

**Social Stratification in a Punjabi Village of Pakistan:
The Dynamics between Caste, Gender, and
Violence**

Ahmed Usman

Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

The University of Leeds
School of Sociology and Social Policy

September 2011

The candidate confirms that the work submitted is his own and that appropriate credit has been given where reference has been made to the work of others

This copy has been supplied on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement

Acknowledgements

A heartfelt thank-you to; the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan and University of the Punjab Lahore Pakistan for funding this study, my supervisors Dr. Paul Bagguley and Dr. Yasmin Hussain, friends, mentors, loved ones, family, research team and most importantly the people who participated in this study.

Abstract

This thesis looks at the system of social stratification in Punjabi villages of Pakistan using caste as a theoretical tool and develops an analysis of the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence. The focus of the research is the hierarchical arrangement of two major caste based status groups in Punjabi villages i.e. landowning castes, Zamindars, and service providing castes, Kammis, their asymmetrical social interactions in the village setting, and its changing patterns. The study draws on the theory of intersectionality to explore the social relations of dominance and resistance in the paradigm of caste and gender as an interconnected system of social oppression and structural violence. It is a case study comparative research and is conducted in two villages of Punjab province in Pakistan, each village as a unit of analysis; one in the arid and other in the irrigated agricultural zone. Since the ownership of land, the nature of agricultural activity, and the agrarian economy form the basis of traditional caste system in rural Pakistan, this research compares the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in two different agricultural contexts.

The literature has mostly dealt with the caste in Muslim Pakistan as a horizontal category with no real attempts to explore the caste relations in rural Pakistan in terms of power, difference, and inequality. This research contrasts with much of the existing literature on the area of caste in Pakistan and argues that the caste system in rural Pakistan exists in the form of the indigenous categories of Quom and Zat, which divide the Zamindar Quoms and Kammi Quoms in distinct and rigid birth-ascribed status groups on the basis of their parentage occupations. Looking at the changing dynamics of caste in contemporary Punjabi villages, this research argues that the caste system still plays a significant role in organizing the village structures. The villager's rights to participate in the social, political, and economic affairs of the village are determined by their caste and memberships in kinship groups. The power relations organized around the caste memberships, caste practices, and caste organization of the village influence the gender identities of the villagers, resulting in different shades of masculinities and femininities across Zamindars and Kammis.

Table of Contents

Contents	Page
Acknowledgements	i
Abstract	ii
Table of Contents	iii
Illustrative materials	vii
Glossary	viii
1. Chapter One - Introduction	1
1.1. Outline of Chapters	8
2. Chapter Two - The Caste System and its Context in Pakistan	12
2.1. Introduction	12
2.2. Conceptualizing Caste	12
2.2.1. <i>Characteristics of Caste System</i>	16
2.3. Caste System in the Pakistani Context	19
2.3.1. <i>Caste System and Labour Relations</i>	27
2.3.2. <i>Caste and Political Organization – Roles of Leadership and Patronage</i>	31
2.3.3. <i>Caste System and Social Exclusion</i>	34
2.4. Conclusion	35
3. Chapter Three - Gender and Violence in Caste Society of Pakistan	38
3.1. Introduction	38
3.2. Patriarchy and Gender in a Caste Society	39
3.2.1. <i>Patriarchy and Caste</i>	39
3.2.2. <i>Construction of Gender and Gender Relations</i>	41
3.2.2.1. <i>Gender and Caste</i>	44
3.2.3. <i>Caste and Gender – Hindu Caste System</i>	47
3.3. Violence in Caste Society	49
3.3.1. <i>Conceptualizing Violence</i>	49
3.3.2. <i>Theorizing Violence in Caste Perspective</i>	51
3.3.2.1. <i>Theorizing Gender Based Violence</i>	55
3.3.3. <i>Caste, Gender Based Violence, and Women</i>	63
3.4. Conclusion	65

4.	Chapter Four - Methodological Framework and Data Collection Methods	68
4.1.	Introduction	68
4.2.	The Qualitative Research Model and Epistemological Position	68
4.3.	The Research Design	71
4.3.1.	<i>Case Study Comparative Research</i>	71
4.3.2.	<i>Selecting Research Sites</i>	75
	4.3.2.1. <i>The Village Demographics</i>	77
4.4.	Data Source and Sampling Strategy	79
4.5.	Strategy for Entering Research Site and Conducting Fieldwork	83
4.5.1.	<i>Negotiation, Rapport Building, and Disclosure</i>	83
4.5.2.	<i>Gatekeeping: Concept, Practice, and Use</i>	85
4.6.	The In-Depth Semi Structured Interviews	87
4.7.	The Reflexive Voice	90
4.7.1.	<i>Standpoint and Power</i>	91
4.7.2.	<i>Understanding the Social and Political Context</i>	92
4.8.	Recruiting and Training the Female Research Assistants	93
4.8.1.	<i>Selection Criteria and Recruitment</i>	93
4.8.2.	<i>Training</i>	93
4.9.	Ethical Considerations	94
4.9.1.	<i>Disengaging Process and Follow up Contacts</i>	96
4.10.	Fieldwork Experiences	97
4.10.1.	<i>Problems and Limitations</i>	97
4.11.	Transcribing and Analysing Data	99
4.11.1.	<i>Translations of the Quotes – A Limitation of the Research</i>	100
4.12.	Conclusion	101
5.	Chapter Five - The System of Social Stratification in Contemporary Punjabi Villages – The Dynamics of Caste System and its Changing Patterns	102
5.1.	Introduction	102
5.2.	Caste as an Endogamous System	102
5.2.1.	<i>Endogamy – A Clear Divide between Kammi and Zamindars</i>	102
5.2.2.	<i>Elopement and Marriage - the Consequences</i>	107
5.3.	Caste Occupations: Changing Patterns	109
5.3.1.	<i>Newly Emerging Institutions and Changing Consumption Patterns – Decline of Caste Occupation</i>	114
5.3.2.	<i>Parentage Occupation – A Lifelong Identification of Kammi Biradaris</i>	117
5.3.3.	<i>Zamindars and Zamindari as an Occupation – Changing Patterns</i>	120

5.4	The Seyp System: An Institution in Decline	124
5.4.1.	<i>Seyp System in Irrigated and Arid Zone's Villages</i>	125
5.4.2.	<i>Decline in Seyp System: Advantage and Disadvantages</i>	130
5.4.3.	<i>Technological Advancements in Agriculture and its impact on Seyp System</i>	132
5.5.	Possession of Land and Cultivation as a Source of Livelihood – Changing Patterns	134
5.6.	Biradari (Kinship) and Zat (Caste)	137
5.7.	Conclusion	140
6.	Chapter Six - Living on the Margins: Caste System, Biradari Memberships, and Rights to Participation in Punjabi Villages	142
6.1.	Introduction	142
6.2.	Ceremonial Occasions and Rights to Participation	142
6.3.	The Dera System	148
6.4.	The Collective Decision Making in a Punjabi Village	153
6.5.	The Electoral Process – Election Campaigns and Voting Process	160
6.6.	Approaching the State Institutions and Caste System	166
6.7.	Conclusion	174
7.	Chapter Seven - Intersectionality – Caste and Gender, Power Relations in Contemporary Punjabi Villages – Changing Patterns	176
7.1.	Introduction	176
7.2.	Intersectionality of Caste and Class	176
7.3.	Caste, Masculinities, and Power Relations	178
7.3.1.	<i>Ability to Ensure Group's Protection – Caste, Politics of Revenge (Competitiveness), and Masculinity</i>	180
	7.3.1.1 <i>Changing Patterns of Masculinity and Politics of Revenge</i>	189
	7.3.1.2 <i>Local Discourses of Caste Based Masculinities</i>	192
7.3.2.	<i>Caste System, Features of Control and Influence, and Masculinity</i>	194
	7.3.2.1 <i>Domestic and Public Characteristics of Masculinity – A Relationship?</i>	194
	7.3.2.2 <i>Caste Based Domination and Subordination in Village Sphere</i>	197
	7.3.2.3 <i>Group Influence in Village Sphere and Masculinity</i>	202
	7.3.2.4 <i>Zamindars as Providers – An Expression of Caste Based Ascendancy</i>	203
7.4.	Caste System and Femininities in Punjabi Villages	206
7.4.1.	<i>Emphasized Femininities vs. Caste Based Roles and Obligations</i>	207
	7.4.1.1 <i>Paid Labour for Kammi Women - Varied Roles across Arid and Irrigated Zone</i>	213

7.4.2.	<i>Changing Public Femininities among Kammis</i>	214
7.4.3.	<i>Caste Membership and Safety of a Woman in Village Sphere</i>	217
7.5.	Conclusion	220
8.	Chapter Eight - Caste and Gender - An Interconnected system of Social Oppression and Structural Violence in Punjabi Villages – Changing Patterns	224
8.1.	Introduction	224
8.2.	Caste, Gender, and Physical Violence	225
8.2.1.	<i>Patterns of domination and Violence among Collaterals</i>	225
8.2.2.	<i>Patterns of domination and Violence against Caste Subordinates</i>	233
	8.2.2.1. <i>Giving as an Institutionalized Asymmetry in Caste Relationships and Violence</i>	238
	8.2.2.2. <i>Violence against Caste Subordinated – Changing Patterns</i>	241
8.3.	Caste, Gender, and Sexual Violence in Community Sphere	249
8.3.1.	<i>Masculinity, Politics of Revenge and Sexual Assaults against Women</i>	250
8.3.2.	<i>Caste Based Roles, Unsafe spaces in the Village Setting, and Sexual Violence</i>	254
8.3.3.	<i>Who Are More Involved in Sexual Violence - Zamindars or Kammis men?</i>	256
8.3.4.	<i>Sexual Violence in Community Sphere – Changing patterns</i>	259
8.4.	Conclusion	264
9.	Chapter Nine - Conclusion	266
9.1.	Reviewing the Main Gaps in Literature and Other Issues Identified	266
9.2.	Drawing the Analytical Themes Together – Main Findings and Observations	267
9.2.1.	<i>Rethinking Caste in Punjabi Context</i>	267
	9.2.1.1. <i>Agricultural context and Caste Dynamics – Arid and Irrigated Zone</i>	271
	9.2.1.2. <i>Caste or Class? - The System of Social Stratification in Contemporary Punjabi Village</i>	272
9.2.2.	Intersecting Inequalities and Power Dynamics	272
	9.2.2.1. <i>Caste and Gender - An Interconnected System of Social Oppression</i>	276
9.3.	Generalizability of the Study	278
9.4.	Recommendations – Agenda for Future Research	283
	Bibliography	285
	Appendices	
Appendix A.	Interviewee Data in the Arid Zone’s Village	301
Appendix B.	Interviewee Data in the Irrigated Zone’s Village	302

Illustrative Materials

Photos		Page
Photo 4.1	Map of Punjab Province	76
Photo 4.2	An irrigated canal	78
Photo 4.3	Route to the irrigated zone's village	85
Photo 5.1	Land in the irrigated zone's village	121
Photo 5.2	Harvesting of wheat crop and land in the arid zone's village	122
Photo 5.3	Small dam near the arid zone's village	123
Photo 6.1	Walima ceremony	145
Photo 6.2	Dera of a Zamindar Biradari	152
Photo 8.1	Agricultural field and maize crop	256

Glossary

Arain	A vegetable grower Quom
Biradari	Kinship group
Chaudhrani	Wife or mother of Chaudhary
Chaudhary	Village chief, headman; honorary title for men from Zamindar Quoms
Dera	Guest house maintained by Zamindars as a collective sitting place for the villagers and other guests. A place to manage agricultural activity and animal farming.
Dua-e-Khair	Prayer for luck/success
Gujjar	A Zamindar Quom in Punjab
Havaili	House of Zamindars/ waders/ upper caste in rural Pakistan
Izzat	Prestige, honour, status
Jat	A Zamindar Quom in Punjab
Kammi	Craftsman; Service providing Quom; status category used for the members of service providing Quoms to distinguish them from the members of landowning Quoms i.e. Zamindars
Laag	Money received by Kammis at ceremonies, especially weddings, from the house they work for i.e. Zamindars or other Kammis
Mastoi	A Baloch tribe in South Punjab, Baluchistan and Sind provinces of Pakistan
Mussali	A Kammi Quom who are Drummers and agricultural labourers
Neundra	Cash gift given to bride/groom
Parea	Village council
Patwari	Land record official at sub division level
Quom	Indigenously used for caste (interchangeably used with Zat)
Rajput	A Zamindar Quom in Punjab
Shalwar Qameez	Trouser suit worn by both men and women consisting of a loose tunic (Qameez) and baggy trouser (Shalwar)
Seyp	Work contract. Normally between a Zamindar and a Kammi household; and also between two Kammi households
Seypi	Those who have work contract (Seyp)
Syed	Honorary title given to men accepted as descendants of Prophet Muhammad
Thana	Police station

Vail	Money given to Kammis, who help or work as labourers, and musicians at weddings or circumcisions
Walima	Feast from groom's side
Zamindar	Landowner; landowning/ cultivator Quom; status category used for the members of landowning Quoms to distinguish them from the members of service providing Quoms i.e. Kammis
Zat	Indigenously used for caste (interchangeably used with Quom)

Chapter One

Introduction

The trouble is that the Biradaris and Quoms¹ are not all equal, and public silencing of the issue is very much about perpetuating existing hierarchies. The inequality is so severe and deeply embedded in parts of the country that it is hardly even noticed. An urbane politician from Lahore did not intend any offence when, outraged at the state's desecration of the remains of a Baloch tribal leader² killed in a military operation, he blurted out, "we don't treat even Kammis³ like that!" No offense was taken, of course because there was no-one to speak up from the Kammi Biradari, or to ask our Lahori friend how he treated his Kammis (Gazdar, 2007: 87).

Sociological debates have proposed a number of different concepts and models to analyse the systems of social stratification in different societies and thus divide individuals into hierarchically ranked categories, which are differentially powerful, privileged, and esteemed (Barker, 2005; Berreman, 1972; Lenski, 1984; Parsons, 1940). However, the most frequently used frameworks are class, caste and status and these can be simplified by the terms "achieved" versus "ascribed" status. The class stratification refers to the shared statuses predominantly identified by the features of income, education, and occupation, and is representative of industrial societies. People attain their social statuses primarily by their individual abilities and efforts and thus a class society is open for social mobility (Berreman, 1972). Caste is a widely used model for birth-ascribed stratification and is much more typical of agricultural societies. In a caste system, individuals are divided into hierarchically ranked status categories on the basis of their shared ancestry. It is a closed system of stratification and social mobility is not possible in terms of caste status (Berreman, 1972; Gupta, 2005; Jaspal, 2011). However Weber (1964) developed a three component approach to social stratification⁴ with class,

¹ "Biradari" and "Quom" are important terms in the caste system of Pakistan and indigenously used for the categorization of individuals on the basis of their kinship and birth-ascribed statuses respectively. However, the terms like Biradari, Quom, and Zat are disputed conceptually in different contexts and, at times, can also be used interchangeably (Lyon, 2004). See section (5.6) for further discussion.

² The politician talked about Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti, a Baloch Nationalist leader killed in a military operation on 26th August 2006. The killing was widely criticized and led to political unrest in the country (Daily Times, 2006).

³ Here the term "Kammis" is used as a status category for the members of different artisan/service providing caste groups e.g. barbers, cobblers, carpenters, who are placed lower than "Zamindars", a status category used for the members of landowning castes, in the system of social stratification in Punjabi villages (Eglar, 1960; also see chapter 5).

⁴ Weber built on Marx's ideas of class, proposing his three component theory of stratification and the concept of life chances. It was stressed that the class divisions suggested by Marx are over simplistic and the dynamics of social stratification are not based merely on ownership of capital and relationships of production. Weber developed the key concepts of his theory of social stratification looking at the social structures of Germany. He observed that many members of the aristocracy lacked economic wealth but enjoyed strong political power. On the other side, many rich families lacked social prestige and power

status, and party, which refer to property, prestige, and power respectively, and stated that all three dimensions have the consequences for life chances. While its characteristics may vary across societies, social stratification has mostly been described in terms of three dimensional theory of Weber (Hurst, 2007; Lemert, 2004).

The dynamics of power and ability to possess and exercise power may vary across different systems of social stratification i.e. caste stratification and class stratification (Berreman, 1972). Class power is an economic concept wherein the possession of economic assets determines individual's life chances and positions of dominance. Status power refers to social prestige and respect accorded to individuals or groups in a society. The existence of status groups can be seen in the form of endogamy, restricted patterns of social interactions, and monopolistic control over certain economic opportunities e.g. land. Political power is about ability of individuals or group to exercise their own will or achieve their goals despite other's resistance and opposition. Another important dimension of power in social stratification is the prospects of social mobility in society (Hurst, 2007; Stark, 2007). These concepts derived from Weber's three dimensional theory can be used to understand the dynamics of power and privilege in different models of social stratification. However, the application and significance of any dimension i.e. class power, status power, political power, or mobility may differ across the systems of caste stratification and class stratification. For example, it is not unusual to find class differentials in a caste society, yet a system of birth-ascribed stratification cannot be analysed solely in terms of class i.e. power positions associated with the possession of economic assets (Berreman, 1972). In a caste society, class mobility, and thus class power, does not relieve individuals from the repercussions of their birth-ascribed statuses. Individuals are positioned in rigidly defined social categories on the basis of their shared birth attributes and they are accorded the social respect and honour in accordance with their group memberships. Hence status power is the more applicable and important dimension in a birth-ascribed stratification, which defines the dynamics of power and ability to possess and exercise power (Gupta, 2005; Jaspal, 2011). Similarly, while the system of acquired rank appreciates the social mobility through individual efforts, it is not possible to alter the status categories in a system of ascribed rank (Berreman, 1972).

because they were Jewish. Hence, Weber proposed that the three independent but connected factors i.e. class, status, and power form the system of social stratification (Weber, 1997, 1978).

In a system of social stratification, collective social hierarchies and inequalities involve the patterns of social relationships that represent the positions of superiority and inferiority in that society. Interpersonal interactions become the means for the expression of power, hierarchy, and asymmetry, and thus define the individual's identity and their social experiences in a society (Berreman, 1972). In a caste system, membership of social categories and their hierarchical arrangement is more clearly defined, well structured, and identifiable, than in a class system. In caste stratification, individuals are recognised and distinguished, and thus regarded, in terms of their group identity (Gupta, 2005; Jaspal, 2011). Hence, inter-group relations in a caste society are characterised by oppression, discrimination, aggression, deprivation, violence, and exploitation directed downward and compliance, honour, service, dependence, and respect claimed from above (Berreman, 1972:401). Since the social groups in a caste system are mutually isolated and distinct, the members are generally excluded from other group's institutions, which results in the groups specific institutions and furthers the categorisation of society into rigid status groups (Berreman, 1972; Jaspal,2011).

In recent years, academics have analysed gender as another important dimension of social separation and inequality. It is stressed that the social experiences of men and women in a system of collective hierarchy cannot be similar, and hence it is important to place men and women at different locations of social inequality (Crenshaw, 1991; McCall, 2005). Interestingly, it was women of colour, a birth ascribed rank, who acknowledged the need to study gender with reference to issues of difference and power (Collins, 2000; Zinn & Dill, 1996). It was suggested that the relations of dominance and resistance in a system of social stratification can be studied in the paradigm of gender together with other birth ascribed issues of inequality⁵ e.g. race (Burgess-Proctor, 2006; Collins, 2000). Similarly, women occupy a central place in the caste organization of Hindu India, and men and women experience caste differently (Dube, 1996; Kannabiran and Kannabiran, 2001). However, there have been few attempts to look at the system of social stratification in India, or other caste societies, in terms of caste and gender as an interconnected system of collective social hierarchy.

This thesis uses caste as a theoretical framework to examine the system of social stratification in Punjabi villages of Pakistan that divides landowning Quoms,

⁵ Theory of intersectionality is the main theoretical paradigm used in this research in order to analyse how gender and caste interact to produce different shades of social inequality in a Punjabi village. See section (3.3) for further discussion.

Zamindars, and service providing Quoms, Kammiss, into hierarchically ranked rigid status groups on the basis of their shared birth attributes and parentage caste occupations. More importantly, gender is considered as an essential factor in stratification processes and structures in order to analyse how men and women experience caste differently and to look at the dynamics of social stratification in Punjabi villages.

In Punjab, the caste system plays an important part in organizing the village life and can be seen as central to Punjabi's identity and concerns (Eglar, 1960; Richerson et al, 1996). It is a vertical category that divides landowning Quoms, Zamindars, and artisan/service providing Quoms, Kammiss, into mutually exclusive and hierarchical status groups. Like its universal characterization, the caste system in rural Pakistan is founded on the birth-ascribed memberships in a ranked category i.e. landowning Quom or service providing Quom, and attaches the occupational distinctiveness with its members (Blood, 1994). While the occupational categories are no more relevant, the villagers in contemporary Punjabi villages are recognized and distinguished through their parentage occupations e.g. cobbler or barber (Lyon, 2004). Moreover, the practice of strict inter-Quom endogamy among Kammiss and Zamindars reproduces them as mutually exclusive social categories (Ahmad, 1970; Eglar, 1960). However, much of the literature on caste in Pakistan gets stuck in the debate whether caste system exists in Muslim Pakistan or not, and thus there are few attempts to look at the caste as a hierarchical arrangement of social groups that are differentially powerful, privileged, and esteemed (Alavi, 1972; Lyon, 2004). Another popular response to the question about caste in Pakistan is that "caste is the past, and now it's different". A few may even justify it by offering the standard anecdote of a Kammi from their village who went to a foreign country and did well (Gazdar, 2007). This research, therefore, gives a special emphasis to the changing dynamics of caste system in rural Pakistan in order to address this popular assertion about the existence of caste in Pakistan. Examining the changing dynamics of caste was even more important, since a few studies suggest that the caste occupations associated with Kammi Quoms are in decline and traditional labour relations have been transformed (Chaudhary, 1999; Hooper and Hamid, 2003; Lyon, 2004).

A few studies (e.g. Eglar, 1960; Gazdar, 2007) have briefly examined the asymmetrical relations between Kammi and Zamindar Quoms, which suggest the existence of collective social hierarchies and inequalities in caste system practiced in rural Pakistan.

Eglar (1960) provided the most comprehensive description of the caste relations in the context of a Punjabi village. This study found that Zamindars and Kammiss are traditionally linked through the labour contract i.e. *Seyp* system, in which Kammiss are provided grains/crops, money, food, and favours in return for their labour and services. Zamindars are the dominant caste group, who control the village affairs and compete for the leadership roles. However, Eglar experienced an acquiescent type of caste system and did not examine the power dynamics involved in the relations of asymmetrical reciprocity between Zamindars and Kammiss. Similarly, some other studies mention that the traditional Zamindar Quoms in Punjab have maintained their monopolistic control over land against Kammi Quoms, and they typically dominate the social, economic, and political aspects of the village life (Eglar, 1960; Gazdar, 2007; Nadvi & Obinson, 2004; Richerson et al, 1996). A poverty assessment report by the Planning and Development, Government of Punjab (2003) identified caste as one of the major reasons for social exclusion and poverty, and highlighted that the Kammi's rights to participation in social, political, and economic affairs of the village are restricted because of their lower standing on the caste hierarchy. While Kammiss and Zamindars are the distinct social groups and dynamics of their relations are clearly asymmetrical, none of the studies conducted on caste in Pakistan address how such social inequalities define the villager's life experiences around the issues of power and difference, which result in different forms of social oppression and violence.

In Pakistan, there is little tolerance in the public domain of any serious discussion about caste and caste based oppression, social hierarchies, and discrimination, though such marginalization is widespread in many parts of the country (Gazdar, 2007).

While academics have increasingly emphasized gender along with other dimensions of social inequality, gender is largely ignored in the literature on caste system in Pakistan. Eglar (1960) briefly discussed how the gender roles performed by Kammi and Zamindar women differ in a Punjab village, which clearly suggests a status hierarchy among them. Similarly, the dynamics of labour relations between Kammi and Zamindar men are asymmetrical. However, Eglar did not detail how the issues of inequality position men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms at different locations of gender-caste hierarchy to determine their social experiences in the village setting. During a field study on issues of social oppression in Pakistan, Gazdar (2007) documented several cases of rape against lower caste women and physical violence against lower caste men, and considered that it happens against them because of their weak socio-political position in society, and subordinate gender identity e.g.

construction of honour among lower caste men. His study suggests that there exists a relationship between caste, gender, and violence. The construction and experiences of gender across Kammiss and Zamindars are one of the major focuses of this research.

In contemporary Punjabi villages, the term “Zamindars” mostly refers to the members of a landowning Quom involved in agriculture (Zamindari) as their occupation. However, it is important to note that the term “Zamindars” do not merely hold economic or occupational meanings, and thus is not used for the members of service providing Quoms doing Zamindari (Eglar, 1960). In another context, the term “Zamindars” is used as a status category to distinguish the members of landowning Quoms from the members of service providing Quoms i.e. “Kammiss” and refers to the parentage occupation of a landowning Quom e.g. Rajputs, Jats. Similarly, the term “Kammiss” denotes an occupational category and is traditionally reserved for the members of service providing Quoms working as labourers and service providers for the villagers. However, like the term “Zamindars”, the term “Kammiss” also serves as a status category that is used to distinguish the members of service providing Quoms and landowning Quoms. In this research, the terms “Zamindars” and “Kammiss” are predominantly used as status categories⁶ in order to examine the group hierarchy and the inter-group relations between landowning Quoms and service providing Quoms in the village setting. It should also be noted that this research focuses on the collective social hierarchy and thus the asymmetrical group dynamics between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms in order to look at the system of social stratification in caste society of a Punjabi village. Intra-group relations are beyond the scope of this study and are only considered to develop a deeper understanding of the context.

In Punjabi villages, the ownership of land, cultivation as an occupational category by parentage, and agrarian economy form the basis of caste structures and determine the traditional caste relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. Therefore, the socio-economic bases of village life are organized around the land and agriculture and its changing dynamics (Richerson et al, 1996). Punjab province is the most populous and an agricultural region contributing 68% of agricultural output in Pakistan (Government of the Punjab, 2010). However, the agricultural patterns and land productivity vary considerably across the arid and irrigated zones of Punjab, which affect the caste structures in the villages located in each zone differently. While land in the irrigated

⁶ See chapter 5 for the discussion on “Zamindars” and “Kammiss” as status and occupational categories in the context of contemporary Punjabi villages.

zone is very fertile and cultivation is the major source of livelihood, agricultural activity in the arid zone of Punjab depends heavily on rain and the productivity of land is quite low (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). As a result, the dynamics of the caste system across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages also differ, especially in terms of the labour relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. Therefore, this research is conducted in two villages in the Punjab region of Pakistan, each village treated as a unit of analysis; one in an arid and other in an irrigated agricultural area⁷. The researcher examined how the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence differ across both agricultural contexts in Punjab.

Specifically, the study aims to:

- i) Understand the dynamics of caste system and inter-group relations between Zamindar (land owning) and Kammi (service providing) Quoms in contemporary Punjabi villages.
- ii) Investigate the asymmetrical nature of social interactions between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms.
- iii) Look at the power structures in caste society of Punjabi villages and its effects on Kammi and Zamindar Quoms in terms of their rights to participation in village affairs.
- iv) Examine how gender and caste interact to produce different shades of gender identity i.e. masculinities and femininities across Kammis and Zamindars.
- v) Study the dynamics of power relations between different caste-gender identities in the community sphere of a Punjabi village.
- vi) Understand caste and gender as an interlocking system of social oppression.
- vii) Look at the patterns and forms of community violence configured around the caste relations and varied gender constructions across Kammis and Zamindars.
- viii) Examine the changes in the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence over time.

⁷ See chapter 4 - Methodology (section 4.3: The Research Design) for a discussion on the caste study comparative research and the dynamics of caste across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages in Punjab province.

In order to investigate the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence, the research questions were developed as follows:

- What is the relationship between caste, gender, and violence in contemporary Pakistan?
- How do the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence operate on the local level?
- How are the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence changing over time at the local level in contemporary Pakistan?

1.1. Outline of Chapters

This thesis is organised into nine chapters. Chapter two and three review the literature and different theoretical perspectives relevant to this research. Chapter four looks at the methodological framework and the data collection methods used. Chapters five to eight analyse the data collected during the fieldwork and Chapter nine concludes the research by drawing the analytical themes together and also suggests the agenda for future research in the area of caste system in Pakistan.

Chapter two provides the review of literature about the caste system and its context in Pakistan. After conceptualizing the term ‘caste’ in broader terms, the chapter argues that the caste system in Pakistan should not be compared with the categories of Hindu caste system. Though certain characteristics of both contexts are shared in common, the bases of caste system practiced in Muslim Pakistan are totally different to the Hindu caste system. It is argued that the caste system in Pakistan is founded on the birth-ascribed occupational categories and there are two major divisions i.e. Zamindar Quoms, landowners/cultivators, and Kammi Quoms, service providers/non-cultivators. The caste system in Pakistan does not have a religious basis or purity rituals, like the Hindu caste system. Furthermore, the chapter compares caste and class as two different tools that the researchers used to measure the social stratification in rural Pakistan and proposes that the caste is the more appropriate criterion in this regard. It is explained how the labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis exist in an institutionalized way and play an important role in organizing the village life. The chapter concludes that the traditional Zamindar Quoms have maintained their control over village affairs and Kammi Quoms are socially marginalized because of their lower standing on the caste based power hierarchy.

Chapter three provides an overview of the gender and violence in the context of caste societies of rural Pakistan. The chapter suggests that the structures of patriarchy and gender in a caste society are mediated through the caste system and there may be considerable diversity in the gender roles and identities and gender relations across the two major caste divisions, i.e. Zamindars and Kammiss, in the context of a Pakistani village. After discussing a few of the different definitions and typologies of violence, the chapter interprets various theoretical paradigms of violence in terms of the caste relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms in a Punjabi village and concludes that the theory of intersectionality can be the preferred approach, though other theories can also be used to analyse different aspects of the caste relations.

Chapter four looks at the methodological considerations and the data collection methods employed in this research. The present study is positioned within the qualitative approach in social research and understands the social reality from an interpretivist standpoint. Furthermore, the research design, data source and sampling strategy, use of in-depth semi structured interviews as a tool of data collection, the scheme for entering fieldwork sites and conducting research, and techniques used for transcribing and analysing data are discussed. The chapter also includes the ethical considerations of the research and the fieldwork experiences of the researcher in Pakistan.

The analysis part of this thesis starts from chapter five, which discusses the dynamics of the caste system in contemporary Punjabi villages. The caste system as an institution, its functioning and the changing nature of relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms are analysed. However, the chapter highlights that the Kammi and Zamindar Quoms are still divided into two mutually exclusive social groups. Kammiss in contemporary Punjabi villages can be divided into two categories. One category includes all those Kammiss who are still involved in the low graded tasks associated with Kammi Quoms and depend on Zamindars for their livelihood. The other category includes a few of those Kammiss who are educated and better off and do not depend on Zamindars anymore. Labourer Kammiss are larger in number than the educated/better off Kammiss in contemporary Punjabi villages. The dynamics of social interaction of both categories of Kammiss with Zamindars of their village vary. It is discussed that the inter-Quom endogamy remains a strict divide between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms; Zamindars and Kammiss, in either of the categories, do not inter-marry. The chapter examines a number of different reasons behind the decline of caste occupations associated with Kammi Quoms. However, Kammiss are always recognized through their caste based

parentage occupations, even if they opt for other occupations. The Seyp system that used to connect Kammi and Zamindar Quoms in labour relations is also coming to end with time as a result of the availability of other labour opportunities to Kammis e.g. industrial labour and decline in their caste occupations. Furthermore, the chapter discusses how Punjabis associate the status of being a Zamindar with the possession of ancestral land and cultivation as the parentage occupation. Hence, the members of non cultivator castes, Kammis, cannot attain the status of being Zamindars. The chapter compares the caste system and its changing dynamics across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages and explains why caste organization of the irrigated zone's village is more persistent than the arid zone's village. The Seyp system maintains the labour relations in the irrigated zone's village. Conversely, the Seyp system had ended in the arid zone's village around a couple of decades ago due to the limited agriculture. The chapter concludes that the Zamindar and Kammi Quoms in the contemporary Punjabi villages are still divided into strict birth-ascribed status groups.

Chapter six discusses how the villager's rights to participation are mediated through their caste memberships and caste organization of their village. Power structures organized around the caste statuses and Biradari affiliations restrict the Kammi Quom's rights to participate in the social, economic, and political affairs of their villages. They are excluded from the mainstream village activities in socially prescribed ways i.e. ceremonial occasions, collective decision making, and electoral process. Moreover, the chapter analyses how the villager's rights to access state institutions, e.g. police and courts, and to benefit from public welfare programmes may involve their Biradari and caste affiliations. Considering the asymmetrical social interactions between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms, the chapter details the process of social marginalization of Kammis in Punjabi villages. It is discussed how Kammis are denied justice at different levels in village life. On the other hand, Zamindars, as a group, control the collective village affairs and dominate the social, economic, and political activities in the village. The chapter develops a comparison between the arid and the irrigated zone's villages and mentions that the caste based power relations and system of patronage were stronger and more structured in the irrigated zone's village than the arid zone's village. While the ⁸Dera system does not exist in the arid zone's village, it is seen as an institution in the irrigated zone's village that plays an important part in organizing the social and political affairs of the village and thus upholding the caste structures.

⁸ See chapter 6 for a discussion on the Dera system in the irrigated zone's village.

Chapter seven explains how the intersectionality of caste and gender produce different shades of gender identity, masculinities and femininities, across Kammis and Zamindars. It is discussed how the power dynamics organized around the caste statuses and caste based social, economic and political affairs of a Punjabi village determine the gender identities of the villagers. The chapter examines the interaction patterns among different gender-caste identities in the village setting. It is highlighted that the educated and better off Kammis are upholding the practices associated with hegemonic masculinity and emphasized femininity as a result of the decline in traditional caste system. The chapter also discusses how the gendered experiences of Kammis and Zamindars in the village sphere may vary across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages of Punjab.

Chapter eight discusses the patterns of violence and social oppression configured around the intersectionality of caste and gender and thus intends to analyse the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in the context of a Punjabi village. The patterns of domination and physical violence among the caste collateral (equals) and against caste subordinates are examined separately. The chapter then looks at the patterns of sexual violence against women in the village sphere. It is explained how the dynamics of different forms of community violence and social oppression are changing, especially against Kammis, as a result of the decline in the caste system and transforming labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis. The chapter also describes how the dynamics of caste based violence may vary across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages in Punjab. Since the caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were stronger than the arid zone's village, Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were more vulnerable towards different forms of social oppression and acts of violence.

Finally, chapter nine brings the major analytical themes of the thesis together by summarizing the findings of the chapter five, six, seven, and eight. The final section of the chapter presents the recommendations for the future research in the area of caste system in Pakistan.

Chapter Two

The Caste System and its Context in Pakistan

2.1. Introduction

This chapter reviews the literature relevant to the caste system in Pakistan. Key themes include the conceptualization of caste, caste in the Pakistani context, caste system and labour relations, caste and political organization in rural Pakistan, and caste as a system of social exclusion. The discussion begins by considering the argument on the conceptualization of caste as a primary institution of Hindu India or as a universal structural category, in non Hindu terms, signifying any kind of closed status groups. Correspondingly, the chapter argues that caste in rural Pakistan should not be understood in terms of the Hindu context. Instead, the caste system in Pakistan indicates a structural phenomenon representing closed status groups and their hierarchical positioning on the basis of parentage occupational categories. Furthermore, different definitions of the caste are analysed and a set of primary characteristics of the caste system is elaborated by developing a comparison between the practices of caste system among Muslims in Pakistan and Hindus in India. The caste system in Pakistan exists in the form of indigenous hierarchical groupings like Zaat and Quom, in the absence of classical categories of the Hindu caste system i.e. Brahmins, Kshatriya, Vaishya, and Shudra. The fundamental divisions are described as between the landowning castes, Zamindars, and the service providing castes, Kammi. The following sections discuss the labour relations, social exclusion of Kammi Quoms, and political organization in rural Pakistan in the context of the caste system. One of the main focuses of the chapter is to compare the caste and class as two different tools to analyse the system of social stratification in rural Pakistan.

2.2. Conceptualizing Caste

Derived from a Portuguese word 'casta' which means lineage, breed or race (Freitas, 2006) the word caste has been dealt with differently by anthropologists and sociologists. Mostly referred to as a fundamental institution of Hindu India by the ethnographers, the concept of caste as a sociological category denotes any kind of class structure of exceptional rigidity in any society (Barth, 1960; Leach, 1969). Such double usage of the concept raised the argument, whether to understand caste as a cultural occurrence exclusively referring to the Hindu society or as a structural phenomenon denoting a highly generalized discussion about the nature of closed status groups, i.e. race,

ethnicity, nobility etc, or different types of social inequalities and differentiations in every society (Gerth and Mills, 1947; Leach, 1969). However conceptualizing caste by detaching it from its original geographical, cultural, and historical Hindu Indian context is difficult and using it outside India has always been questioned by academics. Hence, caste is mostly understood as a cultural phenomenon specific to the Hindu Indian society (Lyon, 2004; Sharma, 1999).

In the Hindu context, caste is described as a specific and distinctive type of socio-religious stratification comprising different hereditary groups placed in a hierarchy according to their ritual statuses. These ritual statuses are determined according to the notions of pure and impure in terms of purity of blood and the nature of work (Dumont, 1970; Miller, 1975). Some kinds of purity in the Hindu caste system are inherent i.e. a Brahman is born with an inherent purity and a Sweeper and Chamar, leatherworker, is inherently polluted. The touch of a sweeper's body is polluting to the ones higher in the caste hierarchy. Purity is connected to the ritual cleanliness, which includes bathing in flowing water, eating the food appropriated for one's caste, abstaining from physical contact with the lower caste's people and keeping away from ritually impure substances like body wastes and excretions etc (Dumont, 1970; Freitas, 2006). However, the notions of purity and pollution in Hindu India vary considerably across castes and regions (Chakravarty, 2003). On the other hand, the caste system in India is going through a number of alterations and Sharma (2004) argues that the caste eventually may be reduced to a word denoting merely a group of people in any society.

Hindus and Muslims in the sub continent practice the caste system with significant variations (Sikand, 2004; Werbner, 1989). The caste system in Hindu communities has a religious basis (Liddle and Joshi, 1986) but the Muslim's holy texts and teachings insist on equality of all Muslims (Alavi, 1972; Lyon, 2004). For the non Hindus, caste practices are the cultural residue of Hinduism (Eglar, 1960). Nevertheless, despite these differences, the caste system has been seen as an essential feature of both Hindu and Muslim societies in the sub continent (Chakravarty, 2003; Sikand, 2004; Werbner, 1989).

Robert Riskey, a British anthropologist, is considered as one of the pioneer western writers on the practices of caste in the Indian region. His books "The Tribes and Castes of Bengal (1892)" and "The People of India (1915)" describe the Indian culture in detail. He understands caste as:

A collection of families, or groups of families, bearing a common name, which usually denotes or is associated with specific occupation claiming common descent from a mythical ancestor, human or divine, professing to follow the same professional calling and regarded by those who are competent to give an opinion as forming a single and homogeneous community (cited in Sharma, 2004: 149).

Risley's argument that the people from a caste group claim common descent from a mythical ancestor is questioned by Hutton (1946). However, his definition rightly depicts the origin of caste system in the Indian region while arguing that the caste system primarily rests on the ancestral occupations. According to Freitas (2006), Risley claims that the caste system exists to prevent the racial mixing but does not explain the other features of the caste system. However, Freitas (2006), himself, did not talk about the features which Risley overlooked in his definition of caste. Risley proposed a broader definition addressing both Muslim and Hindu contexts of the caste in the region. A more comprehensive definition was given by A W Green (1939) (cited in Sharma 2004).

Caste is a system of stratification in which mobility, movement up and down the status ladder, at least ideally may not occur. A person's ascribed status is his life time status. Birth determines occupation, place of residence, style of life, personal associates and the group from among whom one must find a mate. A caste system always includes the notion that physical or even some forms of social contacts with the lower caste people is degrading to higher caste persons. The caste system is also protected by law and sanctified by religion (Sharma, 2004: 149).

This covers a number of features of the caste system but depicts caste as a highly rigid phenomenon and characterizes only the Hindu caste system. It suggests that the options in a caste society are very limited in terms of life style, relationship patterns, occupations, and mate selection. On the other hand, academics stress that the people from lower castes in the modern India are changing their occupations, places of residence, life styles, and personal associates as a result of the increasing trends of urbanization and migration towards cities (Freitas, 2006; Sharma, 2004). Sharma (2004) writes that inter-caste marriages are on the increase in contemporary Indian society and thus the mate selection and relationship patterns are no more a caste phenomenon. People have started changing their occupations on the basis of monetary strengths, even if a person's caste is determined by birth. Furthermore, the occupations are no longer fixed in terms of castes and different professions are open to people of any caste. As a result, Brahmins have rather become deprived of their past respect and inter-caste relationships are also changing. Conversely, while increasing urbanization was seen as a factor weakening the social bonds of caste, Sharma (2004) asserts that the patterns of change in caste cannot be generalized across the rural and urban areas. It is mentioned

that the geographical isolation and long established social structures of the rural India are favourable conditions for perpetuating the caste system. The above discussion suggests that the caste in India is changing due to urbanization and modernization of economy, and therefore old definitions need revising.

Barth (1960) understood caste among Swati Pakhtuns in North Pakistan as a structural category in non-Hindu terms and defined caste as:

A hierarchical system of stable social groups, differing greatly in wealth, privilege, power, and the respect accorded to them by others. In any such system the organization of one stratum may only meaningfully be described with reference to its relations to the other strata [1960: 131].

However, from the discussion of the literature, caste in the Pakistani context used in this thesis is as follows:

A hierarchical system of hereditary based and endogamous stable social groups with definite occupational specializations, differing greatly in privilege, power, and the respect accorded to them by others. In any such system the organization of one stratum may only meaningfully be described with reference to its relations to the other strata.

Caste in Pakistani context represents the hierarchical positioning of hereditary based occupational groups and can be regarded as the defining feature of caste system practiced in rural Pakistan (Barth, 1960; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004). Above suggested definition incorporates the aspects of definite occupations, hereditary, and endogamy, which were overlooked by Barth (1960) in his definition of caste and are the essential characteristics of caste system in Pakistani context (Ahmad, 1970; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004). The word “wealth” is excluded from the definition of caste given by Barth. He discussed the differences in wealth, privilege, power, and respect, accorded to a group by others, as the characteristics of caste society in Swat. Although the service castes are reported as the poorest in rural Pakistan (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003), arguably the caste groups, or individual members from different caste groups, may not always differ greatly in wealth. However, it is important to mention that the mere fact of being wealthy or acquiring some land does not raise the social status of service castes, Kammiss (Eglar, 1960) and villagers associate status with caste memberships and not the economic possessions.

Contrary to the Hindu caste system, caste practices in Pakistan do not prohibit the physical contact between people from different caste groups, as described by A W Green (1939), nor is the place of residence, or the style of life determined by one’s caste, even within the long established rural structures (Eglar, 1960). While the literature on

caste system in India has discussed the changing caste structures as a result of the modernization of economy, industrialization, and urbanization (e.g. Sharma, 2004), this has been neglected in the Pakistani context.

2.2.1 Characteristics of Caste System

Determination by Birth (Ascriptiveness)

Birth is the fundamental feature of a caste system. A person is granted caste membership on the basis of his/her birth into one particular caste group. The caste of a person cannot change despite changes in his/her occupation, educational level or financial position (Blunt, 1969; Freitas, 2006; Sharma, 2004). This feature of caste is applicable both in Hindu Indian and Muslim Pakistan. Birth in a lower caste group attaches a lifelong stigma of subordinate identity to the members of that caste e.g. barbers, even if they acquire higher education or join respectable professions later in their life. While caste system is in decline, the birth-ascribed statuses continue to be the differentiating factor between landowning, Zamindar, and service providing, Kammi, Quoms in rural Pakistan (Eglar, 1960; Hooper and Hamid, 2003; Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003).

Definite Occupations

Caste is defined according to the occupational specializations. Hindu scripture mentions the occupations and occupational functions of all the varnas i.e. Brahmins, Kshatriya, Vaishya, and Shudra. Lowest on the hierarchy are assigned the task to do menial work for all the other varnas (Dutt, 1965; Ghurye, 1961; Sharma, 2004). On the other side, caste divisions in Pakistan are between landowning/cultivator Quoms, Zamindars, and artisan/service providing Quoms, Kammi. Since the villagers in rural Pakistan are increasingly leaving their parentage occupations associated with their Quoms and opting for other employment, caste occupations are no longer relevant. However, the members of different caste groups are always identified through their parentage occupational specializations e.g. barbers or cobblers, which play central role in defining their social relations with others in the village setting (Ahmad, 1970; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004).

Hierarchical Positioning

Caste groups are ranked hierarchically on the basis of occupations associated with their castes. An individual's social position or rank depends on his/her membership in a caste group (Freitas, 2006; Hooper and Hamid, 2003; Klass, 1993). Hindu castes are ranked

in order of Brahmins, Kshatriya, Vaishya, and Shudra (Sharma, 2004). However, Freitas (2006) suggested that the caste based hierarchical positioning can be local and fluid depending on the changes observed over time and place. It is mentioned that in the modern day India an individual's social status is the combination of his achievements and caste. Similarly, Sharma (2004) pointed out that the caste hierarchies are exaggerated in South India. On the other side, the basic caste divisions exist between landowning Quoms, Zamindars, and service providing Quoms, Kammi, in rural Pakistan, with former placed higher on the caste hierarchy. Academics mostly deny any internal rankings within Zamindar Quoms or Kammi Quoms. A few of the Quoms e.g. Arains, vegetable growers, are above the service providing castes but they are not mostly given the status of landowning castes either (Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004; Werbner, 1989).

Endogamous Group

Traditionally the caste groups in India and Pakistan are endogamous (Kapadia, 1958; Eglar, 1960). However, Sharma (2004) mentioned that the inter-caste marriages are increasing in Modern India. Conversely, Sharma also highlighted that the inter-caste marriages are not sanctified in the traditional Hindu communities even at present. Endogamous form of marriage is used as a means to preserve purity within the castes, since marrying to a lower caste person is considered as polluting one's own lineage. Caste endogamy is practiced in Pakistan as well and different Quoms do not inter-marry or at least do not prefer to marry out of their Quoms (Alavi, 1972; Barth, 1960; Eglar, 1960; Leach, 1969). While a few studies suggest that the landowning Quoms inter-marry, the caste endogamy between Kammi and Zamindar Quoms exists as an essential feature of the caste system practiced in rural Pakistan (Ahmad, 1970; Blood, 1994; Eglar, 1960).

Commensality/Rules and Regulations Concerning Food

Restrictions are placed on eating or drinking with the members of other caste groups in the Hindu caste system. Moreover, the caste system governs the rules of accepting or not accepting food from the members of other castes. While there may be no restrictions to accept fruit, milk, butter, dry fruits etc, bread and certain other foods can only be accepted from the members of one's own or higher caste. The conduct of commensality originates from the rituals of purity or impurity in the Hindu caste system (Freitas, 2006; Sharma, 2004). Conversely, the practices of commensality do not exist in Muslim

Pakistan and people from different caste groups eat and drink together and also share food with each other (Ahmad, 1970; Eglar, 1960).

Touchability and Status

Rules of touchability are part of the Hindu caste organization. Touch or at times even the shadow of lower caste individuals is considered as defiling the members of upper castes. Brahmins maintain their caste superiority by not touching lower caste people or by keeping them at a certain distance. While untouchability is practiced rather firmly in certain parts of India, such practices are in decline as a result of the increasing urbanization trends (Sharma, 2004). Conversely, untouchability is virtually absent in Pakistan, being a Muslim society (Ahmad, 1970; Eglar, 1960; Sikand, 2004).

While academics propose not applying the categories of classical Hindu caste system on Pakistani society (e.g. Barth, 1960), there are some significant similarities between the caste systems practiced across two different societies. The Varna and Jati systems in India have the similar characteristics to the Zamindar-Kammi divisions and Quom system in rural Pakistan. The Varna system groups the society into four idealised main types as Brahmins, Kshatriyas, Vaishyas, and Shudras. On the other side, the main caste divisions in rural Pakistan exist between Zamindars and Kammiss. Jatis in the Hindu caste system refer to the endogamous social groups associated with specific hereditary based occupations and membership in a Jati is a birth ascribed status. Different Jatis are included in a Varna e.g. different artisan, labourer, and service providing Jatis comprise the category of Shudra Varna (Dumont, 1980; Lal, 2005). Similarly, different Quoms jointly makeup the categories of Kammiss and Zamindars in the caste system practiced in rural Pakistan. All the service providing, labourer, and artisan Quoms are grouped together as Kammiss e.g. barbers, carpenters, and cobblers. Different landowning Quoms e.g. Rajputs, Jats, and Gujjars are included in the category of Zamindars (Ahmad, 1970; Eglar, 1960). Like the Jatis in the Hindu caste system, different Kammi and Zamindar Quoms are endogamous social groups, and as a result form the Biradari system i.e. kinship groups. People show loyalty to their Jatis and Quoms, especially in the struggles for power and leadership e.g. in elections. While the dynamics of the caste system in India and Pakistan are changing, Jatis and Quoms are still an important factor in marriage practices and mate selection (Lal, 2005; Lyon, 2004). Similarly, the occupational identities associated with the membership in different Jatis and Quoms cannot be changed, even if the members do not follow those occupations later in their life e.g. members of barber Quom/Jati are always recognized through their hereditary

occupation (Lal, 2005; Lyon, 2004). Jatis and Quoms are seen as the most significant principles of organization and categorization in the caste systems practiced in India and Pakistan respectively. The above discussion suggests how the main characteristics of the caste system i.e. determination by birth, definite occupations, hierarchical positioning, and endogamous grouping are associated with the membership in Jatis and Quoms, and are similar between the caste systems practiced among Hindus of India and Muslims of Pakistan. However, it is important to mention that there is no comprehensive system of ritual statuses and notions of pure and impure associated with the main caste divisions of Zamindars and Kammiss or different Quoms, like in the Hindu caste system, and social stratification is expressed in everyday profane situations in a number of different ways (Barth, 1960). On the other side, in the Hindu caste system, membership in a Jati determines the rules and regulations concerning food and touchability for the members, through a socio-religious system of ritual statuses (Bates, 1995; Dumont, 1980).

It is important to consider that the above section compared the classical Hindu caste system in India with Pakistani caste system. Besides Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs in India also practice the caste system with some variations. Among Indian Muslims, the major caste divisions are between Ashrafs and Non Ashrafs, with former higher on the caste hierarchy. Ashrafs claim a foreign decent and are divided into four caste group i.e. Sayyads, Shiekhs, Mughals, and Pathans. Non Ashrafs converted from Hinduism and belonged to the local population. Among non Ashrafs, those who were the higher caste Hindus before conversion consider themselves superior on the caste hierarchy than the other non Ashraf Muslims associated with service providing castes (Bhatti, 1996; Sharma, 2004). Similarly, while the Sikh faith prohibits caste hierarchies and Brahmanical ideology is rather weak in the Indian Punjab, a caste system exists among Sikhs as well. Social relations and the political economy of agriculture, especially in the rural Punjab, are structured around the caste system. Like the Pakistani caste system, the major caste divisions among Sikhs are between landowning cultivators, mostly Jats, and service providing castes (Jodhka, 2004; Puri, 2003).

2.3. Caste System in the Pakistani Context

Most of the studies discussing the dynamics of caste in Pakistan were conducted in the Punjabi villages (e.g. Ahmad, 1970; Alavi, 1972; Chaudhary, 1999; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004), except a few which examined the caste structures in Pakhtun communities (e.g. Ahmed, 1980; Barth, 1960). Hence, the discussion on caste cannot be generalized all

over the Pakistan, especially the urban areas. The studies point to two broad caste divisions in the Pakistani society i.e. between cultivator/ landowning Quoms, Zamindars, and artisans/service providing Quoms, Kammis. Different landowning Quoms traditionally associated with cultivation as their parentage occupation makeup the broader category called “Zamindars”. Nearly all of the members of any Zamindar Quom residing in a Punjabi village own land with varying size of their landholdings. In addition, they may acquire some more land on rent/contract from other Zamindars of their village or surrounding villages. Hence, they can be land owners or tenants. On the other hand, members of all the artisan/service providing Quoms e.g. barber, carpenter, cobbler, blacksmith, weaver, potter, Mussali (labourer) are jointly called as “Kammis”. They serve the villagers as labour or with their crafts and assist cultivators in their occupation. Kammis inherit the occupational crafts associated with their Quom from their ancestors. While Kammis may opt for other professions later in their life, they are always identified in the village setting through their parentage occupations e.g. barber, carpenter. A very few Kammis in a village may own some land and thus cultivate. However, they are not given the status of being Zamindars since this status is associated with the Quom membership and not the material possessions (Ahmad, 1970; Alavi, 1972; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004).

Academics have mostly denied the internal ranking of Zamindar or Kammi Quoms (Alavi, 1972; Eglar, 1960). Eglar (1960) mentioned that Zamindars deal with members of different Kammi Quoms of their village equally, not positioning one over others as a Quom. While barbers are seen as most refined among Kammi Quoms by Eglar (1960), she emphasized that the special position of barbers in the village structure does not signify that their Quom is placed higher than other Kammi Quoms. There are various degrees of importance attached to the occupations of different Kammi Quoms but they are not ranked on caste hierarchy (Eglar, 1960). However, it is important to mention that the individual variations in terms of economic possessions or educational and occupational achievements may exist in a Kammi Quom but the birth-ascribed Quom status of the members does not change and they are always recognized through their memberships in a specific Quom category e.g. barbers or cobblers. Eglar (1960) referred to a few such cases in her study of a Punjabi village and talked about a barber in Mohla who was educated even in 1960 and was working as clerk in railways, though still a member of barber’s Quom. Moreover, she described that a Kammi at times may receive land as gift of his services rendered to a Zamindar or can purchase land if he can

prove that some ancestor of his up to the seventh generation possessed a piece of land. It is mentioned that acquiring land is the greatest longing for Kammis of a village since ownership of land gives Zamindars a superior position over Kammis. Nevertheless, Kammis are not given the status of being Zamindars, even if they acquire land (Eglar, 1960). It suggests that the individual's mobility may be possible within a Quom, in comparison to the other members of that Quom, but their status recognition in terms of their group identity does not change. However, Eglar did not argue how the possession of land, acquiring education, or a governmental job may uplift the status of a Kammi among other members of different Kammi Quoms, and thus positively affect his social experiences in the village life. It is important to note that Eglar conducted her research in 1960 when nearly all Kammis were associated with their Quom occupations. Thus, Eglar (1960) dealt with all Kammis of Mohla as a single category. Arguably, in the contemporary Punjabi villages, quite a few Kammis are educated or have opted for respectable professions and they are categorized higher on the status hierarchy than the Kammis still involved in their Quom occupations or other low graded tasks, though their Quom status does not change. Hence, it is important to investigate how the social mobility among Kammis in terms of education, economic possessions, or occupation may uplift their social standing in the village life and thus create further status categories within a Kammi Quom. Nevertheless, it is important to note that the Quom membership and thus the Quom status is an immutable criterion and members of any Kammi Quom cannot move up the status hierarchy in the overall system of social stratification involving Zamindar and Kammi Quoms.

In the same way, academics deny the internal ranking of different Zamindar Quoms (Alavi, 1972; Eglar, 1960). Werbner (1989) mentioned that the members of every Zamindar Quom position themselves higher than other Zamindar Quoms. Different Zamindar Quoms populate different regions of the Punjab province e.g. Rajputs in the North Punjab, and arguably they place themselves higher on the caste hierarchy than Zamindar Quoms residing in the other regions. However, there is no consensus among academics about the hierarchical ranking of Zamindar Quoms. A few studies suggest that most of the Punjabi villages are owned by Rajputs or Jats, and they are categorized higher on the Zamindar's internal caste hierarchy (Ahmad, 1970; Blood, 1994). Some other studies used the size of landholdings or roles of patronage to analyse the asymmetrical relations between Zamindars, through the Quom statuses of the members remain same. While conducting an anthropological study in a Punjabi village, Alavi

divided members of Zamindar Quom in three categories i.e. landlords who own a substantial area of land, independent small landholders who cultivate their own land, and the poor peasants who are either landless or own too little land and work as sharecroppers and/or wage labourers for other Zamindars (1972). However, instead of placing them on a hierarchy or developing sharply distinguishing groups on the basis of their land possessions, Alavi understood the above mentioned categories of Zamindars through their patron-client relationships. A few others studies (e.g. Ahmad, 1970; Lyon, 2004) also analysed the dynamics of relationships between Zamindars through the roles of patronage and client-ship or variations in the area of their landholdings. However, academics suggest that the caste statuses of the participants in such relationships remain equal. The above discussion shows that the academics mostly agree on Zamindars and Kammiss as two major caste divisions in the Punjabi villages and avoid dividing them into further sub categories on the caste hierarchy.

Lyon (2004) mentioned that much of the literature on the caste system in Pakistan proposes that the caste organization should be seen as a horizontal category. Perhaps Alavi (1972) is the foremost proponent of the non existence of hierarchical positioning of different Quoms in the caste system practiced in Pakistan and argued that the caste ranking is obscure for the Muslims with the exception of Syeds, descendants of the Islamic Prophet Muhammad. The main argument about the horizontal nature of caste system in Pakistan is derived from the comparison/tension between the caste organization of Hindu India that stresses the hierarchical relations of different caste groups and the Islamic ethos stating equality amongst all human beings (Lyon, 2004; Werbner, 1989). Pakistanis view the caste system as the cultural residue of Hindus which refers to the inherited occupations (Eglar, 1960).

Like Alavi (1972), Eglar (1960) understood the caste system in a Punjabi village Mohla as a horizontal category. Though Eglar (1960) identified the two main caste divisions i.e. Zamindars and Kammiss and also looked at their social relations in the village life, she advocated the notions of equality and unity among members of both caste groups, all of whom were Muslims. It is highlighted that being members of different castes does not create social barriers among Zamindars and Kammiss and they all live in close association with each other. Eglar (1960) focused on the practices that differentiate the Hindu caste system from the one prevalent in Punjabi villages of Pakistan and described that Zamindars and Kammiss sit together at the common places for villagers, smoke a common Huka, fetch water from a shared well, accept food from one another's house,

pray side by side in the mosque, and eating together of Kammiss and Zamindars is not prohibited. However, Eglar's description of other aspects of village life in Mohla clearly suggests the existence of status hierarchy among Kammiss and Zamindars. For example, labour relations between Zamindars and Kammiss are the relations of asymmetrical reciprocity characterized by socio-economic interdependence. She also mentioned that the possession of land and caste status render a superior position to Zamindars over Kammiss. Moreover, the leadership roles always reside with Zamindars, which clearly indicate the hierarchical categorization of Kammi and Zamindar Quoms in Mohla.

The claim that the caste organization in rural Pakistan is horizontal is open to criticism and a few researchers (e.g. Ahmad, 1970; Barth, 1981; Gazdar, 2007) have used caste as a measure of social stratification in rural Pakistan. Barth (1981) looked at the caste as a system of social stratification among Swati Pakhtuns in North Pakistan and explained that the caste system involves the hierarchical positioning of different stable social groups in accordance with their occupational specializations. Barth developed a list of these hierarchically ordered social groups and placed landowning Pakhtun castes on the top of hierarchy followed by different craftsman specialists. It is suggested that each stratum in this system of organization can only be understood through its relations to other strata. Power relations organized around the ownership of land, agricultural economy, and roles of political patronage are always controlled by landowning Pakhtun Quoms. However, Barth (1960) conceptualized caste in terms of occupational rigidity, like Eglar (1960), and its applicability to contemporary rural Pakistan may be questionable, since people are increasingly leaving their caste occupations. Though the landowning Quoms and service providing Quoms may still exist as mutually exclusive and stable social groups in the caste society of rural Pakistan, it is important to investigate how the dynamics of their relations in the system of social stratification are changing given that the caste based occupational categories are no longer relevant.

Barth (1981) viewed caste as a structural phenomenon denoting hierarchically ordered groups on the basis of their occupational statuses. It is stressed that the Swat Quoms, being Sunni Muslims, should not be seen as castes in Hindu use of word, though some meaningful comparisons can be developed between both systems of social stratifications. In contrast to the Hindu caste organization, there is no ritual system in Swat to compare or order groups in relation to one another and social stratification is expressed through everyday life profane situations in a variety of different conducts

(Barth, 1981). Hence, Barth did not accept the idea of looking at the caste system in Pakistan in comparison to the Hindu caste organization.

Similarly, Ahmad (1970) applied caste to measure the system of social scarification in a Punjabi village Jalpana and his analysis clearly suggests the hierarchical positioning of Zamindars over Kammiss. All of his respondents unanimously agreed that Zamindars as a group occupy higher rank than the Kammiss, regardless of their economic standings. While a few Kammiss were working as cultivators in Jalpana, Ahmad placed them lower than Zamindar cultivators on the scale of occupational hierarchy. Hence, the villagers were ranked on the status hierarchy in accordance with their caste memberships and not their actual occupations or economic standings. Moreover, Ahmad did not find any evidence of inter marriages between Kammiss and Zamindars. It suggests that Kammiss and Zamindars in a Punjabi village are mutually exclusive categories with Zamindars ranked higher than Kammiss on the caste hierarchy. Consequently, Ahmad (1970) proposed that Kammi and Zamindar Quoms should not be ranked in the same hierarchy since they form two dissimilar systems, which arguably was a methodological weakness in his research. Instead of placing Kammiss and Zamindars on a collective caste hierarchy, Ahmad (1970) established two separately ranked categories of Zamindars and Kammiss, as autonomous social units and not the divisions of a single larger system. Conversely, Barth used a totally different theoretical strategy and suggested that:

In any such system the organization of one stratum can only meaningfully be described with reference to its relation to the other strata, and in the pages which follow the various Quoms are analysed as part of a single, larger system embracing the whole community, and not as autonomous social unit (1981: 16).

Barth (1981) rejected the idea of placing Kammiss and Zamindars into two mutually exclusive and autonomous social units while analysing the system of social stratification embracing whole community. It was suggested that social position of Kammiss and their place on the caste hierarchy can only be understood in relation to Zamindars and vice versa, which seems a valid idea methodologically.

While applying the Hindu caste organization on Zamindar and Kammi caste, as autonomous social units, Ahmad (1970) suggested that there exists a more caste like structure among Kammi Quoms. It was found that the strict practice of endogamy among Kammi Quoms support more caste like structures, like the Hindu caste system, than Zamindar Quoms who inter marry. Besides, internal caste hierarchy among Kammiss was more defined and distinct, like Hindu caste structures. On the other hand,

more Zamindars in Jalpana followed their ancestral occupation, i.e. cultivation, than Kammiss and it was the only variable that suggested that Zamindar Quoms are more caste like grouping than Kammiss.

Later in his research, Ahmad (1970) stressed that the preoccupation with caste as an analytical tool to measure the system of stratification in Punjabi villages is misleading and proposed that the class might be a more significant tool. However, the above discussion suggests that there were a few methodological flaws in his research that arguably led him to recommend that class might be a better tool than caste to study the system of social stratification in a Punjabi village.

Ahmad (1970) instantly rejected caste as a viable tool and applied class to look at the social stratification in Jalpana. Adopting a Marxist approach, he tried to describe the village structures in terms of organization of production by dividing the village population into occupational categories of cultivators and non cultivators. It was mentioned that the organization of production has two aspects i.e. modes of production and social relationships of production. Here, Ahmad placed Kammiss and Zamindars in the organization of production without their caste memberships and suggested that a person's class affiliation is dependent on his occupational position in the organization of production. It should be noted that Ahmad arranged the villagers, Kammiss and Zamindars, into cultivators and non cultivators with regard to their actual occupations, and not the caste based occupations. As mentioned above, a few Kammiss were also working as cultivators in Jalpana. Ahmad argued that the occupational membership determines the socioeconomic statuses, and thus social class, and is a better predictor of the behaviours than the memberships in a caste group. One's socioeconomic status changes with change of his position in the organization of production. Here, Ahmad (1970) totally ignored the Quom based status categories of Kammiss and Zamindars while placing the villagers on status hierarchy, which is open to criticism methodologically. Ahmad (1970) referred to another crucial aspect of the class membership mentioned by Marx which emphasizes that the position in organization of production is not an adequate measure to determine one's class but there should be presence or growth of class consciousness as well. Ahmad found that only a very few Kammiss in Jalpana ranked themselves in the higher social stratum, irrespective of their actual occupations. Arguably, subjective class placement of Kammiss in the higher stratum is always questionable, even if they opt for occupations associated with Zamindars, leaving their caste occupations. As discussed earlier, Kammiss are not given

the status of Zamindars, even if they acquire land or are involved in cultivation (Eglar, 1960). Considering the hierarchical categorization of Zamindars and Kammiss in a Punjabi village, villagers associate status with caste, and not the economic possessions i.e. class. It suggests that the caste consciousness plays an important role in shaping the class consciousness of the villagers and, if it is true, arguably the caste is a better predictor of the behaviours among villagers than class.

While Ahmad asserts that the caste is inappropriate to examine the social organization of a Punjabi village, Marriott's (1955) thesis about caste proposes that the caste was rather a better tool than class to analyse the village structures of Jalpana. Marriott suggested that caste applies to the social structures of those societies in which different Quoms, as parts of a single larger system, occupy corporate ranking in relation to each other and marry endogamously (1955). Moreover, it was described that the caste ranking depends on the high degree of consensus among members of a community about the standing of each caste group. Correspondingly in Ahmad's research, there was a mutual consensus among respondents that Zamindars as a group occupy higher rank than Kammiss. Ahmad ranked even cultivator Kammiss below Zamindars on the occupational hierarchy. Moreover, Ahmad's study suggest that Kammiss and Zamindars do not inter marry, and thus are endogamous social groups.

In conclusion the main caste divisions in rural Pakistan exist between the landowning castes, Zamindars, and service providing castes, Kammiss, which are seen as two mutually exclusive social units in terms of their caste statuses. The literature on caste in Pakistani context does not propose the further sub divisions among these two major caste categories. Considering the status hierarchy among members of Zamindar and Kammi Quoms, it is stressed that the class cannot be used as a tool to measure the system of social stratification in rural Pakistan since villagers associated status with caste and not the ownership/non ownership of economic assets. Arguably, class can be useful to look at the certain aspects of status hierarchy within a caste category e.g. among Zamindars on the basis of their landholdings, but not across the two major caste divisions i.e. Kammiss and Zamindars. Zamindars are always placed higher on the status hierarchy in caste societies of rural Pakistan. Hence, caste is recommended as a better tool to look at the village organization in Punjab and the dynamics of social relations among Kammi and Zamindar Quoms. Correspondingly, it is also argued that the caste in Pakistan is not a horizontal category, as suggested by a few studies (e.g. Alavi, 1972), but a vertical category.

2.3.1. Caste System and Labour Relations

A few of the studies conducted on the caste system in Pakistan have explained how different caste groups are connected in the relationships of asymmetrical reciprocity characterized by the socio economic interdependence (Barth, 1981; Chaudhary, 1999; Eglar, 1960). However, Eglar (1960) provided the most comprehensive description of the caste system and labour relations in the context of Punjabi villages through the Seyp contract between Zamindars and Kammis. The Seyp relationships customarily existed in most parts of Punjab in Pakistan (Chaudhary, 1999; Lyon, 2004). Seyp is a contractual relationship of asymmetrical reciprocity established not merely between two individuals but between two families. Families entered in the Seyp relationship become Seypis to each other. It is predominantly a work contract between a Zamindar and a Kammi household or between two Kammi households through the shared mutual obligations for the work and payment. Families can enter into a Seyp contract at any time and any of the men or women may initiate such contract on behalf of their families (Eglar, 1960).

In a Seyp relationship between a Zamindar family and a Kammi family, the Kammi family works for Zamindar family throughout the year. Alongside their caste based occupational crafts e.g. barbers are responsible for the haircuts of their Seypis, Kammi family works for Zamindar family in their houses and on agricultural fields. In addition, they provide their labour at the ceremonial occasions in the houses of their Seypi Zamindars i.e. at marriages, deaths, circumcision, and child birth. In return, Kammis receive an annual/seasonal share in crops, fodder for their buffalo and wood for burning etc. They receive amount of crops in accordance with the work they did for Zamindars. In addition, Kammis receive Laag i.e. ceremonial money as gift, payment for cooking at the ceremonies along with meal, clothes, grain, and sweets. Furthermore, Zamindars may call Kammis, their Seypis, at the time of need without discussing the amount of work or payment. However, the customary payments for work are known to both parties. At times, a Zamindar may not require the actual work from their Seypis yet he makes the minimum payment to maintain the customary Seyp relation. Every Zamindar family has a Seyp relationship with a set of Kammis e.g. barber, blacksmith, carpenter, cobbler, potter, baker, and Musalli (agricultural labour). Similarly, Seyp relationships exist between Kammis. In addition to their occupational craft, they provide their labour to other Kammis at the ceremonial occasions in their houses and receive Laag, payment for cooking, meal, and other gifts. Kammis also pay their Kammi Seypis in crops/grains that they receive from Zamindar Seypis and as a result of agricultural labour they

provided to other Zamindars at the time of harvest. Like Zamindars, a Kammi family establishes Seyp relationship with number of Zamindar and other Kammi families of the village. Kammis who have only a few Seyp contracts in their village may enter into a Seyp in nearby villages in order to earn more income. However, Kammis customarily do not leave the village of their forefathers (Eglar, 1960).

Eglar (1960) explained how the Seyp system works as a social institution in Punjabi villages and plays significant roles to organize the village life. Different Kammi Quoms address the basic needs of community with set rules and shared mutual obligations with their Seypis. Seyp relationships established among two families usually continue over generations. It is considered as a matter of honour, respect, and dignity to maintain a long standing Seyp relationship. Zamindar families call such an inherited Seyp relationship with any Kammi family as 'Gher De Kammi' (Kammis of the household). It was not merely an economic relationship but rather a long-lasting moral and social bond between Seypis. Seyp relationships are not easily broken and mutual obligations are faithfully fulfilled by either of the parties. Eglar also detailed the mutual responsibilities between Seypis and the nature of work and payments (1960). However, it is important to note that Eglar (1960) focussed on the functional aspect of Seyp system and analysed the practices of caste system, especially the Seyp, as an innate characteristic of the village organization in Mohla. Sets of mutual obligations among Kammis and Zamindars are seen as maintaining the equilibrium of village structures. They enter in the Seyp contract with a commitment to provide support to other half and sustain the relationship. Thus the caste organization of village is maintained through the willing and active participation of Zamindars and Kammis in the Seyp relationship. However, Eglar did not explain how the relationships of asymmetrical reciprocity like Seyp system involve the power dynamics, serve the interests of Zamindars, maintain their dominance over Kammis, and keep Kammis dependent on them for their livelihood.

Furthermore, it is important to bear in mind that Eglar conducted her study in a Punjabi village around 50 years ago; other, more recent, studies suggest that the caste system has been transformed in the contemporary Punjabi villages. Hooper and Hamid (2003) mentioned that the Seyp system is in decline in rural Punjab and as a result the social position of Kammis has further been weakened. It shows that Hooper and Hamid viewed Seyp as a system in favour of Kammis in which Zamindars had social, economic and moral obligations towards Kammis of their village. However, a few other

studies (Chaudhary, 1999; Lyon, 2004) suggested that the Seyp system is in decline in many parts of Punjab because of the availability of industrial and governmental jobs and as a result direct economic dependence of Kammiss on Zamindars is reducing. Nevertheless, the Seyp relations have not ended completely in Punjab. It shows that Kammiss were dependent on Zamindars while they were earning their livelihood through the Seyp contracts. It is important to investigate how the decline in Seyp system has changed the dynamics of labour relations in Punjabi villages and its effect on the village life.

In the same way, Barth (1960) discussed the system of labour relations in the Pakhtun communities which constitute a variant of the Seyp system in Punjab. It is mentioned that the practical implications of the caste structures play an important part in determining the relationships of dominance and submission in the labour relations. The economic organization of the Pakhtun communities involves a number of work contracts relating to land and other services between the occupational specialists from different caste groups. Barth explained how the economic organization of villages in Swat is largely based on the caste structures. Landowning Pakhtuns hold the pivotal roles in this system and co ordinate the different specialists involved in the main productive enterprise of the area i.e. agriculture. The occupation of servants is not associated with any specific caste and members of any caste group may opt for it. However, it is not considered as appropriate and respectable for the Pakhtuns to work as a household servant, being members of landowning caste group. Barth (1960) also explains how these economic and labour relations render political authority to the landowning Pakhtuns.

On the other hand, Lyon (2004) referred to another important feature of the labour relations in Punjab and mentioned that these relations are not homogenous and vary across the urban areas, industrial centres, village size, and average landholding size, though certain characteristics may be common in all these different kinds of labour relations. Lyon analysed the local politics and patronage in a Punjabi village where the landlords with large landholdings were residing. Labour relations were described among the landlords and the non landlord villagers rather than Zamindars and Kammiss. A few of the poor villagers who belonged to a Zamindar Quom i.e. Gujjars were also working as labour for the landlords. However, Lyon (2004), unlike Eglar (1960), discussed the labour relations as expressions of asymmetrical reciprocity and power.

Similarly, Ahmad (1970) analysed the village organization of a Punjabi village in which agricultural land was the property of two landlords, who were not residing in the village. Different Zamindar families were taking care of their land and agricultural activity as sharecroppers. A few Kammis were also working as sharecroppers for the landlords. In the absence of landlords in village, labour relations existed between the sharecropper Zamindars and Kammis. In addition, Ahmad talked about the relationships of patronage and asymmetrical reciprocity between the landlords and other Zamindars of the village, who were their sharecroppers. Political power resided with the landlords in these relationships. Conversely, Eglar did not divide Zamindars in different categories on the basis of variations in their landholdings and dealt with all twenty six Zamindar families of Mohla as a single social unit. Labour relations existed between Kammis and Zamindars in the form of Seyp system. It should be noted that the Seyp contract exists between Zamindars and Kammis or two Kammi households, and not between two Zamindar households. Eglar mentioned that in the district Gujrat, where she conducted her research, land was not abundant and was held in comparatively small parcels (1960). Moreover, division of land over generations had reduced the average size of landholdings among Zamindars of the Mohla and Eglar did not observe extreme variations in the landholdings of different Zamindar families. Arguably, the labour relations between Zamindars do not exist in those Punjabi villages in which there are no extreme variations in the landholdings and thus the socioeconomic status of different Zamindar families. The above discussion shows how the dynamics of labour relations in Punjab may vary across different villages in accordance with the distribution of land among Zamindars. Arguably, the majority of Punjabi villages are jointly owned by different Zamindar families of a village with slight variations in their landholdings, like in the Eglar's case.

Furthermore, the above section mentions that the labour relations in Punjabi villages mostly exist between Zamindars and Kammis, since Kammi castes are traditionally meant to serve Zamindars of their village as artisan and labour (Ahmad, 1970; Eglar, 1960). It means that the caste structures play a central role in determining the dynamics of labour relations in a Punjabi village. However, the studies on caste in Pakistani context do not detail how the relations of economic dependence i.e. labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis involve the experiences of punishment and oppression for the Kammi labourers in a caste society (Bourdieu, 1990).

The studies providing the most comprehensive description of the labour relations in caste societies of rural Pakistan were conducted in the 1960s i.e. Eglar (1960) and Barth (1960), when the caste occupations used to form the basis of economic activity. However, as discussed earlier, the caste system and labour relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms are changing as a result of the availability of other labour opportunities e.g. industrial labour and Kammiss are leaving their caste occupations. Thus, it is important to examine the changing dynamics of caste based labour relations in contemporary Punjabi village and its effects on the traditional caste structures.

2.3.2. Caste and Political Organization - Roles of Leadership and Patronage

Political organization of Punjabi and Pakhtun villages revolve around the landholdings and caste affiliations and thus the roles of patronage and leadership always reside with the traditional landowning Quoms. In other words, land and caste status are seen as the major factors determining the dynamics of, and rights to, political and feudal power (Ahmad, 1970; Alavi, 1972; Barth, 1959a; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004).

Eglar (1960) described how the political power and roles of leadership and patronage in Mohla, a Punjabi village, resided with the Zamindars of village. Land was the major source of income, gaining political prestige in village by entertaining more people, and extending influence in official circles. Since land holds the key to power for Zamindars, they have strong feelings for their land and Eglar (1960) highlighted that Zamindars may share food and money with others but not their land. Zamindars, Chaudharis, in Mohla fulfilled a number of different social roles and devoted their time to the village affairs. A Chaudhari forms a link between villagers and government, sees to it that his village receives governmental loans/subsidies in case of distress, helps villagers financially and socially in the time of need, arranges Parea (village councils) in case of disputes, elopement and theft in the village and takes decisions. Moreover, a Chaudhari maintains a guest house as a symbol of his status. This guest house serves as a men's club for the villagers and Chaudhari's guests are also entertained here. Chaudharis command respect and have influence through their wealth, generosity, and power (Eglar, 1960). On the other hand, Eglar (1960) mentioned that Kammiss are not given the status of Zamindars, even if they acquire land. Leadership roles always reside with Zamindars of the village and only Zamindars are called Chaudhari. It shows that the political power and roles of leadership in a Punjabi village are not associated merely with the ownership of land or economic wellbeing but should be supported by the membership in a Zamindar Quom.

Furthermore, Eglar (1960) talked about the group leadership among Zamindars and described that there is an ongoing struggle for the political leadership and power among different Zamindar Biradaris (kinship groups) and thus they achieve the balance of power in village setting. Biradari affiliations function as a system of patronage. There exists a sense of collective honour among Biradari members and protecting this biradari honour, against other Biradaris, is perceived as collective security for a Biradari. While there may be conflicting interests among members of a Zamindar Biradari, they all unite against other Biradaris in the struggles for power and in conflicts, and ultimate loyalty belongs to one's own Biradari. Kammiss also back their Biradari members in quarrels, and thus have the feelings of collective security. However, Kammiss do not struggle for the roles of leadership and power as group against other Biradaris of the village (Eglar, 1960).

There are striking similarities between the nature of political leadership and roles of patronage described by Eglar (1960) in Mohla and Barth (1981, 1959b) in Swat. Barth (1981) explains the roles of leadership and patronage in Swat in terms of feudal rights of landlord interpreted within the caste structures. Political leadership always reside with the landowning Quoms. In each community, members of one landowning Quom, mostly Pakhtuns, serve as political patrons to the members of all other Quoms. Barth also explained how the landowning Pakhtun Quoms maintain their exclusive rights to serve as patrons and political leaders, even if they lose full economic rights over part of their original Pakhtun land called Daftar. On the other hand, the service providing Quoms are prevented, by landowning Quoms, to acquire land and feudal powers. Barth (1981) highlighted that the political ideology and caste ideology coincide and serve to reinforce each other. Among Swati Pakhtuns, rights to speak in assembly and to serve as political patron to others are associated with the possession of Daftar land. If one Pakhtun sells Daftar land to another Pakhtun, the administrative rights to serve as political patron also shift to the buyer. Conversely, if Daftar land is sold to a person from lower caste or non Pakhtuns, the title associated with the land changes from Daftar to Siri and divorces it from administrative rights. Hence the rights to speak in assembly and act as political patron depend on the land ownership plus membership in landowning castes (Barth, 1981). Similarly, Lyon understood the political leadership in a Punjabi village in the context of hierarchical societies and suggested that the choices are partly dictated by one's standing in the hierarchy (2004). Membership in a

landowning Quom is seen as a necessary prerequisite to attain the political authority and power.

A few studies (Ahmad, 1977; Asad, 1972) attempted a class analysis of the nature of political organization in rural Pakistan. However, their models fail to explain why certain individuals e.g. members of the service providing Quoms could not attain the roles of leadership and patronage in Punjabi and Pakhtun villages. For example, Ahmad (1977) explained that the roles of political power and leadership in Jalpana, a Punjabi village, were gained by the virtue of class standing, and thus were dependent on the economic possessions. His analysis suggested that the factional politics was the dominant mode of political operation in Jalpana (1977) and it was the economic dependence and perceived or real political or economic benefits, and not the caste or kinship, that connected fractional followers with their fractional leaders, landlords who did not live in the village. Ahmad provided quite a rudimentary picture of the roles of leadership and patronage and described that the authority and power resided with the absentee landlords, and in their absence local managers in the village exercised authority. At this point, cultivators and non cultivators, two main categories of his class analysis, become overly marginalized to the exercises and expressions of power. Individual manoeuvring in the patron driven political factions is not detailed by Ahmad (Lyon, 2004). Nevertheless, Ahmad rightly drew attention to the point that the political position is dependent on economic position. His claim is supported by both Eglar and Barth in their assertions that Zamindars in Mohla and Pakhtun landlords in Swat with large landholdings assume the roles of leadership and patronage. However, Ahmad's model fails to explain why the roles of patronage and leadership always reside with the landowning Pakhtun castes in Swat even when they lose their full control over their original Pakhtun land called Daftar.

In conclusion the ability to possess and exercise political power in rural Pakistan involves the membership in a landowning Quom as a necessary prerequisite, and thus the members of service providing Quoms cannot attain the roles of leadership and patronage. Caste status associated with the membership in a landowning Quom or service providing Quoms is the essential factor that defines the villager's rights to acquire authority and power. Hence class i.e. statuses achieved through the economic possessions, or educational and occupational achievements may not be an appropriate tool to look at the power dynamics in rural Pakistan, especially in terms of the hierarchical arrangement of landowning and service providing Quoms.

2.3.3. Caste System and Social Exclusion

A few studies and governmental reports have seen caste as an essential cause of poverty and social exclusion in rural Pakistan, especially in Punjabi and Pakhtun villages (Hooper and Hamid, 2003; Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). Kammiss are almost always amongst poorest and socially excluded groups. Planning and Development, Government of Punjab (2003) described the caste system as a mechanism of differentially expressed rights and power across Kammiss and Zamindars that keeps Kammiss deprived of access to livelihood and dependent on Zamindars. Similarly, Gazdar (2007) viewed caste as key dimension of social, political, and economic interaction in rural Pakistan and emphasized that the caste based inequality is so much deep rooted in Pakistani society that it has become integral part of the social structures and is hardly even noticed.

Pakistani society prefers to silence any discussion about caste-based discrimination and oppression in the public domain even though such marginalisation is widespread in many parts of the country (Gazdar, 2007).

In rural Pakistan, the power structures revolving around the landholdings are characterized by social inequality, poverty, and socio economic exclusion. Land possession represents the rights and privileges related to livelihood (Hooper and Hamid, 2003). Eglar (1960) explained that according to the 'The Land Alienation Act of 1901' non-cultivator Quoms were prohibited to purchase land. Though the law was repealed with the establishment of Pakistan in 1947, a large majority of Kammiss in Punjabi villages still does not possess land. Nadvi & Robinson (2004) pointed out that the traditional Zamindar Quoms own Punjabi villages in north and central Punjab and they maintain their hold over land against service providing castes. Similarly, Barth (1960) highlighted that the Pakhtun landowning Quoms prevent the members of lower Quoms acquiring land and feudal power linked with land. Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, (2003) described how Kammiss in a village of north Punjab were treated like slaves and were forced to obey the members of landowning caste of their village since they lived on their land and were dependent on them for the livelihood. While a few Kammiss in the contemporary villages possess land, are involved in cultivation, and thus may earn their livelihood independently (Ahmad, 1977), they are not given the status of being Zamindars. Villagers associate status of being Zamindar with the caste membership, and not the ownership of economic assets (Eglar, 1960).

Besides their economic marginalization, Kammi Quoms are excluded from the mainstream village affairs e.g. political decision making, conflict resolution processes, and participation in the ceremonial occasions. They are forced to occupy the edges of society because of their lower caste standing. Moreover, they largely depend on Zamindar Quoms of their village/area to gain access to the state institutions e.g. police and courts. Sometimes, they are also denied the rights to benefit from governmental schemes. Landowning Quoms completely control the local justice system in rural Pakistan. Even educated Kammis are mostly unable to break down the social dimensions of caste based discrimination; they are not included in the community level decision making process. It suggests that the caste membership is more significant than educational accomplishments in rural Pakistan. Even if Kammis are present in the collective decision making process at village level, their views are not mostly respected (Hooper and Hamid, 2003; Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). In addition to the social, economic, and political exclusion of Kammis, different studies mentioned about their stigmatised group identity and thus inferior social status. Consequently, they are denied the rights to respect in society (e.g. Gazdar, 2007).

The traditional caste structures in rural Pakistan are weakening as a result of urbanization and industrialization and thus the availability of labour opportunities (Chaudhary, 1999; Hassan, 2010). However Aliani (2009) suggested that though the caste structures are weakening, these have not completely ended, and the lower Quoms residing in Pakistani villages still face social exclusion and oppression. While the traditional caste structures are in decline in contemporary rural Pakistan, it is important to examine the changing dynamics of social relationships between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms in the village life and as a result the Kammi caste's rights to participation in the social, economic, and political affairs of their villages.

2.4. Conclusion

2.4.1. Gaps in the Literature and Issues Raised

While most of the debates regarding caste hail from the Hindu Indian context, academics have identified the intense division of society in rural Pakistan into birth-ascribed status groups based on their parentage occupations. The caste system in Pakistan is discussed in the form of indigenous hierarchical groupings like Quom or Zaat. Correspondingly, it is argued that the caste system certainly exists in Muslim Pakistan, which is a vertical category and plays a significant role in organizing the

village structures. However, it is stressed to not use the Hindu caste organization to measure the system of social stratification in rural Pakistan, since context of the caste systems practiced across both societies differ considerably. The major caste divisions in rural Pakistan exist between landowning Quoms, Zamindars, and service providing Quoms, Kammiss, in the absence of classical categories of Hindu caste system i.e. Brahmins, Kshatriya, Vaishya, and Shudra. Caste structures in rural Pakistan are investigated in terms of the local categories and not the Hindu divisions of caste. A few researchers, who tried to apply the Hindu caste system on the village structures in rural Pakistan, were criticized by the others. Hence, this study will analyse the system of social stratification in Punjabi villages by considering the indigenous hierarchical categories of Zamindar and Kammi Quoms.

The chapter has examined how the different researchers applied caste and class to the village structures in rural Pakistan, especially the Punjabi villages. After critically analysing caste and class as two different frameworks to analyse the social stratification in rural Pakistan, the chapter has argued that the caste is a better tool than class to look at the village organization of Punjabi villages, especially the asymmetrical nature of social relations between two major caste divisions i.e. Kammiss and Zamindars.

While Kammi and Zamindar Quoms are identified as the two major caste divisions in Punjabi villages, the dynamics of their social relations in the village life, especially in terms of power and difference, are not discussed in detail in literature. Much of the literature looks at the caste system in rural Pakistan by focussing on the landowning Quoms i.e. Zamindars and the aspect of service castes i.e. Kammiss remains relatively under researched. In particular, the political and power dynamics of the caste relations and its effects on the Kammi Quoms are not elaborated. While a few studies and governmental reports identified the caste as a major reason of social exclusion in rural Pakistan, there is a need to examine the caste based interaction patterns through which the Kammi Quoms become socially marginalized in the community affairs.

A very few aspects of the asymmetrical social interactions between Kammiss and Zamindars have been investigated. Traditional labour relations in Punjab customarily exist between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms, which involve the expressions of asymmetrical reciprocity and power characterised by socio economic interdependence. However, it is not examined how the labour relations in Punjabi villages may result in the experiences of punishment and oppression for the Kammi labourers. Similarly, the

chapter has discussed how the political organization of Punjabi villages is configured around the landholdings and caste membership. Hence, political leadership and roles of patronage always reside with the Zamindar Quoms of a village. Kammis cannot assume these roles for lacking necessary prerequisites i.e. possession of land and membership in a Zamindar Quom. Kammis are not given the status of Zamindars even if they acquire land. Zamindar is a status category associated with the membership in a landowning Quom, and not the economic possessions. However, the literature does not detail how their marginalized position in the power structures results in the exploitation and domination of Kammi Quoms in the village setting.

The studies employing caste as a tool to measure social stratification in rural Pakistan were conducted in the 1960s and 1970s and the caste system in Pakistani villages has changed since then. Hence, it is also important to investigate how the dynamics of caste and power relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms have transformed over time in rural Pakistan.

Chapter Three

Gender and Violence in Caste Society of Pakistan

3.1. Introduction

This chapter provides an overview of gender and violence in caste societies of rural Pakistan and is divided into two main sections. The first section looks at the literature relevant to the gender structure in caste societies. The discussion begins with the patriarchal nature of Pakistani society and gender roles, and proceeds by taking into consideration the cultural construction of masculinities and femininities, gender relations and women's seclusion. The chapter focuses on how patriarchy and gender in a caste society are mediated through the caste structures. Consequently, it is argued that there may exist a considerable diversity in the dynamics of patriarchy, status of men and women, gender identities, and gender relations across two major caste divisions i.e. Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. The chapter suggests that it is important to examine how the gender structure in the caste societies of rural Pakistan is changing, especially among Kammi Quoms, as a result of the decline in traditional caste system and labour relations. It is identified that there is a serious shortage of literature about the intersectionality of caste and gender in the Pakistani context. While there is some literature available on the women in caste societies of rural Pakistan, the aspect of men is largely ignored.

The second part of the chapter looks at the definitions, typologies, and theories of violence in connection with the relationship between caste, gender, and violence in Pakistani society. After critically analysing a few of the definitions and typologies of violence in brief, the chapter looks at the explanations of violence articulated by different theoretical perspectives i.e. social exchange theory, social conflict/inequality theories, theory of intersectionality, symbolic violence, theory of hegemonic masculinity, and social learning theory. Caste relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms in rural Pakistan are interpreted within different theoretical paradigms mentioned above, and the chapter suggests which theories are preferred. The following section looks at the gender based violence with a special emphasis on the violence against women in Pakistani society and different types of violence against women are highlighted, in particular the sexual violence, acid throwing and burning, honour killing, and forced marriages. It is identified that the studies and statistics on violence against women do not incorporate the caste factor.

3.2. Patriarchy and Gender in a Caste Society

3.2.1. Patriarchy and Caste

Patriarchy is conceptualized in different ways by different theorists (Malti-Douglas, 2007; Sarshar, 2010). However, more generally, it is understood as the hierarchical structuring of a society in such a way that the supremacy, power and control remains with the men and gender relations are characterized by the doctrine of men's responsibility and authority to organize and protect women's lives (Johnson, 2005; Lerner, 1986). Galtung defined patriarchy as:

An institutionalization of male dominance in vertical structures, with very high correlations between position and gender, legitimized by the culture and often emerging as direct violence with males as subjects and females as objects (1996: 40).

This is a broader definition of patriarchy suggesting the manifestation and institutionalization of male dominance over female in a society in culturally justified ways and does not specifically talk about its social, economic, and political aspects. Similarly, Johnson (2005) explained how the gender roles in a patriarchal society are organized to control the power relations between men and women and are supported by a set of ideas to justify the structured process of dominance of men over women. It should be useful to mention here that the gender roles are the socially assigned set of responsibilities and expectations from the men and women in a particular society (Basow, 1992; Eagly 1987; Hassan, 2004).

Creation of patriarchy is an ongoing process, which evolved through the sexual division of labour that established the two gender categories between men and women, development of private property (class societies) and the state, resulting in the control of men over women (Kelkar and Nathan, 1991). However, male dominance is said to be originated from men's control over women's productive and reproductive labour and its products (Beneria, 1979). In the societies with settled agriculture, like Punjab in Pakistan, the access to land is connected with the male lineage (Kelkar and Nathan, 1991) and forms one of the bases of patriarchy. It suggests how patriarchy involves men's control over economic, social, and political dimensions of a society.

The above discussion fits in the debate about the traditional patriarchal structures of Pakistani society, which revolve around the strict sexual division of labour between men and women i.e. economic and reproductive roles, male head of family, men's control over women's sexuality and body through women's seclusion from the public spaces (Agboatwalla, 2000; Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Hakim & Aziz, 1998).

The family is seen as the central entity that defines the gender roles and gender relations, and thus the patriarchal structure of Pakistani society. Characterizing the gender roles in a traditional way, men are assigned the household tasks of head and bread winners of the family, and to look after the contacts outside house. Moreover, men in controlling roles are responsible to protect the honour of the family that resides in the body and sexuality of the women in family by directing their mobility and conduct, especially in the public sphere, which may often emerge in direct violence against women (Dobash and Dobash, 1979; Irfan, 2008; Martin, 1976; Welchman and Hossain, 2005). A man is expected to be strong, rational, decision maker and sexually active in order to fulfil his allocated gender roles. On the other hand, women being in the role of a mother, daughter, wife, and sister are dependent on and subject to a male head. They are assigned the roles of looking after the household activities, bringing up and socializing children and being caring to their men family members. They are responsible for the social connections within the family. Traditionally, a Pakistani woman spends most of her time within the four walls of the house and goes out only for serious and approved reasons (Agboatwalla, 2000; Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Hakim & Aziz, 1998).

However, the gender debates in the Pakistani context do not, on the whole, incorporate the different variants e.g. caste, class, and rural/urban divides, which arguably play an important part in shaping the dynamics of patriarchy in a society. Academics suggest that there exists considerable diversity in the patriarchal relations between men and women across different caste group in the Hindu India. Brahman's control the sexuality of their women with rigorous normative codes compared with the lower caste men, in order to ensure their caste purity (Chakravarti, 1996). Similarly Eglar's (1960) description about the caste system in Mohla, a Punjabi village in Pakistan, indicates that the Zamindar and Kammi women experience patriarchal control differently. While the women from a Chaudhary's household have limited mobility outside their domestic sphere, Kammi women were required to move in the village setting in order to fulfil their caste roles. The patriarchal division of labour in Pakistani society stress that the men are responsible for the household economy and they acquire the authority to decision making and control other family members as an acknowledgment of their economic roles. While Kammi women contribute significantly to the household economy by playing complementary roles in the caste occupation of their husband and working as labour in agricultural fields (Eglar, 1960; Encyclopaedia of Women's

History, 1994), it is not explained in literature how their economic contributions affect their patriarchal experiences in domestic environment. If economic roles and contributions play a part in defining the patriarchal relations between men and women, arguably Kammi women should share the decision making roles with their men at domestic level and experience less patriarchal control than Zamindar women. Hence, it is important to investigate how the dynamics of patriarchy are mediated through the caste structures.

On the other side, Ferdoos (2005) mentioned that the dynamics of patriarchy in overall Pakistani society are transforming with the increasing trends of women coming out of their homes into the labour market. As a result, women's economic dependence on their men is reducing and gender relations are transforming. However, the status of working women in a patriarchal context varies considerably in relation to the urban-rural divide, caste structure, and nature of their employment. For example, working women in rural areas are more discriminated against compared with their counterparts in urban areas and their families impose restrictions on them (Ferdoos, 2005). While the overall structure of Pakistani society remains patriarchal, the above discussion suggests that the status of women in Pakistani society is a heterogeneous category that may vary across the castes, classes, and regions (Asian Development Bank, 2000).

3.2.2. Construction of Gender and Gender Relations

This section explains how the gender structure in a caste society is an integrated whole, which incorporates the gender roles and identities and gender relations, organized around caste, as interconnected features. Due to the lack of literature on gender in caste perspective of Pakistani society, this section refers to the literature on caste and gender in Hindu India context. Although the previous chapter mentions that there are significant differences in the caste systems practiced across the Hindu India and Muslim Pakistan, the gender in Hindu caste system can be seen as the nearest example to Pakistani caste system. Academics also suggest that the Pakistani society being part of the Indian subcontinent has intermingled cultural values with Indian society and the gender structures are found to be similar in both societies (Hakim & Aziz, 1998; Khan, 1994).

Due to overt similarities and consistencies, the practices of the seclusion of women (Purda) as status symbol and their exclusion from male oriented work (which also is prominent among Hindus) remained intact and have been blended with the Islamic traditions of honouring and segregating women (Hakim & Aziz, 1998: 729).

Before looking at gender in caste perspective, it is important to understand how the broader gender structure of Pakistani society defines the gender roles and identities and gender relations. In Pakistani society, it is considered important to socialize boys from their childhood in such a way that they grow to be able to execute the controlling roles. Hakim and Aziz described the traditional course of socializing a boy in Pakistani society as follows:

Within the family, a son is conditioned to be dominant, and protective of family interests and its good name. His training exacts unqualified obedience in childhood, respect for elders and religious leaders, and the sensitivity to concepts of honour, which may, and frequently do, lead to aggressive behaviour (1998: 729).

A son is considered an asset who will be responsible in future to strengthen the family position in society. Parents make certain that he is socialized in a way to be prepared for his future position of paramount authority and leadership in the family, and in the village in case of a landlord family (Hakim & Aziz, 1998; Lyon, 2004; Wilber, 1964). Men's gender roles and gender identities i.e. notions of masculinity are linked with the women in their families and gender relations are defined accordingly (Jafri, 2003; Lewis, 1994; Siddiqui, 1999). Traditionally, the gender relations in Pakistani society are constructed on the perceptions that the women are subsidiary to men; women's actions, body and sexuality is associated with their family's honour; and that the men are liable and entitled to protect the women and thus the honour of their families (Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Hakim & Aziz, 1998). Predispositions within the socialization patterns of men incorporate the sensitivity towards honour of the family associated with the body and sexuality of women in family. This honour is traditionally protected by seclusion of women from the public sphere especially male spaces, practice of Purda, exercising control over women's lives, and regulating their conduct with a set of strict rules of behaviour (Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Irfan, 2008; Jafri, 2003; Mandelbaum, 1988; Welchman and Hossain, 2005).

Correspondingly, women are assigned the gender roles and are socialized in ways that are consistent with the overall gender structure of society. During the course of their socialization, women are trained to take care of domestic affairs. Girls in their childhood are directed to play within the home environment in order to make them learn about their traditional household responsibilities and that they should protect their bodies and sexuality by limiting themselves inside domestic sphere. Girls are especially encouraged to not go outside alone and observe the norms of seclusion e.g. Purda as they near puberty (Ferdoos, 2005; Verma and Mahendra, 2004). In Pakistani society,

the concept of Purda is used with varying socio-religious interpretations and purposes (Mandelbaum, 1988) e.g. to symbolically and physically seclude women, create differentiated male and female spaces, and regulate and protect women's sexuality (Hussein, 2009; Papanek, 1971; White, 1977). When a girl is traditionally socialized to be docile, patient and giving in relationships, and limit herself within the domestic sphere, it helps her to integrate herself with the broader gender structure of society and social expectations from her. These socialization patterns prepare women to fulfil their gender roles and reaffirm their chastity and modesty (Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Ferdoos, 2005; Mandelbaum, 1988; Verma and Mahendra, 2004).

The above discussion shows how the protection of honour associated with the women's sexuality and body and thus the women's seclusion from public sphere plays a central part in defining the gender roles and identities, gender relations, and dynamics of patriarchy in Pakistani society. Traditional gender roles assigned to women and men help to maintain the social order i.e. women take care of the domestic sphere and men are responsible for the home affairs in public domain (Ferdoos, 2005).

Having looked at the broader gender structure of Pakistani society, it is important to understand how the variants like caste, class, and rural-urban divide mediate the construction of gender in Pakistani context. While conducting a comparative study on the social status of rural and urban working women in Pakistan, Ferdoos (2005) mentioned that:

There is considerable diversity in the status of women across classes, regions, and the rural/urban divide due to uneven socio-economic development and the impact of tribal, feudal, and capitalist social formations on women's lives (Ferdoos, 2005: 34).

Furthermore, Ferdoos mentioned that the Pakistani women are increasingly entering into labour market. As a result, the notions of masculinity and gender relations revolving around the seclusion of women and limiting the women's contact with opposite sex are changing. However, Ferdoos argues that the level of acceptance of women's participation in labour market varies considerably across the urban-rural divide. Hence, there are a number of different factors affecting the social status of women in Pakistan. Besides, it is important to investigate how the different variants e.g. caste, class, and region effect the status of men in Pakistani society, which arguably also play a part in shaping the gender relations and dynamics of patriarchy.

3.2.2.1. Gender and Caste

Looking at the dynamics of caste system in a Punjabi village of Pakistan, Eglar (1960) briefly discussed how Kammi women and Chaudharani, wife of the village head called Chaudhary, perform their caste roles in order to support and complement their male counterparts. Kammi women assist their husband in their caste occupations; certain tasks are typically associated with them. Dube (1996) highlighted that the women's work contributes substantially to the occupational continuity of a caste group in the Hindu Indian context. Similarly, Eglar (1960) explained how a woman's contributions enable a Kammi to fulfil the obligations associated with his caste occupation. A number of different tasks are assigned to the Kammi women. Traditionally, women from the barber household cook food at Zamindar's houses for their guests, accompany women from Chaudhary's household in public sphere, distribute ceremonial food in the village, serve as hairdressers of the women villagers, and accompany brides to their in-law's house at the time of marriage. A potter's wife helps him to paint vessels, collects dung from their Seypi's houses for fuel in the kiln, and distributes the wares among their clients. Similarly, a Musalli's wife sweeps the courtyards of Zamindar's houses. In addition, she cleans the guest house maintained by Zamindars for their men guests, though in the absence of men (Eglar, 1960). Hence, Kammi women are required to move in the village setting in order to fulfil the roles associated with their caste groups.

On the other side, the roles associated with Zamindar women are different than the roles performed by their lower caste counterparts. In Punjabi villages, womenfolk play a significant part to maintain the prestige of a Zamindar. For example, when a Zamindar has guests, women in the household are responsible to arrange the food and bedding, which reflect the status of the host. Moreover, Zamindar women control all the provisions and money in household. However, Eglar focussed more on the roles associated with a Chaudharani, wife of village head, and did not discuss in detail the roles of other Zamindar women. A Chaudharani attends the important occasions in Kammi's houses as a representative of the Chaudhary's household and her presence increases the importance of an event. Women in the Chaudhary's household have restricted mobility and Kammi women accompany them in the public sphere. While Kammi women sweep the guest house maintained by Zamindars for their men guests, Zamindar women feel ashamed to visit the guest house, which is a male space (Eglar, 1960).

Eglar's study depicts that Zamindar and Kammi women in a Punjabi village experience gender differently in terms of their seclusion and mobility in the village setting, which arguably play a part in shaping their gender identities as woman. While women from Chaudhary's household step out of their domestic sphere accompanied by a Kammi woman, the Kammi women are freer to move in the village setting in order to fulfil their caste obligations. It suggests that the village streets, agricultural fields, and Dera (guest house) are unfriendly spaces for Zamindar women. Conversely, Kammi women occupy these spaces as site of their routine work and occupational responsibilities.

While the seclusion of women is linked with the virility and primacy of male society in Swat, lower caste female servants and slaves remain unveiled and are freer in their mobility (Barth, 1981, 1969). Similarly, Shah (1994) describes that the labourer women in the rural Sind are not secluded owing to their occupational obligations and they walk freely in the public sphere. Conversely, the landowner's women move around with a feeling of shame. However, the freedom of mobility for landowner's woman may change dramatically as she moves from one geographical area to another. While they are restricted to their Havails in the village setting, they move freely as they go to cities for shopping. These upper caste women keep themselves secluded inside the village boundaries in order to protect the honour of their families associated with their sexuality and body and thus mobility. In the same way, Khan (1994) suggested that the seclusion of women in rural Punjab do not exist as religious obligation, rather economically strong peasants enforce their women to practice Purda and restrict themselves in domestic sphere as a symbol of social status. The above discussion brings up several critical questions regarding the social placement of women in rural Pakistan in relation to their caste statuses.

While studying the Swati Pakhtuns, Barth described the seclusion of women as establishing:

... an organization of activities which allows a simultaneous emphasis on virility and the primacy of male society, and prevents the realities of performance in domestic life from affecting a man's public image (1981:108).

Barth sees the seclusion of women and encapsulation of domestic life as one of the central institutions of Pathan society in Swat (1981). Ideals of virility require men to protect their honour associated with the women in their family which results into restricted mobility of women in public sphere and their limited contact with the opposite sex. Traditional gender roles are assigned in such a way that the women remain within

domestic sphere and men are responsible to take care of the household affairs in public domain. Similarly, while conducting a study on the Mohmand tribe of Pukhtuns, Ahmed (1980) mentioned that the preservation of honour associated with the woman (tor) is one of the central features of Pukhtunwali, the indigenous honour codes among Pukhtun's life style.

On the other hand, the above discussion suggests that the lower caste women in rural Pakistan are freer in their mobility. Economics and their caste obligations force them outside their home environment to work in Zamindar's houses, Dera, and on agricultural fields. While it seems liberating for the lower caste women, it should be noted that they deviate from the culturally emphasized ideals of femininity. Because of their mobility in the village setting, Kammi women certainly have more chances of contact with men from both upper and lower castes. They work in the male spaces where Zamindar's women are reluctant to go (Eglar, 1960). While normatively women's sexuality and body is strictly monitored, regulated, and protected by strict social measures, social liberty of a discriminated section of women raises critical questions. Arguably, free mobility of the lower caste women, who belong to deprived and powerless segment of society, makes them vulnerable towards the acts of sexual and physical violence in the community sphere. Further, referring to the above mentioned quotation by Barth (1981), their women's excessive mobility in the community sphere negatively affects the public image of lower caste men, since ideals of masculinity require men to protect the sexuality and bodies of their women by providing them shelter in the domestic sphere. Arguably, failure to protect the sexuality of their women according to normatively prescribed ways weakens the sense of manhood of the lower caste men.

Literature does not reflect on how the caste structures play a part in shaping the gender identities, i.e. masculinities, and gender relations across Kammi and Zamindar men. Arguably, the caste memberships, caste occupations and roles, and traditional labour relations place Zamindars as dominant and Kammi as subordinate masculine identities in caste societies of rural Pakistan (Connell, 2005). On the other hand, Chaudhary (1999) and Hooper and Hamid (2003) pointed out that the labour relations between Kammi and Zamindars are transforming due to the availability of industrial labour and government jobs. Kammi do not prefer to work on Seyp or as labour for Zamindars and as a result their direct economic dependence on Zamindars is reducing. The traditional caste system is in decline. Hence, it is important to investigate how the

changing caste structures affect the social status of Kammis and, as a result, the dynamics of caste based gender identities and gender relations in Punjabi villages.

3.2.3. Caste and Gender – Hindu Caste System

The social position of women, especially their seclusion from the public sphere, plays an important part in structuring the Hindu caste system, gender relations, and inter-caste power dynamics. Kannabiran and Kannabiran write that:

Gender within caste society is defined and structured in such a manner that the ‘manhood, of the caste is defined both by the degree of control men exercise over women and the degree of passivity of the women of the caste. By the same argument, demonstrating control by humiliating women of another caste is a certain way of reducing the ‘manhood’ of those castes (2001: 254).

Similarly, Liddle and Joshi explained that:

Essential gender division which allows the men to benefit from higher caste status at the expense of the women, for the hardship is not experienced by all the members of the caste. The women alone are subject to it, whilst the men gain privileges both in relation to the men of the lower castes and the women of their own caste (1986: 60).

This shows how the women occupy a central place in the caste organization of Hindu India. Higher caste status is accompanied by the seclusion of women from public sphere. Marriage and sex codes for the upper caste women are very strict that involve child marriages, arranged marriages, husband worshipping, prohibition of divorce, strict monogamy for women, practice of sati, and bans on widow marriage. Obeying these marriage and sex codes are considered as the symbol of prestige among upper caste women and they follow these codes religiously. Hardships experienced by the upper caste women maintain the social exclusiveness, biological purity, and superior status of their caste groups (Liddle and Joshi, 1986). In the Hindu caste society, there exists a connection between the purity of caste and purity of women. Female sexuality presents a potential threat of introducing the lower caste’s blood into the lineage of an upper caste group. Hence, it becomes essential for the upper caste men to protect the sexuality of their women to maintain the biological purity of their caste group (Chakravarty, 2003; Das, 1976; Yalman, 1968).

Social restrictions inflicted on the upper caste women are not often applied on the lives of lower caste women. However, they may perhaps experience hardships of different kind. Lower caste women are not generally secluded for economic reasons; their manual labour is required for survival. Moreover, the marriage and sex codes are not that strict for the lower caste women. Post puberty marriages, divorce, polygyny, widows remarriages are practiced and the custom of sati is absent in the lower castes (Liddle and

Joshi, 1986). However, control and restrictions are imposed on the lower caste women as their caste groups attempt to go up in the power hierarchy by raising their social position in society and thus follow the normative obligations associated with the upper caste groups (Hutton, 1963; Liddle and Joshi, 1986; Srinivas, 1962). Liddle and Joshi (1986) argue that the myths of women's subordination and domesticity contribute significantly in the ideology of gender in Indian society and the women leaving their homes for paid work are considered of loose character and treated as rebellious.

While the upper caste status requires women to experience hardships, it renders power, authority, and control to the upper caste men over all other social groups on the caste hierarchy. Upper caste men regulate the sexuality and body of their women by secluding them from the public sphere following strict social codes (Liddle and Joshi, 1986). Since the manhood of the caste is defined by the degree of control men exercise over their women (2001), upper caste men can be said to have a strong sense of manhood which further characterizes their sense of honour and respect attached with the sexuality of their women.

The basis for the women's seclusion in the caste system is the maintenance of men's position in the social hierarchy, the men deriving their status from the position of the women (Liddle and Joshi, 1986: 93).

On the other side, the lower caste women are not secluded because of the economic reasons and their caste obligations. Hence, the lower caste men cannot restrict the mobility of their women and limit their contact with the opposite sex in order to organize their sexual conduct within the public sphere. It negatively affects their standing on the power continuum in a caste society since they are not privileged to control the social mobility and economic aspects of their women's life. As a result, they have a weak sense of manhood (Kannabiran and Kannabiran, 2001). Different studies conducted on the gender in caste society of India pointed out the 'protector' and 'ability to control' as the major characteristics of hegemonic masculinity (Kumar, Gupta, and Abraham, 2002). Dalit men are treated as inferior and subordinate masculine identity, since they cannot conform to the notions of hegemonic masculinity i.e. controlling the social mobility of their women and protecting their sexuality (Anandhi and Jeyaranjan, 2002; Dagar, 2002).

Correspondingly, the lower caste women become vulnerable towards the acts of violence and thus the victims of inter-caste power politics because of their free mobility in the public sphere, subordinate position on the power hierarchy, and their men's

inability to protect their sexuality (Dagar, 2002; Das, 1976; Kannabiran and Kannabiran, 2001; Liddle and Joshi, 1986; Yalman, 1968). Kannabiran and Kannabiran (2001) explained that humiliating the women of other caste groups is a way to demonstrate control over their men by questioning their manhood. Hence the upper caste men assert power over the lower caste men by humiliating their women in the community setting. It suggests that the caste society in India is structured in such a way that the upper caste men are in a position to enjoy power and control over all other social groups on the power hierarchy.

3.3. Violence in Caste Society

3.3.1. Conceptualizing Violence

It is difficult to provide a universal definition of violence; it involves a range of behaviours varying with the social context (Foege et al, 1995; Hibbs, 1973; Holtzworth-Munroe and Meehan, 2004; Snyder, 1978). The World Health Organization (WHO) (1996) defined violence in broad terms covering self directed, interpersonal, and collective violence. This includes intimidations along with the physical acts and also talks about the relatively overlooked consequences of the violence i.e. psychological damage and deprivations besides injury and death.

The intentional use of physical force or power, threatened or actual, against oneself, another person, or against a group or community, that either results in or has a high likelihood of resulting in injury, death, psychological harm, maldevelopment or deprivation (World report on violence and health, 2002: 4).

Similarly, academics talk about the several other types of non physical violence. For example, Bourdieu (1990) understood the patterns of exploitation in the relationships of economic dependence i.e. labour relations in terms of symbolic violence. It was suggested if non material sources of power i.e. prestige, honour and attention are used to exert dominance over others or alter other's actions, it is called symbolic violence. On the other hand, it is debated among scholars whether to include nonviolent violence i.e. questions of injustice, exploitation, and oppression in the conceptualization of violence or not (Tilly, 2003; Weigert, 1999). Tilly (2003) stressed that it is essential to understand the causal relationships between exploitation/injustice and physical damage. Nevertheless, the non physical violence may emerge as a main category of violence in the present research, which intends to examine the relations of economic dependence and status differentials in the caste society of a Punjabi village. Therefore, it will be interesting to investigate how the asymmetrical social interactions among Zamindars

and Kammiss could involve the social actions that have discriminative/exploitative implications, and thus can be understood as the non physical acts of violence against caste subordinates (also see 3.3.2.1). Further, it is significant to examine the causal relationship between non physical and physical forms of violence in the context of a Punjabi village (Tilly, 2003). For example, if Zamindars are not able to assure the compliance of Kammiss as their caste subordinates or labourers through symbolic ways of exerting domination, arguably they would apply acts of physical violence to achieve it (Gazdar, 2007).

Conversely, Runkle (1976) looked at the psychological violence as metaphorical and criticised the scholars who dealt with psychological facets of violence, i.e. provoking someone by verbal spitefulness or caustic abuse etc, in literal meanings. Runkle proposed a definition of violence as:

An act in which a person employs physical force directly against a living being for the purpose of harming him (1976: 1055).

The above definition suggests that Runkle considered only physical forms of violence. Runkle claimed that his definition is empirical and value free. Pletcher (1977) questioned Runkle's definition of violence from social and legal standpoints and argued that an act of violence cannot be understood socially or legally without considering certain values and intervening ethical considerations of a society. It is important to recognize the contextual realities of a society in order to conceptualize an act of violence occurred within that particular society. Hence, it is not possible to construct a value free definition of violence which can be generally accepted (Pletcher, 1977; World report on violence and health, 2002).

Dahlberg and Krug (2002) suggested a typology of violence by dividing it into three broad categories based on victim-perpetrator relationship i.e. self-directed violence, interpersonal violence and collective violence. Interpersonal violence and collective violence can be relevant categories in the context of present research. *Interpersonal violence* refers to violence that occurs between individuals and is sub-divided into *Family and intimate partner violence* and *Community violence*. The *Community violence* occurs outside the home environment. It is generally committed by those not intimately associated with the victim and may include youth violence, rape, or sexual assaults by strangers, violence at workplaces and institutional settings. Similarly, the present study intends to examine the patterns of violence in the community environment of a Punjabi village, which can be physical, sexual, or symbolic forms of violence. For

example, acts of physical violence against labourer Kammiss or sexual assault against women fall under the category of interpersonal violence in the community setting. Third broad category i.e. *collective violence* involves the instrumental use of violence by one group of people against another group of people and occurs with an intention of attaining certain *political, economic, or social* objectives. Arguably, a number of disputes among Zamindars and among Kammiss, as caste equals, fall under the category of collective violence, and involve political, economic, or social objectives. Inter Biradari violent disputes among Zamindars concerning honour issues, i.e. elopement or sexual abuse of their women, or elections/voting can be seen as the examples of collective violence (Eglar, 1960). At times, land disputes among Zamindars may also convert into group violence (Lyon, 2004). Hence, the categories of interpersonal (community) violence and collective violence can be used to analyse the caste based violence in Punjabi villages.

Tilly (2003) discussed how the variable patterns of social interaction constitute and cause different varieties of collective violence (2003:7). However, in order to understand the different forms of collective violence, Tilly proposed a preliminary typology of interpersonal violence which arises from a two dimensional classification focussing on salience and coordinated dimensions of violence. The first dimension includes individual attacks of a person on another and is called salience of short run damage. The second dimension characterizes the extent of coordination among violent actors and considers at least two perpetrators. Tilly included individual aggression in his typology of interpersonal violence in order to spell out its relation with the larger scale violence (Ben-Ari, 2006; Tilly, 2003). Tilly's two dimensional classification will be used in this research in order to investigate how an individual act of aggression on the election day can result in the larger scale violence among two Zamindar Biradaris/groups. Similarly, sexual assault against a woman in the village setting is preliminary an act of interpersonal violence. Arguably, it converts into collective violence if the victim Biradari takes honour revenge from the perpetrator's biradari, and thus resulting in a longstanding enmity among groups (Eglar, 1960; Gazdar, 2007; Lyon, 2004).

3.3.2. Theorizing Violence in Caste Perspective

This section examines different theories of violence in relation to the caste system and inter-caste relationships in rural Pakistan. Theories explaining violence position its

origin in the socio-cultural influences, hereditary or both i.e. within the social environment and/or within the person. However, sociologists are interested to look at the socio-cultural factors contributing in the occurrence of violence. Hence, sociological explanations of the violence articulated by different theories focus on the importance of structural functionalism or/and process of socialization in order to understand the violence (DeKeseredy and Perry, 2006).

This research employs a somewhat eclectic mix of theories to explore the dynamics of asymmetrical social interactions among Kammi and Zamindar Quoms in the context of Punjabi villages. These theories are used by other authors within related studies and the wider relevant literature and will be employed in the present research to shed light on the findings and to test their applicability in the context of the caste system in a Punjabi village. However, it is important to mention that these theories are neither interrelated nor discussed in any particular sequence. The aim is not to construct some kind of general theoretical framework. The research recognizes that the theories are necessarily limited in their scope and relevance to particular aspects of the issues addressed. These theories i.e. social exchange theory, Social conflict/inequality theories, theory of intersectionality, theory of symbolic violence, theory of hegemonic masculinity, and social learning theory will only be used to understand the specific aspects of the caste system, asymmetrical social interactions between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms, and villagers social experiences around the issues of power, difference, and inequality in a caste society.

Social exchange theory explains the social interaction as a process of negotiated exchanges between individuals/groups that involves cost and benefit analysis, and consideration and comparison of the alternatives available. It stresses that the social relationships are the exchange of goods, the material, and the non-material such as the symbols of approval or prestige (Bourdieu, 1990; Gelles, 1983; Homans, 1958). Social exchanges involve interdependence and are regulated by the norms of reciprocity. This theoretical framework understands the patterns of power within the social relationships through the assumptions that the dependence and power are inversely related, and resources and power are positively and linearly related (Huston, 1983; McDonald, 1981; Thibaut and Kelley, 1959). Thus, the power dynamics in the exchange framework are understood through the resources, dependence, and level of involvement in the relationship. Individuals or a social group giving much in the exchange process exercise control over the ones receiving much in the relationship and may turn violent against

them. Hence, costs of social exchange relationships may involve punishment experiences (Blau, 1964). Social exchange theory is frequently discussed together with the **resource theory** that suggests that the more resourceful, and thus powerful, members of the society with regard to monetary resources, social status, political power, and prestige command, control and subordinate the ones who are comparatively in vulnerable position in the power relationships (Blood and Wolfe, 1960).

The social exchange model has been extensively used to understand the structures of reciprocity and social obligations in different societies (e.g. Malinowski, 1922; Mauss, 1990; Orenstein, 1980). Developing a link between the exchange relationships and violence, Bourdieu's (1990) theory explained how the dominance is expressed and asserted in the social relations through excessive giving. It is suggested that the exchange relations, in form of debt or gift giving, may involve the physical, economic, and/or symbolic violence as means of expressing domination.

The social exchange model is very useful to interpret the exchange relationships in the caste society of a Punjabi village and how the social groups receiving much can experience violence or domination as a result of their subordinate involvement in the relationships. Traditional asymmetrical relationships between Kammi and Zamindar Quoms can be explained using this framework. As discussed in chapter 2, the traditional labour relations in Punjabi villages are organized around the Seyp, which involves material and non-material exchanges between Kammis and Zamindars. Seyp system works in a way that Zamindars always maintain their caste dominance over Kammis. Similarly the dynamics of Vartan Bhanji, gift exchange, among Seypis are clearly asymmetrical (Eglar, 1960). While Zamindars give gifts to Kammis on ceremonial occasions, they do not like to receive in exchange. However, Eglar did not explain how the asymmetrical reciprocity organized around the Seyp system or Vartan Bhanji can involve the acts of violence or expressions of domination exerted against those who receive much in the relationship i.e. Kammis. Besides, it is important to investigate how the symbolic capital (Bourdieu, 1990) e.g. symbols of prestige and authority involved in the asymmetrical exchange relationships render Zamindars power to exert dominance over labourer Kammis.

This model is useful to understand the dynamics of relationships between Zamindars and Kammis doing labour or other low grade tasks, and thus involved in the material and the non material asymmetrical exchanges with Zamindars. On the other hand,

arguably, better off and educated Kammiss do not get involved in the asymmetrical material exchanges with Zamindars of their village since their direct economic dependence on Zamindars reduce considerably. However, using the social exchange model, it will be interesting to explore how Zamindars, through their caste status and control over collective village affairs, keep such Kammiss engaged in the non-material asymmetrical exchange relationships characterized by discrimination, deprivation, and exploitation directed downwards and compliance, approval, and honour claimed from above.

Furthermore, the social exchange model suggests that the criteria used to evaluate the rewards and costs in the exchange relationships vary across individuals and may also change over time. Applying this assumption on the caste society of a Punjabi village, it should be interesting to examine how the availability of industrial jobs to Kammiss as an alternative labour opportunity to Seyp (Chaudhary, 1999) is changing the traditional labour relations between Zamindars and Kammiss, and thus the patterns of caste based violence and domination in Punjabi villages.

Social conflict theory and Inequality theories have their roots in the capitalistic developments and political economies of the private property. While explaining the violence and aggression, these theories consider the social differentials and social hierarchies based on class and gender (DeKeseredy and Perry, 2006; Iadicola and Shupe 1998). Inequality theories understand violence by signifying the power relationships between dominant and dominated social groups in term of economy, means of production and material resources. Though this study will use caste as a tool to measure the system of social stratification in Punjabi villages, it is important to consider that the caste based power disparities across Kammiss and Zamindars are mediated through the economy, means of production and material resource. Traditionally, Zamindars control the means, organization, and social relations of production i.e. land and agricultural activity in the Punjabi villages (Eglar, 1960) and they have maintained their hold over land in opposition to the lower caste groups i.e. Kammiss (Nadvi & Robinson, 2004). On the other hand, a few Kammiss in Punjabi villages own land and are involved in cultivation at a limited level (Ahmad, 1970). Thus, they may earn their livelihood respectably. Though the caste status of such Kammiss remains lower than Zamindars on the caste hierarchy (Eglar, 1960), possession of land at least reduce their economic dependence on Zamindars. Hence, it is important to investigate how the ownership of economic assets or capital accumulation among Kammiss may change the dynamics of

caste relationships in Punjabi villages and thus the patterns of violence and domination against caste subordinates.

While the social exchange model is more useful to look at the traditional caste structures and the dynamics of relationships between Zamindars and Kammis involved in low grade tasks, the social conflict and inequality theories can help to explore the decline of traditional caste relations as a result of the changing class status of better off/educated Kammis and its effects on the village life.

3.3.2.1. Theorizing Gender Based Violence

Gender based violence shifted the focus to the gender roles and the power relations between genders as underlying causes of violence. In 1990 gender based violence was discussed in detail at the Asia Pacific Forum on Women, Law, and Development (APWLD) and the participants defined it as “any act involving use of force or coercion with intent of perpetuating or promoting hierarchical gender relations” (Schular, 1992: 2). In 1993, the United National General Assembly proposed the first official definition of gender based violence at the Declaration on Elimination of Violence against women (Babur, 2007). Article 1 of the resolution 48/104 passed on 20th December 1993 defines it as:

Any act of gender-base violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual, or mental harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private life (Symonides & Volodin, 2002: 33).

However, this definition kept its focus on women rather than the gender roles and the power relations between men and women. Moreover, it did not address the gender based violence against men and the power relations within the genders i.e. among men and among women. On the other hand, Ward (2002) proposed a more comprehensive definition and incorporates the aspects of gender based violence overlooked by United National General Assembly.

Gender based violence refers to “any harm that is perpetrated against a person’s will; that has a negative impact on the physical or psychological health, development and identity of the person; and that is the result of gendered power inequalities that exploit distinctions between males and females, among males and among females. Although not exclusive to women and girls, GBV principally affects them across all cultures. Violence may be physical, sexual, psychological, economic, or socio-cultural (Ward, 2002: 8-9).

Gender based violence is not merely about sexuality or conflict. It involves control and exists as a validation for certain individuals to have power over the others, and helps to

ascertain or strengthen the gender based power structures in a society (Aafjes, 1998; Heise, 1994; Heise, Ellsberg and Gottemoeller, 1999; UN, 1998; UNHCR 2003; Ward, 2002). It takes place both in the domestic and public spheres. At times, cultural norms, values, and beliefs may legitimize the gender based violence (Hyder and Veigh, 2007).

In the context of a Punjabi village, it is important to investigate how the normative structures of a caste society reinforce the power inequalities between men and women, among men and among women, that may result in the different kinds of gender based violence. Thus, it should be examined how the intersectionality of caste and gender provides certain individuals the power to exert domination over others in culturally legitimate ways.

Connell's (2005) **theory of hegemonic masculinity** refers to the dominant form of masculinity on the gender hierarchy which subordinates other masculinities and femininities. Using the fundamental features of this theory, i.e. the combination of the plurality of masculinities and the hierarchy of masculinities, this research intends to explore how the caste memberships mediate the features of hegemonic masculinity in the context of a Punjabi village and produce multiple patterns and hierarchy of masculinities involving Kammi and Zamindar men. Applying another concept of the theory of hegemonic masculinity, this research will investigate how Zamindar masculinity is more socially central and more associated with social power and authority than Kammi masculinity. Arguably, Kammi men cannot conform to the normative ideals of male behaviour because of their subordinate position in the status and power hierarchy and thus they are a marginalized masculine identity e.g. their exclusion from the power structures and leadership roles as individuals and as a group (see 2.3.2). It is important to examine how their inability to follow the hegemonic masculinity results in the different forms of social oppression and discrimination against them. Furthermore, the theory suggests that the hierarchy of masculinities is a pattern of hegemony, and not a pattern involving simple domination through force. Examining that pattern of hegemony, this research will explore how Zamindar masculinity is featured around the cultural consent, institutionalization, discursive centrality, and marginalization of alternatives, and not simply the assertion of caste status through oppression and force (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005).

While the theory of hegemonic masculinity has widely been used to understand the plurality and hierarchy of masculinities, it has also attracted serious criticism. It is

emphasized that the concepts used in the theory are abstract, blurred, and uncertain in meanings and deemphasize the issues of power and domination by providing an overly simplified model for the social relationships involving hegemonic masculinities (Collinson and Hearn, 1994; Hearn, 1996, 2004). The theory is mainly criticized for essentializing the male character and thus imposing a false unity on a social reality that is fluid, contradictory, and contextual in nature, and which unfolds and changes through time (Collier, 1998; MacInnes, 1998; Petersen, 1998, 2003). Furthermore, it is argued that the theory tends to produce a static typology of multiple masculinities and does not elaborate how the non-hegemonic masculinities exist in tension with and thus transform the hegemonic masculinity (Demetriou, 2001). It is suggested that the theory should incorporate a more holistic view of the gender hierarchy, identifying the agency of subordinate groups together with the power of dominant groups and the interplay of gender dynamics and other social dynamics (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). The theory of hegemonic masculinity advocates that the hegemonic masculinity is not the most prevalent masculinity but rather the most socially endorsed and provides the ideals of male behaviour in a society that men are encouraged to follow (Connell, 2005; Donaldson, 1993). Questioning this postulate, several authors have argued that the concept of hegemonic masculinity provides an unsatisfactory theory of the masculine subject. It is questioned how men can conform to an ideal type without ever managing to exactly embody that ideal and what conformity to hegemonic form of masculinity actually looks like in practice (Wetherell and Edley, 1999). The theory articulates loosely with the practical composition of masculinities as ways of living and interacting in everyday life situations and thus does not correspond closely to the lives of actual men. While the theory of hegemonic masculinity presumes a unitary masculine subject, it is argued to be multilayered and divided in practice and a complex subject of gender practice (Collier, 1998; Jefferson, 1994; Wetherell and Edley, 1999). Correspondingly, it is emphasized that the hegemonic masculinity cannot be applied as the settled character structure of any group of men, since men can dodge among multiple social meanings in order to reconcile and renegotiate their position in the social relationships and take up the hegemonic norms strategically. Moreover, it is suggested that the theory reduces, in practice, to a reification of power and toxicity by deducing the relations among masculinities and their hierarchy from the patriarchal subordination of women rather than the structural basis of women subordination. Thus, it is suggested to consider the role of cultural constructions, the institutionalization of gender inequalities, and the interplay of gender dynamics with race, class, and region (Connell and Messerschmidt,

2005; Holter, 1997, 2003). While the content of the practices associated with hegemonic masculinity varies considerably over time and across societies, this theory does not incorporate the geography of masculinities. Hence, it is important to consider the changes in the locally specific constructions of masculinities and the relationship between local and regional masculinities (Connell, 2005; Morrell and Swart, 2005; Pease and Pringle, 2001).

This research attempts to incorporate these criticisms of the theory of hegemonic masculinity and is interested to explore the combination of the plurality of masculinities and the hierarchy of masculinities in the context of a Punjabi village by focusing on the issues of power and dominance mediated through the caste memberships. It is not aimed to develop an ideal type and a static model of hegemonic masculinity by essentializing the male character and thus imposing a false unity on a fluid social reality. Conversely, this research deals with the real life context and looks at the features of hegemonic masculinity constructed in the fluid process of social interaction and its changing dynamics over time. It aims to investigate the construction of masculinities as ways of living and interacting for men in the everyday life context of a Punjabi village. This research does not provide a static typology of Kammi and Zamindar masculinity, but rather is interested to explore how the subordinate masculinity of Kammis exists in tension with the hegemonic masculinity of Zamindars. It will be recognized how the Kammi masculinity is changing as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and thus challenging the Zamindar masculinity. Together with the caste memberships, it is important to explore how the power disparities between Kammi and Zamindar men are mediated through the class disparities and produce different shades of masculinity. Hence considering a more holistic view of the gender hierarchy and complexity of multilayered masculinities organized around the caste based power structures, this research looks at the constructions and hierarchy of masculinities as relational and changing categories. More importantly, in order to address the criticism of the theory of hegemonic masculinity, this research considers the interplay of gender dynamics with social dynamics of caste, class, and region. Similarly, women of colour emphasized that it is important to consider the race and the other issues of social inequality in order to explore the gender hierarchy in any society. They argued that the power cannot be conceptualized solely in terms of sex difference and thus questioned any universal claims about the category of men.

Theory of Intersectionality: The Black Feminist movement pioneered by the women of colour acknowledged the need to study gender with reference to issues of power and difference (Burgess-Proctor, 2006; Collins, 2000; Zinn & Dill, 1996). It was argued that the gender experiences among men and women and their gender relations are not homogenous but are created, defined and recognized by the issues around inequality i.e. race, class, age, sexuality etc. Hence, it is important to construct intersectional approaches which study gender in the context of different locations of inequality (Crenshaw, 1991). The sociological theory of the “Matrix of Domination” (Collins, 2000) conceptualised the social relations of dominance and resistance in paradigm of race, class, and gender as an interconnected system of oppression. Within this theoretical approach, people are socially situated on the power continuum in a society according to their differences. The Black feminists highlighted the experiences of African-American women whereby race, class, and gender are analysed as an interlocking system of their subordination. By developing this theory, they created a new paradigm of studying other issues of oppression and dominance, such as, caste, ethnicity, sexuality, age, religion etc. In recent years, the theory of intersectionality has increasingly been used in the analysis of minority/subordinate cultures and identities by focussing the questions of power and inequalities (Knudsen, 2006).

Arguably, studying the social relations of dominance and resistance in caste society of rural Pakistan in the paradigm of caste and gender as an interconnected system of oppression may result in comparable reasoning to what theory of matrix of domination and multiracial feminism observed in the case of African-American women. It can be examined how the culturally constructed categories of gender and caste interact at multiple levels contributing to the systematic inequalities and thus different forms of social oppression against subordinate gender-caste identities in a Punjabi village (McCall, 2005). It should be interesting to situate four different gender-caste categories i.e. men and women from Zamindar and Kammi Quoms on the power continuum in a caste society and analyse their social experiences organized around the inequality. Moreover, as discussed previously, class can be another factor producing different shades of gender identity and arguably it is important to not divide men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms into any static gender categories, which can be multilayered and complex.

Whilst talking about the power hierarchy, the theory of matrix of domination introduced a conceptual stance which suggests that all groups experience varying amounts of penalty and privilege in a society.

That is, all people simultaneously experience both oppression and privilege; no individual or group can be entirely privileged or entirely oppressed” (Burgess-Proctor, 2006: 35).

Applying this argument on a typical Pakistani village, it can be investigated how the different gender identities experience oppression and privilege in a caste society. For example, while it is liberating for a labourer Kammi woman to move freely in the village setting, she may become vulnerable against any kind of attack or violence. Conversely, Zamindar women are comparatively protected of any disreputable experiences in community environment. However, they pay the penalty in form of their seclusion and restricted mobility in order to maintain the social position of their men and caste groups.

As discussed previously, this research will use the theory of hegemonic masculinity critically. While a few concepts of the theory of hegemonic masculinity are useful to explain the gender issues in the context of a Punjabi village, this research attempts to address the criticism of the theory. On the other hand, the theory of intersectionality also talks about gender hierarchy but suggests exploring it around the issues of inequality and difference, rather than developing any static typology of gender identities. It will be interesting to use the theory of intersectionality in order to address a few of the criticisms of the theory of hegemonic masculinity.

Bourdieu’s (1990) **theory of symbolic violence** is another useful paradigm to analyse the dynamics of power interaction between Zamindars and Kammis who do not depend on Zamindars for their livelihood e.g. educated Kammis, better off Kammis, and those who own land and are involved in cultivation. Though such Kammis remain a subordinate status category and are discriminated against in the village setting, their economic dependence on Zamindars reduce and they do not mostly get involved in the asymmetrical interactions with them (see 2.3.1). Arguably, Zamindars cannot assert domination over these Kammis using direct means e.g. verbal abuse or acts of physical assault. However, it should be interesting to examine how Zamindars impose the categories of thought and perception over such Kammis that have discriminatory implications in order to ensure their caste domination in the village setting. It can be argued that the caste status is an important source of prestige (Izzat), symbolic capital (Bourdieu, 1990), for the members of Zamindar Quoms to maintain their domination

over better off/educated Kammis, though it may not be directly recognizable. However, it is important to investigate how Zamindars assert their caste status in order to maintain caste inequalities against Kammis who are not involved in the traditional caste relations with them. Besides, it can also be examined how Zamindars use symbolic capital e.g. prestige, honour, and authority as a source of power to assert dominance over labourer Kammis or to alter their actions e.g. to compel them to vote for their favoured candidate in the election. Hence, it can be analysed how the relations of economic dependence set the lasting obligations of personal loyalty on the part of labourer Kammis, described as symbolic violence by the Bourdieu, 1990.

While examining the dynamics of power interactions between Zamindar men and Kammi men in the village setting e.g. at Dera, this research intends to look at the indirect means of exerting domination over others as an expression of hegemonic form of masculinity. For example, the way Zamindar men impose the category of caste status over Kammi men and thus assert authority over them or discriminate against them in the daily life village affairs. It can be argued how the ability or inability to impose the categories of thought and perception, having discriminatory meanings, in the caste relations play a part in shaping the gender identities across Zamindar and Kammi men and thus position them at the hegemonic and marginalized masculinity respectively.

Social learning theory is derived from the work of Albert Bandura (1973, 1977) which stressed that the aggression and violent behaviours are learned through the behavioural modelling during the process of socialization. It is argued that the aggression reinforced by the social environment is the most important source of behaviour modelling (Groth 1983; Kaufman and Zigler 1987; O'Leary 1988; Ormrod, 1999; Pagelow 1981; Straus, Gelles, and Steinmetz 1980). Explaining the motivational aspect of aggressive or violent behaviours learned through socialization, it is suggested that many individuals expect positive reinforcements for modelling such behaviours e.g. gaining the praise of others or building self-esteem (Siegel, 1992).

Academics have explained how the process of identity construction in a Punjabi village produces the status inequalities among villagers, Kammis and Zamindars, during the course of their socialization and discussed the caste relations as asymmetrical in terms of socio-economic obligations (Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004). However, it is not mentioned how the process of learning status inequalities in a caste society may involve the power

tactics to maintain the dominance over caste subordinates, which may result in aggression or violence.

Examining the dynamics of asymmetrical social interactions among Zamindars and Kammis in a Punjabi village, the social learning theory can be used to analyse how the management of labour relations and assertion of caste status over caste subordinates may involve the aggression tactics that are learned from and reinforced by the social environment. For example: arguably Zamindars employ abusive conduct towards labourer Kammis in order to ensure their compliance in the labour relations, and hence they expect a positive reinforcement for modelling such behaviour (Bourdieu, 1990). While the social learning theory focuses on the aggressive and violent behaviours, this research considers the non physical ways of asserting domination along with the physical acts of violence against caste subordinates. However, the basic assumptions of the theory can be used to explore how the tactics of asserting domination over caste subordinates using non physical ways are learned during the course of socialization in a caste society, which are reinforced by the social environment e.g. assuring the compliance of Kammi labourers using non physical ways of asserting domination. Hence, the theory of symbolic violence and the social learning theory can be used simultaneously to look at this aspect of social oppression in a caste society.

While looking at the patterns of local politics and patronage in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) explained that the aggression characterizes the most common assertion of status as a landlord. A young landlord gained the respect of his peers in the village when he appeared to beat an insolent labourer with a cricket bat (Lyon, 2004). Similarly, Lyon mentioned that the young landlords, at times, turn violent towards the poor labourers to send a signal to the villagers that they can defend their family's reputation and are strong enough to assume a leadership role in the future. It shows how the aggression produces positive reinforcements among young landlords who use it to assert authority in the village setting.

However, Lyon did not interpret the aggression among young landlords in terms of their gender-caste identity acquired during the course of their socialization in a caste society. Thus using the social learning framework, it is important to analyse how Zamindar men in a Punjabi village learn the aggression tactics and violent behaviours as part of their masculine identity, which are reinforced by the social environment as well. For example, it can be argued that the honour revenge in the context of a Punjabi village involve the

positive social reinforcements and take place as a result of the exaggerated notions of masculine Ghairat (honour) among Zamindar men.

All of the above mentioned theories will be employed to examine the different aspects of caste based violence in a Punjabi village; social exchange theory and symbolic violence will be discussed more than other theories. However, this study predominantly draws on the theory of intersectionality, along with a critical use of the theory of hegemonic masculinity.

3.3.3. Caste, Gender Based Violence, and Women

Violence against women in Pakistani society exists as a structural phenomenon and gender relationships are organized in a way that the women accept different types of violent acts against them as part of their lives during the course of their socialization. Family violence is not mostly recognized as a matter that requires a legal intervention and thus it results in a customary practice (Babur, 2007; UN, 2000). The major types of violence against women discussed in the Pakistani context are the honour killing, sexual violence, forced marriages, and acid throwing and burning (Burney, 2005; Human Rights Watch, 2010).

Honour killing refers to the murder of a family member, usually a woman, for indulging in an act that has brought shame on the family name e.g. having an illegal sexual affair, elopement, or marrying without the consent of family (Amnesty International, 1999; Irfan, 2008). The practice of honour killing of women resides in the ideals of masculinity that require men to protect the honour of the family associated with the sexuality and body of their women (Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Irfan, 2008; Welchman and Hossain, 2005).

In few of the remote areas of Pakistan, blood feuds among tribes are settled through the **forced marriages** and this custom is called **vani**. The marriage can only be avoided if the tribe or clan of the girl pays money, called Deet, as compensation. Since long established cultural ideologies favour the prevalence of Vani, the local authorities and police are normally reluctant to prosecute the cases (Burney, 2005; Kamran, 2007; Najam, 2007; The Guardian, 2006).

In the recent years, there are increasing incidences of **acid throwing and burning of women** in Pakistan (Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, 2006, 2008). In the incidences of burning, husband or other family members douse the victim with kerosene

oil and set a fire, and label it as the stove or cooking death. Similarly, the perpetrators of the acid attacks throw acid at the victims and burn their faces or other body parts. Bringing insufficient dowry and domestic disputes are described as the major reasons for burning. Daughter-in-laws or wives are mostly the victims in such cases. Furthermore, declining a marriage proposal, disobeying the husband or adultery may result in the acid throwing or burning of women. In burning cases, only 5% of the accused are ever convicted; possibly because the victims do not survive by the time of trial. In addition, police are also at times hesitant to investigate such incidents considering these crimes a family matter (Babur, 2007; Human Rights Watch, 2003; Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, 2008; Veena, 2002).

Besides above mentioned crimes, women in Pakistan suffer **sexual violence**. Human Rights Commission of Pakistan reported 808 incidents of sexual violence, rape, and gang rape against women in 2008. Women in Pakistan face sexual violence both in domestic and community spheres and the perpetrators may include acquaintances or strangers. In a few cases reported in 2008, rape was used to settle personal vendetta and the local justice tribunals gave the verdict in which female relatives of the accused were ordered to be raped by the men from victim's family (Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, 2008). It shows how the sexual violence against woman may at times take place as a socially endorsed act in Pakistan.

However, the studies and statistics on violence do not incorporate the caste factor while dealing with the violence against women. During his field work study on the caste based social oppression in rural Pakistan, Gazdar (2007) documented the numerous cases of rape against the Kammi caste women. It was found that the perpetrators were mostly known and committed the crime because of the weak socio political status of the victims. However, Gazdar did not detail how the caste organization of a society constitutes the power dynamics that increase the vulnerability of Kammi women towards the acts of sexual assaults. Similarly, Mukhtaran Mai's gang rape case shows how the caste based power structures get involved in the violence against women in rural Punjab. Mukhtaran Mai was gang raped in honour revenge after her brother was falsely accused of having illicit relations with a girl from the powerful clan of Mastois (Mai, 2007). The incident took place in Meerwala, a village in South Punjab. Mai belonged to Tatla Gujjar clan of that village, another landowning Quom, who were less powerful than Mastois in that region (Mai, 2007). Mai's incident does not reflect the caste based power dynamics between two traditional caste divisions in Punjab i.e.

Zamindars and Kammis. Social power in the South Punjab, where Mai's incident took place, is premised on the political entrepreneurship and leadership within extended kinship groups and not the traditional caste system like in the upper and central Punjab (Nadvi and Obinson, 2004). Arguably, the social stratification in South Punjab cannot be measured by the traditional caste division between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms.

Hence, it is important to investigate how the social inequalities organized around the caste based power structures may result in the different types of violence against women in rural Pakistan. Considering the above discussion, arguably the honour based violence and sexual violence may emerge as the two major types of violence against women in the context of a caste society in rural Pakistan (Eglar, 1960; Gazdar, 2007; The Sunday Times, 2006).

3.4. Conclusion

3.4.1. Gaps in the Literature and Issues Raised

There are hardly any attempts to examine how the rigid hierarchical categorization of caste groups impinges upon the gender construction among men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms, i.e. their gender identities and relations, and determine their social experiences around the issues of power and difference. There is a serious shortage of literature on how the categories of caste and gender interact at multiple levels to produce different shades of social inequality and power relations that subsequently create and define the social experiences of men and women concerning different forms of social oppression and violence.

This chapter has considered debates about the intersection of caste and gender in rural Pakistan with the help of limited information available on the organization of Pathan society in Swat in terms of gender (Ahmed, 1980; Barth, 1969) and the caste based gender roles across Kammi and Zamindar women in a Punjabi village (Eglar, 1960). It has explained how there may exist a considerable diversity in the nature of patriarchy and structure of gender across the major caste divisions in Pakistani society i.e. Zamindar Quoms and Kammi Quoms. Seclusion of women and encapsulation of domestic life define the gender basis of society in rural Pakistan. Ideals of virility and masculine honour are linked with the protection of women in domestic sphere. While the landowning castes follow the norms associated with gender structure of society by limiting the mobility of their women in public sphere, lower caste women are forced to work as labour in the community sphere because of their economic and caste

obligations. As a result, the chapter has argued that the lower caste men are not able to exert dominance over their women, like their upper caste counterparts, by controlling their mobility and economic aspect of their life. Correspondingly, it is suggested that the lower caste women may become vulnerable against acts of violence and oppression because of their excessive mobility in the community sphere and their subordinate caste status.

The limited literature available keeps its focus on the women or their gender roles associated with their caste groups. However it is not examined how their caste memberships and caste roles play a part in constructing their gender identity i.e. femininity and, as a result, define their social experiences in the village setting. Neither is it discussed how the power interactions in a caste society shape the dynamics of masculinity across Kammi and Zamindar men, which determine their social experiences about different form of social oppression in the community environment. In fact, the literature on caste system in Pakistani context does not talk about the power dynamics involved in the hierarchical status categorization of Kammis and Zamindars and their asymmetrical interactions. By examining the social inequalities configured around the caste based power structures this research will highlight the ways in which the subordinate social position of Kammi men and women result in the different forms of social oppression against them. However, it is also important to recognize how the intra caste power relationships among Zamindar Quoms may result in different types of violent conflicts. It will provide a clearer picture of how the lower caste standing shape the particular ways in which the men and women of Kammi Quoms experience violence differently, compared with their counterparts who belong to Zamindar Quoms.

This thesis draws on the theory of intersectionality to analyse how the categories of caste and gender interact at multiple levels to construct the masculinity and femininity across the men and women of Kammi and Zamindar Quoms and define the individual's experience of different forms of oppression and violence. In order to develop a complete picture, the study will first look at the dynamics of caste system in the contemporary Punjabi villages. It will be investigated how the village life is organized around the caste based power structures, which result in the social marginalization of Kammis from the normatively prescribed village activities. The study will then examine how the caste structures determining the social position of members of Zamindar and Kammi Quoms play a part in shaping their gender identities and gender relations. Finally, it will be analysed how the intersectionality of caste and gender mediate the individual's

experiences of different forms of violence. While the traditional caste system and labour relations are in decline in the Punjabi villages, it is significant to investigate how it is affecting the caste based power dynamics and, as a result, the gender structure in rural Pakistan. Hence, one of the research questions in this research especially focuses on how the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence are changing over time in the contemporary rural Pakistan.

Chapter Four

Methodological Framework and Data Collection Methods

4.1. Introduction

This chapter looks at the choices and reasons underpinning the methodological framework and the data collection methods employed in the present research. The chapter starts by examining the qualitative research model, epistemological stance of the study, and adoption of an interpretive approach for the data collection. It is explained how this study benefits from the traditions of inductive and deductive logic in social research. The discussion then proceeds towards the research design and the chapter describes the case study comparative research and the process of selecting research sites in two different agricultural contexts. The following sections detail the data collection methods used in this research. The sampling strategy is discussed together with the data sources. It is mentioned that the scheme for entering the research sites and conducting fieldwork includes the processes of negotiation, rapport building, and disclosure and effective use of gatekeeping. After that, the reasons for selecting in-depth semi structured interviews, as the tool of data collection, are examined alongside the structure of interview guides. The chapter highlights the importance of active reflexivity in the research process. The ethical considerations i.e. informed consent, privacy, anonymity, and confidentiality of the participants are explained within the context of present study. The researcher's fieldwork experiences are also detailed in the chapter. Towards the end, the procedures for transcribing and analysing the data are discussed.

4.2. The Qualitative Research Model and Epistemological Position

While the positivists look at the value free evidences and establishment of scientific hard facts (Neuman, 2000; Robson, 2002), it is difficult to analyse the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in rural Pakistan using the notion of positivists about irrefutable truth and social reality being governed by general laws. As discussed in chapter 2, the caste structures in Pakistan and India are highly contextual and thus not governed by any general laws (Barth, 1960; Dumont, 1970; Eglar, 1960; Leach, 1960; Lyon, 2004). This study argues that the basic patterns of social reality are not stable over time and space, hence rejecting the idea of possibility to establish an absolute truth associated with the quantitative approach in social research (Murphy and Dingwall, 2001).

The present study positions itself within the qualitative approach to social research, which suggests understanding social reality as an outcome of the social interaction of individuals in a particular social context and not as a phenomenon that exists independent of those who construct it. This particular approach of looking at society is known as the interpretive approach and qualitative research is primarily situated in the interpretive school of thought (Berger and Luckman, 1967; Mason, 2002). This approach considers how the social world is created, experienced, interpreted, and understood by those who inhabit it. It means, it is the perceptions and views of the people, attaching meanings to their social world, that interest the qualitative researchers (Bryman, 2001). Hence, the philosophical position (ontology and epistemology), data collection methods, and analytical process of this research study are based on the understanding of how the individuals construct and make sense of the social world around themselves, in which they live and move.

Using the interpretive approach, this research is interested to learn how caste and gender interact to mediate the individual's experience of different forms of social oppression and violence. In other words, the way members of Kammi and Zamindar Quoms in a Punjabi village experience gender and violence differently, and they attach meanings to their experiences. In order to understand and describe the meaningful social action or how people experience their daily life in a particular social setting, an interpretive researcher tries to know it from the point of view of those living within that social setting. Interpretivists believe that a human action has no inherent meanings and that the people in a particular social context, sharing a common meaning system, attach meanings to a social action by constantly making sense of their social world. Hence, the interpretive approach is concerned with the description of how the meaning system in a social group is generated and sustained during the process of fluid social interaction among group members in a social context (Mason, 2002; Neuman, 2000).

While carrying out this research, the logic in practice was followed rather than the reconstructed logic. Reconstructed logic, applied by the quantitative researchers, is concerned with the logic of doing research in a highly organized and systematic way with logically consistent rules and terms. Measures are systematically created and standardized before data collection. In reconstructed logic, the researcher moves in a linear path following a fixed sequence of steps. Conversely, the logic in practice, applied by the qualitative research tradition, is related to the logic of carrying out actual research in the field and capturing and discovering meaning after the researcher is

immersed in the data collected during the fieldwork process. Measures are created in an ad hoc manner and are often specific to a micro level setting (Neuman, 2000). The present study, fitting itself within the logic in practice, was conducted in two Punjabi villages located in different agricultural contexts and the concepts were captured in the form of themes after the researcher immersed himself in the data. The analysis proceeded, by extracting themes from the evidence and organizing data, to present a coherent and consistent picture of the phenomenon under study (Neuman 2000). However, benefiting from the traditions of reconstructed logic, the researcher took systematic measures in selecting the research site, sampling procedures etc. Moreover, the philosophical decisions and methods of data collection are also logically consistent in this research. In qualitative research, the researcher moves in a non linear path making successive passes through steps. At times, the researcher may be required to go backward and sideways before moving forward, and hence gaining new insights with each cycle and repetition in the process of conducting research. Doing qualitative research is, therefore, more of a spiral, going upward slowly but not directly in fixed steps, like in quantitative research (Kaplan, 1964; Neuman, 2000).

As stated above, a qualitative researcher begins with an open and flexible stance i.e. research questions and some ad hoc concepts. Theory is generated from the data in a reflexive manner. This inductive approach of looking at the social phenomenon implies that the theory is grounded in the data. Since a qualitative researcher starts with knowing a little about the concepts under study, conceptualization and operationalization of the concepts occur during the data collection and analysis phase. This flexibility in doing research allows the data and theory to interact (Neuman, 2000).

It was not possible to fit this study into an already existing theoretical framework, which explains the same phenomenon in any other social context e.g. in Hindu India. Hence, inductive reasoning is employed in the present research to produce theory. On the other hand, during the process of formulating the intellectual puzzle, the researcher made certain general assumptions, being an insider to Punjabi culture, with reference to the themes, motifs, and taxonomies that could be generated from the data. It means, this study contains the components of deductive reasoning as well. However, these thoughts are not presented in form of a hypothesis to be tested during the research process (Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008; Mason, 2002). Although the present research study starts with an initial 'partial framework' (Glaser and Strauss, 1967), the themes and concepts will only emerge as the researcher collects the data in field.

4.3. The Research Design

4.3.1. Case Study Comparative Research

In the case study method, social data is organized around a single social unit. It is particularly important to identify the nature of social interactions, social situation, set of social relationships, processes, and events that the case, single social unit, constitutes in connection with the phenomenon being investigated (George and Bennett, 2005; Goode and Hatt, 1952; Yin, 1984). In this research, the data is organized around a typical Punjabi village, as a social unit, by identifying the nature of social interactions and social relationships between Zamindars and Kammiss relating to the social phenomenon under study i.e. how the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence work in a Punjabi village (Glesne and Peshkin, 1992; Hammersley, 1992; Stake, 1995).

The present research is case study comparative research and was conducted in two villages of Punjab province in Pakistan, each village as a unit of analysis; one in the irrigated and other in the arid agricultural areas. It was intended to compare the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in two different agricultural contexts (Regin, 2008). Neuman describes the case study comparative research as following:

It is a type of comparative research in which a researcher examines data (usually qualitative) from one or two particular cultures (or cultural units such as regions) and contrasts the data with a few other cultures (2000: 402).

The primary focus of case study comparative research is to compare particular societies or cultural units, and not to make broad generalizations (Neuman, 2000: 402). This study intended to compare the caste system and its relation with gender and violence in two Punjabi villages from distinct agricultural contexts i.e. irrigated and arid. Results of this study cannot be generalized over whole Punjab or other villages of an agricultural context.

When the researchers compare units or their characteristics, the units should be distinct and separate from each other. If the units are not adequately different, the researcher will find spurious relationships (Neuman, 2000). Hence, it is particularly important to understand the differences between the units, to be compared, in this research. It is essential to mention how the caste system and dynamics between caste, gender, and violence may vary across the arid and the irrigated agricultural contexts in Punjab.

Punjab is the most populous province, with around 56 % of Pakistan's total population. Being an agricultural region, Punjab contributes up to 68 % of agricultural output in

Pakistan (Government of the Punjab, 2010). However, the patterns of agricultural activity and productivity of land vary across different regions of Punjab, which also affect the social and economic dynamics of those regions. The Punjab province can be divided into three distinct agro-ecological zones. The northern Punjab is characterised by arid (rain fed) agriculture, central Punjab by irrigated agriculture and fertile lands, and southern Punjab typified by an arid climate that allows for limited agriculture (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003: 14).

Central Punjab is characterized by the irrigated agriculture and fertile lands. The majority of villagers depend on agricultural land, owned by the traditional Zamindar Quoms, for their subsistence. Livestock is another source of livelihood because of the extensive availability of fodder. Land is an important source of income not only for Zamindars but it provides the labour opportunities to Kammiss as well. Besides their caste based occupational specialities, Kammiss work on the land of Zamindars and help them in taking care of their livestock. A very few Kammiss acquire land from Zamindars on contract and cultivate on their own. Agriculture is the preferred occupation in the irrigated zone of Punjab and the majority of the economic activities related with the livelihood of the villagers take place inside the village boundaries (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). While Kammiss have the labour opportunities to earn their livelihood within the village boundaries, it increases their dependency on Zamindars of their village. Arguably, direct economic dependence on Zamindars and the nature of agricultural activities i.e. working on fields and at Dera as labour add to the vulnerability of Kammiss towards the acts of violence and oppression.

Conversely, the significance of land in the arid zone of Punjab is different compared with the irrigated zone. Land is not very fertile because of a shortage of water. Agricultural activity, growing crops and fodder for livestock, depends heavily on rain. Therefore, the villagers in the arid zone depend on other sources of income, e.g. army, and government and social sector jobs, alongside limited agriculture. Moreover, there is an increasing trend among villagers to migrate to overseas to earn their livelihood. Planning and Development, Government of Punjab (2003) pointed out that even those who own land in the arid zone do not cultivate because of the drought and shortage of rain.

Men in arid area of Punjab see themselves as farmers (85 per cent) even though they also perceived that "*agriculture is almost finished*". Inadequate rain and the government's inability to provide water are seen as the reason for their poverty. Livestock, therefore, is the next source of their livelihood but this too is diminishing because of the shortage of

water and fodder. 35 per cent of men here are in government or non-government employment with 35 per cent of those in the army (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003: 102).

One of the villagers in the arid zone suggested:

As we are facing drought, agricultural land is worthless these days (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003: 102).

The villagers in the arid zone work on agricultural land in the limited harvesting season. Agricultural labour cannot be a permanent source of employment for Kammiss and thus they are required to look for other sources of livelihood. As the economic activity stretches outside the village boundaries because of the limited agricultural activity, it reduces the level of economic dependence of Kammiss on and their involvement in the asymmetrical social relations with Zamindars of their villages. Nevertheless Kammiss in the arid zone perform other low graded tasks, e.g. proving labour at ceremonial occasions, and are socially secluded, like Kammiss of the irrigated zone (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). However, arguably, Kammiss in the arid zone are less vulnerable towards the acts of social oppression and violence compared with their counterparts in the irrigated zone.

The Dera system can be seen as another difference between the irrigated and the arid zone's villages of Punjab. A Dera is a place that Zamindars in the irrigated zone maintain for keeping livestock and to run agricultural activity. Dera is also used as a sitting place for the men villagers. Furthermore, the collective decision making in a village takes place at the Dera. Kammiss take care of Dera as servants. Dera system works as an established social institution in the irrigated zone's villages and have a defined set of roles for Kammiss and Zamindars (Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004; Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). Arguably, the Dera system exists in those areas of Punjab province where agriculture forms the basis of social and economic activity. Since people in the arid zone's villages are involved in agriculture at a limited level, there is no tradition of Dera system in the arid zone of Punjab.

This shows that even though the arid and the irrigated zone of Punjab are part of a single larger unit i.e. Punjab province, the dynamics of caste and labour relations among Kammiss and Zamindars differ across both agricultural regions. It seems that the caste structures in the irrigated zone's villages of Punjab are stronger and persistent compared with the arid zone's villages.

Ragin (1987) describes that the case study comparative method is helpful for identifying factors or characteristics that are constant or that vary among two or more cases. The above discussion shows how the dynamics of caste and the caste experiences of the villagers could vary across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages in Punjab. However, there may be certain aspects of the caste system that are similar in both agricultural contexts e.g. various tasks associated with Kammiss at the ceremonial occasions.

It is important to mention that this research dealt with Zamindars and Kammiss as two distinct social units of a single larger system and examined the dynamics of their asymmetrical social relationships in the village setting. The majority of Punjabi villages are populated by a Zamindar Quom, considered as the owners of that particular village, along with a few Kammi Quoms, the service providers. A few of the Punjabi villages are jointly owned by different Zamindar Quoms. Alongside these two basic caste divisions, there are certain other Quoms in some of the Punjabi villages, mostly in a minority, who are denied the status of being Zamindars but are above service caste i.e. Kammiss, e.g. Arains and Kashmiris (Blood, 1994; Eglar, 1960). These middle rated Quoms are gaining prominence and are involved in agriculture. They own independent villages in some parts of the Punjab. However, examining the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence, this study considered the interaction between two main caste categories i.e. Zamindars and Kammiss. Although the social status of Zamindars in a village varies in accordance with the size of their landholdings (Eglar, 1960), arguably, it does not impact the dynamics of relationship between Zamindars and Kammiss, as broad caste categories, in a village. Kammiss are not given the status of being Zamindar even if they acquire land (Eglar, 1960). Zamindars with smallest landholdings may assert authority over Kammiss, being service providers of the village. It should be useful to mention that Zamindars in the villages under study owned average areas of land, with slight differences; big landlords did not inhabit these villages. In this study, all the Zamindars in one village are dealt with as one social unit. On the other side, Kammiss residing in a Punjabi village are sub divided into different Quoms on the basis of crafts they inherited from their ancestors i.e. barber, carpenter, potter etc. However Eglar (1960) described that Zamindars do not rank any Kammi Quom higher than the other Kammi Quoms, and they all are considered equal in social status, though the degree of importance is attached to tasks and occupations of various Kammiss differently. Hence, all the Kammi Quoms in one village were dealt with as one social unit in this research.

4.3.2. Selecting Research Sites

A purposive approach was used to select the research site. The researcher intentionally chose the setting/location where the social phenomenon or processes under study were more prevalent (Silverman, 2001). The research sites were selected taking into consideration the nature, aim, and purpose of the study. At first, it was important to identify two villages; one in the irrigated and other in the arid districts of Punjab. The irrigated zone's village was selected from the Sheikhpura district. Sheikhpura is one of the most populated districts in Punjab and is located in a wheat-rice irrigated agricultural zone. Literacy among farmers in the Sheikhpura is among lowest in the wheat-rice zones. Conversely, the arid village was selected from the Chakwal district, which is located in the centre of the arid zone in Punjab. Chakwal is known for its martial traditions. In addition, people in Chakwal depend on the rain fed agriculture. Literacy among farmers in the Chakwal districts is among the highest in Punjab (Ahmad, 2001; Ghaus, Pasha and Ghaus 1996; Government of Pakistan, 1994; Khan and Iqbal, 1982). Arguably, martial traditions and high literacy rate in Chakwal is a result of the arid nature of agricultural system in the district. People are required to get education in order to acquire employment in Army and other public/private sector organizations; they cannot earn their livelihood from the limited agricultural activity in the district (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003).



Photo 4.1 Map of Punjab Province showing Chakwal and Sheikhupura districts (Source: website provincial assembly of Punjab⁹)

Since this study intended to look at the dynamics of asymmetrical social interactions among Kammiss and Zamindars, it was important to make sure that the selected villages in each zone are inhabited by the traditional Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. The majority of Punjabi villages are occupied by two main castes division i.e. service castes (Kammiss) and landowning castes (Zamindars) (Eglar, 1960; Nadvi & Obinson, 2004), thus it was not difficult to identify the required villages in the arid and the irrigated zones of Punjab.

Though quite a few other Zamindar Quoms also inhabit different villages of Punjab e.g. Gujjars and Awans, the majority of Punjabis trace their ancestral heritage to pre-Islamic Jats and Rajputs (Blood, 1994). Nadvi & Obinson (2004) identified that the Punjabi villages in north and central Punjab are owned by any of these traditional Zamindar Quoms e.g. Jats, Rajputs, Awans, and Gujjars. These castes maintain their hold over land in opposition to traditionally marginalized castes i.e. service castes (Kammiss). However, the researcher purposefully selected the villages in the arid and the irrigated

⁹ <http://www.pap.gov.pk/index.php/members/bydistrict/en/9>

zone which are occupied by Rajputs and Jats in order to create an ideal cultural context for studying the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence. Alongside Zamindar Quoms, it was important to see that most of the Kammi Quoms were available in the selected villages i.e. barber, baker, cobbler, carpenter, potter, blacksmith, weaver, Musalli (labourer), tailor, Mirasi (village bard) etc (Eglar, 1960).

It was essential to take care of that the both villages, social units, have similar demographics, number of households of Kammi and Zamindars, population size, and caste distributions etc, in order to create a comparable context of both research sites. Medium size villages were selected in both zones i.e. irrigated and arid. The caste composition and population dynamics of the selected villages are discussed below.

4.3.2.1. The Village Demographics

The irrigated zone's village is located in the Ferozewala tehsil of district Sheikhpura which is considered a satellite town of Lahore. The village is owned by the Virk Jats. In addition, an Awan Biradari has a few households and is the other landowning Quom of the village. Kammi Quoms residing in the village are the barber, cobbler, carpenter, blacksmith, potter, Dindar (sweepers), weaver, and Mirasi (village bard). It is a medium size village, comprised of approximately 325 households. There are around 60 Kammi households. Having 22 households, barbers are the largest Kammi biradari. Besides, they are better off compared with other Kammi Biradaris of the village. Awans have 18 households and rest of the households belong to the Virk Jats. Different sources suggest that the total population of the village should not be more than 2500 individuals¹⁰.

¹⁰ It is difficult to calculate the exact population and, at times, the number of households in a village for various reasons. It was found in the present study that:

- The villagers who had migrated to cities or abroad several years ago were registered as the residents of same village in official records i.e. union council records and in voter lists. In Pakistan, domicile and national identity cards are issued on the basis of the home district. In more than a few cases, names of their following generations were also included in the voter lists e.g. 2nd generation British Pakistanis. Besides, their household numbers were listed in the voter's record. Similarly, Lyon suggests that many individuals living and working in a nearby city may continue to count their primary residence as the village (2004:32). It is important to note that the actual population residing in a village on the permanent basis and participating in the village affairs is much lower than the figures shown in the official records. Arguably, the figures suggesting the urban and rural population in Pakistan can be disputed, if many people living in the cities are calculated in official records on the basis of their primary residence as the village in their home districts.
- Considering the above mentioned reasons, the villagers were not certain about the exact population of their villages, and they suggested an approximate figure.
- Names of a few villagers who died several years ago were found in the voter lists.
- A few families, e.g. families of brothers, living in a house but not sharing a common cooking hearth are, at times, calculated as a single household in the official records.

According to the union council records, Zamindars comprise around 82 % of the total population, compared with 18 % of Kammis. Jats of the village are divided into 3 major Biradaris. Awans and a Virk Biradari have kinship relations through marriages and thus are dealt with as one Biradari in this research. The village is located approximately 30 kilometres from Ferozewala tehsil, a larger urban centre, and the villagers frequently travel to Ferozewala for shopping and jobs. There are two primary schools in the village, one for boys and one for girls. The local health centre is located at a distance of 5 kilometres from the village. The village has the modern day facilities of electricity and telephone/mobile networks. Two Industries are located near the village where quite a few Kammis work as daily wage labour.



Photo 4.2 An irrigated canal is passing through the southern side of the irrigated zone's village (Source: author's photo)

The arid zone's village was selected from tehsil and district Chakwal located approximately 90 kilometres south-east of the federal capital Islamabad. The village belongs to the Minhas Rajputs. Kammi Quoms living in the village are the barber, cobbler, potter, carpenter, blacksmith, and Musalli; weavers had migrated. It is also a medium size village and consists of around 250 households, of which 40 households are

-
- There can be political interests in presenting the population as large as possible e.g. for every 10,000 inhabitant, there is one Union Council representative. Thus a village having 10,000 inhabitants acquires the right to its own Union council representative (Lyon, 2004:31).

of Kammis. Cobblers being largest Kammi Biradari have 15 households. Cobblers and Musallis are better off compared with the other Kammi Quoms. Total population of the village is approximately 1800 persons. Besides, there is a Dhok (hamlet) nearby the village and is taken as part of the village in official records. There are around 10 Kammi (cobbler and Musalli) and 5 Zamindar households in the Dhok. Total population of the Dhok is around 100 individuals. Quite a few Kammis residing in the Dhok have labour relations with Zamindars of the village under study. Union council records and gatekeeper's estimation through house counting suggest that Kammis of the village and the Dhok makeup only 20 % of the total population, compared with 80 % of Zamindars. There are two main Zamindar Biradaris in the village along with one smaller Biradari that emerged from one of the larger Biradaris. The village is located in the centre of the arid area of the Punjab province with serious shortage of water for agriculture. Many villagers are working in the Army and other public sector jobs especially teaching and banking, and are also involved in different small businesses. The village is located about 22 kilometres from Chakwal city and the villagers travel to Chakwal for educational and employment purposes on everyday basis. Modern day facilities like telephone/mobile networks, electricity, water supply scheme, and internet are available in the village. In addition to a government high school for boys and a government primary school for girls, there is a co-education private primary school in the village. The local health centre is located at a walking distance from the village.

Alongside above mentioned justifications, it should be conceded that the site selection involved an element of convenience. Considering the sensitive character of this study, the researcher selected the villages which were easily accessible for conducting such research and gatekeepers were available from both Zamindar and Kammi Quoms for initial contact with the villagers.

4.4. Data Source and Sampling Strategy

The dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in a Punjabi village involve socially produced, heterogeneous, and complex processes of becoming and being. Interviewing men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms helped not only to understand the social phenomenon under study by providing a lot of data but also allowed the researcher to identify diverse viewpoints, with reference to caste, gender and age of the respondents. It was essential to give emphasis to the meanings, experiences, and views of all the participants involved in the social phenomenon under study (Pope and Mays, 1995).

Although most of the debates regarding sampling hail from the quantitative research traditions, qualitative researchers also apply rigorous procedures to select specific cases that can clarify and deepen their understanding on the social phenomenon under study. Given that the nature, purpose, and scope of qualitative and quantitative researches differ, their techniques of sampling also differ from each other. The qualitative researchers conduct their study in a micro-setting and are less interested in making broad generalizations. Thus they are not involved in detailed procedures of selecting a representative sample, with the help of probability sampling techniques, in order to produce generalizations about larger population like quantitative researchers. Instead they select their sample, using non probability sampling techniques, with an intention of understanding the context of their study in depth (Marshall, 1996; Neuman, 2000). However, sampling in qualitative interview based research influence the entire research study, including access strategies, data collection, and conclusions made. Qualitative researchers, therefore, apply rigorous procedures to select the sample of their study, which also helps them to improve the reliability and validity of their study (Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008; Luborsky and Rubinstein, 1995).

The sampling strategy was guided by the theoretical and analytical considerations, and thus implies theoretical sampling (Coyne, 1997; Mason, 2002). As stated above, the data sources included the men and women from Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. Hence, the researcher was clear about the relevant categories of people to be interviewed while choosing the sample. Along with the categorization according to caste and gender, the factor of age was considered in selecting the sample, thus making the sample even more diverse. Placing the respondents into different categories, guided by the theoretical logic, and then selecting the sample from within those categories ensured that there are some differences in the sample selected, which helped to understand the social phenomenon more deeply and in a diversified way (Neuman, 2000). Since this research was carried out in two villages, a micro setting, the researcher decided to conduct four interviews in each category. Robson (2002) suggests to keep going until you reach saturation, the point where the researcher feels that there is little or no more data to be gathered. In a research study, reaching the saturation is affected by the population size, research site, nature, and complexity of the phenomenon under study, tool of data collection, and quality of data gathered. However, the researcher can conduct some more interviews, if required (Guest, Bunce, and Johnson, 2006; Thomas, 2008). Since the researcher was conducting in-depth interviews in a micro setting about a familiar

social phenomenon, it was expected that the saturation can be reached with four interviews in each category. The strategy proved useful in the field and the researcher did not feel any need to conduct more interviews in any category (Crouch and Mckenzie, 2006; Morse, 1995).

After fixing the categories and number of cases in each category, Neuman (2000) suggests the haphazard sampling for selecting the respondents from within the categories. Conversely, for the present study, the purposive/judgemental sampling was used to select the respondents from each category. All the relevant categories i.e. men and women from Zamindar and Kammi Quoms were already included in the sampling. Applying purposive sampling, the researcher now decided to select those cases from within the categories which were accessible and more informative on the phenomenon under study i.e. who were permanently resided in the village and not working/studying outside.

The villages under study are populated by a single Zamindar Quom i.e. Virk Jats in the irrigated zone's village and Minhas Rajputs in the arid zone's village. Thus, it was straightforward to select the required number of respondents from Zamindar Quoms in both villages, being a homogenous group. However, representation was given to all major Zamindar Biradaris in a village while selecting the sample. In the arid zone's village, in addition to the 6 respondents (3 men and 3 women) from the two main Zamindar Biradaris, 4 respondents (2 men and 2 women) were selected from the smaller Zamindar Biradari. On the other side, 6 respondents (3 men and 3 women) from the two main Zamindar Biradaris in the irrigated zone's village were represented in the selected sample along with 4 respondents (2 men and 2 women) from the 3rd Zamindar Biradari that included Awan households as well. On the other hand, 6/7 different Kammi Quoms are living in the selected villages, e.g. barbers, cobbler, carpenters. It was important to give representation to all Kammi Quoms in the selected sample, hence making the data more diversified. Though the caste occupations of Kammi Quoms are in decline, the majority of them still work as labourers in the village setting. However, during the fieldwork, the researcher came to know that a few of the Kammi households in the villages under study had left their caste works and they are involved in respectable occupations¹¹. Thus it was significant to include such Kammis in the sampling, along

¹¹ In the context of a Punjabi village, the term "respectable professions" refers to the occupations that do not involve any menial work, jobs typically associated with the Kammi castes e.g. cobblers or barbers, or direct economic dependence on others. Moreover, the villagers associate more respect with the professions achieved through an education.

4.5. Strategy for Entering Research Sites and Conducting Fieldwork

4.5.1. Negotiation, Rapport Building, and Disclosure

In order to enter a research site and conduct fieldwork, the researcher required a flexible work plan, negotiating access and relations with the members, and deciding how much to disclose about the study to interviewees and gatekeepers (Neuman, 2000). Negotiating, rapport building, and gaining the access can be seen as interconnected processes during the field work. The process of negotiation and rapport building is an ongoing process that starts with first contact of the researcher with community members and goes on until the researcher leaves the research site (Gans, 1982; Johnson 1975; Ryen, 2003).

The researcher remained involved in negotiation and confidence building process with the gatekeepers, villagers, and respondents all through the fieldwork. It helped him to develop an equable and trustworthy relationship with the members for attaining detailed information on the phenomenon under study and also for reducing any hostile reactions during and after the fieldwork (Neuman, 2000). Given that the study involved some sensitive themes e.g. sexuality and violence, gaining the confidence of the local community was essential at all stages of the fieldwork in order to spend long hours in and around the village and for addressing any unanticipated implications for the research. The researcher's ethnic equivalence with the villagers and knowledge of the local context helped him considerably in the rapport building process.

Furthermore, the researcher and the female research assistants engaged the individual respondents in the process of rapport building before conducting an in-depth interview with them. Yet again, their command of the local language and ethnic equivalence with the villagers facilitated the acceptance of the research team among interviewees. Establishing a trustworthy relationship with the respondents is considered as fundamental in any interview based research where people discuss their private lives and experiences (May, 1993). In order to build rapport, general issues related with village life, weather conditions, and agricultural activity etc were discussed with the interviewees at the start of every interview, and thus showing an interest in the interviewees and their lives (Neuman, 2000).

Being an insider, the researcher knew that the local dress i.e. Shalwar Qameez, culturally appreciated body language and conversations, and command of the local dialect of Punjabi are essential to establish rapport among villagers. Hence, the research

team behaved, talked, and dressed in a culturally accepted manner during the field work. Moreover, the researcher initially approached the villagers, Zamindars or Kammiss, in the company of gatekeepers from their caste groups, which, the researcher thinks, helped in making them comfortable with the presence of research team. Thus being an insider, creating an understanding and conducive environment in order to facilitate greater rapport was not difficult for the researcher with the help of gatekeepers. Before starting the fieldwork, the researcher anticipated that some villagers may express an uncooperative attitude or an overt unwillingness to participate in the research (Neuman, 2000). However, the response of the gatekeepers, respondents, and villagers in both sites remained overwhelming and their cooperation was encouraging for the research team.

In a Punjabi context, disclosing the personal and professional background and educational achievements was useful in some regards. It helped the researcher in gaining the respect and confidence of the villagers. However, the researcher lost his privacy to some extent. Quite a few respondents were interested to listen about the researcher's experiences in a foreign university/country. A few Zamindars in the arid zone's village seek an advice from the researcher about the educational opportunities for their children. Some of the Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village enquired about the researcher's caste as well. Hence at some points in research, the researcher was required to divert such discussions carefully and to jog his memory to keep the focus on the fieldwork process and behave in a professional manner (Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008; Neuman, 2000).

Besides disclosure about the personal identity, it was essential to decide how much to disclose about the research study. Since it was an interview based research, it was necessary to talk about the contents of study with the interviewees in detail. In addition, some basic specifics, aims, and objectives, of the study were discussed with the gatekeepers. However, the researcher did not disclose the project to other villagers, who did not participate in the research study, since it involved some sensitive themes. Gatekeepers and respondents were also requested to not disclose the contents of the project/interviews to other villagers (Flinch and Mason, 1990).



Photo 4.3 The research team approaching the irrigated zone's village (Source: author's photo)

4.5.2. Gatekeeping: Concept, Practice, and Use

Field research normally requires the support or approval of 'gatekeepers' in order to gain access to a research site. Gatekeepers are those who have formal or informal authority of controlling access to a site. They facilitate the researcher in getting access to key resources needed for doing research within that particular research site; be those resources logistical, human, institutional, or informational (Campbell et al, 2006: 2). In this research, the gatekeepers were required for an initial entry in the villages under study and to facilitate the opportunities to interact with the villagers (Hay, 2000). However, the final selection of the respondents was the sole responsibility of the researcher, without the involvement of gatekeepers.

Academics argue that the relationship between the researcher and gatekeepers should not be considered as unidirectional and static; it evolves in form over time. The necessity and advantages of working with gatekeepers cannot be ignored but, on the other hand, it is a highly complex relationship and, at times, may have unexpected implications for the research (Campbell et al, 2006). In this research, support of the gatekeepers was required for entrance in the villages under study and first contact with the villagers. However, the relationship between the researcher and initial gatekeepers changed as the fieldwork process advanced. Some new gatekeepers were acquired

during the course of rapport building with the villagers and the actual research participants. Nevertheless, it was important to take account of the initial gatekeepers' interests in order to address any unexpected implications for the research (British Sociological Association, 2002), thus the researcher remained in touch with them throughout the fieldwork process.

At times, it is difficult to negotiate the need for conceptual distance/ethical balance with the gatekeepers, yet the researcher must set non-negotiable limits in order to protect the integrity of research (Neuman, 2000). Since this study involved some sensitive themes, the researcher did not negotiate with the gatekeepers on the issues related with confidentiality, anonymity, and identification of the respondents and the risk factors attached with the research. Local elites required special negotiation for gaining access (Neuman, 2000). The researcher contacted the local elites in both villages through his personal and professional contacts, who also served as gatekeepers at the initial stages of the research. It is important to highlight that the local elites offered a great deal of cooperation throughout the fieldwork process in their villages. Taking into consideration the implications related with ethics and security, the researcher negotiated the ethical balance with the initial gatekeepers at the early stages of the fieldwork. Aims and objectives of the research study were explained to the gatekeepers. It was highlighted that the ethical considerations of the study require the protection of confidentiality, anonymity, and identification of all the research participants. In response, the gatekeepers ensured their cooperation and un-conditional support without compromising on the non-negotiable limits of the research.

Sometimes, the approval of gatekeepers creates a stigma that inhibits the cooperation of some of the research participants (Neuman, 2000) and hence, in such situation, the gatekeepers may become an obstacle to gain access or get valid information from the participants (Campbell et al, 2006). In order to ensure the cooperation and participation of the Kammi respondents, the researcher initially contacted with the Kammi men villagers accompanied by a gatekeeper from a Kammi Quom. However, selecting the men respondents from the Kammi Quoms was the sole responsibility of the researcher, for ethical reasons, and the Kammi gatekeeper was not consulted. Kammi women respondents were selected with the help of Kammi men respondents, who were from their own Quom/ Biradari and thus in close relation with them. It helped to ensure that Kammi women's identification remains hidden from the gatekeepers, Zamindars, and

other Kammi men, thus addressing the risk factors associated with a sensitive study. It also prevented the influence of the gatekeepers skewing the results.

In field research, the role of researcher also changes over time. As the researcher spends time in the field and obtains information, power vis-a-vis research participants and initial gatekeepers grow, often to the extent that the researcher becomes a type of gatekeeper as well (Campbell et al, 2006). In order to distinguish the researcher's role as gatekeeper from those of traditional gatekeepers, Campbell et al (2006) labelled the researcher-turned-gatekeeper a "keymaster". The researcher's ethnic equivalence with the villagers, knowledge of the local context and command of local language helped him a great deal in gaining the confidence of respondents, gatekeepers and villagers at all stages of the fieldwork. As a result of this rapport building, the researcher acquired the role of keymaster with time and his dependency on the gatekeepers was reduced considerably. Acquiring the role of keymaster, the researcher was able to select the research participants on his own. As a result, it helped to protect the identification of Kammi respondents from the gatekeepers, and other Zamindars of the village.

4.6. The In-Depth Semi Structured Interviews

Taking into consideration the ontological and epistemological perspectives of this study that the knowledge about the nature of being and becoming is highly situated and contextual, the in-depth qualitative interviews were used as the tool of data collection. Conducting the qualitative interviews with men and women from Zamindar and Kammi Quoms provided the knowledge about a highly individual and specific social context of a Punjabi village. This study was concerned with the subjective meanings and values that the individuals in a Punjabi village attribute to situations and processes (Flick, 2002). The speech event (Neuman, 2000) of in depth interviews was, therefore, a useful way to understand the individual's unique interpretation of the relationship between caste, gender, and violence in the context of a Punjabi village.

Initially the researcher planned to conduct focus group discussions along with individual in depth interviews. It was thought that the focus group discussions may help in obtaining diversified knowledge, and differences of opinion, from the respondents of different age, gender, and caste. Frey and Fontana (1993) recommend group interviews in the social settings where the relationships among respondents are complex and the views are diverse. In addition, the focus group discussions potentially reduce the dominance of the interviewer in the data gathering process. However, the researcher

immediately realized that in a focus group discussion involving Kammi and Zamindars, the Kammi respondents may not feel comfortable to express their views on the issues of power, violence, and oppression. Even if a focus group involved the respondents from same Quom, it would have been difficult for the respondents to discuss about sexuality and violence in other's presence. Thus the potential dangers of compliance and identification (Albrecht, 1993) led the researcher to not decide on focus group discussion as a tool of data collection on a sensitive subject in Pakistani society.

Interviews may take various forms from highly structured interviews, where the same questions are asked from all the respondents in the same order, to unstructured interviews, where interviewer asks questions without any clear focus or set of pre determined themes (Kvale, 1996; Mason, 2002). Keeping in view the nature and epistemological standpoint of this research, the semi structured in depth interview approach was used to collect data for its advantages over rigid structured interviews technique. Semi structured interviews has pre determined questions. However, the researcher has the liberty to alter the order or wordings of the questions, if the situation and context requires (Robson, 2002).

Designing an interview guide (Kvale, 1996), i.e. listing the themes and questions to be explored, is an important process in an interview based research. The interview guide provides flexibility over the ordering of questions and putting emphasis on different themes during the interview process (Robson, 2002). The flexible nature of the semi structured interview technique, using the interview guide, provided an opportunity for the researcher to spend considerable time investigating sensitive aspects of the caste system which have not received attention of the researchers before (Thomas, 2008). Using the interview guide, the researcher was free to change the order of questions and emphasis of the talk, if required, in the process of examining sensitive themes in Pakistani society. Since probing follow-ups are helpful to build on main questions and in extension of initial answers from the respondents (Kvale, 1996), some probing questions were also included in the interview guide. Because of the four different categories of people involved in study i.e. Zamindar and Kammi men and women, four different interview guides were prepared. 75 % of the questions in all the four interview guides were similar, except a few questions that differed. Emphasis of a few questions varied across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. For example, while the respondents in the irrigated zone were asked about the Dera system in detail, it was a less important topic in the arid zone's village. All the questions were open ended,

ordered in general to a specific approach, giving the respondents an opportunity to talk in an extensive manner on the topic under study. Themes included in the interview guide revolved around the caste, gender, and violence in the context of a Punjabi village. The interview guides were structured in such a way that the general themes of caste were discussed before coming to specifics related with power, sexuality, and violence. All the questions in the interview guide were translated into the local languages i.e. Urdu and Punjabi (Creswell, 1997; Denzin & Lincoln, 1998; Rubin & Rubin, 2004; Silverman, 1999; Willis, 2004).

After designing the interview guides, some pilot interviews were conducted in order to check the workability of the tool. Pilot interviews were conducted with Punjabi students in Leeds, who belonged to the rural areas of Punjab similar to the sites selected for this study. In addition, a couple of telephonic interviews were conducted. Pilot interviews were recorded and discussed with the supervisors. The practice of conducting pilot interviews proved very useful in identifying the repetition of certain themes and time consumed for one interview and, as a result, certain changes were made in the interview guide. Language of some questions was also modified after the pilot interviews. However, it was found that the ordering of questions, from general to specific/sensitive themes, worked well in the pilot interviews. One pilot interview in each category was conducted in both villages under study in order to check the workability of interview guide in the actual field and repetition of questions was identified yet again. Thus, the interview guide was improved in the light of pilot interviews conducted in the actual field.

Almost 75 % of the interviews were recorded on the digital voice recorder and ranged from 45 minutes to 3 hours. A few of the interviews were not recorded on the request of the respondents; notes were taken for these interviews. Local health centres, situated outside the villages, were hired for conducting the in-depth interviews, except a few interviews that were conducted in the houses or Dera on the demand of the respondents.

During both phases of fieldwork, in the arid and the irrigated zone, the researcher immersed himself in the everyday lives of the members and remained thoroughly engaged in the informal periods of participant observation (Whyte, 1984) and kept noting his observations on the fieldwork diary. During the course of these observations in contextual setting e.g. at Dera, the researcher got an opportunity to further understand how the dynamics between caste, gender and violence work in a Punjabi village.

4.7. The Reflexive Voice

The reflexive voice in the qualitative research requires the researcher to remain involved in critical self-scrutiny and active reflexivity throughout the research process (Mason, 2002; Watt, 2007). Scientific research tries to achieve the results which have an objective character. Thus, the interactional and constructional nature of epistemological processes involved in the qualitative research necessitate the researcher to engage in the research process in a reflexive way, in order to maintain the scientific rigour of the research (Breuer, Mruck, and Roth, 2002).

There are two kinds of reflexivity in the research process: personal and epistemological. Personal reflexivity requires a researcher to continuously reflect upon how his involvement in the particular study can influence, act upon, and inform the research process and results. It suggests that the researcher should consider how his own experiences, identity (caste and gender in this study), educational attainments, beliefs, and values can shape and manipulate the research study (Nightingale and Cromby, 1999). Alongside critical self-scrutiny, epistemological reflexivity requires the researcher to continuously reflect upon the context of research, assumptions made in the research, research questions asked, data collection methods and data analysis techniques used and their implications for the research process and findings (Willig, 2001).

An interview based research is a 'speech event' (Neuman, 2000) conducted through a 'meta communicative' event (Briggs, 1986), where the parties, interviewee and interviewer, enter into the interview process under certain 'communicative norms'. It is important for the researcher to recognize the differences between the interviewee and himself and that conducting an interview for the research purpose may influence the interviewee's thought process and feelings, and hence alter their responses (Briggs, 1986; Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008). In other words, the researcher should acknowledge that the research may be manipulated by his presence and other external factors (Goodall, 2000). The reflexive voice, during the interview process, helps the researcher to explore, identify, and account for the potential and actual impacts, constraints and biases in the research. Consequently, the active process of reflexivity increases the validity, quality, and scientific rigour of the research (Mason, 2002). In this research, the researcher remained engaged in the active reflexivity all through the research process i.e. in the course of designing the study, fieldwork, data analysis, and write up stages.

4.7.1. Standpoint and Power

A Punjabi researcher, member of a Zamindar Quom, was investigating the oppressive practices within the caste system in Punjabi villages by conducting the in-depth interviews with members of Kammi and Zamindar Quoms, men and women. It suggests that the present study certainly involved the potential issues of power and difference between the researcher and respondents (Karnieli-Miller, Strier, and Pessach, 2009). Hence, it was important for the researcher to understand, adopting a reflexive approach, how to negotiate through the complex epistemological maze of power differentials (Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008), and matrix of domination in the context of this study (Collins, 2000).

The idea of standpoint epistemology was originated by the feminist writers who criticize the dominant conventional epistemologies in the social sciences (Hill, 2000; Andermahr, Lovel and Wolkowitz 1997). The standpoint epistemology emphasizes that the common traits between researcher and respondents, e.g. gender and ethnicity (Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008; Flinch, 1993), are essential to attain the coherent and valid information in a research study. The standpoint feminists advocate since women's lives, roles, and identities are different from men in all societies, women hold different type of experiences, perceptions, and knowledge. The subordinate position of women allows them to understand the social world in a different way than men, who have the biased conventional wisdom (Narayan, 1989). Hence, the feminist's standpoint epistemology proposes that the women researchers are more appropriately placed to investigate the issues related with women in different societies.

The idea of standpoint was adopted by the researchers working in cross cultural contexts (Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008) or on inter-racial issues (Thomas, 2008) in order to understand the potential issues of power differentials in their research. In the same way, the idea of standpoint applies to this research and questions the position of researcher with reference to his caste and gender. On the other hand, academics are highly critical of the feminist's standpoint (Gunaratnam, 2003) and argue that adopting it in its true spirit will challenge the validity and coherence of most of the qualitative research conducted to date (Cowley-Sathiakumar, 2008). It is emphasized that it is not always possible to reduce the differences like gender and ethnicity between the researcher and respondents. Adopting this stance, only the researcher of a particular ethnic background will be able to investigate the issues of an ethnic group i.e. a white researcher with white respondents only (Thomas, 2008).

However, the researcher tried to address the issues of power differential while designing the research study that helped him to acknowledge his own position and potential biases during the data collection and analysis process. During the fieldwork, the researcher did not disclose his caste to the Kammi villagers in order to reduce the perceived caste based power differences and to provide them an opportunity to talk openly about their deprivations. However, a few of the Zamindar respondents enquired about researcher's Quom. The researcher felt that they, Zamindars, were more respectful towards him after knowing about his Quom. All the women respondents, Kammi and Zamindar, were interviewed by the female research assistants, hence reducing the gender differences between interviewer and interviewee.

As discussed in section 4.5, the strategy of approaching the villagers in accompany with the gatekeepers from their own castes was helpful in managing the matrix of domination between the researcher and villagers, especially Kammis. Similarly, selecting the respondents without the involvement of gatekeepers reduced the potential power differentials between the gatekeepers and respondents. The researcher's common ethnic identity with members, command of the local language, and understanding of the local context benefited him in addressing his status differences with villagers during the course of acquiring knowledge.

4.7.2. Understanding the Social and Political Context

Guneratnam (2003) suggested that understanding of the socio-cultural and political environment of the fieldwork sites is vital to analyse the interview based data. On the other hand, the researcher asserts that a deep understanding of the social and political contexts of the research site is essential not only to analyse the data but it is even more important in conducting fieldwork. During the fieldwork process, the researcher ascertained that without a thorough understanding of the social and political dynamics of Punjabi villages, it would have been extremely difficult to conduct a study that included some sensitive themes. Arguably, building a rapport during the fieldwork was not adequate to conduct this study and a prior understanding of the local dynamics was essential. The researcher's identity as an insider helped him a great deal to manage the social and political dynamics in order to probe sensitive issues. Lee (1993) argues that the sensitive character of a research study inheres less in the research topic itself and more in the connection between topic and context in which the research is being carried out. Prior understanding of the socio-political dynamics of a Punjabi village, a well designed fieldwork strategy, and an effective use of gatekeeping minimized the

sensitive character of the research study and ensured the smooth progress of the fieldwork.

As discussed earlier, the local elites provided their unconditional support throughout the fieldwork process in their villages. It helped in managing the social and political contexts of the research sites and thus any unexpected implications for the research. Besides, it is important to mention the contributions of the female research assistants in the fieldwork, who were the natives of the districts under study. Having an in-depth understanding of the local dynamics and a good command over local dialect of Punjabi, they conducted the interviews, involved the interviewees in discussion, and probed the sensitive issues in a highly skilled way.

4.8. Recruiting and Training the Female Research Assistants

4.8.1. Selection Criteria and Recruitment

The process of recruiting and training the female research assistants started after 2 weeks of researcher's arrival in Pakistan. Four female research assistants were selected to interview the woman research participants; two for each district. They were the students of MA Sociology at the University of the Punjab Lahore. After completing their MA courses on qualitative and quantitative research methodologies, they were busy conducting their final research projects. Having participated in a couple of research projects with a local NGO and Research Cell at the Institute of Social & Cultural Studies, they had the experience of conducting in depth interviews. Most importantly, the female research assistants selected for each district were the natives of the districts under study, but not the selected villages, and hence knew the local context and were fluent in the local dialect of Punjabi language.

4.8.2. Training

A three day training session was organized. The Research Cell of the Institute of Social & Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab Lahore was used as venue for the training sessions. On the first day, after a detailed description of the project, the strategy for entering field was discussed with a special emphasis on ethical considerations. The researcher explained the issues related with the negotiation, rapport building, and disclosure. The female research assistants were especially asked to protect the confidentiality, anonymity, and identification of the women research participants.

On the second day, the interview guides were discussed in detail. The researcher trained the female research assistants about the techniques of effective interviewing in relation to this research and local context. Taking into account the sensitive aspects of the study, the researcher emphasized the risks of data security in the field and asked the female assistants to ensure the confidentiality of data.

On the third day, the female research assistants conducted practice in-depth interviews with female MA students, playing the role of the interviewees. The practice interviews were conducted in the absence of the researcher and were recorded, listened to and then discussed with the interviewers in order to ensure the quality control of the interviews. Hence, it was made sure that all the interviewers ask same questions in same way. The schedule for the fieldwork was discussed on the last day of training. Female research assistants were paid at the end of fieldwork according to the prevailing rates in market/Research Cell, Institute of Social & Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab Lahore.

4.9. Ethical Considerations

Even though the informed consent is essential in all the processes of field research (Mason, 2002), academics argue over what actually constitutes the informed consent in social research (Irvine, 1998; Kvale, 1996). In this research study, the research participants were selected during the course of interaction and rapport building with the villagers. After the villagers had accepted the researcher's request to be interviewed, their informed consent was immediately gained by informing them about the purposes and specifics of the study. The time and place for the interview was also decided if they had accepted to participate. Furthermore, the researcher explained about the project to the respondents at the beginning of an interview with them. They were also informed about the expected duration of an interview and that they were free to withdraw at any stage without giving a reason. The villager's response in both villages was overwhelming as a result of an exhaustive rapport building process, effective use of gatekeeping, and researcher's ethnic equivalence with the local population. None of the villagers denied the request of the research team to be interviewed. However, it was decided to not ask the participants to sign a consent form. Since getting the signatures on consent forms or written agreements reflect their legal standing and power, less well educated Punjabi villagers would have been uncomfortable with this practice.

In the context of a Punjabi village, it was essential to gain the consent of the male relatives of women research participants. As mentioned in section 4.5.2, the majority of women respondents were selected in consultation with the men from their own family/ Biradari. Hence, the issue of getting the consent of their male relatives was also addressed during the process of their selection. Male relatives were informed that the women respondents will be interviewed by the female research assistants. However, the consent of women respondents was gained involving their male relatives who, in a way, acted as gatekeepers for the researcher at that stage of the research. A few of the women research participants selected by the female research assistants were requested to consult their male relatives and get their consent before participating in the study. Furthermore, the consent of women respondents was gained before starting an interview with them. The female interviewers explained the specifics of the study and expected duration of an interview to the women respondents. It was informed that they were free to leave at any stage of the interview without explaining any reason to the interviewer. Kvale (1996) emphasised that the ethical considerations associated with a research involving interview conversation should be taken as a moral enterprise. In this research, the researcher designed a strategy to gain the informed consent of the respondents in such a way that their privacy, anonymity, and confidentiality are protected as well.

In order to ensure the anonymity of the research participants, their names and Quom titles were changed in the written thesis. Besides, the names of the selected villages were also changed to prevent the identification of the gatekeepers and respondents by geographical connections. The researcher discarded the names, Quom titles, and addresses of the subjects as soon as possible and referred to the subjects by codes afterwards (Neuman, 2000). The researcher gave assurance to all the respondents that their identities will remain anonymous, not only in the written thesis but also in future publications (Grinyer, 2002).

Considering the sensitive aspects of the study, it was taken care of that the privacy and anonymity of the respondents, especially Kammis, is protected from the gatekeepers and other villagers. The interviews were not conducted at the places where respondent's privacy and anonymity was at risk. Most of the interviews were conducted in the local health centres, outside the villages, where a room was hired. In order to ensure the gender segregation, the researchers did not conduct the parallel interviews of the men and women respondents. Travelling expenses, from village to health centre, were paid to the respondents in the irrigated zone's village. Conversely, the local health centre in

the arid zone's village was located at a walking distance from the village. A few of the respondents in both villages were more comfortable to be interviewed at their Dera, Zamindar men in the irrigated zone, or homes. At the end of an interview, the respondents, especially Kammi, were requested to keep their participation confidential because of the security risk factors.

Data security risk was another important concern. Since the research involved the questions about power relationships and violence, it was ensured that the information remains secure from the villagers, especially those in the positions of power e.g. Zamindars and gatekeepers. Disclosure of the data regarding sensitive issues would have resulted in the security risks against Kammi respondents. The female research assistants were asked to hand over the digital voice recorder to the researcher after conducting an interview. The data was transferred from the recorder to the laptop immediately and was deleted from the digital voice recorder as precautionary measures. The researcher applied a password on the laptop computer in order ensure the data security. All the equipments, recorders and laptop computer, were kept under secure lock and key, when not in use. Since remote access to the University's M drive was not possible from the research locations, the data was stored on the lap top computer. In addition, the female research assistants were strictly asked to keep the disclosure of any illegal activity, rape, honour issues, or elopement etc, confidential, during and after the field work process.

The research team maintained a professional attitude during the fieldwork and followed the ethical guidelines, as closely as possible, provided by the Ethics Committee, University of Leeds, and British Sociological Association (2002).

4.9.1. Disengaging Process and Follow-up Contacts

Literature on methodology places a great emphasis on the strategy for entering research site and conducting fieldwork. However, there is limited reflection on the process of leaving the field and the implications of the research activities on the research participants or the researcher after the fieldwork has ended (Sathiakumar, 2008). Lee (1993) discussed that researching the sensitive topics may potentially affect the lives of the research participants and the researcher after the fieldwork process is over. Given that the research team discussed the issues of power, violence, and sexuality with the respondents, the context of this study was a bit sensitive. Hence, it was ensured that the

Kammi respondents were protected during the fieldwork process and after the researchers had left the field.

Gallmeier (1991) looked at the disengaging process in social research in terms of staying in touch with the research participants and revisiting the site. Similarly, the disengaging process was used in this research as a methodological strategy to ensure the protection of Kammi respondents after the fieldwork was over. The researcher left his contact details with the gatekeepers and male research participants within both villages under study. In addition, the contact details of all the female research assistants were left with the women research participants. Thus it was ensured that the respondents may contact the members of research team in case of any security risk in consequence to their participation in the research study.

After one week of the fieldwork in a village, the research team did the follow up contacts with a few of the research participants, Kammis and Zamindars, in order to get an idea about the security concerns, especially among Kammis. The research team did not find any security problem in the villages. Before coming back to Leeds, the researcher visited both the villages to thank all the research participants, gatekeepers, and villagers for their overwhelming support and welcoming attitude during the fieldwork. The researcher left his contact details, at Leeds, with the respondents and gatekeepers in order to ask any questions about the study in future (Homan, 1991). After three months of the fieldwork, the researcher contacted the gatekeepers, female research assistants, and a few of the research participants in order to know their well being.

4.10. Fieldwork Experiences

4.10.1. Problems and Limitations – Practical and Personal Problems in the Field

Like most of the social researches involving fieldwork, the researcher could not go according to the fieldwork schedule and stumbled upon a range of practical and personal problems that obstructed the fieldwork activity and delayed it by 2 months (Leslie and storey cited in Scheyvens and Storey, 2003; Pollard, 2009). A few of the main problems that researcher faced during the fieldwork are listed below:

- Due to *summer vacations*, there was a delay in the recruitment process of the female research assistants. It was difficult to contact the potential female research assistants and assemble them at the Department of Sociology in order

to have an initial talk. Afterwards, *limited availability of the female research assistants*, because of their academic commitments, caused some further delay in the fieldwork completion.

- It was intended that the research team will conduct parallel interviews of the men and the women research participants. However, it was not possible in the actual field because of the limited availability of the female research assistants. Besides, the researcher spent a few days in each village for the rapport building with the villagers. During that phase, the researcher got the opportunity to conduct interviews with the men respondents. On the other hand, selection of the women respondents required an additional process of negotiation with the villagers. Hence, *conducting parallel interviews was not possible* and it delayed the fieldwork.
- *Political and Security Issues* - While the female research assistants were going to start conducting interviews in the irrigated zone's village in the span of 3 days, University of the Punjab Lahore was closed for some political and security reasons. The students, including the female research assistants, were asked to vacate the hostels in a day's time. It was quite sudden and rare. The research team did not have any other option but to delay the fieldwork. The fieldwork was rescheduled and it caused a delay for 2 weeks.
- *Falling ill* with viral infection restricted the research activities for a couple of weeks.
- *Ramadan and Eids* - While leaving for the fieldwork, it was scheduled to conduct the interviews during the month of Ramadan. However in the field, the researcher decided against carrying out any fieldwork activity during the Ramadan. Considering the hot weather conditions in the fasting month, it was unethical to conduct 1-2 hours of in-depth interviews with the respondents and the quality of data would have suffered as well. Besides Ramadan, the researcher celebrated the Eids in Pakistan. Visiting the research sites during the Eid leaves was not appropriate in the local context. Hence, the researcher did not conduct any fieldwork activity during the Ramadan and Eid days; around 45 days.
- The researcher encountered another unanticipated episode while applying for the release of 2nd instalment of his PhD scholarship in Pakistan. The official procedures at the administration block, University of the Punjab, Lahore took longer than expected which caused a delay in the fieldwork process.

4.11. Transcribing and Analysing Data

Most of the interviews were recorded on the digital voice recorders in order to ensure the smooth and dynamic development of the interviews and to capture the full details of conversation (Kvale, 1996; Robson, 2002). The researcher recorded the interviews with permission of the respondents. However, a few of the interviews were not recorded on the request of the respondents. The researchers took notes for the interviews that were not recorded, and elaborated those points immediately after conducting an interview. The research team used the research diaries for taking field notes.

After completing the fieldwork, all the in depth interviews were listened in detail in order to get an idea about the basic coding and potential themes to be discussed in analysis (Bailey, 2008). In the second round, the researcher coded, translated (from Punjabi to English), and transcribed the data using the Express Scribe software. Subsequently, the major themes and sub themes were identified by referring to the initial coding. Analysis of the present study comprises of 4 chapters.

Academics argue that transcribing the research data is not a simple clerical task and requires an understanding of the associated issues e.g. pauses and fluency in a layman conversation in an in-depth interview. Moreover, it is recommended that the researcher should remain involved in an imaginary dialogue with the respondents during the process of data analysis (Kvale, 1996) in order to ensure active reflexivity. During the informal periods of participant observation in the villages under study (Whyte, 1984), the research team kept noting their observations on the fieldwork diary. The researcher referred back to the field notes while listening to interviews, transcribing and analysing data, and at the write up stage. It helped the researcher to remain in a dialogue with the data, keeping in mind the local context, and hence broadening his understanding about the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence within a Punjabi village.

Data was analysed on the basis of key themes and sub themes emerged during the process of data collection (Have, 1999). Names of the respondents and their Quom titles were changed, by giving them the alternative names and titles respectively, in the written thesis in order to ensure their anonymity. Similarly, the names of the under study villages in the Districts of Sheikhpura and Chakwal were also changed to prevent the identity of the respondents in connection to their villages (Neuman, 2000; Thomas, 2008).

4.11.1. Translation of the Quotes - A Limitation of the Research

Translation of the quotes from Punjabi to English emerged as a serious limitation. Quite a few times, it was difficult to translate the views of the villagers from Punjabi to English and thus retaining the contextual expressions as well. It was found that the translation may partially distort the social meanings associated with a social reality (Nes et al, 2010).

The researcher observed that speaking a sentence in question mode during the conversation mostly signifies the expressions of anger, power, criticism, or helplessness in the context of a Punjabi village. Similarly, villagers may highlight an issue in a dialogue by expressing it as question. It was difficult to translate such sentences in English, so that the contextual expressions and associated meanings are fully conveyed. For example:

“Zamindars think, what Izzat she may have being a labourer Kammi woman”

In this sentence, a Kammi woman respondent expressed her views about the Zamindar’s perceptions about the Izzat of labourer Kammi women, and the way they question their Izzat. The sentence indicates the expression of helplessness and subjective placement of a Kammi woman in the caste society of a Punjabi village. Being a Punjabi and an insider to the local context, the researcher believes that translating such sentences to understandable English may obscure the vigour and true character of the contextual expressions associated with a sentence (Lakoff, 1980).

At times, literal translation of a quote from Punjabi to understandable English was not possible. For example, *“since caste occupations of Kammis have almost ended, they are dying with hunger.* “Dying with hunger” in the sentence indicates that Kammis are not able to earn their livelihood.

Similarly, a few of the terms/words in Punjabi signifying an important social phenomenon in the local context cannot be translated into English. For example, “Ghairat” translated as honour does not convey the contextual expressions and meanings associated with the word. Hence, such terms used in the quotations may require further explanation. The researcher has tried to translate from Punjabi to understandable English in such a way that the contextual expressions are not full distorted, though it was not always possible (Temple, 2008).

4.12. Conclusion

The chapter has discussed the methodological decisions undertaken and the methods of data collection. This research project is designed within the qualitative research traditions, employing the interpretive epistemological standpoint and followed the inductive approach for generating theory from the data. The sampling strategy is guided by the theoretical and analytical considerations, and thus implies the theoretical sampling technique. The chapter has detailed the research design that includes the case study comparative research and the selection of research site in two different agricultural contexts. While discussing the strategy followed for entering the field and conducting fieldwork, the chapter looked at the issues of access, negotiation, rapport building, and disclosure together with the use of gatekeeping. Furthermore, the reasons of choosing in-depth semi structured interviews as a mode of data collection are discussed in comparison with other comparable techniques of data collection in qualitative research. The recruitment process of the female research assistants and proceedings of three day training workshop with them are also detailed.

The chapter has emphasized that the researcher should remain involved in critical self-scrutiny and epistemological reflexivity throughout the research process. It is then explained how the researcher negotiated the power differentials of gender and caste with the research participants. The ethical considerations associated with the present study are also detailed. Furthermore, the chapter discussed the practical and personal problem faced by the researcher in the field and how some unanticipated issues delayed the fieldwork by a couple of months. Towards the end, it is explained how the data was coded, translated, transcribed and analysed on the basis of different themes and sub-themes emerged during the process of fieldwork.

Chapter Five

The System of Social Stratification in Contemporary Punjabi Villages - The Dynamics of Caste System and its Changing Patterns

5.1. Introduction

This chapter discusses the dynamics of the caste system in contemporary Punjabi villages by focussing on the changing patterns of social interaction among Zamindars and Kammiss, and its effects on the village life across both the villages under study located in different agricultural contexts. The major themes analysed are caste as an endogamous system, changing caste occupations, Seyp system as an institution in decline, land ownership and cultivation as a source of livelihood, and the concept of Biradari in contemporary Punjabi villages. The chapter begins by examining how the caste endogamy reproduces Kammiss and Zamindars as two mutually exclusive social groups. The chapter then discusses the changing patterns of caste occupations, reasons behind these changes, and its different impacts on the village life across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. While the caste occupations are in decline, it is highlighted that the villagers are always recognized in the village setting through their parentage caste occupations. The Seyp system is discussed as another institution in decline and the situation of Seyp in both villages is analysed, in turn. It is explained how the dynamics of labour relations among Zamindars and Kammiss are changing as a result of the decline in caste occupations and Seyp system. Furthermore, the chapter looks at the changing patterns of land ownership and adoption of cultivation as a source of livelihood across Kammiss and Zamindars. Finally, the concept of Biradari is discussed as another divide between Zamindars and Kammiss.

5.2. Caste as an Endogamous System

5.2.1. Endogamy – A Clear Divide between Kammiss and Zamindars

Endogamy is one of those essential practices that reproduce Zamindars and Kammiss as two mutually exclusive social groups. Inter-marriages between Zamindars and Kammiss are normatively discouraged in the contemporary Punjabi villages. However, the rules of endogamy differ across Zamindar and Kammi Quoms.

Punjabis trace their ancestral heritage to pre Islam Jats and Rajputs, and most of the Punjabi villages are owned by either Rajputs or Jats. Some of the other Quoms came later to the Punjab, and trace their heritage to Arabia, Persia, Baluchistan, Afghanistan,

and Kashmir. These Quoms own some villages in the central and north Punjab. Alongside Rajputs and Jats, these Quoms e.g. Gujjars, Awans are given the status of Zamindars and constitute an occupational category that traditionally emphasize agriculture related occupations. They all are now considered as the traditional cultivators Quoms i.e. Zamindars in Punjab and inter marry (Blood, 1994; Nadvi & Robinson, 2004).

However, Rajputs in the arid zone's village and Jats in the irrigated zone's village highlighted that they prefer to marry within their Quoms i.e. Rajputs within Rajputs or Jats within Jats. Otherwise, they would opt for some other Zamindar Quom e.g. Rajputs with Jats or vice versa. It was found that the Rajputs in the arid zone's village and Jats in the irrigated zone's village hesitate to marry within Arains, Kashmiris, and few other Quoms that came into prominence later and are considered as lower, by Rajputs and Jats, on the hierarchy of Zamindar Quoms. However, such marriages are on the increase over time. The older respondents, in particular, were against marrying outside their Quoms. For example, Mushtaq (62, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) was of the view that:

Nowadays, young men do not take care that they should keep their lineage pure, by not marrying within other Quoms. As a result, there is a lot of mixture of different Quoms in villages. Jats are marrying even within Arains (laughter); in our times, Jats used to abstain from doing it since it was considered against caste pride. It does not matter nowadays, and I can talk about many such marriages in our village or nearby villages.

This suggests that the social acceptance for inter Quom marriages among Zamindars is increasing. While such marriages are on the increase, villagers may criticize the families marrying within Quoms considered lower on the hierarchy of Zamindars. Talking about one such marriage that recently took place in their village, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) said:

Villagers gossip that the Rajput family have given their daughter in Arains, a lower Quom. No one is considering that groom's family is highly educated and better off; they only talk about their Quom.

While Zamindar Quoms intermarry, all of the respondents suggested that marriages between Kammi Quoms and Zamindar Quoms are not acceptable in villages.

The above discussion shows that the criterion of endogamy among Zamindars is quite flexible and they may marry within other landowning Quoms. Conversely, the rules of endogamy among Kammiss were strict and they do not marry outside their occupational Quoms. Lyon (2004) described that marrying within one's own occupational Quom is not an absolute rule of endogamy among Kammiss and they may marry within other

Kammi Quoms e.g. barbers within cobblers. On the contrary, all of the Kammi respondents in the present research stressed that they marry only in their occupational Quoms by parentage e.g. barbers within barbers, or carpenters within carpenters. Rejecting the idea of marrying outside their occupational group, a barber Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said:

We prefer to marry within our relatives, with children of our brothers and sisters. If we do not have a match in close relatives, we go for the ones who are also barbers or we do not marry. We would not accept a proposal even from Zamindars because we marry only within our occupational group.

The villagers considered it a matter of honour to remain attached to their caste based parentage identity and Biradari memberships, especially while living in the forefather's village. Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) highlighted that Kammis maintain the exclusive identity of their forefathers in village by not marrying outside their occupational group by parentage. Similarly, Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) described that:

We consider it against our caste pride to marry outside our occupational group. If Zamindars do not marry with Kammis, we Kammis are even stricter; we abstain from marrying not only in other Kammi Quoms but also in Zamindars. There is no question of being higher or lower in case of marriages, it is the issue of honour and pride in one's Quom and parentage.

Riaz emphasized that their lineage is purer than Zamindars who may get marry out of their Quoms e.g. a Gujjar boy with a Jat girl.

Conversely, a few of the young Kammi respondents, (e.g. Fahad, 28, arid zone), suggested that they would marry a girl from another Kammi Quom considering the financial position of her family, or even a Zamindar girl, since everyone looks for better and higher. However, they were critical of allowing their own girls to marry outside their occupational Quoms, and considered it against their caste pride. It suggests that Punjabis associate honour with the women in family/Biradari, and these notions of honour play a role in defining the rules of caste endogamy, especially among Kammis.

The researcher identified some factors strengthening the caste endogamy across Kammis and Zamindars. The majority of respondents suggested that they prefer to marry within those equal to their social status and caste was seen as the primary factor determining one's social status in the village setting. After that, the villagers may give consideration to the ownership of economic assets of other family, and educational/professional accomplishments of the men/women in the process of spouse selection. Zamindar respondents highlighted the parentage occupational identities of

Kammis and, as a result, their lower standing on the status hierarchy as the major reason of caste endogamy between Kammis and Zamindars. Lifelong stigma of being Kammis always keeps Kammis inferior by identity, and hence status, in the village setting. (Zahida, 63, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) discussed it as follows:

Marrying within Kammis will bring shame upon our family name. People will gossip about us that “they have established kinship relations with Kammis, whose forefathers used to polish the shoes of their forefathers, who used to sit in their feet, and who used to get grains from their grain pots”.

It is a commonly held belief among Zamindars in the Punjabi villages that inferiority becomes part of Kammi’s blood and habits, even if they leave their caste occupations. Kandeel (21, Zamindar woman, arid zone) repeatedly mentioned that even if they acquire education or attain professional accomplishments, Kammis would always reflect their inferiority when in a relationship. Hence, it is not appropriate for Zamindars to marry within Kammis.

Correspondingly, the researcher was interested to know the views of Kammi respondents about the inter Quom marriages between Zamindars and Kammis. The researcher asked it from both categories of Kammis i.e. who had left low graded tasks and those still working as service providers. Interestingly, the responses of both categories were similar and they considered that marriages between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms are not encouraged because of their status difference on the caste hierarchy, and thus the social standing. Kaneez (46, Kammi woman, arid zone), a housemaid in Zamindar’s houses, said:

Better to remain within your own ones. If you make friendships with camels then you need to higher the doors of your entrance and there emerge complexities. We do not marry within Zamindars because they are higher and we are lower.

Educational and professional accomplishments or financial well being of the caste members do not affect the structure of caste endogamy, in terms of inter-marriages between Zamindars and Kammis. Even if a Kammi girl or boy is highly educated, Zamindars do not opt to marry with them. When asked about the option of choosing an educated Kammi girl as her daughter in law, Kaoser (50, Zamindar woman, arid zone), mother of 3 sons, replied:

Even if a Kammi girl becomes a doctor or an engineer or her family is well off, Rajputs will never ask for the hand of that girl in marriage with their sons. We may go for an uneducated and a poor girl within our Quom but never an educated or a rich Kammi girl.

Kalsoom (35, Zamindar woman, arid zone) narrated how a Kammi girl of their village having a law degree was given in marriage in a distant village to a boy having high school education, only for the reason that he belonged to her occupational caste i.e. cobblers. Similarly, Asif (28, Kammi man, irrigated zone), an educated Kammi boy having a governmental job, stressed that Zamindars would never accept Kammis in kinship relation through marriages, even if a Kammi family is wealthy, and they do not work as service providers anymore.

Furthermore, the respondents suggested that the emphasis on communal/group life reinforces the caste endogamy in villages. Even if a member of Zamindar Biradari wishes to marry within Kammis, or vice versa, the social pressure from the family and other villagers would not let it happen. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said that:

A Zamindar family will not marry in Kammis for the reason that what would the people in Biradari and village say about it and how they would face them. It becomes a gossip and brings shame.

Similarly, Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) mentioned that:

If someone wants to do it, our own brothers and sisters, Biradari and other villagers will not let it happen. In villages people cannot take such decisions on their own, without the consultation and support of brothers and sisters.

This reflects how the social pressure compels villagers to conform to the caste endogamy. Maintaining caste pride in the village setting can be seen as central to Punjabi's identity. Zamindars do not marry in Kammis since society disapproves it. Similarly, Kammis considered it a source of pride to maintain the exclusive identity of their parentage by not marrying outside their occupational groups.

In Punjabi villages, marriage is considered as a ritual that ties two families, and not two individuals. Zamindars stressed that they would not like to establish kinship relations with Kammis through marriage, and thus interact with them as equals and relatives in the village setting.

If we marry within Kammis, they will be visiting our houses, and we will be required to visit their houses like relatives and equals, it is not respectable among Rajputs (Raheel, 44, Zamindar man, arid zone).

In conclusion caste endogamy persists as a clear divide between Kammis and Zamindars in the contemporary Punjabi villages; they do not inter-marry. However, the rules of caste endogamy differ across Kammis and Zamindars. While different landowning Quoms inter-marry, Kammi Quoms get marry only within their

occupational groups by parentage. Caste remains the primary criterion in the process of spouse selection, regarding endogamy between Kammis and Zamindars. Educational and professional achievements and financial well being of the caste members do not affect the structure of caste endogamy. The emphasis on group living strengthens the caste endogamy in Punjabi villages.

5.2.2. Elopement and Marriage - the Consequences

While the inter Quom marriages among Kammis and Zamindars are socially discouraged, a few incidents of elopement and marriages among Kammis and Zamindars were found. However, such marriages do not gain social approval. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Zamindar men generally abstain from taking such step since:

Zamindar Biradaris do not accept such marriages, and nor do the children as a result of that marriage would get an acceptance and respect in that Zamindar Biradari.

Ulfat explained how at times Zamindar boys fall in love with a Kammi girl for her beauty, elope with her, and marry outside the village. Similarly a Zamindar girl may elope with a Kammi boy. However, the consequences of a Zamindar boy eloping with a Kammi girl were suggested to be totally different than a Zamindar girl eloping with a Kammi boy. If a Kammi girl elopes with a Zamindar boy, the majority of the respondents thought that, in spite of the feelings of being dishonoured, Kammis will be helpless to react against Zamindars who are dominant in the village context. While a few of the young Kammis emphasized that they would commit honour killing in such cases, it seems unlikely. Besides, there was no incident of revenge killing against Zamindars committed by Kammis in the villages under study or surrounding villages. Conversely, the respondents believed that a Zamindar girl and a Kammi boy will elope and marry at the cost of their life:

There are life threats for both of them. For this reason, it rarely happens that they elope and marry. There can be illegal sexual relations between a Zamindar woman and a Kammi man but elopement and marrying is rare because it is dangerous for them (Falaksher, 35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Moreover, the family of a Kammi boy, who elopes with a Zamindar girl, is generally forced to leave the village; otherwise Zamindars may commit violence against them. Jameela (57, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) talked about a recent incident in their village, when a Zamindar girl eloped with and married a cobbler boy and the cobbler's family was displaced from the village.

The respondents discussed how, on adopting the taboo ways of getting married, Zamindars may kill their women. Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) suggested that if Zamindars do not kill such rebellious girls, they are considered as dishonourable and everyone in the village points at them. Hence, they kill them in order to protect their honour. It reflects how the social norms act as a social pressure and force the members to abide by the cultural constructs of a society.

At times, a couple elopes and settles away from the village. They may not show up for a long time, or life time, owing to the risks of being killed. Akmal (33, Zamindar man, arid zone) narrated how, a few years ago, a boy from Mussali Biradari eloped with a Rajput girl. All of the Zamindar Biradaris of the village united and burnt the houses of Mussalis and forced them to leave the village. The couple settled in the city. However, Zamindars announced that they would kill the boy, the day he enters the village.

A girl brings shame to the family, when she elopes. Punjabis say that the girl has sold the respect of whole family by taking this step. It is especially shameful for the male members of the family since they move more in the public sphere compared with their females. In Pakistani society, men are considered as responsible for protecting the honour of the family that resides in the body and sexuality of their women (Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Irfan, 2008). If a woman elopes, it becomes humiliating for the male members of her family to face others in the village setting. Describing the feelings of his Rajput friend on elopement of his sister with a Mussali, Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) said:

When his sister eloped with and married a Mussali, it was so embarrassing for my friend that he did not step out of his house for a few months; he was not able to face anyone. We (friends) use to take him out of his house and console him, but it took him a long time to get comfortable around in the village setting.

Discussing another dimension of the phenomenon, the respondents explained how Kammis change their caste identity after migrating to cities and thus they become eligible to marry in Zamindar Quoms. However, such marriages mostly terminate, as soon as the actual caste of Kammis is revealed. It reflects the importance of caste endogamy even in the urban settings of Punjab. Few such marriages were reported to have survived but only after a serious dispute among concerned families. Sharing his family experience, Mushtaq (62, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said:

One of my cousins living in Lahore gave his daughter in marriage to a family who were weavers in their preceding generation in a village of Gujranwala district. After two years of

marriage their actual caste was revealed; we asked those Kammis to divorce our woman and be away from our eyes forever.

This section discussed while marriages between Kammis and Zamindars following customary ways of getting married are unlikely in the Punjabi villages, a few incidents of elopement marriages can be found. However, such marriages generally do not gain social approval, and may, at times, result in honour killings. Similarly, if Kammis marry within Zamindar Quoms in urban settings hiding their caste identity, the marriage usually terminates once the actual caste of Kammis is revealed. Caste endogamy existed in both villages under study and was practiced in similar ways.

5.3. Caste Occupations: Changing Patterns

In the contemporary Punjabi villages, the occupational specialities of any Kammi Quom are not limited to the members of that Quom, but rather other Kammis and a few Zamindars have also opted for those occupations (Lyon, 2004). On the other side, educated and financially better off Kammis, through a very few, have left the occupations and other low graded tasks associated with Kammis and are involved in respectable professions. The researcher was interested to know the reasons behind increasing trends among Kammis to leave their parentage occupations or other occupations/tasks associated with Kammi Quoms. The respondents talked about a number of different factors including decline of traditional caste occupations, availability of daily wage labour, and migration towards cities and doing independent works as reasons of gradual changes in the patterns of caste occupations associated with Kammis. In addition, inclinations towards education and acquiring private/public sector jobs, going abroad for earning purposes, involvement in respectable businesses, and emergence of new institutions and consequent changes in consumption behaviours of the villagers were the other factors discussed. However, while a few of the Kammis in villages have left the low graded occupations, the respondents suggested that most of them are still attached either with their parentage occupations or any other tasks associated with Kammis, and daily wage labour.

Kammis are increasingly moving towards cities for employment purposes. A few of them migrate from their villages along with families and settle in a nearby city. A Kammi family opts to migrate to a city if one of their family members goes abroad and starts earning well, gets a high paid job or starts an independent work in city e.g. mechanics workshop. In cities, Kammis usually leave their caste occupations, detach the

lifelong label of being Kammis, and start a respectable life¹². A few of the Kammi families, in both villages under study, migrated towards nearby cities.

Increasing trends among Kammis to move towards cities for employment or settling purposes are changing the dynamics of labour relations in Punjabi villages. Many Zamindar respondents (e.g. Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that it is becoming hard to find Kammi labour since they have started working in or shifting towards cities. Zamindars of the irrigated zone's village were especially concerned about the increasing trends among Kammis to move towards cities because they always require their labour for agricultural activity and at Dera.

Interestingly, while the majority of young Kammis were inclined to leave their caste occupations and migrate towards cities, the older Kammis were not in favour of leaving their forefather's villages and occupations. Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said that:

Wise (older) Kammis do not want to leave their forefather's village and wish to retain contact with the villagers by serving them. But new generation of Kammis desires to migrate towards cities. They do not want to remain dependent on Zamindars, working as labour for them.

At this point, it is important to distinguish between intentional migration and forced migration of Kammis. Mostly, better off Kammi families intentionally migrate towards cities in order to detach the stigma of being Kammis. However, at times, Kammis are displaced as a result of their serious dispute with Zamindars of the village. Some of the examples of forced migration of Kammis are mentioned earlier in the chapter (see section 5.2.2).

Availability of the daily wage labour is turning out to be a major reason for the decline of caste occupations associated with Kammi Quoms. Kammis prefer to work on daily wage labour than working on Seyp with Zamindars of their villages. A few of the young Kammi boys in the irrigated zone's village were working in the nearby industries. Working on daily wages in an industry is considered as a low grade employment opportunity, since it involves intense physical labour and is a low paid job. Only Kammis or a few poor and uneducated Zamindars were involved in daily wage jobs in

¹² In the context of a Punjabi village, the "respectable life" for Kammi groups refers to leaving the occupations that involve any menial work or direct economic dependence on others, and detaching the lifelong label of being Kammis. There is a tendency among Kammis to migrate to cities in order to detach the labels of barber, potter, or cobbler.

industries. However, this job, at least, decreases the direct dependence of Kammis on Zamindars of their village. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained that:

Because of the availability of daily wage labour in cities, Kammis of our village do not want to work on Seyp with Zamindars. As a result, their dependence on Zamindars has been reduced considerably. Moreover, they get wage on daily basis, and for over time; therefore it is in their benefit.

A young Kammi Ashfaq (37, Kammi man, irrigated zone) was working in a nearby industry on daily wages labour and said that:

Being uneducated I cannot get a good job in city. So I work as labour on daily wages in an industry. It is a tough job but better than working as labour for Zamindars because I am at least secure of their abusive conduct.

While a few Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were employed as daily wage labour in the nearby industries, only a couple of the Kammis in the arid zone's village were working as labourers in an industry far from their village. Industrial labour was not available in the nearby areas of the arid zone's village. In addition, some of the Kammis in both villages were employed on daily wages with local builders, Mistris. The above discussion shows how the availability of alternative labour opportunities and trends of migration towards cities among Kammis are changing the dynamics of labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis in Punjabi villages, and as a result the caste occupations of Kammis are in decline.

The dynamics of employment among Kammis, after they leave their caste occupation, differed across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. While such Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were mainly working as daily wage labour in nearby industries, their counterparts in the arid zone's village were involved in different kinds of small businesses, or technical works at the nearby urban centre. In the arid zone's village, a couple of households in the cobbler's Biradari had their own cloth shops and were comparatively better off. Some Kammis were working as electricians, plumbers, or mechanics. Further, a few of them were serving in the Pakistan Army or as school teachers, and a few others were employed in Saudi Arabia. One young man from the cobbler's Biradari was a civil engineer. On the other side, none of the Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were working in any of the armed forces. However, one Kammi was serving as school teacher, one as social welfare officer and a few barbers in the irrigated zone's village were employed in Middle East countries.

Varied dynamics of employment among Kammis across both villages provide a comparison of their socio-economic well being. The majority of Kammis in the irrigated

zone, who left their caste occupations, were working as daily wage labour in the nearby industries - a low paid job. Conversely, Kammiss in the arid zone' village, after leaving their caste occupations, were mainly involved in small businesses, technical works, and governmental jobs.

While a large majority of elder and some of the young Kammiss were working on Seyp with Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village, none of the Kammiss in the arid zone's village were engaged in the Seyp contracts. Besides, the education rate among Kammiss in the arid zone's village was far higher than their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village. The socio-economic position of Kammiss in the arid zone's village was better as compared with the Kammiss in the irrigated zone's village. Involvement of Kammiss in the Seyp contracts in the irrigated zone's village suggest that they were more dependent on Zamindars of their village compared with the Kammiss in the arid zone's village who were no longer involved in the Seyp relation with Zamindars.

In general, Kammiss in the contemporary Punjabi villages are inclined towards education and acquiring respectable jobs. There exists a strong realization among Kammiss that getting education and acquiring jobs can help them to achieve a respectable life. Some of the Zamindars in both villages mentioned that the Kammiss in Punjabi villages are more inclined towards education compared with Zamindars. Asif (28, Kammi man, irrigated zone), an educated Kammi, explained:

Our parents lived their life serving Zamindars as labour for earning their livelihood. They did not pay attention to their education or education of their children; therefore most of the Kammiss are now uneducated. If we were educated, we would have been doing better work and having a respectable life. But Kammiss are realizing with time that education is must in order to get some respect in society.

As discussed earlier in this section, the level of education among Kammiss in the arid zone's village was much higher than the Kammiss in the irrigated zone's village. It is useful to mention that the level of education among Zamindars of the arid zone's village was also higher than the Zamindars of the irrigated zone's village. Statistics show that the literacy among farmers in Sheikhpura district is among lowest and the literacy among farmers in Chakwal district is among highest in Punjab (Ahmad, 2001). Sajid (24, Kammiss man, irrigated zone) told that only 3 Zamindar and 2 Kammi boys are graduates in whole of their village. However, quite a few of the young Kammi boys in the irrigated zone's village were enrolled in colleges, and the Kammi respondents highlighted that the educational standing of Kammiss of their village will be higher in the near future. The level of education among Kammi women in the irrigated zone's

village was even lower. Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) suggested that their parents do not value girl's education and involve them in household affairs after they complete 8/9 grades in school. Rabia (25, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) told that the majority of Kammi girls in their village are uneducated; all those who went to school did not complete their matriculation and left schooling. While Kammis in the irrigated zone's village had started realizing the importance of education, they only meant education among boys. They still were not in favour of educating their girls beyond high school.

Conversely, the level of education among Kammis in the arid zone's village was much higher. Quite a few of them were educated and doing jobs in the private/public sector, especially as school teachers and in the Pakistan Army. As mentioned above, a young man from cobbler's Biradari was a civil engineer. Interestingly, young Kammi women were even more educated and a few of them were employed as school teachers. Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) was very concerned about the education of her daughters, so that they may earn a respectable life:

When my son completed his FA, I asked him to join Army so that I may spend on the education of my daughters. I have struggled in life; I work in other's houses as housemaid but I do not want my daughters to do it. If they are educated, they may live a respectable life by teaching.

The above analysis provides a comparison of the education trends among Kammis across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. Varying levels of education in both villages can be understood in terms of varying sources of livelihood in two different agricultural contexts.

The majority of old Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were earning their livelihood easily by working on *Seyp* with Zamindars and labour opportunities were available in the village setting. Thus, they did not give importance to education in order to acquire jobs in private/public sector, as mentioned by Asif earlier. Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained:

If Chaudharies keep providing food and living to Kammis, they will stay in village working on *Seyp* with them. However, if it becomes difficult for Kammis to earn a livelihood from the village then they would certainly look for other sources of income.

Though the young Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were inclined towards education in order to acquire good jobs, the majority of Kammi households in the village were still earning their livelihood through *Seyp* or doing other labour for

Zamindars. However, as a result of the decline in caste occupations and Seyp system, Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were looking for other sources of livelihood. For example, a few young Kammi men were working as daily wage labour in industries. Sharif (50, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said that:

Caste occupations and other labour opportunities are finishing with time and, as a result, labourer Kammis are unable to earn their livelihood. They are desperately looking for other works now.

It seems that decline in caste occupations and Seyp system as major sources of their livelihood have increased the trends among Kammis of the irrigated zone's village to acquire jobs through education. Especially, young Kammi men aspired to leave low graded tasks associated with Kammis and live a respectable life.

Conversely, a gradual decline in the agricultural activity and thus the end of Seyp system in the arid zone's village around a couple of decades ago resulted in the unavailability of labour opportunities to earn a livelihood inside the village boundaries. The changing labour situation forced Kammis to look for some other professions/works. As a result, Kammis in the arid zone's village were not only involved in different kind of businesses now but a few of them were educated and doing jobs in public/private sector.

In conclusion migration towards cities, availability of daily wage labour, involvement in businesses and technical works, and acquiring jobs in private/public sector are turning out to be the major reasons of Kammis leaving their caste occupations. However, the situation differed across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. More than a few Kammis in the arid zone's village were involved in respectable businesses and jobs after leaving their caste occupations compared with Kammis in the irrigated zone's village, the majority of whom were still earning their livelihood either through the Seyp contracts or low paid industrial labour.

5.3.1. Newly Emerging Institutions and Changing Consumption Patterns –

Decline of Caste Occupation

The occupations associated with different Kammi Quoms have come to an end, modified, or substituted by (merged with) some newly emerged institutions, and thus are in decline over time, except the occupation of barber. Some of the Kammi caste occupations have been transformed into a mechanical work, business, or industry e.g. occupational specialities of weavers, potters, and blacksmiths. Others are merged with

newly emerged institutions e.g. cooking at ceremonial occasions, traditionally a barber's job, is taken over by the tent service business. Similarly, wood related works once done by carpenters are the part of furniture business. In the majority of cases, Zamindars have taken over the modified forms of Kammi's occupations as their professions. Since the occupation of barbers exists in its traditional form, Zamindars consider it demeaning to adopt it as a profession. Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained that:

Occupations once associated with Kammis have turned into skilled work and operate in form of mechanics shops or business at nearby urban centre. A few Zamindars have also opted for these occupations. No one considers these professions demeaning nowadays.

Newly emerged institutions e.g. tailor shops, catering services, furniture businesses, and mechanics workshops generally operate at the nearby urban centres. The villagers refer to the urban centres, if they require the services once provided by Kammis in villages. Hence, the consumption patterns are changing and, consequently, the caste occupations are in decline. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained that:

Nowadays, villagers go to cities or nearby urban centre, if they require wooden or iron material for construction and furniture, or to buy modern steel crockery for their kitchen use. If catering service is required at marriages, they refer to urban centre. Even barbers prefer to work in nearby towns, rather than in village; this way they can earn more money.

Similarly, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) discussed how the dressing trends among young men are changing, in the village context:

When young men go to cities/towns for education, they start wearing jeans and leave traditional Shalwar Qameez. Even if they wear Shalwar Qameez, they would not like to get it stitched from the local tailor in their villages, and prefer to buy it from modern shops in cities.

The above quotations suggest how the emergence of several new institutions and changing consumption patterns are resulting in the decline of caste occupations associated with Kammis like carpenters, potters, barbers, and tailors. The villagers have increasingly started referring to urban centres rather than asking for the services of a Kammi in their village attached with that occupation. As a result, a few of the old fashioned Kammis who desired to remain attached with and continue their caste occupations in traditional ways have started leaving those occupations. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained that:

Villagers do not use mud pots now. Everyone use steel and other modern crockery and buy it from cities. Therefore, potters in villages do not get much work. As a result, they are looking for other jobs and leaving their caste occupation.

Caste occupation of barbers exists in its traditional form but its dynamics have been changed. While the villagers still require barbers for the haircuts and shaving, their job to cook at ceremonial occasions have been taken over by the catering service, run by Zamindars. Nazar (63, barber, arid zone) explained how Zamindars are adopting the modified form of occupations once associated with Kammis:

Nowadays, villagers are doing every kind of work for money, regardless of their Quom identity. We observe respectable Rajputs running catering services. They hire labour, cook food, and provide it to people at marriages and deaths. These jobs were associated with Kammis in recent past but Zamindars are also doing them now and they call it business.

Most of the villagers nowadays refer to the catering service at ceremonial occasions, except a few who still rely on the local barbers or other Kammis for cooking. Akmal (33, Zamindar man, arid zone) said that:

At ceremonial occasions, villagers nowadays go for the catering service, which provide everything: tenting, chairs, and cooked food etc. In past, it was difficult to manage it involving Kammi labour; assigning every Kammi a different task and supervising them. Villagers go for the catering service instead.

Similarly, the services of barbers used for match making (Eglar, 1960) have been replaced by the modern ways of sending proposals which predominantly involve the concerned families, and not the barbers. Nazar (63, barber, arid zone) told that the barbers are not involved in match making practice anymore:

In past, barbers use to help villagers in finding the suitable spouses for their children. They use to discuss marriageable young men and women in different houses of the village and nearby villages with an intention of matchmaking. Caste occupation of barbers has been confined to haircuts now.

In the contemporary Punjabi villages, members of different Kammi Quoms have learned the barbering skills since occupations associated with their Quoms have declined. Hence, barbering is not solely limited to the barbers by parentage and turning out to be more of an occupation than a caste. Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) shared his observation as follows:

It is written outside the barber shops, or at their rate list, that being barber is a skill, not a caste.

In conclusion the modernization of the economy has affected the caste occupations associated with Kammi Quoms in the Punjabi villages. Emergence of several new institutions in the village life and resulting changes in the consumption patterns among villagers are turning out to be the major reasons of the decline in traditional caste occupations. Only the barber's occupation exists in its traditional form, but several jobs

associated with barbers have also been taken over by the modern institutions e.g. catering services.

5.3.2. Parentage Occupation – A Lifelong Identification of Kammi Biradaris

Lyon (2004) suggested that the Kammi Quoms, and their identity, in the contemporary Punjabi villages should be understood in terms of their parentage, and not their present occupations. Hence, caste cannot be equated with occupations anymore. A Kammi involved in an occupation may claim to have some other parentage occupation and thus caste group e.g. a cobbler may be working as barber but he is always identified as a cobbler. On the other side, Eglar studied the caste system of the 1960s in a Punjabi village, when an overwhelming majority of Kammis were earning their livelihood through their parentage occupations. Hence, Eglar analysed the Kammi Quoms, and their identity, in terms of their caste based occupational specialities. In his study of a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) did not address why Kammis are increasingly leaving their parentage occupations, and therefore, contrary to Eglar's (1960) claim, Quom identity among Kammis cannot be equated with occupations anymore.

In this study, the researcher was interested to know why Kammis are leaving their caste works and opting for the occupations associated with other Kammi Quoms. The respondents talked about a number of different factors in this regard.

Educated and better off Kammi Biradaris in both villages had left their caste occupations and were involved in the respectable businesses. Their Biradari members had gone abroad for earning purposes or acquired some private/public sector jobs. As a result, their caste occupations were taken over by several other Kammis who were not able to earn livelihood through their parentage occupations. Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) described:

When most of the members of our (barber) caste migrated to foreign countries and villagers were not getting the barbers for haircut and shave etc, weavers and potters of our village replaced us. They have learned the barbering skills and have opened their barber shops.

In the past, rural life was interdependent and run through the traditional caste occupations. Kammis were earning their livelihood predominantly through their parentage caste occupations. However, all of the Kammi Quoms i.e. barber, cobbler, weaver, Mussali, blacksmith, potter, carpenter, tailor, and builder may not be residing in every Punjabi village. Thus, a few of the Kammis, in addition to their parentage occupations, learned the skills of other Kammi Quoms not available in their village.

Some of them left their parentage occupations afterwards and continued with the occupations they opted later. Bano (38, Kammi woman/ cobbler, arid zone) explained:

I and my husband learned the tailoring skills around 20 years ago, since a tailor was not available in our village. We are cobblers by Quom but we were also working as tailors for the villagers. Now we do not work as cobblers anymore but we are continuing our tailoring job because it gives us more money and respect as compared to our parentage occupation of being cobbler.

Some of the Kammi Quoms e.g. cobblers and Mussalis (work as drum beaters and labourers usually) were discriminated against and mocked in the village life because of the tasks linked with their caste occupations (Lyon, 2004). As a result, a few of the cobblers and Mussalis opted for the occupations associated with other Kammi Quoms e.g. tailoring in order to detach the stigma of those jobs e.g. shoes repairing (cobblers) and drum beating at marriages (Mussalis). Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone), a Mussali by parentage, told that:

Most of the Mussalis in our village have left drum beating at marriages and have started working as plumbers, barbers, or cooks at the catering services owned by Zamindars. We do not want to be called as Mussalis now.

Nevertheless, Kammis, as individuals and Biradari, are always identified and differentiated on the basis of their parentage caste occupations, and not the occupations they adopt later. Even the educated and better off members of Kammi Quoms live with a lifelong stigma of being Kammis. Kaoser (50, Zamindar women, arid zone) described it as following:

Even if they (Kammis) get education, achieve a higher post, become wealthy, or acquire a lot of land, villagers will still say about them that “they are carpenters, they are barbers, or they are Mussalis”. Education, post, or wealth cannot change caste.

Similarly, Tahir (37, Kammi man, arid zone) explained how their parentage caste occupations serve as a lifelong identification of Kammis:

I have not seen my father or uncles doing the work of cobblers. My grandfather did it for some time; he used to harvest later in his life. Now my brother has a cloth shop, and I work as a carpenter. But we are still identified as cobblers because our forefathers, many years back, were associated with this occupation.

However, Zamindar respondents in both villages stressed that the Kammis have started expressing their dissent on being addressed as Kammis or by the name of their caste occupation e.g. barber or cobbler. Narrating a recent incident, Kalsoom (35, Zamindar woman, arid zone) explained how a cobbler woman of their village stopped working as housemaid in a Zamindar house since Zamindar’s wife called her cobbler in an argument with her.

Some of the Kammi Quoms in Punjabi villages have replaced their occupational labels with the label of a Zamindar Quom. For example, cobblers in the arid zone's village called themselves Malik, and barbers in the irrigated zone's village called themselves Raja. Ahsen (45, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggested that Kammis generally replace their occupational labels with the label of a Zamindar Quom not inhabiting in their village or nearby villages, hence differentiating it from Zamindars of that village/ area. Zamindars do not like Kammis of their village to be recognized with the same label, and would react harshly against Kammis if they do so. Cobblers in the arid zone's village called themselves Malik because Zamindar Malik Quom was not living in that village or nearby villages. Similarly, barbers in the irrigated zone's village called themselves Raja because that area was inhabited by Jats; Rajputs, who are called Raja, were not residing in that village.

When a better off weaver family in the arid zone's village started labelling themselves as Raja, it resulted in a serious dispute among Zamindar Rajputs of the village and weavers, who were ultimately forced to migrate from the village. Ahsen (45, Zamindar man, arid zone) was involved in the argument with weavers and said:

If Kammis of our village start labelling themselves as Rajputs, it means there is no difference between Rajputs and cobblers or weavers. Obviously Rajputs will be annoyed and react against Kammis, if they start calling themselves Rajputs.

It was interesting that even though Kammis did not want to be called as Kammis or through their occupational labels, an overwhelming majority of them expressed a strong attachment with their parentage. They were concerned about maintaining the exclusive identity of their parentage occupational group by not marrying within other Kammi or Zamindar Quoms, especially while residing in the village of their forefathers. It was commonly heard during the interview process that:

Pride is in keeping yourself attached to your forefathers, in spite of acquiring wealth, education or a high post (Aamir, 33, Kammi man, arid zone).

In conclusion quite a few Kammis have left their parentage occupations and opted for the occupations associated with other Kammi Quoms. However, Kammis are always identified and distinguished from other Kammi Biradaris in the village setting on the basis of their parentage occupations. Kammis have started expressing dissent on being called as Kammis, and a few of them have replaced their occupational labels with the label of any Zamindar Quom.

5.3.3. Zamindars and Zamindari as an Occupation – Changing Patterns

The respondents mentioned that there is an increasing trend among Zamindars in the Punjabi villages to shift their focus merely from Zamindari to public/private sector jobs and different businesses. However, the situation of Zamindari as a major source of livelihood, and its changing patterns, differed considerably across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages.

An overwhelming majority of Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village was still attached with Zamindari since they were earning their livelihood predominantly through Zamindari. However, all of the elder Zamindar respondents in the irrigated zone's village aspired for their children to get an education and opt for other professions. Educated Zamindar young men, though a very few, were not involved in Zamindari at all and doing jobs in private/public sector e.g. the Punjab Police and non-governmental organizations (NGO's). Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said that:

Nowadays only those stay in village and do Zamindari who are not educated and sitting useless. Sons of Chaudhary Manzoor, who are educated, work in city at good posts. Their only brother who is un-educated does Zamindari in village. Most of the young Zamindar men are now getting education and they desire to get jobs rather than doing Zamindari.

There was an increasing emphasis on the education of children among Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village. In a few cases, only one male family member was living in the village doing Zamindari and rest of the family had migrated to Sheikhpura city for the better education of their children. The villagers in the irrigated zone's village attached status with the education and professions achieved through an education. Nearly all respondents, Zamindars and Kammiss, quoted the example of Chaudhary Manzoor's sons, who were educated and doing respectable jobs in city, and aspired for their children to follow them.

However, Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village were not in favour of quitting Zamindari completely, even if some of their family members acquire a job or get involved in a business. Agriculture remains their primary source of livelihood, and the respondents highlighted that the agricultural production is on the rise with less human effort due to technological advancements. Hence, one or few of male family members e.g. brother, cousin or father, were taking care of the cultivation and farming activities in the village.



Photo 5.1 Land in the irrigated zone's village is fertile and the majority of villagers depend on agriculture for their livelihood (Source: author's photo)

While the young Zamindar women in the irrigated zone's village were inclined towards education and a couple of them had a bachelor's degree, Zamindar families were not in favour of their women doing any paid jobs. In addition, involvement of the women in the agricultural activity is also reducing with time. On asking about the educational status of Zamindar women and their contribution in the agricultural activity, Rabia (24, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) said:

Young Zamindar women are getting education now but none of the educated Zamindar woman in our village has opted for a job; it is yet not considered respectable among Zamindar families. Some elder Zamindar women contribute in Zamindari but involvement of women in Zamindari is also decreasing.

Conversely, more than a few Zamindar families in the arid zone's village left Zamindari around a couple of decades ago. Zamindar households still attached with Zamindari cultivate on a limited scale and depend on agriculture as a secondary source of their livelihood. It was becoming increasingly difficult for the people in the arid zone's village to earn a livelihood through the arid nature of agriculture. District Chawkal is located at the centre of the arid zone in Punjab province where agricultural activity heavily depends on rain. In recent years, inadequate rain and then the government's inability to provide agricultural water is seen as one of the major reasons for poverty in the district. Agriculture is almost finished in the arid district of Chakwal, since it was

becoming extremely difficult for the Zamindars to cultivate due to drought and shortage of rain (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained that:

Some years back, agriculture almost ended in our village and many Zamindar households gave their land to Kammiss on contract. Others used to cultivate at a limited level.



Photo 5.2 shows the harvesting of wheat crop in the arid zone's village. Land is not very fertile and the villagers cultivate on a limited scale (Source: author's photo)

As a result of this decline in agricultural activity as a source of livelihood, people in the arid zone's village started looking for other professions, especially the professions achieved through an education. District Chakwal is known for its martial traditions and many of the villagers are employed in the Armed forces. In addition, quite a few of the Zamindar men in the arid zone's village were working in foreign countries, especially Saudi Arabia. The trends in investments also changed owing to the decline in agriculture. Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) mentioned that the villagers have started investing more on buying property in cities, establishing businesses e.g. poultry farms and less on agriculture.

However, Zamindar respondents in the arid zone's village highlighted the revival of agriculture in their area as a result of the construction of small dam and technological advancements in agriculture. Quite a few Zamindar families had resumed the cultivation, since agricultural production has increased due to the availability of water.

Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) mentioned that Zamindars of their village are now adopting agriculture as a supplementary source of their livelihood. Nevertheless, agriculture remains the secondary source of livelihood in the arid zone's village and Zamindars were mainly dependent on jobs and businesses.



Photo 5.3 As a result of the construction of small dam near their village, quite a few villagers in the arid zone's village have resumed agricultural activity (Source: author's photo)

The villagers in the arid zone's village, both men and women, were more educated compared with their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village. Many Zamindar women were working as school teachers and contributing in the household economy. However, none of the Zamindar women was involved in Zamindari in the arid zone's village.

Like Kammis, Zamindars in the Punjabi villages are also shifting their focus from their caste occupation i.e. cultivation to other professions. Zamindari in the arid zone's village declined a couple of decades ago since it became difficult for Zamindars to earn a livelihood through the arid agriculture due to shortage of water and infertile land. Hence, the majority of them were involved in private/public sector jobs and businesses along with limited agriculture as secondary source of income. Conversely, agriculture remains the primary source of income for Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village. However, with increasing trends of education, they are also inclined towards other professions especially the jobs in private/public sector.

5.4. The Seyp System: An Institution in Decline

The Seyp system in Punjabi villages principally revolves around the occupational specialties of different caste groups and agricultural activity (Ahmad, 1977; Chaudhary, 1999; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004). Eglar (1960) looked at the Seyp system as a work contract between different caste groups, Zamindars and Kammiss, based on their occupational expertise. For example, a barber was responsible for the haircuts of members of a Zamindar household and was paid on yearly basis or on harvesting seasons in grains or crops, according to an agreed upon share. In addition to their occupational expertise, Kammiss used to work as labour for Zamindars in the Seyp contract. It was not merely an economic relation but moral and social obligations were also felt by the Seypis. The Seyp contract, once created between two families, usually endured across generations. However, with an alteration in and decline of the caste occupations of Kammiss and changing nature of the agricultural activity due to technological advancements, the Seyp system has been affected considerably and is coming towards an end with time. Similarly, Lyon (2004) and Chaudhary (1999) highlighted how the availability of industrial labour and governmental jobs has undermined the Seyp system in Punjab. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained the decline of Seyp system in Punjabi villages as following:

Village life is changing dramatically. Kammiss do not get earning opportunities through their occupational expertise, as their caste occupations have almost ended. They do not want to enter in Seyp with Zamindars just to provide labour and are looking for other jobs. Zamindars have also started going towards cities to get the services once provided by Kammiss in villages as their caste expertise. As a result, Seyp system is in decline in Punjabi villages.

Ulfat added that the barbers have established their barber shops in nearby towns. They do not like to work on Seyp and thus coming to Zamindar's houses for the haircuts. Instead, villagers go at their barbershops for the haircuts and pay in currency. Since the villagers have started using modern steel crockery, potters do not get that much work and most of them have left their caste works. Similarly, the villagers nowadays refer to cities in order to get wooden material for the construction and furniture and, as a result, the occupational specialties of carpenters are in decline.

The Seyp system is seen as the major institution that used to bind Zamindars and Kammiss in labour relations and determine the dynamics of their asymmetrical interactions in the village setting. After the decline in Seyp system, relationship patterns

among Zamindars and Kammis are changing. Tahir (37, Kammi man, arid zone) considered that:

Kammis were Kammis because of the Seyp system. Due to decline in Seyp, direct dependence of Kammis on Zamindars has reduced. Kammis are leaving their caste occupations and Seyp contracts, and opting for other occupations in order to achieve respectable life.

Academics (Hooper and Hamid, 2003; Lyon, 2004) used Jajmani as another name for the Seyp. Both the terms, Jajmani and Seyp, have been used interchangeably in the literature on caste in Pakistan. Conversely, none of the respondents in the present research used the term Jajmani for Seyp; most of them did not even know the term Jajmani.

5.4.1. Seyp System in Irrigated and Arid Zone's Villages

The Seyp system existed in the irrigated zone's village, though it was not practiced that firmly, as in the past. All of the respondents in the irrigated zone mentioned that the Seyp system is in decline in their village. However, the opinions of older and younger Kammis about the Seyp, as an institution and its effectiveness, differed considerably. The elder Kammis in the irrigated zone's village working on Seyp with Zamindars (e.g. Sharif, 56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) supported the Seyp system, considering its benefits for both Zamindars and Kammis. Conversely, the majority of young Kammis were not in favour of the Seyp system and nor did they like to work on Seyp with Zamindars. While a few of the uneducated and poor young Kammis were engaged in the Seyp contracts with Zamindars, others preferred to work on daily wages in nearby industry. The young Kammis were of the view that the Seyp system would come to an end after their parent's generation.

None from our generation in my family is working on Seyp with Zamindars. Some young Kammi men from other families who are uneducated or poor work on Seyp. Though my father is still in Seyp with Zamindars, it may come to an end after our parent's generation (Sajid, 24, Kammi man, irrigated zone).

Furthermore, the young Kammis considered that the village life runs more efficiently after the decline in Seyp system. Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) suggested when Seyp was practiced, villagers used to wait for cobblers, barbers, or carpenters for many days in order get their turn. Kammis were not available on short notice since they were stretched in the works of Zamindars of whole village. After the decline in Seyp system, villagers get those services quickly. For example, in the case of barbers, villagers go to the barbershops, get their haircuts or shave in short time. In return, barbers are paid in

currency on the spot, and they do not wait for six months or a year. Hence, both parties are benefitting from the decline in Seyp system.

The dynamics of Seyp system has been changed over time. As discussed earlier, the caste occupations associated with different Kammi Quoms especially potter, carpenter, blacksmith, weaver, and cobbler have almost ended due to emergence of new institutions, changes in consumption patterns, and technological advancements in agriculture. As a result, when in Seyp with Zamindars, Kammis are now involved only in providing their physical labour to Zamindars, in running the agricultural activity, household affairs, and Dera. They do not perform their caste based occupational specialities in the Seyp relations anymore, except barbers. Hence, the Seyp system in contemporary Punjab is not merely based on the occupational works of different caste groups, like in the past, and predominantly revolves around the provision of labour. A potter (Qurban, 75, Kammi man, irrigated zone), who recently left working on Seyp with Zamindars, explained:

Being Zamindar's Seypi, I was responsible to help them in farming and harvesting, to cut trees and bring wood to their houses for burning purpose, bring anything they require from city, serve guests at their Dera, and provide labour to them at marriages.

The above quotation shows that a potter was only providing manual labour to his Zamindar Seypis. Similarly, Sultan (55, Kammi man irrigated zone) suggested that after the decline of caste occupations, Kammis are working only as servants of Zamindars in the Seyp relations. However, barbers still enter in a Seyp contract on the basis of their occupational expertise, and not only for the provision of labour.

A few of the Kammis working on Seyp with Zamindars mentioned that Zamindars pay them, in return to their services, in cash per month and not in grains after a year. Thus, the rules of payment in Seyp system are also changing. Some of the Zamindars, entirely against the Eglar's (1960) analysis, highlighted that the Seyp is increasingly becoming an economic contract and moral and social responsibilities are not felt by either of the parties as in the past and nor do the Seyp relations endure across generations nowadays.

Seyp has become more of an economic contract with defined rules of work and payments. Seypis are less concerned about their social obligations towards each other and may not be that enthusiastic to extend their support to other party in the time of need e.g. at ceremonial occasions. Moreover, Zamindars and Kammis take no time in breaking the contract nowadays (Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Zamindars require Kammi labour at ceremonial occasions in their houses. In Punjabi villages, different tasks at ceremonial occasions are associated with Kammis e.g. giving

invitation to others in and outside the village, distributing customary meals in the village, serving the guests, and many other general tasks. In the irrigated zone's village, Kammis in Seyp with Zamindars are predominantly responsible to deal with the ceremonial affairs at their Seypis houses. In addition, Zamindars may engage a few more Kammis, not in Seyp with them, as paid labour for an event. Sharif (50, Kammi man, irrigated zone) had the Seyp contract with Zamindars and said:

At the wedding occasion of his son, my Seypi Zamindar assigned me different tasks. For example, I was responsible for Vails, Satta in village, to bring beds from their house to Dera for guests, and rotate Hukka among guests at Dera.

Sharif highlighted that the Seypis care for each other in the time of need. If there is a ceremonial occasion at a Kammi's house, his Seypi Zamindars help him financially. Similarly, Kammis are expected to take care of Zamindar's status and respect by serving their guests wholeheartedly on the ceremonial occasions at their Dera or house.

In addition to Kammi men, Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were also working as labour for their Seypis on agricultural land, at Dera, and in houses as housemaids. A few other Kammi women, not in Seyp with Zamindars, also work as paid labour for Zamindar. It should be useful to mention at this point that more than a few Kammi households in the irrigated zone's village had the Seyp contract with Zamindars. A few others, not in Seyp, also provide their services as paid labour e.g. at the ceremonial occasions.

Traditionally, the Seyp contract exists between Kammis as well. However, as a result of the decline in caste occupations, the Seyp between Kammis is also coming to an end. In an odd case, a Zamindar was working on Seyp with another Zamindar household and was responsible to take care of the agricultural activities at their land and in return was paid in seasonal crops and grains.

On the contrary, the Seyp system has come to an end in the arid zone's village and Zamindars hire the paid Kammi labour for any particular occasion, and pay them in cash. When asked about Seyp, all of the respondents in the arid zone's village straightforwardly replied that there is no existence of the Seyp system in their village anymore. As discussed previously in the chapter, the majority of Zamindars in the arid zone's village left cultivation at extensive level a couple of decades ago and started depending on other sources of livelihood e.g. business and private/public sector jobs. As a result, it was not possible for Zamindars to continue the Seyp relations with Kammis

of their village and pay them in grains or agricultural produces in return to their services.

Few Zamindar households in our village remained involved in agriculture, others left agriculture around 15/20 years ago or used to grow crops at a very limited level i.e. for the use of their own family for one year. Thus people did not have grains to give in Seyp and, as a result, it ended (Ahsen, 45, Zamindar man, arid zone).

Though quite a few Zamindar families in the arid zone's village have resumed cultivation because of the construction of small dam near their village and technological advancements in agriculture, they hire only paid Kammi labour. They do not enter in the Seyp relations with Kammis anymore. While explaining the revival of agricultural activity in their village, Ahsen (45, Zamindar man, arid zone) said:

Secretary Biradari (a Zamindar Biradari) hired Karim cobbler to work on their land near dam where they have started cultivating vegetables and wheat. They pay Karim 7000 rupees per month for his labour.

The majority of respondents, both Zamindars and Kammis, in the arid zone's village considered that the Seyp system is not workable in modern times since there is an increased need of currency in everyday life because of the rapidly changing consumption patterns in villages. It is difficult for the Kammis to make a living if they are paid for their labour at the end of a year. Akmal (33, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained that:

In past, use of currency in everyday life was lesser than today, but now it is not possible to step out of the house without some rupees in pocket. Therefore, it is not practical for Kammis nowadays to make a living, if they get some grains from Zamindars after a year and keep working for them for the whole year.

Correspondingly, Kammi Biradaris in the arid zone's village left their caste occupations, and associated roles, with time and started looking for other works. Though barbers remained attached with their occupational jobs, they also left working on Seyp. Hence, interaction between Zamindars and Kammis in everyday life of the arid zone's villages has nearly ended. Zamindars in the arid zone's village discussed that they require Kammi labour only at the ceremonial occasions or limited harvesting season and pay them in currency. However, Kammi women work as housemaids in Zamindar's houses.

We need Kammi labour at the events of happiness and sorrowfulness, since many tasks at such occasions are associated with Kammis and Zamindars do not like to do those tasks themselves. We pay Kammis right away the event is over (Hameed, 30, Zamindar man, arid zone).

Rizwan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggested that, at the ceremonial occasions, Zamindars consider it against their caste pride to perform the tasks associated with Kammis. For example, Kammis distribute Ch'hakk, a plate of cooked rice, in all houses of the village. Zamindars do not consider it respectable to put cooked rice in a pushcart and distribute a plate of rice in all houses of the village. Similarly, tasks like Sadda (invitations), digging graves, and serving the guests are typically associated with Kammis.

A few of the Zamindar respondents (e.g. Furkan, 28, Zamindar man, arid zone) in the arid zone's village highlighted that the Kammis are increasingly leaving the jobs of serving villagers as labour at the ceremonial occasions and opting for comparatively respectable occupations. Zamindars showed the concern that in near future it may become harder to find Kammi labour at the ceremonial occasions.

Besides their labour at the ceremonial occasions, Kammi women in the arid zone's village work as housemaids in Zamindar's houses and are paid on a monthly basis in rupees. Rizwan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) described that the Kammi women are working in the majority of Zamindar houses of their village:

Kammi woman are working in almost all Zamindar houses of our village, either in the morning or in the evening. They do most of the daily life household tasks for them as housemaids e.g. washing cloths and crockery, cooking.

In conclusion the Seyp system still exists in the irrigated zone's village, though in decline with time. While young Kammis in the irrigated zone's village do not like to work in Seyp with Zamindars, the majority of Kammi households had the Seyp contracts. However, owing to the decline in caste occupations, the dynamics of Seyp system in the irrigated zone's village has changed. In the Seyp contracts, Kammis only provide labour to Zamindars to manage agricultural activity, Dera system, and household affairs; involvement of their occupational expertise has ended. The Seyp between Kammis and Zamindars have turned into more of an economic relation and Seypis do not take care of the moral and social responsibilities towards each other, like in the past. A few other Kammis in the irrigated zone village, not on Seyp, worked as paid labour on an occasional basis e.g. in the harvesting season and were paid in cash. Conversely, the majority of Zamindars in the arid zone's village left cultivation a few years ago because of the lack of water availability and thus the Seyp system ended. While Zamindars in the arid zone's village are resuming the agricultural activity as a result of the construction of small dame near village and technological advancements in

agriculture, they hire paid Kammi labour and do not enter in the Seyp contracts. Similarly, they hire Kammi labour at the ceremonial occasions and for other household works and pay them in cash.

5.4.2. Decline in Seyp System: Advantage and Disadvantages

An overwhelming majority of the respondents in both villages considered that the Zamindars are disadvantaged as a result of the decline in Seyp system, especially Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village. On the other hand, Kammis are advantaged and their direct dependence on Zamindars in everyday life has been reduced considerably. Fazal (50, Kammi man, irrigated zone) was working on Seyp with Zamindars and explained:

In Seyp, Zamindars pay Kammis for a year and get every kind of labour from them. If Kammis stop working on Seyp, Zamindars will be doing all those works themselves, which they consider against their caste pride. Kammis are now getting other sources to earn livelihood, so they would not be affected that much. But decline in Seyp system is affecting Zamindars too much.

Fazal added how certain tasks are assigned to Kammis in the village life and Zamindars do not like to perform those tasks for their caste pride. For example, if Seyp comes to an end, a Chaudhary will bring the fodder for his animals himself. Similarly, Zamindars will serve the guests at their Dera themselves by bringing tea or food from their houses. Doing these tasks affects the prestige of Zamindars. But decline in the Seyp system would not affect Kammis that much. They are labourers and may find labour at some other places e.g. cities. In addition, Kammis are now earning through many other sources, e.g. industrial labour, and Seyp is no more the only source of their livelihood. Similarly a Kammi man in the arid zone's village, where Seyp has ended, suggested while Zamindars are disadvantaged because of the end of Seyp system in their village, Kammis are liberated from a system that use to treat them as slaves:

In Seyp, Kammis were at Zamindar's disposal all the time. They use to get every kind of labour from Kammis for free and mistreat him as well. Zamindars were not doing anything by themselves while having Kammis as their servants (Aamir, 33, Kammi man, arid zone).

The Dera system did not exist in the arid zone's village. On the other hand, Dera plays an important part in organizing the village life in the irrigated zone's village and decline of the Seyp as an institutionalized labour system has drastically affected the running of Zamindar's Dera. While the important roles are associated with Kammis in the Dera system, the respondents mentioned that it is becoming increasingly hard to find Kammi labour. The respondents in the irrigated zone's village explained how the presence of

Kammis at the Dera of Zamindars as servants is seen as a sign of social status for Zamindars. Kammis welcome and entertain the guests at Dera. When the villagers gather at the Dera of Zamindars in the evening, Kammis of the village entertain them with gossip, local songs, and by offering Hukka. Hence, the presence of Kammis at the Dera is essential to run the activities of Dera and is a source of prestige for Zamindars. Because of the decline in Seyp system, it has become hard for Zamindars to find responsible Kammis to run their Dera. As a result, village life is changing, and gatherings and entertainments at the Dera of Zamindars are reducing with time. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained:

Kammis used to run the Dera of Zamindars. They were guards of the Dera and were responsible to receive, serve, and entertain guests at Dera. Their presence was a sign of prestige for Zamindars. But because of the decline in Seyp system, it has become hard for Zamindars to get Kammi labour to manage the activities at Dera and, as a result, crowds at Dera in the evenings and entertainments are reducing.

On the other hand, a few of the Kammis in the irrigated zone's village, working on the Seyp with Zamindars, considered that the decline in Seyp system has disadvantaged Kammis as well. They emphasized that Zamindars facilitate their Seypi Kammis a lot in the time of need e.g. at ceremonial occasions in their houses. Sharif had Seyp contract with Zamindars and highlighted how they supported him when his father died recently and the whole of his Biradari was present at his doorstep. Zamindars provided him with wheat, rice, milk, and meat and assisted him financially. Sharif (50, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said:

Being in Seyp with Zamindars, Kammis do not have any worry in the time of happiness or sorrowfulness at their houses; Zamindars help them. If Seyp comes to an end, Kammis will lose this favour.

A few of the Kammis in the arid zone's village also mentioned that the end of Seyp system in their village has disadvantaged Kammis. Nari (65, Kammi women, arid zone) explained how Zamindars use to help poor Kammis in Seyp. She highlighted, while poor Kammis do not have land to earn living, Seyp has also ended. Similarly, Hooper and Hamid (2003) looked at the Seyp as a system in favour of Kammis and stressed that the social position of Kammis in Punjabi villages has further been weakened as a result of the decline in Seyp System.

This section shows how Zamindars are disadvantaged as a result of the decline in Seyp system. Kammi labour that Zamindars utilize at their agricultural land, Dera, and houses is not easily available, since Kammis are increasingly leaving to engage in Seyp

contracts with Zamindars. Owing to the extensive agricultural activity and existence of Dera system in their village, Zamindars in the irrigated zone are affected more than the Zamindars in the arid zone's village. On the other hand, the majority of Kammiss considered that the decline in the Seyp system has not affected them that much, given that they may earn their livelihood through other sources now. However, a few of the Kammiss suggested that the decline in the Seyp system has disadvantaged Kammiss as well, since Zamindars use to support their Seypi Kammiss considerably in their times of need.

5.4.3. Technological Advancements in Agriculture and its Impact on Seyp System

Technological advancements in agriculture have played a significant part in the decline of the Seyp system. Traditional caste occupations of blacksmiths and carpenters, who used to manufacture and repair agricultural tools, have nearly ended as a result of the latest agricultural technology. Very few traditional agricultural tools made by carpenters and blacksmiths are used in agriculture activity nowadays e.g. tools used to cut the fodder for animals. These tools are available at the nearby urban centres as well. As a result, the majority of carpenters and blacksmiths in Punjabi villages have either left their caste occupations or started their work at the nearby urban centres as mechanics, and do not work for Zamindars on Seyp. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained that:

Nowadays Zamindars have tractors for agricultural activities on their land and do not use ploughs made by carpenters. Thus, carpenters are leaving their caste occupations and Seyp jobs and looking for other works.

While the traditional caste occupations of carpenters and blacksmiths are in decline, a few of them have started working at nearby urban centres as mechanics using their occupational expertise in modern ways. In addition to making agricultural tools, a blacksmith in the irrigated zone' village learned to manufacture iron material used in construction e.g. windows, doors, and grills and was earning well in the nearby urban centre.

Besides their occupational expertise, Kammiss labour is used in cultivation and harvesting. While the availability of agricultural labour inside village boundaries is a source of earning for Kammiss, especially in the irrigated zone, technological advancements in agriculture have reduced the involvement of human labour in agricultural activity. The respondents suggested that the machines are available for every agricultural activity now e.g. ploughing, planting, cutting, and harvesting.

Consequently, Kammis are looking towards other kinds of labour as well e.g. daily wage labour with local builders and in nearby industries and thus economic activity has started stretching out of the village boundaries. These new labour opportunities have resulted in the decline of Seyp system. Qurban (75, Kammi man, irrigated zone) justified the situation by saying:

When we do not get any work in village to earn our livelihood through Zamindars, we are forced to go out of the village to search for other opportunities.

Zamindar respondents in the irrigated zone's village explained how the involvement of machinery in agriculture has increased the cost of production. They mentioned that the Seyp system and thus paying the Seypi Kammis in grains/crops in addition to financial assistance in the time of need add to the economic burden on Zamindars. Therefore, Zamindars also intend to terminate the Seyp relations with Kammis. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said:

In agriculture, cost of production has already been increased. A Zamindar does not want that a Kammi, who provides him labour, gets so much from him in return: fodder for animals, wood to burn, financial help and then grains as well. It increases the financial burden on Zamindars. Zamindars therefore are not in favour of Seyp system anymore.

Though the Seyp system in the arid zone's village has finished, Kammis were getting the daily wage labour during the harvesting season of limited agriculture. Besides, as discussed earlier in the chapter, Zamindars of the arid zone's village were resuming the cultivation as a result of the construction of small dam in their area. However, agricultural technology has considerably reduced the need of manual labour in agriculture, and thus the earning opportunities for Kammis.

This is time of machinery; no one works with hands in agriculture now. There is a different machine available for every agricultural activity. Once Zamindars use to hire Kammi labour for cultivation and harvesting but most of those works are done by machines now (Fazeelat, 68, Zamindar man, arid zone).

In conclusion the technological advancements in the field of agriculture played a part in the decline of caste occupations of a few Kammi Quoms and thus the Seyp system in Punjabi villages. Moreover, the technological advancements in agriculture have reduced the involvement of manual labour in agricultural activity that was an important source of earning for Kammis.

5.5. Possession of Land and Cultivation as a Source of Livelihood- Changing Patterns

In contemporary Punjabi villages, Zamindars and Kammis cannot be divided any longer into cultivators and non cultivators, as Ahmad (1977) illustrated, or those who own land and those who do not own land and only work as craftsmen, as Eglar (1960) illustrated. Kammis, although only a few, are also involved in cultivation nowadays. A few of them own land and a few others get land on rent from Zamindars on yearly contracts and do cultivation. The terms of land contracts varied across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. Akbar (53, Kammi man, arid zone) described that they share the agricultural produce by half with Zamindars and do not pay any other rent. On the other hand, Kammis in the irrigated zone's village paid the rent in cash before or after the cultivation. It is important to mention that the land contracts and Seyp system are not interrelated. Any of the Zamindar or Kammi may hire land by paying contract rent in cash or agricultural produce, as applied. Kammis are not required to provide any labour to Zamindars for hiring their land on contract.

Hameed (30, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained how in the past all the caste groups were attached with their parentage caste occupations. For example, cobblers were involved in repairing shoes and barbers in haircuts. Only Zamindars were doing Zamindari as their caste occupation and they use to give the grains or crops to Kammi Quoms after a year in return to their services. But the village life has changed and Kammis are also doing Zamindari now. Hameed (30, Zamindar man, arid zone) said:

Nowadays Kammis are also involved in cultivation. A few of them own land and some others get it on rent from Zamindars. They are doing Zamindari like Zamindars do and difference between Zamindars and Kammis on the basis of cultivation and land is minimizing with time.

While Kammis and Zamindars in the contemporary Punjabi villages should not be differentiated on the basis of ownership of land or Zamindari, Punjabis associate respect and status of being a Zamindar merely with cultivation as a parentage occupation (Khandani Paisha) and possession of ancestral land (Jaddi Zameen). Thus, the non cultivator Quoms by parentage cannot attain the status of cultivator Quoms. Kammis are always identified as Kammis even if they acquire land or opt for cultivation as a source of their livelihood, and hence there remains a clear divide between Kammis and Zamindars. It suggests that Eglar's (1960) thesis, that Kammis do not get the status of Zamindars if they acquire land, very much persists in the contemporary Punjabi villages. It is such an established social reality in Punjabi villages that Kammis

themselves acknowledged that they cannot attain the status and respect of being Zamindars, if they acquire land, since they do not inherit it from their forefathers and nor are they Zamindars by parentage.

My in-law's Biradari have 350 kanals of land but their status cannot be matched with Rajputs in village because they are not the owners of that land by ancestry. Look! If you, being a Zamindar, have inherited land which is your forefather's land and if I, being a Kammi, buy land or a Zamindar grants me some land by gladness, both cannot be equal in status and respect (Nazar, 63, Kammi man, arid zone).

Similarly, Noor Begum (73, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) mentioned that the barbers of their village recently acquired 6 acres of land and are involved in cultivation. Though they have become independent in earning their livelihood, they are still recognized by their parentage occupation i.e. barbers.

They are not Kammis for the reason that they do not have land; they are Kammis because of their parentage occupations and identity. When they are Kammis from day one, they remain Kammis forever, even if they become landlords and start cultivation (Noor Begum, 73, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone).

Similarly, Meeran (57, Zamindar woman, arid zone) described:

Some Kammis in our village have acquired land. But it is not their forefather's land and nor are they Zamindars by ancestral occupation. Acquiring land does not change ancestry. Even if they possess land for a century, they cannot be considered as Zamindars. They always remain Kammis.

Though there is an increasing trend among Kammis to acquire land, the majority of them still do not possess land and others have very limited land. It was suggested that the majority of Kammi families, originally, were the outsiders, and belonged to some nearby or distant villages/areas. They came in a particular Punjabi village as service providers, on the request of Zamindars of that village. Initially, when a Kammi family came in a village, Zamindars of the village provided them land to live. Therefore, Kammis generally do not possess ancestral land in the villages. Fazeelat (68, Zamindar woman, arid zone) explained that:

Since their forefathers came in our village from other places as service providers of the villagers, Kammis do not possess land in the village. Initially Rajputs gave land to Kammis to live when they came in the village. Now their sons and grandsons are buying land.

The respondents in both villages explained how Zamindars may discourage Kammis of their village if they intend to buy some land. Kammis, especially in the irrigated zone's village, considered that the Zamindars do not want them to acquire land and cultivate, and thus start earning their livelihood independently. It was mentioned that the

Zamindars prefer to sell their land to other Zamindars, but not to the Kammis of village.

Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) said:

Even if a Kammi has money and desires to buy some land, Zamindars preferably will not sell their land to him. They consider it demeaning to sell their ancestral land to Kammis of their Village.

Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how, at times, it may lead to a dispute among Zamindars and Kammis, if Kammis acquire land against the will of Zamindars.

When Kammis desire to buy land, Zamindars would discourage them. If they acquire it, against the will of Zamindars, Zamindars may illegally occupy their land and tease them to the extent that Kammis surrender.

Falaksher emphasized if Kammis start cultivation and become independent, Zamindars will not get Kammi labour. As discussed in chapter 2, Barth (1960) observed the similar patterns among Pakhtuns of Swat where the landowning Pakhtun castes prevent the members of lower castes to acquire land since feudal power is associated with land.

Kammi respondents, both in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages, highlighted while Kammis acquire land, even the poorest of Zamindars do not accept them equal in social status. Zamindars deal with Kammis on the basis of their caste status and not their financial status. Mukhtaran (32, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) described that:

Even if a Kammi acquires 100 acres of land, he remains Kammi and Zamindars will always consider him lower. A Zamindar who owns one acre of land would think "if a Kammi has bought 2 acres, so what, after all he remains a Kammi". They do not accept us as equals.

However, the degree of importance attached to land varied across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. While the land and thus cultivation is the major source of livelihood in the irrigated zone's village, land in the arid zone's village is not fertile because of the shortage of water and, therefore, not very suitable for agriculture (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). In the arid zone's village, many Zamindars gave their land to Kammis on rent, on yearly contracts, and left cultivation some years ago. Conversely, if Kammis in the irrigated zone's village acquire land and start cultivation, and thus become independent in earning their livelihood, it means Zamindars of their village may not get labour to work on their agricultural land and at Dera. Correspondingly, it was quite obvious from the responses of the Kammi respondents in both villages that the Kammi owning land were discriminated against more in the irrigated zone's village than the arid zone's village.

Ansa (30, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) explained how Kammis stop working as service providers in the village setting if they acquire some land. They start earning their livelihood through cultivation and their direct dependence on Zamindars of their village reduces considerably. However, Sultan (53, Kammi man, irrigated zone) suggested that:

If a Kammi has some land, his status would increase to the extent that he can earn his livelihood respectably. But he will always be identified as a Kammi.

In conclusion Kammis, although a very few, own land and are involved in cultivation. Thus, Kammis and Zamindars can no more be divided into cultivators and non cultivators, or landowners and service providers. However, Kammis do not get the status of Zamindars if they acquire land and adopt cultivation as a source of livelihood since Punjabis associate the status of being Zamindars with ancestral land and cultivation as parentage occupation. Zamindars prevent members of Kammi Quoms from buying land. Even if Kammis acquire land, Zamindars do not consider them equal and deal with them in the village life on the basis of their caste status. Nevertheless, Kammis who acquire land usually stop working as service providers and earn their livelihood through cultivation. The degree of importance attached to land varied across both villages. While land is infertile in the arid zone's village and quite a few Zamindars were not involved in agriculture, it remains a major source of livelihood in the irrigated zone. It is suggested that Kammis having land are discriminated against more in the irrigated zone's village compared with the arid zone.

5.6. Biradari (Kinship) and Zat (Caste)

The terms Biradari and Zat are seen as the most significant principles of organization and categorization in the Punjabi villages (Chaudhary, 1999; Lyon, 2004) and also serve as a divide between Zamindars and Kammis residing in a village.

While Chaudhary (1999) suggested that the Zat may be equated indigenously with terms like Biradari and Sharika, a large majority of the respondents in the present research differentiated the Biradari from Zat. However, Zat and Quom were used interchangeably. Zat (caste) is considered as a broader category than Biradari. All those who belong to one particular occupation by parentage are placed in a caste group but only those who are relatives, blood relatives or relatives through marriages, form a Biradari. For example, all the barbers, who share their occupation by parentage, are a

caste group but only those barbers who are relatives are considered as a Biradari. Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained the concept of Biradari as following:

Biradari is all the relatives. For example, we are four brothers and all have children. When children of all of our brother's get marry and extend their families, it will form a Biradari. Biradari includes blood relatives and those linked with us by marriage.

Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated man) differentiated between caste and Biradari as following:

Caste is wide ranging. All the Jats belong to one caste group, even if some live in Shiekhupura and others in far district like Bhakkar. But they cannot be placed in one Biradari because they are not relatives. Only relatives are placed in a Biradari.

A few of the respondents in the irrigated zone's village suggested that only those who are relatives and are residing in one particular geographical area i.e. village can form Biradari and all those who are relatives but reside in different villages cannot be counted in one Biradari. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) considered that:

All those who form a Biradari should be living in one specific village. Our Biradari are those Virks living within our village and are our relatives. We have the relatives living in nearby villages, who are Virks, but they are not included in our Biradari.

However, the majority of respondents in both villages emphasized that the geographical distance cannot be seen as a criterion of Biradari formation and suggested that the relatives living in different/distant villages can be placed in a Biradari.

Conversely, while looking at the role of Biradari'ism in electoral politics of Punjab, Ahmed (2007) ignored even the factor of being relatives as a criterion to constitute a Biradari and considered that offspring of ancestors belong to the same Quom and all of them form a Biradari e.g. Rajput Biradari or Jat Biradari. Ahmed (2007) placed all the members of a Quom in single Biradari. Hence, Biradari is a disputed term conceptually and it seems it is used differently in different contexts in Punjab. Nevertheless, being relatives remains the main criterion to comprise a Biradari in the micro context of a Punjabi village and the researcher examines the term in the present thesis as such.

Kammi Quoms e.g. cobblers usually have a limited number of households in a Punjabi village and thus are less in population. Fazeelat (68, Zamindar woman, arid zone) explained when village life was organized through the caste occupations, different Kammi families, comprising of one or a few households, associated with different occupations inhabited a village as service providers of the villagers. For example, a cobbler family was required in the village to repair the shoes of the villagers.

Correspondingly, in the majority of contemporary Punjabi villages, Kammi Biradaris are still lesser in population than Zamindar Biradaris of the village. Furthermore, it is important to mention that the Kammi marry only within their occupational Quoms (see section 5.2.1). Thus, a Kammi Quom, e.g. all the barbers, residing in a Punjabi village mostly have kinship relations and form a Biradari. All members of a Kammi Biradari belong to same occupation by parentage. Farzand (35, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained it as follows:

A Kammi Quom has only few households in a village. Besides, they strictly marry within their own ones. So they are all relatives and are taken as a Biradari e.g. weaver Biradari or Mussali Biradari.

Conversely, as discussed earlier in the chapter, different Zamindar Quoms inter-marry and hence they may form a Biradari. For example, if a Rajput man marries a Jat woman from within or outside his village, they, Rajputs and Jats, constitute a Biradari.

It is not essential that a Zamindar Biradari may include only the people from one particular landowning Quom. There may be Rajputs and Maliks in one Biradari. If Rajputs give their woman to Maliks in marriage, they (Rajputs and Maliks) form a Biradari (Rizwan, 28, Zamindar man, arid zone).

Both villages under study comprised of more than one Zamindar Biradaris, within single Zamindar Quom residing in the village i.e. Minhas Rajputs in the arid zone's village and Virk Jats in the irrigated zone's village. Hameed (30, Zamindar man, arid zone) mentioned that the different Zamindar Biradaris of their village belong to common ancestors and were a single Biradari a few decades ago. When different Zamindar households in a Biradari or across various Biradaris connect in kinship relations through marriages, and thus come closer socially, they constituted new Biradaris. Hence, more Biradaris emerge in a village with time. Fahad (28, Kammi man, arid zone) suggested that the Zamindar Biradaris of their village inter marry and can be called as one Biradari.

In conclusion all those who belong to same occupation by parentage are placed in a caste group but only the relatives, blood relatives and ones linked through marriages, form a Biradari. Since Kammi and Zamindar Quoms do not inter marry, they cannot constitute a Biradari. Biradari is seen as an important principle of organization in the caste society of Punjabi villages.

5.7. Conclusion

This chapter has analysed the caste system and its context in the contemporary Punjabi villages and explained how the dynamics of caste are changing with time. While the traditional caste structures are in decline, the social legacies of caste system still play important roles in organizing the village life in Punjab. The major caste divisions i.e. Zamindars and Kammiss persist as two mutually exclusive social groups. The focus of analysis remained on the interaction patterns among Kammiss and Zamindars, and its changing dynamics. The caste occupations and the Seyp system are seen as the principle institutions binding Kammiss and Zamindars in caste relationships, and defining the asymmetrical social interactions among them. However, the caste occupations and the Seyp system are in decline and, as a result, the nature of caste relationships between Kammiss and Zamindars are changing fast. The dynamics of labour relations has changed considerably and, as a result, the direct dependence of Kammiss on Zamindars is reducing.

The Seyp system is a work contract organized around the occupational specialities of Kammiss and agricultural activity. Kammiss used to provide their occupational services and labour to Zamindars and were paid in the agricultural produces in return. However, with time, caste occupations of Kammiss have declined, modified, or substituted by newly emerged institutions. As a result, Kammiss started looking for some other works and it resulted in the transformation of their caste relationships with Zamindars, though they still work as labour for Zamindars. Moreover, the availability of alternative employment opportunities for Kammiss furthered the decline of caste occupations and thus the labour relations among Kammiss and Zamindars. Besides working as daily wage labour in nearby industries, Kammiss are migrating towards cities and settling abroad for earning purposes. Acquiring some land, a few Kammiss in villages have started cultivation and it has lessened their direct dependence on Zamindars. In addition, there are increasing trends among Kammiss to get education and acquire private/public sector jobs. However, a large majority of Kammiss are still associated with low graded tasks or daily wage labour, and only a few of them are better off. Because of the decline in caste occupations associated with Kammiss, the dynamics of the Seyp system have changed. Kammiss work only as paid labour for their Seypis, and there is no involvement of their occupational crafts in Seyp now. Nevertheless, it is concluded that the dependence of Kammiss on Zamindars is decreasing with time.

However, the dynamics of change in caste occupations and the Seyp system differed across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. While the Seyp system has come to an end in the arid zone's village, the majority of Kammi households in the irrigated zone's village were engaged in the Seyp contracts with Zamindars. The chapter has concluded that the agriculture as a sole or major source of livelihood in a Punjabi village upholds the caste structures and thus the dependence of Kammis on Zamindars by facilitating the Seyp system and existing labour relations. The caste dynamics and labour relations varied across the villages located in different agricultural contexts and the socio-economic position of Kammis was much better in the arid zone's village compared with the irrigated zone's village.

The dynamics of caste structures, and thus the labour relations among Zamindars and Kammis have been changed in the Punjabi villages, with less dependence of Kammis on Zamindars. However, the caste endogamy, parentage occupational identity, and principles of Biradari formation keep them divided into two mutually exclusive social groups, positioning Zamindars at a higher and Kammis at a lower status. The rules of caste endogamy across Kammis and Zamindars imply that the Zamindars marry within Zamindar Quoms and Kammis within their occupational caste groups. Consequently, they do not form a Biradari, kinship association. Biradari serves as the basis of village organization, and thus placing Kammis and Zamindars in different status categories. Similarly, the parentage occupational identity is seen as another divide between Zamindars and Kammis, and a criterion of status categorizations. Villagers are always recognized, and differentiated as a caste group, in the village setting through their parentage caste occupations, and not the occupations they opt later. Acquiring land or cultivation do not bestow Kammis the status of Zamindar, since respect and status of being Zamindar is associated with the cultivation as parentage occupation and possession of ancestral land. Kammis remain Kammis by identity, and a lower status group compared with Zamindars, despite their educational and professional accomplishments or financial well being.

Chapter Six

Living on the Margins –

Caste System, Biradari Memberships, and Rights to Participation in Punjabi Villages

6.1. Introduction

This chapter details how the villager's rights to participation in the context of a Punjabi village involve their Biradari memberships and caste statuses. Focussing on the interaction patterns among Zamindars and Kammiss, the chapter discusses the processes of social exclusion of Kammiss from the normatively prescribed village activities because of their lower standing on the caste hierarchy. The major themes analyzed in the chapter are the ceremonial occasions and rights to participation, Dera system, elections and voting process, collective decision making, and approaching the state institutions in the micro context of a Punjabi village. The themes are interlinked and intend to elaborate how the caste based power structures, in the patronage driven culture of Punjabi villages, determine the villager's rights to participation. Furthermore, the chapter discusses that the interaction patterns among Zamindars and Kammiss, in the context of major themes mentioned above, vary across the arid and the irrigated zone's village. While the Seyp contracts and Dera system do not exist in the arid zone's village, it is argued that these institutions play a significant role in organizing the village affairs and thus the villager's rights to participation in the irrigated zone's village. The chapter also analyses how the interaction patterns among Zamindars and Kammiss are changing with time.

6.2. Ceremonial Occasions and Rights to Participation

Kammiss are not sent formal invitations to attend the ceremonial occasions in Zamindar's houses (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003). They are expected to visit Zamindar's houses without invitation and participate by providing their services as labour or a Zamindar family may hire them for labour on a particular event e.g. wedding. Kammiss are paid for their labour in currency and, in addition, they receive ceremonial food, clothes, and Laag (money as gift, in case of marriages). However, Kammiss in Seyp with Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village provide labour as part of their Seyp contract.

A number of different roles are assigned to Kammis on the ceremonial occasions in Zamindar's houses. Kammi women wash crockery, clean the house, and help in cooking etc. On the other side, Kammi men are responsible for making formal invitations in and outside the village on behalf of Zamindars, bringing wood for cooking, distributing ceremonial food in the village, and helping in tenting and other miscellaneous tasks. Though the villagers have increasingly started referring to the catering services, quite a few villagers still rely on the Kammis of their village to cook ceremonial food.

On the other side, Zamindars formally invite their Biradari members and other Zamindars of the village; a Kammi is sent to their houses to make an invitation. While the Biradari members are invited over all the events of a ceremonial occasion, members of other Zamindar Biradaris of the village are given the invitation for selective functions e.g. a Walima, a feast from the groom's side. The largest number of non-family members is invited to a Walima (Lyon, 2004), but not the Kammis of village.

Biradari and Zamindars of village and nearby villages are formally invited by sending a Kammi as messenger. Members of Biradari participate in all functions like Mehndi, Rukhsati, and Walima. Guests from other Zamindar Biradaris are invited only at Walima (Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Invitations at the ceremonial occasions can be analysed in terms of the social status of inviter and invitee and as an opportunity for social networking. Giving a formal invitation is a way to identify those one thinks could form his human resource network at individual or Biradari levels and weddings, in particular, are an event to express and strengthen the connections with such people (Lyon, 2004).

When asked, why Zamindars do not invite Kammis on the ceremonial occasions in their houses, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the Zamindars do not establish exchange relationships of Neundra, cash gifts, with Kammis since they are not equal in caste status. Zamindars may give cash gifts to Kammis on the ceremonial occasions in their houses but they do not like to receive it in exchange from them. As discussed in chapter 3, the social exchange model suggests that the exchange relations are used as a means of expressing dominance through creating asymmetrical norms of reciprocity (Bourdieu, 1990; Mauss, 1990). Similarly, the above discussion shows how Zamindars maintain their caste dominance over Kammis using the exchange relations that involve cash gifts on the ceremonial occasions. Besides, most of the Kammis do not have the financial resources to enter into such exchange relationships with Zamindars. On the other hand, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) and Rizwan (28,

Zamindar man, arid zone) were of the view that the Zamindars do not invite Kammis at the ceremonial occasions in their houses since they consider it against their caste pride to deal with Kammis as guests, being a lower status group on the caste hierarchy.

However, the dynamics of caste relations between Zamindars and Kammis are changing as a result of the Kammis leaving their caste occupations and other low graded tasks. The respondents mentioned that Zamindars have started inviting a few of the better off and educated Kammis as guests on the ceremonial occasions in their houses. A Zamindar may invite such Kammis because they are on good terms with them. Nevertheless, it is only a small segment of Kammis who are given a formal invitation by Zamindars. On the other hand, Hadi (58, Zamindar man, arid zone) emphasized that the Kammis invited at ceremonial occasions in Zamindar's houses may face discriminatory conduct from other Zamindar invitees e.g. Zamindar invitees do not like to share a table with Kammi invitees.

Conversely, the Kammi respondents suggested that they formally invite Zamindars of their village on the ceremonial occasions in their houses, especially their Seypis (in the irrigated zone), representatives of the major Zamindar Biradaris, and those who help them in times of need. It is a matter of honour for the Kammis that an influential Zamindar of the village visited their house to attend a ceremonial occasion. In addition, they get some financial help or cash gift from Zamindars.

We invite Zamindars on the occasions of happiness and sorrowfulness at our houses, especially those who help us in the time of need. If they attend, we feel honoured that a Chaudhary came at our doorstep to participate in our event (Sharif, 56, Kammi man, irrigated zone).

The majority of Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone (e.g. Akbar, 53, Kammi man, arid zone) mentioned that Zamindars nowadays do not offer them financial help on the ceremonial occasions in their houses, like in the past, since Seyp is in decline. However, Kammis in the irrigated zone's village working on Seyp may get financial support from Zamindars (as told by Sharif, 56, Kammi man, irrigated zone).

The presence of high status individuals increase the importance of an event and uplift the social standing of the host Biradari among villagers. Rizwan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggested, while Kammis aspire for Zamindars of their village to attend ceremonial occasions in their families, Zamindars would invite politicians, bureaucrats, army officials and other influential on such events. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man,

irrigated zone) explained how it becomes the talk of town if a politically influential person attends a ceremonial occasion in a Zamindar's house.

Villagers invite high status people at ceremonial occasions in their houses e.g. politicians in order to show their links with those influential. Presence of high status people increases the respect of hosts in the eyes of villagers and other guests in ceremony (Asif, 28, Kammi man, irrigated zone).

On the other side, the large gatherings e.g. weddings and funerals, especially at the houses of influential Zamindars, are potentially political opportunities for the politicians to express contacts with the public and interact with them (Lyon, 2004). It shows how such gatherings serve the political interests of both Zamindars of a village and politicians. Walima and funerals, in particular, can be seen as the occasions through which local Zamindars and political influential develop contracts, or express and strengthen their existing contacts. Better off Zamindars or those aspiring for the leadership roles would send invitations to as many influential people as possible, especially the politically influential of the area. In contrast, comparatively poor Zamindars may only invite the leading individuals of their village and nearby villages on such occasions.



Photo 6.1 Walima ceremony at an influential Zamindar's house in the arid zone's village. It is a typical occasion for a Zamindar Biradari to identify their human resource network and express and strengthen their contacts with politically influential persons (Source: author's photo)

In the same way, Kammis invite Zamindars, especially the influential ones, at the ceremonial occasions in their houses in order to show their contacts and level of relations with local influential to their Biradari members and other Kammis of the village. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) highlighted that Kammis, especially, request the local Zamindars to attend the marriage ceremony of their daughters if the groom comes from another village. The presence of Zamindars at the ceremony increases their respect in the eyes of groom's side. Inclusion or exclusion in ceremonial occasions serve as an expression of villager's standing in the status hierarchy.

The respondents, Kammi and Zamindar in the arid and the irrigated zone, considered that the Kammis are rather obligated to invite Zamindars at the ceremonial occasions in their houses owing to their direct or indirect dependence on them in the village life. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the ceremonial events of Kammis usually take place at the Dera or house of Zamindars (only in the irrigated zone's village). Moreover, Kammis acquire financial support of Zamindars on such occasions. Hence, it sets an obligation on Kammis to invite Zamindars. However, the Kammi respondents in the irrigated zone suggested that Kammis do not use the Dera of Zamindars that often nowadays as a result of the decline in Seyp system. Riaz (48, Kammi man, irrigated zone) highlighted if they do not invite Zamindars, it becomes the talk of town that the Kammis of the village did not give any consideration to Zamindars as invitees:

We always invite Zamindars, they come or not. If we do not invite them, they blame us for not considering them as invitees. It becomes a gossip against Kammis. So we are compelled to invite at least their representatives.

More than a few Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone mentioned that Zamindars, when invited, do not generally attend the ceremonial occasions in their houses. If they attend, they come merely to show their presence for a few moments, give cash gift, and may leave the ceremony without joining in the feast. At times, Zamindars send one of their children to attend an event in Kammi's house, on their behalf. It suggests how Zamindars express a low degree of importance to ceremonial occasions in Kammi families.

We feel honoured if Zamindars participate in our happiness and sorrowfulness. But when we invite them, they do not come, since they do not like to establish such Bhaji (exchange relations) with us (Mobeen, 38, Kammi woman, arid zone).

The majority of respondents, Zamindar and Kammi in the arid and the irrigated zone, mentioned that the villagers participate in the death rituals in other's houses regardless of any caste discrimination. However, a few of the Kammi respondents (e.g. Akbar, 53, Kammi man, arid zone) thought that attending the death rituals also involve the expressions of power and status. While the villagers would share mourning with Zamindar households for many days, they visit Kammi's house not more than a few days on such occasions. Similarly, Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) considered that Zamindars discriminate against Kammis while distributing ceremonial meals in the village e.g. on the occasions like marriages, deaths, or births in their houses. She mentioned that, at times, Zamindars do not send ceremonial meals in Kammi's houses. On the other side of the spectrum, the politically influential use the funerals as another opportunity, like weddings, for their political purposes. Asif (28, Kammi man, irrigated zone) highlighted that the politically influential of the area attend the funerals in Zamindar Biradaris of the village in order to express contacts with them. Conversely, they do not attend such occasions in Kammi Biradaris.

In conclusion the villager's rights to participate in the ceremonial occasion involve their caste and Biradari affiliations, and also serve as expressions of status. Their inferior standing on the caste hierarchy restricts Kammi's rights to participation. Zamindars do not invite Kammis as guests, like other Zamindars of the village, at the ceremonial occasions in their houses. Kammis visit Zamindar's houses only to provide their labour and, in return, are paid in money and ceremonial food. Ceremonial occasions serve as an opportunity of expressing connections with others and involve the exchange relationships, cash gifts, and thus are analysed in terms of the social status of inviter and invitee. Zamindars do not like to establish such exchange relationships with Kammis of their village. In addition to their Biradari members, friends, and other Zamindars of their village, the host Zamindars invite the politicians and other influential people of the area. The presence of influential persons increases the importance of an occasion and enhances the social prestige of host Zamindar Biradari in area. On the other side, the politically influential persons use these gatherings as an occasion to express political connections with the public. Hence such occasions involve reciprocal interests of local Zamindars and politically influential persons. Conversely, Kammis send formal invitations to Zamindars on the ceremonial occasions in their houses and feel honoured if Zamindars attend an event on their invitation. However, when invited, Zamindars mostly do not attend a ceremonial occasion in Kammi's houses. Zamindars have started

inviting educated and better off Kammis as guests at the ceremonial occasions in their houses. On the other hand, the villagers generally participate in the death rituals in other's houses regardless of any caste discrimination.

6.3. The Dera System

While the Dera system does not generally exist in the arid zone's villages, it can be seen as an institution that plays a significant role in organizing the village life in the irrigated zone of Punjab. The concept of Dera originated from the Baithak, a sitting place, culture in Punjab and serves a number of different purposes in the village life. Primarily, it is used as a collective sitting place for the male villagers, usually at the evening time, to gossip and share their everyday affairs and other problems. Male guests visiting the village at ceremonial occasions etc are received and entertained at the Dera. Similarly, any politically influential or state officials like police, Patwari (land record official at sub division level) etc visiting the village for any purpose generally approach the Deradars, ones who own Dera, and are served in their Dera. One of the most important functions of the Dera is to provide a place for the collective decision making in village. Explaining the origin and purposes of Dera system, Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said:

Dera system originated from Baithak culture in Punjab. It is a place where villagers sit together in evening to gossip. Everyone comes there, Zamindars and Kammis. They share their problems and other issues at Dera. Decision making in villages also takes place at Dera. Moreover, guests are welcomed and served at Dera of a Zamindar. In past it was a place for passengers to spend a night.

The respondents suggested that only Zamindars own Dera in villages. A few of the better off Kammis may have a sitting place in their houses, i.e. a small Baithak, but they do not own Dera i.e. a collective sitting place for the villagers. Usually, there are two or three Deras in a village that belong to the major Zamindar Biradaris. Having a Dera and presence of people in their Dera is considered as a sign of social prestige and influence for a Zamindar Biradari. Dera is regarded as the pride of Chaudharies. Sultan (53, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained that:

Kammis do not have Dera. Only Zamindars have Dera. Dera is pride of Chaudharies and they consider it honourable having a Dera. When they are Deradars, they take decisions, control village affairs, and people (influential) come at their Dera. Hence they are regarded as powerful and respectable in village and area.

The respondents explained how establishing and running a Dera requires a lot of financial resources. Moreover, Deradars are regarded as having contacts with the

influential in other villages, politicians, and police officials etc, and command respect in the village environment. Being resourceful and influential, Deradars are expected to facilitate villagers, solve their problems, and take collective decisions in the village. They are generous in their dealings and entertain the guests visiting their village and offer Hukka to villagers at their Dera. Kammiss serve the villagers and other guests visiting the Dera as servants. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated man) described that:

Running of Dera require a lot of financial resources and high social status. Major source of income in villages is land which is owned by Zamindars. Besides, Zamindars are respected among villagers and have relations with influential. Having these resources, Zamindars can facilitate villagers.

The respondents highlighted that they have never seen any Kammi as a Deradar. The majority of Kammiss in villages live on the land provided by Zamindars of their village, and thus do not own land to establish their Dera. Moreover, Kammiss do not have the monetary resources to run the activities of a Dera. Their lower standing on the caste hierarchy was seen as another important reason of Kammiss not having their Dera. It was mentioned that owing to their low social status, villagers do not refer to Kammiss for the collective decision making. In addition, Kammiss do not have the contacts with politically influential people or police officials in local police stations and nor do such influential politicians consult Kammiss if they visit their village for any reason. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that only those who take decisions at collective level or have extensive social capital establish a Dera. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated man) said:

Kammiss do not establish Dera since they do not have land or other financial resources to run the activities of a Dera. Besides, they are not able to facilitate people or take decisions at collective level because they are not respected among villagers. Only those establish Dera who have the ability to facilitate others. They are themselves Kammiss, dependent on others. Moreover, they do not have relations with influential. So there is no reason that Kammiss could run their Dera.

On the other side, the respondents mentioned that even if Kammiss acquire some land, earn monetary resources, or establish relations with influential people, Zamindars of the village may not let them establish their own Dera. It is demeaning for the Zamindars if Kammiss of the village become Deradars and thus question their authority as competitors. Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) believed that it would lead to a dispute among Zamindars and Kammiss who intend to stand equal to Zamindars by establishing their Dera, and Kammiss have to surrender at last. Hence, considering the power structures of Punjabi villages, Kammiss abstain from establishing their Dera even

if they have the financial resources. Rasoolan (36, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) explained it as follows:

A few Kammi households in our village are better off but Zamindars would not like them to establish their Dera. Zamindars consider it demeaning that Kammis of the village become their competitors. They suppress those Kammis who try to stand equal to them. Zamindars would say to such Kammis “if you want to become Deradar then we should move to some other place”.

Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) highlighted that all the major Zamindar Biradaris in a village establish their Dera which symbolically reflect their presence in the power structure against their competitors. It is a way to control the collective village affairs and hence attain respect as a group. Thus, the Dera system was viewed as an expression of power across Zamindar Biradaris. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the Zamindar Biradari who runs their Dera efficiently and address the collective village affairs is regarded as more powerful among Zamindar Biradaris. Therefore, all the major Zamindar Biradaris of the village endeavour to maintain the functioning of their Dera.

Powerful people/Biradaris establish their Dera with an intention that villagers would come at their Dera with their problems and they, being Deradar, would solve those problems. In this way, their prestige and power is accepted by villagers and the people outside their village (Falaksher, 35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

The set of roles associated with Zamindars and Kammis in the running of a Dera clearly reflect their caste statuses in the village setting. All the low graded jobs are assigned to Kammis; Zamindars feel it undignified to perform these tasks. However, the importance of Kammis in the running of a Dera cannot be overlooked since all the activities require their involvement. Zamindars always need the presence of a few Kammis to look after the Dera, serve the guests, rotate Hukka among the people in Dera, and entertain them with gossip. In addition, Kammis are given the responsibility to invite villagers in case of collective decision making at the Dera. Zamindars preferably assign these duties to the Kammis who are in Seyp with them and are trustworthy. However, observing the people present at a Dera, and their activities, one can easily distinguish between Kammis and Zamindars. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) viewed the Dera system as an institution that keeps Kammis subordinated. Interaction between Zamindars and Kammis at the Dera was seen as way to remind Kammis of their lower standing on the caste hierarchy. It was suggested that the Dera system upholds the caste organization of a Punjabi village.

Sitting at a Dera one can easily make out who are Zamindars and who are Kammiss. Caste based roles and responsibilities of and expectation from Kammiss at Dera keep them reminded about their lower status and caste (Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Considering the Dera as an institution that promotes discrimination against them, a few of the educated and better off Kammiss (e.g. Sajid, 24, irrigated zone) emphasized that they do not like to visit the Dera of Zamindars.

On the other side, it is becoming increasingly difficult for Zamindars to find Kammiss to look after their Dera because of the decline in the Seyp system. As a result, the Dera system, as an institution, is going through considerable changes. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how the presence of people and the entertainments provided by Kammiss at the Dera are decreasing with time. However, Zamindars still establish their Dera in order to maintain their caste status in their villages.

Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) viewed the Dera as a gendered space that belongs to men. Zamindar women do not visit Dera; especially in the presence of men (also see Eglar, 1960). While a few of the Kammi women can be seen working at the Dera, Kammiss do not like their women to visit Dera without prescribed reasons. It was suggested that the Kammiss regard it as their humiliation if Zamindars ask their women to come at the Dera at an unusual time or in the presence of men.

Besides Dera used as a collective sitting place, the villagers maintain a separate Dera for the agricultural activity which they build in their agricultural fields, outside the village boundaries. The majority of Zamindar households in the irrigated zone's village had their agricultural Dera. It should be noted that the Dera used as a collective sitting place is located within the village boundaries. Zamindars manage the agricultural activity on their land through agricultural Dera. Agricultural equipments e.g. tractor and thresher can be found in this Dera. Agricultural Dera is also used for animal farming. However, a few of the Zamindars may establish a Dera that they use for both purposes i.e. as a collective sitting place and for the agricultural activity. Kammiss do not establish even agricultural Dera since they do not own land, or have limited land, and hence are not involved in extensive cultivation or farming. Only a barber household in the irrigated zone's village, who owned some land and were involved in Zamindari, had a small Dera for their livestock.



Photo 6.2 The Dera of a Zamindar Biradari in the irrigated zone's village, which they use both as a collective sitting place and to manage agricultural activity (Source: author's photo)

On asking why the Dera system exists only in the irrigated zone's villages, the respondents suggested that the Dera system is found in those areas of Punjab province where agriculture forms the economic and social bases of livelihood. Mushtaq (62, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how the Dera serves as a club for the villagers to relax and gossip after the hectic agricultural activity of the day in the irrigated zone's villages. Conversely, the people in the arid areas of Punjab depend on limited agriculture as a secondary source of their livelihood. Most of them are employed in the Army or other private/public sector jobs, especially in the district Chakwal (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003), and remain away from the village life. Since there are fewer opportunities of everyday life gatherings in the villages, the institution of Dera system, a platform for collective sitting on day to day basis, does not exist in the arid areas of Punjab.

In conclusion the Dera system in the irrigated zone of Punjab works as an institution through which Zamindars manage the power structures revolving around the control of collective affairs of their village. Dera is viewed as an institution that renders the authority and prestige to Zamindar Biradaris in a Punjabi village. Zamindars do not like Kammis of their village to become Deradars and thus attain the authority status in the power structures. The existence of the Dera system in the irrigated zone upholds the

caste organization of a Punjabi village and places Kammiss at a subordinate position on the status hierarchy. Conversely, the Dera system does not exist in the arid zone's villages of Punjab. It suggests that the caste system and caste organization of a Punjabi village in the irrigated zone should be more persistent than a Punjabi village in the arid zone. However, with the decline in caste occupations and Seyp, the Dera system in the irrigated zone is going through considerable changes.

6.4. The Collective Decision Making in a Punjabi Village

While looking at the dynamics of power and patronage in the context of a Punjabi village in Pakistan, Lyon (2004) suggested that Punjabis encourage collective action over individual action. It is described that there exists a culture of intervention in which problems are solved through the involvement of allies. The decision making process in a Punjabi village can be seen in the context of Lyon's argument. Punjabis encourage collective decision making, especially if an issue is concerned with the majority of villagers or two or more groups/ Biradaris. At times, an individual's or a family's concerns are also resolved collectively.

The respondents suggested that the collective decision making in their villages takes place in case of elections and voting, robbery in the village, honour and elopement issues, land and irrigation water disputes (only in the irrigated zone's village), and other conflicts across Biradaris or groups. Furthermore, getting the villager's consensus on how to utilize development funds is one of the most common reasons that bring villagers together to take a collective decision. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained it as follows:

Collective decision making takes place in case of flood or spread of disease in village, elections, land disputes, and other conflicts inside village or with another village, a robbery, issues of honour, elopement and sexual assault against a girl, or village level development project. People gather and take a decision either what to do now.

Dera is used as a place for the collective decision making in the irrigated zone's village. On the other side, villagers in the arid zone's villages use the mosque or house of an influential e.g. councillor of the union council for taking collective decisions. The collective decisions do not take place at the houses of Kammiss, in either of the villages.

As discussed earlier in the chapter (section 6.3), one of the major functions of the Dera system in the irrigated zone's villages is to provide a place for the collective decision making. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that Zamindars establish their Dera merely to control the collective decision making process in

village/area. Hence, the Dera system provides an institutionalized way of resolving issues at a collective level in the irrigated zone's villages and delegate decision making authority to Zamindars. The Dera system can be seen as an institution that upholds the practice of taking decisions at a collective level through the involvement of allies. Conversely, the village mosque was mostly used as a place for collective decision making in the arid zone's village. Decisions concerning one particular Biradari may be taken in the house of a Biradari member. However, a place meant for the collective sitting and decision making, like Dera, did not exist in the arid zone's village. It suggests that resolving the affairs at a collective level may be more prevalent in the irrigated zone's village in the presence of Dera system than the arid zone's village where Dera system did not exist.

The collective decision making in a Punjabi village can be divided into the following categories:

- i) Decisions concerning the whole village e.g. how to utilize development funds in the village.
- ii) Decisions concerning a Biradari e.g. which candidate to vote for in the elections.
- iii) Decisions concerning two groups/families of the village e.g. land disputes or honour related issues.
- iv) Decisions concerning a family/ individual e.g. robbery in a villager's house.

The respondents mentioned that all types of decisions at collective level are taken by the Zamindars of the village and Kammiss are not generally included in the decision making process. In a poverty assessment report by the Planning and Development, Government of Punjab (2003), it is highlighted that the local justice system in Punjabi villages is completely controlled by Zamindars and Kammiss are not even allowed to sit in the decision making bodies at any level. Similarly, Sultan (53, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said:

Panchait (gathering for collective decision making) originates from Painch (influential), or vice versa. Chaudharies are Painch and they sit in a Panchait. Kammiss can never be Painch in a village and nor do they take decisions in a Panchait.

The issues concerning the entire village e.g. utilization of development funds, renovation of mosque or streets, conflict with another village are resolved through the involvement of a few of the respectable and influential Zamindars of the village. Though Kammiss are the residents of the same village, they are not generally included in the village level decisions. Hadi (58, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggested that Kammiss are only consulted if their land or houses are being directly affected as a result of any

development project. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) tried to justify the exclusion of Kammis from the collective decision by saying:

There is no point to include Kammis in village level decisions, since they do not have any role in decision making at a collective level. In our village, a few of the respectable Zamindars representing major Zamindar Biradaris sit together and take a decision and everyone accepts it.

In village level decisions, any of the villagers, Kammis or Zamindars, may attend the decision making meeting but they are not expected to get involved in the decision making process directly. However, they may suggest, at times. On the other hand, the majority of Kammi respondents (e.g. Riaz, 48, Kammi man, arid zone) emphasized that, if they suggest in the decision making meetings, Zamindars do not value their opinion. Zamindars consider it against their caste pride to make a decision in light of the opinion given by a Kammi, even if they otherwise would be convinced with his views.

If I, being a Kammi, go at a Dera where collective decision making is taking place and give a very worthy opinion, no one would value my views since I am a Kammi (Sultan, 53, Kammi man, irrigated zone).

As a result, a few of the Kammis highlighted that they do not attend any decision making meetings at collective level because of the discriminatory conduct of Zamindars against them. It was mentioned that Zamindars decide what is in their benefit and impose their decisions on Kammis of the village (Planning and Development, Government of Punjab, 2003).

Though the caste system in Punjabi villages is in decline, the respondents considered that it may take a long time for Zamindars to accept the participation of Kammis in the decision making bodies. Even the educated and better off Kammis are not invited in the decision making process at a collective level. Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) was of the view that the decision making authority in Punjabi villages would always remain with Zamindars even if they have a fewer households than Kammis in the village. Hadi (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained it as follows:

Though the traditional caste system in villages has almost come to an end, division between Kammis and Zamindars persists in terms of the control over collective village affairs. Zamindars may never accept Kammis in decision making roles and leadership roles at collective level.

Kammi respondents in both villages had the similar views:

It is kind of environment which would always keep Kammis marginalized in the collective village affairs, even if they become wealthy or educated. It is unlikely that Zamindars would

start valuing the views of even educated Kammiss in the collective decision making (Sultan, 53, Kammi man, irrigated zone).

The caste organization of a Punjabi village works as a closed system of social mobility. Social mobility in occupation or class terms is possible, but not in terms of caste status. While the occupation based caste system is in decline and Kammiss are getting educated and better off with time, they are still denied the rights of participation, authority, and control in collective village affairs.

There are certain decisions that are taken at Biradari level. Heads of the households in a Biradari sit together at their Dera (irrigated zone) or Baithak (arid zone) of any Biradari member and take a decision with consensus. Mushtaq (62, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) described that:

Biradari members may sit together to take a collective decision about elopement and honour issues, marriage proposal of a girl in Biradari, to develop a consensus on a candidate in elections, or to jointly apply for an agricultural scheme etc.

However, quite a few of the Zamindar respondents in both villages (e.g. Hameed, 30, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained how the trends of resolving household affairs through the involvement of Biradari are decreasing with time. It was mentioned that the villagers prefer to take such decisions at a household level and do not like to involve Biradari members. It seems that the villagers have started preferring individual action over collective action. Conversely, a few of the Zamindar respondents in both villages highlighted that they still would consult their Biradari members while taking an important household decision e.g. marriage proposals. Nevertheless, there are several issues that require the attention of whole Biradari. The most common of these are the electoral politics and honour related issues e.g. a girl elopes or sexual assault against a girl. Biradari members resolve such matters collectively.

On the other side of the spectrum, Kammiss generally do not take collective decisions at Biradari level. They mostly involve some respectable Zamindars of their village to resolve their domestic affairs or the disputes within their Biradari. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) illustrated a recent incident in which he acted as a mediator to resolve a conflict between a Kammi and his in-laws.

Kammiss generally do not resolve their Biradari affairs in consultation with their Biradari members; they would rather ask for the involvement of Zamindars. Zamindars resolve their family matters even (Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammis, especially, ask for the presence of Zamindars of their village while deciding an important issue with another party e.g. marriage proposals, so that the Zamindars may defend them in case the other party averts from decision in future. Kammis do not take a group decision even at the time of elections.

However, a few of the educated and better off Kammis in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages explained how they have started resolving their household and, at times, Biradari matters on their own. They mentioned that they take their group decisions involving their Biradari members, and do not like to consult Zamindars of their village anymore. Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone), one of the better off Kammis in the arid zone's village, said:

We try to resolve our issues ourselves now. We sit together and discuss the matter with our Biradari members. We only involve Zamindars if it is indispensable e.g. in case of police or court matters.

It shows that the educated and better off Kammis take their familial and Biradari decisions independently as compared to Kammis who depend on Zamindars for their livelihood. However, Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) pointed out an interesting dimension of the phenomenon. She explained while an educated and better off segment of a Kammi Biradari may be taking their familial or even Biradari decisions on their own, their Biradari members dependent on Zamindars would prefer to consult Zamindars for resolving their domestic affairs rather than involving their own Biradari members. As discussed in chapter 5, very few Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were educated and better off. Conversely, quite a few Kammis in the arid zone's village were educated or involved in respectable businesses and jobs. Thus, it can be assumed that more Kammis in the arid zone compared with their counterparts in the irrigated zone were independent in deciding their familial and Biradari affairs, without the involvement of Zamindars of their villages.

Another type of collective decision making in the Punjabi villages involves two individuals or groups in dispute. In this case, the disputants would jointly choose the arbitrators and the place of decision making. Such conflicts may take place among Zamindars, Kammis or Zamindars and Kammis. However, the negotiators are always Zamindars, even if one or both of the parties in dispute are Kammis. Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained:

If there is a dispute between two groups, concerned parties decide either which Zamindars they want to involve in decision making process and at which Dera the decision should take place. Kammis are not referred to or nominated as decision makers. Normally, the representatives of all prominent Zamindar Biradaris are included in the decision making process. Everyone accepts their decision.

The researcher asked about the criteria that the disputants follow while choosing the Zamindars who would act as arbitrators in the decision making process. Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained it as follows:

The concerned parties look for some wise Zamindars, who also have good repute and extensive relations in village/area and with powerful people like police and politicians. They nominate them to take decision on their behalf.

Besides highlighting the criteria that the disputants follow to choose mediators, the above quotations reflect the significance of Dera system in the decision making process in the irrigated zone's village. The Dera system, links of the local influential people with politicians and police officials, and rights to take decisions at collective level, together, form the basis of power structures.

The issues and dynamics of disputes across Kammis and Zamindars are different and mediated through their caste affiliations. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the disputes among Zamindars usually require arbitration since none of the party in dispute would like to submit. The disputes among Zamindars are mostly concerned with property, division/ownership of land, irrigated water (only irrigated zone), and honour issues. In contrast, only serious disputes among Kammis and Zamindars are resolved through the involvement of a third party. Kammis generally give up in case of their minor conflicts with Zamindars. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammis do not usually bring their disputes with Zamindars at a decision making platform i.e. Dera or Baithak, unless the dispute is of very serious nature. The disputes among Zamindars and Kammis, that require arbitration, are generally concerned with the issues of honour e.g. a Zamindar boy commits sexual assault against a Kammi girl and it becomes public or physical violence against Kammis.

The majority of Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone considered that they would not get justice in the village council, headed by Zamindars, in case of their dispute with a Zamindar party. Even if Zamindars are found guilty, Kammis are required to negotiate.

It is unlikely that Kammis would get justice if they are in dispute with Zamindars. Kammis have to give up (Jannat, 51, Kammi woman, arid zone).

Only a few of the Kammis (e.g. Qurban, Kammi man, 75, irrigated zone) believed that the Zamindars nominated for the decision making would take an impartial decision.

The majority of Zamindars also considered that the local decision making councils will show partiality in favour of Zamindars in case of their disputes with Kammis of the village. If Zamindars are found culpable, the matter normally gets resolved through negotiation and it is less likely that a serious action will be taken against them. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how in case of a serious offence, the Zamindars, if found guilty, go at the doorstep of Kammis and request for a pardon. Most of the time, Kammis accept their request and the matter gets resolved peacefully. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) highlighted that it is demeaning for the Zamindar to go at the doorstep of Kammis to ask for a pardon. When Zamindars go at their door step and thus humiliate themselves in the eyes of villagers, Kammis forgive them considering their request as retribution. However, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that Kammis usually forgive Zamindars but they would migrate from the village if the matter is very serious e.g. a rape case against a Kammi girl and thus their family's honour is in question.

Talking about of the dynamics of disputes among Zamindars, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how most of the disputes among Zamindars in their village are concerned with the agricultural activity. For example, if one Zamindar utilizes the timings of irrigated water allocated to another Zamindar or someone's animals destroy the crops of another, it may lead to a serious dispute which ultimately requires arbitration. Conversely, in the arid zone's village, Zamindars were not involved in such disputes due to very limited agricultural activity in their village. It suggests that the arbitration through the involvement of allies was more frequent in the irrigated zone's village as compared to the arid zone's village. Therefore the existence of an institutionalized way of resolving disputes among villagers in their everyday life i.e. Dera system becomes more applicable and functional in the irrigated zone's village than the arid zone's village.

The respondents suggested that the disputes among villagers, especially among Zamindars, are mostly reported in the police stations nowadays and as a result the collective decision making through village councils is declining with time. However, most of the disputes reported to police are eventually resolved in the village.

In conclusion the villagers encourage collective action over individual action and prefer to resolve issues concerning community, groups, or individuals through the involvement of allies. The decision making authority at collective level plays a significant part in defining the caste based power structures. The village councils are controlled by Zamindars and Kammiss are not included in the decision making bodies at any level. As a result, Kammiss consider that the decisions taken in local councils are not impartial and they do not get justice in case of their disputes with a Zamindar party. The collective decision making is seen as a practice that upholds the caste organization of Punjabi villages and delegates an authority to Zamindars to control the community affairs. The collective decision making is more prevalent in the irrigated zone's village than the arid zone's village. While the Dera system serves as an institutionalized way of resolving matters at a collective level in the irrigated zone's village, it did not exist in the arid zone's village.

6.5. The Electoral Process – Election Campaigns and Voting Process

Local identities become the substance of electoral politics in Punjabi villages of Pakistan (Ahmed and Naseem, 2011; Wilder, 1999). Biradari loyalty is seen as the most decisive factor in local culture that determines the political behaviours of villagers in Punjab (Ahmed, 2007). While a few studies have examined the role of Zamindar Biradaris as pressure group in the electoral process and their voting behaviour (e.g. Ahmed, 2007), none of those detailed the factors determining voting behaviour of Kammi Quoms in the micro context of a Punjabi village. However, Ahmed (2008) discussed the voting behaviour of dependent voters and the voters weak in wealth or man power, though without their caste affiliations. Arguably, the dynamics of being dependent, poor, and less in population can be helpful measures to understand the voting behaviour of Kammi Quoms in Punjabi villages.

Electoral politics and voting behaviour of the villagers in Punjab can be analysed in terms of the caste organization. Ahmed (2007) mentioned that the local bodies' elections in Punjab are held purely on Biradari basis. Similarly, the candidates contesting National and Provincial assembly elections are supported or opposed by different Zamindar Biradaris in a Punjabi village. Political behaviour of the voters is fixed by their Biradari loyalties rather than any political ideology (Ahmed, 2007). Zamindar Biradaris decide collectively about contesting elections or the candidate they should support in the local bodies' or general elections. The Zamindar respondents, in the arid and the irrigated zone, explained how their decisions to contest election or

support a candidate are influenced by their Biradari based enmities in the village. If one Zamindar Biradari decides to support a candidate in the local bodies or general elections, other Zamindar birdaris would oppose that candidate and vote for any other candidate. Similarly, if a Zamindar Biradari decides to contest local bodies' elections, the other Zamindar Biradari in the village may declare to contest election against them or support a candidate contesting against those Zamindars. Smaller Zamindar Biradaris with the fewest households, and thus fewer numbers of votes, may offer their support to any of the dominant Zamindar Biradari of their village. Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained how the Biradari honour keeps a Zamindar Biradari united against their opponent Zamindar Biradaris during elections. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained:

Longstanding enmities among Zamindar Biradaris in a village play a part in determining their decisions to support or oppose a candidate in elections. If a Biradari decides to support a candidate, other Biradari will go for any other candidate, he wins or lose, does not matter. But on the basis of their personal hostilities, Zamindar Biradaris would always oppose each other in elections.

On the other hand, Kammis in Punjabi villages generally do not contest elections or get involved in the election campaigns in favour of any candidate. The respondents, Zamindar and Kammi in the arid and the irrigated zone, mentioned that Kammis do not contest elections because the process of contesting elections entails a lot of financial resources, Biradarism, extensive social contacts and social recognition, and decision making authority on a collective level. Moreover, as discussed in chapter 5, Kammis are lesser in population and thus in the number of votes in the majority of Punjabi villages. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said:

Kammis are not able to contest elections because they do not have financial resources, social contacts, and decision making authority at the village level. Besides, they are weak as Biradari and do not have enough votes to win an election.

Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) stressed that even if a Kammi Biradari have financial resources, Zamindars of their village would never like them to contest elections. It was highlighted that the elections in Punjab at any level, local bodies' or general election, are contested on the Biradari and dynasty bases. Zamindars would not vote for a Kammi Biradari in local bodies' elections since it is against the caste pride of Zamindars that Kammis of the village acquire leadership roles against them after winning an election. Fahad (28, Kammi man, arid zone) was of the view that a Kammi would only make himself look ridiculous contesting election and even his Biradari members may not vote for him. On the other hand, when seats were allocated to

peasants and women in the local bodies' elections of 2001, a few of the Kammis in Punjabi villages contested and won the elections. However, Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that Zamindars nominated Kammis of their own choice, who were the representatives of Kammi Biradaris larger in population, to contest the peasant seats on their panel. Zamindars nominated these Kammi for peasant seats with a mere intention of getting the votes of their Biradaris for the more important seats, contested by Zamindars themselves, on the same panel. By the same token, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Zamindars usually do not like their women to contest elections. Hence, they nominated Kammi women of their villages to contest the seats allocated to women, on their panel. The Zamindars invent ways to maintain the existing power relations, even if the state endeavours to incorporate the marginalized segments, Kammis and women, in the grass root level of power sharing. Similarly, Kammis do not actively participate in the election campaigns of National or Provincial assembly elections. Ahmed (2008) explained how the active supporters contribute financial expenditures in the election campaigns and acquire the leadership roles by arranging the public meetings at village/union council level, which arguably Kammis cannot do.

Besides their restricted rights to contest elections or participate in election campaigns, it was important to examine the factors that determine the voting behaviours of Kammis i.e. their rights to choice in election. Since Kammis are the collective service providers for the villagers, all Zamindar Biradaris claim a right on their votes in elections. During the election campaigns, all of the Zamindar Biradaris would go to the doorsteps of Kammis or invite them at their Dera/baithak and ask for their votes. In response, Kammis may not refuse to any of them. However, they generally abstain from favouring a Zamindar Biradari openly. Kammi respondents mentioned, if they openly support any Zamindar Biradari in elections, the other Zamindar Biradaris get annoyed and may persecute them in the future. While talking about the voting behaviour of Kammis, Fazal (47, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said:

Kammis are apprehensive to support any Zamindar Biradari openly in elections. We go at every doorstep in village for our livelihood. If we declare our support for one Chaudhary, we may never go at the doorstep of many other Chaudharies. So we keep it hidden.

However, Fazal (47, Kammi man, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammis vote for the candidate favoured by those Zamindars who offer them help in the time of need. On the other hand, Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) mentioned that a Kammi household

would distribute their votes among the candidates supported by different Zamindar Biradaris of their village, so that none of the Zamindar Biradari is unhappy with them.

Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) and Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) explained how a Kammi Biradari may, at times, sit together to discuss and choose a Zamindar Biradari they should support in elections, though keeping it hidden. However, Kammis always follow any of the Zamindars of their village since they cannot generally approach politicians directly.

Moreover, Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) thought that there is a lack of unity among Kammi Biradaris and thus they cannot prove the significance of their votes in elections. Zamindars also considered that Kammis are not united as Biradaris. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that it is easy to disunite Kammis as Biradari on elections due to their dependency on Zamindars, poverty, and marginalized social standing. Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) considered that the local influential, at times, could bribe Kammis to buy their votes, and thus divide them as a Biradari.

The above discussion shows how the indirect ways of asserting dominance over caste subordinates and the relations of economic dependence disguised under a veil of moral obligations may play a part in determining the voting behaviour of Kammis. There is a tendency among Kammi groups to vote for the political party supported by the Zamindar group that they are connected to e.g. their Seypi Zamindars. However, there are no certainties that Kammis will vote for that party, since they are free to use their rights to choice through secret balloting inside the polling station.

On the other hand, Zamindar respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone explained how the voting behaviour of Kammis is becoming unpredictable with time, as their direct dependency on Zamindars declines. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that, in the recent past, Zamindars use to command Kammis to vote for their favoured candidate but it has become difficult to pressurize them. Nowadays, Zamindars ask for the votes of Kammis in a requesting mode. In addition, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) highlighted that Zamindars are now required to convince Kammis by giving them reasons; why they should support one candidate and not the other. As a result of their changing voting behaviour, Zamindars have started inviting a few of the Kammis, who are heads of their Biradaris/households, in decisions making meetings in elections. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said:

Kammis have started exercising their right to choice while voting in elections. Like in the past, Zamindars cannot pressurize Kammis to vote for their favoured candidates. Now Zamindars convince Kammis for a candidate and request them to vote for him.

The respondents, Kammi and Zamindar, in the arid zone (e.g. Gulsher, 30, Kammi man, arid zone) mentioned that a segment of cobbler biradari who are educated and involved in respectable businesses have started taking decisions as a group in elections. Cobblers were the largest Kammi Biradari of the village and had more than a few households and thus number of votes. After taking a collective decision, they openly offer their support to a Zamindar Biradari of their village. However, this was the only examples in both villages that a segment of Kammis supported a candidate in elections openly. Conversely, Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) suggested that the other cobblers of their Biradari, who work as service providers or are involved in low graded tasks, do not endorse their Biradari's decision openly.

Politicians approach the voters in villages involving their caste and Biradari affiliations. During the election campaigns of local bodies' or general elections, the politicians contact the representatives of Zamindar Biradaris in a village. They do not generally approach Kammis. After their negotiations with a politician, representatives of a Zamindar Biradari would invite that politician at their Dera/Baithak and announce their support for him in the presence of whole Biradari. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said that:

During election campaign, politicians approach Zamindars of a village. They do not contact with Kammis. If Zamindars agree to support, the politician comes at the Dera of Zamindars and Dua-e-Khair (prayer for luck/success) is offered in the presence of whole Biradari.

However, a few Zamindar Biradaris in Punjabi villages have permanent associations with a politician or a political party. These Zamindar Biradaris play important roles in election campaigns and help politicians in getting support of other Zamindar Biradaris of different villages serving as mediators; they may also fund the election campaigns.

If a politician comes around for a meeting with the villagers during election campaign, Zamindar Biradari supporting that politician may invite the Kammis of their village to join in. A few of the respondents, Kammi and Zamindar in both villages, suggested that Zamindars invite the heads of Kammi Biradaris to please them, by providing the rights to participation, and get their votes. Conversely, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) was of the view that Zamindar's implicit purpose of inviting Kammis at this occasion is to demonstrate their control over Kammis of the village to politicians. Nevertheless, politicians negotiate only with Zamindars and Kammis present in the

meeting do not mostly get an opportunity to talk directly to the politicians. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) discussed that, in rare cases, a local politician may visit any of the Kammi Biradari during elections, if they are more in population and thus votes. However, politicians generally make such contacts with Kammis in company with the Zamindars of that village. The respondents suggested that Zamindars do not like politicians to approach the Kammis of their village without their involvement. Thus the politicians do not overlook the interests of Zamindar Biradaris who strengthen their election campaigns being dominant in the villages, more in population, and financially strong (Ahmed, 2008).

During election campaign, Zamindars would not like a politician to interact with Kammis of their village directly to ask for their votes, without involving any Zamindar of that village (Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

On the other hand, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) believed that the politician, especially who contest general elections, would not like to interact with the uneducated and poor Kammis when they can easily get their votes involving Zamindars of that village. Situation in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages was not that different, in this regard. A few of the educated and better off cobblers in the arid zone's village started networking with the politicians who contest local bodies' elections. However, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) highlighted that the local politicians develop an acquaintance with the representative of larger Kammi Biradari merely for their own political interests, and they would not give importance to those Kammis over Zamindars of that village. Conversely, none of the Kammi Biradaris in the irrigated zone's village had direct interaction with the politically influential. It seems that Kammis in the arid zone's village were more empowered politically, compared with their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village.

In conclusion the local identities organized around the caste memberships, Biradari organization of a village, and collective village affairs become the substance of electoral politics and determine the voting behaviour of the villagers. Electoral politics revolves around the power relationships among major Zamindar Biradaris who aspire to get leadership roles and have control over collective village affairs. Kammis are not directly involved in the electoral politics and nor do they support any of the Zamindar Biradari openly. During election campaigns, politicians negotiate with Zamindar Biradaris for votes and Zamindars would help politicians to get the votes of marginalized segments of their village i.e. Kammis. Kammis generally do not get an opportunity to interact with

politicians directly. However, the voting behaviour of Kammis is changing with time as a result of the decline in the caste system and they have started exercising their rights to choice while voting in elections.

6.6. Approaching the State Institutions and Caste System

The respondents, Kammi and Zamindar in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages, explained how accessing the state institutions, for the villagers, could involve their caste/Biradari affiliations, local level electoral politics, and power relationships in the village context. The majority of respondents highlighted that it is extremely difficult to get justice in the police stations and, at times, in the courts without involving any local influential person having political contacts. Similarly, acquiring public sector jobs, job postings at preferred stations, and benefiting from the public welfare funds and loans involves political patronage. In this regard, caste and Biradari affiliations play an important part, and thus the Kammi respondents were highly concerned about their rights to access state institutions. While the members of a Zamindar Biradari may acquire the favours of any politically influential person to access the state institutions, Kammis emphasized that they are not, mostly, given any consideration in spite of all their efforts. Farzand (35, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained it as follows:

Kammis are denied justice at all levels. It is hard for them to get justice in police stations or even courts without involving any influential person. Nor do they get any help in getting jobs for their children or in benefitting from welfare funds or loans. Everything is for powerful ones. Members of Zamindar Biradaris may ask a Painch (influential) in their Biradari for help but Kammis are helpless.

The system of political patronage, involving connections between local Zamindars and politically influential persons, constitute the bases of power structures in Punjabi villages. Similarly, the Biradari members working at the prestigious posts in public sector institutions e.g. Army, civil bureaucracy, and the judiciary are the source of power and pride for a Zamindar Biradari. While looking at the electoral politics and voting behaviour in Punjab, Wilder (1999) highlighted that the National/Provincial level politics in Pakistan is not about formulating public policies. Instead, it is about assisting the constituents in police station and courtside problems and offering political patronage in the form of public sector jobs and job appointments, loans, welfare funds and schemes, licences, and loans etc. The substance of National/Provincial politics and electoral process influence the micro level affairs in a Punjabi village. The system of patronage, mentioned above, operates through local influential people who are the representatives of different Zamindar Biradaris. In return, they compensate the

politicians for their patronage during the local bodies' and National/Provincial assembly elections and play an important part in running their election campaigns. Members of Zamindar Biradaris back their representatives in elections and, in response, would expect help in police stations, to acquire public sector jobs, and get the development schemes for their village. Moreover, these local influential persons mostly act as mediators in the local decision making bodies and thus control the collective village affairs.

The local influential Zamindars act as a bridge between the politicians and the villagers especially their Biradari members. They are not merely the supporters but work as consultants at the village and union council levels for the politicians during the election campaigns. Ahmed (2008) highlighted that these supporters take part in the decision making process, share the expenditures in election campaigns, and organize public meetings. The individual and collective roles of these supporters are significant for the successful election campaigns. These supporters are respected in the area for their connections with the politically influential persons. Lyon (2004) explained how demonstrating the ties to influential politicians and belonging to their political factions enhance one's reputation in the area. The representatives of Zamindar Biradaris use this reputation, and links and patronage of these politicians to influence the officials in the state institutions, especially the police, and to acquire other benefits for themselves, their Biradari members, and other villagers. It was commonly heard from the respondents in both villages that:

Politics in Pakistan is about backing the political supporters in their Thana (police station) and Kachehri (courtside) issues, to help them getting development schemes for their villages, and to acquire jobs for their family members (Aamir, 33, Kammi man, arid zone).

This system of political patronage plays an important part in determining the villager's rights to access state institutions, especially the police stations. The respondents, Zamindar and Kammi in the arid and the irrigated zone, viewed the police as a deeply politicised institution in Punjab. Accessing the police stations and getting justice is not easy without the involvement of any politically influential person or bribery. As a result, the villagers prefer to resolve their disputes and other issues involving a few of the local influential Zamindars.

Zamindars are more likely than Kammis to report their matters to police. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) discussed how disputes among Zamindars are often reported to police and sometimes to courts. On the other hand, disputes among Kammis

are generally resolved at the village level involving any Zamindar, Deradar, or Numberdar. Because of the bad reputation of the police, Kammis prefer to involve a few of the local influential Zamindars as arbitrators in case of their clashes with other Kammis and solve the matter in village councils. Similarly, disputes between Zamindars and Kammis mostly get resolved in the village.

While disputes among Zamindars are largely reported to police station nowadays, the conflicts among Kammis and especially among Zamindars and Kammis normally get resolved in the village (Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Similarly, Sultan (53, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said:

Police would get involved if there is a clash between Chaudharies or, only a few times, if Kammis are in conflict. I have rarely seen that a Kammi called police or going to police station against Chaudharies of his village.

While Kammis prefer to resolve their issues in the village involving Zamindars, they may turn to the police station if they do not get justice through the village council. However, all of the respondents, Zamindar and Kammi, were of the view that it is unlikely that Kammis would get fair dealings in the police station without the backing of any influential Zamindar. It was believed that Kammis may not be able to register an FIR (First Information Report) in the police station. If an FIR is registered, the process of criminal justice would not proceed without the involvement of any influential and political patronage.

Police do not give any consideration to the FIR registered by Kammis unless an influential person of their village or area is at their back. They may register the FIR but no action would be taken if a Kammi approaches police station on his own (Gulsher, 30, Kammi man, arid zone).

Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) suggested that a Kammi may spend double the money a Zamindar spends in order to get access to the police station and register an FIR, since no one listens to Kammis in the police station. Furthermore, all of the Kammi respondents, in the arid and the irrigated zone, highlighted that the conduct of police with Kammis approaching the police station is insulting and discriminatory. As a result, Kammis are discouraged to visit the police station and interact with police officials.

If a Kammi goes to police station for registering an FIR, Police behave with him as if he is not a human (48, Riaz, Kammi man, arid zone).

Therefore, Kammis in dispute request Zamindars of their village to help them in dealing with the police. Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that, generally, if one Kammi party acquires the backing of a Zamindar Biradari of their village, the other

Kammi party in dispute would ask for the support of another Zamindar Biradari for registering FIR in the police station. However, most of the time, disputes among Kammi are ultimately resolved in the village with the involvement of some respectable Zamindars.

Conversely, in case of their disputes with a Zamindar party, Kammi prefer to resolve it in the village. However, Kammi may report the serious disputes with Zamindars, e.g. honour related issues, to police with the support of another Zamindar Biradari of their village who are against the Zamindar Biradari in dispute. Nevertheless, such disputes also get resolved in the village towards the end. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that, in such cases, other Zamindars of the village may use the Kammi, in dispute with Zamindars, for their political interests or inter Biradari power politics. It was explained how the other Zamindars, against the Zamindars in dispute with Kammi, could provoke and even financially support the Kammi to report the matter to police merely for their own enmity against those Zamindars. However, the Zamindar party in dispute usually knows that their rival Zamindars are supporting the Kammi against them. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) highlighted that the only purpose behind such politics is to humiliate the Zamindars in dispute through the low status Kammi. On the other hand, Sultan (53, Kammi man, irrigated zone) mentioned that Kammi also know how Zamindars use such Kammi, who are already in trouble, for their own enmities and politics in the police stations and the courts. Therefore, Kammi think a thousand times before asking for the help of any Zamindars in the police proceedings against other Zamindars. Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) drew attention towards an added dimension and mentioned that Zamindars have the kinship relations, through marriages, with most of the other Zamindar Bidadaris of the village. In such situations, all of the Zamindar Bidadaris of the village may ultimately unite, making their kinship a reason, against the victim Kammi and thus leaving them vulnerable. As a result, Kammi are not left with any other options but to resolve the dispute through reconciliation in the village. In the same way, Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) suggested that it is difficult for Kammi to pursue the criminal justice procedures in police stations and courts against Zamindars who ultimately use their links with influential, resources, and Bidadarism and may turn the decisions in their favour. The above discussion can be summarized by the following quotation by Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone):

Zamindars use their contacts with political influential and financial resources, and could manipulate the criminal justice procedure in their favour. Conversely, Kammiss, who are already poor, waste lots of money in police and court procures but may still not get justice. Therefore, we prefer to resolve our disputes with Zamindars involving a few other Zamindars of the village and do not report the matter to police since it is less likely to get justice that way.

Raheel (44, Zamindar man, arid zone) highlighted that, in villages, a person would evaluate the Biradari standing, social contacts, and financial position of the other person before going to the police against him. Having the same opinion, Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammiss, at times, attempt to approach police stations directly in case of their disputes with poor Zamindars. However, such Kammiss may face persecution in the village setting afterwards, and Hadi (58, Zamindar man, arid zone) highlighted that Zamindars of the village may unite against Kammiss on such occasions.

Furthermore, the respondents explained how the legal procedures in police stations and courts are inequitable against Kammiss. The land related document, a quasi-title deed, called Fard is required to furnish bails in court cases and to release anyone from the police stations (Qazi, 2006). This land document indicates the Quom and area of land in possession of a person. Kammiss cannot plea for bail in the police stations or courts since the majority of them do not own land. Though the Punjab Alienation of Land Act 1901 that prohibited non cultivator castes from buying land (Ahmed, 2008) is no more applicable, only a few Kammiss in the Punjabi villages own land. Hence, Kammiss mostly ask for the help of Zamindars of their village in order to furnish bail in the courts or police stations.

While a few of the respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone considered that it is comparatively easy for the educated and better off Kammiss to register FIR in police station and get justice, others were of the view that the police officials deal with Kammiss merely on the basis of their caste status and not their education or financial standing. However, it was interesting to note that the educated and better off Kammiss across the arid and the irrigated zone's village had dissimilar experiences, in this regard. With the help of a recent incident, Hameed (30, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained how the better off segment of cobbler Biradari of their village do not hesitate to go to police stations. Having significant number of votes as Biradari, these cobblers have established the links with local influential politicians. If local influential politicians do not help them, they use financial resources to proceed the criminal justice process in the

police stations. Though it may still be difficult for them to get justice, if they are in dispute with influential Zamindars, they at least report the matter to police. Similarly, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) was of the view that:

Kammis having direct dependence on Zamindars rarely report their disputes with Zamindars to police. But educated and better off Kammis, who do not depend on Zamindars for their livelihood, would at least go to police station in case of their serious disputes with Zamindars; they get the justice or not, that is a different issue.

Conversely, the educated and better off segment of barber Biradari in the irrigated zone, having more than a few households in the village, was in favour of resolving their issues through the village council. Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone), Biradari member of the wealthier barbers, suggested that they do not go to the police station against Zamindars since they have links with influential and are powerful in the village. She considered that it is unlikely for Kammis to get justice in the police station against Zamindars of their village. Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) said:

We prefer to resolve such disputes in village and avoid approaching police. If we go to police station, we do not get justice. Zamindars have links with influential. So nothing would result against them, even if we report the matter in police station. Therefore, we do not go to police for justice.

As discussed in chapter 5, more than a few Kammis from different Kammi Biradaris in the arid zone's village were involved in respectable businesses or private/ public sector jobs. Moreover, the Seyp and Dera system, institutions that uphold the caste organization of a Punjabi village, did not exist in the arid zone's village. Conversely, the majority of Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were working on Seyp with Zamindars or were involved in other low graded tasks. Hence, they were dependent on Zamindars for their livelihood. The Seyp contracts and Dera system existed in the irrigated zone's village. It shows that the caste organization of the irrigated zone's village was much stronger than the arid zone's village. Tendencies among wealthier/educated Kammis across both villages to visit police stations against Zamindars suggest that the stronger caste structures of the irrigated zone's village influence not only the power relations among Zamindars and dependent Kammis but it also affect the interaction patterns among Zamindars and wealthier/educated Kammis of the village. While the educated and better off Kammis of the arid zone's village had started reporting their disputes with Zamindars to police stations, their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village preferred to resolve such clashes through the village councils.

The respondents, Kammi and Zamindar in the arid and the irrigated zone, believed that getting justice through the courts also involve the power politics and bribery, especially in the lower judiciary. Illustrating his experience, Akbar (53, Kammi man, arid zone) explained that none of the Zamindars helped them when an influential Zamindar of their village registered a forged case of robbery against a young man of their Biradari and he was jailed. Kammi Biradari filed many applications against the forged case in the session court but the influential Zamindar, who registered that case to the police, repeatedly got those appeals cancelled using his political contacts. It took a long time for Kammis to secure the release of that boy from the jail. Akbar (53, Kammi man, arid zone) mentioned that most of the Kammis, being poor and landless, cannot afford to hire a lawyer to defend their petitions in courts. They usually submit an application in the district courts, lowest of the all courts in hierarchy in Pakistan. But Zamindars easily get such applications cancelled using their links or bribery since these applications do not have a legal standing.

Furthermore, a few of the Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone stressed that they cannot benefit from the public welfare funds and schemes designed for the poor since it also involve Biradari affiliation in that local context. It was explained how the welfare programmes are implemented at the village level under the supervision of local influential people who have links with politicians. Kammis mentioned that the local influential people mostly allocate these opportunities to their Biradari members, or other political patrons in the village or union council, who they think are poorer, and do not give any consideration to Kammis.

In 2008, the Government of Pakistan initiated a poverty alleviation programme, called Benazir Income Support programme, in order to supplement the income of poor families with direct cash grants of Rs. 2000/ family, every two months (Benazir Income Support programme, 2008). The members of National Assembly and Senate were allocated 8,000 application forms/each member to distribute among the poor in their constituencies. The Kammi respondents mentioned that the legislators distributed these forms among poor through the local influential persons in different union councils and villages of their constituencies. Local influential Zamindars picked the nominees of their choice and poor Kammi were not given their rights. Akbar (53, Kammi man, arid zone) explained that:

The local influential distributed application forms of Benazir Income Support Programme to their relatives and other Zamindars of the village who they considered poorer. Poor Kammis in the villages could not benefit from this welfare programme.

Acquiring the public sector jobs may also involve political patronage and Biradari affiliations. Mushtaq (62, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) discussed how the legislators in National/ Provincial Assembly and the district presidents of the political party in power are allocated a quota in the public sector jobs. They assign these jobs to their political supporters and party workers, merely on political basis, in different union councils and villages in return to their efforts in the election campaigns.

Planning and Development, Government of Punjab (2003) mentioned that Zamindars do not like Kammis of their villages to approach politicians to ask for jobs. It is explained how a few of the educated Kammis of a village in district Sheikhpura were humiliated by a local Zamindar when they enquired about the job opportunities from the member provincial assembly (MPA) present at the Dera of that Zamindar.

Similarly, the development schemes in villages are introduced under the supervision of local Zamindars e.g. water supply schemes, construction of streets. The politicians allocate development grants to the local Zamindars in exchange for their political support in elections. A local online newspaper in district Chakwal, Dhudial News (2010), wrote as follows:

All the development and welfare funds are dispersed in district only on the behest of the treasury parliament members of the district.

In conclusion the villager's rights to access state institutions involve their caste/Biradari memberships, power relations, and system of patronage in the local context. The police are seen as a deeply politicized institution and it is difficult to register FIR and, especially, proceed the criminal justice procedure, in a fair way, without political links or paying-off. Biradari affiliations play an important part in this regard. Members of Zamindar Bidadaris use the links of their group representatives with political influential to get access to police stations and may manipulate the criminal justice process. Conversely, Kammis do not get fair dealings in the police stations because of their lower caste status and lacking political support, especially in case of their disputes with local Zamindars. Hence, they prefer to resolve their disputes in the village councils involving a few of the local influential Zamindars. If they approach police stations, they ask for the support of Zamindars of their village. The Biradari/caste memberships may get involved in the court procedures as well and Kammis may face problems in getting

justice through the courts. Furthermore the development schemes and public welfare funds are dispersed on behest of the influential politicians. These politicians distribute development funds in different villages and union councils of their constituencies through the local Zamindars who benefit their own Biradari members and political patrons. Hence, in a Punjabi village, there exists a web of power relations in which caste and Biradari affiliations play a central part.

6.7. Conclusion

Power structures in a Punjabi village are organized around the system of patronage involving Biradari memberships and caste statuses, and determine the villager's rights to participation at local levels. Considering a few of the major constituents of these power structures, as an integrated whole, this chapter has analysed the multidimensional process of social exclusion that prevents the full participation of Kammiss from the mainstream social and political activities in their villages. The social and political contexts of the villages are interlinked and jointly determine the rights to participation of the members of different Zamindar and Kammi Bidadaris. The interaction between Zamindars and Kammiss, the two major caste divisions, results in the social marginalization of Kammiss at different levels in the village life. The analysis has detailed how Kammiss are often detached from the social relationships and institutional participation in the village because of their lower standing on the caste hierarchy. While the caste organization of the Punjabi villages is weakening as a result of the decline in traditional caste occupations and Seyp system, caste and Biradari associations still play a significant role in defining the interaction patterns among villagers and their rights to participation at local levels.

The system of political patronage forms the bases of power relationships in Punjabi villages, and plays a part in upholding the Biradari associations of the villagers and thus the caste organization of a Punjabi village. Electoral politics and the resulting contacts between the politicians and the representatives of different Zamindar Bidadaris play a significant part in determining the power relationships at a local level. In other words, local Zamindar Bidadaris and politically influential persons are the major interest groups in the patronage networks and their interest associations organize this system of patronage. Electoral politics in Punjabi villages and the voting behaviour of the villagers are contingent on the Biradari and caste affiliations. Local Zamindar Bidadaris serve as pressure groups and play important roles in the election campaigns of different politicians. Elections are seen as occasions where patronage networks between

politicians and local influential Zamindars develop and operate. In return for Zamindar Biradari's support in elections, politicians assist them in police and courtside problems and do out patronage in attaining public sector jobs, welfare funds and loans, and development schemes for their villages. This system of patronage empowers Zamindar Biradaris at local level by facilitating their authority to control the collective village affairs. Political patronage exists as a structural reality in Punjabi villages and the villagers believe that the justice only comes through the contacts. The system of patronage operates at different levels in the village setting and links the members of local Zamindar Biradaris with political influential through their Biradari representatives. It increases the dependency of individual members on their groups and thus strengthens the Biradari associations at local level. Interest groups in the system of patronage express their contacts with each other in different ways. Ceremonial occasions are seen as one of those ways through which such associations are expressed. Kammiss are usually missing from the networks of political patronage and as a result their rights to participate in social and political affairs are also restricted. They are excluded from the collective village affairs e.g. decision making processes and ceremonial occasions in Zamindar's houses. Moreover, Kammiss face a number of different problems in accessing the state institutions i.e. police stations, public sector job market, and rights to benefit from the welfare funds and schemes. However, Kammiss would develop different types of patronage relationships with Zamindars of their villages in order to address their social and economic needs. However the caste structures in Punjabi villages are changing and Kammiss are entering the system of political patronage with time, though still at a limited level.

The caste organization of the villages and caste based power relationships are more persistent in the irrigated zone than the arid zone of Punjab. Besides the Seyp system, the Dera is seen as an institution that largely organizes the village life in the irrigated zone and is an expression of Zamindar's control over collective village affairs. The relationships of power and patronage are managed through the Dera system. On the other hand, the Dera system did not exist in the arid zone's villages. It has already been discussed in chapter five how the extensive agricultural activity strengthens the caste organization of a village, and thus the caste based power structures, in the irrigated zone of Punjab.

Chapter Seven

Intersectionality - Caste and Gender

Power Relations in Contemporary Punjabi Villages – Changing Patterns

7.1. Introduction

This chapter looks at the intersectionality of caste and gender in the context of a Punjabi village and explains how the power relations embedded in the caste memberships of the villagers influence their gender identities and social interactions in the community setting. At the outset, the chapter discusses how the masculine identities of Kammis and Zamindars are implicated in the caste based socio-cultural, economic, and political dynamics of a Punjabi village. It is explained how the constructs of masculine Izzat and status in a caste society involve the ability to ensure group protection, the politics of revenge, and features of control and influence over others as individual/group. The chapter then analyses the construction of femininity across Kammi and Zamindar women in terms of their castes. The features of compliance and protection of reputation associated with sexuality form the basis of emphasized femininity in villages and the chapter explains how the privileges to practice the cultural ideals of femininity could involve the caste memberships of women. The changing dynamics of masculinity and femininity among Kammis are also examined and it is mentioned that the better off and educated Kammis are upholding the norms and practices associated with Zamindars. Finally, the chapter analyses how the patterns of gendered experiences of the villagers differ across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages of Punjab.

7.2. Intersectionality of Caste and Class

This chapter looks at how the caste and gender interact in the context of a Punjabi village to place men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms at different locations of gender-caste hierarchy. Before that, it is important to consider the intersectionality of caste and class in order to explore its relation with gender as another dimension of gender-caste identity among the villagers. The findings of the previous two chapters suggest that while the caste statuses of the members of Kammi and Zamindar Quoms do not change, social mobility in occupational, educational, and economic terms and thus the class position is possible within a caste group which plays a significant part in determining the villager's rights to participation in the collective village affairs and the roles of leaderships and patronage. Hence, the material positions of the villagers cannot be completely ignored while examining the gendered positions of

dominance and subordination in a caste society of rural Punjab. It suggests that the class standing in a caste society may have consequences for life chances, especially amongst Kammiss (Hurst, 2007; Lemert, 2004).

As discussed in chapter 5, better off and educated Kammiss do not get involved in menial work and labour relations and their direct economic dependence on Zamindars reduces considerably. As a result, they do not engage in the asymmetrical social interactions with Zamindars in the village setting that frequently. Chapter 6 has explored how the educated and better off Kammiss have more rights to participation in the ceremonial occasions in Zamindar's houses. Zamindars invite better off and educated Kammiss as guests at the weddings, which indicates their higher standing on the status hierarchy compared with labourer Kammiss. It suggests how the educated and better off Kammiss are garnered more rights to Izzat and respect in the village life. Educated and better off Kammiss in the irrigated zone's village emphasized that they do not visit the Dera of Zamindars, a place that is seen as promoting the caste discrimination against Kammiss. Furthermore, such Kammiss start uniting their Biradaris in order to prove their group significance, especially in the elections, initiate the process of collective decision making, and assume the leadership roles at Biradari level. Similarly, having financial resources, the educated and better off Kammiss are in a better position, compared with other Kammiss, to approach the state institutions. The socio-economic position of Kammiss in the arid zone's village was much better in comparison to their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village, and as a result more Kammiss in the arid zone's village were positioned higher in the status hierarchy. Though they remain a subordinate caste identity, the above discussion shows how the better off and educated Kammiss can manoeuvre the social situations in their favour through their class standing.

While the Zamindars in the villages under study are not divided into strict material hierarchies, their class standings, e.g. size of their landholdings and educational achievements, may have consequences for their life chances in the village setting. Zamindars with large landholdings acquire the roles of patronage and leadership, establish their Dera, represent their Biradaris, and control the collective village affairs and systems of political patronage (Lyon, 2004). Having the financial resources, they can entertain more people to extend their influence in the village, area, and official circles (Eglar, 1960). Through their extravagance and generosity in spending on others, they command respect and authority. Chapter 6 has discussed how the better off Zamindars assuming the leadership roles act as a bridge between the politically

influential and the villagers, especially their Biradari members, which suggests the interplay of local and regional power structures and identities (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). These locally influential Zamindars invite the politically influential of their area on the ceremonial occasions in their Bidadaris to develop contacts with them or to express and strengthen their existing contacts. Furthermore, the villagers associate status with the professions achieved through an education and thus uplifting the class standing of individuals. While looking at the intersectionality of caste and gender, this chapter also discusses how the interplay between caste and class interact with gender to produce different shades of social identity, especially among men and women from Kammi Quoms, which also affect the dynamics of their asymmetrical social interactions with Zamindars in the village settings.

7.3. Caste, Masculinities, and Power Relations

While looking at the masculinities and gender based violence in Indian Punjab, Dagar (2002) suggested that it is not only the gender structure of a society that shapes masculinities rather the socio-cultural ethos, economic and political processes also influence the construction of masculinity in that society. The power structures originating from the possession of land influence the social activity that play a significant part in determining masculinities in Indian Punjab. Leach (1994) also viewed the masculinity as a gender identity that is constructed socially, historically and politically and learned through participation in a society and its institutions. Similarly, the present research explains how the structural features organized around the caste statuses, Biradari organization, power dynamics at the local level, system of political patronage, and possession of land play a role in shaping the masculinities across Kammi and Zamindars in a Punjabi village.

Leach (1994) considered that the quality of a theory about politics of masculinity depends upon its treatment of power relations. The present research deals with the politics of masculinity in Punjabi villages within the framework of power relationships between Zamindars and Kammi in the village setting. In order to understand the political significance of caste based masculinities, the present research involves an analysis of how the masculinities are implicated in the power structures configured around the caste organization of a Punjabi village. Hence, this study examines gender as a relational construct in a caste society. It should be useful to mention at this point that the present analysis focuses on the way masculinities are expressed in the community

sphere of a village, instead of the domestic sphere. In addition, the power relationships between men may often be more visible compared with the power relationships across genders, i.e. men to women. However, the researcher also discusses how the power politics within the same genders play a part in shaping the relationships across genders and vice versa.

This research employs the fundamental features of the theory of hegemonic masculinity to explore the combination of the plurality of masculinities and the hierarchy of masculinities in the context of a Punjabi village. Looking at the construction of masculinity across Kammi and Zamindar men, this chapter understands the culturally idealized form of masculine character i.e. hegemonic masculinity in a Punjabi village and the way caste memberships of Kammi and Zamindar men mediate their ability to comply with the hegemonic form of masculinity, and thus producing multiple masculinities. Applying another concept of the theory of hegemonic masculinity, it is explained how Zamindar masculinity is more socially central and more associated with social power and authority than Kammi masculinity. Construction of hegemonic masculinity in the community sphere of a Punjabi village is configured around the expressions of honour (Izzat/Ghairat), caste status, influence, power, competitiveness, and individual/group dominance. However, honour¹³, Izzat, can be seen as one of the primary factors defining hegemonic form of masculinity in Punjabi villages. While the caste membership of Zamindar men facilitate them to comply with these norms of hegemonic masculinity, it is explained how Kammi men cannot conform to the normative ideals of male behaviour because of their subordinate position in status and power hierarchy and thus they are a marginalized masculine identity. Furthermore, this research supports the idea of the theory of harmonic masculinity that the hierarchy of masculinities is a pattern of hegemony, and not a pattern involving simple domination through force. Considering this pattern of hegemony, it is explored how Zamindar masculinity is featured around the cultural consent, institutionalization, discursive

¹³ Like Biradari, the local term "Izzat" translated as honour is a flexible term, and is used differently in different contexts in Punjab. While looking at the dynamics of power and patronage in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) views Izzat as a right to a certain kind of respect in return for certain kinds of behaviours and certain inherent properties of the individual and his or her group affiliations (Lyon, 2004:20). While Lyon (2004) uses the Urdu word Izzat, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) proposed Ghairat as more appropriate word for referring to the masculine honour associated with woman. However, other forms of masculine honour i.e. associated with control, influence, or dominance are called as Izzat. Both the Urdu words Izzat and Ghairat can be translated as honour in English and are central to the definition of hegemonic masculinity in Punjabi villages. At times, Izzat is also translated as prestige or respect.

centrality, and marginalization of alternatives, and not simply the assertion of status through oppression and force (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005).

On the other side, the theory of hegemonic masculinity is criticized for essentializing the male character, imposing a false unity on a fluid process of social construction of masculinities, and deemphasizing the issues of power and domination by providing an overly simplified and static model for the social relationships involving contesting masculinities (Collinson and Hearn, 1994; Demetriou, 2001; MacInnes, 1998). The theory proposes the ideals of male behaviour that do not correspond closely to the lives of actual men (Connell, 2005; Donaldson, 1993). Addressing this criticism, this chapter analyses the construction of masculinity across Kammi and Zamindar men around the issues of power and domination, and its changing dynamics. This research considers a more holistic view of the gender hierarchy and recognizes the agency of Kammi Quoms as much as the power of Zamindar Quoms, and the mutual conditioning of gender dynamics and other social dynamics i.e. caste, class, and region (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). The two major types of caste based masculinity are not divided into a static typology of masculinities, but rather it is explained how Kammi and Zamindar men can be multilayered masculine subjects in the real life context of a Punjabi village and thus not essentializing the male character. It is analysed how the educated and better off Kammis manipulate the social situations in their favour to some extent and, as a result, the dynamics of their masculinity are changing over time. Rather than developing an ideal type of masculinity, this research explores how the power structures in a caste society position Kammi and Zamindar men in a masculine hierarchy. The characteristics of hegemonic form of masculinity are contextual/ local and signify the interplay of gender dynamics and power structures in a caste society of a Punjabi village. Moreover, this research does not look at the relations among masculinities and their hierarchy merely on the basis of the patriarchal subordination of women but rather focuses on the structural basis of women subordination in a caste society (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; Holter, 2003).

7.3.1. Ability to Ensure Group's Protection – Caste, Politics of Revenge (Competitiveness), and Masculinity

Lyon (2004) explains that in Punjabi villages, the rights to respect and honour are bestowed only if an individual may comply with certain kind of obligations. However, not all actions garnering respect to an individual always imply honour. For example, if a person fulfils his religious obligations as a Muslim and is polite in his dealings with

others but cannot protect his family against competitors, his Izzat being a man is questioned in society despite his good deeds. On the other hand, a person with bad habits as an individual e.g. womanising, drinking, carrying guns can ensure protection of his family, serves his group's interests, and proves himself an effective head of his family/Biradari is seen as a man who has Izzat, though the person may be denied some other kind of Izzat in society (Lyon, 2004).

The majority of respondents, Zamindar and Kammi in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages, considered that the Kammi men are generally helpless to ensure their family protection, especially against Zamindars. There can be a number of different disputes among Zamindars and Kammis in a Punjabi village. However, the respondents (e.g. Iqbal, 27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the most common of these disputes are concerned with the physical violence against Kammis or issues of honour i.e. a Zamindar man commits sexual assault against a Kammi woman or elopes with her. As discussed in chapter 3, in Pakistani society, women's actions, body, and sexuality are associated with the family honour and men in the family are considered liable to protect that honour (Encyclopaedia of Women's History, 1994; Irfan, 2008). Hence, in their honour related disputes with Zamindars, Kammi men are expected to respond to the perpetrators of sexual assault against their women, otherwise their masculine honour is questioned in society. However, the majority of respondents believed that Kammi men would be helpless to act in response, if a Zamindar commits sexual assault against their women or physical violence against any of their group members. It is important to uncover the power dynamics that produce the social relationships positioning Kammis at a subordinate masculine identity and, as a result, Kammi men are helpless to ensure their group protection against Zamindars. The respondents explained how the notions of masculinity across Kammis and Zamindars are implicated in their caste memberships and the caste based power structures in the village. When asked how Kammi men would respond to a Zamindar man who commits sexual assault against their women, Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) said:

A Kammi man cannot do anything except crying and sitting silent in his house. If there is such problem in my family I will not be able to register an FIR in police station against any of Zamindars of my village. Police will not register it since they know that I am a Kammi and my worth is 2 aanay (pennies), not more than that. My worth is 2 aanay I know myself. So it is useless to go to police. In this situation of helplessness, it is rather better for Kammis to remain silent and protect themselves from further humiliation.

Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) added, if the matter becomes public, Zamindars usually place the blame on Kammi woman since it is easy for them to target her character for being a Kammi, who are lower and subjugated ones. Besides, they know that the Kammi men are helpless to retaliate against them for placing such blame on their women. Kammis may rather be persecuted if they raise their voice to get justice. Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) emphasized that no one in the village stands in favour of Kammis on such issues and, as a result, Kammis have no option but to give up:

In such cases, if Kammi men confront Zamindars in order to get justice, they may face persecution for raising their voice. Whole village would unite against Kammis. There comes Biradarism, political links, land, and caste status. Zamindars would not consider truth or justice, but they support the powerful one and their own relatives (Biradari members), since they may also require other's support in the time of need. Therefore, Zamindars do not support Kammis against their Biradari or a powerful party.

Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) mentioned that Kammis try to keep such affairs, i.e. sexual assaults against their women by a Zamindar, hidden since they are helpless to take revenge or report the matter in police station.

As discussed in chapter 3, the theory of intersectionality seeks to examine how the relationships between socio-cultural categories and social identities result in the social hierarchies producing systematic social inequality in a society. While the theory originally focussed on the different forms of social exploitation against women, the concept of intersectionality has increasingly been used to analyse the marginalized positions and different shades of social inequality by focussing on the questions of power in terms of exclusion and inclusion (Knudsen, 2006). It has been employed to understand the social structures, social processes, and social representations around the issues of power, difference, and inequality producing marginalized social positions and identities in a society. The theory of intersectionality provides a classical model for the conceptualization of social oppression in different societies and advocates that the social categories and identities e.g. gender, race, class, and religion do not act independently but are interrelated and signify the intersection of multiple forms of social discrimination (Cheng, 1999; Crenshaw, 1995; Mahalingam, 2007). Similarly, in the above discussion, Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) explains how the marginalized male category and masculine identity emerges among Kammis as a result of their restricted rights to inclusion in the caste based power structures. The above quotations clearly indicate how the subordinate masculine identity of Kammis is implicated in the power structures and social processes revolving around the complex web of caste statuses,

Biradarism, local politics, systems of patronage, and inequitable institutional procedures especially police. These power structures defining the hegemonic and the subordinate masculine identities are directly connected to the mechanisms of inclusion and exclusion. The first quote highlights the feelings of helplessness of a Kammi man who straightforwardly recognized the marginalized masculinity of Kammi men in Punjabi villages. Discussing the inability of Kammi men to ensure their group protection, the majority of Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages talked about the caste based power dynamics pointed out by Riaz. An influential Zamindar Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammis do not practice honour revenge, especially honour killing, since they do not have any political links, social influence, Biradari support, and monetary resources to deal with, and manipulate, the legal procedures at police stations and courts. This shows how the intersectionality of caste and gender works as a system of social oppression against Kammi Quoms in a Punjabi village. Considering the theory of hegemonic masculinity, the above discussion also suggests how Zamindar masculinity is more socially central and more associated with power and authority than Kammi masculinity. However, more importantly, the data supports the idea of the theory of hegemonic masculinity that the hierarchy of masculinities is a pattern of hegemony and not a pattern involving simple domination through force. The above analysis indicates how the power structures in a Punjabi village shape the pattern of hegemony placing Zamindars at a higher position in masculine hierarchy.

While the majority of Zamindar respondents considered that Kammis generally do not commit honour killing, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) referred to an incident in a nearby village and suggested that Kammis may, at times, kill their women if found guilty e.g. if she elopes with a Zamindar or Kammi man. However, all of the Zamindar respondents in both villages mentioned that Kammis would not kill the perpetrators of sexual assault against their women or the men who eloped with their women. On the other hand, Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) highlighted that Kammis may react harshly, though not killing, if they are in dispute on honour issues with other Kammis, or, at times, with poor Zamindars.

Nazar (63, Kammi man, arid zone) pointed towards an important dimension of masculinity among Kammis and emphasized that Kammis are also conscious about their masculine honour, Ghairat, linked with their women, like Zamindars. However, they cannot always comply with the obligations associated with such honour due to their

lower standing on the caste hierarchy, poverty, or dependency on Zamindars. Having the same opinion, Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) highlighted that even the most disadvantaged men in a Punjabi village cannot neglect the sexual/physical assaults against their women but would only respond taking into consideration their own social, political, and financial position and the social standing of the perpetrator. It was suggested that Kammis express their dissent, even if they are helpless to take revenge. They may even migrate from the village in case of a serious matter e.g. rape against a Kammi woman.

Everyone, Kammis and Zamindars, have similar Ghairat associated with their women, and everyone would protect it, regardless of their Quoms. But Kammis may not always be able to retaliate if they are in dispute on honour issues with influential Zamindars, since they do not have resources, influence, or political links (Nazar, 63, Kammi man, arid zone).

The above analysis shows how Kammis in Punjabi villages do not have the choice to comply with certain aspects of masculinity that conform to dominant masculine norms i.e. taking honour revenge from Zamindars or honour killing.

The concept of hegemonic masculinity has been criticized for providing an unsatisfactory theory of the masculine subject. It is argued that the theory presumes a unitary subject, which is a fluid category in practice, and articulates loosely with the practical compositions of masculinities as ways of living in the everyday life of a cultural context (Wetherell and Edley, 1999). Critics suggest that the masculine subject is a multilayered and divided and thus a complex subject of gender practice. Men can dodge among multiple social meanings in order to reconcile and negotiate their position in the social relationships, and they take up the hegemonic norms of masculinity strategically (Collier, 1998; Jefferson, 1994). Hence, it is argued that the hegemonic form of masculinity cannot be seen as a settled character structure of any group of men (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). Similarly, the above discussion by the respondents suggests how Kammi men can take up the hegemonic norms of masculinity strategically; they should not be presumed as unitary masculine subjects. Referring to the caste based power structures in the context of a Punjabi village Nazar (63, Kammi man, arid zone) highlights how Kammi men can be multilayered and divided masculine subjects. Kammi men do not compromise on their Izzat associated with their women but they may not always be able to comply with the obligations associated with protecting this Izzat because of their subordinate position in the power structures. Nevertheless, they react using other ways e.g. expressing their dissent or migrating from the village. In the same way, while they are generally helpless to retaliate against perpetrators, Falaksher

(35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammi men may kill their women, if found guilty, to give a signal that they are conscious about their Izzat and thus adopting the hegemonic norms of masculinity. This suggests how Kammi men can dodge among multiple social meanings in order to negotiate their social position in the village environment. Hence, the practices of hegemonic form of masculinity i.e. protecting the honour associated with women and masculine Ghairat cannot be understood as the settled character structure of Zamindar men.

Besides honour related issues, the respondents mentioned that the Kammi men are generally helpless to protect themselves and their family members against verbal abuse of and physical assaults committed by Zamindars, especially those working as labour. Narrating a recent incident, Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone), working as housemaid in Zamindar's houses, explained how a Zamindar man used disrespectful language towards her in the presence of her husband and their guests:

Because of guests at my place, I took a day leave and informed to Ali's wife that I will not come to work at their house. Ali (Zamindar man) got annoyed over it, since his wife was pregnant and was not able to do household tasks. He came to our house, shouted at me, and used very disrespectful language in presence of guests. My husband was also present but could not stop him.

Rizwan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) believed that Zamindar men and women exercise more influence over Kammis who work as their service provider than their own family members owing to their dependency, poverty, and lower social standing. The above discussion shows how the caste and gender interact to produce the subordinate masculine identity among Kammis. However, it is important to consider that the above analysis focussed on the Kammis still involved in their caste works or other low graded tasks. The following section explains how the dynamics of masculinity among better off and educated Kammis are changing in the context of a Punjabi village.

The honour issues involving Zamindar women result in severe disputes among concerned groups, longstanding enmities, and even revenge killings. Discussing the honour disputes among Zamindars, nearly all of the respondents in the irrigated zone referred to a recent incident of honour killing in their village in which a Zamindar Biradari killed three young men of another Zamindar Biradari. A longstanding enmity between both Zamindar Biradaris started a few years ago, when a young man from one Biradari eloped with a young woman from other Biradari, and they got married. Furthermore, the respondents suggested that Zamindars may commit honour killing of

their women as well, who elope with a man and thus bring shame to family. Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) emphasised if Zamindars do not kill such women, the villagers would call them dishonourable. Hence, Zamindars commit honour killing in order to defend their reputation in society. It shows how the culturally constructed notions of masculine honour, Ghairat, compel Zamindars to commit an unlawful act (Irfan, 2008). It also suggests that the socially constructed ideals have more influence over behaviours of the villagers, than the legal constraints. Istikar (58, Zamindars man, irrigated zone) described it as follows:

Zamindars do not restrain from committing honour killing and going to jail or court if their honour (associated with their women) is questioned. Only a Baigairat (with no Ghairat) will not react. But it is not possible that a person will not react if his Ghairat is challenged.

Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how the ones killing in the name of honour may acquire the backing of their Biradaris. Biradari members unite on such incidents and take a collective decision to deal with the legal procedures in police stations and courts using political links or financial resources. It suggests how the honour revenges/killings are tolerated as a culturally justified practice in the Punjabi villages. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) added, if Zamindars kill their own girls in the name of honour, the matter is not generally disclosed or reported to Police, and they may easily avoid any legal procedures against them. However, police get involved if one Zamindar Biradari commits honour killing against other Zamindar Biradari as revenge.

As discussed in chapter 3, social learning theory advocates that the aggression and violent behaviours reinforced by the social environment are the most important source of behaviour modelling and are learned during the course of socialization (Groth 1983; O'Leary 1988; Ormrod, 1999; Pagelow 1981). Individuals expect positive reinforcements for modelling such behaviour e.g. gaining social acceptance or praise of others, and building self esteem (Siegel, 1992). Similarly, the above discussion shows how committing an act of violence in the name of honour involves the positive social reinforcements in the context of a Punjabi village. The men villagers commit the honour killing to protect their Izzat in the village setting. In a society which places a high premium on Izzat, both individual and group (Lyon, 2004), committing an act of violence to protect Izzat is seen as an act involving positive social reinforcements. Furthermore, the local power structures organized around the Biradarism, social and political patronage, caste statuses, and economic resources reinforce the practice of

honour revenge and exaggerate the notions of masculine Ghairat and Izzat among Zamindar men. In the above discussion, the respondents explain how protecting the Izzat/Ghairat associated with sexuality of women in family is an admired attribute of men, who acquire the social support and backing of their Biradari members to avoid any legal procedures in police and courts. It is highlighted that the inability to protect this Izzat questions the masculinity of a man and brings shame to family. This suggests how Zamindar men in a Punjabi village learn the aggression tactics and violent behaviours as part of their masculine identity during the course of their socialization, which is reinforced by the social environment.

Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) considered that the narratives and practices of honour revenge among Zamindar Quoms in Punjabi villages have symbolic meanings and serve as a signal to others in the village that Zamindars are capable of defending their family honour. Abdullah believed that such signals also play a role in ensuring the protection of Zamindar's women in the village sphere. Having the same views, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said:

A Kammi or even a Zamindar man would not extend hand towards Zamindar's women that easily. They know the revenge; they know an FIR will be registered or they may take away and humiliate a woman from my family.

However, the above discussion stresses the ideals of hegemonic masculinity among Zamindars, and the respondents explained how the members of Zamindar Quoms, at times, may deviate from these principles. For example, Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) mentioned that a Zamindar family in their village did not kill their young woman who eloped with a man from another Zamindar Biradari. They instead arranged her marriage right away. Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggested that, at times, Zamindars would rather prefer to keep such matters hidden i.e. sexual assaults against their women, unless of serious nature, since making it public brings bad name to the family. On the other hand, Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone) thought that even if Zamindars kept the matter hidden, they would take revenge using indirect means e.g. spreading rumours about the perpetrator's women or committing physical violence against the perpetrator by creating any reason for doing it. However, Zamindars who deviate from the ideals of hegemonic masculinity and show their inability or disinterest to protect their family's honour are considered as disreputable among villagers. Ahsen (45, Zamindar man, arid zone) highlighted that the people call such Zamindar men

Baigairat, who do not care about their Gairat, and they are not respected in the village setting.

Critics of the theory of hegemonic masculinity suggest exploring the internal complexities of masculinities and identifying the potential internal contradictions within the practices that construct masculinities, which cannot be understood through a unitary masculine subject. Hegemonic masculinity may characterize compromise formations between contradictory choices or the misjudgements about the costs and benefits of different gender strategies (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; Schwalbe, 1992). It is observed that such contradictory commitments within the practices of hegemonic masculinity also hold the seeds of change (Meuser, 2001). Similarly, the above discussion by different respondents mentions the internal complexities of Zamindar masculinity in the context of a Punjabi village, who may apply diverse gender strategies to address similar situations associated with masculine Izzat. While retaliating against the perpetrators of sexual assault against their women is considered as the most common response among Zamindar men, they may, at times, keep such matters hidden in order to protect their Izzat. However, if the sexual assault is already publicised, they would rather go for honour revenge. This suggests that the protection of Izzat, which is the foremost norm of hegemonic masculinity in Punjabi context, may involve contradictory choices. Similarly, as told by Rukhsana, a Zamindar family arranged the marriage of their young woman, who eloped with a young Zamindar man, rather than committing an act of honour killing. Hence, it is important to explore the potential internal contradictions within the practices that construct hegemonic masculinity or represent a certain group of men.

The respondents in both villages referred to an interesting dimension of masculine honour, Gairat. If an outsider, e.g. a man from a nearby village, commits sexual violence against a woman or has an illegal sexual affair with her, the respondents suggested that it questions the honour of the whole village. The villagers would especially react if the incident took place inside the boundaries of their village, irrespective of the caste group of victim woman. Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) said:

Honour of the whole village is questioned, if an outsider commits an act of sexual assault against or has an illegal sexual affair with a woman of their village. In such cases, no one considers the Quom of woman, either she belongs to Zamindars or Kammis, and everyone would react. Villagers will beat the perpetrator or hand over to police.

The above discussion shows how the caste structures in Punjabi village facilitate the Zamindar men to conform to the dominant masculine norms and remain complicit in sustaining the hegemonic model of masculinity.

7.3.1.1. Changing Patterns of Masculinities and Politics of Revenge

All of the respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages talked about the changing patterns of masculinity among educated and better off Kammiss. However, it was mentioned that they are always labelled as Kammiss owing to their parentage occupations and placed lower on the caste hierarchy. It was important to investigate how the educated and better off Kammiss view their ability to ensure their group/family protection. Some educated/better off young Kammiss (e.g. Asif, 28, Kammi man, irrigated zone) highlighted that they would not restrain from taking revenge if a Zamindar challenges their honour associated with the women or commits physical violence against them or their family members. Similarly, a few of the older Kammiss (e.g. Sultan, 53, Kammi man, irrigated zone) suggested that:

Traditional caste relations between Zamindars and Kammiss have nearly ended. Young Kammi men may not care about any Chaudhary now, if their honour (related with women) is questioned; they would behave aggressively towards the perpetrators of sexual assaults against their women.

Furthermore, the young Kammi boys considered that Zamindars and Kammiss would respond towards perpetrators of violence against their family members in a similar way, since traditional caste structures have almost ended in the villages. Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone) highlighted that Kammiss were helpless to react against Zamindars in the past, owing to their direct dependence on them. However, Kammiss are becoming independent to earn their livelihood and, as a result, their relationships with Zamindars of their village are also changing. Gulsher stressed that Kammiss nowadays condemn Zamindars oppressive conduct, and may also react if Zamindars commit violence against them or their family members. Conversely, Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone) also mentioned that only a small segment of Kammiss in Punjabi villages is educated or better off and a large majority of them are still involved in low graded tasks and work as service providers for Zamindars.

However, considering the caste based power structures in contemporary Punjabi villages, it seems unlikely that Kammiss may retaliate against Zamindars of their village on honour issues. There was no evidence in either of the villages under study when Kammiss had taken revenge or committed honour killing against Zamindars, even

though all of the respondents admitted the high potentials of sexual assaults against Kammi women in the village setting. Furthermore, the respondents narrated some incidents when educated/better off Kammis faced the oppressive and violent conduct of Zamindars in the village setting but were helpless to react, though such incidents are less likely. Besides, the educated and better off Kammi respondents mentioned a number of difficulties they could face in accessing the police stations or getting justice through the village councils because of their lower social standing on the caste hierarchy. Nevertheless, the educated and better off Kammi are securer, compared with Kammis working as labour, against the physical violence or disrespectful conduct of Zamindars since their direct dependence on Zamindars of their village reduces.

On the other hand, the changing patterns of masculinities among Kammis, as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures, cannot be overlooked. It becomes clearer in the following sections how the educated and better off Kammi men in the Punjabi villages have upheld certain norms and practices associated with the hegemonic form of masculinity. Similarly, looking at the masculinities and violence in Indian Punjab, Dagar (2002) said that:

Dominance of the peasantry, in particular the Jat Sikhs, for the construction of masculinities is pronounced in Punjab. However, with increasing economic growth and subsequent increases in income for some Scheduled castes, there is a process of Scheduled castes upholding norms and practices of the dominant groups.

Though the construction of masculinity in Punjabi context cannot be understood by completely divorcing it from the material positions (Lyon, 2004), caste seems to be the primary, and only, criterion that bestows choices to villagers to practice certain aspects of hegemonic forms of masculinity. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that even educated and better off Kammis may not always ensure their family protection against Zamindars since they are an excluded social group in the power structures of a village. It would also be difficult for them to get justice in police station against Zamindars of their village. Similarly, Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) highlighted that even the educated and better off Kammis cannot acquire the leaderships roles and control over collective village affairs in a Punjabi village. As discussed in chapter 5, while the better off Kammis own land, they are not given the status of being Zamindar. Iqbal highlighted that Kammis can never uplift their social standing while residing in a village where their forefathers had worked as service providers of the Zamindars.

Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) referred to another important dimension of Kammi's masculine identity as a group and explained how the educated and better off Kammis in Punjabi villages are trying to unite their Biradaris in order to establish their group significance. Taking into account the power dynamics of Punjabi villages, Kammis have started taking collective decisions as groups in order to influence the village environment on the occasions like elections. Ulfat emphasized that Kammis are learning with time how to protect their group interests against Zamindars of their village:

Educated and better off Kammis are trying to strengthen their group identity. In our village son of a carpenter is educated and has a job in city, he represents his Biradari now. They are uniting as groups to get some importance in village. But more importantly, they have started resolving their disputes on their own and consult Zamindars if indispensable. Zamindar's perception about them, as groups and individuals, is changing since their dependence on Zamindars is lessening with time. In near future they may be able to react as a group in case of their disputes with Zamindars.

This quotation indicates the significance of group unity in the power structures of a Punjabi village. It also suggests how the group association and group influence play a role in shaping the masculine identities among villagers.

This section on the changing patterns of masculinities and politics of revenge explains how the subordinate masculinity of Kammis exists in tension with and has the ability to impact the hegemonic masculinity of Zamindars. One of the main limitations of the theory of hegemonic masculinity is that it does not consider how the non-hegemonic masculinities penetrate and challenge the hegemonic masculinity (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; Demetriou, 2001). On the other hand, the above discussion suggests that the Kammi masculinity always tries to confront the Zamindar masculinity in the context of a Punjabi village. Especially the educated and better off Kammi men start upholding the norms associated with the dominant form of masculinity and develop an ability to challenge Zamindar's dominance at individual and group levels. It is important to note, as suggested by Ulfat in the above quotation, that Zamindar men have also started realizing that the Kammi men can challenge Zamindar masculinity through their group unity and by increasing their socio-economic standing. Hence, the hegemonic form of masculinity does not exist as a unitary pattern, but it is challenged by marginalized masculinities and there is a continuing process of reconfiguration, translation, and negotiation.

7.3.1.2. Local Discourses of Caste Based Masculinities

Discussing the construction and practices of masculinity in the Punjabi villages, Zamindar respondents explained how the narratives of and proverbs about masculinity are associated differently with Kammis and Zamindars. Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned while the local discourses of masculinity portray Zamindars as Gairatmand, protector, brave, and aggressive, Kammis are described as cowardly, subordinate, and even disreputable as men. For example, one of the few proverbs quoted by Zamindar respondents in order to describe the masculine honour of Kammis says:

Kammis are Kammis because there is a Kammi (shortage) in them and that Kammi¹⁴ (shortage) is of any honour or self respect. They do not care what happens to their women in the village sphere (Furkan, 28, Zamindar man, arid zone).

Similarly, while looking at the construction of masculinities and violence in Indian Punjab, Dagar (2002) highlighted that it was common to hear in local discourse that the Jats are not cowardly people like scheduled castes¹⁵ who cannot protect their women in the community environment. Raheel (44, Zamindar man, arid zone) considered that the local discourses rightly depict the characteristics of masculinity across Zamindars and Kammis, and also play a part in shaping their masculine identities.

These narratives, proverbs, and other local discourses may not always create reality but can certainly change the perceptions about reality and allow villagers the flexibility to renegotiate and reconcile their own positions in the social relationships (Lyon, 2004). Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) emphasized that the local discourses of masculinity play a significant role in shaping the perceptions of villagers about the ability of Kammi or Zamindar men to retaliate against competitors. Abdullah considered that the local discourses of Kammi's subordinate masculinity and their inability to retaliate add to the potentials of sexual violence against their women in the village setting.

Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) pointed towards an important dimension of the phenomenon and suggested that the potentials of sexual assaults against Kammi women

¹⁴ In Punjabi language, the word "Kammi" also means the shortage.

¹⁵ The term "scheduled castes" refers to the communities or Jatis who are untouchables in India and are also known as the Dalits and placed lowest on the caste hierarchy. They are historically disadvantaged groups, comprising around 15 % of the total population in India (Sharma, 2004; Dutt, 1965; Government of India, 2001).

may always be present in the village settings but its frequency in narratives is exaggerated. While the narratives imply a strong component of violence in the Punjabi villages, the daily life situation is very different (Lyon, 2004). In addition, it seems that the expected responses of Kammi and Zamindar men towards the perpetrators of sexual assaults against their women are over generalized in the local discourses. Hence, it is important to understand the factors constituting these discourses. The researcher argues that the construction of local discourses, on the above mentioned phenomenon, as a social reality should not be interpreted in isolation but within the complex web of caste structures, power relations at the local level, inequitable state institutions especially police, and the system of patronage serving interests of different social groups.

In conclusion certain rights to masculine honour and respect are associated with the ability to ensure group (family/Biradari) protection against competitors, and thus the politics of revenge. Looking at the intersectionality of caste and gender, the masculinities across Zamindars and Kammis are implicated in the caste based power structures configured around the complex web of caste statuses, Biradarism, inadequate institutional procedures especially police, local politics and system of patronage. These caste based power structures position Kammis at a subordinate masculine identity in the village sphere. They are mostly unable to comply with the obligations associated with cultural ideals of hegemonic masculinity because of their lower standing on the caste hierarchy. Correspondingly, Kammis are generally helpless to ensure their group (family/Biradari) protection against Zamindars of their village. As a result, they are denied certain rights to honour and respect as men in the village sphere. Conversely, the power structures are supportive for Zamindars to conform to the obligations associated with hegemonic form of masculinity i.e. ensuring their group protection, and thus they are bestowed certain rights to masculine Izzat. However, the caste system is changing and Kammis are involving themselves in the power structures of their villages. The educated and better off Kammis are upholding the norms and practices associated with hegemonic masculinity with time. The local discourses and narratives portray masculine identities across Kammis and Zamindars, and could play a part to reinforce the potential of violence against Kammis.

7.3.2. Caste System, Features of Control and Influence, and Masculinity

7.3.2.1. Domestic and Public Characteristics of Masculinity: A Relationship?

Besides the ability to ensure a group's protection, the masculine honour in the context of a Punjabi village implies the features of control and influence in domestic and public sphere. Though the present research analyses the dynamics of masculinity and power relations within the community setting of Punjabi villages, it is important to understand how the domestic masculinity may play a role in shaping the public masculinity. Lyon (2004) mentioned control as the primary criterion of Punjabi's nations of Izzat and suggested that a man's control over his family garners him a minimum level of Izzat. Every extension of control outside the domestic sphere increases the level of his Izzat.

More than a few Zamindar and Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone's village considered that Kammi men are less able than Zamindar men to exert control over their families, especially women. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammi women work outside their domestic sphere as part of their caste obligations, Seyp contract (irrigated zone), or for earning their livelihood and thus contribute significantly in the household economy. While Kammi men do not have an edge over their women in terms of economic contributions, they have lesser rights to exert control over their women compared with Zamindar men who do not allow their women to do paid work in the community environment.

However, Ulfat belonged to the irrigated zone's village where none of the Zamindar women was doing any paid job, as discussed in chapter 5. Conversely, more than a few Zamindar women in the arid zone's village were involved in school teaching. Hence, considering the trends of doing paid jobs among Zamindar women of his village, Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone) suggested, though a man loses certain rights to exert control over his wife once she herself is an earning hand, it cannot be generalized only about Kammi men since many Zamindar women are also working as teachers.

Conversely, Tahir (37, Kammi man, arid zone) mentioned that it is not the paid work and contribution in the household economy but the nature of work a woman was doing in the community environment that shapes the masculine honour of a Kammi man or lessens his control over the women in family. Tahir added, when a Kammi woman works at Zamindar's houses, Dera, or on fields as Seypi or for paid labour, her male relatives, especially husband, lose self respect and honour. As a result, they are also denied the rights to exert influence over her or control her mobility since she is required

to move frequently in the community environment as part of her work obligations. Tahir (37, Kammi man, arid zone) said:

When wife of a Kammi steps out of the house to work in other's houses, he loses all his self respect and honour as a man. He has no rights to command her mobility or exercise influence over her now. Rather control on her is of the Zamindars she works for. That Kammi is recognized as a dishonourable man in the village setting, and people say his wife goes at every doorstep of the village to earn bread.

This shows how the ideals of masculinity in Punjabi villages are associated with the women in family. It indicates a relationship between domestic and public masculinity. An overwhelming majority of the respondents suggested that the paid labour of a woman in the village setting negatively affects the social repute of men associated with her. Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) highlighted that the Ghairat of a man who permits his women to visit every doorstep in the village for paid labour is questionable.

While Nazia (31, Kammi woman, arid zone) liked to consult her husband before starting a paid job in the village setting, Berkatay (44, Kammi women, irrigated zone) suggested that the majority of Kammi women do not always seek the permission of their husbands on such matters. Hence, Kammi men are denied the rights to command the mobility of their women while they work as paid labour in the village. Considering Lyon's argument, Kammi men whose women work as labour in the village setting are not garnered even the minimum level of masculine Izzat since they lack the rights to exert a complete control over their families, especially the mobility of their women.

Conversely, the women of educated and better off Kammis do not work as paid labour in the village setting. Arguably, they are garnered more Izzat as men compared with their counterparts whose women work in the community environment. It means that certain aspects of masculine honour and respect are not immutable in the caste society of Punjabi villages. While Kammi men are constrained by their caste identities/statuses as immutable parameters of social respect and honour, they can manoeuvre and manipulate situations to some extent within these parameters (Lyon, 2004).

It should be noted that more Kammis in the arid zone's village, than the irrigated zone's village, were in a position to uphold the norms associated with cultural ideals of masculine honour. The majority of Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were working on Seyp with Zamindars or involved in other low graded tasks, thus their women were also required to work as service providers. Conversely, more than a few Kammis in the

arid zone's village were doing respectable businesses or private/public sector jobs and their women were not working as paid labour in the village setting.

The concept of hegemonic masculinity has been criticized for dealing with the relations among masculinities and their hierarchy on the basis of patriarchal subordination of women and not the structural basis of women subordination. Holter (2003) emphasized to not deduce the relations among masculinities merely on the basis of the direct exercise of personal control by men over women. It is rather suggested to consider the role of cultural constructions, institutionalization of gender inequalities, and the interplay of gender dynamics with other social categories e.g. race, class, and region (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). Similarly, the above discussion highlights the importance of contextual dynamics of caste, class, and region in order to understand the gender hierarchy in the context of a Punjabi village. While Ulfat talks about the direct control of men over women as the primary factor determining men's rights to Izzat, Tahir and Gulsher contradict and suggest considering the nature of work a women doing in the community sphere that determines their men's position in masculine hierarchy. It is important to mention that the labour and other low grade jobs are associated with Kammi women, as part of their caste based obligations. Zamindar women consider it below their caste based pride to perform these tasks. It suggests how Zamindar men inherit some kind of dominance over Kammi men in masculine hierarchy through their caste membership and status. The class position of a Kammi family is seen as another important factor that plays a part in defining the relations between genders and their hierarchy. Women of educated and better off Kammis do not get involved in the low grade tasks and their men are garnered more rights to Izzat and thus a higher position in masculine hierarchy than the labourer Kammis. Nevertheless, the caste status is an immutable factor placing Zamindar men and women at a higher position in gender hierarchy compared with their lower caste counterparts, both labourer and better off Kammis.

This suggests that the theory of intersectionality might be a more useful theoretical paradigm in terms of looking at the gender relations and gender hierarchy. The theory of intersectionality emphasizes that the race bias occurs when power and hierarchy are solely conceptualized in terms of sex difference or patriarchy, and thus question any universal claims about the categories of men and women. It is argued that the gender experiences among men and women, their gender relations, and gender hierarchy are created, defined, and recognized by the issues around inequality e.g. race and class

(Knudsen, 2006). Similarly, the above discussion shows how the interplay between gender dynamics and social categories of caste, class, and region creates different shades of social identity among men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms and place them on different locations in gender hierarchy.

7.3.2.2. Caste Based Domination and Subordination in the Village Sphere

The expressions of dominance and subordination in the village setting are implicated in the caste membership and status and the caste based power structures. Punjabis associate privilege to exert influence in the public sphere with power (Dagar, 2002; Lyon, 2004). While examining the gender based violence and masculinities in Indian Punjab, Dagar (2002) described the men who could exercise influence over other men in the public domain were considered as powerful.

The respondents explained how the caste memberships of Kammis and Zamindars play a part in shaping their interaction patterns towards each other in the village setting. Kammi men involved in the low graded tasks were especially concerned about the discriminating and disapproving conduct of Zamindars towards them in the community environment.

A (labourer) Kammi dies 100 times in a day because of how they (Zamindars) deal with him in other's presence. They do not consider that Kammis are also human and have some self respect (Riaz, 53, Kammi man, arid zone).

Having the same opinion, Sultan (53, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said:

Zamindars remind (labourer) Kammis of their inferiority every hour in a day by their conduct or language. They would express domination over Kammis, without any reason. We (Kammis) are lower we know it, but Zamindars still feel it important to keep reminding a Kammi about his worthlessness.

The above quotations reflect the views of Kammis working as service providers in their villages and thus interacting with Zamindars in the village settings on frequent basis. Perhaps, they were the most marginalized group of men in the community environment. However, such Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were found to be more vulnerable towards oppressive and discriminatory conduct of Zamindars of their village compared with their counterparts in the arid zone's village. As discussed in chapter 5, the caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were more persistent and stronger than the arid zone's village owing to the existence of Seyp and Dera system. A large majority of Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were earning their livelihood either by the Seyp contracts or other low graded tasks associated with Kammis, and thus they were

required to interact with Zamindars of their village on a frequent basis. They were also working as labour on the Dera of Zamindars. Conversely, Kammis involved in the low graded tasks in the arid zone's village had fewer interactions with Zamindars in the daily life since Seyp had ended and Dera system did not exist in their village. Zamindars of the arid zone's village required Kammi labour only at the ceremonial events or during the limited harvesting season.

On the other side, Zamindar respondents in both villages stressed that it is important for the Zamindars to maintain a respectable distance from Kammis of their village; otherwise they would not obey their command as service providers.

They (Kammis) would pay attention to a Zamindar's instructions only if he maintains a distance from them and deals with them according to their status. Everything looks good at its deserved place. Sometimes it is also required to remind them of their standing (caste status). Nor does it suit a Zamindar to get chummy with his Kammis (Manzoor, 75, Zamindars man irrigated zone).

As discussed previously, social learning theory looks at the aggression and violence reinforced by the social environment as the most important source of behaviour modelling. Individuals learn it during the course of their socialization in a society and expect positive reinforcements for practicing such behaviours e.g. gaining praise of others (Ormrod, 1999; Siegel, 1992). While examining the patterns of local politics and patronage in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) explained how the aggression tactics and occasional violent outbursts produce positive reinforcements among young landlords, who use it to ensure the subordination of poor labourers and assert authority in the village setting. A young landlord gained the respect of his peers when he appeared to beat an insolent labourer with a cricket bat (Lyon, 2004). Similarly, young landlords may turn violent towards the poor labourers to send a signal to the villagers that they can defend their family reputation and are strong enough to assume a leadership role in the future. While the social learning theory focuses on the aggression and violence, this theoretical paradigm can also be useful to show how Zamindar men learn the non physical ways of asserting dominance over Kammis as part of their gender-caste identity and expect positive reinforcements for practicing such behaviours. In the above quotation, Manzoor explains how Zamindars use oppressive conduct towards labourer Kammis to ensure their compliance as service providers and maintain a status hierarchy over them. Looking at the interaction patterns among Zamindar and Kammi men at a Dera or other community spaces, it can be easily observed how such domineering and discriminatory behaviours characterize the most common assertion of status among

Zamindars towards the Kammis of their village in order to keep them compliant and reminded of their lower caste status. Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village were clearly more conscious about maintaining the asymmetrical relationships with their Kammis using such discriminatory conduct, since caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were much stronger than the arid zone's village.

The respondents in both villages suggested that the educated and better off Kammis are less likely to face the oppressive conduct of Zamindars in the village setting. However, Zamindars maintain their caste dominance over them, using direct or indirect means. Abdullah (29, Zamindars man, irrigate zone) mentioned that it is not highly regarded for Zamindars to engage in dealings with Kammis of their village as close associates. While a few Zamindar could have close associations with educated/better off Kammis, they are often criticized by their friends and Biradari members. Besides, as discussed in chapter 6, a few of the Zamindar households in both villages had started inviting educated/better off Kammis as guests at the ceremonial occasions in their houses.

However, the educated and better off Kammi respondents highlighted that Zamindars always maintain an asymmetry and inequality in their dealings with Kammis in the village setting. Tahir (37, Kammi man, arid zone), who was involved in a cloth business, stressed that even the poorest of Zamindars would address a better off Kammi in the village setting in a degrading manner, merely to maintain his caste dominance. Narrating his personal experiences, Fahad (28, Kammi man, arid zone), an educated Kammi, described how Zamindar boys and even teachers use to jeer at him in school for being a cobbler. Similarly, Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) mentioned that Zamindars of his village discriminate against him in the village affairs because of his educational achievements:

Because of my educational achievements Zamindars discriminate me a lot in routine village affairs. Some have straightforwardly taunted me by saying that a new Chaudhary is in emergence. I wear neat clothes and do not remain dirty like other Kammis. Zamindars are not able to tolerate that I am educated and wear better dress than many of them. Because of their teasing conduct I do not go at their Dera and visit only some selective places in the village. I am spending hard time emotionally. Caste is still much more important than education as a factor of respect and honour in our villages.

It is important to note in the above quotation that Sajid does not like to visit the Dera of Zamindars because of their oppressive conduct towards him at Dera. The Dera system in the irrigated zone's village can be seen as an institution that plays a significant role in shaping the masculinity across Zamindars and Kammis. Chapter 6 has discussed how

the activities at a Dera position Zamindars and Kammiss as dominant and subordinate masculine identities respectively. All the low graded tasks at the Dera that Zamindars consider undignified to perform are done by Kammiss. Hence, the Dera system reinforces the caste based masculine identities of Zamindars and Kammiss. Ulfat (45, Zamindars man, irrigated zone) viewed the Dera system as a way to institutionalize the status hierarchies among Zamindars and Kammiss and explained how the Dera system provides Zamindars the culturally legitimate opportunities to exercise influence over Kammiss, with the following example:

If there are ten men sitting at my Dera and two of them are Kammiss and I want someone to go to my house and bring tea or food, I shall ask any or both of Kammiss. They will follow my command since they are Kammiss. If I ask any of Zamindars sitting there; he would reply "am I your Kammi that I should bring food from your house?" because it is not his task. But Kammiss do not react if Zamindars ask them to do such work since it is their role to serve and obey Zamindars.

This quotation reflects how the Dera system legitimizes the dominance of Zamindars over Kammiss in the daily life village affairs. Therefore, educated and better off Kammiss in the irrigated zone's village do not like to visit the Dera of Zamindars. Conversely, the Dera system did not exist in the arid zone's village and Zamindars did not have an institutionalized way, like Dera system, to reproduce the asymmetrical relationships with and status hierarchies over Kammiss in the everyday village affairs. It shows that the caste relationships in the irrigated zone's village were more established compared with the arid zone's village.

Bourdieu's (1990) theory of symbolic violence refers to (almost) unconscious means of social domination maintained over the conscious subjects in everyday life conducts. It operates through the misconception of the power relations maintained in the social environment and involves the imposition of categories of thought and perception on the social agents who have the subordinate social position in a society e.g. in terms of class and gender. Symbolic capital e.g. prestige, honour, and attention renders certain individuals the power to exert dominance over others, through their actions that have discriminatory implications. It is a useful theoretical approach in the context of a Punjabi village to understand how Zamindars use their caste status and prestige as a source of power to maintain domination over Kammiss of their village, not only the labourer Kammiss but also the better off and educated Kammiss. The above quotations by Sajid and Ulfat show how Zamindars use indirect (symbolic) means to keep Kammiss reminded of their lower standing in the caste hierarchy. As discussed previously,

imposing the categories of thoughts, perceptions, and actions that have discriminatory meanings and implications is one of the most common assertions of caste status among Zamindars towards the Kammis of their village. The above quotation by Ulfat shows how such behaviours exist as institutionalized ways of asserting domination over caste subordinates. Thus, contrary to Bourdieu's (1990) claim that the symbolic violence operates through the misconception of the power relations maintained in the social environment, it suggests that the dynamics of power relations involving the indirect means of asserting dominance over caste subordinates are rather well defined and visible in the context of a Punjabi village. As discussed in chapter 3, this research looks at the non physical means of asserting dominance over others as an expression of hegemonic form of masculinity i.e. the way Zamindar men use their symbolic capital to assert authority over Kammi men. The above discussion shows how the intersectionality of caste and masculinity through the categories of thought and actions involving discriminatory implications works as a system of domination and resistance in the community sphere of a Punjabi village and thus positioning Zamindar and Kammi men at dominant and subordinate masculine identities respectively. Furthermore, it is important to note that Sajid's (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) experiences in the village life refer to how Zamindar men invent ways to maintain their dominance over better off and educated Kammis, using indirect means of asserting authority. Zamindar men resist the Kammi men adopting the norms of hegemonic masculinity, using their symbolic capital, in order to keep them a subordinate masculine identity. It suggests that the hegemonic masculinity should not be seen as a self-reproducing form but it is maintained through the tactics of discrimination against or seclusion of the subordinate masculinities using direct or indirect ways (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005).

Zamindar respondents mentioned that the educated and better off Kammis are least discriminated against in village affairs but rather they feel marginalized because of their inherited deprivations and caste stigmatization. In this regard, a few of the Zamindar respondents pointed towards the learning of caste identities through the process of socialization. They considered that Kammis cannot overcome their feelings of being Kammi while living in the village where their forefathers had worked as service providers, even if they uplift their educational and financial standing.

Even if we do not discriminate against educated and richer Kammis, they would feel discriminated. Their forefathers spent their lives sitting in the feet of Zamindars on ground. They have been persecuted by Zamindars since generations. Hence, the feelings of

deprivation become part of their blood, even if they get education or earn a lot of money (Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Academics have briefly discussed how the Punjabis learn their caste identities as part of their childhood socialization (Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004). Eglar (1960) described that a child in a Punjabi village learns his/her caste identity from the time he/she begins to speak. However, it is not detailed in the literature how the caste socialization in a Punjabi village involves the processes of social discrimination and social deprivation resulting in marginalized identities of lower caste groups i.e. Kammiss.

7.3.2.3. Group Influence in the Village Sphere and Masculinity

While looking at the patterns of power and patronage in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) explained how the Punjabis associate rights to respect and reputation with group membership. Similarly, the respondents in both villages linked group unity and influence with power, protection, and the honour of individual group members. The present research understands group influences as a factor defining masculinity across Kammiss and Zamindars.

Explaining how the group identity influences the Izzat of individual members, Kamran (50, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggested that the Biradari members would get united against their rival Biradaris, when they are required to demonstrate their group significance in the village environment e.g. on elections. All members of a Biradari are expected to support their group representatives. On such occasions, individual's Izzat is associated with their group affiliations. Biradari members would try to compromise their intra Biradari hostilities to protect their Izzat against competing groups. Inter Biradari politics and hostile expressions established during these occasions, e.g. elections, may continue, and affect the village affairs afterwards, especially the relations between men from competing Biradaris.

Representatives of Zamindar Biradaris highlighted the significance of unity among Biradari members in order to maintain their position of leadership and control, as a group. Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone), representative of a leading Zamindar Biradari in the irrigated zone's village, said:

I always try to keep them united. Their Izzat in the village is in their unity as a Biradari. If they are united, no one can defeat them in elections. People would refer to their Dera for decision making. Unity will benefit every one of them.

While discussing how the power structures are organized around the group associations, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that the Biradaris controlling collective village affairs and thus having the ability to influence community environment are regarded as powerful. Politicians refer to their group representatives during elections. Biradari members consider that their individual interests, especially accessing state institutions e.g. police and job sector, are attached with and may easily be served through their group accomplishment (also see sections 6.5 & 6.6). The Dera system in the irrigated zone's village serves to protect the group interests of Zamindar Biradaris and can be seen as an expression of their group significance and influence.

On the other hand, as discussed in chapter 6, Kammi Biradaris lack group unity or any representation in the collective village affairs. Kammi respondents (e.g. Sharif, 56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) emphasized if Kammi Biradaris show unity and take a collective decision on the occasions like elections, they may prove their significance not only as groups but they will also be respected as individual members in the village setting. Fazal (47, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained how the lack of unity and strength as a group negatively affected Kammi men's individual identities. Fazal considered that Zamindars use abusive language towards and commit physical assaults against Kammi because of their inability to respond as a group.

Zamindars feel it easy to abuse a Kammi verbally or physically since they know that there is no one behind him to defend or stand in his favour. If Kammi were united and had some ability to react as a group, Zamindars could have been a bit hesitant to do such acts against them.

However, as discussed earlier, Kammi are realizing the significance of group unity and have started participating in the power structures of their villages.

7.3.2.4. Zamindars as Providers: An Expression of Caste Based Ascendancy

In the context of traditional caste relationships, Zamindars are the providers and Kammi are the recipients. In other words, Zamindars are the givers and Kammi are the takers, being service providers, in caste relationships. Social and economic obligations associated with Kammi and Zamindars in the Seyp contracts can be a good example in this regard. Though the caste structures are in decline, Punjabi's identity and concerns, especially with regard to dealings between Kammi and Zamindars, still revolve around their caste memberships. As discussed previously, Zamindars do not like to engage in exchange relations with Kammi, e.g. cash gift on the weddings, since they are on the receiving end in the traditional caste relationships, and thus not equal to Zamindars on

the status hierarchy. While Zamindars may help Kammiss by giving cash gifts or other economic support on the ceremonial occasions in their houses, they do not like to receive it in exchange from Kammiss because providing/giving is an expression of dominance, especially with reference to dealings between Zamindars and Kammiss.

Similarly, extravagance and generosity in terms of spending on others is an expression of honour, respect, and dominance. Zamindars do not like Kammiss of their villages to spend money on them, especially in other's presence.

If a few Kammi and Zamindar men take tea or eat something at Adda (nearby urban centre) in a group, Zamindars would pay for it. They will never like Kammiss to pay and consider it below their caste pride that Kammiss spend on them (Ahsen, 45, Zamindar man, arid zone).

However the relationship patterns among Zamindars and Kammiss are changing and Zamindars have started engaging in such dealings with a few of the educated and better off Kammiss.

Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how Zamindars use excessive giving as a means to control Kammi labour and keep them compliant. Istikhar suggested that Zamindars financially support Kammiss on the occasions of happiness and sorrowfulness in their houses, in order to ensure their compliance and availability as labour in the future.

Zamindars help Kammiss on the events of sorrowfulness and happiness in their houses for their own benefit, so that they (Kammiss) would obey them in future. On such occasions, Zamindars assist Kammiss financially or give them milk, rice, grains etc, when their Biradari is at their doorstep.

Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village were still supporting their Seypi Kammiss on the occasions like weddings or deaths in their houses. Conversely, Kammiss of the arid zone's village mentioned that Zamindars do not offer them any help on such occasions, as the Seyp system has come to an end in their village.

The social exchange model can be useful to explain how the social relationships of asymmetrical reciprocity involving the roles of providers and recipients can be seen as the expressions of dominance and resistance in a caste society. Social exchange theory stresses that the social relationships are the exchange of the goods, the material and also the non material, such as the symbols of approval or prestige. The person or social groups giving much to the others may exercise control over the ones who receive much in the relationships (Homan, 1958, 1961). Powerful members of a society with reference

to status, strength, and money subordinate the ones who are comparatively inferior in the power relationships (Blood and Wolfe, 1960). Similarly, the above discussion shows how Zamindars maintain their caste dominance over Kammis of their villages through the caste based exchange relationships. The structures of asymmetrical reciprocity not only involve the exchange of material goods e.g. gift giving at the ceremonial occasions, but also the exchange of non material goods e.g. Zamindars consider it below their caste based pride to deal with Kammis as equals in community life. The social exchange model has mostly been used to understand the structures of reciprocity and social obligations in different societies (Malinowski, 1922; Mauss, 1990; Orenstein, 1980). However, in the present research, it can also be used to explain how such asymmetrical norms of reciprocity in social relationships play a part in shaping the masculinity across Kammi and Zamindar men and position them as marginalized and hegemonic masculine identities respectively. The above quotation by Ahsen clearly shows how Zamindar men assert their caste dominance over Kammi men in the community sphere using the structures of asymmetrical reciprocity. While the traditional caste structures are in decline, the respondents emphasized that the dealings between Kammis and Zamindars in the contemporary Punjabi villages still involve the asymmetrical social exchanges of material and non material goods. It indicates that the power structures constructing Zamindar masculinity should not be seen as self-reproducing but Zamindar men maintain their caste based ascendancy and masculine domination over Kammi men by preserving the norms of asymmetrical reciprocity in the caste based social relationships.

In conclusion the cultural ideals of hegemonic masculinity involve features of control and influence in the public sphere. Considering the relationship between domestic and public faces of masculinity, the Kammis whose women work as labour in the village setting are denied the rights to certain kind of masculine honour and respect in the public sphere. They lack control over the mobility of their women which negatively affect their image as men in the village setting. Furthermore, the expressions of dominance and subordination, as constructs of masculinity, are manifested in the dealings between Kammis and Zamindars in the community setting. While Kammis working as labour face oppressive conduct of Zamindars in the village setting quite often, educated and better off Kammis are securer. However, Zamindars always maintain their caste dominance over educated and better off Kammis in the village setting and deal with them as caste subordinates. The Dera system and Seyp contracts in

the irrigated zone's village reinforce the asymmetrical interactions and status hierarchies among Kammiss and Zamindars by providing Zamindars the culturally legitimate opportunities to exercise dominance over Kammiss in the public sphere. As a result, caste based masculinity and power relations in the irrigated zone's village are more established and persistent, compared with the arid zone's village. Furthermore, group influence in the village setting plays a part in shaping masculinity across Zamindars and Kammiss. It is mentioned that the lack of unity and strength as a group reinforces the subordinate masculine identity among Kammiss. Furthermore, it is discussed that Zamindars are providers and Kammiss are recipients in the traditional caste relationships in a Punjabi village. Zamindars use such exchange relation as a means to express their caste dominance over Kammiss.

7.4. Caste System and Femininities in Punjabi Villages

The intersectionality of caste and gender produces different forms of femininity across Kammi and Zamindar women. Considering the cultural ideals of femininity in the context of public sphere of a Punjabi village, it is detailed how the construction and experiences of femininity across Kammi and Zamindar women are configured around their caste memberships and masculine identities of their men. Consequently, Kammi's women in Punjabi villages are not able to practice certain aspects of emphasized femininities owing to their caste and the lower social standing of their men. The respondents explained how the social position of a woman and social responses towards her in the village setting are defined in accordance with her caste group and the social status of the men in her family. In other words, Kammi and Zamindar women are dealt with differently by others, outside their home environment. Hence, Punjabis assume the positions of dominance and subordination in the village sphere taking into consideration the other person's caste/Biradari membership. On the other hand, the analysis also highlights that certain aspects of emphasised femininity are not constrained by the caste identities. Women of the educated and better off Kammiss do not work as paid labour in the village setting, and hence they can comply with certain aspects of emphasised femininity, e.g. restricted mobility outside domestic sphere. Correspondingly, it is discussed how Kammi women working as paid labour in the village setting have different feminine identity and social experiences compared with the Kammiss women who belong to better off families. Nevertheless, both of these categories of Kammi women are placed lower than Zamindar women on the gender-caste hierarchy.

7.4.1. Emphasized Femininity vs. Caste Based Roles and Obligations

Features of compliance and protection of repute associated with sexuality form the core of cultural ideals of femininity in the context of a Punjabi village. While discussing the issues of compliance and protection of repute associated with sexuality, the respondents emphasized that the occupational roles and obligations associated with Kammi women working as paid labour in the community settings play a central part in positioning them and their men in subordinate gender identities. These Kammi women are placed at the lowest level of gender-caste hierarchy in Punjabi villages.

When asked why working as paid labour in the village setting is regarded as undignified for a woman, the respondents talked about a number of different factors mentioning how a Kammi woman deviates from the cultural ideals of femininity once she moves out of her domestic environment to work as labour in the community sphere. In this regard, Qandeel (21, Zamindar woman, arid zone) highlighted that the rural women are encouraged to choose only those occupations that are compatible to the emphasised practices of femininity e.g. teaching in a girl's school. Working as paid labour at Zamindar's houses, Dera, or on fields is regarded as demeaning for the women since the roles and obligations associated with these jobs require Kammi women to interact with men, perform low graded tasks as servants, and move frequently in the community sphere. Hence, these Kammi women are needed to indulge in the acts that are considered below the honour and place of a woman in Punjabi society. Similarly, Zahida (63, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) described that ideally a woman's place is in her house where she is protected from any disreputable experience. Once Kammi women, who are already the most powerless group in villages, work as labour in the village sphere that is associated predominantly with men they become highly vulnerable to any kind of attack or violence. Zahida added:

Their work is not considered as respectable because a woman's place is inside her house. It does not look nice to move in village streets all the time and come under everyone's observation (men), especially for the young women. Besides, they work as servants of others and bear impolite conduct; it is below the women's pride and dignity. Village environment is not good for excessive mobility of a woman, and Kammi women are already poor and vulnerable. If her Izzat goes, nothing is left with a woman.

In this regard, the majority of Kammi women had similar views. Sharing their experiences, a few Kammi women in both villages explained how they are forced to act against the emphasized practices of femininity because of their economic and caste roles. As a result, they are likely to be stigmatized as women without any moral

character or respect. Parveen (49, Kammi woman, arid zone), working as a housemaid in Zamindar's houses, emphasized that Kammi women are not given any respect since they approach every doorstep in the village and perform menial tasks.

However, Jameela (57, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) tried to justify the stance of these Kammi women and stressed that they step out of their domestic environment for the noble cause of earning a livelihood for themselves and their children. Jameela emphasized that the Kammi women cannot conform to the cultural ideals of femininity, e.g. restricted mobility, because of their economic and caste obligations.

We are not fond of moving in the village environment to work in other's houses. We do it for our livelihood and for our children. If our men bring enough earning, we would not like to come out of four walls?

Conversely, Qandeel (21, Zamindar woman, arid zone) argued that even the poorest of Zamindars would not authorize their women to work as labour in other's houses, at Dera or on fields. She considered that Kammi women allow their women to go outside domestic environment for doing menial tasks as paid labour because they do not value their honour associated with the women. Qandeel added:

Zamindars may die of hunger but will never like their women to move in the village environment and wash crockery in other's houses for money. It is not about economics but Gairat. Kammi women do not care about their Gairat.

Interestingly, Kammi women (e.g. Rasoolan, 36, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) also mentioned that a Zamindar woman may never work as paid labour in other's houses, like Kammi women, owing to her caste based pride.

Zamindar women consider it demeaning to work as labour for others. She thinks that "I am wife of a Chaudhary, so it is below my caste pride to work as labour going outside home". They take care of household affairs or may go to agricultural fields to serve food to her husband but will never work as paid labour in the village setting.

This shows how the cultural ideals of masculinity and emphasized practices of femininity in Punjabi villages are interconnected. Self esteem of a woman is associated with her caste group and the social standing of her men.

Elaborating further on the paid work of women, Qandeel (21, Zamindar woman, arid zone) suggested that the ascribed gender roles in Punjabi villages assign men the responsibilities to take care of household economy and provide their women a shelter in the four walls. While more than a few Zamindar women in the arid zone's village were working as school teachers and contributing in the household economy, Qandeel

highlighted that Zamindar women are encouraged by their families, especially men, to choose those professions that are compatible to the cultural ideals of femininity, feminine respect, and hence masculine honour. Qandeel thought that Zamindar men would never allow their women to opt for a profession at the cost of their honour in the village setting. Correspondingly, Zamindar men in the irrigated zone's village were even stricter in fulfilling their gender roles concerned with the economic obligations. Rabia (25, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) suggested that none of the Zamindar women in their village is involved in any paid work outside home environment, and only men are responsible for the household economic affairs.

On the other hand, the gender situation among labourer Kammis was different. The caste occupations of Kammis and Seyp system are in decline and, as a result, more than a few Kammis struggled to earn their livelihood, especially in the irrigated zone's village. Berkatay (44, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammi women are required to contribute to the household economy by working as labour in the community sphere since their men alone cannot make enough money through the low paid occupations to run family circle. A few Kammi households in the contemporary Punjabi villages could be better off and thus their women do not work as paid labour. However, the majority of Kammis are still attached with the low paid jobs e.g. Seyp or daily wage labour, especially in the irrigated zone's villages, and their women are also required to contribute in the household economy. Though acknowledging their economic responsibilities, these Kammi women stressed that their excessive mobility in the village environment for labour negatively affects the social reputation of their men. Nazia (31, Kammi woman, arid zone) highlighted that the people point at Kammi men, whose women work as labour in other's houses, because of their inability to fulfil economic obligations and provide their women shelter in four walls.

Obviously people gossip that his daughter, sister, wife, or mother works as labour and he does not have any Izzat to keep her in four walls. But they (our men) cannot do anything; they are helpless being poor.

Emphasized femininity is a gender performance of women that accommodates the hegemonic masculine values and prevents other femininities gaining cultural articulation (Cheng, 1999; Connell, 1987; Schippers, 2007). The analysis also suggests that the construction of gender, masculinities and femininities, in Punjabi villages is an integrated whole that encircles the gender roles and responsibilities, and bestows the rights of honour and respect to those who accomplish the obligations associated with

their genders. Moreover, this gender structure determines inter/intra gender relationship patterns in domestic and public spheres, and also forces individuals towards conformity driven by the gender order of society.

Talking about the roles and obligations associated with the paid work that they do in the village sphere, Kammi women explained how the experiences of doing such works negatively affect their self-esteem as women and lessens their respect in other's eyes. These Kammi women believed that they deviate from the emphasized practices of femininity in the socio-religious context of their society because of their economic and caste roles, and hence they are not respected as women. They were concerned about the discourteous conduct of Zamindar men and women towards them at work.

Because of our caste and work we do, we are not given any respect as women in the village setting. Villagers question our Izzat being a servant and Kammi (Nari, 65, Kammi women, arid zone).

Kaneez (46, Kammi woman, arid zone) mentioned that, at times, Zamindar men could question their Izzat by asking them to indulge in derogatory activities as women e.g. sweeping the courtyard of Dera in the presence of men.

Amara (35, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) suggested that Kammi women are required to work as labour in the spaces which Zamindar women do not like to visit for their caste based feminine pride e.g. Dera. While Zamindar women may visit their agricultural fields to serve meals to their men, Kammi women work at other's fields as paid labour. Amara highlighted that Kammi women move in the spaces associated with men at the expense of their reputation since their safety is always at risk.

Conversely, Bano (38, Kammi woman, arid zone) considered that the ideals of femininity across Kammi and Zamindar women and construction of their self-worth cannot be evaluated using similar criteria because of their varied caste identities, economic positions, and social standing on the status hierarchy. Bano emphasized that even the women of better off Kammi cannot overcome the stigma of being Kammi and would always rate themselves lower than Zamindar women. Denying the criterion of limited mobility as an ideal of femininity for Kammi women, Bano highlighted that they would not be able to earn their livelihood if they start following the standards of Zamindar women. Bano instead suggested that having a strong moral character a Kammi woman can take care of her Izzat in the village environment. However, it should be useful to consider that Bano belonged to the arid zone's village where Kammi

women were working only in Zamindar's houses and were less vulnerable to assaults compared with Kammi women in the irrigated zone who were involved in labour at Dera and in the agricultural fields. Bano discussed the caste based gender identity as an immutable feature and considered that the construction of feminine Izzat and self-worth among Kammi and Zamindar women is determined by their caste memberships.

As discussed previously, the theory of hegemonic masculinity has been criticized for constructing the masculine power, relations among masculinities, and their hierarchy through the patriarchal subordination of women and not the structural basis of women's subordination. It is suggested that we might consider the interplay of gender dynamics with other social dynamics of race, class, and region and not deduce the masculine hierarchy merely on the basis of direct exercise of personal control by men over women. This postulate can also be useful to look at the feminine hierarchy in the caste society of a Punjabi village. The above discussion by Kammi women clearly suggests that it is not merely the patriarchal control that determines the social positions of women and feminine hierarchy in a Punjabi village but it is important to consider other social factors as well. The theory of intersectionality pioneered by the women of colour criticized the race bias that occurs when gender hierarchy is solely conceptualized in terms of sex differences and acknowledged the need to investigate gender hierarchy with reference to issues around inequality e.g. race and class. This theory provides the basis for questioning any universal claims about the categories of men and women (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). It is suggested that we might situate people on the gender based power continuum in a society according to their differences (Burgess-Proctor, 2006; Collins, 2000; Zinn & Dill, 1996). Hence, the theory of intersectionality can be used to address the above mentioned criticism of the theory of hegemonic masculinity. Similarly, in the above discussion, Bano (38, Kammi woman, arid zone) criticized the caste bias that occurs when women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms are placed in a gender hierarchy in terms of sex difference and referred to the caste membership of a woman as an important factor determining her social position and social experiences in a Punjabi village. While class can be an important factor to uplift the social position of Kammi women among other caste members, Bano highlighted caste as an unchangeable feature placing Zamindar women at a higher position in the gender hierarchy compared with their lower caste counterparts.

On the other hand, an overwhelming majority of the women respondents, Kammi and Zamindar, suggested that the restricted mobility of women in the public sphere is valued

as an integral attribute of emphasized femininity in village context. It was explained how it serves as a mechanism to ensure the protection of her sexuality and body, and thus feminine honour. Referring to the local discourses on restricted mobility of women, Berkatay (44, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) said to one of the female research assistants:

A woman's space is inside the four walls of her house, and her Izzat is in keeping herself restricted to those four walls. This is how a noble woman is expected to live her life.

Qandeel (21, Zamindar woman, arid zone) suggested, though restricted mobility of women persists to be a valued feminine characteristic, the young girls in villages are freer in their mobility compared with previous generation's women i.e. their mothers, since they are inclined towards getting education in schools/colleges and opting for teaching careers. Here, it is important to consider that Qandeel belonged to the arid zone's village, where the majority of Zamindar women were educated and quite a few of them were employed as teachers in schools. Conversely, none of the Zamindar woman was doing a job in the irrigated zone's villages despite their inclination towards education. It seems persistent caste structures in the irrigated zone's village emphasize the restricted mobility of women.

It should be noted that the restricted mobility in the public sphere as a valued feminine characteristic does not imply that the women are presumed to confine themselves completely in the four walls. It rather refers to the purposeful mobility, in keeping with feminine honour, and requires women to not move in the social spaces typically associated with men, e.g. other's agricultural fields and tube wells, Dera (irrigated zone), and Adda (local urban centre). In addition, the frequent mobility of women in the streets is not appreciated. Hence, Zamindar women in the Punjabi villages may move outside their domestic sphere for the purpose of education, agricultural activity (irrigated zone), or to visit their Biradari's houses in the village. It is not mobility that matters, but where, with whom, and for what purpose. Though Kammi women move in the community sphere with the purpose of earning livelihood by doing labour for Zamindars, the dynamics of their mobility and work are not generally compatible to the cultural ideals of femininity.

The age of a woman, Kammi or Zamindar, may also be a factor in defining her privileges to mobility outside domestic sphere. Elder and married Zamindar women are freer to go outside domestic sphere compared with the young and unmarried women.

Moreover, the young Zamindar women usually move in accompany with male family members or other women. Though the women of educated and better off Kammi do not work as paid labour, the respondents suggested that they are freer than Zamindar women in their mobility outside domestic sphere.

7.4.1.1. Paid Labour for Kammi Women: Varied Roles across the Arid and the Irrigated Zone

The work opportunities for and the set of roles and responsibilities associated with labourer Kammi women varied considerably across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. Kaneez (46, Kammi woman) suggested that Kammi women in the arid zone's village were working only as maidservants in Zamindar's houses and were paid on monthly basis. In addition, they provide their services as labour on the ceremonial occasions e.g. weddings. A few young Kammi women were teachers. Conversely, Rasoolan (36, Kammi woman) mentioned that Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were involved in manual labour, as part of their Seyp contract or other paid jobs, on agricultural fields, in houses and at Dera of Zamindars. Zamindars require their services on the ceremonial occasions as well. A few of them were also employed as daily wage labour in the nearby industry.

Kammi women in the arid zone's village were not involved as labour at Dera and on fields of Zamindars due to the limited agricultural activity in their village; the Dera system did not exist in the arid zone's village. Hence, Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were moving in the community environment a lot more than their counterparts in the arid zone's village. In addition, it is important to mention while Kammi women in the arid zone's village were working within the village boundaries i.e. in Zamindar's houses, Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were required to move outside the village boundaries i.e. agricultural fields. Dera and agricultural fields are purely male spaces where excessive mobility of women is discouraged. As discussed earlier, though Zamindar women in the irrigated zone's village also visit agricultural fields, Rasoolan (36, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) mentioned that their role and purpose of visiting fields is dissimilar to Kammi women. Zamindar women would go at their own fields to serve food to their men or help them in agricultural activity. Conversely, Kammi women work at other's fields as labour to earn livelihood, and thus interact with men not related to them. Rabia (21, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) mentioned that Zamindars do not like their young girls to visit agricultural fields, and mostly elder/married women go to serve food to Zamindar men working in the

fields. While Zamindar women in the irrigated zone's village were playing various supporting roles in the agricultural activity, none of the Zamindar woman in the arid zone's village was involved in any such work because of very limited cultivation in their village.

7.4.2. Changing Public Femininities¹⁶ among Kammis

Kammis start upholding the norms and practices prevalent in Zamindar Quoms as a result of an increase in their socio economic standing. The educated and better off Kammis usually restrict the mobility of their women, since it forms the bases of cultural ideals of femininity and also play a part in defining the masculine Izzat of the villagers. The respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages suggested that the women of educated and better off Kammis do not work as paid labour in the community environment. However, they were only few in numbers, especially in the irrigated zone's village.

Better off Kammis keep their women inside their houses. Their women do not work as labour in the village setting (Kaneez, 46, Kammi woman, arid zone).

On the other hand, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained why, at times, even the women of better off or educated Kammis may work as labour.

A few Kammi women of our village who belong to better off Kammi households also move freely in village to work as labour. They think that after making more money they may be able to construct their own house in village or migrate to city and start some independent work.

Abdullah (29, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that the better off Kammi families mostly migrate towards a city since it becomes difficult for them to raise their social standing while living in the village where their forefathers worked as service providers. Hence, most of the Kammis still residing in Punjabi villages are labourers and poor. Correspondingly, Abdullah highlighted that the overwhelming majority of Kammi household of their village is involved in low graded tasks, and thus their women also work as labour. However, it is important to state that Ulfat and Abdullah were referring to the socio economic position of Kammis in the irrigated zone's village where the majority of them were involved in the Seyp or other low paid jobs and, as a result, their women were forced to contribute to the household economy by working. Another

¹⁶ The term public femininities refers to the normatively prescribed structure and practices of femininity in public sphere of a Punjabi village i.e. village setting. In the context of present research study the public sphere for women includes the village streets, other's houses, Dera, agricultural fields, tube wells, local urban centres (Adda), and nearby industry.

important factor to consider is that none of the Kammi woman in the irrigated zone's village was educated, as discussed in chapter 5. Whilst the barber Biradari in the irrigated zone's village was better off, the respondents (e.g. Rukhsana, 22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) suggested that quite a few women in the barber Biradari were also involved in paid labour.

Conversely, more than a few Kammis in the arid zone's village had businesses or jobs, as discussed in chapter 5. The respondents (e.g. Hadi, 58, Zamindar man, arid zone) mentioned that a few Kammi families in their village have better life than some Zamindar households, though they are still rated as inferior on the caste hierarchy. Interestingly, some of the educated Kammi girls were employed as teachers in schools and contributing in the household economy. Bibi (25, Kammi woman, arid zone) mentioned that several Kammi women of their village who belong to better off families, or are educated, do not work as paid labour in the village setting.

The above discussion shows how more Kammi women in the arid zone's village were able to practice the cultural ideals of femininity e.g. restricted mobility as compared to their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village the majority of whom were required to work as paid labour outside their domestic sphere.

Nevertheless, Kammi women who were educated or belonged to better off families, and thus not working as paid labour, considered that their social status and respect, cannot be compared with any of the Zamindar women. Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone), belonged to better off barbers of the irrigated zone's village and was not working outside domestic sphere, highlighted that:

We are privileged to the extent that we are not required to move outside our houses and work as labour in village. But we are always considered lower than Zamindar women. Difference of caste always persists, even if we become richer or educated.

Similarly, Bibi (25, Kammi woman, arid zone) emphasized that:

Even uneducated Zamindar women would have more Izzat in the village setting than an educated Kammi woman.

However, Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) highlighted that the educated and better off Kammi women live a respectable life than Kammi women doing paid labour. Having the same opinion, Bibi (25, Kammi woman, arid zone) explained how the Kammi women of better off families start distinguishing themselves from other Kammis and criticize them for being involved in low graded tasks. Bano (38, Kammi woman, arid zone) mentioned that Kammi women not working as labour are at least

advantaged to protect their reputation as women while having the choice to restrict themselves within the domestic sphere. The above discussion shows how the intersectionality of caste, class, and gender results in the different shades of social inequality among Kammi women, as suggested by the theory of intersectionality discussed in chapter 3. Kammi women who belonged to better off families have the more rights to Izzat in the village setting and are placed higher on the status hierarchy than the Kammi women working as labour.

It is interesting to note in the whole discussion about femininity that the women respondents, both Zamindar and Kammi, are not interpreting mobility in the village sphere as a privilege or a liberating experience. They rather prefer to restrict themselves in their domestic environment, especially young girls, and were more concerned about the protection of their reputation/Izzat associated with sexuality than considering free mobility in the public sphere a privilege. It means that the cultural ideals of femininity, and feminine privileges, are contextually constructed and are defined in accordance with the broader gender structures of a society.

Talking about the changing public femininities, the respondents suggested that the roles associated with Kammi women that once existed as important social institutions in the Punjabi villages have come to an end e.g. barber's women as matchmakers or messengers. So the occupational roles of Kammi women described by Eglar in Punjabi villages of the 1960s do not exist anymore. All of the respondents (e.g. Kaneez, 46, Kammi woman, arid zone) suggested that the Kammi women are involved only in manual labour and their traditional caste occupations, and roles associated with those occupations as women, have come to an end.

Furthermore, the social spaces associated with women in the village context are diminishing with time. For example, the practices of washing clothes at tube wells or nearby streams and visiting the village well for fetching water have declined due to the provision of government funded water supply schemes in villages. In addition, the villagers dig water bores equipped with hand pumps in their houses, so that their women are provided with the water for daily use inside houses. However, the women respondents in the irrigated zone's village (e.g. 35, Amara, Kammi woman) mentioned that a few Kammi women in their village still visit tube wells for washing clothes since they do not have water bores in their houses.

As mentioned earlier, the critics of hegemonic masculinity argue that the masculine subject cannot be unitary but is a fluid and ever changing category in practice (Collier, 1998; Jefferson, 1994; Wetherell and Edley, 1999). It is further suggested that the hegemonic norms of masculinity should not be seen as the settled character structure of any group of men (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). This criticism of the theory of hegemonic masculinity can also be applied to examine how the feminine subject is a fluid category and thus not unitary. The above analysis shows how the feminine subject of Kammi women in the context of a Punjabi village is changing as a result of the decline of traditional caste structures. Kammi women are upholding the practices associated with the emphasized femininity. It suggests that the emphasized norms of femininity e.g. restricted mobility in the public sphere and not working as paid labour should not be understood as the settled character structure of Zamindar women. Kammi women can take up the practices associated with the emphasized femininity as a result of the economic uplift of their families and changing caste dynamics. Like the masculine subject of Kammi men, the feminine subject of Kammi women can be complex and multilayered in practice and dynamics of their Izzat in society change as a result of the change in their class position, though their caste status remains same.

7.4.3. Caste Membership and Safety of a Woman in the Village Sphere

It was important to investigate how Kammi and Zamindar women view their safety in the community sphere. It was found that the caste membership of a woman plays a part in defining her sense of protection outside domestic sphere. An overwhelming majority of the respondents believed that Zamindar women are more protected against any assault in the community environment, compared with Kammi women, because of their caste/Biradari memberships and social standing of their men.

A Zamindar woman has the confidence that men will not approach her in the village setting that easily. Men at her back and her Biradari membership provide a feeling of security to a Zamindar woman. Moreover, she grows up having a caste pride which gives her confidence and courage (Huma, 45, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone).

Huma added; though the potentials of sexual assaults against Zamindar women in the village setting cannot be overlooked completely, caste based power structures of Punjabi villages reduce its possibility.

Conversely, Kammi women, especially who work as labour, explained how they move in the village setting with a feeling of insecurity. Amara (35, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) emphasized that even if a Kammi woman tries to avoid disreputable incidents

with the strength of her character, she remains vulnerable against such experiences while working as labour in Zamindar's houses, at Dera, or agricultural field. Having the same opinion, Nazia (31, Kammi woman, arid zone) suggested, though every woman, Zamindar or Kammi, could face assaults in the village setting, a Kammi woman feels more unprotected since she knows that they (as a family/Biradari) cannot react or register an FIR in police against Zamindar perpetrators. Nazia highlighted that because of the inability of their men to take revenge, Kammi women prefer to not disclose such experience to their families either, considering that it may not result in anything but they lose their Izzat among family members.

This reflects how the power structures organized around caste, Biradarism, inequitable institutional responses of police and system of political patronage play a part in shaping not only the masculine but also the feminine identities among Kammis. It suggests that the categories of caste and gender interact to produce a subordinate female category and feminine identity among Kammis. Like Nazia, the majority of Kammi women highlighted that their men's inability to take revenge from influential Zamindars increase their feelings of insecurity in the village sphere. As a result, a few Kammis in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages mentioned that they prefer to restrict the mobility of their young women, or ask them to move in the village environment in a group of women or in accompany with an elder of family, as a protection measure. It shows how age can be a factor defining the rights to mobility for a Kammi woman. However, economics may, at times, force the young Kammi women to work as labour in the village sphere. Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) was one of the few young Kammi girls not working as paid labour in the irrigated zone's village, and said:

Village environment is not safe enough to move alone as a young Kammi woman, so we try to go out with a man of our family. Better to adopt security measures, when we are powerless to react against Zamindars.

This quotation shows how a woman from a better off Kammi family views her security in the community environment. Rukhsana mentioned that, at times, Zamindar boys do not abstain from passing comments on a Kammi girl in street, even if a male family member is accompanying her. The above quotation also suggests that the women of better off Kammis have started moving in the village environment accompanied by their elders or other women. Eglar (1960) described in her study how Kammi women accompanied the Zamindar women when they go out of their houses for shopping or to attend a ceremony. While moving outside the domestic environment with another

person was practiced only among Zamindar women in the villages, the respondents suggested that a few Kammi women from better off Kammi households have also upheld such practices with time.

Rukhsana (22, Kammi women, irrigated zone) thought that the unprotected village environment for the young Kammi women negatively affects their educational attainments. It was suggested that the majority of Kammis in their village do not allow their young women to continue education after 7/8 grades; they believe that their young women are not protected against any kind of attack in the community sphere. While a few Kammi women in the arid zone's village were educated, Bibi (25, Kammi woman, arid zone) emphasized that a Kammi woman cannot overcome her caste inferiority even if she is educated. Her feelings of being Kammi may keep her insecure while moving outside the domestic environment alone. She knows that the power structures in Punjabi villages do not approve of a Kammi woman moving freely in the community sphere.

Conversely, a few of the women respondents, both Kammi and Zamindar, (e.g. Fazeelat, 68, Zamindar woman, arid zone) believed, though caste plays a role in shaping a women's sense of security outside domestic sphere, no one can dare to commit assault against a woman possessing good reputation and a moral character.

This section discusses how the femininities across Kammi and Zamindar women are organized around their caste memberships, and the way intersectionality of caste and gender determine the social experiences of Kammi and Zamindar women in the village setting. Talking about the construction of femininity among labourer Kammi women, it is explained how the roles and obligations associated with Kammi women working as paid labour in the community environment are not compatible to the cultural ideals of femininity. These Kammi women are required to move frequently in the village sphere, interact with men not related to them, and do low graded tasks in male spaces. As a result, they have a subordinate feminine identity. Due to the nature of their work, associated roles, and their men's inability to ensure family's protection, Kammi women become vulnerable against disreputable experiences in the community setting. While Kammi women in the arid zone's village were working only as housemaids for Zamindar, their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village were involved as paid labour in Zamindar houses, at Dera and agricultural fields. However, Kammi women who are educated or belong to better off families do not usually work as labour in the community sphere and uphold certain practices associated with the emphasized

femininity. More Kammi women in the arid zone's village were able to practice the ideals of emphasized femininity owing to their better socio-economic standing than their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village majority of whom was forced to contribute in the household economy by working as labour in the village sphere. Conversely, Zamindar women are able to practice the ideals of emphasized femininity because of their caste memberships and ascribed gender roles. Moreover, the caste based social standing of their men and Biradari affiliations lessen the potentials of any assaults against Zamindar women. Women's sense of protection in the public sphere and sense of self worth is also mediated through their caste and Biradari memberships and social standing of their men.

7.5. Conclusion

This chapter has examined how the categories of caste and gender interact at multiple levels in the context of a Punjabi village to produce different shades of masculinity and femininity among the villagers, and mediate their interaction patterns in the village sphere. Looking at the intersectionality of caste and masculinity, the power structures organized around the caste statuses, local politics, Biradarism, system of political patronage, ability to influence community environment as individual/group, and ability to access justice through local and state institutions, especially police, define the hegemonic form of public masculinity and men villager's rights to practice it. These power structures also play a part in shaping the dynamics of social interaction among men in the village setting. The chapter has detailed how the structural features mentioned above facilitate Zamindars to conform to the cultural ideals of masculinity and maintain their dominance over subordinate masculinity of Kammis. Conversely, the majority of Kammis cannot comply with the obligations associated with hegemonic masculinity owing to their inferior caste status, involvement in low graded tasks, dependence on Zamindars, exclusion from power politics and subsequent system of patronage, and inability to access justice.

The chapter has explained how certain rights to masculine Izzat and status associated with the hegemonic form of masculinity are associated with the ability to ensure group protection, politics of revenge, and features of control and influence in domestic and community sphere. Labourer Kammi men are denied these rights to Izzat and status since they cannot conform to the practices associated with hegemonic masculinity. It is explained how they are generally helpless to protect themselves and their family members against Zamindars because of their exclusion from the power structures and

thus the inability to retaliate. Women of the majority of labourer Kammis work as paid labour in the village setting. It negatively affects the social reputation of Kammis as men, since their women are required to move frequently outside domestic sphere and potentials of assaults against them increase. As a result, these Kammi men are also denied the ability to control the mobility of their women. Besides, they face domination and discriminatory and disapproving conduct of Zamindars in the village setting because of their lower caste statuses and direct dependence on Zamindars.

However, the better off and educated Kammis start upholding certain norms and practices associated with hegemonic form of masculinity. They leave low graded tasks associated with Kammis and their women do not work as paid labour. Their direct interactions with Zamindars in the village setting reduce considerably and, as a result, they become less vulnerable to oppressive conduct. The educated and better off Kammis start getting a few opportunities to participate in the power structures of their villages. They endeavour to unite their Biradaris in order to establish their group significance in the village. On the other hand, caste appears to be the primary, and only, criterion that bestows the choice to individuals to practice certain aspects of hegemonic form of masculinity. Educated and better off Kammis cannot acquire the leadership roles, decision making authority, and control over collective affairs. They face difficulties in getting justice through the village councils or police station in case of their disputes with Zamindars. Moreover, they are always positioned lower on the status hierarchy and Zamindars maintain caste dominance over them. Conversely, it is explained how their caste statuses, Biradari associations, ability to access justice using political patronage, involvement in collective village affairs, and ownership of land produce favourable social structures for Zamindars to conform to the practice of hegemonic form of masculinity. It helps Zamindar men to ensure their group's protection, influence village environment as individual/group, and maintain their caste dominance over Kammis.

The chapter has examined that the dynamics of gendered experiences of Kammi men and relationships among Kammi and Zamindar men in the village setting varied across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. Caste organization in the irrigated zone's village was more persistent and caste structures were stronger, compared with the arid zone's village, because of the existence of Seyp and Dera system. The majority of Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were involved in the low grade tasks. Conversely, more than a few Kammis in the arid zone's village were associated with respectable businesses or jobs. Hence, more Kammis in the arid zone's village were

able to comply with certain aspects of hegemonic masculinity due to their better socio-economic position than their counterparts in the irrigated zone's Kammis, the majority of whom were working as paid labour.

Correspondingly, the public femininities across Kammi and Zamindar women are configured around their caste memberships and social standing of their men. The features of compliance and protection of reputation associated with sexuality form the core of cultural ideals of femininity in Punjabi villages. Kammi women working as labour in the community environment deviate from the emphasized practices of femininity since they are required to move frequently in the village sphere, perform low graded tasks, and interact with the men not related to them. Once labourer Kammi women, the most powerless social group, move freely within the social spaces associated with men, the potentials of assaults increase against them. Moreover, they face the oppressive conduct of Zamindar men and women while working as labour for them. These Kammi women stressed that the experiences of working as labour in the village setting negatively affect their self esteem and lessen their respect in the eyes of others. Labourer Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were moving in the village sphere a lot more than their counterparts in the arid zone because of the varying dynamics of paid labour across both villages. Conversely, even the poorest of Zamindar women do not work as paid labour in the village sphere, considering it against their caste based feminine pride. While none of Zamindar women in the irrigated zone's village were doing a job, their counterparts in the arid zone opt for the occupations compatible with the cultural ideals of femininity e.g. teaching in a girl's school. Caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were stronger than in the arid zone's village and emphasize the restricted mobility of women.

The restricted mobility of women in the public sphere not only forms the bases of emphasized femininity, it also serves as a mechanism to ensure protection of her reputation associated with sexuality and body. Therefore, the women of better off and educated Kammis stop working in the village setting as a result of their social economic uplift. Hence, they are able to practice certain aspects of emphasized femininity, e.g. restricted mobility outside domestic sphere and, as a result, the potentials of assaults against them in the village setting decrease. Furthermore, it is discussed how the caste membership of a woman plays a role in shaping her sense of security in the community sphere. While a Zamindar woman comparatively feels protected against disreputable experiences because of their caste/Biradari memberships and social standing of their

men, Kammi woman, even the educated and better off, considered that the caste based power structure do not approve of a Kammi woman to move freely in the village setting.

Chapter Eight

Caste and Gender –

An Interconnected System of Social Oppression and

Structural Violence in Punjabi Villages – Changing

Patterns

8.1. Introduction

This chapter examines the patterns of violence configured around the caste memberships and gender constructions across Kammiss and Zamindars. Taking into account the findings of the previous three chapters, this chapter intends to analyse the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in the context of a Punjabi village. The main categories of community violence and social oppression discussed in the chapter are:

- i) Different forms of social oppression and physical violence against Kammiss involved in their caste occupations or other low graded tasks i.e. labourer Kammiss.
- ii) Symbolic violence and acts of physical violence against Kammiss who have left their caste occupations, and are better off and educated.
- iii) Sexual violence against women in the village setting.
- iv) Patterns of domination and violence among collaterals (caste equals), Kammiss or Zamindars.

The chapter is divided into two major sections. The first looks at the patterns of domination and physical violence among caste collaterals and against caste subordinates consecutively. The second explains the patterns of sexual violence against women in the community sphere. However, the main focus of the chapter remains the oppressive conduct and structural violence against caste subordinates i.e. Kammiss. The structural violence in the present research refers to the patterns of violence organized around the networks of caste based social relationships in a Punjabi village. Furthermore, the chapter details how the patterns of different forms of social oppression and violence in the village setting are changing as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and transforming labour relations between Zamindars and Kammiss. The chapter also analyses how the dynamics of caste based violence differ across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages of Punjab.

8.2. Caste, Gender, and Physical Violence

8.2.1. Patterns of Domination and Violence among Collaterals

This study focuses on the asymmetrical interactions between Zamindars and Kammis and explains how the caste subordination of individuals may lead towards the oppressive conduct against them in the village sphere. However, it is important to consider the relationship patterns among caste collaterals in terms of different forms of social oppression in order to develop a clear understanding of the context. In the present research, the caste collaterals are the members of same caste group i.e. Zamindar or Kammi (Lyon, 2004). As discussed in chapter 5, Zamindar Biradaris residing in both villages under study had a common ancestor, through descended from a different line. Malik Awan households in the irrigate zone's village also had kinship relations, through marriage, with Virk Jats of their village. Hence, all of the Zamindars are considered as caste collaterals in this research. Similarly, different Kammi Quoms residing in a village have common ancestors. However, the present research analyses all Kammi Quoms of a village as caste collaterals against Zamindars. As discussed in chapter 4, all the Kammis are dealt with as a single social unit. Hence the caste memberships, either Zamindar or Kammi, form the basis of collateral social relationships in the present research. Zamindars in the under study villages are not divided into strict material hierarchies since all of them possessed average area of land, with slight differences. The respondents in both villages explained how the land has been divided into small parcels over generations, and thus most of the Zamindar families of their villages own average area of land.

While looking at the patterns of violence and rivalry in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) explained how the opportunities to ensure domination over collaterals through physical violence are limited. Thus, mostly, the non physical and symbolic modes of asserting dominance are employed. Similarly, Zamindar men considered that dominating the collaterals through acts of physical violence may not be an effective tool, even if there are variations in the area of land possessed or economic status across Zamindars. Mushtaq (62, Zamindar man, arid zone) emphasized that even the richest of Zamindars of their village may not assert dominance over poorer Zamindars using violent ways like physical attack:

In villages, caste pride is more important than wealth; every Zamindar is a Chaudhary. One Zamindar cannot dominate another Zamindar though physical attack; other will react. No one tolerate other's expressions of superiority. For example, if a Zamindar tries to express

domination over other Zamindar, the other would reply “if you are a Chaudhary, I do not come from barbers. I consider myself even higher in caste pride”.

Similarly, Kammi respondents suggested that controlling others, placed in the same caste hierarchy, by aggressive means is not acceptable among villagers. Fahad (28, Kammi man, arid zone) said:

Within one’s own Biradari or caste, no one is willing to accept others as superior and nor do any one bears other’s hostile conduct. They would say “if he is richer, he is richer within his house boundaries; he should not practice his influence over us outside”. Direct domination or assaults get involved when there is inequality in relationships, e.g. one is Kammi, and other is Rajput.

The above quotations reflect that the dynamics of relationships among collaterals involving the expressions of dominance in the village setting, and the resulting responses, are similar across Zamindars and Kammis.

On the other hand, Lyon (2004) mentioned that Punjabis share a value structure that praises violent responses to certain actions, even among collaterals. Similarly, the respondents (e.g. Ulfat, 45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) discussed how incidents of physical aggression may take place among collaterals on issues like honour, property (land division), or voting in elections. It was considered that the acts of physical violence against collaterals are not mostly committed as a direct strategy to dominate, but as revenge and to offset each other’s expressions of dominance, thus out of provocation. However, it is preferred to avoid violent responses, if possible, since the cost of violence among collaterals is high. Risks of physical aggression among collaterals, especially Zamindars, may extend beyond that particular incident and individual disputants, and sometimes result in longstanding enmities.

Age was seen as a factor playing a role in determining an individual’s responses towards competitors. Punjabis typically associate aggressive responses against opponents, e.g. in elections, with the young men. Elders are expected to behave wisely in such incidents, discourage the physical assaults, and not get involved. It was commonly heard during the interviews that:

Young men cannot control their aggression because blood is warm in their age. Older men are wise and their duty is to calm down the young blood at the time of dispute (Mushtaq, 62, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

However, the respondents suggested that the elders would support physically violent responses on the issues related with Ghairat/ Izzat. While the aggression towards collaterals is discouraged, it is considered as a highly admired attribute of men when

performed as an act to defend Izzat or group's interest. Talking about the aggression among young men as a valued attribute, Iqbal, (27, Zamindars man, irrigated zone) mentioned that the occasional violent outbursts, carrying guns, or fearsome conduct in dealings, and thus gaining respect out of fear, is admired among young Zamindar boys. It is also associated with their ability to ensure their group's protection and Izzat (Lyon, 2004).

One of the main limitations of the theory of hegemonic masculinity is that it does not provide a satisfactory theory of the masculine subject. While the theory presumes a unitary masculine subject, it is argued that the men can dodge among multiple social meanings and take up the hegemonic norms strategically in order to reconcile and negotiate their position in the social interactions and social relationships. Hence, the masculine subject is a multilayered, divided, and complex subject of gender practices (Collier, 1998; Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; Jefferson, 1994). Similarly, the above discussion suggests how Zamindar men assume contradictory gender practices in a caste society. It is important to note that the hegemonic norms of masculinity can also be contradictory in different social situations. While it is preferred to avoid the acts of physical violence against caste collaterals, it becomes an admired attribute of men to retaliate against them in the Izzat related issues. In the same way, while elders are generally expected to discourage the aggressive responses against opponents, they would support it to defend the Izzat. Age is seen as another factor that changes the dynamics of hegemonic masculinity among Zamindars. This suggests how Zamindar men can assume multiple social meanings to negotiate their social position in a caste society. Hence, it is important to not essentialize the male character and impose a false unity on a social construction that is contradictory, multifaceted, contextual, and changes over time.

The respondents explained how the physical violence among collaterals may take place in order to defend the Ghairat/Izzat. Insulting behaviour or backbiting in the village setting e.g. at Dera may, at times, result in aggressive responses, if the victims feel that it has damaged their Izzat. However, the most serious issue of the honour disputes among collateral are related with the women in family/Biradari, and could result in severe consequences. In this regard, the respondents in the irrigated zone referred to a recent incident of honour killing in their village (also see 7.2.1). The enmity between two Zamindar groups started several years ago, when a young man from one Biradari eloped with a young woman of another Biradari. After the incident took place, none of

the Biradari was willing to reconcile their hostilities towards each other, and it resulted in the honour killing of three young men. In such disputes, the woman's side is considered as the suffering party since their honour is blemished in society. Asif (28, Kammi man, irrigated zone) described the incident like this:

Few years back a young man from one Zamindar Biradari eloped with a young woman from other Zamindar Biradari and they got married. Both Biradaris are enemies since then. They always oppose each other in village, on elections etc and keep indulging in disputes on little issues due to their old hostilities. But recently a severe clash took place which ended in murder of three young men from the Biradari of man who eloped with the woman of other Biradari. Woman's side took revenge in old enmity. Looks it will not end and man's side will react as their three young men are killed in the incident.

Similarly, the land disputes were mentioned as another reason of group violence among Zamindars i.e. division of disputed land or illegally occupied land. At times, minor conflicts, e.g. distribution of irrigated water, result in the hostile reactions and even acts of physical violence. While talking about such disputes, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said:

At times, minor disputes result in physical attack. For example, if one Zamindar used the timings of irrigated water allotted to other Zamindar, it may result in physical quarrel. Similarly, once in our village, cattle of one Zamindar family destroyed sugarcane crop of other Zamindar family and the dispute resulted in a murder.

As discussed in chapter 6, a number of disputes among Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village that result in the physical fighting are related with agricultural activity; mentioned in above quotation as well. Conversely, Zamindars in the arid zone's village were involved in limited cultivation, and none of the respondents in the arid zone pointed out the agriculture related disputes among Zamindars. Since the agricultural activities are part of everyday life in the irrigated zone, the potentials of violent disputes among Zamindars were clearly more in the irrigated zone's village than the arid zone.

Talking about the other reasons for physically violent disputes, the respondents suggested that the Zamindar Biradaris may enter into antagonistic conduct towards each other during elections. It was explained how the symbolic expressions of rivalry often lead towards the physically aggressive responses. Though the Zamindar Biradaris favouring opposing candidates in elections express their resentment towards each other throughout the election, the potentials of interpersonal or group violence are fairly high on the polling day.

While looking at the patterns of violence and rivalry in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) mentioned that asymmetrical power relations form the cornerstone of Pakistani society.

It was suggested that Pakistanis try to assert dominance by imposing asymmetry in social relationships in all social contexts, even where the individuals involved are positioned at equal hierarchical ranking. Nevertheless, dominance in the collateral relations is mostly asserted through indirect and symbolic modes. Examining the symbolic violence and rivalry between equals, Lyon (2004) focussed on the deg ritual, a public feeding, and explained how the dominance is expressed within collaterals through the roles of giver and receiver. However, it is emphasized that assertion of control, through deg ritual, is not directed against the particular receivers. The receivers in the deg ritual are incidental, though direction of dominance is intended. Conversely, the present research does not look at the modes of dominating others, among Zamindars as collaterals, through the roles of giving and receiving but rather a few other forms of indirect dominance. Moreover, the researcher examined the non-physically violent means that were clearly directed against the particular individuals or group with intentions of asserting dominance. Thus, the present analysis may fit more within the Bourdieu (1990) theory of symbolic violence given that the dominance is asserted over the conscious subjects. In addition, the subjects are also aware of it most of the time and they always try to offset the relationship by responding back, yet again through symbolic modes. However, the symbolic means of expressing dominance may, at times, lead towards the acts of physical violence among collaterals.

The respondents (e.g. Iqbal, 27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how opposing groups or individuals, especially who are involved in longstanding feuds, actively try to express their dominance against each other in the village setting using indirect means, and both parties are mostly conscious of it. One of the most common ways of expressing dominance over others, individuals or group, is exploiting the other party's potential weaknesses or spreading scandalous gossips about the competitors (Lyon, 2004) and thus challenging their repute by targeting their Izzat in the village setting. Academics have discussed gossip as a powerful tool to check other's behaviour in the social relationships (Gluckman, 1963). It has been discussed in chapter 6, how a Zamindar Biradari exploits the susceptibility of their rival Zamindar Biradari who are in dispute with the Kammiss of village. They provide financial and political backing to Kammiss for registering FIR against their rival Zamindars. Though Kammiss may still not get justice in the police station, a Zamindar Biradari availed an opportunity to dishonour their opponent Zamindars through Kammiss, the caste subordinates. Iqbal (27, Zamindar

man, irrigated zone) suggested that both Zamindar Biradaris know who is supporting Kammis and what the purpose of that favour is:

It is highly disgraceful for them (Zamindars in dispute with Kammis) that Kammis of village are dragging them in Police station. Other party gossips "look! they are being humiliated by Kammis".

Furthermore, Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how the competing Zamindar Biradaris of their village try to assert dominance over each other, through indirect means, during elections. If a politician contacts a Zamindar Biradari in order to ask for their support, the other Zamindar Biradari would invite the opposing candidate merely to offset the power dynamics in the village setting. Moreover, Zamindar Biradaris arrange corner meetings for politicians, and their active participation in the electoral activities is a signal of their political existence in the village against rival Biradaris. No Zamindar Biradari would like to give up prior to balloting day, irrespective of the fact whether they win or lose. In the same way, ceremonial occasions, especially weddings, are another opportunity for the better off Zamindars to express dominance over collaterals through extravagance and inviting influential persons, e.g. politicians, as guests.

The respondents (e.g. Ahsen, 45, Zamindar man, arid zone) stressed that Zamindars, as individuals or group, would not tolerate the expressions of dominance in collateral relationships, especially if there exists a history of antagonism between rivals. In order to counteract the power relationships, the competing parties actively respond towards each other's expressions of dominance, mostly through indirect ways. Protecting individual or group significance/Izzat by counterbalancing the dominance of competitors was seen as an integral attribute of Punjabi's public masculinity, especially among Zamindars. Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) emphasized that it is against the caste pride of Rajputs to tolerate other's expressions of dominance, especially competitors, in the public sphere. It is considered as an attribute of Kammi men to surrender, accept other's domination, and not act in response. Hence, expressing the dominance towards competitors, through direct or indirect means, and offsetting the power relationships can be understood as a normatively prescribed feature of the Zamindar's public masculinity.

However, indirectly and non-physically expressed domination, using symbolic means, accumulates the existing antagonism among rivals. It was explained how the hostilities among opposing Biradaris may, at times, extend over generations and often lead

towards physically violent disputes in the village setting. As mentioned earlier in this section, such expressions of dominance are openly directed towards the opponents and the concerned parties are mostly conscious of it. Ahsen (45, Zamindar man, arid zone) explained it with the help of following example:

Two major Zamindar Biradaris of our village oppose each other in village affairs, since many years. Both parties would not waste an opportunity to express their dominance over each other. During elections their bitterness goes at peak. In recent elections, when one Biradari won polling station of village, their young men threw fire crackers outside the houses of other Biradari. In response, their men came out of houses and verbal dispute resulted in severe beating.

When rival Zamindars respond violently towards each other, the risks generally extend beyond that particular event. None of the parties involved may accept the options of retreat or reconciliation. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how, at times, minor disputes among Zamindars result in physical violence, only because of the history of antagonism between them. Adversaries may use minor disputes as an opportunity to assert dominance or counterbalance the other party's dominance and it may lead towards aggressive responses. At times, one party intentionally initiates the physical aggression against other party in a minor dispute, finding it an opportunity to dominate them as their longstanding adversaries. For example, when cattle of a Zamindar family in the irrigated zone's village destroyed the sugarcane crop of other family, exchange of harsh words between both families lead to the physical aggression and resulted in a murder. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that the disputants already had acrimonious relationships, since they belonged to opposing Biradaris. Having a reason to dominate their rivals, Zamindar family whose crops were destroyed initiated the physical aggression.

On the other hand, Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages could not point out any particular reasons for physically violent disputes among Kammi as collaterals. When asked about the violent conflicts among Kammi, Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) said:

Kammi quarrel at petty issues related with give and take, or one family of Kammi got annoyed and quarrel with other Kammi family for not accepting the marriage proposal of their son. They would not get involved in violent fights or shoot each other like Zamindars. They are poor, dependent, and oppressed; they cannot approach police or court. So they try to not indulge in violent attacks.

This quotation suggests a relationship between caste, gender, and violence. The previous chapter on intersectionality of caste and gender has explained how the caste based power structures in a Punjabi village shape the masculinity across Kammi and

Zamindars. Sharif referred to those power structures and mentioned that Kammis abstain from getting involved in physically violent disputes against each other because it is difficult for them to bear out its social, economic, and legal cost. It shows how the caste based power structures restrict the ability of Kammi men to retaliate against rivals.

As discussed in chapter 6, Kammis do not actively participate in the social, economic, and political activities in the village which usually turn out to be the major reasons of violent disputes among Zamindars e.g. electoral politics, aspiration for leadership roles, and land and agricultural related activities. Hence, their exclusion from the mainstream village affairs lessens the chances of Kammis indulging in violent disputes as collaterals.

Though Kammis are subordinate masculine identity and notions of Izzat are not exaggerated among them, like Zamindars, the respondents mentioned that Kammis may get involved in violent disputes against each other on honour issues. However, such disputes among Kammis are not usually as violent as disputes among Zamindars. None of the respondents in both villages mention an incident that could indicate the occurrence of severe physical violence among Kammis as collaterals. There was no incident of killing among Kammis in either of the villages under study. Asif (28, Kammi man, irrigated zone) suggested while Kammis may, at times, behave in a hostile way towards each other on minor issues, Zamindars of the village would actively involve themselves as arbitrators to reconcile the dispute, in their presence.

Better off and educated Kammis try to maintain dominance over other Kammis using indirect and symbolic means. However, their expressions of dominance do not generally involve aggression or physical violence. Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) mentioned that the better off Kammis assert dominance by distancing themselves from the Kammis associated with low graded tasks. They generally create their sub groups distinguishing themselves from labourer Kammis. In Lyon's (2004) viewpoint, such ways of expressing dominance over collaterals can be described as symbolically violent means of influencing others.

In conclusion the most common ways of expressing dominance over collaterals in the context of Punjabi villages are symbolic and non physical. However, Punjabis share a value structure that praises the violent responses to certain actions of the caste collateral e.g. honour issues. Physical violence against collaterals is not generally committed as a direct strategy to dominate, but as a revenge or to offset the power relationships in the

village. Nevertheless, it is preferred to avoid the acts of physical violence against collaterals, since its social, economic, and political cost is high and risks may extend beyond that particular incident and individual disputants. Furthermore, the rival Zamindars, individuals/groups, assert dominance over each other using symbolic and non physical ways, though either of the parties involved are mostly aware of it. Hence, the domination is directed towards particular subjects and may, at times, lead towards physically violent disputes. Similarly, Kammiss may also indulge in hostile conduct towards each other but they rarely commit serious physical violence, especially killings. Social, economic, and legal cost of committing physical violence for Kammiss is even higher because of their subordinate social standing and inability to access justice. Most of them are poor and dependent on Zamindars, especially in the irrigated zone's village. Besides, their restricted rights to participate in the mainstream social, economic, and political activities in the village setting reduce the competition among Kammiss as collaterals. Hence, the potentials of physically violent disputes among Kammiss are also less. While the better off and educated Kammiss maintain dominance over other Kammiss using symbolic means, they rarely use physical ways of ensuring domination.

8.2.2. Patterns of Domination and Violence against Caste Subordinates

Though the rhetoric of violence and aggression can be seen as central to the social definitions of masculinity and honour in Punjab, Lyon (2004) stressed that this rhetoric exceed the actual life in Punjabi villages. It is stressed that the occurrence of physical violence in Punjabi villages is very low in spite of journalistic accounts. However, it is important to consider that Lyon was predominantly dealing with the patterns of violence and rivalry between equals, though he briefly discussed the asymmetrical relations as well. Besides, his analysis focussed on how the dominance is asserted and expressed by symbolically violent means in the context of Mauss' theory of gift giving (1990) and Bourdieu's theory of violence through excessive gifts (1990). On the other hand, the present research is mainly interested to analyse the direct physical violence in caste based asymmetrical social relationships. However, it is useful to consider how the excessive giving in caste relationships, e.g. Seyp, between Kammiss and Zamindars is used, by the givers, as a symbolic means to assert asymmetry in relations. In addition, such asymmetrical relations, based on giving and receiving, may result in the violent behaviours against caste subordinates. As discussed in chapter 3, the social exchange model is extensively used to understand the norms of reciprocity and social obligation in different societies (Malinowski, 1922; Orenstein, 1980). It is mentioned that the

exchange relations, in the form of debt or gift giving, could involve the physical and non physical (symbolic) violence as means of expressing domination or ensuring compliance.

Though the caste system in Punjabi villages is in decline, as discussed in chapter 5, occurrence of the physical violence against Kammis is not infrequent. However, an overwhelming response was that its occurrence is certainly decreasing as a result of the changing labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis. In this regard, it should be highly significant to analyse whether the better off and educated Kammis, who do not engage in asymmetrical interactions with Zamindars as frequently, become more secure against physical violence. On the other hand, the respondents suggested that even the better off and educated Kammis may sometimes countenance the violent conduct of Zamindars in the community sphere. While Lyon (2004) claims that the occurrences of physical violence in Punjabi villages are extremely low, it seems he referred only to violence among equals. Conversely, this thesis argues that the incidents of physical violence against caste subordinates are not infrequent in the Punjabi villages, but are mostly unreported. Although such incidents do not take place on everyday basis, it may not be a justifiable claim that the occurrence of physical violence in Punjabi villages is remarkably low. Here, it should be noted that the present research is interested to examine the dynamics of physical violence and its changing patterns, rather than arguing over how frequently the physical violence occurs in Punjabi villages.

The respondents, Kammi and Zamindar, mentioned a number of different factors behind the acts of physical violence committed by Zamindars against Kammis. However, it is important to note that, in this regard, the experiences of better off and educated Kammis were totally different from Kammis working as paid labour in village or involved in other low graded tasks, e.g. daily wage labour in an industry. This section analyses only the dynamics of physical violence against labourer Kammis.

When asked about the nature of disputes that may result in the acts of physical violence against caste subordinates, the respondents mentioned a number of different issues. However, Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) summarized the dynamics of such disputes among Kammis and Zamindars as follows:

When there is a dispute among Kammis and Zamindars, it is always Kammis to suffer. If a Kammi did not perform an assigned task according to desire of Zamindars, conflict emerges. If a Kammi did not reach at work in time, conflict emerges. If a Kammi preferred one Zamindar over other, conflict emerges. If a Kammi gossiped about one Zamindar at Dera of

other Zamindar or in village setting, conflict emerges. If a Kammi reacted on his mistreatment by a Zamindar, conflict emerges. These conflicts may often lead towards beating, whipping, or verbal abusing of Kammis.

This quotation points out nearly all the major factors that often result in the physical violence against Kammis working as labour for Zamindars or involved in other low graded tasks. One of the influential Zamindars Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) shared his experience and identified the similar reasons of violent disputes among Zamindars and Kammis:

Once I asked Noora Mussali to come next day for some work at my Dera but he did not show up that day. I called him a day after to know his reason for not coming. He told that some other Zamindar ordered him to go to city for some work on same day and time. Since I was the first to ask him to come at my place, I felt disgraced on knowing that he did not follow my direction just to oblige some other Zamindar. They are the Kammis of whole village; they should not prefer one Zamindar over another. It was really annoying for me, so I slapped him and also abused him verbally.

It is significant to note in the above quotations that Kammis and Zamindars have the similar perceptions about the phenomenon. The quotations show that the major reasons of physically violent disputes among Zamindars and Kammis include the Kammi's non compliant behaviours, preferring one Zamindar over other, checking Zamindar's authority, arguing over Zamindar's abusive conduct, not following the directions of Zamindars while performing an assigned task, and gossiping against Zamindars in the village setting.

Kammi women working as paid labour in the village setting may also experience physical assaults for the similar reasons. Ammara (35, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) mentioned that it is common for the labourer Kammi women to face verbal abuse at the work place. While the incidents of physical violence against Kammi women were not as numerous as Kammi men experience, these also occur. A few of the Kammi women shared their experiences, or other Kammi women's experiences, of going through the acts of physical violence at work, committed by Zamindars against them. Nazia (31, Kammi woman, arid zone) was slapped by a young Zamindar man, when she was working as labour at a wedding occasion in his house:

I requested khala Aasia (mother of Zamindar men) that she herself should ask me which work I should do for them. Her sons should not order me because I was not comfortable interacting with men. Sohail (eldest son of Aasia), who used to address me in a humiliating way, rushed towards me and slapped me on face. He shouted how I dare to complain about it to their mother. I left washing dishes there and then, and came back home. His mother never stopped him when he slapped me.

However, the respondents highlighted that the occurrence of physical violence against Kammi women in the village setting is much lower compared with the Kammi men. It was suggested that normatively it is not commendable for a Zamindar man to execute an act of physical violence against a Kammi woman. Besides, men relatives of the victim Kammi women strongly condemn such incidents, and it may result in their non cooperation and complaining towards Zamindars. However, they are usually helpless to retaliate. Arguably, the potentials of physical assaults against Kammi women increase because of their men's inability to ensure the family's protection against Zamindars.

The quote from Nazia (31, Kammi woman, arid zone) shows how the management of labour could result in the acts of physical violence against labourer Kammi. The quotation refers to another important factor behind the physically violent disputes among Zamindars and Kammi. Young Zamindar man slapped Nazia on arguing and hence checking his expressions of dominance towards her. The respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone's villages explained how checking Zamindar's authority and dominance, using direct or indirect means, may often result in the physical violence against Kammi, even if Zamindars are at fault. Iqbal (27, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that it is considered highly disgraceful for a Zamindar if a Kammi reacts towards him physically, argues verbally, and thus checks his dominance. In such incidents, Zamindars usually retaliate strongly against Kammi. It was commonly heard during the fieldwork that:

One turn of a Kammi man is equal to hundred turns of a Zamindar man. It means, if a Zamindar man insults or beats a Kammi man hundred times and Kammi man reacts just once, that is equal. It is considered very disgraceful for a Zamindar man that a Kammi man checked his dominance even verbally, or raised hand towards him (Iqbal, 27 Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

If a Kammi, working as labour or associated with low graded tasks, checks the dominance of a Zamindar, most of the time it directly results in the aggressive response from the Zamindar's side. Sharing his experience, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) illustrated how he, along with his cousin, beat a cobbler boy who argued with them and tried to react physically in defence:

We asked Anju (cobbler boy) to come for Sadda (sending formal invitations to villagers) at my brother's wedding but he did not show up. I and my cousin found him in street and verbally abused him for not coming. When he argued with us in response, my cousin slapped him on face. He picked up a stone lying near in defence and tried to hit us. Meanwhile my father appeared from behind and held his arm back and gave him a good beating. We were furious to see the way he tried to retaliate. My father asked both of us to beat him.

The above quotation indicates another example of how the management of labour and checking Zamindar's dominance result in the physical violence against Kammis.

At times, a Kammi resisting Zamindar's expressions of dominance may not face violent act of vengeance instantaneously. However, he must contend with the animosity that may ultimately result in the physical reprisal by Zamindars, using direct or indirect means, against him. Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) explained how his uncle was falsely accused of all the major theft cases in the area, only for the reason that he used to check Zamindar's abusive conduct. Zamindars of the village handed him over to police who brutally beat him but theft charges on him were not proved. After some months, a few other persons were found to be involved in the same theft cases.

The respondents, Kammi and Zamindar in both villages, talked about quite a few incidents when Kammis of their village faced physical violence for being falsely accused of theft or any other crime. These Kammis were brutally beaten by Zamindars and some of them were later handed over to police. The majority of Kammi respondents (e.g. Riaz 48, Kammi man, arid zone) considered that Zamindars use their links with local police to mete out severe punishments to these Kammis in police station. Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone) described one such incident like this:

A few influential Zamindars of our village blamed two young Kammi men of theft. Both Kammis were first beaten by Zamindars cruelly at Adda (nearby urban centre). One of them was hanged upside down with rope and as a result he suffered trauma for a long time. Afterwards, they were handed over to police who inflicted sever punishments on them.

Gulsher was of the view that Zamindars had feelings of resentment towards young Kammi men. Yet again, Kammis accused of theft were not proven guilty. Kammis, as individuals or group, did not act in response or consult any legal help against influential of their village. In the above mentioned incidents Kammis faced acts of physical violence committed by Zamindars but did not react against them, individually or collectively.

While the gossip composed of insult or backbiting is an effective tool to check other's dominance and power among collaterals (Gluckman, 1963; Lyon, 2004), it may turn out to be another important reason of violent conflicts between Zamindars and Kammis. When a young Kammi man gossiped against Falaksher's (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) Biradari at the Dera of their rivals, he was called by Falaksher and his cousins and threatened physically. Asif (28, Kammi man, irrigated zone) stressed that Kammis are always at the risk of physical assaults if they become part of Zamindar's politics. Asif

considered that Kammis should abstain from talking against any Zamindar within the village setting or favouring one Zamindar over others openly.

Narrating a recent incident, Asgher (31, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how Zamindars, at times, use physical assaults against Kammis merely as means of expressing dominance over them:

A few days ago, a tree fell down in the village graveyard because of storm. A young barber brought that tree to his house for burning. My cousin stopped him in street yesterday and asked with whose permission he brought it to his house. Kammi did not have an answer. My cousin gave him a good beat first and then reported it to police as a theft case. Kammi family came at our doorstep for pardon and the issue was resolved.

Asgher highlighted that his cousin did not have any personal grudge against Kammi man but used that incident merely to demonstrate Zamindar's control over village affairs and Kammis of the village.

It is important to mention that the caste structures and dynamics of labour relations, and thus the interaction patterns among Zamindars and labourer Kammis in the routine village affairs differed across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. As discussed in chapter 5 and chapter 6, the *Seyp* and *Dera* system play an important role in sustaining the labour relations among Kammis and Zamindars in the irrigated zone's village. Conversely, Kammis of the arid zone's village associated with low graded tasks had fewer interactions with Zamindars in the daily life, since there were limited labour opportunities owing to the absence of *Seyp* and *Dera*, and infertile land for agriculture. Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were more likely to face acts of physical violence because of their frequent interaction with Zamindars in the village setting, compared with their counterparts in the arid zone's village.

8.2.2.1. Giving as an Institutionalized Asymmetry in Caste Relationships and Violence

While looking at the patterns of symbolic violence and rivalry in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) argued that the Punjabi landlords (Zamindars) do not count on giving as the primary means of attaining authority and prestige in the social relationships and also finds the Bourdieu's use of violence as contentious to apply to the Pakistani context of giving. Conversely, while looking at the practice of giving in the asymmetrical relationships between Kammis and Zamindars, the present study claims that Zamindars employ giving as a direct strategy to assert dominance over their caste subordinates. Some incidents of violence against Kammis in the villages under study suggest how

giving in the caste relationships between Kammiss and Zamindars can be seen as an important factor of symbolic and potential physical violence against Kammiss. Hence, the present analysis is closer to Bourdieu's theory of violence and domination asserted and expressed by means of excessive giving/gifts (Bourdieu, 1990). As discussed previously, the social exchange model has been used to understand the structures of reciprocity and social obligations in different societies (e.g. Mauss, 1990; Orenstein, 1980). Similarly, this section analyses the patterns of giving and receiving in the caste relationships between Zamindars and Kammiss as an institutionalized asymmetry resulting in different forms of social oppression and structural violence against Kammiss. It is explained how the material and the non material social exchanges between Zamindars and Kammiss involve interdependence and are regulated by the norms of asymmetrical reciprocity. The power dynamics in the exchange relationships between Zamindars and Kammiss are understood through resources, dependence, and level of involvement. It is examined how Kammiss, receiving much in the exchange relationships e.g. through Seyp, become vulnerable towards the acts of physical violence and social oppression (Huston, 1983; McDonald, 1981).

Talking about Zamindar's excessive giving to their Seypi Kammiss on the ceremonial occasions in their houses, Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) emphasized that Zamindars assist Kammiss merely to maintain their dominance over them and keep them compliant for the future availability of labour:

Zamindars help Kammiss in the events of happiness and sorrowfulness in their houses to keep them compliant and earn their respect; so it is in Zamindar's benefit. Labourer Kammiss cannot say no to them in future, when asked for labour. After receiving this financial help, Kammiss would become obliged to provide their labour to Zamindars.

Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that Zamindars expect Kammiss to reciprocate in such relationships in form of their manual labour and compliance. As discussed in chapter 6, Zamindars do not establish the relationships of giving and receiving in terms of gift exchange, e.g. on weddings, with Kammiss, especially those still associated with the low graded tasks. If gifts are not reciprocated, the nature of dealings between the concerned parties shifts to super and sub ordinates which may later transform into clear patron/ client relationships (Lyon, 2004). However, in their caste relationships with Kammiss, Zamindars do not want Kammiss to reciprocate in form of gifts, as equals, but rather their manual labour and compliance. Hence, the reciprocity in caste relationships between Kammiss and Zamindar itself is asymmetrical in nature and assures the dominance of Zamindars. If Kammiss could not fulfil the obligations and

loyalty towards Zamindars who supported them in the time of need, they become vulnerable towards the oppressive conduct of Zamindars. Asif (28, Kammi man, irrigated zone) described it as follows:

Zamindar's favour in the time of need oblige Kammi to remain obedient to them. Doing this favour, Zamindars think that a Kammi is now duty bound to come whenever they require him, at any time and for all types of labour. At times, Kammi may not fulfil their expectations e.g. a Kammi may get late or may not come; some other Zamindar may also require him at that time. Or a Kammi may be busy in his household tasks, when a Zamindar requires him. But Zamindars do not consider such difficulties of a Kammi if they need him for work, and would take no time and turn aggressive against him.

In above discussion, 'gift aggression' (Eglar, 1960) can easily be observed in the give and take relationships between Zamindars and Kammi, especially in Seyp; the manner in which Zamindars assist Kammi and their purpose behind this support. Similarly, as discussed in chapter 3, Bourdieu (1990) explained how the relations of dependence that have an economic basis are disguised under a veil of moral relations. Zamindar's economic favours become a lasting obligation for Kammi and gives Zamindars power to assert domination over them (Bourdieu, 1990).

If Kammi do not fulfil their obligations generated by such exchange relations, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that Zamindar, at first instance, would not go for the acts of physical assault. They rather prefer to settle their differences with Kammi and ensure their submission using non physical means, especially with their Seypi. However, verbal abuse and non physical oppressive conduct may frequently be employed. Nevertheless, the situation may lead towards physical aggression, if other, non physical, means of domination does not work.

Obviously, if a Zamindar is not able to guarantee the obedience of his Kammi even with a lot of spending on them (i.e. helping them in the time of need), such as they do not give ear to what is said to them, or they are lazy to respond when required for a task, it may lead to abuse or beating.

On the other hand, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) viewed the Seyp system as an institutionalized way of binding Zamindars and Kammi into asymmetrical relationships that may often result in the oppressive conducts against Kammi. While more than a few Kammi in the irrigated zone's village were working on Seyp contracts with Zamindar, Seyp system had come to an end in the arid zone's village. Sharif (56, Kammi man, irrigated zone) explained how Chaudharies of their village provide maximum assistance to their Seypi Kammi at the time of ceremonial occasions in their houses. Conversely, Akbar (53, Kammi man, arid zone) mentioned that the trends of offering financial help to Kammi in the events of happiness or sorrowfulness at their

houses have finished in their village as a result of the decline in Seyp system, though Kammiss may borrow money from Zamindars. Hence, giving in the caste relationships existed as an institutionalized asymmetrical reciprocity in the irrigated zone's village and suggest that the Kammiss in the irrigated zone's village were more likely to face the oppressive conduct of Zamindars.

However, it was quite common among Kammiss in the arid zone's village to ask for the financial help or borrow money from Zamindars, as mentioned by Akbar above. The respondents in the arid zone's village narrated a recent incident of violence against a Kammi family of their village that clearly depicts how the excessive giving in caste relationships may results in the acts of physical violence. The Kammi family was living on land provided by an influential Zamindar of their village. Further, the Kammi family had received a lot of financial help from that Zamindar. In return, two Kammi men of that family were working as labour at Zamindar's house and restaurant, but were not paid for around three months. When they wanted to quit that job since they were unable to sustain their livelihood, the Zamindar turned violent against their family. Mobeen (38, Kammi woman, arid zone), a member of the Kammi family, described:

He entered in our house and was furious over why they said to quit the job. My nephew, who works as labour at his hotel, left the house at that time because of fear. Everyone knows they (his Biradari) become animals when angry. He forcefully pushed my old father. When I tried to protect my father, he turned towards me and held me from my shirt and it was torn to shreds. He was using extremely abusive language at that time. We were unable to react since we are living on his land and have taken a lot of money from him.

When asked why they, especially her brother or nephew, did not react against Zamindar man or reported the matter to police, Mobeen said:

Police do not listen to us (Kammiss) against such influential. Moreover, they are very hostile as a Biradari; people like us cannot react against them. Therefore, we kept quiet.

The above quotations demonstrate a strong relationship between caste, gender, and violence in the context of a Punjabi village. The young Kammi man was unable to protect his family against a Zamindar, but rather he opted to leave the house at the time incident took place. In addition, the above incident illustrates how the excessive giving in caste relationships and economic dependence of Kammiss over Zamindars may result in the acts of physical violence against Kammiss.

8.2.2.2. Violence against Caste Subordinates - Changing Patterns

While the labourer Kammiss do not generally retaliate against Zamindar's abusive conduct, they may exercise other forms of reprisals. For example, Kammiss would show

lack of co-operation or complaining behaviours towards Zamindars in the provision of their labour (Lyon, 2004). Istikhar (58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) was concerned about the changing dynamics of labour relations in villages and emphasised that Zamindars can no longer exert authority over Kammiss using abusive conduct since Kammiss nowadays take no time in terminating the work contracts and may easily get some other labour in city or a factory. Besides, Kammiss are increasingly leaving their caste occupations and other low graded tasks. As a result, availability of the manual labour is becoming infrequent with time. Zamindars are now required to be courteous towards Kammiss in order to ensure their availability. It suggests that owing to the transforming labour relations, the dynamics of caste based violence against Kammiss are changing in villages. An overwhelming majority of the respondents in both villages (e.g. Istikhar, 58, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) believed that the caste based violence against Kammiss in villages have decreased considerably.

Having the same opinion, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the decline in Seyp and increasing labour opportunities have reduced the direct economic dependence of Kammiss on Zamindars and, as a result, Kammiss have started arguing with Zamindars over their rights:

If I am not facilitating a Kammi like in Seyp or a Kammi is not dependent on me economically, why he would tolerate my abusive conduct and continue working as labour for me, especially when they can easily get other labour opportunities in city. Kammiss nowadays have started verbally arguing with and reacting towards Zamindars. If they do not react, they at least would not work for a Zamindar who beat or verbally abuse them. They will quit working for him and get a labour in city.

Kammiss had the same perceptions e.g. Ashfaq (37, Kammi man, irrigated zone) was working in a nearby industry on daily wages and said:

Both are labours but working in a factory is much better than working on Seyp with Zamindars since we (Kammiss) are at least secure of insult (verbal) and threats of physical abuse in a factory job. Moreover, factory management pay in time, and one can earn more by doing extra work.

The Kammiss were more vulnerable towards oppressive conducts while working on the Seyp with Zamindars and thus being dependent on them. Therefore, Kammiss do not like to work on Seyp, given that the other opportunities of earning a livelihood are available to them.

Conversely, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) had contrasting views to the majority of other respondents and believed that Kammiss were more protected against the physical assaults while working on the Seyp with Zamindars. He suggested that the

Seypis had social and economic obligations towards each other, and it was considered as the moral responsibility of Zamindars to defend their Seypi Kammis against the acts of physical violence committed by the villagers or any other injustices. However, Falaksher stressed that the nature of Seyp relations have also been changed with time. It is more of an economic contract now and the Seypis do not care about any social obligations towards each other. Zamindars nowadays do not like to confront others in favour of Kammis and, as a result, Kammis have become more vulnerable towards abusive conduct in the village sphere.

While talking about the transforming labour relations, Kammi respondents working as paid labour suggested that they do not work for Zamindars who handle them discourteously or threat them physically. Sharing their experiences, Nari (65, Kammi woman, arid zone) and Jameela (57, Kammi woman, irrigated zone) explained how they quit working as paid labour for Zamindars because of their abusive conduct.

I used to wash dishes and do cleaning in Ajmal's (Zamindar) house. Ajmal's family asked my son to provide them labour in harvesting peanut crop, but he declined their request since he was busy with a few other Zamindars. They got annoyed over it. Next day, when I went to their house for work, all of their family members gathered around me and their mother threatened me of slapping. You dare hit me, I told her. I quit working in their house forever (Nari, 65, Kammi woman, arid zone).

Since quite a few Kammi households in the arid zone's village had left working as labour, Kammis still involved as paid labour in the village setting, as a result, were getting more jobs than before. Nari told that it was not difficult for her to find another labour opportunity in other Zamindar households after she quit working at Ajmal's houses, since labour is becoming infrequent. It shows how the dynamics of labour relations between Kammis and Zamindars are changing as Kammis are increasingly leaving work as labourers for Zamindars. In addition, the above incident suggests that the acts of violence can no longer be considered as an effective tool for Zamindars to control Kammis, ensure their compliance, or exert influence over them.

It has been discussed in chapter 5 that the changes in the labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis varied across the arid and the irrigated zone's villages. Agricultural context of the irrigated zone's village uphold the labour relations. More Kammis in the irrigated zone's village, than their counterparts in the arid zone, were vulnerable towards oppressive conduct of Zamindars because of their economic dependence on them.

Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) referred to another dimension of the changing dynamics of caste based oppression against Kammiss and suggested that the Kammiss in Punjabi villages are uniting as Biradaris and thus becoming stronger and capable, as group, to question Zamindar's injustices against them. Though it is still difficult for them to physically retaliate against Zamindars, they could check Zamindar's power verbally. Educated and better off Kammiss are playing a significant role in uniting their Biradaris. It should be noted that the researcher is presently referring to the changing dynamics of caste based violence only against the labourer Kammiss. Having the same opinions, Fahad (28, Kammi man, arid zone) explained how the Mussali Biradari of their village got revenge from two Zamindar brothers who committed physical violence against one of their Biradari member, who was a labourer.

They (Zamindar brothers) accused a young Mussali of stealing agricultural tools from their house and beat him and, as a result, his arm was fractured. In evening, Mussali Biradari gathered at Saqib's place (influential Zamindar of village) and asked for justice. Saqib called both Zamindar brothers at his house and tried to negotiate the matter, but Zamindar brothers behaved aggressively and started abusing Mussalis verbally. 3/4 Young Mussalis, who were already furious over this injustice could not control themselves; they held both Zamindar brothers, and started punching and kicking them, and a few other Mussalis followed.

However, it was the only incident of its kind in the arid zone's village when Kammiss retaliated against Zamindars as a group. Zamindar brothers beat Mussali so badly that even their own Biradari did not support them against Mussalis. However, Fahad thought that the Zamindar brothers would take revenge from Mussalis later. Alongside cobblers, Mussalis were the better off Biradari in the arid zone's village and a few of their Biradari members were not working as labour for Zamindars anymore. Fahad told that young Mussali men who retaliated against Zamindar brothers were among few of the richer Kammiss of their village.

It is important to note in the above discussion that the acts of physical violence are always instigated by Zamindars and Kammiss may only retaliate at times, though it is also rare. There was no incident of violence, illustrated by the respondents, in either of the villages under study in which Kammiss had initiated the physical violence against Zamindars.

The above discussion focuses on how the dynamics of physical violence against Kammiss working as paid labour or involved in other low graded tasks are changing, as a result of the transforming labour relations between Kammiss and Zamindars. The analysis now considers the nature of relationships between Zamindars and better off/educated Kammiss and explains how Zamindars express their dominance over these

Kammis or may commit the acts of physical violence against them. An overwhelming response in both villages was that the better off and educated Kammis are less likely to face physical violence by Zamindars, since they do not depend on Zamindars for their livelihood and their interactions with Zamindars in the village sphere are also infrequent. Zamindars mostly express their domination over better off and educated Kammis of their village using indirect, non physical means. However, if they start confronting Zamindar's authority in the village setting openly, it may also result in the acts of physical violence against them, though not that frequent.

It has been briefly discussed in chapter 7 how Zamindars express their dominance over educated and better off Kammis of their village using indirect means. It should be useful to reiterate it before analysing the dynamics of violence and oppression against better off/educated Kammis. All of the Kammi respondents stressed that Zamindars cannot accept the social equivalence of educated and better off Kammis in the village setting and always try to maintain their caste dominance over them using symbolic and indirect ways. It is significant to note that the most prevalent ways of dominating educated and better off caste subordinates are symbolic, and not physical, like between caste collaterals. However, these ways of dominating caste subordinates are usually well directed towards the subjects and harsher in nature than the ways of dominating caste collaterals.

The following incident, illustrated by Rukhsana (22, Kammi woman, irrigated zone), shows how Zamindars in the irrigated zone checked the emergence of better off barbers in the power structures of their village, and demonstrated their dominance over them:

Our cattle were stolen a few months back. It was a huge economic lose for us. However our cattle were recovered later with the help of Chaudharies of our village. They helped us in police station and also arranged Parea, village council, for us. Recently, it is revealed that the Chaudharies themselves were involved in stealing the cattle with help of Kammis of neighbouring village. They did it to show us that we still need their help in village and to access police, even if we may be richer than them.

As discussed in chapter 5, better off barbers in the irrigated zone's village were living a comfortable life. A few of their Biradari members were employed in the Middle East countries, and a few others residing in the village owned land and were involved in cultivation. Barber Biradari also started contributing in the village affairs, e.g. they were organizing a fare in the village along with Zamindars for a few years. Besides, they started uniting as Biradari and were taking their collective decisions without involving Zamindars. This incident shows how Zamindars use symbolic capital i.e. their ability to

influence the social environment as a source of power to express domination over Kammis, and thus they exercise symbolic violence (Bourdieu, 1990).

As mentioned earlier, if the better off/educated Kammis start challenging Zamindar's authority openly in the village sphere, it may lead to face to face verbal abuse, or even physically aggressive responses towards Kammis. Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) illustrated his experience:

We celebrate annual fare in village; Zamindars arrange the fare on first day and on second day it is the turn of Kammis. Since last two years we (barbers) have taken lead and also arrange Kabaddi (wrestling) on our day and spend more money on fare than Zamindars. This time when I arranged a better show than Zamindars, they could not tolerate it and one of them verbally abused me in a dirty way on loud speaker to remind me my caste. I was better than him in terms of education and economics, he should have given me respect, but he could not endure that a Kammi have arranged a better show than them and humiliated me.

Similarly, when better off Mussalis of the arid zone's village openly voted for the candidate favoured by one Zamindar Biradari of their village in election, the young Zamindar men from other Biradari verbally abused them outside the polling station on election day. The above incidents show how Zamindars use the non physical ways to oppress better off and educated Kammis.

Though the acts of physical violence against educated and better off caste subordinates are less likely, it still may occur. Kammi respondents in the arid and the irrigated zone's village illustrated some incidents of physical assaults, committed by Zamindars against better off/educated Kammis. For example, Fahad (28, Kammi man, arid zone) explained how an influential Zamindar of the village slapped a young Kammi man who runs a cloth business and belongs to one of the richer Kammi households of their village:

While driving car in the village street, Zakir crossed the cloth shop of a young cobbler who was sitting outside his shop with sprawled legs stretching well into street, though short of obstructing the passage of Zakir's car. Even then Zakir stopped, came out of his car, and slapped the cobbler and asked why his legs are in the street. After a couple of hours, the entire cobbler Biradari came out of their houses with clubs in their hands to take revenge but Zamindars apologized.

The above incident shows when better off cobblers reacted against Zamindars as a group, Zamindars apologized. It was a signal from the cobbler Biradari to Zamindars that they will not tolerate acts of physical violence against them anymore, since they were now independent in earning their livelihood. However, Fahad considered that Kabir slapped young cobbler merely to express Rajput's dominance over wealthier cobblers or, in other words, tried to give a message to the wealthier cobblers that they are still inferior to Rajputs in the village. Nevertheless, the majority of the respondents

thought that Zamindars do not usually employ the acts of physical violence against better off and educated Kammis merely to express their dominance over them, since there are chances, though rare, of retaliation or reporting the matter to police.

As mentioned previously, the concept of hegemonic masculinity has been criticized for not explaining how the subordinate masculinities exist in tension with and impact the hegemonic masculinity (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; Demetriou, 2001). It has already been discussed in chapter 6 how the educated and better off Kammis confront Zamindar's dominance at individual and group levels. Similarly, this incident of physical violence against Kammis clearly points out the challenges that Kammi masculinity poses to Zamindar masculinity in the context of a Punjabi village. Better off cobblers in the arid zone's village openly challenged Zamindar's act of physical violence and Zamindar men were required to apologize. While Zamindar men may use occasional violent outbursts to express their dominance over Kammi men, it is significant that Kammi men have started confronting such expressions of Zamindar masculinity with time. The class standing of the Kammis plays an important part in rendering Kammi men the ability to question Zamindar men's hegemonic masculinity. It is a clear example of how marginalized masculinities exist in tension with and can transform the hegemonic masculinity. This suggests that the interaction of different masculinities and their hierarchy is a continuing process of negotiation and reconfiguration in a society and thus it is not appropriate to develop a static typology of multiple masculinities (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; Demetriou, 2001).

However, as mentioned above, if better off Kammis confront Zamindars openly in the village setting it may possibly result in the physically violent attacks against them. Rizwan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) talked about one such incident that took place recently in their village:

Zamindars initiated a government funded project to drain the waste water of the village outside the village boundaries in agricultural fields. Way of the water flow covered the land of many Zamindars and a Kammi as well. Concerned Zamindars agreed to the project but Kammi man resisted contributing his land for the drainage purpose. It led to conflict between Zamindars and Kammi man and ended in severe beating of that Kammi family by Zamindars. Later, Zamindars forced that project through, without the consent of concerned Kammi family.

Later, that Kammi family migrated from the village. Rizwan considered that the Kammi family faced the physical violence only for being Kammis, and Zamindars knew that Kammi family is not in position to react against them, especially when they all (Zamindars) were united for a cause concerning whole village. Similarly, Sajid (24,

Kammi man, irrigated zone) illustrated how an educated cobbler of their village was slapped by a Zamindar while defending his brother in law who was being beaten by that Zamindar. The young cobbler was the only educated member of his Biradari and all other cobblers of the village were uneducated and working as paid labour for Zamindars. He had to give up against Zamindar, who slapped him, and did not act in response because he knew that there was no one behind him to support him in the process of reprisal.

This incident refers to an important dimension of violence against better off and educated Kammis. As mentioned above, a few times, better off cobblers and Mussalis of the arid zone's village tried to retaliate against Zamindars who committed physical violence against any of their Biradari members. Conversely, there was not even a single incident in the irrigated zone's village when educated/better off Kammis had affectively responded towards Zamindar's acts of violence. In fact, as discussed in chapter 5, only a few Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were educated or better off, and most of their other Biradari members were still involved in the low graded task. Thus, they lacked the support of their poor Biradari members' still working on Seyp or other paid labours, in order to retaliate against Zamindars as a group. Conversely, quite a few Kammis in the arid zone's village were educated or better off, especially in cobbler and Mussali Biradaris, and were not dependent on Zamindars economically. Hence, a couple of Kammi Biradaris in the arid zone's village had numerical strength to check Zamindar's dominance. Though their physically violent reprisal against Zamindars had never been that affective, they sent a signal to Zamindars that they would not tolerate acts of physical violence against them anymore. The educated and better off Kammis of the arid zone's village experienced less violence from Zamindars compared with their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village.

In conclusion Kammis working as paid labour for Zamindars or involved in other low graded tasks are vulnerable towards the potential acts of physical violence by Zamindars in the village setting owing to their economic dependence on Zamindars and/or poverty. Occurrences of physical violence against Kammi women working as paid labour in the community environment are not as frequent as against Kammi men. Zamindars in Punjabi villages employ giving as a strategy to exert dominance over Kammis and keep them compliant. If Kammis are not able to reciprocate in the form of their manual labour and loyalty, they may become vulnerable towards different forms of oppression. However, the patterns of violence against Kammis are changing as a result of the

transforming labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis. Kammis are leaving their caste occupations, and they do not like to work as labour, e.g. Seyp, for Zamindars given that the other labour opportunities are now available to them e.g. daily wage factory labour. While the availability of Kammi labour is reduced, Zamindars are required to deal with Kammis working for them as labour in courteous manner. Otherwise, Zamindars mentioned that Kammis take no time in terminating the work contacts nowadays and may easily find other labour opportunities. Since Seyp, Dera, and extensive agricultural activity uphold the caste structure and labour relations among Kammis and Zamindars, it is suggested that the labourer Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were more vulnerable towards the different forms of oppression than their counterparts in the arid zone. A few Kammis in Punjabi villages are educated and better off. Zamindars mostly express their domination over educated and better off Kammis through symbolic means. However, Zamindars may commit acts of physical violence against better off/educated Kammis if they start confronting Zamindars openly in the village sphere, though such incidents are not that frequent.

8.3. Caste, Gender, and Sexual Violence in the Community Sphere

This section analyses the patterns of sexual violence against women in relation to the intersectionality of caste and gender i.e. their caste memberships and caste based gender constructions. Protecting the social reputation associated with sexuality and potentials of sexual assaults against women in the community sphere play a central part in defining the basis of emphasized femininity in the Punjabi villages. As discussed in chapter 7, women in Punjabi village are obligated to protect their sexuality following the socially prescribed ways of restricted mobility. The men in family are considered responsible to protect the honour of the family associate with the sexuality and body of their women by restricting their mobility in the public sphere.

Nearly all of the respondents considered that their caste memberships and inability of their men to ensure group protection reinforce the potentials of sexual assaults against Kammi women in the village sphere. However, it was mentioned that the occurrences of sexual assaults against Kammi women are lessening, given that the Kammis are increasingly leaving their caste occupations and opting for respectable works, and, as a result, their economic dependence on Zamindars is reducing. Besides, Kammi women of the better off households do not work as labour in the village, and thus practice the restricted mobility in the community sphere.

While looking at the dynamics of power and patronage in a Punjabi village, Lyon (2004) argued that:

There is some violence in rural Punjab but the narratives expand these incidents to impossible frequencies. In particular, if urban Pakistani narratives were an accurate reflection of the level of violence in the villages there would hardly be a man left alive or a woman left un-raped.

The researcher supports Lyon's argument about how the local narratives exaggerate the occurrences of violence in Punjabi villages. Though the potentials of sexual assaults against women in the community sphere, especially labourer Kammi woman, cannot be overlooked, it seems that the local discourses expand its occurrences in the actual life of a Punjabi village. But more importantly, the present research analyses how such exaggerations in local discourses could increase the risks of sexual assaults against Kammi woman in the community sphere. In order to explain it, it is important to uncover the structural relationships that shape the social discourses about the potential acts of sexual assaults against woman in the village setting as a social reality.

Nevertheless, all of the respondents acknowledged the occurrences of sexual assaults against woman in the community sphere of Punjabi villages and explained how the caste structures and subordinate gender identities of Kammis may reinforce the acts of sexual violence against Kammi woman. There was a broad consensus among all the respondents that Kammi women working as paid labour in the village sphere are highly vulnerable, much more than the other women, towards the potential acts of sexual assaults because of the roles and obligations associated with their jobs.

8.3.1. Masculinity, Politics of Revenge and Sexual Assaults against Women

While discussing the patterns and reasons of sexual violence against women within the community sphere, all of the respondents suggested a strong association between the potentials of sexual assaults against women and the ability of their men to take revenge against the perpetrators. Chapter 7 has discussed how the ability of a man to retaliate against the competitors is shaped through the power structures revolving around the web of caste statuses, Biradarism, political patronage, connections with the local justice authorities, economic standing, and accessibility to approach police. All of the respondents were of the view that Zamindar's ability to ensure family's protection lessens the potentials of sexual assaults against their women. Conversely, Kammi women are considered as susceptible towards disreputable experiences in the village setting because of their men's helplessness to retaliate against perpetrators, especially

Zamindars. Kammi cannot protect even themselves against the acts of physical violence committed by Zamindars.

Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how the responses of Zamindar and Kammi men towards the perpetrators of sexual assaults against their women would differ, and what may be the outcomes of those responses. Discussing the Zamindar's response, Ulfat said:

If a man tries to commit sexual assault against a woman from Zamindar Biradari, it will result in a severe clash. First, the victim family will try their best to take revenge by doing same act against any woman from the perpetrator's family. Consequently, someone may get injured or even killed from any party. After that the matter may be reported to police. Such conflicts result in the longstanding enmities.

Fahad (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) narrated a recent incident that occurred in their neighbouring village, when a young Zamindar man tried to commit sexual assault against a young woman from another Zamindar family. Though the woman's family was comparatively poor, their Biradari got involved in order to take reprisal against the perpetrator. A clash took place between both Biradaris and later the woman's side reported the matter in police station. This suggests that Zamindars mostly react as a group towards the perpetrator and thus economic position of the victim family may become a secondary factor.

Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) explained how a matter is usually resolved if both the victim and the perpetrator belong to Kammi Biradaris:

If a man commits sexual assault against a Kammi woman, Biradari of that Kammi woman would approach any Deradar, Numberdar, or any other respectable Zamindar. But it only happens if both victim and perpetrator parties are Kammi. They do not generally resolve such matters themselves or involving any other Kammi. Moreover, they cannot access police that easily. At times, victim's family may also react towards perpetrator, but their reaction is not that violent like Zamindars.

However, in the context of present study, the researcher was particularly interested to know the response of Kammi men if a Zamindar man commits an act of sexual violence against their woman in the community sphere. Ulfat explained it as follows:

If a Zamindar man commits sexual assault against a Kammi woman, and it is disclosed, Kammi Biradari would condemn it strongly and involve respectable Zamindars to take action. But nothing serious happens. First, Kammi women normally do not disclose the assault. Even if it is exposed, the issue normally gets resolved peacefully and through mutual consensus. It generally does not result in a serious quarrel. Kammi cannot even think to commit sexual assault against any woman from Zamindar's family as revenge; this never happen. Honour killing do not take place either.

Ulfat referred to another important dimension of the phenomenon and explained how the matter is mostly resolved if the victim Kammi family is not satisfied with the decision of local justice authorities and intends to report the incident to police:

If Kammis do not sit quietly, what maximum would happen is that the father of young Zamindar man (perpetrator) will go at the doorstep of those Kammis for an apology and everyone (other villagers) would say to the victim Kammi family “he has done something wrong, just forgive it now. Come on, do not be angry; it will not happen in future”. Even if the matter is reported in police, nothing serious may result against Zamindars when other party are Kammis.

It was mentioned that on such occasions Kammis generally forgive, if a Zamindar goes at their doorstep. However, in case of a serious matter, e.g. rape, the concerned Kammi family may migrate from the village.

The perceptions about the varying responses of Kammi and Zamindar men towards the perpetrators of sexual assaults against their women seem to be over generalized among villagers, regardless of the fact that the actual occurrences of sexual assaults in the village setting may not be that frequent. Nearly all respondents had similar views about how Zamindar and Kammi men would respond towards the perpetrators of sexual assaults against their women in the community sphere. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) considered that in view of their perceptions about Kammi men’s inability to retaliate, young Zamindar men remain undaunted in the face of any possible reaction while committing sexual assaults against Kammi women in the community sphere.

Young Zamindar men do not get afraid of committing sexual assault against Kammi women, since they exactly know what maximum may happen against them. Nothing serious happens against them. But a Kammi or even a Zamindar man do not easily go for such an act against Zamindar woman. They know the revenge; they know that an FIR will be registered against me or they will take away a woman from my house.

Having the same opinion, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggested that the young Zamindar men generally do not have the fear of effective reprisal from Kammi men. However, in order to keep their reputation from being blemished, they usually avoid indulging into such acts openly.

The above discussion clearly shows how the production of power in a caste society and processes between (intersectionality of) caste and gender create a system of social oppression against Kammis, which result in the acts of sexual violence against Kammi women. Similarly, using the theory of intersectionality, Crenshaw (1991) has examined the violence against women of colour as an interaction of race and gender.

Some of the incidents, narrated by the respondents, suggest how the above mentioned ideas about the varying responses of Kammi and Zamindar men towards the perpetrators of sexual assaults against their women are actually put into practice. Amna (20, Zamindar woman, irrigated zone) narrated a recent incident in their village, when a young Zamindar man extended his hand towards a young woman from weaver's Biradari working on his agricultural fields as labour and the woman disclosed the incident to her brothers. Weaver family had a Seyp contract with perpetrator's household and the victim woman was busy in sowing crops on the agricultural fields of their Seypis at the time incident took place.

Brother of that young Kammi woman stopped the Zamindar man on street and they behaved aggressively towards each other. Later, the matter was reported to the father of that young Zamindar man (perpetrator), who guaranteed that such incident will not take place again. Committee of Zamindars decided to temporarily expel that young Zamindar man from the village and he was sent to his maternal uncle's house in other village. He is again back in the village after spending a few days outside.

Conversely, as discussed in chapter 5, when a young cobbler man in the irrigated zone's village eloped with and married a young Zamindar woman, the cobbler family was threatened physically by Zamindars and they were forced to migrate from the village.

The above mentioned incident by Amna did not come to an end. It was suggested that the young Zamindar man developed an intense rivalry with the brother of that Kammi woman, who stopped him on the street. After a few months, the Kammi man was found shot dead and the villagers believed that it was the result of that antagonism. The young Zamindar man could not tolerate that a Kammi of his village checked him aggressively, even if he was found guilty. It clearly suggests how Zamindar and Kammi men retaliate against their competitors.

One of the above quotations by Ulfat (45, Zamindar man irrigated zone) pointed out that the Kammi women mostly do not disclose the acts of sexual assaults against them in the community sphere. Having the same opinion, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the women in Punjabi villages prefer to not reveal such incidents to the detriment of their feminine sanctity and reputation, since they may face problems in their marriage proposals in future. Moreover, social respect of their family will also be in question, if they expose it. Falaksher mentioned that even if a Kammi woman informs to her family, the family may not like to divulge the incident, especially if the perpetrator is a Zamindar they cannot go up against. Similarly, Sajid (24, Kammi man, irrigated zone) was of the view that if a woman reveals an act of sexual assault against

her, it means that she does not value her and her family's reputation that such revelation might destroy. It shows how the culturally prescribed morals compel the women to conceal any acts of sexual violence against them in the community sphere, especially if the victim's family is helpless to retaliate against the perpetrator. Ahsan (45, Zamindar man, arid zone) stressed that such behaviours, of not exposing the sexual assaults, embolden the young Zamindar men to commit violence against Kammi women without risks of facing effective reprisal from the victim's family.

8.3.2. Caste Based Roles, Unsafe Spaces in Village Setting, and Sexual Violence

The respondents explained how the roles and obligations associated with their jobs increase the potentials of sexual assaults against Kammi woman working as labour in the community sphere (also see 7.3.1). Labourer Kammi women are required to move excessively in the village setting and work in male spaces, e.g. agricultural fields and Dera, and other's houses, and thus they become susceptible towards disreputable experiences. However, the unsafe spaces at which the potentials of sexual assaults increase against Kammi women differed across both the villages under study. Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were clearly more vulnerable towards such incidents in the community sphere compared with their counterparts in the arid zone's village. As discussed in chapter 7, Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were working on agricultural fields and at Dera (both are male spaces), and houses of Zamindars, as Seypi or paid labour. The Zamindars do not like their women to visit the Dera. Conversely, Kammi women in the arid zone's village were working only as maidservants in Zamindar's houses or as paid labour at the ceremonial occasions. There was a limited and seasonal agricultural activity in the arid zone's village and Zamindars did not employ Kammi women as regular labour on their fields. The mobility of Kammi women in the village setting was greater in the irrigated zone's village than the arid zone. The Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were moving outside their village boundaries to work on agricultural fields.

When asked about the places where Kammi women become vulnerable towards the sexual assaults, the responses across the arid and the irrigated zone varied considerably. Riaz (48, Kammi man, arid zone) talked about the unsafe places for Kammi women in the arid zone's village as follows:

Kammi women who work in Zamindar's houses as housemaids are not secured even by 5%. I know many cases (incidents) when these women were forced towards that act and later were threatened not to reveal it.

By 5 % Riaz meant that Kammi women who work at other's houses are least secure. The majority of respondents in the arid zone's village discussed the vulnerability of Kammi women towards acts of sexual assaults while working as labour in Zamindar's houses. However, they could not clearly mention any other spaces, other than Zamindar's houses. Speaking broadly, most of them suggested that it may happen to Kammi women at the desolate tracts like fields or graveyard side outside the village, though Kammi women do not visit such places regularly. In a couple of incidents, narrated by Raheel (44, Zamindar man, arid zone), Zamindar men committed sexual assaults against Kammi women on the fields outside the village. However, these Kammi women were not working on fields but rather they were just passing through to get to another village.

Conversely, Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were visiting the places like fields and Dera regularly, in addition to Zamindar's houses, as part of their job obligations. Talking about the spaces in the irrigated zone's village where Kammi women are more vulnerable towards sexual abuse, Ulfat (45, Zamindar man) said:

She is at risk everywhere and all the time. When she works in houses and at Dera of Zamindars, she is at risk. When she works on agricultural fields, she is at risk. Even when she is alone at her own house, she is at risk because her husband also works outside home for whole day.

However, Ulfat considered that Kammi women are most vulnerable while Working on the agricultural fields:

There are many chances of sexual assault against Kammi women who work on fields. If a woman is working in sugarcane field alone, it is easy to commit sexual assault against her. Therefore Zamindars do not prefer their women to work alone in sugarcane field. Moreover, Zamindar women will always work at their own fields but Kammi women work at other's fields where Zamindar men may also be present. Besides, Zamindars are powerful in the village; no one will extend hand towards their women that easily. But no one fears from committing sexual assault against Kammi women.

In the incident narrated by Amna in section 8.3.1, a young Zamindar man committed sexual assault against a weaver woman working on fields. Kammi women working on fields are more vulnerable towards sexual assaults than Zamindar women performing the same activity at the same place. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) suggested that the chances of sexual assaults against a women working on fields are higher, either she is Kammi or Zamindar. Therefore, Zamindars do not like to involve their women, especially young women, in agricultural activity. Zamindar women work on fields occasionally. Conversely, Kammi woman do it, as paid labour, for their livelihood or as part of their Seyp contract (also see photo 8.1).



Photo 8.1 Agricultural field is largely a male space, located outside village boundaries in the irrigated zone's village. The picture shows how high the maize crops often grow. This provide some seclusion to workers on agricultural fields, which on occasion can be abused for other reasons including sexual violence; refers to the Ulfat's quotation above (Source: author's photo)

Furthermore, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) mentioned that more than a few Kammi households in their village do not have toilets in their houses and for that reason their women go out on fields where they become highly vulnerable towards sexual abuse. Conversely, the situation in the arid zone's village was different in this regard and Kaneez (46, Kammi woman, arid zone) told that the majority of Kammi households in their village have toilets. It also shows that the socio-economic position of Kammis was better in the arid zone's village than the irrigated zone's village.

8.3.3. Who Are More Involved in Sexual Violence - Zamindar or Kammi Men?

The caste memberships of women may increase or decrease their vulnerability to the sexual abuse. However, the dynamics and frequency of committing such acts could differ across the Kammi and Zamindar men. In this regard, nearly all of the respondents suggested that the frequency of Zamindar men being involved in such acts is much more than the Kammi men. Besides, this section discusses some added dimensions of how their caste memberships mediate the potentials of sexual abuse against women in the village setting. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigate zone) explained it as follows:

At times, Kammi men may commit sexual assaults against Kammi women but their ratio is much lesser than Zamindar men. In fact, Zamindar men feel secure while doing it. They think, what maximum would happen is that it will get revealed. They are not afraid of any serious reprisal. Conversely, Kammi men may react against each other because they are equal in caste status, so they do not go for it that easily. In case of a Zamindar perpetrator, victim Kammi family would only complain to his family. But in case of Kammi perpetrator, victim Kammi family have both options, to react and to complain. So there are fewer chances of Kammi men doing it as compared to Zamindar men, who do not get afraid of Kammi men that much.

It is important to mention that Falaksher was referring to the Kammi women who belong to the Kammi households involved in low graded tasks. Arguably, they are in the majority in the Punjabi villages, especially in the irrigated zone. On the other hand, the dynamics of approaching the women of better off or educated Kammi may be rather different.

An overwhelming majority of the respondents believed that the Zamindar women are less likely to experience sexual assaults in the village setting, though they may go for sexual activity with consent. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) emphasized that there are rare chances, nearly impossible, that a Kammi man would commit an act of sexual assault against Zamindar women. However, Kammi men may, at times, enter into illegal sexual relationships with Zamindar women, with mutual consent, since it is easy for them to approach Zamindar's houses being their Kammi. Conversely, Furkan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) considered that a Zamindar woman may not like to get involved in an illegal sexual activity with a Kammi man, even with consent. However, as discussed in chapter 5, in a couple of incidents in both villages under study young Zamindar women eloped with and married young Kammi men of their village. Gulsher (30, Kammi man, arid zone) suggested that even if a Kammi man approaches a Zamindar woman or exchanges abusive words towards her, he must contend with direct or indirect forms of revenge and that act may prove costly to him, if exposed. Similarly, the respondents suggested that the Zamindar men may sometimes commit acts of sexual assault or put across verbal abuse against Zamindar women. However, it is less likely because of their restricted mobility in the village setting and high chances of their men to retaliate.

Conversely, it was a widely believed social reality and mentioned by an overwhelming majority of the respondents that Kammi women are not only highly susceptible to sexual violence in the village setting but rather it actually happens against them. In this regard, a few Zamindar men shared their experiences. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said that:

It happens and may happen even without their (Kammi women) consent. It is easy to approach them because of their excessive mobility in village and on fields. I have done it so many times on fields.

The respondents mentioned that the young Zamindar men at times try to initiate such relationships with young Kammi women through acts of assault which, they thought, may later transform into consensual activity, in a few cases. Similarly, Zamindar respondents detailed how the young Zamindar men may avail only a soft expression from young Kammi women or their half hearted consent, considering it a signal to initiate a relationship, and commit sexual assault against them. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) and Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) added that at times Zamindar men get involved with Kammi women on the strength of their caste status. If Kammi women, in response, show even half hearted consent, Zamindar men may attempt to initiate a sexual act towards her since culturally men are supposed to make the first move in such relationships. Hence, such cultural conceptions may ultimately end in an act of sexual assault against Kammi women. A few Zamindar men shared their experiences when they initiated such act against a Kammi woman on the basis of her half hearted consent.

She used to smile while crossing me on street (community sphere) and it happened time and again. It is considered as a clear signal in villages. One day I found her alone on fields and I forced her inside fields (Asgher, 31, Zamindar man, irrigated zone).

Though she resisted, Asgher believed that it was merely her culturally prescribed resistance and every woman initially resists (pretends) in such incidents. It shows how the men are positioned in a social network in which certain cultural conceptions about sexual behaviours within the gender relationships may define, and thus normalize, an act of sexual assault as an activity with consent. It seems that, at times, men themselves do not know that they are committing a sexual assault against a woman but rather they consider the resistance of a woman as the culturally prescribed response.

Breaking into Kammi's house crossing the outer walls, usually at night time, is a popular theme of the narratives about sexual assaults against Kammi women in Punjabi villages. Though it may not occur frequently, the respondents mentioned a few incidents when young Zamindar men were caught by the villagers while crossing the walls of a Kammi's house or were found inside house. The respondents considered that they broke into the private sphere of Kammis by crossing the outer walls of their house at mid-night time with mere intentions of sexual activity, though the sexual act may be forced or consensual. Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) shared his experience of

crossing Kammi's wall at night, a few years back, and committing sexual assault against a Kammi woman. Ulfat rather reluctantly admitted that once he already had indulged in sexual act with her by mutual consent. However, this time, he did it without her consent.

However, as discussed in chapter 7, if an outsider, e.g. a man from a neighbouring village, breaks into Kammi's house, it questions the Izzat of whole village, and the men villagers retaliate against the perpetrators. Rizwan (28, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) illustrated how a young Zamindar man from neighbouring village was harshly beaten by Zamindars of his village, and later was handed over to police, when he was caught at mid-night crossing the walls of a Kammi's house in their village. In the neighbouring village of the irrigated zone's village, Zamindars murdered a young Zamindar man from another village on the same account. The respondents (e.g. Furkan, 28, Zamindar man, arid zone) stressed that it questions the Izzat of whole village that an outsider is found involved in such act with a woman of their village and that too inside the boundaries of their village. Hence, the whole village reacts, especially Zamindar men, and it may end in beating or even murder. Conversely, if a Zamindar man breaks into the house of Kammis of his own village, he may earn a bad name for his act. However, he usually does not face very serious consequences.

8.3.4. Sexual Violence in the Community Sphere – Changing Patterns

The majority of respondents were of the view that the incidents of sexual assaults in Punjabi villages are lessening considerably, especially against Kammi women, as a result of the changing caste dynamics and labour relations between Kammis and Zamindars.

As discussed in chapter 7, Kammi women working as paid labour in the village setting become highly vulnerable towards the acts of sexual assaults because of their frequent mobility in the male spaces. Therefore, the educated and better off Kammis do not want their women to work as labour in the community sphere given that they can run the family circle without the economic contributions of their women. Falaksher (35, Kammi man, irrigated zone) suggested that the vulnerability of Kammi women towards disreputable experiences lessens considerably if they do not move outside their domestic spheres for economics since they are not easily approachable by men. Similarly Ulfat (45, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) said that:

Educated and better off Kammis are in better position to protect their women against disreputable experiences. They can run their family circle without the contribution of their women. Therefore, their women do not work as labour in village and become securer of many problems. Moreover,

they are less dependent on Zamindars. They also become a lot more careful about their respect in the village and do not like that their women should move outside frequently.

The Kammis in Punjabi villages are increasingly leaving their caste occupations and are opting for respectable work, and as a result, their economic dependence on Zamindars is reduced. The socio-economic position of Kammis in the arid zone's village was much better than their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village. Quite a few Kammis in the arid zone's villages were involved in respectable occupations and thus their women did not have to work outside the domestic sphere. A few of the Kammi women were educated and employed as school teachers. Conversely, a large majority of Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were working either on Seyp or involved in other low graded tasks and their women were also required to work for their Seypis or do paid labour. Only a few Kammis in the irrigated zone's village were educated and some of the barbers were better off. Comparison of the socio economic status of Kammis across both villages under study suggests that more Kammi women in the arid zone's village were able to protect themselves against disreputable experiences in the community sphere compared with their counterparts in the irrigated zone's village. Hence, it should be safe to assume that the chances and rate of recurrence of sexual assaults against Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were more than the arid zone's village.

In the above quotation, Ulfat suggested that the educated and better off Kammis become conscious about their social prestige associated with women. Since these Kammis can fulfil their economic needs and do not require their women to work as labour anymore, they start considering the other criteria, next stages, on the hierarchy of social positioning of individuals in a village society and try to secure their prestige associated with their women.

The majority of respondents viewed the inaccessibility as a major factor that lessens the potentials of sexual assaults against Kammi women of educated/better off Kammis. Besides, a few of the respondents (e.g. Rizwan, 28, Zamindar man, arid zone) stressed that Zamindar men also hesitate to initiate such acts against the women of better off Kammis since there are high chances of their men showing dissent over the incident and complaining the matter to the perpetrator's family or taking a legal action. As a result, the reputation of the perpetrator may get blemished.

This refers to two important criticisms of the theory of hegemonic masculinity mentioned previously in the chapter. Rizwan (28, Zamindar man, arid zone) suggests how the Kammi masculinity exists in tension with and impact the Zamindar masculinity

in the context of a caste society (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; Demetriou, 2001). Zamindar men start incorporating the better off/educated Kammi men in the mainstream power structures of the village as a result of their ability to challenge Zamindar masculinity. It indicates that the subordinate masculinities can transform the hegemonic masculinity. The above discussion by Rizwan also suggests how Zamindar men dodge among multiple social meanings in order to negotiate their position in different social situations, which reflect their multilayered and divided masculine subject (Collier, 1998; Jefferson, 1994). Zamindar men behave differently towards women of educated/better off Kammi and labourer Kammi women. They assume different social meanings and results for committing an act of sexual assault against two different categories of Kammi women.

Considering the social differentials and social hierarchies in terms of gender, caste and class, the social inequality and conflict theories can be useful to explain the dynamics of social relationships between better off/educated Kammi and Zamindars. As discussed in chapter 3, social inequality and conflict theories understand violence by signifying the power relationships between dominant and dominated social groups in terms of material resources and means of production (DeKeseredy and Perry, 2006). In the present research, it is important to consider how the caste based power disparities across Zamindars and Kammi are mediated through the material resources. As discussed in chapter 5, possession of land and cultivation are the major sources of income in Punjabi villages. The socio-economic bases of the village life are organized around the agricultural economy, which also determine the dynamics of asymmetrical social relationships between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms e.g. *Seyp* contracts. However, if Kammi acquire some land and start cultivating, their direct economic dependence on Zamindars reduces considerably and they do not get involved in the asymmetrical social interactions with Zamindars that frequently. It not only increases their socio-economic position but positively affects their social experiences in the village life. Correspondingly Rizwan highlights that the better off Kammi become less at risk from the acts of violence in the village setting, though they remain a lower caste identity. It shows how the changing roles of Kammi in the main productive enterprise of the village i.e. agriculture and subsequent changes in their class standings may influence their caste experiences. Nevertheless, as discussed previously, they face different kinds of social oppression than their labourer counterparts. While the social inequality/conflict theories suggest understanding the violence signifying the social hierarchies purely on

class basis, this research argues that the class factor does not operate independently in terms of the asymmetrical social relationships between Zamindars and Kammis but rather intersects with the caste to determine the social experiences of the villagers around the issues of social hierarchy. Hence, the social inequality and conflict theories partly explain the phenomenon of violence in the context of a Punjabi village. This also suggests that the intersectionality of caste and gender interact with the category of class to produce different shades of social identity among Kammis, which plays a part in determining their social experiences related with violence and oppression (Crenshaw, 1995; McCall, 2005).

The above analysis shows how this research has employed a somewhat eclectic mix of theories to explore the dynamics of social interactions among Kammi and Zamindar Quoms. These different theoretical perspectives are useful in shedding light upon the findings of this study and are applicable in the context of the caste system in a Punjabi village.

It is discussed in chapter 5 how the labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis have changed as a result of the availability of other labour opportunities for Kammis to earn their livelihood e.g. daily wage labour in industry. A few Kammis in villages do cultivation as well. Consequently, the respondents considered that the occurrences of sexual abuse against Kammi women have lessened in the village setting while the traditional labour relations are in decline. It is significant to note that in Seyp, Kammi women work as labour for the Seypis and they, as a family, are dependent on Zamindars for their livelihood. Other Kammis, not having Seyp contract, also work as paid labour in the village and have the socio-economic dependence on Zamindars. Manzoor (75, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) stressed that the labourer Kammis directly depending on Zamindars are helpless to raise their voice against oppressive conduct of Zamindars. Therefore, Kammis nowadays do not prefer to work on the Seyp or as paid labour for Zamindars given that they can earn a livelihood through other labour or cultivation. They are not required to send their women for labour in the village setting, if they do not engage in the Seyp contract. A few Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village preferred industrial labour than working as paid labour for Zamindars. On the other hand, though Kammi women are inclined to leave working for Zamindars, it was mentioned that the most of them were still involved in paid labour in the village setting. Nevertheless, the respondents believed that the incidents of sexual violence against

Kammi women have certainly decreased as a result of the changing labour dynamics in Punjabi villages.

The traditional caste roles associated with Kammi women have nearly ended in Punjabi villages, and as a result their mobility in the village setting has reduced considerably. Moreover, Kammi men, especially young Kammi men (e.g. Ashfaq, 37, irrigated zone), have started developing an aversion to the practice of sending their women, especially young women, into the community sphere as labour. Jannat (51, Kammi woman, arid zone) was very conscious about the education of her daughters, so that they may earn a respectable living through teaching and are not forced to work as labour, like her. Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) highlighted that:

They (Kammis) have also started restricting the mobility of their young women. Even if they are poor, they would prefer to send their elder women to work as labour in the community sphere.

Furthermore, Falaksher (35, Zamindar man, irrigated zone) pointed towards an interesting aspect of the phenomenon and suggested that the potentials of sexual assaults against women are decreasing as a result of the diminishing social spaces for them in the village setting. As discussed in chapter 7, women do not move in the community sphere that frequently, as compared to the past, for washing purposes at the tube wells or nearby streams because of the water supply schemes and water bore within the houses. In addition, the majority of villagers have started constructing latrines in their houses and their women do not go out in fields, though quite a few Kammi households in the irrigated zone's village still did not have toilets in their houses.

In conclusion the potentials for sexual assaults against women are strongly associated with the ability of their men to ensure their group's protection, and hence retaliate against the perpetrators. It shows how the gender structure in Punjabi villages is an integrated whole in which constructions, and thus experiences, of masculinity and femininity are interconnected. Their men's inability to retaliate against competitors has been seen as one of the major reasons of vulnerability of Kammi women towards the acts of sexual assaults in the community sphere. Conversely, the ability of Zamindar men to retaliate against competitors lessens the potentials of sexual assaults against their women. Besides, the excessive mobility of Kammi women in male spaces, e.g. Dera, fields, and other's houses, in order to work as paid labour is another factor of their susceptibility towards the disreputable experiences in the village setting. However, the incidents of sexual abuse against Kammi women are decreasing as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and changing dynamics of labour relations

between Zamindars and Kammis. Correspondingly, it is mentioned that the women of the educated and better off Kammis do not work as paid labour in the community sphere and thus they are comparatively protected of disreputable experiences outside their domestic environment. Other Kammi men, who are not better off/educated, have also started getting opportunities for earning their livelihood in cities or through industrial labour. They do not like to work on Seyp. As economic activity stretches outside the village boundaries, economic dependence of Kammis on Zamindars has reduced. As a result, the dynamics of their social relationships with Zamindars are changing and they are becoming protected from Zamindar's oppressive conduct. Traditional caste roles associated with Kammi women have also ended. Further, Kammis, as a group, are developing an aversion towards the practice of sending their women outside the domestic sphere for labour.

8.4. Conclusion

This chapter has discussed how the patterns of physical, symbolic, and sexual violence in the community sphere of a Punjabi village are mediated through the caste memberships and gender constructions across Zamindars and Kammis. Taking into consideration the finding of the previous chapters of analysis, this chapter has analysed the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in the context a Punjabi village. It is explored that the domination towards caste collaterals is mostly expressed through symbolic and non physical means. On the other hand, Punjabis share a value structure that praises the acts of physical violence in response to certain actions of caste equals e.g. honour issues. However, physical violence is not used as a direct strategy to dominate the caste collaterals. The chances of retaliation and thus the social, political, and economic cost of physically violent disputes among Zamindars are high. Risks may extend beyond that particular incident and individual disputants and, at times, it result in the longstanding antagonism among Zamindar Biradaris. Similarly Kammis, as collaterals, usually express domination towards each other using symbolic means. At times, they may also get involved in the acts of physical violence, like Zamindars. However, the disputes among Kammis as collaterals are less violent than Zamindars.

Acts of physical violence against labourer Kammis and those involved in other low graded tasks are not that infrequent. In response, Zamindars do not generally face any physically violent reprisal from these Kammis. While Kammis do not generally retaliate against the physical assaults committed by Zamindars, they may respond using other means e.g. through their non cooperating behaviours in the provision of labour. Besides,

these Kammiss face different form of social oppression in the village setting. However, the traditional caste structures and labour relations between Zamindars and Kammiss are in decline, and, as a result, the occurrences of violence against Kammiss in the community sphere are lessening with time. A few Kammiss in the contemporary Punjabi villages are educated and better off. They are comparatively secure against the acts of physical violence since they do not engage in the asymmetrical relations with Zamindars that frequently. However, Zamindars express dominance over such Kammiss using symbolic and non physical means. In addition, Zamindars may turn physically aggressive against educated and better off Kammiss, if they openly challenge Zamindars authority in the village environment. Nevertheless, they are securer against violence and different form of social oppression. On the other side, the labourers Kammi have also started getting labour opportunities in cities or nearby industries and thus they do not like to work on Seyp or as paid labour for Zamindars. Because of the decline in caste based labour relations and reduced economic dependence of Kammiss on Zamindars, the potentials of violence against Kammiss as caste subordinates are decreasing.

The chapter has discussed how the intersectionality of caste and gender define the women's experiences of sexual assaults. It is explained how the caste based power structures reduce the potential for sexual abuse against Zamindar women in the village setting. On the other hand, the inability of Kammi men to retaliate against competitors, especially Zamindars, increases the vulnerability of their women against sexual violence. Besides, roles and obligations associated with the labourer Kammi women and their frequent mobility in male spaces are seen as other important reason behind their susceptibility towards sexual abuse. However, the occurrences of sexual violence against Kammi women have fallen as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and labour relations. The women of educated and better off Kammiss are less vulnerable towards sexual assaults in the community sphere since they do not have to work as paid labour. Other Kammiss are also developing an aversion to the women's labour. Moreover, the traditional caste roles of Kammi women have nearly come to an end. As result of their limited mobility in male spaces, they become securer against the disreputable experiences. While the Dera, Seyp, and extensive agriculture uphold the traditional labour relations in the irrigated zone's village and thus the economic dependence of Kammiss on Zamindars, the chapter has argued that the potentials of violence against Kammiss were higher in the irrigated zone's village than the arid zone's village.

Chapter Nine

Conclusion

This chapter draws together the thesis by taking into account the research questions and main aims mentioned in the introduction chapter and summarizing the core arguments and finding of the study. The purpose of this doctoral thesis has been to understand the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence in the contemporary Punjabi villages and the way these dynamics are changing over time, by looking at the asymmetrical social interactions between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. It was case study comparative research conducted in two villages situated in different agricultural contexts of the Punjab province in Pakistan; one in the arid and the other in the irrigated zone.

9.1. Reviewing the Main Gaps in Literature and Other Issues Identified

There are few attempts (e.g. Ahmad, 1970) to examine caste as a system of social stratification in rural Pakistan that divides individuals into hierarchically ranked categories. This silence in literature about caste as a system of social hierarchy and inequality emerges from the notion that the caste system in Pakistan is a horizontal category and that “we are all equal being Muslims” (Gazdar, 2007; Lyon, 2004). As a result, there are hardly any attempts that have looked at the caste relations in Pakistan in terms of power, difference, and inequality. On the other hand, a few studies (e.g. Eglar, 1960; Hooper & Hamid, 2003) talk about the dynamics of caste relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms that are clearly asymmetrical and suggest the existence of status hierarchy among them in the village life e.g. the traditional labour relations in form of *Seyp* contact, and associated roles and socio-economic obligations. However, there is a lack of literature about how such asymmetrical social relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms involve power dynamics, which also define the individual’s social experiences in the village life around the issues of domination and subordination. Eglar’s (1960) study suggested that gender is another dimension of social identity that interacts with caste to generate status hierarchies among Kammi and Zamindars. However, she only discussed a few of the caste based gender roles associated with a Chaudharani (wife of village head) and Kammi women. She did not examine how the issues of inequality in a caste society position men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms at the different locations of gender-caste hierarchy to define their social experiences in the village setting. Nevertheless, Eglar’s study

indicated that it is important to consider gender along with caste to understand the dynamics of social relations in the context of different locations of social inequality in a caste society. The caste structures organized around the landowning Quoms remained the focus of previous studies on caste in Pakistan (e.g. Ahmad, 1970; Alavi, 1972; Eglar, 1960; Lyon, 2004). There was clearly a need for more work on the artisan/service providing Quoms, their identity construction and social experiences in the village setting around the issues of power, difference, and inequality. A few studies (Hooper & Hamid, 2003; Lyon, 2004) mention that the caste occupations associated with Kammiss and the traditional labour relations between Zamindars and Kammiss are in decline, thus it was also important to examine how the traditional caste structures in Punjabi villages are changing with time, and thus affect the village life. This doctoral thesis intended to address the above mentioned research gaps on the area of the caste system in the Pakistani context.

9.2. Drawing the Analytical Themes Together – Main Findings and Observations

9.2.1. Rethinking Caste in Punjabi Context

One of the major contributions of this doctoral thesis has been to examine the changing dynamics of caste system in rural Pakistan and suggest revisions to the concept of “caste” in the local context. Eglar’s (1960) study, the most comparable to this research, was conducted in the 1950s and the caste system in Punjabi villages has changed considerably since then. Secondly, while academics stress that it is important not to apply the context of Hindu caste system to rural Pakistan, the literature does not identify the set of primary characteristics that represents the Pakistani caste system. Ahmad (1970) tried to assess the applicability of characteristics of the Hindu caste system on the village structures of a Punjabi village, which is seen as a methodological weakness in his research. Hence, this research has explored the primary features of the caste system practiced in rural Punjab, and its changing dynamics, and thus contributes to addressing the gaps in the literature. Considering the first two aims of the study, chapter 5 and chapter 6 have discussed the dynamics of caste system in contemporary Punjab and asymmetrical social relations among Zamindar and Kammi Quoms.

This thesis has shown that the caste system in rural Punjab is organized around the birth ascribed status in a Quom, occupational specializations of Quoms either cultivation or service providing, endogamy and kinship (Biradari), hierarchical positioning of different Quoms, and labour relations. However, these characteristics are only

meaningful considering the two major caste divisions i.e. Zamindar Quoms and Kammi Quoms and dynamics of their social relations. It is important to recognize that the different landowning/cultivator Quoms e.g. Rajput, Jat, Gujjar, Awans form the category of “Zamindars” and similarly the different artisans/service providing Quoms e.g. barbers, cobblers, carpenters are included in the category of “Kammis”. All of the features of the caste system discussed above may not apply on the intra-category interaction patterns among Kammis or Zamindars e.g. endogamy, hierarchical positioning, and labour relations. This research has shown that the traditional labour relations, e.g. *Seyp* and labour at the ceremonial occasions, only exist between Zamindars and Kammis. Moreover, different Zamindar Quoms cannot be placed on a caste hierarchy, since Zamindar Quoms populating in different areas/districts of Punjab rate themselves higher in the caste hierarchy than the Zamindar Quoms residing in other areas e.g. Jats in the central/irrigated Punjab and Rajputs in the northern/arid Punjab. Similarly, different Kammi Quoms cannot be placed hierarchically. This research has also found that there exist inter-Quom marriages among Zamindars and they form kinship (*Biradari*) with each other. Hence, this research has concluded that it is important to understand the caste system in Punjabi villages and applicability of its different features in terms of the intense division of society into Zamindar Quoms and Kammi Quoms. Correspondingly, it is claimed that the caste system certainly exists in rural Pakistan in the form of the indigenous categories of Quom and Zat. It divides Kammi Quoms and Zamindar Quoms in mutually exclusive and hierarchically ranked status groups, which are differentially powerful, privileged, and esteemed.

The other main focus of this thesis has been to understand how the dynamics of the caste system in Punjabi villages have changed over time and, as a result, a few of the characteristics of caste system discussed above may not be applicable anymore or need revising. The term “Kammi” originated from the word “Kamm”, which means service/labour, and was used for those who belonged to service providing castes. Members of the service providing castes i.e. Kammis used to serve Zamindars as labourers and through their occupational crafts inherited from their parentage e.g. barbers. They were earning their livelihood predominantly through their caste occupations i.e. crafts and labour, which formed the basis of their labour relations with Zamindars, e.g. *Seyp* system, and thus the caste system in rural Punjab. The occupational specializations of different Kammi Quoms were integral to the concept of caste (Eglar, 1960). However, this research has found that the caste occupations of

Kammis are in decline as a result of the availability of alternative labour opportunities, trends among Kammis to migrate towards cities and foreign countries for earning purposes, emergence of new institutions in village life, and modernization of economy and resulting changes in the consumption patterns among villagers. In addition, there are increasing trends among Kammis to get education and acquire public/private sector jobs; a few of them are involved in respectable businesses as well. While the caste occupations associated with different Kammi Quoms have almost ended, the dynamics of labour relations have also been changed. The traditional labour relations among Zamindars and Kammis e.g. Seyp system used to exist as an institution in Punjabi villages. Together with serving the villagers with their crafts, Kammis were working as labour for Zamindars. In return, they were paid in crops, grains, and other socio-economic favours (Eglar, 1960). However, with an alteration in and decline of the caste occupations and changing nature of agricultural activity because of the technological advancements, the traditional labour relations have been transformed and are coming to an end over time. Since their caste occupations have ended, Kammis do not like to work merely as labourers and are inclined towards other occupations. A few Kammis in the contemporary Punjabi villages own land and cultivate; an occupation that is traditionally associated with Zamindars. On the other side of the spectrum, Zamindars in the contemporary Punjabi villages are not just cultivators, but rather there are increasing trends among them to get involved in businesses and acquire good jobs through an education. Quite a few of them have left Zamindari, especially in the arid zone. As a result, this research has argued that the members of Kammi and Zamindar Quoms can no longer be strictly divided into the occupational categories of cultivators and non cultivators or landowners and artisans, as suggested by Eglar (1960).

On the basis of the above findings, it is argued that the occupational categories of "Zamindar" and "Kammi" are no longer relevant in the contemporary Punjabi villages, and need revising. Correspondingly, it is suggested that the Eglar's (1960) use of the terms "Kammi" and "Zamindar" are not applicable anymore. However, this research has also explored while there are increasing trends among Kammis to opt for respectable professions, the larger majority of them in the contemporary Punjabi villages still serve the villagers as labourers. Hence, it should be useful to divide Kammis into two categories (i). Better off and educated Kammis and all those who have left their caste occupations and other labour (ii). Kammis still serving villagers as labour or involved in other low graded tasks; they are economically deprived and among

poorest of the poor. Considering the traditional characterization of Kammis, the first category of Kammis arguably cannot be called Kammis any longer since they are not involved in doing the “Kamm”, services/labour, for the villagers. While Zamindars may still discriminate against them by categorizing them as Kammis of the village on the basis of their parentage occupations, they do not like to be identified as Kammis. Their socio-economic dependence on Zamindars reduces considerably, and they are placed higher on the status hierarchy than the other Quom members and thus start differentiating themselves from the other Kammis. The second category of Kammis i.e. labourer Kammis form the traditional category of “Kammis”, though their caste occupations are in decline. However, they have also started showing dissent about being addressed as Kammis or through their parentage occupations e.g. barber. On the other side, the members of Zamindar Quoms who are not involved in Zamindari, they do not identify themselves as Zamindars in terms of an occupational category. The term “Zamindar” nowadays is more applicable to those who are doing Zamindari and the other members of a Zamindar Quom would only identify themselves with the title of their Quom e.g. Virk. However, it is important to note while the occupational use of the terms “Kammis” and “Zamindars” require revising, the terms are relevant as status categories in the context of contemporary Punjabi villages. When the term “Zamindars” refers to a status category to distinguish it from the “Kammis”, all of the members of a landowning Quom identify themselves as Zamindars.

Hence, this research has shown that the two main characteristics of the caste system practiced in Punjabi villages have transformed over time i.e. occupational specializations of Kammis and labour relations. As a result, the dynamics of interaction patterns among Kammis and Zamindars have changed. On the other hand, Zamindars and Kammis are always recognized and differentiated from each other in the village setting on the basis their parentage caste occupations and Quom memberships e.g. barbers or cobblers, and not the occupations they opt for later in their life. Even the educated and better off Kammis live with lifelong stigma of being Kammis. Thus the caste occupations are still relevant in terms of identity and birth remains the fundamental feature of the caste system in Punjab. Similarly, this research has shown that the practice of caste endogamy among Kammis and Zamindars persists, which reproduces them as two mutually exclusive social groups and they do not form kinship relations, Biradari, with each other. One of the key features of the caste system in contemporary Punjabi villages is that it exists as a kinship based cultural category. As a

result, this research has stressed that the Kammi and Zamindar Quoms can still be seen as two distinct status categories in contemporary Punjabi villages, with Zamindars placed higher on the caste hierarchy.

9.2.1.1. Agricultural Context and Caste Dynamics – Arid and Irrigated Zone in Punjab

This research was case study comparative research, conducted in two Punjabi villages of Punjab province in Pakistan; one in the irrigated and the other in the arid agricultural context. Agriculture and labour relations based on agricultural activity form the basis of caste system practiced in Punjabi villages, and the fundamental caste division exists between cultivator Quoms and service providing Quoms. Hence, it was aimed to investigate how the varying agricultural contexts of different zones, irrigated or arid, mediate the caste dynamics of the villages situated in one particular zone. This research has shown how the significance of land and nature of agricultural activity and as a result the labour relations and the major sources of livelihood among villagers differ across the arid and the irrigated zone of Punjab. Thus, the caste system and its dynamics also vary across both regions. It is found that the caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were stronger and more persistent compared with the arid zone's village. This research has discovered that agriculture as a sole or major source of livelihood in the irrigated zone's villages forms the socio-economic basis of village life, which upholds the caste structures and thus the dependence of Kammiss on Zamindars by facilitating the Seyp contracts, Dera system and existing labour relations. While the Seyp has come to an end and Dera system did not exist in the arid zone's village, these institutions play important roles in reinforcing the caste system in the irrigated zone's village and position Zamindar and Kammi Quoms on a status hierarchy. This research has argued that the irrigated nature of agriculture also decelerates the process of change in the caste society of a Punjabi village. Because of the availability of earning sources within the village boundaries, more than a few Kammiss in the irrigated zone's village were working on the Seyp with Zamindars or were involved in the other low graded tasks associated with Kammiss. Conversely, the Seyp system had come to an end in the arid zone's village around a couple of decades ago as a result of the gradual decline in agricultural activity and Kammiss were required to look for other sources of their livelihood, which reduced their socio-economic dependence on Zamindars of their village. Correspondingly, this research has shown that the socio-economic position of

the Kammis in the arid zone's village was better than their counterparts in the irrigated zone.

9.2.1.2. Caste or Class? - The System of Social Stratification in Contemporary Punjabi Villages

This thesis started with a debate whether to analyse the system of social stratification in contemporary Punjabi villages using caste or class as a tool. The findings of this research has shown though the dynamics of caste system have changed considerably, caste remains the better tool than class to look at the hierarchical positioning of Kammi and Zamindar Quoms in a Punjabi village and the dynamics of their social interactions in the village setting. In this regard, status is associated with the caste membership and not the ownership of economic assets. Punjabis associate the status and respect of being a Zamindar, or membership in a Zamindar Quom, with the possession of ancestral land, Jaddi Zameen, and cultivation as a caste based parentage occupation, Khandani Paisha. This research has found that the parentage occupational identities are still applicable to position Kammis and Zamindars on a status hierarchy. Members of a non cultivator Quom cannot attain the status of Zamindars, even if they cultivate or acquire land, and are always identified as Kammis in the village setting. Social mobility in occupation and class terms is possible but not in terms of caste. Kammis remain a subordinate group in the power structures of a caste society, even if they leave serving villagers as labourers and opt for respectable occupations.

9.2.2. Intersecting Inequalities and Power Dynamics

This thesis works on the premises that the caste dynamics play an important part in shaping the gender identities of the members of Zamindar and Kammi Quoms in Punjabi villages, and the intersecting structural inequalities of caste and gender, two different dimensions of social identity, define the individual's experiences of different forms of social oppression and violence in the village setting.

At first, considering the asymmetrical social interactions among Zamindar and Kammi Quoms, this research has examined the dynamics of caste based power structures that create a system of social inequality in Punjabi villages. There is a serious shortage of literature about how the caste as a system of social stratification in rural Pakistan divides the individuals in hierarchically ranked categories, which are differentially powerful, privileged, and esteemed. Hence, this thesis has explored caste as a system of

social stratification in terms of the power and privilege, which also define individual's life experiences in the village setting.

While the traditional caste structures are in decline, it is found that the Biradari and Quom still play key roles in shaping the social, political, and economic basis of village life, which ultimately constitute the power dynamics in contemporary Punjabi villages. Considering these power structures, this thesis has explored the multidimensional processes of social exclusion that restrict a Kammi Quom's rights to participation in the mainstream social, economic, and political affairs of their village. The rights to participate in ceremonial occasions typify the expressions of power and status and are seen as material and non material exchange relations involving caste based status hierarchies. Kammiss are usually not invited as guests on the ceremonial occasions in Zamindar's houses. However, the trends are changing and Zamindars have started inviting the educated and better off Kammiss, though a very few in number. Similarly, Zamindar Biradaris have a complete control over the political affairs of Punjabi villages. Kammiss are not the part of collective decision making bodies, and political and electoral activities at village level. Even the educated and better off Kammiss are generally not included in the collective village affairs. Accessing the state institutions e.g. police, welfare funds, and public sector jobs also involve the Biradari memberships and political contacts. As a result of their exclusion from the system of political patronage, that connects political influential and Zamindar Biradaris, Kammiss normally face difficulties in accessing the state institutions. Hence, it is explored how Kammiss are denied justice at different levels because of their lower standing on the power continuum. One of the major findings of this research is that the procedures at state institutions, especially the justices providing institutions like police and courts, support the existence of longstanding caste structures in Punjabi villages.

Since the traditional caste structures are in decline, this research has found that the Kammiss have started participating in the collective village affairs, though at a very limited level. However, they are strictly denied the rights of leadership and cannot influence the village environment as a group. The caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were more persistent compared with the arid zone's village. As a result, Kammiss of the irrigated zone's village were clearly more marginalized in the village life, compared with their counterparts in the arid zone's village. In order to address the main aims of this study, chapter 6 was designed to look at the asymmetrical social interactions among Kammiss and Zamindars, power structures in caste society of Punjabi

villages and its effects on Kammi and Zamindar Quoms in terms of their rights to participation in the village affairs.

A thorough understanding of the caste as a system of social inequality was necessary to analyse how the issues of power and difference in a caste society interact with gender to produce multiple shades of masculinity and femininity across Kammi and Zamindars. Referring to the aims of this research, chapter 7 has explored how the intersectionality of caste and gender situate men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms at the different levels of power continuum to define their social relations and social experiences in the village setting. This thesis has found a great support for the theory of intersectionality (Collins, 2000; Crenshaw, 1991), which was a very useful theoretical paradigm to examine how the two culturally constructed categories and axes of identity i.e. caste and gender interact on multiple levels, contributing to systematic social inequality in a Punjabi village. This research has shown that it is not only the gender structure of a caste society that shapes the femininities and masculinities, but rather the power relations embedded in the local level social, economic, and political processes also influence the gender identities.

The structural features determining the dynamics of masculinity across Kammi and Zamindars are configured around the caste statuses, ability to control others and influence social environment as individual/group, local politics and system of patronage, Biradarism (kinship), economics, and ability to access the justice providing institutions at local and state levels, especially police. It is important to note that these structural features also constitute the power dynamics of a Punjabi village and determine the villager's rights to participation and thus their social exclusion or inclusion at the local level. Hence, this research has shown how the power structures in a caste society position Kammi at a subordinate and Zamindars at a dominant masculine identity and define the dynamics of their social relations in the village sphere. In contrast to Zamindar men, Kammi men are not able to ensure their family's protection and lack the ability to exert influence and control over others, as individuals and group, in the community sphere, and as a result they are denied certain rights to Izzat.

However the dynamics of Kammi masculinity are changing as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and transformation of labour relations and Kammi have started upholding certain aspects of the hegemonic masculinity. Better off and educated

Kammis start earning their livelihood through respectable work and do not get involved in the asymmetrical relations with Zamindars that frequently. Alternative labour opportunities are available to other Kammis as well and quite a few of them do not work as labour for Zamindars. While their direct socio economic dependence on Zamindars of the village reduces, they become safer from the oppressive conduct of Zamindars compared with the Kammis involved in low graded tasks, e.g. assertion of caste status over caste subordinates, and thus they acquire certain rights to masculine Izzat as well. Nevertheless, certain aspects of hegemonic masculinity are immutable, e.g. caste status, ability to control collective affairs and influence village environment, roles of leadership and patronage. As a result, Kammi men are always positioned lower than Zamindar men on the power and status hierarchy. Besides, Zamindars always maintain their dominance over educated and better off Kammis, using their caste status. Caste structures were stronger in the irrigated zone's villages, than the arid zone's village, due to the existence of Seyp, Dera system, and extensive agriculture. A large majority of Kammis in the irrigated zone were associated with the low graded tasks. Conversely, the socio-economic position of Kammis in the arid zone's village was much better than their counterparts in the irrigated zone and thus they were also able to comply with certain norms of hegemonic masculinity.

Similarly, the dynamics of public femininity across Zamindar and Kammi women are organized around their caste statuses, caste/Biradari based power structures, and social standing of their men. The ideals of compliance and protection of public reputation associated with sexuality, through restricted mobility in community sphere, form the bases of emphasized femininity in a Punjabi village. Labourer Kammi women deviate from the cultural ideals of femininity, since they are required to move in the community sphere, work in male spaces, and perform low graded tasks. They belong to marginalized caste groups and, besides, their men are usually helpless to ensure their protection against members of Zamindar Quom. As a result, labourer Kammi women become vulnerable against disreputable experiences in the village setting and their social reputes associated with sexuality is also questioned. The dynamics of labour for Kammi women differed considerably across the arid and the irrigated zone's village. Labourer Kammi women in the irrigated zone were moving in the village sphere a lot more than their counterparts in the arid zone to work as labour on the agricultural fields and Dera as part of their Seyp contracts with Zamindars. Zamindar women did not work as paid labour and opted only for the occupations compatible to ideals of emphasized

femininity e.g. teaching in girl's school. Their restricted mobility, caste memberships, and ability of their men to ensure family's protection make Zamindar women comparatively protected of disreputable experiences in the village setting. However, this research has found that the dynamics of Kammi femininity are changing with time as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and transforming labour relations. Most of the traditional caste roles associated with Kammi women have ended. Women of the better off and educated Kammis do not work as paid labour for Zamindars and thus they are privileged to practice restricted mobility outside domestic sphere. Other Kammis are also developing an aversion to the women labour with time, especially in the village environment. As a result of their restricted mobility in the village setting, Kammi women become securer of disreputable experiences and can protect their reputation associated with sexuality, and thus they are rendered more rights to Izzat. However, certain aspects of emphasized femininity are immutable e.g. sense of self esteem of a woman, and caste status and associated rights to Izzat in the village setting. Moreover, caste memberships always play a part in shaping the sense of security of women in terms of their mobility in community sphere; Zamindar women felt more protected than their lower caste counterparts.

9.2.2.1. Caste and Gender - An Interconnected System of Social Oppression

This research has investigated the social relations of dominance and resistance in Punjabi villages within the paradigm of caste and gender as an interconnected system of social oppression and violence (Collins, 2000). Men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms were positioned on the power continuum according to their differences i.e. caste and gender in order to look at their experiences of social oppression and violence. It is found that the power structures embedded in the caste practices and local level political, social, and economic processes not only shape the dynamics of masculinity and femininity across Kammis and Zamindars but also define their social experiences regarding different forms of violence. Hence, it is claimed that there exists a strong relationship between caste, gender, and violence in the context of a Punjabi village.

This research has explored three major types of violence in the community setting of a Punjabi village i.e. symbolic violence, physical violence, and sexual violence against women. The dynamics of social oppression and violence among caste collaterals and against caste subordinates differed considerably. It is discovered that the symbolic

violence mostly takes place when physical means to dominate others in the social relations are absent. The opportunities to ensure domination over caste collaterals through physical means are limited in Punjabi villages and most prevalent modes of asserting dominance in such relations are symbolic and non physical. The chances of retaliation and social, political, and economic costs of physically violent disputes among collaterals, especially among Zamindars, are high. As a result, the risks may extend beyond individual disputants and that particular incident.

Conversely, it is not uncommon for Zamindars to exercise physically violent means to ensure the compliance of Kammis and exert control over them, besides symbolic ways of expressing dominance. Zamindars are less likely to face violent reprisals from Kammis. Kammi men's inability to retaliate against Zamindar men and ensure their family's protection represents their subordinate masculine identity. Labour relations and thus the economic dependence of Kammis on Zamindars are seen as the major reasons for physical violence against Kammis committed by Zamindars. However, the patterns of physical violence against Kammis are changing with time as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and transforming labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis. Educated and better off Kammis do not engage in the asymmetrical labour relations with Zamindars. Other Kammis have also started getting alternative labour opportunities and they do not prefer to work as paid labour for Zamindars. While their economic dependence on Zamindars reduces, Kammis become safer from acts of physical violence committed by Zamindars. However, Zamindars usually express their dominance over such Kammis through indirect means, which may, at times, lead towards the physical acts of violence. On the other hand, this research has found that more than a few Kammis in Punjabi villages still work as paid labour for Zamindars. Caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were stronger than the arid zone's village, and thus clearly more conducive for the oppressive practices and acts of violence against Kammis.

Another important type of community violence in caste society of a Punjabi village is the sexual violence against women. This research has shown how the caste memberships of women increase or decrease the potentials of sexual assaults against them in the village setting. The labourer Kammi women are seen as the most vulnerable group of women who are forced out of their domestic sphere to work in community setting because of their economic and caste roles. Their mobility in male spaces increases the potential of sexual assaults against them. Besides, the inability of Kammi

men to ensure their family's protection against competitors, especially Zamindars, is another reason of vulnerability of Kammi women towards the acts of sexual violence. Hence, this research has argued that the subordinate gender identities of Kammi men and women are interconnected, which also define their gendered experiences of different types of violence in the community sphere. Conversely, Zamindar women are comparatively protected against disreputable experiences in the community sphere because of their restricted mobility, Biradari affiliations, and ability of their men to retaliate. On the other side, this research has explored how the risks of sexual assaults against Kammi women are declining as a result of the decline in traditional caste structures and changing labour relations between Zamindars and Kammis. The women of educated and better off Kammis do not work as paid labour. Other Kammis are increasingly developing an aversion towards women labour in the community setting. Moreover, the traditional caste roles associated with Kammi women have almost ended. As a result of their limited mobility in male spaces, Kammi women become more secure against sexual assaults outside the domestic sphere. However, this research has discovered that more than a few Kammi women in Punjabi villages still work as labour. It is explored that the Kammi women, especially the labourer, in the irrigated zone's village were clearly more vulnerable towards the acts of sexual assaults in community sphere than their counterparts in the arid zone's village. Kammi women in the irrigated zone's village were frequently moving in male spaces, seen as unsafe for them e.g. agricultural fields outside village boundaries and Dera. Moreover, the caste structures in the irrigated zone's village were stronger, compared with the arid zone's village and many Kammi families were working on Seyp or as paid labour. Conversely, Kammi women in the arid zone's village were working only as housemaids in Zamindar's houses.

9.3. Generalizability of the Study

The primary focus of this case study comparative research was to compare the caste system and the dynamics between caste, gender, and violence across two different agricultural contexts in Punjab province of Pakistan and not to make broad generalizations from a relatively small-scale study of two villages. The main aim of case study is to seek particularity, which competes with the search for generalizability (Stake, 2003). On the other hand, academics believe that the findings of case study can be helpful to make broader generalizations (Yin, 2003). It is suggested that the content and boundaries/scope of a case can be conceived precisely in an attempt to forge new

generalizations about a social phenomenon that embrace and supersede earlier understandings and theoretical debates (Vaughan, 1992; Walton, 1992). However, explaining a particular set of findings, a researcher has to demonstrate that the case and the data collected is typical enough that it can represent others in a variety of ways and its relevance to similar cases/contexts, its generalizability, can become clear (Platt, 1992; Vaughan, 1992). It is suggested that the sampling procedures and description of the phenomenon in a detailed manner can help in achieving a degree of generalizability. It refers to choosing a research site on the basis of typicality and applying rigorous sampling procedures in selecting the data sources using theoretical and purposive sampling techniques in qualitative research (Kemper et al, 2003; Mays and Pope, 2000; Silverman, 2001). Furthermore, a sufficiently detailed research report is important, which identifies the dynamics of social interactions, social situations, set of social relationships, processes, and events that the case constitutes in connection with the phenomenon being investigated. Hence, the reader can make sense of the situation and whether or not the findings apply in similar settings (Firestone 1987; Mays and Pope 2000). In addition to applying the findings of a case on other such cases and populations, the case study lends itself to theoretical generalizations and thus suggesting new concepts and interpretations about the social phenomenon under study or re-examining earlier concepts and interpretations (Orum et al, 1991; Yin, 1984).

This thesis asserts that the villages under study are not so atypical that some 'tentative generalizations' cannot be made. It is claimed that this study can be positioned in relation to the wider literature about the Punjab and South Asia and about theoretical debates on caste and hegemonic masculinity. About the typicality of a Punjabi village, as a case study, Eglar (1960) suggests that the physical structure, socio-economic structure, average landholdings, and patterns of daily living vary so little that all villages are equally representative of rural Punjab, though Punjabi villages vary in size of population. Correspondingly, the village life in Punjab can be understood using the findings of this study, especially in terms of caste, its changing patterns, and the way intersectionality of caste and gender works as an interconnected system of social oppression and structural violence. The villages under study in both agricultural zones are located at a closer distance to the larger urban centres which can be seen as one of the prime modernization variables. The arid and the irrigated zone's villages are located at around 22 kilometres and 30 kilometres from the larger urban centres respectively. Some villages in the arid and the irrigated zones of Punjab province are more remote

than the villages under study and arguably the caste structures in those villages are stronger and more persistent. However, this research asserts that the patterns of life across different villages in rural Punjab on the basis of geographical proximity of the villages to a larger urban centre do not vary to a degree that the findings of this study cannot be helpful to understand different aspects of the caste system in other Punjabi villages. It is significant that in rural Punjab the basic caste divisions remain between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. Moreover, this research has explored both the traditional and changing dynamics of the caste system and the caste relations between Zamindar and Kammi Quoms. Hence, it is claimed that this case study is useful in terms of its applicability to the remote villages practicing a relatively traditional caste system and also the villages located closer to larger urban centres and thus more influenced by the modern life practices. Furthermore, this research has applied rigorous sampling procedures identifying the data sources, i.e. men and women from Kammi and Zamindar Quoms. In addition, the variables of age and educational status and economic wellbeing of Kammis were also considered. The thesis provides a detailed description of the social interactions, social situations, set of social relationships, processes, and events that typical Punjabi villages constitute in connection with the caste practices. It suggests that the data is sufficiently representative/-typical to make some tentative generalizations about the dynamics of asymmetrical social interactions between the two major caste based status groups in rural Punjab and the way it determines the life experiences of the villagers and its changing patterns.

While the agricultural activity forms the socio-economic bases of the village life in Punjab, this research provides a theoretical generalization by exploring how the dynamics of the caste and its changing patterns may vary across the villages located in different agricultural contexts. The agricultural context, i.e. arid or irrigated, can be an important factor in determining the caste dynamics in a locality. The findings of this research can usefully be applied to the other cases located in similar agricultural zones in order to understand the impacts of the agricultural context on caste structures. Furthermore, this study can be positioned in relation to the wider literature on the caste system in the Indian Punjab. While the Sikh faith prohibits caste hierarchies, a caste system exists among Sikhs of Indian Punjab. Like the caste system in rural Punjab in Pakistan, the social relations and political economy of agriculture in the rural Punjab in India are structured around the caste system. The major caste divisions among Sikhs are between landowning cultivator Jats and service providing Jatis (Jodhka, 2004; Puri,

2003). Hence, it is claimed that the findings of this study can be applied to the wider Punjab in India and Pakistan to understand the social relations organized around the agricultural economy and caste system and thus a degree of generalizability can be achieved. Similarly, this study has relevance to the literature on caste in South Asia including the caste system in a Hindu context. The main characteristics of the caste system i.e. determination by birth, definite occupations, hierarchical positioning, and endogamous grouping are associated with the memberships in Jatis and Quoms, and are similar between the caste systems practiced across different regions and religious identities in South Asia e.g. Muslims, Hindus, and Sikhs in India and Pakistan. Moreover, the ownership of land and agricultural economy and resulting labour relations are also organized around the caste system in rural India and Pakistan. Using caste as a system of social stratification, this study provides a theoretical overview about how the birth ascribed status groups organized around the occupational identities and agricultural economy in South Asia involve the collective social hierarchies, inequalities, and patterns of social relationships representing the positions of superiority and inferiority. The findings of this study can be helpful to understand how the interaction patterns in a caste society become the means for the expression of power, hierarchy, and asymmetry and as a result define individual's identity and their social experiences.

Looking at the geography of masculinities, this research suggests a theoretical overview about the relation between local and regional masculinities, and the way this intersectionality of geographical masculinities is important in the gender politics in rural Punjab. The local masculinity models practiced in Punjabi villages provide the cultural materials that have regional significance and are important in the regional masculinity dynamics in Punjab and vice versa. This research has explored how the systems of political patronage in a village, playing an important part in defining the Kammi and the Zamindar masculinity, operate through the connections between locally influential Zamindars and politically influential Zamindars at regional level, and constitute the bases of local and regional power structures. These power structures organized around the rights to inclusion and exclusion in the ceremonial occasions, the Dera system, control over collective village affairs, electoral politics and voting behaviours, and ability to approach state institutions especially police involve the interplay of local and regional hegemonic masculinities. It provides a theoretical generalization about how the hegemonic masculinity at the regional level in Punjab is symbolically represented

through the interplay of specific local masculine practices that have regional significance (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005).

Considering the geography of masculinities, the findings of this research about the construction of caste based hegemonic masculinity, politics between hegemonic masculinity and subordinate masculinities, and its changing dynamics can be applied to the wider Punjab in India and Pakistan and South Asia. Positioning the findings of this study in relation to the wider literature about caste and masculinities in South Asia, it is suggested that there are considerable similarities in the construction of hegemonic masculinities across the caste societies in South Asia. Dagar (2002) explored how the dominance of peasantry, in particular the Jat Sikhs, is pronounced for the construction of hegemonic masculinity in Indian Punjab and Dalits are placed at subordinate masculine identity because of their lower caste status. Different studies have observed similar patterns in the construction of hegemonic masculinity in the societies practicing the classical Hindu caste system (Gupta, 2010; Kannabiran and Kannabiran, 2001). In the same way, this study can also provide a theoretical overview about how the marginalized masculinities exist in tension with and can transform the hegemonic masculinity in caste societies of South Asia. Looking at the findings of this study about the changing Kammi masculinity in relation to the wider literature about caste in South Asia, it is found that the changes in the subordinate masculinities, e.g. Kammi and Dalit masculinity, in the caste societies have comparable patterns. For example, indentifying the changing masculinities among scheduled castes in the Indian Punjab, Dagar (2002) mentioned that the scheduled caste men are upholding the norms and practices of the dominant castes as a result of the increasing economic growth and subsequent changes in their income. Similarly, Lakshman (2004) examined how Dalit masculinity in a Tamil village in India is changing and becoming more assertive as a result of the reconfigured local economy and land possessions, expansion of non agricultural economy e.g. industrialization, urbanization, increasing educational trends, and proximity and contiguity to the metropolitan cities. It is highlighted that Dalit men in the contemporary rural India aspire to dominate different sphere of life by challenging the hegemonic masculinity of upper caste men. While this research can be useful in exploring the interplay of local and regional hegemonic masculinity in Punjab, the above discussion about caste and masculinities in wider Punjab in India and Pakistan and South Asia suggests that the significance of transnational arenas for the construction of masculinity can also be argued using the findings of this study. In other

words, while the local gender orders in a Punjabi village provide the cultural materials that have the regional significance in Punjab and Pakistan, this interplay of local and regional hegemonic identities can provide the models of masculinity that can be important in transnational arenas in South Asian context (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005).

9.4. Recommendations – Agenda for Future Research

Even though a few studies have been conducted on the caste system in Pakistan, the researcher, during the fieldwork and analysis stages of this thesis, recognized that there are a number of further aspects of the caste system in Pakistani context that should be investigated.

This research has not considered the impacts of socio-legal legacies of colonialism on the caste structures in Pakistan. Eglar (1960) described that in the Indian region, the British used landownership as a basis for organization and as a means to systemize and facilitate the revenue collection. For that purpose, the Regular Settlement was made and permanent ownership was given to those families who already possessed land. The land Alienations act of 1901 forbade the purchase of land for non agriculturist castes. Thus, the landholding became the privilege of Zamindar Quoms, who were then liable to pay taxes to the government, in cash and not in crops. It resulted in the increased contact between Zamindars and the government, which ultimately formed the basis of power structures in Punjabi villages. The Numberdari system, land tenure system, is still functional in Punjab, though in decline. A few years back, the Government of Punjab declared to activate the Numberdari system for improving the system of revenue collection and better liaison between rural populations and the government (Pakistan Press International, 2006). It should be interesting to investigate how the colonialism and its cultural and legal legacies affected the rural structures in Punjab in terms of caste system and its changing dynamics over time.

All of the studies on the caste system in Pakistan have been conducted on rural populations. This research has shown that Kammiss in Punjabi villages are increasingly migrating towards cities, where they may overcome their caste stigma and thus uplift their social standing. However, it is important to investigate how the increasing trends of urbanization and changing consumption patterns in Punjab are transforming the identity construction. In this regard, it should be interesting to interview the Kammiss

who have migrated from villages on permanent basis and analyse to what extent they could overcome their caste identities, and its effects on their lives.

This research concludes that the dynamics of labour relations in Punjabi villages are changing. Because of the availability of industrial labour and other earning opportunities, Kammiss do not like to work on the Seyp with Zamindars. Moreover, they are migrating towards cities. It is important to analyse how this labour gap is being filled and its impacts on village life, especially in the irrigated zone's villages where Kammi labour was indispensable to run agricultural activity and other village affairs.

Bibliography

- AAFJES, A. 1998. *Gender-Based Violence: The Hidden War Crime*. Washington, DC: Women, Law & Development International.
- AGBOATWALLA, M. 2000. Women's development in Pakistan: issues and challenges. *Community Development Journal*, 35 (2), pp.181-185.
- AHMAD, M. 2001. Agricultural Productivity Growth Differential in Punjab, Pakistan: A District-level Analysis. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 40(1), pp.1-25.
- AHMAD, S. 1970. Social Stratification in a Punjabi Village. *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, 4, pp.105-125.
- AHMAD, S. 1977. *Class and Power in a Punjabi Village*. New York and London: Monthly Review Press.
- AHMED, A. S. 1976. *Millennium and Charisma among Pathans. A Critical Essay in Social Anthropology*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- AHMED, A. S. 1980. *Pukhtun economy and society*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- AHMED, A. S. 1986. *Pakistan Society: Islam, Ethnicity and Leadership in South Asia*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- AHMED, M. 2007. Role of Biradari in Punjab Politics. *The Journal of Research (Humanities)*, 27, pp.15-22.
- AHMED, M. 2008. Voting behaviour in rural and urban areas of Punjab [Pakistan]. *Journal of Political Studies*, 14, pp.45-56.
- AHMED, M. and F. NASEEM. 2011. Social system influences Political System - A comparative study of sub-continent. *Berkeley Journal of Social Sciences*, 1(1).
- ALAVI, H. 1972. Kinship in West Punjabi Villages. *Contribution to Indian Sociology*, pp.27-61.
- ALAVI, H. 1988. Pakistan and Islam: Ideology and Ethnicity. In: F. HALLIDAY and H. ALAVI, eds. *In State and Ideology in the Middle East and Pakistan*. London: Macmillan, pp.64-111.
- ALBRECHT, T. L., G. M. JOHNSON and J. B. WALTHER. eds. 1993. *Understanding communication processes in focus groups*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- ALIANI, S. 2009. Caste in Pakistan: The Elephant in the Room. [online]. [Accessed 25 October 2010]. Available from: <http://reddiarypk.wordpress.com/2009/08/25/caste-in-pakistan/>.
- AMNESTY-INTERNATIONAL. 1999. Pakistan: Honour Killings of Girls and Women. [online]. [Accessed 19 December, 2008]. Available from: <http://web.amnesty.org/library/Index/engASA330181999>.
- ANANDHI, S. and A. JEYARANJAN. 2002. Masculinity and Domestic Violence in a Tamil Nadu Village. *Domestic Violence in India: Exploring Strategies, Promoting Dialogue*. [online]. [Accessed 8 February 2009]. Available from: http://74.125.77.132/search?q=cache:A_w63Vd7opsJ:www.icrw.org/docs/DV_India_Report4_52002.pdf+Understanding+Masculinities+%26+Domestic+Violence&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1&gl=uk.
- ANDERMAHR, S., T. LOVEL and C. WOLKOWITZ. 1997. *A Concise Glossary of Feminist Theory*. London and New York: Arnold.
- ASAD, T. 1972. Market Model, Class Structure and Consent: A Reconsideration of Swat Political Organization. *Man*, 7, pp.74-94.

- ASIAN-DEVELOPMENT-BANK. 2000. Country Briefing Paper: Women in Pakistan. [online]. [Accessed 9 February 2009]. Available from: http://www.adb.org/Documents/Books/Country_Briefing_Papers/Women_in_Pakistan/default.asp?p=gender.
- BABUR, Z. U. 2007. *Violence against Women in Pakistan: Current realities and strategies for change*. thesis, European University Centre for Peace Studies, Austria.
- BACHIN, C. 1996. *Women, Law and Society: An action manual for NGOs*. Lahore: Shirkat Gha.
- BAILEY, J. 2008. First steps in qualitative data analysis: transcribing. *Family Practice*, **25**(2), pp.127-131.
- BANDURA, A. 1973. *Aggression: A Social Learning Analysis*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- BANDURA, A. 1977. *Social Learning Theory*. New York: General Learning Press.
- BARI, D. F. 2005. Where is the institutional response. *The Dawn*.
- BARKER, C. 2005. *Cultural Studies: Theory and Practice*. London: Sage.
- BARLAS, A. 2002. *Believing Women in Islam: Unreading Patriarchal Interpretations of the Qur'an*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- BARTH, F. 1959a. *Political Leadership among Swat Pathans*. University of London: The Athlone Press.
- BARTH, F. 1959b. Segmentary opposition and the theory of games. A study of Pathan organisation. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* **89**, pp.5-22.
- BARTH, F. ed. 1960. *The System of Social Stratification in Swat, Northern Pakistan*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- BARTH, F. 1967. Game theory and Pathan society. *Man*, **2**, p629.
- BARTH, F. 1969. *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries*. Boston: Little Brown and Company.
- BARTH, F. 1981. *Features of Person and Society in Swat: Collected Essays on Pathans. Selected Essays of Fredrik Barth Volume II*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- BASOW, S. A. 1992. *Gender: Stereotypes and roles (3rd ed.)*. Belmont, CA: Thomson Brooks/Cole Publishing Co.
- BATES, C. 1995. "Race, Caste and Tribe in Central India: the early origins of Indian anthropometry". In: ROBB, P. (ed.) *The Concept of Race in South Asia*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- BBC-NEWS. 2008. Pakistan women's deaths condemned.
- BEN-ARI, E. 2006. Book Review: The Politics of Collective Violence. *Anthropological Theory*, **6**, pp.249-250.
- BENAZIR-INCOME-SUPPORT-PROGRAMME. 2008. [Accessed 30 February 2010]. Available from: <http://www.bisp.gov.pk/>.
- BENERIA, L. 1979. Reproduction, production and the sexual division of labour. *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, **3**, pp.203-225.
- BENGALI, K. and M. SADAQAT. 2002. *REGIONAL ACCOUNTS OF PAKISTAN: METHODOLOGY AND ESTIMATES 1973-2000*. Social Policy & Development Centre Karachi.

- BERGER, P. and T. LUCKMAN. 1967. *The social construction of reality: a treatise in the sociology of knowledge*. London: Penguin Publishers.
- BERREMAN, G. D. 1972. Race, Caste, and Other Invidious Distinctions in Social Stratification. *Race & Class*, 13, pp.385-414.
- BHATTY, Z. 1996. Social Stratification Among Muslims in India. In: M. N. SRINIVAS, ed. *Caste: Its Twentieth Century Avatar* New Delhi: Viking.
- BLAU, P. M. 1964. *Exchange and Power in Social Life*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- BLOOD, P. ed. 1994. *Pakistan: A Country Study*. Washington: GPO for the Library of Congress.
- BLOOD, R. O. and D. M. WOLFE. 1960. *Husbands and Wives: The Dynamics of Married Living*. Glencoe, IL The Free Press.
- BLUNT, E. A. H. S. 1969. *The caste system of northern India, with special reference to the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh*. Delhi: S. Chand.
- BOURDIEU, P. 1990. *The Logic of Practice*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- BREUER, F., K. MRUCK and W.-M. ROTH. 2002. Subjectivity and Reflexivity: An Introduction [10 paragraphs]. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 3(3).
- BRIGGS, C. L. 1986. *A Sociolinguistic Appraisal of the Role of the Interview in Social Sciences*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- BRITISH-SOCIOLOGICAL-ASSOCIATION. 2002. "Statement of Ethical Practice". [online]. [Accessed 20 April 2009]. Available from: <http://www.britsoc.co.uk>.
- BRYMAN, A. 2001. *Social Research Methods*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- BURGESS-PROCTOR, A. 2006. Intersections of Race, Class, Gender and Crime: Future Directions for Feministic Criminology. *Feminist Criminology (online)* [online]. 1(1), pp.27-44. [Accessed 30 March 2009]. Available from: <http://fcx.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/1/1/27>.
- BURNEY, A. 2005. *Violence against women in Pakistan* [online]. [Accessed 20 December 2008]. Available from: http://www.ansarburney.org/womens_rights-violence.html
- CAMPBELL, L. M., N. J. GRAY, Z. A. MELLETIS, J. G. ABBOTT and J. J. SILVER. 2006. Gatekeepers and Keymasters: Dynamic Relationships of Access in Geographical Fieldwork. *The Geographical Review*, 96(1), pp.97-121.
- CHAKRAVARTY, U. ed. 1996. *Reconceptualising Gender: Phule, Brahmanism and Brahmanical Patriarchy*. Patiala and New Delhi: Vision and Venture.
- CHAKRAVARTY, U. 2003. *Gendering Caste Through a Feminist Lens* [online]. Mumbai: Popular Prakashan. [Accessed 25 January 2009]. Available from: http://books.google.co.uk/books?hl=en&id=nLMDxv_L-U8C&dq=gendering+caste+through+a+feminist+lens&printsec=frontcover&source=web&ots=3VhPJVBmT&sig=iQqksuTHbYtywBkDTz_thM7SzDo&sa=X&oi=book_result&resnum=1&ct=result
- CHAUDHARY, M. A. 1999. *Justice in Practice: Legal Ethnography of a Pakistani Punjabi Village*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- CHENG, C. Marginalized masculinities and hegemonic masculinity: An introduction. *The Journal of Men's Studies*, 7, pp.295-316.
- CHENG, C. 1999. Marginalized Masculinities and Hegemonic Masculinity: An Introduction. *The Journal of Men's Studies*, 7.

- CNN. 2002. *Six men found guilty in gang rape* [online]. [Accessed 5 February 2009]. Available from: <http://archives.cnn.com/2002/WORLD/asiapcf/south/08/31/pakistan.gang.rape/>.
- COLLIER, R. 1998. *Masculinities, crime and criminology: Men, heterosexuality and the criminal (ised) other*. London, Sage.
- COLLINS, P. H. 2000. *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment*. New York: Routledge.
- COLLINSON, D., AND J. HEARN. 1994. Naming men as men: Implications for work, organization and management. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 1, 2-22.
- CONNELL, R. W. 1987. *Gender & Power*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- CONNELL, R. W. 2005. *Masculinities. Second Edition*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- CONNELL, R. W. & MESSERSCHMIDT, J. W. 2005. Hegemonic Masculinity : Rethinking the Concept. *Gender & Society*, 19, 829-859.
- COWLEY-SATHIAKUMAR, S. R. 2008. *The Sri Lankan Tamils - A comparative Analysis of the Experiences of the Second Generation in the UK and Sri Lanka*. Doctor of Philosophy thesis, The University of Leeds.
- COYNE, I. T. 1997. Sampling in qualitative research. Purposeful and theoretical sampling; merging or clear boundaries? *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, (26), pp.623-630.
- CRENSHAW, K. 1991. Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Colour. *Stanford Law Review*, 43, pp.1241-1279.
- CRENSHAW, K. 1995. Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Colour. In: K. C. E. AL, ed. *Critical Race Theory. The Key Writings That Formed the Movement*. New York: The New Press.
- CRESWELL, J. W. 1997. *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- CROUCH, M. and H. MCKENZIE. 2006. The logic of small samples in interview based qualitative research. *Social Science Information*, 45(4), pp.483-499.
- DAGAR, R. 2002. Gender Violence and Construction of Masculinities: An Exploratory Study in Punjab. Domestic Violence in India: Exploring Strategies, Promoting Dialogue. [online]. [Accessed 8 March 2009]. Available from: http://www.aidsportal.org/repos/DV_India_Report4_52002.pdf.
- DAHLBERG, L. L. and E.G.KRUG. 2002. *Violence: A Global Public Health Problem*. World Report on Violence and Health, Geneva: World Health Organization.
- DAILYNEWS. 2010. [online]. [Accessed 30 November 2010].. Available from: <http://www.dailywaqt.com/openlink.asp?ddir=160710&im=fp-14.gif>.
- DAILY-TIMES. 2006. *Akbar Bugti killed in army operation* [online]. [Accessed 2 June 2010].. Available from: http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2006\08\27\story_27-8-2006_pg1_1.
- DAS, V. ed. 1976. *Indian Women: Work, Power and Status*. New Delhi: Vikas.
- DAVIS, A., B. B. GARDNER and M. R. GARDNER. 2009. *Deep South: A Social Anthropological Study of Caste and Class (Southern Classics)*. University of South Carolina Press.
- DEKESEREDY, W. S. and B. PERRY. eds. 2006. *Theories of Violence: A Critical Perspective on Violence*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.

- DEMETRIOU, D. Z. 2001. Connell's concept of hegemonic masculinity: A critique. *Theory and Society*, 30, 227-361.
- DENZIN, N. K. and Y. S. LINCOLN. 1998. *The landscape of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- DHUDIALNEWS. 22 April, 2010. *Dhudialnews*.
- DOBASH, R. E. and R. P. DOBASH. 1979. *Violence Against Wives*. NY: Free Press.
- DONALDSON, M. 1993. What Is Hegemonic Masculinity? *Theory and Society*, 22(5. Special Issue: Masculinities), pp.643-657.
- DONALDSON, M. 1993. What is hegemonic masculinity? *Theory and Society*, 22, 643-657.
- DUBE, L. 1996. *Caste and Women*. Caste: Its Twentieth Century Avatar. New Delhi: Viking, Penguin.
- DUMONT, L. 1970. *Homo Hierarchicus*. London: Paladin.
- DUMONT, L. 1980. *Homo hierarchicus: the caste system and its implications*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press.
- DUTT, N. K. 1965. *Origin and growth of caste in India, vol. II: Castes in Bengal*. Calcutta: Firma K. L. Mukhopad-hyay.
- EAGLY, A. H. 1987. *Sex Differences in Social Behaviour: A Social-Role Interpretation*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- EGLAR, Z. 1960. *A Punjabi Village in Pakistan*. New York and London: Columbia University Press.
- ENCYCLOPAEDIA-OF-WOMEN'S-HISTORY. 1994. "Pakistan: A Country Study". [online]. [Accessed 15 November 2008]. Available from: http://womenshistory.about.com/library/ency/blwh_pakistan_gender.htm.
- FERDOOS, A. 2005. *Social Status of Rural and Urban Working Women in Pakistan - A Comparative Study [online]*. Doctor of Philosophy thesis, der Universität Osnabrück.
- FERRANTE, J. 2007. *Sociology: A Global Perspective*. 6 edition. ed. Wadsworth Publishing.
- FINCH, J. and J. MASON. eds. 1990. *'Decision-taking in the fieldwork process'*. JAI Press.
- FIRESTONE, W. 1987. "Meaning in method: The rhetoric of quantitative and qualitative research." *Educational Researcher*, 16, 16-21.
- FLICK, U. 2002. *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*. 2nd edn ed. London, Thousand Oaks, CA and New Delhi: Sage.
- FLINCH, J. ed. 1993. *'It's Great to have Someone to Talk to': Ethics and Politics of Interviewing Women'*. London: Sage Publication.
- FOEGE, W. H., M. L. ROSENBERG and J. A. MERCY. 1995. Public health and violence prevention. *Current issues in Public Health*, 1, pp.2-9.
- FREITAS, K. 2006. *The Indian Caste System as a Mean of Contract Enforcement*. [online]. [Accessed 28 November 2008]. Available from: <http://www.econ.yale.edu/seminars/jr-fac/jf07/freitas.pdf>.
- FREY, J. and A. FONTANA. eds. 1993. *The group interview in social research*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

- GALLMEIER, C. ed. 1991. *Leaving, Revisiting and Staying in Touch with Neglected Issues in Field Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- GALTUNG, J. 1996. "Peace by peaceful means: Peace and conflict, Development and Civilization". Oslo: International Peace Research Institute.
- GANS, H. J. ed. 1982. *The participant observer as a human being: Observations on the personal aspects of fieldwork*. Boston: George Allen and Unwin.
- GAZDAR, H. 1998. *Review of Pakistan poverty data*. London: Department for International Development.
- GAZDAR, H. 2007. Class, Caste or Race: Veils over Social Oppression in Pakistan. *Economic & Political Weekly*, 42(2), pp.86-88.
- GELLES, R. ed. 1983. "An Exchange Social Theory". Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- GEORGE, A. and A. BENNETT. 2005. *Case Studies and Theory Development in the Social Sciences*. Cambridge: MIT Press.
- GERTH, H. and C. W. MILLS. 1947. *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- GHAUS, A. F. A., H. A. PASHA and R. GHAUS. 1996. Social Development Ranking of Districts of Pakistan. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 35(4), pp.593-614.
- GHURYE, G. S. 1961. *Caste, class, and occupation*. Bombay: Popular Book Depot.
- GLASSER, N. and A. L. STRAUSS. 1967. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. USA: Aldine Transaction.
- GLESNE, C., & PESHKIN, A. 1992. *Becoming qualitative researchers*. New York: Longman.
- GLUCKMAN, M. 1963. Gossip and Scandal. *Current Anthropology*, 4(307-316).
- GOODALL JR, H. 2000. *Writing the New Ethnography*. Oxford: Alta mira Press.
- GOODE, W. J. and P. K. HATT. 1952. *Methods in Social Research*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- GOVERNMENT-OF-INDIA 2001. Scheduled Castes & Scheduled Tribes Population. In: MINISTRY-OF-HOME-AFFAIRS (ed.).
- GOVERNMENT-OF-PAKISTAN. 1994. *1990 Census of Agriculture, Punjab, Province Report*. Lahore: Agricultural Census Organisation, Economic Affairs and Statistics Division.
- GOVERNMENT-OF-THE-PUNJAB. 2010. [online]. [Accessed 23 November 2010]. Available from: http://portal.punjab.gov.pk/portal/portal/media-type/html/user/anon/page/default.psm1/js_panename/ContentViewAdmin/portal/306/nav/right/punjabcms/servlet/PunjabCMSServlet?CMDCMS=V_D_BROWSER&CMDDOCTYPE=1&txtDocID=7394&txtVersionID=1.
- GOW, P. H. A. P. ed. 1994. *Sex and violence*. London: Routledge.
- GRINYER, A. 2002. *The Anonymity of Research Participants: Assumptions, Ethics and Practicalities*. University of Surrey: Social Research Update.
- GROTH, A. N. ed. 1983. "Treatment of the Sexual Offender in a Correctional Institution". NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold.
- GUEST, G., A. BUNCE and L. JOHNSON. 2006. How Many Interviews Are Enough? : An Experiment with Data Saturation and Variability. *Field Methods*, 18, pp.59-81.

- GUNARATNAM, Y. 2003. *Researching 'Race' and Ethnicity: Methods, Knowledge and Power*. London: Sage.
- GUPTA, C. 2010. Feminine, criminal or manly? : Imaging Dalit masculinities in colonial north India. *Indian Economic Social History Review*, 47, 309-342.
- GUPTA, D. 2005. Caste and Politics: Identity Over System. *The Annual Review of Anthropology*, 21, pp.409-427.
- HAKIM, A. and A. AZIZ. 1998. "Socio-cultural, Religious, and Political Aspects of the status of women in Pakistan". *The Pakistan Development Review, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics*, 37(4), pp.727-746.
- HAMMERSLEY, M. 1992. *What's Wrong with Ethnography*. London: Routledge.
- HARVEY, P. and P. GOW. eds. 1994. *Sex and violence*. London: Routledge.
- HASSAN, A. 2010. Migration, small towns and social transformations in Pakistan. *Environment and Urbanization*, 22, pp.33-50.
- HASSAN, M. M. 2004. *Gender Aspects and Issues in Pakistan*. In: "Social Sciences: Endangered and Engendered" Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.
- HASSAN, Y. 1995. *The haven becomes hell: A study of domestic violence in Pakistan*. Lahore: Shirkat Gah.
- HASSAN, Y. 1999. "The Fate of Pakistani women". *International Herald Tribune*.
- HAVE, P. T. 1999. *Doing Conversation Analysis: A Practical Guide*. London: Sage.
- HAY, I. ed. 2000. *Qualitative Research Methods in Human Geography*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- HEARN, J. 1996. Is masculinity dead? A critique of the concept of masculinity/masculinities. In: GHAILL., M. M. A. (ed.) *Understanding masculinities: Social relations and cultural arenas*. Buckingham, UK: Open University Press.
- HEARN, J. 2004. From hegemonic masculinity to the hegemony of men. *Feminist Theory*, 5, 49-72.
- HEISE, L. 1994. Gender-Based Violence and Women's Reproductive Health. *International Journal of Gynaecology & Obstetrics*, 46, pp.221-229.
- HEISE, L., M. ELLSBERG and M. GOTTEMOELLER. 1999. *"Ending Violence Against Women"*. Baltimore, Maryland: Population Information Program, Johns Hopkins School of Public Health.
- HEKMAT, A. 1998. *Women and the Quran: the status of women in Islam*. New York: Prometheus books.
- HIBBS, D. A. 1973. *Mass Political Violence: A Cross-National Causal Analysis*. New York: John Wiley.
- HILL COLLINS, P. 2000. *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment*. New York: Routledge.
- HOLTER, Q. G. 1997. *Gender, patriarchy and capitalism: A social forms analysis*, Oslo, Norway, University of Oslo.
- HOLTER, Q. G. 2003. *Can men do it? Men and gender equality —The Nordic experience*, Copenhagen, Denmark, Nordic Council of Ministers.

- HOLTZWORTH-MUNROE, A. and J. C. MEEHAN. 2004. Typologies of Men Who Are Martialy Violent : Scientific and Clinical Implications. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, **19**, pp.1369-1389.
- HOMAN, R. 1991. *The Ethics of Social Research*. Harlow: Longman.
- HOMANS, G. 1961. *Social Behaviour: Its Elementary Forms*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World.
- HOMANS, G. C. 1958. Social Behaviour as Exchange. *American Journal of Sociology*, **63**(6), pp.597-606.
- HOOPER, D. E. and A. I. HAMID. 2003. Scoping Study on Social Exclusion in Pakistan. [online]. [Accessed 8 March 2009]. Available from: <http://www.docstoc.com/docs/2375996/Scoping-Study-on-Social-Exclusion-Volume-II---Annexes>.
- HOOPER, E. and A. I. HAMID. 2003. *Scoping Study on Social Exclusion in Pakistan*. Islamabad: Department for International Development (DFID).
- HUMAN-RIGHTS-COMMISSION-OF-PAKISTAN. 2003. *Violence against Women*. Lahore: Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.
- HUMAN-RIGHTS-COMMISSION-OF-PAKISTAN. 2006. "Violence against Women". Lahore: Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.
- HUMAN-RIGHTS-COMMISSION-OF-PAKISTAN. 2008. *State of Human Rights in 2008*. Lahore: Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.
- HUMAN-RIGHTS-WATCH. 2003. *Violence against Women in Pakistan*. New York: Human-Rights-Watch.
- HUMAN-RIGHTS-WATCH. 2004. *Violence against women in Pakistan*. New York: Human-Rights-Watch.
- HUMAN-RIGHTS-WATCH. 2010. *World Report Chapter: Pakistan*. New York: Human Rights Watch.
- HURST, C. E. 2007. *Social Inequality Forms, Causes, and Consequences*. Sixth ed. Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- HUSSEIN, S. 2009. 'Face-veiling: a "conversation" between Islam and the West' [online]. [Accessed 30 October 2010]. Available from: <http://asiapacific.anu.edu.au/blogs/southasiamasala/2009/07/24/face-veiling-a-conversation-between-islam-and-the-west/>.
- HUSTON, T. L. 1983. Power. In: H.H.KELLEY, E.BERSCHIED, A.CHRISTENSEN, J.H.HARVEY, T.HUSTON, G.LEVINGER, E.MCCLINTOCK, I.A.PEPLAU and D.R.PETERSON, eds. *Close Relations*. New York: Freeman.
- HUTTON, J. H. 1946. *Caste in India*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- HUTTON, J. H. 1963. *Caste in India: its Nature, Function and Origins*, 4th edition. Bombay: Allied Publishers.
- HYDER, T. and J. M. VEIGH. 2007. Gender-based violence against children in emergencies: Save the Children UK's response. *Gender and Development*, **15**(1), pp.81-93.
- IADICOLA, P. and A. SHUPE. 1998. *Violence, Inequality, and Human Freedom*. Dix Hills, NY: General Hall.
- IRFAN, H. 2008. Honour Related Violence against Women in Pakistan. [online]. [Accessed 21 November 2008]. Available from: <http://74.125.77.132/search?q=cache:QjigSW1I93YJ:www.americanbarfoundation.org/uplo>

ads/cms/documents/hannah_ifran_crimes_of_honour_and_a2j.doc+Welchman+and+Hossain,+2005+lrfan,+2008&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1&gl=uk.

- IRVINE, L. 1998. Organizational ethics and fieldwork realities: Negotiating ethical boundaries in Codependents Anonymous. In: S. GRILLS, ed. *Ethnographic research: Fieldwork settings*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications., pp.167-183.
- JAFRI, A. H. 2003. *Karo Kari (Honour Killing) in Pakistan: A Hermeneutic Study of Various Discourses*. Doctor of Philosophy thesis, University of Oklahoma.
- JAHANGIR, A. 2000. *Civil and Political Rights, Including Questions of Disappearances and Summary Executions*. New York: United Nations.
- JASPAL, R. 2011. Caste, Social Stigma and Identity Processes. *Psychology and Developing Societies*, 23(1), pp.27-62.
- JEFFERSON, T. 1994. Theorizing masculine subjectivity. In: STANKO., T. N. A. E. A. (ed.) *In Just boys doing business? Men, masculinities and crime*. London: Routledge.
- JILANI, H. 1998. *Human rights and democratic development in Pakistan*. Montreal: International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development.
- JODHKA, S. S. 2004. Sikhism and the caste question: Dalits and their politics in contemporary Punjab. *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, 38, pp.165-192.
- JOHNSON, A. G. 2005. *The Gender Knot: Unravelling Our Patriarchal Legacy*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- JOHNSON, J. M. 1975. *Doing field research*. New York: Free Press.
- KAL-TAK. 2010. [online]. [Accessed 19 May 2010]. Available from: <http://pkpolitics.com/2010/05/18/kal-tak-18-may-2010/>.
- KAMRAN, M. 2007. Marriages of minor girls in compensation for murder: SC orders arrest of MNA, 11 others. *The-Sunday-Times*.
- KANNABIRAN, V. and K. KANNABIRAN. 2001. *De-Eroticizing Assaults: Essays on Modesty, Honour and Power*. Calcutta: Stree.
- KAPADIA, K. M. 1958. *Marriage and Family in India*. Calcutta: Oxford University Press.
- KAPLAN, A. 1964. *The conduct of inquiry: Methodology for behavioural science*. New York: Harper & Row.
- KARNIELI-MILLER, O., R. STRIER and L. PESSACH. 2009. Power Relations in Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 19, pp.279-289.
- KAUFMAN, J. and E. ZIGLER. 1987. Do Abused Children Become Abusive Parents. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 57, pp.316-331.
- KELKAR, G. and D. NATHAN. 1991. *Gener and Tribe: Women, Land and Forest in Jharkhand*. London: Zed Books Ltd.
- KEMPER, E., STRINGFIELD, S. & TEDDLIE, C. 2003. Mixed methods sampling strategies in social science research. In: TASHAKKORI, A. & TEDDLIE, C. (eds.) *Handbook of Mixed Methods in Social and Behavioral Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- KHAN, M. H. and M. IQBAL. 1982. Socio-economic Indicators in Rural Pakistan: Some Evidence. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 2(3), pp.217-230.
- KHAN, N. S. ed. 1994. *Reflection the Question of Islam and Modernity*. Lahore: ASR Publications.

- KHAN, S. 2006. *Zina, Transnational Feminism and the Moral Regulation of Pakistani Women*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- KLASS, M. 1993. *The Emergence of the South Asian Social System*. New Delhi: Manohar Publishers and Distributors.
- KNUDSEN, S. V. 2006. Intersectionality—A theoretical inspiration in the analysis of minority cultures and identities in textbooks. In: B. A. E. BRUILLARD, S. V. KNUDSEN, & M. HORSLEY, ed. *Caught in the web or lost in the textbook*. Paris: IUFM de Caen, pp.61-76.
- KOHLMAYER, V. 2007. Honour killings: Another Brutal Face of Islam. [online]. [Accessed 27 January 2009]. Available from: <http://www.humanevents.com/article.php?id=21284>.
- KUMAR, S., S. D. GUPTA and G. ABRAHAM. 2002. Masculinity and Violence against Women in Marriage. An Exploratory Study in Rajasthan. *Domestic Violence in India: Exploring Strategies, Promoting Dialogue*. [online]. [Accessed 8 February 2009]. Available from: http://74.125.77.132/search?q=cache:A_w63Vd7opsJ:www.icrw.org/docs/DV_India_Report4_52002.pdf+Understanding+Masculinities+%26+Domestic+Violence&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1&gl=uk.
- KVALE, S. 1996. *Interviews—An introduction to qualitative research interviewing*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- LAKOFF G, J. M. 1980. *Metaphors we live by*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- LAKSHMAN, C. 2004. Dalit Masculinities in Social Science Research: Revisiting a Tamil Village. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 39, 1088-1092.
- LAL, V. 2005. *Introducing Hinduism*, New York, Totem Books
- LEACH, E. R. ed. 1969. *Introduction: What should we mean by caste?* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- LEACH, M. 1994. The Politics of Masculinity: An Overview of Contemporary Theory. *Social Alternatives*, 12(4), pp.36-37.
- LEE, R. M. 1993. *Doing Research on Sensitive Topics*. London: Sage Publications.
- LEMERT, C. 2004. *Social Theory: The Multicultural and Classic Readings Third Edition*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- LENSKI, G. 1984. *Power and Privilege: Theory of Social Stratification*. The University of North Carolina Press.
- LERNER, G. 1986. *The Creation of Patriarchy*. [online]. [Accessed 7 November 2008]. Available from: http://faculty.mdc.edu/jmcair/Joel10pages/the_creation_of_the%20Patriarchy.htm.
- LEWIS, J. J. 1994. "Pakistan: A Country Study" *Gender Relations: Men, Women, and the Division of Space*. *Encyclopaedia of Women's History*. USA: Federal Research Division of the Library of Congress.
- LIDDLE, J. and R. JOSHI. 1986. *Daughters of Independence: Gender, Caste and Class in India*. London: Zed Books Ltd.
- LUBORSKY, M. R. and R. L. RUBINSTEIN. 1995. Sampling in Qualitative Research : Rationale, Issues, and Methods. *Research on Aging*, 17, pp.89-113.
- LYON, S. M. 2004. *An Anthropological Analysis of Local Politics and Patronage in a Pakistani Village*. New York: The Edwin Mellen Press, Ltd.
- MACINNES, J. 1998. *The end of masculinity: The confusion of sexual genesis and sexual difference in modern society*, Buckingham, UK, Open University Press.

- MAHALINGAM, R. 2007. Beliefs about chastity, machismo, and caste identity: A cultural psychology of gender. *Sex Roles*, **56**, pp.239-249.
- MAI, M. 2007. *In the Name of Honour: A Memoir*. London: Virago Press Ltd.
- MALINOWSKI, B. 1922. *Argonauts of the Western Pacific*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- MALTI-DOUGLAS, F. 2007. *Encyclopaedia of Sex and Gender*. Detroit: Macmillan.
- MANDELBAUM, D. G. 1988. *Women's seclusion and men's honour: sex roles in north India, Bangladesh, and Pakistan*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.
- MARRIOTT, M. 1955. *Caste Ranking and Community Structures in Five Regions of India and Pakistan*. PhD thesis, University of Chicago.
- MARSHALL, M. 1996. Sampling for qualitative research. *Family Practice*, **13**, pp.522-525.
- MARTIN, D. 1976. *Battered Wives*. S.F., CA: Glide.
- MASON, J. 2002. *Qualitative Researching*. London: Sage Publication.
- MASOOD, S. 2008. Pakistan Begins Inquiry Into Deaths of 5 Women. *The New York Times*.
- MAUSS, M. 1990. *The Gift: The Form and Reason for Exchange in Archaic Societies*. London: Routledge.
- MAY, T. 1993. *Social Research. Issues, Methods and Process*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- MAYS, N. & POPE, C. 2000. "Qualitative research in health care: Assessing quality in qualitative research." *British Medical Journal*, **320**, 50-52.
- MCCALL, L. 2005. The Complexity of Intersectionality. *Signs*, **3**, pp.1771-1800.
- MCDONALD, G., G. . 1981. Structural Exchange and Marital Interaction. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, **43**, pp.825-839.
- MESSERSCHMIDT, J. 2004. *Flesh and Blood: Adolescent Gender Diversity and Violence*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- MEUSER, M. 2001. "This doesn't really mean she's holding a whip": Transformation of the gender order and the contradictory modernization of masculinity. *Diskurs*, **1**, 44-50.
- MILLER, D. 1975. *From Hierarchy to Stratification Changing Patterns of Social Inequality in a North Indian Village*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- MORRELL, R., AND S. SWART. 2005. Men in the Third World: Postcolonial perspectives on masculinity. In: M. S. KIMMEL, J. H., AND R.W. CONNELL. (ed.) *Handbook of studies on men&masculinities*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- MORSE, J. M. 1995. The significance of saturation *Qualitative Health Research*, **5**, pp.147-149.
- MUMTAZ, K. and S. FARIDA. 1987. *Women of Pakistan: Two Steps Forward, One Step Back*. Lahore: Vanguard.
- MUMTAZ, K. K. 1976. Traditional forms of rural habitat in Pakistan. *Human settlements and socio-cultural environment* [online]. [Accessed 15 January 2009]. Available from: unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0004/000437/043702eo.pdf -.
- MURPHY, E. and R. DINGWALL. 2001. Qualitative Methods in Health Technology Assessment. In: A. STEVENS, K. ABRAMS, J. BRAZIER and R. F. R. LILFORD, eds. *The Advanced Handbook of Methods in Evidence Based Healthcare*. London: Sage Publications.

- NADVI, K. and M. ROBINSON. 2004. Pakistan Drivers of Change: Synthesis and Policy Implications. [online]. [Accessed 21 January 2009]. Available from: www.gsdr.org/docs/open/DOC35.pdf <<http://www.gsdr.org/docs/open/DOC35.pdf>>.
- NAJAM, A. 2007. We Need More Outrage Against Vani in Pakistan. [online]. [Accessed 27 March 2009]. Available from: <http://pakistaniat.com/2007/08/16/vani-karo-kari-child-marriage-women-violence-pakistan/>.
- NAJAM, N. 2006. "Honour killings in Pakistan". [online]. [Accessed 21 February 2009]. Available from: http://www.crescentlife.com/articles/social%20issues/honor-killings_in_pakistan.htm.
- NARAYAN, U. ed. 1989. *The Project of Feminist Epistemology*. Rutgers: Rutgers University Press.
- NES, F. V., T. ABMA, H. JONSSON and D. DEEG. 2010. Language differences in qualitative research: is meaning lost in translation? *European Journal of Ageing* 7(4), pp.313–316.
- NEUMAN, W. L. 2000. *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. 4th ed. Needham Heights, Massachusetts, United States: Allyn & Bacon.
- NIGHTINGALE, D. and J. CROMBY. eds. 1999. *Social constructionist psychology*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- NIGHTINGALE, D. and J. CROMBY. eds. 1999. *Social Constructionist Psychology: A Critical Analysis of Theory and Practice*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- NORTH-WEST-FRONTIER-TIMELINE. 2006. [online]. [Accessed 18 December 2008]. Available from: <http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/nwfp/timeline/2006.htm>.
- O'LEARY, D. K. ed. 1988. *Physical Aggression Between Spouses: A Social Learning Theory Perspective*. New York: Plenum.
- OFF-THE-RECORD. 2010. [online]. [Accessed 04 June 2010]. Available from: <http://pkpolitics.com/2010/06/03/off-the-record-3-june-2010/>.
- OLDENBURG, V. T. 2002. *Dowry murder: the imperial origins of a cultural crime*. New Delhi: Oxford university press.
- ORENSTEIN, H. 1980. Asymmetrical Reciprocity: A contribution to the Theory of Political Legitimacy. *Current Anthropology*, 21(1), pp.69-91.
- ORMROD, J. E. 1999. *Human learning*. 3rd ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- PAGELOW, M. D. 1981. *Women-Battering: Victims and Their Experiences*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- PAKISTAN-PRESS-INTERNATIONAL. 2006. Numberdari System being activated in Punjab: Minister. [online]. [Accessed 20 November 2010]. Available from: <http://www.highbeam.com/doc/1G1-140899959.html>.
- PAPANEK, H. 1971. Purdah in Pakistan: Seclusion and Modern Occupations for Women. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 33(3), pp.517-530.
- PARSONS, T. 1940. An Analytical Approach to the Theory of Social Stratification. *American Journal of Sociology*, 45(6), pp.841-862.
- PATEL, R. 2003. *Woman versus man: socio-legal gender inequality in Pakistan*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- PEASE, B., AND K. PRINGLE. 2001. *A man's world? Changing men's practices in a globalized world*, London, Zed Books.

- PETERSEN, A. 1998. *Unmasking the masculine: "Men" and "identity" in a sceptical age*, London, Sage.
- PETERSEN, A. 2003. Research on men and masculinities: Some implications of recent theory for future work. *Men and Masculinities*, 6, 54-69.
- PLANNING-AND-DEVELOPMENT-GOVERNMENT-OF-PUNJAB. 2003. Between Hopes and Despair. Pakistani Participatory Poverty Assessment, Punjab Report. [online]. [Accessed 20 February 2009]. Available from: www.dfid.gov.uk/pubs/files/ppa-punjab.pdf.
- PLATT, J. 1992. Cases of cases . . . of cases. In: RAGIN, C. C. & BECKER, H. S. (eds.) *What is a Case? Exploring the Foundations of Social Inquiry*. Melbourne, Australia: Cambridge University Press.
- PLETCHER, G. K. 1977. A Value Free Definition of "Violence"? *Journal of Politics*, 39(4), pp.1055-1060.
- POLLARD, A. 2009. Field of screams: difficulty and ethnographic fieldwork. *Anthropology Matters*, 11(2).
- POPE, C. and N. MAYS. 1995. Reaching the parts other methods cannot reach: an introduction to qualitative methods in health and health services research. *BMJ*, 311(6996), pp.42-5.
- PURI, H. K. 2003. Scheduled Castes in Sikh Community: A Historical Perspective. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 38(26), pp.2693-2701..
- QAZI, M. U. 2006. *COMPUTERISATION OF LAND RECORDS IN PAKISTAN: A Comparative Analysis of Two Projects from a Human Security Perspective*. LEAD International, Islamabad.
- RAGIN, C. C. 1987. *The comparative method*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- RAGIN, C. C. 2008. *Redesigning social inquiry: Set relations in social research*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- RAULET, H. M. and J. S. UPPAL. 1970. The Social Dynamics of Economic Development in Rural Punjab. *Asian Survey*, 10(4), pp.336-347.
- REHMAN, P. K. A. 2002. Masculinity and Violence in the Domestic Domain: An Exploratory Study among the MSM Community. Domestic Violence in India: Exploring Strategies, Promoting Dialogue. [online]. [Accessed 8 May 2009]. Available from: http://74.125.77.132/search?q=cache:A_w63Vd7opsJ:www.icrw.org/docs/DV_India_Report4_52002.pdf+Understanding+Masculinities+%26+Domestic+Violence&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1&gl=uk..
- RICHERSON, P., M. B. MULDER. and B. VILA. 1996. *Principles of Human Ecology*. Needham Heights, MA: Simon & Schuster.
- RISLEY, H. H. 1892. *The Tribes and Castes of Bengal, vol. 2 vols*. Calcutta: Bengal Secretariat Press.
- ROBSON, C. 2002. *Real World Research*. 2nd edition ed. Oxford: Blackwell.
- RUBIN, H. J. and I. S. RUBIN. 2004. *Qualitative interviewing: The art of hearing data (2nd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- RUNKLE, G. 1976. Is Violence Always Wrong? *Journal of politics*, 38, p371.
- RYEN, A. ed. 2003. *'Cross-Cultural Interviewing'*. London: Sage Publishers.
- SARSHAR, M. 2010. PATRIARCHY- THE INDIAN EXPERIENCE. [online]. [Accessed 30 December 2010]. Available from: <http://works.bepress.com/mubashshir/doctype.html>

- SATHIAKUMAR, S. R. C. 2008. *The Sri Lankan Tamils: A Comparative Analysis of the Experiences of the Second Generation in the UK and Sri Lanka*. PhD thesis, The University of Leeds.
- SCHEYVENS, R. and D. STOREY. 2003. *Development Fieldwork: A Practical Guide*. London: Sage Publications.
- SCHIPPERS, M. 2007. Recovering the feminine other: masculinity, femininity, and gender hegemony. *Theory and Society*, 36, pp.85–102.
- SCHULER, M. 1992. *Freedom from violence: women's strategies from around the world*. New York: PACT communications.
- SCHWALBE, M. 1992. Male supremacy and the narrowing of the moral self. *Berkeley Journal of Sociology*, 37, 29-54.
- SEIGEL, L. 1992. *Criminology*. St. Paul, Minn: West Publishing Company.
- SHAH, N. ed. 1994. *The Circles of Freedom of Women: A Case Study of Sindh's Rural and Urban Society*. Lahore: ASR Publications.
- SHAH, N. M. 1986. *Pakistan Women: A socio-economic and Demographic Profile*. Islamabad: Pakistan Institute of Development Economics.
- SHAH, P. and R. A. MEMON. 2004. *Socio-Economic and Demographic Status of Rural Women in Sind*. In: "Social Sciences: Endangered and Engendered", Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan. Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.
- SHAHEED, F. 1990. "Pakistan's women: an analytical description". Islamabad: NORAD.
- SHARMA, R. K. 2004. *Rural Sociology*. New Delhi: Atlantic.
- SHARMA, U. 1999. *Cast*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- SHERI and B. STRITOF. 2005. "Honour killings". [online]. [Accessed 18 December 2008]. Available from: <http://marriage.about.com/od/arrangedmarriages/g/honourkilling.htm>.
- SIDDIQUE, G. U. 2004. *Gender and Social Structure in Pakistan. Proceedings International Conference "Social Sciences: Endangered and Engendered"*. Rawalpindi: Fatima Jinnah Women University.
- SIDDIQUI, M. 1999. Murder of honour. *Muhaddis*. pp.47-58.
- SIKAND, Y. S. 2004. Caste in Indian Muslim Society. "The Asianists' Asia" [online]. [Accessed 29 November 2008]. Available from: <http://stateless.freehosting.net/Caste%20in%20Indian%20Muslim%20Society.htm>.
- SILVERMAN, D. 2001. *Doing Qualitative Research: A Practical Handbook*. London: Sage.
- SILVERMAN, D. 2001. *Interpreting Qualitative Data: Methods for Analysing Talk, Text and Interaction*, London, Sage.
- SILVERMAN, D. R. 1999. *Doing qualitative research: A practical handbook*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- SNYDER, D. 1978. Collective Violence: A Research Agenda and Some Strategic Considerations. *The Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 22(3), pp.499-534.
- SRINIVAS, M. N. 1962. *Caste in Modern India and Other Essays*. London: Asia Publishing House.
- STAKE, R. 1995. *The art of case research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

- STAKE, R. 2003. Case studies. In: LINCOLN, N. K. D. Y. S. (ed.) *Strategies of qualitative inquiry* 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- STARK, R. 2007. *Sociology*. Tenth Edition. ed. Thompson Wadsworth.
- STRAUS, M. A., R. J. GELLES and S. K. STEIMETZ. 1980. *Behind Closed Doors: Violence in the American Family*. New York: Anchor.
- SUBRAMANIAM, M. 2006. *The Power of Women's Organizing: Gender, Caste, and Class in India*. Lanham: Lexington.
- SYMONIDES, J. and V. VOLODIN. 2002. *A guide to human rights- institutions, standards, procedures - Women and Human Rights*. France: UNESCO publications.
- TEMPLE, B. 2008. Narrative analysis of written texts: reflexivity in cross language research. *Qualitative Research*, 8(3), pp.355-365
- THE-GUARDIAN. 2006. Traded like animals - the blood feuds settled with 'gift' of a wife. [online]. Available from: <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2006/apr/21/pakistan.declanwalsh>.
- THE-SUNDAY-TIMES. 2006. Pakistani graduate raped to punish her low-caste family. [online]. [Accessed 2 February 2009]. Available from: <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/article648817.ece>.
- THIBAUT, J. W. and H. H. KELLEY. 1959. *The Social Psychology of Groups*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- THOMAS, D. P. 2008. *The Impact of Community Cohesion on Youth Work: A Case Study from Oldam*. Doctor of Philosophy thesis, University of Leeds.
- TILLY, C. 2003. *The Politics of Collective Violence*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- TRINOVA, M. N. 1962. *Caste in Modern India and Other Essays*. London: Asia Publishing House.
- UN. 1998. *AIDs: An Expression of Gender-Based Violence*. Manilla: UNDP.
- UN. 2000. *Violence against Women in South Asia*. New York: United Nations.
- UNHCR. 2003. *Sexual and Gender-Based Violence against Refugees, Returnees and Internally Displaced Persons*. Geneva: UNHCR.
- VAUGHAN, D. 1992. Theory elaboration: the heuristics of case analysis. In: RAGIN, C. C. & BECKER, H. S. (eds.) *What is a Case? Exploring the Foundations of Social Inquiry*. Melbourne, Australia: Cambridge University Press.
- VEENA, T. O. 2002. *"Dowry murder: the imperial origins of a cultural crime"*. New Delhi: Oxford university press.
- VERMA, R. K. and V. S. MAHENDRA. 2004. Construction of Masculinity in India: A Gender and Sexual Health Perspective. *The Journal of Family Welfare* [online]. 50(Special Issue), [Accessed 18 November 2008]. Available from: <http://74.125.77.132/search?q=cache:0HEuK8fBWAJ:medind.nic.in/jah/t04/s1/jaht04s1p71g.pdf+construction+of+masculinity+in+india&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1&gl=uk>.
- WALTON, J. 1992. Making the theoretical case. In: RAGIN, C. C. & BECKER, H. S. (eds.) *What is a Case? Exploring the Foundations of Social Inquiry*. Melbourne, Australia: Cambridge University Press.
- WARD, J. 2002. *If Not Now, When? Addressing Gender-Based Violence in Refugee, Internally Displaced and Post-Conflict Settings*. New York: The Reproductive Health in Conflict Consortium: The Reproductive Health in Conflict Consortium.

- WATT, D. 2007. On becoming a qualitative researcher: The value of reflexivity. *The Qualitative Report*, 12(1), pp.82-101.
- WEBER, M. ed. 1964. *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization*. New York, NY: The Free Press.
- WEBER, M. 1978. *Economy and Society, Vol. II (Excerpt form Guenther Roth and Claus Wittich, eds.)*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- WEBER, M. 1997. *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization*. New York, NY: The Free Press.
- Encyclopaedia of violence, peace & conflict*. 1999. s.v. Structural violence.
- WELCHMAN, L. and S. HOSSAIN. eds. 2005. *Honour - Crimes, Paradigms, and Violence Against Women*. Oxford University Press.
- WERBNER, P. 1989. The Ranking of Brotherhoods: The Dialectics of Muslim Caste among Overseas Pakistanis. *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, 23, pp.285-315.
- WETHERELL, M., AND N. EDLEY. 1999. Negotiating hegemonic masculinity: Imaginary positions and psycho-discursive practices. *Feminism and Psychology*, 9, 335-356.
- WHITE, E. H. 1977. Purdah. *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies*, 2(1), pp.31-42.
- WHO. 1996. *Global Consultation on Violence and Health. Violence: a public health priority*, Geneva: World Health Organization.
- WHO. 2002. *World report on violence and health: a summary*. Geneva: World Health Organization.
- WHYTE, W. F. 1984. *Learning From the Field: A Guide From Experience* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- WILBER, D. N. 1964. *Pakistan: its people, its society, its culture*. New Haven: Harf press.
- WILDER, A. R. 1999. *The Pakistani Voter: Electoral Politics and Voting Behaviour in the Punjab*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- WILLIG, C. 2001. *Qualitative Research In Psychology: A Practical Guide to Theory and Method*. Buckingham: OUP.
- WILLIS, G. B. 2004. *Cognitive interviewing: A tool for improving questionnaire design*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- WORLD-BANK. P. R. A. E. M. S. U. S. A. REGION. 2002. *Pakistan Poverty Assessment - Poverty in Pakistan: Vulnerabilities, Social Gaps, and Rural Dynamics*. (24296-PAK). World Bank.
- WORLD-REPORT-ON-VIOLENCE-AND-HEALTH. 2002. *World report on violence and health: Summary*. Geneva: World Health Organization.
- YALMAN, N. 1968. On the Purity of Women in the Castes of Ceylon and Malabar. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 93(1), pp.25-58.
- YIN, R. 2003. *Case Study Research Design And Methods*, Thousand Oaks, CA., Sage Publications.
- YIN, R. K. 1984. *Case study research: Design and methods*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- YIN, R. K. 1984. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, Beverly Hills, Sage.
- ZINN, M. B. and B. T. DILL. 1996. Theorizing Difference from Multiracial Feminism. *Feminist Studies*, 22, pp.321-331.

Appendix (A) – Interviewee Data in the Arid Zone's Village

S/No	Alternative Name	Gender	Age	Marital Status	Caste Group	Present Occupation
1	Akbar	Male	53	Married	Kammi	Service Provider/ Cultivation
2	Asgher	Male	52	Married	Kammi	School Peon
3	Fahad	Male	28	Single	Kammi	Cloth shop
4	Gulsher	Male	30	Single	Kammi	Electrician
5	Nazar	Male	63	Married	Kammi	Service Provider/ Barber
6	Riaz	Male	48	Married	Kammi	Service provide/ Cook
7	Tahir	Male	37	Married	Kammi	Furniture work
8	Aamir	Male	33	Married	Kammi	Furniture Shop
9	Jannat	Female	51	Married	Kammi	Housemaid
10	Mobeen	Female	38	Divorced	Kammi	Housemaid
11	Nari	Female	65	Widowed	Kammi	Housemaid
12	Nazia	Female	31	Married	Kammi	Housemaid
13	Parveen	Female	49	Widowed	Kammi	Housemaid
14	Bibi	Female	25	Single	Kammi	School Teacher
15	Bano	Female	38	Married	Kammi	Housewife
16	Kaneez	Female	46	Married	Kammi	Housewife
17	Akmal	Male	33	Married	Kammi	Electrician shop/ Cultivation
18	Furkan	Male	28	Single	Zamindar	Banker in nearby town
19	Hadi Hussain	Male	58	Married	Zamindar	Retired Army/ Cultivation
20	Hameed	Male	30	Married	Zamindar	Tent Service
21	Rizwan	Male	28	Single	Zamindar	Teacher
22	Kamran	Male	50	Married	Zamindar	Retired Army/ Cultivation
23	Raheel	Male	44	Married	Zamindar	Poultry farmer
24	Ahsen	Male	45	Married	Zamindar	Army Retired/ Business
25	Shumaila	Female	37	Married	Zamindar	Housewife
26	Kaoser	Female	50	Married	Zamindar	Housewife
27	Fazeelat	Female	68	Married	Zamindar	Housewife
28	Meeran	Female	57	Married	Zamindar	Housewife
29	Nasreen	Female	35	Married	Zamindar	Teacher
30	Qandeel	Female	21	Single	Zamindar	Student
31	Shamim	Female	53	Married	Zamindar	Teacher
32	Kaloom	Female	35	Single	Zamindar	Teacher

Appendix (B) – Interviewee Data in the Irrigated Zone's Village

S/No	Alternative Name	Gender	Age	Marital Status	Caste Group	Present Occupation
1	Sharif	Male	56	Married	Kammi	Scyp
2	Fazal	Male	47	Married	Kammi	Scyp/ Cultivation
3	Qurban	Male	75	Married	Kammi	Scyp
4	Ashfaq	Male	37	Married	Kammi	Daily wage Factory
5	Sultan	Male	53	Married	Kammi	Scyp
6	Asif	Male	28	Single	Kammi	Social Welfare Officer in home district (residing in village)
7	Sajid	Male	24	Single	Kammi	Recently completed MA
8	Farzand	Male	35	Married	Kammi	Factory labourer/ Cultivation
9	Razia	Female	62	Widowed	Kammi	Scyp
10	Bashiran	Female	50	Married	Kammi	Scyp
11	Mukhtaran	Female	32	Married	Kammi	Housemaid
12	Rasoolan	Female	36	Married	Kammi	Scyp
13	Berkatay	Female	44	Married	Kammi	Service provider/ Labourer
14	Jameela	Female	57	Married	Kammi	Service provider
15	Rukhsana	Female	22	Single	Kammi	Housewife
16	Amara	Female	35	Married	Kammi	Housewife
17	Abdullah	Male	29	Single	Kammi	Cultivation
18	Asgher	Male	31	Married	Zamindar	Cultivation
19	Manzoor	Male	75	Widowed	Zamindar	Cultivation
20	Iqbal	Male	27	Single	Zamindar	Farming/ Cultivation
21	Falaksher	Male	35	Married	Zamindar	Cultivation
22	Mushtaq	Male	62	Married	Zamindar	Cultivation
23	Istikhar	Male	58	Married	Zamindar	Cultivation
24	Ulfat	Male	45	Married	Zamindar	Cultivation
25	Ansa	Female	30	Married	Zamindar	Housewife
26	Amna	Female	20	Single	Zamindar	Student
27	Rabia	Female	25	Single	Zamindar	Recently completed BA
28	Noor Begum	Female	73	Widowed	Zamindar	Housewife
29	Mubashira	Female	35	Married	Zamindar	Housewife
30	Huma	Female	45	Divorced	Zamindar	Housewife
31	Unaiza	Female	50	Married	Zamindar	Housewife
32	Zahida	Female	63	Married	Zamindar	Housewife