

Richardson, D. and May, H. (1999). Deserving victims?: sexual status and the social construction of violence. *The Sociological Review*, 47(2), pp. 308-331.

Robinson, K.H. (2008). In the name of 'childhood innocence': a discursive exploration of the moral panic associated with childhood and sexuality. *Cultural Studies Review*, 14(2), pp. 113-129.

Rogers, C. (2011). *African children trafficked to UK for blood rituals*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-15280776 [Accessed 12 February 2012].

Rohloff, A. and Wright, S. (2010). Moral panic and social theory: beyond the heuristic. *Current Sociology*, 58(3), pp. 403-419.

Romer, D., Jamieson, K.H., and DeCoteau, N.J. (1998). The treatment of persons of color in local television news: ethnic blame discourse or realistic group conflict? *Communication Research*, 25(3), pp. 286-305.

Roulston, K. (2001). Data analysis and 'theorizing as ideology'. *Qualitative Research*, 1(3), pp. 279-302.

Rothe, A. (2011). *Popular trauma culture: selling the pain of others in the mass media*. New Jersey: Rutgers University Press.

Rubin, G. (1993). Misguided, dangerous and wrong: an analysis of anti-pornography politics. In A. Assister and A. Carol, (Eds.). *Bad girls and dirty pictures: the challenge to reclaim feminism*. London: Pluto Press, pp. 18-40.

Salgado-Pottier, R. (2008). A modern moral panic: the representation of British Bangladeshi and Pakistani youth in relation to violence and religion. *Anthropology Matters Journal*, 10(1). [Online]. Available at: http://www.anthropologymatters.com /index.php/anth_matters/article/view/44/82 [Accessed 7 July 2015].

Sanghera, J. (2005). Unpacking the trafficking discourse. In K. Kempadoo, J. Sanghera and B. Pattanaik, (Eds.). *Trafficking and prostitution reconsidered : new perspectives on migration, sex work, and human rights*. London: Paradigm Publishers, pp. 3-24.

de Saussure, F. (1966). *Course in general linguistics*. Translated by W. Baskin. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Saunders, P. (2005). Traffic violations: determining the meaning of violence in sexual trafficking versus sex work. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 20(3), pp. 343-360.

Saunders, P. and Soderlund, G. (2003). Threat or opportunity: sexuality, gender and the ebb and flow of traffic as discourse. *Canadian Woman Studies,* 22(3/4), pp. 16–25.

Scarpa, S. (2008). *Trafficking in human beings: modern slavery*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Seelke, C. R. and Siskin, A. (2008). *Trafficking in persons: U.S. policy and issues for Congress* (RL34317). [Online]. Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service. Available at: http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/key_workplace/ 479/ [Accessed 9 January 2011].

Segrave, M., Milivojevic, S. and Pickering, S. (2009). *Sex trafficking : international context and response*. Cullompton, Devon: Willan.

Sexual Offences Act 2003 (2003). [Online]. UK Policy Governance Association. Available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2003/42/pdfs/ukpga _20030042_en.pdf [Accessed 27 February 2011].

Shain, F. (2011). *The new folk devils: Muslim boys and education in England*. Oakhill: Trentham Books Ltd.

Shared Hope International. (2007). *Demand.* [documentary] [Online]. Shared Hope International. Available at: http://www.sharedhope.org/what/enddemand3.asp [Accessed: 15 March 2010].

Skilbrei, M. and Tveit, M. (2008). Defining trafficking through empirical work: blurred boundaries and their consequences. *Gender, Technology and Development*, 12(1), pp. 9-30.

Skrivankova, K. (2010). *Between decent work and forced labour: examining the continuum of exploitation*. [Online]. JRF programme paper: Forced Labour. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at: http://www.gla.gov.uk/PageFiles/1602

/JRF%20-%20Between%20decent%20work%20and%20forced%20labour.pdf
[Accessed October 2012].

Smith, C. (2010). Pornographication: a discourse for all seasons. *International Journal of Media and Cultural Politics*, 6(1), pp. 103-108.

Smith, J. (2004). *'They said I wasn't human but something that can be bought'*. [Online]. The Times. Available at: http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/life_and_style/article493831.ece?token=null&offset=12&page=2 [Accessed 8 September 2011].

Soderlund, G. (2005). Running from the rescuers: new U.S. crusades against sex trafficking and the rhetoric of abolition. *Feminist Formations*, 17(3), pp. 64-87.

Srikantiah, J. (2007). Perfect victims and real survivors: the iconic victim in domestic human trafficking law. *Boston University Law Review*, 87, pp. 157-211.

Stoecker S. and Shelley L. (2005) *Human traffic and transnational organised crime: Eurasian and American perspectives*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers

Stolz, J. (2006). Explaining Islamophobia: a test of four theories based on the case of a Swiss city. *Swiss Journal of Sociology*, 31(3), pp. 547-566.

Surette, R. (2011). *Media, crime and criminal justice: images, realities, and policies*. 4th ed. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning.

Taken. (2008). Directed by Pierre Morel. France. EuropaCorp, distributed by 20th Century Fox. [motion picture]

Tanner, Laura E. (1994). *Intimate violence: reading rape and torture in twentieth century fiction*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Taras, R. (2012). *Xenophobia and Islamophobia in Europe*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Testa, A. and Armstrong, G. (2012). "We are against Islam!": the Lega Nord and the Islamic folk devil. *SAGE Open,* 2(4), pp. 1-14.

The A21 Campaign. (n.d.). *Abolishing injustice in the 21st Century*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.thea21campaign.org/ [Accessed on 24 August 2011]

The Guardian (2012). *ABCs: national daily newspaper circulation December 2011*. [Online]. The Guardian. Available at: http://www.theguardian.com/media/table/2012/jan/13/abcs-national-newspapers [Accessed 15 July 2012].

The Guardian. (2012). *ABCs: national Sunday newspaper circulation December 2011*. [Online]. The Guardian. Available at: http://www.theguardian.com/media/table/2012/jan/13/abcs-national-newspapers1 [Accessed 15 July 2012].

This is Gloucestershire. (2010). *Channel 4 documentary lifts lid on Cheltenham sex work underworld.* [Online]. This is Gloucestershire. Available at: http://www.thisisgloucestershire.co.uk/Sleazy-vice-ring-cracked-massive-police-swoop/story-11927347-detail/story.html [Accessed 7 September 2011].

Times Higher Education. (2010). *The canon: folk devils and moral panics: the creation of the Mods and the Rockers by Stanley Cohen*. [Online] Times Higher Education. Available at: https://www.timeshighereducation.com/books/the-canon-folk-devils-and-moral-panics-the-creation-of-the-mods-and-rockers-by-stanley-cohen/410619.article [Accessed 21 January 2016].

Tiuriukanova, E. (2005). Female labor migration trends and human trafficking: policy recommendations. In S. Stoecker and L. Shelley, (Eds.). *Human traffic and transnational crime: Eurasian and American perspectives*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, pp. 95-114.

Topping, A. (2011) *Child sex trafficking on the rise with even younger victims targeted.* [Online]. Available at: http://www.guardian.co.uk/society/2011/jan/17/child-trafficking-uk-rise [Accessed 12 February 2012].

Tough Guise. (1999). Directed by Sut Jhally. Northampton, MA, Media Education Foundation. [documentary]

Townsend, M. (2011). *Sex trafficking in the UK: one woman's horrific story of kidnap, rape, beatings and prostitution*. [Online]. The Guardian. Available at: http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/2011/feb/06/sex-traffick-romania-britain [Accessed 8 September 2011].

Traffic Signs. (n.d.). [Online]. Crimestoppers. Available at: http://www.crimestoppers-uk.org/most-wanted/current-campaigns/traffic-signs [Accessed 8 September 2011].

Tverdova, Y.V. (2011). Human trafficking in Russia and other post-Soviet states. *Human Rights Review*, 12, pp. 329-344.

Tyldum, G. and Brunovskis, A. (2005). Describing the unobserved: methodological challenges in empirical studies on human trafficking. In F. Laczko and E. Gozdziak, (Eds.). *Data and research on human trafficking: a global survey*. [Online]. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, pp. 17-34. Available at: http://-www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/IOM_Data_Research_Human_Trafficking.pdf#page=233 [Accessed 5 April 2011].

UK Home Affairs Committee (2009). *The trade in human beings: human trafficking in the UK*. [Online]. London: The Stationery Office Limited. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/human_trafficking_in_the_uk_sixth_report_of_session_2008_09_en_1.pdf [Accessed 25 May 2011].

UK Home Office. (2011). *Human trafficking: the government's strategy*. [Online]. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/human-trafficking-strategy_1.pdf [Accessed 30 March 2016].

UK Home Office (2013). *Passport history timeline*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/agencies-public-bodies/ips/passports/timeline/ [Accessed 6 March 2013].

UK Home Office and Scottish Executive. (2007). *UK action plan on tackling human trafficking*. [Online]. UN.GIFT. Available at: http://www.ungift.org/doc/knowledgehub/resource-centre/Governments/UK_Action_Plan_to_Combat_Human_Trafficking_en.pdf [Accessed 7 September 2011].

UK Home Office and Scottish Executive. (2009). *Update to the UK action plan on tackling human trafficking*. [Online]. UN.GIFT. Available at: http://www.ungift.org/doc/knowledgehub/resource-centre/Governments/Update_to_the_UK_Action_Plan_on_Tackling_Human_Trafficking_en_2009.pdf [Accessed 7 September 2011].

UKHTC (2011). *Statistical data: national referral mechanism data*. [Online]. Serious Organised Crime Agency. Available at: http://www.soca.gov.uk/about-soca/about-the-ukhtc/statistical-data [Accessed 7 September 2011].

UNESCO. (2016). *Xenophobia*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/social-and-human-sciences/themes/international-migration/glossary/xenophobia/ [Accessed 20 April 2016].

UN.GIFT. (2008). *016 workshop: profiling the traffickers*. The Vienna Forum to fight Human Trafficking. [Online]. Available at: https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2008/BP016ProfilingtheTraffickers.pdf [Accessed 11 August 2015].

UN. (1951). *International convention for the suppression of the white slave traffic*. [Online]. Treaty Series. 98, pp. 101. Entered into force 14 August 1951. Available at: https://treaties.un.org/doc/Publication/UNTS/Volume%2098/v98.pdf [Accessed 9 February 2012].

UNODC. (2004). *United Nations convention against transnational organized crime and the protocols thereto*. [Online]. New York: United Nations. Available at: http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNTOC/Publications/TOC%20Convention/TOCebook-e.pdf [Accessed 15 October 2010].

UNODC. (2009). *Global report on trafficking in persons*. [Online]. Vienna: United Nations. Available at: http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Global_Report_on_TIP.pdf [Accessed 23 March 2011].

UNODC. (2011a). *Human trafficking*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html?ref=menuside [Accessed 7 September 2011].

UNODC. (2011b). *United Nations convention against transnational organized crime and the protocols hereto*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/treaties/CTOC/index.html [Accessed 23 March 2011].

UNODC. (2012). *Global report on trafficking in persons*. [Online]. Vienna: United Nations. Available at: https://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/Trafficking_in_Persons_2012_web.pdf [Accessed 5 June 2013].

US Department of State. (2000). *Victims of trafficking and violence protection Act of 2000*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.state.gov/j/tip/laws/ [Accessed 23 May 2011].

US Department of State. (2013). *Trafficking in persons report*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2013/ [Accessed 5 December 2015].

US Department of State. (2015). *Trafficking in persons report*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2015/ [Accessed 5 December 2015].

Vaismoradi, M. Turunen, H. and Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing and Health Sciences*, 15, pp. 398-405.

Valier, C. (2004). *Crime and punishment in contemporary culture*. Abingdon: Routledge.

van Dijk, T. (1988). *News as discourse*. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

van Dijk, T. (1991). *Racism and the press*. Abingdon: Routledge.

van Dijk, T. (1993). *Elite discourse and racism*. London: Sage.

van Dijk, T. (1995). Power and the news media. In D. Paletz, (Ed.). *Political communication and action*. Cresskill, NJ: Hampton Press, pp. 9-36.

van Dijk, T. (2001). Principles of critical discourse analysis. In M. Wetherell, S. Taylor, and S.J. Yates, (Eds.). *Discourse theory and practice: a reader*. London: Sage, pp. 300-317.

Vijeyarasa, R. and Villarino, J.M.B. (2012). Modern-day slavery? a judicial catchall for trafficking, slavery and labour exploitation: a critique of Tang and Rantsev. *Journal of International Law and International Relations*, 8, pp. 36-61.

Wallinger, C. S. (2010). *Media representation and human trafficking: how anti-trafficking discourse affects trafficked persons*. [Online]. Second Annual Interdisciplinary Conference on Human Trafficking. DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska-Lincoln. Available at: http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/cgi/viewcontent .cgi?article=1003&context=humtrafconf2 [Accessed 14 December 2011].

Wanta, W., Golan, G. and Lee, C. (2004). Agenda setting and international news: media influence on public perceptions of foreign nations. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 81(2), pp. 364-377.

Warren, K.B. (2012). Troubling the victim/trafficker dichotomy in efforts to combat human trafficking: the unintended consequences of moralizing labor migration. *Global Legal Studies*, 19(1), pp. 105-120.

Weitzer, R. (2005). New directions in research on prostitution. *Crime, Law & Social Change*, 43, pp. 211-235.

Weitzer, R. (2007a). Prostitution: facts and fiction. *Contexts*, 6(4), pp. 28-33.

Weitzer, R. (2007b). The social construction of sex trafficking: ideology and institutionalization of a moral crusade. *Politics & Society*, 35(3), pp. 447-475.

Wiehl, L. (2006). *Sex trafficking*. [Online]. Fox News. Available at: http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,198694,00.html [Accessed 8 September 2011].

Wilson, M. and O'Brien, E. (2016). Constructing the ideal victim in the United States of America's annual trafficking in persons reports. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 65, pp. 29-45.

Winter, J. (2002). The trial of Rose West: contesting notions of victimhood. In C. Hoyle and R. Young, (Eds.). *New visions of crime victims*. Portland, OR: Hart Publishing, pp. 173-196.

Wolf, N. (2002). *The beauty myth: how images of beauty are used against women*. New York: Perennial.

Woodrow, C. (1999). Revisiting images of the child in early childhood education: reflections and considerations. *Australian Journal of Early Childhood*, 24(4), pp. 7-12.

Wykes, M. and Gunter, B. (2005). *The media and body image*. London: Sage.

Wyler, L. S. and Siskin, A. (2010). *Trafficking in persons: U.S. policy and issues for Congress* (RL34317). [Online]. Washington, D.C.: Congressional Research Service. Available at: https://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/misc/RL34317.pdf [Accessed 10 January 2011].

Wylie, G. and McRedmond, P. (2010). Introduction: human trafficking and Europe. In G. Wylie and P. McRedmond, (Eds.). *Human trafficking in Europe: character, causes and consequences*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 1-16.

Zhou, M.H. (2015). Global sex trafficking overview: facts, myths and debates. In A. R. Ackerman and R. Furman, (Eds.). *Sex Crimes*. New York: Columbia University Press, pp. 81-98.

Zizek, S. (2008). *Violence.* London: Picador.