The Other Leading Note:

A Comparative Study of the Flat Second Pitch Degree in North Indian Classical, Ottoman or Arabian Influenced, Western, Heavy Metal and Film Musics

Sarha Moore

This thesis is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of PhD in Music, Department of Music, University of Sheffield

24 April 2014
Abstract

This cross-cultural and cross-genre study considers the flat second pitch degree (♭2), a semitone above the tonic, in its significant functional role in tonal musics. The ♭2 appears variously in Indian raga, Ottoman and Arabian influenced music, and in Western music, including heavy metal and film musics. This study aims to balance the exploration of difference in connotations of the ♭2 across cultures with an understanding of commonalities in its use and significance.

With the ♭2 as a central focus, I deploy combined methodologies to ask what structural use and connotations it has in various musics, and how it speaks to ideological worldviews such as Orientalism. Through interview, music analysis and literature study I investigate the melodic and harmonic use of the ♭2, its metaphorical associations and meanings past and present.

I find that the ♭2 has as strong a ‘yearning vector’ as the major seventh ‘leading note’. Across many world music genres there are nuanced and complex connotations, with metaphors of verticality underpinning many interpretations of the falling cadence ♭2–♭1. To the Western listener the ♭2 usually signifies anxiety, reinvented in metal as positive and transgressive. Together with the Western signification of the ♭2 as Oriental, a hybrid may be created. I argue that this hybrid may portray the ‘East’ as a negative Other, as exploited in film’s ‘unheard’ soundtracks. In traditions such as Oriental metal and Bollywood, in contrast, hybrid connotations may support articulations of powerful, modern identities.

By showing that the ♭2 is used in different yet comparable ways in multiple genres, I bring different harmonic practices, metaphorical associations and ideologies into the foreground, highlighting expanded significations across cultures. By focusing sharply on a specific musical feature as it appears in various contexts, this study aims to provide a well-defined site for disciplinary debates on cultural boundaries.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTENTS</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES/CD AND DVD CONTENTS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The subject of this research</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research aims in relation to current academic discourses</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research questions</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The case for cross-cultural comparisons</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument for this cross-cultural interval study</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Other: Exoticism, Orientalism and binary separations</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On similarity and difference in world music (studies)</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On Glocalisation</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextualising the $b^2$</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnomusicology</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musicology</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Popular musicology</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On dissonance and metaphor</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissonance</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The leading note</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metaphors of narrowness and falling.</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural specificity</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge gaps in the understanding of the use of the $b^2$</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview technique: asking questions concerning the $b^2$</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choice of examples and use of notation</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Layout of thesis

1  KOMAL RE: THE ♭2 IN RAGAS OF NORTH INDIA AND PAKISTAN  

1.1  The background to raga interpretation  

1.2  Performance and spirituality  

1.3  Komal Re within raga  

   What exactly does the name mean?  
   Komal Re and 'leading note' tensions  
   Connotations of the upper leading note: ‘sadness’ and ‘pathos’  
   Komal Re at dawn and dusk  
   Godhuli bela: 'cowdust time'  

1.4  Mood creation with komal Re in specific ragas  

   Ragas of the first dawn  
   Sunrise ragas  
   Later morning raga Todi  
   Dusk sandhi prakash ragas  
   Raga Shri  
   Raga Basant  
   Later dusk raga Marva  

Conclusion  

2  ‘TOUCHED BY THE MAQ[K]AM’: FLAT ♭2 IN MEDITERRANEAN GENRES  

2.1  Overview of musical traditions  

   The Arabian Empire and its influence in Spain  
   The Ottoman Empire and its influence  
   Transient Mediterranean and Eastern Europe communities  

2.2  The prevalence of the flat ♭2 in Mediterranean genres  

2.3  Use of the flat ♭2 in specific Mediterranean genres  

   Microtonal variations in the use of the flat ♭2  
   Microtonal shifts of the ♭2 according to melody direction  
   Flexibility of ♭2 in non-classical folk and urban genres  
   The Hijaz/ Hicaz maqam/makam  
   'Phrygian-like' maqamat/makamlar  

Conclusion
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cadential motifs on the descending tetrachord</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Harmonic innovations in popular music</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ostinato basslines using the flat ( \flat )</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oscillating Chords</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modal harmony in Mediterranean urban musics</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Connotations and associations of the flat ( \flat ) in the Mediterranean</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associations of mood, spirituality and nostalgia</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional connotations of intensity</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connotations of Nation</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 A HISTORY OF THE OTHER IN THE WEST</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Early musical connotations of the Phrygian mode</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 New sounds in medieval music</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moorish influence on medieval secular music</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ‘Black Legend’</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Renaissance 1400–1600</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of a harmonic framework</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How the Phrygian continued in the Renaissance</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ‘weeping’ <em>pianto</em></td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Baroque rhetoric: the ( \flat ) as lament, passion, the Other.</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ‘lament’ motif</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Of the use of the Phrygian in chorales</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The rise of the Neapolitan sixth chord</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Iberian Baroque</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 The ( \flat ) in the Romantic era</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The zenith of the Neapolitan chord</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Neapolitan Complex</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Phrygian mode returns</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 The late nineteenth and twentieth century: the ( \flat ) as ‘exotic’ trope</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 The tritone substitution and modal jazz</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 4 DISSONANCE AND DISSIDENTS: THE ♭2 WITHIN HEAVY METAL MUSIC 210

### 4.1 Metal context
- The development of a metal signifier 212
- The guitar and bass ostinato riff 216

### 4.2 Metal, the Gothic and the Phrygian mode
- The Gothic connection 217
- The influence of film music on metal 218
- The development of the ♭2 within metal 219

### 4.3 Machismo and the 'feminine' Phrygian mode
- Men in the metal scene 221
- Women in the metal scene 222
- Gender complexities and the Phrygian mode 223

### 4.4 Metal music as a soundtrack to war

### 4.5 Self-discovery and the 'East'
- Metal and the 'exotic' Phrygian mode 227
- Combining the 'East' and metal signification of the ♭2 229
- The Self as Other 230

### 4.6 Oriental metal

Conclusion 235

## 5 THE ♭2 IN FILM, TV AND VIDEO SOUNDTRACKS 237

### 5.1 Part One: Western film soundtracks' use of the ♭2
- Signifier 1: Sadness, anxiety and pathos 240
- Signifier 2: Sinister and threatening 242
- Signifier 3: The East and the exotic 245
- Signifier 4: The sinister East 247
- Signifier 5: The 'beast within' 251
- An 'East' and 'beast' hybrid in war films 252

### 5.2 Part two: Bollywood and the ♭2
- Inherited connotations from classical raga 255
- The modern Indian hero 259
- The disturbing Western influence of dissonance 264
Pastiche and exotic connotations of the ♭2 266
The ‘Bad boy’ 269

Conclusion 272

CONCLUSION 273

The ♭2 plays a significant cadential role in tonal musical cultures 274
The ♭2 is frequently ascribed emotional or narrative connotations 275
There are common metaphors for the ♭2 across these traditions 277
There are different cultural interpretations of the same metaphors 278
Cultural ideologies are revealed through the use of the ♭2 281
Similarity and difference revisited 285
New significations and transformed meanings for the ♭2 287
Contributions and theoretical implications of this study 288
Limitations of the approach, and ideas for future directions 290
Final conclusions 291

REFERENCES 294

DISCOGRAPHY 305

FILM AND RADIO 307

APPENDIX 1: INTERVIEWS 309

APPENDIX 2: MAIN RAGAS WITH KOMAL RE 310

APPENDIX 3: MAQAMAT/MAKAMLAR CONTAINING FLAT ♭ 313

APPENDIX 4: LEADING NOTES IN WESTERN SCALES AND MODES 315
## List of Figures/CD and DVD Contents

Links to audio and video tracks are on [http://theotherleadingnote.blogspot.co.uk](http://theotherleadingnote.blogspot.co.uk)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CD 1 Track</th>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page no.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Shrivastav singing <em>komal Re</em></td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Raga <em>Lalit</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Raga <em>Sohini</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Raga <em>Bhatiyar</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Khan singing raga <em>Bhatiyar.</em></td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Raga <em>Gunakri</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Khan singing raga <em>Gunakri.</em></td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>Raga <em>Bhairav</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>Shrivastav singing characteristic phrases of raga <em>Bhairav.</em></td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>Roy singing characteristic phrases of raga <em>Bhairav.</em></td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>Roy singing <em>Re</em> in raga <em>Bhairav.</em></td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>Raga <em>Bhairavi</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>Khan singing raga <em>Bhairavi.</em></td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>Dhrupad <em>Jagata janani—Baiju Bavare.</em></td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>Raga <em>Todi</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>Khan singing raga <em>Todi.</em></td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td><em>Gujari Todi</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>Datta singing raga <em>Gujari Todi.</em></td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>Datta singing <em>Gujari Todi</em> bandish</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>Raga <em>Komal Rishabh Asavari.</em></td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>Raga <em>Gauri</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>Raga <em>Multani</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>Raga <em>Shri</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>Shrivastav singing raga <em>Shri.</em></td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>Bhatkande <em>Shri.</em></td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td><em>Basant</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>Roy singing raga <em>Basant.</em></td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>Raga <em>Marva</em> ascent and descent.</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>Khan singing falling phrases in raga <em>Marva.</em></td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.30 Khan singing raga *Marva*. 87
1.31 Raga *Dhanashri* ascent and descent. 88
2.1 Notation of microtones between La (A) and Si (B). 101
2.2 Baylav playing *makam Uşşak*. 101
2.3 Oum Kalthoum, ‘Ala Baladi Elmahboub’. 102
2.4 Baylav on microtones in *makam Uşşak* 102
2.5 *Oussak* melodic cadence. 103
2.6 *Yishtabach* mode. 104
2.7 Kandel’s Orchestra ‘Der Gasn Nigun’. 104
2.8 Esma Redzepova, ‘Romano Horo’. 105
2.9 Baylav playing *Hicaz makam*. 106
2.10 ‘Ya Mayilah/Bali’. 107
2.11 *Hicaz seyir*. 108
2.12 Şükrü Tunar ‘Hicaz Oyun Havası’. 108
2.13 ‘Misirlu’. 109
2.14 Amira and Merima Ključo, ‘Mehmeda Majka Budila’. 110
2.15 *Freygish* mode. 110
2.16 ‘Beregovski’ s Sher’. 111
2.17 Kandel’s Orchestra ‘Kandel’s Hora’. 112
2.18 Paco Fernandez, ‘Mani’. 113
2.19 Le Trio Joubran, ‘Masar’. 114
2.20 ‘Sama’i Bayati al Raian’. 115
2.21 Baylav improvising on *Uşşak makam*. 115
2.22 *Saba maqam/makam*. 116
2.23 Alhenawi playing *Sikah* on the *ney*. 116
2.24 *Segah* cadential phrase. 116
2.25 Christos Nikolopoulos, ‘Perpiniadis’ solo. 117
2.26 Naftule Brandwein Orchestra, ‘Freyt Aykh Yidelekh’. 118
2.27 ‘Fandango de Huelva’. 118
2.28 El Camarón de la Isla and Paco de Lucía, ‘Bulerias’. 120
2.29 Le Trio Joubran, ‘Majâz’. 123
2.30 Tarkan, ‘Olürüm Sana’. 124
2.31 Great conch. 125
2.32 Ojos de Brujos, ‘Tiempo de Soleá’ bassline. 125
2.33 *Oussak dromos*. 128
1.3.1 Hildegard of Bingen, ‘O Euchari’.
1.3.2 Aimeric de Peguilhan, ‘Altresi.m pren com fai al jugador’.
1.3.3 Cabezón, ‘Tiento del Cuarto Tono’ last 8 bars.
1.3.4 Josquin des Prez, ‘Tu pauperum refugium’ bars 1–5.
1.3.5 Verdelot, ‘O Dolce Notte’.
1.3.6 Verdelot, ‘O Dolce Notte’ harmonisations of A–B♭–A motif.
1.3.7 Frescobaldi, ‘Canzon Quarti Toni (Mode 4) Adagio 1’.
1.3.8 Frescobaldi, ‘Toccata per l’elevazione’ bars 1–6.
1.3.9 Monteverdi, ‘Lamento della ninfa’ intro bars 9–12.
1.3.10 Monteverdi, ‘Lamento della ninfa’ II.
1.3.11 J. S. Bach ‘Befiehl du deine Wege’ BMV 153
1.3.12 Vitali ‘Corrente Seconda’ (Apel 1990, 192).
1.3.13 Scarlatti, D major sonata (K. 492) bars 26–29.
1.3.14 Scarlatti, A minor sonata (K. 218) bars 77–84.
1.3.15 Scarlatti, C# minor sonata (K. 247) bars 1–16.
1.3.16 Soler, ‘Fandango’ bars 1–10.
1.3.17 Soler, ‘Fandango’ bars 114–16.
1.3.18 Beethoven, ‘Moonlight Sonata’.
1.3.19 Chopin, Waltz in A minor Op. 34 No. 2 bars 53–83.
1.3.20 Schubert, ‘Der Muller und der Bach’ bars 1–28.
1.3.21 Schubert, ‘Erlkonig’ last 7 bars.
3.22 Chopin, Mazurka Op. 41 No. 1. 192
3.23 Brahms, Symphony No. 4 Op. 98 Andante Moderato end. 193
3.24 Schubert, C major String Quintet last 13 bars. 195
3.25 Brahms, Piano Quintet Op. 34 end of the ‘Scherzo’. 196
3.27 Bruckner, Sixth Symphony bars 1–6. 199
3.28 Bruckner, Sixth Symphony fourth movement bars 3–7. 199
3.29 Bruckner, Sixth Symphony finale bars 37–8. 199
3.30 Ravel, ‘Alborado del gracioso’. 200
3.31 Ravel, ‘Chanson Espagnole’ bars 1–4, 8–16. 201
3.32 Debussy, ‘Chanson Espagnole’ bars 1–12. 202
3.34 Debussy, ‘Fantoches’ bars 6–16. 203
3.35 Lily Boulanger, ‘D’un Soir Triste’. 203
3.36 Lili Boulanger, ‘Pie Jesu’ bars 26–28. 203
3.37 Stravinsky, ‘Orpheus’ bars 1–8. 204
3.39 Dizzy Gillespie, ‘Night in Tunisia’. 206
3.40 Thelonious Monk, ‘Bemsha Swing’. 207
3.41 Abdullah Ibrahim, ‘African Market Place’ B section. 208
4.1 Harmonic minor and Phrygian Major. 213
4.2 Rayner playing the Phrygian Major on guitar. 214
4.3 Herbert improvising in Locrian mode on bass. 214
4.4 Herbert demonstrating a bass riff. 216
4.5 Herbert demonstrating a 1–♭2 bass line. 216
4.6 Herbert playing major and Locrian scales. 217
4.7 Rayner playing Phrygian mode on guitar. 217
4.8 Black Sabbath, ‘Hand of Doom’. 218
4.9 Venom, ‘Countess Bathory’. 220
4.10 Metallica, ‘Enter Sandman’. 220
4.11 Arch Enemy, ‘Dead Eyes see no Future’. 221
4.12 Drowning Pool, ‘Bodies’. 222
DVD 1 ‘Bodies’ military clip 225
4.13 Slayer, ‘Angel of Death’. 225
4.14 Lamb of God, ‘One Gun’. 225
4.15 Ministry, ‘Khyber Pass’ 226
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Music/Performance</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>Led Zeppelin, ‘Kashmir’</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>Dick Dale and the Del-tones, ‘Misirlou’</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>Luke Rayner improvising ‘flamenco’ style.</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>Iron Maiden, ‘Powerslave’</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>Metallica, ‘Wherever I May Roam’</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>Yossi Sassi Sararon singing ♭♭2</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>Chaos of Nazareth, ‘Silence before Chaos’</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>Al Qaynah, ‘Ground Zero Pilgrims’</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 2</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Franz Waxman, ‘Norma’s Theme’, <em>Sunset Boulevard</em></td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 3</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>John Williams, ‘Far From the Home I Love’, <em>Fiddler on the Roof</em></td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Clinton Shorter, <em>District 9</em> end of title underscore.</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 4</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Lalo Schifrin, ‘The Plot’, <em>Music from Mission: Impossible</em></td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 5</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>John Williams, theme, <em>Jaws</em></td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 6</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Bernard Herrmann, ‘The Giant Bees’, <em>Mysterious Island</em></td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 7</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>Robert Rodriguez, theme, <em>Planet Terror</em></td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td><em>The State Within</em> tension ostinato.</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>5.10</td>
<td><em>Craven</em> theme.</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 8</td>
<td>5.11</td>
<td>Maurice Jarre, theme, <em>Lawrence of Arabia</em></td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 9</td>
<td>5.12</td>
<td>John Williams, ‘Bottle Dance’, <em>Fiddler on the Roof</em></td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>Ennio Morricone, Mexican theme, <em>The Good, the Bad and the Ugly</em></td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>5.14</td>
<td>Marco Beltrami and Buck Sanders, ‘Hostile’, <em>The Hurt Locker</em></td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>5.15</td>
<td>Hans Zimmer, ‘Chant’ <em>Black Hawk Down</em></td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>Wimbledon women’s tennis final.</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 10</td>
<td>5.17</td>
<td>‘Your First 80 Days’, <em>Marine Corps Recruit Training</em></td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 11</td>
<td>5.18</td>
<td>U.S. Marine Reconnaissance Recruiting Video</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 12</td>
<td>5.19</td>
<td>Shankar-Jaikishan, ‘Ghar Aaya Mera Pardesi’, <em>Awaara</em></td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 14</td>
<td>5.21</td>
<td>Ismail Darbaar, ‘Albela Sajan Aayo Rei’, <em>Hum Dil De Chuke Sanam</em></td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 15</td>
<td>5.22</td>
<td>Pritam, ‘Dhoom Again’, <em>Dhoom 2</em></td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>5.26</td>
<td>Shankar-Jaikishan, nightmare section, <em>Awaara</em></td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD 19</td>
<td>5.27</td>
<td>A.R. Rahman, ‘Main Albeli’, <em>Zubeidaa</em></td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 2.1  Prevalence of the flat ₂ in maqamat/makamlar and folk equivalents.  99
Table 2.2  Turkish notational accidentals.  100
Table 2.3  Melodic cadential motifs in the musical examples of this chapter.  121
Acknowledgements

I could not have written this doctoral thesis without the help and support of the friends around me. Above all, I would like to thank Vivi Lachs, Prof. Penny Florence, Prof. Cathy Lane and Dr. Carol Shergold for supporting me by asking me challenging questions, engaging in stimulating discussions, reading and re-reading drafts of chapters and providing me with a cross-disciplinary academic community. I would also like to thank Kay Charlton, Dr Norah Moore, Mark Allan, Anthea Gomez, Nicky Lachs, Jane Lyons, Dr Jihad Shwaikh, Dr Malcolm Miller, Ruti Lachs, Karunavaca, Mayy Omary, Deepak Shah, Geeta Shah and Sally King, for their encouragement, support and interest and commenting on drafts. Without Julia Haseldine I would have been alone and adrift in Sheffield. This thesis would not have been possible without the hugely dependable help, support and great patience of my principal supervisor Dr. Andrew Killick, who from the start has encouraged and challenged my ideas. His insight and advice has sustained me throughout. The stimulating and challenging comments, advice and encouragement of my second supervisor, Prof. Nicola Dibben, has been invaluable, and I am extremely grateful. I would also like to thank my examiners Prof. Philip Tagg and Dr Simon Keegan-Phipps for their studied, encouraging and critical feedback.

I would like to acknowledge the financial support of the AHRC for the award of a Postgraduate Research Studentship that provided the necessary financial support for this research. The University of Sheffield library facilities, as well as those at SOAS and the British Library, have been indispensable. I would also like to thank Abigail Cobley for her proofreading services, Clare Jenkins of Sheffield Hallam University for access to her interview files and the Open University for access to Clayton and Leante video recordings.

I am most grateful for professional consultations with Arvind Parikh, head of the Indian Musicological Society, Dr. Subroto Mihir Roy, of the University of Pune, Prof. Alexander Knapp and Prof. Owen Wright from SOAS, Dr. Laura Leante from the University of Durham, and Prof. Susan McClary, who have given me valuable expert background information.
Finally I thank my interviewees Louai Alhenawi, Cahit Baylav, Boikutt, the band Chaos of Nazareth, Maurice Chernik, Jasminder Daffu, Soumik Datta, Susi Evans, Pete Herbert, Merima Ključo, Rafaqat Ali Khan, Hakan Ozugurel, Suresh Kumar Prajapati, Luke Rayner, Yossi Sassi-Sa’aron, Merlin Shepherd, Baluji Shrivastav, Deborah Strauss, and Reuben Turner for their generous contributions.
Introduction

When was the last time an ethnomusicologist went out to hunt for sameness rather than difference?... An ideology of difference must be replaced by an ideology of sameness so that—and this is somewhat paradoxical—we can gain a better view of difference. In other words, only if we proceed from a premise of sameness and grant difference in the unique expression of that sameness are we likely to get at the true similarities and differences between musics.

Kofi Agawu (2003, 64, 67–8)

The subject of this research

As a musician specialising in world music, I am interested in playing and researching different genres of music from around the world, making connections and studying difference. Brought up with classical music, I was introduced to Eastern European music through the classical composers Bartók and Khachaturian, who opened up a world of interesting scales and rhythms, far away from those familiar to me. I explored the traditional dance genres of Hungary, Greece, and klezmer and took a course in Indian music. The consistently most compelling element for me in these unfamiliar genres was the use of different scales. My experience over many years of playing with musicians to whom these scales are familiar made me aware of how often our traditions and assumptions can obstruct mutual understanding. It inspired me with a wish to debate issues relevant to world music studies, particularly concerning cross-cultural communication through music. The result is the present study, which seeks to shed light on comparative issues relating to the contextual meanings of musical phenomena and the communication within and between cultures through music.

With this aim in mind I consider one musical phenomenon, the $b^2$ (flat second degree), across a selection of tonal musical genres from around the world. I define the $b^2$, also known as the flat(tened) supertonic, as the note that is a semitone, or other interval smaller than a whole tone, above the tonic, or keynote, in tonal music. I argue that by comparing different cultures’ uses and connotations of this musical element, cultural and ideological similarities and differences can be revealed.

The $b^2$ occurs widely in Ottoman and Arabian influenced musics, North Indian classical music and certain Western genres. The choice of genres studied here has
resulted partly from my personal involvement in playing Indian and klezmer music, and partly from connections resulting from these involvements. These two popular traditions offered participant-observation situations that are, I argue, typical in their use of the $b\flat 2$ within modes and in vernacular harmony.\(^1\) Because my involvement with Indian music was in the popular ‘Bollywood’ genre, it was necessary to research the Indian classical music that influences much of the ‘Bollywood’ style. In the case of klezmer music I was led to further study of Ottoman classical music and its influence on other genres.

These two main areas of involvement, Indian and Ottoman, form the backbone of the material in this thesis. However, to many people in the West the most familiar appearances of the $b\flat 2$ may be in Spanish music and in the famous theme from the film *Jaws* (e.g. Chernik interview 2012), so in addition I discuss four other relevant areas of musical activity that make significant use of the $b\flat 2$: Spanish music with its connection to Arabian culture, Western classical music, film music and heavy metal. These illustrate Western significations and introduce new connotations for the $b\flat 2$.

The $b\flat 2$ exists within tonality, and there are a variety of definitions of the term ‘tonal’. This thesis will use the definition of tonal music as music that has a discrete scale and gravitates towards a particular pitch in that scale. This is related to definitions of ‘pitch-centricity’ (Sachs 1962, 168–174), ‘tonal organisation’ (Blacking 1970, 1–56) and ‘melodic anchoring’ (Bharucha 1996, 383; Thomson 1999, 215). It includes music that is often referred to as modal. Peter Manuel defines modal as ‘a linear melodic construct based on scale or scale-type, with a tonic note, and in many but not all cases, more specific melodic features like pitch hierarchy and characteristic phrases’ (1989, 70). All the music that I discuss in this thesis is modal in this sense.

There is no connection with harmonic triads in this definition of tonal music, yet tension (dissonance) and resolution (consonance) are essential ingredients of the melodic movement in the genres included here, particularly at cadences. I use the term cadence to refer to melodic movement towards a resting point at the end of phrases or to the final note. The $b\flat 2$ is often the penultimate note at a cadence.

---

\(^1\) Vernacular harmony refers to the conventions of modal harmony that musicians have
point, and can be described as an ‘upper leading note’, leading the melodic movement down to the tonic from the distance of a semitone. This ‘upper leading note’ is used regularly in many traditions, though it is constructed as Other in Western music that favours a 7 rising ‘leading note’.

The Phrygian has a downward leading note pointing to the tonic, as opposed to the Western Ionian Major that has a rising leading note to the tonic. There are a few modes and ragas discussed here that contain both: ragas Bhairav, Todi, Shri and Marva, maqam Hijazkar for instance. The use of the tritone substitution chord in jazz also exploits both of these leading notes.

The ‘gravitational’ pull of leading notes to other structural pillars in a piece of music also contributes to tension and release connotations. These vary from the notes a semitone (or other interval smaller than a tone) to either side of the ‘dominant’ note (generally a perfect fifth away from the tonic, with occasional variations), to leading notes toward the third in tertial harmony (Tagg 2009, 36–7). The Ionian mode is also distinguished by two opposing leading notes, 7–1 and 4–3, regarded by Tagg as a basis for the strength of the V–I cadence (ibid., 97).

In this light the modes discussed here may be categorized as to the presence of other leading notes and whether these rise or fall (see Appendices). For instance, the Phrygian has two falling leading notes♭2–1 and ♭6–5, Hicaz has one falling and one rising ♭2–1, 3–4, as the fourth degree is a structural pillar. Where tertial harmony is introduced there may also be ♭6–5 and 4–3 leading notes in Hicaz, as in Phrygian Major, making three downward moving leading notes. It can be argued that additional falling leading notes as well as the ♭2 may magnify the associations with falling metaphors. An example of the use of all three of these falling leading notes is the ♭II–I cadence commonly used in Greek folk music (ibid., 284).

Main tension notes in ragas are semitones away from the drone notes, the downward leading ♭2 and ♭6 indicate dusk, with two downward ‘leading notes’. However the term ‘leading note’ may be confusing in this context as the syntax of the raga may preclude this leading movement, as in raga Marva where the tonic is avoided. The term ‘tension’ note may be more appropriate. The #4 indicates
evening twilight. Many evening ragas also have 7. In the Appendices, each mode and raga that is presented within this thesis is itemized, and the ‘tension’ notes are indicated, including their direction.

The melodic cadences that appear in this thesis highlight many cadential formations that are not often compared with Western classical harmonic cadences. Vernacular harmony that has developed around these melodic cadences further establishes the b2 as a significant part of cadential structures. I argue that these melodic falling cadences are structurally coherent elements of ‘ending’, whether treated harmonically or melodically, within many musical genres outside the Western classical tradition. I therefore name the b2 The Other Leading Note, for two main reasons: firstly to characterise the contrast of this note to the familiar rising 7 ‘leading note’, and secondly because of its use in music of countries often classified by the West as Other.

Interpretations, connotations and associations have become attached to the b2. The term ‘sedimented meaning’ was coined by Maurice Merleau-Ponty in relation to language (Merleau-Ponty 1964, xx); its use within music points to how ‘enculturated listeners hear music as having certain meanings deriving from its history of use’ and associations in previously heard music (White, Dibben, and Pitts 2010, 112). I discuss whether parallels in connotations across the genres discussed here can be explained by the meanings attributed to the b2’s unique position: a semitone interval above the tonic. I ask whether ‘universals’ of connotations exist due to physical features of pitch and/or metaphors that become ‘sedimented’ in these musical gestures.

Further to this discussion on similarities there are differences of conception within different cultures that affect their interpretations of the b2 and are, perhaps, individual and incomparable. For instance, the association of falling pitch with negativity may be culturally specific. These different concepts may affect the prevalence of the b2, which is the least used pitch in an extensive survey of German folk tunes (Huron 2006, 148–9), and perhaps the most common cadential leading note in Turkish classical music.
The most common cadence in Western music has the rising 7–1 leading note, in contrast to the falling cadence b2–1 of ‘Eastern’ classical musics. This, along with Western associations between falling and negativity, may invite divisions along binary lines: East-West, negative-positive, weak-strong. Within this thesis I will analyse this binary thinking together with wider issues of Orientalism, where the sedimented meanings of the b2 may be used in a twenty-first century setting to represent cross-cultural stereotypes. The study of the prevalence and assigned meanings of the b2, within tonal music of different genres from different cultures, may reveal ideological differences and historical prejudices relevant beyond the phenomena themselves.

There is a paucity of analytic and cultural musicological research considering a musical element across cultures. This research reveals cadential sequences that add to a global picture of harmonic practices. Moreover, it sheds light on issues of cadential function and metaphorical concepts within and beyond the (ethno)musicological discipline. It aims to provide a productive way of discussing similarity and difference between musical cultures, and thus addressing the impact of difference on cross-cultural communication.

My overall thesis is that the b2 plays a significant functional role within tonal music cross-genre and cross-culturally. This multi-disciplinary analysis of both commonalities and differences reveals more nuanced and complex connotations than that of the ‘Other’ predominant in Western traditions. These new and more fluid understandings may enable the articulation of powerful, contemporary identities.

**Research aims in relation to current academic discourses**

This thesis engages with discussions within ethnomusicology on cross-cultural analytical study by examining a musicological detail in different traditions. It also connects with discourse on metaphor, touching on embodied metaphors of movement, and, by engaging with music from different disciplinary angles it hopes to contribute to cross-disciplinary dialogue.

There are two primary aims to this study. The first is to investigate the functional roles of the b2 pitch degree across cultures. I will detail how melodic falling cadences are structurally coherent elements of ‘ending’, whether treated
harmonically or melodically, within many musical genres outside the Western classical tradition. This will add to current knowledge of cadential processes by integrating traditions that are often separated by a split between ‘tonal’ and ‘modal’ concepts. The second aim is to ascertain the differences in the connotations and the interpretation of the ♭2 across genres and cultures. This study sets out to explore and compare a number of ‘local’ associations of the ♭2, with their metaphorical underpinnings.

Traditionally, ethnomusicologists have subscribed to the belief that area studies are the most ethical way to describe musical practices within different cultures. Recent global developments have heightened the recognition of a need to cross boundaries, to acknowledge that these boundaries are porous, and to show that ethnomusicologists are well-equipped to demonstrate this. The present cross-cultural study addresses this need by identifying similarities in the use of the ♭2 across cultures.

I identify five current debates on similarity and difference from within different disciplines that may benefit from the results of this study. The first debate questions whether there can be mainstream discussions that embrace the voices of the non-Western and women on an equal footing, rather than as the Other. The ♭2 is a useful focus for these discussions as its primary appearance is in music of non-Western countries or to signify the Other, and this may be seen as speaking to ideological differences.

A second debate concerns history, which is at the heart of our understanding of present musical practice. This study provides a new angle, for instance by allowing us to see more precisely the history of the Phrygian mode in the West and questioning why it slipped out of common usage. By increasing knowledge of how this history shapes modern connotations, we can become more aware of how the Western listener may be prejudiced in relation to the ♭2.

Third, a significant current debate in cognitive psychology concerns the applicability of its results on a global stage. Metaphors of rising and falling and of narrowness have been studied within Western cultures, and to a limited extent in comparison to other cultures. Yet no-one has made a thorough examination
across cultures. While this present study is not quantitative research, it extends cognitive psychological questions to a broader cross-cultural sample.

Fourth, analytical studies are rare within popular musicology, and this study contributes to a body of knowledge within popular musicology that researches musicological issues alongside cultural issues. The study of the ♭2 reveals significant features that only appear in the vernacular world of popular music. For instance, harmonic innovations in Balkan and Spanish popular musics introduce new chord sequences that enable the ♭2 to act as a dominant chord, which are taken up in other popular musics.

Finally, debates around Orientalism remain widespread in the reception and production of music for the twenty-first century. The different connotations of the ♭2 may be used to represent cross-cultural stereotypes that help perpetuate an East-West divide (Al-Taee, 2010, xv). The study of the ♭2 as a marker of the exotic reveals some of the practices of this representation.

Overall this study aims to highlight harmonic practices and metaphorical associations that occur in the music of non-Western countries and in popular music, through a focus on the ♭2.

**Research questions**

The central question in this thesis is whether the ♭2 plays a significant functional role in tonal music, recognised by its creators, and whether there are significant differences in connotation of the ♭2 in different cultures. In addition, this thesis will examine five related research questions: Are there common metaphorical associations attributed to the ♭2 across cultures? Are the occurrences in different traditions comparable, i.e. is there one or many ♭2s? What do the differences tell us about culture and ideologies? Do these differences affect cross-cultural communication? How is composition affected by them?

**The case for cross-cultural comparisons**

One issue that arises when undertaking cross-cultural research is the question of validity. Historically, comparative musicology was a discipline that was later superseded by ethnomusicology. The new ethnomusicologists viewed comparative musicology as being preoccupied with evolutionist and evaluative
concepts, and having a lack of thorough contextual placement (Merriam 1964, 301–2; Blacking 1981, 187, 192). A post-war fear of racialism contributed to the formation of ethnomusicology, which focused on the study of musics within specific cultures, driven by the desire to understand them from the bottom up (Bohlman 2008, 98; Stokes 2008, 209). The development of new musicology and cultural studies in the 1980s brought still more emphasis on context and the need to understand musical practice from within cultures. Single area studies continue to make up the majority of ethnomusicological studies, and these have established a more detailed knowledge base of different musics.

Since the later part of the twentieth century there have been various attempts to revive comparison. Timothy Rice points out advantages to having more communication between areas of study, allowing comparative interpretations (1987, 471, 480–2). It is recognised that comparison is a common practice within world music studies, and with the increasing globalisation of musical practice the need to re-establish academic discourse between different musical cultures is heightened. Some ethnomusicologists in the 1980s advocated ‘comparison and synthesis’ with an ‘open-minded philosophical position’ (Falck, Rice, and Kolinski 1982, xi–ii, xv). Alan Merriam writes that there is inevitable comparison in any discipline that undertakes definition and classification, and that a ‘comparative methodology’ in some form cannot be avoided (1982, 177). He specifically advocates comparative studies ‘under specific circumstances’ in order to lead to ‘new and broadened musical knowledge’ (ibid., 174–5).

Christopher Marshall believes that ‘indigenous philosophical traditions may offer new ways of looking at old issues’, gaining insights into performance practice and reception, and that more will be learnt about ‘listening universally and in specific cultures’ (1982, 172). This present study draws on ‘local’ philosophical differences between traditions that bring such insights.

Similarities are also discovered by comparison. For instance Kofi Agawu, in his polemics on African music scholarship, argues that the complexities of twenty-first century identity formation preclude any easy separation between cultures (2003, xviii). He critiques ethnomusicology as being ‘dedicated to the construction of difference’, and suggests that Africa ‘after all the necessary adjustments have been made for material divergence is remarkably like the West’
Agawu asserts that ‘the belief that African music is fundamentally different from Western music’ deprives ‘specifically African manifestation[s] of any claims to universality, any standing among influential discourses’ (ibid., 63–4). Agawu agrees with Marshall in asserting that the critique of assumptions across cultures can bring insights and ‘build bridges to other musical traditions’ (ibid., xiii). Cross-cultural comparisons, then, can not only unveil differences, but also reveal similarity.

In *The New (Ethno)musicologies* Martin Stokes, while warning of the partial, local nature of ethnographic knowledge and the dangers of speaking of universals (2008, 212–3), writes of how ethnomusicologists are well equipped to engage with issues of the ‘clash of civilisations’ in the twenty-first century. He asserts that the actual making of ‘cultural boundaries’ contributes to ‘processes of inclusion and exclusion, dominance and subjection’, and advocates efforts to cross boundaries and make communication as human beings (ibid., 210). Like Agawu, Stokes is concerned with the eradication of concepts of fundamental differences between cultures, and by highlighting and comparing the use of The Other Leading Note I am also hoping to challenge these boundaries.

What, then, is the standing of comparative studies in the twenty-first century? There are those who stand by the incomparability of different musical cultures. Judith Becker’s conclusion in her 1986 article ‘Is Western Art Music Superior?’ was that ‘music systems are incommensurable’ (1986, 359), and she wrote to Michael Tenzer in 2011 that she continues to maintain this position (Tenzer 2011, 385). Tenzer, in discussing Becker’s conclusion, argues that however subjective our listening experience is, comparative study can ‘open the door to change our understanding’ (Tenzer 2011, 359). Tenzer advocates comparative study to learn about subjective listening and the challenges of becoming open to unfamiliar musics (ibid., 382-83). He demonstrates this not only in his own comparative work on temporal augmentation (2011), but also in his book on cross-cultural analysis co-edited with Roeder (2011). There are other key theorists working on comparative material: Martin Clayton’s (2007) studies in South Asian rhythmic practice; Manuel’s (2009) pan-regional study in the Caribbean; and Stokes’ (2004) studies across Europe and the Middle East exploring identity and emotion.
with a global perspective. Taken together, these studies indicate a continuing interest in comparative study into the twenty-first century.

**Argument for this cross-cultural interval study**

This study is orientated towards pitch. Other factors such as timbre, pitch-frequency, and dynamics hold a lesser, though relevant, position in this discussion. This is not to take away from the important role that these factors play within cultural interpretations, but my wish is to engage with general manifestations of the b2, described as such by composers and performers. Thus, microtonal variations of the b2 are generally discussed together, as a single phenomenon.

Melodic comparison has retained overtones of ‘evolutionary and diffusionist theories’ in ethnomusicological practice, including that conducted by Merriam (1964, 302). Merriam’s cross-cultural interval studies aimed ‘for the reconstruction of culture history’ (ibid., 301). He conducted ‘precise comparison’ in cross-cultural interval studies from the statistical analysis of ‘ascending versus descending intervals; proportions of wide, medium, and narrow intervals; proportions of kinds of intervals used’ in music from Brazil, Trinidad and that of the Cheyenne Indians (ibid., 300).

John Blacking criticised Merriam’s stance:

> Statistical analyses of intervals… are all very well, provided that we know that the same intervals have the same meanings in all the cultures whose music we are comparing. If this is not certain, we may be comparing incomparable phenomena…. If we accept the view that patterns of music sound in any culture are the product of concepts and behaviour peculiar to that culture, we cannot compare them with similar patterns in another culture unless we know that the latter are derived from similar concepts and behavior. (Blacking 1966, 218)

I cannot ‘know’ that the b2 is derived from ‘similar concepts and behaviour’ in the different traditions studied here; in fact I present evidence to show otherwise in some instances. Yet, all the performers and composers within the traditions discussed in this thesis have names for the b2 that are marked as different to the standard second degree, using different terminology: b2, komal Re, koma bemol, küçük mücennep, bakiye, flat two, flattened supertonic. All these names are understood to refer to a pitch degree smaller than a tone above the tonic, and are,
arguably, thus comparable (Blacking 1981, 188). I have chosen to compare this musical element, but I emphasise the emic perception of it rather than my own. Blacking argues for the importance of understanding the classifications used within a culture, and that this is only possible when these meanings are shared: ‘the processes of sharing become as crucial to the semiotics of music as the sonic product which provides the focus for analysis’ (Blacking 1981, 192). The ‘local’ perceptions of significance are also important to Merriam, who discusses the importance of recognising different concepts regarding intervals cross-culturally. He argues that ‘music structure is carried subliminally’ (Merriam 1964, 297), and that cultural understanding is carried by members of cultures often on an unconscious level.

The discussion of similarities and differences between cultures in this thesis is intended to provide a broadening and deepening of the understanding of uses and connotations of the $b\hat{2}$. Different concepts and behaviour may be quite specific within a culture. For example Turkish classical music is concerned with microtones, whereas heavy metal is concerned with timbre, volume and lyrics. This study will report on these differences, make connections and analyse variants in local interpretations. The thesis will ask whether there is one or many $b\hat{2}$s.

I suggest that although there are differences within the genres discussed here, there are also generally similar concepts that merit discussion such as cadence and the use of metaphor. Interpretations of similar or related metaphors bring out connections and variations between genres and cultures. Through cross-cultural comparison I hope to reveal and discuss some of the nuances of different concepts and metaphors, as well as similarities in order to add to musical knowledge that facilitates cross-cultural communication.

**The Other: Exoticism, Orientalism and binary separations**

In the course of this research I have found terminology that describes geographical area, ethnicity, origin or culture in relation to the $b\hat{2}$: for instance, West, East, Oriental, European, Other or exotic. In this section I attempt to portray what the meanings of these ‘field terms’ are for their users, as far as I understand them. ‘Field terms’ are defined by anthropologist James Spradley as
‘the manners of description used by “insiders” and the types of things that they take for granted and may assume that we know’ (Spradley 1979, 142-3). I have found little consistency across my research material, and the use of these terms does not necessarily match dictionary definitions. I do however find patterns of perceived meaning, and binary oppositions, that I hope to convey. I then discuss concepts of similarity and difference that need clarification and definition in the context of this thesis, and discuss the role of the ethnomusicologist in relation to these concepts, extending the discussion on comparative study.

The ♭2 is used as an exotic/Oriental signifier in Western composition and particularly in film music. The ♭2 evokes images of difference, binary separations and the Other. One of the aims of this study is to unpick these terms and analyse the validity of their use in different contexts. I want to invoke and examine the habitual use of these terms rather than using them as my own intellectual framework. I will use these terms throughout the thesis in order to keep an awareness of their associated ‘baggage’ in the foreground, rather than downplaying it.

**West and East**

The term ‘Western’ often refers to people of a European ancestry, or those who have the culture of this area as their main cultural heritage, or their main learnt cultural milieu. The solidification of cultural values in North Europe since the Renaissance era, along with colonial adventures, have brought about a fixed, and sometimes fiercely defended, cultural canon referred to as ‘Western’. I will use the terms West and Western in this thesis to refer to this fixed canon that, for instance, eschews influence from the Ottoman or Arabian empires.

The term ‘East’ is used in a looser way, the actual cultures lying under the umbrella term of Eastern being variable and vague: the ‘East’ is an idea projected onto places, rather than an actual place. Some of the musical traditions discussed here—North Indian classical music and genres influenced by the Ottoman or Arabian empires, including Spanish flamenco and Greek rebetiko—carry the ‘baggage’ of being termed ‘Eastern’ or ‘Oriental’. In relation to this thesis this draws more significance to the fact that the Oriental signifier of the ♭2 does indeed feature largely in some of the music of these traditions.
**Oriental(ism)**

While often being used as a synonym for ‘Eastern’, the term Oriental is also associated with Orientalism, as defined by Edward Said:

The basic distinction between East and West [is] the starting point for elaborate theories, epics, novels, social descriptions, and political accounts concerning the Orient, its people, customs, ‘mind’, destiny…. The Oriental is irrational, depraved, childlike, ‘different’, thus the European is rational, virtuous, mature, ‘normal’…. [This demonstrates] the strength of the West and the Orient’s weakness—as seen by the West. Such strength and such weakness are as intrinsic to Orientalism as they are to any view that divides the world into large general divisions, entities that coexist in a state of tension produced by what is believed to be radical difference. (Said 1978, 2–3, 40, 45)

Said uses the terms West and European as binary opposites to the terms East and Oriental. However, Victor Hugo suggests that the Oriental is ‘Hebraic, Turkish, Greek, Persian, Arab, even Spanish, because Spain is still the Orient; Spain is half African’ (quoted in McClary 1992, 30). Thus the question arises as to the clarity of these terms.

**European**

Martin Stokes describes how the Arabian and Ottoman influence on Europe challenges notions of insider and outsider, ‘normative European values’, introducing concepts of ‘polluted peripheries’ (2008, 211–12). The European countries of Spain, Italy and Greece have all, at some time, been seen as Oriental and ‘exotic’. Spain, in particular, with its long history of Arabian influence, has been the focus of notions of the Orient since at least the nineteenth century, regarded as the Orient within Europe (McClary 1992, 30).

The musics of European cultures influenced by the Arabian and Ottoman Empires, including Greece and Spain, are discussed in chapter two. Certain genres within Greece and Spain, such as *rebetiko* and flamenco, have developed an individuality and identity through the exploitation of these influences, including the use of the $\flat 2$, sometimes associated with subcultural identities and protest. The popular music of Greece and Spain also contains the $\flat 2$ to a substantial degree, as in Turkey, solely due to their Arabian or Ottoman past, and it may be embraced as a national characteristic.
Thus, the binary of West and European versus East and Oriental is not viable geographically, yet I will use both these pairs of terms in this thesis in the manner described above, with the aim of maintaining the awareness of this Othering.

Other
By entitling this thesis *The Other Leading Note* I clearly wish to engage with the concept of the Other. The term ‘Other’ refers to anything or anyone that is different, alien to oneself (one’s Self) or one’s norms. This concept is itself intrinsic to form and structure in music, to tension and release, and to cadence. I argue that in order to understand appearances of the♭₂ on a global stage, it is important to recognise its status as a symbol of the exoticised Other in Western music. In traditions in this study that have been ‘touched by the maqām’, although it sometimes signifies the exotic, it may simply be ‘a note’, an equal participant in musical narrative alongside other pitches. The♭₂ thus has very different significations in the West and it has become part of a broader, culturally and historically specific, marker of exoticism.

Exotic
The term ‘exotic’ refers to something of foreign origin, with a ‘dimension of glamour, the unfamiliar and mysterious’ (Cresswell 2010, 190). So there is exotic music for any culture, as arises in my discussion of Bollywood music. However, in general I refer to the exotic here as predominantly Other to the West.

Binary oppositions
The separation of music between ‘East’ and ‘West’ in musicological discourse has resulted in binaries that are often simplistic, including stereotypes of culture/nature, reason/emotion, and Self/Other. Ruth Solie has summed these up as ‘under control/out of control’ (1995, 11), adding that these associations ‘exercise a strong and virtually subliminal influence on the ways we position and interpret groups of people, their behaviour, and their works’ (ibid.). As Said put it,

> men have always divided the world up into regions having ethereal or imagined distinction from each other. The absolute demarcation between East and West... had been years, even centuries in the making.... [It was] reinforced

---

² I shall use this phrase to refer to these genres within the thesis.
by the colonial encounter as well as by the widespread interest in the alien and unusual. (Said 1978, 39–40)

The binary differences encountered in Orientalism are a strong ideological focus of this thesis, where The Other Leading Note, $b\flat_2$, may be perceived as representing the ‘East’. The subliminal influence on our interpretations is particularly clear in chapter five on film soundtracks.

**On similarity and difference in world music (studies)**

The classifications of ethnomusicology and world music give ‘non-Western’ music space in the academic and commercial worlds, yet the dangers of binary separation and essentialism abound in these fields and may encourage ‘the reification and commercialization of the Other’ (Arom and Martin 2011, 398). On the other hand history has shown that ‘melting pot’ imagery can force acquiescence, the ‘melting’ being expected to come from the non-Westerner (Solie 1995, 6). Solie points out that ‘multi-culturalism’ can create a situation where ‘there may then be demands to “hear a piece of music the way I do”’ (ibid.).

We may offer different accounts, but our disagreement takes on an explicitly political cast when your hearing arises from your experience within a marginalized and ‘different’ community and mine from dominant cultural expectations…. Difference is about power… [and] claiming one’s own difference may be a form of resistance against subsumption into an undifferentiated universal subject. (ibid.)

The highlighting of the use of the $b\flat_2$ as a ‘special’ note for the ‘East’ may be seen as reinforcing an ‘East/West’ binary, perpetuating notions of difference (ibid., 4). However, the assertion of difference may produce ‘an energy that may prompt insights and readings unavailable to those whose lives take the “normal” course’ (ibid., 7). This is interesting to compare with Agawu’s comments on ‘sameness’ (see quote at head of Introduction), and it is possible to marry these seemingly opposing comments. Agawu advocates the assumption of sameness, and, through that, the study of difference, whereas Solie advocates the assertion of equality, bringing with that cultural differences.

The $b\flat_2$ is frequently used in comparable ways in the tonal genres discussed here: it is used to achieve cadence, and has connotations related to its scalar position, often involving pathos in some way. Its use also often varies within the different
cultures researched here, exhibiting different traits that can be absorbed into mainstream discourse. The discussions of different interpretations assert a multiplicity that leads towards a global picture of its use. I argue for all functions and connotations of the $♭2$ to be placed ‘in the premier league’ (Agawu 2003, 67), that is, to be considered alongside other cadential and metaphorical discourse, rather than being hived off to an area of ‘special case’ exotica.

By bringing into mainstream discourse the voices of the subaltern there can be debate on the fluidity of difference and similarity in the same terms. This is made possible by acknowledging the uniqueness of individuals at the same time as recognising convergence and commonalities (Florence 2004, 19, 20). This discourse that brings ‘the margins… into the thick of things’ (ibid., 1–2) is not done in order to compare the unlike, it is not oppositional, ‘not another clear binary of opposing monoliths, but rather a changing network of structured relations’ (ibid., 2) that is ‘reconceptualising exclusion’ (ibid., 5). The ethnomusicologist may be considered to be in a good position to play an activist role in ‘restoring the plurality that hegemony struggles to eliminate’, acknowledging nuanced difference and being ‘attuned to the voices of the voiceless’ (Bohlman 2008, 110). The consideration, here, of the ‘exotic’ musical feature of The Other Leading Note, the $♭2$, as it appears for instance in Europe and in metal, provides a useful, concrete place for disciplinary debates on ‘hard and fast distinctions between “us” and “them”’ (Stokes 2008, 211–12).

**On Glocalisation**

Many late-twentieth-century and early-twenty-first century situations described in this thesis involve a complex identity position where not only national, but global and local, or ‘glocal’ factors are at play. The ‘glocal’ began as a business term but has now pervaded the cultural field and represents the combination, rather than the opposition, of global and local forces, describing ‘the inter-subjective dimension of cultural practice’ (Biddle and Knights 2007, 3). As early as 1991 Roland Robertson described the term as ‘a massive, twofold process involving *the interpenetration of the universalization of particularism and the particularization of universalism*… [Thereby producing] the simultaneity of particularism and universalism’ (1991, 73–4). This brings a wider range of specific configurations of modernity:
Popular culture is constantly being rediscovered and reconfigured… co-opted and reshaped… with musical variations that play to the audience’s understanding of itself… appropriated, transformed, and used by cultures in the constant drama of self-definition (Craig and King 2003, 5–6).

Connell and Gibson argue that these new configurations may reflect ‘the fluxes and fluidity of contemporary life, unsettling binary oppositions’ (2003, 44). They continue to assert that the new meanings and connotations that are developed both question and transform cultural identities (2003, 192, 11).

My discussions of post-MTV Bollywood result from configurations that Cvetkovich and Kellner claim in their assertion that ‘MTV is adapted to local conditions and produces new hybrid forms’ (1997, 11). Bollywood has been regarded as non-authentic in relation to its embracing of global styles, yet identity can be a very local affair, with local conditions and contexts determining the genre. Stokes has long argued: ‘What one is (or wants to be) cannot be “inauthentic”’ (1994, 6). In this way, Bollywood is a new configuration not simply a juxtaposition and mixing. The presence of a ♭2 in a Bollywood tune signals the specificity of, if not India uniquely, a modern edgy sound that portrays ‘Indianness’.

As an identity marker of both modern metal and the ‘East’, the ♭2 is an agent in glocalisation within metal. The styles may be determined by ‘the experiences, emotions, and aspirations… [the] nooks and crannies of local meaning’ (Thompson 2003, 59). The uniqueness of individual expressions of identity may have ‘global, national, regional, and local components… new possibilities for the creation of identities that could be empowering’ (Cvetkovich and Kellner 1997, 12). In this thesis Bollywood and Oriental metal stand out in reference to glocalisation, in addition to many other global and local intersections discussed.

**Contextualising the ♭2**

This research is a cross-disciplinary study, touching on the disciplines of ethnomusicology, musicology, popular musicology and the psychology of music. Literature in all these areas is reviewed separately as each discipline deals with the material in particular ways. Further literature on each genre will be discussed in the relevant chapters.
Ethnomusicology

There is little specific writing on the b2 within ethnomusicology. Broadly speaking, the research in this thesis is situated between Peter Manuel’s (1989; 2002; 2006) cross-cultural musical analyses within countries of the Mediterranean and Timothy Taylor’s (1997) global views on world music, which engage concepts of Orientalism.

Manuel (1989; 2002; 2006) places significant emphasis on the b2 in several articles. In ‘Modal Harmony in Andalusian, Eastern European, and Turkish Syncretic Musics’ he states a desire ‘to revive the spirit of “Comparative Musicology” and to suggest ways in which cross-cultural comparison of selected musical parameters may reveal new sorts of pan-regional music areas’ (Manuel 1989, 70). He then analyses the vernacular harmony that emerged through the ‘confluence of Turko-Arab and Eastern European musics with Western music’, including, in the Eastern Mediterranean, ‘acculturated urban musics’ in Turkey, Greece, and the Balkans (ibid., 71). Manuel’s emphasis on similarities between the harmonic systems of these urban musics is his justification for ‘grouping together… several countries whose musics in other respects are quite heterogeneous’ (ibid., 75). The additional affinities with ‘Andalusian Phrygian tonality’ result in Manuel naming a ‘Mediterranean tonality’ characterised by common modal harmonisations (ibid., 71, 75).

Manuel’s area of research has many overlaps with the material explored in this thesis, one of the principal features of this vernacular harmony being the use of chords containing the b2. Manuel’s term ‘Mediterranean tonality’ addresses my aim of discussing the functions of the b2 in these same musical cultures. The question remains as to how these harmonic observations can be generalised to include melodic cadence and what cultural connotations they support.

Taylor’s Beyond Exoticism: Western Music and the World puts cultural connotations and politics at the fore, following the centres of musical power from sixteenth century court music to the twenty-first century’s popular and ‘world’ music (2007, 1). Taylor argues that ‘exoticism’ is an obscuring label that assumes commonalities that do not necessarily exist across historical and cultural divides (ibid., 209). He advocates looking deeply into how music shapes and is shaped by
history. Following Foucault he asks ‘Why were things the way they were? Why are things the way they are?’ (ibid., 211). Most musicologists, Taylor claims, have remained in the straightjacket of ‘classical music ideology’ where the composer genius is regarded as timeless, rather than placed in a historical and cultural setting: ‘histories of music tend to leave out, well, history’ (ibid., 78). Taylor makes the point that in the last quarter of the nineteenth century, the age of Imperialism brought a fascination with the ‘East’ in modernism and with it a commodification of musics of the Other in the name of aesthetics.

It was a way to deal with the new peoples, new artworks and new sounds coming into European metropoles… [resulting in] the masking of human relations by the reification of music and fetishisation of works, recordings and musicians…. Aesthetics as a form of modern exchange-value… justified everything [including] the appropriation of music of other cultures. (ibid., 102)

Taylor’s work generally addresses my aims of reflecting on connotations of the $b\hat{2}$ and what we can learn about history and culture through the study of exoticisation and exploitation of culture. Without saying much specifically about the $b\hat{2}$, Taylor sets out a framework for discussions on Orientalism in music and how history has shaped contemporary connotations of the $b\hat{2}$. Is there a specific place for the $b\hat{2}$ within the commodification of the ‘East’ as Other?

Laura Leante writes specifically about the $b\hat{2}$ as it appears in her interviews with Indian classical musicians. These investigate the ‘shared meanings attributed to the music’, making it possible to deduct ‘the overall “meaning” of that music within that specific context’ (2009, 187). The context in Leante’s 2009 article ‘The Lotus and the King: Imagery, Gesture and Meaning in a Hindustani Rāg’ is the Shri raga, a raga whose main focus is the relationship between the $b\hat{2}$ and the $\hat{5}$ (ibid., 199). Interviewees draw on images to shape meaning, and highlight differences with other ragas in a comparative manner (ibid., 201–3). This methodology, together with her research data, is useful to my discussion of the connotations of the $b\hat{2}$ within Indian music, and to the larger exploration of metaphor within musical interpretation.

Other studies deal with relevant issues around notes and the creation of meaning. I give particular mention to three of these here, other writings being mentioned briefly and cited more within individual chapters. Firstly, José Martínez details
semiotic interpretations of Indian classical music, including discussion of the role of the ♭2. He contends that the use of any note in Indian classical music is not random, that there is a ‘tendency related to the sign’s capacity of significations’. The ♭2 in this cultural context is associated with pathos, fatigue and tension, yet within a particular raga these connotations may not feature due to other overriding interpretations, so the ‘tendency is not deterministic’ (Martínez 2001, 352).

Secondly, Anna Morcom discusses how the significations of Indian raga become attached to Hindi film music historically in the context of spiritual generalities of nationhood. Disturbance and the Other within a film text is often represented by Western music rather than using the tension signifiers within the raga palette: such as the ♭2 (Morcom 2007, 117, 150, 173).

Thirdly, Martin Stokes has studied the Turkish popular genre Arabesk, and argues that there are deep and complex cultural significations to the choice of music favoured by different cultural groups within Turkey. In post-Ottoman Turkey, performers and audiences of Arabesk music say that their microtonal, chromatic music reflects their feelings of alienation through its ‘impotent pathos’ (Stokes 1989, 13). This is in a context of the Western Orientalist descriptions of ‘Eastern’ music as morbid, emotional and irrational. An added complication is an emic view that argues that the ‘high emotional current of oriental music’ also expresses a depth of subtlety not present in Western music (Stokes 1989, 9, 34– 5).

Insights from these studies inform my discussion on whether there are patterns of interpretations for the ♭2 in Indian classical music that can be compared with patterns in other cultures; whether significations from ragas continue into twenty-first century Hindi film song, and whether there are similar practices in Hollywood. I also assess the importance of the ♭2 ‘exotic’ signifier at the interface of ‘Eastern’ and ‘Western’ musical cultures, questioning whether other traditions studied here carry comparable interpretations.

Further analytical studies explain some of the details of both functional and connotational use of the ♭2 within different cultures, from which expert knowledge I have been able to build my arguments. Karl Signell’s (1977) and
Frederick Stubb’s (1994) studies of Turkish makam describe how a majority of makamlar (plural) contain the b2, how the b2 is varied microtonally and in what circumstances, and how its structural importance in characteristic phrases helps define different makam. Ḥabīb Touma (1996) and Ali J Racy’s (1998; 2004) research into Arabian maqam gives more contextual information and musicological detail of the differences between Turkish and Arabian classical music. The use of the b2 in Spanish Andalusian music is detailed by many authors, among them Timothy Mitchell (1994) and Owen Wright (1992). Abraham Idelsohn (1944) describes the context of Jewish music that klezmer emerged from, and Henry Sapoznik and Pete Sokolow (1987) elaborate on how the klezmer mode Freygish, using the b2, is central to the genre. Risto Pennanen (1999; 2010) writes of musicological and cultural issues in the Balkans, particularly in Greece and Bosnia. Finally, Joep Bor (1999) sets out Indian raga, also describing microtonal usage and connotations.

Musicology
Within musicological analysis there are several specific studies that relate to the b2. Elizabeth Eva Leach (2006) discusses medieval ‘feminine’ associations of the semitone interval, which include the b2–♭1 cadence and inform the meanings attributed to the b2. Raymond Monelle writes on the Baroque pianto topic, a falling semitone gesture of which the b2–♭1 is an example, which represents lament, later changing to the Mannheim ‘sigh’ (Monelle 2000; 2006). Ellen Rosand (1979) and Alex Ross (2011) analyse the prevalence of the ‘lament’ motif 8–♭7–♭6–♭5, arguably derived from the 4–♭3–♭2–♭1 motif. Walter Kimmel (1980) associates all appearances of the falling Phrygian tetrachord with connotations of ‘death’. Geoffrey Chew (1983) writes on Schenkerian analysis and the structural importance of the rising leading note. He advocates a stronger recognition of the leading note in shaping melodic structure. The conclusions of these theorists are relevant to the b2 particularly as an upper leading note falling through a semitone gesture to the tonic.

Susan McClary’s (1991; 1992; 2001; 2004) work on mode includes direct mention of the Phrygian ‘problem’, due to the mode’s b2 that could not be used alongside conventional harmonic practice in the West. Among other insights,
McClary points out that changing use of mode, over history, constantly ‘reinhabits and reanimates some of those old and still-prestigious structures of the past for its own purposes…. Old bottles can serve to ferment entirely new (if quite unlikely) wines’ (2004, 15). McClary discusses many new bottles that the Phrygian mode has inhabited, including its uptake in metal music.

Saul Novack’s (1977) paper ‘The Significance of the Phrygian mode in the History of Tonality’ describes the use of the Phrygian since medieval times within Western music, and also expresses ambiguities and problems in its use, as well as a remarkable persistence in its continuity and the malleability of its meaning. He describes how the development of the Neapolitan cadence gives to the $b2$ a different functional role as a subdominant chord.

In the late nineteenth century the $b2$ also became a signifier of the ‘exotic’. Musicological writing informed by Edward’s Said’s (1978) study of Orientalism and Post-Colonialism addresses issues particularly relevant to this study. Jonathan Bellman (1993; 1998) and Ralph Locke (2009) examine Western classical music’s use of exotic signifiers. Bellman writes ‘it is in large part the attendant cultural connections, tensions, and suggestions that make such stylistic blends as compelling, alluring and ultimately troubling as they are’ (1998, xii). Derek Scott has a historical, cultural approach to Western classical music analysis, with an emphasis on social semiotics: ‘the study of how meanings are constructed within signifying practices and how that impacts upon our understanding of the world we live in’ (2003, 8). All these writings on Orientalism create a clear picture of how ‘exotic’ musical elements, such as the $b2$, are used within Western music.

**Popular musicology**

Philip Tagg (1994; 2004) describes how Orientalist connotations have affected the interpretation of popular music, particularly in respect to film and TV music. Tagg and Robert Clarida’s work includes research on the minor/major, sad/happy debate, drawing out associations of minor scales with ‘sad/bad’, ‘long ago’, ‘female’, ‘stasis’, ‘rural’ and ‘ethnic’. They detail how the minor mode of the Phrygian connotes Mediterranean countries to the Western composer, and conveys the music of ‘somewhere else’ (Tagg and Clarida 2003, 319).
The presence of the ♭2 in popular music perhaps independently of established Western connotations is noted by Karen Collins (2006) in an article concerning the use of the ♭2 in computer game music, concluding that its presence was some kind of ‘accident’ of technology, but this ‘accident’ has resulted in the ♭2 being a common element in later techno music, part of a patchwork of typical motifs.

The large presence of the ♭2 in heavy metal music is addressed by Robert Walser (1992; 1993; 2004) who sets out issues of identity-formation and transgressive masculinity. Following Walser, two writings deal specifically with the use of the ♭2 in metal. Firstly, Andrew Cope discusses Black Sabbath’s transgressive use of the ♭2, asserting that the use of the ♭2, together with the tritone, in Black Sabbath’s music resulted in an original sound that established ‘a whole new set of musical conventions’, which subsequently ‘became a major building block in heavy metal’ (2010, 44, 52, 57). Secondly, Glenn Pillsbury devotes a chapter of his book to the use of the ♭2 in Metallica’s ‘Wherever I May Roam’. Pillsbury asserts that the ♭2 is an established ‘metal’ signifier, reinforcing Cope’s concept of the ♭2 being central to tension and release within metal. Pillsbury also discusses the complexities of the meeting of the exotic ♭2 with the metal ♭2 in relation to identity formation (2006, 101–3).

**On dissonance and metaphor**

There is a body of literature that brings a perspective to the use of the ♭2 from the study of the perceived ‘effects’ of music, based on metaphor and concepts of tonal tension.

**Dissonance**

Tonality, by definition, creates a hierarchical system in which the ♭2 is a significant ‘pointer’ to the tonic, a ‘leading note’. In tonal music the ♭2 holds a position as an ‘upper leading note’. Western Classical musicologists sometimes employ concepts of dissonance in a universal manner. For instance musicologist Charles Rosen describes the major scale as the most harmonically coherent, containing notes most consonant in relation to the tonic, other scales being ‘unstable and expressive’ (1998, 25–6). Reference is made to the harmonic overtone series, a complex mix of which creates a musical note (Cazden 1980,
Any interval between two notes that has a simple numerical ratio of frequencies, in terms of the harmonic overtone series, is described as consonant (Plomp and Levelt 1965, 556). The semitone overtone relationship is 16/15 and would thus be classed as dissonant (e.g. Guthrie and Morrill 1928, 624–8).

Rosen’s claim for the major scale to be more ‘natural’ than other scales is difficult to justify, although as with many scales the 5 is a note that shares some basic harmonic overtones with the tonic. Other pitch degrees in the major scale have considerably less claim to connection with the tonic on the basis of physics. However, where this universalist contention persists, any changes of notes from the major scale, such as the flattening of the 2, would be regarded as unstable and dissonant, contributing to negative connotations.

Another way of understanding dissonance was explored by the physicist Helmholtz, who found that the ear perceives ‘beats’ when two concurrent pitches are separated from each other by a minimal difference in frequency (2007 [1885], 164–196). As the frequency difference increases so do the beats, until there is a general sense of ‘roughness’ to the sound. Reinier Plomp and Willem Levelt describe this physical effect within the human ear as sensory dissonance (1965, 554). The ♭2, lying one semitone higher than the tonic, will be perceived as ‘rough’ when occurring concurrently with the tonic of the same octave, and this may play some part in the perception of harmonic dissonance for the ♭2.

However, to a large extent the experience of dissonance is culturally driven. According to Richard Parncutt, musical harmony is a subjective, psychological experience, concerned with both the physical nature of sounds and the effects of cultural conditioning (Parncutt 1989, 16, 18, 49). Parncutt states that ‘theories of musical intervals based directly on frequency ratios, the harmonic series and combination tones are implausible and unscientific’ (ibid., 10). Instead Parncutt proposes that ‘most aspects of the perception of music may be satisfactorily explained in terms of familiarity with environmental and musical sounds’ (ibid., 20). He advocates a concept of psychoacoustic ‘dissonance’, dependent on previous hearing rather than physical characteristics of the sound (ibid., 9). Repeated exposure to certain intervals and harmonies contributes to these intervals seeming more ‘natural’ to the listener.
The leading note

The need for resolution of perceived dissonance is the foundation of the concept of the leading note. Psychologist Jamshed Bharucha’s theory of ‘melodic anchoring’ is that stable tones, generally the tonic and dominant, are cognitive reference points in a scale (1996). Any other note has an asymmetric attachment like an arrow towards the stable tone, a ‘psychological force pulling a musical event up or down…’. If strong enough... it may demand or evoke a conscious sensation of yearning for a particular resolution’ (ibid., 383, 387, 393). Playing the tonic alone has less emotive power than when it is preceded by an unstable note with its ‘need’ for resolution (ibid., 395, 398). The more unexpected the note, the greater attention it gathers, and the greater the yearning to its stable neighbour (ibid., 385–6). Like the major 7, as an unstable note in close proximity frequency-wise to the tonic, the ♭2 draws attention to the tonic even if the tonic is not sounded. As a result the ♭2 may play a strong structural and emotional role as a leading note. I ask whether, in the musics that I am researching, the ♭2 can be as effective as the 7 as a leading note.

Expectation may be presented as constituting a form of musical meaning, argued by Leonard Meyer: ‘one musical event (be it a tone, a phrase, or a whole section) has meaning because it points to and makes us expect another musical event’ (Meyer 1956, 35). David Huron writes that ‘minds are “wired” for expectation’ (2006, 7). When a ‘future event is highly predictable’ the emotional ‘climax’ can be greatly satisfying (ibid., 325). However, a delay in the resolution of tension increases emotional intensity (ibid., 306–7, 315). All the genres in this thesis are tonal, in the sense that there is a note that is a cognitive reference point. The listener will be aware of this, either consciously or unconsciously (ibid., 143–4). The ♭2, with its tension and high ‘yearning’ towards the tonic, may (by metaphorical association) build a narrative of hope or fear, the resolution of which brings associations of pleasure or defeat, and a release of energy. The ♭2 can thus be a valuable element for suspense in a narrative.

However, tension is not identical with emotion. Psychologists Ortony, Clore and Collins argue that ‘tension’ may refer to a state of arousal, or an intensity of a certain emotion. These emotions may be specific, such as fear, or from more diffuse causes like anxiety (1988, 111). Suspense and unexpectedness are strong
elements in story narratives, as they both increase the level of intensity, and thus the power of emotional reactions (ibid., 85,121). Suspense primarily provides the emotions of hope or fear, and the cognitive state of uncertainty:

One characteristic of emotional experiences, especially vicarious ones, is that in many cases they seem to thrive on some associated suspense. The mental preparation for or forecasting of alternative possible events produces a kind of tension between alternative constructions that when resolved produces a more powerful effect than would have been the case without the suspense-inducing material. (ibid., 131)

Musicologist Deryck Cooke wrote on the emotional ‘meaning’ of pitch degrees within Western classical music using narrative contexts. He stated that the ♭2 is ‘drawn by semitonal tension down to the tonic’ and thus expresses ‘hopeless, spiritless anguish’ (Cooke 1959, 78). Cooke argues that the ♭2 is ‘an expression of anguish in a context of finality’ (ibid.), indicating that there is nowhere to go after falling to the tonic. It thus represents ‘unrelieved hopelessness and despair’ (ibid., 79). Huron, gathering opinions from Western musicians, found common descriptors for the ♭2 of ‘surprise, abruptness, pause’ with sample responses of ‘somewhat dark’ and ‘murky’ (2006, 145–6). Huron posits that these interpretations concern ‘how minds interpret physically sounding tones, not how tones are in the world’ (ibid., 143). Of additional interest here is that Huron found descriptors of the #1 of ‘strong, upward, and bold’, with a sample response of ‘upwardly mobile’. The #1 and ♭2 are enharmonic to each other, yet it appears that different interpretations of upward and downward movement are associated with these two enharmonic equivalents, an implication of rising from the #1, ‘upwardly mobile’, and falling from the ♭2, ‘a sense of almost inevitable further descent’. This begs the question of what aural cues distinguish a note as a #1 rather than a ♭2, whether this is a specifically Western interpretation, with possible implications of modulation to the key of the second degree.

Both the semitone note below the tonic, the major 7, and that above, the ♭2, can be considered very tense, ‘dissonant’ and full of ‘expectation’ fulfilled by release to the tonic. Yet descriptors for each of these pitch degrees are radically different: the ♭2 is described as expressing ‘despair’ and ‘unrelieved hopelessness’, the major 7 as expressing ‘violent longing, aspiration’ (Cooke 1959, 78–9), or ‘restless, itching and pointing’ (Huron 2006, 145). A picture emerges of
significant difference perhaps due to ‘direction’ of movement. Cooke considers rising pitch to be expressive of an ‘outgoing’ of emotion, ‘active, assertive, aggressive, striving, protesting, or aspiring’ (1959, 105) and falling pitch to be an ‘incoming’ of emotion: ‘Depending on context it can be relaxed, yielding, passive, assenting, welcoming, accepting, or enduring’ (ibid., 105). These falling adjectives are far from the descriptor of ‘hopeless anguish’ for the ♭₂ (ibid., 78), suggesting that the falling ♭₂ is, for Cooke, particularly marked with negative associations.

**Metaphors of narrowness and falling.**

George Lakoff and Mark Johnson write of how metaphors deeply influence our everyday living and have a basis in bodily gestures, on ‘physical and cultural experience’ (1980, 14-17). For instance, happiness correlates with a ‘smile and a general feeling of expansiveness. This could in principle form the basis for a metaphor HAPPY IS WIDE; SAD IS NARROW’ (Lakoff and Johnson 1980, 18). The other crucial metaphor in relation to music is of up and down, where ‘SICKNESS AND DEATH ARE DOWN [as] serious illness and death forces us to lie down physically’ (ibid., 15), and ‘SAD IS DOWN, where a drooping posture typically goes along with sadness and depression’ (ibid.).

These body-based metaphors are then developed to give more complex metaphors, such as ‘GOOD IS UP; BAD IS DOWN …. Happiness, health, life and control – the things that principally characterize what is good for a person – are all UP’ in that they are connected with physical erectness (ibid., 16). The next step can be to connect physical wellbeing with social power, therefore ‘LOW STATUS IS DOWN’ (ibid.). The thought process continues that if ‘high status is up’, then from a society’s point of view ‘VIRTUE IS UP; DEPRAVITY IS DOWN… because virtuous actions correlate with social well-being from the society/person’s point of view’ (ibid., 16–17). The ability to reason is said to place human beings above other animals and gives them control over them: ‘CONTROL IS UP thus provides a basis for MAN IS UP and therefore RATIONAL IS UP; EMOTIONAL IS DOWN’ (ibid, 17) building ideological frameworks, such as ‘might is right’.
‘Emotion is down’ sets up a certain viewpoint, where a metaphor of ‘falling in love’ would be considered a ‘falling to the irrational’. However, ‘falling in love’ is a positive expression, contradicting the overriding ‘good is up; bad is down’ metaphors. Lakoff and Johnson present other metaphors that similarly don’t adhere within the overriding scheme: ‘UNKNOWN IS UP; KNOWN IS DOWN’ relates to the experience of understanding as ‘grasping’, as in ‘that’s up in the air’ and ‘the matter is settled’ (ibid., 20). ‘Down to earth’ is another familiar metaphor connected with energy, where ‘relaxed’ is down rather than up being ‘uptight’, coming in the expression ‘settle (or calm) down’. Finally, the metaphors of ‘struggle is up’ and ‘grounding is down’ bring in one more perspective, as in an ‘uphill struggle’ and ‘downhill run’ (ibid.).

The extent of coherence across a network of metaphors from different bodily experiences may determine the ‘success’ of a particular metaphor, and these may vary according to culture and experience.

The overriding metaphor of musical pitch is verticality, the concept that music rises and falls in pitch level (Eitan and Granot 2006, 221–2). This ‘verticality schema’ is explored by, amongst others, cognitive psychologists Zohar Eitan and Roni Granot (2006), who write of how motions of the body, in particular of tension and release, are evoked by the ‘metaphorical motion in virtual space’ (2006, 222). The temporal and linear nature of music creates a sound world that ‘almost inevitably activate[s] visual and kinetic imagery’ (ibid.). Musicologist Michael Spitzer argues that the reverse also holds, with musical gestures, shapes, and structures being given metaphorical interpretations (2004, 3, 5, 6). The passage of music is likened to a physical or emotional ‘journey’ of some kind: ‘We navigate tonal space in terms of departure from and return to a tonal center…. [Our] path is the curvilinear course of melody, whose tensions and resolutions are subject to the “gravitational pull” of the tonic’ (ibid., 57–59).

Musicologist Lawrence Zbikowski describes how music can also evoke bodily gestures and internal tensions (2002, 87). Zbikowski proposes a theory of Conceptual Integration Networks, where a ‘blended space’ is created where the music is anthropomorphised and can take on human emotions (ibid., 91). This anthropomorphisation produces pitch objects that are emotional, that can despair,
aspire, yearn, as in the $b2$ as ‘hopeless anguish’ and the major $\hat{7}$’s ‘violent longing and aspiration’ (Cooke 1959, 78).

Metaphors of breadth and narrowness may be mapped onto large and small intervals. Small intervals may be considered complex, restless, and unpleasant (Krumhansl 1990, 134). Cognitive psychologists Alf Gabrielsson and Erik Lindstrom write of how ‘large pitch variation may be associated with happiness, pleasantness, activity, or surprise; small pitch variation with disgust, anger, fear or boredom’ (2010, 240–1). Philosopher Peter Kivy argues that ‘joy is the result of an expansion of our vital spirits’, and is best expressed by large and expanded intervals, while sadness ‘is caused by a contraction of those same subtle parts of our bodies’ and so the ‘narrowest intervals are the most suitable’ (1989, 39, 41). Kivy continues that the effort required to ‘leap’ intervals musically brings a connotation of larger intervals being more ‘forceful’ (ibid., 55). In opposition, small intervals may represent low energy, leading to the metaphor ‘power is wide; weakness is narrow’. John Sloboda writes on the opening theme of Mozart’s 40th Symphony. He describes the falling semitone pianto $E_b$ to $D$ as a dynamic shape ‘representing something that has got stuck at a particular level…. As the force is repeated, the obstacle is overcome and the music is ‘freed’ to fly up to the $B_b$’ (Sloboda 2005, 168). The metaphor is of a physical ‘breaking away’ into the larger interval: ‘freedom is wide; confined is narrow’.

The connection between faster frequency and ‘high’ is strengthened by embodied connections: the singing voice emerges from higher and lower in the body for faster and slower frequency notes, and increased energy is required for achieving faster frequency vocal notes, producing the concept of working against a gravitational pull. Metaphors of energy in ‘peaks’ and ‘troughs’ may also be psychological: an imagined increase in tension on ascent, reflected by climaxes ‘where intense emotions (or other affective sensations) are prone to be experienced, and troughs, where the intensity is weak’ (Juslin and Sloboda 2010, 91). Musicologist Robert Hatten considers that ‘resignation’ could attach to ‘descending’ musical motions, yet he also views this in a more positive light as acceptance or, in the case of abnegation, a positive spiritual surrender (2004, 57, 59).
There is debate on universalist views of the ♭₂ in regard to the use of metaphors, such as whether it is always ‘sad’ by, among others, Huron (2006). Huron discusses conscious and unconscious musical expectations, both within a piece and within a culture. Huron et al studied whether when a pitch is heard lower than in a previously heard version it is heard as ‘sad’ due to metaphors of sadness in falling (Huron, Yim, and Chordia 2010, 8). The ♭₂ is frequently compared with the major ₂, and negative metaphors of falling bring a perception of increased sadness to this ‘lower than normal’ ♭₂.

Although many of the verticality metaphors are on bi-polar scales, there are also asymmetries, contradictions and other nuances. Although descending pitch strongly evokes movements descending in space, Eitan and Granot found pitch rises to be associated with forward, expansion and energy (2006, 221). Eitan and Granot recount that ‘while dwindling bodily energy often results in conspicuous lowering (falling, bending, sitting, or lying down), energy increase rarely makes us fly' (ibid., 239). They also found that descent is sometimes associated with increased speed (as in the metaphor of a ball bouncing downhill), and increased energy (as in a plane falling from the sky), while ascent is sometimes associated with fatigue, deceleration, decreasing kinetic energy. Eitan and Granot draw the conclusion that the 'cognitive mapping of music into space and motion is much more complex than hitherto assumed' (ibid., 240–2), beyond simple binary oppositions, and simultaneously mapping musical gestures to different aspects of motion.

**Cultural specificity**

The mapping of musical pitch contour to metaphors of ‘up’ and ‘down’ is abstract, yet it is deeply embedded in all the cultures that are discussed in this thesis and is often taken as ‘literal’ (Zbikowski 2002, 69). However, as Zbikowski points out, this is not a universal human metaphor, and there are, or have been, cultures that describe pitch as ‘sharp’ or ‘heavy’; ‘young’ or ‘old’; or ‘small’ and ‘large’ (ibid., 63). Crucially, then, networks of metaphors are affected by culture, and ‘ideologies and conceptual models that are important to the culture are reflected in the mappings' (ibid., 72). Stephen Feld finds asymmetries
in the example of the Kaluli people who have metaphors of waterfalls to create meaning around music of descent, with no comparable imagery for ascent (Feld 1990, 168–9). Zbikowski discusses the ‘conceptual models that we absorb from culture’ and contends that music is a ‘rich cultural product that both constructs and is constructed by cultural experience’ (2002, 72).

Many metaphors concerning human movement or experience inevitably cross cultures. Yet cultural differences affect the emotional and structural significance of the ♭2. Not only the musical culture but also unconscious internal frameworks and conceptual maps affect our responses when listening, resulting in misunderstandings of the structure and content of unfamiliar music (Dowling and Harwood 1986, 3–4). Thus there is a need for cross-cultural study in the area of cognitive perception. Drawing attention to differences highlights the cultural specificity of much empirical study and the phenomena they seek to investigate.

**Knowledge gaps in the understanding of the use of the ♭2**

The literature above provides detailed record of the use and connotations of the ♭2 within some tonal genres. It opens other questions of how these uses and meanings relate across cultures, for instance whether metaphorical interpretation in Indian classical music corresponds to similar interpretations in other cultures; whether connotations within Western traditions appear in, say, the Balkans, and if so, whether they carry different nuances; and whether ‘Mediterranean tonality’ appears outside the Mediterranean.

Further to this, the somewhat closed world of Western signification may give a strong indication of how the connotations of the ♭2 affect cross-cultural communication, and the prejudices that may come to bear on hearing the ♭2 within music of the ‘East’. The literature also opens up questions of new signification for listeners who are, perhaps, little acquainted with traditional significations. My case study of heavy metal, particularly, opens a line of questioning into the connections between sub-cultural significations and those of the hegemonic norm.

I identify four principal gaps in existing knowledge. Firstly, most analytical studies in the field of ethnomusicology have focused on one culture and there is a lack of studies that cross cultural boundaries in analytical musicology. For
instance, harmonic studies of the $b^2$ have concentrated on the Neapolitan cadence, a rare exception being Manuel’s analysis of ‘Phrygian tonality’ that concentrates on vernacular harmony and the role of the $b^2$ in the Mediterranean cadence. Integrating vernacular practice into an expanded harmonic framework increases our knowledge of musical practice globally.

A second area where extensive cross-cultural research is needed is in the study of metaphor. No single study exists which adequately covers, cross-culturally, the metaphorical interpretations of ‘falling’ pitch and ‘narrow’ intervals. There is also little research that compares different interpretations of the $b^2$ within cultures. For example the extensive use of the $b^2$ in metal indicates a need to understand its connotations in metal compared to other Western genres.

Thirdly, connotations of the $b^2$ are clearly marked by cultural origin, with the note being recognised as an Oriental or ‘lament’ signifier to the Western listener. So far, however, there has been little discussion about how it is used compositionally in other cultures and what impact different connotations have on cross-cultural perception and communication.

Fourthly, although extensive research has been carried out on film music, no single study exists which draws together Hollywood and Bollywood interpretations of a musical gesture in soundtracks. No previous study has investigated the implications of Western connotations for the $b^2$ of anguish and the exotic for twenty-first century film soundtracks.

These gaps in knowledge are each addressed to a certain degree by this thesis. I explore the musical practices of a range of different world music traditions in order to establish the functional use and connotations of the $b^2$, with the aim of contributing to knowledge of melodic and harmonic practice; further to this I compare metaphorical interpretations of the $b^2$ and ask whether they speak to cultural ideologies; finally, I investigate new significations and uses of the $b^2$ in late twentieth and early twenty-first century music.

**Methodology**

This thesis follows a case-study design, with in-depth analysis of five areas. The research data in this thesis is drawn from four main types of source: printed
literature, scores, and other library sources; participant observation through my involvement as a saxophone player in popular Indian and klezmer music; qualitative interviews with music performers and musicologists; and analysis of recordings and performances.

Due to my different forms of engagement with the genres discussed in this thesis, varying methods have been used in different chapters. Elements of chapters one, two and five resulted from the analysis of music from the oral traditions with which I have personal involvement through participant-observation, creating transcriptions and reviewing the transcriptions of others. I reviewed secondary literature and interviewed colleagues until I felt that I had grasped some of the fundamentals of the use of the ♭2 in these traditions. I interviewed Indian classical musicians with whom I came into contact through my playing, as well as others in London and India. I joined, for a while, a Turkish classical music class and interviewed the leader, violinist Cahit Baylav. I then interviewed other academics and musicians in the field of Arabian and Ottoman influenced music and reviewed the relevant secondary literature. Chapter four is built around the input of colleagues and students at Redbridge College who were heavy metal artists. As well as interview material I was given guidance by them to metal repertoire. The genre of Oriental metal came to my notice and I had the opportunity to interview musicians in Israel and Palestine. I supplemented this input with secondary literature and the analysis of recordings. Chapter three and the ‘Hollywood’ part of chapter five are based on library research with the addition of my own transcriptions from recordings.

**Interview technique: asking questions concerning the ♭2**

Altogether I conducted twenty-five interviews between 2008 and 2013 (see Appendix 1). I selected interviewees from experienced musicians playing within five areas: eight Indian, two Arabian, nine ‘Ottoman’, one Western classical and five metal musicians; some of my interviewees are also academics in their fields. These interviews were conducted in homes, cafés or workplaces, generally in London, but also in Brighton, Youlgreave, Milton Keynes, Amsterdam, Mumbai, Pune, Udaipur, Los Angeles, Oslo, Tel Aviv, Nazareth and Ramallah. Interviews were generally about one hour long and semi-structured, following my agenda of
enquiry while allowing my interviewees to steer the particular course of travel. With one interviewee only, Rafaqat Ali Khan, I conducted three repeat interviews. I sampled the general opinion of these musicians concerning the $\flat 2$, revealing cultural common denominators connected to the topic.

Laura Leante gave me advice on how to ask about mood and feeling and how the note is played, rather than asking about its meaning. Leante and Martin Clayton have conducted in-depth interviews with North Indian classical musicians (2009). Leante’s strongest message was to approach the subject of the $\flat 2$ in an oblique manner, as any direct approach would result in possible humouring, with the best intentions, and corruption of the data (Leante interview 2010). For instance, after I declared my interest in the $\flat 2$, Pete Herbert made a series of statements such as ‘heavy metal without the $\flat 2$ would be unthinkable’. I was left not knowing whether he was humouring me, although these comments were not incongruous with the rest of his interview. Another example is Khan who became very centred on the $\flat 2$, describing a raga and saying ‘this is the note, it’s all about this note’. Again I found it impossible to ascertain, through language differences, whether he was saying this because of an actual importance to himself, or because of my interest in it. Through judicious withholding of the mention of the $\flat 2$ I have occasionally found interviewees speaking of it unprompted, as did Subroto Roy whose comments became quite centred on the $\flat 2$ without any reference from myself. At other times I have brought it up myself in order to focus the discussion, though letting my interviewees lead the conversation.

I needed to ensure as far as I could that we were speaking the same language, referring to the same things, without misunderstandings. Baylav told me that the flattened second was without doubt the greatest difference between Oriental and Occidental music. I was very excited, but a little disappointed when interviewing him to discover that the flattened second that he was referring to was the ‘neutral second’ interval, wherever it may appear in a scale, not the flattened second of this thesis, which is confined to the $\flat 2$ degree of the scale.³ Confusions around use of terms have also worked the other way round as in interviewing Khan, who

³ The neutral second is a ‘small tone’, microtonally smaller than a Western tone which, in many ways, defines Turkish classical music (see 2.3.1).
stressed that the ♭2 was ‘sad, always sad’. But in a casual conversation another day he said ‘Sad doesn’t mean “Oh I’ve lost my purse”, it means I feel closer to God’ (Khan interview 2008; see chapter one). I could easily have missed this connotation and assumed that I understood what he meant by the term ‘sad’. This illustrates the importance of eliciting the meaning of terms that interviewees take for granted and may assume that the interviewer knows (Spradley 1979, 142–3), and I hope that I generally clarified these terms.

Interviewees have revealed fears of offhand statements being blown up into major insights (Bruno Nettl 2005, 134, 204–6). For instance Palestinian sound artist Boikutt, who I met in Ramallah, remarked on the ♭2 ‘It’s in my music but don’t listen for it!’ (Boikutt interview 2011), perhaps regarding my fixation with the ♭2 as a distortion, a distraction from what was really important to discuss. Baylav also said that the ♭2 was not really an issue at all, and was concerned that I did not make too much of it. The reflexive nature of the New Fieldwork paradigm includes the trials of communication, and the struggle is an essential aspect of musical communication across cultures (Rice, Barz, and Cooley 2008, 16). Fieldwork must be ‘predicated on negotiated relationships’ (Shelemay 1997, 202).

Clear cross-cultural communication may also require me to be more explicit, not less, in order to gain clarification. ‘Each interview is a unique social interaction that involves a negotiation of social roles and frames of reference between strangers’ (Briggs 1986, 24). Differences are part of the process, not an unwanted extra. The confusions within this research have been stimulating and revealing, and crucial for my cross-cultural understanding of the use of the ♭2.4 I have responded to confusions by noting where they occur, referencing their particularities and not making generalisations, yet seeing individual musicians’ experience as important in understanding the use of the ♭2 in their musical cultures. In this way I have tried to take each individual’s opinion into account without overstating it.

I analysed the interview in four steps, based on Spradley’s model (1979). First I clarified my understanding of the ‘field terms’ and connected terms used by

---

4 For more on my issues within interviews see Moore 2010.
different interviewees, for instance in Baylav’s use of the term ‘flat second’. Second, I analysed the relationship of these terms to the themes of cadential function and connotation. Third, I drew the information together within each genre, discovering cultural themes such as metal musicians Pete Herbert and Luke Rayner (interviews 2009) both describing the ♭2 as ‘not happy’, while klezmer clarinettist Maurice Chernik said ‘everybody likes it’ (interview 2012). I looked for connections and gaps, then finally connected and directly integrated these comments with my data from the general literature.

The voices that are heard here are primarily those of musicians steeped in their musical culture, talking about that culture. My goals are to discuss, explore and reflect, and these observations and interviews give ample opportunity to do this within the limitations of such a wide-ranging study. Where there is theoretical supposition I have consulted expert academics in the fields of these case studies before suggesting generalisations within an area. The cross-cultural reflection is mostly my own, again informed by interviewees and area literature.

**Choice of examples and use of notation**

I selected the musical examples from a mixture of my own library of recordings and scores, examples in other texts, recommendations as examples from texts, recommendations from interviewees, internet search and record shop search. I also watched as many films as I could from Bollywood and Hollywood that I thought might use the ♭2, and observed any occurrences in my regular listening to film soundtracks and other media. The examples that are presented in this study are mostly very well known. I rejected about as many examples as I included as they did not include the ♭2; the inclusion was difficult to specify, or they were unrepresentative in my opinion. How representative the examples are of any particular style is hard to quantify as this sample was not chosen scientifically. However, I hope that in the relevant sections I have adequately laid out the prevalence of the ♭2 in the different genres researched here, clarifying how much one might expect to hear such examples in common listening to these genres.

The use of Western notation can be problematic as it depicts only the outlines of a musical event, true equally for Western classical music and other genres. The
consistency of its use here, I argue, is valid as it facilitates comparison between styles. Occasionally I have indicated pitch-slides between notes with a simple line, and melisma with a mordent sign. I have not indicated microtonal variations in the use of the $\flat_2$ within Indian music, though I have within Turkish classical music. This follows conventions within the relevant genres (e.g. Bor 1999; Signell 1977). Generally I only have an interest in the melodic intervals and so may simply transcribe a melody without any contextual instrumentation or accompaniment. Other times the accompaniment may itself appear relevant and so is included.

**Layout of thesis**

The overall structure of this thesis takes the form of five themed chapters, plus this introductory chapter and a conclusion chapter. I start with the particular, a case study of one genre from one country, India, which expounds the case for the $\flat_2$ as a significant note within a particular genre. I then venture with increasing complexity into case studies where cultural interactions and associations build up multiple layers of function and connotation making up the contemporary picture of the use of the $\flat_2$. Finally I draw my overall conclusions.

Chapter one discusses North Indian classical music, a relatively self-contained musical system in which the $\flat_2$ appears widely and is given strong semiotic connotations, with little reference outside the genre. I ask whether the $\flat_2$ plays a significant functional and connotational role in North Indian classical music, recognised by its creators, and whether there is there one or many $\flat_2$s in this tradition. I find that the $\flat_2$ is regarded as one of the more expressive notes due to its ‘dissonance’ in relation to the tonic and also its movability. Every raga that uses the $\flat_2$ has a different interpretation of it, affected by treatment and tradition, and it is used particularly in ragas that are played at the important ritual times of dawn and dusk.

Chapter two studies genres that are all loosely within the Mediterranean area, and have all been ‘touched’ in some way by the *maqam/makam* system of the Arabian or Ottoman Empires. I will henceforth refer to these by the term ‘touched by the *maqam/kalam’*. This expansion of the discussion introduces musical genres that again have a significantly high prevalence of the $\flat_2$, but in addition have more
musical interchange with other musical cultures. I find that the falling melodic cadence $\flat 2 \rightarrow 1$, and the vernacular modal harmonies that include this cadence, are ubiquitous in these genres. I also find that the interface with global music practices and ideologies brings challenges and creative developments.

Chapter three discusses Western classical music, where the $\flat 2$ is little used, asking what connotations are attributable to the $\flat 2$ and whether it has any significant functions in this tradition. It describes how, during the development of harmonic practices, the $\flat 2$ fell out of common use as it was seen to undermine harmonic clarity. Metaphorical interpretations grew up and since that time the $\flat 2$ has been ‘marked’ when used in Western classical music, representing ‘something wrong’, whether that is a lament, a passionate distraction, danger, or a representation of the Other. These connotations, and an awareness of the wide use of the $\flat 2$ in ‘the East’, led to ‘heavy baggage’ around its use in Western classical music, and the interaction with ‘Eastern’ music was also affected.

Chapters four and five study the late twentieth century and early twenty-first century position of the $\flat 2$. The questions asked here are about how the ‘baggage’ that the $\flat 2$ carries within the globalised world of music is used and exploited within different genres and in film. What do the differences of interpretations tell us about culture and ideologies, and do they affect cross-cultural communication? Chapter four looks at the particular case of heavy metal music, which, more than any other Western genre, has embraced the $\flat 2$ as an intrinsic element in a powerful and tension-filled music. It analyses how the Western ‘baggage’ of Otherness for the $\flat 2$ has been mutated to make it part of a new masculinised genre that can, for the first time in the West, bring the $\flat 2$ into use to represent the self, with a new positivity in the semiotic meanings of the $\flat 2$. Metal is a global phenomenon where there are interfaces with ‘Eastern’ genres that also contain the $\flat 2$, as in the case of Oriental metal music. This introduces further complexity and paradox to the sedimented meanings of the $\flat 2$.

Chapter five brings many of the themes of previous chapters together in the study of film music, including both Hollywood and Bollywood. Film music can exploit its position as an ‘unheard melody’ that escapes conscious attention (Gorbman
1987), and the ♭2 in a soundtrack may reinforce stereotypes and ideologies. It may also introduce new musical hybrids driven by visual rather than aural cues. In particular, this may come from combining the Western connotations of danger or ‘something bad’ with the Oriental associations of the ♭2 through the images. Bollywood, as with Oriental Metal, embraces the complexity of the ♭2 having local meanings as well as global ones: self-identity plus Western connotations results in new, positive associations.

In the conclusion the strands are drawn together to reveal a wide and complex picture around a note that, being under-represented in Western theory and practice, has a particularly strong connotative potential that is exploited to represent the Other in many guises. The sometimes traumatic meeting of musical cultures is packed full of musical misunderstandings and, in combination with unlimited other factors, the ♭2 carries sedimented meanings that we would do well to be aware of.

The case for cross-cultural comparison is supported by both theoretical considerations and ideological concerns. The theoretical considerations advocate a wider definition of tonality to include harmonic frameworks that are different from those of Western ‘common practice’. These can be found, for example, in raga and maqamat. On the other hand, ideological issues exposed through the use of the ♭2 better inform us of its twenty-first century global usage. The ♭2 has a unique position as a leading note that has been ‘rejected’ by the West, yet has a valued and often stressed place in many non-Western musical genres. By comparing its use cross-genre and cross-culturally this study not only identifies the ♭2’s significant functional role in tonal music, but highlights an abundance of its connotations that support varied and ideological musical expression.
1 Komal Re: The $\flat$2 in Ragas of North India and Pakistan

Sad in our culture doesn’t mean
‘Oh, I’ve lost my purse’, it means ‘I am closer to God’.
Rafaqat Ali Khan, Sufi singer

The music of the Indian subcontinent is well known for its complex linear system of ragas, in which melody rather than harmony is the driving force. There are hundreds of different ragas, using many different scales. The $\flat$2, known in North Indian raga theory as komal (soft) Rishabh or Re occurs in nearly half of North Indian ragas, and in five out of the ten thaat (families) of ragas: Bhairav, Bhairavi, Todi, Purvi, Marva. This chapter puts the komal Re in its context within North Indian raga, then discusses its prevalence and connotations in particular ragas.

My ethnographic method was to conduct interviews with musicians from North India and Pakistan, both in India and London, as well as drawing on interviews conducted by others, including Laura Leante and Clare Jenkins. The aim was to explore the musicians’ extra- and intra-musical associations with the $\flat$2 within individual ragas, and investigate shared meanings. I supplemented this emic perspective with my own etic analysis of ragas and performances.

I found that as well as komal Re being sometimes regarded as a neutral member of the pitch set of a raga, there is a deeply conscious awareness of the use of komal Re throughout the raga system. Structurally, komal Re may act as a ‘leading note’ within this tonal music and/or be a defining part of a raga’s character. In particular, komal Re may accompany imagery depicting the approach to, or departure from nighttime. The note is considered especially expressive of devotion, sadness and pathos in some of the most popular ragas such as the morning ragas Bhairavi (Lavezzoli 2006, 4) and Bhairav, the late morning raga Gujari Todi and the evening ragas Shri and Marva. This exploration thus describes a genre that uncomplicatedly exploits the $\flat$2, setting the scene for other case studies that will bring in cross-cultural complexities.
1.1 The background to raga interpretation

North Indian classical music is a tonal system with the particularity of sounding drone notes throughout, often played by a 4-stringed instrument, the *tanpura*. Each raga has a collection of pitches named by some variation on the syllables: Sa Re Ga Ma Pa Dha Ni, equivalent to 1 2 3 4 5 6 7. In any raga Re Ga Dha and Ni are either ‘natural’ (shuddha) or ‘flattened’ (komal), the latter represented by underlining the abbreviation (e.g. Re and Dha). Ma may also be sharpened (tivra) shown by an apostrophe (Ma’).

The constant drone consists of the tonic (Sa) and a note a perfect fifth above (Pa), or sometimes a perfect fourth above (Ma). These notes are structural pillars, immovable within the raga (Tournier 2005, 18). The other notes used in a raga are always heard in relationship to these drone notes, especially the tonic. Nazir Ali Jairazbhoy, writing on the evolution of raga, explains that

the tonic (Sa) is the most important note of every rāg [raga], both as a frame of reference and as the perfect resolution…. Against a simple tonic drone, all tones other than the tonic will exhibit a varying measure of restlessness which can only be resolved completely in the tonic. (Jairazbhoy 1972, 68)

I will demonstrate here how the♭2 (Re) holds a strong measure of ‘restlessness’ in relation to the drone.

The *alaap* (first) section of a raga performance presents the notes one at a time in an ascending series of arches, returning each time to the low tonic (Sa). There are often quite lengthy expositions of how each note is treated according to the raga’s conventions (Martínez 2001, 271; Ruckert 2003, 22; Datta interview 2011). The *alaap* may be followed by a fixed composition, called a *bandish*, consisting of two stanzas that develop the character of the raga (Bor 1999, 179). Peformance becomes more virtuosic as it continues, with less emphasis on the particular raga characteristics (Parikh interview 2011). The series of melodic arch shapes, established in the *alaap*, continues throughout the performance, always finally returning to the low tonic.

Each raga will emphasise two other ‘important’ notes called *vadi* and *samvadi*, which may or may not coincide with the structural pillars. The *vadi* of a raga is the most significant note other than Sa, the ‘particular consonant or dissonant character of that note… imparting a distinct aesthetic stamp or ethos to the
raga…. [This is] an index, as it were, of the kind of appeal a raga may put forth’ (Ranade 1939, 137). The vadi is supported by the samvadi, often a perfect fifth above, for instance Re (♭2) and Dha (♭6) (ibid.). There are notable exceptions to the perfect fifth interval, including in two ragas containing komal Re: raga Shri has an augmented fourth between vadi and samvadi (Re and Pa), and raga Marva an augmented fifth (Re and Dha) (Jairazbhoy 1972, 66) (see 1.5.5 and 1.5.7 for more detail on these two ragas).

The vadi and samvadi frequently work together; for instance British sarod player Soumik Datta, who I encountered at his summer course on Indian music at SOAS, describes how ‘there’s a movement mirrored around each of these two notes [the vadi and samvadi] in the lower and higher parts of the scale in many ragas’ (interview 2011). The character of a raga is epitomised by the vadi and samvadi: ‘Ga and Ni [as vadi and samvadi] together might suggest a devotional feeling, Re and Dha a romantic one, and Ma tivra a longingness emotion’ (Tournier 2005, 28). So the use of komal Re as either vadi or samvadi will have a strong effect on the mood of the raga.

Changing the vadi and samvadi, together with the style of ornamentation and motifs, can create many different ragas from the same collection of notes. They are immediately recognised by characteristic phrases, ‘specific ornaments, a distinctive musicality, a way of moving, a proportion, but also…a temperament, feeling, rasa [emotion], time of day…or season that are favourable’ (ibid., 29).

Leante writes that

the defining features of a rāg (e.g. the Re–Pa in Shri)…are avoided in other rāgs…. No one among the musicians who talked about Shri explicitly associated the ascending Re–Pa slide with any other ‘similar’ interval or feature in another rāg, as that would conflict with the distinguishing feature of Shri. (Leante 2009, 200–01)

Thus, characteristic motifs are regarded as incomparable across ragas.

Ragas have one collection of notes in ascent, another in descent, and different ragas play komal Re at a slightly different pitch (Mahajan 2001, 96). Many notes are varied between ascent and descent, played flatter or sharper by shrutis (microtones) (Mahajan 2001, 71). I interviewed sitar player Baluji Shrivastav in
his London home, he describes how this is essentially a vocal tradition and that most great singers will vary their intonation each time:

\[
\text{Nobody can claim that exactly on that shruti they will land... In Indian music, notes are mingled with each other, not separated... So you may start a little higher on the komal Re in a descending line and then when you come back down to Sa you spread it all over the place. Raga Bhairav is an example, from Ma to Re you're a little higher but then you bring it low and go to Sa. (Shrivastav interview 2008)}
\]

In Mumbai, while touring with the Bollywood Brass Band, I visited sitar player, and president of the Indian Musicological Society, Arvind Parikh. Parikh elaborated that even within one raga, every approach to a note may have a different microtone and ornamentation, affecting its interpretation. In relation to komal Re he says ‘In my opinion every shade of komal Re has a different implication’ (interview 2011).

There are immediate, profound and extensive emotional associations relating to the notes of the ragas: ‘The ancient musicologists were particularly interested in the effects of musical notes... The semitones or shrutis of the octave were named according to subtle shades of different sentiments, feelings and emotions. The ragas...emerge as the suggestive sound images of these sentiments, emotions and passions’ (Batish and Batish 1989, 6). As will be seen, it is when notes are emphasised that they are considered most important in mood creation:

\[
\text{When you are waiting on a note for a long time your emotional involvement is much larger, more intense than when you are treating it in transit. There are, therefore, different situations that you have to consider when we consider for komal Re. (Parikh interview 2011)}
\]

This tonal tradition, then, has meaning attributed to pitch choices, motifs and stresses. Mood creation in a raga is through the treatment of svaras (notes). All the notes hold structural significance, but the moveable notes Re Ga, Ma, Dha and Ni, in their infinite variability, have particular relevance in the creation of mood.

1.2 Performance and spirituality
The subtleties of the interrelationship of notes within a raga produce a complex whole, comparable to a human personality (Leante 2009, 185–6). Thus, individual ragas become anthropomorphised with human features (Martínez 2001, 271). Henri Tournier writes that ‘a raga can be considered as a musical
entity whose beauty, personality and character are gradually uncovered by the musician.... The musician can be compared to a painter creating a portrait in front of an audience (2005, 29). The relevance of this in terms of a discussion of the $b^2$ (Re) is that interpretation of svara goes beyond Western understanding of the word ‘note’, as illustrated by the comments of academic and singer Subroto Roy, who I visited on the campus of Pune University, India:

We tend to put something of our own personality into the svara. So it’s a symbiotic thing between the svara and me. So svara is part of me actually, it’s not something that is there in the books, or somebody has told me. It’s part of me and the svara that you will see and feel is going to be different, I believe. (Roy interview 2011)

The individual performer’s spiritual, rather than religious, interpretation is paramount: ‘every one who has ever tangled with the music of the raga knows that the hidden agenda of this art is spiritual…. [This path is] traversed alone and always singly’ (Menon 1998, 4). George Ruckert writes of how music may be considered like a prayer, as a ‘divine manifestation, a gift from God’ and that the musician is on a ‘lifelong path which has spiritual overtones’ (2003, 18–19). Batish and Batish say that music is regarded as ‘a venue to touch the inner soul…. [It has] a communicative power that can be described as pure enlightenment’ (1989, 8).

Performers are trained to look within themselves in order to advance the expression of a raga, creating new moods and associations (Goswami 1995, 56, 72). ‘The point is to beautify it in your own way, bring out your own personality as a musician in improvisation, ornament it in your own way’ (Datta interview 2011). This is with reference to the performer’s teacher (guru) and gharana (‘family’ tradition), yet the importance of the performer and their holistic view is paramount:

You have to look at rāg rather than notes…. You have to sing in relationship with the other notes, it’s very complex…. It’s all to do with the relationship, any Re is different in any rag. It varies from person to person. I sing it in Bhairav from my guru. I have felt it in that way. It is not objective [how] you can look at the svara. I sing it with a certain inflection, related to my physical disposition—what it gives will vary from person to person. If you generalise you will brutalise it. (Roy interview 2011)

Consideration of komal Re on its own, then, is controversial to Roy. Comparative discussion of note use between ragas abounds among practitioners of Indian
classical music, including Roy, but what is most important is that the particular raga context is continually stressed.

Raga-like pitch sets also appear in the Muslim call to prayer, and the Sufi vocal tradition of gawwali shares ‘a common musical frame of reference, musical elements and principles of structuring’ with North Indian classical music (Qureshi 1986, 46) as does the Sikh tradition. Qawwali has developed ragas to express the love of God and to inspire audiences to ecstasy. Sufi music is always based on mystical poetry and ‘has a religious function: to arouse mystical love, even divine ecstasy, the core experience of Sufism’ (ibid., xiii). This constant use of text in gawwali differs from Hindu classical music ‘where the music is primary and its verbal delivery entirely subordinate’ (ibid., 46). Raga is holistic music where any particular note such as komal Re is always considered as part of an expressive whole. Thus, within performance there is a deep spiritual awareness, with often little separation between music and meditation.

1.3 Komal Re within raga

There are many hundreds of ragas, but it is generally considered that a much smaller number, in the tens rather than the hundreds, are the ‘main ragas’. Alain Daniélou names forty-two ‘main ragas’, of which nineteen (45%) use komal Re (1978), and Martínez writes of twenty-five ragas of which ten (42%) have komal Re (2001, 313–6). The reason that these percentages are not a clear 50%, perhaps expected where the choice is binary as with shuddha or komal, is due to some ragas containing no second degree at all, and also the abundance of ragas created for playing in the late evening, which, by time conventions, use shuddha Re. The ♭2 is, thus, a ‘normal’ pitch choice in North Indian raga, in contrast to within Western music where the ♭2 does not occur in any of the standard scales and is always ‘marked’.

Although only some of the ragas that contain komal Re have it as vadi or samvadi (see Appendix 1), practitioners speak of komal Re as a significant note, a bahutva, in many more ragas: the term bahutva means an important note that is used frequently, for instance the komal Re in raga Todi (Caudhurī 2000, 21; Dey 2008, 234). Ananya Dey writes that the presence of the Re and Dha gives a
certain mood, whether stressed or not (2008, 109). I discuss here how this mood is often related to twilight.

What exactly does the name mean?

*Komal* is a Hindi word meaning soft, sensitive, smooth or tender (Goswami 1995, 104), and is a common girls’ name.⁵ These associations to the word *komal* may bring similar associations to the use of *komal* notes. For instance, Daniélou reports that *komal* Re in raga *Basant* is ‘womanly and delicate’ (Daniélou 1978, 7). Such interpretations of pitches very much depend on the individual raga, a point stressed by Roy (interview 2011): there is no simple mapping. Yet there is an association in the name of *komal* of being lower than *shuddha* (natural) that chimes with Huron’s theories of ‘lower than normal’ (Huron, Yim, and Chordia 2010, 8).

*Rishabh* is the full name given to the second degree of the scale (or *rikhabh* in *qawwali*). Shrivastav told me that *rishabh* represents the bull (*Vrishabh*) in Hindu imagery. Here he sets out the Hindu belief system in relation to death and the bull:

> The bull is the chariot of Lord Shiva, the god of destruction, and god of death…. [This is] the death of ignorance and that should be celebrated. Death is not a sinister thing in Indian philosophy. It’s part of finishing a cycle and starting a new cycle…. When an old man who has seen life dies they play music. If you don’t believe in reincarnation, then death is the end of the line, that’s very sad, you have nothing left. But…Hindus believe if you don’t do something in this life that’s OK, next life is there, so relax, there is nothing lost. (Shrivastav interview 2008)

As Shrivastav associates the note Re with the bull, these associations contribute to his sense of the power of the note, and also the spiritual connections. However Parikh comments:

> It’s not *rishabh* it’s *vrishabh* that’s a bull. He [Shrivastav] must have been following the colloquial understanding of it, becoming *rishabh* for the bull. Now I will never agree that *komal rishabh* has any connection with the bull. *Shuddha rishabh* is much stronger. (Parikh interview 2011)

Parikh is not interested in word connections and this illustrates the variance between the opinions of two respected and experienced sitar players. Such

---


61
divergence of interpretation is typical of the oral tradition that is Indian classical music.

The note *rishabh* is also supposed to ‘be expressive of heroism, wonderment and wrath’ (Goswami 1995, 45), yet the different *shrutis* of Re are related to the *rasas* (emotions) of *mridu* or *karuna*, meaning tenderness or compassion (ibid., 44). This apparent contradiction can be resolved by fusing these concepts. For instance in raga *Bhairav* the heroism of Shiva is combined with the romantic connection with his consort Parvati to produce a serious and compassionate raga (Goswami 1995, 46, 90, 92). This combination may also be seen in the description of raga *Shri* as a warrior praying before a battle (see 1.5.5).

*Komal Re* and ‘leading note’ tensions

Tension and relaxation are vital within the melodic development of a raga. Jose Martínez, in his book on the semiotics of Indian classical music, writes of how the artist may hold tension in a melodic line in order to give pleasure from an unfulfilled expectation. The listener ‘either consciously or instinctively’ has musical expectations, thus experiencing the musical emotion in terms of these expectations and the actual realisation within a performed raga (Martínez 2001, 157).

*Komal Re* holds a particular role in this tension and relaxation. For instance, within the arch shape of *alaap* exposition, and the inevitable ending of each section on the low Sa, Re, whether *komal* or *shuddha*, as the note just above Sa, holds a special place. Shrivastav allows *komal* Re greater significance, again tied to associations of the bull:

> *Komal Re* is more expressive than the *shuddha* Re because *shuddha* Re is farther away from Sa. The closer notes are very expressive. Anything that is closer, you can feel more expression, it’s very physical. If you play different notes, the closer you get the vibrato gets faster and stronger…. *Komal Re* is very, very powerful. The bull is associated with power; philosophically it is very powerful. And as it has got more vibrato and faster frequencies it is powerful…. In relation to the octave the *komal* Re is the most powerful semitone, the one from Sa itself. (Shrivastav interview 2008)

Related to this comment, Lahore-based Sufi singer Rafaqat Ali Khan, who I interviewed during the period of his working together with the Bollywood Brass Band in Oslo, told me that ‘*komal rikhabh* [Re] is like your seventh’ (Khan interview 2008). Both artists here, then, privilege the final melodic cadences to
the low tonic of Re–Sa over the rising cadence Ni (7) to Sa. This is not to say that Ni is not a significant leading note (Jairazbhoy 1972, 76), but that both Ni and komal Re act as leading notes. Ganesh Ranade wrote that ‘Indian music…uses both the upward and downward leading notes with equal facility’ (1939, 137). Komal Re is very close in pitch frequency to Sa, as is Ni, and similarly the notes tivra Ma and Dha are very close to Pa (5). These notes, the b2, the #4, the b♯ and the 7, all lie a ‘dissonant’ semitone away from drone notes constantly playing the tonic, fifth and octave. The suggestion, and perceived ‘need for resolution’ to, notes consonant with the drones is akin to the ‘melodic anchoring’ theories of Bharucha (Castellano, Bharucha and Krumhansl 1984, 394–7). Bharucha describes Indian music as displaying how the yearning vector ‘is typified by the performer dwelling on the semitone on either side of the Sa or Pa, finally resolving to the Sa or Pa with dramatic effect’ (ibid., 383). For instance, Parikh’s description of raga Marva gives a picture of building a yearning for the tonic by withholding it and resting on the b2. Bigamudre Deva writes that both ‘Re and Dha cause tension, disturb consciousness, are dissonant, highly dissonant and suggestive of tonic and dominant’ (1981, 134). These notes play an important part in performance time theory, with connections to perceptions of dissonance (ibid., 131).

The manner of approaching komal Re will also affect its sense of tension within raga performance. Shrivastav described how ‘the komal Re is very dissonant and that tension is increased by rising from Sa to Re, rather than falling Ga to Re, which is more relaxed’, while the ascent from Re is also uplifting (Shrivastav interview 2008; Figure 1.1). This is evident in interpretations of raga Shri with its characteristic rise from Re to Pa (see 1.5.5), and congruent with Roy’s comment that the ‘b2 is not necessarily a leading note. It may gravitate to Pa’ (Roy interview 2011). Khan agreed that the amount of emphasis is all-important: for instance by emphasising Pa the raga can be uplifting (e.g. Khan interview 2008). Ascent and descent to and from komal Re will thus affect its interpretation in relation to tension.

Connotations of the upper leading note: ‘sadness’ and ‘pathos’

There are emotional connotations of ‘sadness’ attributed to komal Re. Ranade argues that komal Re, komal Dha, tivra Ma and Ni, are all dissonant, and that when a raga emphasises any of these notes ‘it would be openly sad and dull or depressing’ (1939, 137). He continues concerning the performance of a raga: ‘If it is to have a sad or depressing appeal, the dissonances must receive greater prominence’ (ibid.).

However Khan, although reporting that komal Re always gives a ‘sad’ mood, described it as ‘beautiful’, indicating an ambiguity to the meaning of the word ‘sad’. He explained: ‘Sad in our Sufi religion doesn’t mean “Oh, I’ve lost my purse”’, it means that I’m closer to God, it is a beautiful and lovely sensation’ (Khan interview 2008). A similar exploration of the meaning of the word ‘sad’ is discussed by Clayton, who finds that the terms ‘sad’ and ‘calm’ are attributed to raga Shri, and surmises that ‘both would be associated with slow introverted movements’ within that raga (2005, 371). Shrivastav agreed that ‘sad’ was how he, too, understood the note, but also suggested that ‘sad’ could be romantic: ‘the Re is the sad aspect, when you long for someone’ (Shrivastav interview 2008).

![Figure 1.1](http://theotherleadingnote.blogspot.co.uk)

Describing the ♭2 in, for instance, ragas Marwa and Todi as ‘tender’ or ‘loving’ does not necessarily imply that the ♭2 is not heard as ‘dissonant’. It may rather be that there is no simple correlation between dissonance and discomfort.

---

Transcriptions are by myself unless otherwise stated. The breves at the beginning of the scores indicate the tonic. Key signature and other conventions are style specific. In this chapter I follow the convention of notating Sa as C. When these examples are sung the performer generally sings the sargam syllables. I include them in instrumental examples for easier comparison. I also use stemless notes as the music is unmetred.

Links to audio tracks are also on [http://theotherleadingnote.blogspot.co.uk](http://theotherleadingnote.blogspot.co.uk)

Such insights may inform results of psychological research, such as that of Timothy Maher on differing reactions to ragas Marwa and Todi as being heard differently by Indian and Canadian respondents (1976, 264).
Shrivastav explained that the tendency of ragas was to fall, and so there is a preponderance of hearing *komal* Re falling to Sa, bringing many associations of ‘sadness’. However he felt that when the melody rose *komal* Re was not sad: ‘This is very positive, coming from Ni to Re is quite a happy aspect, going back to Sa is the sad aspect’ (Shrivastav interview 2008; Figure 1.1). Parikh, in contrast to Shrivastav, describes the approach to *komal* Re from below as full of ‘pathos’: ‘I feel that when *komal* Re starts from the bottom there is intense pathos. When you are touching it from [an] upper note the pathos is slightly less in my opinion, the intensity is less’ (Parikh interview 2011). Metaphors of falling are clearly playing a part here, though the connotations vary from artist to artist, and, crucially, falling down from *komal* Re may have positive associations, such as relaxing or being closer to God.

The term ‘pathos’ also may have different interpretations. Parikh continues:

> Intense pathos also has two implications: one is a very sensitive implication, and one is [a] very hard implication, I don’t want to use the word ‘rough’, but very deep rooted, and one other [implication] is very sensitive...that leads you to tears...to complete withdrawal into your own self. I’m talking about very fine elements now. (ibid.)

It is clear from these comments that there is no simple equation of, for instance, *komal* Re equals pathos. In fact the depth of the nuances of meaning and interpretation of individual *svara* (notes) are exactly what sets classical raga apart from other musical traditions. As well as these comments displaying different subtleties to the interpretation of the ‘dissonant’ *komal* Re, issues of context are introduced. Deepak Raja writes: ‘The Indian aesthetic sensibility is far too mature to assume a mechanistic correspondence between *svara*-material and the emotional content of all its melodic potentialities’ (2005, 165). As with all note use in ragas, context will finally determine function and meaning, there is no syllogistic connection of *komal* Re is sad, therefore the raga is sad. There are different interpretations and associations for *komal* Re, yet there is a common sense of tension and repeated associations of sadness, pathos, relaxation, power and longing.

**Komal Re at dawn and dusk**

There is a long tradition of performing ragas at particular times of the day, and many ragas have strong connotations related to this time theory:
In the beginning, music was confined to rituals, worship and prayers. As specified seasons and hours of day and night were fixed for different religious rites, music relating to them came to be associated with such time and later on these times were crystallized into rigid rules. (Batish and Batish 1989, 6)

Of the seventy-eight ragas listed in the *Raga Guide* twenty-three have the *konal* Re, seventeen of which are played around dawn or dusk (Bor 1999). The subsection of ragas that are played around twilight are called the *sandhi prakash* ragas. *Sandhi* means junction, and *prakash* means light. There is a discrepancy within my research as to what span of time is called *sandhi prakash*, in particular whether it is the whole period of light changes from 4 till 7 (a.m. or p.m., a fairly constant period in the North Indian region) or the 10–15 minute period of ‘white light’ which starts this period at dawn, and completes it at dusk, or indeed the similarly short period of sunrise/sunset (Roy; Parikh; Prajapati interviews 2011). *Sandhi prakash* ragas are generally considered to be played till 7 a.m./p.m., though some practitioners continue till 9 a.m. (Fyze-Rahamin 2004, 76).

Overwhelmingly these *sandhi prakash* ragas use *konal* Re, together with *konal* Dha (Fyze-Rahamin 2004, 76, Parikh, Roy interview 2011, Shrivastav interview 2008). For Suresh Prajapati, a flute player that I interviewed in his music shop in Udaipur, this is a tautological connection, where the reason for using *konal* Re and *konal* Dha in *sandhi prakash* ragas is because they are *sandhi prakash* ragas and ‘if you don’t use these notes they’re not *sandhi prakash*’ (Prajapati interview 2011). The inclusion of *konal* Re and *konal* Dha in a raga can also be said to define its performance to be at these hours, despite the fact that there are important exceptions such as *Todi* (performed late morning) (Raja 2005, 163).

The morning ragas have their most stressed note (*vadi*) in the upper tetrachord (Bhatkhande quoted in Jairazbhoy 1972, 67), so morning twilight ragas may have *Dha* as *vadi* and *Re* as *samvadi*, for instance in raga *Bhairav*. Conversely, the afternoon ragas have *vadi* in the lower tetrachord (Raja 2005, 163; Roy interview 2011) and two important ragas performed at evening twilight, *Shri* and *Marva*, have *Re* as *vadi*.

The importance of *konal* Re and *konal* Dha in *sandhi prakash* ragas is well established (e.g. Dey 2008, 169), while the explanations for this importance vary. Sometimes explanations from my interviewees again followed a tautological
path: komal Re and komal Dha are important to sandhi prakash ragas because they define the time. Parikh says

Sandhi prakash ragas are early morning when the sun is not there but there is twilight—dawn and in the evening. These are the most sensitive periods as they say, and therefore komal Re is the most intense, the impact is the most intense at this time… Sandhi prakash, as you will agree, is a very sensitive period…when one period is ending, another period is starting, the joining, the linking period is very, very sensitive according to our great masters, and [in] that period the pathos is very intense and therefore [we have] the Sa–Re…. Because it has been so determined that komal rishabh from lower note are more used in the evening ragas, [for example] Shri. Therefore that intensity of pathos, from a biological point of view, in the evening, [occurs] around 6 o’clock…. [In the] very early morning the same principle applies when there is also sandhi prakash. So this komal Re from lower note is used for intense pathos in both sandhi prakash periods. (Parikh interview 2011)

Asked for an explanation for this concept, Parikh continued:

All komal notes [are used at twilight], but with a greater emphasis on komal Re and komal Dha. The two notes komal Ga and komal Ni are also there... but the intensity of moods, in my opinion, are created by komal Re and komal Dha more than komal Ga and komal Ni…. Komal Ga and komal Ni are not treated as resting points…. To my practical experience, komal Ga and komal Ni are used more as transit resting points, whereas komal Re and komal Dha are being treated as resting points and therefore they have a greater impact. (Parikh interview 2011)

The appropriateness of komal Re and komal Dha for twilight ragas is attributed by Deva to their perceived dissonance:

The sandhya (twilight) is a most crucial time…. The switch over of modes of existence occurs…. For the extra-conscious forces to act, it is necessary that the conscious itself be quiet or disturbed and less capable of censorship… it should be ‘confused’ and its pretensions to constancy and reality be destroyed. To achieve this the music must be such that it introduces tension. The tensions which disturb and confuse the conscious are created by the use of ‘dissonant’ tones, by the employment of tortuous movements and by the avoidance of resting places. It will be obvious that all the sandhi prakash ragas employ notes like komal re and dha…. With the employment of dissonant tones and movements, tensions which confuse the conscious are created, yielding it to the forces that are extra-conscious. (Deva 1981, 133–5)

Deva adds that the combination of Re and Dha with Ma’ ‘indicates a mood of tiredness... and shows the weary mood of nature before sunset’ (Deva 1981, 163).

Other explanations for using komal Re and komal Dha at twilight were clearly attached to the ‘lower than shuddha’ aspect of the two notes. Komal, meaning soft, can be taken as ‘quiet’: Ranade states that ‘on account of a considerable fall in the general noise level, very soft and low notes can be easily heard and
enjoyed…. [these ragas are] the most favourite of the artistes and listeners alike’ (1939, 137). Raja makes connections to the body:

The suppressed/debilitated microtones of the Re and Dha are suggestive of the semi-awake condition, and are believed to have an aesthetic affinity with the quality of light in the twilight zones. Some senior vocalists also report that, during these periods, the throat muscles tend to become loose, and the accurate rendition of shuddha Re and Dha svaras becomes difficult. There could, therefore, also be a physiological basis for this pattern. (Raja 2005, 163)

Roy also commented on this concept of a semi-awake condition:

Flattened notes help you to get into the active mode of life, or make you sleep well, they bridge between the unconscious and conscious minds, or between different levels of consciousness…. The unconscious mind is active when you’re asleep, so when you’re coming from sleep the softer notes help you into the active mode. When you have to go to sleep again you need soothing notes to help you…. The relationship between conscious and unconscious has something to do with komal and shuddha notes. I’m not saying this is entirely mental—not in Freudian sense, in an Indian sense. Komal and shuddha are a mystery, why they give you different moods. (Roy interview 2011)

Govinde Tembe describes the komal Re as follows: ‘It is as though it is half awakened to consciousness, but rather sluggish on account of the break in sleep, morose and sad’ (1976, 22), while Fyzee-Rahamin describes all the sandhi prakash ragas as ‘slow, dreamy and pure’ (2004, 76).

This connection with the night and consciousness leads to more visual images, as here described in terms of raga Bhairav:

Imagine a devotee hallowing the morn with svaras of raga Bhairav, which is meant for this particular part of the day. Steading himself with the utterance of the tonic, he sets out to develop the singing in such a way that he may be able to saturate himself with images and attitudes that suit the hour—the rising sun, yearning in prayer and the concomitant chastening of self, pouring arghya (sacred water) on the idol, and detachment from the things of the world. A brief but immaculate touch on the tonic, followed at once by komal Re prolonged firmly and sweetly, attuned the mind with the sunrise outside, by suggesting emergence. The same note [komal Re] touched while descending from Ga provides, in a manner, a clear euphonic transcript of the downward angle of arghya being poured on the idol [Shiva]. As attunement grows through the aid of svaras (or notes), detachment deepens and the singer cooperates by articulating the Sa (tonic) merely ideally and lingering on the Re—now faintly, though of course sweetly—the note suggesting transcendence. The Re thus becomes an aid to devotion and to elevation of the self. (Saxena quoted in Martínez 2001, 171)
Mahajan describes the Re as ‘rising from the infinite Sa, fresh and energetic’ (2001, 101) while the Re of raga Purvi (a dusk raga) ‘subsides to Sa with a desire to take rest’ (ibid.). Raja comments that the change from komal to shuddha is ‘symbolising the completion of the night-to-day or day-to-night transition that commences in the twilight’ (2005, 164). This is congruent with Shrivastav, who explained that morning is bright and as it gets brighter, the komal Re changes to shuddha Re. As the day progresses there is a sense of having moved from the tonic, then when it comes to the end of the day return to the tonic becomes more the theme. As dusk approaches the Re is again flattened and becomes particularly prominent as a relaxing note (Shrivastav interview 2008). The use of komal Re in the twilight ragas thus evokes visual imagery of the day related to the position of Re just ‘above’Sa.

The twilight ragas represent emotions (rasas) of shanta (contemplative, meditative and peaceful) and karuna (sadness, pathos, compassion, sympathy) (Batish and Batish 1989, 8). Raja writes that there is ‘the possibility that certain svaras (notes), or combinations of svaras, might have a higher probability of communicating certain emotions appropriate to certain times of the day/night than others’ (2005, 165). In explanation of how this may occur with Indian listeners, Raja continues:

The Time theory works for them because they have Indian bodies, and Indian minds, of a particular generation, responding under the sunlight quality and climatic conditions characteristic of the Indian subcontinent. (ibid.)

Dawn and dusk pass rapidly within India as it lies close to the equator. The emotional significance of the twilight period may be lessened for Indian musicians who live further from the equator, for instance in England.

**Godhuli bela: ‘cowdust time’**

Within India there are strong associations with evening twilight and it is known as ‘cowdust time’:

This is the time when the mode of life changes drastically and suddenly…. As day passes into night, consciousness quiets and other forces take over. The infra- and supra-conscious forces are now given their chance to project themselves into the individual mind. (Deva 1981, 133, 134)
Raja describes how there is a deep cultural meaning to twilight, emphasised by
the movement of the cows, and the dust that they raise, as they come home from
grazing (2005, 163–4). The term \textit{godhuli bela}, comprised of \textit{go} (cows) + \textit{dhuli}
(dust) + \textit{bela} (time), specifically refers to Hindu philosophy involving Krishna
depicted as a cowherd. Clare Jenkins’s radio programme \textit{Cowdust Time} contains
many voices supporting a religious and cultural significance of evening twilight.

‘It is that fantastic time of day,’ says writer and academic Rajendrasingh Jadeja,
‘when the cowdust raised transforms the scene from stark, sharp light to a fantasy
world’. There are various comments on the fantactic, sometimes lonely and odd,
world of twilight, when the sun is just down, where evil spirits abound that may
be dispelled by the lighting of lamps, a time when ‘psychological and spiritual
energies are flowing from the higher consciousness to the physical and back’
(quotes from Jenkins 2012). Twilight is considered an important time to return
home when temple bells and muezzins call people of different faiths to prayer
and there are many devotional songs and poems devoted to this twilight hour.
These may be thanking God for the day and/or asking for protection through the
night (ibid.).

\textit{Re} is treated as the most emphasised note, the \textit{vadi}, within two popular ragas,
\textit{Shri} and \textit{Marva}, which are performed at different periods of the evening twilight.
Jenkins interviewed musician Sugna Shah, who elaborated on the importance of
\textit{Re}, \textit{Dha} and \textit{Ma’} in evening twilight ragas:

\textit{Rishabh komal}, \textit{Dha komal} and \textit{tivra Ma}, they create a world of their own, a
world of different mood, of dejection, a mood of separation after the day’s
over you feel a little tired, and sometime you ask yourself ‘What have I done
during the whole day?’ and then you start thinking about yourself, and then
you go inside yourself and that is the mood of this raga, that’s what I think....
\textit{Re komal}, \textit{Dha komal}, they give the effect of sadness or surrender to God, or
realisation of God…the note of dejection, sadness, longing. So that mood of
dejection or separation, these moods are represented through the musical
notes, and these notes, \textit{Re} and \textit{Dha}, are used for \textit{sandhi prakash} raga. (Shah
interview in Jenkins 2012)

Thus, for Shah, as for Deva, there is an association of sadness or surrender to God
in the notes \textit{komal} \textit{Re} and \textit{komal} \textit{Dha}, attached to the evening twilight time.

The time theory within North Indian ragas may have origins in the times of daily
rituals in which music was played, rituals connected to cycles of life, closeness to
God and general beliefs about life and death. Music played at dawn and dusk
gives an opportunity to meditate, musically, on these times of transition and change, whether or not the choices of notes were originally tied to the time. There are philosophical and religious connections made and a vivid musical language embedded within the ragas to express change and loss, in which komal Re features strongly.

1.4 Mood creation with komal Re in specific ragas

By studying komal Re in further depth within particular ragas, I will show something of how complex and subtle the understanding of melodic use is for mood creation in respect to this note, and how this varies between ragas. The importance of characteristic phrases may be demonstrated by exploring how different ragas with the same basic pitch selection may create very different moods.

Ragas of the first dawn

Komal Re is used in several ragas performed in the late night and early morning. They often also contain tivra Ma and are members of the Marva scale family (thaat), as is the case with the early morning ragas Lalit and Sohini (Figures 1.2 and 1.3). Re is particularly low at first dawn, flatter than a semitone, represented by the symbols Re- and Re-. Bose writes ‘The two phrases Ma Re- Sa and Ma Re- Sa are combined together to constitute the chromatic phrase Ma Re- Re- Sa which is especially suited for the twilight hour just before sunrise…. [This is] the cadence phrase of Lalit and Sohini’ (1960, 458).

Figure 1.2 Raga Lalit ascent and descent (Bor 1999, 104).

Re is present in the melodic cadences of raga Lalit but is not emphasised (Goswami 1995, 59, 61). Raga Sohini also does not linger on komal Re, and the melody lines often end on the high Sa (Figure1.3). However, the mood of these two ragas are very different: raga Lalit is said to express the pain of lovers forced to separate before dawn, while Sohini is a fast-moving raga that is described as ‘bright and lovely’.

---

9 SV indicates the samvadi, and V indicates the vadi, as specified by Batish and Batish 1989.
The theme of love and separation returns with raga *Bhatiyar*, which is played at early dawn. This raga, like raga *Lalit* has both *komal* Re and *tivra* Ma (Figure 1.4). However *komal* Re, though neither *vadi* nor *samvadi*, is emphasised in the higher octave where it is held high and dissonant over the octave (Figure 1.5).

The descending scale begins on high Re and omits Sa to fall to Ni and beyond. Khan sang raga *Bhatiyar* for me, emphasising the *komal* Re, and described how this can become ‘like Dracula, very, very sad’. He continued:

> I love raga *Bhatiyar*, because it has a favourite note, which is *komal rikhabh* [Re]. The way that it is approached and ends phrases, it attracts me. It is a late night/early morning raga expressing the sleepless longing for a lover. (Khan interview 2012)

He described a *Bhatiyar* lyric: ‘It's because of you that I’m very sad. It’s because of you that I’m awake all night, you make me hurt’. Khan considers *komal* Re to be crucial in raga *Bhatiyar*, giving the very sad mood. But the raga also contains hope, represented by *shuddha* Dha. The mood depends on the emphasis and the lyric, he says, with *komal* Re stressed in both low and high and phrases often ending on it (Khan interview 2008; Figure 1.5 bracketed phrases).
These descriptions of raga *Bhatiyar* express a general sadness, with *komal* Re being regarded as a significant agent in this mood creation.11

**Sunrise ragas**

Sadness is also attributed to *komal* Re in the sunrise pentatonic morning raga *Gunakri* (Figure 1.6). Khan, playing on the piano the stressed *komal* Re and said:

> This note is most important [Figure 1.7 playing *komal* Re]…this creates a mood… you sustain on it…. The mood is sad, always sad. (Khan interview 2008)

Khan explained that for him the morning is sad because ‘I don’t want to really focus on the world, I am with God, I need his blessing. If someone is away from me, my love, this is also related to this note [Re]’ (Khan interview 2008).

Longing and sadness are repeated associations in the morning twilight ragas for Khan.

---

10 The brackets inserted over the notation indicate the use of the $b\frac{2}{2}$, often indicating a cadential phrase or sometimes solely its presence.

11 See chapter five for associations between weeping and raga *Bhatiyar*. 
Associations are different with the popular raga Bhairav. This is considered devotional and serious, with an ‘invocation expression, masculine but tender’ (Mahajan 2001, 101). Shrivastav explained that the name Bhairav adds to its special character, as this is one of the aspects of Lord Shiva. Shiva is depicted as an awe-inspiring ascetic with a trident, skulls and snakes (Bor 1999, 32). Tenderness is added to the image through Shiva’s role as romantic consort to Parvati.

As with all morning ragas, the movement of raga Bhairav is generally down, with komal Re only occurring on the descent (Figure 1.8), often emphasised and enunciated with heavy, slow oscillation from komal Ga. The Ga in raga Bhairav is generally shuddha, but Ga is also used in Bhairav to give komal Re its ‘flavour’ (Mahajan 2001, 143). Komal Re is very important in this sunrise raga, and Shrivastav demonstrates what he described as the ‘power’ of the descending komal Re with its characteristic cadence of Ga–sustained Re–Sa (Figure 1.9).
Roy, however, sings this characteristic phrase with *shuddha* Ga, emphasising the falling movement from Ma to Re as the ‘revealing’ part of the raga (Figure 1.10 A).

![Figure 1.10 Roy singing characteristic phrases of raga Bhairav (interview 2011). CD 1 track 5: 0.00–0.06, 0.31–0.48.](image)

Roy explained that in the morning ragas there is a downward motion, without a need to fall from Re to Sa, the signature of the raga being established, in the case of Bhairav, by the fall Ma to Re. ‘Descent from Ma to Re is more important than Re to Sa. If you don’t go to Sa it doesn’t matter [Figure 1.10 A]. Ma to Re is the revealing and characteristic part’ (Figure 1.10 B; Roy interview 2011).

Within this meditational raga there can be deep spiritual associations to the vital note *komal* Re. I asked Roy to describe the mood of *komal* Re in raga Bhairav and he answered by saying that he must sing it to know (Figure 1.11). After singing he said:

> This is kind of a delight. It’s a delight…[a] spiritual bliss with which I have experienced a couple of times in life when I was meditating, it is a similar kind of feeling when I sing *rāg Bhairav* or *rāg Bhairavi*. Bhairavi…gives me the feeling I am looking at a scenario where I’m seeing a person who’s wearing (of course this is enculturated, but I’m just telling you what it means) a saffron dress. I’m just walking away from the physical world, going into a spiritual realm. That’s the kind of feeling I get when I sing Bhairav. Bhairav is kind of an enlightenment, which I relate with my actual experiences, which I’ve got while meditating…. It’s not at all sad. (Roy interview 2011)

Roy’s view that a raga can be ‘not at all sad’ although *komal* Re is often emphasised, indicates a variance from Khan who appeared to imply that for him *komal* Re is always sad.

![Figure 1.11 Roy singing *komal* Re in raga Bhairav (interview 2011). CD 1 track 5: 1.22–1.45.](image)
Not to be confused with raga Bhairav is raga Bhairavi (Figure 1.12). Bhairavi is a favourite raga in the Indian subcontinent, a light raga that is used in many folk songs, where it may be performed slow or fast in tempo. Khan explained how flexible raga Bhairavi can be, as the pitches may be freely varied during a performance: shuddha instead of komal, tivra instead of shuddha. It is essentially a morning raga, but the raga has broken out of its slot and now can be played at any time of the day or night, and is often played at the end of all-evening or night concerts. It is associated with ‘love and contentment’ (Goswami 1995, 42), the erotic, devotion, and most of all the plaintiveness of separated lovers (Bor 1999, 34).

Figure 1.12 Raga Bhairavi ascent and descent (Khan interview 2008).

Khan sang a sufi song in raga Bhairavi (Figure 1.13): There is no particular stress on komal Re, yet many phrases end with a falling Ga Re Sa melodic cadence, indicating the structural importance of these notes. Martínez describes how such diagrammatic melodic movements are used in a sixteenth century vocal

12 Transcribed with Sa Re Ga syllables rather than lyrics, and transposed to C.
composition in raga Bhairavi, a prayer to the goddess Sarasvati. One lyric, dukha harani ‘who takes away our pain’, is supported by the phrase Dha Ma Ga Re Sa. This ‘descending melody represents the unburdening of pain or sorrow, and eventual pacification when the tonic is reached’ (Martínez 2001, 123) (Figure 1.14, Nos. 1, 4), while the lyric johi johi mangata ‘longing for boons’ is set to a rising phrase (Figure 1.14, Nos. 2, 3). The rising of the melody represents the progressive bestowal of boons to the persistent and deferential devotee…[culminating in a] motif Sa Re Sa in the upper octave…. The relief of pain as descending and the granting of requests as ascending phrases are diagrams…they refer to the dynamism of ideas rather than actual movements. (Martínez 2001, 123)

Even while using similar pitch choices, each raga to be played at dawn creates a unique ‘personality’. Komal Re may be a symbolic element representing the dawn (as in raga Lalit); it may be stressed and given a ‘sad’ connotation, or be a significant structural element that defines its character as with the cadential ‘power’ of the Ga–Re motif in raga Bhairav. The ‘lower than normal’ emotional effect, espoused by Huron (Huron, Yim, and Chordia 2010, 8), is produced within raga Bhairavi when komal Re appears after shuddha Re, a phenomenon that is also discussed in chapter two.

Later morning raga Todi
Generally after sunrise komal Re changes to shuddha Re, but the late morning (9 a.m.–12 noon) raga Todi retains the Re and Dha, and adds tivra Ma (Figure 1.15).
Roy says that ‘Todi is an indicator toward the day as it has tivra notes’ (Roy interview 2011).

There are many varieties of Todi with different emphases and moods, though Goswami describes it as generally ‘expressive of abandonment’ (Goswami 1995, 42). Khan sang Todi emphasising the importance of Pa, yet with characteristic phrases and melodic cadences of Ga–Re–Sa and Ga–Re (Figure 1.16). Komal Re is used structurally at cadences, but is not otherwise lingered on. It can be seen, then, that the associations of separation and abandonment here are not due to a specific emphasis on komal Re.

Gujari Todi is a member of the Todi family that does stress komal Re, also performed late morning. As in raga Bhairav Re is samvadi and Dha is vadi (Tournier 2005, 170) (Figure 1.17). Gujari Todi omits Pa and the tonic is also withheld for periods of time to mirror this omission (Jairazbhoy 1972, 80 note 11). Datta says that there is much stress on komal Re and the melody often lingers there with a meend (ornament) before falling to Sa. Even when the melody goes up higher it comes back to rest on Re, then finishes off with a tail to Sa (Datta interview 2011) (Figure 1.18).
Tournier says that the characteristic motif is Re–Ga–Re–Sa; this is demonstrated here by Datta in a standard bandish (fixed composition) (Figure 1.19). Tournier associates this raga with Todi connotations of the ‘grief of being separated from the beloved’ (2005, 170).

Datta adds associations of ‘peace, stretching, a long breath’ and also describes there being an essence of the ‘burning sun, like as it’s rising. Real fire, too hot, too powerful. You have to try and incorporate that essence in the rāg’ (Datta interview 2011). This morning raga has a downward movement, yet withholds the Sa, creating a tension. Komal Re is important in this creation of tension.

Gujari Todi, then, is an important and popular raga in contemporary musical practice, which has various interpretations within the oral traditions of different gharanas. The interpretations of b2 within the raga include a structural cadential role and an association of ‘grief in separation’.

A final raga to mention in this section is raga Komal Rishabh Asavari. This raga, named after the komal Re, is coupled with the raga simply named Asavari. Both are late morning ragas and they have related motifs. As with Gujari Todi, Re is samvadi, whether komal or not (Figure 1.20), and Ma is shuddha (the pitch set is thus the same as raga Bhairavi). Deva argues that the addition of the komal Re makes Komal Rishabh Asavari more feminine, deep, wiser, more sober and melancholy than Asavari without komal Re (Deva 1981, 172).
Dusk sandhi praksh ragas

Dusk ragas all have an association in the mind of Hindus with the Krishna/Radha love story (see 1.4.1). They often have komal Re as vadi and use tivra Ma, a combination that brings particular associations for some practitioners, as with Nayan Ghosh:

- A sadness element comes from the combination of tivra Ma and komal Re. Most of the ragas having these notes komal Re and tivra Ma have a strong pathos, which is there in Shri [and Marva], and in Todi in the morning rāg [raga], pathos is very strong... and Purvi.... Komal Re and tivra Ma gives the feeling of sadness. (interview in Clayton and Leante 2009)

As with all ragas, each one has its own character, which is attached to the time of day, the vadi and samvadi, and particular motifs and treatment of pitches. For instance, raga Shri and raga Puriya Dhanashri have the same notes, yet the distinctive importance of Re and its rise to Pa in Shri is completely absent in Puriya Dhanashri. Marva and Puriya likewise have the same pitch set, with Marva’s vadi of komal Re setting it apart (Martínez 2001, 140).

The pentatonic evening raga Gauri, which Sikh musician Jasminder Daffu told me is very prevalent in the Sikh tradition, is assigned to early dusk and autumn with a contemplative mood (Daffu interview 2012). The vadi of raga Gauri is komal Re and its samvadi is Pa; it has no Ga or Dha in the Sikh tradition (Figure 1.21). The notes of this raga are also contained within the morning raga Bhairav, yet it has a very different emphasis among the notes. Although komal Re is an important note in raga Gauri it is described as a ‘short and feeble note, tilted toward Sa representing absolutely helpless expression, feminine, helpless, lovely, melancholy’ (Mahajan 2001, 142). This is a sharp contrast to the ‘masculine’ interpretations of raga Bhairav.
A raga from the *Todi thaat*, the early dusk raga *Multani* is said, by Sounak Chaterjee, to be played ‘when the sun has not yet set’ (interview in Clayton and Leante 2009). He described the mood as being created ‘from the Re, because the Re is not approached directly’ (Figure 1.22), though the vadi is Pa and the samvadi is Sa. He called it ‘a tired raga… almost begging for respite…. [It represents] a destitute woman, pleading, begging… she has a dignity. Poor, but you must respect her…. [This is] a wonderful raga’ (ibid.). The richness of this imagery and how it connects with *komal* Re is typically personal to individual musicians.

I will now consider two dusk ragas in more detail, raga *Shri* and raga *Marva*, as well as a brief mention of raga *Basant*, supported particularly by comments from the interviews of Clayton and Leante. Raga *Shri* and raga *Marva* are both very popular, well-loved ragas, considered by Chaterjee as ‘serious and deeply meaningful’ (Clayton and Leante 2009). They are often spoken of together, in terms of their commonalities—as by Nayan Ghosh: ‘[Like] the pink of sunset and the birds returning home, *Shri* and *Marva* both have a vastness’ (ibid.)—and their differences: ‘the feeling of “separation and longing” sometimes attributed to *Shri* was that of a “temporary” separation, and not a permanent state of loss [as in *Marva*]’ (Leante 2009, 201). Shrivastav says that *Shri* has ‘a rising tension... you

---

13 Information on the Sikh use of raga *Gauri* from: 
<http://fateh.sikhnet.com/sikhnet/gurbani.nsf/d9c75ce4db27be328725639a0063aecc/c6913d082d559571872565bc004de797!OpenDocument> [accessed 15/03/2014].

---

Figure 1.21 Raga *Gauri* ascent and descent.13

Figure 1.22 Raga *Multani* ascent and descent (Bor 1999, 122).
are still working, but at the end of the day. It’s beautiful but it’s not as relaxing as the raga *Marva*’ (Shrivastav interview 2008).

**Raga Shri**

The dusk raga *Shri* is played later than *Multani*, but earlier than *Marva*, during the short period of actual sunset. The *vadi* and *samvadi* of raga *Shri* are Re and Pa, and Ga and Dha are avoided on ascent, resulting in large interval movements on ascent (Leante 2009, 188) (Figure 1.23). Bor describes the *komal* Re as being played very flat, and with unique ornamentation (Bor 1999, 146). A ‘seriousness’ in relation to the approaching night is attributed to raga *Shri*.

Viswanath Shirodkar said: ‘It always gives the feeling that dusk has set in…. At sunset you feel worried because you feel that the night is coming…. You cannot play *Shri* in a light way’ (Clayton and Leante 2009). This was echoed by Falguni Mitra: ‘*Shri* is a very contemplative and sombre, serious rāg, very different from so many rāgs, it has to be handled very carefully’ (ibid.). In Nayan Ghosh’s words, *Shri* is ‘prayerful yet with modesty, humility, but there’s also a sort of virility in *Shri* rāg. There is a hidden warrior in it, but after all *Shri* is a peaceful rāg… imagine a warrior praying before the battle…. it’s not humble and soft like other peaceful rāgs’ (ibid.).

![Figure 1.23 Raga Shri ascent and descent (Bor 1999, 146).](image)

Leante has extensively gathered interpretations of raga *Shri* from interviews with musicians (2009, 188). These all focus on the rising Re to Pa motif, a unique augmented fourth rise between vadi and samvadi (ibid., 190). For instance Falguni Mitra attributed the sombre, meditative feeling to the characteristic phrase Sa Re Pa (Clayton and Leante 2009) (Figure 1.24).

![Figure 1.24 Shrivastav singing raga Shri (interview 2008). CD 1 track 10: 0.00–0.11.](image)
Ramakant Gundecha said that ‘the combination of Re and Pa is very special. The glide from Pa to Re and Re to Pa, it’s difficult to express in words, it’s a matter of singing’ (ibid.). Nayan Ghosh described it thus: ‘Shri has a more direct attack on the Pa from Re… You see the height because you’re going up the scale, like one peak to another peak’ (ibid.). There can be an association between this rise from Re to Pa and metaphorical ‘rising’ to a ‘high’ position and status, a position of ‘strength’ and ‘virility’ represented by Pa (Leante 2009, 190). Leante describes a ‘web of potential meanings somehow associated with ideas of “authoritativeness”, “devotion”, “separation”, “sunset” and “being in a high location” from which individual musicians draw in various ways to build their own image of the rāg’ (ibid., 192).

Another association with this rise is of hope, during a time of separation, of return, as in the sun rising again the next day (ibid., 191–2). The rise from Re to Pa is said by Viswanath Shirodkar to ‘suggest the sun’s promise to come back…. the rāg is saying it’s alright because the sun will come back in the morning’ (Clayton and Leante 2009). The particular role of komal Re in this motif is described by Pratuysh Banerjee as ‘really tentative, preparing you for something, you are not sure what this is heading for, but the rāg really opens up and the full emotion of the thing opens up when you play [Re to Pa]’ (Banerjee quoted in Leante 2009, 198).

A different aspect of Shri’s komal Re is brought out by Umakant Gundecha: ‘kosal Rishabh has a very, very special character. Re is a very bright Re [hands opening up]. Of course it has a very special position [very low]…. [It is] very complex and difficult’ (Clayton and Leante 2009).

When played in the high octave it is described by Vijay Koparkar as very affective: ‘We have a feeling on our skin, a tingle’ (ibid.). Leante quotes two musicians, guitar player Debasish Bhattacharya and singer Chiranjib Chakraborty, as relating the low Re to high Re rise in devotional terms: to Bhattacharya low Re is Radha at the feet of Krishna, high Re is ‘her cry for the separation… emphasis[ing] the octave interval Re–Re’; to Chakraborty this interval is ‘chanting in front of God’ and aspiration: low Re associated with himself, and high Re with ‘what I am visualizing’ (Leante 2009, 194–5).
Jairazbhoy considers *komal* Re in raga *Shri* to have a strong role as a leading note, due to the non-symmetric placement of *vadi* and *samvadi*, that is the augmented fourth interval between them. *Komal* Re is a ‘leading note in terms of both melodic and inherent dynamic function, and thus needs resolution even more strongly. The tension of this leading note is accentuated by the use of suspense as illustrated in an example taken from Bhatkhande, where the melody continually lingers on *komal* Re (Figure 1.25): ‘Resolution is often withheld for fairly long periods, thus placing emphasis on the Db [Re], and it is this sense of restlessness that is characteristic of *Shri rāg*’ (Jairazbhoy 1972, 78).

![Figure 1.25 Bhatkande Shri (Jairazbhoy 1972, 79).](image)

The descending aspect of raga *Shri* is also reflected in comments of sitar player Subroto Roy Chowdhury who says that, for him, the descending Pa to Re is crucial, creating tension and ‘suppressed desire’ (Clayton and Leante 2009).

Singer Ritwik Sanyal talks of a ‘pulling of the *Rishabh* from the *Pancham* [5]’ (quoted in Leante 2009, 199), stressing that the character of the raga only emerges in this ‘pulling down’, the main focus being Re, with Pa as its support: ‘All the other notes get merged in the *Rishabh*’ (ibid.). Vijay Koparkar describes the fall from Pa to Re as giving a ‘feeling of surrendering…. It is very affective, total surrender’ (Clayton and Leante 2009). This emphasis on the arrival on *komal* Re rather than the departure fits well with the status of Re as *vadi* and Pa as *samvadi*.

Many of the images of raga *Shri* are related to the word *Shri* itself, a term to describe an honourable deity or man: seriousness, virility, heroism and beauty. The special nature of *komal* Re and Pa also play a vital part in the mood creation, *komal* Re being very flat above the Sa and relating by an augmented fourth to Pa. These draw associations of tension and restlessness to the descriptions of the raga.
Raga Basant

Another raga from the same thaat (raga family) is raga Basant, meaning Spring, related to the joyful, playful period of the holi festival (Bor 1999, 30) (Figure 1.26).

![Figure 1.26 Basant ascent and descent (Bor 1999, 30).](image1)

Raga Basant may be very ‘light’; Pa is almost absent, and there is no lingering on Re. Daniélou describes raga Basant as expressing the ‘feminine aspect of spring’ and indicates that ‘Ma and Re are very womanly and delicate’ (Daniélou 1980, 350). Roy sings raga Basant (Figure 1.27) and asks ‘Now how will you categorise this komal Rishabh in rāg Basant? It is not sad. It’s a very complex mechanism, rāg doesn’t come to you on demand’ (Roy interview 2011).

![Figure 1.27 Roy singing raga Basant (interview 2011). CD 1 track 11: 0.00–0.20.](image2)

This contrasting of ragas highlights the relevance of the treatment of notes, beyond their mere presence in a raga. Within some ragas there may be no particular stress on the komal Re, and it may have little effect on the character of the raga.

Later dusk raga Marva

Raga Marva also has komal Re as vadi, but now shuddha Dha as samvadi (Figure 1.28), giving an augmented fifth or diminished fourth interval between these important notes.

![Figure 1.28 Raga Marva ascent and descent (Khan interview 2008).](image3)
The general movement, unlike the rising of Shri’s Re–Pa phrase, is always ‘going down’ (Khan interview 2008) (Figure 1.29).

![Figure 1.29 Khan singing falling phrases in raga Marva (Khan interview 2008). CD 1 track 12: 0.20–0.33.]

Marva is played after sunset, and the feelings of descent into night are described as being stronger than in raga Shri. Chaterjee said:

[It is] one of my favourite ragas…. There are so many ragas of the evening time, of the transition point from day to night…. I don’t know why Marva is so special…. The sun has already set, the last glow to be gone…. There is a lot of pain associated with these [evening] ragas, the tiredness, maybe, after the day’s work…. Dressed like a hermit… the colour of the sunset, the colour of the suffering of the poet. Sunset is black, orange and red…. [What is so special is some] sinister feeling, [the] felling of ego, the boldness and that barrenness along with the pathos, very subjective. (Clayton and Leante 2009)

Viswanath Shirodkar said that ‘komal Re will give you a feeling of depression, you kind of become sad…. [This is] at 6.30 to 7 o’clock in the evening when you get home. You don’t get that feeling of depression in the rāg Shри’ (ibid.).

The concept of pain is extended to separation: ‘Haunting music, something has happened to us, and we feel pain…. Marva is a sad raga, we can say… “leave me alone”, then you listen [to] Marva…. You feel in Marva pain, pain from here, someone’s broken your heart’ (Prajakati interview 2011). It is also connected to the sinister, as Chaterjee says: ‘There is some sinister feeling in raga Marva I personally feel, this is very personal. Perhaps it was used in a horror film’ (Clayton and Leante 2009). 14

Shrivastav describes the character of Marva in relation to komal Re, bringing out a very different association:

Marva is a lower octave raga, you don’t have to go very high, and it’s a very, very relaxed feeling. Yet the three notes Ni to Re and then Sa create such a tension: Re is very special here, you bring from Ni to Re and create tension, then you relax on Sa or Dha, a bluesy aspect. I love it, it is very relaxing, it’s the end of the day, you’re going to relax, chill out, the work’s tension is finished, and your partner, your lover is coming, you want to relax, in front of the box maybe. (Shrivastav interview 2008)

14 See chapter five for comment on the horror film to which Chaterjee refers.
All the descriptions that I have come across agree on the importance of komal Re to the character of Marva as serious or dignified. Chaterjee said that ‘the shruti of Re is higher compared to others; this gives it a dignified personality. Not a young man, nothing frivolous: grave, calm, solemn, dignified. You are awestruck, respecting and keeping a distance’ (Clayton and Leante 2009).

Phrases often linger on Re, and movement from Re to Ni or Dha is common (Figure 1.30, Nos. 1, 2, 3, 5); the tonic Sa is frequently avoided or withheld. Many phrases will rise only to Ni, ending on Dha Ni, or pass to the high Re (Figure 1.30, No. 4). Even at the end, Sa often subsides to Dha (Figure 1.30, No. 6). Chaterjee described the effect of this evasion:

When you do come to the Sa it becomes a very special location, especially when approaching the high Sa. Almost there, going to the Dha–Ni–Re then not to the Sa. It creates a tense expectation for the Sa.... For the audience ‘When will he get there?’ When it finally comes it is heart-shattering experience.... Ni and Re [are used] mainly to create this [experience]. (ibid.)

For Ghosh there is loneliness in the elusive nature of Sa:

There is always something and before you take it, it goes away.... Each time as Sa comes back you think ‘Oh I have got what I'm looking for’. The absence of Sa in Marva gives you a sense of loneliness. All the other notes are there but still you feel a kind of an unrest in your mind. (ibid.)

These comments are coherent with the above discussion on twilight. Arvind Parikh, however, does not associate Marva with evening and has a description of the effect of komal Re as of a bottled-up tension, related to gender:

Marva is the bottled grief of the male... Re is not going from Sa it is going from Dha or Ni and then you wait on Re... the intensity of that male grief. You are avoiding Sa and then you have a sense of relief, that’s the feeling... The implication of komal Re is very strong. (Parikh interview 2011)

When played unornamented in the low octave, raga Marva has been described as giving ‘a positively gloomy and despondent mood’ (Goswami 1995, 39). Raga
Puriya Dhanashri and raga Sohini (a pre-dawn raga) contain the same pitches. Chaterjee said ‘We have two other ragas with the same notes: Puriya and Sohini.... It really astonishes me how two ragas with the same notes but different stresses become so different in mood’ (Clayton and Leante 2009). Puriya Dhanashri (another dusk raga, Figure 1.31) is low, and serpentine, without ‘the positive gloom’ of Marva, although still ‘serious and contemplative’ (Goswami 1995, 39). The typical evasion phrases of Ni–Re and Re–Ni are absent.

Sohini, as an early morning raga, has a very different character. Parikh still considers Sohini to be full of pathos:

The pathos of the male is Marva and pathos of the female is Sohini: it is an outburst, the women’s outburst.... In Sohini you don’t wait long on Re, you are waiting on Sa. Sa is the most prominent note in Sohini.... The female is not able to sustain its grief, its sound screams, while the male is supposedly (though I don’t think that it’s correct to say it), they are able to sustain their grief. (Parikh interview 2011)

Again the importance of motif and stress is accentuated. Marva gains much of its character from komal Re not resolving to Sa. Other ragas with the same notes but different vadi, samvadi and note treatment may render komal Re insignificant in mood creation.

The komal Re of Shri and Marva are treated very differently, one played flatter, the other sharper, one ornamented, the other not. Arguably there is no connection between the komal Re in these two ragas, yet komal Re is fundamental to both these ragas of dusk, contributing suspense and seriousness to both.

This survey of komal Re in various ragas shows that there are rich and varied connotations for komal Re within particular ragas, while there are some common interpretations, for instance a sense of tension, when komal Re is stressed, that is resolved either by falling to the tonic or rising to Pa. In some ragas the

---

emphasising of komal Re may add to a sad or devotional connotation (e.g. Bhatiyar, Gunakri, and godhuli bela ragas). It may be a sonic emblem of the raga (Shri, Bhairav). In others it may play an important structural role at cadence points (Marva, Todi), sometimes only appearing on descent to the tonic (Bhairav, Multani). The ‘softening’ effect of a note being ‘lower than normal’ is used in raga Bhairavi where Re is often followed by komal Re. Longing and separation may be directly associated with komal Re, or may be incidental to the note but a general connotation of a raga (Lalit, Todi). Other connotations of komal Re include a ‘helpless collapse’ toward Sa (Gauri), ‘powerful’ cadential strength, spiritual delight (Bhairav), meditative hope (Shri), and frustrated desire (Shri, Marva). Each raga, regarded holistically, gives komal Re its own ‘personality’, with a wealth of variations as laid out here.

Conclusion
North Indian classical musical traditions thoroughly incorporate the $b2$. It is a common choice for the second pitch degree in a raga, and features in a high proportion of performances. Komal Re ($b2$) is often regarded as particularly expressive, partly because of its movability, partly its closeness to Sa. Associations are always tempered by context, with no mechanistic way in which one note can be seen to create mood directly. However, komal Re is variously associated with pathos, wrath, power, tension and relaxation, described as sad, beautiful and relaxing. These different interpretations may co-exist within the same moment.

Komal Re and komal Dha define ragas deemed suitable to be played at twilight, sandhi prakash, and generally do not appear at other times (with notable exceptions). Twilight is a very important time culturally in North India, bringing particular associations of prayer, change and tension to these two notes. There is precision of meaning for different twilight ragas and a plethora of interpretations, with different subtleties for dawn and dusk. Within each sandhi prakash raga, komal Re is treated very differently, creating different moods within the context of Sandhi time.

In some ragas komal Re is a regular note, usually passed through at cadences, but not important in mood or identity-forming. However, some of the central and
most popular ragas emphasise komal Re: Bhairav, Gujari Todi, Shri and Marva. Within these ragas komal Re is vital to raga identity and mood creation.

This complex picture of connotations for the♭2 is unique to North Indian classical music. The tradition’s separation from Western influence, apart from in its theoretical writings, leaves a strong example of the use of this note as a highly nuanced element of musical composition, each piece creating its own meanings for the♭2(s). The exploration of melody creates whole worlds, personalities and journeys in melodic interpretation, where the♭2 is a common pitch choice.
2 ‘Touched by the Maqākam’: The Flat 2 in Mediterranean Genres

This chapter highlights the use of the flat 2\textsuperscript{16} in the wide field of modal music of the Mediterranean. It focuses on the functional role of the ♭2 and the connotations of ‘emotionality’, both inside and outside of the Mediterranean traditions. It will further some of the themes set out in chapter one, such as the leading note role of the ♭2, associations of sadness and/or power, particular uses of ‘lower than normal’ and motifs involving the ♭2. All the genres discussed in this chapter have developed within countries that have been under the dominion of either (or both) the Arabian or Ottoman Empires.

The Arabian Empire brought classical Arabian music to Western Europe, in Spain and Sicily. This classical musical tradition uses families of maqamat (plural of maqam), pitch systems that are, like Indian raga, halfway between scales and tunes, and include characteristic phrases that define them. The flat 2 has a significant presence in these maqamat, as in the Arabian Hijaz maqam that is defined by its 4–3–♭2–1 tetrachord.

The Arabian musical tradition is reflected in Ottoman makamlar (plural of makam), comparable to maqamat but with slightly different names and notes and with different performance practices. There are many commonalities between the pitch systems of these two classical musics due to historical connections (see 2.1). For instance the Ottoman Hicaz makam has a similar pitch set to the Arabian Hijaz maqam, and from hereon I will couple them as Hijaz/Hicaz maqam/makam when discussing the Arabian and Ottoman traditions together.

The musical traditions of the Arabian and Ottoman Empires have left many traces in the countries of their dominion. Influences from maqam/makam ‘pervade most forms of art and vernacular music in the Arab and Turkish world’ (Manuel 2006, 96). Manuel, writing about the Ottoman Empire, says:

\begin{quote}
The extended Ottoman Turkish rule exerted considerable musical impact and served [in some ways] as a culturally unifying force at different periods and in different regions. Ottoman domination took distinct forms, ranging from
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{16} In this chapter I often use the term flat 2 rather than ♭2 as the latter means a specific microtone in Ottoman makam, a note that is 4/9 of a tone above the tonic. In Arabian and Ottoman art music there are a variety of symbols for the flat 2. Flat 2 thus refers here to any flattened 2 whether of size four, five or eight komas, where a koma is a 1/9 of a tone.
direct colonial rule, to nominal suzerainty, to rule through foreign intermediaries. Yet despite these differences, Turkish music appears to have influenced secular musical practices to some degree throughout the areas under Ottoman control. (Manuel 1989, 76)

Within vernacular forms, the *maqamat/makamlar* develop simplifications and variations and are often referred to as modes. For instance the Phrygian mode, defined by its $4\flat 3\flat 2\flat 1$ tetrachord,\(^{17}\) is used widely in Andalusia and the Balkans and is very similar to several classical *maqamat/makamlar* (Boyd 1987, 314). Also, the fifth mode of the harmonic minor, known variously as Phrygian Major/Phrygian Dominant in flamenco, Freygish/Ahava Raba in Ashkenazi Jewish klezmer, or *Hizas* in Greek *dromos* (the Greek modal system) is comparable to *Hijaz/Hicaz maqam/makam*. The emotional language constructed around the classical Arabian and Ottoman *maqamat/makamlar* has also ‘touched’ these genres.

I discuss the prevalence and the structural and emotional importance of the flat $\hat{2}$ in various traditional and vernacular genres from the Mediterranean area, including classical Turkish and Arabian music, Turkish pop, Balkan, Jewish, Gypsy and Andalusian traditions. Each of these diverse cultures and genres has a strong sense of identity and, often, a nationalistic attachment to the music. Drives for modernity, for instance in Turkey and Greece, conflicts such as in the former Yugoslavia and Palestine, and issues of identity relating to displacement and diasporas all influence the musical works discussed here. I needed a term to encompass all these genres, and decided to use the phrase ‘touched by the *maq[k]lam*’ as it conveys origins in either the Arabian or Ottoman art traditions, while accepting change and development in individual genres.

In the first half of this chapter I begin by introducing each tradition separately, with a brief indication of its relevance to the flat $\hat{2}$. I then introduce the *maqamat/makamlar* pitch system with its particular use of microtones and pitch changes around cadences. I discuss the prevalence of prominent modal families that use the flat $\hat{2}$, namely the ‘Hijaz-type’ and ‘Phrygian-type’, and describe the wide use of the flat $\hat{2}$ in cadential motifs. The first half of the chapter ends with a discussion of the effects of harmonic innovations in popular music practice since

---

\(^{17}\) I use the symbol $\flat 3$, $\flat 6$ and $\flat 7$ throughout this chapter as distinctions between degrees of flatness of 3 and 7 are not important for your analytical purposes.
the nineteenth century. These include the use of oscillating chords and new ‘modal’ harmonies.

The second half of this chapter discusses the emotional connotations and associations connected with the flat 2 within these genres. Often the music of these genres is described, from both internal and external standpoints, as ‘emotional’, and I ask whether the flat 2 holds a special position in these constructs of emotionality. I explore commonalities and differences between the genres through analysis, literature and interview, finding connotations of spirituality, nostalgia, yearning, melancholia and joy. I ask whether an awareness of musical difference between ‘East’ and ‘West’ contributed to changes in musical practice, through an emphasis or avoidance of the flat 2 in respect to feelings of national identity.

This chapter indicates a wide role in Mediterranean traditions for the flat 2 in melodic cadence, reinforced by the development of harmonic cadence. The flat 2 also supports broad emotional expression including interpretations based on the use of microtonal variation. Moreover, these traditions engage widely with global musical practice and frequently maintain the flat 2 as an identity marker.

2.1 Overview of musical traditions

This introduction to the musical traditions of the Mediterranean will set out historical connections and differences that may influence the use and connotations of the flat 2 as it appears in these traditions. Although the Arabian Empire and the Ottoman Empire were very distinct from one another, they are drawn together here through their shared use of comparable maqamat/makamlar.

The Arabian Empire and its influence in Spain

The Arabian Empire, during the seventh to the thirteenth centuries, covered the countries of the Middle East, Central Asia, North Africa, Spain and Sicily. Its centre was first in Arabia, and later in Istanbul and in Cordoba in Spain (Touma 1996, xix, 9–11). Hijaz, a region in Arabia gave its name to the best-known Arabian family of maqamat. Another family of maqamat, the Kurd maqamat, was named after the Kurdish nation in East Anatolia. Both of these families of maqamat, as well as others, contain the flat 2 and have been very influential in the sound of Arabian music.
The Arabian centre in Cordoba, in Andalusia, Spain, lasted for eight hundred years, and was central to Arabian musical development. Much has been written about the influence of Arabian music on the traditions of later Spanish music, in particular Andalusian folk music and flamenco, together with other influences, including those from Jews, Christians, and Gypsies (Cunningham and Pelinski 2001, 139; Manuel 1989, 71–5; Menocal 2002; Paetzold 2009, 218). The flat 2 appears in Spanish folk music up to the present century, influenced by the ongoing presence of Morisco workers, half a million of whom continued to live in Spain after the expulsions, with ‘Moorish echoes’ retained particularly in rural areas. Flamenco music emerged in the early nineteenth century in Andalusia, primarily amongst the Gypsy community (Farmer 1930, 271). Flamenco is attached emotionally and musically to the Arabian and Andalusian past and has a significant and stressed flat 2 presence. Whether this presence derives from the Moorish heritage or is attributable to the presence and practice of Gypsy musicians in Andalusia, with Indian roots, the connections to maqamat are strong (Paetzold 2009, 218; Manuel 1989, 74). Sephardic Jews and Gypsies who lived and worked alongside the Moors in Spain transmitted elements from Arabian music throughout Europe.

The Ottoman Empire and its influence

After the demise of the Arabian Empire, many of the same countries came under the control of the Ottoman Empire, which lasted from 1299 to 1923. The rich musical heritage of the Arabian Empire deeply influenced the cultural practice within the Ottoman Empire, in particular Turkey, the Balkans and Greece. Istanbul was the centre of the Ottoman Empire, and ‘Ottoman art music’ became synonymous with ‘Turkish classical music’, which lasted until the twentieth century. After the disintegration of the Ottoman Empire there was an official restriction on Ottoman music in Turkey, regarded as not fitting into the modernistic aspirations of the new socialist regime. One of the consequences of the resulting radio ban on Ottoman music was that Turkish people began listening to Arabian radio, principally broadcasting from Egypt. New popular and urban styles developed from this encounter including Arabesk, many of the stars of which were Kurds from Eastern Turkey, with Arabian maqamat widely used.
(Stokes 1989, 30). Turkish folk, classical and pop music has an overwhelming presence of the flat ₂.

Ottoman rule left many footprints in the Balkans. Colonial domination lasted for hundreds of years in some countries, lasting into the twentieth century. The Yugoslav wars from 1991–2001 affected musical attachment to the Ottoman heritage, with some countries trying to create a distance from Ottoman influence, which was seen as ‘foreign’. Other countries embraced the Ottoman heritage, for instance Macedonia, Kosovo and Bosnia, which have a prominent presence of the flat ₂ in their traditional repertoire. I met Bosnian accordionist Merima Ključo in Amsterdam after hearing her speak on BBC radio 4 on the flat ₂ and sevda. Ključo described the Bosnian folk style sevda which features the flat ₂, as influenced by Ukrainian, Greek, Romanian, Gypsy, Sephardic Jewish and Ottoman Turkish music, merging in the ‘cross-cultural melting pot of Balkan towns’ (interview 2011). The folk song of Bosnia has itself been very influential within the other countries of the former Yugoslavia: ‘The [slavic] descendants of European and Asian slaves’ unburden the pain of their ‘collective suffering’ through this ‘melancholic’ sevda music (Longinović 2000, 628–9).

Much of the dromoi in popular Greek ‘café music’ was closely related to the Ottoman makamlar, and Greek rebetiko music developed from this tradition. Pennanen writes that there were rough equivalents to Ottoman makamlar, with similar compositional rules, but like Ottoman popular songs, melodies of the café style did not always follow the classical makam rules (1999, 77, 81). New variations of names appeared: Hitzas, Oussak, and Kiourdi, which are very popular in urban and folk music, all still using the flat ₂, but often with modernising elements such as fixed-fret instruments and chordal accompaniment, as with the use of the bouzouki in rebetiko music (Pennanen 1999, 82–3).18

**Transient Mediterranean and Eastern Europe communities**

The flat ₂ also appears strongly in the music of transient communities of Gypsies and Jews, who live, or have lived, in all the regions discussed here. Jewish and Gypsy musicians worked throughout Eastern Europe, at weddings and other

---

18 When referring to music played on fixed-fret or keyboard instruments I will use the symbol ♭ for the semitone interval.
entertainment events and their repertoires often overlap at these occasions (Manuel 1989, 89). Along with any musical characteristics brought forward through their own history by Gypsy and Jewish people, musicians also picked up musical characteristics from wherever they were living. These interchanges influenced popular musical practice, and these two ethnic groups also brought the flat 2 wherever they settled (e.g. Romania, Poland, Russia).

The Spanish Gypsy influence on the development and practice of flamenco has been mentioned above in relation to Andalusia. However, there were also established Gypsy communities in Turkey, the Balkans and Hungary since the fourteenth century. The composer Bartók attributed the use of the Hicaz makam and other ‘Oriental’ modes within Hungary to the practices of Gypsies, rather than to the brief Ottoman presence in Hungary (Bartók 1997, 191–2). Balint Sárosi, writing on Hungarian Gypsy music, attributes the presence of the distinctive augmented second interval between flat 2 and 3 in the Hicaz makam to the local traditional music (1970, 35). Partly due to Bartók’s influence, the Hicaz and other modes containing the augmented second interval remain today primarily in Gypsy music.

Sephardic Jews arrived in Turkey and the Balkans in large numbers after their expulsion from Spain in 1492, bringing influences from the Moors. Writing of the Mediterranean area Manuel suggests that

the presence of Jewish professional secular musicians (klezmorim) throughout Eastern Europe also appears to have functioned as an agent of musical homogeneity. Jews constituted an international community present in all the countries in question here, and Jewish musicians tended to serve as conduits for the transmission of stylistic features and musical genres. (Manuel 1989, 76–7)

The Ashkenazi Jews of Eastern Europe developed instrumental wedding dance music known today as klezmer. The particular characteristics of klezmer music are a combination of local musical influences and cantorial style, due to its function within the religious service of marriage (Idelsohn 1944, 24). The modes used in klezmer are sometimes named after, and used in, cantorial prayers, as in the popular Ahava Raba mode, also known as Freygish, which is comparable to the Hicaz makam, defined by its 4–3–♭2–1 tetrachord (Knapp interview 2009).
From the analysis contained in these individual areas, what has become clear is that these different traditions are deeply ‘touched by the maq[k]am’ and that the flat $\hat{2}$ is a vital ingredient in their music. These details inform the following discussion, indicating some of the variety that influences musical practice in Mediterranean countries. The next section explores how widely the flat $\hat{2}$ is used in these traditions.

2.2 The prevalence of the flat $\hat{2}$ in Mediterranean genres

Within the classical Arabian and Ottoman traditions, maqamat/makamlar containing a second scale degree that is flatter than a major second (sometimes by microtones) represent a sizeable proportion of the most performed repertoire. Four of the eight most common families of Arabian maqamat have a flat $\hat{2}$: Bayati, Hijaz, Kurd and Sikah, as does the important maqam Saba (Touma 1996, 37). I interviewed Syrian ney player Louai Alhenawi during his summer school on Arabic music at SOAS, he reported that some maqamat are used more often, and in particular ‘Kurd is used a lot in folk, particularly in Kurdish area... in 70% of pop to give a folksy sound’ (Alhenawi interview 2011). The situation is comparable in Turkish classical music with over half of makamlar having a flat $\hat{2}$ (Signell 1977, 35). I interviewed violinist, and music lecturer at Istanbul’s Balikesir University, Cahit Baylav, when we both worked at a London college. Baylav consulted what he called the ‘standard’ tunes book of notated art songs, Türk Halk Müziinden Seçmeler (TRT Müzik Dairesi Bakanlı 2001) and calculated that approximately 80% of the tunes in this popular edition were based on makamlar that contained a flat $\hat{2}$ (Baylav 2008), revealing that more songs are written and performed in these makamlar due to their popularity.

In klezmer, Moishe Beregovsky and Mark Slobin mention Ahava Raba, with its flat $\hat{2}$, as being used in 25% of all klezmer tunes (1982, 195–6). This is comparable in my own survey from the standard reference book on klezmer music The Compeat Klezmer (Sapoznik and Sokolow 1987), and two other notation books of klezmer (Cravitz 2008; Wolfgram 1997) where over a third have a flat $\hat{2}$. Within general Yiddish folk song of Eastern European origin published in six anthologies by song collectors Ruth Rubin, Eleanor and Joseph Mlotek, and Aharon Vinkovetzky, Abba Kovner, and Sinai Leichter, the
prevalence is lower, though still a significant proportion: the average proportion of tunes using a flat 2 is 12.5%, though the proportion within lullabies is higher, around 20% (Rubin 1964, 1965; Mlotek and Mlotek 1972, 1988, 1995), and 40% in Vinkovetzky, Kovner and Leichter (1989). In Greek urban music, of the seven most often used dromos families, four use the flat 2 (Pennanen 1999, 26–7). Manuel notes the prominence of the Hitzas dromos, which has a flat 2 in roughly 11% of a sample he took of Greek folk songs, noting that it is widespread in rebetiko (Manuel 1989, 82). The Oussak dromos, another mode with a flat 2 is also very widespread (Pennanen 1999, 82).

Table 2.1 is an overview of the popular ‘families’ of maqamat/makamlar that contain a flat 2, with some of their folk and popular equivalents. Maqamat/makamlar are defined by the two tetrachords (or sometimes trichords) that make up the mode. Families of modes are defined by the first of these tetrachords. The percentages are speculative estimates of the proportion of flat 2 pieces in the popular repertoire, based on my research here.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tradition</th>
<th>Modal system</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>First tetrachord/trichord</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arabian</td>
<td>maqam</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>1-♭2-3-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottoman</td>
<td>makam</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>Hijaz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek</td>
<td>dromos</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Hitzas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gypsy</td>
<td>mode</td>
<td>'Gypsy scale'</td>
<td>Phrygian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish</td>
<td>mode</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Ahava Raba/Freygish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>flamenco</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>Phrygian Major/</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

19 See section 2.5.1 for more on lullabies.
20 The point of including these statistics is to demonstrate general prevalence of the 2 in these genres, in contrast to within, for instance, German folk melodies where the 2 is the least common pitch degree (Huron 2006, 148–9).
21 See Table 2.2 for an explanation of these symbols.
From the above accounts of the proportion of flat 2 use within these genres, I argue a high prevalence of the flat 2. At times the flat 2 may be in a minority of the music but is seen as particularly important within the culture, for instance in klezmer. At other times, as in Turkish classical music, it is a vital ingredient of the genre’s sound palette.

2.3 Use of the flat 2 in specific Mediterranean genres

As previously described, the traditions of classical Arabian maqamat and the equivalents of makamlar in Turkey, and dromos in Greece, have a common heritage, with names of individual modes often shared amongst these traditions. This music was transmitted orally until the twentieth century, resulting in many variations between countries and, indeed, within traditions. One important difference between Arabian and Turkish traditions is the nature of the exact interval between the tonic and the flat 2, as the notes will vary by microtones, as in Indian raga. The following section looks in detail at microtonal variations in these modes in order to shed light on the complexities of the use of the flat 2 in these genres.

Microtonal variations in the use of the flat 2

In both the Turkish classical tradition and the Arabian tradition, there is reference to the ‘neutral’ 2 but these are not the same interval in each. In Turkish tradition this is an interval equivalent to a minimally reduced whole tone (8/9 of a tone), whereas in Arabian music it is a 3/4 tone, halfway between a whole tone and a semitone. In most cases of maqamat described here the Arabian flat 2 is a 3/4 tone. Within Turkish classical music there is more variation, and there is also a small semitone (4/9 of a tone), and a large semitone (5/9 of a tone). The minimal change of 1/9 of a tone is called a koma (Signell 1977, 27).

A stave-based notational system was developed indicating microtones, based on Western concepts of tonic (karar), dominant (güslü) and major and minor scales,
by three Turkish musicologists: Rauf Yekta, Subhi Arel and Sadettin Ezgi.\textsuperscript{22} Arel and Ezgi devised new notational signs for the microtones (Table 2.1). In the following discussion, where it relates to this notated music, I will use the $\flat$ symbol only to refer to the small semitone $\flat 2$ in this section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>name of interval</th>
<th>number of komas in interval</th>
<th>flat sign</th>
<th>sharp sign</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Büyük Mücennep/ neutral second/ koma bemol</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>$\flat$</td>
<td>$#$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Küçük Mücennep/ large semitone</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>$\flat$</td>
<td>$#$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bakiye/ small semitone</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>$\flat$</td>
<td>$#$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>koma</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>$\flat$</td>
<td>$\flat$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.2 Turkish notational accidentals (Atalay 2013).\textsuperscript{24}

Theory and practice differ substantially in these predominantly oral traditions. The note actually played and heard in performance can be up to two komas different from the notated pitch (Signell 1977, 37). Baylav explained that the notation is only a guide and singers perform what ‘sounds right’ in a particular piece: ‘To our brain they [the microtones] are somewhat trivial, a sort of colouring, our brain tends to change them, it’s a tradition’ (interview 2009), for instance the $\flat 2$ in the makam Uşşak is often up to 2.5 komas flatter than notated, so ‘giving it its characteristic flavour’ (ibid.). Baylav continued that the $\hat{2}$ in Turkish makamlar are significantly affected by microtonal variations. As in raga, some pitches of the scale do not change microtonally: the tonic, the fifth and usually the $\hat{4}$ are fixed, but other notes, especially the $\hat{2}$ in a ‘minor key’ or the $\hat{3}$ in a ‘major key’ are ‘fluid’ (ibid.). Baylav refers to ‘minor’ and ‘major’ makamlar, depending on whether the third degree is flattened or not (ibid.). There is a large amount of flexibility to the pitch of the $\hat{2}$ in ‘minor’ makamlar, with the

\textsuperscript{22} A parallel notation was developed for Arabian classical music.

\textsuperscript{23} Atalay <www.unfretted.com/pages/classes/makam.php> [accessed 21/08/2013].
standard being the neutral second, \( \frac{8}{9} \) of a tone in Turkish music, where it is known as *koma bemol*. ‘Minor’ *makamlar* are notated as beginning on the note A, and microtones are focused between the notes A (La) and B (Si) (Stubbs 1994, 158-160) (Figure 2.1).\(^{24}\)

![Figure 2.1 Notation of microtones between La (A) and Si (B) (Baylav interview 2009; Atalay 2013).](image)

**Microtonal shifts of the \( \frac{8}{9} \) according to melody direction**

Pitch will often vary by microtones between ascending and descending melodic lines in Turkish *makam*. Baylav said in interview that ‘there’s a general tendency to sharpen on the way up, it’s a natural tendency, but only in the ‘fluid’ area, not the tonic or dominant’ (interview 2009).\(^{26}\) To illustrate this point Baylav played *makam Uşşak* on the violin playing the \( \frac{8}{9} \) (*koma bemol*) on ascent and flattened to \( \frac{5}{9} \) on descent (Figure 2.2).

![Figure 2.2 Baylav playing makam Uşşak (interview 2009). CD 1 track 13: 0.00–0.06.](image)

Karl Signell agrees that ‘the second degree of the *makam Uşşak* will be lowered by a *koma* in the melodic environment of a cadential phrase’ (Signell 1977, 45), a microtonal flattening of the \( \frac{8}{9} \) on the descent to the tonic.

Within Arabian classical practice there are also microtonal shifts in performance and the second is pitched slightly differently in different *maqamat*, whatever the notation says. Alhenawi explained that, particularly in some *maqamat*, there are

\(^{24}\) There are connections here to a ‘Pythagorean’ scale based on C, where the \( \frac{8}{9} \) is microtonally flat and the \( \frac{5}{4} \) is sharp. ‘Minor’ *makamlar* built on A thus give the \( \frac{8}{9} \) as flat and the \( \frac{5}{4} \) as sharp. This basic formation is standard in *maqamat/makamlar* (the Arabian ‘minor’ *maqamat* start on D). Although the notation is standardised, performers play in whatever key suits their instruments.

\(^{25}\) Atalay <www.unfretted.com/pages/classes/makam.php> [accessed 21/08/2013].

\(^{26}\) This point is repeated by Owen Wright (2.3) indicating a sense of ‘naturalness’ to this movement, a ‘grounding’, with positive metaphors of falling.
microtonal changes on ascent and descent, particularly to the 2 and 6 (interview 2011). An example of this is in the Egyptian singer Oum Kalthoum’s 1935 performance of the song ‘Ala Baladi Elmahboub’ (To my dear country). This song is in Bayati maqam, which generally uses the neutral second, C2, but this becomes B2 on descent in the melodic cadences b3–b2–1 and 1–b2–b3–b2–1 (Figure 2.3).

![Figure 2.3 Oum Kalthoum, ‘Ala Baladi Elmahboub’, Tichouf Oumori [CD], 1995. CD 1 track 14: 0.00–1.06.]

Owen Wright, Emeritus Professor of Musicology of the Middle East at SOAS, explained that in Arabian music

as a general issue it would certainly be the case that there would be a tendency where a mode allows you two different realisations of the same pitch zone, named area, whatever you want to call it, they would pop for the higher one on ascent and the lower one in descent, this is a very common feature. (Wright interview 2012)

Here is, again, some intimation of the wide sense within Arabian (and Ottoman) music of a ‘natural’ falling of pitches on descent, particularly at cadences.

**Flexibility of 2 in non-classical folk and urban genres**

Within the non-classical folk and urban genres considered here, there is much less adherence to classical maqam/makam practice, and with fixed fretted and keyboard instruments the microtones are hard to maintain. Baylav describes this process in the playing of makam Ussak (CD 1 track 15). There are, however, keyboards with possibilities for microtones, and fixed pitches do not restrict singers or some other instrumentalists. Pennanen is confident that although instrumental melodies are usually played in equal temperament in Greek rebetiko (1999, 76), tending to ‘blur the exact character of some closely related makams,

27 “Ala Baladi Elmahboub” is composed by Riyadh Al-Sunbati.
the characteristic melodic shapes [are] maintained thus retaining their identities’ (ibid., 27). An example is in rebetika songs that are in makam Kürdi, where there is often a $b^2$ on ascent, returning to the $b^2$ on descent, as in the 1954 song ‘To Vouno’ by Lukas Daralas and Vangelis Prekas (Figure 2.4) (ibid., 90). Pennanen quotes ney player Yiofgos Symeonidis as attributing this to the $b^2$ being considered ‘melodically somewhat awkward in ascents but good in cadences’ (ibid.).

Without the use of microtones this practice also appears with the whole-tone $b^2$ on ascent and the $b^2$ on descent. A variant of this concept is using both the $b^2$ and the $b^2$ on descent: a ‘chromatic closing formula’ commonly used by rebetika musicians, in the Oussak dromos (Figure 2.5; ibid., 51).

These patterns of variance are also recorded within klezmer: clarinettist Michèle Gingras writes that ‘modes are not strict and almost always include flexible tones, notes which are sometimes raised or lowered, depending on the contours of the

---

28 $b^2$ here represents the semitone $b^2$, which I use when referencing urban and popular styles. This is comparable to the Western classical practice of sharpening the 6 and 7 on ascent in the melodic minor scale.
melody’ (Gingras 2013, 2). The Jewish mode *Yishtabach*, in particular, has a whole tone ♯2 on ascent and a ♭2 on descent to its cadence (Figure 2.6) (Horowitz 2006). Other klezmer modes, such as *Mogen Ovos* and *Misheberakh*, may also introduce the ♭2 for a cadential motif, producing a ‘lower than normal’ phenomenon as in ‘Der Gasn Nigun’, a klezmer tune in *Mogen Ovos* mode (Figure 2.7).²⁹ Maurice Chernik, clarinettist and band leader of London klezmer band Shir, said ‘There are quite a few tunes that have a flat ♯2 at the end, but not in the rest of it, so its used cadentially, it’s almost like the opposite of *musica ficta*:’³⁰ Jewish ficta!’ (interview 2012).

Further examples can be found within other Mediterranean traditions, as in the music of the Macedonian-born Roma Gypsy Esma Redzepova, singing ‘Romano Horo’ with a mode very similar to the Jewish *Yishtabach*, sometimes flattening the ♯2 on descent by microtones, and using a full ♭2 for the repeating chorus phrase and ending cadence (Figure 2.8). The practice of varying the ♯2 within a piece is also recorded within Spanish music that is essentially in the Arabian *Bayati maqam* (similar to the Phrygian mode) (Cunningham and Pelinski 2001, 139–40).

From these examples it is clear that microtonal flexibility remains present in the musical practice of much of the classical, popular and folk music ‘touched by the *maq[am]*’, and that there is an overriding tendency for pitches to be lowered at

---

²⁹ This ‘lower than normal’ phenomena is taken up by Huron (Huron, Yim, and Chordia 2010, 8).

³⁰ *Musica ficta* was the practice of inserting sharps or flats in performance (Rosen 1998, 113).
final cadences, whether from a ‘natural’ to a flat, or by microtones to strengthen the cadence. This vernacular tradition of lowering the 5 at cadence gives the flat 5 a unique ‘leading note’ role. The practice of introducing non-diatonic notes at cadences is familiar from Western minor scales that raise the 7 on ascent to the upper tonic: the chromatic, unexpected element strengthens the attraction to the tonic. I argue that this process can be seen reflected in the falling cadences of the Ottoman and Arabian traditions, where the 5 is flattened only at the cadence.31

Figure 2.8 Esma Redzepova, ‘Romano Horo’, *Gypsy Caravan* [CD], 2007. CD 1 track 17: 0.00–0.53.

31 Musicologist Fred Lerdahl’s theory of attraction describes how the more unexpected the note is the stronger the attraction to the stable tone (Lerdahl 1996, 361–2). Inserting a non-diatonic note into the scale, such as the ♭2, thus provides a very strong attraction to the tonic.
The Hijaz/Hzça maqam/makam

In this next section of the chapter I will establish an argument for a consistency of structural function of the falling tetrachord, or trichord, involving the flat 2 at cadential points across the traditions ‘touched by the maq[k]am’, describing similarities and differences between its use in different modes.

Of all the maqamat/makamlar, the most well known internationally is Hijaz/Hicz. The combination of the flat 2 and the ‘natural’ 3 produces a distinctive augmented second interval between them: ‘the trademark of the Hicz mode’ (Manuel 1989, 77), which has become an ‘Oriental’ signature. The family of Hijaz/Hicz all have a lower tetrachord 1–flat 2–3–4. The flat 2 is what distinguishes this Hijaz/Hicz tetrachord from the Western major scale’s lower tetrachord. Different extensions to this tetrachord make up the members of its family.

What is less well known is the microtonal position of the flat 2 in classical Hijaz/Hicz. The Turkish Hicz family of makamlar start with an interval of five komas, ⁷, the ‘large semitone’. This is followed by an interval larger than a tone, 12 komas, which in turn is followed by another ‘large semitone’ (Figure 2.9).

![Figure 2.9 Baylav playing Hicz makam (interview 2009). CD 1 track 18: 0.03–0.08, 0.16–0.19, 0.49–0.51.](image)

In Arabian classical music theory, Hijaz has its second degree as a semitone and the third degree as a major third, the interval between them thus is an augmented second playable on a fixed fret or keyboard instrument (Alhenawi interview 2011). This larger augmented second interval, also used in Hitzas and other popular styles, gives a more distinctive sound than the smaller Turkish interval. This, in turn, makes this maqam/dromos more of a ‘signature’.

Another maqam in twenty-first century Arabian practice called ‘old Hijaz’ is more similar in its intervals to the Turkish Hicz, as in the al-Andalus piece called ‘Ya Mayilah Ala-L-Ghusun Ayni’ recorded by the Al Turath Ensemble. ♫

All the sections end with a falling melodic cadence ⁴3–⁷2–1 (Figure 2.10).
Microtonal inflections in other Andalusian music, such as flamenco, may conceivably have historical connections with this al-Andalus practice.

Figure 2.10 ‘Ya Mayilah/Bali’ (Alhenawi’s transcription 2011). See also CD 1 track 19: 0.00–0.37 for a version of this tune.  

Cadential phrases in Hijaz/Hicaz are often 3–flat2–1. However another cadence is named by the eighteenth-century Turkish theorist Cantemir, the ‘suspended cadence’, also called asma karar (Signell 1977, 45–49). Aydemir and Dirikcan write that suspended cadences are ‘mostly played on the second and the third degrees depending on the structure of the makam’, and, like the equivalent Western ‘imperfect cadence’, they connote these suspended cadences as being ‘unresolved’ (2010, 26). A typical asma karar phrase in makam Hicaz comes to a rest on the flat 2, which is raised by 3 komas from its standard pitch 3\(\flat\)2 to 4\(\flat\)2 (Figure 2.11). This raising of pitch is typical of the asma karar (Signell 1977, 45).

---

32 This is not a transcription of this particular recording, as with similar examples with the annotation ‘a version of this tune’.
Thus, within Arabian and Turkish classical musics, the Hijaz/Hicaz makam/maqam has variations, and in particular the ‘characteristic’ augmented second interval is less pronounced in traditional Turkish classical music.

Hijaz/Hicaz maqam also occurs widely in other folk and urban musics that have been influenced by classical Arabian or Ottoman music, including Turkish popular and urban Gypsy music (Manuel 1989, 84). Signell describes how microtonal variations occur still in Turkish popular music: ‘Hicaz is very common in folk music and in the semi-classical style fasil, a style considered to be Gypsy influenced and often played in nightclubs. The second note of Hicaz is played sharper in fasil’ (Signell 1977, 11). The Turkish Gypsy Dance ‘Hicaz Oyun Havası’ demonstrates this use of Hicaz with microtonal shifts and use of the higher $b2$ (Figure 2.12).

Figure 2.12 ‘Hicaz Oyun Havası’. 33 CD 1 track 20: 0.00–0.55.

---


108
Manuel also notes the prominence of the *Hitzas dromos* in Greek urban music, with a particular mention of its presence in *rebetiko* (1989, 82). A famous example is the Greek *rebetiko* song ‘Misirlu’ (Figure 2.13), which uses two members of the *Hitzas dromos* family: *Hitzas* and *Hitzaskar*. The melody here is in tempered intervals that can be played on the fixed-fret bouzouki. Ključo ([radio] 2010) describes this mode as ‘what we have generally in the Balkan music’. She explains that the difference between the first tetrachord of this mode and the Western major scale is ‘only the second note, and that makes the whole rest really sounding so much different’ (ibid.). Again, the scale that Ključo describes is playable on an accordion, as in the Bosnian *sevda* song ‘Mehmeda Majka Budila’, which is built around the lower tetrachord, and the cadences are 3–flat 2–1 (Figure 2.14).

![Figure 2.13 ‘Misirlu’.](<www.youtube.com/watch?v=bsUYqF32EdU>[accessed 01/09/2013].)

---

The Jewish klezmer mode comparable to Hijaz/Hicaz is called by the Yiddish name Freygish, due to its similarity to the Phrygian mode. This mode can also be known as Ahava Raba after a Jewish cantorial prayer of the same name (Figure 2.15).

At the KlezNorth conference in Youlgrave, visiting New York Klezmer violinist Deborah Strauss said that ‘Freygish is a typical klezmer mode, defined by its flat second’ (interview 2013). Chernik expanded: ‘It’s the ultimate Jewish sound, Freygish’ (interview 2012). Strauss’ analysis considers the majority of a klezmer tune to be ornamentation, and, in relation to a Freygish tune, she describes it as having an essentially simple shape based overall on a falling trichord 3→♭2→♭1 (interview 2013). She illustrates this in the A section of ‘Beregovski’s Sher’ where the melody concentrates on F# for the first 12 bars (excepting where the Gm chord appears), then moves down to focus on E flat, where the Cm chord is used, and finally to D (Figure 2.16) (ibid., 2013).
Strauss explained that this general downward feeling is what make Freygish different to Hicaz maqam. Further to this, Strauss emphasised the importance of cadential phrases and that they need to include the $b\flat$ ‘or they don’t sound Freygish’ (Strauss interview 2013). Another example of a klezmer tune in the Freygish mode, ‘Kandel’s Hora’, has similar cadential motifs: $3–b\flat 2–1–b\flat 7–1$, and $3–4–3–b\flat 2–1$ conclude the two sections respectively (Figure 2.17).

---

Figure 2.17 ‘Kandel’s Hora’ (Sapoznik and Sokolow 1987, 50). 36 CD 1 track 23: 0.00–1.05.

Flamenco players name their equivalent to the Hijaz maqam the ‘Phrygian Major’ mode, familiar to the flamenco guitarist alongside the Phrygian mode. Paco de Fernandez’s composition ‘Mani’ (Figure 2.18), demonstrates the practice within flamenco of mixing these two modes, Phrygian Major and Phrygian, introducing a ♭3 in the second melody. Within what are known in Arabian or Ottoman practice as ‘major modes’, a flexibility around the ♭3 is very common. This variance between a ♭3 and a ⌈3 or whole tone 3 Manuel calls a ‘Phrygian tonality’, according to him a visible heritage of the Arabian Empire in Spain, citing its appearance in fandangos and other folk genres (1989, 71–5).

By drawing together these different ‘Hijaz-type’ examples I argue that, as well as being the best-known from outside, this family of modes are also very popular within the Mediterranean area. Further to this I argue that the falling tetrachord and/or the trichord 3–flat2–1, prominently used in cadential motifs in these examples, is central to melodic shape in tunes using ‘Hijaz-type’ modes, exploiting the flat 2 as a ‘leading note’. The Hijaz/Hicaz maqam/makam successfully transfers to fixed pitch instruments, where the augmented second interval between the 3 and flat 2 is particularly apparent.

36 In chord symbols the symbol ♭ refers to a semitone; the small roman numerals mean that the chord is minor. These chords are discussed in 2.4.3.
Figure 2.18 Paco Fernandez, ‘Mani’, Café Del Mar Vol. 5 [CD], 1998. CD 1 track 24: 0.00–0.54; 1.19–1.28
‘Phrygian-like’ maqamat/makamlar

Another family of modes based on the tetrachord of Ī–flat ♯2–♭3–4, familiar from the Phrygian mode, have less of a, ‘signature’ sound than the Hijaz family (lacking the augmented second interval), yet they are also very commonly used and popular in Mediterranean genres, ‘touched by the maq[am]’. Indeed, in Turkish classical music Kürdi makam, based on this tetrachord, is the most popular makam of any that contain a♭2 (Baylav interview 2009). Kürdi is considered a folk-type maqam/makam originating from the Kurdish people and is also very popular in Arabian countries, where it is known as Kurd (Alhenawi interview 2011). The Palestinian Group Le Trio Joubran’s piece called, ‘Masar’ is in Kurd maqam. This is a simple melody in two parts, each of which descends from the ♯5 to the Ī with a cadential motif using the ♭2 as leading note (Figure 2.19).

Microtonal variations in the amount of flattening of the ♯2 produce two other families of maqamat/makamlar based on the tetrachord Ī–♭2–♭3–4: Ushshaq/Uşşak and Bayati. These are also popular in art music with the ♯2 flattened by just one koma in Turkey to 8/9 of a tone, and to 3/4 tone in Arabian music (both called the neutral second, ♭2). Maqamat/makamlar containing the neutral ♭2 are often favoured by performers because of the particular nature of this microtonal difference to the whole tone. Alhenawi told me that Bayati maqam was his favoured maqam, partly because of the ‘subtlety’ of the ♭2 (interview 2011). In the Arabian tune ‘Sama’i Bayati al Raian’ (Figure 2.20) the Bayati maqam is illustrated. This is a continuous, unresting piece, with the ♭2 appearing in Ī–♭3–♭2–Ī downward runs within the first section. The chorus section meanders downwards to the final cadential motif, ♭3–♭2–Ī. Two further sections explore the maqam, each returning finally to the falling tetrachord Ī–♭3–
♭3–♭2–♭1 or trichord ♭3–♭♭2–♭1.

Figure 2.20 ‘Sama’i Bayati al Raian’ (Alhenawi’s transcription 2011). See also CD 1 track 26: 0.12–3.02 for a version of this tune. 37

The theme of restlessness continues in the example of Baylav singing in Uşşak makam (Figure 2.21). The first phrase ends with the melodic cadence 4–♭3–♭♭2, another example of the asma karar (suspended cadence), while cadential motifs ♭3–♭♭2–♭1–♭♭1, and ♭3–♭♭2–♭1–♭ ♭1 occur later.

Figure 2.21 Baylav improvising on Uşşak makam (interview 2009). CD 1 track 27: 0.02–0.23, 0.30–0.35.

37 Farhan Sabbagh, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mZzAu3MQCa4> [accessed 27/03/2014].
There are two more maqam/makam families, each unique and complicated in different ways, connected to the asma karar and the flat ˥. First is the Saba family, built from a tetrachord of ₁–♭₂–♭₃–₄ (Figure 2.22). The Turkish Saba makam has a characteristic motif, with an asma karar. This is significant in the discussion of the flat ˥ as, although the asma karar occurs to some degree in all makamlar, there are different amounts of emphasis and different notes used for the suspension. This is part of the signature of the makam. Signell analysed three typical solo phrases in makam Saba and identified the asma karar ending on the ♭₂ in all of them (Signell 1977, 62–5).

![Figure 2.22 Saba maqam/makam (Racy 2004, 99; Signell 1977, 62).](image)

The continual practice of ending on an asma karar on the ♭₂ in Bayati maqam/makam possibly resulted in the formation of the Sikah/Segah family (Alhenawi interview 2011). The ♭₂ is taken as a new tonic, making a new maqam/makam based on this note (Figure 2.23). In this setting the once flexible ˥ is no longer moveable as it is the tonic, ₁, and the second degree is five komas, a ‘large semitone’, above it i.e. a new ♭₂ (Baylav interview 2009). Baylav played a cadential phrase in makam Sega, where the tonic is B♭ and the ♭₂ is C; the cadence is D–C–B♭ (Figure 2.24).

![Figure 2.23 Alhenawi playing Sikah on the ney (interview 2011). CD 1 track 28: 0.09–0.16.](image)

![Figure 2.24 Sega cadential phrase (Signell 1973, 129).](image)

Turning to Balkan urban traditions there can be a simpler picture. For instance in Greece the dromos with the tetrachord ₁–flat ˥–♭₃–₄ is called Oussak, and in rebetiko this dromos may contain melodies in makamlar Kürdi, Uşşak, Bayati or Hüseyni. ‘In the equal-tempered system of the bouzouki tradition the intervallic differences between these makams are largely blurred. ‘Dromos Oussak’ has
come to denote a classificational category of melodies and scales with predominantly a flat second degree’ (Pennanen 1999, 82).

On a fixed-fret instrument like the bouzouki, variations between ascending and descending lines coming from the microtonal traditions can be translated to semitone shifts (as noted in 2.3.3). This is illustrated by bouzouki player Nikolopoulos, soloing on the track ‘Perpiniadis’ (Figure 2.25). Most cadential phrases use the♭2 as leading note, although the whole-tone 2, F#, also appears in the melody. This illustrates how the nuances of the pitch of the 2 between rising and falling melodic lines continue into urban genres in Greece as semitone shifts. This is akin to the changing rising and falling flat 2 displayed in the Macedonian tune ‘Romano Horo’ (Figure 2.8).

Figure 2.25 Cristos Nikolopoulos, ‘Perpiniadis’ solo’, Bouzouki Spectacular.38 CD 1 track 29: 0.05–0.40

The Jewish klezmer mode Yishtaybach encapsulates this movement, a mode that ascends as the Aeolian mode (Mogen Ovos), and descends as the Phrygian (Figure 2.6) illustrated in ‘Freyt Aykh Yidelekh’ (Figure 2.26). This practice of semitone shifts from the 2 to the flat 2 is demonstrated widely in popular and urban styles throughout the region discussed here.

Phrygian-type modes are abundant within Andalusia and Spain and the melodic cadence of $4 \rightarrow b3 \rightarrow b2 \rightarrow 1$ has been named the Andalusian cadence (Livermore 1972, 149). An example is a *fandango* transcribed by Manuel that has a generally descending melody (Figure 2.27), each section cadencing with the $4 \rightarrow b3 \rightarrow b2 \rightarrow 1$.

The chord sequence associated with the Andalusian Cadence often introduces a major chord on the tonic, and with it the whole-tone $3$. Paco Fernandez’s track ‘Mani’ (Figure 2.18) illustrates how this mixture of $3$ gives a link to the Hijaz *maqam* through the Phrygian Major mode. ‘Mani’ also demonstrates the Andalusian Cadence using both $b3$ and whole-tone $3$. The falling tetrachord of the Andalusian cadence, $4 \rightarrow (b)3 \rightarrow b2 \rightarrow 1$, with its flat $2$ and changing $3$, is
regarded as the defining feature of Andalusian music (Cunningham and Pelinski 2001, 139).

From this analysis I argue that the Phrygian-type mode, known for its wide use in Andalusian flamenco (often referred to as the ‘Spanish scale’ e.g. Scott 1998, 166), is also fundamental to Balkan and Arabian classical, folk and popular music. Baylav’s report that Kürdi is the most commonly used makam with a flat 2 in Turkish classical music, and Alhenawi’s estimate that Kurd is used in seventy percent of pop songs today, are evidence of this wide use. Similar to the Hijaz-type modes, these modes adapt to fixed pitch instruments by fixing the fluid flat 2 to the semitone interval. From the examples presented here I argue that the falling tetrachord 4–♭3–flat 2–1 and/or the trichord ♭3–flat 2–1 is ubiquitous at cadences, with the flat 2 as leading note. Overwhelmingly, these popular Phrygian-type modes use the falling tetrachord for the cadence, maintaining the strong structural function demonstrated in the Hijaz-type modes. Having established the prevalence of the falling motif, I now move on to examine this cadence in greater depth.

**Cadential motifs on the descending tetrachord**

All the most commonly used maqamat with a ♭2, ♭♭2 or ♭♭♭2 contain cadential motifs using that note (Wright interview 2012). Melodic motifs (sayr/seyir) characterise the maqam/makam genre and can immediately identify one maqam/makam from another (Touma 1996, 45). As with North Indian raga, they give the pieces a unique flavour or atmosphere (Stubbs 1994, 123). Although classical sayr/seyir may not be strictly followed in folk and urban musics, the presence of characteristic phrases is still strong. Pennanen writes of how, still, in the popular field ‘makam-specific melodic formulae are important for makam identification and classification’ (1999, 70).

Characteristic motifs particularly concentrate around cadences. For example, Turkish classical phrases frequently end with a cadential sayir such as 3–♭2–1–♭2–♭♭1 (Stubbs 1994, 183, 208), and Touma describes the falling ‘cadential sequence of seconds leading to the final tone’ as defining an Arabian maqam family (1996, 28, 56). Overall the practice of having a falling cadence is widespread within all the genres discussed in this chapter.
Often the whole melody generally descends, as in Le Trio Joubran’s piece ‘Masar’ (Figure 2.19), or ‘Beregovski’s Sher’ (Figure 2.16); flamenco melodies frequently start on a higher note and then fall to the tonic (Manuel 2006, 97) via the Andalusian cadence, $4\rightarrow b\flat 3\rightarrow flat 2\rightarrow 1$, as in ‘Bulerías’ performed by El Cameron de las Isla (vocal) with Paco de Lucía (guitar) (Figure 2.28).

![Figure 2.28 El Camarón de la Isla and Paco de Lucía, ‘Bulerías’, 1976.](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MmYWOUg9hgA) [accessed 01/04/2014].

In all the melodic cadences containing the flat 2 presented in this chapter, generally the final cadence arrives to the tonic by descent through the ‘upper leading note’, the flat 2. Wright agrees in respect to the Turkish and Arabian classical systems, asserting:

> The descent through the tetrachord is the crucial matter. The falling tetrachord is there whether or not there’s a flat 2 in the maqam, a descending final element. So it doesn’t matter if the beginning is rising or level or descending, the last chunk is descending. That’s it, that’s the way the system works…. If you’ve got a maqam with the minor second your cadence will virtually always make use of it, your final step is flattened second to finalis [final note]. That would be absolutely stereotypical, you would just have a stepwise descent, usually, probably through the tetrachord actually. (Wright interview 2012)

A ‘lower leading note’, the $7$, is recognised in Turkish theory, named yeden, a whole-tone, neutral tone or semitone below the tonic (Signell 1977, 48). Aydemir and Dirikcan state that the function of the yeden is to ‘make the final cadence more powerful’ (2010, 27). However, the Turkish yeden is frequently absent from cadential motifs in makamlar. Wright told me

> the yeden is totally misleading—let’s have what the West has! And of course they’re always given as the tone below the finalis... in many cases you virtually never find it in a cadence, in some you do. That’s an arbitrary generalization based on Western ideas. (Wright interview 2012)
None of the examples notated in this chapter use the major 𓊄 ‘lower leading note’ yeden at cadence points. Some use the flat 𓊄, in conjunction with the flat 2, encircling the tonic, but more than half only use the flat 2 as the cadential ‘upper leading note’. Table 2.3 displays the cadential motifs using the flat 2 and yeden occurring in these examples; the falling (𓊄)𓊄–flat2–1 is more consistent than any other motif.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>cadence</th>
<th>Arabian</th>
<th>Turkish</th>
<th>Greek</th>
<th>Yugoslav</th>
<th>Jewish</th>
<th>Gypsy</th>
<th>Spanish</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>𓊄–flat2–1</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3–flat2–1</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1–flat2–1</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flat2–𓊄–1</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flat2–1–𓊄–1</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>𓊄–flat2–1</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.3 Melodic cadential motifs in the musical examples of this chapter.

I have not found mention of this significant functional role of the flat 2 in these genres in the literature of the area. Signell, although mentioning the Western Neapolitan chord in another context, does not mention the flat 2 as a part of a cadential motif (1977, 68). In an interview Wright acknowledged it and suggested that a ‘Western’ inclination to the theoretician’s perspective might be responsible for its omission (instead introducing the yeden) (Wright interview 2012). The flat 2 in the examples presented here can be said ‘to make the final cadence more powerful’ in much the same way as the yeden, or often instead of the yeden.

From this analysis I observe that the flat 2 holds a distinct and large profile within the cadential motifs of my research material in the Mediterranean and Eastern Europe, whether as the resting point in a ‘suspended’ cadence or the ‘leading note’ leading to the tonic. The flat 2 is frequently lowered within the falling cadence, moving it closer to the tonic. I therefore argue that the flat 2 is structurally important within Hijaz and ‘Phrygian-type’ maqamat/makamlar in all the genres discussed in this chapter. The constant use of the flat 2, when present,
as a ‘leading note’ is significant, and somewhat overlooked, hence my term for it: The Other Leading Note.

2.4 Harmonic innovations in popular music
Since the nineteenth century, harmonic innovations support and sometimes replace the melodic cadential motifs in urban music ‘touched by the maq[k]am’. The innovations developed range from an ostinato, or a drone-like oscillation of bass notes under the melodies, to the introduction of full chordal accompaniment (Touma 1996, xx). This section identifies the different ways in which the development of chordal harmony emphasises and adds to the flat 2’s cadential roles. I will show that there are significant innovations and traditions within the vernacular harmony involving the flat 2.

Much has been said of an incompatibility between harmonic procedures and ‘modal’ music. For instance Baylav expressed a fear concerning Turkish classical music that perhaps half of the makamlar with flat 2s may fade from use due to the introduction, in popular Turkish music, of guitars and keyboards (interview 2009). These concerns are shared by Manuel regarding the maqamat/makamlar with ‘prominent neutral intervals’ (1989, 82–3).

Pennanen maintains (see 2.3.3) that in rebetiko, at least, there is no such loss as microtones can be retained by a singer, violin or clarinet over the tempere-accompaniment (1999, 76). In addition, the ‘signature’ sound of the Hijaz/Hicaz family of maqamat/makamlar is not threatened by the microtonal changes produced by being played on fixed-fret instruments and keyboards, as it (often) contains no microtones. The Kürdi family also ‘survives’ the loss of the microtones, as it is playable on a keyboard without substantial alteration.

Ostinato basslines using the flat 2
Harmony may be introduced in a manner that includes microtones. The ostinato is a characteristic element of classical Arabian music (Racy 2004, 116). On Le Trio Joubran’s track ‘Majâz’, in maqam Kurd, one of the three oud players plays an ostinato bass line (Figure 2.29) that uses both 2 and b2, and has a particularly strong accent on the b2 before it falls to the tonic drone.
With the introduction of the electric bass, with its frets, came accompaniment to \textit{maqâm/makâm} restricted to the fixed tones in the mode, such as the Í, and Š. Such basslines represent a strand of musical modernisation that is easily compatible with microtonally shifting melodies (Pennanen 1999, 86). Turkish guitarist Hakan Ozugurel, a colleague in Hackney educational work, told me that the bass leaves the singer, for instance, freedom to perform the ‘fluid’ notes above the fixed bass (Ozugurel interview 2009).
The bass line may also use the semitone $\flat_2$: the song ‘Olürüm Sana’ (I would die for you), by Turkish pop singer Tarkan, has several bass riffs using the $\flat_2$. The first bass riff is $1-\flat 7-1-\flat 7-1$, which later moves to $\flat 2-1$ and $\flat 4-\flat 3$. In the second

---

40 The variation in the melody on repeats is not transcribed.
section there is a driving pedal tonic note bass with each bar starting on the $b\flat 2$, then in the third section there is a riff $b\flat 2-1\hat{1}1\hat{1}1\hat{1}1$ followed by repeated $b\flat 2$, then repeated $b\flat 7$ then $\hat{1}$, ending with three cadences of $b\flat 2-1$ (Figure 2.30). These reinforce the melodic cadences of the voice above, that also emphasise the $b\flat 2-\hat{1}$.

Figure 2.31 Great conch (Livermore 1972, 5).

Oscillation between the tonic and flat $\hat{2}$ has a long tradition in Spanish music. For instance Livermore writes that to the present day there are folk music practices of ‘northerners [who] dance to the call of the great conch or horn’s notes of do, do, re flat, re flat... till they reach exhaustion’, a tradition dating back to Roman times (Figure 2.31) (1972, 5). The common use of Bayati maqam, which has a $d\flat 3$, in Spain is affected by a ‘rounding off’ to a semitone $\hat{2}$ to afford this oscillation on a fixed-fret instrument like a bass (Manuel 2006, 78, 96). In contemporary flamenco practice a bass line ostinato using $1$ and $b\flat 2$ is characteristic, illustrated in the 2002 song ‘Tiempo de Solea’ (Figure 2.32) from the Barcelona based flamenco group Ojos de Brujos. The repeated ostinato oscillates between phrases starting on D and E$\flat$, exploiting the $b\flat 2$’s established cadential role under various melodic lines.

Figure 2.32 Ojos de Brujos, ‘Tiempo de Solea’ (bassline), Bari [CD], 2005. CD 1 track 34: 0.00–1.06.

---

41 The oscillating bassline between $b\flat 2$ and $\hat{1}$, sometimes adding in $b\flat 7$ and encircling the tonic, has influenced Western music, including heavy metal, jazz and film music (see chapters four and five).
Oscillating Chords

The Ojos de Brujos bass line outlines the two major chords I and bII. The major chord on the bII would not be considered functional in Western chordal practice, and some have argued that this oscillation is more present more for colour than structural function (e.g. Manuel 1989, 90). I would suggest, however, that the bII chord performs a ‘dominant’ function just as the b2 performs a ‘leading note’ function. All the notes of the bII chord, b2, 4 and b6, add to a sense of tension which is followed by the release back to the tonic chord: 1–3–5. In the ‘Bulerias’ (Figure 2.28) there is a longer chord sequence, with melodic arpeggiation that illustrates this movement. This longer sequence IV–bIII–bII–I (Fm–E♭–D♭–C) is a hallmark of flamenco.

An alternative chord oscillation I–bvi–I is also used in flamenco, as in the track ‘Mani’ (Figure 2.18). The bvi chord, consisting of the scale degrees b7, b2 and 4, fulfills the same ‘dominant’ function as the bII, adding the b7 which, although a full tone away from the tonic, adds its own tension. The strongest note of tension remains the b2, a semitone from the tonic. I argue that these two chord sequences bII–I and bvi–I both act as dominant-to-tonic cadences, and are particular harmonic features of the Mediterranean.

Modal harmony in Mediterranean urban musics

In the urban genres discussed in this chapter, functional harmony of ‘tonic’, ‘subdominant’ and ‘dominant’ chords has developed according to the mode being used in a particular piece. Modes that have a flat 2 have the particular characteristic of being incompatible with a conventional ‘dominant’ chord, the V chord, as this chord has a whole-tone 2. The solution that is reached in Eastern Europe, Turkey and Andalusia is to devise new ‘dominant’ chords. This results in distinctive sequences that can add to our understanding of harmonic theory. Idelsohn writes of how the composer Weintraub devised a

---

[^42]: It is important to note a possible confusion in the discussion of Arabian and Ottoman music relating to the term ‘dominant’ as it also refers to a central note within a makam known otherwise as ghammez/güslü that has no role at the cadential point. The reference to ‘dominant function’ here is of a different nature, meaning essentially a tension chord.

[^43]: In Western classical music the solution was to avoid the flat 2 (see chapter three).
system of harmonisation for Jewish modes: ‘he breaks the fetters of classical harmony, and strikes out, forging for himself a new and untried path’ (1944, 482). Manuel writes on how the Hijaz/Hicaz-type modes, because of their flat 2, have thus played an important role in the generation of new harmonic sequences (1989, 76).

Manuel’s 1989 paper ‘Modal harmony in Andalusian, Eastern European and Turkish syncretic musics’ researches the vernacular harmony in a similar range of genres to this chapter, as it is also concerned with the shared heritage from Arabian or Ottoman dominion. With reference to Manuel’s findings and my own observations this section will continue to discuss these vernacular chord progressions and describe how the flat 2 plays a vital role in them.

There is much to compare between chordal practices in the countries that were under Arabian or Ottoman influence (ibid., 85) and there has been ‘a relatively consistent modal harmonic system in the countries in question’ (ibid., 75).

Manuel calls it ‘Mediterranean Tonality’ (ibid.), and discusses the implicit chord progressions in folk melodies and the appearance of harmonisation, for instance, in Greece as a ‘vogue as early as the first decades of the nineteenth century’ (ibid., 79, 80). Pennanen has named it ‘traditional harmony’ in relation to urban Greek music (1999, 70), writing of how a cadential chord progression was common by the 1950s in Greek dromos, to signal the end of sections (ibid., 105).

The ♭VII–I(i) cadence is very common in Greek dromoi that have a ‘flat or unstable second and natural seventh. The resolving power of this chord is mostly owing to the third that is situated a minor second above the final’ (ibid., 106).

Here Pennanen refers to the ♭2 and how this harmony builds on established dissonance principles. The extensive presence of the ♭2–♯1 melodic cadence illustrates a wide use here of the ♭2 for tension and release.

In the song ‘To Vouno’, in Oussak dromos (Figure 2.4) the cadential chord sequence is ♭VII–i, appearing in bars 2 and 4. Manuel transcribes an example of Oussak dromos (Figure 2.33), resulting in a longer chord sequence: i–iv–♭VII–♭III–♭vii–i. The fourth degree is an important note in Oussak so this is a natural place for a chord, and the cadential motif is supported with the ♭vii chord.

Manuel considers the whole sequence to be latent in this melody (1989, 82): each
chord fits, generally, with the first note of the bar, which becomes either the root or another chord note. The exceptions can be analysed as ‘leaning’ notes (similar to the Western appoggiatura).

![Figure 2.33 Oussak dromos (Manuel 1989, 82).](image)

Traditionally in Oussak dromos there are microtonal changes of the flat 2, and with harmonisations come concerns over the loss of these microtones. For instance, the flat 2 in a melody, when accompanied by the b² vii chord, creates a ‘clash with the chordal accompaniment’ and may precipitate ‘consistent use of either raised or lowered second by the vocalist or melodic instrument’ (Manuel 1989, 81). In practice, however, the melody instrument player often maintains the flat 2 whatever the accompaniment is playing, and this then becomes an aspect of the aesthetic. Another variation on this theme is to introduce the major bVII chord to the accompaniment, usually not at the cadence point because of the resulting loss of the flat 2 leading note (Pennanen 1999, 108). This is illustrated in Figure 2.33 with the G major chord in bar 4.

The bvi–i cadence is also popular in other Balkan music. It is implied in the movement of the bassline of the Macedonian track ‘Romano Horo’ (Figure 2.8), with the b 2 appearing strongly in the melody.

Chordal accompaniment to tunes in the Hicaz makam also uses the bvi chord, now resolving to I major. A well-known Macedonian traditional song in Hicaz makam is ‘Jovano Jovanke’ (Figure 2.34), illustrating the bvi–I cadence under the melodic cadential motif of the falling tetrachord 4–3–flat2–1. The chord sequence introduces the B♭ (b2) within the bvi chord in the accompaniment in more instances than it appears in the melody.

---

44 This is comparable to the Western classical ‘Phrygian’ cadence, though the latter is iv to V.
Within klezmer theory, the ♭vii chord is described as the ‘Ahava Raba dominant’ (Sapoznik and Sokolow 1987, 23). The klezmer tradition was built around dance music, which particularly developed instrumental accompaniment and chord use. In the klezmer tune ‘Baym Rebin’s Sude’, as in many Freygish (Ahava Raba) tunes, there are only three different chords used: I as tonic function chord, iv as subdominant function chord, and ♭vii as dominant function chord. All the cadences are ♭vii–I, the Ahava Raba cadence (Figure 2.35). Of this cadence Chernik said ‘It’s so not Western’ (interview 2012).

Figure 2.34 ‘Jovano Jovanke’ (Kampp, Larsen and Nielsen 1976). See also CD 1 track 35: 0.02–0.46 for a version of this tune.
A section
||: I | I | I ♭vii | I | I iv | I ♭vii | I | I |
   I | I | I ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | I | I :||

B section
||: iv | I | iv | iv | ♭vii | I | I iv | I | I |
   I iv | I iv | I | I | ♭vii | ♭vii | I | I :||

C section
||: iv | ♭vii | I | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | I | I |
   iv | ♭vii | I | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | ♭vii | I | I :||

Figure 2.35 Abe Shwartz Orchestra, ‘Baym Rebin’s Sude’ (Sapoznik and Sokolow 1987, 61). CD 1 track 36: 0.02–2.10.

The melodic cadential motifs are ♭7–♭2–♭7–♭1, ♭2–♭1–♭7–♭2–♭1, and the chords ♭vii–I can be said to be latent in these motifs. The harmony lingers on the ♭vii at the end of the sections, accentuating the tension before the final resolution. This typical chord sequence is also in ‘Kandel’s Hora’ (Figure 2.17). Here the melodic cadential motif at the end of the A section is ♭2–♭1–♭7–♭1, and of the B section ♭2–♭1–♭2–♭1, again implying the given chords. Strauss says that

*Freygish* has a basic ♭1–♭7 feel. Take any Freygish tune and you find the same shape. Long phrases moving through time, and the dance between these two notes, with their accompanying triad. A cadence based on ♭vii–I: minor to major, with the momentum, tight movements and semitone leading note [♭2]. (Strauss interview 2013)
The ‘Ahava Raba dominant’ chord sometimes also occurs within klezmer tunes in different modes, such as in the Yishtabach mode that descends to the tonic using the ♭2 at cadence points (Sapoznik and Sokolow 1987, 23), the resolution being to the minor tonic. This is illustrated in ‘Freyt Aykh Yidelekh’ (see Figure 2.23), and in ‘Der Gasn Nigun’ (Figure 2.7). The ‘Ahava Raba dominant’ chord may also occur in tunes in other modes, such as in the Misheberach mode.

The ♭II–I cadence is not used to any great extent in harmonisations of the Jewish Freygish mode. In this I disagree with Manuel, who writes that the harmony in klezmer music is much the same as in the Balkans (1989, 90). My observation is that there is scant use of the ♭II–I cadence within klezmer music, the favoured sequence remaining ♭vii–I. ♭vii contains both the pitch degrees ♭7 and ♭2, thus ‘encircling’ the tonic, as often does the melody, whereas the ♭II gives more strength to the ♭2 note as a bass note, and provides a major chord for the dominant role.

The chord ♭II is used to fulfil the role of ‘dominant’ in Mediterranean genres, again with iv as a subdominant chord. In Greece, since the 1960s, the cadential sequence ♭II–i has frequently been used for tunes in Oussak dromos (Pennanen 1999, 105–106), and in the cadence ♭II–I within the Hijaz/Hicaz family of maqam/makam (ibid., 78). As with the ♭vii–I cadence the ♭2 is crucial at the cadence point (ibid., 82). For instance, tunes in the Greek dromoi Hitzas and Hitzaskar are most likely to cadence on ♭II–I (Figure 2.36).

![Figure 2.36 Hitzas dromos with ♭II–I cadence (Vasili 2011, 40).](image)

‘Misirlu’, in Hitzaskar dromos (Figure 2.13), uses an ostinato bassline on the tonic and fifth as would have been used in early harmonisations of the early twentieth century. A later version (Figure 2.37), by Angelopoulos, shows how accompaniments have changed through the twentieth century, more recent harmonisations introducing the ♭II–I cadence. The ♭II–I cadence, particularly notable in the A section, is supporting a ♭♭ in the melody, providing semitone ‘leading’ tension notes below and above the tonic.
A section
\[ \text{l: I | I | } \text{♭II | I | I | :l | iv | ♭II | I | I | :ll} \]

B section
\[ \text{l: iv | iv | ♭III | ♭III | ♭II | ♭II | I | I | :l} \]
\[ \text{l | ♭viim | iv | I | I | ♭viim | ♭II | I | I | :ll} \]

Figure 2.37 Manolis Angelopoulos ‘Misirlou’. CD 1 track 37: 0.17–1.50.

In Andalusian Phrygian tonality both the ♭vii7 and the ♭II are used as ‘dominant’ chords. In the ‘Fandango de Huelva’ (Figure 2.27) the chord sequence iv–♭III–♭II–I (Am–G–F–E) resolves to a major tonic chord based on the melodic ‘Andalusian cadence’ known from flamenco, but present in Andalusian music at least since the seventeenth century in the local fandango style (Livermore 1972, 149). This sequence reflects the synthesis of the Bayati and Hijaz maqamat that are present in Andalusian music, by having a ♭III chord and a major I chord. ‘This progression functions not only as a cadential figure, but indeed as the basis of Andalusian folk music employing Phrygian tonality’ (Manuel 1989, 72). Most fandangos contain ostinato patterns with this iv–♭III–♭II–I chord sequence, also seen in Paco de Lucía’s ‘Bulerias’ (see Figure 2.28). It is also widely used in

---

45 Misirlou <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9BZ4mobFCgo> [accessed 27/03/2014].
other flamenco song forms, together with the simpler oscillation between chords I and ♭II (see 2.4.2) (ibid., 74–75).

This section has examined the introduction of triadic chordal accompaniment in Mediterranean and Eastern European genres, resulting in innovative harmonic progressions due to the use of the ♭2 as a ‘leading note’; Manuel describes these as ‘Mediterranean Tonality’ (1989, 75). The Andalusian melodic cadence becomes a chordal sequence IV→♭III→♭II→I, and the shorter sequence of ♭II→I is commonly used in the Balkans. Within klezmer music the favoured cadential sequence is ♭vii→I, containing the pitch degrees ♭7, ♭2 and 4. I argue that these chord progressions can be considered equivalent to dominant-to-tonic sequences in Western theory, in the sense in which Manuel describes the dominant chord as ‘that chord which most strongly demands resolution to the tonic’ (ibid., 72). The unfamiliarity of the ♭II and ♭vii chords within Western harmonic theory may obscure their structural relevance in these genres. These chord sequences strengthen the structural importance of The Other Leading Note, the flat 2.

2.5 Connotations and associations of the flat ♭2 in the Mediterranean

For the West the flattened second is an exotic thing but for us it’s a normal thing, we just think of it as another makam, we don’t attribute feelings to them. (Baylav interview 2009)

From the analysis in previous sections of this chapter it can be observed that the flat ♭2 is used in a significant proportion of the classical and popular music that has received an Arabian or Ottoman influence. This music ‘touched by the maq[k]lam’, despite Baylav’s insight, is often laden with emotional association and spiritual depth. The second half of this chapter will explore connotations of the flat ♭2 in Mediterranean music.

‘Ecstasy’ is the desired state of the Arabian classical performer, a state called saltanah; the Jewish Hassidic movement has ‘ecstatic’ musical practices; Bosnian sevda is considered deeply emotional music and the ‘deep song’ of

---

46 My use of ‘ecstasy’ here differs from that of Gilbert Rouget in Music and Trance. Rouget contrasts the sometimes frenetic and wild behaviour induced by music with the inner contemplation and ‘annihilation’ inspired by deep meditation, calling the musical version ‘trance’ in opposition to the term ‘ecstasy’, which Rouget reserves for a silent state (1985, 3–6).
Andalusian *duende* is said to tap depths of ‘passionate’ emotion and express the suffering of a nation (Mitchell 1994, 121). O’Connell writes of an ‘Ottoman aesthetic’ since the sixteenth century in the Mediterranean region, ‘particularly apparent in music’ (2005, 7), which has spawned urban music styles of today that mark out the countries ‘touched by the *maq[k]am*’. This section attempts to explore an Ottoman [or Arabian] aesthetic, and asks how the constructions of emotion within each culture related to the flat 2 contribute to this aesthetic.

The principal connotations that have relevance for the flat 2 have been drawn from interviews with musicians, literature reviews and lyric analyses. Many of these are general associations, while others relate to the position of the flat 2 as a ‘leading note’ in connection with metaphors of tension and falling. The connotations can be divided into three categories. Firstly there are associations of mood, ‘spirituality’ and nostalgia; secondly, emotional connotations of intensity, yearning, sadness, passion, melancholia and joy; and thirdly, emotional associations connected to nation, with resulting influences on musical practice.

**Associations of mood, spirituality and nostalgia**

Specific connotations for the flat 2 may be couched within general associations of *maqamat/makamlar* that contain the note. Stokes explains: ‘makam are often considered, in Turkey, to be ‘empty’ syntactical structures in which anything can be said in a variety of moods. This, however, would be a somewhat academic view’; in reality, mood is very much associated with different *makamlar*:

‘Though people might dispute what a given *makam* signifies, many assume that it does signify something or other’ (Stokes 2010, 52).

**Mood**

Alhenawi described his own connotations and moods for the most popular *maqamat* that contain flat 2 degrees. I summarise these here, with the addition of other voices. *Hijaz maqam*, named after a region of Arabia, is said to conjure up the desert (Sassi-Sa’aron interview 2011), distant longing, solemn, invocation (Touma 1996, 43), or a wondering atmosphere (Alhenawi interview 2011).

On the related *maqamat Kurd* and *Bayati* Alhenawi comments:

*Kurd* gives a folksy sound…. *Bayati* is very rich, my favourite *maqam*, you can play it with any mood you want: happy, sad. It’s the same as *Kurd* but
with a quartertone 4\(\frac{1}{2}\). Bayati is the richest maqam, you can have so many different effects, you can play the Bayati with a happy way, a dancey way, you can play it with the opposite: a wondering and sad way. (Alhenawi interview 2011)

*Bayati* is used for expressing gentleness, vitality, ‘light joy’ and femininity (Touma 1996, 43–4):

‘The *Saba* is associated a lot with sad moments, it’s like crying really…. A lot of warm sadness sound’ (Alhenawi interview 2011). *Saba* evokes sadness and pain (Touma 1996, 44), and the Syrian theorist Tawfiq al-Sabbagh describes it as emotional and melancholic (quoted by Racy 2004, 109).

*Sikah/ Segah maqam/makam* is associated with feelings of serious love (Touma 1996, 44) while Alhenawi says that it conveys ‘a folksy atmosphere but it has also a far-off wondering and sadness... a tense kind of thing’ (interview 2011). Al-Sabbagh describes *Sikah Arabi* as a ‘beautiful’ and ‘pleasant’ mode that can express joy, but also melancholy (quoted by Racy 2004, 109–10). The restlessness of the tonic being a ‘flexible’ note itself (see 2.3.5) can bring associations of disturbance associated with ‘melancholia’, as in relation to *Segah maqam* in Turkish classical music:

It gives a feeling of incompleteness, compared to the feeling of completeness of the major scale. But then eventually the ears get used to that melancholic thing. It’s so popular. I suppose that melancholia is popular. (Baylav interview 2009)

In sum, the *maqamat/makamlar* with a flat 2 are variously associated with emotions of seriousness, wondering, yearning, sadness, pain, melancholia, gentleness, vitality, joy, femininity and happiness.

*Maqamat/makamlar* with a whole-tone 2 also have various associations. *Maqam/makam Rast* ‘evokes a feeling of pride, power, soundness of mind and masculinity’ (Touma 1996, 44); ‘Rast is the heavy *maqam*: not really major but... heavy, serious, big, not emotional’ (Alhenawi interview 2011), and Stokes writes that the Turkish *Nihavent makam* (with natural 2 and 3) signifies melancholia (2010, 52, 55).

In any scale there is a potential for notes to be exploited in different ways:

It’s not coincidence that many sad things occur in some makams, but the opposite is not an exception. For instance *Hicaz* is usually used for sad
feelings, but you can have very lively dance-inducing music in that same makam. (Baylav interview 2009)

Although there is flexibility in these interpretations, the general understanding of maqamat/makamlar is that there are mood associations to each one, which will vary according to style, tempo and lyric. Since a large proportion of these maqamat/makamlar contain a flat 2, the flat 2 also becomes associated with the moods and emotions of each maqam/makam. I will now set out some of these associations.

**Spirituality**

Spiritual connotations of the flat 2 come from both religious and secular aspects of life. Classical maqamat/makamlar play a significant part in religious contexts and are heard in the call to prayer (azan/ezan). Scott Marcus writes that in Cairo the muezzin generally use two maqamat: Rast and Hijaz (2007, 14–15), though Racy has reported on the practice of different maqamat for different days of the week being maintained in a Cairo mosque into the early twentieth century (2004, 139). Marcus also conducted a survey in Istanbul, finding that ‘makam Saba is used for the pre-dawn call; Uşşak for the noon call; Rast for the afternoon call; Segah for the sunset call; and Hicaz for the final call’ at the main Ottoman mosques there. However, a muezzin in Istanbul told him that this was not practiced widely elsewhere in Turkey (Marcus 2007, 14–15). Stokes presents a different list, again referring to Istanbul: ‘Early morning prayer often uses Saba.... Noon is Saba, Hijaz or Bayati. Afternoon is Hijaz. Early evening is either Hijaz or Rast. Night is Hijaz, Rast, Bayati or Neva’ (Stokes 2010, 167). Although there are certain contradictions between these two surveys, according to Stokes a reasonably musically literate Istanbullian will make clear associations between makamlar and the relevant call to prayer (2010, 167). Eighty percent of the makamlar named in this context contain the flat 2, indicating the strong aural association between the flat 2 and the prayer modes.

Religious association with mode is strong within Jewish music. The Hasidic mystic movement, which began in Eastern Europe in the early eighteenth century, has a tradition of wordless songs called nigunim that ‘draw the singer closer to God’, creating ‘ecstatic fervour’ (Sapožnik and Sokolow 1987, 5). The Ahava Raba mode (Freygish), became very popular for melodies that could lead the
singer into a transformed state (Idelsohn 1944, 420). In addition, in Jewish
cantorial singing, *Ahava Raba* is used for songs of passion, grief and mourning,
yearning and great emotion (Idelsohn 1944, 88). Idelsohn writes that the *Ahava
Raba* mode became

a real channel of Jewish expression, especially for moods of excitement,
from the stirring passion of pain, of love and faith in God…. The more the
Jewish people in those countries were persecuted for their religion, the more
passionate became their expression of love for it. For such intense
sentiments they adopted this Tartaric Oriental mode [*Ahava Raba*], full of
fire and romanticism. (Idelsohn 1944, 88)

Yiddish scholar and historian, Vivi Lachs is the singer with London klezmer band
Klezmer Klub. She gives an example of the use of *Ahava Raba* in this context in
the ‘joyful and rousing’ song of praise ‘Yigdal’, sung at the end of every Sabbath
service by the whole congregation (interview 2013). ‘Yigdal’, which Chernik
considers to be very ‘deep’, is sung slow with falling $4-3-b^2-1$ cadences over
harmonisations of $b\text{vii}-I$ (Figure 2.38), (interview 2012).

![Figure 2.38 'Yigdal' (Adler and Hühner 1902, 419). See also CD 1 track 38: 1.47–2.14 for a version of this tune.](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tUvrLkZ6XIw) [accessed 10/04/2014].

Idelsohn continued that there is possibly an intensity in the *Ahava Raba* mode,
with its $4-3-b^2-1$ cadence, that ‘spoke’ to the Eastern European Jewish diaspora
(1944, 87). Idelsohn traces its adoption from Asia Minor and the Balkans from
the thirteenth century, writing that it ‘nestled itself in the fertile soil of the
receptive Jewish soul’ (ibid.). Dr Alexander Knapp, research associate in Jewish
Music at SOAS, reported that the *Ahava Raba* mode is used for penitential

---

prayers, asking for forgiveness and always very intense; when the cantor wants to
'stir up' the congregation, perhaps to tears, it is the mode that they use: ‘[It] is
about what’s going on inside the person, the conflicts and the pain, those kinds of
issues’. Knapp comments on the role of the b2 in Ahava Raba using metaphors of
narrowness:

[It is] a colouring device [to make a] more effective cadence, somehow
reflecting the prose of the liturgy of devotion…. Generally speaking, the
closer the interval the more intense, the wider the more open the expression.
This is certainly true in Jewish music…. When a cantor lingers on the
flattened 2 before coming to a close on the tonic what’s actually going
through his mind? There could be all sorts of motivations; they may be
different each time. It could be different for each cantor. It comes down to
feeling. (Knapp interview 2009)

So there are strong associations of particular modes with religious contexts. The
flat 2 is clearly pertinent in these examples, with particular modes that contain the
flat 2 as a characteristic note drawing out associations of prayerfulness or
intensity. In terms of community cohesion and moving people to religious
devotion the flat 2 is seen by some to hold significance.

Even for the non-religious, the azan/ezan (call to prayer) permeates life within
many countries that have Islamic populations, as the muezzin’s call is heard in
every village and city (Marcus 2007, 4; Boikutt interview 2011). The Qur’an is
‘recited into the ear of a baby immediately upon being born’ (Stokes 1992, 233).
The noted heavy presence of the flat 2 in the call to prayer gives some indication
of its presence in the sonic surroundings, heard every day wherever the call to
prayer is sounded, bringing with it a spiritual association.

Jewish cantorial singing has also had a large influence beyond the synagogue.
Klezmer music, due to its main forum being the wedding ritual, a religious
occasion, includes instrumental compositions using the modes of the cantor.
Ahava Raba occurs in approximately twenty-five percent of klezmer dance tunes
and spiritual associations for the mode are retained.

Thus, the spiritual associations of the flat 2 permeate the secular world of the
Mediterranean and Eastern Europe. It is heard every day in the call to prayer, and
embedded in the sounds of spiritual dance tunes.
Spiritual practices themselves may be secular. There are many musical practices within the Mediterranean area that are deemed ‘ecstatic’ (popularly understood as producing a state of intense emotion). Oum Kalthoum (1898–1975) was renowned for the ecstasy, both of joy and torment, which she could achieve while singing. She is famous across Arabian, North African, Turkish and Balkan countries, regarded as an icon of Arabian singing. She learnt her extended singing style from reciting the Qur’an and has brought that now into a spiritual, secular setting (Danielson 2008, 22, 116).

Arabian classical *maqam* are performed at communal events where audience and artist work together to create *saltanah*, translated as ‘modal ecstasy’, in the performer and *tarab* (enchantment) in the audience (Racy 1998, 96–101). These practices share a history with the Sufis’ ‘ecstatic’ musical practices. Also, Racy reports that the ‘captivating’ power of the *maqam* is ‘reminiscent of the magical connotations of the *duende* state experienced by Spanish flamenco musicians’ (ibid., 101). Racy continues that ‘modal ecstasy’ is specific to each *maqam*—‘at times modes impose themselves in ways that seems mystifying and compelling’—and is related to associations given to different *maqam/makam* by cosmological theories (ibid., 100).

It is easier to create *saltanah* in common *maqamat* such as *Bayati, Rast, Sikah, Saba* and *Hijaz* [all of which except for *Rast* contain a flat 2], in part because these modes have progressions that are particularly familiar, expansive, and deeply ingrained in the minds of the listeners and performers. (Racy 2004, 137)

There is an association, then, between the most popular *maqamat* and ‘ecstatic qualities’ in secular settings.

As well as the evidence presented here of the flat 2 being present in a lot of intense, ‘ecstatic’ music, there can be a more hypnotic or mesmeric association to the flat 2 as in the above examples with oscillating ostinati (see 2.4.1). The Palestinian *oud* trio Le Trio Joubran (2013) describe a desire to move the audience ‘between painful ecstasy and sumptuous silence’ with their instrumental music. They write that their music is ‘inspired by Palestinian poetry, much of which is on pain and poverty’ (ibid.). Although classically trained, their music does not always follow traditional forms and will often be based on simple repetitive ostinati. In ‘Majâz’, translated as ‘metaphor’, they use a typical
technique of an ostinato line to create a mesmeric effect (Figure 2.29). The heavy emphasis on the flat 2 as the last note of this ostinato strongly colours the cadence with a suspension, akin to the ‘suspended cadence’. The suspended cadence, in creating a stop on ‘a very active tone’ (Signell 1977, 48–49), gives a sense of unrest. The flat 2, in its place of ‘unrest’ in relation to the tonic, may signify a ‘disturbed’ or ‘restless’ emotion. This instrumental piece leaves the interpretation to the listener, influenced by the title of the track and the album is ‘metaphor’.

Drones and ostinati are traditional elements of classical Arabian music and have been recognised for their ‘potent ecstatic suggestibility’ (Racy 1998, 96–101). In another track, ‘Masar’, from the same album, the main tune is repeated as an ostinato, over a pedal note (Figure 2.19). The two phrases repeat while the accompaniment becomes more intense and increases in tempo. Each phrase ends with the motif ♭3–♭4–flat 2–♭1, with a large drop from the 4 to flat 2. The effect is to highlight the flat 2–♭1 cadences, again with an intensity to be interpreted by the listener. The intensity of lingering on the flat 2 at the cadence, as in ‘Majâz’, can be like an emotional statement of ‘unrest’, with its resolution representing a sigh of relief.

The ♭2 as an individual note acquires special connotations within flamenco music. The oscillation (see 2.4.2) between the I and ♭II guitar chords is emblematic of the genre: its mere presence will signify the flamenco Gypsy and is regarded as stirring and mesmeric.48 The example of Ojos de Brujo’s ‘Tiempo de Soleá’ (time of Soleá which is a flamenco dance) demonstrates a repeated bass ostinato moving between D and E♭ incessantly beneath a lyric that speaks of the suffering of those who have to live on the streets (Figure 2.32), perhaps using the harmonic tension-and-release as a metaphor for struggle. In Spanish folk music, Livermore writes of a practice where ‘the combination of alternating final notes on mi and fa (♭♭1 and ♭2) has remained the classic jota aragonesa [a Spanish dance]’ (1972, 149). She continues that flamenco guitarists will exploit this ‘carefully considered repetition of hypnotic charm’ (ibid., 164). The track ‘Mani’ (Figure 2.18) demonstrates the use of the ♭2 in both the repeated melody and the

48 The ‘flamenco’ oscillation between I and ♭II also appears in film music (see chapter five).
chord, probably with no connotative intention beyond the engendering of ‘trance’ in a popular sense in this ‘chill-out’ track.

The particular movement of oscillating between the tonic and the $b\hat{2}$ is exemplified in flamenco, yet this pattern of increased intensity in rising to the $b\hat{2}$, then falling back to the tonic, also appears as a ‘hypnotic’ element in examples from other urban pop music, as in the example of ‘Olürüm Sana’ (Figure 2.30). The ‘hypnotic’ practice of oscillating between the tonic and the flat $\hat{2}$ is an iconic tension-and-release device made famous by the flamenco guitar tradition. It is used in urban popular music around the Mediterranean basin, including in Arabian and Turkish music. The flat $\hat{2}$, in its place of ‘unrest’ in relation to the tonic, is also used in ‘suspended cadences’ to signify something ‘disturbed’ or ‘restless’.

**Nostalgia**

A genre that, later in life, can create a powerful element of nostalgia, and where mood signification can be very particular, is lullabies. These songs, primarily designed to lull the child to sleep, may be tender, joyous or sad. There is a significantly prevalent use of the flat $\hat{2}$ within lullabies of the Mediterranean area, particularly in Hijaz/Hicaz-related modes. Lullabies may be passed from generation to generation and thus may continue older melodic practices than the surrounding folk melodies. Livermore writes of how the ‘chromatically inflected’ (1972, 166) Muslim field-songs have been transformed to cradle-tunes in many areas of Spain (ibid., 146), perhaps explaining why there are so many Spanish and Sephardic lullabies in Hijaz maqam. My survey of Eastern European lullabies printed within six Yiddish song books displays a significant percentage, around twenty percent, in the Ahava Raba mode, a much larger percentage than in Yiddish song generally (Vinkovetzky et al, 1989; Rubin 1964, 1965; Mlotek and Mlotek, 1972, 1988, 1995). ‘Unter Dem Kinds Vigele’ (Beneath Baby’s Cradle) is a typical Yiddish ‘cradle song’ using the Ahava Raba mode (Figure 2.39).
The flat 2 is sometimes used in a soothing melodic phrase within a lullaby. However, the Turkish lullaby ‘Dandini Dandini Dastana’ uses Hicaz makam for an aspirational lullaby:

May our pots be coated with tin,
May my daughter be a bride in a mansion,
And my son dwell in a palace,
Dandini Dandini,
My son is ten months old,
Even were he only five months old,
May he find beauties as brides.49

The verse is made up of four phrases, the first ending on 4, the next two on a ‘suspended cadence’ on b2, and the final phrase with the falling tetrachord 4–3–b2–1. Baylav demonstrates a three–line version of this verse (CD 1 track 39: 0.00–0.17). In the fuller version, the chorus of ‘Huu huu huu hu, Ehe ehe ehe eee’ is sung on the notes b2–1, indicating, perhaps, a connotation for the b2–1 of ‘soothing and relaxing’ (Figure 2.40).

The Iraqi lullaby ‘Dilillol’ is a comparably soothing song in Hijaz maqam (Figure 2.41). Again the first sung phrase ends on \( b^2 \), the ‘suspended cadence’, followed by a final falling melodic cadence \( 3-b^2-1 \), perhaps signifying ‘release into sleep’.

![Figure 2.41 Suad Dori, ‘Dilillol’. CD 1 track 41: 0.00–0.10; 1.56–2.23.](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gNWGnTtKZwA) [accessed 19/02/2014].

This slow lullaby in Hicaz makam (Figure 2.14) has each phrase following a downward trajectory, ending firstly with the falling \( 3-b^2-1 \) motif, secondly with a twist of flattening the third also to make \( 3-b^2-b^3-b^2-1 \). The combination of lullaby and lament can be reflected in the connotations of the \( b^2-1 \) cadence, being a soothing sound for the child at the same time as having sadder connotations for the singer.

---


Katherine Meizel discusses the Sephardic lullaby ‘Nani nani’, again in the equivalent of the Hijaz maqam, transcribed by Isaac Lévy in Chants Judéo-Espagnols, which has appeared in many Eastern Sephardic versions (2003, 43–6). The narrative is of the singing of a simple lullaby being interrupted by an errant husband, who is refused entry to the home (ibid., 42; Figure 2.42). The melody follows the pattern of initial phrases ending with ‘suspended cadences’ on the ♭2, keeping back the 3–♭2–♭1 cadence until the section ends. In the second section the melody rises to the higher octave then slowly descends, again cadencing on the ♭2, until the final cadence. Here, again, the ‘suspended cadences’ play a role, sustaining the sense of unrest for some time before the final relaxation. A combination of a falling contour to the phrases generally and the use of ‘suspended cadences’ may support a lyric of unrest and lamentation here, together with the sense of release to sleep.

Figure 2.42 ‘Nani Nani’, transcribed by Isaac Lévy (Meizel 2003, 41). See also CD track 42: 0.00–1.19 for a version of this tune.

Iraqi, Turkish, Yiddish, Sephardic, Bosnian, Spanish, all use the Hijaz-type mode in some lullabies. The flat 2 within this mode is used to support lyrics of relaxation or lament, particularly with the use of ‘suspended cadences’ and the flat 2–♭1 cadence. The Hijaz/Hicaz mode may gain a nostalgic association simply from its presence in childhood songs. Livermore writes that the ‘first musical impressions on the infant ear have been incalculably effective in securing a native love of exotic scales unchanging down the centuries’ (1972, 141), that ‘the Andalusian infant is familiarized with the old chromaticisms, modulations and rhythms before he himself can sing a note’ (ibid., 171). Baylav suggested that the
general popularity of the *Hicaz makam* may be due to the fact that the majority of lullabies in the folk tradition were in it, so that people first heard it when they were babies, and that it therefore had a strong familiarity, feeding a nostalgia for childhood (interview 2009).

Nostalgia and notions of a lost Golden Era are apparent in the ideologies of some of the cultures discussed in this chapter. For instance Paetzold writes of how Andalusia holds onto the Arabian theme of al-Andalus as a lost paradise, romantic, mysterious and exotic (2009, 208). The memory of a Golden Age of the Arabian Empire in medieval times is echoed by Alhenawi, describing the culture of that time when ‘Europe was in the dark ages’ (interview 2011). Turkey has its own Golden Age of the Ottoman Empire in the fifteenth to sixteenth centuries. And there is a nostalgia in Greece for the Hellenic Golden Age, regarded as ‘pure and clean’ (Tragaki 2005, 59–62) in sentimental comparisons with the modernity exemplified by *rebetiko*.

For some Jews the sound of the Freygish mode evokes nostalgia for Jerusalem (Knapp interview 2009); to others it is ‘just part of growing up to have those tunes around you’ (Lachs interview 2013).

The sound of distinctive modes such as *Hicaz/Hijaz* may be used to represent a general ‘lost innocence’ as in the use of Iraqi lullabies in connection with the Iraqi wars. The lullaby ‘Dilillol’ has been used in this manner in an online video (2011) of a mother conveying pain at her son’s death. Stokes writes on the many connections between nostalgia, melancholia and the struggle for urban and national modernity in Turkey since the end of the Ottoman Empire (2010, 92, 149, 187). *Hicaz/Hijaz* may unconsciously signify childhood and nostalgic, familiar feelings. These connotations may then be used in contexts of lament and/or struggle.

**Emotional connotations of intensity**

The three flat-2 Arabian *maqamat* cited by Racy (see 2.5.1) as being particularly eligible for ecstasy, *Sikah, Saba* and *Hijaz*, all have microtonally altered flat 2 that vary during the performance. This also occurs in Ottoman classical music, where Signell writes that the intervals of *Saba* and *Hicaz makamlar* seem to be

---

especially changeable in terms of microtonal shifts (1977, 139). Classical Arabian and Ottoman musicians and theorists have suggested that the use of microtonal shifts is fundamental to the production of ‘emotionality’ within maqamat/makamlar (ibid.; Alhenawi interview 2011). Ozugurel said ‘In Turkish “infinite” music, in which pitches can vary by microtones… if you put these notes one after another it makes people sad, like A to B-flat [1♭2]. That’s what I believe and many people think the same way in Turkey’ (interview 2009).

Touma writes of the 2 and 4 in maqam Saba, that these notes may fluctuate upward or downward somewhat, thus causing a ‘sadder’ or ‘more sensitive’ emotional mood. It is the changeable size of certain intervals in this non-tempered tone system that influences the emotional content of a maqam. (Touma 1996, 45)

Alhenawi also attributes the ‘sadness’ of maqam Saba to the microtonally flattened position of the notes, stating that if they were higher they would be ‘brighter’ (interview 2011).

Touma conducted an experiment with groups of Arabian and non-Arabian listeners to ascertain their emotional impressions of maqam Saba. He wanted to determine why ‘after just a few seconds, the maqam Saba evokes a feeling of sadness in the listener’, suggesting that the ‘particular characteristic colouring’ of the microtones elicits specific emotional reactions. However, Touma’s experiment revealed that these reactions were far more marked with Arabian listeners than with Western listeners (1996, 44), pointing to the enculturation of these emotional connotations.

In Oum Kalthoum’s song ‘Ala Baladi Elmahboub’ (To my dear country), in Bayati maqam, the phrases rise using ć2 and fall with ♭2 (Figure 2.3). The lyrics of the song are a common Arabian theme of the yearning of separated lovers:

To the country of my sweetheart
Bring me to the country of my sweetheart
My love has increased as the separation cauterizes me
My darling my heart is with you
Throughout the night staying up with you
My eyes wish to see you
I complain to you and you console me
Oh traveller on the Nile River?
Why am I in Egypt a lover?
I can’t sleep at night because he is gone
Bring me to the country of my sweetheart.\textsuperscript{53}

The sadness represented here is, I suggest, supported by the ‘sad/sensitive’
connotations attributed to the fluctuating \(\hat{2}\), as well as its prominence generally in
the melody and particularly the descent to the cadences.

Other popular music of the Mediterranean area also contains microtonal shifts.
For instance, Livermore alludes to these in the expression of mood within
flamenco music: notes ‘of depressed or of sharpened tone’ that musicians say
establish an atmosphere of the exotic (1972, 164). These microtonal changes
may indeed connote ‘the exotic’ (Alhenawi interview 2011), as in the Gypsy song
‘Romano Horo’ (Figure 2.8), where Redzepova flattens the \(\hat{2}\) to a \(b\hat{2}\) on the
descending catch phrase ‘Gypsy dance’.

There is a general ‘emotional’ signification to the microtones within Arabian or
Ottoman influenced musical traditions, enculturated meanings given to shifts as
small as 1/9 of a tone. The raising up on ascent and lowering on descent can be
 connoted as ‘bright’ and ‘sad/sensitive’ respectively. This may also give a
’sad/sensitive’ signification to the ubiquitous falling tetrachord (\(4–[b]3–\text{flat}\ 2–1\))
at the ends of phrases. The flat \(2\) is often the most altered note, and can itself be
connoted as ‘sad’, ‘yearning’ or ‘exotic’.

I have described the complexity of the \(b\hat{2}–\hat{1}\) cadence, which is received both as
soothing and as lament. This may be related to the ‘compulsion’ within these
genres for the \(b\hat{2}\) to ‘fall’ to the tonic.\textsuperscript{54} Two comments from Alexander Knapp
and Merlin Shepherd, one of the foremost klezmer clarinetists, support this
connotation:

For me I have a strong emotional experience with the flattened second.
Ending on the flattened second doesn’t feel final, the penultimate note in a
cadence. I feel that it’s got to slip to the tonic…. I feel tremendous tension
from the supertonic to the tonic. I imagine that a lot of people feel that.
(Knapp interview 2009)

\textsuperscript{53} Arabic Music Translation 2007.
\textless http://www.arabicmusictranslation.com/2007/05/oum-kalthoum-to-country-of-
my.html\textgreater  [accessed 21/08/2013].

\textsuperscript{54} These ‘compulsions’ are akin to the ‘yearning’ of Bharucha’s psychological research
(1996, 393).
There is something very intense about the flatted second resolving to the tonic. Certainly in the West it needs to resolve. It’s a relaxation down. (Shepherd interview 2009)

Alhenawi recalled his teacher’s instruction for improvisation within Arabian classical music to have melodic falls and appoggiaturas to ‘add feeling... to make it live a little, then die. Build your improvisation—living, rising then dying, falling’ (Alhenawi interview 2011). Here we see an association of ‘up and down’ in musical pitch with ‘life and death’, with no negative connotation.

The falling $b^2 - 1$ melodic cadence has, however, acquired negative and underworld connotations. For example, Livermore writes that ‘the southern la, sol, fa, mi [4→$b^3$→$b^2$→1, the Andalusian cadence] persists in a shadowy undertone’ in northern music (1972, 160). When put alongside Federico Garcia Lorca’s description of Andalusian duende the emphasis on a ‘shadowy’ cadence, considered the backbone of flamenco harmony, may contribute to Lorca’s connotations:

These black sounds are the mystery, the roots fastened in the mire that we all know and all ignore, the mire that gives us the very substance of art…. [It is a question] of blood, of the most ancient culture, of spontaneous creation…. [This power is] the spirit of the earth…. I am talking about... that melancholy demon of Descartes. (Lorca 1980, 43)

This plangent theme reappears in connection with Greek rebetiko music, described by Tragaki as

- a genre associated with hashish consumption and the urban criminal underworld: vagabonds, prostitutes, pickpockets, pimps and black marketers…. [This is] music of the polluted city that bears the depression of the lowlife urban groups and promotes sensuality and passivity.... Rebetiko songs have the closed, cloudy sky of the cities. (Tragaki 2005, 51, 56)

These are metaphors of a combination of ‘falling’ and ‘negativity’: the underworld, depression, and lowlife with no view of the sky. Rebetiko has frequently been associated with melancholia. For instance ‘in the mid-1960s the Western-educated chairman of the first Panhellenic Psychiatry Conference declared that melancholic bouzouki songs were responsible for an increase in mental disorders in Greece’ (Pennanen 2010, 77). Yet Tragaki also describes rebetiko as having a passion that ‘expresses the folk soul’ (2005, 52). Rebetiko music uses the Hitzas dromos, with flat ♯, to a significant extent: for instance in ‘Misirlu’, whose lyrics intimate the possibility of madness (Figure 2.13), a cross-
cultural love affair, telling of honeyed kisses and the promise of madness if love must be denied.

In these examples from Arabian classical, Spanish flamenco and Greek *rebetiko* music there is an association between the ‘compulsion’ to fall and metaphors of physical falling, cycles of life, negativity and madness, sometimes with ‘sublime’ connotations. The $b2\!-\!1$ ‘fall’ is a significant element of these metaphors in its presence within the falling cadential motif.

Sublime and melancholic connotations are also found in the traditional music of Bosnia: *sevda*. The Bosnian duo Amira Međunjanin and Merima Ključo describe it as ‘deep, deep emotional music... akin to Spanish *duende*’ ([radio] 2010). The song ‘Simbil Cvece’ on their 2010 album *Zumra* is a Serbian folksong in the *sevda* genre (Figure 2.43). The lyrics concern a painful yearning as the result of lost love. The phrases of this song of ‘yearning’ are predominantly falling, through the tetrachord $4\!-\!3\!-\!b2\!-\!1$.

![Figure 2.43 Amira and Merima Ključo, ‘Simbil Cvece’, Zumra [CD], 2010. CD 1 track 43: 0.23–2.43.](image)

Ključo attributes much of the emotion generally within *sevda* to the $b2$ (Figure 2.44):\(^{55}\)

![Figure 2.44 Ključo singing Hicaz [radio] 2010. CD 1 track 44: 0.21–0.44.](image)

\(^{55}\) The semitone interval may be considered to be ‘melancholy’ in psychological research (e.g. Maher and Berlyne 1982, 16).
I asked Kljućo, in interview, to expand on her references to the $b_2$, and she told me:

When you... know what is the cause of that emotional movement you think now OK.... It’s so interesting to see people react when you just change the second note.... Your body naturally goes with this second, you turn differently.... All of a sudden your body moves, your ear, everything just turns to the different direction. It is like looking to the wonderful baby and giving a kiss. (Kljućo, interview 2011)

Bosnian musicologist Vlado Milošević, however, attributes the melancholic feeling within sevda music to the augmented second interval, describing it as having tremendous power on the imagination and associations with the Orient (Pennanen 2010, 78). The augmented second occurs between $b_2$ and $3$, and Kljućo contends that the important note here is the $b_2$, as the active, ‘emotional’ ingredient (interview 2011). There is a direct Arabian connection to sevda, the name deriving from the Arabic word for melancholy, fused with a Turkish word meaning love. This is interpreted in sevda as connected with love songs of suffering and yearning, often associated with passion, ‘Oriental’ eroticism, and sometimes elation (Pennanen 2010, 78–84).

**Passion and melancholia**

From Arabian saltanah to Andalusian duende there is a melancholic connotation to much traditional and contemporary music of the Mediterranean, expressing suffering, either from a history of colonial domination, eviction from a homeland, general poverty or unrequited love. Within Turkey, the melancholic disposition is maintained within both the remnants of Ottoman classical makamlar, outlawed from its central position by the socialist government of Attaturk, and popular genres influenced by Egyptian music, such as Arabesk. Stokes has made a study of the genre Arabesk, which has associations of alienation, separation and a metaphor of ‘burning’, inflamed with love or hurt ‘the metaphor of combustion runs through every aspect of music-making in Turkey’ (1992, 134–5). Baylav, in interview, told me that Arabesk is listened to by those

with a lot of reason to be melancholic: people for economic, political reasons moved from their villages, losing lots of things, moved to outskirts of

---

56 Melancholia—black bile—is one of the four cardinal humours: a ‘cold and dry’ physical ‘affliction’ seen to affect the spirit, thus the use of the term melancholia for a state of sadness and depression associated with the earth and death (Paster 2010, 5, 141).
Istanbul and other cities who have developed their own music, which is extremely tragic, heavy and painful music. So when it’s reproduced in a studio it breaks your heart. (Baylav interview 2009)

Stokes writes that ‘Db–C–B♭–A descents are very characteristic of cadential patterns in the Western Anatolian genre boslak... [with] fate-obsessed lyrics’ (Stokes 2010, 88). The Arabesk singer Müslüm Gürses’s song ‘Kaç Kadeh Kirildi’ has the theme of passive suffering (Figure 2.45). The last four bars has the refrain ‘I cannot forget you’, ending with the falling tetrachord 4–♭3–♭2–1.

So many wineglasses have been broken in my heart
I cannot comfort myself anyhow
So many nights I have been crying secretly like this
Whatever I did I cannot forget you
Who knows who is in your heart now
Maybe you have already forgotten me
I still live in the past
You are in everything I cannot forget you
They say every love has an end as time passes
Mine has not ended yet I could not understand
They say there is no hope in this love just forget
Whatever I did I cannot forget you

Figure 2.45 Müslüm Gürses, ‘Kaç Kadeh Kirildi’. CD 1 track 45: 0.04–0.33

The theme of passive suffering is common in Turkish popular Arabesk music, as is the falling tetrachord cadence 4–(♭)3–♭2–1. Both feature also in the 1997 Turkish song ‘Olürüm Sana’ (I would die for you) from the album of the same name by pop singer Tarkan, which contains these lyrics:

Oh at last love has opened my doorway
Coming to me gently

Entered my soul.
Where were you before this?
I’d steam up in your arms
In your fire.
How was I unaware of you before, lover
I’ve been renewed by your lips,
No no in you.

Obviously she’s crazy like me,
Foolhardy, headstrong, crazy
This love must tame us
I would die for you, I would die for you, I would die for you, wild thing
You’ve done me in she-devil
Baby, I’m addicted to you
You’ve taken my sanity
Caught in your web cruel lady\(^5\)

The music lingers on the \(\flat 2\), the first section beginning and ending with a motif ending \(\flat 3–\flat 2–\flat 7\) (Figure 2.30). The second section starts with repeated \(\flat 2\)s falling to the tonic, and the third section also oscillates between these two notes. The third section ends with the lyric ‘I’d die for you’ repeated three times on the motif \(\flat 2–\flat 7–\flat 1\) ending with the words ‘wild thing’ on the notes \(\flat 2–\flat 1\). Here is a repeated use of the \(\flat 2\) to support the expression of passionate emotion in Turkish popular music.

Stokes describes how within Turkish music in general ‘all music tells the same story, and this story is essentially one of fate, and the disintegration of society and individual’ (Stokes 1989, 30). Ozugurel said

> it could be history. People must have suffered from wars, going to other countries for work, or just another village. A woman may have married and gone 10km to her husband’s village, or died from illness. In industrialised countries like the UK with better transportation services these issues may not have continued into the twentieth century. (Ozugurel interview 2009)

Without suggesting that there is a syllogism of ‘the \(\flat 2\) is connoted as sad, and this music is sad therefore the music is sad because of the \(\flat 2\)’, I argue that the \(\flat 2\)’s inherited connotations make it a useful agent in supporting a sad lyric, whether used consciously or unconsciously by the composer.

\(^5\) Tarkan Translations. <tarkantr.blogspot.co.uk/2005/06/lrm-sana-song-lyrics> [accessed 01/09/2013].
In answer to my question why he thought that there were eighty percent of Turkish tunes using the flat 2 Baylav replied: ‘It’s like asking why there are so many Western pieces in the major scale’ (Baylav interview 2009). He agreed that it was interesting that Turkish culture embraced this note so much, and, when pushed, that there might be a connection with the emotion of melancholy (ibid.).

Conflict and displacement have reinforced other musical traditions, laced with melancholic nostalgia, as in the revival of klezmer, the music from Eastern Europe, in the Jewish diaspora (Sapoznik and Sokolow 1987, 19; Idelsohn 1944, 24). Knapp comments:

> It has often been said that in Eastern Ashkenazi Jewish music the pain is never far away, not far below the surface…. This may have a lot to do with social, cultural, political religious circumstances. Over the centuries, life has been tough. This may have found expression in these modes [e.g. *Ahava Rabah*], as they’re more expressive of that sort of thing, not the same as modalities of nations where there has been relatively little conflict. Nations with their own homelands, where they haven’t been moved from one place to another... heard an intensity in the flat second, augmented second, minor second combination that spoke to them. (Knapp interview 2009)

Andalusian flamenco is also associated with suffering passion and romantic expression. Ruth Davis writes of how Gypsy musicians in Spain developed a ‘song repertory of a special character, rooted in poverty, [which] expressed the plight of their existence and gave impetus to poetic and musical forms that had become prominent around the mid eighteenth century’ (2004, 218). Wealthy audiences have historically financially supported Gypsy musicians with their melancholic music of poverty and oppression in order to further their own ‘spiritual’ interest (Mitchell 1994, 97, 99–101). Lyrically, flamenco songs may be ‘bare expressions of elemental emotion’ (Washabaugh 1996, 2). Livermore, in her history of Spanish music, describes songs that express ‘smouldering individual resentments at fate, as when the miners and prisoners in labour gangs give vent to their sufferings…. They give vent to the explosion of exaggerated disappointment with which the extrovert Andalusian expresses chagrín or spleen…. [It admits] the cry of revenge, of hate, or regret, but never the weak sigh of passive suffering’ (Livermore 1972, 168, 169, 170). This passion is not passive, but music railing against poverty and oppression, and the intensity is supported by the backbone of flamenco, the Andalusian cadence (4→♭3→♭2→♭1).
This is another genre using the $b\hat{2}$ in association with music of hardship and melancholia.

Simple love songs and songs of love’s yearning and loss are ubiquitous in the Mediterranean and Eastern European region, often using traditional poetry and filled with metaphors expressive of suffering of many kinds. Many of the phrase shapes of this music have falling melodic cadences through the flat $\hat{2}$, contributing to connotations of sadness where appropriate, as when matching the lyrics. The Bosnian folk genre sevda is named after melancholia and love, its character often being a ‘yearning’ combination of these two emotions. Some Bosnians have placed the seat of the ‘emotion’ within the music as a result of the $b\hat{2}$ or the augmented second interval $b\hat{2}–\hat{3}$. Turkish popular music has established passive, fate-obsessed traditions that use the falling $4–b\hat{3}–b\hat{2}–1$ overwhelmingly. Romantic melancholia extends to Jewish klezmer music in the worldwide Jewish diasporas. Themes of romance, melancholia and passion are also very vibrant in Andalusia, as evidenced by the writings of Lorca.

The flat $\hat{2}$ plays a significant part in these genres and therefore carries with it their connotations. Countries such as those of Sub-saharan Africa, that have not been under the dominion of the Arabic or Ottoman Empires do not have the resource of the flat $\hat{2}$, in the same manner, to use as an expression of identity, they remain an Other.

Joy

The flatted second is just a note but it does appear more often in the music I like than it should! (Shepherd interview 2009)

Positive, ‘upbeat’ and joyful connotations are strongly associated with some music that has a flat $\hat{2}$ throughout the Mediterranean area. Many Arabian classical songs in maqamat containing the flat $\hat{2}$ are very lively, with Kurd and Bayati/Uşşak being especially flexible in their connotations (Alhenawi interview 2011). Baylav stresses (see 2.5.1) that joyful tunes in flat-$\hat{2}$ makamlar like Hicaz that are often used for sad moods are ‘not an exception’. He argues that ‘the sadness doesn’t come from the flattened second…. The flat second can be used in a very lively and uplifting manner’ in Turkish classical music (Baylav interview 2009). There is often a combination of joy and ‘depth’ attached to the Jewish
Freygish mode. For instance Chernik describes the flat ♭ as ‘that lovely feature of the Freygish... it’s haunting’ (interview 2012). I now present some examples of music with joyful interpretations of the flat ♭.

One example using Hicaz makam is the Sufi dance ‘Hicaz Ilahi’, which follows the melodic arches characteristic of other tunes discussed here, but has a faster tempo and a strong dance beat. The Turkish classical fasıl traditionally ends with a dance tune called an ‘Oyun Havası’, usually in makam Bayati or Kürdi, which is upbeat dance music with a question-and-answer catch phrase stressing the flat ♭ and much emphasis on melodic lines falling ♭♭♭ ♭. This dance has found a new existence as an urban popular dance, as in the Turkish Gypsy Dance ‘Hicaz Oyun Havası’ (Figure 2.12), a joyful dance tune using Hicaz makam.

Lyrics may support the positive feeling. For instance the Macedonian Gypsy dance ‘Romano Horo’ (Figure 2.8) is a song inviting the audience to dance, with the ♭♭♭ ♭ cadence emphasised at cadences on the word ‘dance’. Another example is Turkey’s entry for the Eurovision Song Contest in 2009, ‘Dum Tek Tek’, with music in makam Bayati/Kürdi written by singer Hadise. The lyrics are of an intense, erotic love ‘Crazy for You’, but with no intimation of the melancholia of Tarkan’s ‘Olürüm Sana’.

Baby you’re perfect for me
You are my gift from heaven
This is the greatest story
Of all times—[stressed ♭♭♭ ♭]
We met like in a movie
So meant to last forever
And what you’re doing to me
Feels so fine—[stressed ♭♭♭ ♭]
Angel, I wake up and live my dreams
Endlessly crazy for you! [stressed ♭♭♭ ♭]
Chorus:
Can you feel the rhythm in my heart
The beat’s going Dum Tek Tek
Always out like there’s no limit
Feels like there’s no way back.60

Three catchphrases emphasise the falling cadence ♭♭3–♭2–♭1 on the lyrics ‘greatest story of all times’, ‘feels so fine’ and ‘crazy for you’. The bassline is mesmerically using a 1–♭♭2–♭♭7–♭1 ostinato, and the use of flutes, fast tempo and a strong beat lighten the mood.

Playing a ‘melancholic’ song at a fast tempo may be sufficient to transform it into a joyful dance. Ozugurel described the repertoire of his Turkish wedding band as having at least half the songs on very sad subjects: ‘people dying of starvation, bullets in the head or of lost love’, but the second half of his performances uses similar songs, sometimes the same songs, but at fast tempos for dancing. ‘You can play a sad song with a B♭♭ [♭2] fast at a wedding and get everyone dancing and laughing’ (Ozugurel interview 2009).

Speed is not a requirement, though, for conveying joy, as in the song of praise ‘Yigdal’, in the Jewish Ahava Raba mode, which is ‘slow and jolly’ (Lachs interview 2013) (Figure 2.38). Klezmer bands generally play dance music for weddings, often joyful pieces such as the Hassidic tune ‘Baym Rebin’s Sude’ (the Rabbi’s meal) (Figure 2.35), and ‘Far der kale: Bughicis Freylakhs’ (Figure 2.46). The Freylekh, translated as ‘happy’, is a klezmer dance style that often uses the Ahava Raba (Freygish) mode (Cravitz 2008, 2). The second, third and last sections of ‘Bughicis Freylakh’ all end with the falling tetrachord 4–♭3–♭2–♭1, accentuating the ♭2. It could be noted that there is quite a lot of upward movement in the melodies generally, including octave leaps in the cadences at the ends of the second and fourth sections, and these contour changes would merit further investigation in relation to mood.

Thus music from the Mediterranean regions that contains the flat 2 may have very lively connotations. Some instrumental dance music particularly uses the Hijaz/Hicaz/Ahava Raba mode as a positive choice (e.g. the Jewish Freylekh dance). Lyrics may support a lively interpretation, but also the lyric may be
ignored and a joyful dance with the flat 2 can be created despite ‘yearning’ lyrics.

Figure 2.46 Budowitz, ‘Bughicis Freylakhs’, Wedding Without A Bride [CD], 2000. CD track 46: 0.00–1.22.

Connotations of Nation

I have given examples above of where traditional and classical musics have contributed to a national consciousness. For example Le Trio Joubran’s music from their album Majâz accompanies the 2011 Palestinian film Five Broken Cameras, about the separation of the Palestinian people from their lands. ‘Majâz’ is the theme tune, and recurs many times in the underscore with its accented flat 2 last note (see Figure 2.29), and ‘Masar’ is also played full length twice.

Within the Balkans there are some particularly strong examples of this practice, as a result of the upheavals of war and colonialism in the twentieth century. Folk songs of love, loss and yearning often support a strong voice of nationhood and a desire for freedom and independence (Longinović 2000, 625). ‘Melancholia’ can be represented as a positive, romantic yearning, deeply involved with nationhood. Tomislav Longinović writes:
The Romantic gaze had been fully internalised by the thinkers of Yugoslav late modernism…. Notions of blood, passion, primitivism and the internalized gaze bringing a superiority and a depth within their melancholic and sorrowful songs. (ibid., 628)

Bosnian sevda, with its particular and conscious significations for the $\flat 2$ of ‘emotion’ is given special significance: Robert Golden, in his video Stories of Sevda: the Bosnian Blues describes ‘a world of great beauty and harrowing darkness, ultimately addressing questions of cultural identity standing against barbarism’ and states that sevda was very important for the nation’s post-war identity’ ([film] 2007). Longinovic describes folk music as ‘the bottom of the soul, an abyss from which emanates the pain of unfulfilled desire and destiny’ (2000, 628), and locates the most ‘acute expression’ in sevda, describing how sevda was used as a unifying ‘unburdening’ genre within the Yugoslavian nation after the Second World War: ‘Countries that had all suffered victimisation under centuries of colonization by the Ottomans found connection in that suffering through the intense music of Sevda’ (ibid.). In a comparable fashion to the Turkish pop music described above (2.5.2), Slavic nations may hold on to the ‘slave’ in their name, those who have been ‘slaves’ in the recent past of Ottoman dominion, and

revel in their injured masculinity while listening to the songs which evoke the sweet pain of longing…. The folk song evokes sevdah, the black bile of melancholy that lingers in the singing of Bosnians, expressing suppressed pain as they fought to affirm their particular ‘racial-cultural’ identities (ibid., 629).

The traditional Macedonian song ‘Jovano Jovanke’, in the Hicaz mode, has been used as a metaphor for the yearning for national independence in Macedonia. Used in the 1961 film Solunskite Atentatori, about the treatment of the Macedonian people under Ottoman rule, the song’s lyrics concern lovers separated by disapproving parents. ‘Jovano Jovanke’ is used here as a criticism of the Macedonian leaders in the battle for liberation, in that they do not allow the population (their metaphorical children) to determine the future of the country.

Jovano, Jovanke,
You sit by the Vardar,
Bleaching your white linen,

61 This association with Blues music underlines the importance of recognizing that the emotions described are by no means predicated on the presence of a $\flat 2$. 
Bleaching your white linen, my dear
Looking at the hills.
Jovano, Jovanke,
I’m waiting for you,

To come to my home,
And you don’t come, my dear
My heart, Jovano.
Jovano, Jovanke,
Your mother Won’t let you go
To come to me, my dear, My heart, Jovano.62

Jovano, a girl’s name, is generally sung on the notes 3–5–4♭3–♭2–♭–1, perhaps as a sad, yearning call. The song has also been claimed by Bulgaria, as the Vardar River used to be in Bulgaria and some Bulgarians have very strong attachments to the ‘Oriental’ folk songs (Rice 2002, 39). Popular Bulgarian singer Slavi Trivonov has recorded a version of ‘Jovano Jovanke’ with a video set in the trenches of the Battle of Doyran in 1917, a harrowing tribute to those who died in this battle.63 The popular song ‘Jovano Jovanke’ uses the ♭2 in a prominent manner to support these romantic nationalist concerns.

Thus, intense music that has the ♭2 as an emblematic element is associated with a powerful ‘unburdening’ musical expression, often associated with nationalism. Using the Balkans as an example, it is possible to regard the ♭2 as a significant part of a romantic, nationalist repertoire, building on its connotations of melancholia that become attached to nation itself.

Of the many countries and ethnic groups that have come under Arabian or Ottoman dominion, some have gravitated more to the flat-2 modes than others. Neither Arab nor Ottoman empires exist today, and a continuing attachment to maqamat/makamlar traditions can reflect a nation’s identity in regards to modernity, religion and/or self-expression. For example in the Balkans the breakup of Yugoslavia shattered many bonds, with some countries putting themselves at a distance from the ‘foreign’ music of other parts of the Balkans: ‘The word [sevda] and all it stands for are Orientally tinged, and the north-

westerners of Yugoslavia—Croats and Slovenes—usually regarded it with a
certain ambivalence’ (Živković 2011, 56). On the contrary there can be an
association made between the ‘sadness’ of the people and their ‘soulfulness’.
Živković writes: ‘Slovenes had merry polkas, Macedonians painfully sad, slow,
slow laments. As folk sociology had it, the merrier the music—the ‘shallower’
the soul, and the higher per capita suicide rate’ (ibid., 57).

In European Judaism during past centuries, judgements were made about
populations, including opinions on their music. The ‘assimilated’ Jews of Austria
and Germany were wealthier, urban and more sophisticated, and may have had
little time for what they might have considered ‘Oriental’ or ‘backward’ Eastern
Jewry. Knapp describes the use of the flat 2 in relation to these views:

There are as many Jewish identities as there are Jews: some will love the
flattened 2, some will despise it. The Ahava Raba was very popular amongst
Eastern Ashkenazi Jews as opposed to the Germans who found it a little
Oriental and alien, they liked to be more Western…. It wasn’t regarded as
the essential ingredient that in the East it was…. They did not want to
identify with this constant persecution, misery, pogroms, and being seen as
second-class citizens. This oppression found expression in the music of the
Eastern Jews, whether it was Ahava Raba or just the voice production of the
folk tunes of those communities. (Knapp interview 2009)

London-based Jewish cantor Reuben Turner told me that within the state of Israel
there has been a conscious decision to move towards ‘happier’ scales and away
from ‘the narrow intervals of the ghetto’ (interview 2009). The semitone interval
♭2–1 is surely one of the intervals that triggers such metaphors of narrowness.64

Again the converse of this situation is that Jews in the diaspora may come to
regard the Ahava Raba mode as providing a sense of identity to, in particular, the
non-religious Jew: ‘For many secular Jews, playing a flattened 2 followed by a
major 3 gives them a key to what they consider to be their roots’ (Shepherd
interview 2009).

The Phrygian 4–♭3–♭2–1 tetrachord also produces an effect in, perhaps, a more
‘unseen’ way, less obvious without the augmented second interval yet still
marked as different from Western music. The Gypsy musician will often play on

---

64 This metaphor concurs with psychologists Maher and Berlyne’s research conclusions
that larger intervals may be considered more ‘powerful’, more ‘complex’, ‘clearer’ and
‘carefree’ than smaller intervals (1982, 14).
stereotypes in order to market a romantic image of identity, the desire to please the customer is paramount (Sárosi 1970, 246). Balint Sárosi, writing on the collecting of Hungarian Gypsy folk songs reported:

The Gypsy musician wants the song to be ‘tasty’ for the customer in the way he ‘cooks’ it. It happened with one of our folklorists that when he was collecting from a village Gypsy musician, the Gypsy came to realize that it was mainly the melodies with a Phrygian cadence which pleased the collector (a Phrygian cadence is a minor second interval, e.g. F–E, at the end of a melody). From then onwards, whenever it was at all possible, he brought even the commonest melody to an end with a Phrygian cadence—while his companion obligingly observed the effect on the face of the listener. (ibid., 246–7)

Such self-exoticisation is influential in musical practice of the Mediterranean and Eastern European area, visible in the complex marketing processes of world music and tying in with issues of Orientalism and Glocalisation (Craig and King 2003, 5–6). These examples from Balkan and Jewish music show a little of the complex and conscious attitudes that can be attached to the flat 2 and the modes containing it. The ‘Oriental stamp’ that the falling tetrachord 4–(♭)3–♭2–1 has acquired affects the attitude to its continued use within the musical repertoire of different ethnic groups, particularly in relation to modernity, self-identification and marketing.

**Conclusion**

The research literature, my interviews and the musical examples analysed here all indicate that there is a significant presence of the flat 2 in the music of the Mediterranean and Eastern Europe. This presence varies from an added ‘exotic’ element in Gypsy music to an overwhelming eighty percent presence in Turkish classical music. The flattening of the 2 is considered a ‘natural’ occurrence in classical Arabian or Ottoman musical traditions and can be said to be ‘just there’.

Yet, I argue, the consistent and pervasive presence of the flat 2 in the area has a greater relevance.

When present, the flat 2 is a crucial note, often the penultimate ‘leading note’ in the final melodic cadences. The flat 2 appears predominantly as an ‘upper leading note’ that is a structural element emphasising the tonic in descending melodic cadences as part of a falling tetrachord. There is a perceived pull downwards to the tonic from the flat 2, a semitone above it. These cadences are often intensified.
by lowering the flat 2 by microtones and thus increasing the ‘dissonance’. The flat 2’s role of ‘leading note’ is transferred to harmonic practices, where distinctive chord sequences use the flat 2 within a ‘dominant’ chord: ♭II–I in Greek *Hitzas*, ♭vii–I in the klezmer Freygish mode.

There are many associations related to tension and release arising from this ‘falling’ resolution and, in its position of upper neighbour to the tonic, the flat 2 is effective for expressing yearning, relaxing and other emotions of stress and release. Within the literature and from interviewees (e.g. Baylav interview 2008; Alhenawi interview 2011) there are also associations made between ‘up’ in pitch for bright, and ‘down’ in pitch for sad or sensitive. I argue that these associations contribute to the heightened ‘emotional’ connotations of the ‘falling’ resolution of the flat 2.

The examples of the flat 2 in this chapter are often sharper on ascent than on descent. On descent they are lowered by microtones, or even semitones, for the final melodic cadence. I argue that this difference in note-pitch between ascent and descent holds poignant connotations of sadness, softness and relaxation because, as with the minor 3 within a tonal or modal context it is a lower version of the scale degree than ‘expected’.65

Sometimes there are no apparent emotional connotations to the flat 2 here. Indeed there are many ‘neutral’ tunes and songs, where the flat 2 bears no emotional weight. However, the flat 2 that is ‘naturally’ there in this music may still be considered to be an important part of a national music, with musicians having a self-awareness that this is different to what is ‘naturally’ in Western music.

There are some general associations that the presence of a flat 2 gives to music. One example is when ‘Spain’ is evoked by the tetrachord 4–♭3–♭2–1.66 The presence of the augmented second interval, as between the flat 2 and the 3 in Hijaz, Hicaz, Hitzas, and Ahava Raba modes, is discussed as an ‘Oriental’ or national signifier within the literature and interviews. These mode are often

---

65 These ‘lower than normal’ connotations chime with psychologist Huron’s results (Huron, Yim, and Chordia 2010, 8).
66 The fluidity of this national depiction ‘in which the local and the global are mutually imbricated’ is described by Biddle and Knights (2007, 14).
regarded as being intense and expressive, full of potential to express the
sometimes complex and intense emotions of diasporic and conflicted
communities. The flat 2 is the defining note for these modes, and therefore carries
this connotation.

Many of the genres discussed have themes in common: struggle for identity,
inviting a state of prayerfulness, melancholia, passion, nostalgia, or religion, with
emotions that are often ‘yearning’, ‘loving’ or ‘burning’. It is no coincidence that
the countries and genres studied here are some of the poorer relations of Western
European countries, or diasporic communities. James Parakilas wrote that it is ‘as
if a national soul were the compensation offered to the powerless’ (1998, 138).
My argument adds that the sense of Otherness and noble suffering is epitomised
by The Other Leading Note, metaphorically falling to its destiny, which can be
regarded as an intrinsic part of Racy’s description of ‘Eastern Soul’ (2004, 142).
The particular emotional emphasis on the flat 2 in the genres studied here make it
an emotional icon, with my interviewees often describing unspecific emotional
attachment to the note by calling it simply ‘emotional’.

Yet not all the music with the flat 2 is ‘sad’ or ‘sensitive’: some is very lively and
happy. Also, there is much melancholic music in many countries that does not
contain the flat 2, such as Blues music, and there are countries that have been
‘touched by the maq[k]am’ which have no significant flat 2 element, for example
Croatia. There is no syllogistic connection between the flat 2 and sadness, as is
evident from the counter-examples. It may be tempting to suggest that the
connotations of ‘sadness’ are simply related to tempo and lyric, and certainly
these have a strong influence. However I argue that the links that are discussed
above, of, for example, Hicaz to lullabies, the call to prayer and particular
maqam/makam, and importantly the falling tetrachord as intensity, bring
associations that inform interpretations.

The inheritance of the flat 2, from the traditions of the Arabian and Ottoman
Empires, provides a musical resource to the genres of countries that have come
under their dominion, producing a different relationship to the note than in
countries without that heritage, whether taken up in musical genres or not.
I argue that the use of this Other Leading Note provides new insights into melodic and tonal practices, and that the ‘unseen’ nature of the flat 2 makes it very useful for the expression of an array of emotions within the music considered here. The intensity of the flat 2 and its fall to the tonic may be used to express melancholia, lament, torment, relaxation or ecstasy. Whether this is for the purpose of ‘self-exoticisation’, for self-expression, or for an assertion of national identity there are an unlimited number of variations in the countries ‘touched by the maq[k]am’.
3  A History of the Other in the West

The flat second packs an intense ‘wallop’ to listeners in the West.
(Susan McClary interview 2011)

This chapter analyses how the $b_{2}$ fell out of common usage in Western church and secular music, was ousted from the Western canon and became Other in the West. It investigates, chronologically, the history of the $b_{2}$ within Western music, giving a timeline from the medieval church in France to northern Europe and America in the twenty-first century. By highlighting trends in the occasional occurrences of the $b_{2}$, it explores connotations that became attached to the note. I argue that there are two key associations that became attached to the $b_{2}$ in the West, which changed the nature of its usage. The first is the association of the $b_{2}$ with feelings of anxiety and doom, contributing to strong affective reactions in listeners who have been enculturated with these associations. The second is a much later association of the $b_{2}$ with the Oriental through the interface with its use in Spanish, Indian and Arabian musics. These two contrasting significations became layered or merged in the overall connotation of the $b_{2}$ with ‘Otherness’. The result is that the $b_{2}$ has become a potent musical tool for expressing the Other in Western music. In addition, the $b_{2}$ came to be seen as part of the ‘old-fashioned’ church modes, so that on the rare occasions the $b_{2}$ was used it could either allude to or represent the ‘archaic’. I hope to convey some of the complexities of these potent meetings of connotations for musicians and audiences.

My main sources for this chapter are musical scores, musicological literature, and an interview with musicologist Susan McClary, while at the 2010 Los Angeles Society for Ethnomusicology conference, on the earlier history of the Phrygian mode.

3.1  Early musical connotations of the Phrygian mode

‘Phrygian mode’ has been a musical term since the days of ancient Greece, and was referred to by Plato and Aristotle. There is little agreement in the literature as to what notes were in these early modes, but one thing that is clear is that the ancient Greek modes were not the same as the later medieval modes of the same
name (for instance the modern Phrygian mode). For the sake of clarity, I use inverted commas to describe the Greek ‘Phrygian mode’ as I am here discussing the associations of the name rather than any particular note configuration.

Phrygia was a remote area in Anatolia, to the east of the domain of ancient Greece, and the instruments and music from there were considered foreign to the Greeks (Barker 1984, 15). The main Phrygian instrument was an oboe-like instrument called the *aulos*, capable of a very complex and expressive sound, said to be capable of playing music containing more semitone intervals than other instruments of the period (Wyss 1996, 26; Barker 1984, 51). Plato, in the fourth century BC, developed a moral ethos that frowned on the ‘complexity’ of the Phrygian *aulos* sound, in contrast to the ‘manly’ simplicity of the truly Greek Dorian mode played on stringed instruments. Both the ‘Eastern’ land of Phrygia and women are set up here as the Other, a commonality they share down the ages (Macarthur 2002, 119).

Ethnomusicologist Gilbert Rouget compared these two modes, arguing that the Phrygian mode is more expressive: ‘Musically, it is clear that a mode able to make tone-semitone contrasts must offer much greater expressive possibilities’ (1985, 224–5). This binary opposition, between Phrygian and Dorian, established Phrygia and its associated instrument, the *aulos*, as the Other, and in Greek times the ‘Phrygian mode’ was tainted with disapproval (Barker 1984, 99).

In illustration of the disapproval in which it was held, the playing of the *aulos* in the Phrygian mode was reported to incite men to frenzy, passion and violence. ‘Dangers’ of women and music are played out here. The music is seen to be dangerous in a similar way to other forms of seduction, as with the sirens (Austern 1998, 38–9). The sirens had been ‘enticing men’ throughout history. Subtly, and importantly, the concept of incitement transforms the signification away from ‘dangerous’ feminine charms, to the erotic charge for the listener. In contrast, a change of mode to Dorian calms the temper (Rouget 1985, 228–9).

The two modes thus became split along binary lines by their associations. Dorian in relation to Phrygian became

calm vs agitated, virile vs effeminate, worthy vs unworthy, aristocratic vs plebian, beauty vs banality, educational vs entertaining. The Phrygian side of this opposition could be summed up in one word: release.… [The modes’]
effect was due less to their musical characteristics than to the fact that they were signs: signs of Phrygia, the land from which Dionysus himself had come, in short, from the cradle of Dionysus worship. (ibid., 224–5)

Thus the connotations were established in Greek times of the Phrygian being Other: ‘the music of enthusiasm of Dionysiac mania was strongly felt to be Phrygian’ (Rouget 1985, 93). Anything labelled Phrygian was considered foreign, complex and immoral.

3.2 New sounds in medieval music

There is a further and important complication that arises in the medieval period concerning the notes of the Phrygian mode. In the ninth century the Gregorian church modes were established, keeping the names from the old Greek modes of Phrygian, Dorian, etc. However, the ‘new’ medieval modes called Phrygian and Dorian had different pitch sets to the earlier Greek modes of the same name. The new Phrygian may have even been based on the Ancient Greek Dorian and vice versa (Powers, 2001, 778, 781). The associations and stories attached to the Ancient Greek modes were now transferred to the medieval modes, and the Phrygian mode maintained its classification as Other. It was again described as the war-like mode, and continued its connotations of inciting passion and anger. Considering the strong, and opposing, connotations established in Greek times between the Phrygian and Dorian modes, this is an ironic turnaround.

The association of Other still linked Phrygia with wantonness and effeminacy. Elizabeth Eva Leach describes the medieval association of Phrygia: ‘with classic orientalist tropes of irregular sexual behaviour’ (Leach 2006, 2, 7). In addition, the concept of the Phrygian mode inciting ardour and violence cropped up in different forms. One version reported by Boethius has an association with Pythagoras:

Is there anyone who does not know the story about the young man from Taormina... calmed by Pythagoras who... advised that the mode be changed [from Phrygian to Dorian]... thus tempering the frenzy in the young man’s soul and restoring him to a peaceful state of mind. (Rouget 1985, 229–30)

This version may imply that the ethos of the modes could be attributed to the Pythagorean ‘harmony of the spheres’, and that the Phrygian mode is, perhaps, some aberration.
This attribution can be seen to hark back to the semitone intervals associated with the Phrygian *aulos*. Medieval theorists debated whether the ‘imperfect’ interval of the semitone could be considered part of the ‘harmony of the spheres’ (Kepler 1997, 465). The term ‘semi’ was seen as meaning an ‘incomplete’ tone, and music ‘rich in intervals smaller than a tone’ was deemed to be of a ‘morally dubious nature’ (Leach, 2006, 1–2). Thus the sound of the *aulos* playing the Phrygian mode would be associated with the immoral not only due to the associations with Phrygia, but also because of the preponderance of semitone intervals believed to be played on it (see 3.1).

The pitch sets of the medieval church modes remain constant until today. Among them, the Phrygian and Locrian modes, and no others, contain the $b2$.

Within medieval music there were generally tonal centres, with ‘a drive towards an endpoint’ (McAlpine 2008, 441). The semitone interval was vital to the cadential pull, leading notes either up or down to the tonic (Forte 1959, 18; Chew 1983, 35–6). However, connections were made between the semitone ‘leading note’ attraction to the tonic and the leading of the ‘simple and masculine’ tone to the ‘effeminate and violent’ semitone, stating that the listener’s ‘moral fiber would be mollified by such unethical semitones’ (Leach 2006, 5). Leach writes that this ‘tension-resolution patterning was felt to depict a sensual appetite whose ethicality was questionable’ (ibid., 3). The medieval Phrygian mode with its $b2$–$\bar{1}$ melodic cadence might well have attracted these further connotations.

Yet the Phrygian mode was used extensively by some medieval church composers. There is an absence of musical scores and a scarcity of contemporary written sources to analyse the early use of the Gregorian church modes. However one composer, the German Hildegard of Bingen (1098–1179), had her music so admired by her contemporaries that they took the unusual step of transcribing many of her pieces. About half of all these transcriptions of Hildegard of Bingen are in the Phrygian mode (McAlpine 2008, 253). Her piece ‘O Euchari’ begins on the tonic E, leaping to the B (Figure 3.1), a tonality-establishing device that is repeated in bars 10, 14 and 28. As with much of Hildegard’s work the mode is clear throughout. She uses phrases which are characteristic of the Phrygian mode during this period, as in the stepwise descent from C to E in bars 7–9, and again
in bars 33–35 (ibid., 253, 256), and there are frequent falling cadences back to the final E. The leap from D to F in bar 20, b7–♭2 is described by Fiona McAlpine as enclosing the E in a wedge (ibid., 256). This circling of the tonic is familiar from many tonal melodic gestures discussed in the previous chapter, and will appear strongly in the case of heavy metal bass lines in the gesture b7–♭2–♭1.

The particular characteristic phrases of the Phrygian mode, used in this period, have been said to contribute to certain ambiguities in its identification. Saul Novack writes of how the Phrygian tonality was often not clear until the end of a piece (1977, 86). This ambiguity of where the tonal centre lay apparently made the Phrygian rather difficult to appreciate by those not ‘in the know’ and used scarcely (McAlpine 2008, 257).

Thus there is a somewhat unclear picture of the use of the Phrygian mode within medieval church music. As one of the most prolific of medieval church composers there is substantial significance to the proportion of pieces in the Phrygian mode by Hildegard, especially in the light of writings on a scarcity of this mode in the same period.

\[ j = 84 \]

Figure 3.1 Hildegard of Bingen, ‘O Euchari’ (McAlpine 2008, 254–5). See also CD 2 track 1: 0.00–0.40; 1.30–1.59 for a version of this song.
Moorish influence on medieval secular music

The eleventh-to-thirteenth century troubadours were prominent in southern France. They were knights and musicians, playing secular music for the courts of Europe. Although troubadours were familiar with the church music of southern France, influences on their musical compositions also came from elsewhere in Europe. The troubadours travelled widely: for instance Aimeric de Peguilhan spent time in the courts of Spain and played with Moorish musicians (Wright 1992, 566–7), and troubadour William IX had a Spanish wife (Menocal 2002, 125). Moreover, the many Moorish troupes of musicians in the Christian courts of Europe were known to the troubadours (Wright 1992, 563). Writing of the eleventh century, Roger Boase says ‘No princely retinue was complete without Moorish musicians.... Moorish musicians and singers were invariably present at wedding festivities’ (1977, 69). So, in addition to musical influence from the churches, influence from the high art of the Hispano-Arabian Empire upon troubadour music in France was quite possible, though difficult to specify (McAlpine 2008, 259).

One reason for this difficulty was the relative absence of notation. Contemporary transcription of troubadour music was idiosyncratic, each scribe having their own choice of tonal centres and intervallic structure for songs (Aubrey 2000, 136). Wright sums up the situation by saying: ‘What dominates the picture, it should be admitted from the outset, is the stark fact that the music itself can not be disinterred’ (1992, 555). It is possible, however, to consider this repertoire in a general contextualised way.

The troubadour instruments of lute and rebec are adaptations of the Arabian oud and rabab and ‘it is sensible to assume that along with them were adopted for the most part their characteristic sounds and playing techniques’ (ibid., 566). So considering these Arabian instrument origins it would be surprising not to find traces of the Arabian music of the time. Troubadour ‘Songs of love’ were also sung on both sides of the Pyrenees (Menocal 2002, 124). However, in her study of surviving manuscripts, McAlpine finds scarce use of the Phrygian mode in French troubadour song: in only eight out of two hundred and forty songs transcribed. Aimerac de Perguilhan’s (1190–1221) ‘Altressi.m pren com fai al jugador’, is one of these eight (Figure 3.2).
Althou -

gh there are two melodic cadences $\flat 2 - 1 - \flat 7 - 1$ in bars 12–13 and 23–24, it is notable that the finalis E is not rested on, or indeed sung much, until the last cadence of the falling A–E tetrachord, perhaps demonstrating the ‘difficult’ nature of Phrygian mode use at the time in the ambiguity of its tonal centre (McAlpine 2008, 273). McAlpine gives this ‘difficulty’ as an explanation of the mode’s scarcity, suggesting that Phrygian mode pieces within the church required a familiarity of theoretical conventions to be understood, and as these conventions may not have been understood by the general populace in France they would not have been popular in contemporary secular music (ibid., 257, 286).

The ‘Black Legend’

The importance and influence of troubadour songs in later musical developments of Western music is well established, and the presence or absence of the $\flat 2$ within this tradition is therefore relevant to later use of this note. However, investigating the $\flat 2$ in this repertoire highlights the rather unequal treatment the influence of Moorish traditions has received in musicological enquiry. It has been suggested that there are ‘deliberate omissions’ of connections between Arabian musical traditions in Spain, including Spanish court music, and the French troubadour movement, and, thus, later European musical development (Etzion 1998, 104). In fact the Moorish influence has been written of as being a drawback, dubbed the ‘Black Legend’, with Spain seen as having ill-repute,
partly due to its ‘racial impurity’ (ibid., 96), and a ‘slow progress’ of musical
development within Spain to be in part ‘accounted for by the prevalence of
Moorish manners and customs for many centuries…. [These left traces in] the
Moorish corruption of Spanish manners’ (ibid., 103). The eighteenth-century
publication *Encyclopedie Methodique* claimed that ‘Spain had not contributed
anything worthwhile to Western civilization in the last 1000 years’ (ibid., 96).
These comments are made in the full knowledge of the history of sophisticated
court music known to, and influencing later composers such as Domenico
Scarlatti. Other authors have acknowledged a great contribution made by the
Andalusian Moors to Spanish music (ibid., 113). However Etzion contends that
musicology is still affected by the ‘prejudices arising from the Black Legend’
towards Spanish music, though often this is more a case of obliviousness than any
direct slander (ibid., 97). The question relevant to this thesis is how the use of the
♭2 in post-Arabian Europe might have been affected by these anti-Moorish
attitudes. The causes of the demise of the Phrygian mode in Europe may have
been partly ideological as well as musical. Exactly what role an anti-Islamic
feeling had in the development of European musical style, however, ‘remains as
elusive and enigmatic as ever’ (Wright 1992, 574).

3.3 Renaissance 1400–1600
McClary acknowledges a connection between Arabian song and troubadour
music in the development of the madrigal: ‘The madrigal resuscitates a tradition
of vernacular love song… stretching from the Moorish courts of medieval Spain,
through the troubadours’ (2004, 6). Yet it was during the Renaissance period that
the distancing from the ♭2 became stronger. In interview I asked McClary
whether the distancing had a connection with Moorish resonances. She replied:

I think there are a lot of places in the history of Western art music where the
sense that it would sound Arabic to do otherwise does come into the picture,
and so I don’t think that’s completely out of the picture. [However] I think
its de-legitimation doesn’t come primarily from trying to distance oneself
from an alien culture. (McClary interview 2011)

The main reason that the Phrygian mode fell out of use in the West was described
to me as through the development of polyphony.
The development of a harmonic framework

In the fifteenth century there is a premium put on the vertical.... It’s very hard to use the Phrygian.... The Phrygian mode held a particular problem within the polyphonic framework due to its $\flat 2$ note, and was labelled illegitimate.... Most of the distance comes from a set of choices that occurred during the development of polyphonic and contrapuntal practice in European music. And once you have certain kinds of cadence types that are adopted as just what conventionally will happen to create closure... it’s really hard to accommodate it [the $\flat 2$]. (McClary interview 2011)

The harmonic framework established in the Renaissance developed the practice of having a dominant-to-tonic (V–I) cadence (Rosen 1998, 26). Within the V chord were the $\hat{7}$ and natural $\hat{2}$ degrees, crucially incompatible with the $\flat 2$. The major $\hat{7}$ was introduced informally at first, as early as the tenth century (McAlpine 2008, 288), with the practice of musica ficta where, as in Turkish classical music, performance practice sometimes differed from written notations. One difference was the practice of sharpening the $\hat{7}$ degree when ascending to the tonic. A crucial changing point was when this informal practice started to be notated. The semitone tension, $\hat{7}$–$\hat{1}$, became consolidated as a means of closure at cadence points. The rise of the V–I ‘perfect’ cadence used this $\hat{7}$–$\hat{1}$ tension and release as a vital part of its effect (Novack 1977, 86–7).

The Phrygian mode could not support this V chord. Melodies in E Phrygian were sometimes adapted to resolve to other notes, often A, increasing the ambiguity of tonal centre that was already present in the mode. This ambiguity and the impossibility of using a V–I ‘perfect’ cadence prompts McClary to comment that the Phrygian was ‘unsuitable for the vast majority of situations’ (2004, 82). Thus there was progressively less use of the Phrygian mode as harmonic practices of polyphony developed.

How the Phrygian continued in the Renaissance

However, the Phrygian tonality survived the advent of polyphony to a certain extent, continuing beside the major and minor tonalities. The Phrygian ‘remained the unique exception, successfully resisting mutation that reflected the path leading to major-minor absolutism.... The step-wise motion normally is accomplished in the form now known as the Phrygian cadence’ (Novack 1977, 87). This survival was partly because of its ‘illegitimacy’. McClary remarked that
composers introduce the Phrygian mode ‘in special circumstances to evoke either a mystical state or the Other’ (interview 2011).

As in other musical cultures, such as in Mediterranean genres (see chapter two), harmonic solutions were devised such as the sequence ♭vii–I, to harmonise the Phrygian. The Spanish Renaissance composer Cabezón wrote often in the Phrygian mode, as in the ‘Tiento del Cuarto Tono’ (Figure 3.3). The vii (Dm) chord was used frequently, with a ♭vii–I cadence, in bars 3–4, though note how the ♭2 is not used in the final plagal cadence.

![Figure 3.3 Cabezón, ‘Tiento del Cuarto Tono’ last 8 bars (1958, 24).](image)

The ♭II chord, later to be known as the Neapolitan, is also used. For instance the Franco-Flemish composer Josquin des Prez’s ‘Tu Pauperum Refugium’ (Figure 3.4) uses three chords: E minor and A minor triads, then in the penultimate bar the F, ♭II, in first inversion. This produces in its resolution the effect of a plagal cadence (IV–I). The cadence can be seen to be strengthened by the presence of an F rather than E (present in a conventional IV chord) in the penultimate chord (Novack 1977, 91,108). Tension is then maintained till the final chord, with the falling semitone ♭2–♭1 in the second voice.

![Figure 3.4 Josquin des Prez, ‘Tu Pauperum Refugium’ bars 1–5 (Davison and Apel 1949, 92).](image)
The ‘weeping’ pianto

Monelle discusses the falling semitone motif, which he refers to as the pianto topic, dating back to Renaissance madrigals where it accompanied lyrics about weeping (pianti) (2000, 17). The metaphorical connotations that are embedded within the falling semitone gesture are deeply influential on interpretations of the $b^2$–$i$ movement. I argue that the falling semitone $b^2$–$i$ motif, is a particularly intense form of the pianto as it falls to the tonic.\(^{67}\)

The falling semitone interval also retained associations of femininity from the medieval period. Linda Austern quotes the seventeenth-century theorist Charles Butler writing that ‘effeminate lamentations, sorrowful passions, and complaints are fitly exprest by the inordinate half-notes’ (quoted in Austern 1998, 41). The \(b^2\), being a semitone above the key-note, was thus coded as soft and given a feminine, sorrowful description, as opposed to the ‘natural’ whole step that is described as firm, austere and masculine (Leach 2006, 8). For instance Johannes Kepler writes on music and gender in 1599:

> For as woman is made chiefly to be passive, man to be active, especially in the act of generation, so the soft kind is fitted for the feminine motions of the mind, the hard for masculine activities… [When] things are upside down, so that there is a semi-tone in the lowest position… Phrygian to the ancients, it agrees with this reversal of the order of nature that they sound plaintive, broken, and in a sense lamentable [indicating] languor of the mind [or perhaps] pleasurable sadness, as when we are pleased with softness of mind, with loves and desires, or when joy expresses itself in tears. (Kepler 1997, 240, 243–5)

The $b^2$ came to connote pathos, anguish or equivocation. The sixteenth century madrigal by Verdelot, ‘O Dolce Notte’ (Oh Sweet Night), has an initial melodic motif of A–B♭–A (\(i–b^2–i\)) (Figure 3.5) that McClary says ‘haunts the canzona…. Verdelot offers us night as a nocturnal arch consisting of A B♭ A’ (ibid., 51). McClary describes how the ‘B♭ pulls downward’ (2004, 48). The motif A–B♭–A is used as the bass line of the harmony A–Gm/B♭–A, and then melodically over chord sequences Dm–Gm–Dm, F–B♭–F, and D–Gm–D, all in the context of an A minor tonality (Figure 3.6). The ‘nocturnal arch’ of ‘O Dolce Notte’ has a lyric describing a ‘delicious and corrupt world’ (ibid., 44, ), a night of a ‘triumph of love’ at the expense of ‘human decency’ (ibid., 47). Here are

---

\(^{67}\) See also Moore 2012.
overtones of the Other, and McClary states that ‘the early modern Self—with all its insecurities, its arrogance, its narcissism, its scepticism, its dualisms—already stands here fully formed in these canzone’ (ibid., 53).

Figure 3.5 Verdelot, ‘O Dolce Notte’. CD 2 track 2: 0.00–0.08.

Figure 3.6 Verdelot, ‘O Dolce Notte’ harmonisations of A–B♭–A motif (McClary 2004, 50).

So, in sum, the advent of the V–I harmonic cadence in the Renaissance period meant that the Phrygian mode did not fit in. Yet it continued as an occasional Other choice, with, for instance, the vii–I chord sequence (as later ‘re-invented’ in Mediterranean music and reinterpreted in Western music as iv–V). Within Western European contexts the b2–♭1 pianto began to get attached to notions of the Other, as well as weakness, pathos, anguish and the feminine, partly because of connotations of the broader category of the semitone interval.

The Greek and medieval associations between the Phrygian mode and the incitement of passion and anger (see 3.1) continued into the Renaissance period. Powers quotes an anonymous writer from the sixteenth century seeking to justify the inclusion of this scale within liturgical texts: ‘Since this mode is harsh and inciting to wrath and war, it is suitably applied to those matters where something of bravery or power is shown... through which the devil was conquered, and the world was rescued through the blood of Christ’ (quoted in Powers 2001, 798). These strong associations lead us to the Baroque period and the ‘affects’.

3.4 Baroque rhetoric: the b2 as lament, passion, the Other.

The Baroque art of rhetoric and its ‘affects’ gave new life to the modes, including the Phrygian, as a means of evoking particular effects. The Phrygian mode was now clearly marked as Other. McClary describes how it managed to survive, despite the advent of major-minor tonality, taking the role of conveying complexity: ‘Its procedures fetishize its genetic abnormality and arrange for it to
prevail—against all odds—over more likely, less pathological alternatives’ (2004, 82). For example, Girolamo Frescobaldi (1583–1644) experimented with the Phrygian, creating bizarre pieces that deliberately exploited the ‘illegitimacy’ of the mode: ‘Frescobaldi wants it to sound like it’s beyond reason’ (McClary interview 2011). The canzona after the communion in the 1635 ‘Fiori Musicali’ contains an Adagio that is in the Phrygian mode, though often sharpening the third to produce the Phrygian Major mode (Figure 3.7). Frescobaldi makes no attempt to secrete the $\flat_2$ within the harmonic framework (as other composers might), but uses it clearly in the bass line, adding other dissonant notes to emphasise spiritual associations of ‘irrationality’. The harmony of the final cadence in bars 3–4 is Dm/F–Em–E, the $\flat_{vii}–I(i)$ comparable to harmonisations in chapter two.

![Figure 3.7 Frescobaldi, ‘Canzon Quarti Toni (Mode 4) Adagio 1 bars 14–17.’](http://conquest.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/f/fe/IMSLP213599-WIMA.1448-Fiori_musicali.pdf)

The ‘Toccata per l’elevatione’, later in the same work, is also in the Phrygian mode. The $\flat_2$–$\hat{1}$ motif appears in the bass line at the end of bar 3, and again in the tenor in bar 5, followed by the natural $\hat{2}$ and major $\hat{3}$ (Figure 3.8). Frescobaldi used many accidentals and extreme dissonances, and his works were very influential on later composers, such as J. S. Bach.

---

The ‘lament’ motif

By the beginning the Baroque period the falling semitone gesture, the *pianto*, had lost direct attachment to lyrics of weeping, and now signified ‘grief, pain, regret, loss’ (Monelle 2000, 17). Often this *pianto* gesture occurred in the context of the falling ‘Phrygian’ tetrachord, named after the lower tetrachord of the Phrygian mode. However, much of this writing places this tetrachord freely within a scale, for instance $\text{♭7–♭6–5}$. The term ‘Phrygian’ was once more adapted, here referring to any tone-tone-semitone falling gesture. This extended figure became known as the ‘lament motif’ (Rosand 1979, 349). William Kimmel takes the signification of grief to an extreme and associates all occurrences of a falling ‘Phrygian’ tetrachord (the lament motif) with death, writing: ‘Wherever in music these configurations occur prominently, they disclose the presence and workings of death in the musical being’ (1980, 44–45).

The ‘lament motif’ was often repeated as a bass ostinato, as in Monteverdi’s *Lamento della ninfa* of 1638, in which the lyrics tell of how the nymph has been abandoned. Dissonance is used in the introduction, perhaps to highlight ‘distress’, with an F natural and F sharp sounded together in the vii–I cadence (Figure 3.9).

---

*Figure 3.8 Frescobaldi, ‘Toccata per l’elevatione’ bars 1–6.*


---

*Figure 3.9 Monteverdi, ‘Lamento della ninfa’ intro bars 9–12.*

---

With the introduction of the ‘lament motif’, Monteverdi illuminates the expressive implications of the descending tetrachord pattern and demonstrates its suitability for association with lament…. In its unremitting descent, its gravity, the pattern offers an analogue of obsession, perceptible as an expression of hopeless suffering…. [This refers to] an emotional state rather than a narrative action. It is precisely the descending tetrachord ostinato, as an appropriate mimetic gesture, that embodies the representational element… that signifies its affect. (Rosand 1979, 349–52)

![Figure 3.10 Monteverdi, ‘Lamento della ninfa’ II.](http://conquest.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/d/d0/IMSLP269048-PMLP82381-LamentoNinfa-concert.pdf) [accessed 18/03/2014].

The constant repetition of the ‘lament’ bass adds to its emotional power (Ross 2011, 35–7). The two-bar sequence ending on an imperfect cadence. $i-\flat V_{II}-\flat V_{I}-(A m G F E)$, persists right to the final chord of E (Figure 3.10), leaving uncertainty and lack of resolution. The affinity with the $iV-\flat III-\flat II-I$ sequence is striking, an the emotional and exotic appeal of the sequence carries through its transposition. McClary says that the

lament bass in Italian [music is] grabbing onto exoticism but also a kind of racial identification and not wanting to sound like that—so you take the instrument and the sense of repeating but distance yourselves, make it behave properly…. What the Italians got from all those ostinato patterns was a very different sense of tonality—they could vamp—a very different sense of time passing. (McClary interview 2011)

It can thus be argued that the ‘lament’ bass developed from the falling tetrachord

---


71 ibid.
of the Bayati maqam –♭3–♭2–♭1 and the Andalusian cadence (introduced in chapter two). The names and sentiments of the 2–♭1 pianto topic continue within these changed settings. The sequence had travelled far from Andalusia, taking the Moorish gesture and adapting it to fit the emergent major-minor tonalities: in Baroque Italy this sequence gravitated to i–♭VI–♭VI–V, ending with an imperfect cadence. The ambiguity that had hung over the Phrygian mode since the times of Gregorian chant now attempted to find certainty within the new harmonic settings.

Both the Phrygian and Andalusian cadences were important parts of the rhetorical gestures of the Baroque, perceived as producing strong affects on the listener, principally of ‘grief’. The cadence mutated from the viib–I sequence (see 3.3.2) to the chord sequence ivb–V, again giving an imperfect cadence and allowing it to ‘fit in’ to the ‘modern’ minor scale harmonies, and this is now known as the ‘Phrygian cadence’. The 2 disappeared from common practice, with both the Phrygian and Andalusian cadences now transferred to the dominant rather than the tonic, as the structural role previously taken by the 2 is now taken by the 6. Connotations of passion and anguish also transferred to the 6. Musicologist Deryck Cooke describes the use of the 2 as ‘an expression of anguish in a context of finality, a hopeless anguish’, in contrast to the 6 that is ‘anguish with hope’ (Cooke 1959, 78).

Of the use of the Phrygian in chorales

The Phrygian mode continued to be used, in the late Baroque period, within chorales, with connotations of passion and anguish (Novack 1977, 102). A chorale was often given many different musical settings or lyrics, and thus provides a window into the contemporary attitude to mode and meaning. One popular chorale, known from J. S. Bach’s famous setting of ‘O Haupt voll Blut und Wunden’ (O Sacred Head Now Wounded) BWV 244/17, was given numerous different settings (some seventy-six), with essentially the same melody, and sometimes contradictory lyrics (ibid., 7). Bach composed several settings of the chorale to the lyrics ‘Befiehl du deine Wege’ (Commit your way to the Lord), in the major scale, as BWV 244 from the St Matthew Passion, and in the
Phrygian mode, as BWV 153 (Figure 3.11). The tonality of the phrygian setting is not clear until the final plagal cadence in E. The $b_2$ appears once only in this extract, though on an accented beat, in bar 3. The most popular lyrics for the chorale, fifty one settings, were ‘Herzlich tut mich verlangen’ (I yearn from my heart), which ‘tells a story of a believer who looks forward to dying and going to Heaven; and ‘Ach Herr, mich armen Sünder’ (Oh Lord, I am a poor sinner) which involves a believer who fears the wrath of God and going to Hell’ (Hill, Kamentsky and Trehub 1996, 5). The heaven-associated theme and the hell-associated theme were all either in the Ionian mode (major scale) or the Phrygian mode (ibid.). A significant number, twenty-three out of twenty-six, of the ‘Promise of salvation’ lyric settings were in the Ionian mode, while seventeen of the twenty-five ‘Going to Hell’ lyric settings were in the Phrygian mode (ibid., 8). It may be concluded that there is a stronger, though not overwhelming, negative connotation here for the Phrygian mode.

Figure 3.11 J. S. Bach, ‘Befiehl du deine Wege’ BMV 153.

More recent reflections on ‘O Haupt voll Blut und Wunden’ have included from Heinrich Schenker, who preferred the Ionian treatment declaring that the last note ‘is correctly understood as the $\check{3}$’ (Schenker 1979, 95). Schenker here is considering the final note of E to not be the tonic, but a chord note of a C major triad. Hill et al conducted a study with twentieth century Canadian subjects who chose which of these modes they felt to be the most appropriate mode for each setting (1996, 7). They found that children as well as adults judged the Ionian mode more suitable for the ‘salvation/reward’ alternative and the Phrygian mode more suitable for the ‘condemnation/punishment’ alternative (ibid., 7–9). The associations for the Phrygian mode that were established in the Baroque era are thus seen to still survive into the twentieth century.

72 <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=urWnxgFts3w> [accessed 16/03/14].
The rise of the Neapolitan sixth chord

Another development in the Baroque period was in the use of the ♭II as a sub-dominant chord rather than a dominant chord, often appearing in first inversion, and called the Neapolitan sixth chord. The name came from an association with the ‘Neapolitan school’, and it was an established, if infrequent, harmonic practice by the end of the seventeenth century, used by Scarlatti, Carissimi, Corelli, and Purcell.\(^\text{74}\)

The Neapolitan chord retained the passionate connotations of the ♭2, as indicated by Richard Taruskin, writing about Scarlatti’s lyric setting in ‘Opera l’Eraclea’ 1700: ‘Note the Neapolitan throb that emphasises—what else?—the words ‘Remember that I love you!’ [ricordati ch’io t’amo]?’ (ibid., 145). The Neapolitan chord became popular and remained so through to the Romantic Era (Novack 1977, 103).

In des Prez’s early use of this chord (Figure 3.4), Novack describes the ♭II chord as a sub-dominant chord in a plagal cadence, with the ♭2 replacing the .REG. to provide more tension to the chord (ibid., 91). This major chord was often used within a minor key, where it was considered to have advantages over the diminished chord built on the diatonic natural 2 (ibid., 108). Novack writes that ‘the diatonic background of tonality reaches out to absorb within its inner detail non-diatonic tones.... The Phrygian mode adds its characteristic 2nd degree to the process of mixture’ (ibid., 103). There is, however, no question of being in the Phrygian mode here: the ♭2 is a non-diatonic incursion providing a harmonic function.

![Figure 3.12 Vitali ‘Corrente Seconda’ (Apel 1990, 192).](image)

\(^{74}\) Neapolitan harmony may have origins in the siciliana aria that often cadences on the Neapolitan sixth chord: ‘This distinctive harmonic mannerism, which quickly caught on in other repertoires, reinforces the impression that the siciliana may have originated in some local musical dialect’ (Taruskin 2009, 145).
Vitali’s ‘Corrente Seconda’ is an early example of the Neapolitan sixth chord (see Figure 3.12). The melodic $\flat 2$ passes to the $\hat{1}$, onto the major $\hat{7}$, and resolves in a perfect cadence back up to the $\hat{1}$. Here is what McAlpine describes as a melodic ‘wedge’, the two leading notes encircling the tonic before their resolution (McAlpine 2008, 256).

Peter Smith writes that ‘the Neapolitan does not normally form a direct harmonic connection with its tonic; it characteristically functions as a dominant preparation’ (Smith 1998, 11). The Neapolitan chord was almost always followed by the dominant chord, this sequence better fitting into the contemporary musical theory where the V–i/I perfect cadence predominated (Novack 1977, 103). The cadential sequence that became established using the Neapolitan sixth chord was the sequence $\flat II_b$–(ic)–V–i/I.

Thus the $\flat 2$ was an affective signifier in the rhetorical Baroque style, the $\flat 2$–$\hat{1}$ being an intense manifestation of the pianto motif. It also began to appear in new, structural ways, as a part of new cadences, such as the Neapolitan cadence where it combined with the rising leading note in the harmonic practices of the Baroque. The ‘weeping’ pianto became the Mannheim ‘sigh’ in Western musical metaphor (Monelle 1991, 102–3). The semitone fall became an iconic manifestation of a physical sigh (Cardillo 2008, 80), representing despair, yielding and passive resignation.

The Iberian Baroque

In Spain the $\flat II$ I cadence became more established, perhaps because the strength of the Arabian heritage of the falling tetrachord from Bayati maqam $\hat{4}$$\flat 3$$\flat 2$$\hat{1}$ was stronger due to the Moorish heritage. The Phrygian and Andalusian melodic cadences appeared in folk music and were frequently used in classical compositions. As in Italian practice, however, these cadences were often transposed to i–$\flat$VII–VI–V rather than the original iv–$\flat$I–III–$\flat$II–I.

Exchanges with Italy were deeply influential, Spain governing Naples for hundreds of years. Domenico Scarlatti lived for half his life in Spain, including several years in Andalusia: ‘Accordingly, his sonatas contain several features reminiscent of Spanish vernacular musics’ (Manuel 2002, 314). Scarlatti’s Sonata in D major K492 was written in the 1750s, when he had been in Spain for twenty-
five years, and contains allusions to Andalusian guitar motifs, with \( \hat{1} - \hat{b}^2 - \hat{1} \)
movement in the bassline (Figure 3.13). The harmony oscillates between the
chords E and B\(^9\)/F, giving an E to F bass line. The strong affiliation with the
Spanish folk bass movement of the rising and falling semitone is striking. This
passage would be analysed as V–II\(^c\) in A minor, a transposition of the \( \hat{1} - \hat{b}^2 \)
bassline to \( \hat{5} - \hat{b}^6 \).

![Figure 3.13 Scarlatti, D major sonata (K. 492) bars 26–29.](image)

Another example is Scarlatti’s A minor Sonata K. 218, where in bars 79–83 he
uses the sequence IV–V–iv\(^b\)–V (Figure 3.14). Dean Sutcliffe writes that here
‘what remains is the engine of Spanish harmony as Scarlatti conceives it in this
sonata, the IV or IV6 alternating with V in the Phrygian progression’ (Sutcliffe
2003, 117). In Scarlatti’s C# minor sonata K. 247, the Andalusian bass line is
used, together with ornaments likened to the Spanish cante jondo style of singing
as at the Phrygian cadence to G# at bars 9–11 (ibid., 332) (Figure 3.15).

![Figure 3.14 Scarlatti, A minor sonata (K. 218) bars 77–84.](image)

---

<http://imslp.org/wiki/Keyboard_Sonata_in_D_major,_K.492_%28Scarlatti,_Domenico
%29> [accessed 18/03/2014].
Scarlatti’s Spanish pupil Antonio Soler also made wide use of the Andalusian and Phrygian cadences in his keyboard works. Soler was more likely to retain the position of the Phrygian cadence on the sequence $\flat ii^7 I$, as in his ‘Fandango’.

The ‘Fandango’ is a ten-minute piece with a constant ostinato outlining the harmony of Gm7–A triads (Figure 3.16). This clearly is reminiscent of harmonic patterns in flamenco guitar playing, and Manuel comments on this particular ostinato as typical of a fandango (2002, 319).

---


The ostinato is relentless, only occasionally coming to a rest on the A (Figure 3.17). ‘Ambiguities’ involved in the harmonisation of the Phrygian mode are discussed by Manuel (2002, 311–36). Whereas Scarlatti would generally, though not always, follow the European manner of resolving an Andalusian cadence to its highest note, Soler’s keyboard fandangos end on the traditional Phrygian close (ibid., 315–6). Western musicologists, such as Malcolm Boyd, have treated this cadence as perhaps incomplete (Boyd 1987, 193). Yet Manuel asserts that this is a basic misunderstanding of the Spanish harmonic practice, and that a resolution, in this case to the D, is the gringo ending (2002, 318).

Phrygian tonality continued in Ottoman or Arabian influenced Mediterranean countries:

While Phrygian-type modal harmony essentially died out elsewhere in Europe, the harmonic scheme described here thrived in precisely those areas exposed to prolonged Arab or Turkish rule, and concomitantly to Arab modal influence (Andalusia, Greece, and the Balkans). Thus the term Phrygian tonality, as used here and by others to describe Andalusian music, does not imply identity with or direct historical links to Gregorian modal practice. (ibid., 313)

Within Spain, then, although as with Italian Baroque music, the sentiment and melodic motifs are often transferred to the b6 in order to be diatonic within standard minor tonality, the b2 also appears in compositions influenced by Andalusian local music, sometimes with evocations of Spanish dance music. The use of the b2 in Spain can be considered qualitatively different to that in the rest of Europe due to the ‘closeness’ of its Arabian heritage. There has been a continuum in Spain of Arabian musical influence from the tenth to the twenty-first century. I argue that the presence of the b2–1 melodic cadence is part of this heritage.

80 Gringo is Spanish slang for ‘white foreigners’.
3.5 The ♭2 in the Romantic era

By the second half of the eighteenth century, major–minor tonality, with an emphasis on tonic and dominant harmonies, was established throughout the European classical repertoire. The harmonic developments established in the Renaissance brought the V–I perfect cadence to prominence above all other harmonic expression. The rising leading note and the V–I perfect cadence were regarded as ‘modern’, the modes as ‘archaic’ (Taylor 2007, 17–18). The modes that did not have a major 7 fell out of use in standard Western classical composition, as did the Lydian mode with its raised fourth.

The eighteenth century was the time of ‘Enlightenment’ and tonality was ‘understood as the enactment of the Enlightenment priorities’ (McClary 2001, 69). Taylor writes of the role of colonialism in the rise of tonality and opera, and contends that the ‘discovery’ of the New World shook the European’s sense of Selfhood (2007, 17–18). In order to support their Self, Europeans now felt a need to claim centrality, putting Others on the periphery, to be continually mastered. The resulting narrative of the ‘hero’s journey’ was then manifested in tonality and opera, where the role of Others is taken by new keys or ‘foreign’ elements that are subsequently banished (ibid.). During the Enlightenment, foreign representation in music changed from simply ‘exotic’ to concepts of the ‘uncivilised’ (ibid., 46). Turkish references were particularly rampant, partly as the Ottoman Empire had been a significant threat to the West (ibid., 51).

When nineteenth-century composers used the ♭2 or the Phrygian mode the associations were very clear: these devices were alien, transgressions from the norm, expressing anguish, passion, weakness and femininity. A nineteenth-century Encyclopedia Britannica entry tells that the Phrygian mode itself is ‘alleged by some as an argument of their effeminacy’ (Maclaren 1823, 414).

The zenith of the Neapolitan chord

Although the Neapolitan chord has its roots in Renaissance and Baroque music, it flourished in the nineteenth century. As described above, the Neapolitan chord is usually used in the role of a subdominant chord, in which the ♭2 does not directly resolve to the tonic, but passes over it to the 7 then resolves in the perfect cadence. This sequence
led to an expansion of the harmonic process. The ♭II chord, used in many ways, became extended, enveloping within its prolongations melodic activity rich in its contrast to the diatonic framework of the I chord to which it is related as ♭II. (Novack 1977, 122)

I will now describe specific cases of its use in nineteenth century composition; variations where the melodic movement between 1 and ♭2 is emphasised with Neapolitan chord use; and the development of the Neapolitan Complex, where there is a tonicisation of the ♭2.

The classic harmonic sequence using the Neapolitan chord is ♭IIb–(ic)–V7–i. I offer three examples of it, all of which have associations with tragedy. Firstly, at the beginning of Beethoven’s Piano Sonata No. 14 in C-sharp minor Op. 27, No. 2, the ‘Moonlight Sonata’ (Figure 3.18), the sequence is i | i7d | VI ♭IIb | V7 ic V7 | i. Within the arpeggiated theme the ♭2 clearly plays a harmonic role. Barry Cooper described this theme as having a ‘feeling of profound tragedy, intensified at times by the use of the flattened supertonic’ (Cooper 2008, 115). The ♭2 is thus directly associated with the connotation of tragedy.

![Figure 3.18 Beethoven, ‘Moonlight Sonata’](http://erato.uvt.nl/files/imglnks/usimg/d/d0/IMSLP218185-PMLP01458-Beethoven_Op_27_No_2_I.pdf) [accessed 18/03/2014].

Secondly, the Lento from Chopin’s ‘Valse Brillante’ in A Minor Op. 34 No. 2 has a standard use of the Neapolitan cadence. The second theme of the waltz starts loud and bright in the A Major scale (bars 53–68) and then is repeated suddenly and quietly in minor tonality (bars 69–84), with the ♭2 giving a Phrygian tinge (Figure 3.19). The major ii–V sequence transforms to the

---

81 (2012, 1) Beethoven– Moonlight Sonata.
Neapolitan $\flat I - V$:\footnote{In the chart here and throughout this thesis b and c refer to first and second inversions.}

\begin{align*}
1 & | ii^b & | V^7 & | vi & | V^7 & | III^7 & | ii^b & | V^7 & | I \\
I & | ii^b & | V^{799} & | bVI & | Ic & | Ic & | V^7 & | I & | II
\end{align*}

to

\begin{align*}
1 & | bII^b & | V^7 & | vi & | V^7 & | i^7 & | bII^b & | V^7 & | I \\
i & | bII^b & | V^{799} & | bVI & | ic & | Ic & | V^7 & | i & | II
\end{align*}

The melodic falling $\flat 3 - \flat 2 - i - 7 - 1$ gesture in bars 69–71 is a striking contrast to the major $3 - 2 - i - 7 - 1$ in bars 53–5, and the two sequences repeat twice more in the piece. Blair Johnston described this change of mode as a ‘bittersweet inspiration…. He positively bathes himself in languor and longing throughout’ (2012, para. 3). The waltz is described by reviewer Nico Paul as showing ‘the “other” side of Chopin: full of melancholy, gloom and grief, expressed in mournful simplicity’ (2012, para. 3). The role of the $\flat 2$ here is both in combination with the $\flat 3$ in the change of mode to ‘lower than expected’\footnote{Again, congruent with Huron’s ‘lower than normal’ research (Huron, Yim, and Chordia 2010, 8).}, and in the contrast within bars 69–84 of the use of natural 2 on ascent (for example in bars 71 and 76) and $\flat 2$ on descent.
Figure 3.19 Chopin, Waltz in A minor Op. 34 No. 2 bars 53–84. See also CD 2 track 4: 0.05–0.55.

Thirdly, Schubert’s 1823 Der Muller und der Bach, comes at the end of a twenty-song cycle where a man is about to drown himself in a brook (Figure 3.20). The ♭IIb–V7–i (A♭/C–D7–Gm) Neapolitan cadence occurs in the last three bars of the first and third lines. The melodic figures emphasise the movement from the ♭2 to the 7, via a light touch of the 1, before the 7–1 perfect cadence. The second line ends with a four bar cadence ♭IIb #IV7/V | V | V |, a variation of the sequence giving more emphasis to the melodic gesture ♭2–1, afforded by the 1 being one of the notes of the added #IV7 chord. Schubert uses this sequence to arrive at an imperfect cadence. Here there is clear, direct and emphasised movement of ♭2–1, both in the vocal line and the accompaniment.

Schubert uses this same sequence in his 1815 ‘Erlkonig’ (Elf King), a setting of a Goethe poem on the death of a small boy. Schubert brings in chords on the $\flat\text{II}$ (A$b$) at the point of death of the child. The repetitive $\flat$2 bass octaves through the chord changes add to the poignancy of the text. The chord sequence for this ending is $\flat\text{II} \mid \flat\text{V}^7/\flat\text{II} \mid \flat\text{IIb} \mid \#\text{IV}$o7 $\mid \text{V}^7 \mid \text{i}$ (Figure 3.21). The additional chord of #IVo7 between the subdominant $\flat\text{IIb}$ and the dominant V7 allows for the tonic to be played in the melody. There is also a direct movement of $\flat\text{2} \rightarrow \text{I}$ in the accompaniment, before the final perfect cadence with its release to death. Schubert embraced the Neapolitan chord as an expression of anguish, synonymous with grief.

---


191
Another variation in the use of the Neapolitan chord is to insert it between two tonic chords. Chopin uses the Phrygian mode with Neapolitan chordal harmony in Mazurka Op. 41 No. 1. The Mazurka starts with an unaccompanied Phrygian melody in which the $b\flat_2$ rises from the tonic. (Figure 3.22). This is joined by a harmonisation of $i\flat IIb\mid i7\mid IV\mid i\flat IIb\mid i c\flat IV\mid i$. There is no $V$ chord and the final cadence is plagal, this sequence is remarkably undriven by regular common-period harmony, emphasising its modality.

Figure 3.21 Schubert, ‘Erlkonig’ last 7 bars.\textsuperscript{86}

\textsuperscript{86} (2007, 6) Schubert–Erlkonig.

Figure 3.22 Chopin, Mazurka Op. 41 No. 1.\textsuperscript{87}

\textsuperscript{87} (2011, 1) Chopin–Mazurka Op. 41.
A second example of the I→♭II→I sequence is in the slow movement of Brahms’s fourth Symphony in E, where F Major and minor chords are used in contrast to E major, for instance in the last few bars (Figure 3.23) (Wintle 1987, 200). This focus on ‘the extremes invoked by E major and F minor’ fits associations within Western classical music of E major as representing passive ‘sublime love’, and F minor representing turbulence, ‘the expression of anxiety and even the diabolical’ (ibid., 204, 219). Both the ♭II and the ♭ii chords are used, as well as the ♭VI, and V⁷ variants. The central chord movement of this ending is I→♭II⁷→I. There is a repeating melodic motif ♭₂→♭♭₃→♭₁, and, at the final cadence, direct melodic movement ♭₂→♭₁ in the second stave part.

I argue that the direct resolution of ♭₂→♭₁ presents the ♭₂ as ‘upper leading note’. Novack stops short of this concept, writing that within tonal music

the strong linear drive to the first degree from the half-step above frequently converts ♭₂ virtually into an upper leading-tone. Thus the lowered second finally assumed a primary contrapuntal and structural role in the projection of tonality. (Novack 1977, 123)

---


<http://erato.uvt.nl/files/imglnks/usimg/2/29/IMSLP00101-Brahms_Symphony_No.4_Mov.2.pdf> [accessed 18/03/2014].
And Margaret Notley comments on the ‘prominence that foreground Neapolitan progressions frequently place on the $b2$–$1$ melodic half step’ (1994, 140). Schubert’s later compositions used the $b2$ ‘as a terminal inflection’ often in the bass voice (Novack 1977, 123). The last five bars of his 1828 String Quintet is an example of strong use of the $b2$–$1$ motif (Figure 3.24). After a ferocious $bII^{75}$ chord and direct resolution to $I$, there is a unison setting across all the strings and the $b2$–$1$ as a simple cadential gesture. This chromatic movement fits into both the style hongrois of this final movement and the overall pathos of the Quintet (Bellman 1993, 173).
Figure 3.24 Schubert, C major String Quintet last 13 bars. See also CD 2 track 5: 0.26–0.41.

---

Influenced by the Schubert Quintet, Brahms also uses the $\flat_2 - \flat_1$ motif, though in a lighter style hongrois vein, at the end of the ‘Scherzo’ of his 1865 Piano Quintet (Webster 1979, 65)(Figure 3.25). The $\flat_2 - \flat_1$ is used as the repeating motif completing the melody. I argue that these examples clearly give the function of ‘upper leading note’ to the $\flat_2$. This role is not straightforwardly acknowledged within the Western classical tradition.

Figure 3.25 Brahms, Piano Quintet Op. 34 end of the ‘Scherzo’.\textsuperscript{90} See also CD 2 track 6: 1.18–1.23.

The Neapolitan Complex

I make a brief mention of the Neapolitan Complex, where the $\flat_2$ is tonicised and becomes a flat second key centre. The Neapolitan complex is a network of key centres that can create chord progressions using $\flat VI$ and $\flat II$ chords in conjunction with $V$ and $I$ chords, often using the $\flat II$ chord as a pivot between tonalities (Notley 1994, 140). The Neapolitan Complex, though deeply involved with the $\flat 2$ in regard to key movement and emotional concept, is in many ways irrelevant to the discussion of this thesis. The concern here is with the $\flat 2$ as a pitch that is smaller than a tone above the tonic. The Neapolitan Complex generally involves tonicisation of the $\flat 2$ (where the $\flat 2$ takes over as the tonic), in which situation all the parameters change. However, there are continuing

conceptual associations involving the Neapolitan Complex, in which the ♭II once more represents anguish.

An example of the Neapolitan Complex is in the first movement of Beethoven’s Piano Sonata No. 23 in F minor, Op. 57, the ‘Appassionata’. After beginning with arpeggiated gestures in both F and G♭ tonalities, and their respective dominants C and D♭, in bar 10 the pianto motif ♭6–5 is introduced in a contrasting register, deep in the bass register and very quiet (Figure 3.26). Charles Rosen describes this ‘laconic’ four-note ♭6–5 motif as encapsulating the Neapolitan relationship (Rosen 1997, 96–7). This sonata is recognised as being expressive of ‘tragic’ emotion, with the contrasts of register and tonality in this example perhaps displaying conflicts of mood.

![Figure 3.26 Beethoven, ‘Appassionata’ Sonata First movement bars 9–13.](http://javanese.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/0/06/IMSLP141085-PMLP01480-Beethoven_Piano_Sonata_in_F_minor__Appassionata__-composer_s_manuscript1.pdf)

The works of Schubert, Brahms and Bruckner in particular develop the Neapolitan Complex, giving it significant importance (Smith 1998, 1). The ♭2, then, is incorporated into tonality’s exploration of key centres, as an adventure in tonality that eventually returns to its starting point. ‘Turbulent’ keys like that based on the ♭2 of the ‘parent’ scale are treated as ‘foreign’ places to be explored and then returned from (Taylor 2007, 17–18), harking back to the description of Enlightenment narrative described above.

The Phrygian mode returns

Rare since the Baroque chorale in Western tonal music, the Phrygian mode returns with Bruckner to explicitly represent the arcane, while still maintaining negative connotations. The medieval church modes could give ‘antique, ecclesiastical, or rustic colour’ to a piece (Carver 2005, 74). Bruckner was a

---

91 (2011, 5) Beethoven—Appassionata Sonata. 
<http://javanese.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/0/06/IMSLP141085-PMLP01480-Beethoven_Piano_Sonata_in_F_minor__Appassionata__-composer_s_manuscript1.pdf> [accessed 18/03/2014].
deeply religious man whose music was influenced by Palestrina, and the Phrygian mode is used as the main tonality in some of his sacred works (ibid., 99). For instance, his composition *Pange lingua* mixes the Phrygian mode with E minor (ibid., 79).

In his symphonies Bruckner introduced the Phrygian mode as the Other, a ‘third force alongside major and minor tonality’ (ibid., 99). As part of his own religious and emotional struggles, the Phrygian represented something that must be conquered, and each symphony ends safely back in a more ‘normal’ tonality (ibid.). An exception to this is the ‘astonishing Phrygian ending’ of the Fourth Symphony (ibid., 90).

An example of Bruckner’s Othering of the Phrygian occurs in his Sixth Symphony. The Phrygian mode is the central juxtaposition against the tonic major (ibid., 99). The symphony starts in A major, with a violin pedal note on C#. However the bass melodic motif is immediately accentuating the semitones above the tonic and dominant, Bb and F, as if in the A Phrygian Major mode (Figure 3.27). The Finale to this symphony (Figure 3.28) begins in the Phrygian and is described by Carver as having a ‘troubled character’ (ibid., 93). The major tonality is then asserted, only to again be ‘challenged in turn by highly charged Phrygian and Neapolitan motifs’ (ibid., 91), as in the F Phrygian of bars 37–8 (Figure 3.29). Carver writes that Bruckner is using the Phrygian mode to ‘destabilize the tonality’ (ibid.), to undermine the major with ‘pessimistic Phrygian elements’ and ‘to lay bare the insecurity that lies at the heart of the Sixth’ (ibid., 93). The return to the major at the end of the Finale is a given: ‘the crucial, final banishment of the Phrygian F… This paves the way for Bruckner’s customary recall of the first theme of the first movement, purged of foreign elements’ (ibid., 96). Thus, as a signifier of the spiritual past, or internal spirit, the Phrygian mode continued to be full of anguish, still carrying negativity, the foreign and a sense of the wrong.
The nineteenth century saw many and varied manifestations of the use of the $\flat$2. Overall the $\flat$2 represented anguish, tragedy or death. There was a continued use of the $\flat$2–1 motif, especially noticeable in melodic cadences. Harmonic developments involving the $\flat$II chord, the Neapolitan chord, brought new facets to the interpretations involving the $\flat$2, with associations being more attached to its subdominant role, rather than as a leading note.

### 3.6 The late nineteenth and twentieth century: the $\flat$2 as ‘exotic’ trope

Since the nineteenth century the use of the $\flat$2–1 motif as an ‘exotic’ signifier complicates its associations (Al-Taee 2010, 82–3; Scott 2003, 8). Spanish folk music and dance, particularly Andalusian, became fashionable in nineteenth
century Paris, spearheaded by Debussy, Ravel and the Spaniard la Falla. Phrygian inflexions were part of a stock of mannerisms used to create a desired ‘Spanish’ sound (Scott, 2003, 166). Much was made of the Andalusian cadence, the same falling Phrygian tetrachord that was basic to the lament motif (see 3.4.1).

Ravel and la Falla may be seen to be continuing the Spanish tradition that had used the b\(^2\) uninterrupted since the time of the Arabian presence in Spain. Ravel had a Basque mother and a childhood home on the Spanish border. His 1905 piano piece ‘Alborado del gracioso’ from Miroirs depicts the morning song of a gracioso, a jester from theatrical comedies. The alborado, or aubade, a morning song, was a genre known to early troubadours, a song to warn lovers of the arrival of morning (Aubrey 2000, ix). The piece starts with an oscillation between I and b\(^{\text{III}}\) chords (Figure 3.30), reminiscent of flamenco. In the 1910 ‘Chanson Espagnole’, Ravel again uses the oscillation between 1 and b\(^{2}\) as an introduction, this time harmonised with chords D5/E\(^{\flat}\) | D5 / Cm7. The D chord contains root and fifth only. The 3, though generally absent on the tonic chord appears as b\(^{3}\) in a grace note in the cadence at the end of the first verse, the b\(^{\text{II}}\)–I (Figure 3.31).

Figure 3.30 Ravel, ‘Alborado del gracioso’ first four bars.\(^{92}\)

Orientalist composition using the $b^2$ is clearer with Debussy, who, although influenced by his own visits to Spain, had most familiarity with Spanish music from artists in Paris and other Orientalist works from France. Debussy’s 1883 setting of a poem by Louis Charles Alfred de Musset, ‘Chanson Espagnol’ represents three singing Spanish girl dancers, beginning with a Phrygian motif in two keys F# and D (Figure 3.32). Another example is the cadence in Ibería’s ‘Par les Rues et les Chemins’ where an opening theme is then repeated later in the Phrygian mode, with a $b^2$II–I progression (Figure 3.33). This Phrygian pattern appears four times during the course of ‘Par les rues et les chemins’ and also at the very end of another movement in Iberia: ‘Le Matin d’un jour de fête’.

---

Alongside location, the $\flat_2-\flat_1$ gesture may have other Oriental associations of the exotic and sensual, with possibly violent undertones (Al-Taee 2010, xiv). The dysphoric $\flat_2-\flat_1$ pianto may be meshed onto the Oriental $\flat_2-\flat_1$ gesture, and significant combinations have been made between the two. The ease of moving between these two gestures provides a tight fit for their use in composition. Debussy’s 1891 setting of Paul Verlaine’s poem ‘Fantoches’ demonstrates the use of the traditional ‘Spanish’ Phrygian melodic cadence (not transferred to $\flat_6-\flat_5$) in connotations of exoticism and immorality (Figure 3.34). The lyrics are about marionettes with an evil plan involving a Spanish pirate and a ‘half-naked’ woman, the Phrygian ‘fa la la’ phrase setting the ‘Spanish’ scene.
The inherited signification of anguish brings the French composer Lili Boulanger (1893–1918) to express deep sobriety with the use of the $\flat_2$. Boulanger returns to classical significations in, for instance, ‘D’un Soir Triste’. Written during the First World War, ‘D’un Soir Triste’ has a sombre theme in the Phrygian mode (Figure 3.35). Boulanger’s ‘Pie Jesu’, a setting from the Requiem mass, was dictated on her death bed in 1918, aged 24, although prepared since 1913 (Potter 2006, 124). The piece begins with distress and ends with calm: ‘anguished intensity to calm acceptance of fate’. This short work is highly chromatic until bar 26, where the $\flat_2$ pedal note comes in and anguish moves to plaintiveness (Figure 3.36) (Potter 2006, 124). The Phrygian here, then, represents a ‘calming’, perhaps spiritual, contrast to the chromatic.

Sometimes the Phrygian scale is simply used to represent the Other in twentieth-century composition. Stravinsky used the descending Phrygian scale to describe
Orpheus’s descent to the underworld in ‘Orpheus’ (Ross 2011, 25), the Other signifying hell. Stravinsky had been studying the works of Monteverdi at the time of the composition of ‘Orpheus’, just after the Second World War, and the lament motif is used here as in Monteverdi’s *Lamento Della Ninfa*. Orpheus’s lyre, a harp here opens the work, playing a lament to his wife: ‘the mourning harp maintains an even pulse with slow descending scales in the Phrygian mode’ (White 1966, 402) (Figure 3.37).

![Figure 3.37 Stravinsky, ‘Orpheus’ bars 1–8. See also CD 2 track 9: 0.00–0.30](image)

Associations between the falling semitone and lament were still strong in the late twentieth century. Jonathan Cross writes that ‘The Phrygian is the only mode characterised by a semitone above the final, which gives its cadence a peculiarly melancholic affect’ (2009, 27). Cross describes how Harrison Birtwistle associated the note E with melancholy, and his ‘signature’ motif is E–F–D’ (ibid.). Cross suggests that this association for Birtwistle arises because the note E is often the tonic of the Phrygian mode. Birtwistle’s ‘The Fields of Sorrow’ is centred on the relationship between E and F: ‘Two soprano soloists, calling to each other like ritual mourners, the first of whom begins with the familiar E–F–E lamenting motif’ (ibid., 27, 29).

My final example of Western classical music is from Philip Glass in the final aria of *Satyagraha*. Glass uses thirty ascending Phrygian scales in part of this work dedicated to Gandhi, with the rising scale possibly giving a ‘positive’ slant (1’ 45” onwards; Figure 3.38).

---

Thus a ‘positive’ exotic Other was sometimes represented by the Phrygian mode, with its distinctive $b^2$, in twentieth century compositions. New music developed that broke down the rigidities of tonality and modes played a significant part in this development. The sense of the Other in the $b^2$ to the Western listener is carried on many levels, particularly the inherited ‘illegitimacy’ from medieval times and the image of the exotic Other established by the late nineteenth century. These occurrences of the $b^2$ remain rare in Western contemporary classical music, their power to express the Orient being defined by this rarity, and they illustrate an abiding Orientalist signification.

3.7 The tritone substitution and modal jazz

The jazz genre of be-bop in the 1940s explored chromaticism and dissonance, and ‘rediscovered’ the $b^7$–I cadence, naming it the ‘tritone substitution’. The name comes from the perceived connection between the $V^7$ dominant and the $b^7$ chord, and the interval of a tritone between the roots of these chords. The two chords have two notes in common, the $4$ and the major $7$ leading note. These are considered vital notes in the $V^7$ chord’s dominant function, and jazz players maintain that the $b^7$ carries the same dominant function as the $V^7$ dominant chord.

Musicologist Lerdahl takes the example of the key of F#: ‘The G7 acts as an altered dominant: G and F act as double leading tones to F#’ (Lerdahl 2001, 311). Lerdahl continues that G7 has a ‘dominant function not only locally in relation to C but also globally to F#’. He relates the tritone substitution back ‘at least to Schubert’ to ‘the dominant function of the $b^7$ chord’, describing the $b^7$ as an...
effective dominant chord due to the ‘yearning vector’, linking harmonic and melodic practice (Lerdahl 2001, 311).

The ‘tritone substitution’ is now an established device in jazz, often considered as an optional substitution for the dominant chord in any V7–I sequence. An example is Dizzy Gillespie’s ‘Night in Tunisia’ (Figure 3.39) where there is an oscillation between the chords ♭II7 and I. The arpeggiated melody is full of extensions to these chords and chromaticisms, but the tonic is clear and at the perfect cadence the $V^7_{♭ II}$ (A$^{7/5}$) chord is used that contains an E♭, and the melody encircles the tonic: $♭ 2–7–1$.

![Figure 3.39 Dizzy Gillespie, ‘Night in Tunisia’ (Hal Leonard 2004, 7). See also CD track 11:0.00–0.43 for a version of this tune.](image)

Another typical example is Thelonious Monk’s ‘Bemsha Swing’, which again makes much use of the ♭II7–I cadence, here in the longer ‘substituted’ sequence ♭VIm7–♭II7–I (Figure 3.40 bars 7-8). Unlike in ‘A Night in Tunisia’, the $♭ 2$ pitch appears only once in the melody (in bar 10), suggesting that the inclusion of the ♭II chord is principally a harmonic device in ‘Bemsha Swing’.

---

96 Jazz chord notation for minor chords: VIm is the same as vi.
Figure 3.40 Thelonious Monk, ‘Bemsha Swing’ (Realbook 2013, 22).

Miles Davis, influenced by pianist George Russell, began to develop more
melodic and modal jazz composition, producing the album Kind of Blue in 1959.
This album challenged concepts of tonality within jazz and was a huge success,
creating a new genre termed ‘modal jazz’. The medieval modes, including the
Phrygian mode, were exploited for their unusual sounds and perceived lack of
tonal drive. These were the same reasons for their exclusion in Renaissance times.
The modes, including the Phrygian mode remain a standard in contemporary jazz
performance.

The principal drive to modal jazz came from challenges to tonality, but
associations were also made between modes containing the $b_2$ and Spain or
North Africa. One of the tracks on Kind of Blue is called ‘Flamenco Sketches’,
and the Phrygian mode is often referred to, in jazz education, as the Spanish
mode. The title of Gillespie’s ‘Night in Tunisia’ would indicate an awareness of
the $b_2$ in North African music, though this World War Two composition is
reported as not being named such at the time of composition (Shipton 1999, 113).
A clearer example of deliberate North African associations for the $b_2$ is in
Abdullah Ibrahim’s ‘African Market Place’. South African jazz pianist Ibrahim
alludes here, with the $b_2$ and the major $\hat{3}$, to the Hijaz maqam of North Africa
(Figure 3.41), and this fits with the vernacular use of the $bII$–I cadence for Hijaz
maqam as seen in chapter two.
The ♭2 has been maintained as a signifier of the ‘exotic’ Other into the twenty-first century. Tagg and Clarida remark on how the Phrygian mode is still regarded as exotic: ‘From a Eurocentric viewpoint, this is the mode of Spain, gypsies, Balkans, Turks and Arabs…. [This is] music from “somewhere else”… the Phrygian is obviously neither default mode nor default melodic vocabulary’ (Tagg and Clarida 2003, 319). Orientalism is associated with much of the use of the ♭2 in twenty-first century jazz and contemporary classical music. There is also an aspect of self-identification through its use by non-Western composers, such as Ibrahim.

**Conclusion**

It’s very strongly marked as not normal…. In the physical bodies that are accustomed back to the fifteenth century it is going to sound profoundly alien, and there may be even a physical reaction.

(McClary interview 2011)

I have traced a journey for the ♭2, in music of the West, taking it from possibly very common usage in medieval times to being problematised by its modal motifs, by polyphony, and by racism. Further, it came to be used as a significant functional tool in the nineteenth century, and then as an ‘exotic’ signifier.

In Greek times anything labelled Phrygian was foreign, and this included ‘a Phrygian mode’. Medieval church and secular musics developed the Phrygian mode with a ♭2, and voiced ‘difficulties’ around issues around its performance and interpretation. Harmonic practice developed and the ♭2 was deemed
‘illegitimate’ as it was incompatible with the V–I ‘perfect’ cadence.

Any occurrences of the $b_2$ after the medieval period in diatonic Western music were rare, and the examples above are exceptions. The $b_2$ was generally no longer used as a leading note, though the $b_6–5$ motif remained as a memory of it. The $b_2$ appeared as a non-diatonic insertion in the subdominant chord, producing the Neapolitan sixth chord. What also remained was ‘anguished’ connotations in its various manifestations, concepts of the Other and evocations of Spain. Meaning thus became embedded in the music in several ways: Phrygian was foreign and thus a dangerous Other; $b_2$ was not useable in conventional harmony, so became Other; when used the $b_2$ could also represent the archaic, and the $b_2$ was finally associated with exoticised, eroticised Spain.

Musical motifs containing the $b_2$ signify the Other, the note itself being Other to the ‘normal’ choice of musical notes in Western genres. This is in significant contrast to chapters one and two, which deal with musics in which the $b_2$ is very much part of the Self. The inherited connotations from hundreds of years of associations in the ‘West’ are of anguish, the alien, ‘Eastern’, passivity, weakness; the listener intuitively recognises the Other in its appearance. The whole history is yet to be revealed, but I argue that any appearance of the $b_2$ in Western music is so loaded, the baggage of sedimented meaning so heavy, that it has become unavailable for general expressive and structural use, signifying so strongly ‘anguish’ and/or the ‘exotic’ Other. This chapter thus highlights a stark contrast with the last two chapters which deal with musics in which the $b_2$ is very much part of the Self.
4 Dissonance and Dissidents: The $b^2$ within Heavy Metal Music

Heavy metal music without the minor second? It would be unspeakable, it wouldn’t be allowed. I don’t think it would be metal, it would be a sham. You must have a minor second, it’s the mainstay, it’s the seal of approval for metal.

(Pete Herbert interview 2009)

Heavy metal stands out in Western music for its use of the ‘transgressive’ $b^2$. The musical background of Western rock music from which heavy metal arose in the 1960s barely contains this note, yet heavy metal music has made extensive and deliberate use of the ‘medieval modes’, particularly those starting with a semitone. The $b^2$ is contained within the Phrygian and Locrian modes which are both frequently used in virtuosic metal guitar solos, and the movement from keynote to $b^2$ regularly appears in metal bass lines. In this chapter I explore how the $b^2$ became a favoured note in metal music, how it adapted little-used musical associations and reworked the medieval modes to create innovative interpretations.

The abundance of the $b^2$ in heavy metal may be attributable to its tense and transgressive connotations inherited from Western classical music, where the instability and dissonance of the $b^2$ is the Other to the Self of the tonic. Within Western music generally it portrays doom, anguish, or the exotic. These very associations of the $b^2$ can make it powerful as a tool for heavy metal music. The $b^2\downarrow$ falling cadence is ideal for the varied and complex interests of metal subgenres that embrace its dissonance to aid the expression of violent and empowering emotions.

In heavy metal, the $b^2\downarrow$ motif is transformed into a popular Other that is powerful and shocking. This transformation exploits the transgressive nature, the Otherness of the $b^2$, to associate the motive with positive discourses of hell and death in a new masculinist ideology. I describe how these interpretations exploit the $b^2$ to represent not only violent and dissident emotions but also positive representations of empowerment, searching for greater meaning. In doing so, it touches on ‘Eastern’ imagery in an often Orientalist fashion.
I will discuss the dissonant and powerful potential of the $\flat 2$ within metal by using interviews with performers and engaging with the music and the literature. I study the significations of the $\flat 2 \mathring{1}$ gesture in metal tracks, from its inception in the 1970s through to the twenty-first century including the sub-genre of Oriental Metal. I argue that a unique voice for this note has developed within this genre. This note becomes an identity marker in heavy metal, emblematic of the ‘metalhead’s’ resistance to the status quo. It is emphasised in a unique way where its dissonance is used to evoke ominous and powerful emotions in a manner that empowers individual and communal identity. I suggest a relevance that this use of the $\flat 2$ has within the genre and in the wider musical world.

4.1 Metal context

Heavy metal music emerged out of a crisis of masculinity in the 1960s amongst working class male youth. Young men felt emasculated by unemployment, bleak prospects and authorities that were indifferent to their situation (Walser, 1993, x, 109). Metal music developed for the disenfranchised, those with no easy living or assured status, who were seeking empowerment. Walser writes that ‘heavy metal explores the Other, everything that hegemonic society does not want to acknowledge, the dark side of the day-lit enlightened adult world’ (Walser, 1993, 162). Heavy metal established itself as anti-Modernist, rolling back to pre-Renaissance, pre-Enlightenment times. Lyrical themes of fantasy, occult and the supernatural added to this framework.

In metal an ‘angry’ music was created, harder and heavier than rock, offering the opportunity to release violent drives suppressed by the norms of mainstream society, and railing against injustice (Deanna 2008, 5). Heavy metal music empowered the performers and audiences, giving a sense of another community that expressed the intensity of their feelings and their desires for ‘something more’ (Walser 1993, 159).

The style has become a worldwide voice for teenagers struggling to find identity beyond that of their parents, as described to me by Luke Rayner, guitarist from the reformed Stoner metal band Leaf Hound, and music colleague at Redbridge College:
It’s stuff your parents don’t like, so by listening to it you can rebel, it’s about rebellion…. Heavy metal looks kindly on the underdog, the nerdy kid at school who’s kicked around. A lot of songs are about rising up, showing people what you’re made of, getting back at a bully. A lot of kids that like it are not the mainstream trendy kids; they’re left of field people. (Rayner interview 2009)

A teenage girl is cited by Walser as saying ‘I feel paranoid when listening to “easy listening” music as it’s lying about the world’ (quoted in Walser 1993, 159). It can be said that through the voicing of texts on madness and suicide, amongst other themes, there is a resonance with teenagers’ sense of vulnerability. Through identification and community there can come hope. Generally speaking, when teenagers become adults and get employment their interest in the dissonances of metal wanes (Walser 1993, 110). Rayner, aged 25 agreed: ‘I can’t listen to it in the way that I used to’ (interview 2009). Yet the genre adapts to new generations and remains a significant voice, conveying lyrics of anger and empowerment.

The development of a metal signifier

Much has been written on the elements within metal music: violent lyrics, loud distortion, and gunfire-like percussion amongst them. The bass thunders out ‘riffs’ (one or two bar ostinato motifs), over which the guitarist will sometimes play in unison, while at other times the guitar will play virtuosic solos soaring above the backing support. The $b\flat_2$ is also recognised as a significant element of the metal sound (Pillsbury 2006; Cope 2010).

The $b\flat_2$ is not used to any great extent in contemporary pop, rock, folk, rhythm and blues, or punk, though it has a certain presence in some synthesizer music. Collins researches the music of video games, in particular the history of those produced on the Atari computers, and is struck by the ‘prominence of flat twos’ (2006, para. 13) in this music, disproportionate to the surrounding popular music. Her conclusion is that its presence ‘is to a large extent dependent on the tuning constraints of the Atari’ (ibid., para 21). However, she suggests that ‘an Atari aesthetic [has] been absorbed into game programmers’ consciousness’ (ibid.), and that since the early 1980s, as a result of this phenomenon, there is a much larger shift in tonal sensibilities: ‘The use and acceptance of this modal element [the $b\flat_2$]—particularly in genres that were based on synthesizer music, such as techno,
house, and industrial—was influenced by the exposure to Atari VCS songs’ (ibid.). This accidental use of the ♭2 will also be seen as a possible route into metal, in metal’s case concerning the physicality of the guitar and the easy movement from the open string to first fret.

The presence of the ♭2 in metal music is due to three principal factors: the manipulation of the classical harmonic minor scale to emphasise its semitone intervals; the exploitation of the ‘medieval’ modes, and an awareness of its affective use in ‘death’ music or for evoking an Other.

Heavy metal music grew out of rock music in the late 1960s. Most rock music up to that time had been pentatonic in scale formation, particularly emphasising the ‘bluesy’ minor pentatonic scale (Everett 2004, para 21). The founders of the heavy metal style were the 1960s groups Led Zeppelin, Deep Purple and Black Sabbath. Deep Purple’s Ritchie Blackmore and Jon Lord had studied classically and were familiar with other modes and scales and, amongst others, brought classical scales into hard rock music including the harmonic minor scale (Figure 4.1A). Rayner told me:

It was influenced by people who’d been classically trained and realised that this would work over the heavy style…. The solos were more classically inspired. Harmonic minor sounds quite good and clever when you play it fast with a lot of distortion on your guitar. (Rayner interview 2009)

The harmonic minor crops up regularly in heavy metal, with virtuosic solos based on Baroque musical works (Walser 1993, 104).

Rayner explained how, further to this, if you play the harmonic minor starting on its fifth note you are playing the Phrygian Major scale, giving the resulting scale a ♭2 (Figure 4.1B).

![Figure 4.1 Harmonic minor and Phrygian Major.](image)

It’s also intense and memorable with the harmonic minor scale and the flattened second. It’s instantly recognisable. With heavy metal you want that
intensity, everything’s harsh. The solo needs to be intense…. Playing bluesy pentatonic doesn’t tend to work in that context over a sinister riff... flat second [is] very prominent in heavy metal... a very sinister connotation to it. Heavy metal tends to have heaviness and bluntness. (Rayner interview 2009)

The large interval between the $\flat 2$ and $3$ can be regarded as adding, by way of contrast, to the intensity of the semitone: it ‘provides a phenomenological intensification of the smaller movement between the second degree and the first’ (Pillsbury 2006, 108).

The volume and distortion used in metal guitar solos have established a new character for the Phrygian Major. These virtuosic solos are regarded within the genre as evoking intensity, danger and excitement, liberating and empowering over the oppressive power of the rhythm section (Walser 1993, 15, 54). Rayner described the desire to play very fast, and demonstrated this ability with a Phrygian Major scale, explaining that these are relatively easy to play on the guitar, thereby partly explaining their popularity (interview 2009) (Figure 4.2).

![Figure 4.2 Rayner playing the Phrygian Major on guitar (interview 2009, CD 2 track 13: 0.07–0.19).](image)

Pete Herbert bass guitarist from metal band Leaf Hound, and music colleague at Redbridge College, demonstrates soloing in the Locrian mode, which he, like Rayner, says has a straightforward shape that is easier to play than a regular major scale (interview 2009) (Figure 4.3).

![Figure 4.3 Herbert improvising in Locrian mode on bass (interview 2009). CD 2 track 14: 0.00–0.07.](image)

Playing the Phrygian and Locrian makes it really jarring and fast…. You can hammer away at these scales; you can run it. It’s easy to play 1 2 4 fingering, more comfortable. It’s the right sound, it’s jarring, it’s unease [sic], it produces certain emotions in the human form. (ibid.)
Rayner and Herbert are suggesting, like Collins, that there may be extra-musical reasons, such as physical ease, for the use of these certain scales in metal, and hence for the prominence of the ♭2 in metal.

They also expressed strong musical attachment to these modes. Herbert prefers the Phrygian and Locrian modes to the Phrygian Major (known to him as the Byzantine scale), which he feels would be ‘out of place’ in his own music. He describes the ♭2 (minor second):

It’s unnerving, unsettling, there’s too many perfect cadences all resolving in pop songs, let’s have it unresolved, keep it up in the air, keep the audience a little whacked out. It’s my own personality, I like a bit of fun and frolics. My goal is not to unnerve but just to throw it out there, a little whacky. Like root, fifths, octaves with minor second on the top, it’s a bit different. John Williams’ Jaws was the first time I heard it [see chapter five]. Once I’d got over playing it on the piano I had lessons, and this whole world of modes opened up, including Phrygian and Locrian, got the minor second there. The major scale is all resolved and neat, but when you come to [the modes] you think—wow where did that come from? (Herbert interview 2009)

Rayner also expresses this sense of pleasure from the unexpected difference of the ♭2 sound:

That flattened second sounds quite ominous to me. The first time I heard the flattened second it sounded very appealing, in 80s heavy metal music: Mernstein, Iron Maiden, Metallica. That kind of music inspired me to play the guitar when I was 11 or 12. (Rayner interview 2009)

The ‘unsettling’ and ‘ominous’ associations may be connected with the pitch closeness of the ♭2 to the tonic. Metal scholar Robert Walser writes of the Phrygian mode, comments that equally apply to the Locrian, considering that metaphors of ‘narrowness’ are conferred onto the ♭2 itself, and it is possible to talk about the ♭2 independently in these associations:

This mode has a second degree only a half step away from the tonic instead of a whole step. Phenomenologically, this closeness means that the second degree hangs precariously over the tonic, making the mode seem claustrophobic and unstable. Hedged in by its upper neighbour, even the tonic, normally the point of rest, acquires an uncomfortable inflection in this mode. (Walser 1993, 47)

Even when the tonic is not immediately sounded it remains in the listener’s memory, and attracts metaphors of narrowness. Walser is indicating that the ♭2 can be so ‘powerful’ that it saps power from the ‘home’ tonic.
The guitar and bass ostinato riff

The $b^2$ is heard most strongly in metal music in the ‘powerful’ bass riff, the movement from tonic to $b^2$ being used in repeated ostinatos at high volume. Led Zeppelin was instrumental in the introduction of these guitar and bass riffs, giving heavy metal an aggressive and industrial sound (Fast 2001, 42) (Figure 4.4). The guitar and bass are generally playing power chords, which are chords of the root and fifth without a third. The lack of thirds in the chords means that the soloist can play most modes without clashing against the backing, though clashing is also often welcomed:

![Figure 4.4 Herbert demonstrating a bass riff (interview 2009). CD 2 track 15: 0.04–0.09.](image)

A riff with minor second makes it more interesting, really ‘doomy’ .... It suits the style, not... something pretty in a major scale.... It also suits the stagecraft of it all, that you can mosh whilst playing a riff based around a root and a minor second. You can jump around to the minor second riff, say E to F, without playing a wrong note. Unison guitar and bass locked in for riff. Tribal, all knocking your heads. I think it’s those two things: the image, the movement, the physical stagecraft, performance and what a minor second does to you as a human, you know on a human level. It creates the skull and the spiral to hell. (Herbert interview 2009)

Herbert’s comment on ‘moshing’ refers to the ease of playing the lowest string (E) on the guitar, alternating with a first fret note (F), the $b^2$, and that this can easily be played while jumping around (Figure 4.5).

![Figure 4.5 Herbert demonstrating a $1-\flat2$ bass line (interview 2009). CD 2 track 16: 0.06–0.16.](image)

‘The spiral to hell’ refers to the descending resolution of this $b^2$ to the tonic, which has associations commented on by Tagg: ‘The effect of melodic descent using small intervals probably date[s] back to at least the pre-Baroque and its notions of music’s rhetorical devices like katabasis [descent into hell], a fitting concept in the context of sadness and death!’ (2004, 368). The hero’s narrative established in post-medieval times was a discourse of upward striving, escaping
from the low and murky depths, conquering all with the hero’s positivity (Taylor 2007, 17–18, 28). Herbert’s comment on the ‘spiral to hell’ shows that contrasting associations are abiding and evocative within an anti-heroic framework. He continues:

As a bass player you can play a simple E minor to F bass riff while the guitarist paints a Locrian-based image, a Hieronymus Bosch solo, images of hell, over the locked-in semitone bass…. In heavy metal the flat second makes it really doomy. That’s what’s wanted, to make a discord, let’s be doomy. (Herbert interview 2009)

Herbert demonstrated by playing a major scale and saying ‘That’s happy’ then a Locrian scale saying ‘That’s not happy, it can be as simple as that’ (ibid.) (Figure 4.6).

Figure 4.6 Herbert playing major and Locrian scales (interview 2009).

Rayner, similarly, played the Phrygian mode to me (Figure 4.7) and said ‘It’s not a happy sound is it?’ (interview 2009).

Figure 4.7 Rayner playing Phrygian mode on guitar (interview 2009). CD 2 track 17: 0.00–0.06.

Ease of playing, attraction to difference, and general associations of unease are prominent, then, in connection to the ♭2 in metal. Herbert introduces associations to hell and this leads us to the Gothic connections of metal.

4.2 Metal, the Gothic and the Phrygian mode

The Gothic connection

An element of the developing genre of heavy metal music was a fascination with the themes of 1950s Gothic horror movies. Images of the devil, the ‘blood of Christ’ and all things Gothic have been highly significant in metal music. The ‘medieval church modes’, including the Phrygian and the Locrian, due to their ‘archaic’ status, gained Gothic connotations for heavy metal followers. Intense emotional associations become attached to the modes:

While the particular associations that were once attached to each mode vanished long ago, modes continue to produce powerful and specific
affective charges…. Modes are not merely abstruse theoretical categories; they can serve as a shorthand for referring to sets of meaningful elements of musical discourses. (Walser 1993, 46)

The modes hold sedimented meanings of the archaic and are thus highly suitable for the creation of Gothic imagery (Cope 2010, 125).

The early metal band Black Sabbath were pioneers in lyrics associated with Gothic horror, anti-Christian sentiments and medieval imagery (Walser 1993, 10). They were drawn to ‘medieval’ modes, highlighting the most ‘unusual’ notes: the $b^2$ and #4. Andrew Cope writes:

Black Sabbath appear to have adopted and contextualised certain key intervals…. Those intervals, namely the flat second and the tritone, were the cornerstones of the guitar riff output of Black Sabbath from 1969 to 1975. [There was a] consistent privileging of the flat second. (Cope 2010, 51–2, 56)

For example, the $b^2$–$\tilde{1}$ motif is particularly prominent in the bass line in the mid-section, between 3’37” and 4’10”, of Black Sabbath’s 1970 track ‘Hand of Doom’ (Figure 4.8).

\[ \text{Figure 4.8 Black Sabbath, ‘Hand of Doom’, Paranoid [CD], 1970. CD 2 track 18: 0.00–0.26.} \]

The influence of film music on metal

The use of these intervals is also influenced by other film music, in particular the crime TV/film themes and chromatic ‘space age’ sound tracks of the 1950s and 60s (Taylor 2001, 90; Cope 2010, 52). Cope writes that film music composers ‘reinforce the cultural associations of malevolence, fear and distress associated with the flat second’ (ibid., 54) in a time contemporary with Black Sabbath, citing the 1975 Jaws theme as an example: ‘It is interesting too that Williams employs this interval combined with a low string tessitura, the same as heavy metal’ (ibid.).

Cope continues that ‘the $b^2$ [and] its visceral associations of tension’ (2010, 53, 55) and the tritone, established at this time as tension cues within film and
classical music, gave ‘musical enhancement’ to the production of tension (ibid., 55).

I propose that Black Sabbath, in a radical transgression of their blues roots, evolved a new and original form of music.... [They used] melodic concepts based on privileged intervals such as the tritone and flat second... (and judicious omission of blues and rock and roll conventions).... The originality of this sound was one that contributed to the evolution of heavy metal, as a genre, by the establishment of a whole new set of musical conventions. (ibid., 70, 52)

Cope considered these ‘crucial intervals’ within guitar riffs to be ‘musical building blocks that give identity to bands considered to be heavy metal’ (ibid., 44). He considers the ♭2 to be ‘a major signifier of heavy metal syntax’ (ibid., 124), a ‘tension builder’ that has ‘been perpetuated and extensively explored by subsequent metal bands of all decades’ (ibid., 125).

The development of the ♭2 within metal

Many subgenres of metal have appeared in the decades since Black Sabbath established these building blocks. There has been a trend in emerging subgenres to make metal ‘tougher’, more ‘extreme’, avoiding movement towards other hard rock and bluesy styles. ‘Extreme’ metal was influenced by punk, and in the 1970s a punk/metal subgenre emerged called the New Wave of British Heavy Metal, which became a model for more recent ‘extreme’ metal.

Extreme metal further developed dissonant aspects, such as the use of the ♭2:

Certain modes have long had particular associations and connotations, with the Phrygian and Locrian seen to have the ‘darkest’ sounds.... Where extreme heavy metal appears to differ... is that it ‘lightens’ these modes to a far lesser extent.... Extreme heavy metal represents a sustained and austere exploration of ‘darker’ modes that have long been associated with danger and evil. (Kahn-Harris 2007, 31)

Lyrical content also became more ‘extreme’. ‘Lyrics focus on the bleak but concrete horrors of the real or possibly real world: the isolation and alienation of individuals, the corruption of those in power and the horrors done by people on one another and to the environment’ (Weinstein 2009, 50). The subgenre of black metal developed ‘satanic’ lyrics and a style that became very allied with right-wing sentiments, and the Gothic connections of the modes contributed to the prominence of the ♭2 in this subgenre, exploited to help create satanic and horrific illusions. Black metal was born with British band Venom’s album Black
Metal, on which the track ‘Countess Bathory’ has an intense four note bass line ending on $\flat 2$ (Figure 4.9).

![Figure 4.9 Venom, ‘Countess Bathory’. Black Metal [CD], 1982. CD 2 track 19: 0.00–0.22.](image)

The subgenre of thrash metal developed directly from the New Wave of British Heavy Metal. It was faster and more transgressive lyrically, with a similar punk influence. The thrash metal band Metallica, according to Cope, ‘revels in compositional devices that are clearly influenced by the syntax and structure of Black Sabbath songs... including the privileging of tritones and flat seconds’ (2010, 103). In Metallica’s ‘Enter Sandman’ (Figure 4.10) the lyrics are about a mythical person who put children to death by sprinkling sand in their eyes:

```
Say your prayers little one,
Don’t forget my son,
To include everyone.
I tuck you in,
Warm within
Keep you free from sin
‘Til the sandman he comes,
Sleep with one eye open,
Gripping your pillow tight.
Exit: light.
Enter: night.
Take my hand,
We’re off to never never-land. (Metallica 2013)
```

The $\flat 2$, accented on the final offbeat in the bar, heightens the lyric’s intensity.

![Figure 4.10 Metallica, ‘Enter Sandman’. The Black Album [CD], 1992. CD 2 track 20: 0.04–0.19.](image)

Twenty-first century extreme metal music has often forsaken many melodic features from its heavy metal heritage, with harmonic dissonance becoming even more intense, maintaining the $\flat 2$ in ‘locked-in’ bass and guitar riffs. Arch Enemy’s 2003 track ‘Dead Eyes See no Future’ demonstrates this continued
popularity of the ♭2 (Figure 4.11). Accented on the first beats of the bar, this use of the ♭2 is reminiscent of Black Sabbath’s ‘Hand of Doom’ from four decades earlier.

Figure 4.11 Arch Enemy, ‘Dead Eyes see no Future’. Anthems of Rebellion [CD], 2004. CD 2 track 21: 0.00–0.19.

The Gothic associations of the Phrygian and Locrian modes, together with the dissonant relationship of the ♭2 to the tonic resulted in the ♭2 becoming a significant element of ‘extreme’ metal. The ♭2 remains ubiquitous in metal music, recognised as a mainstay of the contemporary metal sound (Pillsbury 2006, 126–128).

4.3 Machismo and the ‘feminine’ Phrygian mode

Another connection that is important within metal, relevant to the use of the ♭2, is the connection between representations of masculinity and the Other. When the Phrygian mode represented the Other in Ancient Greek times it was considered un-manly and effeminate (see 3.1). The transformations that have occurred since then in both music practice and ideologies prove very interesting in relation to the use of the Phrygian mode, and hence the ♭2.

Men in the metal scene

Overwhelmingly metal music is described as powerful and masculine:

It’s fight music, heavy, fast and aggressive…. It stirs something inside for me. If you’re driving fast on the motorway, it’s hard and it’s heavy…. There’s some kind of sense of power you get when using the guitar in that way. I still feel it now it makes you feel good, like seeing someone scoring a nice goal, the way the ball goes in is so nice and perfect. The same thing happens when you stand in front of a loud guitar amplifier and play a loud note or hit a loud chord and you feel the power going through you, you created that, and there’s people in front of you getting off on it too. (Rayner interview 2009)

This awareness of the community of metalheads is particularly strong at live gigs. The experience is one of ‘brotherhood’: participants have to be man enough to suffer the volume and survive the physical assault of the ‘mosh pit’, where the
slam dancing takes place (Gruzelier 2007, 64–70). The 2001 song ‘Bodies’ by American alternative metal band Drowning Pool was written about dancing in a ‘mosh pit’, and has the chorus line ‘Let the Bodies Hit the Floor’.

Figure 4.12 Drowning Pool, ‘Bodies’. Sinner [CD], 2001. CD 2 track 22: 0.19–0.33.

The chord sequence of ‘Bodies’ is I–♭Vc, in an oscillating tritone relation. The lyric and the bass line are both melodically built on the ♭2–♭1 pianto (Figure 4.12), and the sedimented meanings of the ♭2–♭1 gesture as anguished add weight to the song’s powerful connotations. This is music for ‘real men’, warriors, an aggressive, transgressive and shocking expression of homosociality (Walser, 1993, 110), passionate and communal (Gruzelier 2007, 74).

Women in the metal scene

There are women involved in the metal scene: for instance Angela Gossow, the female ‘growler’ (singer) fronting Arch Enemy, has considerable respect and prestige. Yet often the images of women on metal videos and band covers are ‘unreconstructed’, sometimes in a deliberately shocking way. For instance, Drowning Pool’s 2001 track ‘Sinner’ (Sinner [CD], 2001) has a video where the only images of women are of them being ‘degraded’ in some manner, as if the ‘sin’ is to associate with them. The strength of the male bonding can be seen to be contingent on the absence of women and romantic concerns, which could disrupt the male community’s strength with what it may regard as ‘dangerous seductive charms’, akin to the ancient sirens (Krenske and McKay 2000, 290; Walser, 1993, 116). This is clearly illustrated in the band 3 Inches of Blood’s 2012 track ‘Metal Woman’ which contains the following lyrics:

She is a Metal Woman
Demon in the sack
Metal Woman
Ready to attack
Are you ready?
Bullet belt seduction
Lures you to the chase
Throws her chains around you
Pulls in for a taste
Black Widow wanting
Shows a glimpse of lace
Lust will betray you
She’ll smash your face
Do not betray a Metal Woman
You’ll be the prey of a Metal Woman
Don’t turn your back on a Metal Woman
She stalks the night the Metal Woman
Do not cry out for a Metal Woman
The cold steel eyes of a Metal Woman (*Long Live Heavy Metal* [CD] 2012).

There is a paradox here: the brotherhood of metal sees women as ‘subversive and dangerous’, yet metal music itself embraces the ‘subversive and dangerous’, as well as other ‘feminised’ concepts within the dualisms of binary thinking, such as irrational, evil, disturbed, dangerous and Other. So the Other that is woman is allied with irrationality, evil, madness and horror: common themes in metal lyrics. The genre co-opts the ‘feminine’ Phrygian Other $\flat 2$, embracing its cloak of Otherness. As ever in the adoption of the Other however, it remains crucially ‘male, virile and powerful’ (Battersby 1994, 38). The metal expression of masculinity is not simple. The genre wallows in Otherness, presenting itself as challenging, anti-heroic masculinist music.

**Gender complexities and the Phrygian mode**

There is no standard masculine heroic ethos here, no exploitation of the ‘rational’ major scale. Historically, the Phrygian $\flat 2$ was deemed ‘weak’ and ‘feminine’ (Leach 2006, 4), a far cry from the machismo of heavy metal. The medieval modes were seen to lack the masculine ‘thrust’ of the major scale, with the Phrygian mode holding a particular problem due to its $\flat 2$ note. Its theoretical ‘imperfection’ was mapped onto the morally dubious and effeminate (McClary 2004, 96): ‘As centered rational subjectivity becomes increasingly the assumption underlying musical procedures, Phrygian gets squeezed out of the picture’ (ibid., 96, 209).

The Phrygian mode went ‘underground’ in the West. It resurfaced occasionally, and very particularly with the heavy metal genre which reclassified it as having
‘evil’ associations (see further Moore 2011). McClary points out how the ‘problems’ of the Phrygian mode can be turned to compositional advantage:

[The Phrygian is] an option that usually lies dormant within the system but that can be conjured up de profundis when called upon to help spew out particularly harsh affective states... bands such as Metallica and Megadeth adopted Phrygian as their modus operandi. This ‘problem’ turns into a strength if one wishes to simulate such an uncomfortable affective realm. (McClary 2004, 96, 209)

The dissonant associations, originating in Western classical music, are rebelliously used and produce new meanings within the metal genre, ‘build[ing] on the sedimented content of musical forms and cultural icons’ (Walser, 1993, 104, 170). Clearly these associations can be very pertinent in the metal genre, which lauds instability and discomfort. The genre’s desire to shock and revel in ‘devil-like’ scenarios naturally also gravitates toward the sedimented meanings within, specifically, the Phrygian mode’s ♭2.

By combining the ♭2 musical motif with low frequency and loud volume, its association may change from pathetic to aggressive, to a new anti-heroic identification. The Otherness of the ♭2 is transformed from having a passive connotation to a threatening and thus powerful one.

The move is radical in that the music itself embraces loud aggression. The original associations strengthen the new adapted meanings: the Other that was weak becomes strong, a radical force. It can be argued that music that is merely fast and loud would not contain the deep sense of transgressive threat that the ♭2 gives at the heart of metal music.

4.4 Metal music as a soundtrack to war

Although the music is aggressive, historically metal was associated with an anti-war stance. Black Sabbath established an ‘anti-patriarchal aesthetic’ full of ‘anti-war posturing’ (Cope 2010, 121). However, tracks written as critiques of war, or simply with ‘powerful’ lyrics, have been used in military situations with general connotations of action, adventure and violence. For instance, the song ‘Bodies’ with its chorus line: ‘Let the Bodies Hit the Floor’ (Figure 4.12) has been taken out of context on many occasions and used in connection with violence and war, including both critiques of war such as the films Soundtrack to War and
*Fahrenheit 9/11*, and in other war dramas like *Stop-Loss* and *Rambo 4* (Sumera 2008, 50; see also DVD track 1: 0.16 to end). Journalist David Peisner writes: ‘Nearly every interrogator and soldier I spoke to mentioned the... hit “Bodies”, with its wild-eyed chorus “Let the bodies hit the floor!” as a favourite for both psyching up U.S. soldiers and psyching out enemies and captives’ (2006, para. 36).

Other tracks are more specifically associated with violence: black metal band Slayer’s 1986 track ‘Angel of Death’ is about a Nazi war criminal. It has a bass line riff beginning with $\hat{1}–b\hat{2}$ and uses the $b\hat{2}$ in a manner described by Pieslak as ‘like an automatic weapon, machine gun’ (2009, 151) (Figure 4.13).

![Figure 4.13 Slayer, ‘Angel of Death’. Reign in Blood [CD], 1986. CD 2 track 23: 0.01–0.29.](image)

The violence of the lyrics in this song gave Slayer a controversial image, and a ‘Nazi right-wing subset that adored the song’ (Ferris 2008, 115).

Often in metal, militaristic lyrics are coming from an anti-war stance, as with the American metal band Lamb of God’s 2004 track ‘One Gun’ (Puri 2010, 59), with its lyric:

The sins of deliverance
The eyes of the patriot fixed through the scope
The unknowing tyrant, walks to the rope.
It’s where murder is justice that martyrs are made.
A one gun salute for the new independence day.
They’ll hallow your name.
They’ll hallow your name for your sacrifice.

![Figure 4.14 Lamb of God, ‘One Gun’. Ashes to the Wake [CD], 2004. CD 2 track 24: 0.00–0.29.](image)

‘One Gun’ starts with an intense, accented bass line oscillating $\hat{1}–b\hat{2}–\hat{1}–b\hat{2}–\hat{1}$ (Figure 4.14), similar to a drum call.
Heavy metal’s extensive use of the ♭2 as part of its powerful, loud, masculine, threatening sound is also exploited in recent films set in wars in the Middle East. The metal band Ministry had three of their tracks used in the film *The Hurt Locker*. One of these tracks, ‘Khyber Pass’ (named after a possible location of Osama Bin Laden), combines the ♭2 in its bass line with the ♭2 in ‘Eastern’-sounding melodies [CD 2 track 25: 0.05–0.58]. The combination of ♭2 as metal signifier with ♭2 as Oriental signifier brings a new complication to these representations.97

4.5 Self-discovery and the ‘East’

As well as evoking death, doom and anguish, the ♭2 as exotic signifier supports lyrics of fantasy, empowerment and nomadic adventure in the manner of Orientalism. In metal music the lyrics are often based on

- fantasy and folklore, elves and dwarves; Excalibur pulled out of the stone; Arabia, Ali Baba and the forty thieves; stories about the nomads and bedouins. It’s a very general image. A lot of early Led Zeppelin and Deep Purple music was very mystic: mountains, eagles, abstract, not real life. They were rock stars, bored, wanting new things to explore. (Rayner interview 2009)

Led Zeppelin’s 1975 track ‘Kashmir’ is a positive ‘finding oneself’ story written while Robert Plant travelled across Morocco. The central keyboard solo is based on the A Phrygian Major scale over a melody emphasising the ♭2, with lyrics that describe the desert (Figure 4.15).

The evocations of the Orient are usually geographically non-specific, as here where a song inspired by a drive through the Moroccan desert is called ‘Kashmir’. ‘The Orient may be a blank screen for projecting Western concerns about itself’ (Locke 1991, 285). Walser writes that such evocations are powerful particularly because they are non-specific (1993, 154). Between the fifteenth and eighteenth centuries ‘for most Europeans, the entire non-European world was seen as no more than theatre, an endless Arabian Nights entertainment…. Its people… were imaginary creatures whose deeds and words could be edifying or farcical, as one chose’ (Whaples 1958, 3).

97 This connection is taken up in chapter five.
And my eyes fill with sand,
As I scan this wasted land
Trying to find,
Trying to find where I’ve been.

Figure 4.15 Led Zeppelin, ‘Kashmir’, Physical Graffiti [CD], 1975. CD 2 track 26: 0.03–0.24.

Metal and the ‘exotic’ Phrygian mode

The inclusion of the Phrygian mode will immediately, as Tagg writes, evoke the exotic (2004, 319). Within earlier popular music there was occasional use of the $b_2$ with ‘Eastern’ connections, for instance in heavy rock guitarist Dick Dale’s version of ‘Misirlu’ which uses the Turkish Hicazkar makam (Dick Dale and his Del-tones 1962. CD 2 track 27: 1.41–end). The distinctive sound of the $b_2$ stands out as an exotic identifier.

My interviewees endorse the presence of a simple association between the $b_2$ and the ‘exotic’: ‘The flattened second would be the note that I’d rely on to create a Middle Eastern feeling. You can really ham it up, that minor second’ (Herbert interview 2009). Rayner echoes this: ‘When I do my “flamenco” bit, it’s my favourite way of using it [the $b_2$].’ It really works in terms of a dark, heavy

98 The Phrygian Major mode as it is used in flamenco is discussed in chapter two.
metal, sinister-sounding scale’ (Rayner interview 2009) (Figure 4.16).

Figure 4.16 Luke Rayner improvising ‘flamenco style’ (interview 2009). CD 2 track 28: 0.00–0.08; 0.28–0.41.

The band Iron Maiden in the 1980s was exploring tensions between reality and dream, evil and power, sometimes with ‘Eastern’ associations. They were essentially interested in personal ‘liberation’, through adventures with such themes as alchemy or mythical and ‘Eastern’ sources, in order to discover new ‘powers’ in the modern world. Iron Maiden’s track ‘Powerslave’ uses the $b\text{2}$ to emphasise Egyptian imagery, as evident in lyrics.

Into the abyss I’ll fall—the eye of Horus
Into the eyes of the night—watching me go
Green is the cat’s eye that glows—in this temple
Enter the risen Osiris—risen again.

Figure 4.17 Iron Maiden, ‘Powerslave’, Powerslave [CD], 2002. CD 2 track 29: 0.00–0.34.

The ‘Powerslave’ bassline uses the $b\text{2}$ as an accented offbeat, and in the falling $\text{5}–\text{4}–\text{3}–b\text{2}$ cadence (Figure 4.17). The bass line functions both as a typical heavy metal riff and as an exotic signifier.

One of the traditions of metal music is to use dramatic textural and volume contrasts, along with pastiches of classical music, as in Led Zeppelin’s 1971 ‘A Stairway to Heaven’ (Led Zeppelin [CD] 1971). Occasionally Middle Eastern or Indian music has been used in this context, for instance in Metallica’s 1991 track
'Wherever I May Roam', where a motif with the $b2$ is repeated first on an electric sitar then as a heavy bass riff (Figure 4.18).

Figure 4.18 Metallica, ‘Wherever I May Roam’, *The Black Album* [CD], 1992. CD 2 track 30: 0.03–0.44.

The track concerns a search for self via the concept of ‘the road’. Glenn Pillsbury’s chapter ‘The Road and the Mode’ is about this use of the $b2$ in ‘Wherever I May Roam’. He describes how Metallica are ‘using musical tropes instantly identifiable as some exotic Other.... This ethnic backdrop can represent danger or evoke uncertainty and mystery’ (Pillsbury 2006, 103, 104). The intense guitar solo is in the Phrygian Major mode.

**Combining the ‘East’ and metal signification of the $b2$**

Pillsbury questions the frequent reference to Phrygian, as an exotic signifier, contending that the $b2$ is often used without any exotic connection as a ‘metal’ signifier (in agreement with Cope). Pillsbury argues that in ‘Wherever I May Roam’ the change from ‘Eastern mystery’ on the sitar to a ‘recognisably metal riff’ muddies questions of Orientalism, although the $b2$ in the metal bass riff provides a connection between the two representations (ibid., 101, 105):

Understanding how the analytical details of such a tiny structural element can contain a wealth of cultural context means it is also necessary to examine the tools used in that analysis.... I propose alternate considerations for analysing the linkage between Phrygian sounds, exoticism, and heavy metal. (ibid., 101)

Pillsbury believes that modal terminology within metal, such as Phrygian, was developed in the 1980s to give gravitas to the metal genre by using terminology ‘explicitly to position the virtuosity of metal guitar as distinctly studied and learned’ rather than just ‘noise’ (ibid., 117). For him, the use of the $b2$ in
‘Wherever I May Roam’ is more about tension and release, a bass riff over a tonic drone:

The contour of the melody adds stability, floating above the drone it moves away from its starting pitch, but always pushes back down to it via the pointed resolution of the upper half step…. The guitars land solidly one half-step higher, on low F. The arrival wrenches the narrative out of the stability of the low E, at once suspending the expectation of low E while also acting to push the song forward. (ibid., 104, 107)

This ‘wrenching’ of the narrative to instability on the $b\flat_2$ is taken by Pillsbury to be, as Cope has stated, a classic metal building block.

**The Self as Other**

However, in ‘Wherever I May Roam’ the repeated ostinato constantly moves between sitar and electric bass: ‘East and West, Other and Self that have been created by this point’ (Pillsbury 2006, 105). Complications arise as they did in the metal appropriation of the classical connotations of the $b\flat_2$ as ‘feminine’ and Other (see 4.3). Metallica’s wish ‘to create a blanket non-Western setting… enacts many of the traditional power hierarchies involved in determining and asserting one’s identity through its superficial representation of the Other’ (ibid., 103, 111). The location of the Other is within the artist, while ‘the experience of a foreign place calls up subconscious images of the self related to one’s original or usual place, and our perception of that foreign place depends very much on how much our insider/outsider status shapes up’ (ibid., 112–3). The exotic is both the desired Other—‘The Road as his Bride’ (ibid., 104, 106)—and ‘a location for the celebration of individualism, restless energy, and action…. A rebellion against agrarian conventionality’ (ibid., 109). Tagg and Clarida refer to the desire for a romantic escape from the mundane and disempowering everyday world, an escape from a perverted rationalism:

[Romanticism is] criticising capitalism from idealist positions situated as far away as possible from the perceived historical and/or geographical location of... (European or North American) capitalism. The idealised ‘other places’... anywhere in time or place will do, the further the better…. Although such traits of romanticism may be escapist, those ‘elsewheres’ may have provided, historically speaking, the only accessible point from which it seemed possible to criticise, as well as escape from, the hated reality of capitalism and its perversion of rationalism. (Tagg and Clarida 2003, 37 note 7)
Pillsbury adds that ‘representative of the exoticism of the Phrygian mode [the ♭2] is also representative of a multifaceted issue in the theorisation of metal’s general harmonic language’ (Pillsbury 2006, 107). The ♭2 passes seamlessly between its signification as ‘metal’ and its signification as ‘exotic’, giving it a special place in this song, and in many similar conjunctions of ‘Eastern’ music and metal.

### 4.6 Oriental metal

‘Wherever I May Roam’ illustrated the combined functions of the ♭2–♭1 motif both as a metal signifier and to depict the Orient. I will now turn to the genre of Oriental metal, which is based on the interaction of metal and Arabian or Indian music.

Oriental metal originated with the Israeli band Orphaned Land in the 1990s. The genre has now extended to Palestine, Egypt and America amongst other countries. It uses Arabian modes and instruments for contrast and self-identification, often in quiet sections at the start and end of tracks, in a comparable manner to Metallica’s ‘Wherever I May Roam’. This genre follows in the tradition of folk metal genres, present in Scandinavia and Germany since the 1980s, that fuse local traditional music with metal. It is not defined by who is creating the music; there are many American Oriental metal groups, and many metal groups in the ‘Orient’ that do not use local music, and are not classified as Oriental metal.

Orphaned Land is a group with members of mixed heritage, including guitarist Yossi Sassi Sa’aron who is a Mizrahi Jew with Libyan and Iraqi parents, brought up with Middle Eastern music. I met Sa’aron in Tel Aviv, he spoke of the difference in the use of the ♭2 between his own band and American metal bands:

> I think a lot of people in metal in the Western world play it because... it has that half tone diabolic, bad boy kind of essence to it.... All the things that are like, you know, quite dissonant to the ear.... [He sings a phrase with ♭2: CD 2 track 31: 0.15–0.20]. They do something that is Phrygian...metal is used to being a bit dissonant, out of scale notes.... Many bands just do because they want this contrast, the sound of this half-tone games and to sound a bit diabolic... tough... but for me it’s really nothing about that. I don’t try to be diabolic and to create any controversial sounds or dissonant sounds in any way. For me it is far from dissonant. (Sa’aron interview 2010)
As the $b\sharp_2$ is not Other to many Oriental metal musicians the potential for expression using this note becomes more complex. Meanings are extended by the use of Arabian scales as self-identity markers.

The ‘masculine’ connotations acquired from the metal genre can be transferred to the $b\sharp_2$ within Arabian music, enabling young men in the Middle East further empowerment through their own local musical resources. I was told about the Palestinian Oriental metal band Chaos of Nazareth by a London friend. While on holiday in Israel I met and interviewed them. They, likewise, have a close identification with Arabian music and ‘scales’.

The feeling of heavy metal is powerful... not like pop songs ‘I love this, I love you’.... Lyrics are not happy songs, not ‘Oh I was born in a happy country’.... People are killing people in war, the world is coming to an end somehow... this is why Chaos plays.... We came with a message, we’re not just making heavy metal because heavy metal rules. No, if we had a great country, if we were living in a great place we’d be making soft rock or soft songs.... What am I going to say? To [say to] the people living here to raise the mask from their eyes. That’s what I’m talking about. Our message is peace and see the truth. We’re metalists, we’re the metalheads. We’re not normal guys, normal persons. (Nadaf interview 2011)

Chaos of Nazareth’s 2011 track ‘Silence before Chaos’ starts with an extended Arabian melody, played on the qanun (zither) by guitarist Firaz Nadaf’s father. This melody, centred on the $b\sharp_2$–$\flat$ motif, is taken up in a ‘heavy’ bass line in the subsequent metal track, similar to the one in ‘Wherever I May Roam’ (Figure 4.19). Here, the emphasis of the $b\sharp_2$ in the bass riff moves to a syncopated pattern, rather than, as in the qanun tune, appearing mainly on unaccented notes.
Nadaf describes the dissonance of the ♭2: ‘It’s tight, like Israel’ (interview 2011). These two Oriental metal bands, both from Israel, one Jewish, the other Arab both speak of Middle Eastern music being their ground, the metal sound being their milieu. They are producing their own unique music, reflecting contemporary life, demonstrating glocalisation in their exploration of ‘concrete cultural configurations and phenomena’ (Cvetkovich and Kellner 1997, 9). Their local resource of the ♭2 strengthens their powerful metal sound. Popular music can give the opportunity to assert human agency in ‘radically differentiated political situations’ (Connell and Gibson 2003, 272; Biddle and Knights 2007, 8).

There is a growing metal scene in the Islamic world. The majority of metal bands in the Middle East have no overt inclusion of traditional local music, such as the Iraqi band Acrassicauda, which is the subject of a documentary: *Heavy Metal in Baghdad* (2007). In this documentary the band members report how metal music has been part of their lives for years, and they are amused by the idea that American soldiers would think that playing metal out of their tanks would alarm them—they simply join in with ‘air guitar’. Mark LeVine describes how metal music often grows in countries that are in conflict and can be deeply empowering to musicians and fans (2008, 11).

---

The global popularity of metal can be used within the subgenre of Oriental metal deliberately to promote cross-cultural communication. Al Qaynah is an Internet-

Figure 4.20 Al Qaynah, ‘Ground Zero Pilgrims’.\textsuperscript{100} CD 2 track 33: 0.00–0.53.

based metal band created by Danish musician Jesper Boye. Al Qaynah specifically aims to mix Arabian, Indian and Eastern European music into the heavy metal genre as part of a political message. Different instrumental sound files from musicians from around the globe are collated on a MySpace site (Boye 2007). The 2007 Al Qaynah track ‘Ground Zero Pilgrims’ is a mix of shawms and electric bass, with a focus on the $\flat_{2}–\tilde{1}$ fall (Figure 4.20). Boye comments

Afghanistan... is our metaphorical homeland…. The musical project is to blend western, Middle Eastern and Eastern influences in a homogenous way. Emphasising unity and flow—not differences. The musical vision is ‘Eastern metal’. It’s an attempt to create a sound that truly reflects the urban experience of late modern western society, without adhering to common genre boundaries…. Using the tonalities of Middle East and India combined with a western base of monotone droning metal. The conflicts between the Western world and Islamic and third world countries... provide the motivations that fuel Al Qaynah... the project also symbolizes that illusive [sic] possibility of peaceful and tolerant relations between all the people of the world. (Boye 2007)

The easy transition from $\flat_{2}$ as metal signifier to $\flat_{2}$ as ‘Eastern’ signifier makes these compositions very effective in following the trend established by Led Zeppelin and Metallica. The embracing of the $\flat_{2}$ as a powerful, expressive symbol that occurs in metal by artists who have the $\flat_{2}$ in their ‘local’ traditions can, I would argue, be used for clear statements of self-identity and masculinity. The potential for expression using this note becomes more nuanced with connotations given to Arabian scales, and empowerment can be derived from self-identification with both the Arabian sound and its metal setting.

**Conclusion**

Metal genres are embracing the shadowy, anti-establishment character of the $\flat_{2}$ and are continuing to exploit it within music of protest. The $\flat_{2}$ that was ‘Othered’ by Western classical music is appropriated for the Self. Oriental metal specifically collaborates with ‘local’ musics of the Middle East and India, where the $\flat_{2}$ is part of the Self, forming a hybrid with the $\flat_{2}$ as metal signifier.

Heavy metal music looks back to the medieval period and embraces the shadowy stance that the $\flat_{2}–\tilde{1}$ motif may represent. Metal music is not religious, but it has a spiritual dimension: the complexities of shadowy thinking without the religious dogma, the ‘outsider inside’ of countercultural music. The metal tradition stands
out in its deliberate and extensive use of the ♭2 to help create subversive, anti-establishment emotions. The ‘Other’ ♭2 is ideal for indicating the ‘Other within’ and this is the status of heavy metal musicians, the defining aspect of the counterculture. The dissonance is full of potential for expressing intensity, particularly for those who by inclination or compulsion are drawn to the shadows.

The Phrygian musical motif that had been feminine became an agent for the expression of male power, by being played at high volume and low frequency. It was thus redefined as powerful, active and masculine: apposite connotations for a modern ideology of the anti-hero. The masculinity associated with the ♭2 in metal music is a new and radical signification; the transgressive genre has adopted the transgressive note as a mainstay for its aggressive sound.

This ‘subversive’ genre is now often co-opted into the mainstream, widely used in military situations, still appealing to young men’s desire for excitement and power. Within metal the ♭2 remains significant and central to its aggressive power, and metal has given the ♭2 unique and innovative significations.
5 The $b^2$ in Film, TV and Video Soundtracks

In this chapter I am addressing the connotations of the $b^2$ in soundtrack music, principally from Hollywood and Bollywood. By comparing its appearance in these two different film industries I hope to illustrate how clichés involving the $b^2$ are widely exploited in both cultures, reflecting complex and differing ideological issues.

Film music is a rich resource for exposing the sedimented meanings of musical motifs. Claudia Gorbman argues that the role of the score is to instantly inform the visual image with meaning, predominantly as an ‘unheard melody’ (1987), meaning that the listener does not consciously register and acknowledge the music. Gorbman contends that

> music serves to ward off the displeasure of uncertain signification. The particular kind of music used in dominant feature films has connotative values so strongly codified that it can bear a similar relation to the images as a caption to a news photograph. It interprets the image, pinpoints and channels the correct meaning of the narrative events depicted. (Gorbman 1987, 58)

Gorbman, though, does not allow here for variations arising from cultural difference, discussed later.

The chosen ‘meaning’ put on the image can be represented by music that might in other circumstances be taken as clichéd or not politically correct (Adorno and Eisler 1994, 13; Killick 2001, 186). In this ‘unheard’ guise all that matters is that the sign ‘works’, with the audience having the ‘correct’ emotional reponse. The other side of this equation is that, as Andrew Killick writes: ‘We can learn from music what we would not otherwise know’ (2001, 199). The composer may unconsciously reveal ideologies through the use of musical codes.

Early books on film music by Adorno and Eisler (1994 [1947]) and by Kurt London (1936) give valuable background to how the ‘unheard’ music in film works on the subconscious. They express the relevance of the sounds being subliminal in their effect on the film viewer. London describes how we all have an ‘unconscious education in music…. Everything that is apprehended by the subconscious self is much more deeply impressed’ (1936, 37–8). This is echoed by Roy Prendegast: ‘Music has a way of bypassing the human’s normal, rational
defence mechanisms... a gut reaction unobtainable in any other way’ (1992, 210). So the combination of deliberate and unconscious acts of the composer impacts on the film listener in an often unrecognised manner.

This lack of recognition can cast music itself as irrational. Carol Flinn argues that as the ‘weaker’ partner to the visuals in a film, music can become codified as ‘weak’ and nostalgic, in contrast to the ‘rational and epistemologically treasured visual term’ (1992, 6). Flinn continues that the mere presence of music in a film scene can cast an ideological coding: its ‘abstract nature gains special resonance’ (ibid., 10). So the ‘unheard’ music may take on a political or psychological mantle.

The responsibility of the film composer, in relation to ideological values, is discussed in practical scoring technique books that give insights into compositional decisions (e.g. Karlin and Wright, 1990). Earle Hagan argues that

> the selected, deliberate, psychological usage of music is the principal burden of the picture composer…. Like the skilled psychologist, the skilled composer must be selective in the area of deliberate and calculated psychological stimuli. If he leans on the wrong emotional values, he can warp the picture out of shape. (Hagen 1971, 167) [emphasis in original]

The particular musical codes used will determine the filmgoers’ emotional experience beyond the visual impressions.

This chapter is in two distinct halves. The first half will explore the connotations of the ♭2 in Western, mainly Hollywood, films. In a Western film framework, use of the ♭2 generally has one of the following five, sometimes overlapping, significations. First is the inherited Western association of the ♭2 with sadness, anxiety and pathos. Second, since the late twentieth century the ♭2 has become a film code for sinister tension. The tension of the semitone movement from 1–♭2 was taken up in films, the most notorious and influential being *Jaws*. The ♭2 supported tense, doomladen associations of a different sort of Other, an aggressive ‘beast’. These ominous connotations have become fashionable in thrillers, crime dramas and war films since the 1980s. Third, the ♭2 as Oriental signifier has been exploited in pastiches, creating geographical locators of countries that use the ♭2 widely in their local music. Fourth, ‘Eastern’ and Other codes have been meshed together in films where there is some conflict with an
Eastern country. Finally, as metal signifier the ♭2 is used in ‘heavy’ bass riffs representing empowerment. This is exploited in recent films and soundtracks, often as ‘pumping up’ music for sport or battle. I will discuss these five significations, then comment on how within a Middle Eastern war setting the metal and Oriental significations of the ♭2 are used together in soundtracks, pursuing an enhanced understanding of the ideological usage of the ♭2.

The second half of this chapter explores these themes further, addressing how these connotations might be nuanced in a different political and cultural setting: the Indian film music industry. Bollywood music has significant structural differences from Hollywood music. For instance, the song and dance structure within many Bollywood films introduces melodies that are distinctly ‘heard’. As made clear in chapter one the ♭2 is not Other in Indian classical raga, and raga is commonly used in film song, the ♭2 evoking a myriad of associations: hope, grief, seriousness, ambition, poignancy of separation, spirituality and sometimes the Indian identity of a hero.

Other codings for the ♭2 have also been inherited from Hollywood and Western music generally, though significations often change within Bollywood, as when Western-type dissonance is sometimes linked to ideas of an ‘evil West’. The tension of the 1–♭2–1 gesture, as heard in the *Jaws* theme tune, also appears in Bollywood films and I argue that this use has a more ironic and thus lighter interpretation due partly to the lack of clear Othering of the ♭2. The use of the ♭2 here is more related to scenes of ‘waywardness’ than to any serious threat.

I find that when the ♭2 is lingered on, which it frequently is, in a film score it is generally a deliberate act, intended to produce a definite desired effect on the audience. The codes are strong and compositionally useful, with connotations affected by context. Despite some commonality in connotations of the ♭2, in general there is a level of diversity in Bollywood connotations that Hollywood does not have, due to the fact that the ♭2 is not simply the Other in Indian music.

### 5.1 Part One: Western film soundtracks’ use of the ♭2

Within literature on Western film music there is little direct mention of the ♭2. However, some of the literature that discusses dissonance, major/minor tonalities,
and the ♭6, gives useful insights into the connotations of the ♭2 in film scores. For example, Tagg and Clarida conducted a wide survey of Western listeners’ emotional responses to various TV title tunes. They found that dissonance is understood to be a ‘symbolic convention’ equalling discomfort, used for a ‘longing for geographically remote homeland’ or ‘to evoke an aching emotional undercurrent’ and may be a ‘multi-purpose sorrow/tragedy cue’ (2003, 445–6). The dissonance that the ♭2 creates with the tonic would be an example of the use of this convention.

They also found that extracts in the minor key were often associated with ‘the ethnic’, ‘longing’ and ‘elsewhere’, whether in time or place (ibid., 320–44). Royal Brown describes how composers use major/minor tonalities for dramatic effect including happy/sad and rational/irrational (1994, 160). These results not only have resonances with codings for the ♭6 but raise general issues around the notion of ‘flatter than normal’ in emotional cognition, as researched by Huron, Yim, and Chordia (2010, 8).

Tagg and Clarida also found a ‘rich history of supporting connotations’ to the flattening of the 6, attributable to the fact that the ♭6 ‘occurs so seldom in the music…. [There is] no handy mnemonic identifier for it…. Hearing even one… [is] sufficiently novel to elicit a strongly specific response’ (2003, 447). The ♭6, although uncommon in the Western canon, is present in the standard minor scale. However, in chapter three it was discussed how the standard major and minor scales used in Western music since Renaissance times do not contain a ♭2. Like the ♭6, following Tagg and Clarida’s logic, the ♭2 will also command a strong response from the listener in the Western film score.

So I argue that when the ♭2 is used in Western composition it stands out, and this makes it particularly valuable in film scores. Through discussion of a sample of Western film music I will explore how these associations of the ♭2 are deliberately utilised in film, taking the five connotations mentioned earlier in turn.

**Signifier 1: Sadness, anxiety and pathos**

In the rare occurrences of the ♭2 in Western classical music the connotations have
generally been of lament and anguish. These connotations, combined with the archaic, disused nature of the medieval Phrygian mode, made the $b\flat 2$ eminently suitable for the Franz Waxman’s musical motif for Norma Winstone in the 1950 film *Sunset Boulevard* (Figure 5.1). The music here uses pathos to tell us something about Norma, the leading character, once a famous actress, now fallen on bad times. Waxman’s *leitmotiv* in the Phrygian mode signifies Norma’s frozen, arcane status that the audience respond to with pathos. The bass part moves in parallel fifths up the Phrygian mode as if in Gregorian chant, and the motif rises up and down the lower tetrachord of the scale.

![Figure 5.1 Franz Waxman, ‘Norma’s Theme’, Sunset Boulevard (Steckler 2011, 10). See also DVD track 2: 0.21–0.31.](image)

This is a rare example of associating the $b\flat 2$ with pathos in Hollywood scores. Another instance is in the 2001 war film *Black Hawk Down* where a young American soldier’s fear and distress in the theatre of war has a background score of ‘Arabian’ music on strings, with motifs on both the $b\flat 6$ and the $b\flat 2$ (Figure 5.2).

![Figure 5.2 Hans Zimmer, ‘Arabian’ tune, Black Hawk Down (2001). CD 2 track 34: 0.00–0.18.](image)

The composer Hans Zimmer seemingly exploits the African setting to rationalise the use of the Arabian Hijaz *maqam*. By using the Arabian *maqam* I contend that Zimmer is ‘borrowing’ a common connotation of melancholia for the $b\flat 2$ from the *maqam* tradition (see chapter two).

Other instances where a general association of ‘unease’ is given to the $b\flat 2$ can be subtle and minimal, perhaps ‘unheard’ in the backing score as an indication of a significant change in the narrative. In 1971 John Williams arranged and scored the music for the film of *Fiddler on the Roof*. As Tevye’s daughter Perchik departs for Siberia, leaving her home forever, she sings a song that has no $b\flat 2$
until the last stanza when the tune ends (Figure 5.3).

This may be described as a ‘structural’ use of the ♭2, used to mark a change in the film action. Karlin and Wright discuss the device of bringing elements into title music that ‘suggest the drama before it occurs’ (1990, 131). The long, haunting single note interjection, here as a train whistle, before the scene change, sets the scene for the following action. Two other examples illustrate the use of the ♭2 in this way. Firstly, at the end of Clinton Shorter’s title music for the 2009 film District 9, a long ♭2 is held before the final tonic (Figure 5.4).

Secondly, in the title music of Christopher Young’s 2001 film music for Shipping News, the ♭2 again appears just before the action starts (Shipping News [DVD] 2001).

As can be seen through these examples, the inherited connotations of the ♭2 within Western music of sadness and unease are occasionally used to evoke pathos and anxiety in film soundtracks. These associations then expand into more negative connotations of this ‘dissonant’ note.

Signifier 2: Sinister and threatening

The ♭2 starts being used as a code for the sinister in Hollywood films in the last third of the twentieth century. The stability of the tonic may be reinforced by its juxtaposition with the ♭2. Brown writes that

tonality... creates its sense of stability by exploiting hierarchically weaker intervals that the listener feels must resolve.... In general, dissonance often gets used in film music, much the same way the minor mode does, to create affective backing for more ominous situations. (1994, 7–8) [emphasis in original]
For instance, in the 1967 underscore of the TV thriller Mission: Impossible Lalo Schifrin’s theme called ‘The Plot’ uses the dissonance of both the $b\text{2}$ and the $\#4$ in what he describes as a ‘suspense theme’ (Schifrin quoted in Brown, 1994, 317). At first there is movement around the tonic to $b7$ and $b2$, followed by an accented low $b2$ (Figure 5.5).

![Figure 5.5 Lalo Schifrin, ‘The Plot’, Music from Mission: Impossible (1967). DVD track 4: 0.03–0.16.](image)

The 1975 film Jaws made the $b2$ famous, heralding an approaching shark (Figure 5.6). There was a big promotion for the film that ‘featured Williams’s atmospheric yet succinct Jaws theme’ (Davison, 2004, 46). Jaws has an iconic status in the history of film and film music. Mervyn Cooke’s 2008 book on the history of film has the shark as its front cover (Cooke 2008), and the bass semitone motif of oscillating $1–b2–1–b2–1$ struck a particular resonance becoming one of the most famous film music examples of all time. Monelle acknowledges a connection between the ‘Jaws’ motif and ‘the dysphoric sentiment of the pianto’ (Monelle 2006, 7), describing how the motif ‘conjures terror in John Williams’ music for the movie Jaws’ (ibid., 7).

![Figure 5.6 John Williams, theme, Jaws (1975). DVD track 5: 0.00–0.13; 3.10–3.21.](image)

The success of Jaws heralded a new ‘classical’ period of composition, a ‘return to conservative values’ (Davison, 2004, 2–3), to themes of 1950s horror movies, resonating with metal’s lust for gore and its inspiration from early Gothic horror movies.

As discussed in chapter four Williams’s use of dissonance and in particular the semitone motif to evoke suspense was influenced by earlier film composers such
as Bernard Herrmann. Indeed Herrmann’s music for ‘The Giant Bees’ in the 1961 film *Mysterious Island* was a precursor of the use of the ostinato semitone motif to indicate threat, this time from giant bees. Herrmann’s *piano* moves around the minor scale, occasionally appearing as the larger interval $b2–b7$ (Figure 5.7).

![Figure 5.7 Bernard Herrmann, ‘The Giant Bees’, *Mysterious Island* (2007). DVD track 6: 1.37–2.07.](image)

The ‘Jaws motif’ is now present in numerous Hollywood film tracks, a subliminal shark: a signifier of sinister threat. Annahid Kassabian writes of how ‘audiences have simply seen enough films to know what “low, ominous sounds” or tubas mean’ (Kassabian 2001, 24). She continues that ‘one would have to work hard *not* to acquire competence in it; for example, the theme for *Jaws*... developed a life of its own, becoming *the* sound of ironic danger’ (ibid., 109–10) [emphasis in original].

An example of this ironic connotation is Robert Rodriguez’s main theme from his 2007 comedy zombie thriller *Planet Terror* (Figure 5.8). The mesmeric, oscillating riff $1–b2–1$ is joined, as in *Jaws*, by a note a tone below the tonic. This theme re-occurs almost incessantly throughout the film, underlying a persistent threat from alien attack.

![Figure 5.8 Robert Rodriguez, theme, *Planet Terror* (2007). DVD track 7: 1.45–2.01.](image)

The use of the $b2$ as a generally sinister presence in soundtracks is exemplified by three other examples. The 2006 British TV political drama *The State Within* has a plot about possible war with a fictional republic of Tyrgyzstan. In episode 7, at 19.28–19.52, the underscore for a particularly tense scene is a falling bass ostinato: $b2–1–#4$ (Figure 5.9). The second example is in the British police drama *Craven* on BBC Radio 4 Women’s Hour, which has a theme tune featuring the
falling melodic cadence 3–♭2–♯1 (Figure 5.10). The third example comes from the underscore for the American TV drama *Homeland* (2011), about the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. In episode 11, called ‘The Vest’, at 2.40–4.10, the action is of the male leading character donning a suicide bomber’s vest. The ♭2 appears in long synthesiser notes together with the tonic and the major 7th, juxtaposing semitones above and below the tonic. Then an ‘Arabic qanun’ plays a falling pianto ♭2–♯1 at 3.52, connecting to the ♭2 as Oriental signifier. The ♭2 synthesiser notes continue and then the pianto repeats at 4.04. This underscore returns each time the suicide vest again comes to the fore, as at 32.40, this time without the pianto. I argue that these three examples all demonstrate the falling pianto connoting a sinister or criminal presence, a foreboding, which is repeated in many places on TV, radio and film.

The images of the ‘East’ that come into these examples can be expanded by a broader look at how the ♭2 has been used to create and introduce associations with the East.

**Signifier 3: The East and the exotic**

The ‘Oriental’ signification of the ♭2 has resulted in the ‘West’ using the ♭2 as a geographical locator to connote exotic countries and cultures. An example of this is in Maurice Jarre’s main theme for the 1962 *Lawrence of Arabia* film (Figure
The notes of the Hijazkar maqam are used as the scale for this theme. The significant ‘Arabian’ sound is created by the combined use of the $b\flat_2$, the major $3$ and the $b\flat_6$. ‘Mediterranean tonality’ appears in the accompanying chords: both the $b\flat_vii-I$ and $b\flat_{II-I}$ cadences being used; these emphasise the $b\flat_2$ and reinforce the ‘Arabian’ sound. Tagg and Clarida write of the appearance within Western music of ‘such modality connoting, if not North Africa, then possibly Spain and if not Spain then at least Sicily or the Mezzogiorno…. [It] is ethnically, socially and geographically music from “somewhere else”’ (2003, 319). In Jarre’s theme it is striking how the tonic D continually returns on the first beat of each bar, demonstrating, perhaps, Lawrence’s dominance over the Other.\(^{101}\)

![Figure 5.11 Maurice Jarre, theme, Lawrence of Arabia (1962). DVD track 8: 0.05–1.07.](image)

The evocation in William Alwyn’s The Black Tent is of the Arabian desert of Jordan and Syria, which ‘provided the opportunity to fuse Western and Arabian musical elements in the service of a desert drama about miscegenation’ (Cooke 2008, 243–4). Prendegast writes of how the use of Western-composed ‘Oriental’ music has a greater dramatic effect than ‘authentic Oriental’ music in that it creates an immediate image for the Westerner in an Orientalist fashion (1992, 202). These film soundtracks are couched in Western musical style and carry romantic connotations of the desert and Anglo/Arab encounters.

Sometimes the $b\flat_2$ within a musical phrase will support Orientalist character stereotyping. The original score of Fiddler on the Roof features the $b\flat_2$ as one element in the representation of Jewish ‘Tradition’ (the title of the opening song), in ‘If I were a Rich Man’, and in the ‘Bottle Dance’. The $b\flat_2$ is used in a positive and festive way to connote East European Jewishness. The original score was written by Jerry Bock, but adapted for film by John Williams. Williams’s adaption adds two more occurrences of the $b\flat_2$ than in the original musical. The

\(^{101}\) Thanks to Andrew Killick for this observation.
first is the train whistle in ‘Far from the Home I love’ (Figure 5.3) and the second is in the ‘Bottle Dance’. Bock’s score starts with a † to natural 2 trill on the clarinet, bringing in the ɔ2 quite late in the tune. However Williams’s score begins with a trill to the ɔ2 (Figure 5.12). Williams’s change of scoring may reflect a growing use of the ɔ2 in the latter half of the twentieth century for connotations of the ‘exotic’ in film.

Figure 5.12 John Williams, ‘Bottle Dance’, Fiddler on the Roof (1971). DVD track 9: 1.00–1.05.

I have discussed Arabian and Jewish connotations attributable to the occurrence of the ɔ2 in the musical traditions of Arabs and Jews, yet its prominence in Andalusian flamenco music results in the term ‘Spanish scale’ being assigned to ɔ2 modes. The ɔ2 is also used in film to represent Spain or Mexico, or with greater complexity to signify a spaghetti western, as in Ennio Morricone’s 1966 score for The Good, the Bad and the Ugly where the ɔ2 is used as a chromatic passing note (Figure 5.13).

Figure 5.13 Ennio Morricone, Mexican theme, The Good, the Bad and the Ugly (1966). CD 2 track 38: 0.00–0.17; 0.15–0.31.

The examples in this section show how Western-style music uses the ɔ2 to signify images of the East. These examples don’t display negative connotations, but simply portray a Western version of the East. Yet there is also a usage of the ɔ2 that displays more sinister evocations of the East.

Signifier 4: The sinister East

The spaghetti western flamenco pastiche is often used to evoke an ethos in a film of a different genre. For instance, flamenco music appears in the 2008 film The Hurt Locker, about an American bomb disposal team in Baghdad during the Iraq war. The soundtrack contains occasional ‘flamenco’ guitar inserts and its main theme is based on the Phrygian mode. However the main geographical sonic
locators are transferred to the Middle East, and there is a return to Arabian music, where the same main theme may evoke the Arabian Hijaz maqam as this contains the same notes as the Phrygian Major mode. One of the film’s composers, Marco Beltrami, described how the concept of the music was essentially diegetic (onscreen), developing the sounds of an ‘alien’ landscape (2009). ‘We decided it should conjure up images of a western…. Then we used various performance techniques to achieve the atmosphere of an unpredictable, alien landscape’ (ibid.). The Othering of the Arab is thus clear.

The ♭₂ appears in the diegetic sounds: for instance, in a ‘rotor wash from a helicopter’ where a ♭₂ motif is heard, a D♭ drone falling a semitone to the C. This is echoed by an ‘Arabian’ song clip developing the melody, also using the ♭₂, followed by the film’s main theme (Figure 5.14). Director Katherine Bigelow discusses how she wanted the realism of sound design to dominate the movie, and asked the composers to ‘blur the distinction between the score and other sounds within the film’. On the soundtrack album this track is named ‘Hostile’ (ibid.), and sinister connotations of the ‘enemy’ may be evoked through the ‘Arabian’ ♭₂.

![Figure 5.14 Marco Beltrami and Buck Sanders, ‘Hostile’, The Hurt Locker (2009). CD 2 track 38: 0.05–1.12.](image)

Another example of the ‘East’ as sinister may be in the controversial use of the sound of the adhan (call to prayer) in The Hurt Locker’s soundtrack. This contains the ♭₂ and is based on maqamat. Ostensibly the presence of the adhan is diegetic sound design, giving a geographical atmosphere. However, the fact that this is heard just before the discovery of the buried bombs is not coincidental, making an inevitable and sinister connection between Islam and ‘terrorism’.

Arguably, use of the adhan would provide this connotation whether or not there
was a b♭2 used, yet this note’s direct signification of the Other easily supports the imagery.

*The Hurt Locker* is far from unique in this use of the b♭2 for both threat and the Arab-as-Muslim. Numerous other war films based in countries with a Muslim presence use Arabian music with the b♭2, as with Hans Zimmer’s music from the 2001 film *Black Hawk Down*, based in Somalia, which combines rock music with Arabian music. There is no particular reason for including Arabian music here other than that the overlords are Muslim, yet it contributes to connotations of ‘foreign threat’. The b♭2 appears in ‘Arabian’ motifs on strings, juxtaposed with open-fifth chords, which could allude to medieval arcaneness or to metal power chords (Figure 5.15). Similar motifs are then played on the oud as part of a falling three-note motif. The presence of the b♭2 contributes to the evocation of both danger and an Islamic presence.

Figure 5.15 Hans Zimmer, ‘Chant’ *Black Hawk Down* (2001).[^102] CD 2 track 40: 0.03–0.54.

Killick writes of how music has ‘become a code for precisely those meanings that are [not] expressed in more “explicit” tracks such as dialogue and visual images, and which would indeed be considered unacceptable or offensive if so expressed’ (2001, 186). Killick warns of the dangers of implicit associations lending themselves to dubious ends (ibid., 192). Basem Ra’ad argues that ‘the ancient biases described in films here are potentially more dangerous, certainly more insidious, than outright prejudice because they are less noticeable and so work at

[^102]: ‘Chant’ *Black Hawk Down*<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FtJBdR3cHWA&list=PLCE4306D5E48EB951> [accessed 31/03/14].
a deeper subterranean level.... Whether the harm is intentional or not... whether there is an ‘embedded’ or an ‘embedding’ design for a weaponry to generate new hatreds out of old hatreds.... Much harm they can cause to multi-ethnic understanding today’ (Ra‘ad 2005, 376). Film music can be deeply influential on cinema audiences and, as it is not the conscious focus of attention, it can affect the listener at a deep level.

The historical and political facts of Western European encounters with the Middle East and Muslim countries have indeed affected the musical landscape in the ‘West’, where an intimation of an Arabian maqam immediately triggers certain Othering connotations. Psychologists Curtis and Bharucha argue that:

Tones that violate our cultural expectations may evoke emotional responses, and this source of emotional responses may be unique to the non-native listener.... The listener’s long-term schematic knowledge of their own musical culture shapes the perception of music within and across cultures. (Curtis and Bharucha 2009, 374)

When listening to unfamiliar music we bring our own cultural expectancies. So our experiences of an unfamiliar modality ‘may be drastically different than the experiences of one who is familiar with the modality’ (ibid., 373). We thus ‘may have affective experiences that differ from those of a native listener’ (ibid.). A Western listener unfamiliar with the ♭2 may hear it as lower than the ‘natural’ 2, and assign the metaphor ‘lower is wrong’, ‘lower is weak’. The falling cadence within Middle Eastern music may attract this metaphor, and be regarded as revealing weakness.

Said analyses Orientalism as serving the West in its ‘political vision of [a] reality whose structure promoted the difference between the familiar (Europe, the West, “us”) and the strange (the Orient, the “East”, “them”)’ (Said 1978, 43–4). Stokes argues that musical essentialism and boundaries ‘are as much a part of the violence of the political situation as shooting and bombs [bringing] people separated by these boundaries into an intense and potentially explosive proximity’ (1994, 10). The juxtaposition of ‘us’ and ‘them’ is clear in Hollywood films: ‘Hollywood has always needed evil characters... Arabs seem to be enduring fixtures’ (Al-Taee 2010, 260). Stokes continues that ‘these musical images do not just reflect knowledge of “other places” but preform them in significant ways’ (Stokes 1994, 5). The augmented second
informs us in the context of our own musical language of an imagined world of violence and repressed sexuality. These deeply rooted images … allow its governments to mobilise their armies against Middle Eastern populations the moment their supply of oil is threatened (ibid., 4).

The ♭2 as a perhaps more hidden Oriental signifier also may portray the sinister, threatening Arab within film soundtracks.

**Signifier 5: The ‘beast within’**

The ‘us’ and ‘them’ has a further development in a newer signification of the ♭2 as the Other, also used in soundtracks for ‘war’: the ‘beast’ within.

My final examples in this section discuss ‘pumping up’ soundtracks, and their use of the ♭2 in bass riffs, based on the practice of athletes and soldiers listening to music on their personal ‘i-pods’. Pieslak points out how since the 1980s metal has been simply codified for action, adventure and violence (2009, 77). For instance, as we saw in chapter four, metal band Drowning Pool’s track ‘Bodies’ has been used as a popular song for building up bravado for battle. Similarly, TV sports programmes use ‘metal-type’ rhythmic bass ostinatos using the 1–♭2 to ‘build up’ to sports challenges, as in, for instance, the ceremony music at the 2012 Olympics, the music for the 2013 Athletics World Championships and the build-up music to the 2013 women’s tennis final at Wimbledon. In the latter the bass ostinato 1–♭2 repeats four times before the voiceover starts, continuing in an underscore (Figure 5.16).

![Diagram](image)

**Figure 5.16 Wimbledon women’s tennis final (2013). CD 2 track 41: 0.01–0.23.**
I argue that the introduction of grooves using the $\flat 2$ in ‘build-up’ soundtracks for sport and war is influenced by the history of its use in metal. Reni Celeste, writing in 2005, records that

> a significant shift has occurred in the past 40 years of modern sound cinema in which the musical and sonic dimension of cinema has become increasingly aggressive and even dominant. This shift corresponds to the rise of high-action sequences, music video, musical interludes, and the emergence of youth culture and rock music. (Celeste 2005, 114)

The sinister and/or transgressive edge gone, what remains is a powerful, modern statement of determination, which is used to gear up the audience into an intense support of their team or nation. These are new significations in popular musics that challenge the contention that $\flat 2$ is Other: the ‘beast’ is now the Self getting ready for a contest.

**An ‘East’ and ‘beast’ hybrid in war films**

The masculinity and machismo of the main character Sergeant James in *The Hurt Locker* is underlined by his listening to the track ‘Khyber Pass’. This track combines ‘Arabian’ singing and a metal track with a $\flat 2$$-\hat{1}$ bass riff. The final credits are accompanied by a repeat of ‘Khyber Pass’ as a leitmotiv for James’s character. This could be heard simply as ‘pumping-up’ music for battle yet the ambiguous politics of this war film brings into question the presence of the ‘Arabian’ singing. The lyrics of ‘Khyber Pass’ are not heard and, indeed, the fact that the metal band Ministry’s album *Rio Grande Blood*, from which the tracks used in *The Hurt Locker* come, is an anti-war CD is not emphasised and would not be obvious to the listener.

According to Pieslak, metal has been introduced since ‘around 2003’ into the advertising of almost all branches of the armed services’ (2009, 41). Army recruitment music in the 1960s typically contained military marches (DVD track 10).

> However, in the 2007 U.S. Marine Reconnaissance Recruiting Video there is an oscillation $\hat{1}$$-\flat 2$$-\hat{1}$$-\flat 2$$-\hat{1}$ accompanying three images. The first image is of an ‘Eastern’ man holding a weapon, with captions regarding the threat from terrorism. This changes to a more menacing image of an American soldier with the caption ‘We will be watching’. The final image of a skull with the motto

\[103\] ‘Your First 80 Days’<www.youtube.com/watch?v=nSa96KakIZw> [accessed 04/03/2011]. DVD track 10: 0.00–0.18.
‘swift, silent, deadly’ introduces heavy metal music, with an electric guitar playing a fast repeated $\flat 2$–$\flat 2$ motif (Figure 5.17).

I argue that this video is underlining a perceived threat to the American way of life from the ‘East’ by using the ‘Eastern’ $\flat 2$ subliminally under the image of a ‘sinister ‘Eastern’ man, and then the $\flat 2$ is appropriated by a sinister and powerful image of a U.S. marine. The metal genre may be seen to advocate ‘dirty fighting’ in support of the American ethos of personal freedom over an ‘evil enemy’.

The rise of metal music has resulted in a juxtaposition of sounds within war film soundtracks where the $\flat 2$ of metal music, coded to represent an (anti-heroic) American soldier, appears alongside the sinister $\flat 2$ representing the ‘Eastern’ environment and people. The overall message is of a powerful army encountering a sinister enemy. The coincidence of the $\flat 2$ musical codes reinforces these dual messages of a sinister ‘Eastern’ presence and the threatening American military.

Figure 5.17 U.S. Marine Reconnaissance Recruiting Video (2007). DVD track 11: 0.15–0.45

I would argue that since the film Jaws and the rise of metal music, the Western ear, well attuned to the $\flat 2$ as the Other, also associates it with power. So a helicopter propeller set against the falling semitone, $\flat 2$–$\flat 1$, in The Hurt Locker can evoke the strength of the US air force. Following this with a falling semitone in an Arab voice can signify sinister threat from Iraqi locals. When these codes of ‘East’ or ‘beast’ are brought together in a Middle Eastern war movie it is pertinent to ask what stereotypes are being reinforced. A young American soldier
typically has little knowledge of the Arabian people as individuals or their culture, beyond connections with terrorism and ‘backwardness’. He does probably have a familiarity with metal music and the resonances of that music in terms of power and subversion. If a composer lingers on a dissonance that appears commonly in both metal music and the Arabian maqamat, such as the $\flat 2$, in a narrative context involving an Arab enemy, an easy connection can be made between the Arab and threat: ‘East’ and ‘beast’.

The motivations of composers of war film music are individual and complex, yet the use of the $\flat 2$ in these two guises is deliberate. The meshing of $\flat 2$ as ‘East’ and $\flat 2$ as empowerment are very different from those discussed in chapter four in regards to Oriental metal. There is no ascription of power to the ‘Eastern’ enemy here; the metal ingredient is decidedly American.

By drawing together the different significations discussed here, I argue that the inherited Western sedimented meanings of the $\flat 2$ have enabled it to be readily used to convey the Other in several guises: disturbed, sinister and exotic. The metal association of the $\flat 2$ with subversive empowerment also allows for the Jaws shark to be internalised within the Western self-identity: the ‘beast’ within.

5.2 Part two: Bollywood and the $\flat 2$

In another culture, enculturated with different musical associations for the $\flat 2$, a film audience will understand its presence in different ways. The Bollywood audience may be familiar with the $\flat 2$ from Indian classical and folk music, but mostly from Bollywood itself.

Dubbed Bollywood during the 1980s in a derogative description of its ‘parasitic’ relationship to Hollywood, the Indian film industry has always modelled itself on the American industry (Singh 2007, 7). Yet the history of Indian cinema is also the history of ideology and nationhood in India. At first it was the story of the independence struggle; then post-independence democracy and nation building, serving as ‘a temporary palliative to crores of Indians who are overstressed by endemic pressures of poverty [and] unemployment’ in a country striving to establish and modernise itself in the global economy (ibid., 39, 43).
The industry drew on traditional theatrical practice to draw in the illiterate or non-Hindi-speaking rural population, producing the masala (mixed genre) film that heavily uses the non-verbal arts of spectacle, song and dance to further the narrative. The mythic tales of Ramayana and Mahabharata continually reappear in different guises even in contemporary Bollywood cinema. Through these tales the ethos of the traditional ‘all-Indian’ nation is upheld (ibid., 51). Singh emphasises the importance of film as a populist medium, expressive and influential, reinforcing ideologies in relation to nationhood and personal freedom.

Within these masala films there is a myriad of different musical styles and the \( \flat 2 \) is, historically, significantly more present than in Hollywood films. As with Western film, Bollywood music literature gives background contextual information, concentrating variously on songs, composers and genre, rather than engaging with specific musical detail such as the \( \flat 2 \), although the use of dissonance in general is discussed. In addition, choices of different ragas in soundtracks are itemised. The significations from part one of this chapter will be revisited in this context, together with new significations.

**Inherited connotations from classical raga**

In chapter one I detailed some of the connotations of the \( \flat 2 \) (komal Re) within classical raga, which convey emotions ranging from deep sadness to seriousness, strength, relaxation and delight. Bollywood composers have always drawn on classical ragas and folk tunes, particularly in the composition of film songs. Ashraf Aziz writes of how the popular Bollywood songs in the 1930s and 1940s were a ‘soundtrack of [the] Indian national movement’ and how an evening raga such as Shri may be used in a film song with its connotation of ‘a morally darkening universe created by oppression’, or a morning raga such as Bhairavi for revolutionary hope (2003, 98). Both these popular ragas contain \( \flat 2 \) as a crucial note.

There is an identification made between Indian classical music and India itself: Aziz suggests that ‘encoded in the classical music are the sacred and historical dimensions of Indian history’ (2003, 33). There was a conscious use of ragas in film song during the first years of independence to bolster national identity, alongside innovations from the ‘West’ and other foreign influences (Arnold 1991,
For instance, two films by director Ritwik Ghatak, that would not be classified as Bollywood—*Komal Gandhar* (1961), and *Meghe Dhaka Tara* (1960)—both, according to Roy, consciously use raga themes, from ragas containing the $b^2$, to emphasise the content that concerns the tragedy of the partition of Bengal…. The insistence on Indian music could either be [Ghatak’s] love for the music itself and confidence on what it could do, or for his deep emotional attachment to things that belong to his motherland (raga music in this case), [that] he wanted to show through his characters. (Roy 2009, 8, 12–13)

In *Meghe Dhaka Tara* the background score is of the male star doing vocal practice in raga *Gun Kali* (*Gunakri*), a raga that evokes pathos to the Indian listener, and here signifies grief, even when performed at a fast tempo (Roy 2009, 26–7). In *Komal Gandhar* the name itself ‘point[s] at a deep grief’ (ibid., 8). Roy explains about the *shruti* of *Ga*:

> The Komal Gandhar... has innumerable shades (not just the physical microtones) capable of functioning as signs of all these complex feelings that one is flooded with when tragedy strikes, and yet makes one feel alive, ticking, and energetic. (ibid., 11)

These comments from Roy on the complexity of a note’s ability to function on many levels compliment his general comments on *komal* notes in interview (see chapter one).

Alison Arnold details how since the beginning of the Hindi film industry the film song has been used to convey feelings and emotion, with different ragas being used at different stages of a film (ibid., 60). For instance, the song ‘Naina Neer Bahaye’ in the 2005 film *Water*, by composer A.R. Rahman, is based on raga *Bhatiyar*, a raga associated with sadness. The title of this song translates as ‘Tears are flowing from my eyes’ (Daffu interview 2012) and features melodic falls ending on the $b^2–1$. Another example is the use of raga *Marva* in the song ‘Kher he dil je happy he dil’ within a horror movie, *Bees Saal Baad* (1962). This film was alluded to in an interview cited in chapter one by Chaterjee, who claimed that his memory of the popular film had left him with the sense that raga *Marva* had a sinister feel to it. This indicates a sometimes symbiotic relationship of associations between film mood and raga mood.

There are inevitable strictures on the natural development of a raga placed on it
by film use, where it is unable to follow its extended classical form. The term *filmi rāg* comes from the adaptation of ragas to fit film use. Ranade writes of the development of this strand of compositional technique, citing A.R. Rahman as ‘not averse to playing with a raga frame’ (2006, 326).

Some ragas are more adaptable than others to film, and the most popular raga in film music is one with a $b^2$: raga *Bhairavi*. Semiotician Jose Martínez explains that raga *Bhairavi* does not have many of the restrictions of style and movement that other ragas have. Raga *Bhairavi* is often associated with ‘the poignancy of separation’ (Bor 1999, 34). The song ‘Ghar Aaya Mera Pardesi’, composed by the duo Shankar-Jaikishan for the 1951 film *Awaara*, demonstrates the use of raga *Bhairavi* to portray this poignancy (Figure 5.18). The song describes a dream sequence depicting a man’s internal struggle between good and evil. Although there is a light sentiment in the song, representing the call of a woman drawing him to salvation, there is ultimately sadness and separation.

![Figure 5.18 Shankar-Jaikishan, ‘Ghar Aaya Mera Pardesi’, Awaara. DVD track 12: 0.48–1.16.](image)

Some contemporary Bollywood composers are creating a modern, urban sound using raga resources, and, again, raga *Bhairavi* is a popular choice. For instance, the song ‘Sapnon Se Bhare Naina’ from the 2009 film *Luck by Chance*, composed by the trio Shankar-Ehsaan-Loy, uses the $b^2$ as an integral element in the ostinato bass line, as well as lingering on it in the upper octave of the melody (Figure 5.19). According to Khan, the song is faithful to the raga *Bhairavi* in the basic exposition as sung by classical singer Shankar Mahadevan (interview 2013).

---

104 This song is based on Oum Kalthoum’s singing of ‘Ala Baladi Elmahboub’ (Figure 2.3), also with lyrics concerning the yearning of separated lovers.
The scene concerns an audition to enter the Bollywood film industry, and the lyrics are about serious concerns around expectations and ambitions. Despite the classical nature of this song, the $b^2$ is used within a modern setting, bringing traditional raga associations into an MTV style.

A more traditional exposition of the raga is Ismail Darbaar’s love song ‘Albela Sajan Aayo Rei’ from the 1999 film *Hum Dil De Chuke Sanam*. This song is unusually traditional in twenty-first-century Bollywood, more akin to the pre-1990 style, and it uses the serious raga *Ahir Bhairav*, with a lyric that means ‘a lover has come to hold my hands’. The film is about a family of classical musicians and ends with the ‘good daughter’ leaving her chosen lover and returning from the diaspora to her village and arranged husband. This film is in some ways a reaction to modernist themes in contemporary Bollywood, and the traditional raga here is indicative of nationhood, family and stasis. The *bhajan* (devotional song) included in ‘Albela Sajan Aayo Rei’ often lingers on the ♭2, arguably accenting the poignancy of the situation by being in the raga *Ahir Bhairav*, characterised by its ethos of the ascetic, with the ♭2 having a serious connotation within that setting (Figure 5.20).

The modern Indian hero

In modern Hindi cinema, ragas are used less than before as the film industry becomes more geared to a global market. The film song traditionally depicted a static ‘tableau’, represented by the raga; thus the hero or heroine in a film singing to a raga-based melody, might support an essentialist cliché of India as being static, while the ‘West’ is progressive (Morcom 2007, 165).
This association has contributed to recent changes (ibid.). Since the 1990s the traditional divisions between song and action sequences have become blurred, along with changes in ideologies away from concerns of nationhood to the desires to modernise (Bhaskar and Allen 2009; Singh 2007). Composers have experimented with the development of what has been named Indipop, an ‘Indian’ version of MTV-style pop. This is an example of glocalisation, the reappropriation of global products, partly to ‘make inroads into global markets’ (Biddle and Knights 2007, 6), partly in the construction of ‘national’ sounds by ‘accentuating, celebrating and marketing local differences’ (Connell and Gibson 2003, 124). These new ‘hybrids’ are ‘both questioning and transforming cultural identities’ (ibid., 124, 11). The biggest hits today are often tunes with an “‘Indian melody”, not necessarily a raga, but something with a modal melodic structure and an “Indian feel”’ (Morcom 2007, 158).

The♭2 is a distinctive ‘Indian’ element that fulfils the function of producing an ‘Indian melody’, as in the hit film song ‘Dhoom Again’, from the 2006 film Dhoom 2, with lyrics of ‘burning passion’ and ‘wild emotion’. The main theme ends with♭2–♯1, the inclusion of this gesture arguably indicating ‘Indianness’ (Figure 5.21).

![Figure 5.21 Pritam, ‘Dhoom Again’, Dhoom 2 (2006) DVD track 15: 0.58–1.07; 1.45–2.03; 2.57–3.16.](image)

The conflict between modernity and tradition is a common theme in Bollywood films, and I argue that the♭2 plays a distinctive role in its exposition. In the 2009 film London Dreams there is a divide between an aspirational musician in London, striving to become a star, singing in Indipop style over rock music, and
his best friend left behind in India, who becomes a more talented singer in a folk style, though also with a strong rock feel. The song ‘Tapke Masti’ starts with the ‘rustic’ singer, with a light swing rhythm on the _tumbi_ (a traditional Punjabi single-stringed instrument), between the tonic, the \( b_2 \) and the major 7 (Figure 5.22). The riff is joined by a hunting horn on the falling \( b_2-1 \) gesture. This is taken over by a heavy electric guitar, and a strong vocal melody also focusing on the \( b_2 \). This song suggests a new connotation for the \( b_2 \) in Bollywood, a strong association with rural India, representing lost innocence, yet carrying the modern stamps of rock music. The \( b_2 \) does not carry any negativity, as it might in a Hollywood film, despite the ‘heavy’ setting. It is notable that all the songs set in rural India in this film contain the \( b_2 \) while the London-based ones mostly do not. An exception is an angst-driven ‘Victory’ song sung at Wembley stadium, about a lonely, rock star’s plight in London, suggesting that the character has ‘lost his soul’. Western negative connotations of the \( b_2 \) are used here in relation to the ‘loss’ of India.
Despite the continuing ‘evil West’ theme in Bollywood, there is an overwhelming drive to modernism, and as rock music can exemplify this tension it is very popular in India. The film *Rock On*, 2008, with music also by Shankar-Ehsaan-Loy, has a theme tune featuring the ♭2 in its bass riff, and the lyrics are sung in Hindi: even in India, the lyrics of rock songs are generally sung in English. Both
the use of Hindi and the unusual use of the ♭2 in rock music fit with the film’s attempt to bring rock music into an Indian arena with Indian national distinctions (Figure 5.23). Most of the tracks in *Rock On* do not feature the ♭2, so the appearance of it in this title tune is significant. One other song where the ♭2 appears is sung in the scene of a music competition, where an aggressive Indian metal band’s song ‘Zehreelay’ has a ♭2 ostinato (Figure 5.24). This is an unusual instance of the ♭2 being associated with something sinister, aggressive and threatening, using the metal coding of the note. There is also a ♭2 in the underscore of the ensuing fight scene between band members from each band (Figure 5.25).

![Figure 5.23 Shankar-Ehsaan-Loy, theme, *Rock On* (2008). DVD track 17: 0.00–0.31.](image)

![Figure 5.24 Shankar-Ehsaan-Loy, ‘Zehreelay’, *Rock On* (2008). DVD track 18: 0.01–0.14; 0.32–0.45.](image)

![Figure 5.25 Shankar-Ehsaan-Loy, Fight underscore, *Rock On* (2008). CD 2 track 42: 0.05–0.16.](image)

So the ♭2 is simultaneously an indicator of ‘Indianness’, and of modernity. The negative coding introduced with the adoption of Western metal semiotics is also significant as a representation of the ‘negative’ Other. I will next explore further the negative connotations adopted from Western influences.
The disturbing Western influence of dissonance

As in Hollywood film, melodrama, suspense and tension are vital ingredients of Hindi film. Dissonance is often exploited to represent this tension, and the Jaws shark has also swum in the Indian Ocean. Western orchestration and filmic devices have been used, particularly in action sequences and backing scores. Accompaniments to action sequences may carry more unfamiliar music, giving a higher sense of drama. Morcom argues that the tradition within Western music of using chromaticism to cause an aural dissonance, with ‘unpleasant associations—fear, suspense, evil as in Herrmann’s music for Hitchcock’, invites Bollywood composers to utilise Western music in dramatic sequences, as there is an absence of this chromaticism in Indian music (2007, 150):

Western sounding techniques for creating disturbance, extensive chromatic movement, whole tone scales, diminished sevenths, semitones and unmelodic motifs for villainy, apparently do so by being altogether out of the musical logic of any kind of Indian melody. (ibid., 173)

Music director Vishal Bharadwaj is quoted as saying that Indian music is not appropriate for ‘deeply disturbing/unpleasant scenes’, unless some of the ‘odd scales are used (for instance those that are non-diatonic, using... a higher degree of chromaticism)’ (quoted in Morcom 2007, 174).

Bollywood composers found it easier to convey disturbance through the use of Western-style symphonic music (ibid.). The extra-musical function of the ‘Indian’ song to support ideologies of a pure Indian morality still continues (Majumbar 2001, 163), and threats from the West may appear in the action scenes. This is another motivation for keeping raga ‘pure’, restricted to the film song, despite the inherent connotative potentials of ragas that represent anger, terror and disgust. Morcom reports film composer Shivkumar Sharma as saying in interview, that to express the drama of ‘life’s realities of anger and frustration’ you create ‘discord notes, and then you can create a feel [sic] of repulsiveness’ and he describes how this is achieved by the ‘orchestral influences of symphony music’ (Sharma quoted in Mera and Morcom 2009, 72). Composers can find it less complicated to use another genre to signify the sometimes violent action scenes than to compromise the traditional structure of ragas: dissonance within non-traditional music has the advantage of not being constricted by the demands of raga use.
An early instance of the $\flat 2$ being used in Western-style music for a ‘dissonant’ action sequence is in ‘Ghar Aaya Mera Pardesi’. After the scene described above of the ‘heavenly’ appearance of a lover, there is a nightmarish vision of hell, supported by Western-style melodramatic music, from the composer duo of Shankar-Jaikishan, highlighting the $\flat 2$ (Figure 5.26). There is extreme use of dissonance here, with the $\flat 2$ as a significant presence.

Figure 5.26 Shankar-Jaikishan, ‘Ghar Aaya Mera Pardesi’ nightmare section, Awaara (1951).

Hindi film music composition was traditionally divided between songwriters, sometimes classically trained or popular composers, and backing score composers who frequently emanated from Goan and Parsee schools of Western classically-trained composers. Dattaram Wadkar and Sebastian de Souza, both from Goa, worked as arrangers on this track, with a large orchestra (Ranade 2006, 324). Gregory Booth describes how Indian composers ‘gradually engaged with Hollywood’s emphasis on the orchestral background score as presented in foreign films’ (2008, 275). The eclectic nature of the Goan musicians’ training was apt for the requirements of Hindi film, and composers such as Wadkar and de Souza significantly contributed to the inclusion of Western music in Bollywood scores (Booth 2008, 239). Morcom adds that ‘Western music was and is anyway fashionable and one of the unique selling points of Hindi films’ (2007, 172); the
hybridity of Hindi film music is central to its popularity (Gopal and Moorti 2008, 14; Tyrrell and Dudrah 2006, 197).

**Pastiche and exotic connotations of the $\flat$**

As well as using Western-style music, song composers were able to establish an appeal to a wide audience through the use of non-specific musical styles and melodic ideas, from different regions within India and also from Arabian, Latin and Spanish flamenco traditions. A cultural pluralism pervades the film ideology and this is enhanced by the inclusion of foreign aspects, which are regarded as a novelty by the indigenous audience, being both contemporary and ‘non-partisan’: ‘Indian audiences have thus unknowingly enhanced the composers’ and producers’ proclivity for eclecticism’ (Arnold 1988, 187). The mixture of traditional form and global musical resources has established an urban and cosmopolitan musical genre.

Pastiche songs and underscore will use the musics of Others, holding it up as a contrast, sometimes to be ‘risen above’, sometimes depicting a certain ‘waywardness’. Composers experiment with styles from around the world, while maintaining an ‘Indian’ sound. The assimilation of foreign elements, for instance Sajjad’s fusions of Hindi and Middle Eastern music in the 1950s, is described as ‘exotic’ and ‘otherworldly’ (Aziz 2004, 33). Aziz argues that ‘pastiche captured [the] fragmented experience of life in India’ (ibid., xxv). So the $\flat$ may well appear in a Bollywood film score due to the insertion of an Arabian style or an evocation of Spain rather than through an indigenous source: factors such as the $\flat$ again enable these insertions to remain in some sense Indian-sounding.

As in Hollywood, the Spanish flamenco genre, characterised by its use of the $\flat$, is used widely in pastiche within Bollywood soundtracks. There is an awareness of the cultural connections between the Spanish Gypsies and their Indian roots: the nomadic gypsies of Rajasthan travelled beyond the shores of India into Spain (Renard, Manus, and Fellman 2007, 4), and scholars of flamenco have made links back to Rajasthani traditions (e.g. Rappaport 2009, 21). Thus there is a fundamentally different power relation attached to the use of flamenco music in Bollywood compared to its use in Hollywood.
Similarly to the appearance in Bollywood of a Rajasthani gypsy dancer, the ‘exotic’ flamenco dancer may indicate ‘waywardness’ or departure from tradition as in ‘Main Albeli’ a song by A.R. Rahman from the 2001 movie Zubeidaa. The story begins with a girl performing a flamenco song, the words of the song meaning ‘I want to be free’. The girl’s father severely disapproves of this singing and dancing, bans her from performance and pushes her into an arranged marriage. The ♭2 is here part of the flamenco music, using the Phrygian Major mode, with possible connotations of freedom from Indian traditions (Figure 5.27).

‘Wayward’ music may also accompany erotic dancing in Hindi film, often as a staged performance where the eye of the film actor is on the dancer (Morcom 2007, 57). These ‘item songs’ are inextricably linked in Bollywood to the courtesan tradition (Bhaskar and Allen 2009, 8). Sexualised stereotypes of the Other from Arabia and the Middle East contribute to the use of ‘Arabian’ music in these ‘erotic’ scenes. Pre-existing Arabian or Turkish songs are adapted, such as the song ‘Crazy Kiya Re’, in the 2006 film Dhoom 2, which is an adaptation by composer Pritam of ‘Olürüm Sana’ by Turkish singer Tarkan (Figure 2.30).

The commonality of, for instance, the ♭2 in both maqamat and Indian raga
enables this song to ‘pass’ as an Indian one. The narrative in the film concerns two thieves, the woman thief in this scene inviting the male to collaboration through her erotic dance. The main musical motif of ‘Crazy Kiya Re’ focuses on the $b\flat$, the tension of the $b\flat$ releasing to the tonic, with a possible connotation for the $b\flat$ of erotic charge (Figure 5.28) (the original Turkish song was passionate and erotic).

The ‘wayward’ associations of Arabian and Turkish music containing the $b\flat$ may solely portray criminal activity, as in ‘Salaame’ from the 2004 film Dhoom. Latin music (itself an exotic indicator, but here simply used for ‘having fun’), is interrupted by an ‘Arabian’ interlude. The male dancers disappear and the association is with criminality: a robbery scene. The music of this interlude begins with a bass line with a $b\flat$, followed by Arabian music samples with prominent $b\flat$s, not appearing in the main song (Figure 5.29). This contrasting interlude within a Bollywood film song is another form of the well-used formula discussed already in relation to Western backing scores, with the music changing genre to be more ‘adventurous’ for the action sequence. Salsa music here
represents the modern standard, with Arabian music as the Other. The emphasis on the $b\flat$ is, arguably, intrinsic to the tension of this passage.'

The association between Arabian music and a robbery may be surprising to a Western ear that is more familiar with more ‘sinister’ associations for Arabian sounds. I suggest that the absence of a strong sense of the Arab as a threat to India in the present time could explain this lack of ‘sinister’ Other connotations for the $b\flat$ within Arabian music in Bollywood, the strongest connotations being ‘erotic’ or criminal.

Instances of flamenco and Arabian music within Bollywood may not include the $b\flat$, as in An Evening in Paris in 1967, yet there is an abundance of the use of the $b\flat$ in these pastiche scenes. In identifying occasions when the movement from ‘heroic’ to ‘wayward’ and ‘erotic’ is accompanied by the addition of the $b\flat$, I argue that Othering, as in Western connotations of the $b\flat$, has been adopted in Bollywood by way of Arabian and flamenco pastiche.

The ‘Bad boy’

Since the 1960s there has been a ‘masculinising’ of the Bollywood film, with more use of action music, foreign dance and dramatic pop music. The character of the ‘bad boy’ was developed in the heyday of actor Amitabh Bachchan with his 1975 seminal film Sholay. The ‘bad boy’ hero is often seen as an innocent victim involved in the melodrama, who at the end of the film displays his moral
value, his ‘pure’ heart revealed (Creekmur 2001, 377).

Criminal exploits of the ‘bad boy’ are often, as in Hollywood, accompanied by flamenco-like music dating back to the spaghetti western. Karlin and Wright comment on the music of genre films: ‘if you watch a Western or action film, you know something about the film before you see it.... Familiar styles of music can be a successful point of departure for comedy’ (Karlin and Wright 1990, 179–181). The cowboy has become a popular role model of freedom in both America and India. The conventions in the spaghetti western of parody and self-parody can present amoral ‘brutal violence, heroic action adventure and an aura of modern myth’ (Cooke 2008, 180, 371). The changeable associations of flamenco music, with both light and threatening connotations, affords it a special role also in giving an ironic touch to films that have an ambiguous message around crime. The guitar riff from tonic to $\flat^2$, to $\flat^3$ and back again is a classic flamenco signifier.

I will discuss two films that exploit flamenco, and the $\flat^2$, for the ‘bad boy’ criminal. Firstly, the 2005 film Bunty Aur Bubli is about two ‘lovable crooks’: flamenco is introduced into the underscore when a criminal deal is being made, but a light touch is maintained throughout with the flamenco guitar riff (Figure 5.30). The Indian individual’s desire for wish fulfilment is played out here, with this suggestion of flamenco adding to the comic and forgiving view on their criminality: there is no death in a gun battle as in Bonnie and Clyde. Secondly, the 2010 film Dabangg, with music composed by the duo Sajid-Wajid, describes itself as ‘dark’ comedy pulp crime fiction about police corruption. Again there is an ambiguous view on this corruption due to the comic elements: the title credits have banners reading ‘corrupt and loveable’. This positive profile of the ‘bad boy’ hero prevails despite summary executions that the police officer conducts on screen, with an underlying message that this ‘job needs doing’. Playback singer Khan told me ‘everyone knows that the police are corrupt, this is just a comedy’ (interview 2011). The flamenco guitar style supports the message that this police officer is like a cowboy in a spaghetti western (reminiscent of the ‘hero’ of The Hurt Locker).
Amoral violence is played out in the title theme supported by persistent use of the $b\text{\textnormal{2}}$ in an extended flamenco pastiche (Figure 5.31). The final extended oscillating motif between $\hat{1}$ and $b\text{\textnormal{2}}$ is clearly playing on a flamenco motif, with strong associations of tension, aggression and threat, yet all the while the ironic, over-the-top, nature of the narrative is maintained.

From the analysis of these individual songs and underscores, what has become clear is that signification of the $b\text{\textnormal{2}}$ in Bollywood music is more diverse than in Hollywood. The principal significations are: meanings inherited from individual ragas, such as poignancy of separation, seriousness, hope and grief; images of the ‘wayward’ or ‘bad boy’; and, increasingly, connotations of a modern rock-influenced Indian identity where the $b\text{\textnormal{2}}$ is recognised as something distinctive to the Indipop genre. Sinister associations of the $b\text{\textnormal{2}}$ are generally limited to its use in Western-style orchestration.
Conclusion

In this chapter I have explored general differences in connotations of the ♭2 between the American and Indian film industries. The ♭2 is used extensively in both Hollywood and Bollywood to codify ‘exotic’, through Arabian or flamenco motifs, or ‘wayward’, through the *Jaws* oscillation. The interface of heavy metal and the ‘East’ within Hollywood war films is extensive, often connoting ‘East’ and ‘beast’. Indeed within Hollywood the associations of the ♭2, so little used in standard Western music, are so strong and specific as to make a highly affective film signifier that is extensively and deliberately used. In Bollywood the connotations of threat and the exotic tend to be less sinister and ‘lighter’, as there is not a strong connection between the Other and the ♭2. Bollywood uses this note more, and for a larger range of signification, reflecting traditional connotations in Indian classical music. I argue that in a modern setting, the ♭2 in film song conveys an ideological statement about progress and identity.

There are comparable connotations of pathos, the exotic, and empowerment. Each of these has a particular and very specific ideological focus in the different film industries: these two industries of populist cinema use the ♭2 to support images ranging from hope to ‘terrorism’. For Hollywood the use of the ♭2 in a threatening manner exploits connotations that, I argue, are new to a Western framework and support a contemporary ‘bad boy’ view of the American way of life. In Bollywood the ♭2 may also signify the ‘bad boy’, yet an underlying acceptance of the ♭2 as a standard feature in Indian music, allows for a greater range of emotional and dramatic signification. The absence of a clear Other connotation for the ♭2 within Indian culture also prevents some of the more negative Hollywood connotations taking hold in Bollywood.

The study of film music reveals the assumed meanings within a culture as expressed through musical elements. The combination of image and music clarifies the sedimented meanings set out in the previous chapters and illustrates ideological changes over time, including highlighting new significations of the ♭2.
Conclusion

This cross-cultural cross-genre comparative study has highlighted some of the significance of a musical element, the ♭₂, to general musical theory. I have argued that additional knowledge of the musical function and representation of the ♭₂ contributes to discourse in the fields of ethno(musicology), psychology of music, film and popular music studies.

In drawing the threads of these chapters together, I am cautious of making any direct comparisons between the use and meaning of the ♭₂ in different musical cultures. Even when there are clear historical ties, as between Western classical and heavy metal music, the contemporary usage may be little connected. I do not intend to draw conclusions where none can be drawn; the fundamentally different ideologies of, for instance, Indian classical and Western popular music prevent easy comparison. The intricate, and elusive, possible commonalities and differences between the interpretations of the musical expressions presented here are, to a large extent, what makes the subject seem to me so interesting and important.

This research set out to address the following questions: Does the ♭₂ play a significant function in tonal musical cultures? Are there significant differences in connotation of the ♭₂ in different cultures? Are there common metaphorical associations attributed to the ♭₂ across cultures? Are the occurrences in different traditions comparable, i.e. is there one or are there many ♭₂s? What do the differences tell us about culture and ideologies? Do these differences affect cross-cultural communication? How is composition and performance affected by these differences?

I will begin by highlighting the key points made so far in relation to these questions, under the areas of: cadential function; emotional and narrative connotations, including commonalities and differences in metaphors across cultures; ideologies behind different interpretations; similarity and difference revisited; and expanded significations for the ♭₂. I will then detail what I believe to be this study’s contribution to learning, the limitations of the thesis and ideas for future directions.
The $b\sharp 2$ plays a significant cadential role in tonal musical cultures

Both North Indian classical music and genres ‘touched by the maq[a]m’ use the $b\sharp 2$ widely as an intrinsic part of cadential structures. Although the $b\sharp 2$ is significantly less frequently encountered in Western music, it carries a particular cadential function, leading to a dominant chord, when it does occur. I also argue that new structural uses are found in contemporary metal, popular and film musics.

The most obvious finding to emerge from this study is that the $b\sharp 2$, a semitone above the tonic, has the same characteristic of high tension in relation to the tonic as the major $\flat 7$ leading note, a semitone below it. This is why I call it The Other Leading Note.

I have found the $b\sharp 2$ to be used functionally as a leading note in two ways. Firstly, the dissonance of the $b\sharp 2$ is frequently used in the approach to or departure from the tonic, for instance in the melodic cadences of Indian raga, where relation to the tonic is always central. The falling Phrygian tetrachord is also a ubiquitous melodic cadence in maqamat/makamlar that contain the flat $\hat{2}$. Further to this, the lowering to the $b\sharp 2$ on descent is considered to intensify the cadence in a wide range of genres discussed here. Secondly, the $b\sharp 2–\hat{1}$ resolution sometimes appears in a harmony line rather than a melody. For instance the $b\sharp 2$ is a vital part of vernacular harmonic chord sequences, within a ‘dominant’ chord leading to the tonic.\[105\]

The specific cadential progressions of $b\text{vii}–\text{I(i)}$ and $b\text{II}–\text{I(i)}$ appear widely in Greek, Macedonian, klezmer, and Spanish genres, as well as in metal, Bollywood film tunes and soundtracks. These sequences, in some sense, signify the genres: for example this is what Manuel’s term ‘Mediterranean tonality’ refers to.

The Phrygian mode and the $b\sharp 2$ became problematic within Western common practice, and in chapter three I argued that there were a complex of reasons for this. The role of the $b\sharp 2$ as a leading note was more or less dropped in Western music, yet I describe how the $b\sharp 2$ developed a significant functional role in the Neapolitan cadence, where it acts as part of a sub-dominant chord. More recently,

\[105\] The ‘dominant’ chord is defined here as the chord containing most tension in relation to the tonic chord.
with the introduction of the ♭2 as an exotic signifier, there are Western compositions that re-introduce the ♭2 as a leading note, with vernacular harmony known from Ottoman and Arabian influenced urban musics.

We have seen within heavy metal the ♭2 as a compelling element of bass riffs, and the chord progressions of ♭vii–I(i) and ♭II–I(i) both appear widely in metal. The rarity of the ♭2 as a functional note elsewhere in Western music highlights its use in metal as particularly remarkable. I have also illustrated other post-metal uses of the ♭2 as a leading note in popular and film musics in the late twentieth and early twenty-first century.

I find that there is a functional importance to the ♭2 in a tonal context as a ‘dissonance’ with a ‘yearning’ to resolve. Yet this importance has been overlooked in Western musical theory, as it has in cognitive psychological writing. This neglect is perhaps due to the relative absence of the ♭2 in Western classical music, which may also account for many connotations attributed to the note of uncertainty, surprise, edginess and instability within the West, as the ♭2 has greater effect in genres where it is rarely used. The ‘lower than normal’ ♭2 may trigger negative ‘falling’ metaphors. An expanded theoretical awareness of, for instance, Mediterranean tonality embraces the use of The Other Leading Note and extends our knowledge of cadential practice.

**The ♭2 is frequently ascribed emotional or narrative connotations**

I have shown in individual chapters that the ♭2 is often ascribed emotional and or narrative connotations in various traditions. From this exploration across cultures I conclude that the ♭2 is deeply connected to feelings and ideas. This note brings up considerable connotations, emotional and narrative, in all the genres discussed here.

This study has shown that within the genres researched here there is significant variation in nuanced associations related to the ♭2 and the ♭2–1 gesture. These include contrary interpretations: ‘delight’ or ‘spiritual bliss’, contrasting with ‘relaxation’ or ‘seriousness’, and even more so with ‘power’, ‘yearning’, ‘pathos’ and ‘grief’. I found that there can be a further complexity of emotional connotation in late twentieth- and early twenty-first-century occurrences of the ♭2.
and the $b^\flat_2$--$h$ gesture, where different emotional and narrative connotations combine.

The most intricate picture emerged within Indian classical music, where each raga is likened to a human personality, and, when the $b^\flat_2$ is present, it represents an aspect of this personality. These ‘human’ aspects have nuances that vary in different performances and for each performer. The emotional and spiritual connections are so nuanced that each musical performance produces its own vivid interpretations. To highlight one note here can be seen to ‘brutalise’ the interpretation (Roy interview 2011). However, I also found genre-wide associations in Indian classical music, such as the $b^\flat_2$ being part of the representation of twilight.

Within Mediterranean genres it is important to reiterate that in many occurrences of the $b^\flat_2$ it can be described as ‘just there’, one note of the mode (Baylav interview 2009). A number of performers I interviewed were wary of ascribing emotion specifically to the $b^\flat_2$. Conversely, the $b^\flat_2$ may be claimed as a passionate self-identity marker, as when Ključo told me that the $b^\flat_2$ ‘gives emotion’ (interview 2011), displaying a pride in the ‘emotional’ over the ‘rational’ in Balkan music. There are also specific associations, such as links of maqam/makam containing the $b^\flat_2$ to lullabies, or the call to prayer.

As chapter three has shown, within Western theory and practice the $b^\flat_2$ has a particularly strong connotative potential, representing the Other and/or the foreign. This connotation is largely a result of its relative absence in Western music, with unfamiliarity enhancing any other emotional associations.

The $b^\flat_2$ can be regarded as one contributing factor to an emotional state within the traditions discussed. In a similar way to the more common discussions regarding the emotional connotations of major and minor modes, the $b^\flat_2$ neither determines a mood, nor is necessary for it. Other cultural associations also play a part. I therefore argue that although these genres can be seen to employ a connection between the $b^\flat_2$ and emotion, they have to be discussed separately because of the ideologies surrounding them.
There are common metaphors for the $\flat 2$ across these traditions

I have found that some interpretations of the $\flat 2$ result from similar metaphorical associations across cultures. The arch contour, typically appearing as much in music from the Indian and Ottoman repertoires as within Western classical music, has the standard resolution from tension to release on the low tonic at the final cadence. There is a contention, supported by my interviewees Baylav and Wright, that this ‘narrative’ is somehow ‘natural’, that to fall step-wise down to the stillness of the tonic is a ‘natural’ cadence (Huron 2006, 88, 154; Schenker 1979, 13).

Metaphors are embedded in the use of the $\flat 2$ with its ‘expectancy’ to fall to $\hat{1}$ and the narrowness of the interval from the $\flat 2$ to the tonic, such as rising with energy and descending with relaxation. There are three areas of metaphor crucial to this discussion: narrowness as restriction; attraction as restlessness; and falling as sad. I shall summarise these in turn.

Firstly, narrow intervals are often perceived as creating tension and the semitone interval gets connoted as ‘dissonant’, although it is argued that the sense of dissonance is mostly cultural. I have found that ‘dissonant’ intervals, including that between $\hat{1}$ and $\flat 2$, are considered complexity and intense, appropriate for the representation of particular moods in Indian classical music, Mediterranean traditional musics, metal and other Western genres, with common associations of pathos and melancholia, as well as more nuanced and varied expressions of close dissonance, including intensity, beauty and depth.

Secondly, as a leading note, the $\flat 2$ is associated with metaphors of intense ‘attraction’, of restless ‘pulling’ towards or ‘yearning’ for the tonic. This use is illustrated in all the areas discussed here, with ‘yearning’ being a common descriptor. In Indian classical music yearning ‘up’ from the rising $\hat{7}$ leading note and ‘down’ from the $\flat 2$ are considered equal. The high prevalence of the $\flat II$ as a dominant chord, and the $\flat 2$ in cadential motifs within non-Western, and, to and extent, Western musics such as heavy metal, illustrates its importance in this leading note role. This attraction is heightened by the practice of lowering the $\hat{2}$ on descent, particularly in the Mediterranean traditions, increasing the tension and intensifying the cadence.
Thirdly, I found that pitch is perceived as rising and falling, and is associated with emotions that also ‘rise’ and ‘fall’ in all the genres discussed. So descent in music maps onto metaphors of falling, which, in turn, may be mapped onto, for instance, a melancholic state (Zbikowski 2002, 66). Metaphors abound of pitch falling, many of a negative nature, due to the association with the body falling: depression, sadness, low status, depravity, pathos, grief and death amongst them. As the overwhelming ‘tendency’ for the♭₂ is to fall to the tonic, any metaphor of falling may become embedded within it: lower energy, gravity, calming, relaxation appear in all the genres discussed above. The rising semitone ⁷–₁, on the other hand, may be associated with rising metaphors: active, assertive, hopeful, aspiring.

**There are different cultural interpretations of the same metaphors**

Alongside these commonalities I have also found substantially different interpretations of the same three areas of metaphor: narrowness, attraction and verticality.

The narrow semitone interval is sometimes interpreted as ‘calm’, ‘beautiful’ or ‘spiritual’. Indeed the ‘complex’ and ‘restless’ associations of dissonance may heighten any emotion. Within Indian classical music the use of the ‘dissonant’♭₂ in ragas of the twilight period is connected with change and prayer, the ‘soft’ notes perceived as appropriate to the ‘sensitive’ time of dusk (Parikh interview 2011). In Ottoman-influenced Mediterranean music small pitch movement may also be associated with prayer, or lullabies. In the ‘West’ associations are often made between semitone movement and the ‘sinister’ or ‘ominous’, as in the *Jaws* motif, and this is extended in the passionately transgressive connotations of the ₁–♭₂–₁ gesture within metal.

The strength of attraction from♭₂ to ₁ is variously described as ‘powerful’, ‘tormented’, ‘relaxing’ and ‘ecstatic’, as well as ‘yearning’, within these different genres. I discussed how expectation affects the ‘yearning vector’, arguing that the♭₂ is stronger in its attraction to the tonic in a Western context than is the ⁷, because of its unfamiliarity. In particular, the presence of the♭₂ within non-Western music can also produce a ‘this music is sad’ reaction from Westerners that would not be present for cultural insiders.
‘Falling’ has a multitude of negative associations: I have found that the falling ♭2–♭1 cadence has, over hundreds of years, held overwhelmingly negative connotations in Western music, representing ‘anguish’ or ‘lament’ as well as ‘yielding’, ‘passivity’ and ‘despair’. I argue that these conventions have made the ♭2–♭1 problematic as a mainstream cadence in the ‘West’ due to the heavy emotional baggage that the gesture carries in this context. Yet there are also a significant number of positive metaphors attached to the falling ♭2–♭1 cadence. In non-Western musical cultures, the ♭2 is often free from negative connotations. Although the associations of ‘sadness’ are strong in all these genres, I found many other interpretations of ‘falling’, including ‘relaxation’, ‘grounding’, ‘calming’ and ‘coming down to earth’. Shrivastav and Khan both related that ‘God is down’ (interviews 2008). Alhenawi spoke of a metaphor of ‘life is up, death is down’, speaking of this in a neutral manner, not a negative one (interview 2011). Downward musical movement was related to connotations of ‘loving’ and soothing (Roy interview 2011). This chimes with Huron’s comment that ‘descending pitch glides are associated with calm’ (2006, 326).

The sense of the ♭2 being ‘lower than normal’ also brings associations with metaphors of falling in all the genres discussed here, and, again, these associations are not always of ‘sadness’. I particularly found that the convention of raising notes on ascent and lowering them on descent, in several genres, brings connotations of both ‘sadness’ and ‘sensitivity’: For instance, Alhenawi attributed a sensitivity to the amount of ‘flatness’ of a pitch (interview 2011), and in Indian classical music the flat notes are described as ‘soft’ and ‘sensitive’, and appropriate for the representation of serious or nuanced emotions.

Every culture will create its own network of metaphors and specific interpretations. For instance, central to the theory of Indian raga is the concept that each raga is a person, with a spectrum of human characteristics that the performer will display and perhaps identify with. Our expectations are based on our own cultural background, and metaphors are frequently tied to belief systems and assumptions of knowledge. What musicians in different cultures make of metaphors is important. Each culture’s or genre’s network of interpretations may
be ‘obvious’ and ‘natural’ to insiders, yet alien to outsiders. Growing up in a culture means imbibing the sedimented meanings of that culture.

The complexities of metaphorical interpretations given to the falling ♭2–♭1 cadence may confound easy musical communication. Also, I found attributions of ‘sadness’ and ‘melancholia’ to mean different things in different cultures. Two examples are, firstly, Khan saying that the ♭2 was always sad, which meant to him that it was ‘close to God, a beautiful sensation’ (interview 2008), and, secondly, Ključo describing the ‘melancholia’ that she ascribed to the presence of the ♭2 in Bosnian sevda as ‘loving’ and ‘deep’ (interview 2011).

The metaphors associated with the ♭2 are various and sometimes incongruent with each other. For instance, positive metaphors of the falling semitone ♭2–♭1 motif of ‘relaxed is down’ and ‘grounding is down’ may be contradicted by negative metaphors of ‘narrowness’ as ‘confined’, ‘sad’ and ‘weak’. Such contradictions between metaphors of verticality and narrowness confound easy binary thinking. Breaking down the binary oppositions and allowing greater variance and subtlety into the theories frees the ♭2–♭1 from the shackles of purely negative imagery.

The misunderstandings that can emerge are important here, where metaphors may be misplaced onto ‘foreign’ music. Concepts of dissonance and ‘yearning’ for resolution need not be uncomfortable sensations, musically or ideologically. Full of expectation and dissonance and commanding a falling contour, the multitude of culturally defined perceptions of the ♭2 make it a vital note for musical expression. However, the ♭2 has been largely ignored in its structural and expressive role.

Is the variation of ♭2 presence in different ragas and maqamat/makamlar picked up by listeners in local cultures and/or Western cultures? Is the present day use of the ♭2 within heavy metal music and thriller/war film received in a different manner by non-Western listeners?

So, as well as metaphorical associations attributed to the ♭2 in common across these cultures, there are some unique connotations that only occur within specific areas considered here. In particular there are common connotations of ‘pathos’,
‘sadness’, ‘yearning’ and specific local connotations of, amongst others, ‘sensitivity’, ‘relaxation’ and the ‘diabolic’. Thus, interpretations of the same metaphors are dependent on context, manner of performance, and tradition. The complexities, ambiguities and contradictions in metaphors attached to the ♭2 bring new insights that contribute to both ethnomusicological and psychological debate.

Cross-cultural misunderstandings can easily result from the misreading of musical gestures. Music is not a universal language. Mari Reiss Jones and Susan Holleran write:

The problem of multiple meanings or interpretations is clearly a fundamental one in any attempt to understand the communicative act. Communication, virtually by definition, assumes a low level of uncertainty with respect to some shared idea of speaker and listener or, in the case of music, of performer/composer and listener. Multiple analyses of the musical structure of a given piece are possible, and this fact has important implications both for formal theories of musical grammar and for psychological approaches that strive to explain aspects of the acts of perceiving, representation, and expressive performance. (Jones and Holleran 1992, 4)

Lakoff and Johnson state that ‘how we think metaphorically matters. It can determine questions of war and peace’ (Lakoff and Johnson 1980, 243). Musical communication is ripe for miscommunication and, as described above, the ♭2 is manipulated to represent the East as sinister or as an exotic Other. **Cultural ideologies are revealed through the use of the ♭2**

I define cultural ideologies as sets of ideas or concepts of different cultures, subcultures or ethnic groups. These worldviews may be ‘audible’ within different musical codes. The ♭2 carries its sedimented meanings within each musical genre, and works with other elements in the music to evince aspects of the ideologies of those traditions.

The ‘natural’, ‘normal’ and self-evident assumptions within any culture have strong implications for cross-cultural communication if left unquestioned. Responses to this study from my interviewees have included remarks such as: this is naïve; you are wasting your time on trivia; and this is obvious. One implication to these remarks is that we know what the ♭2 signifies, so what more is there to say? Within a given culture’s widespread beliefs and attitudes the ‘common
sense’ understandings of the \(b^2\) prevail. However, the ideological forces that operate through the coding of the \(b^2\) may be left undeciphered. Codes are not ideologically neutral; in order to ‘understand’ a piece of music we are to some extent following the ideologies that create it.

Differences in ideology may invoke variant, even opposing interpretations. For instance, the metaphor of ‘down is bad’ may be assumed to be a given. However the discussion on Indian art music demonstrates a different belief system where ‘down’ may be very positive, an approach to death and rebirth or unity with God. Likewise in Mediterranean music the descent through the 4–(\(\flat\)3–\(\flat\)2–1) tetrachord is generally positive and ‘grounding’. The opening up to the possibility of ‘down is good sometimes’ challenges commonplace metaphors and makes way for other concepts, including contradictory metaphors that demand a more nuanced understanding.

This research has shown that some of the interpretations for the \(b^2\) are so different to each other that they open up a space where misunderstandings can arise, or limitations in meaning be imposed. Some misunderstandings inevitably happen as the particular cultural history of the listener brings a host of preconceptions to the sounds. As with any music this determines how the listener interprets the music, in effect the listener becoming the composer. For instance, the coincidence of the \(b^2\) being both a ‘lament’ signifier and an ‘Oriental’ signifier in the West reinforces negative attitudes towards the ‘Oriental’. The use of the \(b^2\) marks a piece of music, or section of music, as different, thus exacerbating the tendency to Other within whatever context it appears.

In the West, the historical Othering of the \(b^2\) became a part of the narratives of colonialism and imperialism in Western classical music. The \(b^2\), when it appeared, was a passing element to be conquered or managed. Appearing in films that advocate the conquering of alien forces in the name of national security, the \(b^2\) is a subtle and useful tool.

Within propaganda in modern war films, the East and ‘beast’ settings of the \(b^2\), using it as part of modern ‘fight music’ and as an Oriental signifier, imply ideologies of ‘might is right’ over the enemy from the ‘East’. Messages around
the essentialising of a Middle Eastern threat are conveyed. The meeting of $b_2$ as dysphoric and $b_2$ as an Oriental trope is subtle and effective, more ‘unheard’ than the more clichéd Oriental signifier, the augmented second interval.

In Hollywood, the Arab has long been a ‘baddie’, and the $b_2$ can represent this to the Western audience through its sedimented meanings. Al-Taee writes of how, in the post-9/11 world, Orientalist works continually ‘fuel tensions between East and West... aimed at exercising power and hegemony over the Orient’ (Al-Taee, 2010, xv). Hollywood war films often represent an ideology of the American being enlightened and a saviour of the world, battling backward, corrupt and unenlightened nations overseas. Soundtracks, the ‘unheard’ element in a film, are particularly useful for articulating covert ideologies, communicating stereotypes through the soundtrack that might not be possible explicitly in story or character. The use of the $b_2$ in soundtracks might thus reinforce racist and xenophobic ideologies without the listener’s conscious awareness.

Ideological standpoints that have a more complex and differentiated view of world cultures allow for the myriad different connotations of the $b_2$ to flourish. This is exemplified by composers of music from within ‘hybrid’ contexts, such as in Bollywood. In Bollywood there may be various connotations of the $b_2$ from Indian classical and folk music, combined with those of Latin, Arabic and Western music. These, together, portray aspects of Indian nationalist ideologies that regard modernity and Indian identity as crucial in a glocalised culture. Bollywood can be firmly Indian while partaking in modern consumer capitalism. Within this context, the $b_2$ may be connoted as Indian, as modern, as ‘evil’, as ‘exotic’, or as many other things.

Another tradition that has a complex relation to identity is the metal genre. Metal’s ideology of ‘machismo’ is portrayed in its use of relentless ostinato bass lines, with the $b_2$ representing dissonance interpreted as aggressive and challenging. The $b_2$–$\hat{1}$ gesture, with the metaphor of ‘down is bad’ inherited from Western classical music, reinforces associations of ‘descent to hell’, fitting with Satanistic ideologies (or the threat of them) within some strands of metal. Metal ideologies generally dwell on the ‘negative’ in order to be honest about the world,
and the pull downward in the falling $\flat 2-\hat{1}$ cadence becomes powerful and transgressive.

These powerful connotations are reinterpreted in the use of the $\flat 2$ for ‘build-up’ music for sport, again in rhythmic ostinatos, where the $\flat 2-\hat{1}$ gesture may become connotated as ‘down is earthing’ and deeply powerful. These interpretations might support the sports ideology that believes strength in sport benefits society through its ‘character-building’ qualities.

There are deep nationalist attachments to the falling tetrachord $4-(\flat 3-\flat 2-\hat{1})$ in many different musical genres in the Mediterranean area. The $\flat 2$ may epitomise what is ‘special’ in these cultures, through the knowledge of it not being present in Western scales. Self-conscious concepts of sad or hard lives are expressed with the $\flat 2$ in relation to the identity of Balkan, Gypsy, Jewish, Kurdish, and Palestinian people. Nations in strife, poverty or dislocation convey ‘noble suffering’ through the ‘melancholic’, and this can become a complex and romantic standpoint. The metaphorical fall of the $\flat 2-\hat{1}$ gesture epitomises ‘falling to destiny’, and the ‘tension’ of the $\flat 2$ itself, with its connotations of sensitivity, depth and passion, may represent a romantic view of the ‘East’, as opposed to an unfeeling, cold and rational ‘West’ with its major scale. These interpretations are partly an adoption of Western stereotypes of the ‘spiritual East’ versus a rational West, but also, within the music of genres and countries where the $\flat 2$ is familiar, these nuances of connotation have long existed.

Overall I have found four main ideological tendencies revealed by the use of the $\flat 2$. Firstly, universal statements such as ‘down in pitch is negative’ are affected by Western concepts of ‘fall’, which may not be shared by other cultures, as with the positive view in Indian belief of death and reincarnation being ‘down’ as opposed to the Christian belief system where down is to hell and up is to heaven. There are also associations within Western ideologies dating back to colonial adventures of ‘upward’ striving and achievement mapped onto rising pitch. In addition, in genres influenced by the Ottoman and Arabian musical traditions the falling cadence is considered a standard phrase ending, often with no value judgment.
Secondly, metaphors of narrowness in the use of the $\flat \tilde{2}$ reveal cultural differences. The perceived ‘dissonance’ of the semitone interval may not be taken as uncomfortable in some cultures; rather it may indicate depth and sensitivity, or a healthy yearning for change.

Thirdly, nationalistic or conservative ideologies are displayed through the use of the $\flat \tilde{2}$ in Bollywood film tunes. A possibly similar nationalistic trait involving the $\flat \tilde{2}$ is illustrated in Balkan music where it connotes a romantic attachment of ‘emotion’.

Fourthly there can be associations of value, of good and bad, whether this is ‘East is good, West is bad’ or the other way round.

Taken together, these four areas, which are imbricated with one another, are evidence that the study of metaphorical interpretation of the $\flat \tilde{2}$ in different cultures reveals possibilities of going beyond binary oppositions in orientational metaphor. The connotations may not easily slip into oppositions, and may instead reveal concurrent, apparently conflicting metaphors.

**Similarity and difference revisited**

The knowledge of the $\flat \tilde{2}$ as being specifically present in the music of some countries, particularly the Mediterranean, has contributed to the $\flat \tilde{2}$ being an Oriental signifier. I have argued that in the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries the Other of the *pianto* trope met the Other of the Spanish or ‘exotic’ trope, reinforcing the irrational, feminised, dystopic connotations of each. The coincidence of these two signifiers contributes to the concept that music containing the $\flat \tilde{2}$ is indicative of Other cultures that also then become somehow irrational and ‘dark’ in comparison with Western music and culture. Connotations abound in the awareness of this note being an Other signifier, indicating subversion, irrationality or non-Western/non-mainstream identity, claimed as a passionate self-identity marker in Mediterranean and Arabian musics and an emblem of metal.

The Othering within Western music obviously has repercussions on the perception by Westerners of music from non-Western countries that contains the $\flat \tilde{2}$. Heard solely as an Oriental motif the musical understanding of non-Western
music is diminished. Associations of femininity, passivity and anguish are embedded in the coding for the Western listener of this ‘exotic’ music. The high presence of negative metaphors for falling in the ‘West’, together with the high prevalence of the ♭2 gesture in the ‘East’ may contribute to the sustaining of stereotypes of the East as ‘weak’, ‘backward’ and ‘melancholy’.

The highlighting of the ♭2 in Mediterranean and North Indian music may sustain stereotypes of ‘East’ and ‘West’. Matthew Head contends that there remains a fine line between the mere acknowledgement of music as exotic and Orientalist perception: ‘The distinction between Orientalist representation and a multicultural fusion of idioms cannot be made purely on the basis of the text and its formal properties’ (Head 2003, 212). World music is framed for the enjoyment of the Other, presenting music as exotic, spiritual and deep, with marketing reasons to exploit differences: ‘Capitalism absorbs and works through difference, resulting in multiple capitalisms and multiple modernities’ (Connell and Gibson 2003, 192). A non-Western artist may become established in the ‘West’ by the special qualities of their local music. The ♭2 is a significant element in world music as an ‘exotic’ signifier and may convey a clear difference to be exploited. Non-Western musicians, in exploiting Orientalist perceptions, perhaps risk remaining ever as Other. I ask whether the non-Western artist needs to abandon self-exoticisation in order to attempt to become an equal participant on the musical stage. Or is the hegemony of Western music simply such that there can be no equal place for Oriental music?

Conversely, can Western music ever code the ♭2 as an expression of delight or relaxation, as it may be coded in, for instance, Indian raga? The ♭2 plays a significant role as an Other to the Western listener. Re-habilitating it into a mainstream position would leave a vacancy for another motif to express the Other. History shows that Other musical elements can be assimilated into the norm. The assimilation of the ♭2 into mainstream compositions in the ‘West’ would require it to cease to be an ‘exotic intrusion’, as John Mackenzie writes, while broadening the compositional palette (MacKenzie 1995, 142). This would require a creative breakdown of binaristic categories.
Issues of self-identity are highlighted in the use of the ♭₂. Examples of contemporary use of the ♭₂ in Mediterranean, heavy metal and film musics, created in awareness of its signification of Otherness, emphasise complexities around the difference between ‘us’ and ‘them’.

**New significations and transformed meanings for the ♭₂**

In the late twentieth century and twenty-first century, I argue that the ♭₂ has been used in innovative ways with new fusions, transformations and complexities of meaning in the manner of glocalisation and ‘strategic inauthenticity’ where ‘popular music had become an avenue for diverse musical diffusions and post-colonial expressions’ (Connell and Gibson 2003, 154, 154–5). I identify four ways that these transformed and new meanings for the ♭₂ manifest themselves.

Firstly, the old connotation of the ♭₂ as ‘anguished’ Other used in films has been transformed to mean ‘ominous’ and ‘threatening’. This is especially perceptible in the ‘shark’ theme in the film *Jaws*. As an ‘unheard’ underscore in many other films, the presence of the ♭₂ provides a subtext to a multitude of thriller films of ‘darkness’, ‘death’ or a general threat.

Secondly, the new signification of ‘ominous’ and ‘threatening’, rather than existing in a negative form, becomes positive within heavy metal music. The ♭₂ may still signify the ‘ominous’, yet within a transgressive context the negative connotations of the ♭₂ are redefined for subversive purposes, to represent ‘doom’ and ‘hell’ in positive discourse. The pull downward of the falling ♭₂–♭₁ cadence becomes powerful and positive. The ♭₂ has been appropriated and transformed to connote aggressive power and masculinity in metal, becoming a metal signifier that embraces an individualistic and anti-establishment ideology, a marker of dissidence.

Thirdly, the ‘Western’ view of the ♭₂ has been taken up by ‘Eastern’ composers and made their own. Cultural interchange fuzzes the borders of tradition, ideology, modernity and self-awareness. The Western ‘exotic’ signifier is complicated when the East becomes Self rather than Other (see chapters four and five), and significations of the ♭₂ are intertwined and confused. In this study I found combinations of the Oriental trope and the Other trope resulting in new
significations in both Bollywood music and in Oriental metal. Oriental metal exemplifies an elaborate configuration of Self and Other, threatened and threatening, combining the Western connotations of danger with the Oriental associations of the b♭2 creating a strong identity for Oriental Metal within the metal framework. Oriental metal, like all folk metal, incorporates local music into its sound. The b♭2 in Oriental Metal carries both the significations of the West and the b♭2 as an Oriental self-identity marker. This complex music is produced from a ‘hybrid condition’ (Frith 2000, 314).

Fourthly, the b♭2 provides something different in the rock environment that strengthens various connotations for modern youth. For example, within Bollywood music the use of the b♭2 adds an ‘edge’ to the ‘bad-boy’ image in rock tracks, the coincidence of the ‘Eastern’ and ‘hard rock’ significations again being utilised. Bollywood music re-interprets the b♭2 as a signifier of both nationhood and modernity. Finally, there is some evidence of the b♭2 signifying ‘build-up’ music for sports events in the West, new signification perhaps influenced by metal but without the subversive threat.

These new significations ‘reinhabit and reanimate’ (McClary 2004, 15) the b♭2, expanding and fermenting new meanings.

**Contributions and theoretical implications of this study**

In this study I have sought new insights by placing the b♭2 as a central focus across cultures. This is the first time that a cross-genre study has brought a comparative approach to the use of the b♭2 across this breadth of cultures, extending discussions initiated by Leante (2009), Manuel (1989), Novack (1977), Pillsbury (2006) and Cope (2010). By drawing together knowledge on the b♭2 from different cultures and disciplines, I have shown that The Other Leading Note is used in different yet comparable ways. The b♭2 is a distinctive pitch degree that often affects listeners subconsciously; I have tried to make this ‘hidden’, culturally specific, knowledge more explicit. I have drawn conclusions concerning four main aspects of the b♭2: cadential function, metaphor, ideology and new significations.
Firstly, through the exploration of the structural importance of the ♭2 and its cadential functions, I have been able to illuminate features in common between traditions. For example I show that The Other Leading Note is used for its perceived attraction to the tonic in melodic and/or harmonic cadences in all the genres studied here.

Secondly, I extend the debate on universalist views of the ♭2 in regard to the use of metaphors, such as that it is always ‘sad’, by bringing in a comparative element to debates around metaphor and dissonance within tonal systems. This study contributes fresh data that shows the commonality and variance of metaphorical interpretation across cultures. The data indicates that metaphorical concepts of falling pitch and narrow intervals cross cultural boundaries, yet different interpretations of these metaphors highlight different conceptual frameworks across genres.

Thirdly, I analyse what is ‘obvious’ about the ♭2 in different cultures, providing evidence that the ‘obvious’ may expose varying ideologies. In particular I show how Orientalism is embedded on a very concrete level in musical material by this very specific feature of the ♭2. Western associations of the ♭2 with anguish and the Oriental create an ‘East and beast’ hybrid widely used in late twentieth and early twenty-first-century film thriller soundtracks to convey the presence of the Oriental or Other. This furthers the insights of, for example, Stokes and Al-Taee concerning popular and film music (Stokes 2010; Al-Taee 2010).

Finally, I contribute to the musicological discipline the knowledge of new significations of the ♭2 resulting from the interface of genres and cultures. I have corroborated Pillsbury’s (2006, 101–28) and Cope’s (2010, 44) identification of the importance of the ♭2 in metal, and extended this to include cross-cultural insights involving Oriental metal and Bollywood film music. There is an additional significance in these genres of the meeting of connotations across genres, including those where the ♭2 may not be signified as a negative Other. These complexities of associations may contribute to the ♭2 supporting the representation of powerful, modern identities.
Limitations of the approach, and ideas for future directions

The main limitation of this thesis is the depth of insight within each culture. This study focuses on a wide range of cultures and genres, so that in-depth knowledge of all these different cultures was never an option. I felt drawn to cover as much as I did in order to achieve a worthwhile comparative picture, but it would take many lifetimes to do justice to the nuances of the subject in these areas. The conclusions that I draw here are designed to open a multitude of further research opportunities. For instance, in order to further establish the $b^2$ as a ‘device’ that crosses cultures, deeper ethnographic research in any one of these genres, collaborating with experts in the area, could bring greater awareness of the position that the $b^2$ has in local discourse. A number of possible future studies into the musical practices within, for instance, India and the Balkans, could provide more definitive evidence on the sedimented meanings of the $b^2$ for people growing up in the non-Western world.

A second limitation is that the interview element of this study has been realised through a mixture of convenient sampling and purposive sampling. The variable nature of this ethnography whilst giving significant insights into individual opinion, remains specific to certain people. A wider study in any of the cultures discussed here would go to corroborating or confounding my findings. Further cross-cultural interviews would also go further in answering questions such as that of what prejudices are involved in the hearing of the $b^2$. These are particularly important within any culture where the $b^2$ is not an Other, and will broaden the data from which universalist conclusions may be made or refuted.

Other future directions in related research include the following five possibilities. First, a question that recurs throughout this study, and remains unanswered, is the extent of the influence of Spain in the dissemination, and avoidance, of the $b^2$. A focused analysis of the literature on Arabo-Spanish cultural inheritance, including expert consultation and the study of archival transcriptions would make a valuable contribution to Islamic and European cultural studies.

Second, I have observed that there is a high prevalence of the $b^2$ in lullabies of the Mediterranean, perhaps connected to a specific aspect of inherited song
within this context. A future study would bring more knowledge of how the ♭2 is particularly maintained in connection with lullaby.

Third, the ♭2 as signifier of the ‘soft’ and ‘feminine’ has been touched on in this thesis: it is intermittently visible in metal and in the feminisation of the ‘East’. An exploration of the ♭2 in relation to gender may add to discourse on the archetypal Other: the feminine.

Fourth, the ‘unheard’ impact of the ♭2 as an Other signifier, especially in film as illustrated in this thesis, is crucial in contemporary film studies. Further research into film usage would inform our understanding of Orientalist and Othering devices that support ideological, and general, film content.

Finally, further to Orientalist discussions highlighted in the use of the ♭2, could there be a theoretical model for more possibilities of significance in Western music? These are, perhaps, intimated in the sports themes presented here. Is the West doomed to its inherited connotations of the Other in the ♭2, or can vernacular usage of the ♭2 in popular musics inform future composition, with more nuanced connotations? Hybrid and fusion compositions that use the ♭2, with their new significations, subtleties and complexities may herald further possibilities for expansions of connotations for the ♭2.

**Final conclusions**

I recognise that, as an English musician from Croydon, I put my Croydon ear to the ♭2. Aware of its use in the ‘East’ I create my own meanings as I listen with my own experience and prejudices. The music becomes ‘exotic’, ‘Oriental’, ‘sexy’ and ‘exciting’ (Hall 1991, 21). I also inherit the sedimented meanings of the ♭2 in the ‘West’: ‘anguish’, ‘illegitimacy’, ‘archaic’, and add these to my interpretations of ‘Eastern’ music with a ♭2. Rather than repelling me, these added connotations speak to the misfit in me and build on the sense of the music being ‘cool’, far from the familiar, the ultimate Other, the feeling experienced by everyone who doesn’t fit in, bringing pathos, bringing tears, but also bringing pleasure. For me, the ♭2 connotes ‘drive’, an awareness of being alive, thwarting gravity, longing, delicious anticipation, deferred gratification. I identify with the heavy metal followers’ concepts of the ♭2 falling to the tonic as ‘depression’,
descending to hell, but also with the power of the release of anger, the transgressive sound: dissonance at its greatest ‘shock and awe’.  

Stuart Hall writes of how our ‘identities are never completed, never finished’. He continues that the awareness of the

Other that belongs inside one…. [This notion] breaks down the boundaries, between outside and inside, between those who belong and those who do not…. [This] inscription of identity in the look of the other finds its articulation profoundly in the ranges of a given text’ (Hall 1991, 48).

Turkish musician Baylav said to me: ‘To you it’s exotic, to us it is just a note’ (interview 2008). McClary explained that it was inappropriate to hear the transgressive in the ♭2 within ‘Eastern’ music (interview 2011). Yet how can I ‘turn off’ the embedded sedimented meanings that I carry? How could I make an appropriate listening, without prejudice? Blacking asks: 

What is the epistemological status of a semiotic analysis by a single person?… There are many ways in which an outsider can listen usefully to strange music…. The analysis itself is part of the artistic process…. Every work has a multiplicity of interpretations. (Blacking 1981, 193)

My intention in this thesis is to engage with my own ‘local’ position as a player, interviewer and analyst, to gain awareness of my own prejudices. I argue that it is possible to listen and enjoy in an ethical way, accepting that it is not possible to know all the meanings given to a musical work by its creators, while hoping for—and indeed sometimes trusting the experience of—some artistic and cross-cultural understanding.

Contemporary Orientalism regards all these complexities of interactions and asymmetrical relations of power: ‘Orientalism becomes a more dynamic and complex concept that engages both [West and ‘Orient’] in a vigorous interplay instead of a simple opposition’ (Al-Taee 2010, 10). So the breaking down of a strict binarism may involve, as seen in metal, the embracing of the ♭2 as a marker of a step toward self-determination, or a rejection of Western rationalism.

On the other hand, the exploration of the unfamiliar may be able to create new spaces, arenas where humans may communicate to a greater extent:

[World music] has provided new means of expression and creation that show how the interaction between human beings, collaboration, and real

---

106 See Moore 2013.
knowledge of and respect for the Other lead to novelty and creation [with] undeniable aesthetic achievements. (Arom and Martin 2011, 398)

The exploration of use and connotations of the $\flat 2$ can clearly be part of this aesthetic adventure.

The $\flat 2$ carries particular yet varied connotations, ranging from sadness to ecstasy, and it is often distinctly ‘marked’ in its use. There may be common psychological and metaphorical factors behind the interpretations of the $\flat 2$ in different cultures, often understood in different ways, with varied meanings: the metaphor of ‘down’ might be common, but ‘down’ might have various connotations. Misinterpretation and miscommunication between musical cultures may result from sometimes ‘incomparable’ associations for the $\flat 2$. Cultural differences have also contributed to ‘edgy’, modern connotations of the $\flat 2$, while composers writing within cultures where the $\flat 2$ is ‘just a note’, may express an empowering self-identity through it.

This study has argued that the $\flat 2$ is The Other Leading Note, a structurally important element in tonal music, in both melodic and harmonic cadences, functioning as a leading note to the tonic. This is comparable to the rising $\hat{7}$ leading note. The ‘sameness’ of these two leading notes can, in Agawu’s words, give us a better view of difference.
References


Common Concerns, Cultural Differences, edited by D. Cooper and Dawe, 49–76. Lanham: Scarecrow Press.


Webster, James. 1979. ‘Schubert’s Sonata Form and Brahms’s First Maturity (II)’. 19th-Century Music 3 (1): 52–71.


Discography


Al Turath Ensemble. 2000. ‘Ya Mayilah’. La Musica De Al-Andalus [CD]. Almaviva: B0000064TL.


Brahms, ‘Scherzo’ Piano Quintet Op. 34. [accessed 23/09/2013].


Camarón de las Isla and Paco de Lucía. 1976. ‘Bulerias’. [accessed 18/01/2012].


Film and Radio


Marine Corps Recruit Training. 1966. ‘Your First 80 Days’.


Wimbledon Women’s final. 2013. BBC 1.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b036tc7k> [accessed 08/07/2013].

‘Your First 80 Days (1966) - Marine Corps Recruit Training’.
<www.youtube.com/watch?v=nSa96KakIZw> [accessed 04/03/2011].

## Glossary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adhan/Ezan</td>
<td>call to prayer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaap</td>
<td>exposition of a raga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asma karar</td>
<td>suspended cadence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aulos</td>
<td>oboe-like instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dha</td>
<td>flat 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diegetic</td>
<td>on screen sound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dromos/dromoi</td>
<td>the Greek modal system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duende</td>
<td>Andalusian ‘deep song’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fandango</td>
<td>Spanish dance tune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filmi râg</td>
<td>a raga adapted for film</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finalis</td>
<td>final note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Godhuli bela</td>
<td>‘cowdust time’, dusk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Güssü/ghammaz</td>
<td>dominant note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hijaz-type</td>
<td>any mode that has a first tetrachord of 1–flat2–3–4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indipop</td>
<td>an ‘Indian’ version of MTV-style pop.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karar</td>
<td>tonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karuna</td>
<td>pathos, tenderness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koma/comma</td>
<td>1/9 of a whole tone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Komal</td>
<td>flat/soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leitmotiv</td>
<td>motif associated with a specific character</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makam(lar)</td>
<td>the Turkish modal system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maqam(at)</td>
<td>the Arabian modal system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masala</td>
<td>mixed genre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miskeberakh</td>
<td>klezmer mode like major scale with ♭7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mogen Ovos</td>
<td>klezmer mode like Aeolian minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musica Ficta</td>
<td>practice of inserting sharps or flats in performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ney</td>
<td>end-blown flute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oud</td>
<td>Arabian lute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phrygian-type</td>
<td>any mode that has a first tetrachord of 1–flat2–flat3–4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pianto</td>
<td>‘weeping’ semitone fall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qawwali</td>
<td>Sufi devotional music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raag/râg</td>
<td>raga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re</td>
<td>flat 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebetiko(a)</td>
<td>Greek musical genre and its plural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rishabh/Rikabh</td>
<td>♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sa Re Ga Ma Pa Dha Ni</td>
<td>notes of Indian scale: 1 2 3 4 5 6 ♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samvadi (SV)</td>
<td>defining note in raga, supporting the vadi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saltanah</td>
<td>modal ecstasy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandhi prakash</td>
<td>twilight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sargam</td>
<td>Indian solfa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarod</td>
<td>lute-like instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sayr/seyrir</td>
<td>melodic motifs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sevda</td>
<td>Bosnian musical genre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shruti</td>
<td>microtones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shuddha</td>
<td>natural/pure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Svara</td>
<td>note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taan</td>
<td>an improvisation at a fast tempo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thaat</td>
<td>scale family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tivra</td>
<td>sharp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Touched by the maq[k]am</td>
<td>any culture or genre that has been under the influence of Arabian or Ottoman Empires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tumbi</td>
<td>a Punjabi plucked single-stringed instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qanun</td>
<td>zither</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vadi (V)</td>
<td>defining note in raga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yeden</td>
<td>leading note</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix 1: Interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Year(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alhenawi, Louai</td>
<td>Syrian</td>
<td><em>ney</em> player</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baylav, Cahit</td>
<td>Turkish, Syrian</td>
<td>classical violinist</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boikutt</td>
<td>Palestinian Sound Artist</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ramallah</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaos of Nazareth</td>
<td>Palestinian</td>
<td>metal band</td>
<td>Nazareth</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chernik, Maurice</td>
<td>British</td>
<td>klezmer clarinettist</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daffu, Jasminder</td>
<td>British, Pakistani</td>
<td><em>sarod</em> player</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Datta, Soumilk</td>
<td>British</td>
<td>metal bass player</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert, Pete</td>
<td>British</td>
<td>metal bass player</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ključo, Merima</td>
<td>Bosnian</td>
<td>accordionist</td>
<td>Amsterdam</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Knapp, Alexander</td>
<td>British, Scottish</td>
<td>research associate in Jewish music</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lachs, Vivi</td>
<td>British</td>
<td>Yiddish singer</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Leante, Laura</td>
<td>ethnomusicologist</td>
<td></td>
<td>Milton Keynes</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. McClary, Susan</td>
<td>musicologist</td>
<td></td>
<td>Los Angeles</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ozugurel, Hakan</td>
<td>Turkish</td>
<td>guitar player</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parikh, Arvind</td>
<td>sitar player and head of Indian Musicological Society</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mumbai</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prajapati, Suresh Kumar</td>
<td>flutist and teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td>Udaipur</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Roy, Subroto Mihir</td>
<td>musicologist, Indian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pune</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sassi-Sa’aron, Yossi</td>
<td>Israeli</td>
<td>guitarist</td>
<td>Tel Aviv</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shepherd, Merlin</td>
<td>British, American</td>
<td>klezmer clarinettist</td>
<td>Brighton</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shrivastav, Baluji</td>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>sitar player</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strauss, Deborah</td>
<td>American</td>
<td>klezmer violinist</td>
<td>Youlgreave</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turner, Reuben</td>
<td>British</td>
<td>cantor</td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Wright, Owen</td>
<td>ethnomusicologist</td>
<td></td>
<td>London</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2: Main ragas with komal Re\textsuperscript{107}

Raga Lalit (Marva thaat) (Bor 1999, 104).\textsuperscript{108}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{lalit.png}
\end{figure}

Raga Gunakri (pentatonic) (Khan interview 2012).

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{gunakri.png}
\end{figure}

Raga Bhairav (Bor 1999, 32).

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{bhairav.png}
\end{figure}

Raga Bhairavi (Khan interview 2008).

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{bhairavi.png}
\end{figure}

Raga Todi (Bor 1999, 120).

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{todi.png}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{107} Ragas compiled from “main ragas” lists by Daniélou, and “great” ragas listed by Martínez, favouring Martínez and not inclusive (Daniélou 1978; Bor 1999; Batish and Batish 1989).

\textsuperscript{108} SV indicates the samvadi, and V indicates the vadi, as specified by Batish and Batish 1989. Arrows indicate the directionality of the leading notes: notes less than a tone from drone notes (open note heads indicate drone notes).
Raga Gujari Todi (Bor 1999, 74).

Raga Komal Rishabh Asavari (Todi Thaat) (Bor, 1999, 24).

Raga Multani (Bor 1999, 122).

Raga Shri (Bor 1999, 146).

Basant (Purvi thaat) (Bor 1999, 30).

Raga Marva (Khan interview 2008).  

---

109 Information on drone notes from: <http://chandrakantha.com/raga_raag> [accessed 15/03/14].
Raga *Dhanashri (Purvi thaat).*\(^{110}\)

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
\text{Si} & \text{Re} & \text{Ga} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Dha} & \text{Ni} & \text{Re} & \text{Sa} & \text{Sa} & \text{Ni} & \text{Dha} & \text{Pa} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Ga} & \text{Re} & \text{Sa} \\
\end{array}
\]

Raga *Purvi* (Bor 1999, 136).

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
\text{Ni} & \text{Re} & \text{Ga} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Dha} & \text{Ni} & \text{Sa} & \text{Sa} & \text{Ni} & \text{Dha} & \text{Pa} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Ga} & \text{Ma} & \text{Re} & \text{Ga} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Ga} & \text{Re} & \text{Sa} \\
\end{array}
\]

Raga *Puriya* (Bor 1999, 130).

Other ragas with *Re* (Daniéllou 1978; Bor 1999; Batish and Batish 1989):

Raga *Sohini (Marva thaat)* (Bor 1999, 156).

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
\text{Ga} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Dha} & \text{Ni} & \text{Sa} & \text{Re} & \text{Sa} & \text{Sa} & \text{Ni} & \text{Dha} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Ga} & \text{Re} & \text{Sa} \\
\end{array}
\]

Raga *Bhatiyar (Marva thaat)* (Bor 1999, 38).

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
\text{Sa} & \text{Ma} & \text{Pa} & \text{Ga} & \text{Ma'} & \text{Dha} & \text{Sa} & \text{Re} & \text{Ni} & \text{Dha} & \text{Pa} & \text{Ma} & \text{Pa} & \text{Ga} & \text{Re} & \text{Sa} \\
\end{array}
\]

Raga *Gauri* (pentatonic raga) (Daffu interview 2012).

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
\text{Sa} & \text{Re} & \text{Ma} & \text{Pa} & \text{Ni} & \text{Sa} & \text{Sa} & \text{Ni} & \text{Pa} & \text{Ma} & \text{Re} & \text{Sa} \\
\end{array}
\]

---


Appendix 3: *Maqamat/makamlar* containing flat ₂

**Hijaz**

```
\begin{align*}
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\end{align*}
```

Also known as Ottoman *Hicaz makam*\(^{111}\); Greek *Hitzas*; Jewish *Freygish/Ahava Raba* mode; Phrygian Major/Dominant; Spanish scale.\(^{112}\)

**Hicaz/Freygish with triadic structure**

```
\begin{align*}
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\end{align*}
```

When harmonized with triads, the placement and number of leading notes change.

**Hijazkar**

```
\begin{align*}
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\end{align*}
```

Also known as Ottoman *Hicazkar makam*; Greek *Hitzaskar*; Byzantine scale; Gypsy scale

**Kurd**

```
\begin{align*}
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} & \quad \text{ɐ} \\
\end{align*}
```

Also known as Ottoman *Kürdi makam*; Greek *Kiourdi*; Jewish *Yishtabach* [descending] mode; Phrygian; Spanish scale.

\(^{111}\) Microtonal differences are not recorded here.

\(^{112}\) <http://www.maqamworld.com/maqamat/hijaz.html> [accessed 14/03/2014]. The intervals marked 1/2 or 3/4 indicate leading notes, and directionality to structural ‘pillar’ notes.
Bayati

Also known as Ushshak maqam; Ottoman Bayati or Uşşak makam; Greek Oussak.

Sikah

Also known as Ottoman or Greek Segah.

Saba

Also known as Ottoman Saba or Greek Sabah.
Appendix 4: Leading Notes in Western scales and modes

Harmonic minor

The intervals marked 1/2 indicate semitone-leading notes, with directionality to triad notes.

Ascending melodic minor

Ionian Major

Phrygian

Also applicable to Arabic Kürd, Ottoman Kürdi, Greek Kiourdi and Jewish Yishtabach when harmonized with triads.
Locrian

Dorian

Aeolian

Also known as Adonoi Molokh.

Lydian

Mixolydian