# Valuing health benefits: the development of a preference-based measure of health for use in the economic evaluation of health care from the SF36 Health Survey 

John Edward Brazier

This thesis has been submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

The work was undertaken in the Department of Economics at The University of Sheffield

vol 2

Date of submission: May 1997
Date of acceptance:

## BEST COPY

## AVAILABLE

## TEXT IN ORIGINAL IS CLOSE TO THE EDGE OF THE PAGE

## TEXT BOUND INTO

## THE SPINE

## Appendix 1

Five preference-based measures

## A1.1: The Quality of Well-Being Scale - Function

| Step | Step definition | Weight |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Mobility Scale (MOB) | -.000 |
| 5 | No limitations for health reasons | -.062 |
| 4 | Did not drive a car, health related; did not ride in a car as usual for age (younger <br> than 15 yr.), health related, and/or did not use public transportation, health <br> related; or had or would have used more help than usual for age to use public <br> transportation, health related; or had or would have used more help than usual for <br> age to use public transportation, health related |  |
| 2 | In hospital, health related | -.090 |
| 4 | Nhysical Activity Scale (PAC) |  |
| 3 | In wheelchair, moved or controlled movement of wheelchair without help from <br> someone else; or had trouble or did not try to lift, stoop, bend over, or use stairs <br> or inclines, health related; and/or had any other physical limitation in walking, or <br> did not try to walk as far as or as fast as others the same age are able, health <br> related | -.060 |
| 1 | In wheelchair, did not move or control the movement of wheelchair without help <br> from someone else, or in bed, chair, or couch for most or all of the day, health <br> related | -.077 |
| 5 | Social Activity Scale (SAC) | -.000 |
| 4 | No limitations for health reasons | -.000 |
| 3 | Limited in other (e.g. recreational) role activity, health related | -.061 |
| 2 | Performed no major role activity, health related, but did perform self-care <br> activities | -.061 |
| 1 | Performed no major role activity, health related, and did not perform or had more <br> help than usual in performance of one or more self-care activities, health related | -.106 |
|  | -0.61 |  |

## A1.1 continued: - symptom and problem complexes

| CPX No. | CPX description | Weight |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Death [not on respondent's card] | -. 727 |
| 2 | Loss of consciousness such as seizure (fits), fainting, or coma (out cold or knocked out) | -. 407 |
| 3 | Burn over large areas of face, body, arms, or legs | -.387 |
| 4 | Pain, bleeding, itching, or discharge (drainage) from sexual organs - does not include normal menstrual bleeding | -. 349 |
| 5 | Trouble learning, remembering, or thinking clearly | - 340 |
| 6. | Any combination of one or more hands, feet, arms, or legs either missing, deformed (crooked), paralysed (unable to move), or broken - includes wearing artificial limbs or braces | -.333 |
| 7 | Pain, stiffness, weakness, numbness, or other discomfort in chest, stomach (including hernia or rupture), side, neck, back, hips, or any joints or hands, feet, arms, or legs | -. 299 |
| 8 | Pain, burning, bleeding, itching, or other difficulty with rectum, bowel movements, or urination (passing water) | -. 292 |
| 9 | Sick or upset stomach, vomiting or loose bowel movement, with or without chills, or aching all over | -. 290 |
| 10 | General tiredness, weakness, or weight loss | -. 259 |
| 11 | Cough, wheezing or shortness of breath, with or without fever, chills, or aching all over | -. 257 |
| 12 | Spells of feeling upset, being depressed, or of crying | -. 257 |
| 13 | Headache, or dizziness, or ringing in ears, or spells of feeling hot, nervous or shaky | -. 244 |
| 14 | Burning or itching rash on large areas of face, body, arms, or legs | -. 240 |
| 15 | Trouble talking, such as lisp, stuttering, hoarseness, or being unable to speak | -. 237 |
| 16 | Pain or discomfort in one or both eyes (such as burning or itching) or any trouble seeing after correction | -. 230 |
| 17 | Overweight for age and height or skin defect of face, body, arms, or legs, such as scars, pimples, warts, bruises or changes in colour | -. 188 |
| 18 | Pain in ear, tooth, jaw, throat, lips, tongue; several missing or crooked permanent teeth - includes wearing bridges or false teeth | -. 170 |
| 19 | Took medication or stayed on a prescribed diet for health reasons | -. 144 |
| 20 | Wore eyeglasses or contact lenses | -. 101 |
| 21 | Breathing smog or unpleasant air | -. 101 |
| 22 | No symptoms or problems [not on respondent's card] | -. 000 |
| 23 | Standard symptom/problem | -. 257 |
| 24 | Trouble sleeping | -. 257 |
| 25 | Intoxication | -. 257 |
| 26 | Problems with sexual interest or performance | -. 257 |
| 27 | Excessive worry or anxiety | -. 257 |

## A 1.2: Rosser's Classification of illness states

| Disability |  | Distress |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| I | No disability | A. | No distress |
| II | Slight social disability | B. | Mild |
| III | Severe social disability and/or slight impairment of performance at work Able to do all housework except very heavy tasks | C. <br> D. | Moderate <br> Severe |
| IV | Choice of work or performance at work very severely limited Housewives and old people able to do light housework only but able to go out shopping |  |  |
| V | Unable to undertake any paid employment Unable to continue any education Old people confined to home except for escorted outings and short walks and unable to do shopping <br> Housewives able only to perform a few simple tasks |  |  |
| VI | Confined to chair of to wheelchair or able to move around in the house only with support from an assistant |  |  |
| VII | Confined to bed |  |  |
| VIII | Unconscious |  |  |

See: Kind, Rosser and Williams: 'Valuation of Quality of Life: Some Psychometric Evidence' in JonesLee, M.W. (editor) The Value of Life and Safety, North Holland, 1982.

## A1.2 continued: - Rosser's Valuation Matrix: All 70 respondents

| Disability <br> Rating | Distress Rating |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | A |  | B |  |  |  | C |  | D |
| II | 1.000 | 0.995 | 0.990 | 0.967 |  |  |  |  |  |
| III | 0.990 | 0.986 | 0.973 | 0.932 |  |  |  |  |  |
| IV | 0.980 | 0.972 | 0.956 | 0.912 |  |  |  |  |  |
| V | 0.964 | 0.956 | 0.942 | 0.870 |  |  |  |  |  |
| VI | 0.946 | 0.935 | 0.900 | 0.700 |  |  |  |  |  |
| VII | 0.875 | 0.845 | 0.680 | 0.000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| VIII | 0.677 | 0.564 | 0.000 | -1.486 |  |  |  |  |  |

Fixed points: $\quad$ Healthy $=1 \quad$ Dead $=0$
See: Kind, Rosser \& Williams: 'Valuation of Quality of Life: Some Psychometric Evidence’ in JonesLee, M.W. (editor)The Value of Life and Safety, North Holland, 1982:

A1.3 HUI-I

| Level | Definition of HRQOL Concept | Preference Weight |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Physical function: mobility and physical activity ( $\mathbf{P})^{2}$ |  |
| P1 | Being able to get around the house, yard, neighbourhood or community WITHOUT HELP from another person; AND having NO limitation in physical ability to lift, walk, run, jump or bend. | 1.00 |
| P2 | Being able to get around the house, yard, neighbourhood or community WITHOUT HELP from another person; AND having SOME limitations in physical ability to lift, walk, run, jump or bend. | 0.91 |
| P3 | Being able to get around the house, yard, neighbourhood or community WITHOUT HELP from another person; AND NEEDING mechanical aids to walk or get around. | 0.81 |
| P4 | NEEDING HELP from another person in order to get around the house, yard, neighbourhood or community; AND having SOME limitations in physical ability to lift, walk, run, jump or bend. | 0.80 |
| P5 | NEEDING HELP from another person in order to get around the house, yard, neighbourhood or community; AND NEEDING mechanical aids to walk or get around. | 0.61 |
| P6 | NEEDING HELP from another person in order to get around the house, yard, neighbourhood or community; AND NOT being able to use or control the arms and legs. | 0.52 |
|  | Role function: self-care and role activity (R) ${ }^{\text {n }}$ |  |
| R1 | Being able to eat, dress, bathe, and go to the toilet WITHOUT HELP; AND having NO limitations when playing, going to school, working or in other activities. | 1.00 |
| R2 | Being able to eat, dress, bathe and go to the toilet WITHOUT HELP; AND having SOME limitations when working, going to school, playing or in other activities. | 0.94 |
| R3 | Being able to eat, dress, bathe and go to the toilet WITHOUT HELP; AND NOT being able to play, attend school or work | 0.77 |
| R4 | NEEDING HELP to eat, dress, bathe or go to the toilet; AND having SOME limitations when working, going to school, playing or in other activities. | 0.75 |
| R5 | NEEDING HELP to eat, dress, bathe or go to the toilet; AND NOT being able to play, attend school or work. | 0.50 |
|  | Social-emotional function: emotional well-being and social activity (S) |  |
| S1 | Being happy and relaxed most or all of the time, AND having an average number of friends and contacts with others. | 1.00 |
| S2 | Being happy and relaxed most or all of the time, AND having very few friends and little contact with others | 0.96 |
| S3 | Being anxious or depressed some or a good bit of time. AND having an average number of friends and contacts with others. | 0.86 |
| S4 | Being anxious or depressed some or a good bit of time, AND having very few friends and little contact with others. |  |
|  | Health problem (H) ${ }^{\text {d }}$ |  |
| H1 | Having no health problem | 1.00 |
| H2 | Having a minor physical deformity or disfigurement such as scars on the face | 0.92 |
| H3 | Needing a hearing aid | 0.91 |
| H4 | Having a medical problem which causes pain or discomfort for a few days in a row every two months | 0.91 |
| H5 | Needing to go to a special school because of trouble learning or remembering things | 0.86 |
| H6 | Having trouble seeing even when wearing glasses | 0.84 |
| H7 | Having trouble being understood by others | 0.83 |
| H8 | Being blind OR deaf OR not able to speak | 0.74 |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ Multiple choices within each description are applied to individuals as appropriate for their age. For example, a 3 year old child is not expected to be able to get around the community without help from another person ${ }^{6}$ Individuals with more than one health problem are classified according to the problem they consider the most serious

## Calculating Formula

The formula gives utility values on the standard scale where healthy is 1.00 and dead is 0.00 . However, since some of the health states were judged to be worse than death, some of the utility values are less than zero. The least utility value, for health state (P6, R5, S4, H8), is 0.21 .

$$
\mathrm{U}=1.42\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{i}} \mathrm{R}_{\mathrm{i}} \mathrm{~S}_{\mathrm{i}} \mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{i}}\right)-0.42
$$

Where $U=$ utility of health state $P_{i}=$ preference weight for the level on mobility and physical activity; $R_{i}=$ preference weight for the level on role function, etc.

|  |
| :---: |
|  |
| Uxample Calculations |
| $\mathrm{U}(\mathrm{P} 1, \mathrm{R} 1, \mathrm{~S} 1, \mathrm{H} 1)=1.42(1.00 \times 1.00 \times 1.00 \times 1.00)-0.42=1.00$ |
| $\mathrm{U}(\mathrm{P} 1, \mathrm{R} 1, \mathrm{~S} 1, \mathrm{H} 4)=1.42(1.00 \times 1.00 \times 1.00 \times 1.91)-0.42=0.87$ |
| $\mathrm{U}(\mathrm{P} 3, \mathrm{R} 2, \mathrm{~S} 1, \mathrm{H} 4)=1.42(0.81 \times 0.94 \times 1.00 \times 1.00)-0.42=0.66$ |
| $\mathrm{U}(\mathrm{P} 1, \mathrm{R} 1, \mathrm{~S} 4, \mathrm{H} 1)=1.42(1.00 \times 0.94 \times 0.77 \times 1.00)-0.42=0.61$ |
| $\mathrm{U}(\mathrm{P} 3, \mathrm{R} 2, \mathrm{~S} 2, \mathrm{H} 5)=1.42(0.81 \times 0.94 \times 0.96 \times 0.86)-0.42=0.47$ |
| $\mathrm{U}(\mathrm{P} 5, \mathrm{R} 4, \mathrm{~S} 3, \mathrm{H} 1)=1.42(0.61 \times 0.75 \times 0.86 \times 1.00)-0.42=0.14$ |
| $\mathrm{U}(\mathrm{P} 6, \mathrm{R} 5, \mathrm{~S} 4, \mathrm{H} 8)=1.42(0.52 \times 0.50 \times 0.77 \times 0.74)-0.42=0.21$ |

Adapted from Drummond et al 1987
a Although the formula produces a single utility value for each health state, the measurements on which the formula is based are not precise. Measurement uncertainty includes both sampling error and measurement imprecision. These are combined in the standard error $S_{x}=0.06$. A sensitivity analysis of $\pm 2 S_{x}$ would give an upper bound utility value of $U+0.12$, not to exceed 1.00 , and a lower bound of $U-0.12$.

## A1.3 continued: HUI-II

| ATTRIBUTE SENSORY | LEVEL <br> 1 <br> 2 <br> 3 <br> 4 | DESCRIPTION <br> Able to see, hear and speak normally for age Requires equipment to see or hear or speak See, hears or speaks with limitations, even with equipment Blind, deaf or mute |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| MOBILITY | 4 | Able to walk, bend, lift, jump and run normally for age Walks, bends, lifts, jumps or runs with some limitations, but does not require help. <br> Requires mechanical equipment (such as canes, crutches, braces or wheelchair) to walk or get around independently. <br> Requires the help of another person to walk or get around and requires mechanical equipment as well <br> Unable to control or use arms and legs |
| EMOTION | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 4 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | Generally happy and free from worry <br> Occasionally fretful, angry, irritable, anxious, depressed or suffering "night terrors." <br> Often fretful, angry, irritable, anxious, depressed or suffering "night terrors" <br> Almost always fretful, angry, irritable, anxious, depressed Extremely fretful, angry, irritable or depressed, usually requiring hospitalisation or psychiatric institutional care. |
| COGNITIVE | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 2 \\ 3 \end{array}$ | Learns and remembers school work normally for age Learns and remembers school work more slowly than classmates, as judged by parents and/or teachers <br> Learns and remembers very slowly and usually requires special educational assistance <br> Unable to learn and remember |
| SELF-CARE | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 2 \\ 3 \end{array}$ | Eats, bathes, dresses and uses the toilet normally for age <br> Eats, bathes, dresses or uses the toilet independently with difficulty Requires mechanical equipment to eat, bathes, dress or use the toilet independently <br> Requires the help of another person to eat, bathe, dress or use the toilet. |
| PAIN | 2 3 4 | Free of pain and discomfort <br> Occasional pain. Discomfort relieved by non-prescription drugs or selfcontrol activity without disruption of normal activities <br> Frequent pain. Discomfort relieved by oral medicines with occasional disruption of normal activities <br> Frequent pain; frequent disruption of normal activities. Discomfort requires prescription narcotics for relief. <br> Severe pain. Pain not relieved by drugs and constantly disrupts normal activities |
| FERTILITY | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 2 \\ 3 \end{array}$ | Able to have children with a fertile spouse Difficulty in having children with a fertile spouse Unable to have children with a fertile spouse |

## Multi-Attribute Value Function (MAVF)

| Sensory |  | Mobility |  | Emotional |  | Cognitive |  | Self-Care |  | Pain |  | Fertility |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| X1 | al | x2 | a2 | x3 | a3 | x4 | a4 | x5 | a5 | x6 | a6 | x7 | a7 |
| 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 |
| 2 | 0.73 | 2 | 0.78 | 2 | 0.69 | 2 | 0.72 | 2 | 0.88 | 2 | 0.77 | 2 | 0.79 |
| 3 | 0.57 | 3 | 0.54 | 3 | 0.51 | 3 | 0.59 | 3 | 0.81 | 3 | 0.54 | 3 | 0.61 |
| 4 | 0.33 | 4 | 0.42 | 4 | 0.40 | 4 | 0.34 | 4 | 0.73 | 4 | 0.34 |  |  |
|  |  | 5 | 0.30 | 5 | 0.27 |  |  |  |  | 5 | 0.17 |  |  |

$v^{*}=1.02\left(\mathrm{a} 1^{*} \mathrm{a} 2\right.$ * $\mathrm{a} 3^{*} \mathrm{a} 4$ * $\left.\mathrm{a} 5^{*} \mathrm{a} 6^{*} \mathrm{a} 7\right)-0.02$
where $v^{*}$ is the value of the health state on a value scale where dead has a value of 0.00 and healthy has a value of 1.00. Because the worst possible health state was judged by respondents as worse than death, it has a negative value of -0.02

Multiple-Attribute Utility Function (MAUF)

| Sensory |  | Mobility |  | Emotional |  | Cognitive |  | Self-Care |  | Pain |  | Fertility |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| xl | bl | x2 | b2 | x3 | b3 | x4 | b4 | x5 | b5 | x6 | b6 | x7 | b7 |
| 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 | 1 | 1.00 |
| 2 | 0.95 | 2 | 0.97 | 2 | 0.93 | 2 | 0.95 | 2 | 0.97 | 2 | 0.97 | 2 | 0.97 |
| 3 | 0.86 | 3 | 0.84 | 3 | 0.81 | 3 | 0.88 | 3 | 0.91 | 3 | 0.85 | 3 | 0.88 |
| 4 | 0.61 | 4 | 0.73 | 4 | 0.70 | 4 | 0.65 | 4 | 0.80 | 4 | 0.64 |  |  |
|  |  | 5 | 0.58 | 5 | 0.53 |  |  |  |  | 5 | 0.38 |  |  |

$u^{*}=1.06(b 1$ * b2 * b3 * b4 * b5 * b6 * b7) - 0.06
where $u^{*}$ is the utility of the health state on a utility scale where dead has a value of 0.00 and healthy has a value of 1.00. Because the worst possible health state was judged by respondents as worse than death, it has a negative value of -0.02

| Attribute | Level | Level description |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Vision | 1 | Able to see well enough to read ordinary newsprint and recognise a friend on the other side of <br> the street, without glasses or contact lenses <br> Able to see well enough to read ordinary newsprint and recognise a friend on the other side of <br> the street, but with glasses or contact lenses <br> Able to read ordinary newsprint with or without glasses but unable to recognise a friend on the <br> other side of the street, even with glasses or contact lenses <br> Able to recognise a friend on the other side of the street with or without glasses but unable to <br> read ordinary newsprint, even with glasses or contact lenses <br> Unable to read ordinary newsprint and unable to recognise a friend on the other side of the <br> street, even with glasses or contact lenses <br> Unable to see at all |
|  | 5 | 2 |


|  |  | independent even with use of special tools) |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Emotion | 1 | Happy and interested in life |
|  | 2 | Somewhat happy |
|  | 3 | Somewhat unhappy |
|  | 4 | Very unhappy |
|  | 5 | So unhappy that life is not worthwhile |

Contd.


Table II Predictive validity of multi-attribute value function (MAVF) and multi-attribute utility function (MAUF) for the Health Utilities Index Mark II system.[51]. The scores in this table are on all the worst-healthy scale (the scale where the worst possible health state has a score that would be obtained from table I, which is on the dead-to-healthy scale

| MAVF ( $\mathrm{n}=203$ ) |  |  |  | MAUF ( $\mathrm{n}=194$ ) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| validation state ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | value predicted by model (P) | measured <br> value (M) | difference (deviation) ( $\mathrm{P}-\mathrm{M}$ ) | Validation state ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | utility predicted by model (P) | measured utility (M) | difference (deviation) (P - M) |
| Interior 1 | 0.29 | 0.34 | -0.05 | Mobility $3 / 5$ | 0.84 | 0.78 | 0.06 |
| Interior 2 | 0.37 | 0.41 | -0.04 | Fertility 3/3 | 0.89 | 0.88 | 0.01 |
| Interior 3 | 0.06 | 0.21 | -0.15 | Interior 1 | 0.68 | 0.76 | -0.08 |
| Interior 4 | 0.01 | 0.09 | -0.08 | Interior 3 | 0.51 | 0.51 | 0.00 |
| Mean diffe | ence (devia |  | -0.080 |  |  |  | -0.002 |
| Standard d | viation ${ }^{\text {b }}$ |  | 0.105 |  |  |  | 0.058 |
| a Interior 1 health state is $1,4,2,1,1,1,1$; Interior 2 health state is $1,1,3,2,1,1,1$; Interior 3 health state is $3,3,2,3,3,2,2$; Interior 4 health state is $3,3,4,4,4,4,3$; Mobility $3 / 5$ health state is $1,3,1,1,1,1,1$. Fertility $3 / 3$ health state is $1,1,1,1,1,1,3$. See section 4.2 for details of the notation. <br> $b$ The standard deviation of the prediction error is $\sqrt{ }\left[\Sigma d^{2} /(n-1)\right]$, where $d=$ difference (deviation) and $n=4$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## A1.4: 15D. 2

Question $1 \quad$ Mobility

1 ( ) I am able to walk normally (without difficulty) indoors, outdoors and on stairs
2 ( ) I am able to walk without difficulty indoors, but outdoors and/or on stairs I have slight difficulties
3 ( ) I am able to walk without help indoors (with or without an appliance), but outdoors and/or on stairs only with considerable difficulty or with help from others.
4 ( ) I am able to walk indoors only with help from others
5 ( ) I am completely bed-ridden and unable to move about

## Question $2 \quad$ Vision

1 ( ) I see normally, i.e. I can read newspapers and TV text without difficulty (with or without glasses)
2 ( ) I can read papers and/or TV text with slight difficulty (with or without glasses).
3 ( ) I can read papers and/or TV text with considerable difficulty (with or without glasses).
4

5
( ) I cannot read papers or TV text either with glasses or without, but I can see enough to walk about without guidance
5 ( ) I cannot see enough to walk about without a guide, i.e. I am almost or completely blind

## Question $3 \quad$ Hearing

1 ( ) I can hear normally, i.e. normal speech (with or without a hearing aid).
2 ( ) I hear normal speech with a little difficulty
3 ( ) I hear normal speech with considerable difficulty; in conversation I need voices to be louder than normal
4 ( ) I hear even loud voices poorly; I am almost deaf
5 ( ) I am completely deaf

## Question 4 Breathing

1 ( ) I am able to breathe normally, i.e. with no shortness of breath or other breathing difficulty

## Question 5

## Sleeping

1 ( ) I am able to sleep normally, i.e. I have no problems with sleeping
( ) I have slight problems with sleeping, e.g. difficulty in falling asleep, or sometimes waking at night
( ) I have moderate problems with sleeping, e.g. disturbed sleep, or feeling I have not slept enough
( ) I have great problems with sleeping, e.g. having to use sleeping pills often or routinely, or usually waking at night and/or too early in the morning
( ) I suffer severe sleeplessness, e.g. sleep is almost impossible even with full use of sleeping pills, or staying awake most of the night

Question 6 Eating

## Question $7 \quad$ Speech

1 ( ) I am able to speak normally, i.e. clearly, audibly and fluently
2 ( ) I have slight speech difficulties, e.g. occasional fumbling for words, mumbling, or changes of pitch
3 ( ) I can make myself understood, but my speech is e.g. disjointed, faltering, stuttering or stammering
( ) Most people have great difficulty understanding my speech
( ) I can only make myself understood by gestures

## Question $8 \quad$ Elimination

1 ( ) My bladder and bowel work normally and without problems
2 ( ) I have slight problems with my bladder and/or bowel function, e.g. difficulties with urination, or loose or hard bowels
3 ( ) I have marked problems with my bladder and/or bowel function, e.g. occasional 'accidents', or severe constipation or diarrhoea
4 ( ) I have serious problems with my bladder an/or bowel function, e.g. routine 'accidents', or need of catheterization or enemas
5 ( ) I have no control over my bladder and/or bowel function

## Question $9 \quad$ Usual activities

1 ( ) I am able to perform my usual activities (e.g. employment, studying, housework, free-time activities) without difficulty
( ) I am able to perform my usual activities slightly less effectively or with minor difficulty
( ) I am able to perform my usual activities much less effectively, with considerable difficulty, or not completely
( ) I can only manage a small proportion of my previously usual activities
( ) I am unable to manage any of my previously usual activities

## Question $10 \quad$ Mental function

1 ( ) I am able to think clearly and logically, and my memory functions well
2 ( ) I have slight difficulties in thinking clearly and logically, or my memory sometimes fails me
3 ( ) I have marked difficulties in thinking clearly and logically, or my memory is somewhat impaired
4

5

## Question 11

1 ( ) I have no physical discomfort or symptoms, e.g. pain, ache, nausea, itching etc.
2 ( ) I have mild physical discomfort or symptoms, e.g. pain, ache, nausea, itching etc.
3 ( ) I have marked physical discomfort or symptoms, e.g. pain, ache, nausea, itching etc.
4 ( ) I have unbearable physical discomfort or symptoms e.g. pain, ache, nausea, itching etc.

## Question 12

 Depression1 ( ) I do not feel at all sad, melancholic or depressed
2 ( ) I feel slightly sad, melancholic or depressed
3 ( ) I feel moderately sad, melancholic or depressed.
4 ( ) I feel extremely sad, melancholic or depressed.

## Question 13 Distress

1 ( ) I do not feel at all anxious, stressed or nervous
2 ( ) I feel slightly anxious, stressed or nervous
3 ( ) I feel moderately anxious, stressed or nervous
4 ( ) I feel very anxious, stressed or nervous
5 ( ) I feel extremely anxious, stressed or nervous

## Question $14 \quad$ Vitality

1 ( ) I feel healthy and energetic
2 ( ) I feel slightly weary, tired or feeble
3 ( ) I feel moderately weary, tired or feeble
4 ( ) I feel very weary, tired or feeble, almost exhausted
5 ( ) I feel extremely weary, tired or feeble, totally exhausted
Question 15 Sexual activity
( ) My state of health has no adverse effect on my sexual activity
( ) My state of health has a slight effect on my sexual activity
( ) My state of health has a considerable effect on my sexual activity
( ) My state of health makes sexual activity almost impossible
( ) My state of health makes sexual activity impossible

## A1.5: The EuroQol Descriptive System-five dimensions (EQ-5D)

| Mobility |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 1. | No problems walking about |
| 2. | Some problems walking about <br> 3. |
| Confined to bed |  |

## Coefficients for TTO tariffs

| DIMENSION | COEFFICIENT |
| :--- | :---: |
| Constant (a) | 0.081 |
| Mobility | 0.069 |
| level 2 | 0.314 |
| level 3 |  |
| Self-care | 0.104 |
| level 2 | 0.214 |
| level 3 | 0.036 |
| Usual activity | 0.094 |
| level 2 | 0.123 |
| level 3 | 0.386 |
| Pain/discomfort |  |
| level 2 | 0.071 |
| level 3 | 0.236 |
| Anxiety/depression | 0.269 |
| level 2 | 0.46 |
| level 3 |  |
| N3 |  |
| adjusted r |  |

## Appendix 2

UK Short Form 36 (SF-36) Health Survey

The following questions ask you about your health, how you feel and how well you are able to do your usual activities.

If you are unsure how to answer a question, please give the best answer you can.

1. In general, would you say your health is:
(tick one)

|  |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Excellent $\qquad$ <br> Very good $\qquad$ O |  |
|  | Good................................. 0 |
|  | Fair ................................... 0 |
|  | Poo |

2. Compared to one year ago, how would you rate your health in
general now?
(tick one)
Much better than one year ago ............................... O
Somewhat better than one year ago....................... O
About the same ........................................................ O
Somewhat worse now than one year ago............... ○
Much worse now than one year ago ....................... O

## HEALTH AND DAILY ACTIVITIES

3. The following questions are about activities that you might do during a typical day. Does your health limit you in these activities? If so, how much?
(circle one number on each line)

| ACTIVITIES | Yes, limited a lot | Yes, limited a little | No, not limited at all |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| a. Vigorous activities, such as running, lifting heavy objects, participating in strenuous sports | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| b. Moderate activities, such as moving a table, pushing a vacuum cleaner, bowling or playing golf | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| c. Lifting or carrying groceries | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| d. Climbing several flights of stairs | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| e. Climbing one flight of stairs | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| f. Bending, kneeling or stooping | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| g. Walking more than a mile | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| h. Walking half a mile | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| i. Walking $\mathbf{1 0 0}$ yards | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| j. Bathing and dressing yourself | 1 | 2 | 3 |

4. During the past 4 weeks, have you had any of the following problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health?
(circle one number on each line)

|  | YES | NO |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| a. Cut down on the amount of time you spent on work or other activities | 1 | 2 |
| b. Accomplished less than you would like | 1 | 2 |
| c. Were limited in the kind of work or other activities | 1 | 2 |
| d. Had difficulty in performing the work or other activities (e.g. it took extra effort) | 1 | 2 |

5. During the past 4 weeks, have you had any of the following problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of any emotional problems (such as feeling depressed or anxious)?
(circle one number on each line)

|  | YES | NO |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| a. Cut down on the amount of time you spent on work or other activities | 1 | 2 |
| b. Accomplished less than you would like | 1 | 2 |
| c. Didn't do work or other activities as carefully as usual | 1 | 2 |

6. During the past 4 weeks, to what extent have your physical health or emotional problems interfered with your normal social activities with family, friends, neighbours or groups?
(circle one number)
Not at all ..... 1
Slightly ..... 2
Moderately ..... 3
Quite a bit ..... 4
Extremely ..... 5
7. How much bodily pain have you had during the past 4 weeks?(circle one number)
None ..... 1
Very mild ..... 2
Mild ..... 3
Moderate ..... 4
Severe. ..... 5
Very severe ..... 6
8. During the past 4 weeks, how much did pain interfere with your normal work (including work both outside the home and housework)?
(circle one number)
Not at all ..... 1
A little bit ..... 2
Moderately ..... 3
Quite a bit ..... 4
Extremely ..... 5

## YOUR FEELINGS

9. These questions are about how you feel and how things have been with you during the past 4 weeks. (For each question, please indicate the one answer that comes closest to the way you have been feeling.)
(circle one number on each line)

| How much of the time during the past 4 weeks: | All of the time | Most of the time | A good bit of the time | Some of the time | A little of the time | None of the time |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| a. Did you feel full of life? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| b. Have you been a very nervous person? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| c. Have you felt so down in the dumps that nothing could cheer you up? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| d. Have you felt calm and peaceful? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| e. Did you have a lot of energy? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| f. Have you felt downhearted and low? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| g. Did you feel worn-out? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| h. Have you been a happy person? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| i. Did you feel tired? | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| j. Has your health limited your social activities (like visiting friends or close relatives) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

## HEALTH IN GENERAL

10. Please choose the answer that best describes how true or false each of the following statements is for you.
(circle one number on each line)

|  | Definitely <br> true | Mostly <br> true | Not <br> sure | Mostly <br> false | Definitely <br> false |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| a. I seem to get ill |  |  |  |  |  |
| more easily than <br> other people | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| b. I am as healthy as <br> anybody I know | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| c.I expect my health <br> to get worse$\mathbf{c}^{\text {d. My health is }}$excellent | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |

## Appendix 3

Scoring system for the SF-36

## SF-36 SCORING SYSTEM ${ }^{1}$

The instructions given below are for scoring the eight dimensions of the UK SF-36 reproduced in this manual. They show;

- which items compose each dimension;
- the coding system for each item. Important note: not all items in a domain are coded in the same manner. For example, in the mental health dimension items 9d and 9h are coded in the reverse manner to $9 \mathrm{~b}, 9 \mathrm{c}$ and 9 f ;
- the scoring algorithms for each dimension.

If you are interested in creating the summary scale scores (the Physical Component Summary (PCS) and the Mental Component Summary (MCS)) from UK SF-36 data then please see page 39.

## 1. Coding items:

## Physical function

## Role limitation due to physical problems

$\mathbf{4 a}, \mathbf{4 b}, \mathbf{4 c}, \mathbf{4 d}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& Y e s=0 \\
& \mathrm{No}=1
\end{aligned}
$$

## Role limitation due to emotional problems

5a, 5b, 5c

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathrm{Yes}=0 \\
& \mathrm{No}=1
\end{aligned}
$$

[^0]
## Social functioning

6
Not at all $=5$
Slightly $=4$
Moderately $=3$
Quite abit $=2$
Extremely $=1$
9j
All of the time $=1$
Most of the time $=2$
A good bit of the time $=4$
A little bit of the time $=5$
None of the time $=6$

## Mental health

9b, 9c, 9f

9d, 9h

## Energy/vitality

9a, 9e

9g, 9 I
All of the time $=6$
Most of the time $=5$
A good bit of the time $=4$
Some of the time $=3$
A little of the time $=2$
None of the time $=1$
All of the time $=1$
Most of the time $=2$
A good bit of the time $=3$
Some of the time $=4$
A little of the time $=5$
None of the time $=6$

## Pain

7
None $=6$
Very mild = 5
Mild $=4$
Moderate $=3$
Severe $=2$
Very severe $=1$

8
Not at all $=5$
A little bit $=4$
Moderately $=3$
Quite a bit = 2
Extremely $=1$

## General health Perception

1
Excellent $=5$
Very good $=4.4$
Good $=3.4$
Fair $=2$
Poor $=1$

10a, 10c
Definitely true $=5$
Mostly true $=2$
Not sure $=3$
Mostly false $=4$
Definitely false $=5$

10b, 10d
Definitely true $=5$
Mostly true $=4$
Not sure $=3$
Mostly false = 2
Definitely false $=1$

## Change in health

2
Much better now $=5$
Somewhat better $=4$
About the same $=3$
Somewhat worse $=1$
Much worse $=1$

## 2. Calculating dimension scores

## Physical function (PF)

$P F=3 a+3 b+3 c+3 d+3 e+3 f+3 g+3 h+3 I+3 j$
Physical function score $=((\mathrm{PF}-10) / 10)^{*} 100$

## Role limitation due to physical problems (RP)

$R P=4 a+4 b+4 c+4 d$
Role limitation due to physical problems score $=(\mathrm{RP} / 4)^{*} 100$

## Role limitation due to emotional problems (EP)

$R E=5 a+5 b+5 c$
Role limitations due to emotional problems score $=(\mathrm{RE} / 3)^{*} 100$

## Social functioning (SF)

$\mathrm{SC}=6+9 \mathrm{j}$
Social functioning score $=((\mathrm{SC}-2) / 9)^{*} 100$

## Mental health (MH)

$M H=9 b+9 c+9 d+9 f+9 h$
Mental health score $=((\mathrm{MH}-5) / 25)^{*} 100$

## Energy/vitality (EV)

$E V=9 a+9 e+9 g+9 I$
Energy/vitality score $=((\mathrm{EV}-4) / 20)^{*} 100$

## Pain (P)

$\mathrm{P}=7+8$
Pain $=((\mathrm{p}-2) / 9)^{*} 100$

## General health Perception (GHP)

$H P=1+10 a+10 b+10 c+10 d$
General health perceptions $=((\mathrm{GHP}-5) / 20)^{*} 100$

## Change in health (CH)

$\mathrm{CH}=2$
Change in health score $=((\mathrm{CH}-1) / 4)^{*} 100$
Notes: (see over)

Notes:

This scoring system is for use with the SF-36, as reproduced in this manual.
Do not present CH data in terms of means and standard deviations.
Where items are missing from multi-item scales the developers suggest an estimate may be calculated. They suggest that in those instances where over half the items are completed missing values can be imputed as the average of completed items. We have not employed this strategy in the data presented in this report. We strongly advise that users do not impute data in small data sets.

Ownership of this report does not constitute or imply a right to use this questionnaire. Potential users must inform the Medical Outcomes Trust (see page 43).

## Appendix 4

Valuation Survey questionnaire booklet

UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD MEDICAL SCHOOL

Medical Care Research Unit Department of General Practice

## VALUATION OF HEALTH AND ILL HEALTH

We are trying to find out how people value health. Please answer every question as best you can, but don't take too fong over each one.

## Ground information

How old are you? years

| Are you | Please tick <br> male <br> female |
| :--- | ---: |
| Do you do any paid work as an employee or | Yes, full-time |
| self employed? | Yes, part-time |

If "YES", what is (or was) the name and title of your main job?
Occupation $\qquad$ Industry $\qquad$
looking for work?
l NO ", are you
permanently unable to work?
wholly retired?
full-time student?

If other please specify $\qquad$

How old were you when you completed your full-time education?
$\qquad$ years

In general would you say your health is:


Do you have any long-standing illness, disability or infirmity?
(long-standing means anything that has troubled you over a period of time or that is likely to affect you over a period of time).

If "YES", does this limit your activities in any way?


## B. YOUR OWN HEALTH TODAY

Please tick one box in each groun to show which statements best describe you health state today.

## Physical functioning

Level
Please tick
one in
each group

1. Your health does not limit you in vigorous activities (e.g. running, lifting heavy objects, participating in strenuous sports).
2. Your health limits you in vigorous activities (e.g. running, lifting heavy objects, participating in strenuous sports).
3. Your health limits you in climbing several flights of stairs or in walking more than a mile.
4. Your health limits you in climbing one flight of stairs or in walking half a mile.
5. Your health limits you in walking 100 yards.
6. Your health limits you in bathing and dressing yourself.

## Role limitation

Level

1. You have no problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health or any emotional problems.
2. You have problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health or any emotional problems.

## Social functioning

## Level

1. Your physical health or emotional problems do not interfere at all with your normal social activities.
2. Your physical health or emotional problems interfere slightly with your normal social activities.
3. Your physical health or emotional problems interfere moderately with your normal social activities
4. Your physical health or emotional problems interfere quite a bit with your normal social activities.
5. Your physical health or emotional problems interfere extremely with your normal social activities.

Level

1. You have no bodily pain.
2. You have very mild bodily pain.
3. You have mild bodily pain.
4. You have moderate bodily pain.
5. You have severe bodily pain.
6. You have very severe bodily pain.

## Mental health

Level

1. You feel tense or downhearted and low a little or none of the time.
2. You feel tense or downhearted and low some of the time.
3. You feel tense or downhearted and low a good bit of the time.
4. You feel tense or downhearted and low most of the time.
5. You feel tense or downhearted and low all of the time.

Vitality
Level

1. You feel worn out or tired a little or none of the time.
2. You feel worn out or tired some of the time
3. You feel worn out or tired a good bit of the time.
4. You feel worn out or tired most of the time.
5. You feel worn out or tired all of the time.

The health states which we will be using in the rest of this questionnaire will all be made up from these six groups of statements.

## C. RANKING AND RATING EXERCISE

Attached to this questionnaire are two envelopes. Please open the envelope marked I and remove the contents. There should be six cards, each describing a state of health. The cards are in no particular order. You will see that one card has 'unconsciousness, followed shortly by death' written on it. Rank this card along with the others.

Please read through each card carefully in your own time.
When you do this, imagine you yourself are in these states and that they would last for 10 years without any change.

Please sort the cards into an order so that the one you think is the best health state is at the top and the one you think is the worst is at the bottom. If you think any are the same, you can place them alongside each other.

When you have ranked them, please list them below in order of severity, starting with the least severe at the top. You may rank two or more health states equally.

We would now like you to indicate how good or bad you think each health state on the scale opposite.

Rating exercise I


## Ranking Exercise II

Please rank the health states in Envelope II, and list them below in order of severity, starting with 1 for the least severe. You may rank two or more health states equally.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

Now indicate how good or bad you think each health state on the scale opposite.


## D. STANDARD GAMBLE EXERCISES

You are going to be asked to make choices between the health states you have just ranked. One choice will involve a risk and the other will be a certainty.

The choice in the upper box describes a state of health. The first choice is fairly simple because it describes only one state of health, which is certain to occur. If something is certain, it is equal to $100 \%$ chance or probability.

The second choice is more complicated because if it is chosen there are two possible results. The chances of each of these results occurring will be shown to you.

For example, let us assume you have suffered an illness. The doctor explains to you that you have the two choices shown opposite: one choice is to stay in the health state shown in the upper box and the second choice is a treatment which may succeed or fail. The first choice means remaining in a state of illhealth for certain, whereas the treatment choice is risky, since the treatment doesn't always work. If the treatment does work, you will be in the health state shown in the lower left hand box. But if the treatment does not work, your health will deteriorate and may result in death (as shown in this example).

For each choice there are a range of chances of a successful treatment (from 99 in 100 down to 10 in 100) and corresponding chances of dying from the treatment ( 1 in 100 up to 90 in 100). These are shown on the left hand side of the facing page.

In the following exercises, the health states in the upper boxes show the CERTAIN outcome of NOT having treatment, but differ in every exercise.

The health states in the lower two boxes differ in only a selection of exercises.
From now on, imagine that you yourself are in these states, and that they would last for 10 years without change.
N.B. Remember, there are no right or wrong answers - we are asking you to make value judgements.

Suppose you were in a state of ill-health shown immediately below. The doctor tells you that you will remain in this condition for ten years unless you have treatment. However, this treatment does not have a certain outcome. If it succeeds, it will result in a better state of health. If it fails, you will shortly die. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

E
Your health limits you in climbing one flight of
stairs or in walking half a mile.
You have problems with your work or other
regular daily activitles as a result of your
physical health or any emotional problems.
Your physical health or emotional problems
interfere quite a bit with your normal social
activities.
You have moderate bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low most of
the time.

You feel worn out or tired most of the time.

## OR

## IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

- health does not limit you in vigorous cities (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, Nicipating in strenuous sports).
thave no problems with your work or other Hlar daily actlvities as a result of your aical health or any emotional problems.

1 physical health or emotional problems do interfere at all with your normal social Alties.

U have no bodily pain.
feel tense or downhearted and low a little or of the time.

4 feel worn out or tired alittle or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
| Unconsciousness followed shortly by death |
|  |

Suppose you were in a state of ill-health shown immediately below. The doctor tells you that you will remain in this condition for ten years unless you have treatment. However, this treatment does not have a certain outcome. If it succeeds, it will result in a better state of health. If it fails, you will shortly die. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

| Q |
| :--- |
| Your heaith limits you in climbing several flights |
| of stairs or in walking more than a mile. |
| You have problems with your work or other |
| regular daily activities as a result of your |
| physical health or any emotional problems. |
| Your physical health or emotional problems |
| interfere moderately with your normal social |
| activities. |
| You have moderate bodily pain. |
| You feel tense or downhearted and low some of |
| the time. |
| You feel worn out or tired some of the time. |

## OR

IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

health does not limit you in vigorous thes (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, elpating in strenuous sports).

Rave no problems with your work or other far daily actvities as a result of your cal health or any emotional problems.
physical health or emotional problems do nerfere at all with your normal social thes.

Tave no bodily pain.
Teel tense or downhearted and low alittle or of the time.

Peel worn out or tired a little or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS


Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most
difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

Qutcome of treatment:
Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

| $\quad$ P |
| :--- |
| Your health does not limit you in vigorous |
| activities (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, |
| participating in strenuous sports). |
| You have no problems with your work or other |
| regular daily activities as a result of your |
| physical health or any emotional problems. |
| Your physical health or emotional problems do |
| not interfere at all with your normal social |
| activities. |
| You have mild bodily pain. |
| You feel tense or downhearted and low a little or |
| none of the time. |
| You feel worn out or tired a little or none of the |
| time. |

## OR

IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

Wealth does not limit you in vigorous les (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, pating in strenuous sports).

We no problems with your work or other - daily activities as a result of your al health or any emotional problems.

Whysical health or emotional problems do terfere at all with your normal social Hes.
vene bodily pain.
el tense or downhearted and low alittle or the time.
el worn out or tired alittle or none of the

## IF TREATMENT FAILS

## M

Unconsciousness followed shortly by death

Please put a $\checkmark$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

## Outcome of treatment:

Chances of success ${ }^{\text {Chances of failure }}$

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100^{*}$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100^{*}$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

## S

Your health limits you in bathing and dressing yourself.

You have problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health or any emotional problems.

Your physical health or emotional problems interfere quite a bit with your normal social activities.

You have moderate bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low alittle or none of the time.

You feel worn out or tired all of the time.

## OR

IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

Palth does not limit you in vigorous eg. running, lifting heavy objects, Dating in strenuous sports).
ve no problems with your work or other - daily activities as a result of your al health or any emotional problems.
tyysical health or emotional problems de erfere at all with your normal social es.
ve ne bodily pain.
tense or downhearted and low alittle or the time.
worn out or tired alittle or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
| Unconsciousness followed shortly by death |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most
difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

## Outcome of treatment:

Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

FOR CERTAIN
Your health limits you in climbing one flight of
stairs or in walking half a mile.
You have problems with your work or other
regular daily activities as a result of your
physical health or any emotional problems.
Your physical health or emotional problems
interfere slightly with your normal social
activities.
You have moderate bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low a good
bit of the time.
You feel worn out or tired most of the time.

## OR

## IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

Health does not limit you in vigorous tes (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, Apating in strenuous sports).
ne no problems with your work or other
daily actuvities as a result of your Cal health or any emotional problems.

Physical health or emotional problems do terfere at all with your normal social Nes.

Mave no bodily pain.
vel tense or downhearted and low a little or the time.
el worn out or tired alittle or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS


Please put a $\checkmark$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

## Qutcome of treatment:

Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100^{\star}$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100^{\star}$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

## $u$

Your health limits you in vigorous activities (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, participating in strenuous sports).

You have problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health or any emotional problems.

Your physical health or emotional problems interfere slightly with your normal social activities.

You have moderate bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low a good bit of the time.

You feel worn out or tired some of the time.

## OR

## 0

vealth does not limit you in vigorous
les (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, lpating in strenuous sports).

Ave no problems with your work or other
daily activities as a result of your tal health or any emotional problems.

Nysical health or emotional problems do lerfere at all with your normal social Ves.
-ve no bodily pain.
Qel tense or downhearted and low alittle or Nine time.

Sel worn out or tired alittle or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
| Unconsciousness followed shortly by death |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most
difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

## Outcome of treatment:

Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

## v

Your health limits you in walking 100 yards.
You have problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health or any emotional problems.

Your physical health or emotional problems interfere extremely with your normal social activities.

You have no bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low a little or none of the time.

You feel worn out or tired some of the time.

## OR

IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

Thealth does not limit you in vigorous les (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, Clpating in strenuous sports).
have no problems with your work or other Mar daily activities as a result of your Hcal health or any emotional problems.

Physical health or emotional problems do merfere at all with your normal social tries.

I have no bodily pain.
Ifeel tense or downhearted and low a little or Rof the time.

Ifeel worn out or tired a little or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

Qutcome of treatment:
Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100 *$ | 0 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e ~ d e a t h ~ p r e f e r r e d ~$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

| W |
| :--- |
| Your health does not limit you in vigorous |
| activities (eg. running, Ifting heavy objects, |
| participating in strenuous sports). |
| You have problems with your work or other |
| regular daily activities as a result of your |
| physical health or any emotional problems. |
| Your physical health or emotional problems |
| interfere quite a bit with your normal social |
| activities. |
| You have no bodily pain. |
| You feel tense or downhearted and low most of |
| the time. |
| You feel worn out or tired a good bit of the time. |

## OR

## IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

health does not limit you in vigorous dtles (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, (cipating in strenuous sports).

Thave ne problems with your work or other * Har dally activities as a result of your sical health or any emotional problems.
physical health or emotional problems do Interfere at all with your normal social witles.

Whave no bodily pain.
Peel tense or downhearted and low alittle or eof ine time.

Feel worn out or tired alittleor none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

Outcome of treatment:
Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100^{\star}$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{\star}$ | 1 | in | $100^{\star}$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

## X

Your health limits you in vigorous activities (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, participating in strenuous sports).

You have problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health or any emotional problems.

Your physical health or emotional problems interfere quite a bit with your normal social activities.

You have very mild bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low most of the time.

You feel worn out or tired most of the time.

## OR

## IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

Wealth does not limit you in vigorous les (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, Epating in strenuous sports).
have no problems with your work or other har daily activities as a result of your 4cal health or any emotional problems.
physical health or emotional problems do herfere at all with your normal social whes.
have no bodily pain.
feel tense or downhearted and low a little or Lof the time.

Ifeel worn out or tired a little or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

## Qutcome of treatment:

Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

Y
Your health limits you in bathing and dressing
yourself.
You have problems with your work or other
regular daily activities as a result of your
physical health or any emotional problems.
Your physical health or emotional problems
interfere extremely with your normal social
activities.
You have severe bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low all of the
time.
You feel worn out or tired all of the time.

## OR

## IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

Whealth does not limit you in vigorous thes (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, (cipating in strenuous sports).

Thave no problems with your work or other lar dally activities as a result of your fical health or any emotional problems.

Physical health or emotional problems do fiterfere at all with your normal social witles.
dave ne bodily pain.
feel tense or downhearted and low a little or ef the time.
feel worn out or tired alittle or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
| Unconsciousness followed shortly by death |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

Outcome of treatment:
Chances of success

| 100 | in | Chances of failure |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100^{*}$ |  |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |  |
| Immediate death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in a different state of ill-health for ten years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

R
Your health limits you in climbing several flights
of stairs or in walking more than a mile.
You have no problems with your work or other
regular daily activities as a result of your
physical health or any emotional problems.
Your physical health or emotional problems do
not interfere at all with your normal social
activities.
You have very mild bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low alittle or
none of the time.
You feel worn out or tired a little or none of the
time.

## OR

## IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

health does not limit you in vigorous thes (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, cipating in strenuous sports).
have $\underline{0}$ problems with your work or other lar daily activities as a result of your tical health or any emotional problems.

Physical health or emotional problems do merfere at all with your normal social vities.
thave no bodily pain.
teel tense or downhearted and low a little or of the time.
feel worn out or tired alittle or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| $M$ |
| :---: |
| Unconsclousness followed shortly by death |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most
difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

## Qutcome of treatment:

Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100^{*}$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e ~ d e a t h ~ p r e f e r r e d ~$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

This time, you are in the same state of ill-health as before (i.e. R) but the outcome of treatment failure has changed. Instead of dying, you will end up in the condition described below (lie. S). The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

| Your health limits you in climbing several flights |
| :--- |
| of stairs or in walking more than a mile. |
| You have no problems with your work or other |
| regular daily activities as a result of your |
| physical health or any emotional problems. |
| Your physical health or emotional problems do |
| not interfere at all with your normal social |
| activities. |
| You have very mild bodily pain. |
| You feel tense or downhearted and low alittle or |
| none of the time. |
| You feel worn out or tired a little or none of the |
| time. |

## OR

## 0

health does not limit you in vigorous les (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, Elpating in strenuous sports).
fave no problems with your work or other ar dally activities as a result of your cal health or any emotional problems.

Physical health or emotional problems do Merfere at all with your normal social ines.

## Shave no bodily pain.

Heel tense or downhearted and low a little or of the time.
feel worn out or tired a little or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

## S

Your health limits you in bathing and dressing yourself.

You have problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health or any emotional problems.

Your physical health or emotional problems interfere quite a bit with your normal social activities.

You have moderate bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low alitule or none of the time.

You feel worn out or tired all of the time.

Please put a $\checkmark$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

Qutcome of treatment:
Chances of success Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100^{*}$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100^{*}$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e$ | death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again but the outcome of treatment failure has changed again. The choice is therefore between:

FOR CERTAIN

| T T |
| :--- |
| Your health limits you in climbing one flight of |
| stairs or in walking half a mile. |
| You have problems with your work or other |
| regular daily activities as a result of your |
| physical health or any emotional problems. |
| Your physical health or emotional problems |
| interfere slightly with your normal social |
| activities. |
| You have moderate bodily pain. |
| You feel tense or downhearted and low a good |
| bit of the time. |
| You feel worn out or tired most of the time. |

## OR

## If TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

## 0

Health does not limit you in vigorous leg (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, dpating in strenuous sports).

Tve no problems with your work or other dally actvities as a result of your cal health or any emotional problems.

Physical health or emotional problems do perfere at all with your normal social
(ies.
Theve no bodily pain.
pel tense or downhearted and low allttle or lof the time.

Wel worn out or tired alittle or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| Y |
| :--- |
| Your health limits you in bathing and dressing |
| yourself. |
| You have problems with your work or other |
| regular daily activities as a result of your |
| physical health or any emotional problems. |
| Your physical health or emotional problems |
| interfere extremely with your normal social |
| activities. |
| You have severe bodily pain. |
| You feel tense or downhearted and low all of the |
| time. |
| You feel worn out or tired all of the time. |

Please put a $\checkmark$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

Qutcome of treatment:
Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100 *$ | 0 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100^{*}$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| $1 m m e d i a t e ~ d e a t h ~ p r e f e r r e d ~$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Now do the same thing again, but this time you will remain in the state of ill-health for TWO years unless you have treatment. The choice is therefore between:

## FOR CERTAIN

Q
Your health limits you in climbing several flights
of stairs or in walking more than a mile.
You have problems with your work or other
reguiar daily activities as a result of your
physical health or any emotional problems.
Your physical health or emotional problems
interfere moderately with your normal social
activities.
You have moderate bodily pain.
You feel tense or downhearted and low some of
the time.
You feel worn out or tired some of the time.
OR

IF TREATMENT SUCCEEDS

0
health does not limit you in vigorous tles (eg. running, lifting heavy objects, cipating in strenuous sports).
have no problems with your work or other lar daily activities as a result of your Itcal health or any emotional problems.

Physical health or emotional problems do terfere at all with your normal social wities.
have no bodily pain.
feel tense or downhearted and low a little or eof the time.
feel worn out or tired a little or none of the

IF TREATMENT FAILS

| M |
| :---: |
| Unconsciousness followed shortly by death |
|  |

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would CHOOSE the risky treatment.

Please put an $X$ against all cases where you are CONFIDENT that you would REJECT the treatment and accept the certain health state.

Please put a = against the case where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

Outcome of treatment:
Chances of success $\mid$ Chances of failure

| 100 | in | $100^{*}$ | 0 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 99 | in | $100^{*}$ | 1 | in | $100 *$ |  |
| 98 | in | 100 | 2 | in | 100 |  |
| 97 | in | 100 | 3 | in | 100 |  |
| 96 | in | 100 | 4 | in | 100 |  |
| 95 | in | 100 | 5 | in | 100 |  |
| 90 | in | 100 | 10 | in | 100 |  |
| 85 | in | 100 | 15 | in | 100 |  |
| 80 | in | 100 | 20 | in | 100 |  |
| 75 | in | 100 | 25 | in | 100 |  |
| 70 | in | 100 | 30 | in | 100 |  |
| 60 | in | 100 | 40 | in | 100 |  |
| 50 | in | 100 | 50 | in | 100 |  |
| 40 | in | 100 | 60 | in | 100 |  |
| 30 | in | 100 | 70 | in | 100 |  |
| 20 | in | 100 | 80 | in | 100 |  |
| 10 | in | 100 | 90 | in | 100 |  |
| Immediate death preferred |  |  |  |  |  |  |

* You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100 (i.e. a chance of success which is higher than 99 in 100). If so, at what level of failure would you accept treatment?

Many thanks for your co-operation. This research is at an early stage and we would welcome any comments you may have on the questionnaire.

## Comments:

## Length/duration

## Contents

Other

## Appendix 5

Explanation given to respondents by the researcher about the valuation exercise

## Introduction

The aim of the Health Service is to help people have longer health lives. Medical treatments can achieve great improvements in people's health, but can also have negative consequences. It is important to know not only whether a treatment brings about benefit, but the value of any benefit. But different people place different values on the various aspects of health. The purpose of the survey is to find out about these values.

- $\quad$ This research is being carried out on behalf of the University of Sheffield (Medical Care Research Unit and Department of General Practice) and is funded by the Department of Health.
- The whole exercise will take about three quarters of an hour.
- It involves you completing a questionnaire. I will explain each part of the questionnaire before you start and you will be free to ask questions both before and whilst you are completing the questionnaire.
- Many thanks for agreeing to participate.


## Part A and B

Would you now please turn to the first page of the questionnaire.

Background Information - here are a few simple questions. We guarantee your answers will be treated with anonymity.

On the next two pages, there are some questions about your health today. There are 6 questions, one for each dimensions of health - for each group. We would like you to tick the level which best describes your health.

In the next two pages, there are some questions about your health today. There are 6 questions, one for each dimension of health - for each group. We would like you to tick the level which best describes your health.

In the exercises which follow, states of health will be described in terms of statements selected from these 6 dimensions.

For example - show over head - here is a health state where: read. Note how the first statement relates to physical functioning, statement 2 role limitation, and so on. There are many different states like this - we want you to value 12 for us.

There are three ways in which these states are valued.

## Part C - Ranking

The first part is simply a question of ranking the health states.

Attached to the questionnaire are two envelopes. Please open the envelope marked 1 and remove the contents. There should be six cards, each describing a state of health (show the group). The cards are in no particular order. You will see that one card has 'unconsciousness, followed shortly by death' written on it. Rank this card along with the others.

Please read through each card carefully in your own time.

When you do this, imagine you yourself are in these states and that they would last for 10 years without any change.

Please sort the cards into an order so that the one you think is the best health state is at the top and the one you think is the worst is at the bottom. If you think any are the same, you can place them alongside each other.

When you have ranked them, please list them below in order of severity, starting with the least severe at the top. You may rank two or more health states equally.


#### Abstract

Rating

We would now like you to indicate how good or bad you think each health state on the scale opposite, by a cross and the corresponding letter. Show scale on overhead.

It may be helpful to mark your ratings of the best and worst states first, followed by the intermediate states - thus (show on an overhead). Please locate the remaining injuries/health states on the scale so that the distance between any two on the scale reflects how much worse you judge one compared with the other. You may choose to change the order in which you place the states.


There is a second envelope of states for you to repeat the exercise

When you have completed this exercise, then you are asked to value the same states but using another method.

## Part D - Standard Gamble exercises

You are going to be asked to make choices between the health states you have just ranked. One choice will involve a risk and the other will be a certainty.

The doctor explains to you that you have the two choices shown opposite: one choice is to stay in the health state shown in the upper box and the second choice is a treatment which may succeed or fail. The first choice means remaining in a state of ill-health for certain, whereas the treatment choice is risky, since the treatment doesn't always work (e.g. a hip replacement). If the treatment does work, you will be in the health state shown in the lower left hand box. But if the treatment does not
work, your health will deteriorate and may result in death (as shown in this example). In this example, treatment failure results in a worse state of health. In some, it is death.

The first choice is fairly simple because it describes only one state of health, which is certain to occur. If something is certain, it is equal to $100 \%$ chance or probability.

The second choice is more complicated because if it is chosen there are two possible results, success and failure. There are a range of chances of a successful treatment (from 99 in 100 down to 10 in 100) and corresponding chances of dying from the treatment ( 1 in 100 up to 90 in 100). These are shown on the left hand side of the facing page. You are asked to consider whether or not or not you would have the treatment at different levels of risk.

Please put a $\sqrt{ }$ against all cases you are confident that you would choose the risky treatment. (SHOW OVERHEAD). Start at the top with 100 in 100 chance of success, i.e. no chance of failure. If you would have the treatment, indicate with a $\sqrt{ }$. Then consider 99 in 100 and so on, until you are not sure and then leave the box opposite blank.

You may be willing to accept the treatment but only if it has a chance of failure less than 1 in 100. If so, you can indicate the level at which you would accept treatment at the bottom of the page. (INDICATE).

In the same way, put an $X$ against all cases you are confident that you would reject the treatment and accept the certain health state, starting from the bottom with 100 in 100 chance of failure, i.e. where treatment failure is preferred. Continue putting an $X$ against each case until you are not sure, and then leave the box blank.

Finally, put a = against the cases where you think it would be most difficult to choose between having the risky treatment and not having the treatment.

In considering these choices, imagine that you are in these states, and that they would last for 10 years without change.

Remember, there are no right or wrong answers - we are asking you to make value judgements.

Please read each question carefully. The health states in the gambles do change between the questions.

## Appendix 6

Plots of VAS against SG

PlotA6.2: $\quad$ SG against VAS - individual values

Plot A6.3: Predicted mean against VAS - Quadratic function

Plot A6.4: Predicted mean SG against VAS

Plot A6.5: Predicted mean SG against VAS


Plot A6.7: Predicted individual SG against VAS

1.0
Plot A6.8: Predicted individual SG against VAS

Plot A6.9: Predicted individual SG against VAS

- Torrance's power function (3c)



## Appendix 7

Plots of the differences between EQ-5D/SF-6D VAS values and patient's own VAS ratings and EQ-5D/SF-6D VAS values



EQ-5D VAS
Plot A7.2b: Difference between SF-6D VAS and own VAS rating against SF-6D VAS

SF-6D VAS





## Appendix 8

Further results modelling health state values

Table A8.1 Alternative specifications of VAS median model

| (1) Logit VAS |  | (2) Inclusion of extreme variables (1) |  | B |  |
| :--- | ---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

1. M5, LT2 and LBT3 were not tolerated by model.

Table A8.2a: Alternative specifications of individual VAS model


1. M5, LT2 and LBT3 were not tolerated by model.

Table A8.2a: (Continued)
3) Inclusion of First Order interaction terms ${ }^{1,2,3}$

|  | B | T |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| Physical | -.057 | -14.7 |
| R2 | -.112 | -7.2 |
| S45 | -.103 | -6.7 |
| Pain23 | -.035 | -2.6 |
| Pain4 | -.117 | -7.6 |
| Pain56 | -.134 | -6.6 |
| M2 | -.097 | -8.4 |
| M3 | -.156 | -9.9 |
| M45 | -.271 | -7.2 |
| Pain4V2 | .054 | 3.2 |
| S45M45 | .119 | 2.9 |
| (Constant) | .468 | 29.9 |
| Variables not in the equation |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| S2 |  |  |
| S3 | .027594 | 1.340 |
| V2 | -.033525 | -1.326 |
| V34 | -.015221 | -.663 |
| V5 | -.008724 | -.343 |
|  | -.028408 | -1.004 |
| and 46 interaction terms |  |  |
| df |  |  |
| Adj R ${ }^{2}$ |  |  |

1. Main effects restricted to significant terms in the consistent version of the individual VAS model.
2. For ease of completion, the physical levels were replaced by a single variable PHYSICAL (1-6). This was not found to alter significantly the model.
3. This model was estimated by a stepwise procedure and excludes all terms not significant at the $5 \%$ level.
4. The interaction Pain4V2 has resulted in V2 no longer being significant.

Table A8.2b: Individual VAS model - split test

| Sample (1) |  |  | Sample (2) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | T | B | T |
| PH2 | -. 087 | -3.3*** | -. 060 | -2.5* |
| PH3 | -. 112 | -4.4*** | -. 108 | $-4.2^{* * *}$ |
| PH4 | -. 200 | -6.2*** | -. 149 | -5.0*** |
| PH5 | -. 195 | -4.9*** | -. 242 | -6.4*** |
| PH6 | -. 305 | -8.0*** | -. 261 | -6.9*** |
| R2 | -. 106 | -2.9** | -. 103 | -2.9** |
| S2 | . 040 | . 9 | . 010 | . 2 |
| S3 | -. 003 | . 1 | -. 030 | -. 8 |
| S4 | -. 035 | -. 8 | -. 083 | -1.9 |
| S5 | -. 080 | -1.5 | -. 147 | -2.9** |
| PAIN2 | -. 040 | -1.4 | -. 060 | -1.9 |
| PAIN3 | -. 020 | . 6 | -. 046 | -1.6 |
| PAIN4 | -. 070 | -2.4* | -. 121 | -4.4*** |
| PAIN5 | -. 127 | -3.1** | -. 160 | -3.6*** |
| PAIN6 | -. 054 | -1.1 | -. 173 | -3.4 *** |
| M2 | -. 046 | -2.0 | -. 106 | -4.5*** |
| M3 | -. 098 | -3.0 | -. 162 | -4.9*** |
| M4 | -. 101 | -2.9 | -. 187 | -5.2*** |
| M5 | -. 054 | -1.0 | -. 073 | -1.2 |
| V2 | -. 060 | -2.2* | . 016 | . 5 |
| V3 | -. 128 | -4.0*** | -. 018 | -. 6 |
| V4 | -089 | -2.3 | -. 024 | -. 6 |
| V5 | -. 164 | -3.8*** | -. 052 | -1.0 |
| Constant | . 417 | 16.5*** | . 434 | 16.0*** |
| df | 642 |  |  | 667 |
| Adj $\mathrm{R}^{2}$ | . 675 |  |  | . 690 |
| Normality test | NS |  |  | * |
| Het. test | NS |  |  | NS |
| RESET test | NS |  |  | NS |
| Chow test |  |  |  | NS |

Table A8.2c: Individual VAS model - excluding ouliers ( $\pm \mathbf{2 . 5 \%}$ )

|  | B | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| PH2 | -. 056 | 3.3** |
| PH3 | -. 108 | 6.3*** |
| PH4 | -. 167 | 8.2*** |
| PH5 | -. 207 | 8.1*** |
| PH6 | -. 275 | 11.0*** |
| R2 | -. 098 | 4.2*** |
| S2 | . 014 | . 5 |
| S3 | -. 015 | . 6 |
| S4 | -. 055 | 1.9 |
| S5 | -. 115 | 3.4*** |
| PAIN2 | -. 042 | 2.0* |
| PAIN3 | -. 003 | . 2 |
| PAIN4 | -. 085 | 4.7*** |
| PAIN5 | -. 128 | 4.5*** |
| PAIN6 | -. 097 | 2.8** |
| M2 | -. 074 | 4.8*** |
| M3 | -. 135 | 6.3*** |
| M4 | -. 147 | 6.0*** |
| M5 | -. 048 | 1.3 |
| V2 | -. 015 | . 9 |
| V3 | -. 060 | $2.8{ }^{* *}$ |
| V4 | -049 | 1.8 |
| V5 | -. 106 | 3.4*** |
| Constant | . 403 | 22.7*** |
| df | 1270 |  |
| Adj R ${ }^{2}$ | . 687 |  |
| Normality test | NS |  |
| Het. test | NS |  |
| RESET test | NS |  |

Table A8.3 Alternative specifications of SG median model

| (1) Logit SG |  |  | (2) Inclusion of extreme variables |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | T | B | $\mathrm{T}^{\top}$ |
| Constant | 4.952 | 20.1*** | 1.049 | 9.9*** |
| PH2 | -. 499 | 2.0 | -. 030 | . 9 |
| PH3 | -1.027 | 4.2*** | -. 045 | 1.3 |
| PH4 | -1.530 | 5.5*** | -. 099 | 3.1** |
| PH5 | -1.872 | 5.4*** | -. 159 | 2.6* |
| PH6 | -1.720 | 5.3 *** | -. 126 | 2.2* |
| R2 | . 146 | . 4 | . 057 | 1.0 |
| S2 | -. 335 | . 9 | -. 022 | . 5 |
| S3 | -. 511 | 1.5 | -. 048 | 1.1 |
| S4 | -1.022 | 2.6* | -. 110 | 2.3 |
| S5 | . 587 | 1.2 | -. 041 | . 6 |
| PAIN2 | . 084 | . 3 | . 001 | . 0 |
| PAIN3 | -. 243 | . 9 | -. 017 | . 7 |
| PAIN4 | -. 239 | . 9 | -. 013 | . 5 |
| PAIN5 | -. 753 | 2.0 | -. 169 | 2.8** |
| PAIN6 | -. 984 | 2.0 | -. 251 | 3.3** |
| M2 | -. 287 | 1.3 | -. 021 | . 6 |
| M3 | -. 142 | . 5 | . 004 | . 1 |
| M4 | -. 146 | . 5 | . 031 | . 5 |
| M5 | -2.468 | 4.5*** | - | - |
| V2 | -. 634 | 2.6* | . 048 | 1.2 |
| V3 | -. 944 | 3.3** | . 077 | 1.6 |
| V4 | -. 554 | 1.5 | -. 067 | 1.0 |
| V5 | -. 467 | 1.1 | -. 050 | . 8 |
| LT1 |  |  | . 001 | . 5 |
| LT3 |  |  | . 044 | . 9 |
| LT4 |  |  | -. 015 | . 2 |
| LT5 |  |  | -. 038 | . 4 |
| LBT1 |  |  | -. 020 | . 5 |
| LBT2 |  |  | . 020 | . 4 |
| LBT4 |  |  | . 119 | 1.1 |
| LBT5 |  |  | . 086 | . 7 |
| LBT6 |  |  | -. 236 | 1.7 |
| df | 33 |  | 25 |  |
| Adj. R2 | 0.877 |  | 0.892 |  |

1. M5, LT2 and LBT3 were not tolerated by the model.

Table A8.4a: Alternative specifications of individual SG model

| (1) Inclusion of extreme variables ${ }^{\text {² }}$ |  |  | (2) Inclusion of 1st order interaction terms ${ }^{2,3}$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | T |  | B | T |
| Constant | . 112 | 1.5 | Constant | . 107 | 15.1*** |
| PH2 | -. 006 | . 3 | Ph6 | -. 189 | 10.6*** |
| PH3 | -. 017 | . 7 | R2 | -. 070 | 8.0*** |
| PH4 | -. 063 | 2.8** | M5 | -. 194 | 9.0*** |
| PH5 | -. 059 | 1.4 | Ph3M34 | -. 071 | 4.4*** |
| PH6 | -. 94 | 2.3* | Ph45Pain5 | -. 126 | 5.0*** |
| R2 | -. 24 | . 6 | Ph45V35 | . 048 | 3.4*** |
| S2 | . 014 | . 5 | Ph6Pain4 | -. 093 | 4.7*** |
| S3 | -. 015 | . 5 | Pain6M34 | -. 073 | 2.4* |
| S4 | -. 039 | 1.2 |  |  |  |
| S5 | -. 008 | . 1 | Varia | in the equa |  |
| PAIN2 | -. 024 | 1.0 |  |  |  |
| PAIN3 | -. 019 | 1.0 |  |  |  |
| PAIN4 | -. 017 | . 9 | Ph2 | -. 012 | . 5 |
| PAIN5 | -. 127 | 3.0** | Ph3 | -. 006 | . 2 |
| PAIN6 | -. 156 | 2.9** | Ph45 | -. 036 | 1.1 |
| M2 | -. 016 | . 7 | PAIN23 | -. 000 | . 0 |
| M3 | -. 037 | 1.1 | PAIN4 | . 006 | 2 |
| M4 | -. 005 | . 1 | PAIN5 | -. 053 | . 9 |
| M5 | - | - | PAIN6 | -. 034 | . 7 |
| V2 | . 017 | . 6 | M2 | -. 029 | 1.2 |
| V3 | -. 006 | . 2 | M34 | -. 019 | . 7 |
| V4 | . 001 | . 0 | V345 | -. 033 | 1.1 |
| V5 | . 005 | . 1 |  |  |  |
| LT1 | . 004 | . 2 | PLU | racton term |  |
| LT3 | . 034 | . 9 |  |  |  |
| LT4 | . 027 | . 6 |  |  |  |
| LT5 | . 025 | . 4 |  |  |  |
| LBT1 | -. 005 | . 2 |  |  |  |
| LBT3 | -. 005 | . 1 |  |  |  |
| LBT4 | . 028 | . 4 |  |  |  |
| LBT5 | -. 022 | . 2 |  |  |  |
| LBT6 | -. 213 | 2.2* |  |  |  |
| df Adj. $\mathrm{R}^{2}$ | 1005 0.489 |  |  |  |  |

1. M5, LT2 and LBT2 have not been tolerated by the model.
2. Main effects restricted to significant terms in the consistent version of the SG model.
3. This model was estimated by a stepwise procedure and excludes all terms not significant at the 5\% level.

Table A8.4c: Individual SG model - split test

| Sample (1) |  |  | Sample (2) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | T | B | T |
| PH2 | -. 027 | -1.1 | -. 023 | 1.1 |
| PH3 | . 29 | -1.3 | -. 030 | 1.4 |
| PH4 | -. 088 | -3.4*** | -. 067 | 2.6* |
| PH5 | -. 36 | -1.1 | -. 097 | 3.0** |
| PH6 | -. 139 | -4.4*** | -. 091 | 3.0** |
| R2 | -. 014 | -. 4 | . 050 | 1.7 |
| S2 | -. 024 | -. 6 | . 036 | 1.1 |
| S3 | -. 032 | -1.0 | . 001 | . 1 |
| S4 | -. 050 | -1.3 | -. 027 | . 8 |
| S5 | -. 054 | -1.3 | -. 004 | . 1 |
| PAIN2 | -. 017 | -. 6 | -. 025 | 1.0 |
| PAIN3 | -. 021 | -. 8 | -. 028 | 1.2 |
| PAIN4 | -. 022 | -. 9 | -. 025 | 1.1 |
| PAIN5 | -. 107 | -3.0** | -. 127 | 3.7*** |
| PAIN6 | -. 282 | -5.6*** | -. 096 | 2.1* |
| M2 | -. 007 | -. 3 | -. 036 | 1.9 |
| M3 | -. 006 | -. 2 | -. 059 | 2.1* |
| M4 | -. 017 | -. 5 | -. 030 | 1.0 |
| M5 | -. 218 | $-4.3^{* * *}$ | -. 178 | 3.6*** |
| V2 | . 016 | . 7 | -. 008 | . 3 |
| V3 | -. 018 | -. 7 | . 026 | . 9 |
| V4 | . 013 | . 4 | -. 027 | . 8 |
| V5 | . 053 | 1.4 | -. 060 | 1.5 |
| Constant | . 131 | 5.5*** | . 176 | 7.7*** |
| df | 508 |  | 481 |  |
| Adj $\mathrm{R}^{2}$ | . 508 |  | . 488 |  |
| Normality test | *** |  | *** |  |
| Het. test | *** |  | *** |  |
| RESET test | NS |  | NS |  |

Table A8.4d: Individual SG model excluding outliers


Table A8.4e: A re-run of the individual SG model assuming a value of 1.0 in place of a mid-point value of 0.995

|  | B |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Constant | .149 | $9.4^{* * *}$ |
| PH2 | -.014 | .9 |
| PH3 | -.027 | 1.7 |
| PH4 | -.071 | $4.0^{* * *}$ |
| PH5 | -.063 | $2.8^{\star *}$ |
| PH6 | -.103 | $4.9^{* * *}$ |
| R2 | -.037 | 1.7 |
| S2 | .015 | .6 |
| S3 | -.012 | .6 |
| S4 | -.031 | 1.2 |
| S5 | -.028 | .9 |
| PAIN2 | -.027 | 1.5 |
| PAIN3 | -.026 | 1.6 |
| PAIN4 | -.026 | 1.6 |
| PAIN5 | -.126 | $5.3^{* * *}$ |
| PAIN6 | -.163 | $5.1^{* * *}$ |
| M2 | -.028 | 2.0 |
| M3 | -.043 | $2.3^{*}$ |
| M4 | -.031 | 1.5 |
| M5 | -.200 | $5.8^{* * *}$ |
| V2 | .012 | .8 |
| V3 | -.013 | .7 |
| V4 | -.001 | .0 |
| V5 | -.005 | .2 |
|  |  |  |
| df | 1345 |  |
| Adj R 2 | 0.682 |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |

Note: 41 observations were assumed to be 1.0 rather than 0.995 .

Table A8.5a: Entering a constant term into the random part of the model - VAS


Table A8.5b: Entering dimension levels into the random part of the model - VAS


Table A8.5b (continued): Entering dimension levels into the random part of the model - VAS

|  | Social |  | Pain |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | SE | B | SE |
| Fixed part | 916 | .021*** | . 915 | .022*** |
| Constant |  |  |  |  |
| PH2 | -. 054 | .018** | -. 054 | .019** |
| PH3 | -. 104 | .018*** | -. 101 | .019*** |
| PH4 | -. 145 | .022*** | -. 143 | .023*** |
| PH5 | -. 176 | .028*** | -. 175 | .029*** |
| PH6 | -. 263 | .027*** | -. 263 | .028*** |
| R2 | -. 128 | .026*** | -. 129 | .029*** |
| S2 | . 004 | . 031 | . 006 | . 032 |
| S3 | -. 007 | . 027 | -. 005 | . 028 |
| S4 | -. 044 | . 032 | -. 044 | . 033 |
| S5 | -. 182 | .039*** | -. 177 | .041*** |
| PAIN2 | -. 063 | . 022 | -. 064 | . 024 |
| PAIN3 | -. 022 | . 021 | -. 020 | . 021 |
| PAIN4 | -. 103 | .020*** | -. 100 | .021*** |
| PAIN5 | -. 163 | .032*** | -. 160 | .032*** |
| PAIN6 | -. 117 | .038** | -. 121 | .039** |
| M2 | -. 087 | .017*** | -. 084 | .018*** |
| M3 | -. 145 | .025*** | -. 146 | .025*** |
| M4 | -. 171 | .027*** | -. 165 | .028*** |
| M5 | . 003 | . 043 | . 007 | . 045 |
| V2 | . 012 | . 021 | . 010 | . 022 |
| V3 | -. 029 | . 025 | -. 034 | . 026 |
| V4 | -. 025 | . 031 | -. 031 | . 032 |
| V5 | -. 090 | .035** | -. 096 | .030** |
| Random part |  |  |  |  |
| Level 1 variance | 2.057 | .0939*** | 2.266 | .097*** |
| Level 2 variance |  |  |  |  |
| Cons/Cons | 1.515 | .178*** | 1.489 | .206*** |
| Level 2/Cons | . 127 | . 173 | -. 252 | . 174 |
| Level 2/Level 2 | . 255 | . 270 | . 290 | . 244 |
| Level 3/Cons. |  | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 3/Level 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 4/Cons. | . 433 | . 155 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 4/Level 4 | 1.066 | .269*** |  |  |
| Level 5/Cons |  | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 5/level 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 6/Cons. |  |  | 0 | 0 |
| Level 6/Level 6 |  |  | 0 | 0 |
| -2* log-likelihood | 1147 |  |  | 16 |

Table A8.5b (continued): Entering dimension levels into the random part of the model - VAS

|  | Vitality |  |
| :--- | ---: | :--- |
|  |  |  |
|  | B | SE |
| Fixed part | .914 | $.021^{* * *}$ |
| Constant |  |  |
| PH2 | -.058 | $.019^{* *}$ |
| PH3 | -.107 | $.019^{* * *}$ |
| PH4 | -.142 | $.023^{* * *}$ |
| PH5 | -.181 | $.029^{* * *}$ |
| PH6 | -.262 | $.07^{* * *}$ |
| R2 | -.127 | $.027^{* * *}$ |
| S2 | .002 | .031 |
| S3 | -.005 | .028 |
| S4 | -.047 | .033 |
| S5 | -.170 | $.039^{* * *}$ |
| PAIN2 | -.052 | $-023^{*}$ |
| PAIN3 | -.017 | .021 |
| PAIN4 | -.100 | $.021^{* * *}$ |
| PAIN5 | -.163 | $.031^{* * *}$ |
| PAIN6 | -.127 | $.039^{* * *}$ |
| M2 | -.087 | $.017^{* * *}$ |
| M3 | -.142 | $.025^{* * *}$ |
| M4 | -.167 | $.027^{* * *}$ |
| M5 | .001 | .044 |
| V2 | .007 | .021 |
| V3 | -.029 | .026 |
| V4 | -.029 | .031 |
| V5 | -.091 | $.035^{* *}$ |
| Random part |  |  |
| Level 1 variance | 2.220 | $.101^{* * *}$ |
| Level 2 variance |  |  |
| Cons/Cons | 1.745 | $.256^{* * *}$ |
| Level 2/Cons | -.550 | .163 |
| Level 2/Level 2 | .029 | .158 |
| Level 3/Cons. | -.076 | .140 |
| Level 3/Level 3 | .359 | .201 |
| Level 4/Cons. | 0 | 0 |
| Level 4/Level 4 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 5/Cons | 0 | 0 |
| Level 5/level 5 | 0 | 0 |
| $-2^{\star}$ log-likelihood | 11492 |  |

Table A8.6a: Multi-level modelling of health state values - SG


Table A8.6b: Models with dimension levels in the random part of the model - SG

|  | Physical |  | Role |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | SE | B | SE |
| Fixed part | . 979 | .017*** | . 993 | . 016 |
| Constant |  |  |  |  |
| PH2 | . 016 | . 014 | . 022 | . 015 |
| PH3 | . 032 | .014* | . 036 | . 015 |
| PH4 | . 061 | .018*** | . 062 | . 018 |
| PH5 | . 063 | .023** | . 069 | . 022 |
| PH6 | . 101 | .023*** | . 103 | . 021 |
| R2 | . 026 | . 020 | . 010 | . 022 |
| S2 | . 012 | . 023 | . 006 | . 024 |
| S3 | . 004 | . 021 | . 019 | . 021 |
| S4 | . 019 | . 024 | . 031 | . 025 |
| S5 | . 015 | . 035 | . 029 | . 032 |
| PAIN2 | . 005 | . 018 | . 001 | . 018 |
| PAIN3 | . 007 | . 016 | . 011 | . 016 |
| PAIN4 | . 011 | . 016 | . 011 | . 016 |
| PAIN5 | . 129 | .024*** | . 128 | . 024 |
| PAIN6 | . 167 | .033*** | . 160 | . 033 |
| M2 | . 030 | .014* | . 024 | . 014 |
| M3 | . 044 | .018* | . 041 | . 020 |
| M4 | . 032 | . 020 | . 038 | . 021 |
| M5 | . 214 | .038*** | . 201 | . 036 |
| V2 | . 008 | . 016 | . 014 | . 015 |
| V3 | . 021 | . 018 | . 034 | . 018 |
| V4 | . 020 | . 023 | . 038 | . 023 |
| V5 | . 021 | . 026 | . 039 | . 026 |
| Random part |  |  |  |  |
| Level 1 variance | . 942 | 0.53 | 1.211 | .059*** |
| Level 2 variance |  |  |  |  |
| Cons/Cons | . 633 | .110*** | . 059 | . 074 |
| Level 2/Cons | 0 | 0 | 5.100 | . 181 |
| Level 2/Level 2 | 0 | 0 | 6.523 | 0.180 |
| Level 3/Cons. | 0 | 0 |  |  |
| Level 3/Level 3 | 0 | 0 |  |  |
| Level 4/Cons. | . 267 | .101** |  |  |
| Level 4/Level 4 | . 414 | . 198 |  |  |
| Level 5/Cons | -. 033 | . 120 |  |  |
| Level 5/level 5 | . 904 | .275** |  |  |
| Level 6/Cons. | . 617 | .135*** |  |  |
| Level 6/Level 6 | 1.537 | .299*** |  |  |
| -2* log-likelihood | 809 |  | 81 |  |

Table A8.6b (continued) : Models with dimension levels in the random part - SG

|  | Social |  | Pain |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | SE | B | SE |
| Fixed part | 988 | .016*** | . 984 | .015*** |
| Constant |  |  |  |  |
| PH2 | -. 019 | . 014 | . 013 | . 013 |
| PH3 | -. 031 | .014* | . 028 | .013* |
| PH4 | -. 059 | .017*** | . 063 | .015*** |
| PH5 | -. 055 | .022** | . 048 | .020* |
| PH6 | -. 101 | .020*** | . 117 | .019*** |
| R2 | -. 036 | . 020 | . 040 | . 018 |
| S2 | . 016 | . 023 | . 011 | . 020 |
| S3 | . 001 | . 021 | . 004 | . 019 |
| S4 | -. 017 | . 025 | . 013 | . 023 |
| S5 | -. 019 | . 038 | . 028 | . 028 |
| PAIN2 | -. 013 | . 018 | . 014 | . 016 |
| PAIN3 | -. 011 | . 016 | . 013 | . 014 |
| PAIN4 | -. 020 | . 016 | . 010 | . 015 |
| PAIN5 | -. 131 | .023*** | . 145 | .036*** |
| PAIN6 | -. 170 | .033*** | . 165 | .046*** |
| M2 | -. 028 | .014* | . 031 | .012* |
| M3 | -. 033 | .018* | . 061 | . 017 |
| M4 | -. 032 | . 020 | . 042 | . 021 |
| M5 | -. 203 | .039*** | . 185 | .038*** |
| V2 | . 004 | . 015 | . 010 | . 014 |
| V3 | -. 023 | . 018 | . 010 | . 017 |
| V4 | -. 016 | . 023 | . 004 | . 022 |
| V5 | -. 017 | . 026 | . 010 | . 025 |
| Random part |  |  |  |  |
| Level 1 variance | 1.105 | .060*** | . 835 | .040*** |
| Level 2 variance |  |  |  |  |
| Cons/Cons | . 448 | .102*** | . 630 | .108*** |
| Level 2/Cons | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 2/Level 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 3/Cons. | . 470 | .081*** | 0 | 0 |
| Level 3/Level 3 | . 038 | . 107 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 4/Cons. | . 360 | .079*** | . 336 | .068*** |
| Level 4/Level 4 | . 197 | . 113 | . 224 | .091* |
| Level 5/Cons | . 221 | . 183 | . 544 | .230* |
| Level 5/level 5 | 2.320 | .558*** | 4.713 | .913*** |
| Level 6/Cons. |  |  | 1.158 | .342*** |
| Level 6/Level 6 |  |  | 3.914 | 1.306** |
| -2* log-likelihood | 813 |  |  |  |

Table A8.6b (continued): Models with dimension levels in the random part - SG

|  | Mental |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | B | SE |
| Fixed part | . 979 | .017*** |
| Constant |  |  |
| PH2 | -. 017 | . 014 |
| PH3 | -. 028 | .014** |
| PH4 | -. 068 | .016*** |
| PH5 | -. 045 | .022** |
| PH6 | -. 110 | .019*** |
| R2 | -. 049 | .020* |
| S2 | . 019 | . 022 |
| S3 | . 014 | . 020 |
| S4 | -. 009 | . 023 |
| S5 | -. 031 | . 029 |
| PAIN2 | -. 013 | . 017 |
| PAIN3 | -. 011 | . 015 |
| PAIN4 | -. 017 | . 015 |
| PAIN5 | -. 132 | .023*** |
| PAIN6 | -. 163 | .032*** |
| M2 | -. 038 | .013** |
| M3 | -. 049 | .019** |
| M4 | -. 039 | . 021 |
| M5 | -. 200 | .047*** |
| V2 | . 021 | . 016 |
| V3 | -. 001 | . 018 |
| V4 | . 005 | . 022 |
| V5 | . 009 | . 025 |
| Random part |  |  |
| Level 1 variance | . 903 | .048*** |
| Level 2 variance |  |  |
| Cons/Cons | . 975 | .156*** |
| Level 2/Cons | 0 | 0 |
| Level 2/Level 2 | 0 | 0 |
| Level 3/Cons. | . 400 | .137** |
| Level 3/Level 3 | . 539 | .202* |
| Level 4/Cons. | -. 049 | . 104 |
| Level 4/Level 4 | . 380 | .135* |
| Level 5/Cons | . 437 | . 373 |
| Level 5/level 5 | 6.077 | 1.362*** |
| -2* log-likelihood | 8074 |  |

Table A8.7: Mean VAS model for non-patients

|  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
|  | B T |  |
| Constant | .429 | 21.4 |
| PH2 | -.067 | -3.4 |
| PH3 | -.105 | -5.3 |
| PH4 | -.165 | -7.3 |
| PH5 | -.212 | -7.6 |
| PH6 | -.279 | -10.4 |
| R2 | -.107 | -4.1 |
| S2 | .023 | .8 |
| S3 | -.027 | -1.0 |
| S4 | -.069 | -2.2 |
| S5 | -.124 | -3.3 |
| PAIN2 | -.044 | -1.9 |
| PAIN3 | .001 | .1 |
| PAIN4 | -.084 | -4.1 |
| PAIN5 | -.123 | -4.0 |
| PAIN6 | -.132 | -3.3 |
| M2 | -.076 | -4.4 |
| M3 | -.140 | -5.9 |
| M4 | -.150 | -5.7 |
| M5 | -.084 | -1.9 |
| V2 | -.029 | -1.5 |
| V3 | -.081 | -3.5 |
| V4 | -.070 | -2.4 |
| V5 | -.107 | -3.3 |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| df |  |  |
| Adj. R2 | 0.694 |  |
|  |  |  |


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Source: Jenkinson et al, 1996

