

The Negative Language of the Dionysian School  
of Mystical Theology

An Approach to the Cloud of Unknowing

in Two Volumes

Volume Two

ROSEMARY ANN LEES

Thesis submitted for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy

University of York  
Centre for Medieval Studies

March, 1981

CONTENTS

VOLUME TWO

	Page
Table of Contents	i
Appendix I Hugh and Richard of St. Victor: the non-Dionysian tradition of contemplative theology and its influence on the <u>Cloud of Unknowing</u>	
Hugh of St. Victor	1
Richard of St. Victor	6
Victorine influence on the <u>Cloud of Unknowing</u>	11
Appendix II Possible secondary influences on the <u>Cloud</u> author from texts associated with the Dionysian mystical tradition: the <u>De Contemplatione</u> and the <u>De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis</u>	
<u>De Contemplatione</u>	24
<u>De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis</u>	28
Notes to Introduction	37
Notes to Chapter I	37
Notes to Chapter II	50
Notes to Chapter III	57
Notes to Conclusion	90
Notes to Appendix I	107
Notes to Appendix II	114
Bibliography	117

APPENDICES

## APPENDIX I

Hugh and Richard of St. Victor: the non-Dionysian tradition of contemplative theology and its influence on the Cloud of Unknowing.

The importance of the Victorine influence on the development of mystical theology during the medieval period may scarcely be overstated, and it is therefore necessary to account in some measure for the disproportionately scant attention which, with the exception of Thomas Gallus, these authors have warranted in the present thesis.

### Hugh of St. Victor

Both Hugh († 1141) and his disciple Richard († 1173) occupy the centre ground in their own century between the intensely devotional religion of the Bernardine school and the extremes of scholastic theology as propounded by Abelard and his followers. They also mediate between the largely distinct mystical traditions of the past, as represented by Ps.-Dionysius and Augustine, and the more synthetic and intricately defined theories of contemplation which evolved in the later middle ages.<sup>1</sup> It was Hugh who first brought Ps.-Dionysius to the fore in the field of Latin theology through his Expositio in Hierarchiam Coelestem S. Dionysii, which he wrote in response to requests from his students for an introduction to the complexities of Dionysian theology.<sup>2</sup> His interpretation of the text, moreover, which is heavily coloured by the principles of Augustinian theology long ingrained in his thinking, was to a considerable extent instrumental in determining the direction taken by Dionysian studies for successive generations of scholars, culminating in Gallus' authoritative work on the Latin Corpus. The character of Hugh's commentary

as it reflects the traits which mark his contemplative theory as a whole is usefully summarized by René Roques:

Le Commentaire de Hugues respecte ainsi le cadre hiérarchique proposé par Denys, et les lois générales qui régissent le comportement des intelligences à l'intérieur de ce cadre: procession et conversion, anagogie, 'analogia', purification, illumination, perfection ou union, amour. Il apparaît toutefois que, dans la présentation de ces thèmes, Hugues impose à la pensée dionysienne des précisions qu'elle ne contient pas et qui l'infléchissent dans un sens partiellement nouveau. D'une manière habituelle il néglige volontiers le point de vue objectif, hiérarchique, 'cosmique', toujours présent à la pensée de Denys, pour lui préférer le point de vue psychologique, moral, pratique, affectif, beaucoup moins accusé dans le Corpus dionysien ...

Sans doute amour et connaissance se rejoignent à leur point extrême, mais le primat revient incontestablement à l'amour, lui aussi précurseur et générateur de la connaissance. Contrairement à l'amour hiérarchique, 'cosmique', 'ordonné', presque intellectualiste de Denys, l'amour hugonien devient une réalité foncièrement psychologique, expérimentale, affective: il est contact ('contrectare'), expérience ('experientia'), sentiment ('sentitur'), dégustation ('gustare'), douceur ('dulcedo'), saveur ('sapere'), satiété ('satietas'), joie ('gaudium'), refection ('refectio', 'reficere'), chaleur extrême ('superfervidium'), ébullition ('bullens'). Et tous ces caractères trouvent leur illustration dans les thèmes sponsaux du Cantique des Cantiques ou dans l'expérience de Marie-Madeleine, totalement négligés par Denys.

... Même en commentant Denys, Hugues reprend spontanément, les thèmes, les points de vue et les oppositions d'Augustin.<sup>3</sup>

Roques's catalogue of Augustinian influences on Hugh's theology may be supplemented from Roger Baron's study, Science et Sagesse chez Hugues de Saint-Victor, which includes Hugh's emphasis on the need for spiritual purification and on self-knowledge as an inroad to knowledge of God, also his conviction that the final beatific vision in which God is seen face to face may be anticipated in earthly experience of the divine presence, among his major ideological debts to St. Augustine.<sup>4</sup> A.A. Cayré, moreover, in La Contemplation Augustinienne. Principes de Spiritualité et de Théologie,<sup>5</sup> stresses the association of mysticism and theology, and the importance of symbolism as notable aspects of Augustine's legacy, through Hugh, to the Victorine school.

The range of Hugh's work is extraordinarily comprehensive, and his most significant contribution to the development of mystical theology resides less in specialized treatment of the subject - his work on the Dionysian Corpus, for example, seems to have been confined to the De Coelesti Hierarchia - than in the broad spiritual base which he established from the merging of the Augustinian and Dionysian traditions for successive contemplative theologians to build on. As Roques argues, his writings have a strongly practical bias and he devotes considerable space to the everyday realities, physical as well as moral and devotional, of the religious life. His De Meditatione,<sup>6</sup> for example, details the various exercises (reading of the Bible, self-scrutiny and meditation on creation) which promote loving appreciation of the nature of God, and the De Institutione Novitiorum is concerned with propriety of dress and external behaviour as they reflect the inner purity of the soul. The formal classification of the contemplative way, however, was left for Richard of St.-Victor: A. Mignon, in Les Origines de la Scolastique et Hugues de Saint-Victor,<sup>7</sup> confirms that what remains of enduring value in Hugh's work,

... c'est moins la convenance de la classification établie par lui que sa doctrine sur les différents exercices de la vie spirituelle.<sup>8</sup>

It is Hugh's incipient theory concerning the respective functions of knowledge and love in the mystical ascent, however, which commands most attention in the present context. The issue was vigorously contested in the divided spiritual climate of his century, and Hugh endorsed the standpoint of the schools insofar as he reaffirmed the efficacy of the reason in this area and the relevance of all knowledge which was properly supported by faith.<sup>9</sup> Creation, the Bible, the soul

and Christ are all in different ways accessible manifestations of their divine source,<sup>10</sup> and it is through study of these in the reason (perpetually nourished by the imagination<sup>11</sup>) that man may ascend to contemplate the origin of all their perfections. In the first chapter of Bk. I of his Expositio in Hierarchiam Coelestem, Hugh states,

Impossibile enim est invisibilia, nisi per visibilia demonstrari: et propterea omnis theologia necesse habet visibilibus demonstrationibus uti in invisibilium declaratione.<sup>12</sup>

As Roger Baron comments in relation to this passage, Hugh's concept is of an incomprehensible but not unintelligible God, and his tenure of both positions simultaneously ensures an equal status in his theology for the affirmative and negative dialectics alike.<sup>13</sup>

Where Hugh deviates from narrowly scholastic principles, however, is in asserting the ultimate primacy of love as a mode of knowing God:

Plus diligitur quam intelligitur, et intrat dilectio et appropinquat ubi scientia foris est.<sup>14</sup>

Love must be stimulated by some rational appreciation of the nature and worthiness of its object - this is a fundamental tenet of Augustinian theology - but the summit of discursive knowledge is finally superseded by the penetrating power of love. In the De Arca Noe Morali, Hugh gives this account of the interdependency of knowledge and love in the progress to contemplation:

Duobus modis Deus cor humanum inhabitat, per cognitionem videlicet et amorem, una tamen mansio est, quia et omnis qui novit cum diligit, et nemo diligere potest qui non novit. In hoc tamen differre videtur, quod scientia per cognitionem fidei fabricam erigit, dilectio autem per virtutem quasi colore superducto aedificium pingit. Sic autem utrum libet necessarium perspicitur, quia nec splendere potest si non fuerit, nec placere si non splenduerit.<sup>15</sup>

Love is here seen as an embellishment on the building of faith, and it is in an ecstasy of love, Hugh insists, that the supreme earthly experience of God's presence occurs. The Soul describes the ecstatic condition in these terms in its final interchange with Man in the

De Arrha Animae:

Hoc ultimum interrogationis meae benigne, ut suscipias, quaeso, quid est illud dulce, quod in ejus recordatione aliquando me tangere solet, et tam vehementer atque suaviter afficere, ut jam tota quodammodo a memetipsa abalienari, et nescio quo abstrahi incipiam. Subito enim innovor et tota immutor, et bene mihi esse incipit ultra quam dicere sufficiam. Exhilaratur conscientia, in oblivionem venit omnis praeteritorum dolorum miseria, exsultat animus, clarescit intellectus, cor illuminatur, desideria jucundatur, jamque alibi (nescio ubi) me esse video, et quasi quiddam amplexibus amoris intus teneo, et nescio quid illud sit, et tamen illud semper retinere, et nunquam perdere toto adnisu laboro. Luctatur quodammodo delectabiliter animus, ne recedat ab eo, quod semper amplectere desiderat, et quasi in illo omnium desideriorum finem invenerit summe et ineffabiliter exsultat, nihil amplius quaerens, nihil ultra appetens, semper sic esse volens.<sup>16</sup>

In reply, Man confirms that this is a touch, a foretaste of the beatific vision, it is the betrothal-gift of the divine Spouse, "qui in futuro se tibi videndum, et perpetuo possidendum dabit."<sup>17</sup>

Clearly, therefore, while Hugh suggests that the interplay between discursive knowledge and love in the ascent to contemplation finally gives way to experience of God through love alone, he also intimates that the ecstatic state is one of enlightenment - an enlightenment of the intelligence, though not of the reason, which will be completed in immortality. Thus, in his unfinished commentary In Ecclesiasten Homiliae, Hugh arrives at the following definition of contemplation:

Contemplatio est perspicax, et liber animi contuitus in res perspicendas usquequaque diffusus,

and goes on to reaffirm the Augustinian contention that the state of enlightenment is also one of rest:



... deinde roborata mente cum flamma amoris, et validius ardere et clarius splendere coeperit, mox omnis perturbationum caligo evanescit: et jam pura mente animus ad contemplationem veritatis se diffundit. Novissime autem postquam assidua veritatis contemplatione cor penetratum fuerit, et ad ipsum summae veritatis fontem medullitus toto animæ affectu intraverit, tunc in idipsum dulcedinis quasi totum ignitum, et in ignem amoris conversum, ab omni strepitu et perturbatione pacatissimum requiescit.<sup>18</sup>

Roger Baron, summarizing the nature of Hugh's achievement, emphasizes his importance as establishing a synthesis between philosophy, theology and mysticism:

Son génie fut d'abord de mettre les richesses augustinienes à la portée de l'eruditio didascalica médiévale. Sa grandeur ... fut d'avoir fourni par toute son œuvre augustinienne: la construction systématique de la sagesse chrétienne, la synthèse de la science et de la contemplation.<sup>19</sup>

In linguistic terms, the corollary of the contemplative theory which Hugh thus evolved is a positive vocabulary, exploiting the rational operation of language to convey the analogical approach to God through His various apprehensible manifestations. Similarly, his reverence for the Bible as the inspired word of God which both affords the pattern for the contemplative life and impassions the soul to attain it, prompts him to draw extensively on scriptural language and, in particular, on the imagery of the Canticle of Canticles. The sensuous terminology of this Book is an apt vehicle for the intensity of Hugh's devotion to Christ, the divine Spouse,<sup>20</sup> and its profoundly experiential character, moreover, reflects the essential irrationality of the loving awareness of God which the soul achieves in ecstasy.

Richard of St. Victor

The difference between Hugh and his successor Richard, Aelred Squire proposes in the introduction to his edition of selected texts

of the former,

... marks the difference between one generation of writers and another. In his universality Hugh belonged to the world that also produced St. Bernard of Clairvaux, 'the last of the fathers'. Richard already seems to belong to the world of the specialist.<sup>21</sup>

Students of the Victorines, indeed, rarely claim peculiar distinction for Richard as an original thinker.<sup>22</sup> He shared Hugh's literary heritage, and in many respects developed his theology along the lines already prescribed by Hugh: he thus gave prominence to Dionysian principles of hierarchy<sup>23</sup> and, like Hugh, formulated close connexions between his theory of contemplation and empirical observations from the natural world, the psychology of the mind, the historicity of biblical narratives and the established exegesis of scriptural texts - the most important biblical sources for his analysis of the soul's condition at the various stages of its progress to contemplative union being, traditionally, the chronicle of Moses, the Canticle of Canticles and the account in Genesis of Jacob's children, which is the basis of his Benjamin Minor and Benjamin Major. Richard's talent was above all for defining and classifying, and in the several texts which he devoted to intensive scrutiny of the mystic way, he consolidated and imposed a formal and coherent structure on the principles of contemplative theology which Hugh had left largely imprecise and undeveloped.<sup>24</sup>

The Benjamin Major divides the contemplative ascent into six grades,<sup>25</sup> and Richard endorses Hugh's contention that the whole is grounded in the power of the imagination to stimulate the soul, which it does by feeding the reason with earthly knowledge (including knowledge of self), thus impelling it to aspire to awareness of the nature of its heavenly goal. Jacob has children by Rachel's handmaid, Bilhah,

who represents Imagination, before Rachel - Reason - herself conceives:

Item, cum scriptum sit: 'Quia invisibilia Dei, a creatura mundi per ea, quae facta sunt, intellecta conspiciuntur' (Rom.1), inde manifeste colligitur quia ad invisibilium cognitionem numquam ratio assurgeret, nisi ei ancilla sua, imaginatio videlicet, rerum visibilium formam repraesentaret. Per rerum enim visibilium speciem surgit ad rerum invisibilium cognitionem, quoties ex his ad illam quamdam trahit similitudinem. Sed constat quia sine imaginatione corporalia nesciret, sine quorum cognitione ad coelestium contemplationem non ascenderet.<sup>26</sup>

The preoccupation with the relative functions of knowledge and love in the contemplative ascent which is characteristic of his century is as strongly marked in Richard's works as in Hugh's, and Richard is at pains to reassert and define the essential roles of both cognitive faculties.<sup>27</sup> Their interdependence is forcefully argued in Benjamin Major IV,10:

Ad hoc siquidem nobis datur hujusmodi gratia, ad hoc, inquam, infunditur aeternorum intelligentia, ut sciamus quid indefessi debeamus per studium quaerere, vel per desiderium suspirare. Alioquin frustra in nobis divinae cognitionis abundantia crescit, nisi divinae in nobis dilectionis flammam augeat. Debeat itaque in nobis crescere semper, et ex cognitione dilectio, et nihilominus ex dilectione cognitio, et mutuis incrementis, mutua incrementa ministrare debent, et alternis augmentis alterna augmenta accrescere habent. Debet ergo anima perfecta et assidue summorum contemplationi dedita omni hōra peregrinationis suae terminum ergastulique hujus egressum cum summo desiderio exspectare, quod id, quod interim videt per speculum et in aenigmate, mereatur facie ad faciem videre.<sup>28</sup>

The instrument of the contemplative act itself is the intelligentia, the pure intelligence: as Richard affirms in Benjamin Minor, 87,

Comprehensio siquidem rerum invisibilium pertinet ad intelligentiam puram,<sup>29</sup>

and he insists that this is a higher rational faculty, capable of an apprehension of God which exceeds the scope of discursive reasoning:

... ad id quod divinitus inspiratur, humani sensus  
capacitas succumbit, et nisi humanae ratiocinationis  
angustias deserat, ad capiendum divinae inspirationis  
arcanum intelligentiae sinum non dilatatur.<sup>30</sup>

Like Hugh, therefore, he upholds the Dionysian principle of divine transcendence, but equally, he resists the Dionysian inference that the contemplative way is thus necessarily apophatic and culminates in an awareness of God which completely transcends finite modes of cognition. The unitive experience takes place, according to Richard, in ecstasy, when the rational faculties are in abeyance - Rachel dies in giving birth to Benjamin - and the operations of even the intelligentia are subdued while the ecstatic state persists. But thereafter, its cognitive powers are reenergised, and the intelligentia is able to recall and interpret the soul's brief unitive vision. The process is described in Benjamin Major, IV, 11:

Sed ille quasi de tabernaculo in advenientis Domini occursum egreditur, egressus autem quasi facie ad faciem intuetur, qui per mentis excessum extra semetipsum ductus, summae sapientiae lumen sine aliquo involucro, figurarumve adumbratione, denique non per speculum et in aenigmate, sed in simplici, ut sic dicam, veritate contemplatur. Exterius visum introrsum trahit quando in quod per excessum vidit multa retractatione, vehementique discussione, capabile, seu etiam comprehensibile sibi efficit, et tum rationum attestazione, tum similitudinem adaptatione, ad communem intelligentiam deducit.<sup>31</sup>

It is clear, moreover, that Richard conceives of the unitive experience as a face-to-face vision of God; earlier in the same text, he introduces a formal definition of contemplation which derives from Hugh:

Contemplatio est libera mentis perspicacia in sapientiae spectacula cum admiratione suspensa ...,<sup>32</sup>

but he goes further than Hugh in suggesting that this earthly unitive experience differs only in degree and not in kind from the ultimate beatific vision of which it is a foretaste.<sup>33</sup> Richard is, however,

unspecific as to the precise nature of this ecstatic knowledge. It is one of the few areas of uncertainty in his otherwise accurately defined theology, and his language reflects this in generalized references to obscure knowledge and the intuitive power of love.

The emphasis in Richard's analysis of the mystic way is therefore on continuity, and at each stage some degree of knowledge is involved - whether, as in the earlier stages, attained by discursive reasoning or, as at the highest levels, achieved independently of the rational faculties through the cognitive powers of the intelligentia. As Kirchberger maintains,

All through this plan the lower states are shown to be related to the higher ones, there is differentiation but no cleavage between them, no Neo-Platonic disregard or contempt for the things of sense, or for the world of reason in relation to the realm of the spirit. Even when Richard describes the last heights of contemplation, where all action is from God and man remains passive in the ecstasy of the darkness of contemplation, there are certain inconsistencies which may derive from this ingrained conviction that at no point is man entirely free from the natural laws, experiences and habits which govern his being throughout the earlier stages of his spiritual development.<sup>34</sup>

The central image for Richard's contemplative theory is possibly that of dawn passing into day which occurs in Benjamin Major V, 9-10: the hazy knowledge which is the first light of dawn gradually gives way to the complete awareness and intensity of devotion which are symbolized by the complementary light and heat of the fully risen sun.

In respect of his contention that a rationally inaccessible God can only be experienced in an ecstasy of love and his reiteration of the traditional interpretation of Moses' experience in the darkness of Mount Sinai as a paradigm for the contemplative state, Richard, therefore, kept faith with the Dionysian tradition as it had been

transmitted to him through his predecessor Hugh.<sup>35</sup> But, as Kirchberger reaffirms, this does not imply that he also admitted the Dionysian corollary of the negative mystical way:<sup>36</sup>

Richard does not ascend to God by the way of negation. His 'dark night of unknowing' occurs at the end of a progressive affirmative system of experimental and acquired spiritual knowledge and his example of Moses ascending into the cloud is different in some respects from that of Denis. It is only in the last stages of contemplation that the soul, according to Richard, is passive and all is received from God. Denis thought it dangerous to use sensible images as analogies for spiritual things but this is one of Richard's chief characteristics, basing himself on the text of S. Paul, 'For the invisible things of him from the creation of the world are clearly seen, being understood by the things that are made' (Rom.1,20). In this and other respects Richard follows S. Augustine within the general Western tradition. God may be known, must be sought, will be found by prayer, humility and love, on earth. He can be known 'through a glass darkly', in heaven 'face to face'. But here Richard asserts that even here on earth, in the experience of ecstasy, God can be seen face to face.<sup>37</sup>

The native bent of Richard's thought is thus unequivocally affirmative and commands a correspondingly positive mode of expression.<sup>38</sup> His reliance on the reason and its higher function, the intelligentia, to induce vision of God at the climax of the analogical approach to Him through His accessible manifestations, is complemented by a faith in the rational operation of language and a sense of its aptitude to express both the process of ascent and the cognitive experience of God in which it culminates. The biblical paradigms for the contemplative way, moreover, which, like Hugh, he holds to be divinely inspired, are an important source of terminology for Richard's account of the mystical experience.

#### Victorine influence on the Cloud of Unknowing

The characteristics of Victorine mystical theology which have been accentuated here are of considerable importance in determining the Cloud author's possible indebtedness to the writers of this school

for his theory of contemplation. The Cloud of Unknowing is clearly an eclectic text, and in general its teaching is heavily influenced by Victorine precepts.<sup>39</sup> In its uncompromising advocacy of the negative way, however, it stands apart from other contemporary English treatises on contemplation and embraces a recognized tradition of mystical theology which flourished primarily on the continent; if, therefore, its precise allegiances in this distinctive area of its theology may be established, it should be possible to assess the text in its proper context and this might in turn go far to indicating its likely provenance.

Detailed discussion of the Cloud author's theory of the relative functions of knowledge and love in the contemplative ascent is, of course, inappropriate in an appendix and has been reserved for chapter III and the concluding section of this thesis. Here, however, it is enough to stress the fundamentally negative direction of his thought, with its insistence on unknowing and rejection of all that is not God as a means of attaining loving union with Him. He summarizes his teaching as early as Ch. 3;

Lift up þin herte vnto God wiþ a meek steryng of loue;  
& mene himself, & none of his goodes. & þerto loke þee loþe  
to þenk on ouzt bot on hymself, so þat nouzt worche in þi  
witte ne in þi wille bot only himself. & do þat in þee is  
to forzete alle þe creatures þat euer God maad & þe werkes  
of hem, so þat þi þouzt ne þi desire be not directe ne  
streche to any of hem, neiþer in general ne in special.  
Bot lat hem be, & take no kepe to hem. (Cloud 16/3-9).

This is undoubtedly in the Dionysian tradition of mystical theology as it was developed by Thomas Gallus and Hugh of Balma, and contradicts the emphasis on light and knowledge which predominates in the essentially Augustinian mysticism of Hugh and Richard of St.-Victor. Linguistically,

also, the exponents of the different schools of contemplative theory are distinct. The Cloud author's ultimate rejection of the things of sense and reason in the unitive way involves a denial of the relevance of language which is wholly alien to the Victorine writers. His narrow concentration on the divine nature itself, moreover, which implies the final transcendence of all God's apprehensible manifestations, necessarily deposes Christ from the central role which he occupies in Victorine mysticism and thus minimizes the use of Christocentric language in the English text - except, as in the second chapter, where the preliminary meditative stages of the contemplative ascent are under discussion.

Nevertheless, while it will be shown that the Cloud author's attitude to language is in general characteristically Dionysian, he is demonstrably influenced by the Victorine interpretation of certain elements of Dionysian terminology which became assimilated into its vocabulary. The central "cloud" image of the English text, for example, is coloured by the suggestion of a twofold function which belongs to Richard's adaptation of the Dionysian concept. In Benjamin Major IV, 22, Richard writes,

In medium nebulae Moyses ingreditur, quando humana mens ab illa divini luminis immensitate absorpta, summa sui oblivione sopitur; ita ut mirari valeas, et juste mirari debeas quomodo concordet ibi nubes cum igne, et ignis cum nube: nubes ignorantiae, cum nube<sup>40</sup> illuminatae intelligentiae. Ignorantia et oblivio notorum et expertorum cum revelatione et intelligentia, prius ignotorum et eousque inexpertorum. Nam uno eodemque tempore humana intelligentia, et ad divina illuminatur, et ad humana obnubilatur.<sup>41</sup>

The passage finds an echo in such passages as Cloud 24/2-4, where Richard's version of the "caliginem ignorantiae" of the De Mystica Theologia I, "nubes ignorantiae", is reproduced in the "clowde of



vnknowing" of the English text, and his intimation that the cloud operates differently in respect of earthly and divine realities is accounted for in the complementary "clowde of forzetyng":

... þee byhouep, as þis clowde of vnknowyng is abouen þee, bitwix þee & þi God, rizt so put a clowde of forzetyng bineþ þee, bitwix þee & alle cretures þat euer ben maad.

The Cloud follows Richard in consistently emphasizing the exertion needed to repress all forms of hindrance to the contemplative act,<sup>42</sup> and in such contexts as Benjamin Major IV,1, he refers to the contemplative effort by the term subsequently favoured by the Cloud author - "opus", "werk". In the extract from the Cloud, however, the "clowde of forzetyng" is clearly distinguished from the "clowde of vnknowyng" and the English author insists with few exceptions that the contemplative experience of a transcendent God cannot take place otherwise than in a cloud of unknowing:

... for 3if euer schalt þou fele him or see him, as it may be here, it behouep alweis be in þis clowde & in þis derknes (Cloud 17/7-9).

Richard's "nubes ignorantiae", however, itself incorporates both the functions delineated in the English text, as a later passage from the Benjamin Major confirms:

Ad idem respicit quod discipulos Christi nubes lucida obumbravit. Una itaque et eadem nubes et lucendo obumbravit, et obumbrando illuminavit, quia et illuminavit ad divina et obnuvilavit ad humana.<sup>43</sup>

It is apparent, moreover, that where the Cloud author accentuates the incomprehensibility of God and the consequent distance of unitive experience of His presence from all finite modes of knowledge - the "darkness", therefore, of loving union with Him - Richard, by contrast,

affirms that such experience , though obscure in the sense that it does not accord with normal principles of rationality, nevertheless entails knowledge, illumination.<sup>44</sup>

In general terms, the Cloud author profits most from the Victorines in respect of the definition which they brought to mystical theology, their analysis and classification of the psychology and activities of the contemplative ascent and its various stages. The English writer does not share the exegetical bias of Richard and Hugh, but he adopts many of their interpretations of scriptural texts in terms of the mystic way: Privy Counselling 150/10-23, for example, recalls Richard's exegesis of the biblical account of Rachel's death in giving birth to Benjamin as the transcendence of reason with the advent of ecstasy; Cloud chs.71-3 restates Richard's categorization of the different types of contemplative by analogy with Moses, Aaron and Bezaleel in Benjamin Major IV, 22-23, and the author's self-deprecatory claim to fulfil the role of Bezaleel echoes Richard's assessment of his own function in V, 1 of the same work; the prolonged discussion of the active and contemplative lives in Cloud chs.17-23 is based on Richard's interpretation of Luke's account of Martha and Mary, and there is a particularly close verbal recollection of Benjamin Major I, 1 -

Haec est pars quae electis et perfectis nunquam aufertur.  
Hoc sane negotium quod nullo fine terminatur. Nam veritatis  
contemplatio in hac vita inchoatur, sed in futura jugi  
perpetuitate celebratur<sup>45</sup> -

in Cloud 52/20-23: Christ

... seyde þat Mary had chosen þe best partye, þe whiche schuld neuer be taken fro hir. For whi þat parfite sterying of loue þat byginneþ here is euen in noumbre wiþ þat þat schal last wiþouten ende in þe blis of heuen; for al is bot one.

It is significant, however, that while both writers stress the continuity between earthly contemplative union and the union which obtains in eternity, the English author focusses on the singleness of the loving impulse; Richard, on the other hand, describes an intellectual apprehension which is extended and perfected in the beatific vision.

The account of the faculties of the soul in Cloud chs. 63-66 also derives, as is commonly pointed out, from Richard's categorization in Benjamin Minor 3-6, though the subject is subsidiary to the main preoccupations of the English work and its treatment comparatively perfunctory.<sup>46</sup> Indeed, while the English author here reaffirms the Victorine principle that the reason is dependent on the secondary faculty of imagination, he is uncompromising in restricting their roles to the preliminary stages of the mystic ascent and also accentuates their potential to drag the soul advanced in contemplation down from the eminence it has achieved. He is equally un-Victorine in the severe limitations which he imposes on the efficacy of the allied activity of meditation. The complexity of his attitude emerges clearly from a passage in Privy Counselling:

&, I preie þee, how schuldest þou com to þis worching by þe vse of þi wittys? Sekirly neuer; ne 3it by þi faire wise, þi sotyle & þi queinte ymaginacions & meditacions, 3e, þof þei be of þi wrechid leuying, þe Passion of Criste, þe ioies of oure Lady, or of alle þe seintes & aungelles of heuen, or 3it of eny qualite or sotilte or condicion þat perteynþ to þe beyng of þiself or of God. Sekirly me had leuer haue soche a nakid blynde felyng of myself as I touchid before (not of my doynge bot of myself. Many men clepen here doynge hemself, & it is not so; for one am I þat do, & anoþer aren my dedes þat ben done. & þe same it is of God; for one is he in himself, & anoþer ben his werkes). & raper it schuld breke myn herte in teres for lackyng of felyng of God & for þe painful birþin of myself, & kyndil my desire in loue & desiryng after þe felyng of God, þan alle þe sotyle & þe queynte ymaginacions or meditacions þat man kan telle or may fynde wretyn in book, be þei neuer so holy ne schewe þei neuer so feire to þe sotyle ize of þi corious witte

Neuerþeles 3it ben þees faire meditacions þe trewest wey þat a synner may haue in his begynnyng to be goostly felyng of himself & of God. (P.C. 157/27 - 158/19).<sup>47</sup>

He is explicitly nervous of the power of meditation on past offences to rekindle the impulse to sin,<sup>48</sup> and he emphatically opposes any reversion to the imaginative and rational faculties as a means of recapturing the contemplative experience through meditation on the divine attributes - a procedure which Richard formally recommends in Benjamin Major IV, 17-18:

For it nedip not now in encrease of þi perfeccion to go bak in fedying of þi wittys, as it is in beholdyng of þe qualitees of þi beyng, so þat þou miȝtest by soche beholdyng fede & fille þin affeccion wiþ louely & likyng felynges in God & goostly þinges, & þin vnderstondyng wiþ goostly wisdome of holy meditations in seching after þe knowyng of God. (P.C. 143/3-8).<sup>49</sup>

It is significant, moreover, that much of the important fifth chapter of the Benjamin Minor which details Richard's theory of knowledge, emphasizing its basis in the imagination and its analogical progress through the power of reason from the visible to the invisible - the foundation, indeed, of his affirmative mystical theology - is excluded from the Cloud author's English version of the text.

The importance of the Victorines as specifying and analysing the activities proper to the various stages of the contemplative ascent has already been underlined, and the impact of Hugh's theorizing on the Cloud author is nowhere more telling than in respect of his teaching on prayer. The key text in this connexion is Hugh's De Modo Orandi.<sup>50</sup> The catalogue of various kinds of prayer at the beginning of Privy Counselling (135/13-19), for example, may owe something to the distinctions which Hugh formulates in this work; certainly, the differentiation which the English writer incorporates here between prayer which is "...mental wiþinne endited by þouȝt or vocale wiþouten by pronounsying of worde" is a major theme of the Latin text. The lively section on the efficacy

of brief ejaculatory prayer in Cloud chs. 36-39, where all meaning is concentrated in the single words "synne" and "God" -

For it is best whan it is in pure spirit, wipoutyn specyall pouzt or any pronounsyng of worde; bot zif it be any seeldom tyme, when for habundaunce of spiryt it brestip up into worde (Cloud 78/20-23) =

graphically restates Hugh's definition in the second chapter of his treatise on prayer:

Sciendum est etiam, quod supplicatio aliquando fit per sola nomina sicut est illud: 'Misericordia mea, refugium meum, susceptor meus, liberator meus, Deus meus, adjutor meus' (Psal. CXL111). Aliquando per sola verba sicut est respice, miserere, placare, attende et fac. Aliquando simul per nomina et verba sicut est illud: 'Verba me audire percipe, Domine, intellige clamorem meum. Intende voci orationis meae rex meus, et Deus meus' (Psal.V). Sed illud genus supplicationis, quod per sola nomina fit, quando magis est foris significatione imperfectum, tanto magis intus est abundantia dilectionis plenum. Affectus enim hoc proprium habet, quo quanto major et ferventior intus est, tanto minus foris per vocem explicari potest. Illud vero genus supplicationis, quod per sola verba exprimitur, minorem quidem isto devotionem indicat, majorem autem illo, quod nominibus simul et verbis, plena videlicet significatione pronuntiatur. Illud igitur, quod solis nominibus fit, ad puram orationem pertinere videtur, quod solis verbis ad exactionem; quod nominibus simul et verbis ad captationem. Ita ut pura oratio magis in jubulum convertatur, et appropinquet Deo, perveniat citius, et efficacius obtineat. 51

Similarly, Hugh's definition of pure prayer,

Pura oratio est, quando ex abundantia devotionis mens ita accenditur, ut cum se ad Deum postulatura converterit, prae amoris ejus magnitudine etiam petitionis suae obliviscatur; et dum amore ejus, quem videt, perfrui vehementer concupiscit totaque jam illi vacare desiderat ejus etiam, pro quo venit, curam libenter postponat,<sup>52</sup>

in which he terms this "bursting up" of the spirit a catching fire and emphasizes the self-forgetfulness of the soul when it attains this perfection, finds echoes in various contexts of the Cloud Corpus: in particular, Privy Counselling 156/16-20 offers the following description

of the height of contemplative prayer:

& þis is þe trewe condicion of a parfite loue, only vtterly to spoyle hymself of himself for þat þing þat he louiþ, & not admit ne suffre to be cloped bot only in þat þing þat he louiþ; & þat not only for a tyme, bot eendlessly to be vmbilappid þerin, in ful & fynal forȝetyng of hymself,

and Cloud 62/14-19 uses the image of fire to express the effect of the divine intervention which may reward the soul's effort when it has achieved this state:

þan wil he sumtyme paraenture seend oute a beme of goostly lizt, peersyng þis cloude of vnknowing þat is bitwix þee & hym, & schewe þee sum of his priuete, þe whiche man may not, ne kan not, speke. þan schalt þou fele þine affeccion enflaumid wip þe fiire of his loue, fer more þen I kan telle þee, or may, or wile, at þis tyme.

It is impracticable to detail here all examples of the Cloud author's possible indebtedness to the Victorines, though some of the more interesting are worthy of remark.<sup>53</sup> The concept of self as a lump of sin and a burden to the soul aspiring to contemplation, as it occurs in such extracts as this from Cloud ch.44 -

For as ofte as he wolde haue a trewe wetyng & a felyng of his God in purtee of spirit, as it may be here, & siþen felip þat he may not - for he findeþ euermore his wetyng & his felyng as it were ocupied & fillyd wip a foule stinkyng lumpe of himself, þe whiche behouep alweis be hatid & be dispisid & forsaken, if he schal be Goddes parfite dissiple, lernid of hymself in þe mount of perfeccion - as ofte he goþ ni wod for sorow; in so mochel, þat he wepiþ & weiliþ, striuiþ, cursiþ & banneþ, & schortly to sey, hym þinkiþ þat he beriþ so heuy a birþen of hymself þat he rechiþ neuer what worþ hym, so þat God were plesid (Cloud 84/11-20) -

is strongly reminiscent of Hugh's imagery in, for example, the De Arca Noe Morali III, 10, where he describes the debasing effect of pride and excessive curiosity on the would-be contemplative:

Fit sibi ipsi gravis animus et quasi plumbum immobilis permanens sursum erigi non valet. Et qui prius pennis contemplationis coelos penetrare consueverat, nunc gravis pressus pondere sub se cadit.<sup>54</sup>

The comparison of the over-eager contemplative to a "gredy grehounde" (Cloud 87/19) possibly recalls Hugh's description of false contemplatives who,

in agendo vel audiendo quasi canes sitientes linguam protendunt.<sup>55</sup>

There are similar references to God's hiding from man in order to stimulate his devotion in Cloud 132/4-18 (cf. Privy Counselling 168/10-169/26) and the De Arca Noe Morali IV, 9-10. More generally, the distaste for curiosity which characterizes the Cloud author's writings is equally marked in Hugh of St.-Victor - the above reference from the De Arca Noe Morali III, 10 is representative in this respect - and the championing of discretion in spiritual matters by both Hugh and Richard is warmly echoed in the Cloud Corpus.<sup>56</sup>

It should be added, however, that in some such instances there may have been intermediary influences on the Cloud author from other works which also drew on Victorine sources. Affinities between the Cloud author and Gallus and Balma on some of these points have already been noted in Ch. III. Further, the notion of God's withdrawal of His immediate presence (though not of His grace) from the contemplative as a means of stimulating devotion, for example, recurs in Letters IX and X of the Scala Claustralium by the Carthusian Guigo II - a frequently cited analogue for the Cloud which itself owes much to Bernardine and Victorine theology.<sup>57</sup> The text is particularly indebted to Hugh for its experiential character, its focus on Christ and extensive use of biblical language and example - its sensuous nuptial imagery has close affinities with Hugh's application of the vocabulary of the Canticle in the De Arrha Animae. In respect of its threefold division of the

contemplative life into the purgative, illuminative and unitive ways, however, the Scala Claustralium is in the tradition of Origen and Ps.-Dionysius. Its author also derives his concept of the ecstatic nature of mystic union from Dionysian theology, though his precedent in this is Victorine and he adopts the Victorine interpretation of the Dionysian theory.<sup>58</sup> The Scala Claustralium stands, therefore, in much the same general relationship to the Cloud of Unknowing as the Victorine texts under consideration - as an important source for the English work, that is, but not in the area of negative mysticism in the Dionysian tradition.<sup>59</sup> Further instances in which parallels exist in both Hugh and Guigo for Cloud material - illustrative of the difficulty of establishing the precise inspiration for some aspects of the English treatise - include the classification of the contemplative progression as "lectio", "meditatio", "oratio", "contemplatio",<sup>60</sup> and the grading of contemplatives as "incipientes", "proficientes" or "perfecti".<sup>61</sup> It is noteworthy, moreover, that both these classifications - though by the fourteenth century they had achieved sufficiently widespread currency to make identification of the Cloud author's immediate source impracticable - reappear together, as they do in chapter 35 of the Cloud, in another possible analogue of the English text, the De Contemplatione by the Carthusian Guigo du Pont,<sup>62</sup> and that the second of the two is fundamental to the thought and organization of the important Viae Syon Lugent of Hugh of Balma.<sup>63</sup>

It has already been suggested that comparison of the Cloud with Victorine works in terms of the theory of language which governs their composition is inappropriate; there are, however, several interesting and perhaps significant similarities of style and form between the writings of the English author and Hugh of St. Victor. It is possible,



for example, that the form and tone of the Cloud of Unknowing may have been influenced by Hugh's De Institutione Novitiorum.<sup>64</sup> Some of the important resemblances and distinctions between the two works have been noted above; in addition to these, it may be observed that both are treatises of guidance for novices and share many of the characteristics which are calculated to suit their audience and purpose: a pervasive air of good sense; variation of pace in order to stimulate interest (though this is much more marked in Cloud, where it is complemented by a personal tone which is absent from Hugh's work); the use of short readily digestible chapters whose main points are often succinctly restated in the final paragraph; inclusion of descriptions such as those of the false contemplatives which are memorable for their very vividness, and simple images or similes which impress by their closeness to common experience (the comparison of the indiscreet contemplative to a man who, gazing blissfully at the sky, fails to notice the pitfalls at his feet in ch. IX of the De Institutione Novitiorum is of this kind) - these are the techniques of the practised teacher which are used to such good effect in the Cloud. Similarly, some of the stylistic features of the Cloud which contribute to its success as a manual of instruction may owe something to Hugh's example. It is clearly difficult to single out as a specific influence on the Cloud any one author from the Latin tradition to whose work as a whole the style of the text is so indebted: a markedly rhetorical prose, extensive use of rhythm and the musical quality of language, are not characteristics which are exclusive to Hugh, though, as the following passage from the De Institutione Novitiorum amply demonstrates, they are a distinctive feature of his work:

Item disciplina est membrorum omnium motus ordinatus, et dispositio decens in omni habitu et actione. Audistis quid

sit disciplina, nunc attendite quam utilis et quam necessaria est. Disciplina est compes cupiditas, malorum desidorium carcer, frenum lasciviae, elationis jugum, vinculum iracundiae, quae domat intemperantiam, levitatem ligat, et omnes inordinatos motus mentis atque illicitos appetitus suffocat.<sup>65</sup>

The striking qualities of the prose in this extract - its echoing rhythms, alliteration, verbal pairings, balanced syntax and physical imagery - are all characteristic of the English text. Perhaps more important, however, in respect of its possible influence on the Cloud, is the way in which these features combine with crisp definitions and direct address to the audience in order to produce a piece of prose which is at once lucid and easily assimilable. It may be, therefore, that the Cloud owes more to Hugh's De Institutione Novitiorum for its teaching technique which exploits form and style to inculcate meaning than has hitherto been acknowledged.

## APPENDIX II

Possible secondary influences on the Cloud author from texts associated with the Dionysian mystical tradition: the De Contemplatione and the De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis

There has not been space enough in this thesis to give adequate consideration to possible intermediaries between Hugh of Balma and the Cloud author in the transmission of the Dionysian negative mystical tradition. It has already been noted, however, that Hugh's work was widely popular on the continent during the later thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, and especially within the Carthusian order to which he belonged. The Carthusians, indeed, seem to have been the principal guardians of the Dionysian tradition during this period - not only through the texts which they themselves produced, but also through the mystical literature which they influenced and disseminated. It seems appropriate, therefore, to give some account of two of the major texts in this category which may have some bearing on the Cloud of Unknowing and which future research may show to indicate something of its likely provenance and authorship.

### De Contemplatione

The first is the De Contemplatione by Guigo du Pont, monk of the Grande Chartreuse who died in 1297. The fullest account of this still unedited treatise is that of J.P. Grausem, S.J., in his article "Le De Contemplatione du Chartreux Guigues du Pont (†1297)".<sup>1</sup> Grausem suggests that Guigo composed the treatise towards the end of his life, possibly after 1285, and that his work was never known to a large audience, though it was used by such influential members of his own order as Denis the Carthusian and Ludolphus of Saxony. He records

only three extant manuscripts of the text: Paris B.N. MS 14978 ff.216<sup>a</sup>-277<sup>b</sup>, which dates from the fifteenth century and belonged to the Abbey of St. Victor in Paris; Charleville MS 56, a fourteenth century manuscript from the Charterhouse of Mont Dieu; Bibliothèque Mazarine MS 960. Of these, only B.N. MS 14978 is complete, though it contains many errors.<sup>2</sup> There is, however, a further manuscript of the text, now Stonyhurst College MS LXV111: it comprises ff.32<sup>b</sup>-51, and is headed "Liber de contemplatione editus a domino guigone de ponte". The manuscript runs to 247 leaves, and is made up of diverse ascetical treatises in different hands, including works by Hugh and Richard of St. Victor, St. Bernard and St. Anselm. It is of Low German workmanship and an inscription on one of the fly leaves, "Liber Carthusiensi in Rurimūdo" indicates that it once belonged to the Carthusian monastery at Ruremons.<sup>3</sup>

The De Contemplatione is divided into three complementary parts, which amount to three distinct tracts on the contemplative life.<sup>4</sup> It is an eclectic text, which cites St. Gregory, Richard of St. Victor, William of St. Thierry and St. Bernard besides Hugh of Balma himself,<sup>5</sup> and is overburdened with excessive classifications and repetitions. It is founded, however, as Grausem notes, on a twofold division of contemplative experience which embraces both major traditions of mystical theology:

S'inspirant à la fois de l'Aréopagite et de saint Bernard, Guigues distingue la contemplation 'spéculative' (intellectuelle, affirmative) et la contemplation 'anagogique' (affective, négative).<sup>6</sup>

The same interrelation of divergent theological traditions is also apparent in Hugh of Balma, but to different effect. Grausem observes that Guigo achieves no real synthesis between the two, and demonstrates

that, although he declares a preference for the negative way, the De Contemplatione is not characteristically Dionysian in the sense that the adjective aptly describes the Viae Syon Lugent:

Comme on le voit, notre chartreux s'efforce de faire coïncider, dans la description de ces deux modes de contemplation, le point de vue de Denys l'Aréopagite (affirmative-négative) avec celui qu'esquisse Bernard et que développe un des maîtres préférés de Guigues, l'auteur de la Theologia Mystica, Hugues de Balma (intellectuelle-affective). Mais le raccord reste artificiel: de la division dionysienne le De contemplatione ne conserve guère que les termes, et ses explications se ramènent en somme à l'antithèse de l'abbé de Clairvaux: 'Duo (sunt) contemplationis excessus: in intellectu unus, et alter in affectu; unus in lumine, alter in fervore; unus in agnitione, alter in devotione' (Serm. in Cantica XLIX,4; P.L. CLXXXIII, 1018).<sup>7</sup>

The Viae Syon Lugent and the De Contemplatione nevertheless have important elements in common - though not all are peculiar to these texts: the centrality of love and grace in unitive contemplation; the categorisation of contemplatives as "incipientes", "proficientes" and "perfecti" (see De Contemplatione III, ff.250<sup>a</sup>-277<sup>b</sup>); the insistence on the experiential nature of contemplation. There are other points on which the two authors agree, but with considerable difference in emphasis: Hugh is less concerned than Guigo with details of the exercises proper to the contemplative life ("lectio", "meditatio", "oratorio", "desiderium"), for example, and with the need to participate in the life of Christ through meditation. Guigo owes most to Hugh, however, in respect of his theory of the loving "adhesions" - Guigo's term is consistently "adhaerere" - which progressively unite the soul to God:

Par la pratique prolongée de ces deux 'adhésions' l'essor de l'âme se fera de jour en jour plus spontané. Bientôt elle pourra se passer de toute considération préparatoire, de tout intermédiaire: l'amour l'entraînera directement vers Dieu dans une contemplation tout aimante.<sup>8</sup>

The inspiration for this is clearly Hugh's account of the soul's unitive

aspirations, and the De Contemplatione and the Cloud of Unknowing stand in a similar dependent relation to the Viae Syon Lugent in respect of this area of their theology. Guigo's divergences from Hugh's theology on other points of doctrine, however, are without parallel in the English text. Grausem comments on these differences:

À propos de la contemplation anagogique Guigues recommande l'opuscule de son confrère: 'de (contemplatione anagogica) optime loquitur libellus qui incipit Vie Syon Lugent, quem studiose legat qui ad hanc vult pervenire' (f.226<sup>r</sup>); mais le jugeant obscur et prolix, il veut le mettre à la portée des débutants. En réalité, s'il partage les préférences de Hugues pour la contemplation affective, il atténue beaucoup sa doctrine. Non seulement il donne une place beaucoup plus grande aux exercices proprement ascétiques et à la contemplation spéculative, mais il note expressément que la contemplation affective n'est jamais entièrement dépourvu d'élément intellectuel. On peut arriver, dit-il, à l'union mystique par les deux voies, 'quamvis, ut videtur, nec excessus intellectivus possit fieri sine affectivus nec affectivus equidem sine commistione intellectivi' (f.240<sup>v</sup>). Malgré cette importante restriction, l'influence exercée sur Guigues par la Theologia mystica est très sensible. C'est à elle qu'il faut attribuer également, semble-t-il, l'importance qu'il accorde aux aspirations.<sup>9</sup>

Both authors stress the ecstatic nature of the unitive experience: the second part of the De Contemplatione enumerates the twelve consolations which God bestows on the soul during the contemplative ascent, and the seventh to the eleventh are identified as mystical graces which precede the ultimate beatific vision, while the eleventh level itself - the height of contemplative experience in this life - is labelled the domain of excessus mentis:

Item videtur Deus per perfectum mentis excessum sicut viderunt Angeli, infra. Item videtur Deus veraciter et perfectissime sicut est in beata patria ab illis qui sunt in regione vivorum... Omnes iste visiones usque ad penultimam que fit per perfectum excessum haberi possunt modo. In hoc excessu Deus videtur per essentiam, non enim ante istum excessum consummatus erit iste gradus undecimus scilicet mentis excessus. Cum autem ad hunc gradum scilicet mentis excessum felix et beata iam coram Domino pia mens perfecte pervenerit, solo carnis pariete distat a beata vita, quo soluto intrabit sine repulsa in gaudium Domini sui,

ut cum illis Domino Deo vivat in eternum quorum consortio in  
terris exulans iungebatur.<sup>10</sup>

Guigo, however, unlike Hugh and unlike the Cloud author, insists that the intellect, though raised through ecstasy from its natural sphere of operation, is nevertheless still involved in the unitive vision - Grausem suggests that his source for the theory of unitive knowledge is William of St. Thierry rather than Hugh of Balma - and he envisages a single continuous ascent from the soul's turning from sin, to its ecstatic awareness and even to the beatific vision which it enjoys eternally. Guigo's divergence from Hugh is thus radical and obtains in the precise area of his theology which above all distinguishes Hugh from his predecessor in the Dionysian mystical tradition, Thomas Gallus, and seems to ally him with the English author of the Cloud of Unknowing.

#### De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis

Wolfgang Riehle has recently recalled attention to the De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis by the Franciscan Rudolph of Biberach as a possible analogue for the Cloud of Unknowing. The English summary affixed to his Studien zur englischen Mystik des Mittelalters unter besonderer Berücksichtigung ihrer Metaphorik makes reference to the widespread reception of Dionysian mysticism in vernacular literature on the continent during the fourteenth century, and he notes,

This voluminous work... contains passages strikingly similar to the Cloud when it speaks of the affective experience of God in a night of unknowing. This text, which may well have found its way to England, is more closely related in thought to the Cloud than the treatise De Adhaerendo Deo,<sup>11</sup> which has so far been considered as a text exhibiting some parallels with the Cloud. In fact, the De Adhaerendo Deo of Johannes von Kastl is itself closely related to De Septem Itineribus because it has extracted from the latter a number of quotations. As De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis was a text dear to the Carthusians and

Augustinian canons, it might well be that these two orders, who did so much for the propagation of mystical texts in England, introduced Rudolf's work to an English public.

The most comprehensive account of the text and its manuscript history is contained in Margot Schmidt's edition of the German version, Rudolf von Biberach. Die Siben Strassen zu Got.<sup>12</sup> The Latin text was written in the late thirteenth or early fourteenth century. Its author was a popular and respected figure in his community, and the text reached a vast and varied audience. Schmidt records more than a hundred manuscripts of the Latin text, which demonstrate that its readership extended to all levels of secular clergy, university circles and even the nobility. It was, however, particularly popular among the Carthusians and Augustinians - Schmidt specifies eighteen manuscripts from continental Charterhouses alone. The vernacular text - possibly produced by the Dominicans of Basel between 1345 and 1360, and perhaps connected with female monastic communities - was equally widely read. Schmidt lists only two manuscripts from England: MS Middlehill Cod.789 (from the private collection of Sir Thomas Phillips, present whereabouts unknown), and Oxford Bodleian Cod. 52 ('Iste liber est monasterii caritatis' saec. XV; Saec. XLV ex. f.35ra-62vb). The Bodleian manuscript also contains De Septem Donis Spiritus Sancti by the same author and various tracts on the contemplative life by Hugh and Richard of St. Victor, Thomas Gallus and Bonaventura. The exact provenance of these manuscripts is unknown.<sup>13</sup>

The De Septem Itineribus is a compilation of contemplative theology assembled from more than forty sources, both classical and patristic. Apart from the Bible - Rudolph draws heavily on the traditional exegesis of the Canticle as a pattern for the mystic ascent - the author's principal



authorities are Augustine, Ps.-Dionysius, St. Gregory, St. Bernard, Hugh and Richard of St. Victor, and, above all, Thomas Gallus. The treatise was not, however, conceived as a doctrinal compendium: though it does not seem to have been directed to a particular audience, it nevertheless reflects the personal convictions of its author and his pressing concern with the individual soul's progress to union with God.<sup>14</sup> Rudolph is discriminating and not uncritical in the treatment of his sources. Thus in defining contemplation, he gives prominence to Gallus' theory over those of Richard of St. Victor, Ps.-Augustinus (the De Spiritu et Anima) and Origen which he also reviews. His work is marked by the preoccupation of his age with the respective roles of amor and intellectus in the contemplative way,<sup>15</sup> and he follows Gallus in consistently affirming the primacy of love as a mode of knowledge and classifying Richard's as an intellectual theory of contemplation. Margot Schmidt offers this assessment of Rudolph's contribution to the development of contemplative theology:

Das Neuartige bei Rudolf von Biberach ist, daß er die Tradition von der geistigen Welt des Areopagiten und seiner Kommentatoren, Hugo von St. Viktor, Thomas Gallus und Robert Grosseteste, in Auseinandersetzung mit Richard von St. Viktor sieht. Mit dieser Überlieferung wird in besonderer Weise das stets unendlich übergreifende Ewigkeitsbewußtsein und die alles sprengende transzendente Erfahrung, das Mysterium, in den Vordergrund gestellt zu einer Zeit, in der die Hochscholastik die Herrschaft der klar und fest umreißenen 'ratio' und des alles begreifenden 'intellectus' sich durchgesetzt zu haben scheint.<sup>16</sup>

Rudolph's inclusion of material from Ps.-Dionysius and his extensive use of the Dionysian commentators (notably Gallus, but also Grosseteste), moreover, meant that he figured largely in the popularisation of Dionysian theology. His influence on German mysticism was particularly great, and the vernacular translation of his work did much to shape the vocabulary of German mystical literature:

Whether Rudolph's direct influence extended to the author of the Cloud of Unknowing is, however, difficult to ascertain. The present survey of the De Septem Itineribus, it must be admitted, has found no evidence which proves conclusively that it did. To put the case more precisely, the two texts hold certain convictions in common and contain some passages which are without question strikingly similar - but the issue of dependence is confused by the eclectic nature of the De Septem Itineribus. Both texts seem to have drawn on the same sources, and, in particular, both make extensive use of Gallus' work on the Dionysian Corpus. The Cloud author may well have appreciated the De Septem Itineribus for its assemblage of contemplative theology and its confirmation of Gallus' interpretation of Dionysian principles, with its insistence on the primacy of love as a cognitive faculty - but it is difficult to locate distinctive points on which the two texts agree, and the apparent divergences in key aspects of the contemplative theory which the two authors propound suggest, at least, that Rudolph was not a profound or pervasive influence on the mystical theology which informs the Cloud author's work.

Rudolph's account of the contemplative way is closely modelled on that of Gallus, which is itself grounded on the Dionysian concept of the angelic hierarchy. He restates Gallus' threefold division of the ascent into the domains of nature, nature and grace, and grace alone, and confirms that the last is the domain of mentis excessus where the natural operations of the intellect and the affection reach their term, the activity of the intellect is suspended and the soul passively experiences the divine presence through its unitive faculty, the affectus principalis.<sup>18</sup> Like Gallus, Rudolph insists on the singleness and continuity of the ascent from its beginnings in

purgation to its fulfilment in the experience of union. This is implicit in the structure of the De Septem Itineribus, which is sectionalized according to the phases of the ascent and presupposes the growth of each stage out of the one which precedes it. The text does not accommodate Hugh of Balma's development of Gallus' theology which isolates the unitive faculty and the unitive way. In this it is at variance with the Cloud - as also in the prominence which it gives to the notion that the culmination of and justification for the contemplative way is a life of generous activity on earth. The altruistic ideal of contemplation is taken account of in the Book of Privy Counselling -

... a verey & a parfite sacrificer of himself þus by a comon entent vnto alle dop þat in him is to knit alle men to God as effectuely as himself is. (P.C. 142/20-22) -

but Rudolph, giving full weight to the physical as well as the spiritual aspects of man's nature, clearly envisages a more material contribution to the well-being of mankind which is more in line with the contemplative ideal embodied by Moses in Gregory of Nyssa's exegesis of the Book of Exodus. He devotes the final chapter of his treatise to the pastoral obligations of the contemplative, taking Hugh of St. Victor's Didascalicon VII, 26 as his authority:

'Want bekanntnissi der warheit machet (den menschen) nüt volkomen, es gange denn dar nach hab der tugend an wūrkenne', als Hvgo spricht. Er spricht öch alsus: 'Waz hilfet vns, ob wir in got bekennen d<sup>v</sup> h<sup>o</sup>hi siner maiestat vnd siner grösse, so wir dar vns enheinen nütz samnen? Want wenne wir komen von der inren götlichen heinlich<sup>e</sup>i der beschö<sup>d</sup>, waz mugen wir denne mit vns bringen, want liecht der biltsamen wūrkvnge'?<sup>19</sup>

Rudolph's attention to the dual nature of man in his concept of the contemplative life is also reflected in the central role which

Christ occupies in his theology. He insists that Christ is the focus of man's sense faculties in his humanity, and of the inner spiritual senses through his divinity. He thus gives more prominence than the Cloud author to experiential knowledge of God through the spiritual senses, to the need for the soul to be reformed in the image of Christ and to the mystery of the sacrament<sup>20</sup> - though the English texts themselves insist on the basic premise that Christ's manhood is the door to his Godhead. Rudolph's emphasis on the centrality of Christ is echoed by Johannes von Kastl in the De Adhaerendo Deo.

The three authors also hold a common conviction that the proper mastery and direction of the will is a prerequisite of the contemplative way. Rudolph's term is "recta intentio": he urges that the contemplative must progressively abandon self and adhere to the divine will, and that this end is to be achieved through recollection and meditation and through the concentration of the soul's loving impulse on God. This too is the main theme of the De Adhaerendo Deo. Rudolph takes as his authority for this the De Quattuor Gradibus Violentiae Caritatis:

Si minnet nüt an eines vnd dūr eines. Ir mag nüt gnüg sin an eines, als ir öch nüt mag smekken, nūwant dur eines. Si minnet einus, sie erwelt einus ... Was vber das ir begegunt, daz in der begirde nüt en ist, daz verwirft si balde, daz trit si vnder ir füsse balde...<sup>21</sup>

The image of trampling impediments to love for God under foot recurs in the second chapter of the text, where Rudolph's source is Gregory's Moralia V, 28:

'Dis verborgenen Wort ist ein rede einer inren zŷgeistvnge, dŷ berŷrende das Gemŷt old den geist erhebt, vnd nidertrvckende zŷtlich gedenke enphlammot den geist mit ewigen begirden, das in nŷt gelüste ze gedenkenne den oberstv ding vnd alle nidre ding versmahe ...<sup>22</sup>

The thought and expression in both cases are clearly close to the Cloud, though Rudolph was not necessarily the Cloud author's immediate source for them and, indeed, it has been suggested that Hugh of Balma was a more likely influence on their particular application in the Cloud Corpus.

Rudolph's theory of unitive knowledge endorses and often cites Gallus. As such it has much in common with the Cloud and it similarly reproduces the traditional vocabulary and verbal models which characterize Dionysian mystical theology. In Ch.V, whose main theme is the unitive knowledge of God which the soul achieves through love, Rudolph writes,

Hie bi merken wir, daz d<sup>v</sup> g<sup>u</sup>tat der minne vbertrift vnd vbergat d<sup>u</sup> g<sup>u</sup>tat verstantlicher bekennung an etlichen staffel. Aber als vil als der minne g<sup>u</sup>tat vbertrift bekennen, also vil vbergat si daz bekennen, ber<sup>u</sup>rende got in etlichen staffel der minne, z<sup>v</sup> dem d<sup>v</sup> g<sup>u</sup>tat, des verstantlich bekennen kommen n<sup>u</sup>t mag, want d<sup>v</sup> minsami g<sup>u</sup>tat ist vberverstantlich, zem minsten hie in disem lebenne want in dem vatterlande 'werden wir sehent Got, als er est'.<sup>23</sup>

'Ein ieklicher mensche, der mit der vnbegriffenlichkeit vereint wirt, d<sup>v</sup> ell<sup>v</sup> ding ist, der wirt gesetzzet in ein vbertreffendes wesen, daz enhein vernunft ervaren mag noch enhein v<sup>u</sup>rstant beschowen mag, vnd ein solcher mensche ist von allen dingen vnd als von im selben gescheiden vnd wirt vereint furstantlich mit fureinung der minne, d<sup>v</sup> wurkt daz gewer bekennen mit gotte, der im doch vnbekant ist, vnd ist doch daz bekennen vil besser denne daz verstantlich bekennen, so der mensche lat das v<sup>u</sup>rstantlich bekennen vnd bekent got vber verstantnissi vnd vber gem<sup>u</sup>te'. (Gallus, Extractio, Dionysiaca I, 710). Vnzvnt har ret der lerer. Hie macht d<sup>v</sup> merken, daz d<sup>v</sup> vberverstantlicher ofnung beschilt n<sup>u</sup>t mit verstantlichem bekennende want mit der air br<sup>v</sup>nnendosten, vberwallenden, 'enphintlicher bekentnissi' der minne.<sup>24</sup>

Rudolph, like Johannes von Kastl, does not entirely displace the intellect and its higher function, the intelligentia, from the contemplative way: unitive knowledge is beyond the scope of the discursive power of reason, but he insists that sapientia acquisita must pave the way for the divinely infused wisdom which crowns the ascent. He affirms

the superiority of the affective over the intellectual power, however, and of knowledge which is attained through union in the "principalis affectus" (the "fureinten vnd vberverstentlichen bekennung" which "d'v' almechtig gnade erfult der d'v' nat'ur n'vt geleisten mag")<sup>25</sup> over intellectual cognition. He characterizes unitive awareness as experiential knowledge whose medium is love.

The differences between the Cloud author's unitive theology and that of Rudolph and Gallus - in spite of the considerable common ground between them - need not be rehearsed here. If nothing more, however, the De Septem Itineribus is an interesting parallel to the Cloud as a fourteenth century exposition of the Dionysian mystical tradition, and exemplifies the continuity of that tradition, particularly in Carthusian circles. The German version, moreover, is a fund of comparisons with the Cloud and the Deonise Hid Diuinite in the vernacular rendering of Latin Dionysian terminology. It exhibits the same resourcefulness and intent to use native vocabulary and word-forms wherever possible, while preserving the content and the linguistic patterns (e.g. paradox, prefixes of negation and excess etc.) which are essential to the expression of Dionysian theology. Thus the negating prefix is consistently rendered 'un-':

"unkunst" (Lat. ignorantia); "unbekant", "unerkant" (Lat. ignotus); "untotlich" (Lat. immortalis); "unbegriflichkeit" (Lat. incomprehensibilitas); "unwortlich", "unsaglich" (Lat. ineffabilis); "ungesichtig" (Lat. invisibilis).

The "super-" prefix is uniformly "uber-":

"uberverstentlich" (Lat. superintellectualis); "uberweslich",  
"ubersubstancilich" (Lat. supersubstantialis),

and the same prefix is applied to the vocabulary which denotes excess or transcendence:

"ubergan", "ubertreffen" (Lat. excedere); "ubergang" (Lat. excessus); "ubergan" (Lat. transcendere); cf. "uszug" (Lat. ecstasis); "usziehend" (Lat. ecstaticus).

The terminology pertaining to union centres on "ein", the precise equivalent of M.E. "on" on which the unitive vocabulary of the

Deonise Hid Diuinite is based:

"vereinunge", "einunge" (Lat. unio); "vereinen" (Lat. unire);  
"einikeit" (Lat. unitas); "fureinung", "vereinigung" (Lat. unio).

As with the Deonise Hid Diuinite, the Dionysian terminology of the Die siben strassen is rendered by vernacular vocabulary wherever possible and is thus stripped of something of its esoteric quality: e.g.

"geistliche sin" (Lat. mysteria); "heimliche" (Lat. mysterium);  
"verborgen", "geistlich" (Lat. mysticus); "heimlich" (Lat. occulta); "furzuk", "gezogen" (Lat. raptus); "wisheit" (Lat. sapientia); "mit wurcherin" (Lat. cooperatrix); "lipliche sache (ding)" (Lat. corporalia); "vinstri" (Lat. caligo).

It is noteworthy, in respect of this last example, that Rudolph's phrase for the location of Moses' mystical experience, the "vinstri einer vnkunst", exactly reproduces the "caliginem ignorantiae" of the first chapter of the De Mystica Theologia: he does not include the variant form of "cloud of unknowing" which the English author favours in his original works. His interpretation of the concept of Dionysian darkness, however, is that of Gallus which also influenced the Cloud author: it at once denotes the impenetrability of God to intellectual knowledge and His entire accessibility to the anoetic cognitive power of love.

NOTES



## NOTES

### Notes to Introduction

1. Alasdair MacIntyre, 'Is religious language so idiosyncratic that we can hope for no philosophical account of it?', Religious Language and the Problem of Religious Knowledge, ed. Ronald E. Santoni (Bloomington & London, 1968), 47-51, p.47.
2. On the theology of the Word, see, for example, G. Kittel, ed., G.W. Bromiley, trans., Theological Dictionary of the New Testament (Michigan, 1967), Vol. IV, 69-136; A. Richardson, ed., Theological Wordbook of the Bible (London, 1962); A. Richardson, The Gospel According to Saint John (London, 1960) and An Introduction to the Theology of the New Testament (London, 1961).
3. In International Philosophical Quarterly, Vol. IX, No.3, Sept. 1969, 406-430, pp.412-3.
4. See Erich Auerbach, trans. R. Manheim, "Figura", Scenes from the Drama of European Literature (New York, 1959), 11-71; Beryl Smalley, The Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages (Oxford, 1952).
5. I.T. Ramsey, Religious Language (London, 1967).
6. Tomasic, art.cit., pp.427-9.
7. All references to the Cloud Corpus are to the editions of Prof. Phyllis Hodgson, 'The Cloud of Unknowing' and 'The Book of Privy Counselling', (Early English Text Society, O.S. 218, 1944 reprinted 1973), and 'Deonise Hid Diuinite' and other Treatises on Contemplative Prayer related to 'The Cloud of Unknowing' (Early English Text Society, No. 231, 1955 reprinted 1958). Page references are cited as in these two volumes, but in each case the name of the specific treatise is quoted rather than the title of the volume.
8. Stephen Gersh, From Iamblichus to Eriugena. An Investigation of the Prehistory and Evolution of the Pseudo-Dionysian Tradition (Leiden, 1978), Intro. p.1.
9. Ibid., fn, p.228.

### Notes to Chapter I

1. Details of Gregory's biography are given in Jean Daniélou, S.J., selected and introduced, Herbert Musurillo, trans. and ed., From Glory to Glory. Texts from Gregory of Nyssa (London, 1962), pp. 3-10; William Moore and Henry Austin Wilson, trans., Select Writings and Letters of Gregory, Bishop of Nyssa (Oxford, 1893), pp. 1-8.
2. See Jean Daniélou, S.J., "Gregory of Nyssa", Spirituality through the Centuries, ed. James Walsh, S.J. (London, 1964), 317-26.
3. Platonisme et Théologie Mystique (Paris, 1944), p.87.

4. Against Eunomius, Bk. XII, P.G. XLV 941D. Trans. Daniélou, From Glory to Glory, p.122. The practice of quoting Gregory in the authoritative English translation of Daniélou has been adopted for the sake of clarity and - in view of the length of some citations - economy. Where the quotations illustrate a linguistic rather than a general doctrinal point, however, the relevant Greek terms will be included in parentheses following the English version. The Greek text, for all of Gregory's works except the Life of Moses, is taken from Migne's Patrologia Graecae, Vols. XLIV-XLVI. The Life of Moses is cited in the more recent critical edition of Jean Daniélou, S.J., Grégoire de Nysse. 'La Vie de Moïse' (Sources Chrétiennes, Paris, 1968), and the parallel French translation has therefore also been quoted in preference to the English extracts in From Glory to Glory.
5. On the Beatitudes, sermon VI, P.G. XLIV 1269C-1272A. F.G.T.G., pp.100-101. See below, pp.61-3 on the significance of 'knowledge' and 'vision' in Gregory's theology.
6. Comm. on Cant., sermon VI, P.G. XLIV 893A-B. F.G.T.G., p.202.
7. Ibid. 964C-965B.
8. Ibid. 1000D-1001A. F.G.T.G. p.247. The passage is reproduced and discussed below, p.56ff, with particular reference to its linguistic significance.
9. See, for example, Gregory's interpretation of the parable of the lost drachma (Luke 15. 8-9) in On Virginity, P.G. XLVI 369B-376B. The paradigmatic relation between God and man is expressed in the mirror imagery which recurs throughout Gregory's work: e.g., ibid. 368B-D; On the Soul and the Resurrection, P.G. XLVI 89C; Comm. on Cant., sermon IV, 832D-833C; ibid., sermon XV, 1093C-1096D. See also Gabriel Horn, "Le 'Miroir' et la 'Nuée'. Deux manières de voir Dieu d'après S. Grégoire de Nysse", R.A.M., 1927, 113-31.
10. In On Virginity, 352A-D, Gregory again describes the process in terms of containing the waters of a stream in order to use their power to greatest effect.
11. P.G. XLIV 233C-256C.
12. Stephen Mackenna, trans., Plotinus 'Enneads' (London, 1969), p.63. It is taken up again by Ps.-Dionysius in the third chapter of the De Mystica Theologia.
13. See, for example, Comm. on Cant., sermon II, 805D. Gregory's divergence from platonism on this point is emphasized by Daniélou, P. et T.M., p.44.
14. See Enneads, VI, 9, 9-10. Op.cit., pp.623-4.
15. Ibid., sermon XV, 1093D. F.G.T.G., p.282. See Aloisius Lieske, S.J., "Zur Theologie der Christumystik Gregors von Nyssa", Scholastik, XIV, 4, 1939, 485-514. Also Daniélou, P. et T.M., p.213, on the distinctions between Gregory's theology and platonism in this area.
16. 873D-876A. F.G.T.G., p.190. On the doctrine of epectasis, see P. et T.M., pp.291-307. It derives from St. Paul's epistle to the Philippians 3.13: "Fratres, ego me non arbitror comprehendisse. Unum autem, quae quidem retro sunt obliviscens, ad ea vero, quae sunt priora, extendens meipsum."

17. Against Eunomius, Bk. XII, 940A-941D.
18. See above, fn. 16.
19. P. et T.M., p.188.
20. See ibid., pp.265-6.
21. 361A. F.G.T.G., p.105.
22. See, for example, Plotinus, Enneads VI, 9, 9-10 (above, fn. 14). The point is discussed by Endre von Ivanka, in his article, "Von Platonismus zur Theorie der Mystik", Scholastik, Vol. II, 1936, 163-95.
23. Vie de Moïse, 329B-C, pp.110-13.
24. Commentary on Ecclesiastes, sermon VII, P.G. XLIV, 729B-C, F.G.T.G., p.127. See below, pp.61-3, on the linguistic implications of this passage.
25. Comm. on Eccles., ibid. F.G.T.G., pp.127-8.
26. On the Beatitudes, sermon VI, 1268B. F.G.T.G., p.98.
27. Comm. on Eccles., sermon VII, 729A. F.G.T.G., p.126.  
cf. On Virginité, 361B-C, F.G.T.G., p.105, where Gregory interprets David's response to his ecstatic vision of God:  
And though yearning to say something which would do justice to his vision, he can only cry out (in words that all can echo after him): 'Every man is a liar' (Ps. 115. 11). And this I take to mean that anyone who attempts to portray that ineffable Light in language is truly 'a liar' - not because of any abhorrence of the truth, but merely because of the infirmity of his explanation.
28. Comm. on Cant., sermon VI, 885C-D. F.G.T.G., p.196.
29. Vie de Moïse, 300C-D, pp.48-9.
30. Comm. on Cant., sermon V, 873C-876C. F.G.T.G., pp.189-91.
31. Vie de Moïse, 405C, pp.272-5.
32. 361C-D. F.G.T.G., p.106.
33. Sermon 1, 765A. F.G.T.G., p.152.
34. Ibid., 776C. F.G.T.G., p.154.
35. See, for example, ibid., sermon VIII, 944D-945D. F.G.T.G., pp.215-6.
36. On Virginité, 360C-D. F.G.T.G., p.104.
37. The observations of Louis Bouyer, in his article "Holy Scripture and Tradition as seen by the Fathers", The Eastern Churches Quarterly, 1947, 2-16, are also relevant in this connexion. He argues that the early church fathers saw no essential incongruity between biblical teaching and certain systems of philosophy outside the mainstream of Christianity:  
The Fathers are quite consistently able to say that the whole of our Faith is included in the Scriptures, while in another place they assert with the same confidence that Scripture is of no avail without Tradition as its complement. More pointedly still, they will say

that Tradition is able to supplement Scripture on very important questions, without undermining - at least in their own minds - their calm fundamental certitude that we have in the Scriptures a 'pleroma' never to be superseded nor even superadded to. (p.4)

The prevalence of such an attitude would clearly have to some extent moulded Gregory's thinking and afforded further sanction for his appropriation of terminologies from different sources.

Jean Daniélou, in From Shadows to Reality. Studies in the biblical typology of the Fathers (London, 1960) (p.207), also makes the important point that there was some precedent for Gregory's practice in Philo, who had already laid down the "principles of true Christian humanism" in advocating the pressing of secular culture - in particular, the art of rhetoric - into the service of religion.

38. P. et T.M., p.154.

39. See esp. the Quaestiones in Exodum, the De Vita Mosis, and the De Posteritate Caini. On Philo's method, see Erich Auerbach's essay, "Figura"; for Gregory's relationship to Philo, see Daniélou, "Vie de Moïse", intro. pp.16-25 and From Shadows to Reality.

40. Hans Lewy, Philosophical Writings. Philo. Selections, Oxford (1946), p.13.

41. Daniélou, F.S.T.R., p.136. The subject of the bearing of specifically typological modes of interpretation - particularly as they are defined by Daniélou and Auerbach - on Gregory's theology will be given closer consideration below, pp.34-7.

42. Philip Watson trans., Agape and Eros. A Study of the Christian Idea of Love (London, 1932). See esp. pp.430-46. The scope of Nygren's work is impressive, though the details of his thesis have been justly criticized. M.C. D'Arcy, S.J., The Mind and Heart of Love. Lion and Unicorn. A Study in Eros and Agape (London, 1945), has reaffirmed the basic validity of Nygren's distinctions between platonic eros and Christian agape, but objects to the rigidity with which he dissociates them and his tendency to classify authors according to which motif predominates in their work (see esp. pp.54-83). Nygren makes, he comments,

... a superficially clear and sharp distinction between Eros and Agape, egocentric and theocentric love, which he then works to death. He does not, however, see that he has forced them both into such contrasting shapes that neither is alive. (p.69).

Nygren's account of Gregory's theology, indeed, overstates its evident affiliations with neoplatonism and fails to give adequate weight to the significance of the Incarnation - the supreme manifestation of divine agape - as the foundation of all human aspirations to mystic union. His view is nevertheless worth restating:

It is nevertheless not the Agape but the Eros motif that really characterises Gregory's thought. Here we meet the attitude of pure mysticism, with its whole apparatus of concepts that were traditional ever since Philo and Plotinus .... Gregory's great and ever-recurrent theme is fellowship with God according to the scheme of ascent.

- Even the choice of subjects for his writings bears unequivocal witness to this tendency (pp.431-2).  
cf. also Daniélou's section on eros and agape in Gregory's theology, P. et T.M. pp.199-208.
43. See below, pp.39 ff.
  44. Comm. on Cant., sermon XV, 1100D. F.G.T.G., p.284.
  45. See Vie de Moïse, 357B-D, pp.170-3.
  46. Sermon VI, 901B. F.G.T.G., p.207.
  47. Ibid., sermon V, 868A. F.G.T.G., p.185.
  48. Ibid., 925B.
  49. Ibid., sermon XV, 1101A. F.G.T.G., p.285.
  50. Against Eunomius, Bk. XII, 940A-B. F.G.T.G., p.119.  
Gregory's interpretation of the biblical narrative is heavily indebted to Philo's On the Migration of Abraham.
  51. See Vie de Moïse, 380B-392D, pp.216-245.
  52. Comm. on Cant., sermon IX, 972D-973C. F.G.T.G., pp.234-5.
  53. Ibid., sermon 1, 776A-B. F.G.T.G., pp.153-4.
  54. Thus, in his discussion of the significance of Aaron in the Vie de Moïse, 340B-D, pp.134-5, Gregory argues that the apparent incompatibility of certain narrative details with the general interpretation should in no way invalidate the whole.
  55. See above, pp. 26-28.
  56. Comm. on Cant., sermon VI, 900B-905C. F.G.T.G., pp.206-13.
  57. Comm. on Cant., sermon VI, 892C. F.G.T.G., p.201.
  58. Ibid., sermon IX, 961C-964C. F.G.T.G., pp.227-9.
  59. Vie de Moïse, 397D-405D, pp.257-275, and 408B-409A, pp.276-281.
  60. Daniélou is, in fact, primarily concerned with 'typology', which operates entirely according to figural principles but is exclusively a biblical phenomenon. He traces the progressive assimilation of the typological method of exegesis from Judaic into Christian theology. Auerbach's essay, however, considers figural interpretation in its broader application.
  61. Op. cit., pp.53-4. cf. Daniélou, F.S.T.R., p.52;  
... the essence of typology lies in showing that it is history itself which is figurative rather than in replacing history by allegory.
  62. He asserts elsewhere that,  
Often vague similarities in the structure of events or in their attendant circumstances suffice to make the figura recognizable; to find it, one had to be determined to interpret in a certain way. (op. cit., p.29).
  63. The three aspects of prophetic prefiguration are well illustrated by Daniélou in respect of Adamic typology:  
The similarities, which are the very basis of typology, are intended to bring into relief the unity of the divine plan ... Typology reveals analogies which are

a unifying thread of all, bestowing as it were the signature of God on his work, and guaranteeing the authenticity of Scripture. The Adamic typology particularly has this twofold character. Later history is but part and parcel of the direct preparation for Christ. Adam, on the other hand, is in a sense the head of sinful humanity, yet this does not prevent his human nature having perpetually engraven on it the resemblance to Christ - and we know that the resemblance to Christ is in the Christian view of things always an image of the future, a τύπος μέλλοντος, not a reflexion of some previous existence or one of a higher order. To come into touch with the future, to enter into the stream of history, such is the consequence of being the image of God.

(F.S.T.R., pp.30-31).

Moreover, Gregory himself explicitly affirms the necessity of interpreting Scripture by such principles in his exposition of Cant. 2. 13-14, 'Come, my dove, in the cleft of the rock next to the wall':

Now I will tell you what He means by this, for we must translate the words a little more clearly out of their enigmatic obscurity. The one 'cleft in the rock' for man is the sublime message of the Gospel; for once we come to it there is no further need for types and symbolic representations, and the truth clears up the obscure message of the Law....

The meaning, then, of our text is this: when you have gazed in spirit upon the rays that shine through the prophetic windows, abide no longer in the shadow of the wall. For the wall indeed casts a shadow of the good things that are to come; in no sense does it offer the very image of reality. And so you must move from the wall to the rock that is contiguous; the rock is adjacent to the wall, since the Law had been the bulwark for the truth of the Gospel.

(Comm. on Cant., sermon V, 877A-B. F.G.T.G., p.192)

64. See above, pp.28-29. Daniélou deals in detail with Philo's typological interpretation of the life of Moses in F.S.T.R., pp.202-225.
65. 365B, pp.186-7.
66. F.S.T.R., p.111.
67. See above, p.31-2. Daniélou's qualifying remark should, however, also be noted:  
 ... Gregory transposes into Christian thought the whole of Philo's interpretation of Moses. The allegorical method is the same; their mystical and theological interests are similar. But the whole is considered from the Christian point of view. (ibid., p.226).
68. Ibid., p.93.
69. Vie de Moïse, 361D-364A, pp.182-3.
70. Comm. on Cant., sermon III, 828C. F.G.T.G., p.168.
71. Ibid, sermon XI, 1001B. F.G.T.G., pp.247-8. See also above, pp.15-16.

72. P. et T.M., pp.25-6.
73. See ibid., pp.17-18.
74. Ibid., fn. p.23.
75. On the Beatitudes, sermon VI, 1269A. F.G.T.G., p.99.  
 Citing the same passage in P. et T.M., Daniélou notes that the idea is Stoic in origin (pp.138-40). The closely related Platonic concept of earthly beauty as a 'stepping stone' to appreciation of the divine also had an important bearing on Gregory's theology. Hence the obviously Platonic terminology of this passage from On Virginité (364B):  
 But the man with the trained, clear-sighted mind will not let his eyes have the complete say in his perception of reality. He does not stop with the external phenomena; he does not think that what he cannot see does not exist. He penetrates into the nature of the soul and the qualities that are inherent in bodies.  
 So it is with the study of beauty. The man of imperfect intelligence, when he sees an object marked by external beauty, draws the inference that the object is also beautiful within because it happens to exercise a pleasurable attraction on his senses. He does not penetrate any deeper into the matter. But another person, whose mind's eye has been purified, when he sees such phenomena, despises them: they are merely the material on which the archetype of beauty operates. And he uses what he sees merely as a step towards the vision of that spiritual beauty whose communication is the ultimate reason why all other things are rightly called beautiful. (F.G.T.G., p.107).
76. See Vie de Moïse, 377D-78A, pp.214-17.
77. Sermon VII, 732C. F.G.T.G., p.129.
78. See below, p.51 ff.
79. See above, pp.15-16, but reproduced and discussed below with special reference to its language, p.56.
80. J.F. Anderson, trans., The Dark Knowledge of God (London, 1948). His point is exemplified in a passage from On Virginité:  
 For God is not dependent on anything for His beauty (καλόν); His beauty is not limited to certain times or aspects, but He is beautiful by Himself, through Himself, and in Himself He is eternal Beauty (τοιούτου καλόν ὄν) - not changing from one moment to the next - constantly the same beyond all change or alteration, increase or addition .... For no one could be so blind as not to realize that the God of all things is the first, supreme and unique Goodness, Beauty and Purity. (368C-D. F.G.T.G., p.111).  
 Passages such as this also support the argument put forward by David L. Balás, S.O. Cist., in 'METOTETIA ΘΕΟΤ' Man's Participation in God's Perfections according to Saint Gregory of Nyssa (Rome, 1966):  
 Gregory transferred all the truly absolute attributes of the Platonic intelligible world to God - transforming and completing them of course in the light of Revelation. (p.139).

81. Op. cit., p.28.
82. Sermon I, 624B. F.G.T.G., p.84.
83. The idea clearly represents a significant qualification - though not a contradiction - of Gregory's notion of the complete disjunction between material and spiritual realities which was discussed above, pp.23-24.
84. Sermon I, 780C-D. F.G.T.G., p.156. Daniélou notes that the quotation from Proverbs does not occur in the book as it stands now, but suggests that Gregory may have been referring to Prov. 2.5, "Then shalt thou ... find the knowledge of God".
85. "Le début d'une doctrine des cinq sens spirituels chez Origène", R.A.M., XIII, April, 1932, 113-45, p.114. Rahner argues convincingly that Origen derived his ideas from scriptural exegesis, and, in particular, from the Canticle, which significantly came to be regarded by later mystical tradition as the major biblical source for its theology.
86. In the introduction to their edition of selections from Gregory's works, Moore and Wilson cite passages which demonstrate Gregory's consciousness of the important function of sensual perception:  
'the intelligible cannot be realized in body at all, except it be commingled with sensation;' and again, 'as there can be no sensation without a material substance, so there can be no exercise of the power of thought without sensation.' (De Hom. Op., Ch.VIII; De An. et Resurr.205) . (Op. cit., p.19.)  
The significance of the non-rational connotations of sense language will be considered in some detail in the following pages.
87. Ibid., pp.120-21.
88. Vie de Moïse, 408B-C, pp.276-7.
89. Cf. the indiscriminate references to God the Creator and the Word Incarnate in his exposition of Cant. 5.1 in Comm. on Cant., sermon X, 985B-988B. F.G.T.G., pp 237-8.
90. See, for example, the passage in sermon II of his Comm. on Cant., in which he expatiates on the theme of Christ as the Good Shepherd, 801A-D. F.G.T.G., pp.158-9 .
91. Vie de Moïse, 332D, pp.116-19.  
Daniélou also stresses the importance of this association in P. et T.M., pp 31-2.
92. Op. cit., p.17. Cf. his allusion to "the non-synonymy of the divine names and their mysterious comprehension" (p.35). See also below, pp.61-3, on this point.
93. See above, pp.21.23.
94. Comm. on Cant., sermon II, 801A. F.G.T.G., p.158.
95. Cf. the parallel redefinition of the role of language discussed above, pp.24-25.  
An interesting passage from On the Beatitudes VII, is also relevant in this connexion. It is cited and translated by Gabriel Horn, in his article "Le 'Miroir', la 'Nuée'":  
'L'Écriture détaille les grandeurs de la Nature souveraine: mais qu'est cela auprès de la Nature elle-même? Le texte



ne parle qu'à ma mesure, autant que je puis l'entendre, et non pas à la mesure de celui qu'il décrit ...' (p.115). Similarly, in his interpretation of the statement in Matt. 5.8 that "The pure of heart will see God", Gregory insists that such vision is qualified and not absolute:

For the eye does not see it (ie. the ineffable nature of the Good) completely as it is (ὅσον ἐστὶ βλέπει), but only insofar as it can receive it. (Comm. on Cant., sermon VIII, 941B. F.G.T.G., p.212).

F. Lossky, in his valuable article, "La Théologie Négative dans la Doctrine de Denys l'Aréopagite", Revue des Sciences Philosophiques, Paris, 1939, 204-221, indicates that a parallel reassessment of the function of language obtains in the Dionysian treatises of affirmative theology:

En disant 'Dieu', 'Sagesse', 'Vie', 'Celui qui est', nous entendons des Vertus déifiantes, éclairantes, vivifiantes, créatrices. Ces appellations divines, ainsi que d'autres, révélées dans l'Écriture Sainte, désignant différentes Vertus ou 'Providences' (προνοίαι ἐκφαντορικάι), comme les appelle encore Denys, voulant par là désigner les rapports providentiels de Dieu avec la créature. (p.208).

96. Comm. on Eccles., sermon VII, 725A. F.G.T.G., pp.122-3. cf. the juxtapositioning of affirmative and negative epithets in the passage from Comm. on Cant., sermon V, quoted above pp.17-18.
97. Sermon II, 808A. F.G.T.G., p.163.
98. On Virginité, 368C. F.G.T.G., p.111.
99. Comm. on Cant., sermon VI, 897D. F.G.T.G., p.206.
100. See above, pp.25-27. In theological terms, cf. his insistence on the restoration of virginity as the foundation of the mystic ascent - On Virginité, 369B-376B. F.G.T.G., pp.112-7.
101. Comm. on Cant., sermon IV, 845A-C. F.G.T.G., p.176.
102. Noting the importance which Gregory accords to the spiritual sense of taste, Daniélou observes,  
... il est un des mystiques de la 'suavité divine', et par là il annonce Diadoque et saint Bernard, et se sépare, au contraire, de la tradition plus intellectualiste d'Origène, d'Evagre, de Denys, de Maxime. Sur ce point, en effet, Denys qui dépend de lui en ce qui concerne la théologie négative, s'en sépare. (P. et T.M., p.237).  
Gregory's influence on different schools of mystical theology will be discussed below, pp.71-72.
103. P. et T.M., p.120.
104. See, for example, ibid., p.175.  
Et c'est ici que l'originalité de Grégoire de Nysse apparaît le plus, et qu'on peut voir en lui le vrai fondateur de la théologie mystique. Sa grande idée, en effet, est que, même pour l'âme parvenue à la θεωρία (the fulfilment of the illuminative way) - qu'il intègre - l'ὄυσις divine reste encore infiniment inaccessible.
105. See above, esp. pp.44-6.

106. Daniélou stresses this point in his comments on a passage from the Commentary on the Canticle, sermon IX:  
 Enfin le vin représente le plus haute degré de la douceur spirituelle: 'C'est par le vin que la joie (ευφροσύνη) est versée aux coeurs plus parfaits de ceux qui ne sont plus agités par les flots de l'enfance, mais qui peuvent s'abreuver au cratère de la Sagesse et y puiser les biens'. (956D).  
 L'allusion au cratère de la Sagesse, qui est une expression consacrée du langage mystique depuis Philon, nous montre qu'ici nous touchons à la limite supérieure des sens spirituels et que nous atteignons à un aspect supérieur de la vie mystique, à l'extase. (P. et T.M., p.242).
107. Ibid., pp.178-82.
108. Ibid., pp.180-1.
109. See above, pp.16-19.
110. P. et T.M., pp.206-7.
111. Compare, for example, Anders Nygren, op.cit., pp.179-80:  
 The entire structure of Platonic Eros is egocentric. Everything centres on the individual soul and its destiny. All that matters from first to last is the soul that is aflame with Eros - its Divine nature, its present straits while it is in bondage to the body, its gradual ascent to the world above, its blessed vision of the Ideas in their unveiled glory.
112. See above, pp. 29-30.
113. Sermon IV, 852A-B. F.G.T.G., pp.178-9. (The reference here is to Cant. 5.5). cf. also ibid., sermon XIII, 1045D-1048D, F.G.T.G., p.272, and comparable references to the wound of love and the stripping away of the bridal veil in ibid., sermon XII, 1029A-1037C, F.G.T.G., pp.263-71.
114. Sermon XI, 1000C-1001A. F.G.T.G., pp.246-7.  
 This passage was cited and discussed in part above (pp.15-16) cf. the similar passage in the Vie de Moïse, 376C-380A, pp.208-217.  
 It will be noted here that following biblical example, the concept of 'darkness' denotes both the unregenerate state of the soul and the condition in which the highest mystic union is attained. It is therefore a metaphor for both the purgative and unitive stages of the contemplative ascent. The potential difficulties arising from the application of the same word with diverse meanings to the distinct categories of the ascent are outlined below, pp.72-74. The distinctions between the Greek terms σκοτός and γνόφος will be discussed below, Ch.II, fn.91.
115. Philo, The Life of Moses, I, 158. Trans. Hans Lewy, op. cit., p.68. Daniélou cites as a further example of this common Philonian idea Strom. II, 2, 115-6, in From Shadows to Reality, p.218.
116. Études Carmélitaines, 1938, 33-53, pp.46-8.  
 The point is a key one in considering the evolution of cloud imagery in subsequent mystical tradition. In his discussion

of the biblical account of the original event on Sinai, Lebreton urges the inherent ambiguity of the allusion to the cloud (art. cit. fn.126, pp.5-6). There is, indeed, a sense in which it seems to represent both a barrier between God and man and a sphere outside normal experience where a kind of awareness of the divine nature is conceivable.

Some ambiguity is also apparent in the passage from Comm. on Cant., 1000C-1001A cited above. While the cloud is clearly connected with the ultimate divine darkness, it is also identified with the analogical knowledge of God which pertains to the second or illuminative stage of the mystic ascent. Elsewhere Gregory refers appropriately to the 'φωτιζούσης νεφέλης' ('luminous cloud'), which guides the people of Israel in Exodus 14 (see Vie de Moïse, 360D-364D, pp.176-181).

Daniélou also notes (P. et T.M., fn. p.20) that the cloud corresponds to the symbolical second stage in Dionysius' theology.

117. Art. cit., pp.46-48.
118. Cf. Lebreton, art. cit. fn.126, pp.12-15.
119. P. et T.M., introduction, pp.8-9. Daniélou subsequently adds that in Philo, darkness seems "davantage exposé philosophique en langage allégorique qu'expérience mystique" (p.191). He in fact explores the whole issue in greater depth in the section devoted to divine darkness, (pp.190-99).
120. p.57.
121. Vie de Moïse, 380A, pp.216-7.
122. See above, p.56.
123. Puech, art. cit., p.36.
124. Lossky, art. cit., pp.204-6.
- 124a. See, for example, the discussion of Plotinus' notions of purification and its function in the first part of this chapter.
125. Ibid., p.206.
126. See also Jules Lebreton, "La Nuit Obscure d'Après Saint Jean de la Croix. Les Sources et la Caractère de sa Doctrine", R.A.M., 1928, 3-24. Lebreton distinguishes two concepts of mystical night which derive from different ideological traditions: the night of neoplatonic philosophy is associated with the process of intellectual purification whereby the mind regains its perfection and its capacity to contemplate the One, whereas in Judaic theology, the night of the soul is a purgatorial experience which is imposed on the soul by the fact of God's transcendence and man's unworthiness to approach the divine. The differences are summarized by Lebreton:

Dans cette contemplation néo-platonicienne nulle trace de cette effroi sacrée, de cette angoisse qui saisait les prophètes. Et en effet si la préparation mystique consiste seulement dans ces dépouillements de cette ascension dialectique, elle peut être laborieuse, mais elle n'a rien d'une agonie; elle n'attaque point au fond de l'âme ces racines mauvaises qu'elle ignore;

chez le mystique chrétien, au contraire, la foi, sous l'impulsion de la charité, pénètre comme un glaive, jusqu'à la distinction de l'âme et de l'esprit; elle blesse, elle brûle dans des profondeurs que Dieu seul peut atteindre, et c'est ce qui rend cette agonie si douloureuse et si solitaire. (p.18).

The concept of night in Gregory's theology clearly takes account of both traditions.

127. Art. cit., pp.49-52. Daniélou concurs on this point, in asserting that, "aucun auteur ne lui a donné plus de place que Grégoire de Nysse. C'est de lui, ainsi que le prouvent des dépendances littérales, que le Pseudo-Denys en héritera. Et par le Pseudo-Denys, toute la mystique ultérieure jusqu'à saint Jean de la Croix sera enrichie de ce thème. C'est donc un des points où son influence sur la création de la langue mystique est la plus évidente." (P. et T.M., p.191).
128. Puech, art. cit., p.53.
129. Sermon VI, 892B-893C. Trans. F.G.T.G., pp.201-2.
130. Cf. the wound imagery, discussed above, pp. 54-55.
131. Vie de Moïse, 404A, pp.266-7. See also above, pp. 14-16.
132. The significance of Gregory's reluctance to acknowledge that awareness of God is 'vision' even in the spiritual sense - a point on which he diverges radically from neoplatonism - is commented on by Daniélou:  
 ... la vue est le sens le plus intellectuel. La vision de Dieu est une expérience d'ordre plus proprement intellectuel. Il est significatif que ce soit ceci précisément que conteste Grégoire - et c'est peut-être l'enseignement essentiel de sa mystique, celui dont la portée sera le plus considérable et qui fait de lui, peut on dire, le fondateur de la mystique. Pour lui il n'y a pas de vision de Dieu, mais seulement une expérience de la présence de Dieu, c'est-à-dire que Dieu est saisi comme une personne dans un contact existentiel au delà de toute intelligence et finalement dans une relation d'amour. Or c'est là ce qui va devenir par la suite le caractère même de la mystique. Denys l'Aréopagite empruntera cet enseignement à Grégoire et, par Denys, Jean de la Croix en héritera. (P. et T.M., pp.231-2).
- The subject is also discussed in E. von Ivanka's article, "Von Platonismus zur Theorie der Mystik".
133. e.g. Vie de Moïse, 377A, pp.212-3.
134. See pp.20 and 23.
135. Thomasic, art. cit. p.412, notes the importance of Gregory's emphasis on the paradigmatic relation between God and man for his theory of language as a vehicle for mystical theology.
136. See above, pp.47-8.
137. P. et T.M., pp.182-9.
138. Ibid., p.185.
139. Ibid., p.187.

140. See above, pp.16-19.
141. P. et T.M., p.189.
142. Daniélou also compares 'ἰδεῖν ἄορατα' ('to see invisible things'); ibid., p.188.
143. Gießen, 1929. See pp.132-7 for a specific discussion of Gregory of Nyssa.
144. Ibid., pp.40-41.
145. Ibid., pp.110-11. Lewy does not, however, dismiss the possibility that Gregory depended directly on Philo (see fn. p.112). Hugo Koch, in his article 'Das mystische Schauen beim hl. Gregor von Nyssa', Theologische Quartalschrift, III, 1898, 397-420, is, in fact, emphatic in his insistence that Gregory drew on Philo without intermediary in respect of the closely allied notion of mystical darkness (pp.410-13).
146. Lewy, op. cit., pp.133-4. The point is also discussed by Daniélou, P. et T.M., pp.274-84.
147. Sermon X, 989B-C. F.G.T.G., pp.238-9.
148. See above, esp. pp.27, 31-33.
149. See above, pp.52-4.
150. In the introduction to his book (π1), Lewy remarks on the extraordinary position of 'μέθη νηφάλιος', since alone among the phrases associated with the experience of ecstasy, it appears only in Philo's treatises and has no precise counterpart in the hellenistic mystery language or in the traditional ecstatic vocabulary of Platonism.
151. See Lewy, ibid., pp.134-5.
152. Sermon X, 992C-D. F.G.T.G., pp.240-1. See also above, pp.23-4 and 61-3.
153. P. et T.M., pp.274-84.
154. Ibid., p.281.
155. Lewy, ibid., pp.136-7.
156. The point is stressed by Aloisius Lieske, S.J., art. cit. pp.495-6, and Hugo Koch, art. cit. pp.413-4.
157. P. et T.M., p.303.
158. Journet also argues that "without an unshakable affirmative and cataphatic theology there is no negative and apophatic theology". (op. cit., p.75).
159. David L. Balás, S.O. Cist., also demonstrates the inseparability of positive and negative theology in his doctrinal analysis of Gregory's works, METOTEIA ΘΕΟΤ. Man's Participation in God's Perfections according to Saint Gregory of Nyssa. See esp. chpts. V-VI (pp.121-161).  
Lossky also concurs on this point (art. cit., p.207), and illustrates, furthermore, the complementary nature of positive and negative theology, in that the former works downwards from God - recognizing the nature of the cause in the effect - while negative theology aspires in a contrary direction to experience of the Unknowable (pp.217-18).

160. P. et T.M., p.224.
161. See Vie de Moïse, 349A-B, pp.152-5 and the passage from the same treatise discussed above, pp.56 ff.
162. See Vie de Moïse, 373D, pp.206-7. The reference here is to Exodus 19. 15.
163. P. et T.M., p.261.

#### Notes to Chapter II

1. Wiesbaden, 1958.
2. Op. cit., p.4 fn.
3. Paris, 1962. See esp. pp.63-134. cf. also Völker, op. cit., pp.1-11, and Phyllis Hodgson, "Dionysius the Areopagite and the Christian Mystical Tradition", Contemporary Review, November 1949, 281-5.
4. Op. cit., p.1 fn.
5. Mainz, 1900.
6. cf. Roques, op. cit., pp.226-40, and "À Propos des Sources du Pseudo-Denys", Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique, Vol. LVI, pt.2, 1961, 449-64. Also, in connexion with Ps.-Dionysius' indebtedness to Proclus, H.D. Saffrey, O.P., "Un lien objectif entre le Pseudo-Denys et Proclus", Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der Altchristlichen Literatur (Leipzig, 1966), 98-105; L.H. Grondijs, "La terminologie metalogique dans la théologie dionysienne", Nederlands Theologisch Tijdschrift, Vol. XIV, 1959/60, 420-9.  
Maurice de Wulf, History of Mediaeval Philosophy (London, 1952), pp.101-105, and Dom David Knowles, The Evolution of Medieval Thought (London, 1962), p.55 ff. and The English Mystical Tradition (London, 1964), are in broad agreement with this dating of the Corpus.
7. Op. cit., pp.1 and 228 fn.
8. Op. cit., p.358.
9. Revue des Sciences Philosophiques et Théologiques, Vol. XXV, 1936, 5-75. He dates the Corpus, however, in the second half of the fourth century. Étienne Gilson, La Philosophie au Moyen Age (Paris, 1962), pp.80-5, concurs on this early dating of Ps.-Dionysius' work.
10. Recherches de Science Religieuse, Vol. XXXVI, 1949, 5-24, p.18. Von Ivanka gives a tentative date of mid fifth century for the Dionysian Corpus: the author's attitude to platonism, he suggests, is representative of the contemporary climate of opposition to paganism whose focus was neoplatonic culture.
11. Op. cit., pp.125 ff.
12. Ibid., pp.155-6.
13. Paris, Louvain; Bruges printed, 1959. See pp.180-1.

14. Reprinted in P.G. Théry, O.P., "Documents concernant Jean Sarrazin. Reviseur de la traduction Érigénienne du Corpus Dionysiacum", A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol. XVII, 1950-51, 45-87. Cf. also the quasi-apostolic miniature of Ps.-Dionysius in MS Louvre N.100 (presented to the Abbey of St. Denis in Paris by the Emperor of Constantinople, Manuel Paléologue, in 1408), reproduced in P.G. Théry, O.P., "Recherches pour une Édition Grecque Historique du Pseudo Denys", The New Scholasticism, Vol.III, No.4, Oct.1929, 353-442.
15. It is noteworthy, however, that Gregory's Commentary on the Canticle had a profound though indirect influence on medieval spirituality, since it was a major source for St. Bernard's widely popular sermons on the text.
16. It is regrettable and a serious handicap to studies of this kind that no critical edition of the Greek Corpus has yet been produced. The texts are usually cited in Migne's edition (Patrologia Graecae, Paris, 1889, t.111-1V), where they are reprinted from the Venice edition of 1755-6 and have many apparent errors. The De Divinis Nominibus has been quoted here in this edition (P.G. t.III, 585-996). In the case of the De Mystica Theologia, however, it has been expedient to use the text of the 1562 edition, reprinted by Dom Philippe Chevallier in Dionysiaca. Recueil donnant l'ensemble des traductions latines des ouvrages attribués au Denys l'Aréopage (Paris, 1937): its use has been dictated by the nature of the study undertaken in Ch.III, which relies heavily on Chevallier's collection of parallel texts of the various Latin versions of the work. The English translations of both works are by C.E. Rolt, Dionysius the Areopagite. "The Divine Names" and "The Mystical Theology" (London, 1940). It should be noted, however, that Migne's Greek text seems to show some variations from the version on which Rolt's translation is based: these involve differences in the order of words or phrases, omissions and inclusions. Rolt's translation also expands on the original text where the compression of the Greek obscures its meaning. It has nevertheless usually been possible to cite the parallel Greek passages to Rolt's translation from Migne's text. Minor variations in the two texts have not been noted, but significant textual differences have been recorded and commented on.
17. M.Th.I. Chev.571-2. Rolt, p.192-3.
18. Op. cit., p.161.
19. Op. cit., p.218.
20. Op. cit., p.172.
21. Op. cit., p.78. Cf. also on this point René Roques, "Symbolisme et théologie négative chez le Pseudo-Denys", Bulletin de l'Association Guillaume Budé, I, 1957, 97-112.
22. Cf. Dom Placid Spearrit, A Philosophical Enquiry into Dionysian Mysticism (A thesis presented to the Faculty of Letters at the University of Fribourg, Switzerland, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy), 1968, pp. 129-41, on the divisions of the mystic way in Dionysian theology. Fr. Spearrit gives special consideration to the passage in De Divinis Nominibus VII. 3 (869-872D), which states that God can be known,
- ἐν τῇ πάντων ἀφαιρέσει  
καὶ ὑπεροχῇ  
καὶ ἐν τῇ παντῶν αἰτία

This may imply three ways (i.e. negation, eminence, causation), or, as Fr. Spearrit notes, the grammatical construction of the passage may mean that Ps.-Dionysius intended to distinguish two ways of approaching God. He asks,

is it safe to assume that cataphatic theology uses the via causalitas, apophatic theology the via negationis? And if so, is there a third theology, perhaps mystical theology, for the via eminentiae? (p.141)

Fr. Spearrit concludes that Ps.-Dionysius' theology is not one of fine distinctions between the stages of the mystic ascent, but reaffirms that the fact of divine transcendence dominates both the cataphatic and apophatic procedures.

23. Op. cit., pp. 80-81.
24. 576-8. Rolt, p.194.
25. Op. cit., pp.120-121. See also below, pp.114-5, on Ps.-Dionysius' theory of the unitive faculty.
26. Op. cit., p.220.
27. See pp.87-92.
28. Ibid., p.222.
29. Op. cit., p.61.
30. See Vanneste, op. cit., p.98.
31. The issue is discussed by Völker, op. cit., pp.215-7.
32. See above, pp.76-8; also E. von Ivanka, "Zum Problem des christlichen Neuplatonismus. II Inwieweit ist Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita Neuplatoniker?", Scholastik 31, 1956, 384-403.
33. Lebreton puts this point in "La nuit obscure d'après Saint Jean de la Croix", but uses it to support his argument that the Dionysian Corpus expounds a thinly disguised neoplatonism.
34. Op. cit., pp.17-26.
35. D.N. IV, 1. P.G.III, 748 A-B. Rolt, pp.86-7.
36. See F. Lossky, "La notion des Analogies chez Denys le Pseudo-Aréopagite", A.H.D.L.M.A., 5, 1930, 279-309.
37. There is no precise equivalent of Rolt's translation in Migne's text at this point: the Greek text cited by Rolt in the footnote to this passage reads "τοῖς θείοις μᾶλλον ἀνα θεῖναι τὸν ὄντως ἔρωτα".
38. D.N. IV, 12. 772-774D. Rolt, pp.104-5.
39. Op. cit., p.371.
40. R.A.M., 6, 1925, 278-89.
41. Vigilæ Christianae, 20, 1966, 235-43. Cf. also A.H. Armstrong, "Platonic Eros and Christian Agape", Downside Review, 79, 1961, 105-21.
42. Art. cit., p.237.
43. D.N. IV, 13. 776A. Rolt, p.106.
44. D.N. IV, 12. 773C-D. Rolt, p.105.
45. 776A. Rolt, p.105.



46. See above, p.84.
47. Op. cit., pp.17-26.
48. The specific reference here is to D.N. 708A-713D.
49. Art. cit., p.238.
50. It is necessary to qualify in this way arguments such as that of James W. Douglass, in "The Negative Theology of Dionysius the Areopagite", Downside Review, 81, 1963, 115-24, who, insisting on Ps.-Dionysius' conformity with essential principles of Christianity, asserts that dark knowledge of God in Ps.-Dionysius' view is to be achieved through love.
51. Art. cit., p.43. Puech cites several possible minor verbal echoes of Gregory's work in Ps.-Dionysius as a means of substantiating his argument for the overall similarity between the doctrine and method of the two theologians (ibid., p.45).
52. Art. cit., pp.240-1.
53. D.N. I,1. 612C-D. Rolt, pp.52-3.
54. Ibid., 612C. Rolt, p.52.
55. D.N. I,4. 620D-621B. Rolt, pp.57-8. See Hugo Koch, op. cit., pp.108-23, on the significance of the concept of initiation in the literature of the Greek mystery religions.
56. D.N. II,4. 661D. Rolt, p.69.
57. D.N. IV,11. 772A. Rolt, p.103.
58. M.Th. I. 567. Rolt, p.191.
59. M.Th. III. 589-90. Rolt, 197-8.
60. M.Th.I. 566. Rolt, p.191.
61. D.N.IV, 7. 761C. Rolt, p.96.
62. D.N.IX, 2. 924D. Rolt, p.162.
63. P.G. Théry, O.P., in his article "Scot Érigène. Introduteur de Denys", The New Scholasticism, April 1933, Vol VII, No.2, 91-108, argues that Ps.-Dionysius observes three broad categories in his classification of the divine names, the second of which includes terms denoting relative concepts which are imputed to God on an analogical principle (e.g. great, small, same, different, etc. (Chs. IX-XI)). The first category is of "noms de perfections diffusées dans les êtres créés, considérés en eux-mêmes indépendamment des relations qui peuvent les unir" (e.g. being (Ch. V), life (Ch. VI), wisdom (Ch. VII), power, righteousness, etc. (Ch. VIII)); the third comprises titles expressing God's dominance of the world (e.g. King of kings, Lord of lords, etc. (Ch. XII)).
- With regard to the second category, E. von Ivanka suggests in his article "Der Aufbau der Schrift De Divinis Nominibus des Ps.-Dionysios", Scholastik, 15, 1940, 386-99, that Ps.-Dionysius was indebted to Plato's Parmenides for the simultaneous ascription of contradictory characteristics to the Godhead.
64. Op. cit., pp.270-1.
65. D.N. VI, 3. 864D-866A. Rolt, p.146.

66. Cf. also D.N. I, 4 and II, 7 on this point. See Lossky, art. cit., on the significance of analogy (ἀναλογία) in the Dionysian Corpus.
67. D.N. V, 2. 833B. Rolt, p.132.
68. D.N. II, 8. 672C. Rolt, p.75.
69. D.N. V, 5. 840A-D. Rolt, p.136.
70. D.N. VI, 1. 860A-B. Rolt, p.144.
71. See also Gersh, op. cit., pp. 267-8 on this point:  
 Ps.-Dionysius refers frequently to the notion that God is above being, life, intellect and so on without specifying whether he transcends such characteristics as they are found in the created order or in themselves. However, he is occasionally more specific and in one passage asks how it is that God can perceive intelligible things 'when he has no intellectual activities' (οὐκ ἔχων νοερὰς ἐνεργείας) while in another he stresses that God is non-psychic and non-intellectual and therefore has 'neither imagination nor opinion nor reason nor intellection' (οὔτε φαντασίαν ἢ δόξαν ἢ λόγον ἢ νόησιν ἔχει). In both these texts the writer clearly argues that the divine nature even transcends the activity of cognition itself and thereby asserts a proposition which, although it has the most far reaching implications for theological speculation, is assumed rather than justified in Ps.-Dionysius' discussion. However, some reflection upon the pagan Neoplatonic understanding of cognition in general suggests that what is at the back of the writer's mind is the notion that thought involves a division between mind and object and between the various objects themselves which is incompatible with the divine simplicity.
72. Ibid., 860A. Rolt, p.144. Rolt's translation reproduces the sense of Migne's Greek text, though he was clearly working from an abbreviated version of this passage. The parallel Latin translation of Migne's text reads,  
 Aeternam autem dicit, non quod participet aeternitatem (siquidem haec continet aeternitates), sed sicuti Deus et ens dicitur et plusquam ens; cum quod sit existentia plusquam existentia, tum quod non participet essentiam, sed sit supraquam essentia; sic etiam aeterna est vita ejus, et rursam plusquam aeterna. Aeterna quidem, quia ipse sibi aeternitas et perpetuitas existit; supraquam aeterna vero, quia ipse saeculorum quoque conditor est. (859A).
73. The question of Ps.-Dionysius' "hyper-" (ὑπερ-) vocabulary is discussed in some detail by L.H. Grondijs (art. cit.). He argues that Ps.-Dionysius' model for this verbal form is to be found in the works of the later neoplatonist, Damascius, but he asserts that the terminology was invested with new significance in the Dionysian Corpus:  
 On retrouve donc dans son oeuvre toute la nomenclature de la sagesse grecque mais reportée, par cet allongement, vers un domaine tout nouveau de la pensée philosophique et de la spéculation théologique. Chaque terme nouveau comporte une transformation du sens radical ... (p.428).  
 Grondijs takes this point as evidence for Ps.-Dionysius' critical and innovatory attitude towards neoplatonist ideas and terminology, though he undoubtedly worked within its framework. He also notes

the importance of Ps.-Dionysius' achievement in introducing this linguistic formula into the vocabulary of Christian theology.

The prefix does, however, occur with the same sense in the works of Gregory of Nyssa, where it forms part of his technical vocabulary of mystical theology, reflecting the abnormality of the religious situation which it describes. There too, it has negative as well as positive connotations, and occurs in conjunction with the specifically negative terminology associated with the unitive way (see above, pp. 64-5).

74. D.N. II, 3. 661B-662C. cf. Rolt, p.68.
75. D.N. IV, 3. 753C-D. Rolt, pp.89-90.
76. M.Th. III. 585. Rolt, p.196.
77. M.Th.I. 577. Rolt, p.194. Vanneste (op. cit., p.107) notes that Ps.-Dionysius accounts for negative forms belonging to two traditions:  
l'une est biblique (invisible, inexplorable, indécouvrable),  
l'autre platonicienne, par-dessus tout la célèbre triade  
(ἀνούσιον, ἄζωον, et ἀνοον).  
Both are subjected to the same dialectic, and brought in line with the procedure of aphairesis.
78. M. Th. II. 579. Rolt, p.194.
79. M. Th. II. 579-82. Rolt, pp.194-6.
80. These terms were not, of course, peculiar to the literature of Christian mysticism. See Koch, op. cit., pp.135-74 on the neo-platonist background of Dionysian terminology in this area.
81. On this point see H.-C. Puech, art. cit., pp.40-2 and W. Völker, op. cit., pp.210-17.
82. M.Th. I. 577-8. Rolt, p.194.
83. Art. cit.
84. Op. cit., esp. p.215.
85. D.N. IV, 5. 758D. Rolt, p.94.
86. Cf. Ps.-Dionysius' application of the platonic image of sculpture in M.Th. III, as contrasted with Gregory's use of the same image (see above, 16-17 ). Purification in the Dionysian Corpus is consistently envisaged as an intellectual process rather than, as in Gregory's work, a properly ascetic one.
87. Letter V, To Dorothy. Text and translation are as printed by Vanneste, op. cit., pp.244-5.
88. Vanneste, *ibid.*, see p.126 and p.171. On the significance of "darkness" in the Dionysian Corpus, see pp. 125-81.
89. D.N.VII, 2. 881D. Rolt, p.150.
90. Vanneste, *ibid.*, p.164.
91. The precise meaning of γνόφος has been a source of some confusion. Vanneste comments on the situation:  
De soi, γνόφος, forme tardive de δνόφος, signifie obscurité, ténèbres. Les meilleures traductions de l'Ancien Testament, où ce vocable se rencontre plus d'une fois, porte cependant "nuée obscure". Sans doute, le thème de γνόφος de Exod. 20,21 (Μωυσῆς δὲ εἰσῆλθεν εἰς τὸν γνόφον) est interprété par les

traducteurs selon une description qui précède dans Exod. 19,16: 'Et il y eut des tonnerres, des éclairs et une nuée obscure (νεφέλη γνοφώδης) sur la montagne'. On pourrait tenir compte de cette résonance biblique du thème et traduire le gnophos comme le fait, entre autres, H.-C. Puech, par 'la Nuée'. Nous croyons cependant que le pseudo-Denys y verrait un affaiblissement de sa pensée, qui recommande le sens plus général d'obscurité à cause de l'opposition nette entre lumière et obscurité. La 'Nuée' n'est, pour lui, qu'un nom symbolique, énuméré avec beaucoup d'autres, quelque part dans les Noms Divins (D.N. 1,6). (Ibid., p.171)

Ps.-Dionysius also uses the term σκότος to denote "darkness", apparently as a synonym for γνόφος: in M.Th.I (566, Rolt, p.191), "darkness" (γνόφον) surrounds the secret knowledge of God which is itself "intensely dark" (σκοτεινοτάτω); parallels may be cited for the references in the same chapter to "the ray of that divine darkness" (τοῦ θείου σκότους ἀκτῖνα 566, Rolt, p.192) and "Darkness" (σκότος) as the "secret Place" (ἀποκρυφὴν) of God (570, Rolt, p.192) from other passages of the Dionysian Corpus which incorporate γνόφος rather than σκότος - line one of the Letter To Dorothy, cited above (p.109), for example, speaks of θεῖος γνόφος, and Letter I, To Gaius, includes "sa Ténèbre .... voile toute connaissance" (σκότος .... ἀποκρύπτεται πᾶσαν γνῶσιν) (Vanneste, ibid., pp.242-3); in Ch.V of the De Mystica Theologia (600, Rolt, p.200) σκότος is coupled with φῶς ("light") as γνόφος and φῶς are linked in the same line of the Letter to Dorothy. Later translators and commentators on the De Mystica Theologia insisted on distinguishing the two terms: γνόφος is consistently rendered by "caligo" and σκότος by "tenebrae". It will be shown in the following chapter, however, that the English translator of the Deonise Hid Diuinite effectively preserves the sense of Ps.-Dionysius' text more precisely in representing both terms as "darkness".

92. M.Th. I. 574-7. Rolt, pp.193-4.

93. See above, pp.90-91.

94. 566, Rolt, p.191. See also Vanneste, op. cit., pp.174-5 on this point.

95. Ibid., pp.176-7.

96. Puech renders γνόφος by 'Nuée'. See above, fn.91.

97. H.-C. Puech, art. cit., p.43. Cf. also Vanneste's conclusions on this point:

... le mystique dionysien s'efforce de pénétrer 'dans la Ténèbre', mais cette obscurité, une fois atteinte, ne résulte pas d'un fait psychologique mais de la situation du terme, Dieu en tant que retiré dans la Ténèbre de sa transcendance inaccessible ... tous les passages de la Théologie Mystique se laissent aisément définir dans le sens d'une transcendance divine, assignant à l'inconnaissance la fonction de mettre un terme à l'enchaînement des négations. (op. cit., pp.126-7).

98. D.N. V, 11. 772B. Rolt, p.103. Migne's version makes it still clearer that Ps.-Dionysius is speaking of transcendent light, as in the De Mystica Theologia he alludes to darkness, as the term of the process of aphairesis: the passage continues,

... tum etiam intelligibiles operationes (αἱ νοεραὶ ἐνέργειαι)  
sunt superfluae, sicut et sensus (αἱ αἰσθήσεις), quoniam  
his sublimiora cogitat anima jam Deo unita.

99. M.Th.I. 565-6. Rolt, p.191.
100. M.Th.II. 579-80. Rolt, p.194.
101. Letter V. Vannestè, op. cit., pp.244-5.
102. M.Th.I. 578. Rolt, p.194.
103. Letter I. Vanneste, op. cit., pp.242-3.
104. M.Th.III. 590. Rolt, p.198.

Notes to Chapter III

1. The allusion occurs in his 34th homily on the Evangelists (P.L. LXXVI, 1254)
2. See P.G. Théry, "Recherches pour une édition grecque historique du Pseudo-Denys". The letter is preserved, he notes, in the "Codex carolingien 449 de la Bibliothèque Nationale, de Vienne (Autriche)".
3. See P. Lehmann, "Zur Kenntnis der Schriften des Dionysius Areopagita im Mittelalter", Revue Benedictine, Vol. 35, 1923, 81-97.

4. D.H.D. 2/3-12.

5. There is some debate as to the precise dating of these translations. P. Théry proposes a date of between 827 and 834 for Hilduin's version in "Scot Érigène. Traducteur de Denys", Bulletin du Cange Union Académique Internationale, Vol. VI, 1931, 185-278, though he amends this to 830-835 in a subsequent article, "Jean Sarrazin. 'Traducteur' de Scot Érigène", Studia Medievalia in Honorem R.-J. Martin (Bruges, 1947), 359-81. The latter dating agrees more closely with H.F. Dondaine's placing of the treatises between 832 and 835 in Le Corpus Dionysien de l'Université de Paris au XIII<sup>e</sup> Siècle (Rome, 1953).

In the same two articles, Théry suggests dates of towards 860 and c858 respectively for Scot Erigena's Versio Dionysii. Maieul Cappuyns, O.S.B., however, in Jean Scot Érigène. Sa Vie, son Oeuvre, sa Pensée (Louvain, 1933), prefers a dating of between 860 and 862, and Dondaine (*ibid.*) concurs in dating the completion of the work towards 862.

Sarracenus' version of the text dates from the early twelfth century; Dondaine (*ibid.*) puts its completion c1167, though he notes that it rarely featured in scholarly works before 1240.

Thomas Gallus' extensive work on the Dionysian Corpus spans a wider period. Théry's dating of it between 1224 and 1243 (in "Thomas Gallus. Aperçu Biographique", A.H.D.L.M.A. Vol. XII, 1939, 141-208) is broadly corroborated by James Walsh S.J., 'Sapientia Christianorum': The Doctrine of Thomas Gallus Abbot of Vercelli on Contemplation (Dissertatio ad Lauream in Facultate Theologica, Pontifica Universitas Gregoriana. Romae, 1957), esp. Ch. II, pp. 30-51, and confirmed by D.A. Callus, O.P. in "An Unknown Commentary on the Pseudo-Dionysian Letters", Dominican Studies, I, 1948, 58-67. The important Extractio is generally assigned to 1238.

Grosseteste's translations and commentaries on the four principal Dionysian tracts seem to have been composed between 1239-1243. See D.A. Callus, O.P. "The Date of Grosseteste's Translations and Commentaries on Pseudo-Dionysius and the Nichomachean Ethics", Recherches de Théologie Ancienne et Médiévale, Vol. XIV, 1947, 186-210, and "Robert Grosseteste as a Scholar", Robert Grosseteste, Scholar and Bishop. Essays in Commemoration of the Seventh Centenary of his Death, ed. D.A. Callus (Oxford, 1955), 1-69; cf. also Dondaine, *ibid.*

6. See P.G. Théry, "Hilduin et la première traduction des écrits du Pseudo-Denys", Revue Hist. Église France, t. 1X, 1923, 23-40, and "Études dionysiennes: I, Hilduin traducteur de Denys: II, Édition de sa traduction", Études de Philosophie Médiévale, ed. Étienne Gilson, t. XVI & XIX (Paris, 1932 & 1937).
7. P.G. Théry, "Scot Érigène. Introduteur de Denys", The New Scholasticism, Vol. VII, No. 2, April 1933, 91-108.
8. M. Cappuyns, op.cit., Ch. IV, pp.128-179. Théry contends, however, in "Scot Érigène. Traducteur de Denys", that Erigena's eventual proficiency in Greek had its roots in an insubstantial but still defineable movement which cultivated hellenic studies and flourished in Ireland and among Irish scholars studying on the continent.
9. Cappuyns, *ibid.*, p.141; and Théry, *ibid.*, pp.239-41.
10. Preface to the Versio Dionysii; P.L. CXXII, 1031D-1032A.
11. *Ibid.*, 1032B.
12. See Callus, "Robert Grosseteste as a Scholar". Grosseteste's translation is, it should be emphasized, altogether more proficient and erudite than Erigena's in its execution. Its extreme erudition is, according to Théry, one of the reasons for its surprisingly limited impact on medieval thought:  
 La version de Robert Grosseteste, trop tardive et peut-être aussi trop savante, n'eut sur les spéculations médiévales, qu'une très minime influence, presque négligeable.  
 ("Recherches pour une édition grecque historique du Pseudo-Denys", p.425 fn.)

Callus also reiterates Théry's point concerning the date of Grosseteste's translations (they were begun in 1239, the year following the completion of Gallus' Extractio) as a factor in their failure to make any effective contribution to the study of Ps.-Dionysius in the schools. He notes their slowness to achieve currency even in Oxford, though he claims that they were in rather more frequent usage among the Franciscans during the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries. Dondaine (op.cit., p.116) cites various English Franciscans who depend on Grosseteste, and confirms that,

La version de Grossetête, contemporaine ou presque de l'Extractio, fut plus lente à se répandre sur le continent. Nous n'en trouvons pas de trace précise chez S. Albert, S. Bonaventure ou S. Thomas, ni non plus chez leurs premiers élèves. Il faut faire une exception pour Guillaume de la Mare ...; mais Guillaume appartient à Oxford autant qu'à Paris.

Their major sphere of influence, in Callus' view, was within the Flemish, German and Austrian schools of mysticism during the second half of the fourteenth and the fifteenth centuries, and the Franciscan Rudolph of Biberach was among the most authoritative writers to draw on his work. However, in his article "The Date of Grosseteste's Translations and Commentaries on Pseudo-Dionysius and the Nichomachean Ethics", Callus also produces evidence of friendship between Grosseteste and Thomas Gallus, and demonstrates convincingly that the Franciscan Adam Marsh acted as intermediary in the interchange of work on the

Dionysian Corpus between the two scholars. Callus admits the possibility of mutual influence in spite of the widely different temperaments of the two theologians - a circumstance which, if proven, might show the influence of Grosseteste on the dissemination of Dionysian scholarship, at least indirectly, through the immensely popular works of Gallus, to have been greater than it is currently estimated.

Grosseteste's version of the Dionysian Corpus will not, however, receive the attention which it merits of itself in this thesis, since there is nothing to suggest that the Cloud author was familiar with the work and certainly no persuasive evidence that he drew on it for his translation of the De Mystica Theologia. Indeed, if he did know Grosseteste's text, he seems to have disregarded it - arguably because he considered its excessive scholarliness unsuited to his purposes as a translator. It might be remarked, however, that his probable ignorance of the text would seem to indicate that he was unconnected with the Oxford movement and tends to substantiate other evidence to be presented in the course of this thesis that his principal debt was to continental rather than English sources.

13. Théry, *ibid.*, p.229.

14. The point is an important one. Cf. Théry, *ibid.*, p.185:

Au 1X<sup>e</sup> siècle, le langage philosophique et théologique se crée en Occident; les idées nouvelles introduites par Denys vont déterminer une langue nouvelle.

J. De Ghellink, S.J., Le Mouvement Théologique du XII<sup>e</sup> Siècle (Bruges, 1948), Appendix III, pp.97-102, emphasizes the same aspect of the significance of the earliest Dionysian translations: Ceux qui s'intéressent à la terminologie théologique ne peuvent demeurer indifférents à ces traductions du principal et presque unique penseur original de l'époque carolingienne. Jean Scot, en effet, a fait passer chez les théologiens et les philosophes médiévaux un certain nombre de termes latins, dont un relevé partiel, le seul existant, a été fourni par R. Eucken, Geschichte de philosophischen Terminologie im Umriss dargestellt (Leipzig, 1879). L'on y trouve, entre autres mots, 'continuitas', 'subsistentia', mais ce mot-ci n'est plus neuf alors, 'modus essendi', 'specificans', 'purus intellectus', 'incausale', et surtout le mot 'supernaturalis', dont récemment le P. Deneffe a fait l'histoire ("Geschichte des Wortes 'supernaturalis'", Zeitschrift. f. kathol. Theolog., t. XLVI, 1922, 337-360). (pp.101-2).

Théry, however, also discriminates between the areas in which the Latin vocabulary of Erigena's Dionysian translations is comparatively rich and those in which it is deficient (*ibid.*, pp.247-58). He specifies Erigena's "terminologie psychologique" as belonging to the former category, but classifies his metaphysical language among the latter group. He illustrates the point by comparison with the vocabulary of Sarracenus' later version of the Corpus:

Texte de Denys	Scot Erigena	Sarracenus
οὐσία	essentia	substantia
ὑποστάσις	substantia	persona
ὑπαρξις	subsistentia	essentia

15. Cappuyns, *op.cit.*, pp.138-9.



16. The Mind of Eriugena. Papers of a Colloquium Dublin 14-18 July 1970, ed. John J. O'Meara and Ludwig Bieler (Dublin, 1973), 59-77.
17. Ibid., p.61.
18. Ibid., p.64.
19. Théry, "Scot Érigène. Introduteur de Denys", p.108.
20. Théry, "Documents concernant Jean Sarrazin. Reviseur de la traduction Érigénienne du Corpus Dionysiacum", pp.48-50.
21. In this respect, the situation had barely changed since the time of Erigena. Jean-Marie Déchanet, in an essay entitled "John Scotus Erigena", Spirituality through the Centuries, ed. J. Walsh, S.J., 83-96, writes,  
 Erigena's was an age when St. Augustine, through countless popularisations, reigned supreme, when this contact with the Greek Fathers was in the nature of a revelation for Erigena. We can understand his enthusiasm when we think of the narrow confines of sacred science in his day, reduced to interpretations of St. Augustine that were one-sided when they were not downright exaggerated, like Godescalc's.  
 To discover another and more optimistic anthropology than Augustine's, above all to discover the negative theology of the Pseudo-Denys, which opened up fresh perspectives on the mystery of God; all this was highly exhilarating for a mind as inquiring and open as Erigena's. He set about doing for the West what the Greek Fathers and the Pseudo-Denys had done for the East - providing a synthesis of Neo-Platonism and Christian thought. Audacious though the project was, Erigena was partially successful. But he was ahead of his time. His contemporaries were not equal to understanding what he was trying to do, and his system, as such, was disregarded. Yet in spite of his having no immediate successors, his ideas did have a profound influence, especially in the twelfth century, before they became so distorted that De Divisione Naturae was unreservedly condemned. (pp.84-5)
- Déchanet's essay also provides an account of Erigena's intellectualist system of philosophy and assesses its relative affinities with Christian and neo-platonist tradition. It also indicates a further cause for neglect of his Dionysian translations in the controversy surrounding Erigena's orthodoxy which resulted in his discrediting as a theologian.
22. Théry, *ibid.*, pp.45-6. The Preface occurs in MSS Paris, B.N., 1619, col.22; 18061, f.21<sup>b</sup>; Mazarine, 786; Bruges, 160; München, Staatsbibliothek, 23456; Vat.MSS Lat. 176, 177.
23. Théry indicates later in the same article that "... la version d'Hilduin est inconnue; elle était, d'ailleurs, complètement impraticable" (*ibid.*, p.62), thus the only Latin version available to scholars in the twelfth century was that of Erigena. Cappuyns, *op.cit.*, p.151 fn., suggests that Hilduin's translation scarcely became known at all outside the Abbey of Saint-Denys before the twelfth century, though he contends firmly that Erigena made

extensive use of the Hilduin version in his own translation and indeed treated it as a rival to be convincingly worsted. The Vita Dionysii, however, was transcribed and widely read during the medieval period.

24. Théry, *ibid.*, p.50.
25. The letter appears in a number of MSS, including Paris, BN. 2376, fol. 79; 15629, fol. 23<sup>b</sup>; Mazarine, 627 (860) fol. 38<sup>a</sup>. Théry reproduces the letter and discusses its implications in "Documents concernant Jean Sarrazin". See also below, p.129.
26. Dondaine notes that Grosseteste makes a similar complaint and tries to compensate for the deficiencies of Latin by supplementing his text with copious explanatory notes (*op.cit.*, p.33).
27. Théry, however, differentiates the three translations otherwise. He suggests that unlike the Sarracenus and Erigena versions of the Dionysian Corpus which, it is universally agreed, were produced by single authors working directly from written texts, the Hilduin version was compiled "orally", by a group of monks from Saint-Denis in collaboration with the Abbot. He gives a summary account of this process in his article "Jean Sarrazin. 'Traducteur' de Scot Érigène":

Les moines de Saint-Denis, arrêtés par les difficultés de la lecture du manuscrit oncial et par leur ignorance du grec, c'est-à-dire arrêtés par des difficultés paléographiques et linguistiques, seront obligés pour traduire le Corpus dionysiacum de se partager la besogne. Nous aurons: I moine lecteur + I moine auditeur - traducteur + I auditeur - scribe. La traduction saint-dionysienne du Corpus dionysiacum est le premier exemple des grandes traductions phonétiques que nous retrouverons à Tolède, au XII<sup>e</sup> siècle ... Chaque fois que le traducteur latin ignorera la langue qu'il doit traduire, soit grecque, soit arabe, nous trouverons auprès de lui un collaborateur; de plus, entre la langue initiale et la langue finale, il y aura toujours un intermédiaire phonétique. (p.360).
- Théry traces a number of the defects of Hilduin's text to this method, which involves proceeding on a word-by-word basis and adds the possibility of auditory mistakes to the already considerable sources of potential error.
- Cappuyns, however, finds Théry's evidence too slight to support this conclusion (*op.cit.*, p.150 fn).
28. See, for example, "Scot Érigène. Traducteur de Denys", pp. 193-202.
29. *Ibid.*, and pp. 274-5. cf. also Cappuyns, *op.cit.*, p.141.
30. The passage is discussed by Théry in "Recherches pour une édition grecque historique du Pseudo-Denys", pp.389-396.
31. Théry, *ibid.* His terminology is retained by Dondaine, (*op.cit.*).
32. Théry, *ibid.*, pp.389-396.
33. See, for example, Ezio Franceschini's account of the scholia in "Grosseteste's Translation of the  $\text{I}\rho\text{o}\alpha\text{o}\text{f}\text{o}\text{s}$  and  $\text{E}\chi\text{o}\alpha\text{i}\alpha$  of Maximus to the Writings of the Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita", The Journal of Theological Studies, Vol. XXXIV, 1933, 355-63 .

He notes that two manuscripts add the name of Germanus, Patriarch of Constantinople. The article demonstrates that Grosseteste translated the scholia to the Ecclesiastical Hierarchy and the De Divinis Nominibus with the texts themselves, without knowing them to be by Maximus, and made extensive use of them in his commentaries on the Dionysian Corpus.

34. Art. cit., p.61.
35. Théry, "Recherches ...", p.402. Théry is unable to identify either manuscript precisely, though he establishes that the manuscript used by Sarracenus must have been related to the tenth century MS Florence Bibliothèque Laurentienne 686 (Fonds Saint-Marc).
36. See Dondaine, op.cit., chs. I & II. He demonstrates that Erigena himself revised his translation as his familiarity with the Corpus and ease in handling it increased, and that he enriched the text with glosses from his De Divisione Naturae which intervened between the composition of the first and second versions of his translation. Dondaine summarizes the position prior to the appearance of Sarracenus' text:  
 L'état du Corpus areopagiticum latin à l'aube du XI<sup>e</sup> siècle. Ce Corpus consiste essentiellement en la version de Scot, munie des scolies de Maxime traduites et glossées par Anastase, et d'un apparat de glossées interlinéaires éclairant le texte de Scot. (p.36).
37. Théry discusses Sarracenus' revision of the Versio Dionysii in "Documents concernant Jean Sarrazin", pp. 60-87, and incorporates a detailed analysis of the morphology of Erigena's translation and a glossary of the principal terms in "Scot Érigène. Traducteur de Denys", pp.239-74.
38. Revue Néoscholastique, 1927, 28-68. See esp. pp. 51-59 for discussion of the mystical content of Erigena's thought
39. "Documents concernant Jean Sarrazin", p.79. Théry goes on to stress the necessity for changes of this kind to make the Dionysian tracts acceptable to Western Christianity, and reaffirms Sarracenus' key role in the process:  
 Pour rester une 'autorité', et conserver son titre de premier théologien, Denys devait subir une transformation. La révision de Sarrazin marque le début de cette transformation et l'un des moments les plus caractéristiques dans l'histoire de l'influence dionysienne. (p.82).
40. "Scot Érigène. Traducteur de Denys", pp.257-8. cf. also Théry, "Scot Érigène. Introduteur de Denys", p.106 fn.
41. J. Chatillon, "Chronique. De Guillaume de Champeaux à Thomas Gallus. Chronique d'Histoire Littéraire et Doctrinale de l'École de Saint Victor", Revue du Moyen Âge Latin, Vol.VIII, 1952, 247-273.
42. See fn.2 for a bibliography of critical works which detail the composition and chronology of Gallus' corpus, cf. also Théry, "Thomas Gallus et Égide d'Assise. Le traité De Septem Contemplationis". Revue Néoscholastique de Philosophie, Vol. XXXVI, 1938, 180-90.

43. See P.G. Théry, O.P., "Les Oeuvres Dionysiennes de Thomas Gallus. L'Explanatio sur la Théologie Mystique", Vie Spirituelle, Supplément, Vol. XXXIII, 1932, 129-154, p.142.
44. P.G. Théry, O.P., "Les Oeuvres Dionysiennes de Thomas Gallus. L'Extractio", Vie Spirituelle, Supplément, Vol. XXXI, 1932, 147-67, p.162: cf. also idem. XXXII, 1932, 22-43.  
Walsh (op.cit., pp.37-8) notes the distinction between Gallus' design for the Extractio and its reception among scholars and theologians:  
Thomas makes it very clear that his version is neither a commentary nor a translation; and he lays no claim to the establishment of the correct text. He is simply writing down, as briefly and clearly as possible, in the theological parlance of the day, what he understands the text to mean: and not what he understands it to say. But in spite of this, his version became for posterity a translation. Albert the Great cites it as such; and some thirteenth century scholars will use it in preference to the versions of Scotus Erigena, John Sarracenus, or Robert Grosseteste.
45. From the Extractio, D.N. Ch.I, reprinted by Théry, *ibid.*, p.24.
46. Opera Dionys. Carth., t. XV, p.29, reprinted by Théry, *ibid.*, pp. 148-9.
47. Théry, *ibid.*, pp.154-61 and "Thomas Gallus et les Concordances Bibliques", Beitrag zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters, Supplement Band III, 1935, 427-446. Théry proposes in the latter article that the concordances used by Gallus may well have been of his own composition.
48. Théry, "Les Oeuvres Dionysiennes de Thomas Gallus. L'Extractio", pp.150-4. The point is confirmed by Dondaine, op.cit., p.31: Grand admirateur de Denys, il goutait surtout la Théologie Mystique et en promettait l'intelligence au lecteur éclairé intérieurement par l'Onctio. Il ignorait le grec.
49. See Théry, *ibid.*, p.25.
50. Op.cit., pp.38-9.
51. *Ibid.*, Ch. II, pp.30-51.
52. Théry, *ibid.*, pp.37-8.
53. The point will be considered more closely below, pp.203-12.
54. Op.cit., pp.102-3.
55. Op.cit., Intro., p.VI.
56. Quoted by Gallus in "An Unknown Commentary...", p.59.
57. This point is amply illustrated by Théry, *ibid.*, pp.26-36. He argues that Gallus made extensive use of biblical concordances in commenting on the Dionysian Corpus, and he exemplifies a passage from his Explanatio on the De Divinis Nominibus (MS Vienne 695, ff. 35<sup>a</sup>-36<sup>a</sup>) in which he assembles parallel terms relating to the contemplative life from the Bible and the Dionysian tracts (*ibid.* p.28).
58. Théry supports this assessment of Gallus' transforming influence on Dionysian thought:

il transpose en théologie ce que Denys disait en philosophie. D'un mot - c'est notre conviction profonde - il christianise Denys. (ibid. p.33).

59. See Dondaine, op.cit. He summarizes the purpose of the Parisian enterprise in the following terms:

... l'intention générale de tout l'ouvrage reste bien celle qu'on a dite: mettre à la portée du théologien (de 1200 ou de 1240) l'univers dionysien déjà assimilé par la pensée occidentale... 'Exposer' Denys, si possible un Denys rejoint en son texte authentique, mais surtout un Denys clarifié, repensé par des latins et en quelque mesure augustinisé; telle fut, semble-t-il, l'idée implicite qui a présidé à l'élaboration du Corpus parisien. (p.124)

The project involved assembling the various translations and commentaries on the Dionysian Corpus (by Hugh of St. Victor, for example, and Albert the Great), and its products testify to the advanced state of Dionysian scholarship on the continent in the thirteenth century and the considerable sophistication of the textual resources which were widely available to theologians and students of the treatises. Representative manuscripts of the Parisian Corpus include MSS Paris B.N. Lat. 15630 and 17341.

Dom Philippe Chevallier, in Dionysiaca, also emphasizes the extent to which the University of Paris promoted Dionysian scholarship:

toute jeune encore, l'Université de Paris considéra les oeuvres du grand Denys comme un manuel à mettre entre les mains des étudiants de la faculté de théologie. Entre 1275 et 1286 elle fait paraître une ordonnance qui détermine officiellement aux libraires le prix des manuscrits préparés pour les étudiants: 'Librorum theologiae et philosophiae et juris pretium, ab Universitate Parisiensi taxatum, quod debent habere librarii pro exemplari commodato scholaribus'. Sous la rubrique 'ista sunt exemplari super theologiam', entre la liste des chefs-d'oeuvre du à saint Augustin et celle des écrits de frère Thomas d'Aquin ('scripta fratris Thome de Aquino'), on note: 'liber DIONYSII cum commentis'. (Intro., p LXXVII)

Dondaine's suggestion that it was an "augustinized" Ps.-Dionysius which the University of Paris disseminated is, moreover, confirmed by Théry, who stresses that it was principally through Thomas Gallus that the influence of Hugh and Richard of St. Victor was brought to bear on Dionysian theology. In his article "Denys au Moyen Âge", Études Carmélitaines, Vol. 23, 1938, 68-74, for example, Théry writes:

En Thomas, Denys et Hugues de Saint-Victor se complètent: si Denys enseigne la nudité intellectuelle, le renoncement à toute représentation déterminée, Hugues de Saint-Victor enseigne l'ascèse de l'amour, les échelons de la montée vers Dieu dont le dernier degré est l'apex affectionis ou la syndérèse. Désormais dans l'histoire de la philosophie religieuse, la syndérèse - la signification en variera un demi-siècle plus tard - submerge l'intellect: la Nuit obscure s'illumine par l'amour. (p.71)

60. M.T. D'Alverny, art.cit., A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol.XIII, 1940, 391-402. The article records the discovery of Gallus' second commentary on the Canticle together with fragments of other of his works in MS Cambridge, Corpus Christi 314, which belonged to the Abbey

of Saint Augustine at Canterbury. Cf. also Chatillon, art.cit., p.271.

61. Ibid., p.392. A detailed account of the history of the association of these two religious foundations is to be found in J.E. Foster, M.A., "The Connection of the Church of Chesterton with the Abbey of Vercelli", Proceedings of the Cambridge Antiquarian Society, New Series, VII, Vol. XIII, 1908-9, 185-212. Cf. also P.G. Théry, O.P., "Thomas Gallus. Aperçu Biographique".
62. Walsh, op.cit.; Intro. pp. III-IV. Though manuscripts of the Extractio seem to have been comparatively common, Walsh records only three extant English manuscripts of the complete Explanatio: the fifteenth century MSS Merton College, Oxford (Coxe) 69; B.M. Royal 8 G IV (a late thirteenth century manuscript which belonged to Evesham Abbey); the early fourteenth century MS Merton College, Oxford (Coxe) 18, (ibid., pp 58-9). Royal 8 G IV and Royal 5 D X also contain fragments of the work.

Dom Justin McCann, in his edition of the Cloud of Unknowing (London, 1924), intro. p XIII, refers to a manuscript in Worcester Cathedral Library (MS F 57), and the citation is accepted by Prof. Hodgson in her edition of Deonise Hid Diuinite, Intro. p. XXXIX fn., but P. Théry is unable to verify this reference ("Les Oeuvres Dionysiennes de Thomas Gallus. L'Explanatio sur la Théologie Mystique", p.154 fn.) and Walsh does not include it in his account of the manuscripts. There seem to be no substantial arguments in favour of McCann's hypothesis that the English translator of the Deonise Hid Diuinite used MS Royal 8 G IV, which he records as having come from East Anglia, where it possibly belonged to William Fykeys, rector of Burnham Deepdale in Norfolk. M.R. James, "The Catalogue of the Library of the Augustinian Friars at York now first edited from the MS at Trinity College, Dublin", Johanni Willis Clark Dicatus (Cambridge, 1909), 2-96, lists as Item 119 a MS now lost, but extant in the third quarter of the fourteenth century, which seems to have contained Gallus' commentaries on the four principal texts of Ps.-Dionysius and, alledgedly, on the Symbolic Theology. It is uncertain, however, whether the term "commentary" properly denotes the Explanatio, or whether it refers more loosely to the Extractio.

63. The title Viae Syon Lugent derives from the opening words of the treatise. It has been preferred in the present thesis to avoid confusion with other works having similar titles to the alternative forms.
64. Théry, ibid., pp.142-3.
65. See Prof. Hodgson's account of the Corpus in the introductions to her editions of Cloud and Deonise Hid Diuinite, pp. LXXVII-LXXXV and XXXIV-LVII respectively.
66. Ed. Hans Kurath, Middle English Dictionary (Michigan, 1954). The dictionary has currently been published as far as N3 (noien-nywrpe).
67. Even prior to the publication of the M.E.D., Joy Russell-Smith singled out Prof. Hodgson's account of the Cloud author's vocabulary as one of the weaknesses of her edition of his works (in her review of the Deonise Hid Diuinite, English Studies, xli, 1960, 261-7. Her specific criticisms of Prof. Hodgson's method include the suggestion that many of the analogues for

- the Cloud author's diction which she terms "Wicliffite" might more aptly be called "biblical", since they have no particular Wicliffite connotations and the parallels are simply such as might be expected from the subject matter of the Cloud Corpus.
68. See above, fn.62.
69. This hypothesis is of extreme interest for the Cloud Corpus as a whole. Of the seven treatises which comprise the group, no less than three are translations from Latin (the other two being A Tretyse of þe Stodye of Wysdome þat Men Clepen Beniamyn and A Tretis of Discrecyon of Spirites), and no original Latin works have yet been proved attributable to their author. Similarly, wherever he has occasion to incorporate Latin quotations from the Bible or the Church Fathers in his writings - and instances of this are comparatively infrequent - he invariably supplies either a literal translation of the Latin or follows the texts with longer expository passages which constitute both commentary and gloss: e.g. P.C. 139/3-5, 145/7 ff; P.P. 49/5-6, 8-10; Disc. St. 63/23-26, 64/24 - 65/3 etc.
- The possible implications of this will be discussed in detail in the concluding chapter of this thesis.
70. All references to the Latin translations of the De Mystica Theologia and to Gallus' Extractio are from the Chevallier edition of the texts.
71. Wolfgang Riehle, Studien zur englischen Mystik des Mittelalters unter besonderer Berücksichtigung ihrer Metaphorik (Heidelberg, 1977), notes that the M.E.D. is particularly inadequate in its treatment of mystical terminology:
- Jedoch waren es auch in England in einigen Fällen gerade die Mystiker, die einem Wort eine neue Bedeutung erschlossen haben, wie sich etwa offensichtlich die heutige Bedeutung des Wortes 'to enjoy' in mystischem Kontext angebahnt hat. Darum erscheint es auch keinesfalls gerechtfertigt, daß das MED die englischen Mystiker in so eklatanter Weise vernachlässigt, mystische Bedeutungen eines Wortes öfteren gar nicht erfaßt oder sich besonders interessante Belege für die übertragene Bedeutung eines Begriffes mehrfach entgehen läßt, ganz zu schweigen davon, daß in diesem lexikalischen Werk wiederholt die mystische Wortbedeutung nur unzureichend oder gar falsch angegeben wird. Daher erscheint bei manchen Wörtern ein Beleg aus der sog. Wyclif-Bibel, während mehrmals die etwa gleichzeitig entstandenen mystischen Texte weniger berücksichtigt werden. (p.231).
72. It will be necessary to rely on the O.E.D. for vocabulary not yet covered by the M.E.D.
73. It has not been possible, within the limits of this chapter, to document the precise derivation of the words under discussion. It has therefore been decided to draw only a broad distinction between vocabulary of romance as opposed to germanic origin, without indicating the exact channels through which they entered the language.
74. It has been considered unnecessary to reproduce all references to entries in the O.E.D. and M.E.D. indiscriminately in the same amount of detail: only such references as are of special interest in relation to the Cloud Corpus or have particular bearing on the use of words in the D.H.D. have been cited in detail.

75. Some of the difficulties involved in discriminating words assigned to this category from those included in the third group are taken account of in the notes to the words listed. The inevitable crudeness of the division is accentuated in the case of such words as "substantial" (2/15, 3/17, 5/31 etc). O.E.D. includes various references pre-1400 (e.g. Wiclif and Usk's Testament of Love), but the specialized contexts in which they occur fail to constitute persuasive evidence of their general currency. The noun "substance" also appears in Cl. (82/16).
76. D.H.D., Intro., pp XXX-XXXI.
77. References to Deonise Hid Diuinite are in the edition of Prof. Hodgson. The text of Sarracenus (S.) is as printed by Chevallier (op.cit.), as is the Greek version, which is reproduced as a parallel text on the same page. References to the Extractio (Ex.) are also to the text as printed by Chevallier (ibid., pp.709-12), but the paragraph rather than the page reference has been cited in the case of this work, which Chevallier prints separately from the parallel translations. As the Deonise Hid Diuinite is largely based on the Sarracenus version, the usual practice has been to cite S. for comparison with the English translation, but Ex. has been extensively cited where the various versions correspond. In a few cases, where the English translation seems to adhere more closely to Ex. than to S., Ex. has been cited in preference. Further, occasional references have been made to Gallus' Gloss on the De Mystica Theologia where it seems to have substantially influenced the English text (ed. Migne, P.L. CXXII, 267-84).  
Comparison of the various versions has usually been confined to individual words or phrases, though it has sometimes seemed expedient to give some indication of the context in which they occur. References have usually been given chronologically, though where different parts of the same word appear - as in the case of "derk" which occurs in nominal and adjectival forms - the various parts have been grouped together. Different ways of rendering the same concept have also been grouped together under a single heading: e.g. "deny", "do away", "put away" etc. under the heading of Negation. In some cases, where a term used consistently in the Latin versions is not reproduced exactly in the English text - e.g. Excess, Symbolic, Mystical, Theology - the various vernacular equivalents have been grouped together under the heading of the common Latin term.  
Interpolations and expansions in the English text which use the terms under consideration have been recorded, similarly interesting omissions from or modifications of the Latin sources. It has also seemed apposite to record passages of theological exposition, often of a technical nature, in the areas under consideration, which are omitted from the Deonise Hid Diuinite (see esp. under the headings of Symbolic, Union, Unity).
78. See also Prof. Hodgson's note on this point, D.H.D. 7/28-9 fn.
79. The modern English meanings are as given in Prof. Hodgson's glossary.
80. In Disc. St. 74/5-9, the verb "auferetur" in the biblical quotation "Maria... optimam partem elegit, que non auferetur ab ea" is similarly translated "... schuld neuer be take fro hir".



81. "Voiding" also occurs in Disc. St. 75/4.
82. This is also the most common expression in the Corpus as a whole, although in his independent compositions, the English writer frequently describes the soul's unitive experience of God in terms of "see", "fele" and "behold" (see below, pp. 265-8).
83. René Roques, in his article "Traduction ou interprétation? Brèves remarques sur Jean Scot traducteur de Denys", pp.62-3, uses the example of the translation of the Greek terms νοερός and νοητός to illustrate both the strengths and weaknesses of Erigena's text in relation to the earlier version of Hilduin. He argues that Erigena shows greater accuracy and confidence than Hilduin in regularly translating νοερός by "intellectualis", where Hilduin usually has "intelligibilis", but occasionally "intellectualis", "intellectuosus", "intelligens", "intellectivus", and "intellectus". By contrast νοητός is more correctly though inconsistently rendered "intelligibilis" by Hilduin, whereas Erigena almost invariably has "invisibilis". The proper readings are on the whole preserved in the later versions used by the English translator, but they are not retained in the Deonise Hid Diuinite.

84. The phrase "resonable inuestigacions" occurs, however, in P.C. 144/22.

85. "Comprehende", however, occurs in Cloud 18/18.

86. Wolfgang Riehle (op.cit.) sees the preference for native over Latin word forms as characteristic of English mystical texts in general, and likens them to their German counterparts in this respect. In the English summary of his argument, he states,

The comparison between the English and the Middle High German texts has demonstrated that the English authors often use mystical terms which are etymologically related to the equivalent words occurring in the German texts. The reasons for this notable preference for the Germanic vocabulary in the English texts appears to be that the transparence and directness of the Germanic words makes them predisposed for the articulation of the spiritual sphere.

Clearly, the evidence seems to verify that the Cloud author's use of vernacular vocabulary was frequently a matter of choice (though it may be argued that Riehle gives insufficient consideration to objective factors limiting the author's freedom in this respect), and it is certain that the immediacy of the Germanic terms was among their strongest recommendations for the English writer. Noting the affinities between the Wicliffite movement and the trend towards vernacular mystical literature both in England and on the continent, however, Riehle goes on to propose that the exploitation of the vernacular was in both cases closely connected with the growth of lay piety in the fourteenth century, especially prevalent among women (op.cit., pp.15-44). He similarly characterizes the style of Hilton and the Cloud author alike as

... einer sehr anschaulich - konkreten, auf das gute Verständnis ihrer Laienleser bezogenen bildhaften Sprache.(p.227)

The justification for this account of the genesis and audience of the Cloud Corpus will be discussed in the following chapter.

It is worth noting, however, that the evidence which Riehle submits of resemblances between English and German mystical texts of the fourteenth century does not lead him to conclude any further relationship between the two literatures than may be ascribed to their common descent from the same Latin sources.

87. The Extractio also includes one example of "incomprehensibilitas".
88. Cf. the translator's coinage "vnfele", in the sense of "lose the feeling of" in Cloud 45/13.
89. Riehle, op.cit., Intro., pp.17-18.
90. It should be noted, however, that not all the vocabulary so constructed is of a technical nature: "vnclene" (Cloud 33/15) and "vnnoumerable" (D.H.D. 6/20-1 and 25), for example, are negative forms with no specialized connotations.
91. The O.E.D. does not record these forms. There is a single reference to "ungrope" from the mid sixteenth century, and "vnreasonable" is recorded from the early fourteenth century (e.g. in Pricke of Conscience, Rolle's English Psalter, the 1382 Wicliffite Bible). It also occurs in Privy Counselling 137/28.
92. The earliest reference to "inmaterial" in the M.E.D. is from the mid fifteenth century. "Inordynacioun" is not recorded, though "inordinate" seems to have been current from the late fourteenth century ("vnordeynde" occurs relatively frequently in the Cloud Corpus: e.g. Cl. 80/7-8, 91/12, 98/7, 99/20 and 101/8). The M.E.D. includes one reference to "inuisible" from the early fourteenth century in Rolle's English Psalter, and it seems to have been in common usage later in this century.
93. Cloud 125/8 has a reference to "vnmaad goostly þing". "Vnbigonne" is recorded in the O.E.D. from c1000.
94. See, for example, the catalogue of negative terms which Gallus incorporates in Chapter I of the Extractio (above p.167).
95. See extracts 1 and 5 (above, p.167).
96. See extracts 2, 4, 6 and 8 (above, p.167).
97. See above, p.167.
98. See below, pp. 276-8.
99. See below, pp.195 ff. Cf. also the account of the comparable phrase "setteþ hym abouen þe natureel teermes of hymself" (5/10-11), below, pp.197-8. The development of the term "supernaturalis" is traced by August Deneffe, S.J., in his article "Geschichte des Wortes 'supernaturalis'", Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie, Vol. XLVI, 1922, 337-60. F. Deneffe argues that the word evolved in conjunction with Dionysian mystical theology and first appeared in Scot Erigena's ninth century translation of the Dionysian Corpus as the counterpart of Gk. ὑπερφυσίς (a term which Ps.-Dionysius seems to have drawn from Platonist sources). He also notes that the word was slow to become absorbed into the traditional theological vocabulary outside the context of the Dionysian Corpus.

100. Helen. L Gardner, in "Walter Hilton and the Authorship of the Cloud of Unknowing", Review of English Studies, Vol. IX, No. 34, April 1933, 129-147, includes the use of the word "souereyn" among the evidence which eliminates Hilton as a possible author for the Cloud Corpus:  
 ... it may be noted that both Hilton and the author of the Cloud constantly use the word 'sovereign' as an adjective, and that, indeed the use of this word does serve, almost, to mark off the mysticism of the later half of the century from that of the earlier. The present writer suggests that the word may have been introduced into the vocabulary of English mysticism by the translation of Denis Hid Diuinite, in which it is used to render the perpetual  $\delta\pi\epsilon\rho$  prefix of Dionysius, rendered in Latin by 'super'.... If, as is suggested, the translation was responsible for the popularisation of the adjective, then Hilton, who is very fond of the word, must have written after the translation was made. (p. 146).
101. Sarracenus once translates  $\sigma\kappa\omicron\tau\epsilon\iota\nu\omicron\tau\acute{\alpha}\tau\omega$  by "obscurissimo" (566).
102. See above, pp.107-115.
103. Cf. the comparable usage in Cloud 47/12, "þe derk wordes of his Manheed... ."
104. The entry also lists c1350 MP Psalter 17.13: As derk (L. tenebrosa) water in cloudes of þe aier. a1382 Wycliffite Bible (1) Is. 59.10: Wee han stumblid in mydday as in dercnesses (L. in tenebris) and Gen. 1.2: Derknessis (L. tenebrae) weren vpon þe face of the see.
105. Prof. Hodgson (Cloud, intro, p. LX11) suggests Richard of St. Victor as a possible influence and comments,  
 The 'cloud of unknowing' is adapted from the Dionysian conception of the 'darkness' of 'unknowing'. The Latin translations have always 'caligo', which is exactly translated by 'darkness' in Deonise Hid Diuinite. In a passage from Benjamin Major (Lib. IV, cap. 22 (Migne, Patrologia Latina, t. CXCVI, col. 165)), obviously influenced by the description of the ascent of Moses in De Mystica Theologia, Richard of St. Victor used exactly the same image as the Middle English writer: he described the 'nubes ignorantiae'. It is worth reiterating here, however, in reply to Prof. Hodgson's observations that the phrase "caliginem ignorantiae" rendered by "þe derknes of vnknowyng" occurs only once in the Deonise Hid Diuinite (5/17-18), and that in the various contexts in which the terms appear elsewhere in the De Mystica Theologia, the Latin versions differ from their English counterpart in consistently distinguishing "caligo" with its connotations of "cloud" as well as "darkness" from "tenebrae" which implies "darkness" alone. The influence of the "nubes ignorantiae" of Richard of St. Victor - which restates the distinction drawn by the Latin translators in unambiguous form - on the imagery of the Cloud of Unknowing is nevertheless entirely probable.  
 Riehle (op. cit. p.24) also proposes that the image of the "cloud of unknowing" might owe something to Boethius' Consolatio Philosophiae. Man is there said to be in a "nubes inscitiae"

when he turns his attention from eternal to earthly things,  
Nam ubi oculos a summae luce veritatis ad inferiora et  
tenebrosa deicerunt, nox inscitiae nube caligant (ed.  
Loeb, p.370).

106. cf. Hugh of Balma's Viae Syon Lugent 679 IID, "Haec cognitio mystica vocatur, id est, occulta.
107. The expression "blynde beholdyng" occurs elsewhere in both Cloud (32/7, 73/17) and Privy Counselling (139/12, 142/9-10), and the concept of unitive knowledge of God as in some sense a "beholdyng" or "syt" is reiterated within the Deonise Hid Diuinite (4/16, 5/6-8, 6/27). Wolfgang Riehle (op. cit., pp. 174-5) calls attention to the translation of "contemplatio" by "syt" in pe Stodye of Wysdome - the passage in question reads "And þerfore whatso þou be þat coueytest to come to contemplacioun of God, þat is to sey, to bryng forþe soche a childe þat men clepyn in þe story Beniamyn, þat is to sey, syt of God" (Ben. Min. 45/10-12) - and notes that a precedent already existed in English mystical literature for the Cloud author's use of the term in this specialized sense:  
Die spezielle Bedeutung meditatio, contemplatio, speculatio des Verbalsubstantivs biholding ist im übrigen von den Mystikern erst eigentlich entwickelt worden. So bezeichnet Rolle einmal den höheren Teil der Kontemplation als ein 'behaldyng and ʒernyng of þe þynges of heven'. Diesen bei Rolle schon vorgegebenen Begriff übernimmt der Autor der Cloud und benützt ihn vor allem dazu, die Problematik der menschlichen Gotteserkenntnis aufzuzeigen. Solange die Seele im Körper wohne, sei 'þe scharpnes of oure vnderstonding in beholding alle goostly þynges bot most specialy of God, medelid wiþ sum maner of fantasie' (33/12f). Daraus leitet er seine uns bekannte paradoxe Aufforderung ab, der Mensch solle Gott zu erkennen versuchen in 'a blinde beholdyng vnto þe nakid beyng of God himself only' (32/7f).
108. It, too, is used relatively frequently throughout the Cloud Corpus, and the noun "priuete" (which appears here in D.H.D. 3/26) occurs in Cloud 62/14-17, in a passage whose similarity to the Deonise Hid Diuinite is striking:  
þan wil he sumtyme parauenture send oute a beme of goostly lizt, peersyng þis cloude of vnknowing þat is bitwix þee & hym, & schewe þee sum of his priuete, þe which man may not, ne kan not, speke.
109. It is also possible that the translator's use of "hid" to represent Latin "mystica" in the title of the text was inspired by the Pauline concept of the "hidden wisdom of God" which he describes in his first epistle to the Corinthians 2. 6-9:  
Sapientiam autem loquimur inter perfectos: sapientiam vero non hujus saeculi, neque principum hujus saeculi qui destruuntur: Sed loquimur Dei sapientiam in misterio, quae abscondita est, quam praedestinavit Deus ante saecula in gloriam nostram.  
Quam nemo principum hujus saeculi cognovit: si enim cognovissent, numquam Dominum gloriae crucifixissent.  
Sed sicut scriptum est: Quod oculus non vidit, nec auris audivit, nec in cor hominis ascendit, quae praeparavit Deus iis, qui diligunt illum.

The historic Dionysius, as a disciple of St. Paul, would have been implicated in the apostle's injunction to his followers to broadcast this wisdom throughout the Church (see, for example, Romans 16.25-7), and while the myth of his authenticity survived, the writings of the Ps.-Areopagite might be seen to fulfil this command. This is particularly true of the De Mystica Theologia, since "the hidden wisdom of God", as the passage from I Corinthians illustrates, is for St. Paul the highest attainment of those who have progressed to spiritual maturity in the Christian faith, and the De Mystica Theologia is the most advanced of the Dionysian treatises and the most exclusively concerned with the ultimate mysteries of the Godhead. The identification of this "hidden wisdom" of Christians with contemplative knowledge of God as it was defined in Dionysian mystical theology was consolidated and accentuated by Thomas Gallus, and the English translator may have been influenced by Gallus in this respect (see below, pp. 203 ff.). It is noteworthy that in D.H.D. 2/20, "hid" seems to correspond most closely to "abscondita" in the Extractio - the Latin adjective which describes the wisdom of Christians in I Corinthians 2.7.

110. The English author may, however, have been influenced by the equally unspecific allusion which the Extractio includes at this point.
111. See, however, Prof. Hodgson's note on the form of the English title (7/28-9 fn.).
112. Other synonyms occurring in the Cloud Corpus are "couplid" (Cloud 31/8, 53/20, 71/17 etc.) "ioined" (P.P. 50/11), and "congelid" (Cloud 82/15-16) which describes the clinging of mortal attributes to the contemplative which impede his progress to union (cf. the usage of the term in D.H.D. 6/22). In P.P. 56/15-57/3, the English author reaffirms the traditional mystical interpretation of the Canticle by applying its nuptial imagery to the contemplative "oonheed" between the soul and God: "in þis oonheed is þe mariage maad bitwix God and þe soule" (56/21).
113. Wolfgang Riehle, op. cit., pp.129-32. He records here that "unio" is technically represented by "onyng" (e.g. P.C. 163/27-8, "... goostly onyng of oure soule vnto hym in parfite charite"), and "unitas" - which normally refers to union between the soul and God - by "onheed" (e.g. P.C. 148/1). He also demonstrates, however, that these technical distinctions are by no means consistently maintained in English mystical texts, and he counters the example of "onheed" in P.C. 148/1 with an incidence of the word in 169/13 of the same text where its connotations are different. Similarly, he lists the various synonyms which the inventiveness of the English writers substitutes for "onen" in this context: "binden", "fastnen", "knitten", "couplen", "joinen".

Riehle also remarks on the absence of the technical Latin term for the achievement of contemplative union, "fruitio", in Hilton and Julian of Norwich as well as in the Cloud Corpus (op. cit., p.150), though his opinion that this discernible tendency to avoid abstract and markedly technical theological vocabulary is to be accounted for by presuming a lay audience for these texts may be questionable.

114. See above, pp.170-1.
115. Thérý, 'L'Extractio', pp.36-42 includes this in his catalogue of modifications which Gallus made to his sources.
116. Wolfgang Riehle, op.cit., pp.133-5, claims that the substitution of concrete vernacular phrases for the technical Latin vocabulary of "extasis" and "excessus mentis" is characteristic of English mystical literature as a whole. He supports his argument with reference to D.H.D. 3/12, Rolle's English Psalter ("out passynge of thought" (p.236)), and Misyn's translation of the Incendium Amoris ("passynge of mynde be contemplacion" (30/38)).
- It should be added, however, that the English writers thus effectively established a traditional mystical vocabulary of their own which uses Latin models and the existing verbal resources of the vernacular.
117. Riehle (ibid.) alluding specifically to this passage from Privy Counselling and Prof. Hodgson's footnote on it, comments,
- Nach Hodgson lehnt sich das Book of Privy Counselling in seiner Deutung des mystischen 'excessus' 'most closely' an Richards von St. Victor Benjamin Minor an. In der Tat wird "ähnlich wie bei Richard Benjamins 'excess of mynde' als 'excess of loue' gedeutet, in dem der Mensch werde 'rauisch(h)ed abouen mynde'. Wiederum in formaler Anlehnung an Richard sagt der Verfasser gleichzeitig, wenn die Seele zu wahrer Kontemplation gelangt sei, 'þan dizep alle mans reson'. Trotzdem zeigen sich bei dieser Frage gewisse Unterschiede zwischen dem Cloud- Autor und Richard: denn im Gegensatz zu jenem redet Richard nicht einer ausschließlich affektiven Gotteserkenntnis das Wort, sondern da er nicht vernunftfeindlich ist, weist er den menschlichen Verstandeskräften doch eine beträchtliche Fähigkeit der Erkenntnis des Transzendenten zu, nur muß bei ihm die letzte Erleuchtung in der Kontemplation durch Gott selbst erfolgen.
- The degrees to which the affective and intellectual powers are deemed to be involved in unitive apprehension of God by the Cloud author and the Victorines are discussed in detail below, pp.239 ff. and in Appendix I.
118. The phrase "abouen kynde" (the precise equivalent of Lat. "supernaturaliter") may be interpreted as making rather different, more general claims concerning divine inaccessibility to the unaided human powers of apprehension than "abouen mynde", which locates and defines the nature of the unitive experience with some precision. It will be seen below pp.249 ff., however, that the two ideas are closely interconnected for the Cloud author.
119. The O.E.D. cites only two fourteenth century examples of "rauischid": Piers Plowman B.11.17 and Pearl 1088.
120. Wolfgang Riehle (op.cit. pp.135-8) suggests that the technical distinction between "extasis" and "raptus" is not generally preserved in English mysticism. The Cloud author seems, however, to differentiate between the ecstatic condition in which the soul contemplates God and its momentary accession to this state through "rauisching".

121. Riehle's comments on the image of being drawn up to God (op.cit. pp.110-11), which derives from Canticle 1.3 ("Trahe me: post te curremus, in odorem unguentorum tuorum..."), clearly also have a bearing on the composition of the English expression. He notes the highly individualistic ways in which the traditional biblical imagery was developed among the English writers of contemplative prose, and cites as examples Rolle's Meditatio de Passione Domini, "... drawe me euer to þee and wiþ þee as a nett draweþ fysshe til it comeþ to þe banke of deep") and a comparable usage by the Cloud author himself, "Bot 3if I schal sey þe soþe, lat God drawe þi loue up to þat cloude..." (Cloud 34/20-21).
122. The corollary of this notion of unitive experience - that God transcends all earthly concepts "secundum excessum" - is stated in the headings to chs. IV and V of the Sarracenus text of the De Mystica Theologia, and it is notable in view of the English translator's apparent reluctance to include the Latinate phrase "excesse of mynde" where he has a vernacular alternative in "abouen mynde" which is both unambiguous and precise, that he omits the qualification "secundum excessum" on both occasions. Similarly he disregards the passage from the Extractio (corresponding to 8/12-15) in which Gallus explains the equal force of the dialectics of excess and negation as they are applied to God. Again, he seems concerned to avoid unnecessary technicality of either thought or expression, and it is characteristic of his version of the Dionysian treatise that he makes less play of the fact of divine transcendence than the Latin translators of the text. See below, pp.279-82.
123. See also Cloud 74/11-13; Privy Counselling 140/6-7, 143/9-10. In some instances, he locates the unitive experience in the "deepnes of spirit". Cloud, ch. 47, for example, has  
 þou wost wel þis, þat God is a spirit; & who-so schuld  
 be onid vnto hym, it behouip to be in soþfastnes & deepnes  
 of spirit... (88/19-20),  
 but this he paradoxically identifies with the height:  
 ... þe depnes of spirit, þe whiche is þe heizt (for in  
 goostlynes alle is one, heizt & depnes, lengþe & brede).  
(Cloud 75/1-2).
124. Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie, Vol. 72, 1950, 129-76. Von Ivanka cites "principale mentis" (ἡγεμονικόν), "scintilla animae" (ἀπόσπασμα ("des kosmischen Feuers")) and "sinderesis" (συντήρησις) as equivalent terms in scholastic usage.
125. The New Scholasticism, Vol. XXIX, No. 1, January 1955, 1-32.
126. Mulligan notes (ibid. p.23 fn) that the traditional Augustinian position is restated in Hugh of St. Victor's Expositio in hierarchiam coelestem III; P.L. CLXXV, 979, and in Richard of St. Victor's De Gratia Contemplationis I, 3; P.L. CXCVI, 67.
127. Ibid. p.4.
128. Mulligan records a similar correlation between the Augustinian theory of ratio superior and the Stoic concept of synderesis:  
 Because of St. Jerome's description of synderesis as being the inextinguishable spark of conscience, some medieval writers immediately concluded that it was very likely the

same as the higher part of the reason described by St. Augustine, the part which is turned towards God and eternal truths. (Ibid. p.25).

The complex history of the word "synderesis" is explored more fully by M.B. Crowe in his article "The Term Synderesis and the Scholastics", Irish Theological Quarterly, Vol. XXIII, April 1956, 151-164 and 228-245. The relevant passage from St. Jerome occurs in his Commentary on Ezechiel (P.L. XXV, 22). Crowe suggests that it owes its widespread currency in the Middle Ages to a scribal error, since the original text of St. Jerome seems to have read "syneidesis" at this point. Crowe confirms, however, its repeated connexion with the ratio superior of St. Augustine in medieval theological texts.

129. The commentary on Isaias 6, 1-4 from the Explanation of the Angelic Hierarchy is printed in an Appendix to Walsh's thesis, pp. 1'-19'. The text is edited from MSS Vienna 695 and Oxford 69 by P.G. Théry, O.P. in "Commentaire sur Isaie de Thomas de Saint-Victor", Vie Spirituelle, Supplément, Vol. XLVII, 1936, 146-162.

Jeanne Barbet, in the introduction to Thomas Gallus, Commentaires du Cantique des Cantiques (Paris, 1967), notes an important variation in Gallus' treatment of the Dionysian principle of hierarchy:

Alors que Denys commence son étude des hierarchies célestes en allant de la plus élevée à la plus basse, des Séraphins aux Anges, Thomas adopte la démarche contraire: il décrit d'abord l'ange de l'esprit et finit par le séraphin. La raison en est que, même s'il est vrai que la structure hiérarchique de l'esprit contemplatif dépend avant tout de l'irradiation sur lui de la lumière divine à partir de sa fine pointe, qui est unie à Dieu, et de la consommation progressive et mesurée de cette lumière à l'âme tout entier, Gallus veut nous montrer comment s'effectue le retour à Dieu de l'âme entière. Il l'envisage alors tout d'abord en sa nature afin de décrire les étapes de son ascension vers les sommets de la vie mystique, ascension qui serait impossible sans effort de sa part, mais aussi sans l'attrait que Dieu exerce sur elle afin de l'élever là même où sa nature ne saurait la conduire. La double médiation hiérarchique est constamment en jeu et le commentaire la met constamment en lumière. (p.48).

130. Walsh, op.cit., pp.9'/10-10'/4. It is noteworthy that Gallus shifts consistently, as here, to the passive mood to express the receptive condition of the soul at the highest stage of the contemplative ascent. In his Explanation of the Divine Names, ch.4, for example, he writes:

'Vivo iam non ego' etc: id est, vita naturali per unitionem excessivam ad eternitatis immensitatem quasi absorpta, et suo officio suspensa, dirigor, (M93 r 2) doceor, moveor, regor vita supersubstantiali, cui unior, qua repleor; et hoc est 'Christus vivit in me': .... Qui mente excedunt extasim pat dicuntur, quia aguntur, non agunt. (Walsh, ibid., Appendix to Part III, p.266/2140-2159).

131. Ibid., p.82. The notion that the three phases of the contemplative life are distinguished as the spheres where nature, nature and grace, and grace alone operate respectively also occurs in Richard of St. Victor's Benjamin Major, IV 2.



132. 8'/8-10. Walsh notes in this connexion that Augustine's distinction between sapientia and scientia is also the basis of Gallus' differentiation of the second and third mansions of the hierarchy of the mind (pp. 138ff.).
133. Commentary on Isaias. Walsh, *ibid.* 12'/27-31.
134. See, for example, the commentary on the De Ecclesiastica Hierarchia,  
 Ipse Jhesus qui est thearchissima mens: id est, divina et principalis sapientia .... qui est 'principium-fontalis' causa et ordinator omnis ierarchie angelice et humane et ierarchie sanctificationis, quod consistit in scientiis et doctrinis et virtutibus, et divine operationibus, a Deo emanatis et in Deum tendentis. (Quoted Walsh, *ibid.*, p.90 fn.).
135. Walsh cites the First Commentary on the Canticle for Gallus' doctrine of the senses:  
 Tunc enim exteriorum sensuum delectatio totaliter ad interiorum sensuum convertitur dilectationem... Convenit autem dici, duos esse sensus in intellectu - visum et auditum: tres autem in affectu, sc., gustum, tactum et odoratum, qui omnes uno modo ex hoc quod anima divinorum inhaeret contemplationi, ad sua obiecta ferventissime suscitantur: visus ad splendores auditus ad Divinas inspirationes, gustus ad dulcissimos sapes, tactus ad levissimas fragrantias supersolentes,  
 and for his theory that the sense of taste corresponds most closely to the unitive experience itself:  
 Non autem puto esse ab re, quod per osculum oris unitionis experientia designatur. Nam sicut os instrumentum est, in quo sapida omnia deputant: sic in unitione conveniunt et experiuntur delectationes omnium virtutum et illuminationes. (*ibid.*, pp.250-251).
136. Gallus identifies the second mansion as the proper sphere of intellectual knowledge (see Walsh, *op.cit.*, Ch. III, pp. 101-20). He distinguishes knowledge of this order from that of the philosopher, in that it is informed by and culminates in love. He insists, moreover, that it is an integral part of the continuous process of ascent to unitive awareness.
137. Walsh, *ibid.* Appendix III, p.264/2089-2103.
138. Robert Javelet accounts for the apparent inconsistency between Gallus' divergences from Richard's theology and his claim to own Richard as his master, in his article, "Thomas Gallus et Richard de Saint-Victor mystiques", Recherches de Théologie Ancienne et Médiévale, Vol. 29, 1962, 206-33. He notes that Gallus identifies two modes of knowledge at the beginning of the Explanacio, la science et la connaissance proprement dite, celle qui atteint Dieu au coeur" (p.207) - "duplici modo" which are based on the concepts of scire and nosse. Gallus assumes and simplifies the six grades of contemplation which Richard defines in the Benjamin Major, and associates them with the first category of knowledge. Javelet comments that Gallus' treatment of the sixth grade is cursory, possibly as a gesture of courtesy to Richard, since Gallus departs from him here in classifying contemplation of this order according

to the principles of Dionysian theology. Gallus, he stresses, substitutes principalis affectio for Richard's intelligentia as the instrument of unitive knowledge. He also emphasizes, however, that Gallus follows Richard in assuming that the affective and intellectual modes of knowledge tend to merge at the culmination of the contemplative experience. Thus for Richard,

La flamme à son sommet se contracte en une pointe vivante; ainsi l'âme se simplifie en montant, vers son Amour. Elle devient un simple élan, un 'ad Deum'. Le dualisme intellect-amour disparaît. Thomas distingue aussi nettement que Richard le 'sensatum intellectus' et les 'sensata affeccionis'. Il formule avec netteté la simplification de l'esprit au terme de l'ascension spirituelle: 'In mentis excessum rapitur, unitis et simplicatis motibus. Osee lg: congregantur filii Juda, id est motus affeccionum et Israël filii, id est motus intelligentie'. (MS Vienne 695 f.82<sup>ra</sup>). Cette simplification, qui d'ailleurs dilate l'esprit pour une contemplation plus riche, efface toutes les interprétations figuratives de la vérité; elle prépare l'heure et le lieu de l'union silencieuse à l'ineffable. (p.232).

Cf. also Javelet's sequel to this article, *Ibid.*, Vol. 30, 1963, 88-121. The issue of the relationship of Gallus' theology to that of Richard of St. Victor is also considered here in Appendix I. It is intended to identify the radical divergences from Victorine principles which Gallus' commitment to Dionysian theology instituted in his mystical theory, which involves reaffirming some of the fundamental distinctions between the two major traditions of mystical theology in the Middle Ages. It will also give support, however, to the argument that Victorine theories concerning the role of the intellect in mystical knowledge remained integral to Gallus' thought, which is the basis of the contention that Hugh of Balma first developed a theology which isolated the mystical faculty and mystical awareness from other modes of cognition, and that the Cloud author was Hugh's disciple in this respect.

139. Quoted Walsh, *ibid.* fn. p.177.

Endre Von Ivanka, in his article "Zur Überwindung des neuplatonischen Intellektualismus in der Deutung der Mystik: intelligentia oder principalis affectio", Scholastik, Vol. XXX, 1955, 185-194, traces the descent of the concept of intelligentia from Proclus and argues that Gallus incorporates it into his theology by identifying it with the principalis affectio as the faculty of mystical knowledge.

140. Walsh, *ibid.*, Appendix I, 13'/14-19.

141. Quoted Walsh, *ibid.*, p.215.

142. Walsh, *ibid.*, pp.255-8.

143. See above, pp.113-5.

144. See above, pp.199-20.

145. Quoted Walsh, *ibid.*, p.245.

146. Von Ivanka, art. cit., p.168.

147. Walsh, *ibid.*, p.222 fn., says of this knowledge,  
 There can be no doubt that for Thomas the heights of  
 contemplation consist in mystical knowledge of the Trinity.  
 The soul at the summit appears in the sight of God:  
 "... apparente in conspectu Dei, Dei tui ... id est, in  
 excessiva contemplacione trinitas eterne". (D.N. c3).  
 cf. also Robert Javelet's account of the fusion of the  
 affective and intellectual modes of knowledge in Gallus'  
 theology (above, fn.138).
148. Walsh, *ibid.*, p.99.
149. Von Ivanka, art. cit., p.170.
150. The text of the Viae Syon Lugent cited here is that printed  
 among the complete works of Bonaventura, Bonaventura, Cologne  
 ed. 1609 (after the Vatican edition), Vol. VII, pp.657-687,  
 under the alternative title, De Mystica Theologia. An English  
 translation of parts of the treatise (dated 1676) by Robert  
 Bacon is listed in the Catalogus Manuscriptorum Codicum  
Bibliothecae Uffenbachianae (Frankfurt, 1747), pp.302-4,  
 Item III. Interestingly, Item IV of the same manuscript is  
 a text of the Cloud of Unknowing: the description reads,  
 Veteris cujusdam scriptoris Liber Mysticus: 'Θυὸς Νυθὸς'  
 or the divine cloud of unknowing, written long since by  
 a contemplative monk a mst. above 300.years old, copied  
 by ROBERT BACON.
151. See Appendix I and, for further parallels P.S. Jolliffe, "Two  
 Middle English Tracts on the Contemplative Life", Medieval  
Studies XXXVII, 1975, 85-121, pp.117-8.
152. Medieval Mystical Tradition and St. John of the Cross, by A  
 Benedictine of Stanbrook (London, 1954), pp.92-100, includes  
 a clear account of the principal lines of the text. A more  
 detailed analysis of Hugh's contemplative theology is given  
 by Jean Krynen, "La Pratique et la Théorie de l'Amour sans  
 Connaissance dans la Viae Sion Lugent d'Hugues de Balma",  
R.A.M, Vol. XL, 1964, 161-83.
153. See M.R. James, The Western Manuscripts in the Library of  
Trinity College, Cambridge (Cambridge, 1900) Vol. I; and  
A Descriptive Catalogue of the Manuscripts in the Library  
of Gonville and Caius College (Cambridge, 1907) Vol. I.  
 Both MSS are said to date from the fifteenth century. In  
 the Trinity College MS, the Viae Syon Lugent is attributed  
 to St. Bernard and printed among his works. The Caius College  
 MS contains religious tracts in Latin by various authors,  
 including the Stimulus Amoris and Rolle's De Emendacione  
Peccatoris.
154. Jolliffe cites Dr. A.I. Doyle as his authority for this  
 statement (art. cit., p.117 fn).
155. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, Vol. 27, No. 3, July, 1976,  
 225-40.
156. A translation of this text is printed by James Walsh, "The  
 Ascent to Contemplative Wisdom", The Way, Vol. 9, 1969, 243-50.
157. Sargent's article states that this manuscript was annotated by  
 James Grenehalgh, but the author has since contradicted this claim.

158. The Viae Syon Lugent itself was not, however, annotated by Grenehalgh.
159. Viae Syon Lugent, 661-668.
160. Ibid., 665-6.
161. See below, pp. 236-8.
162. Gallus classifies Richard of St. Victor's contemplative theology as belonging to this order (see above, pp. 206-7).
163. Ibid., 683-687.
164. The converse argument, which cited the example of the angelic hierarchy, had rested on the assumption that in the progress to union, the soul had to pass through the cherubim stage in order to reach the level of the seraphim.
165. Hugh goes on here to comment on the appropriate economy of the De Mystica Theologia: its brevity, he claims, is consistent with the doctrine which it propounds, though it contains a wealth of meaning. It is possible that there is an echo of Hugh's description of the text -  
     in quo licet sint pauca verba, tamen est quasi infinita  
     sententia (659 Col. I A) -  
 in Privy Counselling 164/7, where the English author, by contrast, deprecates what he classes as the comparative verbosity and inconsequentiality of his own work. His exclamation, "Lo! here many wordes & lityl sentence", which seems to reproduce the terms and construction of Hugh's phrase, disparages his own efforts by implicit comparison with terseness and profundity of the De Mystica Theologia.
166. See Appendix I.
167. See above, p. 216.
168. See above, pp. 216-7.
169. Jean Krynen, art. cit. p. 182, also suggests that Hugh, in his eagerness to emphasize the purely affective character of the unitive way, neglects the concept of non-discursive knowledge in pure faith in the theoretical account of his theology, though he seems to acknowledge its efficacy in the main practical section of the text:  
     ... lorsqu'elle exclut de la voie d'amour caché toute  
     intellection spéculative et exige la totale quiétude de  
     l'entendement à l'égard de ces opérations actives, cette  
     thèse est incomplète lorsqu'elle englobe dans la connaissance  
     spéculative à exclure, la connaissance supra-intellectuelle  
     de la pure foi. C'est grâce à celle-ci, au contraire, que  
     toute autre connaissance est ôtée, et c'est elle qui établit  
     l'intelligence dans la totale quiétude à l'égard des opérations  
     de sa vertu naturelle active.
170. See above, pp. 203-5.
171. Walsh, op. cit., p. 246fn.
172. Ibid., 13'/9-10.
173. The key text for Gallus' theory of the ecstasy of love is his commentary on the De Divinis Nominibus, IV, which is printed

by Walsh in his Appendix to Part III, op. cit., pp.262-271.

174. Walsh, *ibid.* p.73. Richard of St. Victor also refers to the intellectual and spiritual effort required to obtain contemplation as "opus" in, for example, Ben. Maj.IV,1.
175. Quoted Walsh, *ibid.*, p.175fn. See pp.174-206 for a discussion of Gallus' teaching on this stage of the contemplative ascent.
176. See, however, below pp.244-5.
177. Walsh, *op.cit.*, p.175 fn.
178. The insistence on the fundamental need for right direction of the will is also characteristic of Rudolph of Biberach. His De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis is among several works discussed briefly in Appendix II as possible intermediaries between Hugh of Balma and the Cloud author in the transmission of Dionysian theology.
179. Prof. Hodgson lists some of the major sources of the Cloud author's theory in the introduction to her edition of the text, pp.lxix-lxxiii.
180. Rudolph of Biberach also places considerable emphasis on this point: see below, Appendix II.
181. See Viae Syon Lugent I, De Via Purgativa, op. cit., 659-61 and Cloud chs. 13-15.
182. The Viae Syon Lugent alludes conversely to the "foot of love" in descriptions of the soul's unitive ascent through the power of the affection:  
In quantum ergo mens per pedes affectionum in ipso, qui est vera vita, aspirat ardentius quietari, intantum minus carnali affectioni coniungitur, cum sentiat ea quae sunt spiritus, & per consequens magis ac magis in Deo absorbetur. (670 Col. I D) cf. 675 Col. I A, 676 Col. I D etc. The same energetic metaphor recurs in the Cloud Corpus:  
In þe whiche solitari forme & maner of leuyng þou maist lerne to lift up þe fote of þi loue, & step towards þat state & degre of leuyng þat is parfite, & þe laste state of alle.

(Cloud 14/12-15)

Its use is too widespread, however, to attach particular importance to this parallel. Riehle (*op. cit.* pp.102-3) gives some indication of its currency:

Diese liebende Willenskraft der Seele, mit der sie sich auf Gott zubewegt, wird gerade in der englischen Mystik gern mit dem Bild der „Liebesfüße“ konkretisiert. Vor allem in den Texten des Cloud - Autors, Rolles, Hiltons und dem Myroure of Oure Ladye versucht die Seele, mit dem Fuß der Liebe bzw. den Füßen der „affectionis“ Gott zu erreichen. Als Bildquelle für diese Metaphorik kommt neben Pseudo-Dionysius und den Kommentaren von Thomas Cisterciensis, Thomas Gallus und Hugo von St. Caro vor allem Augustin in Frage, der in seiner Enarratio in Psalmum 1X.15 eine Gleichung von „amor“ und „pes animae“ aufstellt. Die englische Übersetzung von Guigos II Traktat Scala Claustralium erklärt daraufhin geradezu, daß jede Erwähnung eines Fußes in der Bibel in allegorischer Exegese als Bild für die mystische Liebe verstanden werden müsse:  
'By a fote in Holy Wrytte is love vnderstond' (D.H.D. 115/23).

183. Dom Justin McCann, commenting on the relationship of the Cloud author's theology to that of Thomas Gallus in the introduction to his modernised text The Cloud of Unknowing (London, 1924), which also contains D.H.D. and P.C., says of the concept of union through love:

For Vercellensis, apparently it meant the complete supersession of the intellect.... But a more temperate school - and our author seems to belong to it - holding fast to the doctrine that there is no willing without knowing... refused to depose the intellect. (pp. XXVIII-XXIX)

Dom McCann here accentuates an important aspect of the text's achievement. His account of the role of the intellect in Gallus' theology is, however, inadequate, and his failure to recognize the English author's exemption of the unitive way from this general rule represents a vital misconception of his contemplative theory and its likely derivation.

184. cf. P.C. 136/7-9.

185. See above, p. 222.

186. James Walsh, in his article "The Cloud of Unknowing", The Month, 1963, 325-336, implies that the Cloud author agrees with Gallus in the allocation of roles to the intellectual and loving powers in the ascent to mystical union. He rightly questions Prof. Hodgson's claim that Gallus,

... teaches that the supreme mystical apprehension of God is achieved by a special faculty of the soul which he calls "principalis affectio"... The author of the Cloud gives a quite conventional account of the faculties of the soul.

(Cloud, Intro. plxvii)

Prof. Hodgson herself has since incorporated a footnote which admits agreement between the two authors in their fundamental insistence on "the exercise of the will, and on the power of love to attain to a surpassing, immediate knowledge of God". Father Walsh goes on,

Thomas' doctrine is that in the ascent to God, a point is reached when both intellect and will are drawn upwards by special contemplative graces and transformed, in preparation for union. The name given to intellect and will when their full powers are thus energised is apex intellectus and apex affectus (or principalis affectio); these powers are, at the moment of the transforming union, in some way separated from the mind which contains them. The term used by the author of the Cloud for this full extension of the intellect and will in unitive contemplation is "the supreme point of the spirit". 'When you are in this state', he says, 'your love is both chaste and perfect; now it is that you see your God and your love of him both together; and you also experience him directly, as he is in himself, in the highest point of your spirit, by being made spiritually one with his love'.

But in the actual comprehension of God, the final consummation of the union when "a marriage is made between God and the soul", the power of the intellect, even supported as it is by special graces, special illuminations, fails, and it is in the affection alone that union is experienced. The most vivid description given by the author of the Cloud of this moment of union is worded thus: 'And therefore give heed to

this exercise and its marvellous working in your soul. For rightly understood, it is a sudden and unheralded stirring speedily springing up to God like a spark from the coal'. The Latin name given to intellect and will as they work together in the way of contemplation is synderesis, the natural impulse by virtue of which the soul is the image of the Sovereign Good and naturally adheres to it. This impulse, when perfectly purified by the love of God, is called the scintilla synderesis, for it flies above the soul like the spark above the fire. (pp. 330-31)

It is hoped to show in the course of this chapter, however, that the Cloud author is largely influenced by Hugh of Balma's interpretation of the tradition of Dionysian contemplative theology, and, like him, adapts Gallus' theory of unitive awareness to dissociate the intellectual faculty from both the ascent to union and the unitive experience itself.

187. See above, pp.219-22.

188. See above, p.239.

189. Quoted Walsh, op. cit., p.238.

190. See Cloud chs. 36-40.

191. e.g. Cloud 28/10-16:

& zif þee list haue þis entent lappid & foulden in o worde, for þou schuldest haue betir holde þerapon, take þee bot a litil worde of o silable; for so it is betir þen of two, for euer þe schorter it is, þe betir it acordeþ wiþ þe werk of þe spirite. & soche a worde is þis worde GOD or þis worde LOUE. Cheese þee wheþer þou wilt, or anoþer as þe list: whiche þat þee likeþ best of o silable. & fasten þis worde to þin herte, so þat it neuer go þens for þing þat bifalleþ.

These exercises are discussed by Hugh in Viae Syon Lugent 661 Col. II - 672 Col. I.

The similarity between the two texts in this respect is commented on by François Vandenbroucke in La Spiritualité du Moyen Âge, Dom Jean Leclercq, Dom François Vandenbroucke, Louis Bouyer (Aubier, 1961), pp.504 & 546. Jolliffe (art. cit.) also confirms that the loving aspirations and the concept of knowledge through unknowing are the two areas in which the texts have most in common.

192. Ed. O. Kuhn, Grossbritannien und Deutschland (München, 1974), pp. 461-476. cf. also Studien zur englischen Mystik des Mittelalters, pp.214-5.

193. Ed. C. Horstmann, Yorkshire Writers (London, 1895), Vol. I, p.278.

194. Ibid., p.339.

195. See above, pp. 221-4.

196. The references to the soul's spiritual location are explained more fully in Cloud, chs. 8 and 62, and Viae Syon Lugent 668 Col. II E - 672 Col. I D and 680 Col. II D-E respectively.

197. Walsh; op. cit., Appendix I, p.5<sup>2</sup>-fn.

198. Prof. Hodgson is representative of commentators on the Cloud Corpus who, accepting the author's indebtedness to Gallus on certain points of theology, have nevertheless not admitted a link between his unitive theology and the mystical tradition which Gallus developed. She writes,  
 The discussion at disproportionate length of the nature and powers of the soul in chapters 63-6 of The Cloud sounds also polemic. Unlike the German mystics, and unlike a great number of his predecessors and contemporaries, who claim a higher faculty through which union with God takes place in the essence of the soul, the author of The Cloud recognizes no higher faculty than the reason and the will, and through the right working of these he taught that the mystical union can take place. (Cloud, Intro.p.lvi1)  
 See also above, fn. 186.
200. The point bears directly on the question of Hilton's possible authorship of the Cloud. Wolfgang Riehle, for example, in his article "Der Seelengrund in der englischen Mystik des Mittelalters im Vergleich zur deutschen" (pp.461-2), claims that the two authors agree in regarding the dark night as an intermediary stage between the soul's entry into the contemplative way and the full enlightenment of contemplative vision -  
 Wenn dieser Spring in einem Akt liebender Hingabe erfolge, werde gerade die Dunkelheit paradoxerweise in das Licht der Erkenntnis führen.  
 It seems, however, that the Cloud author's contradiction of this theory is among the major grounds for disputing common authorship of the Cloud - and Hilton groups of texts - though it will be shown below (pp. 263-6) that there is a sense in which darkness is light for the Cloud author.
201. Cloud 24/1.
202. Cf. ibid. 123/22-23.
203. cf. Cloud 94/19 "... pis blinde sterynge of loue in pin herte".
204. See Appendix II for parallels of the Cloud author's use of "nakid" in the De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis of Rudolph of Biberach.
205. S. & Ex. 567; D.H.D. 2/32.
206. See above, p. 251-2.
207. It has been suggested - notably by Dom David Knowles in The English Mystical Tradition (pp. 74 ff) - that the Cloud author's theology of grace is influenced by scholasticism and, in particular, by Aquinas. Knowles proposes, on the basis of this, that the author was possibly an ex-religious, preferably an ex-Dominican, and connects him with the Rhineland school of mysticism. The research of this thesis has found no evidence to support the latter claims, though the influence of scholastic philosophy has been noted in respect of the Cloud author's teaching on the grounde or substaunce of the soul, for example (see below, fn.212). The scope of the present thesis has not permitted detailed comparison between the Cloud author and Aquinas on the issue of grace, however, and the possibility of influence in this general area of his theology cannot be discounted.



208. There may be some specific recollection of the Extractio here, since the corresponding paragraph of this text includes the phrase "per unitionem dilectionis" (578).
209. There is no precise equivalent for this expression in the sources of the D.H.D., though the translator may be developing a hint from Gallus' Gloss, which has "uniri Deo per super-intellectualem cognitionem et affectionem sui" (269 B) at this point.
210. See above, pp. 207.
211. See above, pp. 178-9.
212. The Cloud author, it should be noted, defines the soul's unitive faculty, "þe first poynt of þi spirit", as the essence of its being. In Privy Counselling 141/11-12, for example, he writes, þou schalt fynde þat þe first poynte & þe pricke of þi beholdyng, whatsoeuer it be, is þi nakid being, and in 144/4-8,  
 Bot alle coriouste left & fer put bak, do worschip to þi God with þi substaunce, al þat þou arte þat þou arte vnto alle him þat is as he is, þe whiche only of himself, wipoutyn moo, is þe blisful being of boþe of himself & of þee.  
 Wolfgang Riehle, in his article "Der Seelengrund in der englischen Mystik des Mittelalters im Vergleich zur deutschen", suggests that the Cloud author's allusions to the grunde or substaunce of the soul are derived from scholasticism, and that he may have influenced Julian of Norwich's theology on this point.  
 William Johnston, The Mysticism of "The Cloud of Unknowing" (New York, 1967), also comments on the significance of the Cloud author's location of mystical union in "the sovereign point of the spirit", "the lowest point of the wit" or "the naked being":  
 The English author uses it, firstly, to stress the totality of the soul's union with God: not a union of parts or faculties but a total merging of one into the other; secondly, he uses it to emphasize the existential (as opposed to essential) nature of the union: it is a union of being with being; thirdly, he uses it to show that union is not horizontal but vertical, not in motion but in rest, not in time but in timelessness. In this way he is able to describe the most complete union of man with God. (pp. 210-1).
- \*213. cf. also P.C. 143/3-16 (quoted in part below, p.261).
214. See, for example, the Prologue to the Viae Syon Lugent (658 Col. I B-C):  
 Sapientia enim haec quae Mystica Theologia dicitur, à Paulo Apostolo est edocta, à Dionysio Areopagita suo discipulo conscripta, quae idem est quod extensio amoris in Deum per amoris desiderium. Quantum distat ortus ab occidente, omnium creaturarum scientiam incomparabiliter praeexcellit. Nam alias scientias mundi doctores edocent, sed de hac à solo Deo immediate, non à mortali homine spiritus edocetur.
215. See below, p.275.
216. cf. Alia est istis multo excellentior, per amorem ardentissimum vnitium, quae actualiter sine omni medio animum disponente,
- \*213<sup>a</sup> See page 89.

ardentissime facit in dilectum suis extensionibus sursum actiuus consurgere: quae Mystica Theologia tradita in apice affectiuae consurgit, quae consurrectio ignorata, vel per ignorantiam dicitur, vt remoto omnis imaginationis, rationis, intellectus, vel intelligentiae exercitio, per vnitionem ardentissimi amoris id sentiat in praesenti, quod intelligentia capere non sufficit, immo quod potius est, omnis speculatiua cognitio totaliter ignorat. (679 Col. I E - II A) ... sed insuper in anima incomparabiliter per amoris vnitiui desideria perfectio amplioris cognitionis relinquitur, quam studendo, vel audiendo, vel pro rationis exercitio conquiratur. (672 Col. II D)

217. cf P.C. 169/17-26 (quoted above, p.254).  
 218. cf P.C. 143/17-144/8, where the verb 'is' has the same force.  
 219. See above, pp.253-4.  
 220. See above, pp.219-21.

221. Prof. Hodgson compares this passage, in a footnote, to the Tretyse of þe Stodye of Wysdome 43/16-44/6:

þan bygynnip þer a maner of cleerte of þe lizt of God for to schyne in þi soule, and a maner of sonnebeme þat is gostly to apere before þi goostly sizt, þe whiche is þe ize of þi soule and is openid to beholde God & godly þinges, heuen & heuenly þinges, and alle maner of goostly þinges. Bot þis sizt is bot be tymes, whiles God wil vouchesaaf to zeue it to a worchyng soule, þe whiles it is in þe batayle of þis deedly liif. Bot after þis liif it schal be euerlastyng.

Light, in this context, however, is "þe lizt of his grace þat he seendeþ in þi reson" (43/12), and the text is concerned with the degree of purely intellectual enlightenment which is involved in the contemplative experience. The passage from the Cloud is, in fact, more strongly reminiscent of Gallus' Commentary on Isaias, where he promises the contemplative a sudden infusion of divine light at the height of the second mansion, as a gratuitous reward for his continual efforts to achieve union and before he enters the domain of synderesis:

Qui ergo interim positi, celum cotidie suspirant, assiduisque conatibus co-operante gratia ad illius radii susceptionem famelicum et sitabundum sinum synderesis totis viribus expandunt, nec ratione nec auctoritate indigent edoceri quod sic ocius experiuntur: sc. nullis suis conatibus, etiam co-operante gratia, posse se radium illum attingere aut accipere. Sed quod non potest co-operari gratia pro nostra infirmitate, potest eidem per se ipsam operari omnifica virtute; et cum vult, et quibus et quando vult, se offert mentibus per se ipsam; et licet eas assidue inhabitet per iustitiam, raro tamen et momentanee, in affectu sc., non intellectu, supple se offert mentibus per sensibilem et rapidum fervorem, tanquam guttam illius fluvii ignei quam vidit Dan. egredientem a facie maiestatis. (Walsh, op.cit.

Appendix I, 11'/22-12'/6)

Gallus' theory may perhaps have influenced the Cloud author's interpolation of the phrase "þe whiche is somtyme sodeyner þen

- oper" into his translation of Deonise Hid Diuinite 8/19, where it qualifies the concept of ascent through unknowing and introduces an element of flexibility - perhaps, by inference, of divine intervention - into the Dionysian scheme of ordered, logical and hierarchical progress to union.
222. The concept of "sight" of God is, of course traditional, though interpretations vary widely as to what it implies. It is, therefore, worth noting that Hugh of Balma applies the metaphor to the cognitive aspect of the unitive experience in a sense akin to that of the Cloud author:  
 vt orans affectionum desiderio in métis affectu quantum possibile est in via, sicattente exoret, ac si ipsum videret facie ad faciem (681 Col. II D)
223. cf D.H.D. 2/32, and above, pp. 187-8. Also D.H.D. 4/15-16, "...rauischid to beholde abouen kynde", and above pp. 194-8.
224. McCann, op. cit., Intro. p. XV.
225. D.H.D., Intro. p. xlii.
226. The translator's strict fidelity to his sources in the Deonise Hid Diuinite is particularly striking by comparison with his practice in, for example, the Tretyse of be Stodye of Wysdome (the Benjamin Minor). There too, however, he preserves the sequence of thought in his source while reflecting his own interpretation of its substance. It is significant, for instance, that he omits Richard of St. Victor's theory of knowledge in 13/8-9 -  
 ad invisibilium cognitionem nunquam ratio assurgeret, nisi ei ancilla sua, imaginatio videlicet, rerum visibilium formam repraesentaret. Per rerum enim visibilium speciem surgit ad rerum invisibilium cognitionem (Ben. Min. V. 4) - though as Prof. Hodgson notes in her comments on the text, the theory is "fundamental to his (i.e. Richard's) thought". Clearly the translator is more at his ease in translating the Benjamin Minor, where he has none of the constraints of extreme theological and linguistic complexity which keep him close to the text of the De Mystica Theologia.
227. See above, pp. 256-7.
228. "A Talking of the Love of God and the continuity of the stylistic traditions of Middle English prose meditations", The Review of English Studies, Vol. III, New Series, No. 10, April 1952, 97-116, and "A Treatise in Cadence", The Modern Language Review, Vol. XLVII, No. 2, April 1952, 156-164.
229. Morgan, "A Talking...", p. 116.
230. A Talkyng of be Loue of God, ed. Sister Dr. M. Salvina Westra, O.P. (The Hague, 1950), 2/16-20.
231. The expression is A.C. Spearing's, from his essay "The Art of Preaching and Piers Plowman", Criticism and Medieval Poetry (London, 1964), p. 123.
232. Op. cit., 16/15-23.

233. Prof. Hodgson, in her article "A Ladder of Foure Ronges by the whiche Men Mowe Wele Clyme to Heven: A Study in the Prose Style of a Middle English Translation", Modern Language Review, Vol. XLIV, No. 4, Oct. 1949, 465-475, argues that the late fourteenth- or early fifteenth-century translation of the Scala Claustralium, by the Carthusian Prior Guigo II, demonstrates the continuity of the English prose tradition as it was defined by Margery Morgan. The text is printed by Prof. Hodgson as Appendix B to her edition of D.H.D., pp. 100-117. The text has been consistently associated with the Cloud Corpus, though no evidence has been put forward which assigns it conclusively to the same author. (See E. Colledge O.S.A. and James Walsh S.J., Lettre sur la Vie Contemplative (L'Echelle des Moines), (Paris, 1970)). It provides, however, many interesting comparisons with the D.H.D. Both translations are emancipated from their Latin sources to the extent that they read, as far as possible, as autonomous pieces of vernacular prose. Both sharpen and simplify their sources in order to heighten their appeal to an audience of pupils. There are notable similarities, moreover, in their handling of Latin vocabulary:

{ Colledge & Walsh (op. cit. 84/24-25) "...coelorum secreta rimatur"  
 { D.H.D. 101/3 "...and shewith to the clymber heuently pryvetees"  
 { Colledge & Walsh (ibid. 98/202) "...secreta colloquia"  
 { D.H.D. 112/8 "thyng þat is so hydde & so vnknown"  
 { Colledge & Walsh (ibid. 88/73-4) "'Quis ascendet in montem Domini aut quis stabit loco sanctus eius?'"  
 { D.H.D. 108/9 "'Who shalle clymbe or ascende into the hylle of God'".

Prof. Hodgson comments on the prose style of A Ladder and the Cloud Corpus,

This is a prose founded on balance of sound - clause set against clause, phrase against phrase, word against word...

This all pervasive balance of idea and expression results in a controlled and rhythmical prose, which is especially effective when suggestive of direction or climax (art. cit., pp. 472-3).

It is worth restating in this context that Wolfgang Riehle (op. cit., p.228), confining his attention to the element of diction in English devotional literature, suggests that the writers of mystical prose in particular also shared a linguistic tradition which had developed in conjunction with their common subject matter:

Bei den englischen Texten als einer eigenen Gruppe herrschte eine beachtlicher Grad an sprachliche Kontinuität vor. Es zeigte sich immer wieder, wie einzelne teils seit der Ancrene Wisse, teils seit Rolle gebräuchliche mystische Termini in gleicher Bedeutung in den späteren Texten wiederkehrten. So bestätigte sich uns die in der Forschung schon kommentierte sprachliche Affinität zwischen dem Autor der Cloud und Hilton, und hinzu traten Ähnlichkeiten zwischen der Cloud und dem Mirror of Simple Souls.

234. Walsh, op. cit., Appendix to Ch. IV, 169/754-6.  
 235. See above, p. 261.

236. cf. the translator's interpolated example of the relationship of mistress to servant in D.H.D. 5/8, "as þe lady haþ hir maydens", as an illustration of the preeminence of contemplative over rational knowledge; the simile seems to recollect Gallus' use of "ancillatur" in Ex. 565 (see above, p. 270).
237. The version of Sarracenus here reads,  
 sicut ipsius naturae insigne facientes, auferentes  
 prohibitiones officientes mundaе occulti visioni, et ipsam  
 in se ipsa ablatione sola occultam manifestantes  
 pulchritudinem (580-1).  
 The text of the D.H.D. is closest to the Gloss, which has,  
 sicut est videre in artificibus, qui aliquam fabricant  
 similitudinem de aliqua inanimata materia, qui sculpendo  
 et incidendo remouent exteriores partes materiae grossiores,  
 qui occultant et cooperiunt, ne videri possit illa pura imago,  
 quae naturaliter et potentialiter est interius, et per solam  
 talium offendiculorum remotionem sine alio additamento  
 manifestatur in propria specie ipsius imaginis pulchritudo,  
 quae prius latebat in occulto. (276 C).
238. cf. the translator's omission of the phrase "et hymnos reponere" (S. 579), "et hymnos referre" (Gloss 275 D) from the heading of D.H.D. Ch. II.
239. D.H.D. Intro. p. xlii.
240. The qualifying phrase is also omitted from the Extractio.
241. See above, pp. 178-9.
242. See above, p. 172-3.
243. cf. D.H.D. 10/12, "in hym", where the Extractio (600) specifies "in Verbo".
244. Prof. Hodgson comments on other textual modifications which seem to bear the stamp of the Cloud author's literary personality: e.g. the advice that the contemplative's contrition is to be "sleiz" and "listi" (D.H.D. 3/1), and the intimate tone of his encouragement to the initiate in 3/9-10, "And, as it is possible to me for to speke & to þee to vnderstonde, loke þat þou rise wiþ me in þis grace..." See also pp. xlii-xliii of the introduction to her edition for Prof. Hodgson's general assessment of the English text's relation to its sources.
245. cf. Prof. Hodgson's note on the English author's expansion of the text of Sarracenus in D.H.D. 3/7-9: Prof. Hodgson comments on its clumsiness, but adds that it is "one which is easily intelligible compared with the highly philosophical explanation of the Commentary, f. 44<sup>a</sup>."
- 213<sup>a</sup> The Cloud author's use of "kunnyng" here seems to denote discursive knowledge, scientia, as distinct from contemplative wisdom, sapientia, which he consistently terms "wisdom". It is noteworthy that he also uses "kunnyng" in D.H.D. 10/6 as the equivalent of "scientia" in his Latin sources - the sole occurrence of either term in these texts. This seems to suggest that he used both terms in a technical sense, thus transposing into the vernacular the vocabulary as well as the theoretical distinctions of Latin theology.

## Notes to Conclusion

1. E. Colledge, The Mediaeval Mystics of England (London, 1962), pp. 77-8.
2. Cloud, Intro. pp. lviii - lix.
3. See pp. 354-5.
4. Fr. Colledge has compared the Cloud author's anxiety that his work might become known outside the circle for which he intended it with Ruysbroek's veto on the publication of The Spiritual Espousals. He notes Ruysbroek's extreme concern at the possibility of his work's falling into the wrong hands and being disastrously misunderstood when, against his wishes, it was smuggled out of his convent (*ibid.*, pp. 79-80).
5. Essays in Criticism, Vol. XXVII, No. 4, 1977, 283-98, p. 292.
6. cf. also Cloud 106/11-15.
7. Art. cit., p. 296. The reference is to Cloud 117/14-17.
8. William Johnston, The Mysticism of 'The Cloud of Unknowing' (New York, 1967), pp. 206-7.
9. See Cloud chs. 36-40.
10. Expositor, 7 Ser., No. 22, Oct. 1907, 373-384, p. 373.
11. Op. cit., Intro., fn. p.lxxxii.
12. The present discussion follows Prof. Hodgson's example in excluding the extant manuscripts of the text in the Baker recension.
13. Op. cit., p.XVI.
14. Op. cit., p. 68.
15. Downside Review, Vol. LII, 1934, 71-92, p. 71.
16. This Transcending God. The Teaching of the Author of 'The Cloud of Unknowing' (London, 1971), p. 9.
17. Op. cit., pp. 34-5.
18. See The Cloud of Unknowing, Intro. pp. ix-li, and Deonise Hid Diuinite, Intro. pp. ix - xxix.
19. Ph.D. Thesis, Downing College, Cambridge, 1953.
20. Most of the information included in this section on the authority of Dr. Doyle has been extracted from his thesis. It is supplemented, however, by further details which he has kindly volunteered by letter and in conversation. The relevant sections of the Survey are, for Cloud, pp. 276-80, and, for the associated epistles, pp. 203-5. See also Notes 57-59 (pp. 131-34).
21. Beatrice White, in her review of the E.E.T.S. edition of Cloud, (in Modern Language Review, Vol. 44, 1949, 99 - 103), comments on Prof. Hodgson's failure to draw attention to the possible significance of the Carthusian provenance of four of the manuscripts which she discusses:  
There is nothing unusual in evidence such as this that the work has a direct appeal to a contemplative order. But there are

hints in the text itself which suggest a Carthusian provenance or, at any rate, a special relationship. Dr. Hodgson has not emphasized these insinuations. (p. 101).

The textual evidence which she cites in support of her claim to connect Cloud with the Carthusians will be considered below, pp. 329ff.

22. Dr. Doyle suggests that both these manuscripts were corrected from another copy, and notes that the post-medieval copies of Cloud made abroad during the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries seem to be derived from examples of this group which were taken to the continent by the exiled Carthusians and transmitted by them to the revived Benedictines.

There are also extracts from the Douce 262 text of Cloud, somewhat surprisingly, in the eighteenth century MS Gough Kent 14 - a collection of items relating to Kent which includes orders about the pier and harbour of Margate (dated 1615 and 1629), assembled and partly written by the Rev. John Lewis of Margate. Item 7, f.107 is "Extracts from a MS. containing 'the divine cloud of unknowing' and other devotional treatises owned by Edw. Jacob in 1770". It seems that Douce 262 was in Jacob's possession at this date.

23. Michael G. Sargent, in his article "The Transmission by the English Carthusians of some Late Medieval Spiritual Writings", Journal of Ecclesiastical History, Vol. 27, No. 3, July 1976, 225-40, explains,

The form of this note suggests that William Exmewe was the scribe of the MS., and that the note itself was written by Maurice Chauncey .... This affidavit formula, in which the author of a note on the scribe of a particular MS. also gives his own name (perhaps as a control for accuracy), also occurs on MS. Trinity, Cambridge 354, in the hand of James Grenehalgh. (fn. p. 238).

Chauncey was later prior of the exiled English Charterhouse of Sheen Anglorum and Exmewe was procurator of the London Charterhouse, martyred at Tyburn in May - June 1535.

24. The writer of the note on f.1<sup>b</sup> ("I suppose Walter Hylton a Carthusian temp. Henr. 6 was the Author"), R.M. Massey, has been identified by Prof. T.A. Birrell as Richard Middleton Massey F.S.A., F.R.S. (died 1743), a non-juror and at one time Underkeeper of the Ashmolean. See "English Mystics in Non-Catholic Circles. II", Downside Review, Vol. 94, part 316, 1976, 99 - 117. Prof. Birrell states in this article that Massey presented the manuscript to the Bodleian in 1770, but has corrected this in a letter to read 1710.

25. English Studies, 33, 1952, 49-66, p. 58. The translations in Pemb. 221 have recently been published by Walsh and Colledge in "The Cloud of Unknowing and the Mirror of Simple Souls in the Latin Glossed Translations of Richard Methley", Archivio Italiano per la Storia della Pieta, Vol. VII, Rome, 1979, 51-171. Regrettably, this volume is still unavailable in this country, and it has only been possible to use material from it as it has been reported in articles by the authors' students and associates. It seems to contain much valuable information on MS Pemb. 221 and notes, too, on the study of Hugh of Balma

in English Charterhouses during the fifteenth century which would be of particular interest to this thesis.

26. Dr. Doyle argues that either these manuscripts both have a common source or that li.vi.39 was copied from the Harley manuscript.

27. See below, p. 330. Michael G. Sargent, art. cit., has rightly cautioned against basing exaggerated claims on the survival of texts in Carthusian manuscripts:

evidence depends to an extent on the perhaps disproportionate number of Carthusian MSS. and versions preserved by the English recusant communities (p.240).

On the transmission of books in the English Charterhouses, he notes that no booklists are extant, if indeed they ever existed, and Fr. Colledge has argued that books moved freely between the English foundations in his article on the Treatise of Perfection. See also Doyle, op. cit., Note XIII, pp. 198-9, on James Grenehalgh and the movement of Carthusian books.

28. The manuscript has the signature of Robert Bateman on f.38, a wealthy city businessman who was connected with Nicholas Ferrar and Little Gidding. It passed to the Restoration Anglican cleric Edward Stillingfleet (1635-1699), Bishop of Worcester from 1689, after Bateman's death in 1658. See Prof. T.A. Birrell's article, "English Catholic Mystics in Non-Catholic Circles, I", Downside Review, 94, 1976, 60-81, pp. 69-70.

It is worth noting that Prof. Birrell's article contains much valuable information on the post-medieval history of the Cloud manuscripts both in England and on the continent. Two points may be recorded here as being of considerable interest though not direct relevance to the work of this thesis:

1) the Capuchin Benet Canfield (1562-1610) possessed a copy of Cloud in a transcript of Carthusian provenance made in 1582 which later came into the possession of Fr. Augustine Baker. (Birrell's authority for this statement is The Life of Fr. Augustine Baker by Peter Salvin & Serenus Cressy, ed. Justin McCann (London, 1933), p. 168).

2) Robert Bacon, the puritan intellectual who translated Hugh of Balma's Viae Syon Lugent (dated 1676), also made a manuscript copy of Cloud (see above, Ch. III, fn.150).

29. See A Catalogue of the Manuscripts preserved in the Library of the University of Cambridge, (Cambridge, 1857-8), Vol. III, pp. 535 ff. Dr. Doyle notes the inscriptions on this manuscript: 'Mag. iohannes claustun' (XV) is the autograph of a secular priest, and 'ser thomas colman' (XVI in), perhaps belonged to a family in the eastern counties.

30. Op. cit., p. 280. Examples of the interpolations on f. 125, which possibly date from late in the period 1493-1530, are,

Walter hylton, Scala perfectionis, viij d. / paul the hermit, ijd./xiiij profetis of Tribulacion, ijd./ The boke of iiij loves, iijd./ The vij shedyngis of bloode of Christ, id./ The fourme of pe confession little boke...

On f. 123<sup>b</sup> is the colophon: 'Prey for the wryter Qui nominatur Walterus Fytzherbert'. Dr. Doyle has stated in a letter that this scribe has Derbyshire family connexions, and that "the formula he uses may imply a devout readership of acquaintances, but that



does not add much (it resembles formulae used in some MSS written for Syon nuns by friends, for instance)."

An inscription on f. 2 shows the manuscript to have been owned by the Chancery Clerk Richard Colchester (d. 1643) in 1624. The papers of the Colchester and Colchester-Wemyss family are deposited at the County Record Office of Gloucestershire County Council (D 36). Information supplied by the county archivist, Brian S. Smith, and subsequent enquiries at the Public Record Office have not uncovered any documentary evidence concerning Colchester's acquisition of the manuscript or its likely provenance.

31. The manuscript is East Anglian and written in a non-professional hand. In the sixteenth century it belonged to John Jewel, Bishop of Salisbury, who had some connexion with Cranmer in the capacity of a notary c1554, though his acquisition of the manuscript is probably unconnected with this circumstance. See The Works of John Jewel, Bishop of Salisbury, ed. Rev. John Ayre (Cambridge, 1850).
32. Dr. Doyle describes both as amateurish manuscripts of the distinctively E.M. type. 17 CXXVI seems to be a direct transcript of MS Harl. 674, with the same column ruling for Latin notes and gloss which, in this case, were never begun. The passage from Cloud ch.10 is present, but cancelled in a contemporary hand (cf. 17 C XXVII). It is omitted altogether from 17 D V.
33. Both these manuscripts belonged to the Lumley Library and carry the signature of John, Lord Lumley on f.2a and f.19 respectively. See The library of John, Lord Lumley. The Catalogue of 1609, ed. Sears Jayne & Francis R. Johnson (London, 1956). Entry 286 (p. 63) reads, "The divine cloude of unknowinge; incerti, manuscript. Bis." Nothing is known concerning Lumley's acquisition of these manuscripts which might indicate their provenance. They do not have Cranmer's signature, and therefore cannot be assumed to have been part of the nucleus of his Library which came from this source. They are conspicuous among the 936 entries in the theology section of the Lumley catalogue by being in English where the preponderance of the works are in Latin.
34. Several inscriptions suggest that the owner of this manuscript in 1647, William Parish, was also its transcriber and the author of the final item in the manuscript (see Cloud, Intro. p XIII). Prof. Birrell identifies him as the Vicar of Tilney in Norfolk, and gives his dates as 1603-89.
35. Op. cit., p.277.
36. Ibid., pp. 204-5.
37. Cambridge, 1952.
38. Printed by Bennett as Appendix I to this volume.
39. Printed at the instigation of Sir Richard Sutton, Steward of Syon Abbey from 1513 and one of the founders of Brasenose College, Oxford.

Prof. N.F. Blake, in Caxton: England's First Publisher (London, 1976), pp. 188-90, notes that de Worde had already printed the Treatise of Love (an adaptation of part of the Ancrene Wisse), the Chastising of God's Children, and the

Meditations of St. Bernard, prior to 1494. He comments, It may be that the shortage of material forced him to look for religious material, which was the most readily available work in English at this time, but there is no reason to doubt that he was a man of strong religious convictions who wanted to publish works of this sort.

He also notes that de Worde, besides using the courtly or mercantile patrons who had served Caxton,

...made increasing use of clerics; by the time of his death he was more frequently printing works for people in orders than for anyone else. At the beginning of his career we cannot be sure that the 'devout person' who asked for the Treatise of Love was a cleric, though the 'devout student of the University of Cambridge' who requested the Meditations of Saint Bernard must have been in minor orders at least. Two of his early patrons were Thomas, Prior of St. Anne's Charterhouse, and Richard, Bishop of Durham.

40. Art. cit., I, p. 66.
41. Ibid.
42. See Doyle, op. cit., Note 61. He notes that more than one surviving copy of the volume seems to have belonged to religious.
43. Ibid., p. 205.
44. Printed in the McCann edition of Cloud, pp. 243-46.
45. P.S. Jolliffe, in A Check-List of Middle English Prose Writings of Spiritual Guidance (Toronto, 1974), records this piece elsewhere only in MS Bodl. 938 (ff. 243b - 246a), though he does not acknowledge it as an extract from Cloud. Bodl. 938 dates from the first half of the fifteenth century, and contains various Lollard pieces (expositions of standard liturgical texts in English), also several tracts of basic instruction in the conduct of the Christian life, including Poor Caitiff and the Form of Perfect Living. Dr. Doyle (op. cit., Note XVI), observes that the hand of this manuscript is identical to one of those in the common profit volume MS Ff.vi.31 which contains three of the texts associated with Cloud (see below, pp. 315-6).  
The chapters from Cloud in question, chs 63-66, comprise a discourse on the faculties of the soul - summarized from Richard of St. Victor. Though they are entirely relevant to the theme of the text, they are in some respects scarcely integral to it and can be readily extracted and appreciated as a self-contained monograph on the subject. It is nevertheless extremely interesting to find them in a manuscript such as Bodl.938, since extracts from the Cloud in any case occur only rarely outside the manuscripts which contain the complete text (see below, pp 324-7).
46. This text is printed by Clare Kirchberger with slightly modernised spelling in the Life of the Spirit, Vol. IV, 1949, pp. 147-8. She comments in a short preface that this piece is interesting as an early example of devotion to the Heart of Jesus. It is also notable, however, as a summary account of the mystical ascent in which the soul transcends devotion to Christ and focusses its desire on God. The singleness and intensity of this impulse, the author suggests, might issue in monosyllabic verbal utterances such as "heart" or

"God": the compression and non-analytical character of these outbursts is the linguistic counterpart of the soul's undifferentiating concentration on the pure being of God in relation to the loving soul. The resemblance to Cloud in this respect is striking.

47. Prof. Hodgson notes the entry on the second fly-leaf: "thys boke is susster anne colvyllle", who seems likely to be the nun of that name who was at Syon in 1518. The only other text in the manuscript is A Treatise of Eight Chapters, ascribed to Hilton.

Dr. Doyle comments on this manuscript in Note XVI (op. cit., pp. 208-14) where he deals with common profit and affiliated volumes. He dates it XVmed., and confirms that it was made from the goods of a London layman, Robert Holond, a shearman who died in 1436. He compares MS Lambeth 472 (of Hilton's works), made from the goods of John Killum. On this manuscript, see Doyle *ibid.*, pp. 199-20. He notes that its exemplar must have been the virtual duplicate of volume M.26 in the Syon brethren's library: it was passed among laymen and came into the possession of a priest towards the end of the century.

48. See V.J. Scattergood's article, "A Late Medieval Prose Miscellany from St. Mark's Hospital" (unpublished). The manuscript was written at the Hospital of St. Mary and St. Mark at Billeswick in autumn 1502. It comprises a miscellany of devotional, not specifically contemplative prose, mostly in English and including an exposition of the difficult words of the Missal and Psalter (ff.1<sup>a</sup>-119<sup>a</sup>), an English text of Flete's De Remediis Contra Temptaciones (ff.121<sup>a</sup>-127<sup>b</sup>) and, following this, the Discrecyon of Spirites (ff.127<sup>b</sup>-133<sup>b</sup>). Prof. Scattergood comments that different items in the manuscript seem to be intended for different readers - not only for the brethren of the house, that is, but also for female residents, and in one case - the item on ff.137<sup>b</sup>-140<sup>b</sup> - perhaps even for non-residents. Prof. Scattergood has also speculated in a letter that the treatise Discrecyon of Spirites seems to be linked with the text of Flete in this manuscript, and that it may have been taken from a common profit volume.

Dr. Doyle has a note on the Hospital of St. Mark (op. cit., Note XXXI, pp. 297-300). He observes that it followed the Benedictine rule and was virtually a religious house; also (*ibid.*, p.205) that it had strong contemplative interests and excellent literary connexions with the metropolis about this time.

49. See above, note 47 and Doyle op. cit., Note XVI. He dates this manuscript, too, XVmed. The administration of the property of Robert Holond, who donated MS Harl. 993, was granted to the John Colop mentioned here in 1441. He was also covenanted to distribute in alms the property of John Killum - donor of MS Lambeth 472.

50. See above, fn. 45.

51. Summary descriptions of these manuscripts are included in Prof. Hodgson's volume Deonise Hid Diuinite, and the recurrence of certain texts and the relationship of the manuscripts are discussed by her and Dr. Doyle (loc. cit.).

52. An interesting allusion to Ps.-Dionysius in the Dialogue between a Lord and a Clerk upon Translation (from Trevisa's translation of Higden's Polychronicon and reproduced in A.W. Pollard's Fifteenth Century Prose and Verse (London, 1903), pp. 203-208) suggests that Trevisa was unaware of the existence of the Deonise Hid Diuinite, since he laments that English had not been thought a fit vehicle for translations of the Dionysian Corpus, whereas French versions had already been produced from Erigena's Latin texts. Trevisa's ignorance of the Deonise Hid Diuinite would seem to confirm the hypothesis that the text had only a limited circulation.
- Perhaps this is an appropriate context in which to acknowledge Prof. Norman Blake's argument for defining Middle English prose tradition in terms of audience, which he sets out in his article, "Middle English Prose and its Audience", Anglia, IV, 1972, 437-55. He speaks of "a specialised monastic audience" for works of practical and spiritual guidance such as the Ancrene Wisse, the Cloud Corpus, the works of Hilton and Rolle, Love's Mirror, the Chastising and the Orcherd of Syon which, he goes on, constitute a tradition because of their close relationship with one another (p.445). In Prof. Blake's terms, Trevisa's ignorance of the Deonise Hid Diuinite might not be surprising, since he was presumably outside this tradition. The correlation which he argues between the content of a text and its audience seems justified, and the principle has been admitted in the present discussion. His conclusion that,
- the works of the author of the Cloud of Unknowing are extant in such a reasonable number of manuscripts and were copied and read in such a relatively restricted audience that I find it difficult to believe that there were not many people who knew or at least suspected who the author was. (pp. 448-9),
- seems in general valid. Perhaps, however, Prof. Blake's leap from this to a theoretical account of Middle English prose tradition and the assumption that the Cloud author wrote consciously within such a tradition, is artificial and gives insufficient consideration to the particular circumstances of the composition and circulation of the Cloud author's works.
53. Medium Aevum, Vol. XVI, 1947, 36-42.
54. M. Deanesly, "Vernacular Books in England in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries", Modern Language Review, Vol. XV, 1920, 349-58. The works of Rolle and Hilton are shown to have been owned by men and women, seculars and religious, during the period in question, and the author attributes some of the manifest popularity of Hilton to Nicholas Love's recommendation of his work in the Mirror.
55. See, for example, op. cit., p. 273.
56. S.S. Hussey, "The Text of The Scale of Perfection, Book II", Neuphilologische Mitteilungen, Vol. 65, No. 1, 1964, 75-92.
57. MS York Cathedral XVI. I. 9, f.4a. The manuscript was written at Mount Grace. I am indebted to M.R. Moyes, also engaged in research at York University, for information concerning this text.

58. Ed. Sanford Brown Meech, The Book of Margery Kempe (E.E.T.S. O.S. 212, 1940). cf. also 139/23-25, 153/37-154/29.
59. Ed. Edmund Colledge O.S.A. & James Walsh S.J., A Book of Showings to the anchoress Julian of Norwich (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto, 1978), p.45.
60. Helen L. Gardner, "The Text of the Scale of Perfection", Medium Aevum, Vol. 1, 1936, 11-30.
61. Colledge, Mediaeval Mystics, p.74.
62. Ed. Toshiyuki Takamiya, "Walter Hilton's Of Angels' Song. Edited from the British Museum MS Additional 27592", Studies in English Literature (Tokyo), English Number, 1977, 3-31.
63. See pp. 348-50.
64. See F. Wormald, "Some Popular Miniatures and their Rich Relations", Miscellanea pro arte. Festschrift für Hermann Schnitzler (Düsseldorf, 1965), 279-85. On MS Add. 37790, see Colledge, "The Treatise of Perfection", and Colledge & Walsh, A Book of Showings.
65. See above, pp.213-4.
66. Jolliffe notes (art. cit., p.117) that the quotations from Scale and the Cloud Corpus are more often textually exact than those from the Viae Syon Lugent, which, in the absence of a critical edition of the text, seem more like general allusions than precise citations. Jolliffe refers to Balma's work under its alternative title of the De Mystica Theologia, which has been avoided in this thesis because of the possibility of confusion with the Dionysian text of that name.
67. Ibid., pp. 120-21. But see above, p. 312-13.
68. Jolliffe is referring here to the Walsh and Colledge edition of the Latin Cloud and Mirror of Simple Souls in MS Pemb. 221. See above, fn. 25.
69. Ibid., p.118.
70. Ibid., p.119.
71. Ibid., p.121.
72. Op. cit., pp. 1-5.
73. The editors note that the MS was once in the possession of James Grenehalgh, and speculate that it may have been written at Sheen. On the likelihood that it was a commissioned volume, they refer to other evidence which indicates that Carthusian scribes may have copied volumes for sale outside their monasteries.
74. Art. cit., p.61.
75. Op. cit., pp.10-12.
76. N.M., Vol. LXXVlll, 1977, 31-45.
77. Roger Lovatt, "The Imitation of Christ in Late Medieval England", Transactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th Series, Vol. XVIII, 1968, 97-121.

78. Cf. also N.F. Blake, "Revelations of St. Matilda", Notes and Queries, New Series, Vol. XX, 1973, 323-5.
79. Op.cit., pp.276-7.
80. See MS Parkminster FF9.
81. See, for example, Richard Bruce Marks, The Medieval Manuscript Library of the Charterhouse of St. Barbara in Cologne (Analecta Cartusiana, Salzburg, 1974). In addition to two copies of the Dionysian Corpus, the library of St. Barbara's is known to have contained a text of Hugh of Balma's Viae Syon Lugent in a mid fifteenth century manuscript (now MS Berlin Lat. Oct. 272).
82. Art. cit., p.114.
83. Fr. Colledge has some comments on the polemic tone of some passages of Privy Counsel which are interesting in this connexion:  
 ... in its angry denunciation of those 'half-humbled, logic-chopping souls' who listen every day of their lives to the Scriptures and the Fathers being read aloud, and yet refuse to accept the evidence of their ears that mystical prayer has always been extolled as the highest form of spiritual life, contains several indications that the author's chief critics are in constant touch with him, possibly members of his own order. The editor must here content himself with saying that he thinks the evidence against the author being a religious is negligible - in the often quoted passage from chapter 10 of The Cloud, all that he is doing is to stress that even seculars and the laity have their obligations to obedience, and in chapter 23, where he says that 'we' are dependent on other men's casual charity for the necessities of 'our' existence, the 'we' seems to refer not particularly to him and his disciple, but to religious in general, the subject of the whole discussion on patrimony here. But, unless proof could be found to show that in the Carthusian order in England in the author's day there was such a division on the merits of mystical prayer - and that would be very surprising - it would seem that he was not a Carthusian. None the less, he took their device for his motto, and he has kept, over five centuries, the secret of his name to himself. (Mediaeval Mystics, p.80).
- Fr. Colledge's more recent research in this area has led him to modify his opinion that the Cloud author was unlikely to have been Carthusian, and he has indeed indicated in conversation that he now inclines to the view of Carthusian authorship.
84. Fr. Colledge (ibid., intro., pp.45-7) notes that Adam of Dryburgh (entered Witham Charterhouse c1189-90) made what was probably the first use in England of the Dionysian doctrine of the negative way in the description of the eighth stage of meditation in his De Quadripartito Exercitio Cellae (P.L. CL111, Col. 799-884) - though, prior to this in 1167, John of Salisbury had written the letter to Sarracenus which prompted him to undertake the revision of the Erigena translation.
85. Art. cit., p.54. The Confirmacio occurs in MS Trinity College, Cambridge 1401.

86. Joyce Bazire & Eric Colledge, ed., 'The Chastising of God's Children' and 'The Treatise of Perfection of the Sons of God' (Oxford, 1957), p.87.
87. Walter Baier, Untersuchungen zu den Passionsbetrachtungen in der 'Vita Christi' des Ludolf von Sachsen (Analecta Cartusiana 44, Salzburg, 1977), p.16.
88. Op. cit., p.58.
89. H.E. Allen, Writings Ascribed to Richard Rolle, Hermit of Hampole, and Materials for his Biography (New York, 1927), pp.527-37. The text is taken from MS Uppsala C. 621 f. 67b sq., which she dates c.1400 and suggests was once at Syon.
90. This argument is precisely contrary to the view of C.S. Nieva (op. cit.), who comments,  
 In writing The Cloud the author does not draw on any one particular author, but says that God is the Source of his teaching. The personal experiences described by the author confirm the statement that he was a mystic, and he draws on these experiences rather than on other writers, in his teachings. (p.239)  
 Nieva acknowledges the text's affinities with the Dionysian mystical tradition, but in emphasizing the centrality of the author's personal experience and his divine inspiration, he tends to treat its relationship to that tradition as a matter of superficial indebtedness for an appropriate vocabulary. He therefore says of the Cloud author's location of union in the apex mentis:  
 The mystics simply mean that the encounter took place in a level too deep for them to express, while somehow affirming that an encounter actually did take place. (p.26).
91. Art. cit., pp.229-30.
92. See esp. op. cit., pp.65-78.
93. Ibid., p.75.
94. Edmund Colledge, "De nobilitate anime and De ornatu spiritualium nupciarum: Bibliotheek Rijksuniversiteit Utrecht, MS. 5. F. 34", Quaerendo, Vol. 1X/2, 1979, 149-59, pp.158-9.
95. James Hogg, ed., Boniface of Savoy, Carthusian and Archbishop of Canterbury 1207-1270 by Leland Edward Wilshire (Analecta Cartusiana 31, Salzburg, 1977), pp.91-119.
96. Op. cit., p.292. cf. also Dr. Doyle's comments on the Carthusian conversi:  
 the early regulations against their reading had relaxed, as those against any use of the vernacular had, at least in England (ibid. p.277 fn).
97. Beatrice White, art. cit., p.101.
98. The inference that the disciple has formally committed himself to a solitary or monastic life agrees with the various suggestions that he has positively renounced the world: the unitive way, the author affirms, is for "alle þat han forsaken þe worild in a trewe wille, & þerto þat zeuen hem not to actyue liif, bot to þat liif þat is clepid contemplatyue liif" (Cloud 63/3-6). In the

following passage, the bracketed clauses have been omitted from some manuscripts (see Prof. Hodgson's notes and above p.307 ):  
 neuerpeles in þee, & in alle oper þat han in a trewe wile forsaken þe woreld, (& arte oblischid vnto any degree in deuoute leuyng in Holi Chirche, whatso it be, priue or aperte, & þerto þat wil be rewlid not after þeire owne wille & þeire owne witte, bot after þe wille & þe counsel of þeire souereins, whatso þei be, religious or seculeres), soche a likyng or a gruching fastnyng in þe flescheli herte is bot venial synne. þe cause of þis is þe grounding & þe rotyng of zoure entent in God, maad in þe biginnyng of zoure leuyng (in þat state þat 3e stonde in), (bi þe witnes & þe counsel of som discret fader). (Cloud 36/7-16).

Prof. Hodgson has commented on these omissions:

... it seems more probable that these readings were to be found in an early stage of the text and were later cancelled or omitted in an attempt to make the treatise less particular, or by those opposed to the religious life (perhaps by Lollards), than that they were interpolated at a later stage in the development of the text and subsequently cancelled. (Cloud, 13/4 fn.)  
 cf. also Cloud 13/4-5.

99. MS Pemb. Coll. 221, f.4b (reproduced by Fr. Colledge, "De nobilitate anime...", p.158):  
 Hoc loco attende, lector, quod communis status est laycorum, specialis clericorum vel religiosorum, singularis solitariorum, scilicet heremitarum anachoritarum vel precipue Cartusiensium. Vnde videtur quod cuidam Cartusienſi hic liber compositus fuit, quia scilicet non solent moderni de approbata religione exire ad heremium, vt antiquitus, sed ad cartusienses.
100. "Review of the Cloud of Unknowing", M.Aev., Vol. XVI, 1947, 36-42, p. 39.
101. Art. cit., p.101.
102. Op. cit., pp.55-6. They cite a short tract on the enclosed life in MS Bodl. Lat. th. d. 7, also MS Christ's College, Cambridge DD. 1.11.
103. "De nobilitate anime...", p.158.
104. Op. cit., p.78.
105. Cf., for example, the almost complete lack of reference to conventual life in the Scala Claustralium of the Carthusian Prior Guigo II. The author alludes to it only in describing to his correspondent the circumstances under which he evolved his classification of the spiritual life - "corporati manuum labore occupatus" (Walsh & Colledge, ed., Guigues II le Chartreux. Lettre sur la Vie Contemplative (L'Échelle des Moines), Sources Chretiennes 163, Paris, 1970). Both works may be contrasted in this respect with the Golden Epistle of William of St. Thierry, for example, which was written in the first instance for Carthusian novices and is mainly pre-occupied with the conduct of their daily lives.

The Scala, as indisputably a Carthusian text, has further affinities with Cloud which deserve comment. It is written in letter form, addressed in some manuscripts to "Gervais" (e.g. in MS Trinity College, Dublin 216, where it occurs with Hilton's



letter to Adam Horsley). The relationship of the writer and recipient is that of pupil and former director, now distanced physically. The tone of the work is also public, however, and its construction is formal: in this it resembles Cloud (see below, fn. 114), though these characteristics are much more pronounced in the Scala and its circulation beyond its original recipient is accordingly wider than that of the English text (See the introduction to the Walsh and Colledge edition of the Scala, and Dom A. Wilmart, "Les Écrits Spirituels des deux Guigues", R.A.M., Vol. V, 1924, 59-79 and 127-58.

It is interesting, however, that the Cloud author draws his simile for the hypocrite's abuse of his spiritual authority from conventual life:

He makip hem liche besy prelates wakyng ouer alle þe degrees of Cristen mens leuyng, as an abbot ouer his monkes.

(Cloud 102/10-12).

106. See, for example, Cloud 88/7-9 -  
I haue ben sterid many day bope to fele þus & þink þus & sey þus, as weel to som oþer of my specyal freendes in God, as I am now vnto þee -  
and below, pp. 352-4.
107. See P.C. 154/11-20, which refers the reader back to Cloud and D.H.D. The Pistle of Preier seems also to have been addressed to the same disciple - the author alludes to it here as "þi lityl pistle of preier" (154/14-15).
108. Op. cit., p.71.
109. Op. cit., p.32
110. The document is printed from MS Cotton Nero A.iii, f.130a. See Hogg, op. cit., pp.120-5.
111. The wording of the vow also merits comment in view of the terms which describe the disciple's state in ch. 1 of Cloud: he asks to lyve and dye here emonges yow, in y<sup>e</sup> state of a monke, or prebendarye and seruante vnto alle.
112. But see below, fn. 114.
113. See A.I. Doyle, "Books Connected with the Vere Family and Barking Abbey", Transactions of the Essex Archeological Society, Vol. XXV, 1958, 222-43. The article discusses MS Cambridge University Library Ff.vi.33, probably written for Syon c1500 by a Carthusian of Sheen, which contains the Tretyse of þe Stodye of Wysdome and the English version of the Scala Claustralium, A Ladder of Foure Ronges.  
cf. Anne Hudson, "A Chapter from Walter Hilton in Two Middle English Compilations", Neophilologus, Vol. L11, 1968, 416-21.
114. The Prologue of Cloud is insistent that the text is intended first and foremost for such a one as "purposed him to be a parfite folower of Criste, not only in actyue leuyng, bot in þe souereinnest pointe of contemplatife leuyng..." (2/1-3), but he commends it as a source of comfort to those who lead a mixed life (3/1-8) and anticipates the means by which it might reach other readers (1/10-14, 105/6). Privy Counsel is also directed

in the first instance to a specific reader with a contemplative vocation (135/5-7), but, like Cloud, its tone is public as well as intimate, and the author expects it to circulate among like-minded readers (135/7-9). Again, however, he seems to presume that its prospective audience will not be entirely contemplative:

Whatsoeuer þou be þat þis writyng schalt ouþer rede or here,  
& namely in þis place where I make a difference bitwix hem  
þat ben clepid to saluacion & hem þat ben clepid to  
perfeccion... (P.C. 161/16-19).

It has already been noted that the Cloud author tends to blur distinctions between contemplation as a state and as a way of life (see above, Ch. III pp. 233-4): in Privy Counsel, indeed, his reference to "alle þi doynge... wheþer þei be actyue or contemplatyue" (147/22-3) seems to denote different occupations of one individual. But the considerable amount of practical, frank advice on the daily conduct of the religious life which Cloud, in particular, incorporates, reaffirms that the author assumes that more than the strictest contemplatives will read it. This has been noted by L.E. Rogers, who associates the text with an English tradition of works written as manuals for recluses, in his unpublished dissertation, An Edition of British Museum MS Harley 2372 (Advice to Recluses), (Oxford, 1934). The Latin version of the text in Harley 2372, the Speculum Inclusorum, has been edited from MSS Royal 5 A V and St. John's, Oxford 177, by Fr. L. Oliger, in Lateranum, New Series, Vol. IV, No. 1, Rome, 1938, 63ff. The text was written in the third quarter of the fourteenth century, possibly by an English Carthusian. Dr. Doyle has informed me that the Royal MS was connected with the Charterhouses of Coventry and Sheen, that the St. John's MS was once in the possession of Dygon, and that the text appeared in a Carthusian list of the late fifteenth/early sixteenth century taken back to Hull from London. I have also consulted, on Dr. Doyle's recommendation, Fr. Oliger's articles, "Regula Recluserum et Quaestiones Tres de Vita Solitaria saec. XIII-XIV", Antonianum, IX, 1934, 37-84 and 243-59, and "Regulae Tres Recluserum et Eremitarum Angliae saec. XIII-XIV", Antonianum, III, 1928, 151-90 and 299-320, for possible analogues of Cloud. Manuscript evidence shows that these texts, also, were known to the Carthusians. The affinities with Cloud, however, seem general rather than specific and consist mainly in the practical advice they offer on the religious life. Cf. also similar arguments about the conduct of the solitary and monastic life, ascribed to John Norton, in the Carthusian MS. Bodleian Lat. th.d. 27, ff. 196b-200b.

115. Op. cit., p.86.
116. Colledge and Bazire describe the circumstances of its composition: it was written for one of the anchorites of the Zonienbosch to serve as a memorandum of their conversations concerning mystical theology, and it is indeed not a work for beginners. (ibid., p.85). cf. Colledge, "The Treatise of Perfection...", pp.61-6.
117. Colledge and Bazire, ed., 248/7-9.
118. Studien zur englischen Mystik des Mittelalters, pp.38-9.
119. Ibid., p.39.

120. pp.333-4.
121. Ibid., pp.42-3.
122. Ibid., p.25.
123. Ibid., p.32.  
cf. Riehle's article, "Der Seelengrund in der englischen Mystik", which acknowledges scholastic influence on the Cloud author in respect of his theory of the "ground" or "substance" of the soul, but suggests that he tempers it with biblical and homiletic material in order to make it more accessible to a lay audience.
124. E.M. Thompson, The Carthusian Order in England (London, 1930), p.176 fn.
125. Op. cit., p.33.
126. The important annotations are reproduced by Helen Gardner, "Walter Hilton and the Authorship of the Cloud of Unknowing", Review of English Studies, Vol. IX, No. 34, April 1933, 129-147. Michael G. Sargent (art. cit.) has indicated that Grenehalgh's notes on Hilton's authorship refer only to Cloud and do not link the text with Privy Counsel as the work of one man. The latter text was added to the manuscript only after Grenehalgh had worked on it, and in fact he is known to have seen this text in MS Harley 2373 only, which he may have annotated sometime later at Mount Grace.
127. In chronological order these articles are: "Walter Hilton and the Authorship of the Cloud of Unknowing"; "The Text of the Scale of Perfection"; "Walter Hilton and the Mystical Tradition in England", E.S., Vol. XXII, 1937, 103-27; "Review of the Cloud of Unknowing".
128. "Walter Hilton and The Cloud of Unknowing: A Problem of Authorship Reconsidered", Modern Language Review, Vol. IV, 1955, 395-406.
129. "The Problem of Walter Hilton's Possible Authorship of The Cloud of Unknowing and its Related Tracts".
130. Op. cit., esp. pp.25-8. Hilton's claim to authorship of the Cloud Corpus is in general supported by Dom Justin McCann (op. cit.) and Dorothy Jones (op. cit.). C.S. Nieva does not dismiss the possibility, but he conjectures that the Cloud author was more likely to have been a solitary or recluse (op. cit., esp. p.103).
131. Downside Review, Vol. VC, April, 1977, 95-109.
132. cf. also Colledge's arguments against Hilton's authorship, "Recent Work on Walter Hilton", Blackfriars, June, 1956, 265-70 and Dom Gerard Sitwell, "Contemplation in The Scale of Perfection", Downside Review, Summer, 1949, 276-90.
133. MS Harley, 6579, f.110b; Clark, art. cit., p.104.
134. See Appendix I on the distinctions between the Dionysian and Victorine mystical traditions. Fr. Colledge (Mediaeval Mystics, p.70) reaffirms the point:  
For him (Hilton), as for the Victorines, 'contemplation' is mysticism. That is why, in Book I of The Scale, he can distinguish between three stages in 'contemplation', intellectual,

affective, and the highest stage which is both cognitive and affective, a stage of 'contemplation' which will be fulfilled affectively in rapture, cognitively in illumination. Hilton's concept of the mystical night is also essentially Augustinian: its location in the scheme of a single continuous ascent to contemplative enlightenment agrees with Richard of St. Victor, who describes the process imagistically as night transformed into dawn. See also in this issue Gardner, "Walter Hilton and the authorship of the Cloud of Unknowing"; Hodgson, art. cit.; Clark, art. cit.; Riehle, "The Problem of Walter Hilton's Possible Authorship of The Cloud of Unknowing".

It is interesting that MS Trinity College, Dublin 122 of Cloud and Privy Counsel contains (ff. 104-16) a short text beginning "Thou schilt well understond þt there are two Days or two Lightes...", which has been identified as Scale II, ch 24 and concerns Hilton's theory of the mystical night.

135. See Clark, art. cit., and Jones, op.cit., Intro. pxli.
136. This does not, however, seem to support the argument for common authorship as Gardner, in "Review of the Cloud of Unknowing", and Riehle, art. cit., suggest.
137. M.Aev., Vol. XLVI, 1977, 49-65.
138. Op.cit., p.247.
139. See S.S. Hussey, "The Text of The Scale of Perfection, Book II", and "Latin and English in The Scale of Perfection", M.S., Vol. XXXV, 1973, 456-76. Also Doyle, *ibid.*, pp. 199-200, on the manuscript of Hilton's works, Lambeth 472. He suggests that it was made from such an exemplar as the virtual duplicate volume M. 26 in the Syon brethren's library, but it circulated in both lay and religious contexts.
140. Art. cit., pp. 97-100.
141. Cf. also Discrecyon of Spirites and Cloud, ch. 48.
142. The spiritual immaturity of the disciple is conveyed not only by specific references to his age (e.g. "þi zong hert" 67/6), but also by the author's inclusion of much practical, basic instruction on the conduct of his daily life, and the presumption that the disciple has not progressed sufficiently to be capable of interpreting his own religious experience.
143. The relevant passage from the Discrecioun is 69/22-71/11. Joy Russell-Smith, in her review of the E.E.T.S. edition of the text, refutes Prof. Hodgson's inference that the author was "a free-lance rather than a professed religious" with the observation that he is very far from criticizing professed religion in his works as a whole, and, further, that,  
     The treatise tells us only that the disciple was probably not bound by a Rule, but nothing concerning the author's state of life (art. cit., p.266).  
 C.S. Nieva's conclusion from the same evidence that neither the disciple nor the author could have been Carthusian is similarly unfounded (op. cit., p.115 fn.). Riehle, also, discounts the different character and possibly different audience of the Discrecioun when he argues from the freedom of lifestyle implied

in this passage to the authorship of the Corpus as a whole (ibid., pp. 37-8). It is worth noting that the text explicitly allows for the different status of the author and disciple:

And vnto þe tyme be þat þou maist wite what it is, worche after þo mens counseile, þat knowen here owne disposicioun, bot not after þeire disposicioun. (77/10-13).

144. See Doyle, op. cit., pp.243-75.
145. "De nobilitate anime...", p. 150.
146. Ibid., p. 78.
147. L.F. Powell, ed., "The Mirroure of the Blessed Lyf of Jesu Christ". A Translation of the Latin Work entitled "Meditationes Vitae Christi", attributed to Cardinal Bonaventura. Made before the year 1410 by Nicholas Love, Prior of the Carthusian Monastery of Mount Grace (Oxford, 1908), p.8.
148. Cf. the Pistle of Preier, which explores the specific subject of prayer more closely at the request of the disciple (48/2-4). The author invites such questions in Cloud 130/14-17.  
Fr. Colledge has compared the relationship of Privy Counsel to Cloud with Ruysbroek's The Little Book of Enlightenment which explains some of the complexities of his Spiritual Espousals (Mediaeval Mystics, pp.79-80).
149. Note, for example, his emphatic insistence on adherence to the orthodox Church and his disapproval of misguided individualism (Cloud, ch. 56). He is also scrupulous in dissociating himself from heretical theories of mystical union: Wolfgang Riehle (op. cit., p.209) contrasts the precise definition in ch. 67, which accentuates the role of grace and the eternal distinction between God and man -  
only bi his mercy wiþouten þi desert arte maad a God in grace, onyd wiþ him in spirit wiþouten departyng, boþe here & in blis of heuen wiþouten any eende. So þat, þouz þou be al one wiþ hym in grace, zit þou arte ful fer bineþe hym in kynde (120/16-20) -  
with Eckhart's concept of deifying union: "vrewet iuch mit mir, ich bin got worden" (Deutsche Werke II, 239).
150. Prof. Hodgson notes the Cloud author's concern with contemporary religious questions (Intro., p.li ff):  
Emphasis in his works on certain disputed themes such as the need for grace, Immanence and Transcendence, the relationship of body and soul in the work of contemplation, the respective merits of the active and contemplative lives, suggests that he had some voice, at least, in contemporary controversy.  
Colledge also compares Hilton and the Cloud author in this respect:  
... Hilton and the Cloud author, were trained academics, widely read, proficient in Latin, their minds sharp and agile from constant discussion and disputation, their pens running quickly and easily. As they write, they can review the succession of great writers on their subject; and when they needed to refresh their memories or to enquire further, they had libraries to consult and colleagues to ask. (Mediaeval Mystics, p. 84).
151. Translated from the Latin by Joy Russell-Smith, The Way, Vol. VI, 1966, 230-41.

152. Cf. the urgency of the Cloud author's appeal for his disciple's prayers in Pistle of Preier 59/9-17, which contrasts with the more formal requests in Cloud 67/17-19 and 129/10-12.
153. "Walter Hilton and a Tract in Defence of the Veneration of Images", Dominican Studies, Vol. VII, 1954, 180-214.
154. *Ibid.*, p.181. cf. Cloud, chs. 18-23: the discussion here of the relative merits of the active and contemplative lives seems disproportionate to the individual circumstances of the disciple.
155. *Op. cit.*, Intro., p.lxxxiv.
156. The other Northern Charterhouses at Hull (founded 1378-9) and Coventry (founded 1381) seem less probable on both these counts, and Mount Grace (founded 1398) is unquestionably too late to be considered.
157. "Walter Hilton and a Tract...", p.205 fn.
158. See, for example, Colledge, "De nobilitate anime...", p. 153; also Roger Lovatt, *art. cit.*, pp.106-13 on the traffic of devotional works between England and the continental charterhouses.
159. Catalogus, (Basle, 1557), p. 569.
160. "The Text of the Scale of Perfection", pp. 13-14.

NOTES TO APPENDICES

Notes to Appendix I

1. See Marcel Lenghart, La Théorie de la Contemplation Mystique dans l'Oeuvre de Richard de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1935), intro. pp. V-XXXI; A. Mignon, Les Origines de la Scolastique et Hugues de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1895), esp. pp. 145-93 and 325-95; trans. Clare Kirchberger, Richard of St.-Victor. Selected Writings on Contemplation (London, 1957), intro. p.37.
2. All references, unless otherwise stated, are to the works of Hugh as printed in P.L., t. CLXXV-CLXXV11, and of Richard in t. CXCVI. Details of Hugh's biography, the precise corpus and chronology of his works are presented in such recent studies as Jean Chatillon, "Chronique. De Guillaume de Champeaux à Thomas Gallus", Revue du Moyen Âge Latin, Vol. VIII, 1952, 139-62, which also treats of the same aspects of Richard, pp.254-64; Roger Baron, Science et Sagesse chez Hugues de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1957), intro. pp.V11-XLV11, "Hugues de Saint-Victor. Contribution à un Nouvel Examen de son Oeuvre", Traditio, Vol. 15, 1959, 223-297, and Études sur Hugues de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1963), pp.31-89.
3. René Roques, Structures Théologiques. De la Gnose à Richard de Saint-Victor, pp.325-6.
4. See esp. Ch. V ('La Sagesse de Contemplation'), pp.167-208. Baron also notes that certain aspects of Richard's theology which derive from neo-platonism (e.g. the concept of the contemplative way as an ascent) came to him via Augustine and Ps.-Dionysius alike.
5. Bruges, 1954.
6. This text is printed in Hugues de Saint-Victor. Six Opuscules, ed. Roger Baron (Les Éditions du Cerf, Paris, 1969), pp.44-59.
7. Paris, 1895.
8. Op. cit., p.365.
9. The notion "Omnia disce; videbis postea nihil esse superfluum; coarctata scientia iucunda non est" (Didascalion: de Studio Legendi, VI, 3) is fundamental to Hugh's theology.
10. These are the betrothal gifts offered to the soul in the De Arrha Anima. Roger Baron comments on this aspect of Hugh's mystical theology in Science et Sagesse:  

Par le fait que la mystique hugonienne est une mystique de la Bible, elle est aussi une mystique du Dieu vivant, du Christe et de l'Église. (pp.184-5)

He goes on to emphasize that the necessity to contemplate and imitate Christ implicates the soul in the sacramental life of the Church.
11. See Mignon, op. cit., pp.110 ff. for an analysis of the relationship between imagination and reason in Hugh's philosophy.
12. P.L. CLXXV, 926 D.

13. Roger Baron, Études sur Hugues de Saint-Victor, pp. 210-211.
14. Expositio in Hierarchiam Coelestem, VI, 7. P.L. CLXXV, 1038 D.
15. Op. cit., Bk I, Ch. 2. P.L. CLXXV1, 621 D.
16. Op. cit., P.L. CLXXV1, 970 A-B.
17. Ibid., 970 C.
18. P.L. CLXXV, 117A-118A.
19. Roger Baron, Science et Sagesse, p.225. Mignon, op. cit., p.172 concurs with Baron's assessment. He labels Hugh "un théologien scolastique au meilleur sens du mot", who was responsible for establishing "la légitimité et la grande utilité de l'explication rationnelle et de la forme scientifique dans la théologie".
20. Roger Baron, Science et Sagesse, pp. 175-6, stresses the centrality of Christ in Hugh's theology:  
 Dans la pensée de Hugues, la médiation du Christ est centrale. Elle explique le monde comme l'histoire, la destinée de chaque homme comme la destinée de l'humanité .... C'est à cause de cette merveilleuse médiation que le Christ est le constructeur de l'arche, dans le De arca, le divin Fiancé du De arrha, que tout s'illumine, dans l'In Hierarchiam, à la clarté de Jésus, qu'il y a un parallèle, dans le De Contemplatione entre les trois tentations du Christ et nos trois tentations, entre les trois ascensions du Christ (sur la montagne, sur la Croix, au ciel) et nos trois ascensions.  
 Mignon, op. cit., pp.195-229, emphasizes the same aspect of Hugh's work.
21. Introduced by Aelred Squire, O.P., translated by a Religious of C.S.M.V., Hugh of St.-Victor. Selected Spiritual Writings (London, 1962), pp. 41-2.
22. A sound and wide-ranging introduction to Richard's contemplative theology which expands on many of the issues mentioned in the present summary is provided by Clare Kirchberger's introduction to her Richard of St.-Victor. Selected Writings on Contemplation.
23. Both Hugh and Richard worked from Erigena's version of Ps.-Dionysius, and Richard supplemented his reading of the text of the De Coelesti Hierarchia with Hugh's commentary on the treatise.
24. Marcel Lenglard, La Théorie de la Contemplation Mystique dans l'Oeuvre de Richard de Saint-Victor, makes this assessment of Richard's achievement:  
 ... il semble que les distinctions pronées par Richard eurent du moins le mérite de classer les phénomènes mystiques et d'apporter en ce domaine des précisions utiles (p.81).
25. See Bk. I, ch. 6. In Bk. V, ch. 2 of the same text, Richard also formulates a further threefold classification of the contemplative ascent. Of these stages,  
 Primus surgit ex industria humana, tertius ex sola gratia divina, medius autem ex utriusque permistione, humanae videlicet industriae et gratiae divinae. (P.L. CXCV1, 170A-B)  
 Thus in the fifth and sixth grades of Richard's categorization - broadly, infused contemplation and union - the soul is passive under the operation of divine grace.



Richard's teaching on this point is essential to Thomas Gallus' account of the mystic way.

26. Benjamin Minor, 5 (P.L. CXCVI, 4 D).
27. Lenghart, op. cit. intro. pxxxix confirms that,  
Le grand mérite de Richard fut de comprendre quelle aide efficace la spéculation rationnellement conduite pouvait apporter aux élans d'amour de l'âme dévote.
28. P.L. CXCVI, 145 C-D. F. Guimet, in "Caritas Ordinata et Amor Discretus dans la théologie trinitaire de Richard de Saint-Victor", Revue du Moyen Âge Latin, Vol. IV, 1948, 225-36 - the sequel to "Notes en marge d'un texte de Richard de Saint-Victor", A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol. XIV, 1943-5, 371-94 - emphasizes the interdependency of knowledge and love at all levels of the contemplative ascent:  
... la perfection de l'amour est toujours mesurée par la perfection de son objet, ou, ce qui revient au même, la perfection de l'amour va de pair avec celle de la connaissance (p. 234).
29. Ibid., 62 D.
30. Ibid., 58 B. Richard occasionally locates knowledge of this order in "cor altum" (ibid. 59 B) or, in Benjamin Major IV, 23, which refers to Moses' experience of God's presence on Sinai and Aaron's in the Holy of Holies, he interprets the Exodus narrative as describing the contemplative experience taking place in the apex of the mind, which is spiritually one with the depth of the soul:  
Sicut ergo per verticem montis intelligimus mentis summum, sic per sancta sanctorum intelligimus humanae mentis intimum. Sed in humano procul dubio animo idem est summum quod intimum, et intimum quod summum. Idem itaque intelligimus per verticem montis et per oraculum tabernaculi foederis (Ibid., 167 A).  
The paradoxical identification of height and depth in the spirit recalls Cloud ch. 37 ("... for in goostlynes alle is one, heizt & depnes, lengþe & brede" 75/2-3), though it is hoped to demonstrate in this Appendix and Ch. III that the Cloud author's concept of union in the highest point of the spirit differs significantly from that expounded by Richard of St. Victor.
31. P.L. CXCVI, 147 A-B.
32. Ibid., 67 D.
33. Cf. also Benjamin Major IV, 5 and 7.
34. Kirchberger, op. cit., pp. 29-30.
35. This also involves the adoption of certain elements of Dionysian terminology, as, for example, in Benjamin Minor 74,  
Nemo ergo se existimet ad illius divini luminis claritatem, argumentando posse penetrare; nemo se credat humana illud ratiocinatione posse comprehendere. Si enim aliqua argumentatione adiri potuisset lumen illud divinum, utique inaccessible non fuisset, (P.L. CXCVI, 53 A)  
though as in the case of the theology, this does not imply a comprehensive admission of the Dionysian theory of language.

36. V. Lossky, in his article "Les Éléments de 'Théologie Négative' dans la Pensée de Saint Augustin", Augustinus Magister. Congres International Augustinien. Communications I, 1954, 575-81, demonstrates that the belief in God's transcendence necessarily introduces a negative element into the theology of St. Augustine himself, but that this need not and does not command a theory of contemplation in the Dionysian vein.
37. Kirchberger, op. cit., pp. 53-4.
38. R. Javelet draws some interesting comparisons between Richard's contemplative theology and that of Thomas Gallus in his article, "Thomas Gallus et Richard de Saint-Victor Mystiques", R.T.A.M., Vol. 30), 1963, 88-121. Whilst acknowledging the extent of Richard's influence on Gallus' thought, he stresses Gallus' profound divergence from Richard's theory in adopting the negative dialectic of Dionysian theology:
- Sous la plume de Thomas reviennent sans cesse les vocables hyperboliques du Pseudo-Denys, dont l'accumulation vise à dépasser le superlatif lui-même, qui les caractérise: supersubstantialis, superbona, superdea .... Richard écrit: 'Summe potens, summe sapiens, summe bonus', sans plus, pour signifier que rien ne dépasse Dieu, mais non pas que Dieu dépasse radicalement ce qui est, est étranger à toute idée que nous pouvons avoir de lui. Il arrive à notre pieur de laisser échapper quelques termes dionysiens; mais vraiment jamais il ne creuse un fossé entre l'homme spirituel, entre l'homme divinisé et le Dieu déifiant. Le hiatus se creuse, entre l'homme du raisonnable ou même de l'intelligible et l'homme de l'intellectible; par l'extase, l'homme est promu au rang de Dieu; sa finitude n'apparaît que face à l'immensité du Dieu en qui il se meut, connaît, aime; il reste 'créé', mais il est passé de l'image à l'Être. Le hiatus au contraire, pour Thomas, se creuse en Dieu lui-même, entre la Divinité qui est le Non-Être et ce Dieu qui reste accessible à l'homme. Sans doute il n'est pas deux Dieux distincts substantiellement; mais, pour le spirituel lui-même, le vrai Dieu échappe en son fond. Ce n'est pas cette adhésion immédiate à la suprême clarté, cette vision face à face qu'exalte Richard, plus fidèle, semble-t-il, que Thomas à l'Évangile. Il est vrai que, pour Thomas, l'Évangile, s'il est la plus parfaite connaissance du divin ici-bas, n'est qu'une modalité de connaissance imparfaite... La sagesse de Thomas est apophatique; en conséquence elle ne peut exprimer l'ineffable; si elle en parle, elle n'est plus elle-même mais une traduction positive de ce que l'intellect a perçu des raisons nécessaires au 'lieu de Dieu', ou mieux des révélations de l'Évangile. Richard éprouve intensément l'impuissance des mots à exprimer ce qu'il pense, ce qu'il sait et goûte de Dieu, il croit néanmoins en formuler une vérité authentique. Sa sagesse est positive. (pp. 102-6).
39. The issue is discussed briefly by Kirchberger, *ibid.*, pp. 65-8.
40. Kirchberger, op. cit., p. 176 fn., notes "P.L. text 'nube', but perhaps an error for 'igne' according to the previous clause".
41. P.L. CXCVI, 165 B-C.
42. See, for example, Benjamin Major IV, 4.

43. P.L. CXCV1, 172 B-C.
44. In the continuation of the passage cited above from Benjamin Major IV, 22, Richard compares the state of residing in the cloud to 'sleep', on the authority of Psalm 4, 9 (Vulgate 4, 8):  
 Recte ergo per soporem, mentis alienatio exprimitur; per quam ab assuetis absentatur, et quasi per somnum occupata, a rebus humanis, divinarum rerum contemplatione peregrinatur .  
 (P.L. CXCV1, 165 D)  
 This is strongly reminiscent of Privy Counselling 152/3-9, "& wel is þis werk licnyd to a slepe...."
45. P.L. CXCV1, 65 A.
46. See Prof. Hodgson's introduction to her edition of Cloud, pp. lxxiii-lxxvi. Her general comment on the English author's translation of the Benjamin Minor also has some bearing on his handling of Richard's contemplative theory in his original works:  
 ... the Middle English writer was interested only in the single theme of contemplative prayer and in his purpose of guidance, and whereas he will expand upon the practical application of his teaching and its effect upon the disciple's mind or feeling ... he has no place for the theoretical distinctions dear to scholastic writers. (Deonise Hid Diuinite, Intro., pp. xlv-xlvi).
47. It is important to stress, however, that in his insistence on meditation as a necessary preface to the contemplative ascent, the Cloud author is entirely in accord with Victorine tradition. The progression "Redyng, þinkyng & Preying" which he endorses in Cloud, ch. 35 may derive, as Prof. Hodgson suggests in her notes to this passage, from Hugh's Eruditionis Didascalicae, and parallel references abound in Hugh's work: see, for example, De Modo Orandi, ch. 1.
48. See, for example, Cloud, ch. 16.
49. Contemplation, he continues, is to be retained,  
 ... wipouten besines of þiself in corious seching & ransakyng wip þi goostly wittis amonges eny of þe qualitees þat longin not only to þe beyng of þiself bot also to þe beyng of God. (143/13-6).
50. P.L. CLXXV1 977-88.
51. Op. cit., P.L. CLXXV1, 980 B-D.
52. Ibid., A-B. The emphasis in both writers is on the primacy of the loving impulse, so that the meaning is one whatever the length of the prayer.
53. Prof. Hodgson cites some examples in the footnotes to her E.E.T.S. editions of the texts.
54. Op. cit., P.L. CLXXV1, 656 D.
55. De Institutione Novitiorum, P.L. CLXXV1, 941 D.
56. Roger Baron, Science et Sagesse, pp. 170-71, attributes the importance which Hugh attaches to the virtue of discretion to the influence of Cassian.  
 There is, however, as Clare Kirchberger remarks, a distinction between the Victorine concept of discretion (see the interpretation

of Joseph in Benjamin Minor, 66-71) and what it denotes for the English author:

But Richard chiefly takes discretion as the first fruits of reason, the means of self-knowledge; counsel of prudence and moderation. The English writer passes beyond these meanings when he describes the virtue as an instinctive knowledge of what to do, not merely in relation to men and self, but towards God, a spiritual apprehension of spiritual things and what they mean and how to adjust oneself to God's being and will. (Op. cit., p.68)

The Cloud author indeed advocates that the "scharpe double-eggid dreedful swerde of discrecioun" (Cloud 68/10-11) should moderate everything but the striving for contemplative union (see especially Cloud, chs. 41 and 42), and he insists that once this object is attained, the soul will intuitively behave with discretion in all its other occupations:

For I may not trowe þat a soule contynowyng in þis werk niȝt & day wipoutyn discrecioun schuld mowe erre in any of þees outward doinges; & elles me þink þat he schuld alweis erre.  
(Cloud 81/5-8)

Hence although, as is widely acknowledged, the English writer draws extensively on Hugh's description of the outrageous behaviour of misguided or inexperienced contemplatives in the De Institutione Novitiorum X and XII (but cf. also De Modo Orandi VI) for his own energetic portrait of their excesses in Cloud chs. 45 and 52-4, he does not imitate Hugh's meticulous account of the proprieties to be observed in both inward and outward conduct, but concentrates instead on the attainment of the spiritual union from which these naturally derive. Cf. also on this point pp. 333-4 above.

57. The text is edited and presented with a parallel French translation and informative introduction by E. Colledge and J. Walsh, Guigues II le Chartreux. Lettre sur la Vie Contemplative (L'Échelle des Moines), (Sources Chrétiennes 163, Paris, 1970).
58. See, for example, Guigo's definition of contemplation, op. cit., 84/36-8:  
Contemplatio est mentis in Deum suspensae quaedam supra se elevatio, eternae dulcis gaudia degustans.
59. The English translation of the Scala, A Ladder of Foure Ronges (ed. Prof. Hodgson, Deonise Hid Diuinite, pp.100-117) which significantly modifies the Latin text in order to accentuate specific points of doctrine, resembles the Cloud still more closely: i.e. in its emphasis on the primacy of love in the contemplative ascent; the necessity of grace and co-operation between God and the soul; the distinction between pagan wisdom and the sapientia christianorum; the insistence that the soul must experience for itself through contemplation what cannot be adequately described to it by another. The distinctions between the Latin original and the M.E. translation are discussed by Colledge and Walsh, op. cit., intro. pp.45-52. It is also notable that the English version, like the works of the Cloud author, is characterized by the excellence of its compiler as a teacher, which shows itself particularly in the inclusion of popular examples to make the text more immediately intelligible:

e.g. the illustration of the innkeeper to demonstrate the centrality of love in the progress to union (D.H.D. 113/20-114-22).

60. See Cloud, ch. 35, 71/11-72/22; Scala 84/20-21; Hugh's Eruditionis Didascalicae, V, 9 (P.L. CLXXV1, 797) - this example is cited by Prof. Hodgson, Cloud 71/15 fn.
61. See Cloud, *ibid.*; Scala 108/296-30; Hugh, *ibid.* (Prof. Hodgson does not indicate that the association of the two concepts in the Cloud is echoed in this chapter of Hugh's text).
62. See in particular the third section of the work, MS Paris B.N. 14978, ff. 250<sup>a</sup> - 277<sup>b</sup>. Guigues uses the slightly variant form, "lectio", "meditatio", "oratio", "desiderium". See Appendix II regarding this text.
63. The distinction between "incipientes", "proficientes" and "perfecti", outlined in the Prologue to the text, underlies the division of the work into three principal sections.
64. P.L. CLXXV1, 925-52.
65. *Op. cit.*, P.L. CLXXV1, 935 A-B. For an analysis of Hugh's literary style, see Roger Baron, Études sur Hugues de Saint-Victor, pp. 11-20. Baron detects an element of virtuosity in Hugh's style - an accusation from which the Cloud author is perhaps not entirely free, though Hugh's prose is far more elaborately contrived than anything in the English Corpus. G. Robert, Les Écoles et l'Enseignement de la Théologie pendant la Première Moitié du XI<sup>e</sup> Siècle (Paris, 1909) associates Hugh's prose with a "culte de la belle langue latine" which he claims grew up in the early twelfth century in conjunction with the revival of antique Latin literature characteristic of the period.

Notes to Appendix II

1. R.A.M., X, Juillet 1929, 259-89. Some of the main points of Grausem's description are summarized in La Spiritualité du Moyen Âge (Leclerq, Vandenbroucke, Bouyer), pp. 546-7.
2. The present writer has obtained a photostat copy of this manuscript and hopes to examine it in more detail in the future. It has been considered too great an undertaking to be incorporated in this thesis, and insufficient textual evidence, and no manuscript evidence, have yet come to light which demand its inclusion by suggesting that the text was in all probability a direct influence on the Cloud, and not simply its counterpart as an exposition of the Dionysian mystical tradition.
3. I am indebted to the Librarian of Stonyhurst College, Rev. F.J. Turner, for information concerning this manuscript.
4. Walter Baier makes some reference to the De Contemplatione in his Untersuchungen zu den Passionsbetrachtungen in der "Vita Christi" des Ludolf von Sachsen (Analecta Cartusiana 44, Salzburg, 1977), II, pp. 292-5. He describes the content of the three books:  
Das erste Buch (Incipit: Sicut Mater consolatur) behandelt die zwölf Stufen der Einigung der Seele mit Gott; das zweite Buch (Incipit: Fundamentum aliud) den Weg der bereits gereinigten und gerechtfertigten Seele mit besonderer Betonung und begeisterter Schilderung des Lebens Christi; das dritte Buch (Incipit: Finem loquendi) das aktive geistliche Leben.  
(p. 293)  
Baier also confirms that the treatise circulated only narrowly - "Der Traktat De Cont. war nur im Orden und dessen Freundeskreisen bekannt" (p. 292) - though Ludolphus of Saxony's incorporation of material from Bk. II ensured some of the treatise a wider and lasting currency. Baier refers to five surviving manuscripts of the work; cf. B. Gaillard, "Guigues du Pont", D.S.A.M., VI, 1176-1179.
5. Humphrey Pawsey, in his essay on Guigo the Angelic in Spirituality through the Centuries, pp. 132-43, notes the affinity between Guigo du Pont and the author of the Scala Claustralium, and suggests that the De Contemplatione develops a main theme of the earlier work in exploring the relationship between the beatific vision and contemplative experience. cf. also Dom A. Wilmart, "Les Écrits Spirituels des deux Guigues", R.A.M., V, 1924, 59-79 and 127-58.
6. Grausem, art. cit., p. 273.
7. Ibid., p. 276.
8. Ibid., p. 274.
9. Ibid., pp. 286-7. Baier has observed that Hugh of Balma's account of mystical theology was not universally approved within the Carthusian order and that the De Contemplatione in some respects refutes the Viae Syon Lugent (op. cit., I, p. 34). He elaborates on this point in the second volume of his work:  
Mit seinem Traktat De contemplatione wollte er offenbar der Theologia mystica Hugos von Balma, seines Zeitgenossens und

Ordensbruders, entgegentreten, der er in gewissen Punkten für wenig erfahrene Seelen als 'zu hoch und zu dunkel' findet. Guigo wendet sich gegen die Begarden und eine antiintellektuelle Kontemplation. Der affektiven Kontemplation, die für ihn nicht ohne Einsicht ist, gibt er vor anderen, die er auch kennt, den Vorzug. Mehr affektiv als intellektuell, nicht besonders originell und mehr praktisch eingestellt, sieht er in der aktiven und liebevollen Betrachtung des Lebens Christi einen bleibenden Wert. (p. 292)

Baier also speculates on the possibility that the De Contemplatione may have been written jointly within the monastic community.

10. De Contemplatione f.246<sup>b</sup> sq. (Grausem, *ibid.* p.282).

11. The De Adhaerendo Deo (once attributed to Albert the Great) is the work of Johannes von Kastl - a Benedictine monk from Kastl in Bavaria and perhaps prior there c.1399. It has been published by J. Huijben (Vie Spirituelle, Supplément, 1922, 22-27; 1923, 80-101). English versions are printed in the English Recusant Literature series, ed. D.M. Rogers, Vol. 96, 1972, pp. 281-372, and trans. by a Benedictine of Princethorpe Priory, On Union with God (London, 1911). Recent editions of other works attributed to this author with critical comment are ed. Clemens Stroick, Unpublished Theological Writings of Johannes Castellensis (Ottawa, 1964) and P. Josef Sudbrack, S.J., Die Geistliche Theologie des Johannes von Kastl. Studien zur Frömmigkeitgeschichte des Spätmittelalters (Münster, 1967). Both writers stress that Johannes von Kastl was a compiler. Manuscript evidence suggests that his work was widely read, and Fr. Sudbrack associates his writings with the Carthusian dissemination of Dionysian literature through his dependence on Rudolph of Biberach (*op. cit.*, pp.162-7). He seems to have absorbed Dionysian theology, however, through secondary sources - the commentators, Hugh of St. Victor and Thomas Gallus. Riehle (*op. cit.*, p.36) also notes that Johannes cites the same extracts as Rudolph of Biberach had earlier assembled from Ps.-Dionysius, Thomas Gallus and Grosseteste on the theme of ecstatic love. Fr. Sudbrack concludes that although the De Adhaerendo Deo has much in common with the Cloud of Unknowing in respect of the author's adoption of Dionysian theology and terminology - notably the concept of the "naked intent" to God - there is no convincing evidence that the English author drew directly on the De Adhaerendo Deo or that their apparent similarities need any other explanation than their shared background. Stroick suggests, in fact, that Johannes is in general closer in temper to the Victorine and Bernardine mystical traditions, sharing with them a devotion to Christ's humanity, and evolving a Christocentric theory of contemplation. It is worth noting, moreover, that Johannes' use of the term "naked" ("nudus"), which Prof. Hodgson has compared with the Cloud author's in the introduction to her edition of the text (pp. lxiv-lxix), has a precedent in the De Septem Itineribus: Rudolph advocates the stripping away of earthly concepts - "von allen dingen genzelich enplost vürstentnissi" (III, Schmidt, p.79 - see below, fn.12) - as a precondition of the contemplative ascent. Dom David Knowles reaffirms that the De Adhaerendo Deo was written too late and is too much lacking in the Cloud author's mystical experience, to be more than a "collateral relation" of the English work (The English Mystical Tradition (London, 1961), p.76).

12. Specilegium Bonaventuriarum, VI, Quarrachi, Florentiae Typographia Collegii S. Bonaventurae, 1969. The edition is from MS. Cod. Einsiedeln 278, ff. 3a - 147b. The Latin text is printed in S. Bonaventura Opera Omnia, Romae Vaticana, 1596, VII, pp.145-196.
13. Dr. A.I. Doyle has been unable to add to Schmidt's information concerning these manuscripts or to specify further English manuscripts of the text.
14. The Prologue to the text presents the contemplative ascent as the duty of every man and a natural fulfilment of his being:  
 Nv̄ ist es an allen zwivel war, daz d̄v̄ vernvnftige natur vmbe geschaffen ist, daz si iren macher müge verstan vnd minnen vnd da mitte bestan vnd beliben vnd seleklich leben in dem, der daz ewig leben (weslich) ist eweklich (op. cit., p 1).  
 The German text has been cited here for its greater accessibility and reliability than the early printed versions in which the Latin treatise is available, and also because it provides interesting parallels with the Cloud Corpus in its use of the vernacular to render Dionysian terminology.
15. Schmidt discusses this aspect of the text in her introduction, pp. 228-248.
16. Op. cit., p.180.
17. The Dionysian theory of ecstatic love as uniting God and the hierarchies of creation is also an important theme of the De Septem Itineribus Ch. IV, op. cit., pp.88-129.
18. See De Septem Itineribus Ch. III, op. cit., pp.63-5.
19. Ibid., Ch. VII, op. cit., p.166.
20. See De Septem Itineribus Ch. V, op. cit., pp.143-165.
21. Ibid. Ch. IV, op. cit., p.116.
22. Ibid. Ch. II, op. cit., p.35.
23. Ibid. Ch. V, op. cit., p.136.
24. Ibid. Ch. V, op. cit., p.140.
25. Ibid. Ch. VII, op. cit., p.163.



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Printed Sources and Editions

- Augustine      On Christian Doctrine, tr. D.W. Robertson, Jr.  
(New York, 1958)
- Biblia Sacra Latina ex Biblia Sacra Vulgatae Editionis (London, 1977 ed.)
- Ps.-Dionysius      Patrologia, series graeca, ed. J.-P. Migne (Paris, 1857 ff.), t. III-IV  
De Divinis Nominibus      P.G.t.III, col. 585-996  
Dionysiaca. Recueil donnant l'ensemble des traductions latines des ouvrages attribués au Denys l'Aréopage, ed. P. Chevallier (Paris, 1937), 2 Vols.  
De Mystica Theologia      Chev. I, 565-602  
Dionysius the Areopagite. 'The Divine Names' and 'The Mystical Theology', tr. C.E. Rolt (London, 1940)  
Epistle I, To Gaius; Epistle V, To Dorothy, ed. and tr. J. Vanneste, Le Mystère de Dieu. Essai sur la Structure Rationnelle de la Doctrine Mystique du Pseudo-Denys l'Aréopagite (Paris, Louvain; Bruges, printed 1959), pp. 242-5
- Erigena      Versio Dionysii      Patrologia, series Latina, ed. J.-P. Migne (Paris, 1844 ff.), t. CXXII
- Gallus, Thomas      Extractio (De Mystica Theologia)      Chev. I, 709-12  
Expositiones seu Glossae in Mysticam Theologiam Sancti Dionysii  
P.L. t. CXXII, col. 267-84  
Thomas Gallus. Commentaires du Cantique des Cantiques, ed. J. Barbet (Paris, 1967)  
Commentaire sur Isaïe de Thomas de Saint-Victor, ed. G. Théry, Vie Spirituelle, Supplément, Vol. XLVII, 1936, 146-62; ed. J. Walsh, 'Sapientia Christianorum': The Doctrine of Thomas Gallus Abbot of Vercelli on Contemplation (unpubl. Dissertatio ad Lauream in Facultate Theologica, Pontifica Universitas Gregoriana, Rome, 1957), pp. 6'-9'.  
Explanatio, De Divinis Nominibus IV (extracts), ed. J. Walsh, ibid., Appendix to Ch. IV, pp. 163-73 and Appendix to Part III, pp. 262-71
- Gardner, E.G.      The Cell of Self-Knowledge: seven early English mystical treatises printed by Henry Pepwell in 1521 (London, 1925)
- Gregory of Nyssa      Grégoire de Nysse. 'La Vie de Moïse', ed. J. Daniélou (Sources Chrétiennes, Paris, 1968)  
Against Eunomius      P.G. t. XLV  
Commentary on the Canticle      P.G. t. XLIV  
On the Beatitudes      P.G. t. XLIV  
On the Making of Man      P.G. t. XLIV  
On the Soul and the Resurrection      P.G. t. XLVI  
On Virginity      P.G. t. XLVI  
From Glory to Glory. Texts from Gregory of Nyssa, selected and intro. J. Daniélou, tr. and ed. H. Musurillo (London, 1962)

Select Writings and Letters of Gregory, Bishop of Nyssa,  
tr. W. Moore, H.A. Wilson (Oxford, 1893)

- Guigo II      Guigues II le Chartreux. Lettre sur la Vie Contemplative (L'Échelle des Moines), ed. E. Colledge, J. Walsh (Sources Chrétiennes 163, Paris, 1970)  
A Ladder of Foure Ronges by the which Men Mowe Wele Clyme to Heven, printed as Appendix B in 'Deonise Hid Diuinite' and other Treatises on Contemplative Prayer related to 'The Cloud of Unknowing', ed. P. Hodgson (E.E.T.S. 231, 1955, reprinted 1958)
- Hilton, Walter      An Exposition of 'Qui Habitat' and 'Bonum Est' in English, ed. B. Wallner (Lund Studies in English, Vol. XX111, 1954)  
'A Letter to a Hermit', tr. J.M. Russell-Smith, The Way, Vol. 6, 1966, 230-41  
Minor Works of Walter Hilton, ed. D. Jones (London, 1929)  
The Scale of Perfection, mod. E. Underhill (London, 1948); as The Ladder of Perfection, mod. L. Sherley-Price (London, 1957)  
Walter Hilton's 'Eight Chapters on Perfection', ed. F. Kuriyagawa (Tokyo, 1967)  
"Walter Hilton's Of Angels' Song edited from the British Museum MS Additional 27592", Studies in English Literature (Tokyo), English Number, 1977, 3-31
- Hodgson, P., ed.      'The Cloud of Unknowing' and 'The Book of Privy Counselling' (E.E.T.S., O.S.218, 1944, reprinted 1973)  
'Deonise Hid Diuinite' and other Treatises on Contemplative Prayer related to 'The Cloud of Unknowing' (E.E.T.S., No. 231, 1955, reprinted 1958)
- Hodgson, P., Liegey G., ed.      The Orcherd of Syon (E.E.T.S., O.S. 258, 1966)
- Hogg, J., ed.      Boniface of Savoy, Carthusian and Archbishop of Canterbury 1207-1270 by Leland Edward Wilshire (Analecta Cartusiana 31, Salzburg, 1977)
- Horstmann C., ed.      Yorkshire Writers. Richard Rolle of Hampole and his Followers (London, 1895)
- Hugh of Balma      Viae Syon Iugent (known also as De Mystica Theologia, and De Triplici Via), S. Bonaventura, Opera (Cologne ed. 1609, after the Vatican ed. 1588), Vol. VII, col. 657-87  
"The Ascent to Contemplative Wisdom" (extract from V.S.L. III which occurs in MS Douce 262), tr. J. Walsh, The Way, Vol. 9, 1969, 243-50
- Hugh of St. Victor      Expositio in Hierarchiam Coelestem S. Dionysii  
P.L. t. CLXXV  
De Arca Noe Morali      P.L. t. CLXXVI  
De Arrha Animae      P.L. t. CLXXVI  
De Institutione Novitiorum      P.L. t. CLXXVI

- De Modo Orandi P.L. t. CLXXVI  
In Ecclesiasten Homiliae P.L. t. CLXXV  
Hugues de Saint-Victor. Six Opuscles, ed. R. Baron (Sources  
Chrétiennes, Paris, 1969)  
Hugh of St.-Victor. Selected Spiritual Writings, intro.  
A. Squire, tr. A Religious of C.S.M.V. (London, 1962)
- Johannes Castellensis Unpublished Theological Writings of Johannes  
Castellensis, ed. C. Stroick (Ottawa, 1964)  
On Union with God (De Adhaerendo Deo), tr. A Benedictine of  
Princethorpe Priory (London, 1911)
- Jolliffe, P.S., ed. "Two Middle English Tracts on the Contemplative  
Life", M.S., Vol. XXXVII, 1975, 85-121
- Julian of Norwich A Book of Showings to the anchoress Julian of  
Norwich, ed. E. Colledge, J. Walsh (Pontifical Institute of  
Mediaeval Studies, Toronto, 1978)
- Kempe, Margery The Book of Margery Kempe, ed. S.B. Meech (E.E.T.S.,  
O.S. 212, 1940)
- Kirchberger, C., ed. 'Mystical Prayer' (fragment in MS Douce 262, ff. 132-3),  
Life of the Spirit (A Blackfriars Review), Vol. IV, 1949, 147-8
- Mc Cann, J., mod., 'The Cloud of Unknowing' and other Treatises by an  
English Mystic of the Fourteenth Century (London, 1924)
- Oliger, L., ed. "Regulae Tres Recluserum et Eremitarum Angliae saec.  
XII-XIV", Antonianum, Vol. III, 1928, 151-90 and 299-320  
"Regula Recluserum et Quaestiones Tres de Vita Solitaria saec.  
XIII-XIV", Antonianum, Vol. IX, 1934, 37-84 and 243-59
- Philo Philosophical Writings. Philo. Selections, ed. H. Lewy (Oxford,  
1946)
- Plotinus The Enneads, tr. S. Mackenna, fourth edition revised by  
B.S. Page (London, 1969)
- Pollard, A.W. Fifteenth Century Prose and Verse (London, 1903)
- Richard of St. Victor Benjamin Major P.L. t. CXCVI  
Benjamin Minor P.L. t. CXCVI  
Richard of St.-Victor. Selected Writings on Contemplation,  
tr. C. Kirchberger (London, 1957)
- Roger, L.E., ed. An Edition of British Museum MS Harley 2372 (Advice  
to Recluses), (Unpubl. dissertation, Oxford, 1934)
- Rudolph of Biberach Rudolf von Biberach. Die Siben Strassen zu Got  
(Medieval German version of De Septem Itineribus Aeternitatis),  
ed. M. Schmidt (Specilegium Bonaventuriarum, VI, Quarrachi,  
Florentiae Typographia Collegii S. Bonaventurae, 1969)
- Ruysbroek, John of 'The Chastising of God's Children' and 'The  
Treatise of Perfection of the Sons of God', ed. J. Bazire,  
E. Colledge (Oxford, 1957)

Sarracenus, Johannes      Nova Translatio (De Mystica Theologia) Chev. I,  
565-602

Westra, M.S., ed.      A Talkyng of þe Loue of God (The Hague, 1950)

William of St. Thierry      The Golden Epistle of Abbot William of St. Thierry to the Carthusians of Mont Dieu, ed. J. McCann, tr. W. Shewring (London, 1930)

#### Secondary Sources

Allen, H.E.      Writings ascribed to Richard Rolle, Hermit of Hampole, and Materials for his Biography (New York, 1927)

d'Alverny, M.T.      "Le Second Commentaire de Thomas Gallus Abbé de Verceil sur le Cantique des Cantiques", A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol. X111, 1940-2, 391-402

Andres, F.      "Die Stufen der Contemplatio in Bonaventuras Itinerarium mentis in Deum und in Benjamin maior des Richard von St. Viktor", Franziskanische Studien, July, 1921, 189-200

d'Arcy, M.C.      The Mind and Heart of Love. Lion and Unicorn. A Study in Eros and Agape (London, 1945)

Armstrong, A.H.      "Platonic Eros and Christian Agape", Downside Review, Vol. 79, 1961, 105-21  
ed. The Cambridge History of Later Greek and Early Medieval Philosophy (Cambridge, 1967)

Auerbach, E.      "Figura", Scenes from the Drama of European Literature, tr. R. Manheim (New York, 1959), 11-71

Baier, W.      Untersuchungen zu den Passionsbetrachtungen in der "Vita Christi" des Ludolf von Sachsen (Analecta Cartusiana 44, Salzburg, 1977)

Balás, D.L.      "METΟΥΣΙΑ ΘΕΟΥ". Man's Participation in God's Perfections according to Saint Gregory of Nyssa (Rome, 1966)

Baron, R.      Études sur Hugues de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1963)  
"Hugues de Saint-Victor. Contribution à un Nouvel Examen de son Oeuvre", Traditio, Vol. 15, 1959, 223-97  
Science et Sagesse chez Hugues de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1957)

Bateson, M., ed.      Catalogue of the Library of Syon Monastery Isleworth (Cambridge, 1898)

A Benedictine of Stanbrook      Medieval Mystical Tradition and St. John of the Cross (London, 1954)

Bennett, H.S.      English Books and Readers 1475-1557 (Cambridge, 1952)  
English Books and Readers 1558-1603 (Cambridge, 1965)  
English Books and Readers 1603-1640 (Cambridge, 1970)

- Birrell, T.A. "English Catholic Mystics in Non-Catholic Circles I", Downside Review, Vol. 94, Pt. 316, 1976, 60-81; II, *ibid.*, 99-117; III, *ibid.*, 213-29
- Blake, N.F. "Middle English Prose and its Audience", Anglia, Band 90, Heft 4, 1972, 437-55  
 "Revelations of St. Matilda", Notes and Queries, New series, Vol. 20, 1973, 323-5  
 "Varieties of Middle English Religious Prose", Chaucer and Middle English Studies in Honour of Rossell Hope Robbins, ed. B. Rowland (London, 1974), 348-56
- Bloom, A. "Contemplation et Ascèse: Contribution Orthodoxe", Études Carmélitaines, 1949, 49-67
- Bouyer, L. "Holy Scripture and Tradition as seen by the Fathers", The Eastern Churches Quarterly, 1947, 2-16
- Brian, B.D. A Study of the Imagery in 'The Cloud of Unknowing' (Unpubl. M.A. Thesis, Duke University, 1961)
- Burrow, J.A. "Fantasy and Language in The Cloud of Unknowing", Essays in Criticism, Vol. XXV11, No. 4, Oct. 1977, 283-98
- Callus, D.A. "The Date of Grosseteste's Translations and Commentaries on Pseudo-Dionysius and the Nichomachean Ethics", R.T.A.M., Vol. XIV, 1947, 186-210  
 "Robert Grosseteste as a Scholar", Robert Grosseteste, Scholar and Bishop. Essays in Commemoration of the Seventh Centenary of his Death, ed. D.A. Callus (Oxford, 1955), 1-69  
 "An Unknown Commentary on the Pseudo-Dionysian Letters", Dominican Studies, I, 1948, 58-67
- Cappuyns, M. Jean Scot Érigène. Sa Vie, son Oeuvre, sa Pensée (Louvain, 1933)
- Cayré, A.A. La Contemplation Augustinienne. Principes de Spiritualité et de Théologie (Bruges, 1954)
- Chambers, R.W. On the Continuity of English Prose from Alfred to More and his School (E.E.T.S., O.S. 186, 1931)
- Chatillon, J. "Chronique. De Guillaume de Champeaux à Thomas Gallus", Revue du Moyen Âge Latin, Vol. VIII, 1952, 139-62 and 247-73
- Chaytor, H.J. From Script to Print: An Introduction to Medieval Literature (Cambridge, 1945)
- Clark, J.P.H. "The Lightsome Darkness - Aspects of Walter Hilton's Theological Background", Downside Review, Vol. 95, April 1977, 95-109
- Colledge, E. The Mediaeval Mystics of England (London, 1962)  
 "De nobilitate anime and De ornatu spiritualium nupciarum: Bibliothek Rijksuniversiteit Utrecht MS. 5. F. 34", Guaerendo, Vol. 1X/2, 1979, 149-59

- "Recent Work on Walter Hilton", Blackfriars, June 1956, 265-70  
 "The Treatise of Perfection of the Sons of God: A fifteenth-century English Ruysbroek translation", English Studies, Vol. 33, 1952, 49-66
- Crowe, M.B. "The Term Synderesis and the Scholastics", Irish Theological Quarterly, Vol. XXIII, April 1956, 151-64 and 228-45
- Daniélou, J., tr. Hibberd, W. From Shadows to Reality. Studies in the Biblical Typology of the Fathers (London, 1960)  
Platonisme et Théologie Mystique (Paris, 1944)
- Deanesly, M. "Vernacular Books in England in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries", Modern Language Review, Vol. XV, No. 4, October 1920, 349-58
- Deneffe, A. "Geschichte des Wortes supernaturalis", Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie, Vol. XLVI, 1922, 337-60
- Dondaine, H.F. Le Corpus Dionysien de l'Université de Paris au XIII<sup>e</sup> Siècle (Rome, 1953)
- Douglass, J.W. "The Negative Theology of Dionysius the Areopagite", Downside Review, Vol. 81, 1963, 115-24
- Doyle, A.I. "Books Connected with the Vere Family and Barking Abbey", Transactions of the Essex Archeological Society, Vol. 25, 1958, 222-43  
 "The Shaping of the Vernon and Simeon Manuscripts", Chaucer and Middle English Studies in Honour of Rossell Hope Robbins, ed. B. Rowland (London, 1974), 328-41  
A Survey of the Origins and Circulation of Theological Writings in English in the 14th, 15th and early 16th Centuries, with special reference to the part of the Clergy therein (Unpubl. Ph.D. Thesis, Downing College, Cambridge, 1953)
- Elwin, V. "Christian Dhyana" or Prayer of Loving Regard. A Study of "The Cloud of Unknowing" (London, 1930)
- Fisher, N. "Handlist of Animal References in Middle English Religious Prose", Leeds Studies in English, New series, Vol. IV, 1970, 49-111
- Foster, J.E. "The Connection of the Church of Chesterton with the Abbey of Vercelli", Proceedings of the Cambridge Antiquarian Society, New series VII, Vol. XIII, 1908-9, 185-212
- Franceschini, E. "Grosseteste's Translation of the  $\Pi$ ΡΟΛΟΓΟΣ and  $\Sigma$ ΧΟΛΙΑ of Maximus to the Writings of the Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita", The Journal of Theological Studies, Vol. XXXIV, 1933, 355-63
- Gardner, H.L. Review of The Cloud of Unknowing (E.E.T.S. ed.), M.Aev., Vol. XVI, 1947, 36-42

- "The Text of the Scale of Perfection", M.Aev., Vol. V, 1936, 11-30
- "Walter Hilton and the Authorship of the Cloud of Unknowing", Review of English Studies, Vol. IX, No. 34, April 1933, 129-47
- "Walter Hilton and the Mystical Tradition in England", E.S., Vol. XXII, 1937, 103-27
- Gersh, S. From Iamblichus to Eriugena. An Investigation of the Prehistory and Evolution of the Pseudo-Dionysian Tradition (Leiden, 1978)
- de Ghellink, J. Le Mouvement Théologique du XII<sup>e</sup> Siècle (Bruges, 1948)
- Gilson, E. La Philosophie au Moyen Âge (Paris, 1962)
- Grabmann, M. "Ps.-Dionysius Areopagita in lateinischen Übersetzungen des Mittelalters", Festgabe Ehrhard (Bonn, 1922), 180-9
- Grausem, J.P. "Le De Contemplatione du Chartreux Guigues du Pont (†1297)", R.A.M., Vol. X, July 1929, 259-89
- Grondijs, L.H. "La Terminologie Métalogique dans la Théologie Dionysienne", Nederlands Theologisch Tijdschrift, Vol. XIV, 1959/60, 420-9
- "Sur la Terminologie Dionysienne", Bulletin de l'Association Guillaume Budé, Vol. 18, 1959, 438-47
- Guimet, F. "Caritas Ordinata et Amor Discretus dans la Théologie Trinitaire de Richard de Saint-Victor", Revue du Moyen Âge Latin, Vol. IV, 1948, 225-36
- "Notes en Marge d'un Texte de Richard de Saint-Victor", A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol. XIV, 1943-5, 371-94
- Hodgson, P. "Dionysius the Areopagite and Christian Mystical Tradition", Contemporary Review, Nov. 1949, 281-5
- "A Ladder of Foure Ronges by the whiche Men Mowe Wele Clyme to Heven. A Study of the Prose Style of a Middle English Translation", Modern Language Review, Vol. XLIV, No. 4, Oct. 1949, 465-75
- "The Orchard of Syon and the English Mystical Tradition", Proceedings of the British Academy, Vol. I, 1964, 230-2
- Three 14th-Century English Mystics (London, 1967)
- "Walter Hilton and The Cloud of Unknowing: A Problem of Authorship Reconsidered", Modern Language Review, Vol. 4, 1955, 395-406
- Horn, G. "Amour et Extase d'après Denys l'Aréopagite", R.A.M., Vol. 6, 1925, 278-89
- "Le Miroir et la Nuée. Deux Manières de voir Dieu d'après S. Grégoire de Nysse", R.A.M., Vol. 8, April 1927, 113-31
- Hudson, A. "A Chapter from Walter Hilton in Two Middle English Compilations", Neuphilologus, Vol. 52, 1968, 416-21
- Hussey, S.S. "Latin and English in The Scale of Perfection", M.S., Vol. XXXV, 1973, 456-76



- "The Text of The Scale of Perfection, Book II", N.M., Vol. 65, No.1, 1964, 75-92
- von Ivanka, E.        "Apex Mentis. Wanderung und Wandlung eines stoischen Terminismus", Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie, Vol. 72, 1950, 129-76  
       "Der Aufbau der Schrift De Divinis Nominibus des Ps.-Dionysios", Scholastik, Vol. 15, 1940, 386-99  
       "La Signification Historique du Corpus Areopageticum", Recherches de Science Religieuse, Vol. XXXVI, 1949, 5-24  
       "Von Platonismus zur Theorie der Mystik. Zur Erkenntnislehre Gregors von Nyssa", Scholastik, Vol. 2, 1936, 163-95  
       "Zum Problem des christlichen Neuplatonismus. II Inwieweit ist Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita Neuplatoniker?", Scholastik, Vol. 31, 1956, 384-403  
       "Zur Überwindung des neuplatonischen Intellektualismus in der Deutung der Mystik: intelligentia oder principalis affectio", Scholastik, Vol. 30, 1955, 185-94
- James, M.R.        "The Catalogue of the Library of the Augustinian Friars at York now first edited from the MS at Trinity College, Dublin", Johanni Willis Clark Dictatus (Cambridge, 1909)  
       A Descriptive Catalogue of the Manuscripts in the Library of Gonville and Caius College (Cambridge, 1907)  
       The Western Manuscripts in the Library of Trinity College, Cambridge (Cambridge, 1900)
- Javelet, R.        "Thomas Gallus et Richard de Saint-Victor Mystiques", R.T.A.M., Vol. 29, 1962, 206-33; Vol. 30, 1963, 88-121
- Jayne, S., Johnson, F.R., ed.        The Library of John, Lord Lumley. The Catalogue of 1609 (New York, 1967)
- Johnston, W.        The Mysticism of 'The Cloud of Unknowing' (New York, 1967)
- Jolliffe, P.S.        A Check-List of Middle English Prose Writings of Spiritual Guidance (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto, 1974)
- Jones, R.M.        The Flowering of Mysticism. The Friends of God in the Fourteenth Century (New York, 1939)
- Journet, C., tr. Anderson, J.F.        The Dark Knowledge of God (London, 1948)
- Ker, N.R.        Medieval Libraries of Great Britain. A List of Surviving Books (2nd ed., London, 1964)
- Kirchberger, C.        "Bodleian Manuscripts Relating to the Spiritual Life, 1500-1750", Bodleian Quarterly Record, Vol. III, 1951, 155-64  
       "A Link with Little Gidding", Theology, 1949, 294-8
- Kittel, G., ed., Bromiley, G.W., tr.        Theological Dictionary of the New Testament, Vol. IV (Michigan, 1967)
- Knowles, D.        The English Mystical Tradition (London, 1961)  
       The Evolution of Medieval Thought (London, 1962)  
       "The Excellence of The Cloud", Downside Review, Vol. LII, 1934, 71-92

- Koch, H. "Das mystische Schauen beim hl. Gregor von Nyssa", Theologische Quartalschrift, III, 1898, 397-420  
Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita in seinen Beziehungen zum Neuplatonismus und Mysterienwesen (Mainz, 1900)
- Krynen, J. "La Pratique et la Théorie de l'Amour sans Connaissance dans la Viae Syon Lugent d'Hugues de Balma", R.A.M., Vol. XL, 1964, 161-83
- Kurath, H., ed. Middle English Dictionary (Michigan, 1954 ff)
- Lebreton, J. "La Nuit Obscure d'après Saint-Jean de la Croix. Les Sources et la Caractère de sa Doctrine", R.A.M., 1928, 3-24
- Leclercq, J., Vandenbroucke, F., Bouyer, L., ed. La Spiritualité du Moyen Âge (Aubier, 1961)
- Lehmann, P. "Zur Kenntnis der Schriften des Dionysius Areopagita im Mittelalter", Revue Benedictine, Vol. 35, 1923, 81-97
- Lenglart, M. La Théorie de la Contemplation Mystique dans l'Oeuvre de Richard de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1935)
- Lewy, H. 'Sobria Ebrietas'. Untersuchungen zu Geschichte der antiken Mystik (Gießen, 1929)
- Lieske, A. "Zur Theologie der Christusbmystik Gregors von Nyssa", Scholastik, Vol. XLV, No. 4, 1939, 485-514
- Lossky, V. "La Notion des Analogies chez Denys le Pseudo-Aréopagite", A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol. 5, 1930, 279-309  
"La Théologie Négative dans la Doctrine de Denys l'Aréopagite", Revue des Sciences Philosophiques, Paris, Vol. XXVIII, 1939, 204-21  
"Les Éléments de Théologie Négative dans la Pensée de Saint Augustin", Augustinus Magister. Congrès International Augustinien. Communications I, 1954, 575-81
- Lovatt, R. "The Imitation of Christ in Late Medieval England", T.R.H.S., 5th Series, Vol. 18, 1968, 97-121
- Madan, F., Craster, H.H.E., ed. A Summary Catalogue of the Western Manuscripts in the Bodleian Library at Oxford (Oxford, 1895-1937)
- Marks, R.B. The Medieval Manuscript Library of the Charterhouse of St. Barbara in Cologne (Analecta Cartusiana 21, Salzburg, 1974)
- McCann, J. "The Cloud of Unknowing", Ampleforth Journal, Summer, 1924, 192-7
- Merton, T. Mystics and Zen Masters (New York, 1967)
- Mignon, A. Les Origines de la Scolastique et Hugues de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1895)

- M'Intyre, D.M.        "The Cloud of Unknowing", Expositor, 7 series,  
Vol. 22, Oct. 1907, 373-84
- Morgan, M.M.        "A Talkyng of the Love of God and the Continuity of  
Stylistic Traditions in Middle English Prose Meditations",  
Review of English Studies, New Series, Vol. III, No. 10,  
April 1952, 97-116  
"A Treatise in Cadence", Modern Language Review, Vol. XLVII,  
No. 2, April 1952, 156-64
- Mulligan, R.W.        "Ratio Superior and Ratio Inferior: the Historical  
Background", The New Scholasticism, Vol. XXIX, No.1, Jan. 1955,  
1-32
- Nicolas, J.-H.        Dieu Connu comme Inconnu. Essai d'une Critique de  
la Connaissance Théologique (Paris, 1966)
- Nieva, C.S.        This Transcending God. The Teaching of the Author of  
'The Cloud of Unknowing' (London, 1971)
- Noetinger, M.        "The Authorship of The Cloud of Unknowing", Blackfriars,  
1924, 1457-64
- Nygren, A., tr. Watson, P.    Agape and Eros. A Study of the Christian  
Idea of Love (London, 1932)
- O'Meara, J.J., Bieler, L., ed.    The Mind of Eriugena. Papers of a  
Colloquium, Dublin, 14-18 July, 1970 (Dublin, 1973)
- Pepler, C.        The English Religious Heritage (London, 1958)  
The Three Degrees. A Study in Christian Mysticism (London,  
1957)
- Pera, C.        "Denys le Mystique et la ΘΕΟΜΑΧΙΑ", Recherches des Sciences  
Philosophiques et Théologiques, Vol. XXV, 1936, 5-75
- Petry, R.C., ed.        Late Medieval Mysticism (The Library of Christian  
Classics, Vol. XIII, London, 1957)
- Pollard, A.W., Redgrave, G.R., ed.    A Short-Title Catalogue of Books  
Printed in England, Scotland and Ireland and of English Books  
Printed Abroad 1475-1642 (Oxford, 1926, reprinted 1946)
- Puech, H.-C.        "La Ténèbre Mystique chez le Pseudo-Denys l'Aréopagite  
et dans la Tradition Patristique", Études Carmélitaines, 1938,  
33-53
- Rahner, K.        "Le Début d'une Doctrine des Cinq Sens Spirituels chez  
Origène", R.A.M., Vol. XIII, April 1932, 113-45
- Ramsey, I.T.        Religious Language: an Empirical Placing of Theological  
Phrases (London, 1967)
- Richardson, A.        The Gospel According to Saint John (London, 1960)  
An Introduction to the Theology of the New Testament (London,  
1961)  
Theological Wordbook of the Bible (London, 1962)

- Riehle, W. "The Problem of Walter Hilton's Possible Authorship of The Cloud of Unknowing and its Related Tracts", N.M., Vol. LXXVIII, 1977, 31-45  
 "Der Seelengrund in der englischen Mystik des Mittelalters im Vergleich zur deutschen", Grossbritannien und Deutschland, ed. O. Kuhn, München, 1974, 461-76  
Studien zur englischen Mystik des Mittelalters unter besonderer Berücksichtigung ihrer Metaphorik (Heidelberg, 1977)
- Rist, J.M. "A Note on Eros and Agape in Pseudo-Dionysius", Vigiliae Christianae, Vol. 20, 1966, 235-43
- Robbins, R.H. Review of Deonise Hid Diuinite (E.E.T.S. ed.), Speculum, Vol. XXXI, 1957, 406-10
- Robert, G. Les Écoles et l'Enseignement de la Théologie pendant la Première Moitié du XII<sup>e</sup> Siècle (Paris, 1909)
- Roques, R. "À Propos des Sources du Pseudo-Denys", Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique, Vol. LVI, Pt. 2, 1961, 449-64  
Structures Théologiques. De la Gnose à Richard de Saint-Victor (Paris, 1962)  
 "Symbolisme et Théologie Négative chez le Pseudo-Denys", Bulletin de l'Association Guillaume Budé, Vol. I, 1957, 97-112
- Russell-Smith, J.M. Article-review of Deonise Hid Diuinite (E.E.T.S. ed.), English Studies, Vol. XLI, 1960, 261-7.  
 "Walter Hilton and a Tract in Defence of the Veneration of Images", Dominican Studies, Vol. VII, 1954, 180-214
- Saffrey, H.D. "Un Lien Objectif entre le Pseudo-Denys et Proclus", Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur, Vol. 94, Leipzig, 1966, 98-105
- Santoni, R.E., ed. Religious Language and the Problem of Religious Knowledge (Bloomington and London, 1968)
- Sargent, M.G. "A New Manuscript of The Chastising of God's Children with an Ascription to Walter Hilton", M. Aev., Vol. XLVI, 1977, 49-65  
 "The Transmission by the English Carthusians of some late Medieval Spiritual Writings", Journal of Ecclesiastical History, Vol. 27, No. 3, July 1976, 225-40
- Scattergood, V.J. "A Late Medieval Miscellany from St. Mark's Hospital", unpubl.
- Sitwell, G. "Contemplation in The Scale of Perfection", Downside Review, Summer 1949, 276-90
- Smalley, B. The Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages (Oxford, 1952)
- Spearrit, P. A Philosophical Enquiry into Dionysian Mysticism (A thesis presented to the Faculty of Letters at the

University of Fribourg, Switzerland, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, 1968)

- Stephen, L., Lee, S., ed. The Dictionary of National Biography (Oxford, 1949-50)
- Sudbrack, J. Die geistliche Theologie des Johannes von Kastl. Studien zur Frömmigkeitsgeschichte des Spätmittelalters (Münster, 1967)
- Tait, M.B. The Brigittine Monastery of Syon (Middlesex) with special reference to its Monastic Usages (unpubl. D.Phil. thesis, Oxford, 1975)
- Techert, M. "Le Plotinisme dans le Système de Jean Scot Érigène", Revue Néoscholastique, 1927, 28-68
- Théry, G. "Chronologie des Oeuvres de Thomas Gallus, Abbé de Verceil", Divus Thomas (Plac.), Vol. XI, 1934, 264-77, 365-85, 469-96  
"Denys au Moyen Âge. L'Aube de la Nuit Obscure", Études Carmélitaines, Vol. XXIII, 1938, 68-74  
"Documents concernant Jean Sarrazin. Reviseur de la Traduction Érigénienne du Corpus Dionysiacum", A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol. XVII, 1950-51, 45-87  
"Études Dionysiennes: I, Hilduin Traducteur de Denys; II, Édition de sa Traduction", Études de Philosophie Médiévale, ed. E. Gilson (Paris 1932 and 1937) t. XVI and XIX  
"Hilduin et la Première Traduction des Écrits du Pseudo-Denys", Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France, Vol. LX, 1923, 23-40  
"Jean Sarrazin. Traducteur de Scot Érigène", Studia Medievalia in Honorem R.-J. Martin (Bruges, 1947) 359-81  
"Les Oeuvres Dionysiennes de Thomas Gallus. L'Explanatio sur la Théologie Mystique", Vie Spirituelle, Supplément, Vol. XXXIII, 1932, 129-54  
"Les Oeuvres Dionysiennes de Thomas Gallus. L'Extractio", Vie Spirituelle, Supplément, Vol. XXXI, 1932, 147-67; Vol. XXXII, 1932, 22-43  
"Recherches pour une Édition Grecque Historique du Pseudo-Denys", The New Scholasticism, Vol. III, No. 4, Oct. 1929, 353-42  
"Scot Érigène. Introduteur de Denys", The New Scholasticism, Vol. VII, No. 2, April 1933, 91-108  
"Scot Érigène. Traducteur de Denys", Bulletin du Cange Union Académique Internationale, Vol. VI, 1931, 185-278  
"Thomas Gallus. Aperçu Biographique", A.H.D.L.M.A., Vol. XII, 1939, 141-208  
"Thomas Gallus et Égide d'Assise. Le Traité De Septem Gradibus Contemplationis", Revue Néoscholastique de Philosophie, Vol. XXXVI, 1934, 180-90  
"Thomas Gallus et les Concordances Bibliques", Beitrag zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters, Supplement, Band III, 1935, 427-46
- Thompson, E.M. The Carthusian Order in England (London, 1930)

- Tomasic, T. "Negative Theology and Subjectivity. An Approach to the Tradition of Pseudo-Dionysius", International Philosophical Quarterly, Vol. 1X, No. 3, Sept. 1969, 406-430
- Underhill, E. Mysticism: A Study in the Nature and Development of Man's Spiritual Consciousness (4th Ed., London, 1912)
- Vacant, A., ed. Dictionnaire de Théologie Catholique (Paris, 1922)
- Völker, W. Kontemplation und Ekstase bei Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita (Wiesbaden, 1958)
- Vanneste, J. Le Mystère de Dieu. Essai sur la Structure Rationnelle de la Doctrine Mystique du Pseudo-Denys l'Aréopagite (Paris, Louvain; Bruges, printed, 1959)
- Walsh, J. "The Cloud of Unknowing", The Month, 1963, 325-36  
"Sapientia Christianorum": The Doctrine of Thomas Gallus Abbot of Vercelli on Contemplation (Unpubl. Dissertatio ad Lauream in Facultate Theologica, Pontifica Universitas Gregoriana, Rome, 1957)  
ed. Spirituality through the Centuries (London, 1964)
- Watson, A.G. The Manuscripts of Henry Savile of Banke (London, 1969)
- Weiss, R. "The Study of Greek in England during the Fourteenth Century", Rinascimento, Vol. 2, 1951, 209-39
- White, B. Review of The Cloud of Unknowing (E.E.T.S. ed.), Modern Language Review, Vol. 44, 1949, 99-103
- White, H.C. The Tudor Books of Private Devotion (Wisconsin, 1951)
- Wilmart, A. "Les Écrits Spirituels des deux Guigues", R.A.M., Vol. V, 1924, 59-79 and 127-58
- Wormald, F. "Some Popular Miniatures and their Rich Relations"; Miscellanea Pro Arte. Festschrift für Hermann Schnitzler (Düsseldorf, 1965) 279-85
- Wright, C.E. Fontes Harleiani (London, 1972)
- de Wulf, M. History of Mediaeval Philosophy (London, 1952)