Reconsidering and Contextualising the Vernacular Tradition: Popular Music and British Manuscript Compilations (1650–2000)

Stephen William John Campbell

Doctor of Philosophy

University of York
Department of Music

October 2012
Abstract

Current interest in traditional music is driving a search for new repertoire as scholars and enthusiasts seek to unearth working musical manuscripts from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. This thesis looks at a selection of such compilations, examining their origins and cultural contexts and re-contextualizing them within the current revivalist milieu. It examines the journey of melody from printed sources to performance, a process in which the manuscripts represent a key step: they are a conduit, a means through which music is created. The first chapter sets the scene for the thesis, exploring the origins and contexts of the manuscripts that will be considered. It offers a review of literature and presents a challenge to some of the accepted notions surrounding folk and traditional music, such as genre (a relatively recent construct), authenticity and the acquiring of melodies as an end in itself. The second chapter explores the current drive toward establishing regional styles, which are unstable constructs, and it examines the use of music as a catalyst for nationalist and racist agendas. It also concerns music as a product of the critical political economy and addresses aspects of repertoire, variation and the downward filtration of culture. It contextualizes twentieth-century interest in traditional music.

Chapter Three approaches the chronological starting point of the thesis, John Playford’s *English Dancing Master*. It considers Playford’s impact on the many subsequent publications of country-dance music and the adoption of country-dance melodies into popular usage. As evidence of the deployment of these melodies along with military music and popular song, the pre-1800 manuscripts of Henry Atkinson, William Vickers and Joshua Jackson are scrutinised. Chapter Four addresses the main focus of the work, the anonymous *Campbell I* manuscript (circa 1810), which demonstrates a melange of dance music, military music, art music and song. The chapter highlights the interdependence of these musics and the social settings from which they emanate.
Chapter Five, which considers the nineteenth-century manuscripts of Lawrence Leadley, Amelia Benwell, Francis Rippon and William Norris, shows how developments in musical instrument technology and industrialisation combined with a broadening complexity of technique and expertise to produce greater diversity. The final chapter argues that genre boundaries, as currently understood, are not borne out by the evidence presented in the manuscript compilations. The epilogue looks at the continuing use of score for the creation of music for social interaction through an examination of a recent manuscript, *Campbell II*. The thesis as a whole highlights a mismatch between the current perception of vernacular music and the actuality of that music in its original context.
List of Illustrations

Figure 1 Swiss music box, play list, p.27.
Figure 2 ‘Highland Mary’, p.36, reproduced by kind permission of the National Library of Scotland.
Figure 3 ‘In the days when we went Gipsying’, Leadley Ms., Vol. II, p.62, reproduced by kind permission of James Merryweather.
Figure 4 *The Gentleman’s Musical Companion*, title page, p.97, reproduced by kind permission of the National Library of Scotland.
Figure 5 Ó Riada and Ceoltoíri Chualann, p.116, *The Chieftains: The Authorized Biography*.
Figure 6 ‘Here we meet too soon to part’, p.126, reproduced by kind permission of Francis Boutle Publishers.
Figure 7 *The Daily Universal Register* of 1 January 1785, p.158.
Figure 8 *Country dances selected as perform’d at court and all publick assemblies and entertainments*, title page, p.161, reproduced by kind permission of the National Library of Scotland.
Figure 9 ‘The Harriott’, p.181, reproduced by kind permission of John Hanewich (president), *The Company of Fifers & Drummers*, Ivoryton, Connecticut, USA.
Figure 10 ‘Roslin Castle’ and ‘The Answer to Roslin Castle’, p.197, reproduced by kind permission of the Bodleian Library, Oxford.
Figure 11 ‘Caledonian Laddie’, p.218, reproduced by kind permission of the National Library of Scotland.
Figure 12 ‘The Waterman’, p.228, University of East London, *East London Theatre Archive*. 
Figure 13  ‘Lea Rigges’, p.239, reproduced by kind permission of the Northumbrian Pipers’ Society.

Figure 14  ‘My Ain Kind Dearie’, p.240, reproduced by kind permission of the Northumbrian Pipers’ Society.

Figure 15  Single-keyed, open-system fife, p.248.

Figure 16  ‘The Unfortunate Lad’, p.249, reproduced by kind permission of the Bodleian Library, Oxford.

Figure 17  Tunes from Oscar and Malvina, p.257, reproduced by kind permission of the National Library of Scotland.

Figure 18  Photograph of Lawrence Leadley, p.268, reproduced by kind permission of James Merryweather.

Figure 19  ‘We May be Happy Yet’, p.298, reproduced by kind permission of the Bodleian Library, Oxford.

Figure 20  ‘Long, Long Ago’, p.310, reproduced by kind permission of the Northumbrian Pipers’ Society.

Figure 21  ‘The Girl I left behind me’, p.315, Chetham’s Library, Manchester.

Figure 22  ‘Kathleen Mavourneen’, p.320, reproduced by kind permission of the National Library of Scotland.

Figure 23  ‘The Blighted Flower’, p.341, Chetham’s Library, Manchester.

Figure 24  ‘Summer is Icumen in’, p.359, reproduced by kind permission of Dover publications, Inc., New York.


Figure 26  ‘Lovely Nancy’, II, p.373, reproduced by kind permission of Geoff Bowen and Robin Shepherd.
Figure 27  ‘Lovely Nancy’, III, p.374, reproduced by kind permission of Francis Boutle Publishers.

Figure 28  ‘Lovely Nancy’, IV, p.374, reproduced by kind permission of the English Folk Dance and Song Society.

Images of sheet music taken from the National Library of Australia, John Hopkins University, the National Library of Scotland and the Library of Congress collections are cited in footnotes and used by kind permission.
# Table of Contents

1  Chapter One: Introduction

1.1  Introduction to the Archive: Methodological Concerns

1.1.1  Overview

1.1.2  Research Questions

1.1.3  Historical Contexts

1.1.4  Sources and Influences

1.1.5  Provenance

1.1.6  Case Study Selection Criteria

1.1.7  Availability of Materials

1.1.8  Organisation of the Thesis

1.1.9  Manuscript as a Record of Repertoire

1.1.10  Measure of the Popular

1.1.11  Reflection of Sensibilities and Popular Musical Trends

1.1.12  Nature of the Contents

1.1.13  Ephemerality and Proliferation of Eighteenth-Century Music Publications

1.1.14  Physical Attributes of the Manuscripts

1.1.15  Technical Considerations

1.1.16  Cultural Standing: High- and Low-Brow Contexts

1.1.17  Literature Review

2  Chapter Two: Musical Identity, Key Themes and Present Day Contexts

2.1  Musical Identity: Regionalism, Nationalism and Racism

2.1.1  Regionalism

2.1.2  Nationalism and Racism

2.1.3  Musical Identity: Conclusion
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Key Themes</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Style and the Redeployment of Melody and Its Consequences</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 The Selection Process</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Continuity/Change over Time</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4 Downward Filtration of Culture</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5 Interdependent Forms: Song, Martial and Dance Music</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.6 Theatrical Influences</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.7 Development of Musical Instruments</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.8 Developments in Notation and Technology</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.9 Gender Issues</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.10 Audience Issues: Musical Subculture</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Contemporary Contexts: Traditional Music in the Twentieth and Twenty-First Centuries</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 The Edwardian Revival</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 The Second Twentieth-Century Revival and Present Day</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Conclusion to Chapter Two</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Chapter Three: Foundations: John Playford and Early Compilations</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 John Playford (1623–1686/7)</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 The Henry Atkinson Manuscript</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 The William Vickers Manuscript</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 The Joshua Jackson Manuscript</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Conclusion to Chapter Three</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Chapter Four: Campbell I Manuscript</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Notes on Contents</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3 Conclusion to Chapter Four .......................................................... 260
  4.3.1 Contents................................................................................. 260
  4.3.2 Sources.................................................................................. 262
  4.3.3 Deployment.............................................................................. 263

5 Chapter Five: The Leadley, Benwell, Rippon and Norris Manuscripts ........................................ 264
  5.1 Introduction ............................................................................. 264
  5.2 The Lawrence Leadley Manuscript ........................................ 267
    5.2.1 Book I ................................................................................. 270
    5.2.2 Book II ................................................................................. 276
    5.2.3 Book III ............................................................................... 278
    5.2.4 Book IV ............................................................................... 279
  5.3 The Amelia Benwell Manuscripts ............................................ 282
    5.3.1 Physical Attributes .............................................................. 282
    5.3.2 Contents.............................................................................. 294
    5.3.3 Benwell Manuscripts: Conclusion ....................................... 343
  5.4 The Francis Rippon Manuscripts ............................................. 344
    5.4.1 Physical Attributes .............................................................. 344
    5.4.2 Contents.............................................................................. 346
  5.5 The Norris Manuscript ............................................................. 351
    5.5.1 Physical Attributes .............................................................. 351
    5.5.2 Contents.............................................................................. 354

6 Chapter Six: Concluding Discussion .............................................. 357
  6.1 Part One: Observations and Analysis ...................................... 357
    6.1.1 Methodology ....................................................................... 357
    6.1.2 Establishment of Format: The Handwritten Manuscript ... 358
    6.1.3 Roles and Deployments ....................................................... 360
Acknowledgments

This work has been many decades in the making, with many individuals contributing to its formation. I wish to thank those who have encouraged me in its preparation, criticised it when necessary and otherwise assisted in its creation. These include:

Neil Sorrell, Catherine Laws, John Potter, Jenny Doctor, Áine Sheil, Stephanie Miller and June Rawden of the University of York

Richard Middleton of the University of Newcastle upon Tyne

Rosaline Bachelor, Alan Easterbrook, David Hillery and David Howes

Peter Bower and Jean Stirk of the British Association of Paper Historians

Chris Webb and Trevor Cooper of the Borthwick Institute, York

Major M. L. Sullivan, Curator, Prince of Wales Own Regiment of Yorkshire Museum, York

The staff of the York Archive, York City Library, York

Sarah Laycock, Library and Collections Officer, Brontë Parsonage Museum, Haworth, Keighley

Graham Hogg, Senior Curator, Rare Book Collections, National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh

Almut Boehme, Head of Music, National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh

Malcolm Taylor, Library Director, English Folk Dance and Song Society, London

Julia Say of the Northumbrian Pipers’ Society

The following libraries and collections assisted in establishing the provenance of pieces:

National Library of Australia, Sheet Music Collection

Bodleian Library, *Allegro* Catalogue of Ballads


Lester S. Levy Collection of Sheet Music, Sheridan Libraries, Johns Hopkins University

Chetham’s Library, *Axon* Ballad Collection
Author’s Declaration

I hereby declare that I am the sole author of this thesis.
Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Introduction to the Archive: Methodological Concerns

1.1.1 Overview

This thesis focuses on the context and content of a selection of handwritten manuscripts containing dance, song, military and other music, mainly emanating from the North of England and Scottish Borders. The study is centred on manuscripts in the writer’s possession, in particular one dating from c. 1810 that contains a broad selection of country dance, martial and song melodies. In-depth analysis of these collections raises numerous musicological questions, with implications for the negotiation of genre boundaries; the social, political and economic contexts of the manuscripts; and the function of ephemeral music in popular culture. Considering the significance of the collections to the compilers and their audiences along with their relevance today is essential to this study. Notions of ‘folk’, ‘art’ and ‘traditional’ music are brought into question, using evidence of the downward filtration of culture through the echelons of society, by tracing the deployment and re-contextualisation of melody. (Throughout the thesis, I use the terms ‘folk’ and ‘traditional’ more or less interchangeably based on the International Folk Music Council’s definition of a folk/traditional song.) Shifts in the roles and deployments of the studied pieces in sociological, political and national terms illustrate the adaptable significance of melody.

The instigation of the work was the examination of the contents of an anonymous leather-bound book of handwritten music I discovered in a second-hand bookshop in Micklegate, York, c. 1973. I refer to the manuscript as Campbell I, as it bears no title or other means of distinction. The unravelling of the complex bundle of

---

1 See Appendix 1.
evidence presented in the volume has involved investigation into watermarks, organology, military history, popular dance and song, as well as a broad realisation of the collection’s original context and makeup. My interest in traditional music, especially that used to accompany social dance, was well established by 1973. (I had studied with folk-music specialist Gwen Marchant Polwarth at Newcastle upon Tyne.) The manuscript presented much material that lay outside the social dance music canon, and the majority of pieces were not confined to the usual violin first-position range of country dance melodies. The volume lay dormant on a bookshelf for over 30 years. I was aware, prior to the collection’s coming to light, of the existence of other such manuscripts, having been involved with revivals of pieces taken from Joshua Jackson’s book dated 1798, unearthed in Harrogate in the early 1970s. This thesis deals with the content, contexts and musicological significance of this and other, similar collections, considering their relation to the timeframes from which they emanate and their pertinence today.

1.1.2 Research Questions

This work examines the formation of a popular and traditional music canon using handwritten music manuscripts as evidence. Attention is drawn to the wide variety of music in the manuscripts, demonstrating the eclectic tastes of both the compilers and their audiences. The thesis illustrates the selection of high-brow, composed melody for vernacular usage, exemplifying the social mobility of music. The placing of melody into varied contexts is examined; the redeployments of melody in a range of roles and settings over time demonstrates its adaptability and pliability. The thorny question of the definition of folk and traditional music is addressed in the context of current thinking. An analysis of the current reception of traditional music, its role and relevance
today, forms the concluding section of the work. In brief, the thesis will address the following questions:

- What are the consequences of applying contemporary genre boundaries to the popular music of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries? (How does eighteenth- and nineteenth-century popular music challenge the way we think about genre today?)
- How can we approach an understanding of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century popular music as experienced in its time?
- To what extent does the canon of traditional British dance music and song comply with ‘folk’ paradigm notions of an organically evolved vernacular culture?
- What factors have contributed to the current fascination with and emphasis on regionalism in ‘traditional’ music performance in the British Isles?
- How can we identify regional difference deriving from performance style as distinct from difference deriving from actual area-specific melodic features?
- How does popular music of the eighteenth- and nineteenth-centuries challenge our understanding of the distinction between “high” and “low” culture?

1.1.3 Historical Contexts

The contents of the manuscript collection uncovered in York and also that of Joshua Jackson include country dance and martial music alongside popular song from the theatre. They also contain published pieces by composers of the likes of Charles Dibdin and extracts from larger composed works. The manuscripts thus feature a wide-ranging variety of pieces and sources. These volumes present evidence of eclectic repertoire that
does not readily fall into current musical genres or categories. To classify these collections as early examples of folk dance or traditional music is to oversimplify their actuality and to brush over the complex nature of their makeup and diversity.

Much of the study of ‘folk’ and ‘traditional’ music of the British Isles during the twentieth century by Cecil Sharp, A. L. Lloyd and other scholars, is somewhat insular in that the folk music tradition is often examined as a separate entity from other popular and art music. The multifaceted makeup of manuscript collections like that of Jackson form part of the wider musical landscape of late eighteenth-century and early nineteenth-century Britain. Ian Gammie and Derek McCulloch, in their examination of the music manuscripts of Jane Austen, refer to ‘the sheer scope and variety of the music contained within the eight volumes, showing just how rich the public (and private) musical life of Britain must have been in the period from about 1760 … to about 1810’.² They add that in Austen’s collection ‘[v]irtually all genres apart from the symphony are present’.³ The varied nature of the contents of manuscript collections is a recurring element of this study. By tracing the changing form and contents of manuscript collections over several centuries, it is possible to establish commonality of purpose whilst also placing them within the context of broader philosophical movements. Thus the role of manuscript collections may be observed through the Baroque, Classical and Romantic periods. As one would expect, marked differences are manifest in such collections over time, but similarities in contents, purpose and format are more striking. Such compilations are the ‘tools of the trade’ of performing musicians, and judging by the large number that have survived over the centuries, it must have been standard practice for instrumentalists to gather together such collections.

³ Ibid, p.4.
The inclusion of works by Handel, Mozart and Rossini in these volumes signifies a broader reflection of the popular than that portrayed by those whose interests lie within the traditional music field. For example, the 1994 publication of pieces from Lawrence Leadley’s manuscripts contains little mention of the violin arrangement of the whole of the overture to Rossini’s *L’Italiana in Algeri*.\(^4\) It thereby fails to acknowledge the true nature of Leadley’s playing and the broad scope of the musical activities of the late nineteenth-century Bradford bourgeoisie. The many recent publications of melodies taken from manuscript sources of the likes of Leadley’s are restricted to the ‘folk’ market. They do not purport to be rigorous academic works, but they nonetheless contribute to a blinkered understanding of the varied music and performance of artists like Leadley.

1.1.4 Sources and Influences

The accumulation of empirical evidence has been assisted greatly by the identification of pieces through the use of the many library collections and databases available online. This vast amount of accessible material has enabled informed historical positioning of the manuscripts’ contents. By tracing the printed sources of melodies, this thesis illustrates the extent of the material’s proliferation as well as its provenance. The observations and conclusions drawn with respect to the contents of the archives are based on the adoption of pieces into popular circulation and their subsequent re-contextualisation. The deployment of melody in differing roles, from the printed page to vernacular usage, is much in evidence. My research paints a clear picture of the music that was performed in particular economic, social and political milieus over the last three hundred years, placing the manuscripts it analyses firmly in context. The broader philosophy of the era from which the manuscripts are derived, notably the Romantic

---

Movement, has shed further light upon the motivations and aspirations of the compilers and their audiences.

1.1.5 Provenance

As stated above, the *Campbell I* collection has no name or indication as to its compiler or provenance. The paper was traceable by means of watermarks and countermarks, which established its date of production as 1810. This date was further verified through in-depth analysis of contents. (For example, Charles Dibdin’s sea songs, written in 1803, are included in the collection, so the manuscript must have been produced some time thereafter.) The location of the compiler and his or her performance venues is the subject of informed conjecture. The included repertoire certainly suggests military performance, as well as other social functions. As David Murray and Raoul Camus both point out, the military musician was often a freelance player who would play on the orchestral platform or at the musical theatre as well as the on the parade ground or in the officers' mess. There is no concrete proof that the compiler of *Campbell I* was such a professional instrumentalist, but the contents of the manuscripts and the evidence of musical expertise contained therein justify this assertion.

A sizable minority of melodies in *Campbell I* have no name; the provenance of such tunes has been established using existing databases of incipits whenever possible. This is an ongoing process.

1.1.6 Case Study Selection Criteria

I have selected manuscript collections for this study that are available in their entirety. The main focus of the study is on those collections from the nineteenth century which

---

are not in the public domain: *Campbell I and II, Benwell I and II*, and *Norris*. The musically rich environments from which these collections emanate provide evidence of diverse and complex material and insight into cultural life of the era. Other complete collections centred on the North of England, readily available either in museums, libraries or scanned on websites, are scrutinised as comparative collections. This is not to establish a case for regional style but, on the contrary, to demonstrate homogeneity of music throughout the British Isles. The contents and context of the manuscripts listed above plus the Francis Rippon collection from York are examined for the first time by this study.

**Timeline**

- John Playford, publication of 1st ed. of *The English Dancing Master* – 1651
- Henry Atkinson, c1661–c1700
  - Ms. dated 1694
- William Vickers
  - Ms. dated 1770
- Joshua Jackson, 1763–1839
  - Ms. dated 1798
- *Campbell* Ms. I c1810
- Amelia Benwell
- Francis Rippon, Ms c.1860
- R. W. Norris Ms. 1886
- Lawrence Leadley (1827–1897), Mss.
- *Campbell* Ms II 1980s

A synchronic study of the *Campbell I* manuscript is the main focus of this work. Diachronic comparison of the wider sample reveals commonality of purpose and
contents, and it gives insight into the work of performing musicians other than virtuosi. A collection signed Lloyd Huwes, in the writer’s possession, illustrates what is excluded from the study. It contains compositions by the Welsh composer Brinley Richards; it is a handwritten copy of his work. Immaculately executed, this collection is focused solely on Richards’s work, a broad selection of pieces of the mid- to later part of the nineteenth century, when it was compiled. This, I consider, falls under the remit of a scholar of Richards’s work, and not of this study, which focuses on compilations of work from various sources and for various purposes. Compared to, say, the Amelia Benwell collection, Huwes’s compilation of Richards’s compositions volume is concentrated on a more restricted field; it is not necessarily a broad reflection of the popular or vernacular music.

1.1.7 Availability of Materials

Each collection is a sample of the music of the time from which it emanates. The variety of material in these collections shows that they are more than compilations of country dance music. Unfortunately, many such collections are inaccessible. A leather-bound family music book is featured on the BBC website *A History of the World in a Hundred Objects* with the following post from the owner:

> The book is a collection of popular music from the late 1700’s onwards. The music was handwritten by my Great Grandfather, an engraver from Louth. It is believed that he collected the songs for a Glee Club. The book includes a handwritten transcript of *Les Marseilles* [sic] (The French National Anthem) — newly written around that time.  

---


7 Ibid, accessed 20.07.11.
This collection remains in private ownership and is not available for examination. The use of such a manuscript to notate glee songs shows a dimension of popular musical activity sparsely represented in the manuscript sample of this study. The Jackson Ms. does contain songs which one may categorise as glee, but these are few in number.

The inclusion of ‘La Marseillaise’, which is also in the Austen and Benwell collections, demonstrates the popularity of this piece with the British during and after the Napoleonic wars. Gammie and McCulloch, in considering Austen’s manuscript collection, shed light on this apparent anomaly:

The presence of quite a few French songs in the collection might be construed as a curiosity since Britain was at war with France for most of Jane Austen’s adult life…. We should remember that French was still the international language of diplomacy *par excellence*, and that the wars of the time were seen more as resistance to Napoleonic military aggression rather than as a conflict with French culture.\(^8\)

The Marseillaise is found in collections both prior to the Napoleonic wars and after them, confirming Gammie and McCulloch’s interpretation of its continuing popularity with the British. I suggest the strength of the melody and the status of the French language amongst the English middle-classes may well account for this seemingly unpatriotic practice.

1.1.8 Organisation of the Thesis

In Chapter Three, I have grouped publisher John Playford with the Henry Atkinson, William Vickers and Jackson manuscripts in order to illustrate the formation of and changes in the canon. The continuing deployment of repertoire manuscript collections

---

during the eighteenth century establishes a foundation for the scrutiny of *Campbell I*. Chapter Four concerns *Campbell I*'s contents and the provenance of the pieces therein. Chapter Five addresses the manuscripts of Leadley, Benwell, Rippon, and Norris. It demonstrates the continuing use of manuscript collections and the impact of changing fashion, technology, education etc. on their contents and on the popular music canon. This section provides insight into the use of vernacular manuscripts during the nineteenth century. Chapter Six is a concluding discussion encompassing the revival and re-contextualisation of ‘traditional’ music as well as a consideration of current performance and debate.

Although Johann Herder had established his notion of folk music during the time the manuscripts were in use, the contents of the manuscripts were not dictated by this idea; rather, they reflect the varied musical fashions of their time. Changes in the contents of the manuscripts over time demonstrate gradual evolution rather than seismic shifts in repertoire. The sample is small but gives a clear indication of music in popular circulation over more than 200 years; the manuscripts are evidence of the performance and adoption of pieces by musicians. Diachronic development in the contents of the manuscripts reflects the advancements made in instrument technology and the evolution of artistic styles over time.

### 1.1.9 Manuscript as a Record of Repertoire

The manuscript purchased in York, *Campbell I*, presents a selection of melodic pieces meticulously written out by hand. It is a bespoke score selected by the compiler, demonstrating the wide-ranging musical tastes of a performer and the requirements of her/his audience. The competence with which the musical notation is executed demonstrates a level of musical literacy and expertise of a very high order. In recent decades, more and more of these handwritten musical compilations have come to light.
Such collections have attracted the attentions of and been sought out by enthusiastic revivalists of ‘traditional’ music.

The evidence uncovered by this study demonstrates the wide, eclectic nature of the repertoires of the compilers of the manuscripts and how many of their melodies lie outside what is accepted today as the traditional music canon. These pieces are, to use William Chappell’s descriptor, ‘the popular music of the olden time’. They have been claimed by folk music enthusiasts and performers as traditional music. The current need to categorise and compartmentalise music into genres in order to meet marketing requirements often results in the arbitrary classification of the manuscripts’ contents as folk music. However, much of the contents may be described as ‘art’ music. (What music is not?) Matthew Gelbart recognised how folk and art music are intrinsically linked:

To understand fully the persistence and influence of these categories, we must not only recognize the fact that each is open to variation bearing loose “family resemblances”, we must also realize something that has not been considered much in the existing literature: the specific interdependence of “folk” and “art” as a binary, dialectical paring. These signifiers have gained their referents through contrast and opposition to each other: throughout their history, the fact that “folk music” and “art music” have functioned in a dialogue with each other has rendered their force exclusive rather than inclusive.

Gelbart’s polemic is vindicated by evidence found within these collections: we have a melange of popular song, country dance and martial music intermingled with pieces

---


written by Handel, Mozart and Rossini. His refreshing musicological stance exposes the true nature of the popular in its broad inclusivity.

From Herder via Sharp to Lloyd and onward, the true nature of the wide-ranging, eclectic tastes of the masses have been pruned to slot within a constructed ‘folk’ paradigm. The music of the noble savage, the exotic ‘other’, has held a fascination for more than two centuries, manifesting in ethnomusicological studies centred on the British proletariat. The identification (and creation) of a British song tradition was an essential element of eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century nationalism and an offshoot of Romanticism. The deconstruction of the concept of British ‘folk music’, instigated by Dave Harker (1985) and partially rebuffed by C. J. Bearman (2002), has led to healthy scepticism. Richard Middleton expresses an awareness of the shaky ground on which the concept and definition of folk song are based, writing, ‘[T]he seemingly most archaic “folk song” … generally turn out to have among its ancestry connections with the print world of the towns’. Pieces for these collections are selected by the compiler, who considers the requirements and tastes of her/his audience. This filtering process will, of course, exclude the second-rate, the banal and music that falls outside the required form.

Selection is a significant feature of these manuscript collections. It is the selection process that elevates their significance in terms of relevance to their era; the included pieces are recognised by the compilers as having merit and being worthy of inclusion in the manuscript collections. They possess the ‘selection’ element stated in the International Folk Music Council’s definition of a folk/traditional song. (The essential elements of a traditional folk song are laid out in the 1954 definition as continuity, variation and ‘selection’ by the community.) It is this selection by the compilers of the manuscripts that is the most intriguing aspect of their makeup.

There are two basic considerations motivating the compiler: a drawing together of the desired repertoire in a single volume, making the musical score easily transportable; and financial expedience, as the compilation exercise would be far cheaper than purchasing scarce printed music. The bespoke nature of these collections assists our understanding of their intended roles. The time-consuming task of gathering pieces in one volume and writing them out by hand signifies the importance of the pieces to the compiler.

There are three possible practical roles and motivations for the creation of these handwritten compilations of music. Firstly, as stated previously, they may be used in performance as an aide memoire. Secondly, they may be used in pedagogy, for instruction in dance or instrumental tuition. Thirdly, the books may be simply repositories of pieces favoured by the compilers. These categories are not mutually exclusive and may all be considered as simultaneous functions. The manuscripts have their own intrinsic beauty, and their compilation may be considered as having artistic worth for its own sake. They also encapsulate a sense of utility, and each collection conveys not only a display of differing levels of distress and ‘wear and tear’ but also a sense of human contact. The scars of use add to each volume’s ambient aura of utilitarian functionality and bear witness to many years of practical deployment.

Most musical ensembles today have their repertoire collections or ‘band pads’, but with developments in computer graphics and technology, the paper score is being replaced by the LED screen. These electronic devises are the current equivalents of the manuscript collections.

1.1.10 Measure of the Popular

The consensus, the majority, the most well-liked, the most common – the word ‘popular’ carries all of these connotations, and it is an elusive concept when applied to
Middleton places ‘popular music’ within ‘the whole musical field’, seeing it as fluid, ever changing and ‘active’.\(^{12}\) There were no ‘charts’ at the end of the eighteenth century to measure the popularity of musical pieces, so it is difficult to quantify. Musicians’ compilations provide large quantities of gathered melodies that reflect what was performed and heard. Certain melodies are found in many of these collections, which is an indication of their popularity. If material is found in several collections over many years, then I consider it to have been popular and accepted into the canon. ‘The popular’, in this context, is that used in common musical parlance.

Most musically literate Western performing musicians gather a bank of music together to serve as a resource, a library for practice, repertoire and instruction. Today the music listener, too, will house a personal collection of recordings as, for example, MP3 files for portable players. Previously, a compact disc, vinyl record or shellac 78s collection might have given insight into an individual’s personality and character. Famously, a portable jukebox belonging to John Lennon came to light. It was featured on *The South Bank Show* in 2004.\(^{13}\) This machine travelled with Lennon and contained his personal collection of 45 rpm singles in the mid-1960s. Lennon’s selection of recordings was released on a double compact disc and represents a distillation of the popular music of his era. The manuscript compilations are similarly a focus of the popular and an essential part of the compilers’ and their audiences’ identities.

The individual compiler’s personal tastes may or may not be in line with the populace, but the demands of audiences add another dimension to the selection process. The public-house jukeboxes of the 1960s and 1970s housed record collections selected by the owners attempting to meet the popular music demands of drinkers. Below is the playlist from a Swiss music box, in the writer’s possession, from the second

---

half of the nineteenth century; the music box is a forerunner of the iPod or juke box in that it is a bespoke collection of music. The eight pieces are extracts from larger works composed by Verdi (Un ballo in Maschera), Weber (Der Freischütz), Grisar (Les Porcherons), J. Strauss (II?) (‘Sensitive Walzer’), Flotow (Martha, oder Der Markt zu Richmond), Halévy (L’Éclair and La Magicienne) and Auber (La Muette de Portici). They were likely selected by the constructor of the music box based on her/his anticipation of the musical tastes of the market. Such assessment of the tastes and demands of the market is an element of all business risk that entails an attempt to predict the market or, in the case of music, the demands and expectations of the recipient.

Figure 1: Swiss music box playlist

Concert programmes and printed musical anthologies are subject to similar forces of influence in their makeup. Applying set theory to the example above, let Set A represents all the possible melodies placed on the drum of the music box by the supplier. Let set B represents the melodies the purchaser of the music box wished to be placed on the machine. Let set C represents the actual pieces placed on the music box by the supplier, i.e. the eight pieces. The intersection (∩) of the two sets A and B are those melodies on the drum of the music box that the purchaser wanted. That area of C which lies outside B (i.e. C ∩ B') is the mismatch between what the purchaser wanted and what was on the music box, those tunes on the drum that the purchaser did not want. As a Venn diagram:
In terms of the manuscripts, set $A$ is the repertoire of the performer/compiler/promoter, and set $B$ is the expectations of the recipient. $A \cap B$ represents a consensus between $A$ and $B$, with the universal set $\mathcal{E}$ being all music. $C$ is the contents of the manuscript, programme, anthology, etc. $C \cap B'$ represents the intersection of the contents of the manuscript with that outside the requirements and expectations of $B$. This area of mismatch is variable in magnitude: the greater its contents, the greater $B$’s dissatisfaction. There may well be compromise between $A \cap B$.

For example, $A$ may wish to innovate whilst $B$ may be conservative in expectations. This area of contention is problematic and may represent the difference between success and failure. I suggest that this intersection, $C \cap B'$, is virtually the null set when applied to the handwritten manuscripts under consideration, as the compiler will have attempted to meet the demands of the audience. Each piece must have been intended to be performed by the compiler at some time to have warranted inclusion in the collection. The performing musicians’ manuscript collections of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries were subject to the demands, forces and constraints imposed by the recipients of the music.

The old adage ‘he who pays the piper calls the tune’ must apply to the selection of the contents in these collections. This is certainly borne out by the verse taken from Vickers’s manuscript of 1770:
ON MUSIC

Music’s a Crotchet, the Sober thinks it Vain,
The Fiddle’s a Wooden Projection;
Tunes are But Flights of a Whimsical Brain
Which the Bottle Brings Best to Perfection
Musicians are half witted, merry and mad,
And Those are the same that admire Them;
They’re Fools if they Play unless they’re Well Paid,
And the Others are Blockheads to Hire them.¹⁴

This verse may imply that Vickers performed on a professional or semi-professional basis. There is no doubt that compilers of the manuscripts under consideration in this thesis had some non-monetary motivations for gathering the collections together, but it is my contention that many of the compilers were at least semi-professional, if not fully-professional, musicians.

As well as musical concerns, the collation process involves non-musical considerations. For instance, the public may demand the dance associated with a particular tune rather than the tune itself. Marches may be associated with a notable individual, a particular regiment or a specific occasion, and the melody thereby acquires emblematic significance and, by popular demand, inclusion in the collection. The formation of these collections is a dynamic process, a multifaceted dialectic between compiler/performer and audience.

1.1.11 Reflection of Sensibilities and Popular Musical Trends

Fashions in popular social dance change, evolve and develop with time, and each of the manuscript collections represents a sizable sample of modes in music and dance of their

eras. The current fascination with celebrities and their affairs is nothing new. The liaison between Nelson and Lady Hamilton was a huge centre of interest amongst polite society in the early years of the nineteenth century, and it is acknowledged as such in the music of the time. We have in *Campbell I* ‘Nelson’s Waltz’, ‘Nelson’s New Waltz’ and ‘Lady Hamilton’s New Waltz’, the eponymous titles not only recognising their celebrity status but also aligning them both with the burgeoning new dance fashion of the period, the waltz. Scathing attacks were written on the Hamiltons and Nelson on their return to London in November 1800. Tom Pocock writes: ‘The caricatures, notably by James Gillray, showed Nelson as a seducer, Sir William as an elderly cuckold, and his wife as an obese nymphomaniac’. After his death, Nelson was besmirched by gossip, and not until the establishment of Trafalgar Day in the run up to the First World War did his reputation recover fully. The plummeting heroic status of Nelson in the minds of upright Victorians after his death was due, as Tom Pocock points out, in part to Victorian reticence; to the scurrilous Memoirs of Lady Hamilton, published anonymously after her death in 1815, which went through several editions during the century; and to her daughter Horatia’s reluctance to accept the identity of her mother.

However, the heroic reputation of Nelson was re-established in the late nineteenth century. Nicholas Roger describes him as, ‘a symbol of imperial Britain and its overarching sea power, and a talisman against anxiety’. The inclusion of the ‘Nelson’ pieces in *Campbell I* verifies the status of the naval hero at the beginning of the


16 Ibid.

eighteenth century and also the awareness of the public of his liaison with Emma Hamilton. (It is worth noting that in stark contrast to such examples, many individuals and events named in the collections have sunk into obscurity.)

The musical manuscripts of Jane Austen form a collection of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century. Patrick Piggott has shown the integral part that music and song played in the lives of the bourgeoisie and upper classes. The Austen family’s collection also demonstrates the continuum of musical taste spanning the social divides of the time. Gammie and McCulloch emphasise the ‘sheer scope and variety’ of the music contained with the eight volumes. They also acknowledge the manuscripts’ reflection of popular and international influences: ‘Insofar as Jane Austen may represent the bourgeoisie of the day, we can say that her music collection reflects most of the trends of the time, both native and imported, in more or less equal portions’. In a similar manner, the Campbell I manuscript contains a wide variety and cross section of the music of its era, as Chapter Four will discuss.

Another influence on the manuscripts was the threat of invasion by the French, which had far-reaching effects on the population of England in the late eighteenth century and into the nineteenth century. John Clare the Northamptonshire poet, the embodiment of the noble savage, reflects on this fear and the establishment of local militias:

When the country was chin deep in the fears of invasion and every mouth was filled with the terrors which Bouneparte [sic] had spread in other co[u]ntrys [sic] a national scheme was set up on foot to raise a raw army of volunteers and to make the matter plausible a letter was circulated said to be written by the

---

19 Ibid, p.6.
prince regent I forget how many was demanded from our parish but I remember the panic which it created was very great
… the papers that were circulated assurd [sic] the people of England that the French were on the eve of invading it.  

The deployment of huge numbers of men in the British forces during the Napoleonic wars saw a commensurate rise in the number of martial compositions in the form of marches and songs. The impact of the war was felt on many levels and reached smaller towns and villages with the creation of local militias, as seen above. The mobility of armed forces was reliant on the rhythm of the drum and the music of the fife to insure uniformity of step on the march.

In this sense music provided both jingoistic melody to stir the spirit and a practical rhythmical tool for the logistics of the war machine. Dibdin was commissioned to write patriotic sea songs to stir morale and galvanise the British spirit against the French:

As a renewal of war with Napoleonic France loomed in 1803, Addington’s government finally recognized the value of Dibdin’s songs and commissioned him to publish each month a patriotic song suitable for ships, camp, and home. Following the declaration of war against France in May 1803, Dibdin published monthly eight *British War Songs* (4 June 1803 to 4 January 1804), with accompaniments for piano, small military band, and two flutes or guitars. These songs then formed the backbone of *Britons Strike Home*, which opened on 17 September, adding greatly to patriotic fervour. As a result of his efforts, including abandoning his usual summer tour of the

---

provinces, Dibdin was awarded a pension of £200 by the government.21

It is no surprise that Dibdin’s songs and the common marches of the time found their way into the manuscript collections of the early nineteenth century.

A comprehensive history of ‘war music’, The Songs and Music of the Redcoats 1642–1902, was written in 1970 by Lewis Winstock.22 This work illustrates the influence of popular musical modes on martial music. Winstock emphasises the quality and quantity of men fighting, along with the impact of the Napoleonic Wars on British society.

Being men of a more elevated class than was usual for the common soldiers they had both the ability and the desire to express themselves…. Music … played its part on the home front, and the innumerable volunteer corps which were raised to counter the threat of invasion inevitably had their own music and their specially composed and adopted marches.23

The Campbell I manuscript is written evidence of the vast musical input into the war effort against the French. The local militia’s use of melody for drill would instil airs in the memory of the young soldiers thus adding to the martial music’s popular acceptance and longevity.

1.1.12 Nature of the Contents

A mixture of song melody, social dance tunes and martial music is found in the majority of these manuscript collections. Their contents are not only an indication of the popular but also an insight into the deployment of the music and musicians. It is plausible that

23 Ibid, pp.88 and 91.
there was much interchange between musicians of differing musical outlets, such as the ballroom, theatre and parade ground. Camus makes this assumption with respect to eighteenth-century orchestras:

It would be logical to assume that the wind players forming bands had had some experience prior to joining the military and would most likely continue to perform in local orchestras, if not in fact forming local orchestras of their own, such as the Royal Artillery and others. Parke wrote that the musicians of the three British Guard regiments up to 1783 consisted of excellent players taken from the king’s and commercial theatres, whose only military responsibility was to play the changing of the guard daily.24

The military band would play for both dancing and marching, deploying the same music. Murray writes:

[W]e should remember that the sound or tone of the band remained the same no matter what the occasion or function might be, and that the tempo at which the more popular ballroom dances of the period [the late eighteenth century] were performed was very similar to that at which the soldiers marched in the drill square’.25

He goes on to point out that the form of the march was akin to that of the country dance, with its AABB form:

[T]he pieces played did not have to last for very long, perhaps only for the time it took the battalion to pass the saluting base

at Ordinary Step of seventy-two to the minute. For this reason most of the marches of the eighteenth century consisted of two quite simple sections of eight or sixteen bars in common time, each section repeated.26 The ease with which simple eight-bar phrases may be committed to memory, both for march and country dance accompaniment, must also have influenced the proliferation and longevity of this format.

In a few cases it is possible to ascertain the volume from which sets of melodies have been copied. This is demonstrated in Campbell I, for example. ‘Sweet Kathlane Macree’ (ms. #150), ‘The Wandering Harper’ (ms. #156) and ‘Cushlamachree’ (ms. #158) were all taken from Benjamin Crosby’s Irish Musical Repository (published in London, 1808).

Many marches, as we shall see, are adapted from song melodies. Winstock’s work gives examples of the music material adopted by the British soldiers over the centuries. These include pieces from Pills to Purge Melancholy, others by Handel and the songs of Robert Burns, all of which bear a strong correlation with the sources of the manuscript’s contents. Winstock’s creation of the genre of ‘war music’ is an essential part of his polemic. He distinguishes between the music used by the military (both on and off the battle field) and those pieces written concerning war for popular consumption, stating that his work ‘disregards the songs about wars, battles, commanders and soldiers which lie thick in ballad collections masquerading as songs of war’.27 Lloyd made a similar distinction between the sea songs used by sailors and songs about seafaring life and events, writing, ‘Some folk songs of the sea were made by landsmen and are embellished with fanciful details that would baffle a sailor’.28

---

26 Ibid, p.84.
27 Ibid, p.ii.
Campbell I manuscript contains pieces that fall into both of Winstock’s and Lloyd’s categories, that is, soldiers’ and sailors’ song melodies – regimental marches juxtaposed with the tunes of Dibdin. The inclusion of a descriptive piece, taken from Oscar and Malvina, depicting ‘March’ into battle followed by ‘Battle’, ‘Groans of the Wounded’, ‘Retreat’, ‘Quick Step’ and ‘Dance after the Battle’ gives a synaesthetic representation of the horror of the battlefield, portraying slaughter amid triumphalism. For details of the origins of the piece, see ‘Notes on Contents’: Campbell I #182 (p.256).

John Clare the ‘peasant’ poet compiled a two-volume collection of song lyrics and dance melodies. His well-documented life gives an insight into how manuscript-book compilers acquired their skills and repertoire. George Decon quotes Clare’s writing: ‘I used to seize the leisure that every wet day brought me to go to Dury’s shop to read and get new tunes for my fiddle’. This is first-hand evidence of the transfer of printed music into a manuscript collection by the compiler. Jonathan Bate, in his biography of Clare, illustrates how Clare also acquired melodies from local gypsies:

Clare’s continuing interest in gypsy music may be seen from one of his journal entries: ‘[G]ot the tune of “highland Mary” from Wisdom Smith a gipsy [sic] and pricked another sweet tune without name as he fiddled it’.

---

Burns’s song ‘Highland Mary’, written in 1792, was produced as a broadside ballad in the latter part of the eighteenth century. The melody to the song is in G minor, and there exists within the folk dance canon also a, march-like melody, in G major, used for Coxwold Morris dancing, that bears the same name.

This example illustrates some of the difficulties encountered in establishing the provenance of pieces under examination in this study. A single melody may have multiple titles and vice versa. No melody notation for ‘Highland Mary’ is contained within the Clare manuscripts, but his use of the word ‘pricked’ implies that he noted the melody on paper. George Deacon speculates regarding Clare’s ability to notate melodies from performance:

As Clare expressed no difficulty in collecting tunes from his friends we may assume that the instrumental performance of a repetitive dance tune, or indeed the performance on fiddle of a song tune with the advantage of being able to watch the
fingering, presented fewer problems than taking down a purely vocal performance.\textsuperscript{31}

This part of Decon’s work is informed conjecture. The extrapolation regarding Clare’s ability to notate melodies from his single mention of the ‘pricked’ melodies ‘Highland Mary’ and ‘another sweet tune’ is somewhat tenuous.\textsuperscript{32} I would suggest that Decon’s view says more about his attempt to categorise Clare as an early collector of traditional song and music than the actuality of Clare’s methods of acquisition.

Clare may have noted some features of the melodies, but there is no evidence to show he was able to place such melodies into musical notation. He did play fiddle along with the Smith family, however. Clare writes:

As soon as I got here the Smiths gang of gipseys [sic] and as I began to be able to be a desent [sic] scraper we had a desant [sic] round of merriment for a fortnight some times [sic] going to dance or drink at the camp and at other times at the public house.\textsuperscript{33}

Clare goes on to write: ‘I usd [sic] to spend my Sundays and summer evenings among them learning to play the fiddle in their manner by ear’.\textsuperscript{34} There is, then, a clear picture of Clare’s acquisition of both playing skill and repertoire. As he had been the recipient of noblesse oblige with respect to his poetry, it seems logical to assume that he would have aspirations with regard to his musical performance abilities. Decon dismisses the evidence presented by Octavius Gilchrist in\textit{ London Magazine} (1820) as publicity, yet he still points out that ‘in his biography of Clare (\textit{Life and Remains of John Clare}) J. L. Cherry refers to Clare’s purpose in learning to play the fiddle as being, “in the hope of

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{32} Ibid, p.30.
\item \textsuperscript{34} Ibid, p.38.
\end{itemize}
obtaining a trifle at the annual feasts in the neighbourhood at Christmas.” Decon thus attempts to place Clare within the revivalist folk music paradigm. Rather than being a rustic folk fiddler, I suggest, Clare may well have harboured performance aspirations on the violin. Clare would have been acquainted with stately home entertainment having worked at Burghley House as a gardener.

1.1.13 Ephemerality and Proliferation of Eighteenth-Century Music

Publications

The huge number of country dance melodies written and printed during the eighteenth century is debatably one of the first examples of the commodification of music. Technical advances in music printing, such as the introduction of engraved copper plates, made music more accessible. Coley writes: ‘Music printing from engraved copper plates was firmly established in England by Thomas Cross (1632–82), who with his son … set a standard of artistry rarely equalled by their contemporaries’. The printing of music by this technique expanded greatly during the eighteenth century although it remained costly and time consuming. Nonetheless, many provincial booksellers were able to print collections of country dance melodies, which supplied the huge demand for new pieces for social dancing. These tunes were composed and published in their thousands, and many found their way into manuscript collections, including, for example, Vickers (1770) and Jackson (1798).

The popularity of the Ballad Opera grew during the eighteenth century with Gay’s The Beggar’s Opera, which was first performed in 1728. Such musical and dramatic collations provided an accessible alternative to opera seria. The popular genre contained

---

37 Coley, Noel, ‘Music Printing from the Sixteenth to the Twentieth Century’, A302, From Composition to Performance: Musicians at Work, ch.18, Block 3, Open University, 2002, Milton Keynes, p.57.
many musical compositions, songs and ballads of an ephemeral nature, and pieces from these productions and were often transcribed into manuscript collections, such as Jackson and *Campbell I*. The popularity of compositions by James Hook, Dibdin and others may be measured by their inclusion in these collections, yet they were unable to survive into the popular canon beyond the early nineteenth century. These melodies and pieces are very much of their time; for example, *Campbell I* includes Dibdin’s ephemeral ‘Tom Tough’ (see p.202) alongside Thomas Arne’s perennial ‘Rule Britannia’ (see p.179). ‘Tom Tough’ was of pertinence during the Napoleonic Wars but has now faded into obscurity whereas the sentiments of Arne’s composition still hold a nationalistic, even jingoistic appeal today.

Many of the melodies in the manuscript collections were created as marches by band leaders. Murray writes, concerning the composition of simple military marches: ‘The master of the band, as well as prominent composers, might produce … short marches for the regiment, which could find itself with several marches…. Some … had three or four, all called “The March of the Umpteenth Regiment”’. These pieces had to be easy to commit to memory, and they had to be in the required form to fit within the technical limitations of instruments, for example, the open-system fife with its restricted range of keys. Camus elucidates:

> Music racks or lyres were unknown [late seventeenth century] for use in marching, so the music would have to be memorized and quickly. The horn players probably would not have time to change crooks while on the field, and even if they did certainly would not carry a whole bag full of them on parade.40

---

The large number of country dance tunes published in the eighteenth century forms the basis of Irish traditional music. Aloys Fleischmann and Mícheál Ó Súilleabháin have demonstrated this in their exhaustive work *Sources of Irish Traditional Music C. 1600–1855*. It has been possible to trace the provenance of many of the airs contained in the manuscripts utilising this reference work. In order to trace the sources of melodies in this thesis, I have included incipits based on both C and G for the pieces contained in *Campbell I.*

Claude Simpson, in his work *The British Broadside Ballad and its Music*, illustrates the proliferation of printed melodies, which formed one of the bases of the British vernacular song. Simpson not only shows the vastness in quantity and the ephemeral nature of such music, but he also acknowledges the symbiotic relationship between the melodies for dance and song and their shared roots. He states:

> Another … invaluable source of ballad tunes is a collection of country dances with their music, *The Dancing Master*. [The first edition only was entitled *The English Dancing Master*.] This popular work … went through eighteen editions between 1651 and c. 1728 and grew from an original hundred tunes to more than 900…. It is often a moot point whether a given air represents a ballad tune adapted to dance purposes or vice versa; evidently both processes operated.

Simpson acknowledges the exchange of melody between dance and song. This evolutionary change proves problematic when attempting to establish which came first, the dance, the marching melody or the song tune. Melodies co-existed fulfilling both song and dance accompaniment roles (and serving as marches). Indeed, some

---

41 See Appendix 2.
publications, such as William Thomson’s *Orpheus Caledonius* (1725), have settings of their contents in both formats separately, i.e. song and dance. (See Campbell I, #67, p.220.) Such dual deployment of melody was acceptable practice.\(^{44}\)

Establishing the origins of the melodies in Playford’s *Dancing Master* is problematic. Jeremy Barlow does not address the issue, and little in-depth research appears to have been carried out on the matter.\(^{45}\) To illustrate the redeployment of melody from song to dance and to demonstrate the difficulty in sourcing of a Playford’s dance melodies, I will focus on one melody. The ballad ‘Cuckolds all a row’ was registered in the Stationer’s Register on 9 June 1637.\(^{46}\) Playford included this ‘country dance’ tune in the first edition of the *English Dancing Master* of 1650/1651. Thus were created three distinct artistic forms of ‘Cuckolds all [in] a row’: country dance, melody and ballad. The (lost) ballad commenced, ‘Not long ago, as all alone I lay upon my bed’; the melody and the dance, both with the same title, were periodically reissued during the eighteenth century.\(^{47}\) Notwithstanding the licentious implications of the title, the three forms of the piece have failed to survive in vernacular usage. Sharp’s ‘Hey boys up go we’, published in 1911 in volume three of *The English Country Dance Graded Series*, is Playford’s ‘Cuckolds all a row’, the title censored for elementary school usage.

### 1.1.14 Physical Attributes of the Manuscripts

A striking feature of these manuscript collections is the skill of the compilers. These were musically literate individuals displaying artistry in their copperplate handwriting of

---


the titles and idiosyncratic styles of notation. Some melodies were noted in haste, but the majority were painstakingly documented.

The effort in producing these collections is abundantly clear from the most superficial of inspections. Recognition, by their custodians, of their intrinsic craftsmanship will have contributed to their chances of survival over the generations. The high quality of the boards and binding will similarly have contributed to their longevity; custodians are less likely to dispose of an item of apparent artistic merit. The size of the earlier volumes enabled them to be placed easily in the case of a musical instrument or a large pocket. The books used towards the middle of the nineteenth century show an increase in size from *Campbell I* (1810), with six staves per page, to *Benwell* (1848/9) and *Leadley I* II (c.1850), each with twelve staves per page.

There is consistency of hand in most of the collections. The notable exception to this is the Lawrence Leadley collection of manuscripts. There appear to be three distinct styles of notation deployed in the compilations. Certain differences may be accounted for by changes in the maturing hand of Leadley, as the construction of the collection runs to seven volumes and spans many years, with the later volumes being completed whilst he resided in Bradford. This does not account for the pronounced differences in style, though, especially with the compilation of books five and six, which are collections of hymns and psalms. A full examination of the Leadley collection comes later in this work.

1.1.15 Technical Considerations

The staves of the manuscripts have rastrum-ruled staves. The pen was able to draw five lines at one stroke. This enabled a blank note-book to be purchased from a stationer and ruled accordingly. All these manuscripts contain errors of transcription, but some contain fewer than others. Errors in the placement of bar lines, note duration and key
signatures are the most frequently encountered. One may only speculate as to the reasons for errors. Haste, lack of concentration or lack of knowledge spring to mind, but for the most part these errors do not prove to be a great obstacle in the interpretation of the melodies as they are mostly of a minor nature. In *Campbell I*, the placement of melodies on a page is done with the best use of space as a consideration. Melodies are placed to avoid the need to turn pages during performance.

Pagination and melody numbering are features of the majority of the collections, and contents lists are often included by the compiler. In all instances, spellings and capitalisation of melody titles in this work follow those of the manuscript.

1.1.16  *Cultural Standing: High- and Low-Brow Contexts*

It is only within the last few decades of the twentieth century that the in-depth study of popular culture has gained full academic respectability. The huge quantities of money generated within the popular music industry have provided motivation for the establishment of centres for its study and dissemination. The International Centre for Music Studies at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne gained an international reputation under the leadership of Professor Richard Middleton. Middleton carried the mantle of musicologist Wilfrid Mellers, with his considerations of popular music, whilst integrating the popular cultural methods of analysis of the University of Birmingham and the Open University.

This example of a shift towards a broader musicology does not outweigh the emphasis placed on elitist musical forms such as opera in our educational establishments. Both Ireland and Scotland place weight on ‘traditional’ music as a valid avenue of research whilst the English tend to regard it more as an adjunct of a study of history or social studies. Harker states:
The serious study of ‘folksong’ has never won a firm institutional base in Britain, and this is remarkably contradictory, given the concept’s history and its overwhelmingly bourgeois character.\textsuperscript{48} Graded musical examinations in traditional music performance are now available in Ireland and Scotland, but England lags behind, with the stigma of amateurism still attached firmly to the study of folk music.

\textbf{1.1.17 Literature Review}

As stated, current thought on the vernacular music of the British Isles has challenged the whole concept of ‘folk’ song. In the 1980s Harker\textsuperscript{49} exposed the unstable foundations of folk music by demonstrating the impact of the print on the oral tradition and the fabrication of tradition from Herder via Sharp\textsuperscript{50} to Lloyd.\textsuperscript{51} Consequently, academics such as Vic Gammon have deviated from the stance of Sharp and Lloyd to accommodate Harker’s critique.\textsuperscript{52} This has led to a focus on style and interpretation. Gelbart’s \textit{The Invention of ‘Folk Music’ and ‘Art Music’} demonstrates a more apolitical stance toward notions of ‘folk’ and ‘traditional’ music.\textsuperscript{53} Gelbart’s in-depth analysis of the music traces the creation of the concept of the ‘folk song’ and the formation – or fabrication – of a musical ‘folk tradition’. He writes:

\begin{quote}
Eccentric claims about the specific origins for the whole of folk music corpuses have continued to arise occasionally, but these have generally been neutralized by the consensus path through
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{49} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{52} Gammon, Vic, \textit{Desire, Drink and Death in English Folk and Vernacular Song}, 1600–1900, Ashgate Publishing Ltd., Aldershot, 2008.
the centre, which rejects any such blanket claims as improvable, and steers attention back to “tradition”.54

Despite attempts by the likes of Harker to undermine majority opinion, the Sharpian/Darwinian, evolutionary view of folk music still prevails. For example, instrumentalists in the context of the Irish and Scottish Celtic music tradition and also within current revivalist practice in England seemingly continue to espouse the view of folk music as ‘organic’.

Barry Callaghan, another example stemming from a Darwinian-influenced school of thought, is compelled to propel the Hardcore English music into the social milieu in order to establish ‘folk’ credentials, to establish its ‘organic’ roots, despite acknowledging the composed sources of the music.

[T]his is the music that has arisen from the eighteenth century and early nineteenth-century Assemblies, the London and provincial theatres, the Victorian ballrooms, the itinerant dancing-masters, the farm festivals, the travellers’ campfires, the urban street corners, the drawing-rooms, the public houses, the village hops the countless weddings; and which now survives in rude health in pub and festival sessions, social dance and ceilidh parties, village hops, family celebrations and … weddings.55

The Romanticism of Grimm and Herder still prevails in Callaghan’s all-encompassing scenario. This idealised construction is based on bourgeois revivals and antiquarianism.

What was originally part of multifaceted mainstream culture now forms the repertoire

54 Ibid, p.190.
of a musical sub-group regurgitating melody. Callaghan, in his statement, places the music into an imaginary, organic melting pot and thereby reinforces the folk paradigm.

1.1.17.1 Key Scholars, Revival and the Limitations of Existing Scholarship

Interest in folk music spans the two hundred years since the term was first introduced into the language. Herder first used the term ‘Volkslied’ and, as Gelbart states, ‘Much of the German debate has hinged on the question of whether Herder created the concept itself, or just the name’.56 Herder’s notion of folk music was adopted by the English, and enthusiasm for folk song has seen, as Gammon puts it, ‘three great surges of interest in the last two hundred or so years’.57

The first ‘surge’, part of the Romantic Movement, was centred on text. Gammon cites ‘Ritson, Sir Walter Scott, Maidment, even Burns and John Clare’ as notable figures in this initial blossoming of interest in folk songs and ballads. The second ‘surge’ came toward the end of Victoria’s reign and ran into the first part of the twentieth century. The protagonists in this ‘revival’, as Gammon points out, were Lucy Broadwood, Sharp, Ralph Vaughan Williams and Frank Kidson. Sharp, with his *English Folk Song: Some Conclusions* (1907), paved the way for folk song scholarship in England. The third surge of interest came with the work of Lloyd, Alan Lomax, Ewan McColl and Hamish Henderson. As Gammon points out, this was ‘the most complicated revival of all, encompassing a wide range of motivations for involvement’.58

1.1.17.2 Revivalist/Traditionalist Stance

Much has been written concerning vernacular song – labelled either traditional or folk – over the last 150 years. This study focuses mainly on melody rather than song. The

---

58 Ibid, p.25.
analysis of folk dance melody is often regarded as an adjunct to the study of song. The conclusions reached in the analysis of folk song are conveniently transferred to the contents of manuscript collections. The accompanying myths and constructions follow accordingly. I maintain that the contents of these collections should be spared categorisation as ‘folk’ song (with all its surrounding mythologies) and seen in the broader context of musical history.

The categorisation of manuscript contents as folk song has led to an implied assumption that the original compilers of these collections were ‘folk’ or ‘traditional’ musicians. What is it that defines a traditional/folk musician or singer? As with other aspects of ‘folk’ encountered in this study, notions surrounding the concept of a traditional performer lend themselves to a wide range of interpretations. Although there are many instances of ‘song carriers’ and musicians with vast repertoires of country dance music, the idea of repertoires being handed down from one generation to another exclusively by oral/aural means is somewhat anachronistic for the period from which the manuscripts emerge; the printed music itself is evidence of printed transmission, which I will argue throughout this thesis was and is a widely used method for learning repertoire. Many players of traditional music were (mostly) musically literate and were able to access printed sources. These printed sources were the means by which melodies were acquired and learnt.

The Village Music Project, centred at the University of Salford, recognises the diversity of the contents of handwritten manuscripts, and the many roles of the compilers of these collections, yet it imposes, by implication, the pastoral myth of Merry England:

Often, musically literate musicians wrote down their tunes, songs, hymns, psalms and band parts in a single book which was easily carried along with their portable instrument. Some of
these surviving handwritten books date back to the eighteenth century. Some are devoted entirely to church music, some to secular music like the dance tunes of the day, and some are a rich mixture of all musics of their time.\textsuperscript{59}

The placing of such musicians within ‘the village’ is part of the mythology of the rural idyll and a constructed folk paradigm. The Village Music Project and similar endeavours, by means of retrospective synthesis, attempt to create an organic cultural utopia, one that never was. This attempted fabrication says more about the constructors than the actuality of vernacular music practice of the eighteenth century.

1.1.17.3 Interdisciplinary/Ideological Methodologies

Middleton defines three categories of ‘Folkloristic’\textsuperscript{60} analysts of traditional music:

1. Those ‘who subscribe to Seeger’s four musical types: “primitive” or “tribal”, “elite” or “art”, “folk” and “popular”’.\textsuperscript{61}

2. Those who define the music in “the cultural process [i.e. continuity and oral transmission] rather than abstract musical types”.\textsuperscript{62}

3. Those who “reject all rigid boundaries, preferring a conception simply of varying practice within one field, that of ‘music’”.\textsuperscript{63}

I consider the third of Middleton’s categories to be best fit for the approach taken in this thesis. Objectivity in assessing the stance of differing interpretations on ‘folk’, ‘vernacular’ or ‘traditional’ music is a necessary part of my deliberations.

\textsuperscript{61}Ibid, p.127.
\textsuperscript{62}Ibid, p.128.
\textsuperscript{63}Ibid, p.128.
The study of ‘folk’ music attracts political, sociological, geographic, economic and historical attention. The multi-disciplinary approach of current musicological analysis incorporates a vast range of analytic tools acquired from cultural ethnology, semiotics, psychology, etc. These enable interdisciplinary discourse. There has been a shift from the examination of empirical evidence to the epistemological validation of context and meaning. It is no longer sufficient simply to acquire data (in the case of this study, melodies); it is necessary to evaluate impact, relevance, context, etc. This is exemplified by David Hillery, who writes:

Since World War 2 scholarship has attempted to develop the study of ‘folk song’ from a position where the intent was to collect and preserve selected cultural items, shifting through to a more contextualised paradigm and finally to a position where the concern is an understanding of music as culture through personal embedment in the society under scrutiny.\(^{64}\)

As Hillery points out, the cultural value of music, with ties to locale, warrants attention from a sociological stance. It is important to question the existence of discernible and distinct musical characteristics associated with place. To this end, I attempt to differentiate between musical accent and musical dialect in my examination of regionalism.

1.1.17.4 Taxonomy

The cataloguing of the many works of J. S. Bach and Mozart has been carried out by Wolfgang Schmieder and Ludwig von Köchel, respectively. It would be useful for scholars and enthusiasts in the area of traditional music if the thousands of melodies that are considered to fall into this category were similarly catalogued and ordered.

There are drives towards this end, as indicated below, but any full and comprehensive cataloguing is an enormous task fraught with problems of copyright and finance.

A huge number of number collections of song and melody that may be placed under the umbrella of traditional or folk music have been published over the last two hundred years. Some fascinating publications of social dance music emanating from the British Isles have been printed. These revivalist collections date from the mid-nineteenth century and include the collections of George Petrie, Francis O’Neill, Frank Roche, James Kerr and many others. The list is long and still growing. Similarly, collections of folk songs and ballads have been published in their hundreds from the first half of the nineteenth century to the present day. The Child Ballads and their variants were the first to be identified by number, and the music to them was gathered together and published by Bertrand Bronson in the second half of the twentieth century. In the recently constructed *Roud Index*, Steve Roud lists and numbers folksongs from the British Isles; the index is available via the English Folk Dance and Song Society website. In listing the melodies collected by George Petrie in mid-eighteenth-century Ireland, David Cooper utilises Breandán Breathach’s numbering of melodies.

In 2000, Collette Maloney catalogued the manuscripts of Edward Bunting, the Irish music publisher, producing a useful volume of incipits (i.e., the first few bars of the pieces) with contextual analysis. Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin, in their *Sources of Irish Traditional Music C. 1600–1855*, and Barlow in *The Complete Country Dance Tunes from Playford’s Dancing Master* (1651–ca.1728), have likewise produced lists of incipits that have been utilised for tracing melodies in this study.

---

The Roud database contains the words of the first line of the song only, with no music. Pointers to published or recorded sources plus other data are given; copyright and ownership create problems with regard to making the full songs available via the database. There are over 170,000 entries, and the index is a record of the songs’ existence. The expansion of the World Wide Web has enabled Andrew Kuntz in America to gather together a collection of over 55,000 fiddle tunes. Kuntz deploys the ABC technique for the notation of the melodies, thus avoiding issues of copyright. This word-processed means of notation is easily posted on websites, as opposed to traditional notation, which is more time consuming. Kuntz’s database, The Fiddler’s Companion, is currently being expanded to include musical notation as the Traditional Tune Archive.67

Extracts from the musical manuscripts of Jane Austen have been published by Gammie and McCulloch as incipits, with the first few bars of each piece printed in traditional notation.68 Their index demonstrates clearly the impact of composed music on the formation of the manuscripts; they point out that ‘most of the music in Jane Austen’s historic collection came from printed sources of the day.’69 Austen’s musical manuscripts have attracted considerable interest from outside the field of musicology because of her standing as an authoress.

Charles Gore produced The Scottish Fiddle Music Index in 1994 and a comprehensive list of collections, composers and publishers of Scottish music in 2008.70 Gore recognizes the impact of technology on the printing of collections and hence their availability.71 It is computer technology that has facilitated the creation and interrogation of traditional music databases such as Gore’s. Gore’s database is available online via the

68 Gammie, Ian and Derek McCulloch, Incipits from the Manuscript Sources: Jane Austen’s Music, Corda Music Publications and Jane Austen Memorial Trust, St. Albans, 1996.
69 Ibid, 1996, p.3.
71 Ibid, preface.
Highland Music Trust website.\textsuperscript{72} The Scottish and Irish Celtic nationalistic gestalt perpetuates musical traditions as an intrinsic aspect of identity. Distinct national musical characteristics and traits have been moulded from common printed roots, many of song melodies, military and dance tunes emanating from England. Such regionalism is a feature of ethnomusicological study, and much has been written concerning the issue. Music may or may not have regional dialects, but the political, historical and sociological \textit{obiter dicta} mould majority opinion persuasively. Gore writes, “Traditions are the “DNA” of a nation’s culture”,\textsuperscript{73} whereas music is sound without any political and nationalist affiliations. The imposition of nationalism, patriotism and other symbolic significations onto music transforms sounds into cultural artefacts.

1.1.17.5 Authenticity

Our search for the authentic is seen by Charles Taylor as narcissistic, self-centred striving for a prelapsarian utopia:

We have lost contact with the earth and its rhythms that our ancestors had. We have lost contact with ourselves, and our own natural being, and are driven by an imperative of domination that condemns us to ceaseless battle against nature within and around us…. It is present in our culture today in a number of forms. It goes along, for instance, with an admiration for the life of pre-industrial peoples, and often with a political position of defence of aboriginal societies against the encroachment of industrial civilisation.\textsuperscript{74}

\textsuperscript{73} Ibid, p.1.
Gelbart concurs with Taylor’s identification of the basic human desire for the autochthonous and pastoral, and he goes further in recognising this as a motivation for representations of the simple life in expressive art. He states:

At the root of both poetic and musical pastoral lay the desire to treat humanity’s general place in nature by examining humans in their ‘simplest’ state. ‘Simple’ here does not necessarily imply ‘primitive’… Rather … [it] indicates what is idealized, least encumbered by corollaries, and thus most heuristically elegant.  

This aesthetic goal is distinct from political motivations, which were a feature of much of the interest in ‘folk’ during the twentieth century. This revivalist movement contained elements of the attraction of nature and the simple life, but its main concern was the establishment of an idealised proletarian culture. Sharp was a Fabian Socialist and Lloyd a committed Marxist. This is not to say there was no interest in the revival of folk music and dance from the political right. Georgina Boyes draws attention to the right-wing sympathies of Rolf Gardiner, the moving force behind the establishment of the Morris Ring in the 1930s. She states:

Gardiner was an activist whose call to youth to challenge and revolutionise moribund institutions was characteristic of the 1930s. Equally typical was his association with politics – firstly with Guild Socialism and then rapidly, through his interests as a Germanist, with Fascism.

There was a polarisation of political ideologies in the years preceding World War Two. During this period the two protagonists of the ‘second’ revival of folk music, Lloyd and

McColl, crystallised their socialist political philosophies. Gammon calls for more work to be carried out with regard to interest in, reception of and performance of both folk song and dance during this ‘fascinating period’.77

We have then the back-drop for the ‘invention’ of folk music and the associated justifications of authenticity and validity. The separation of ‘folk’ from art music and military music is an essential element in the construction of a distinct genre. This thesis draws attention to the unstable boundaries of genre construction and the interdependence of genres during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Traditional dance music and folk songs are often analysed as a single aspect of culture. Although they are very similar, however, they are separate entities in that traditional singers are not generally as reliant on written music as instrumentalists. Furthermore, social dance music often appears to be on a continuum with classical music; there seems to be a symbiotic co-dependence, a two-way interplay, between music of the two categories. The fact that folk song is orally transmitted sometimes leads to its disparagement by musical elitists, so treatment of folk song as distinct from social dance is at times required. Nostalgic antiquarianism often motivates interest in traditional music, and its deceptive simplicity of form has attracted derisory comment emanating from high-brow musical circles. Gammon cites Constant Lambert (1933) and Adrian Mourby (1997) as exemplifying negative attitudes towards folk song. He states:

It is interesting to ask why these attitudes, which amount to nothing more than a form of cultural self-hatred, are so prevalent, why the English so particularly revel in such patronising and sneering views? They become important when

---

we enter the highly political field of the allocation of resources.\textsuperscript{78}

The allocation of funding hits a nerve that provokes Gammon’s 2003 comment; he earlier draws attention to the low status of traditional music amongst academic staff at universities and the vast sums of money allocated to maintain operatic performance in this country. As with jazz, traditional music is beginning to gain a foothold and a degree of respectability in the academy, but it appears that traditional music remains largely a musical backwater.

2 Chapter Two: Musical Identity, Key Themes and Present Day Contexts

2.1 Musical Identity: Regionalism, Nationalism and Racism

Current debate on these politically charged issues is comprised of a multitude of opinions and views, with much agenda-driven conjecture. In the constituent parts of the British Isles, distinct musical characteristics and regional styles have become increasingly important aspects of the folk music enthusiasts’ and revivalists’ agenda. There appears to be a need in the human psyche to identify manifestations of regional, national and racial identity in music. Issues concerning regional and national musical identity form an integral element of the contents of the manuscripts under consideration. Rather than emphasising differences, the manuscripts display the drives towards the unity of the constituent parts of the United Kingdom and commonality of musical sources.

\textsuperscript{78} Ibid, p.23.
2.1.1 Regionalism

The French commercial practice of associating food and drink produce with *Terroir* corresponds significantly to the ways in which regionalism is often applied to traditional folk music’s stylistic traits and formation. *Terroir* is the basis for the restrictive trade practice, appellation d’origine contrôlée, which grew up in France during the twentieth century. This rigid classification system maintains that *Terroir* (i.e., the earth, climate, the whole environment from which a product emanates) imposes unique qualities and features on a given product’s makeup. For example, wine character and quality is determined by the chemical structure of the soil in which the vine grows, along with the climate, etc. The extent to which the concept of appellation contrôlée is a fabrication, a marketing ploy devised to stifle competition, is debatable. Whatever the case, in France the accumulated community gestalt is so powerful that dissent challenging the validity of the impact of *terroir* on the appellation product is regarded as highly objectionable. Indeed, the law is often used to uphold the legitimacy of *Terroir*. (In Europe, sparkling wine can only be called champagne if it is actually from the Champagne region.) The Académie Française likewise exercises rigid control over the French language in an attempt to maintain the ‘purity’ of the language and combat any encroachment of American/English usage. Essentially, the protectionism exercised by the Académie Française is one of the several means by which national identity and individuality are maintained. The construction of musical identity likewise reinforces national patriotic identity.

Academics, enthusiasts and exponents of traditional music in the Republic of Ireland are similarly committed to creating an association of music with regional identity. The popular, regionalist view of music in Ireland is exemplified by Paul Dromey: ‘The evolution of traditional Irish music can … be viewed as a series of
interconnected stylistic lineages, traceable to different locales and master players within those locales. The creation of a distinct national musical identity has been the raison d’être of Comhaltas Ceoltóirí Éireann, the Irish cultural and musical association, since its inception in 1951. The emphasis on the identification of distinct regional musical styles in Ireland increased towards the end of the twentieth century. Similar associations of music with locale are prevalent among current traditional music revivalists throughout the British Isles.

The theory of cultural area (Kulturkreislehre) was applied to folk music in Germany by Werner Danckert and Albrecht Schneider, linking style with ‘history and ethnology’. Ethnomusicologists often regard the ‘sense of place’ and ‘cultural core’ associated with folk music as an aspect of musical nationalism. This association of music with terroir has become tenuous, however, with the changes brought about by modernity, especially in Western Europe. As Philip Bohlman puts it:

Folk music has not … diminished in its symbolic role of distilling and representing a community’s social basis; rather, it has responded to a changing social basis by changing itself, absorbing different repertories, and reflecting a stylistic congeries.

During the twentieth century, British communities became increasingly subject to the onslaught of commoditised music delivered by cinema, television, and recordings. Historically, the influence of stylistic fashions from art music on vernacular music is marked in the British Isles. There exists, in the manuscripts examined in this study, a reflection of changing fashions and styles between art music and popular music. This

---

81 Ibid, p.56.
82 Ibid, p.57.
exchange of material and interpretation is two-way. The manuscript collections form an interface between the high and low brow, containing elements of each. They are a reflection of society rather than place. Music is a human creation not a product of the soil. It has social bases and is also a mobile entity. In considering Western European music, what is striking is the commonality of form, technical makeup and rendition among music from different countries.

Such uniformity of form is contrary to popular and ethnomusicological expectations. The folk music of the British Isles and Ireland demonstrates homogeneity and sameness with a few striking exceptions (e.g., Northumberland). Lloyd, whose writing in 1966 is still pertinent today, pointed out the consistency of style and form in English music, with highly developed transport and communication accounting for the uniformity.

In some countries, the folk music is in clearly marked regional styles so that passing from one district to another is almost like crossing the frontier into a foreign land, so different are the musics. That's usually a sign of isolation, of poor communication between one area and another. Not so with England. For centuries our roads have been too good, our population too mobile for the best folk songs to stay at home.\(^83\)

The mobility of the population and the cultural interdependence that Lloyd highlights hold true for much of the manuscript evidence considered in this work. The influence of large urban centres on the provincial and rural music is demonstrated in published works, especially with the dissemination of dance and military music. Nonetheless, a historical association exists whereby songs are linked to specific areas. This may be traced back to the systematic attempt by collectors such as Sharp to retrieve folk song

from extinction, which was a major motivation for those involved in the Edwardian revival.

The revivalists’ association of folk with place took a variety of forms around the turn of the century. The counties from which folk songs were collected during the late Victorian and Edwardian revival of folk song are noted, along with their tunes and lyrics, in the *Journals of the Folk Song Society*, the collectors worked within their chosen locales, for example, Sharp in Somerset, Kidson in Yorkshire, Grainger in Lincolnshire and Baring-Gould in the West Country. The association of folk song with place is also exemplified by the publication of Broadwood and John Fuller Maitland’s *English County Songs* of 1893. At this early stage of the folk song revival, Broadwood and Maitland recognised the homogeneity and consistency of English folk songs, stating: ‘In no case is it asserted that a particular song is the exclusive property of a particular county, nor is it possible from internal evidence to assign any tune to any one county’.84 Whilst recognising the ‘peculiarities of cadences, modulations and the like’ in songs, the editors sidestep any attempt at rigorous analysis by stating: ‘This book does not profess to be a scientific treatise on such points’.85 Similar disclaimers are often employed in folk song commentary. For example, at the outset of his *Folk Song in England*, Lloyd employs the opt-out clause: ‘This is a book for beginners not specialists’.86 Not all analysts of folk music have expertise in music, with many coming from a background in history, literature, sociology, etc.

Others, though, have a background specifically in music. Percy Grainger, a pianist, composer and musicologist, applied a rigorous approach in the notating of folk song with the aid of a ‘Standard’ Edison-Bell Phonograph. His findings and observations were published in ‘Collecting with the Phonograph’, which was published

---

85 Ibid, p.iii.
in the *Journal of the Folk Song Society*, May 1908.\(^7\) (Béla Vikár had demonstrated the use of the phonograph in song collection at the *Congrès International de Musique* in Paris in 1900).\(^8\) By means of Phonograph recordings, Grainger was able to detect the subtle nuances used by the performer in the rendition of the song, i.e., use of decorations, changes in pitch or the deployment of *rubato*. Frank Kidson, a Leeds-based antiquarian, was the first amongst the folk collectors to recognize the influence of print on the formation of the folk song canon.\(^9\)

In my approach to the manuscripts examined in this thesis, I build on the strengths of these existing methodologies, using a scientific approach informed by a rigorous examination of printed sources. The case studies in this work demonstrate the value of investing the time and resources into the objective analysis of this aspect of ethnomusicology.

When one looks at the association of folk music with place using rigorous analysis, one finds that actually the music of the British Isles is more homogenous than different. A specific example of homogeneity across regions is to be found in Alfred Williams’s essay regarding the songs of the Upper Thames, which demonstrates the changeable makeup of songs and their adaptability to specific locations. Williams, in his essay of 1924, recognises that the songs from the Upper Thames were mostly brought into the area from urban centres:

> [H]ardly any of any of them are local. Songs are often claimed for this or that locality, but if you should make careful inquires

\(^7\) Grainger, Percy Aldridge, ‘Collecting with the Phonograph’, *Journal of the Folk-Song Society*, III/iii No. 12, May 1908, reprinted Balough, Teresa, compiled with commentary, *Percy Aldridge Grainger, A Musical Genius from Australia: Selected Writings by and about Percy Grainger*, University of Western Australia, Nedlands, 6907, 1997.


you would find that the evidence upon which the claim is based is invalid. The mention of a place-name in a song or ballad is by some taken as a certain sign that it is a local piece. But very often the evidence is absolutely untrustworthy. The song will usually admit of almost any name being used. The professional ballad-singer, passing from town to town, substituted a fresh name to fit the locality. It helped the song to “catch on,” and served to sell their sheets.\(^{90}\)

He goes on to speculate that the broadside ballad hawkers were part of a distribution chain emanating from urban centres rather than the songs being generated in a rural setting: “There appears to have been a school of … ballad-writers, very well trained to their work, and admirably informed as to the best means of captivating the ear of the public. No doubt the work was remunerative.”\(^{91}\) This implied professionalism of the song and ballad composers is in line with the main tenets of this thesis, which argues that many of the manuscripts under consideration here were created by trained, paid musicians.

Despite the homogeneity of music from across the British Isles, printed music collections are often based on place. An example of a collection based on region may be found in the composed, printed sources found in *Folk Songs of the Upper Thames*. Williams includes in his collection a song called ‘In the Days we went a-Gipsying’, stating that it was sung by ‘travelling navvies and drovers’.\(^{92}\) The melody is to be found in Vol. II (#23) of Lawrence Leadley’s manuscript collection (c. 1840) from Helperby, North Yorkshire.

---

\(^{90}\) Williams, Alfred, *Folk Songs of the Upper Thames: With an Essay on Folk-song Activity in the Upper Thames Neighbourhood*, Duckworth, 1923, p.11.

\(^{91}\) Ibid, p.12.

\(^{92}\) Ibid, p .69.
Contrary to Williams’s suggestion, the piece is a drawing-room ballad. The music to this piece was composed by Nathan James Sporle (1812–1853). The lyrics were written by H. Edward Ransford, and it was published by J. Keegan, London. Its inclusion in the Leadley manuscript collection illustrates the adoption and adaptation of song melody into the military and dance music canons, exemplifying both a shift in the role of the piece and its wide geographical dissemination. Other sources also illustrate the song’s association with a particular place, its world-wide distribution and its popularity. Romantic notions of Romany life must have captivated the imaginations of those experiencing change and turmoil in the second half of the eighteenth century in both industrial and rural settings. A copy of this drawing-room ballad is housed in the Library of Congress sheet music collection, an arrangement by Joseph Knight published in New York (1839). The Library of Congress descriptor for the collection that contains the piece is *Music for a Nation: American Sheet Music, 1820–1860*, which claims the song as part of American national musical heritage.

---

The song’s vernacular adoption masks its drawing-room provenance. A couplet from the song is quoted by Charlotte Brontë in the first chapter of *Jane Eyre*, and the music was adopted by the North Staffordshire, Prince of Wales’s Regiment, as its regimental march. Such deployments demonstrate the proliferation and popularity of both the words and the music. The genesis of the piece is known and its performance widespread; the song has no particular association with the Upper Thames Valley. It is one of many pieces emanating from composed sources within the vernacular canon.

Another feature often associated with regional music—at times problematically—is dialect. Williams, considering the use of dialect in song lyrics, points out that the written use of dialect is an urban, middle-class pursuit:

> The villagers speak in dialect, but they do not care to read it. They are shocked and offended to see their own language written. The townspeople do not speak dialect, but like to read it. There is a difference. Clearly … our dialect, as we know it, was written by outsiders, not be those who spoke it. And that is
why so very few of the regular folk-songs survive in dialect form.\textsuperscript{94}

The contents of the collection \textit{Folk Songs of the Upper Thames} display clearly a canon of music shared with other districts of England. Harker describes Williams as an ‘unalloyed reactionary\textsuperscript{95}’ pandering to bourgeois standards and tastes in his writing, but he nonetheless recognises Williams’s contribution to the understanding of folk culture.\textsuperscript{96} The essay by Williams is based on participatory observation and practical experience, and it forms a valid commentary on rural culture and song performance in the Upper Thames Valley.

Regional approaches have been particularly embraced in studies of Scotland and Ireland because of the role of music in the formation of national identity there. Celtic music exemplifies nationalist striving for identity and distinctiveness. With the establishment of the Irish Free State and the ever increasing independence of both Scotland and Wales, the twentieth century saw the creation of a distinct Celtic musical identity. Bohlman comments provocatively on its revival and construction:

Those who inhabit Celtic lands … have forgotten their culture or at the very least, attempts to remember the culture through the language have largely failed.… To stem the ineluctable pull of forgetting, promoters of Celtic identity have mustered a wide variety of musical practices.… A tradition of instrumental music has been moulded into an instrumentarium with harps


\textsuperscript{96} Ibid, p.211.
and bagpipes, both of which had been almost entirely forgotten by the beginning of the nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{97}

I have pointed out elsewhere the common sources of the music of the British Isles, yet musicians and audiences continue to desire regional musical dialects; this is an essential aspect of nationalism. Distinct national musical characteristics do exist: the Scotch snap, for example. The Scotch snap is essentially the Lombard rhythm employed by Bach and Vivaldi in the Baroque; it was introduced during the seventeenth century. In Scotland this period is called ‘the Scottish Baroque’, claiming a discrete genre and separate musicality for the nation – essentially it is a melange of dance and mainstream concert music. ‘The Baroque in Scotland’ might therefore be a more precise descriptor.

George Emmerson attempts to pinpoint musical characteristics particular to Scottish music in his history of Scottish dance music, as he describes it ‘the Scottish idiom’.\textsuperscript{98} His observations are based on those of Alexander Malcolm (1721) and Finlay Dun (c.1860). The features of Scottish music Dun draws attention to appear vague and nebulous. For example, he notes ‘[a]lterations of the major with its relative minor; the melody moving to and from these keys to the exclusion of every other, and not at regular distances’.\textsuperscript{99} The same attributes might be exhibited by popular songs from the second half of the twentieth century. The characteristics highlighted by Emmerson form a convoluted, wordy case containing little concrete evidence with the exception of the citation of melody titles.

Contrary to Emmerson’s observations and in keeping with Bohlman’s comments above, bagpipes were revived as part of a nationalist agenda.


Cannon highlights the revivalist influence of the Highland Society of London on the encouragement of highland pipe playing.

By the 1770s there was concern that bagpipe playing was in danger of extinction, and it was this belief that led to the formation, in 1778, of the Highland Society of London, a body of gentlemen who incorporated themselves with various objects connected with the Highland way of life but especially with preserving the Gaelic language, customs, and music.\(^\text{100}\)

The mythology surrounding the highland bagpipe and its music is a complex fabrication, a mesh of falsehood and truth in which the actuality is difficult to establish or validate. What is relevant to this study is the impact of the war-pipes on the music of Scotland. As with the Northumbrian small-pipes (see below) and the uilleann in Ireland, the technical peculiarities of war-pipes engender distinct features into the music they play. With no means by which to silence the chanter throughout the duration of a melody, fingering techniques are deployed to compensate for repeated notes, phrasing, etc. It is this feature of the instrument that has nurtured and perpetuated the Scottish snap. Many musical characteristics often thought of as regional are actually technically determined by the peculiarities of instruments.

The determination on the part of the performers and analysts of traditional music to create regional styles is especially evident in the case of Ireland, where the styles of Sligo, Kerry, Donegal, etc. are seen as distinct traditions. There is little firm evidence to support this construction. For example, the playing style of the doyen of Sligo fiddling, Michael Coleman (1891–1945), owes as much to the music of the New York swing era and the dancing of the foxtrot as it does the music of Ireland.

Coleman’s recordings and technique were the standard to which fiddlers throughout Ireland aspired with their rapid triplets and syncopated rhythms.

Gammon concurs with the fixing of style to place, or as he terms it *habitus*, but he also recognizes the importance of performer competence. Of *habitus*, he writes:

A style is a set of elements which cohere into a way of doing things musically (we could call it a musical *habitus*, to borrow an idea from Bourdieu.) It exists as a set of inter-subjective notions and a related set of musical practices belonging to a social or cultural group. (Style has elements in common with such things as craft methods or accent and dialect in language.)\(^{101}\)

I maintain that dialect and accent when applied to music are distinct features. Musical accent is interpretation and idiosyncratic rendition whereas musical dialect involves distinctive technical features of the music’s structure and configuration. Gammon acknowledges that some individual performances may well be attributed to the competence of the player or singer to interpret the music.

All kinds of music have practitioners of different levels of competence. Competence can be defined as the ability to manage voice or instrument to execute the particular stylistic norms of a particular kind of music.\(^{102}\)

Individual performers can have a profound impact on people’s perceptions of the music of a region as a result of their outstanding ability.

The whole area of ‘folk style’ is ridden with conjecture, much of which is founded on scant or non-academic evidence. Debates concerning the styles of fiddle

---


\(^{102}\) Ibid, para.14.
playing during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries can only be based on the evidence of printed music and manuscript collections, which point towards the playing standards of the concert platform as an aspirational goal. During the twentieth century, with the development in recording technology, it has been made possible to subject folk performances to analysis of stylistic interpretation. There were many more field recordings made of singers than of instrumentalists during the first half of the twentieth century. However, the commercial recordings of Tom Clough, James Scott Skinner, Michael Coleman and others give us some idea of the stylistic norms of the time.

The only county in England that has definable, distinct, traits in its folk music is Northumberland. Tom Gilfellon and Lloyd comment that the ‘North-eastern musical tradition … is unlike any other in the world’. Its peculiar features are derived from the unique technical features of the Northumbrian smallpipes. The style of staccato playing on the Northumbrian pipers, ‘popping peas’, as piper Colin Caisley described the notes, is made possible by the end of the chanter being closed, enabling it to be silenced. This feature of the instrument has been much demanded and emphasised by judges of competition playing. However, exponents of the instrument, like Billy Pigg (1902–1968) would also incorporate open fingering in their playing technique; therefore, other techniques and modes of playing were acceptable. The staccato feature of the Northumbrian smallpipes has been adopted as ‘Northumbrian style’ on other instruments, most noticeably the fiddle and concertina. I suggest that adoption of this stylistic trait this is a recent fabrication. One only has to listen to the violin of Jack Thompson of the Cheviot Ranters to realise that the portamento and vibrato features in his playing owe much to the playing style of Fritz Kreisler, not to the possible staccato-playing capabilities of the Northumbrian smallpipe chanter. Nibs Mathews, writing in 1971, says the Cheviot Ranters are:

Arguably the most distinguished and ‘authentic’ of English folk dance bands… Folk musicians of enormous practical experience in the handling of traditional tunes for dancing, the group offers a reliable presentation of the style, form and tempo proper to the English community dance.\textsuperscript{104}

This extract claims the Cheviot Ranters as exponents of English community dance. However, the format and style of both Irish and Scottish bands of the time was the same as that the Ranters. Their repertoire was based on the ceili band genre of the mid-twentieth century, but Jack Thompson’s playing style also demonstrates the influence of the ‘classical’ orchestral tradition.

Another feature of the Northumbrian smallpipes that has led to melodic characteristics often cited as evidence of ‘place’ in Northumbrian music is the restricted range of the chanter. Recently extended-range chanters have become more readily available. The restricted compass of the chanter has resulted in features of both song and dance tunes that seek to circumvent the constraint by compensatory melodic adjustments. Lloyd writes:

Odd, difficult and delectable such tunes are, with their seesawing sixths and octaves and what has been called their “dongdonging” between tonic and supertonic chords … present in scores of melodies of the Northeast…. In many a pipe-tune a forgotten song is hidden, its original shape masked by odd leaps and curious chord-shifts due to questions of fingering or peculiarities of bagpipe construction.\textsuperscript{105}

There exist, as a result of the influence of the peculiar technical features of the Northumbrian smallpipe chanter, songs that display these odd leaps in their melodies. In ‘Fill the Tankard Hinny’,\textsuperscript{106} the opening bar demonstrates a characteristic Northumbrian smallpipe chanter leap of a major seventh, testing the vocal expertise of the singer.

![Sheet music for Fill the Tankard Hinny](image)

Lloyd makes much of the distinct features of Northumbrian music, citing ‘Bony at Morn’ and ‘“Shew’s the way to Wallington”, with its nimble leaps and its profusion of augmented fourths’, as striking examples.\textsuperscript{107} He goes on to relate the experience encountered by Newcastle-born William Whittaker (1876–1944), who was principal of the Scottish National Academy of Music and Professor of Music at the University of Glasgow:

Whittaker tells of a German musician when confronted with the latter song ['Shew’s the way to Wallington'], who asked incredulously: “Do you really tell me that the peasants in your district sing these songs?” Whittaker asked him why he doubted it. The German answered: “If your peasants can sing such

\textsuperscript{106} Polwarth, Gwen Marchant, \textit{Folk Songs of Northumberland}, Oriel Press, Newcastle upon Tyne, 1967, p.22.

songs they must be the most musical race in the world.”

Whittaker’s reply was: “Who told you they weren’t?”

Such anecdotal evidence is fodder for myth-making, and besides being a somewhat amusing recollection, it has a disturbing racial base. The Germans appear to have had a particular interest in the music of Northumberland; in 1929, Frank Howes led a group of ‘folk’ singers to perform in The Hague and Cologne. Included amongst the group of singers was Northumbrian piper Tom Clough. Clough’s presence, as Howes points out, ‘was specified by name in the original invitation’. The Weimar Republic, from which the Third Reich emerged, purported to maintain German superiority in all aspects of human endeavour, including music. (Perhaps the music Clough performed and that of Northumberland challenged this delusion.)

As this section of the chapter has explored, scholars and enthusiasts of folk music often place great emphasis on regionalism. They use regionalism as a grid on which to place the music, to map music, and it becomes an end in itself. As I have shown, however, for the British Isles, regionalism is not the most useful framework; a strictly regional approach to folk music overlooks important common features across regions.

2.1.2 Nationalism and Racism

Nationalism, ethnicity and racism are important aspects of musical identity, and an examination of their implications for traditional music is relevant to this study. Bohlman extends national and regional musical considerations to include aspects of ethnicity and race in his essay on *Music, Race, and the End of History in Modern Europe*, demonstrating that they are inextricably linked to musical identity. He points out that in Germany a

series of song collections, the *Landschaftliche Volkslieder*, were published with a view to demonstrating the geographical extent of German culture.

Each volume would represent a single place … a single landscape, with its distinct musical map. Though initiated in the wake of World War I, the volumes of *Landschaftliche Volkslieder* continued to appear until 1971, reaching a total of 43 volumes. The history of this mapping of German culture … intersected with the most dramatic and devastating periods of twentieth-century European history, indeed musically representing that history.…. The individual volumes of the landscape projects mobilized German history through complex representational practices. The songs appear on the pages as if taken from the past, but the illustrations and arrangements deliberately recontextualize them for the future.¹¹⁰

These songs, as part of German identity, were thus utilised to bolster the ideology of the Third Reich. ‘Guitar Playing Hans’ (below) was welcome throughout the many German-speaking lands of Europe. The heroic, sword-wielding, conqueror image presents a stark contrast to guitar carrying Hans.

Above is the front cover and a depiction of a German Warrior from the publication of Der Zupfgeigenhansl, this copy printed by Friedrich Hofmeister, Leipzig, 1916. The volume formed part of the esprit de corps of German youth organisations. Such deployment of song is reminiscent of Dibdin’s patriotic songs from the Napoleonic Wars contained in Campbell I.

The Zupfgeigenhansl collection of German folk songs is associated particularly with the Wandervogel youth movement. It was originally published in 1908. The flag-waving, jingoistic deployment of music is utilised to intoxicate the mind into nationalistic fervour; a sense of identity and place are regarded as essential elements of the collection’s makeup. These volumes contain a more subtle attachment to the Fatherland, evoking patriotism.

The folk song revival of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century in Britain may be considered as an adjunct or an offshoot of musically based nationalism. In the British Isles national song collections towards the latter part of the nineteenth century became increasingly focused on the constituent parts of the Kingdom. A series published by Boosey and Co. (London and New York) from the 1870s onward includes separate volumes for The Songs of England (3 volumes), Scotland, Wales and Ireland, plus a volume of Manx National Songs. The unity of the constituent parts of the British Isles is
illustrated by Harold Boulton and Arthur Somervell's, *Songs of the Four Nations*. This impressive volume of ‘national’ songs contains many lyrics of ‘unknown’ origin and displays late Victorian moves towards the folk song revival heralded by Frank Kidson, Baring-Gould and Lucy Broadwood.

Boulton also edited the two volume compilation of Scottish songs with arrangements by Malcolm Lawson, *Songs of the North*, with songs available separately. Referring to Scotland as the North emphasised the unity of the kingdom, and the collection’s dedication to ‘Her Majesty, The Queen’ pandered to Victoria’s passion for Scottish culture. A similar compilation was *British Minstrelsy: A Representative Collection of the Songs of the Four Nations*, which comprised four volumes with arrangements by Joseph Parry, John Greig, F. W. Bussell, H. Fleetwood Sheppard and W. H. Hopkinson. All of these collections of national songs are set to piano accompaniment, as were the majority of the compilations of folk songs that were soon to follow. Notably, Baring-Gould’s *Songs and Ballads of the West* (1889–91) established the format for subsequent collectors to

---

follow. Two significant exceptions are John Collingwood Bruce and John Stokoe’s *The Northumbrian Minstrelsy* and Kidson’s *Traditional Tunes*, which were both published with words and melody only.

The English folk song movement’s protagonist, Cecil Sharp, rejected composed national songs, such as Dibdin’s *Tom Bowling*, making the case in his *English Folk Song: Some Conclusions*, first published 1907, that only ‘authentic’ folk song should be taught in schools. His bowdlerised *Folk Songs for Schools*, published with the assistance of Baring-Gould, were to be inflicted on English school children for the next 60 years.

In the second half of the twentieth century, as part of the revival of the traditional music of the British Isles, McColl pronounced that singers should perform the songs from their own locales. This was a reaction against American hegemony in folk music, its commercial encroachment into popular music and commodification.

[McColl] became concerned that British traditional music was being swamped by American styles. He therefore introduced his controversial ‘policy rule’ – singers had to perform songs from their own tradition, depending on whether they were British or American.113

Ironically, the British National Party, at the outset of the twenty-first century, claimed British traditional music as part of its political agenda, provoking the establishment of the *Folk Against Fascism* movement amongst performing revivalist folk musicians.114 The adoption by the extreme Right of the musical traditions of the British Isles would have been an anathema to McColl, who ‘never deviated from his staunch left-wing views’.115

---

The rightful inclusion of the music from immigrant communities as an integral element of the traditions of the United Kingdom by performers such as *The Imagined Village* has highlighted the diverse and ever-changing nature of the music of these isles.

The incident with the British National Party was by no means the first case of folk music being used to racist ends. Racism rears its ugly head in the original context of the ballad, collected by Sharp and others, ‘Sir Hugh of Lincoln’ (Child: 155). Similar stories were used to incite pogroms against the Jews as early as 1144. Reginald Nettel relates the story surrounding Hugh of Lincoln:

> His death was made a reason for a pogrom. Many Jews were arrested, some executed, many tortured, and the whole Jewish community forced to pay an enormous sum to obtain the release of their compatriots from prison.

We have here an example of song being deployed to reinforce racial victimisation. What is striking is that such a ballad should survive to be commented on in the twentieth century. An example of the piece may be found in Bronson’s *Traditional Tunes of the Child Ballads*. A pertinent extract is as follows:

> The first that came out was a Jew’s daughter,
> Was dressèd all in green;
> “Come in, come in my little Sir Hugh
> To have your ball again”

> “I cannot come there, I will not come there,
> Without my playmates all,
> For I know full well my mother dear

---

118 Ibid, p.68.
“Twill cause my blood to fall”.

The first she offered him was a fig,
The next a finer thing;
The third a cherry as red as blood,
Which tolled the young thing in.

She sat him on a gilty chair;
She gave him sugar sweet;
She laid him on a dresser board,
And stabbed him like a sheep.\(^{119}\)

The whole incident is thought now to be a malicious fabrication and the song a remnant of racist persecution. Folk song and music give us a perspective on historical events, movements, personalities, etc. that do not always concur with current understanding. They are of their time, and they give, as in this case, a disturbing reminder of the possibility for unsavoury implementations of music and song.

In contrast, McColl cites the song ‘The Colour-bar Strike’ as an attempt to sway opinion away from racism. The song was written ‘in the folk idiom’ by Charlie Mayo, a fireman on a steam locomotive at Kings Cross, London.\(^{120}\) In 1957 the workers in the locomotive shed went on strike in order to bar coloured workers. The National Union of Railwaymen refused to back the strike, and the ‘colour-bar’ failed.

The shunters broke the grip one day,
The Kings Cross goods-yard when on strike;
Not in a fight for better pay,
But a coloured man they did not like.

They didn’t like that coloured man,
They wouldn’t work with him they said;
In truth it touched their overtime
And so to a colour bar it led.

…

Jim Figgins [N.U.R.] said: “Get back to work,
This is a strike we’ll not support
This is the kind of prejudice,
The unions have always fought.”

…

Man, don’t let smoke get in your eyes!
Kindle that flame and keep it bright;
To proud traditions still be true
And make those joined hands black and white.121

I sense the pen of McColl in these verses. It emanates from the era of the protest song and civil rights campaigning in the United States. The piece is in line with the social commentary songs of Woody Guthrie and early Bob Dylan, i.e., written with the intent of changing public and government opinions and policy. Both ‘The Colour-bar Strike’ and ‘Sir Hugh of Lincoln’ demonstrate the active nature of folk song – of songs as tools of political and social leverage, redolent of their eras and offering insight into both conflict and emotion.

121 Ibid, p.40.
2.1.3 Musical Identity: Conclusion

Evidence of ownership and identity in music and the emblematic deployment of music abound in the manuscripts considered in this thesis. Unlike printed sources, the manuscripts considered here demonstrate the practical deployment and selection of repertoire. They reflect or reject the political, social, religious and economic influence of the times from which they emanate.

There are regional musical differences among the component parts of the British Isles; however, there are also common features that align British music with the European tradition. I have shown in this chapter that there exists an innate human need to identify with and possess music; music forms a focus of group cohesion. The social and political adoption of music is inextricably linked to space – hence the concatenation of music and terroir with the pitfalls of an over-simplistic mapping of styles to specific areas. The actuality of the interplay between music and identity is complex, a multifaceted linkage of interpretive styles, repertoires, space and music’s social bases. The relationship between these factors is by its very nature in a constant state of flux. Historically, the homogeneity of the music within the British Isles is seldom emphasised. A large proportion of folksong and music collections are based on specific locales, leading to assumptions concerning verifiable localised musical traits.

Music and song are often deployed to reinforce national identity. They have been associated with the emblematic representation of patriotism, especially in martial contexts, for centuries. (One has only to consider the fifteenth-century ‘Agincourt Carol’ to realise the longevity of this association.) The contents of the manuscripts examined in this study exemplify the exploitative use of music in the promotion of militaristic esprit de corps, along with incitement to battle purveyed in the guise of bravery, courage and gallantry.
The deployment of music for both racist subjugation and the promotion of equality are evident within the field of traditional music. Early twentieth-century collectors operated within a society that upheld a much less enlightened attitude towards race than exists today. Examples of racial stereotyping and underlying prejudice form the basis, as Bohlman has shown us, for much of the ethnomusicological work done in Europe, especially during the first half of the last century. The socio-political climate is much changed, but prejudice and discrimination still abide within traditional and folk music.

Class is a more useful tool of analysis than regionalism in the consideration of traditional and folk music. This study uses a class-based model of society, including Marxist distinctions between the proletariat; the bourgeois, middle classes; and an upper-class elite. ‘High-’ and ‘low-brow culture’ are often vague, subjective descriptors. The permeability of class barriers is exposed in this chapter, as is the ability of some music to gain acceptability across social divides. Pieces such as *The Old Arcadia*\(^{122}\) and the idyll portrayed in *The Hidden Ireland*\(^{123}\) are escapist fabrications, nothing more than a constructed, bucolic myth. The desire for a pastoral idyll is near universal.

Song and melody books – ‘coffins’, as Michael Pickering refers to them\(^{124}\) – can only convey a taste of the full diversity and extent of the social bases from which they emanate. Handwritten musical manuscripts offer the opportunity to investigate the music of particular individuals and to focus on the pieces selected by them for their audiences, thereby giving a participatory credence to analysis. The reconstruction of past actuality is a non-achievable goal, but the manuscripts provide a more realistic


sense of music in its time than printed collections or other historical records, a tangible link to music as a lived experience.

2.2 Key Themes

2.2.1 Style and the Redeployment of Melody and Its Consequences

There has been a shift away from epistemological, retrospective analysis of vernacular music to a focus on style, performance technique and the use of space. These are now major concerns of the analysts of traditional music today. Gammon, in his critical analysis of current performance of English church music, emphasises the import of ‘style’ and ‘historically informed’ interpretation whilst differentiating between style and competence. Such informed conjecture pervades present day discourse and performance of vernacular music. The diverse usage of melody, contained in the manuscripts under scrutiny, suggests a multitude of performance spaces and varied styles. However, it is possible to call on current performance of, for instance, the Ulster marching band tradition or the American War of Independence and Civil War re-enactment fife bands performances for some indication of aspects of style and interpretation.

It is important to examine the contexts and deployments of the pieces from the manuscripts, and one of the most fascinating aspects of their contents is how melodies’ roles shift when taken out of their original context. Melodies are most frequently redeployed between song, dance and martial music.

---

2.2.2 The Selection Process

Any piece performed outside its original space or role, physical and/or social, is re-contextualised. This study investigates the significations that result from such re-contextualisations – the elements that are carried, and why. The works of Grainger or Vaughan Williams, for example, which contain ‘folk’ melodies, transport the original material from the parlour (cottage) to the concert platform and immerse the melody in orchestration. Such shifts in performance context are multidimensional changes of time, space and social context. The impact of melody, which has been subjected to a filtration process of selection and re-contextualisation that refines and moulds, is evident in the works of these composers: these are ‘good tunes’. I take this as consensus of opinion, popularity and common acceptance. These melodies have undergone tests of acceptability demonstrated by their inclusion in the popular canon, and they have endeared themselves to many, often for several centuries. This process is not restricted to ‘folk’ melody. Melodies written by Handel, Mozart and other composers are placed in contexts far removed from those intended by their creators. One can only speculate what Handel would have thought of ‘Dead March in Saul’ (1739) being used to accompany masonic raising ceremonies, military funerals and executions for cowardice. The piece is used for funerals to this day, both military and civil, and for both royalty and commoners.

The selection of melody for inclusion in the manuscripts, and therefore in repertoire, is an underlying and recurring concern of this study. Below is the notation from Francis Rippon’s manuscript housed in the museum collection of The Royal Dragoons Guards and The Prince of Wales’s Own Regiment of Yorkshire in York.
This example demonstrates the elements of simplicity and memorability coupled with a hook that captures emotion. This abridged version of Handel’s piece would have formed part of an arrangement, but it may well have been used as a solo cornet piece for military internments. A more detailed analysis is offered in the section of this work on the Rippon manuscripts.

It is the human need for the security of the familiar that reinforces and constructs the popular canon of such ‘traditional’ music. Memorability, in the minds of both the performer and recipient, assists familiarity and acceptability. The process of selection is by its very nature coupled with rejection; therefore, ephemeral pieces abound in these collections, but their melodic merit is validated by way of inclusion in the manuscripts. The compilers of the manuscripts considered them of sufficient merit to warrant inclusion. This sets them apart from the thousands of rejected pieces published over the last four hundred years that did not meet with the approval of the manuscript compilers, let alone those pieces publishers did not print. The manuscripts are evidence of a selection process, a sifting and distilling of the melodic content, which adds to their worth in terms of the memorability of the included songs and their significance to the recipient.
2.2.3 Continuity/Change over Time

The manifestation of changing tastes and the evolution of a canon is a fascinating aspect of the contents of these collections. The popular music of today displays atavistic traits that are traceable to rock-and-roll, jazz and the blues, but artists continue to strive for innovation and originality. The evidence presented by the manuscripts, which are indicative of musical trends of the early nineteenth century, suggests a more sedate rate of change than that witnessed in later periods. ‘Sir Roger de Coverley’, first printed in the ninth edition of The Dancing Master in 1695, remains to this day part of the country dance canon as a dance and as a melody. Examples of such longevity abound, yet ephemeral dance pieces displaying fads and fancies from The Whirligig (1651) to The Mashed Potato and The Monkey (1960s) in their thousands have sunk into relative obscurity.

2.2.4 Downward Filtration of Culture

The traditionalist stance regarding the origins of folk music is founded in notions of the organic growth of culture. Bohlman describes the genesis of these notions:

The earliest theories to concern themselves with folk music itself – those of Johann Gottfried Herder [1744–1803] and Jacob Grimm [1785–1863], for example – fused nature and folk society. When Herder did specify the characteristics of ‘the folk’ he preferred to see them as ‘wild’ and ‘lacking social organisation’ (unpolizirt), that is, close to nature so that they could be more responsive to ‘nature’s poesy’ (Naturpoesie)…. Denying that a folk song could have a composer, Grimm

---

announced that ‘a folk song composes itself and transmits itself’.\textsuperscript{127}

Empirical evidence relating to the provenance of pieces found by tracing origins of the contents of these collections demonstrates a flow of material from printed sources to the popular milieu and vernacular deployment. The evidence to be examined in the body of this thesis suggests that the melodies in these manuscripts are composed pieces, which means that they fall outside Herder and Grimm’s notion of folk music.

Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin, in their exacting scrutiny of the sources of Irish traditional music, demonstrate how the music’s foundations are based on printed and composed pieces.\textsuperscript{128} It is their work that gave impetus to this study and highlighted the composed and printed works from which the Irish musical tradition was formed. This thesis demonstrates the similar printed roots of the contents of the handwritten manuscripts under consideration by applying Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin’s methodology.

This thesis examines the provenance of the material contained in the manuscript collections to demonstrate a downward filtration of culture – in this case, music – through the social echelons of society. The fact that the contents of the manuscripts stem from printed sources, as this thesis reveals, forms a challenge to notions of ‘folk’ culture and is inimical to much mainstream consensus on the matter. Lloyd considered that the downward filtration of culture model asserted by the German political philosopher and politician Friedrich Naumann (1860–1919) to be an ‘arrogant hypothesis’. He goes on to state:

The proposition of Naumann and his fellows is that song, like all other kinds of art, filters downward through the layers of

\textsuperscript{127} Bohlman, Philip V., \textit{The Study of Folk Music in the Western World}, Indiana University Press, Bloomington and Indianapolis, 1988, p.7.
society until it comes to rest among the lowest classes, where it
lingers on as folk song which is merely the vague and
sometimes distorted echo of once-fashionable musical and
poetic culture.\textsuperscript{129}

My intention is not to refute the creativity of Lloyd’s ‘primitive communal culture’ but
to demonstrate the intrinsic link between folk song and popular melody as cultural
entities and secondly to illustrate the fact that, as he states, ‘traffic between the arts of
differing social classes proceeds in both directions.’\textsuperscript{130}

There has been a re-evaluation of notions of ‘folk’ during the latter part of the
twentieth century. As Gammon states, ‘In certain ways “folk” was the invention of the
nineteenth century’.\textsuperscript{131} ‘Traditional music’, as a term, has grander and broader
connotations than ‘folk song’, and it is, as Fintan Vallely puts it, ‘more than just a
“popular” music form’.\textsuperscript{132} The consensus of thought pertaining to folk song and
traditional music established by Francis Childe, Sharp and Lloyd, which had grown out
of nineteenth-century Romanticism and the socialist drive towards a validation of
proletarian culture, were attacked by Harker\textsuperscript{133} and Boyes.\textsuperscript{134} Ben Harker, in his
biography of Ewan McColl, writes: ‘Dave Harker [was] the first intellectual from the left
to apply sustained critical pressure to the workerist romanticism and shaky scholarship
sometimes underpinning the political revival’s construction of an authentic, working-
class music’.\textsuperscript{135} Gammon acknowledges this shift in the view of the academy when he

\textsuperscript{130} Ibid, p.54.
\textsuperscript{131} Gammon, Vic, Bob Sharwell and Paul Sartin eds., \textit{Hampshire Dance Tunes: Country Dance Tunes from the
\textsuperscript{132} Vallely, Fintan, \textit{The Apollos of Shamrockery: Traditional Musics in the Modern Age}, Stokes, Martin,
and Philip Bohlman, eds., \textit{Celtic Modern: Music at the Global Fringe}, Scarecrow Press, Inc., Lanham and
\textsuperscript{133} Harker, Dave, \textit{Fakesong: The Manufacture of British 'Folksong' 1700 to the Present Day}, Open University
\textsuperscript{134} Boyes, Georgina, \textit{The Imagined Village: Culture, Ideology and the English Folk Revival}, Manchester University
states: ‘By the 1980s the assumptions of Sharpianism were undergoing critical scrutiny and new views were emerging.’ However, much of present mainstream thought falls into two schools, that which adheres to Herder’s ‘folk’ paradigm and that which aims to deconstruct this established stance, thereby recognising a move towards a broader view of popular musical culture. I consider a more complete evaluation of this aspect of the recent re-contextualisation of the contents of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century handwritten manuscript collections as essential to this study. The insight gained from the dissemination of the contents and context of these manuscripts demonstrates the foundation and underpinning structure of what is labelled ‘traditional music’ today.

The complex nature of the ‘popular’ or ‘folk’ is multi-faceted, and any simplistic application of social mobility models to musical items must be considered in the context of time and place. Such musicological considerations as reception, performance interpretation and space must lie in the realms of conjecture or informed assumption when dealing with manuscript artefacts that are the lingering evidence of sound that dissipated long ago. Any revivalists’ musical interpretation of the contents of these manuscripts has both the ‘art’ and ‘folk’ music stylistic traditions on which to draw.

What is evident in these collections is a commonality of purpose and use. They are a partial reflection of the fashions and sensibilities of their time. Certain forms of music, such as the symphony or the opera, are not included. Gammon recognises the diverse aspects of traditional culture when he states, ‘There was no mystic unity of peoples and traditions in the past, any more than there is today.’

The hierarchical, pyramidal structure of society at the turn of the eighteenth century and into the nineteenth century was headed by the royalty and an aristocracy with a taste for the classical and operatic music of the continent, which was less

---


accessible to the general populace. Noblesse oblige was exercised with composers Handel and J. C. Bach receiving patronage from the Hanoverian monarchy. The creation of the ballad opera genre during the eighteenth century was an indicator of a lower, compensatory culture. John Gay’s *Beggar’s Opera* (1728) incorporated popular street ballads in English, satirised the Italian operas of the upper classes and heralded in a spate of ballad operas accessible to many. Middleton recognises the juxtaposition of Gay’s ‘criminal world of London low-life’ with ‘contemporary high society’, which anticipates later ‘differentiation in social personae’.

This conforms to Middleton’s postmodern critical theory polemic, which situates music in social and political contexts, as does this work concerning song, country dance and military music. The fascination that the higher levels of society had for the simple life was manifested in the interest in country dancing, rustic song and the rural idyll. Middleton points out that the music of Gay’s opera was taken from pre-existing sources, the majority from popular songs current at the time found on song sheets, broadside ballads, and, in many cases, two famous published tune collections of the seventeenth-and early-eighteenth centuries, *The Dancing Master* and *Wit and Mirth Or Pills to Purge Melancholy* – the popularity of which already reflected a burgeoning aristocratic and bourgeois interest in vernacular music.

Middleton recognises the potential for the movement of music between social classes in the fascination of the aristocracy and bourgeois with vernacular music. The intrigue and attraction of the simple life was to become the driving force behind the invention of ‘folk’ music.

---

140 Ibid, p.17.
There has been little work carried out on the origins of the music in Playford’s *Dancing Master*. Barlow, in his *The Complete Country Dance Tunes*,\(^{141}\) does not address the issue. Margaret Dean-Smith, however, sheds some light on the matter:

[I]t is very rare to find the tunes of *The Dancing Master* print before 1651. Probably not more than a score of them are so found and that only in the Netherlands collections of the first third of the century, Vallet’s Paradisus Musicus, 1615–18, Valerius’s Gedenck-Clanck, 1626, Starter’s Friesche Lust-hof, 1621, Pers’ Bellerophon, 1622, and Camphuysen’s Stichtelycke Rymen, 1647. With only one or two exceptions, the previous appearance of these tunes in Britain is in manuscript – the Fitzwilliam and Lady Nevell’s Virginal Books, very occasionally in Cosyn’s Virginal Book, Ballet’s, Dallis’, Elizabeth Rogers’ and Jane Pickering’s Lute Books, and a few in the lute collections at Cambridge. A very few have been discovered in madrigals, rounds and catches. After 1651, in which year Playford brought out his Cittern Lessons, his Lessons for the Viol, Musica Harmonia, Musick and Mirth (the parts of *A Musical Banquet* later issued as separate books) and *The Dancing Master* the same tunes recur again and again and tend to crystallize into a more or less permanent phrase and form.\(^{142}\)


It would appear that melodies selected for *The Dancing Master* were part of an established canon prior to its publication, stemming from a variety of sources, as cited by Dean-Smith. An analysis of the significance of the publications of John Playford is to follow.

We have seen that in the seventeenth century, the targeted audiences for Playford’s *Dancing Master* were the nobility and the gentlemen of the Inns of Court. Country dance was adopted into popular usage during the eighteenth century. A parallel to this dissemination of culture is to be seen in the development of English change-ringing. David Potter describes the origins of the art form as having developed as a sporting hobby by the English gentry during the seventeenth century. They formed themselves into private gentlemen’s clubs and met regularly to practice their new art form.\(^{143}\)

Once the pastime of the elite, change-ringing was opened up to other classes as the number of bell peels increased. Country dance was disseminated similarly, from the elite to the lower classes.

The dissemination of culture from printed sources into vernacular usage is evident within each of the manuscripts addressed in this work. The complex, multifaceted makeup of the popular music categorised as folk music derives its nature from all possible sources; it is an amorphous concept, in constant flux.

### 2.2.5 Interdependent Forms: Song, Martial and Dance Music

The interdependent relationship between song, martial and dance music is also a recurring feature of the manuscript collections. Song melodies are adapted for marching and nationalist jingoism as well as to accompany dances of the stage and assembly/ballroom. Such recycling and redeployment of melody is much in evidence.

---

today, with pieces taken from ‘known’ melody for the creation of television programmes and advertisments. The period march ‘Over the Hills and Far Away’, for instance, is deployed in recent television productions such as *Sharp* to signify validity and authenticity in the mind of the recipient.\(^{144}\) The auteur’s use of traditional music for scene and mood setting, especially in historical film, has become rather a cliché, but it nonetheless evokes the required ‘authenticity’.

### 2.2.6 Theatrical Influences

The theatrical stage provided a rich source of popular song and dance throughout the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Evidence of the influence of theatre on popular culture is contained within the manuscript collections, which suggests that some of the compilers of these volumes may have performed in theatres.\(^{145}\) Avoiding the classification of these musicians within the ‘folk’ paradigm of the rustic village performer enables the consideration of such possibilities. Chappell’s *The Ballad Literature and Popular Music of the Olden Time* contains a substantial body of evidence relating to the music of the eighteenth-century stage.\(^{146}\)

### 2.2.7 Development of Musical Instruments

The compilers of these collections were mainly instrumentalists. The instruments on which they performed were those of their eras. One of the earliest examples extant in the British Isles of instrumental collections is the *The Skene Ms.* (c.1620), which is in tablature form written for the mandour or mandore, a form of lute. The manuscript is housed in the National Library of Scotland and belongs to the Faculty of Advocates.

---

\(^{144}\) Cornwell, Bernard, series of novels, first pub. 1981, with a following series of television films entitled *Sharp*.


The contents of *The Skene* are a reflection of popular musical taste in the first half of the seventeenth century, and I would classify it into the same category of musicians’ repertoire as those manuscripts considered in this study. The instrument for which this collection was intended is of its time. Similarly, the Atkinson Ms. (1694) was written for violin or treble viol, the fashionable instrument of its day.

The violin evolved during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries to become the orchestral instrument we know today. As the eighteenth century progressed, the instrument was used increasingly for the instruction and accompaniment of social dance. There was a commensurate increase in the number of country dance collections suitable for the instrument published. The German or transverse flute shows a parallel technological development, becoming a popular instrument for gentlemen to play towards the end of the eighteenth century. The use of the fife and drum in martial music added to the proliferation of pieces suited to the instrument in the public milieu. This led to an increase in the availability of instruments and a commensurate increase in the number of performers. The addition of keys to the fife is considered during the examination of melodies in *Campbell I*.

The development of the piano after 1800 gained apace, and increased production of instruments brought them into the parlours of the bourgeoisie. Derek Scott has documented the proliferation of Victorian sentimental songs and ballads throughout the nineteenth century. These songs, along with dance music for the piano, were integrated into the popular repertoire of the Victorian Bourgeoisie. This development in domestic music-making, with its operatic and Viennese chamber music influences, is demonstrated in this work by the examination of the contents of the manuscript collection of the Bristol governess Amelia Benwell.

---


2.2.8 Developments in Notation and Technology

The contrast between the musical notation of the Atkinson Manuscript (1694) and that of Leadley’s later (c.1850) manuscripts is, as one would expect, marked. The style of notation was taken from the printed music of their eras, which by Leadley’s time was in virtually the same format as is used today. Inevitable lapses in concentration are evident in all such handwritten collections; what is surprising is how accurate the majority of the transcriptions are. Campbell I contains music of transposing instruments with the arrangement of ‘The Duke of Kent’s March’ (see page 255) for clarinets and C fife. There is evidence that some pieces are parts of larger arrangements without corresponding melody and/or harmony.

2.2.9 Gender Issues

Much of the history of music is a record of the achievements of male composers and performers. Although there have been moves toward equality in the second half of twentieth century, gender bias is found throughout recorded history. This is certainly the case within the field of traditional folk song and music. Major female figures in the field of the likes of Lucy Broadwood, Mary Neal and Maud Karpeles established themselves towards the later part of the nineteenth century and into the twentieth century. These female protagonists were outnumbered, however, by male figures such as Francis Child, Baring-Gould, Sharp and Vaughan Williams. The musicians who created the manuscript collections on which this thesis is focused were all male with the exception of Benwell. The following section is concerned with an examination of gender issues as they apply to these collections.

Published country dance material displays a gender bias from its outset. John Playford’s introduction to The English Dancing Master, ‘To the Ingenious Reader’, was addressed to gentlemen:
The art of Dancing called by the Ancient Greeks *Orchestice*, and *Orchestis*, is a commendable and rare Quality fit for young Gentlemen…. I have ventured to put forth this ensuing Worke to the view, and gentle censure of all Gentlemen lovers of this Quality.\(^{148}\)

A preface to the 1651 publication contains no reference to lady dancers, yet this is a collection of social dance for men and women. The first mention of women is in the legend at the outset of the book.\(^{149}\)

Playford utilises the symbols thus:

The fact that Playford makes little mention of half of the participants in the dances is symptomatic of his problematic attitude toward female participants in social dance.

In the eighteenth century, knowledge of music was seen as an integral part of the education of a lady. As a result, drawing, embroidery and dancing (along with music-making) were seen as beneficial occupations for women who had time to pursue such virtuous diversions.\(^{150}\) James Parakilas writes, “The accomplishments of upper-class were designed to demonstrate to the world that the men of their families didn’t need them to be gainfully employed”.\(^{151}\) Nurturing ability in these creative areas was seen as


\(^{149}\) Ibid, p.vi.


95
investment that enhanced matrimonial eligibility. Richard Leppert shows how musical expertise was equated with social capital:

[T]he culture demanded music as an appropriate mark of femininity itself and female class status. As such music was routinely viewed by parents as an asset to their daughters’ future matrimonial stock. It was an investment aimed at preserving family honour.\(^\text{152}\)

The desirability of musical education for young ladies continued into the nineteenth century. A governess able to instruct the daughters of the families of the emerging Victorian bourgeoisie and nouveau riche would be a valued asset to the household. Amelia Benwell of Bristol was one such governess, who wrote out meticulously two volumes of music for piano. Benwell’s 1847/8 compilations offers a fascinating insight into domestic, drawing-room culture during an age of revolution, famine, industrial expansion and increased moralistic consciousness. The music manuscript collection of Jane Austen is a significant representation of bourgeois taste at the turn of the eighteenth century. A large amount of work has been done on Austen’s collection; I consider it fortuitous that the Benwell collection came to light because it enables the scrutiny of a female perspective on popular music and a comparison with other collections from the same period, such as Lawrence Leadley’s and the musical manuscript compilation of Anne Bronté (1843).

That men dominated the field of manuscript compilation is self-evident. Both Austen and Benwell were pianists, which was an accepted instrumental path for ladies to follow at the turn of the eighteenth/nineteenth centuries and later into the twentieth century. The gender divide with respect to instrument choice is stark; violin and flute

players tended to be male, as were – accordingly – the compilers of the majority of manuscript collections.

Figure 4: The Gentleman’s Musical Companion, title page.

Above is the title page of the gender-specific *The Gentleman’s Musical Companion* (1803), illustrating in its title and cover image the masculine practice and performance of violin and flute. This volume contains ‘Duke of York’s Quick Step’ (see p.208), which is included in the *Campbell I* manuscript. None of the official members of the army and navy were women, which accounts for the disproportionate prevalence of male-authored pieces and performers in the field of martial music. Although the *Campbell I* manuscript is anonymous, the martial nature of its contents suggests it was compiled by a bandsman.

The instruments played by the compilers of the handwritten manuscript compilations may reflect gendered attitudes toward instrumentation. (Jackson and Leadley were violinists, and Austen and Benwell were pianists.) Gendered attitudes influenced a shift from male to female dominance in the field of Celtic harp playing. Moloney, in her contextualisation of the manuscripts of Bunting, draws attention to the

---

demise of the harp-playing ‘tradition’ of Ireland at the end of the eighteenth century.\textsuperscript{154}

Held in 1790, on the first anniversary of the storming of the Bastille, the Belfast harp festival employed Bunting to note down the playing of the few surviving sean nos (old style) harpists. With the backdrop of the rise in the nationalist fervour of the United Irishmen and the need to establish an Irish musical identity, Bunting went on to publish many of the pieces played at the festival. Out of the ten harpists in attendance, there was only one woman, Rose Mooney from County Meath. Charles Fanning, Arthur O’Neill and Rose Mooney were considered to be best in the festival, and prizes were awarded accordingly. The harp-playing tradition of Ireland was ostensibly a male domain. This is in stark contrast to the current orchestral tradition, which is, based on my observation, characterized predominantly by female harpists.

The old, itinerant, often blind harp players stereotypically associated with the harp, such as Turlough O Carolan, had lost their market with the decline in the patronage by the Irish aristocracy. The ancient Gaelic system was ousted by Cromwell in the mid-seventeenth century. O’Sullivan writes: ‘The Cromwellian Settlement spelt the final end of the bardic order in any part of Ireland’.\textsuperscript{155} The harpists had been reduced to begging, no longer held in high esteem in the great country houses. The downward mobility of these often virtuoso players is highlighted in Malcolm Chapman’s stark juxtaposition of two exponents of the instrument:

If you are an aesthetically minded nineteenth-century Edinburgh lady, you can play your Celtic harp in your Georgian drawing room, and expect to elicit admiration and nostalgia for the misty and fugitive beauties of this forgotten tradition, and for your own sensitivity in recapturing it. The trick does not


work, however, if outside on the street every peddler and roughneck has a ‘Celtic’ harp, which he habitually uses to accompany the latest bawdy songs.\textsuperscript{156}

Chapman’s fabricated scenario has many implications. His depiction of the contrasting contexts in which the harp was played reflects (musical) embourgeoisment; that which was initially the music of the landed gentry was re-adopted, via low-class itinerant musicians, by the bourgeoisie. This illustrates the mobility of musical instruments between social classes. There is then a dual redeployment of both instruments and melodies between differing levels of society in Chapman’s example.

Boyes has made much of the sexist implications of Sharp’s promotion of male exclusivity in the revival of Morris dancing in the early part of the twentieth century.\textsuperscript{157} Sharp collected the ritual dances from men’s Morris dance teams. He states: ‘The Morris, like the Sword Dance, of which it is an offshoot, is a ceremonial, spectacular, and professional dance; it is performed by men only’.\textsuperscript{158} Sharp maintained that the ceremonial dance of revivalists should, in turn, be performed by male dancers with strict adherence to (his) prescribed form. This brought him into conflict with Mary Neal (1860–1944) and her folk dancers of the Espérance Girls’ Club. The rift between Neal and Sharp has gained much recent attention as a result of the re-evaluation of the role of female protagonists in the twentieth-century folk revival. In evaluating the material and considering the context of the manuscript collections, this thesis makes every effort to give appropriate recognition to women’s influence on their makeup.


2.2.10 Audience Issues: Musical Subculture

Today there is a specialised audience for traditional music, as for many genres of music. This is an educated, middle-class group that encourages participation, has its own hierarchical structure, rejects much of mainstream commercial music and forms a musical subculture. An ideology surrounding traditional music exists that scorns the exploitation and commodification of music and is retrospective in outlook. With their mission statements and competition standards, an academic and performing elite establishes norms and boundaries as to the acceptability of material, standards, conduct and style, with bodies such as the English Folk Dance and Song Society, the Morris Ring and the Northumbrian Pipers Society maintaining core standards. A 2009 publication by the Northumbrian Pipers Society, for instance, included an article by Pauline Cato entitled, ‘What do I look for in judging competition?’ in which strict guidance regarding style was given: ‘As a whole the performance should be confident and polished with some evidence of personal style whilst within the realms of traditional Northumbrian playing.’ Such material suggests a drive toward an ideal concept of traditional music and playing.

2.3 Contemporary Contexts: Traditional Music in the Twentieth and Twenty-First Centuries

To understand the relevance of the manuscripts to the twentieth century, we need to look at them in relation to the history of traditional music in the twentieth century. The revival of interest in traditional music consisted of three parts, two of which occurred in

---


the twentieth century: the Edwardian revival and the revival in the latter half of the twentieth century.

The philosophical climate in which the Edwardian folk song revival was nurtured encompassed the Arts and Crafts Movement of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. This movement championed a revival of traditional methods and design. Philip Webb (1831–1915) based his work on vernacular architecture, and William Morris (1834–1896) based his art on nature. An emphasis on handcrafted goods helped to establish an atavistic perspective and philosophy. John Ruskin (1819–1900) whilst at Oxford ‘wrote a series of essays linking architecture and nature for J[ohn] C. Loudon’s Architectural Magazine, later republished as The Poetry of Architecture’.161 It is the political and aesthetic values of Ruskin and the work of Webb and Morris on which much of the philosophy of the Arts and Crafts Movement is based and from which the Edwardian revival of folk music emerged. Impelled also by nationalistic motivations, a coterie of composers formed to incorporate folk song into their work. These included Percy Grainger, Vaughan Williams, and George Butterworth, all of whom were much involved with the folk song movement. Alain Frogley, writing on Vaughan Williams’s involvement with the revival, states:

[H]is direct encounter with what seemed to him an expression of the deepest aspirations of England’s common people struck with the force almost of a religious conversion. Although its actual stylistic impact on his own music has been exaggerated, as a philosophical and emotional touchstone of artistic authenticity, folk-song was

crucial to Vaughan Williams’s developing views of national identity, community, and the social mission of the composer.\(^{162}\)

It is precisely this motivating ‘force’ which lay behind much of the folk music revival of the twentieth century. Vaughan Williams was a socialist, and it was increasingly the case that the ‘left’ was linked to folk song; revivalist protagonists McColl and Lloyd, of the later twentieth century, were committed Marxists.

### 2.3.1 The Edwardian Revival

Revival is a form of re-contextualisation. The late Victorian and Edwardian recovery of ‘folk’ song and music brought with it concerted attempts to arrange ‘folk’ melodies for the concert platform and to reinstate what was regarded as musical heritage back into the nation’s musical consciousness. The movement, headed by Sharp, claimed copyright on hundreds of melodies, arranged them for piano and – with the support of the Board of Education – trained teachers to impose the ‘tradition’ on school children.

Sharp and his amanuensis Maud Karpeles styled themselves as guardians and saviours of the English folk tradition. (After Sharp’s death, Karpeles continued his arguments. Both Harker and Gammon point out that one should consult the 1907 edition of Sharp’s *Some Conclusions* rather than later ones as the later editions were modified by Karpeles.\(^{163}\) His conflict with Mary Neal, the founder of the Espérance Guild of Morris Dancers, epitomises his striving for verisimilitude and ‘scholarly accuracy.’\(^{164}\)

---


\(^{163}\) Gammon, Vic, ‘One Hundred Years of the Folk Song Society,’ *Folk Song Tradition, Revival and Re-Creation*, ed. by Ian Russell and David Atkinson, The Elphinstone Institute, Aberdeen, 2003, p.15.

Neal … was more directly concerned with the joy of the actual dancer: she believed in the power of the material to transmit itself, and regretted the necessity for books of instruction. From 1910 to 1914 there was a bitter struggle between Sharp’s English Folk Dance Society (EFDS) and Neal’s guild.165

Sharp’s view was that the English Morris dance was a male preserve and its (his) original choreography should be rigidly adhered to. The tussle for the ‘reins’ of the folk song movement was exacerbated by the establishment of the Association for the Revival and Practice of Folk Music.166 As Roy Judge points out: ‘Sharp was … very conscious that his own roles as an expert and as the original collector were in some danger’.167 Sharp’s mission, to regenerate the oral tradition of folk singing and the precise performance of country and ritual dance, was an extension of the egotistical promotion of himself as ‘the expert’ on English folk culture. He demanded purity and authenticity in rendition. Notions of mimesis and verisimilitude, likeness to the original, were the goal. This was summarised by Sharp: ‘My great desire is that at the outset these songs and dances should be introduced to the present generation in the purest form possible’.168 In fact much of Sharp’s folk song polemic was derived from others:

In the main his theoretical writings on folksong, dance and custom were based on combinations of proposals put forward by other scholars, rather than original premises derived from his own work.169

165 Ibid.
Reassessment of the work of Sharp is still underway, but the impact of his contribution to the revival of folk music is still in evidence to this day.

Sharp (and others, notably Kidson) recognised the significance of the Playford publications in forming the foundation of the country dance form. Sharp published many of the melodies from the *Dancing Master*, arranging them for piano as accompaniment for his series of instruction books on country dances, for example, *Country Dance Tunes from the English Dancing Master* (1911), below.

This series of extracts from Playford’s *Dancing Master* was not a collection of folk melodies from the ‘field’. Strictly speaking these were not folk dances and melodies; these pieces were simply taken from the original publications, harmonised for piano and republished as part of the ‘folk’ music and dance revival. The use of the word ‘country’ added rustic, ‘folk’ connotations. Sharp also ‘modernised’ the time signatures of the Playford pieces, with 6/4 changed to 6/8 and 9/4 changed to 9/8, for example. It is interesting to note that ‘English’ was only used by Playford for the 1650/1 publication and not the subsequent editions, whereas Sharp refers to all from 1650 to 1728 as *The
**English Dancing Master** in his titles (part of the era's drive toward nationalism and the establishment of an English music identity). The book from which the title page above was taken contains eleven volumes of Sharp’s *Country Dance Tunes*, bound together for convenience. This is a descendent of the handwritten compilations of previous centuries.

Sharp reprinted many of these seventeenth and eighteenth century melodies, claiming copyright whilst aligning them with the revival of traditional music by implication. These publications have moulded the perception of ‘folk’ dance music that exists today. The melodies and their dances are still performed. Below is a programme of dances for a céilidh on 14 April 2012, in York.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Dance Name</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Tune(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.40</td>
<td>Set up and sound Check</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.30</td>
<td>Introductory tunes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set 4-6 cpl</td>
<td>Sir Roger de Coverley</td>
<td>9/8 slip jigs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set 5 couple</td>
<td>Weaver's Galopede</td>
<td>32b jigs/reels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set 5 couple</td>
<td>Waves of Tory</td>
<td>48b jigs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set 3 couple</td>
<td>Black Nag</td>
<td>Own tune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demo</td>
<td>Three cpl circle</td>
<td>Jenny Pluck Pears</td>
<td>Own tune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set 5 couple</td>
<td>Levi Jackson Rag</td>
<td>Own tune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Longways – anaw</td>
<td>Great Man of Ballangigh</td>
<td>32b jigs</td>
<td>Hunt The Squirrel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set – 8 cpl</td>
<td>Willow Tree</td>
<td>48b jigs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big Circle</td>
<td>Sellengers Round</td>
<td>32b reel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.00ish</td>
<td>Break</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demo</td>
<td>Long set 4cpl</td>
<td>Nonesuch</td>
<td>Own tune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Longways – anaw</td>
<td>Indian Queen</td>
<td>32b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set 5 cpl</td>
<td>St George</td>
<td>40b jigs</td>
<td>Scottish if poss.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demo</td>
<td>2 couples</td>
<td>Parsons Farewell</td>
<td>Own tune</td>
<td>3 parts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big circle</td>
<td>Gathering Peascods</td>
<td>Own tune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 cpl in line</td>
<td>Dorset Four Hand Reel</td>
<td>2 x 64b +8bars</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demo</td>
<td>4 couple round/squ</td>
<td>Newcastle</td>
<td>Own tune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long set 5/cpl</td>
<td>Drops of Brandy</td>
<td>9/8 slip jigs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big Circle</td>
<td>The Firlie</td>
<td>32b reels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big Circle – prog</td>
<td>Barrie Dance</td>
<td>16b jigs/reels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.55</td>
<td>Playour – couple</td>
<td>Waltz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.00</td>
<td>PACKED UP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Out of the twenty dances in the schedule, nine are taken from the *Dancing Master*, and of those, five are from the 1650/1 first edition. It is largely due to the interventions of Sharp that this material from the seventeenth and early eighteenth century is performed to this day. The melodies taken from the *Dancing Master* are in bold.

Similarly to Sharp’s printing of his piano arrangements of Playford's pieces, Grainger's *British Folk Music Settings* and orchestrations of traditional music placed folk
melodies on the concert platform. One such piece was an amalgamation of two reels, ‘Temple Hill’ and ‘Molly on the Shore’, which Grainger took from the Petrie collection, *Petrie’s Complete Irish Music*, published in 1903.  

Grainger acknowledges the provenance of the reels and prints Petrie’s melodies alongside his arrangement for piano. Unlike Sharp, who draws from a printed source, Petrie names the manuscripts of piper Patrick Carew of Cork as his source of the melodies. David Cooper quotes Petrie’s reference to the manuscripts as ‘an extensive collection of tunes made within the present century by Patrick Carew, a county of Cork piper – the use of which was kindly allowed me by my friend Mr Richard Dowden … Alderman of Cork’. Grainger’s use of Petrie’s pieces drawn from Carew is a prime example of melodies being taken from handwritten manuscripts and re-contextualized for contemporary performance.

---


I suggest that Carew was a ‘gentleman’ piper of the likes of James Goodman; both were competent exponents of the uilleann pipes who gathered manuscript collections of melodies for performance on their instruments. Much of the repertoire of the first part of the nineteenth century for the uilleann pipes is taken from O'Farrell's *Pocket Companion for the Union or Irish Pipes* in four volumes (1806–16); ‘Molly on the Shore’ is a version of ‘My Own Kind Dearie’, a Scottish melody. Variations on this tune by Clough are referred to in Chapter One of this work. O'Farrell’s publications were a source of several pieces in the *Campbell I* manuscript compilation. The reel ‘Molly on the Shore’ was recorded by the influential Sligo fiddler Michael Coleman under the

---

title ‘The Crooked Road to Dublin’, recorded c. 1924.\textsuperscript{174} Tracing the genealogy of melodies of this nature may be time-consuming, but it reveals a concatenation of strands and variations proving, amongst other insights, how similar to one another many melodies are.

Grainger’s setting of ‘Molly on the Shore’ was performed by virtuoso violinist Fritz Kreisler in his own arrangement for violin and piano.

A comparison of the performances in Coleman setting and that of Kreisler displays the huge differences in interpretation, style and technique. This is just one piece of thousands that could have been selected for inclusion, indicating the vast array of melodies from the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century that were available to revivalists.

In the relentless search for new, ‘original’ material, performers at the outset of the twenty-first century have increasingly turned to the manuscripts of the eighteenth and nineteenth century. This is no new thing. Baring-Gould (1834–1924), along with his ‘musical colleague Henry Fleetwood’, made a copy of the manuscript book of William Andrews, a fiddle player of Sheepstor, Devon.⁴⁷⁵ Becoming aware of the significance of its content, Baring-Gould visited Andrews in 1890 with Rev. H. Fleetwood Sheppard and later in 1892 with Rev. Fredrick W. Bussell. On the second visit, as Martin Graebe states, Baring-Gould recognised that the old man was a valuable store of old tunes…. In his cottage at Sheepstor the old man had a rack in the ceiling that was full of music including a number of ancient church music manuscripts as well as secular tunes.⁴⁷⁶ Baring-Gould and Bussell borrowed a manuscript book from Andrews and added melodies from it to their own collection. How many of Andrews melodies were disregarded by Baring-Gould and Bussell we do not know. Baring-Gould is renowned for his modification of the texts of the songs he acquired from country singers. Referring to Songs and Ballads of the West: A Collection made from the Mouths of the People, first published in four parts (1889–1891) and later as A Garland of Country Songs (1895), James Reeves states: ‘In these collections the texts are drastically emended, abridged, restored, expurgated or wholly re-written’.⁴⁷⁷ For a fuller account of the censorship carried out by Baring-Gould, see chapter ten, ‘The Old Singing Men’, in Bickford Dickinson’s biography of the man. Baring-Gould relied on his colleagues to note down the melodies to the songs he collected; this bare-bones

---

⁴⁷⁶ Ibid, p.4.
notation usually comprised a single stanza. It was not until Grainger used the portable phonograph to record singers in the field that the true complexity and subtle variation of the performances were recognised. We do not know what the manuscripts examined in this thesis sounded like because there was no means of mechanical recording before the late nineteenth century, so the early twentieth-century evidence regarding the style and rendition of traditional pieces provided by Grainger and Sharpe – even though they mostly recorded singers rather than instrumentalists – is most informative.

The extent and diversity of Andrews’s musical tastes is not represented in the Wren Trust’s publication. As Baring-Gould was primarily interested in ‘folk’ song, he will have disregarded music with a different pedigree. The ‘rack in Andrews’s’ ceiling, as we have seen, ‘was full of music’.

One presumes that this represented the wider repertoire of this fiddler – or should we say violinist? The filtration of ‘folk music’ from ‘art music’, the composed, the ecclesiastic, as I have stated, says a great deal about the motivations of the editor, collector and publisher; Baring-Gould’s rejection of a large proportion of Andrews’s collection of music results in a skewed view of the full extent of the repertoire and musicianship of the performer. Gammon recognises this feature in the modus operandi of Sharp, i.e. the failure to recognise the wider repertoire of performers in his collecting of folk song. It would appear from the evidence that the musicality of Williams has certainly not been represented fully by Baring-Gould or the subsequent Wren publication.

The lack of acknowledgement of the full extent and diversity of the repertoire of these musicians misrepresents their role and capabilities. The fact is that the squarson

---


Baring-Gould expected that the people from whom he collected folk song and music were illiterate, musically uneducated peasants. This was also the case with many of the other folk song collectors. It was not in the collectors’ interests to acknowledge the capabilities, musical or otherwise, of the people from whom they collected the songs and music. Their agenda was to root out ‘peasant’ folk songs and ignore all other aspects of the musicality of their sometimes diversely talented informants. Harker recognises the musical censorship Sharp perpetrated.\textsuperscript{181} One wonders how many melodies were adapted and filtered to fit Sharp’s model of a folk song in his search for modality in English folk songs. Percy Grainger was also keen to perpetuate the feudal term ‘peasant’. He refers to Joseph Taylor, from whom he collected the song Brigg Fair, as Harker goes on to point out, ‘as a “Genuine Peasant Folksinger”’. In fact Taylor was a bailiff on a large estate\textsuperscript{182} and had been a church song-man for forty years.\textsuperscript{183} We have, then, evidence of the rewriting and bowdlerisation of the lyrics, along with the adaptation and collation of the melodies of the songs, plus the wholesale writing-off of pieces that these collectors considered unworthy, of little value or interest. Those disregarded were popular music hall songs, art songs and one wonders what else. This may well have been a manifestation of the view of these collectors that such material was polluting the bottom-up evolution of culture. To the contrary, it is now acceptable to view ‘folksongs’ as a negotiated selection of songs from diverse sources, as does Britta Sweers in her considerations of ‘Electric Folk’.

\textsuperscript{182} Ibid, p.207.
The use of the term “folk music” is a history of categorisation rather than a description of the music in its own terms. Especially when researching traditional music or electric folk, the matter of definition becomes extremely difficult.\(^\text{184}\)

It is the same difficult mismatch between definition and actuality that confronted Sharp and the other Edwardian collectors of folk music when they chose to ignore much of the repertoire of their informants. The imposition of a hypothesis (i.e. folk song definition) by the manipulation of data (the songs and melodies) was a deception, a misrepresentation of the true nature of vernacular music. Applying such a hypothesis to the manuscripts under consideration in this thesis in a similar manner would also be misrepresentative.

### 2.3.2 The Second Twentieth-Century Revival and Present Day

This part of the study accounts for some of the current interest in and the recent popularity of the playing of ‘folk’, ‘traditional’, ‘celtic’, ‘autochthonous’, ‘vernacular’ dance music, and it examines the origins of this in time and space. By carrying out this exercise, it will be possible to establish the significance and context of the many handwritten manuscript books that have come to light toward the end of the twentieth century and to re-contextualize the music therein from a twenty-first-century perspective.

#### 2.3.2.1 Re-Contextualization and Revival

Traditional and folk music of the British Isles has, as part of its beauty, the intrinsic element of simplicity. It is melodic, not polyphonic. As shifts in context, time, performance space and fashion arise and the critical political economy changes, this

attractive trait of simplicity is exploited. Traditional music is easily modified and its simplicity destroyed. It can be bent, remoulded, fused, connected, electrified and re-contextualised by individuals with vastly varying degrees of talent, expertise and taste. Given this propensity to metamorphose, the music spawns attractive, well-formed protégés along with vulgar, disfigured offshoots, sadly. The dichotomy here is that, on the one hand, tradition demands that things should stay as they always were. On the other hand, to be realists, we must accept that change is inevitable. Acceptance of the inevitability of change is the postmodern path, questioning genre boundaries; perhaps, however, we need also be ever mindful whence the music emanated.

Traditional music has developed into and is exploited as a political and nationalist artefact. This has been the case over the centuries to a lesser or greater extent, as all music is a product of its time. As jingoistic sectarianism and nationalism ebb and flow, the deployment of national and traditional music in accompaniment to the flag-waving zealot, for example, in turn waxes and wanes. The first melody in the Campbell I manuscript, ‘Rule Britannia’, is still played at the ‘Last Night at the Proms’, and the Queen’s Jubilee celebration has incorporated traditional melodies, in band arrangements, for marching and pageantry.

In film, traditional music has become an element of the auteur’s palette with layers of signification bound up with emotional, nostalgic, violent, or bucolic scene-setting – Roland Barthes would have had a field day. It is commoditised and packaged so that ‘Celtic Relaxation’ may be purchased alongside the aggressive exploits of The Highlander and Barry Linden on DVD; fusions of ‘Celtic/Chinese’ or ‘Celtic/Country’ are available on iTunes. It is symptomatic of our time that we need to know about our roots and forbearers; we are striving to find our identity. Twentieth/twenty-first century revivalist drives towards the authentic are merely props in the suspension of our
disbelief in the present multimedia age. Atavistic musical elements are becoming hackneyed triggers as well-trodden paths are revisited with ever-increasing frequency. There is a need to draw some parallels here with American Country Music. This multimillion-dollar business has an ability to change, grow and develop, yet it persists in referring back, as previously stated, to earlier developments. In doing so, it regenerates itself, looping back on itself in order to establish its ‘authenticity’ then progressing and developing anew. (I discuss this in further detail below in relation to the work by Richard Peterson on the fabrication of authenticity in country music.)

The deployment of folk melodies by classical composers has taken place over many centuries. Such deployments often signify the bucolic. They are, by their nature, ‘well tried’, available in abundance and memorable. In the second half of the nineteenth century, attempts by composers to establish music with distinct national characterises turned logically to indigenous traditional music and song to fulfil this aim. The incorporation of traditional music for this purpose placed it on the concert platform in the works of Vaughan Williams and Grainger, thus enhancing the music’s social standing and deployment. Folk melody has been and remains to date a resource for composers of art music. The manuscripts examined in this thesis include many melodies that lie outside the knowledge of art music composers; they are thus useful resources of well-tried melodic material.

2.3.2.2 Twentieth-Century Redeployments of Traditional Music

One of the significant changes that occurred in the twentieth century was the shift from the use of music exclusively for dancing and military purposes to music also being used for listening and for its own sake. This was a fundamental shift in role – the audience became passive listeners rather than active dancers or marchers.
The music performed for dancing and military contexts has a specific purpose. Its rhythms are utilised to give a pulse to the lifting and falling of feet, be they on the dance floor or on the tarmacadam of the road to the field of battle. The redeployment of music outside or beyond its intended purpose has many manifestations. Be it in advertising, at the cinema, in the home, on mobile ‘phones; technology has assisted this shift of performance space, enabling ease of access to the once inaccessible. Dance suites, minuets, waltzes, mazurkas, etc. have, for many centuries, found their way into and become the basis of concert platform performance in the West, albeit in adapted formats. The military bands of the armed forces also perform music for listening as well as to accompany marching. With the coming of the railways, army mobility and logistics were modernised, and long distance route marches—and their accompanying music—became a thing of the past. The music of marching was retained for the most part for ceremonial spirit de corps, mess and concert performance.

That the deployment of dance/martial music shifted from the practical uses of dancing and marching to passive listening in the twentieth century is shown in the example of Ireland’s Seán Ó Riada (1931–71), the protagonist in bringing the traditional music of Ireland to the concert platform and recording and television studios. The impact he has had on the ‘reinvention’ of traditional music in Ireland is far-reaching. The attitudes towards ‘traditional’ music performance in the whole of the British Isles have been influenced by Ó Riada’s re-contextualisation of dance music. He brought together forces to emulate the sounds and repertoire of traditional Irish music. He repackaged the music and presented it in a form that has proved eminently palatable to audiences and musicians alike in the second half of the twentieth century. Harry White
writes: ‘[B]etween 1961 and 1969 his work with Ceoltóirí Cualann permanently altered the complexion and sound of traditional Irish music’.\textsuperscript{185}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure5.png}
\caption{Ó Riada and Ceoltóirí Chualann}
\end{figure}

Ó Riada and Ceoltóirí Chualann merged ideas from both early music and jazz. The format was based on a baroque ensemble with solos being taken by individual instruments in rotation as in the performance of jazz.\textsuperscript{186} The ensemble owed its roots to, but was a striking departure from, cèilí band practice in its introduction of ‘integrated textures, novel instrumentation, and virtuoso finesse’.\textsuperscript{187} Unison playing of traditional dance music was the convention, with chord accompaniment being supplied by accordion and piano in the cèilí band tradition. Ó Riada used his expertise to orchestrate the airs and dance tunes, which were further enhanced by technical advances in stereophonic recording. These proved eminently marketable with the growing adoption of high fidelity stereo systems of the 1960s, thereby taking the music of Ireland into the middle-class sitting room throughout the British Isles.


2.3.2.3 The Celtic Revival

The revival and survival of a canon of social dance music is more evident in the Celtic periphery of the British Isles, Scotland and Ireland, than within the dance music uncovered by collectors such as Sharp, Grainger and Baring-Gould in England. This Celtic peripheral revival/survival, as has been shown by Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin, stems from common printed sources emanating from the centres of population of London, Edinburgh and Dublin. The use of melodies as signifiers of national identity is an essential aspect of their deployment in Ireland and Scotland. This aspect of nationalistic musical identity has been commented on previously in this work in reference to the work of Bohlman (2.1.1.). The fervour of conviction of the zealous participants in the recent Celtic musical revival is often an all-consuming passion generating its own impetus and mythologies.

In England the continuity of a canon of folk dance music is less evident. The interventions of the likes of Sharp, Lloyd and the English Folk Dance and Song Society in this field form the basis of current ideological thinking.

2.3.2.4 Emulation and Verisimilitude in Traditional Music Revival

This section will go beyond the manuscripts discussed above to bring into the conversation the present-day implications and relevance of the research presented in this thesis. It is the relevance and performance of traditional music today (as part of our current culture) that prompted this examination. The use of music as presented in handwritten compilations indicates the essential role it plays in our lives, then and now.

As mentioned previously, we do not know how the contents of these music manuscripts sounded. This is a recurring problem with all historical music performance, and there is no definitive answer to the question of how performance should sound. Conventions on style and interpretation in rendition are established, and these display
shifts in emphasis from performance to performance and also show gradual change over time.

Louise Marcus writes: ‘[T]he success of his Ceoltóirí Chualann experiment in the group performance of traditional music continues to spawn endless imitations ranging in style from purist to rock’.¹⁸⁸ This adoption of Ó Riada’s model has taken hold throughout the British Isles and further afield amongst the Irish Diaspora since the early 1960s. The traditional music of Ireland thereby was given a second life – a reincarnation that projected it into the commercial market controlled by the international media corporations. This systemic time-shift is more than acculturation; it is multifaceted, with economic, sociological and political implications assisted by ever-developing technological innovations. Music from the Jackson manuscript recorded on *Trip to Harrogate* in the 1970s, discussed previously, was based on the Ó Riada model.

At the outset of the twenty-first century, live performance of traditional dance music could be heard in concert, on the street, in the public house or at home, creating, in some cases, a leap of centuries and a deployment quite divorced from the music’s original function. The musicians who recreate such ‘traditional’ music vary vastly in competence, as does the quality of the melodies they perform.

Waves of revivalist performers have followed in the wake of Ó Riada’s innovative Ceoltóirí Chualann performances, with attempts to recreate the styles and music of English Morris dance music, Northumbrian music, Scottish music, Welsh music and late Polish traditional music. The proliferation of state-funded peripatetic instrumental teaching that began in England in the 1950s may well have, unwittingly, contributed to the growth of the popularity of amateur performance of such music. The melodies of the mythical ‘country fiddler’ are eminently accessible to the semi-skilled

instrumentalist the music colleges and universities left behind. Often needing no accompaniment, they are free-standing and adopt a satisfying, rounded form that is easily performed on violin, concertina, flute, accordion, melodeon, etc. Often political, nationalistic and antiquarian motivations are at the heart of the revivalist’s searching. The goals of authenticity and verisimilitude drive these revivalist endeavours, and performance is focused on the recreation of sound, in this case, of an undetermined date and style.

As Peterson points out when discussing country music, the performer, in order to establish her/his credentials, will attempt to identify with recognised role models in the field by stating her/his own pedigree and that of the piece, which is to be performed in order to establish ‘authenticity’. This is also the case with the revivalist performer of dance music or of a song of a bygone era. The Morris dance concertina player will attempt to emulate the phrasing and sound of William Kimber, the Northumbrian piper Billy Pigg or Tom Clough – these, along with many others, are recognised style icons. They are essential elements in the fabrication of a British – or in these cases, English – folk tradition. What is fascinating here is that there are so many varied styles within field recordings; for example, the vastly contrasting styles of the Northumbrian pipers Joe Hutton, Billy Pigg and Jack Armstrong give no clear indication of ‘traditional style’ or of any particular mode of interpretation.

Peterson explains how country music reinforces its authenticity by constantly looping back after each stage in its development. He states, ‘Songs lyrics written in the decades since [Hank] William’s death increasingly load up on signifiers that ambiguously locate the song – and by inference the singer – squarely within the country music

---

The singers and performers of the English ‘tradition’ are similarly called upon to validate the style and repertoire content of the revivalist performer.

The current fascination of the traditional music enthusiast with the handwritten music manuscripts is a similar exercise in validation and authentication to that to which Peterson draws attention. Revivalists attempt to write songs and melodies ‘within the tradition’, but greater value and worth is given to those learned from the tradition, from the field recordings of Grainger, Sharpe or Lomax, or from published collections of the vast canon of English ‘folk’ songs and dance tunes.

2.3.2.5 Recent Controversies

Many publications by the likes of Playford were extracted wholesale by Sharp and published as ‘folk tunes’ without any evidence of the acceptance of the tunes by the community to demonstrate continuity of canon. (Sharp did not collect these pieces from the field.) The historical attempts to explain, define and theorise about ‘traditional’ and ‘folk’ music have proved too difficult to pinpoint and compartmentalise the form. The terms in themselves are vague, emotionally loaded descriptors that carry far-reaching historical connotations. For many, nowadays, folk song is still equated with amateurism and second-rate performance: ‘cow pat’ music, as it was referred to in the 1920s and 1930s. This is an outcome of its accessibility and ease of performance plus misguided notions of poor standards and shifted criteria. As with all music, the well-crafted and executed performance is a skill acquired only with a combination of talent and perseverance; as previously stated, the examination and dissemination of folk and traditional musics has only comparatively recently received a positive reception in the academy.

---

The lineage of bourgeois, semi-professional ‘experts’ in English/British folk/traditional musics may be traced back to the first half of the nineteenth century when the social anthropology of music had its genesis among names including Broadwood, Chappell, Child, Kidson, Sharp, Grainger and latterly Bronson. Lloyd endeavoured to collect, publish, redirect, or exploit what many of them saw as a manifestation of a musical and poetic culture emanating and being perpetuated by the proletariat. The 1954 International Folk Music Council (now the International Council for Traditional Music) definition, mentioned previously and quoted at length by Lloyd and Howes, is a manifestation of the belief in a ‘bottom up’ culture pivoting on quasi-Darwinian selection and the moulding of musical culture through variation.  

Donald Wilgus traces the roots of the attempts to cast light on attitudes towards the communal creation of folk song under the heading of ‘Cecil J. Sharp and the English Darwinians’. Sharp’s English Folk Song: Some Conclusions, which was published in 1907, sets out the ‘folksong’ as the incarnation of a corporate, compositional gestalt of the masses. Sharp was averse to the Board of Education’s recommended list of ‘National or Folk-Songs’. Wilgus points out that ‘Sharp took violent exception to this list of fifty songs, all but seven of which he found to be either art songs or artistic reworking of folksongs’. An argument ensued in the public press concerned the distinction between Volkslied and volkstümlich Lied. This is, essentially, the distinction between ‘folk’ songs and ‘national’ songs.

The impact of Sharp’s Some Conclusions reverberated within the Folk Song Society and latterly the English Folk Dance and Song Society and beyond, throughout the twentieth century. Wilgus observes: ‘[H]is theory remained constant, became the creed

192 See Appendix 1.
of the Folk-Song Society and is still [in 1959] breathed through the English Folk Dance and Song Society'. However, as also pointed out above, Wilgus states disparagingly that ‘Sharp accepts so many arguments advanced by differing theorists that his comments on folk poetry can hardly be taken seriously’. This is a reference to the individualist/communalist dichotomy regarding the origins of folk ballads. The *Rank Encyclopaedia* elucidates:

A school known as “individualists” (John Meier, Louise Pound) asserted that all ballads are the work of individual poets and are “popular” merely in having been taken up by the folk. “Communalists” (F. B. Gummere, W. M. Hart, G. L. Kittredge) insisted that the prototypical ballad was concocted in assemblies of the folk in the exultations of choral dance.

Sharp appears to have been of the “communalist” school, basing his *Some Conclusions* on the theories that emanated from within the Folk-Lore Society, which had been founded in 1878. He states towards the end of chapter on ‘Evolution’ in *Some Conclusions*: “The individual … invents; the community selects. It is necessary to dwell upon this point because it is one which is often misapprehended by opponents of communal theory.”

He was well aware of the debate concerning the individualist/communalist discussion that had been taking place within the Folk-Lore Society. Eventually a compromise, acknowledging the role of the individual in ballad creation, was reached, as the *Rank Encyclopaedia* recognises:

Current opinion concedes that the traits of “ballad-ness” may be explained by the communal theory, but holds that all extant

---

ballads are originally the work of individuals. As the individualists failed to understand, however, the work of an individual poet does not become a ballad until it is accepted by the folk and remodelled by ballad conventions in the course of its tour in oral tradition.  

The pieces contained in the manuscripts considered in this study are, I suggest, composed by individuals and subsequently brought into print. They are created by individuals and adopted for community use.

The International Folk Music Council’s (I.C.T.M.) definition of a folk song echoes Sharp’s *Conclusions* as his biographer and collaborator, Karpeles, was the Council’s Honorary Secretary from 1946 to 1963. Howes acknowledges Sharp’s contention that ‘oral tradition … is the process by which the folk-song grows and is created – growth being part of creation’. Lloyd’s political agenda, conversely, utilizes Sharp’s Fabian Socialist view of the product (folk song) as a manifestation of proletarian culture. Lloyd also recognises that Sharp’s theories were based on somewhat shaky foundations by stating that his *Conclusions* ‘are by no means firmly based’.

Prior to Lloyd’s and Howe’s texts of 1967 and 1969, Vaughan Williams published papers in 1934 under the heading *National Music* that had been delivered at Bryn Mawr College, Pennsylvania, in 1932. These also echoed Sharp’s *Some Conclusions*, adding little of substance to them. However, Vaughan Williams does tackle what Lloyd, from Naumann, refers to as folk song being ‘the product of die primitive Gemeinschaftskultur (primitive communal culture)’. He examines folk and national song and its impact on art and ecclesiastical music and goes on to challenge the scholastic

---

musical establishment with its ‘unfortunate tendency ... to believe that the written 
words must be authoritative and oral tradition unreliable’.

Vaughan Williams acknowledges, in this work, the impact that ‘lower’ musical culture has exerted on more 
‘sophisticated’ musics, including plain-song.

Lloyd’s earlier Workers’ Music Association pamphlet, The Singing Englishman, was 
an attempt to apply a Marxist analysis to understanding folk song. The songs, Lloyd 
saw, were a reflection of class struggle. Their thoughts, amusements, and aspirations 
contained examples of class conflict. One way of viewing this is in relation to the critical 
political economy: ‘Whereas mainstream economics sees the “economy” as a separate 
specialised domain, critical political economy is interested in the interplay between 
economic organisation and political, social and cultural life.’

To appreciate folk song 
and melodies fully, one must understand the contexts from which they emanate and 
should understand them as the product of the critical political economy. As Harker 
points out:

This “reflections” view of history and culture relates to the 
“vulgar” or “mechanical” Marxist conception of Marx’s 
notion of the relationship between economic “base” and legal, 
political and general culture “superstructure” – as though 
culture were “reflected” in a complex mirror from the 
economic element in social organization rather than having a 
dialectical relationship with economic and other forces.

The social context of folk music and the stratification of society in these terms has been 
the foundation of the analysis in this work. The manuscripts considered here are an

206 AA830 The Postgraduate Foundation Module in Popular Culture, Open University MA Humanities, Milton 
Keynes, 1999, Appendix 1, Reading 4, ‘Culture, Communication and Political Economy,’ p.34.
207 Harker, Dave, Fakesong: The Manufacture of British Folksong 1700 to the Present Day, Open University 
Press, Milton Keynes, 1987, p.239.
element of the Marxist construct of a cultural ‘superstructure’, the product of their political and economic milieu. Their makeup is multifaceted, as are the definitions of folk song seen above.

Based on the time and effort spent preparing the manuscripts, it is likely that a prominent motivation was that of monetary gain. Writing on music as a profession in the period 1750–1850, Deborah Rohr states: ‘Among artisans and labourers, music could be viewed as a means of social advancement’.\(^{208}\) She highlights the expansion in the number of musicians employed in military bands towards the end of the nineteenth century\(^{209}\) and comments on the makeup of dance bands during the same period as ‘the work of hack [my italics] musicians or those who could find no other employment’.\(^{210}\) This is rather a disparaging, elitist view of musicians playing vernacular music. Williams Vickers and Joshua Jackson, along with many other manuscript compilers, may well be regarded by some as ‘hack’ musicians, but their music and its performance formed an essential part of the social and cultural life in their areas.

Patronage of the Arts in the form of the encouragement of the ‘peasant’ writer or musician is a feature of many of the items within the manuscripts. Northamptonshire poet and ‘fiddler’ John Clare was regarded by espousers of early nineteenth century ‘primitivism’ as a manifestation of ‘the noble savage’. He owed much to the financial support of several benefactors, namely, The Marquis of Exeter, Lord Milton and Admiral Lord Restock. Clare was able to read and write music. Bate states: ‘It was probably schoolmaster Merissa who taught him the art of musical notation’.\(^{211}\)

\(^{209}\) Ibid, p.131.
\(^{210}\) Ibid, p.132.
Figure 6: ‘Here we meet too soon to part’.

Above is a setting of Clare’s poem ‘The Meeting’ (‘Here we meet too soon to part’) acknowledging the patronage of the Marquis of Exeter.\textsuperscript{212} The publication of such pieces must have fuelled Clare’s poetic and musical aspirations. The encouragement of the moneyed classes motivated both Clare’s writing and, I would suggest, his violin-playing; it also likely motivated his compilation of a manuscript. The socioeconomic background for the compilation of musical manuscripts is an essential consideration, as has been shown throughout this thesis.

\subsection*{2.3.2.6 Purism and Rendition}

The performance of material from the vernacular/folk music domain is subject to nebulous and ill-defined ideals. Individuals construct an image of how such music should sound and be interpreted. These notions are time-dependent. What is seen as acceptable to one generation shifts and transmutes to the next. Grainger and Vaughan Williams’s settings and orchestrations of folk melodies bear little likeness to the attempts at verisimilitude seen in the interpretations of songs by Lloyd and McColl, later

in the twentieth century. Art music and folk music performance criteria differ vastly. In folk music, sincerity of performance served up with rawness in interpretation became synonymous with a ‘purity’ of tradition. The differing style in renditions of Peter Pears’s ‘Lark in the Clear Air’ and Bert Lloyd’s ‘Lovely Joan’ highlights a vast chasm between artistic (classical Viennese) criteria and workers’ ideological rendition. The juxtaposition of such contrasting styles is a manifestation of conflicting high-to-low/low-to-high cultural interpretations. Lloyd claims the song for the people, the folk. His rendition is ‘authentic’ insomuch that it is a statement of political pride in proletariat culture, whereas the Pears’ parlour/drawing room interpretation is based on the Classical Viennese Salon and Chamber music tradition. The Celebrated Working Mans’ Band created by Lloyd for his iconic recording of industrial folk song and music, *The Iron Muse*, gave basic renditions to pieces extracted from Bruce and Stake’s Minstrelsy and the John Peacock and James Aird collections. Melodies from these printed collections from the late eighteenth and nineteenth century were allocated the role of signifying industrial music by Lloyd.

Authentication and verification by Lloyd for the ‘industrial’ credentials of these pieces is, as with much of Lloyds’ work, unsubstantiated. Expert opinion and approval of the likes of Sharp and Lloyd was sufficient historically to sway the beliefs and understanding of the majority as to the providence of instrumental ‘folk’ melodies. Myth-creation and fabrication is not always clear cut. Half-truths and hearsay contribute to what we want to be the actuality. Thus, Sharp’s extracts from *The Dancing Master* and Lloyd’s industrial dance melodies become the music of the folk. What were ephemeral pieces are revived and given the stamp ‘traditional’ merely because of their age and form.

The manuscripts examined in this study testify to the popular usage of pieces. Their revival as ‘traditional folk music’ feeds a search for our roots and desire to
establish our identity in a world where we are subjected to mass-media onslaughts of processed music packages from multinational controlled cyber-space.

2.3.2.7 The Session

Current interest in eighteenth and nineteenth century manuscripts is driven in part by performance in musical ‘sessions’. Participation and interest in folk music is now confined to a subculture. What was once mainstream popular music in the eighteenth century is regurgitated today by thousands of amateur musicians with vastly varying degrees of instrumental competence. A growth in amateur choirs, ukulele ensembles, revival rock and dance bands, acoustic sessions, etc. is symptomatic of a rejection of the music of the mass media. These musical activities act as social events for the musicians, and participation is often of greater importance than the sound produced.

Participatory performance of folk dance music, usually occurring in public houses, has its own rules and conventions. These musical ‘sessions’ attempt to add security and familiarity to the ever-changing commercial demand for new material and innovation in the multinational popular music business. Niall Mackinnon devotes a chapter to ‘The Session’ in the 1993 publication *The British Folk Scene.* Since Mackinnon’s appraisal of the phenomenon, the network of these musical gatherings has developed significantly. A particular session might focus upon a particular aspect of traditional music, for example, Irish reels, Morris tunes, Northumbrian pipe music, etc.

These impromptu musical performances vary in standard and status. They are a development of the folk club scene of the second half of the twentieth century. The Irish ‘seisiún’ may include song and has its own history, conventions, etiquette, hierarchical structure and boundaries; it forms the model for sessions found throughout the British Isles. Participation carries ideological significance. As Mackinnon states, ‘the

---

performance of music is dependent upon a whole range of musical, paramusical actions from which and through which it derives its meaning.\textsuperscript{214} Although sessions superficially involve straightforward performance, they incorporate complex interactions within their deceptive informality.

The session musician is part of a musical sub-culture; the essence of her/his fulfilment is derived from participation. Pride is taken in being musically illiterate and learning ‘by ear’, these being essential elements of the ‘tradition’. However, session participants are often well-educated and middle-class, as were attendees at folk clubs in the 1990s.\textsuperscript{215} Session performance is often not intended for audience consumption, and the music’s initial purpose as dance accompaniment is mostly disregarded. This is not a full consideration of this interesting development in the performance of traditional music, which warrants fuller analysis. However, it is important to note that the current demand for the revival of music from eighteenth and nineteenth century manuscripts is fuelled by session performers.

2.4 Conclusion to Chapter Two

I have drawn attention to the shaky ground on which many of the assumptions pertaining to traditional music are based. Helen O’Shea, in her recent publication \textit{The Making of Irish Traditional Music}, demonstrates a more realistic view of traditional music in Ireland than many previous publications on the subject.\textsuperscript{216} She provides insight into current ‘session’ practice in Ireland, with its male-dominated hierarchy, along with a critique of the growth of regionalism. The punning title of her work suggests fabrication, yet she manages to traverse the precarious tight-rope between the accepted

\textsuperscript{214} Ibid, p.1.
\textsuperscript{215} Ibid, p.140.
traditionalist stance and its deconstruction with skill. The fetishisation of musical style, personalities and locale are part of a commodification of traditional music; it becomes a national emblem, a facet of the tourist industry and a marketing exercise. The iconic cultural position of traditional music in Ireland is now very different from similar English music. Retrospective, revivalist curiosity may move on to aspects of traditional music other than handwritten manuscripts. The manuscript collections from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries offer a real insight into popular culture and the lives and experiences of their compilers. Their re-contextualisation in the twenty-first century is bound to be problematic, but it is hoped that this work goes some way towards a true representation of their context and contents.

3 Chapter Three: Foundations: John Playford and Early Compilations

3.1 Introduction

The foundations of what may be loosely defined as the ‘traditional’ music of the British Isles may be traced back to the many hundreds of publications that saw light between 1650 and 1850. The evidence that follows indicates that the corpus of music that constitutes the canon of ‘folk’ dance music drew upon a vast array of sources. By far the largest contributions to this canon were the country-dance publications of the late seventeenth and eighteenth century. The following is an examination of the genesis and early development of this canon. The key role of John Playford in the initial promotion of the country dance and its music, plus the publication of other popular accessible pieces, is placed in context. The adoption of pieces published by Playford and those that followed him is reflected in the contents of the three manuscript compilations selected for scrutiny: Henry Atkinson’s, William Vickers’s and Joshua Jackson’s. The
scanned copies of the manuscripts of Atkinson and Vickers are readily accessible via the Folk Archive Resource North East website, and the writer possesses a photocopy of the Jackson manuscript. These primary sources give a clear indication of what was actually performed—rather than what was published—during this period. There are other manuscripts from this period, but those selected give a clear indication of the diversity of the musical tastes of the times from which they emanate.

3.2 John Playford (1623–1686/7)

This section concerns the foundations of traditional music, the eighteenth century ‘Golden Era’ of country dance music and the political and social climate from which it emanated. Playford pioneered the publication of country dance collections, which were to form the basis of social dancing in stately homes and public assembly rooms throughout the country. These popular social dances transcended social boundaries, containing elements of both courtly and peasant dance. The notion that the folk and the elite traded dance and song in a cultural exchange is undisputable; there was multifaceted interplay between the social classes in this aspect of the arts. It is all too easy to compartmentalise music into defined genres associated with particular social classes, but in fact the social distribution of music is complex. Evaluations of genre features in relation to class are complicated by the passage of time. While time offers hindsight, the vagaries of diachronic ordering also hinder interpretation.

It was following the pronounced political and religious changes of the mid-seventeenth century that the creation and proliferation of country dance music and popular song grew. Dance tunes and songs were, in turn, to form the basis of the canon of vernacular music that survives in large part to this day. The songs and dances of this

period may be seen as a reaction to the Puritans’ aversion to worldliness. In 1650 the first signs of this shift towards more permissive attitudes towards the Arts were emerging.

The year 1650 has both political and musical significance. The English Civil War (1641–1651) was drawing to a close – the Battle of Worcester (1651) saw victory for the Parliamentarians. Charles I had been executed in 1649, and the first signs of a relenting of Puritan austerity were beginning to emerge. The period of the Commonwealth, the interregnum, brought with it a ban on public theatrical performance, which was not lifted until 1660, the year of Charles II’s restoration to the throne of England. In 1651, however, Playford published *The English Dancing Master*. (As Kidson points out: ‘It was really issued in November of the preceding year’.218) The fact that Cromwell and the Parliamentarians allowed publication of *The English Dancing Master* was a sign of a shift towards greater tolerance and a change in attitudes towards the arts. Fidelico de Rocheforte writes:

By personal inclination and family, Playford was a Royalist.

One of his political tracts was *The Perfect Narrative of the Tryal of the King*, as well as others relating to the executions of royalist nobility. In November of 1649 a warrant was issued for his arrest as well as his associates. Nothing was heard of him for a year until, on November 7, 1650, a stationer’s register was entered for *The English Dancing Master*. Apparently things had cooled off enough for him to return.219

This first edition of the *Dancing Master* is the only one to have ‘English’ in the title. All

---

Kidson, IV (4): 516, 05.08.09.

subsequent editions are simply titled *The Dancing Master*. It may well be that this was an acknowledgement that the dances and their accompanying melodies were not solely English. Playford included in the publication pieces that were anything but English; for example, ‘Skellamefago’ (or ‘Don Pedro’) and ‘Scots Cap’ (or ‘Edinburgh Castle’) are included in the collection.

Cromwell himself was not averse to musical enjoyment. Chappell notes that he employed a musician to teach his daughters, and concerts were given in his home.220 In his examination of musical activity during the Commonwealth, Chappell cites several other examples which demonstrate that Cromwell ‘was … a great lover of music’.221 This is also borne out by Evelyn Wells in her exploration of the links between Playford’s dance melodies and broadside ballad tunes: ‘Many of the Puritans loved music … even dancing was countenanced’.222 The Reformation, notwithstanding, heralded an austere epoch for the arts. Max Weber documents the stifling of worldliness and creativity:

[A] scepticism descended like a frost on the life of “Merry old England.”…. The theatre was obnoxious to the Puritans, and with the strict exclusion of the erotic and of nudity from the realm of toleration, a radical view of either literature or art could not exist. The conceptions of idle talk, of superfluities, and vain, ostentation, all designations of an ascetic, and especially not serving the glory of God, but of man, were always at hand to serve in deciding in favour of sober utility as

---

221 Ibid, p.415.
against any artistic tendencies.\textsuperscript{223}

The impact of the imposition of this harsh regime was far-reaching; the Government prohibited maypole festivities and curtailed Christmas indulgence. As Weber points out, ‘the Puritan town government closed the theatre at Stratford-on-Avon while Shakespeare was still alive and residing there in his last years’.\textsuperscript{224} The theatre was subject to the greatest censure amongst the arts. Secular song and social dance were permitted, as mentioned above, and Fraser emphasises that it was not dance that was objectionable: ‘The Puritan attitude to dancing was always rather to condemn the lasciviousness induced by it, than dancing itself’.\textsuperscript{225} Playford’s wife ran a dancing school during the Interregnum, and her influence could account for his radical change from publishing political tracts to dancing manuals.\textsuperscript{226}

Playford may well have been imprisoned in the year prior to the release of the 1651 edition of \textit{The English Dancing Master} for his publication of Royalist tracts.\textsuperscript{227} He was arrested at the beginning of December 1649; there is no record of him having been imprisoned, but after that date his publishing efforts were directed towards music rather than politics. This appears to have been a major change in Playford’s work policy, as Peter Lindenbaum illustrates:

\begin{quote}
After … political publications, whether overtly Royalist or not, in 1651 Playford switched to the publication of music.… [F]rom 1651 to the end of the Interregnum, twenty-four of twenty-seven Playford publications were music or music related
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{224} Ibid, p.274.
\textsuperscript{226} Ibid, p.464.
This leads one to the conjecture that the publication of country dances was a milder form of protest against Puritanism than political tracts.

_The English Dancing Master_ was the first of Playford’s many music publications and the one that led to his domination in the music-publishing business in England until his death in 1686. His son, Henry, took over his business on his demise, publishing the eighth to twelfth editions of _The Dancing Master_ between 1690 and 1703. John Young was responsible for the publication of the subsequent six editions, the last being published c1728. The country dance and its music were evidently an acceptable form of recreation during the interregnum and remained popular well into the eighteenth century and beyond.

The common belief is that John Playford did not compose the music or invent the dances contained within the _English Dancing Master_, as de Rocheforte writes:

> It is fairly well known that John Playford was a bookseller and publisher, not a dancing master. It is also fairly well accepted that he did not write _The English Dancing Master_. Scholars have determined that six to eight different contributors actually wrote the book, some covering dances known for years, while others may have been penned specifically for the book.

The publication utilised developments in music printing technology whilst gathering pieces into an easily accessible format. The work, then, is a collation from many sources and is of great significance in cultural terms. The collection was innovative, and the many later editions give a clear indication of its relevance and popular acceptance.

---

228 Ibid, p.130.
Robert Keller points out the significance and enormity of the work, pointing out that country dances remained popular for a further century and a half. He states:

[This]e group social dances … were to dominate Western ballrooms for the next 150 years…. The series eventually grew to eighteen editions of the first volume (1651–1728), four of a second (1710–1728), and two of a third (1719?–1726?) and long out-lived its originator. The three volumes eventually encompassed 1,053 unique dances and their music. Many were copied from one edition to the next so that the entire contents, with duplicates, amounts to 6,217 dances, including 186 tunes without dances and 3 songs (‘Dunmore Kate’, ‘Mr Lane’s Magot’ and ‘The Quakers Dance’).

The mere quantity of material contained in the volumes of The Dancing Master gives us an indication of the demand for such music at the time. Throughout the eighteenth century the dance melody repertoire was greatly enlarged by the publication of hundreds of similar collections.

Cromwell died in 1658, and with the Restoration of Charles II to the throne in 1660, a reaction against Puritanism took place under this hedonistic, merry monarch. The theatres were opened again in 1660, and the bawdy Restoration Comedy became redolent of the times and reflected the antics of court. John Golby and A. W. (Bill) Purdue emphasise the lasting impact of this shift in moral perceptions:

The Restoration saw a reaction to the attacks on popular culture of the Puritan period, which lasted well into the eighteenth-century. Not only did the recreations and

institutions which had been suppressed – theatre, gambling, maypoles, cock-fighting and brothels – make a considerable come-back but gentlemen as Justices of the Peace showed little enthusiasm for the role of moral policemen.232

They go on to point out that it was not until the late eighteenth century that there was ‘a renewed call for moral regeneration’.233 This was to take the form of strict Victorian standards brought in with the rise of Methodism and Non-conformist doctrines. The ebb and flow in standards of morality is a reflected in corresponding changes in the Arts and is especially noticeable in popular song.

A great contrast in mores between Puritan rectitude and Restoration permissiveness is evident. Between 1698 and 1720, John Playford’s youngest son, Henry Playford, published Wit and Mirth, or Pills to Purge Melancholy, a large collection of songs of which many were bawdy, containing either much double entendre or blatantly explicit verse. They were gathered together and many written by Thomas D’Urfey. This work, which in its final edition had six volumes containing more than 1000 songs, is very much a vocal cousin of The Dancing Master. The Contemplator’s Short Biography of Durfey, as his name was originally written, states: ‘His country songs were coarse and popular, dealing with common folk and their relationships…. His songs were often labelled as vulgar – not without reason’.234 The melodies had many sets of words written to them, as is the case with broadside ballads and hymns. Song and hymn melodies were often enlivened and adapted for the dance floor. It is often difficult to establish which came first, the dance melody or the song tune. For example, “Twas Within a Furlong of Edinbrough Town’ was arranged as a song by Purcell. The

233 Ibid, p.45.
Contemplator’s Short Biography claims the piece was written D’Urfey, which it may well have been, but it also notes that ‘[t]he tune is sometimes attributed to Henry Purcell (with whom D’Urfey often collaborated).’ The piece was included in the 1696 supplement to the ninth edition of The Dancing Master and forms part of the core repertoire of British traditional music to this day.

Many of the melodies contained within the manuscripts this thesis examines were published in The Dancing Master and Wit and Mirth, or Pills to Purge Melancholy. There is a symbiotic relationship between dance and song collections, which share and interchange common tunes. Wells’s essay, ‘Playford Tunes and Broadside Ballads’, mentioned above, also demonstrates this point.

Playford’s Dancing Master was the first of the many publications of country-dance music produced to satisfy the demand for this popular pastime. John Playford’s Division Violin (1684) provided some of the melodies included in the Atkinson manuscript, and Henry Playford’s Collection of Original Scotch Tunes (1700) was the first publication of Scottish tunes as a distinct national composition. The creation of a musical division between English and Scottish music was to become a genre divide founded on political expedience.

Julia Sutton considers the relationship between courtly dances and country dances, noting an interchange of steps, figures and ideas. She states:

We know that throughout Western dance history the cultivated arts of dance and music have relied on folk and “exotic” elements (whether real or imaginary) for fresh ideas, renewed vigour, and special character, eventually remaking them in the

---

235 Ibid
fashionable courtly or theatrical image until a need for fresh inspiration has been felt once more. We are also aware, however, that the imitation by the lower classes of aristocratic fads and tastes has been a strong force in the history of the performing arts. In the sixteenth century the line dividing court and folk dance appears to have been simply a separation marked by greater attention to elegance, style and technique on the part of those of gentle birth. Certainly many of the dance figures in our manuals such as hays, circles, turning one's partner, or changing places, belong to both courtly and country worlds, their origin lost in the mists of time.  

I have quoted Sutton at length as her specialised insight sheds light on the interdependence of courtly dance and folk dance. She cites ‘English manuscripts of the Innes of Court dating from the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries’ as one of ‘the chief bases for the twentieth century revivals’ in courtly dances. John Playford must have been aware of the existence of these documents as his business was located in the vicinity, and he appears to have been a willing conduit for the transfer of the courtly dances of Nobilà di Dame to the lower echelons of society. 

Playford’s Dancing Master heralded in the publication of hundreds of collections of country dance during the eighteenth century. These form the basis of the canon of folk dance melodies throughout the British Isles. This study demonstrates the further influence of musical fashions and developments on the moulding of this canon. The performers who provided the music for dancing, a catalyst of social interaction and courtship, amassed their repertoires in manuscript collections of melodies.

---

The scrutiny of publications and ideas on folk music of the twentieth century forms a basis for discussion in Chapter Six of this study. The role and relevance of such music today, its significance and varied deployment, provide an intriguing insight into musical identity and perceptions. The late nineteenth and twentieth century saw a resurgence of interest in folk music coupled with nationalist fervour. This revival formed the basis of our ideas of folk and traditional music, claiming musical insight into national identity and character. Playford’s publications may be regarded as the foundation on which these traditions were established.

3.3 The Henry Atkinson Manuscript

The cover of this book states: ‘Henry Atkinson’, ‘his book’, ‘1694’. Like the other manuscript compilers in this study, Atkinson makes it abundantly clear to whom the book belongs. The volume is regarded as the earliest handwritten ‘fiddler’s’ manuscript book of its type extant and is a remarkable historical and musicological find. For this artefact to have lain dormant, outside the care of museum and library archives, for over three hundred years is a credit to its many custodians. A scanned copy is available on the Farne (Folk Archive Resource North East) website, run by the Gateshead council; this has been utilised for the purposes of this study.240 The original manuscript is housed at the Gosforth Records Office, Newcastle upon Tyne.

It is commonly believed that the compilation emanates from the northeast of England because it includes ‘Bobby Shaftoe’, ‘Sir John Fenwick’ and ‘Wylam Away’, ‘all of which’, as the website states, ‘have continued to be played by pipers and fiddlers in the region to the present-day’.241 The Chatto family, who were custodians of the volume as far back as the 1830s, hail from Northumberland, which further establishes its

241 Ibid.
northeast provenance. The website’s preface to the collection states: ‘In notes accompanying the manuscript, dated early to mid-nineteenth century, William A. Chatto also informs us that “Henry Atkinson … was a native of the county of Northumberland, and lived in the neighbourhood of Hartburn”’; Chatto does not say where he obtained this information’. Atkinson's compilation represents a wide selection of popular music from his time. His broad-ranging repertoire encapsulates a non-genre-bound reflection of the music of the era.

The Farne website approaches the manuscript from a traditional folk music stance, seeking to claim Atkinson as a ‘folk fiddler’, but the evidence suggests Atkinson was a capable musician on an instrument that was at a high point in its development and popularity during his life. Atkinson’s manuscript contains much more than ‘country dance’ music, and his compilation includes performance pieces, such as ‘Tolletts Ground’, which demonstrate the wider violin repertoire. The indications are that Atkinson may well have been a violin teacher or dancing master, and the pieces included in the volume suggest he was a fairly accomplished musician.

There are no dance instructions or song lyrics contained in the volume. The book includes detailed bowing directions, more than one would expect simply for performance purposes, suggesting a pedagogical function. As one would expect of a manuscript of this age, the notation utilises very different styles from our modern conventions. For example, jigs are written in 6/4 as opposed to 6/8. Other similar timing conventions of the period are also employed. The clefs are mostly as our modern G, but some others, possibly written in a different hand, are more elaborate.

Atkinson’s book measures 12cm x 20cm and is of a size that would easily fit into a pocket or instrument case, which would suit the itinerant musician. Many of the pieces contained therein are indeed country dances, some of which are traceable to

---

242 Ibid.
editions of Playford’s *Dancing Master*, yet others display considerable instrumental
technique and musicality. I use the label country dance as a generic term rather than
referring to a specific dance or group of dances. Country dances of this time were in
fashion and were very much the entertainment of the more ‘well to do’. Atkinson
includes in his collection pieces from Playford’s *Division Violin* (1685) and Walsh’s
*Division Flute* (1705). The *Farne* website states:

This tune appears as ‘Tolletts Ground’ in Playford’s *The Division Violin* 1684 (PDV no.7). Confusingly Atkinson writes his strain
numbers at the end of strains, Playford at the beginning. Part of
Atkinson is not clearly legible, but it seems that he stays very
close to the printed version. He has all Playford’s 22 strains,
and in the same sequence. Where there are discrepancies, it
appears that while sometimes Atkinson has miscopied,
sometimes he has in fact corrected Playford. Note that what
Atkinson calls the “Ground” is in fact strain 22 in Playford,
whose own “Ground basse”, written on the bass clef, is clearly
separated from the main tune. It seems very likely that this
tune, given its length, would have circulated in written form,
perhaps via intervening texts. 243

I would assert that this piece provides us with tangible evidence that Atkinson was more
a violinist than a rustic fiddler. The inclusion of this work in the manuscript shows that
he was very much up-to-date with the current repertoire for his instrument. As briefly
noted previously, the violin was very much the instrument du jour at this time, reaching
a high point in its construction and technical development. The *Farne* website makes the
assumption that Atkinson ‘recorded the music from aural circulation’, but there is scant

evidence to justify such conjecture.\textsuperscript{244} The assumption results, I feel, from the compilers of the website imposing their predetermined concept of the ‘traditional folk fiddler’ onto Atkinson. They might argue that variation from Playford’s published melodies is evidence of the ‘folk process’ and vernacular style and usage. I would maintain, however, that such adaptation and adjustment is a feature of most musical performance and in fact an integral part of interpretation, ‘folk’ or otherwise.

‘Tollett’s Ground’ is a work that does not form part of the country-dance canon. It is a piece that would have the ‘Ground’ played as a basis on which the violin divisions or variations are performed to demonstrate expertise on the violin – this is for performance rather than dance or song accompaniment. As with the other manuscripts under scrutiny in this study, one wonders whether there were similar companion collections containing parts to be played alongside those that have survived. The treble violin would take the leading melodic part in arrangements at this time, so it is not surprising that the contents of the volume are not supporting parts. Atkinson undoubtedly played with fellow musicians: we have a piece on page 47 that is in two parts, marked with the directions ‘1st treble Mr Condiff’ and ‘2nd treble Mrs Condiff’, for example. As the website states, these parts were ‘written so that two players can read them from different sides of the book, hence one appears upside down’.\textsuperscript{245} This ‘table-top’ scoring of instrumental and vocal music had been used for both secular and ecclesiastical music in parts for centuries.

Matthew Spring mentions ‘Tollett’s Ground’, along with other pieces, when examining the content of a Balcarres manuscript of pieces arranged for the lute. He states: ‘There are many slight melodic and rhythmical discrepancies between the printed versions and those in the Balcarres manuscript, but for the most part the violin line is

\textsuperscript{244} Ibid, introduction.
\textsuperscript{245} Ibid, p.47.
simply transposed down an octave … to suit the tessitura of the lute.246 The appearance of both ‘Tollett’s Ground’ and ‘Farnell’s Ground’ in both the Balcarres and Atkinson manuscripts verifies that these pieces were indeed in ‘circulation’ amongst performing musicians at the end of the seventeenth century, as the Farne website claims. The scarcity of printed music would have made such copying a practical necessity. The fact that manuscript compilers selected pieces like ‘Tollett’s Ground’ from printed sources rather than by ear is one of the pivotal and recurring claims of this study.

The inclusion of the piece ‘A New Lesson’, page 68, intimates pedagogy for either the treble violin or the dance floor. Given that detailed bowing is included in the manuscript and dance notation is absent, the former is most likely the case. The scarcity and high cost of printed music as well as the convenience of gathering desired pieces in one volume would have instigated the creation of Atkinson’s manuscript. Emmerson considers similar Scottish manuscripts that relate to the English case. He writes, ‘These manuscript compilations [from the first half of the eighteenth century] testify to a demand for printed publications of Scottish music – particularly dance music – which was not being satisfied’.247 Emmerson does not consider the gathering of desired pieces in a single volume as an indicator of the compiler’s repertoire. What is significant about Atkinson’s manuscript is not only its remarkable survival but the early demonstration of this means of gathering together pieces in a single volume.

Military and courtly pieces appear in the collection alongside rustic dance and song melodies, giving an indication of a wide range of taste and the possibly varied applications of the music. The diversity of material includes much that is outside the canon of vernacular or folk music. A large number of Scottish pieces suggests the volume may originate from North of the border. Conversely, it may demonstrate the

popularity of Scottish music at the English court after the restoration. The content of the collection is not retrospective. It comprises current, recently published material in vogue at the end of the seventeenth century. Some pieces, such as ‘Over the Hills and Far Away’, which is included twice, have remained in the popular and military music canon until the present day. The two versions in the manuscript show a virtually identical setting, both in C major, and there is no apparent reason for its duplication. Published versions of the song, contemporaneous to Atkinson’s collection, are to be found in D’Urfey’s *Pills to Purge Melancholy* (1706), George Farquhar’s play *The Recruiting Officer* (1706), and Gay’s *The Beggar’s Opera* (1728).

We are currently locked into an obsessively genre-centric paradigm, which constructs boundaries rather than respecting a continuum, so many regard manuscripts like Atkinson’s simply as folk music. In fact, Atkinson’s manuscript reflects a key philosophy of the era from which it emerges: pastoralism. The renaissance brought with it aspirations towards a rural Utopia, with works such as Sir Philip Sidney’s *Arcadia* illustrating bucolic scenes of dancing shepherds. Sydney writes:

>[S]even shepherds … joining themselves, four of them making a square and the other two going a little wide of either … and the seventh man foremost…. In like order came out the seven appassionate shepherds, all keeping the pace of their foot by their voice and sundry consorted instruments.248

Sir Philip Sidney (1554–1586) did not live to see his work published. (*Arcadia* was first published in 1586). Katherine Duncan-Jones notes that the book was described by Horace Walpole in 1768 as ‘tedious, lamentable, pedantic, pastoral romance’ and by William Hazlitt in 1820 as ‘one of the greatest monuments of the abuse of intellectual

power upon record.’ Despite these later disparaging comments, though, the work’s popularity and pastoral theme reflected the aspirations of the time. ‘[I]t was this literary centaur which was read for over three hundred years.’ The work gives us an insight into the sensibilities of the ladies and gentlemen who danced their ‘country dances’ to the music of Atkinson and his like, distracting themselves from the reality of their existence. Nymphs and shepherds these dancers were certainly not, but they certainly fostered pastoral fantasy.

Atkinson’s manuscript relates closely to this cultural moment. It is a dancing master’s or dance musician’s tune book with a large proportion of the melodies taken from the Playford Dancing Master editions published between 1651 and 1728. The Atkinson manuscript, as I have stated, is dated 1694, by which time the eighth edition of the Playford work had been published, and ‘The Country Dance’ was well established amongst fashionable society. The 1651 first edition of the English Dancing Master is dedicated to ‘gentlemen’ and appeals to bucolic myths of the time: ‘The Gentlemen of the Innes Of Court, whose sweet and ayry Activity has crowned their Grand Solemnities with Admiration to all Spectators’. This was not the music of the peasantry but the construction of an upper-class ideal of peasantry, an attempt to recreate a rural idyll.

The Atkinson collection contains many of the features that are to be found in the other collections considered in this study: an eclectic mix of melodies from a wide variety of sources that provide evidence of personal selection. The music is scored for a specific instrument, and the scribe demonstrates musical literacy and accuracy. The volume is utilitarian, in an easily accessible and transportable format. Ownership is

clear, as if there existed a strong possibility of losing the book or it be taken by another musician, etc. The music contained in the Atkinson manuscript is redolent of its time, containing fashionable dance melodies; it needs to be considered on its own terms rather than through the eyes of twenty-first-century folk music revivalists.

3.4  The William Vickers Manuscript

This manuscript, dated 1770, is probably the most widely scrutinised and most written about of those under consideration. The work has been twice published under the editorship of Matt Seattle (1986–7) in three parts and again in a single volume in 2008. It has proved to be a rich source of country-dance music, enhancing the repertoires of many musicians, especially from the northeast of England. In his introduction to the first volume in 1986, Seattle states: ‘The William Vickers collection is, in my view, among the most important collections of traditional music, published or unpublished, to have been made in the British Isles’.  

There are pages missing from the surviving volume; Vickers wrote an index that refers to melodies that do not appear amongst the 581 pieces. A digitally scanned copy of the original manuscript is available on Gateshead Council’s Farne Project website. The existence of a scanned copy available online signifies the document’s import and provides a measure of the current interest in these collections.

The significance of this work is summed up on the cover of the 2008 edition: ‘William Vickers’s tune book is one of the largest and most interesting English fiddle

manuscripts’. The editor may make the distinction that the collection is English because funding for the second edition was provided by the English Folk Dance and Song Society. I would maintain, however, that as with all the collections I am considering, such nationalistic boundaries were never foremost in the minds of the compilers.

The collection of — as Vickers terms them — ‘Country Dances’ forms a comprehensive insight into the repertoire of the dance musician of the second half of the eighteenth century. It is one of the earliest of the post-Playford manuscripts to have come to light. The collection includes a group of sixteen mostly consecutive cotillions. These were introduced into England in 1766 from France and were much in vogue in the 1770s. This demonstrates that Vickers was in touch with the fashions and requirements of his audiences.

The work shows the development of a vernacular process of selection and rejection of pieces that shaped the canon of the popular milieu. There were a large number of collections of country dances published during the eighteenth century, and this compilation reflects this vogue. Seattle, in his introduction to the 2008 edition, points out: ‘Vickers describes his collection as Country Dances but it is obvious that his interest is in the tunes rather than the dances they accompany’. It would appear that Seattle bases this conjecture on the non-inclusion of dance notation in the manuscript and the quantity of material therein. He seeks to impose the form of the current traditional ‘session’ onto Vickers and his music. (There is no other evidence to verify the statement.) As the collection contains dance music, I would argue that dance was likely what it was used for, at least in part. The playing of such music solely for listening is a recent phenomenon, and very much a revivalist practice growing in popularity from

---

the 1960s onward. Seattle assumes the compilation to be ‘traditional music’; the implication of his use of ‘collection’ is that Vickers acquired the pieces in manner of collectors such as Sharp or Grainger. It is more likely, however, that Vickers obtained the volume’s contents from printed sources or gathered them from the music books of other performers specifically for performance purposes.

The compilation reflects Vickers’s personal character and tastes. The music is written mainly in one hand, presumably Vickers’s, but a small number of melodies indicate other contributors. This is not a retrospective collection, and few pieces from editions of *The Dancing Master* are included in the book. A wonderful insight into Vickers’s humour and character is demonstrated in the short verse ‘On Music’, included in the volume and quoted above (see section 1.1.10).

This humorous verse gives an insight into Vickers’s attitude toward performance and his derisory regard for those by whom he was paid. Vickers’s use of the phrase “Well Paid” suggests he performed for monetary reward and would no doubt choose those pieces that were the most popular with his patrons and most suited to his own preference. The melodies contained in the many published collections of this time were of variable quality, so placing together in one volume the melodies most suited to his and his audiences’ tastes was an eminently sensible reason for the creation of the collection.

The published editions of the music of Vickers are revivalist tools. A majority of the melodies within the volume had been long forgotten and removed from the popular canon. It is as a result of revivalist interest that the compilation has been published. Bohlman points out that ‘[r]evival is an overt and explicit act of authentication’.257 The published editions of the Vickers volume are, correspondingly, not only an attempt to rekindle interest in the music but also to construct and authenticate the mythical ‘folk

---

fiddler’. As so little is known about Vickers, it is possible to attach to him an array of attributes that say more about revivalists’ perceptions of rustic musicians fiddling in ale houses or accompanying dancing on the village green than about the actuality of Vickers himself. The revival of traditional music abounds with the ‘fabrication of authenticity’ (to use Peterson’s phrase) and the belief in an organic cultural base for music, i.e. a music that is embedded in, and cultivated by, community. Bruce and Stoke used Vickers’s collection as a source of material for their Northumbrian Minstrelsy, thus establishing the collection as one of the cornerstones of Northumbrian music. More than the music of its place, though, Vickers’s music was the music of his time. Its revival and publication imposes present day signification. Bohlman elucidates:

Revival is, in an ideological sense, the ultimate collapse of time and space because it fully admits of the efficacy of that collapse for creating contemporary meaning. Revival relies heavily on new symbols masquerading as the old. Thus, when borrowing folk music from the past, the revivalist assumes that the audience will simultaneously imagine one set of values, strip those values from the music, and allow new … values to assert themselves.

The Great Northern Tune Book, containing Vickers’s music, is a means by which the revivalist is able to link with the past, and the online manuscript adds reassuringly to the validation and authentication process.

When viewed objectively, the collection is a fascinating survival and an intriguing record of popular merrymaking. A ‘mission statement’ is contained in part three of the first edition of *The Great Northern Tune Book*:

Their [dance melodies] current revival by leading musicians such as Alistair Anderson, John Kirkpatrick, Blowzabella and others, together with publications such as this, will … lead to a reawakening of interest in earlier types of English music, which, potentially, has just as much to offer as any other tradition in breadth of repertoire, scope for collective music-making, and opportunity for individual virtuosity.  

This surmises the motives of current revivalists. The acquisition of repertoire for ‘session’ performance is a retrospective exercise. The participants form a musically based subculture that shuns current popular music in an antiquarian, nostalgic quest for ‘merry England’.

### 3.5 The Joshua Jackson Manuscript

This section examines the manuscript book of violin player Joshua Jackson (1763–1839). It remains in the possession of the Jackson family of Harrogate. Folk song enthusiast David Howes stumbled on the collection whilst visiting the shop run by Jackson’s descendants in the early 1970s. Howes and his associates brought it to the notice of the Folk Revival movement by issuing a recording on vinyl of a selection of pieces from the book in 1977. This attempt to re-contextualise the music of Jackson was a precursor to the flood of interest for such repositories of vernacular music, which developed pace towards the end of the twentieth century and into the twenty-first

---

century. Geoff and Liz Bowen and Robin and Rosalind Shepherd published a selection of pieces from the manuscript, directed at the folk dance music enthusiast, in 1998. Describing the volume, they write:

The Jackson Manuscript is a book of one hundred and fifty pages containing more than 500 handwritten tunes, songs and dances…. The collection is written on high quality paper, originally foolscap, cut in half and bound with leather into a book with heavy card covers. This provides a succinct description of the physical manuscript. A second volume of pieces from the collection, published by Robin and Rosalind Shepherd, followed in 2011. Both volumes include a short biography of Jackson and his environs plus speculation about his music making.

Like the compilers of the other manuscripts under consideration in this study, Jackson clearly labels the inside front of the volume with his name and the date, 1798.

Example 1
As shown, Jackson uses individual type letters to manually inscribe the volume with his name. He also signs the inside back cover along with the date. As the following page illustrates, Jackson employs the same printing type for the pagination and the melody titles; the musical notes are also positioned using type. This practice is abandoned in the second half of the volume, however, where the melody titles are placed in between the

---


263 Ibid, p.4.

first and second lines of the melodies. In most of the manuscript, Jackson uses an implement to produce blots to indicate the position of the notes on the staff; he pens in the stems.

Example 2
In order to save space, the pieces do not always commence with a fresh stave. We see above that ‘What a beau my granny was’ follows on immediately after ‘O thou were born to please me’. Capitalisation is not used in titles and occasionally, as in example 2, dance instructions are written along with the melody. Two jigs are written together, and two common-time pieces are written one after the other. This would enable a dance in one tempo to employ both melodies in performance. The manuscript staves appear to be hand drawn and utilise the recto leaves, the verso leaves containing notes, dance instructions, recipes, accounts, plus some additional melodies.

The content of the book is wide ranging and demonstrates the eclectic nature of Jackson and his audiences. We see on pages 34 and 36, below, how Handel’s ‘See the conquering hero’ and extracts from other works are included alongside pieces from the country-dance canon. This is a clear example of composed pieces — or, rather, melodic extracts from compositions — being employed in contexts other than those originally
intended. This crossover and fusion is a forerunner of sampling and even musical plagiarism.
Example 4

There is much evidence to show that Arne’s ‘Water Parted from the Sea’ was accepted into popular performance and circulation. An account of singing in the London streets of 1819 demonstrates the broad nature of popular song, ranging from the monotony of the songs of the street vendors to Italian opera.

[It] was but yesterday a woman invited the publick to purchase shrimps, to a tune which has invariably been applied to water cod as to spinage and muffins…. One would scarcely believe such absurdities in London, at a time when every hairdresser’s boy whistles Italian airs and even the footmen at the doors of the King’s Theatre hum ‘Water Parted from the Sea.’

---

266 Urban, Sylvanus, The Gentleman’s Magazine and Historical Chronicle, From January to June 1819, Volume LXXXIX, Nichols and Son, 1819, London, p.424. See: http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=_dHAAIAIAAJ&pg=PA424&dq=water+parted+from+the+sea+handel&hl=en&ei=_llMTJ7MK5-y0gSN-
Jackson’s collection reflected popular taste, with the inclusion of such pieces by Arne and Handel. This is a clear example of the filtration of high culture through all levels of society and demonstrates the wide-ranging tastes of the time.

Bowen and Shepherd’s writings on Jackson and his music give us an idealised picture of the man and the role of the manuscript book. As Rob Wegman points out, ‘We pick and choose, select and combine, whatever evidence we need to fill out the patterns we wish to perceive.’ 267 Under the heading ‘Music and Dancing in Jackson’s Time’, Bowen and Shepherd write:

There was considerable friendly interaction between the different classes and sections of society during Jackson’s time and some of these events were enjoyed by both the landed gentry and their servants and tenants. It was common for the landowner to arrange an evening’s entertainment for his servants. This was sometimes a dance and sometimes amateur theatricals, followed by a supper in the house. 268

Bowen and Shepherd’s vision of a rural idyll is questionable. It is an ideal that Bowen and Shepherd impose on Jackson in order to place him into the stereotypical category of ‘Folk Fiddler’.

The 1977 recording by Howes does not fall into this trap, with pieces given a wide range of interpretation beyond the straightjacket of the ‘folk’ genre. The inclusion of the banjo in the forces employed on this recording, for instance, is out of step with

---


the late twentieth-century drive towards verisimilitude and authenticity. Jim Bainbridge reviewed the re-issue of the album on CD.\textsuperscript{269} He writes:

much of the musical rhythm is outside the current dance
tradition, in that there are minuets, quadrilles and military items
here. However, most “English” bands would benefit from such
variety as this and no doubt it will be well used by musicians in
the coming millennium.\textsuperscript{270}

This review reflects the essence of my discourse, in that it recognises the multi-faceted
nature of the content of Jackson’s manuscript and other such collections. The Bowen
and Shepherd publication fails to consider that a violinist of Jackson’s ability would be
in demand locally to perform with and supplement visiting theatrical companies and
orchestras. His skills would have a ready market in the popular spa town of Harrogate
and beyond. I might suggest that the song ‘Cuddy Clumps first visit to London’ could
describe Jackson’s own experience in London.

It isn’t long sin I first com’d fra the North and so you must
needs think sirs
I’se a lad not easily humm’d unless it be when I’se in drink sirs
And somehow I don’t know which way but the folk up in town
be so droll sirs
That I must ha’ been drunk every day for they’ve humm’d by
gum one and all sirs.\textsuperscript{271}

The song’s ‘stage Yorkshireman’s’ anecdotal overtones could well belong to Jackson
himself.

\textsuperscript{271} Bowen, G. and L. and R. and R. Shepherd, \textit{Tunes, Songs and Dances from 1798 Manuscript of Joshua
The Daily Universal Register of 1 January 1785 (which was the forerunner of The Times) carries an advertisement for The Follies of the Day, Or, The Marriage of Figaro along with a New Pantomime, The Magic Cavern, Or, Virtue’s Triumph.\textsuperscript{272} The advertisement is as follows:

![Image of The Daily Universal Register, 1785 advertisement]

The final line of the advertisement is what is pertinent to this study. The sale of song words, most probably in the form of a broadside ballad, demonstrates how music and songs from theatrical performances were made available to the public. This dissemination of music and song gives a glimpse of how theatrical pieces were adopted into the popular culture of the day and into the manuscripts of the likes of Jackson’s.

The stage was a major source of material for broadside ballads. As John Holloway and Joan Black point out: ‘[T]he major London ballad printers were quite willing to print songs and ballads that originated in the concert hall or else were composed for many levels’.\textsuperscript{273} They go on to highlight this avenue of cultural exchange between stage and street with examples of concert hall performers depicted on broadside ballad sheets blocks. They cite several examples. For instance, ‘The block above the “Dustman’s

\textsuperscript{272} The Times, 225\textsuperscript{th} Anniversary, edition, 01.01.10.
Delight” shows a shepherdess, facing front, her arms in a characteristic stage singer’s gesture, as she stands against a stagily symmetrical background.274

During the Regency period there was a shift in popular culture. As Golby and Purdue point out, ‘An older popular culture – customary, and in which work and popular amusements dovetailed with each other – decayed and modern leisure emerged, commercial and individualistic’.275 Within the Jackson collection we see evidence of country dance pieces that are easily traceable to Playford’s Dancing Master; we see early ballad operas alongside contemporary hornpipes, illustrating the constant shift in the makeup of the country dance canon. Jackson’s collection demonstrates a shift away from the ‘older popular culture’ in its inclusion of pieces from the theatrical music stage, glee songs and pieces from popular writers such as Dibdin.

Each of the manuscripts under consideration in this work gives similarly fascinating glimpses into the evolution of the social dance and popular music repertoire. Dance instructions are included in Jackson’s manuscript. Often brief, these appear to be in the same format as those to be found in the country-dance music publications of John Walsh senior (1665/6–1736) and John Walsh junior (1709–1766). Their publications were but a few of the hundreds of such collections published during the eighteenth century. Alongside the publication of Handel’s works, their published country dance collections include:

- Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1713
- Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1714
- The Merry Musician, parts I-IV (1716–1733)
- The Complete Dancing Master (1718)
- The Complete Dancing Master, Book II (1719)

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1726

The New Country Dancing Master (1728)

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1731

The Third Book of the Most Celebrated Jiggs (1731)

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1732

Thirty New and Choice Country Dances (1735)

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1736

Caledonian Country Dances, Books I-III (1737–1740)

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1742

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1745

Caledonian Country Dances, Book IV (1745)

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1748

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1750

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1751

The Complete Country Dancing Master, Volume V (1755)

Caledonian Country Dances, Volume II, part II (1760)

Twenty Four New Country Dances for the Year 1763

I itemise this incomplete list of country-dance collections from the Walshes’ publishing house to exemplify the vast number of such collections printed during what must be regarded as the golden age of the country dance.276 Below the title page of a composite volume of Walsh’s publications held at the National Library of Scotland appears the following:277

---


Figure 8: Composite country dance volume.

The reference to the ‘Court’ is reminiscent of Playford’s introduction to the *English Dancing Master* and adds aristocratic respectability to the pastime of country dancing and its accompanying music. The other publications mentioned in this title page demonstrate the range of pieces published by Walsh (i.e., minuets by Handel, opera, theatre and song melody), a broad selection of music reminiscent of that found in Jackson’s manuscript.

The first volume of pieces from the Jackson manuscript focused on social dance melodies and notation. Following on from Wegman’s argument above, Bowen and Shepherd selected the contents of Jackson’s manuscript that suited their publication agenda, i.e., to meet the requirements of revivalist interest in traditional music and dance. Many of the pieces showing the diverse nature of Jackson’s repertoire are omitted from this first volume, giving the impression that Jackson had restricted musical capabilities and tastes. The second volume of the publication of the Jackson Manuscript, by R. and R Shepherd, contains many pieces that fall outside the country-dance form. There are pieces from collections such as Walsh’s, with the addition of glee songs, martial music and short classical pieces. These recent publications both contain
lists of the full content of the manuscript, which includes both ‘art’ and ‘folk’ items. One can only speculate as to how many pieces have been lost from folk revivalist collections because of their lacking ‘folk’ pedigree.

This significant manuscript of Jackson’s encapsulates his broad, eclectic musical tastes. From the evidence presented in both published volumes, Jackson appears to have been a ‘well-to-do’ businessman, with enough expertise on the violin to pursue musical diversions. The inclusion of such pieces as, for example, ‘Trip to Castle Howard’, ‘Weatherby Grange’, and ‘Lilling Hall’, maintains the aristocratic aspirations of the country-dance idiom. The prosperous spa town of Harrogate must have given violinist Jackson and similar musicians ample opportunity to engage in music-making. Jackson’s compilation gives us a clear insight into the popular music performed in a provincial spa town at the outset of the nineteenth century.

There are errors in Jackson’s notation. For example, ‘Peacock Follow the Hen’ is written in 6/8 time rather than usual 9/8 time. However, this may indicate that Jackson wrote the melody from memory rather than copying the piece from notation. Shepherd comments, ‘The occasional peculiarities in the notation and spelling suggest much was written from memory, which might explain the number of untitled tunes towards the end of the book’. Shep 278

Again we have the ‘folk music collector’ imposed upon the compiler of the collection.

Susan Wollenberg has drawn attention to the ‘National Music’ collection of John Baptist Malchair (1730–1812), which is a compilation of melodies taken from ‘the field’. Malchair, ‘leader of the Oxford Music Room (later the Holywell Music Room) band in 1760’, was a skilled musician. 279 Wollenberg describes his mode of working: ‘Malchair had trained his ear and the consciously retentive part of his memory to serve

---

him as recording agents, and as soon as he heard a tune they sprang into action. How many melodies Jackson wrote down from memory we will never know. The German-born Wollenberg was an observer/notary of vernacular music — an outsider, not a participant. I suggest that much of Jackson’s material was copied from printed sources, directly or indirectly. Untitled tunes abound in the manuscripts Campbell I and Leadley I, all of which appear to be martial music deployed during the Napoleonic wars. This leads to speculation as to the existence of a common source for such material. Melodies were published with generic titles or with no titles, for example, in works such as Patrick McDonald’s A Collection of Highland and Vocal Airs (1784). The eighteen untitled pieces in McDonald’s collection appear to have been taken from the repertoire of the highland bagpipes.

Shepherd, in his description of the compilation, acknowledges the diversity of Jackson’s music, such that it would appeal to ‘all levels of society’ and be deployed in a variety of social contexts and venues. The collection demonstrates the uniformity and consistency of popular pieces of the time, featuring compositions by Dibdin, William Felton, Handel, etc. Jackson’s compilation makes an interesting comparison, in terms of contents, to the contemporary collection and musical manuscripts of Jane Austen. The most noticeable differences appear to have been dictated not only by class disparity but by the instruments on which the collections’ contents were intended to be played, i.e., violin or piano. The sources of Jackson’s music warrant fuller investigation, especially pieces of theatrical music from the provinces. It is a significant collection

illustrating the diverse nature of the musical landscape at the outset of the nineteenth century.

3.6 Conclusion to Chapter Three

The examinations of the manuscript compilations of Atkinson, Vickers and Jackson reveal that the compilations’ contents reflect the current musical tastes of the times from which they emanate. These are not retrospective collections. Some pieces are carried forward from Playford’s foundation via Atkinson’s compilation all the way through to Jackson’s. There is a canon of music common to all three compilers, but each manuscript also contains its own unique character, contributing toward a process that endorsed and recorded the ‘popular’.

The technical expertise of the musicians also relates to the popularity of their instruments in their time. All three compilers were violin players, the instrument itself having reached a high point in its technical development during the early part of the eighteenth century. The popularity of the country dance during the eighteenth century is much in evidence in all three manuscripts, providing continuity with the foundations laid by Playford in the mid- to late seventeenth century. Vickers’s collection in particular illustrates a ‘high point’ in the popularity of this form of social dance. These are demand-driven compilations.

The three volumes are of the same format and indeed similar to the first edition of Playford. They are an eminently practical means of collating music for performance and/or pedagogy in a compact single volume. Both manuscript book and violin are both easily portable and lend themselves to use by a travelling musician or dancing master. Each of the compilers makes the ownership of his volume clear to avoid loss or
misappropriation. All three compilers are male; manuscripts compiled by women are in evidence later with the growth in piano ownership and popularity after 1800.

The compilers demonstrate varying degrees of musical literacy. Atkinson shows a reasonable level of competence whereas both Vickers and Jackson have lesser capabilities, with errors present in their notation. Nonetheless, all produced legible, workable scores. Each of the collections contains social dance melodies, but the influence of popular classical compositions, songs and pieces from the theatrical stage is much in evidence in the later Jackson compilation, which reflects a diversification and expansion of popular musical taste towards the end of the eighteenth century. This expansion is borne out by Gammie and McCulloch’s observations on the broad nature of the music included in the musical manuscripts of Jane Austen.284 The rate of change in the form of the music and the augmentation of its diversity gains momentum towards the end of the eighteenth and the beginning of the nineteenth centuries.

Martial music is contained in each of the three collections, as with the other compilations examined in this study. Similarity of form and tempo makes possible the dual deployment of melodies as both marches and dance tunes. One can only speculate as to whether the likes of Jackson may have been employed by officers for dances in their Mess in the garrison town of Ripon or the assembly balls of cities such as York.

One of the main commonalities amongst the three manuscripts is that they all show that the association of music with place is often a spurious linkage. ‘The Long Room of Scarborough’ (i.e., the assembly room) provides the title of a slip jig contained in both Vickers’s and Jackson’s collections. The inclusion of the piece in both collections does not tie the musicians to Scarborough, but it illustrates the overlap of material between them. Claims by the Farne archive that both the Atkinson and the Vickers manuscript represent a continuing, distinctively northeast-England musical

tradition have no real musicological foundation. What is striking about these compilations is the inclusion of melodies representing the whole of the British Isles rather than any particular enclave. This commonality of vernacular musical repertoire found in the British Isles must stem from printed collections like Aird’s. For example, Aird printed ‘The Long Room of Scarborough’, mentioned above, in volume one of his collection, which likely led to its inclusion in compilations like Vickers’s and Jackson’s.

‘The Long Room of Scarborough’ is only one example of compilers drawing upon printed sources. The contents of these volumes are a complex web derived from diverse sources. To categorise these musicians simply as ‘folk fiddlers’ imposes constraints on our current perceptions of their musicianship and audiences. This thesis contributes to the understanding and the unravelling of the many facets of the repertoires of eighteenth-century working musicians by going beyond a ‘folk’ paradigm.

4 Chapter Four: Campbell I Manuscript

4.1 Introduction

This section of the study is an examination of the handwritten musical manuscript book that came into my possession during the early 1970s. When I recently asked Peter Miller (of Ken Spelman’s bookshop in Micklegate, York) where he had obtained the book, he could not recall. The first element of this section comprises a description of the book’s physical properties and a statistical examination of its content. Throughout this section, I will explore how the manuscript reflects the needs of its compiler and his/her performance requirements.

The volume is bound in pigskin, measures 225 x 135 mm and has 86 unnumbered pages. When the book was first acquired, the spine of the binding had severely deteriorated. A professional bookbinder was employed to restore the damaged
spine sympathetically, in pigskin similar to that used originally. There are still some loose leaves within the volume. The general condition of the book is good, and there is little evidence of wear and tear considering its considerable age. The book has obviously been well looked after, and I would suggest it has lain dormant for many years. The paper used for the volume is of good quality. Watermark lines are to be found on many pages and a fleur-de-lis on others, this being a sign of good quality paper throughout Europe. Counter marks with the letters B, U, D, and G (of the name Budgen) are visible on several pages.

There is evidence of three consecutive leaves having been torn from the book; they may or may not have had melodies written on them. At the point in the book where the three pages are missing, there is a transition from melodies with titles to those unnamed, and the numbering of the melodies ceases four pages before this. One must speculate that these later melody titles and numbers were omitted by the scribe, who may well have intended to complete the task but never did. Because a large percentage of the melodies in the book lack titles, it is difficult to identify some of the tunes. A number of melodies are easily identifiable as they form part of the core repertoire played at the beginning of the nineteenth century. For example, the unnumbered tune at the bottom of p.46 (#96a, my numbering) is recognizable as ‘La Belle Catherine’, and the D-major setting ‘The Mason’s Apron’ is identifiable on p.48 (#100). In order to assist with the identification of melodies, this thesis lists the content of the manuscript as incipits, distinguishing those with a C base from those with a G base. (See Appendix 1.) These incipits will also assist in the future identification of melodies from this and other compilations.

The volume, I suggest, would have contained 48 leaves, so either a further two are missing, or they are those pasted to the boards of the book. The number 48 has many factors, so a book containing 48 pages is easily produced by the folding of large
sheets of paper. The melodies are written in the treble clef throughout, the first 116 pieces being numbered. There are unnumbered pieces written on the inside of the boards of the book, both back and front. These pages appear to have been glued to the outer boards after binding. The handwriting is in neat copperplate. The ink is now sepia, but I would assume it to have been black with a brown base, originally; it has faded. Most black inks have either a blue or brown base, with the exception of Indian ink, which is true black; therefore, Indian ink was not used in the production of this collection. The high quality of the paper has restricted the amount of the ‘bleed-through’ – that is, ink from one page soaking through to the obverse page – but some may be found. The book has six staves per page, and these have been drawn in similar ink to the notation; a staff pen was used to draw five lines simultaneously. I base this assertion on the varying intensity and depth of the lines drawn. Brause music-ruling pen nibs are still manufactured in Germany.

For the most part each tune begins with a fresh musical stave, and the melodies are kept to one page. However, there are exceptions to this practice. See ‘Bard’s Legacy’, ‘Sweet Kathlane Macree’ and ‘Cushlamachree’, for example, which do not begin on separate lines; instead, they have been written subsequent to the original preparation of the manuscript into empty staves at the bottom of consecutive pages. (Ms. pages 66 and 67). ‘Abram Newland’ (pages 18/19), ‘God Save the King’ (pages 22/23) and ‘The Little Harvest Rose’ (pages 68/69) similarly run across the bottom staves of adjacent pages. Pages 65, 72, 73 and 76 have the last staff left blank.

There are no pieces that require the turning of a page, suggesting that the volume was intended to be used in performance rather than to make a written record of the melodies. The music is thoughtfully spaced throughout the volume, which appears to be the work of an experienced copyist or musician. The musical notation is consistently neat throughout the volume, with the exception a few hastily written
melodies. The handwriting is uniform throughout and appears to be the work of one scribe. There is evidence of the writer drawing a straight line, in pencil, on which to write the title of each piece. I would suggest that this is evidence of the care taken in the writing out of the collection. For the most part, the pieces do not have any music directions although changes in tempo and dynamics are given in very few cases. Page 83 has a melody that may be the work of a different hand. It appears to have been written out at considerable speed with a broader pen nib, which may well account for its differing style; many of its distinguishing features are consistent with the rest of the manuscript.

Grace notes are included in many of the melodies, and for the most part these are restricted to simple appoggiatura. Some of the pieces employ grace notes that are eminently suitable for performance on woodwind instruments, such as the clarinet, fife or flute – for example, those found in the march ‘Cary Owen’ (ms. page 48, #102, see page 233). Many of the pieces have been transposed from their published keys and have been arranged to suit woodwind instruments (as with Leadley’s manuscript I), with many pieces set in C and F major in a high register.

The airs in the manuscript are mainly made up of simple four- or eight-bar phrases that are repeated and then followed by a similar four- or eight-bar development (what the Irish call the ‘turn’ of the tune); this is also repeated. This is the standard form of the majority of country-dance melodies and many marches. There are, of course, variations on this form. For example, eight-bar A sections are sometimes coupled with sixteen-bar B sections.

The pitch of the melodies indicates that many of them were intended to be performed on fife or clarinet while others are suited to the trumpet or cornet. One piece, ‘The Duke of Kent’s March’ (page 255), is arranged for two clarinets and a fife.
This piece is scored in C major for the clarinets and D major for the fife. The D-major part is marked ‘C Fife’, which would have sounded a whole tone lower.

As many of the airs are marches and many of the titles are martial in nature, it is more than likely that the volume was once the property of a military bandsman, as speculated above. There is no name, date or indication of the provenance of the volume, unlike the majority of the manuscripts in this study. The volume may have been at one time been army property rather than belonging one particular individual. This may well account for the lack of designated ownership.

The titles of the pieces contained within the manuscript give us some indication as to the date from which it emanates. ‘God save the King’ tells us that the volume must predate the reign of Victoria, who ascended to the throne in 1837. Other pieces also give us some approximate indication of its date, for example, ‘Nelson’s Waltz’ and ‘Lady Hamilton’s New Waltz’. Nelson died in 1805, but his heroic fame, along with gossip surrounding his affair with Lady Hamilton, lived on for many years after his death. Lady Emma Hamilton died in 1815 in poverty in France. On the basis of this and other evidence, I suggest that the volume is from about 1810.

Peter Bower of the British Association of Paper Historians has assisted me in identifying the watermarks and counter marks of the paper used to construct the volume. John Budgen of Dartford Mill, Dartford, Kent, made the paper before he went into partnership with George Wilmott in 1812.285 Bower states in his analysis that the ‘paper was probably made between 1808 and 1812’. This reinforces my conjecture that the date of the manuscript is c. 1810. As stated, Budgen’s paper is of good quality, and Bower notes that both Benjamin Franklin and John Constable made use of his paper in their work. It is possible that the paper used to construct the book may have lain in stock for considerable time before being bound into book form and also that the

---

285 See Appendix 3.
writing down of the melodies may have taken some time. However, the date 1810 for this compilation appears to be a sensible assumption; all the pieces contained in the volume predate 1810.

The consistency of the handwriting indicates that the melodies, though carefully written, were entered into the book over a short timescale. As there are few errors and corrections, I would further suggest that the scribe was accustomed to writing musical notation with a considerable degree of accuracy. It is impossible to ascertain whether or not the melodies have been copied from a separate volume, other works or taken down directly from performance. As discussed in greater detail below, I suspect that the former is the case. However, the settings of the more common melodies included in the manuscript demonstrate well-tried versions and adaptations with elements of sophistication and subtlety. For example, the tune of ‘Brighton Camp’ is set in 6/8 time as opposed to the more usual 2/4 time (p.215). This is an unusual adaptation of the melody, one not to be found in printed collections.

Other pieces suggest printed sources. Indeed, in some instances consecutive pieces suggest a common printed source. For example, ‘The fair Woman’ (ms. #153), ‘Turn Thy Wand’ring Steps, Fair Maid’ (ms. #154), ‘The Wandering Harper’ (ms. #155), ‘I was the boy for bewitching them’ and ‘Cushlamachree’ (ms. #156) were all printed in B. Crosby’s *The Irish Musical Repository* (London, 1808). These four consecutive pieces, with #155 being an identical setting, were most likely taken from this 1808 collection. Crosby’s publication also contains ‘Sweet Kathleen Macree’ (ms. #150) and ‘The Lakes of Killarney’ (ms. #166). The publication contained current, fashionable pieces that were utilised by the compiler of the manuscript. Like Atkinson’s, Vickers’s and Jackson’s, the *Campbell I* collection is emblematic of its time and up to date with current publications. It also illustrates the dissemination of pieces from printed source to manuscript for popular performance, then, latterly, adoption into the
country dances/martial music canon. The process of selection is what is fascinating here. One must ask, why were these pieces chosen, in particular? What made them appeal to the compiler of the manuscript? Do they contain any particular attraction or ‘hook’? This filtration process is evident throughout the manuscript, and a bespoke collection is the result.

The selection process took into consideration the demands of the compilers’ prospective audience. In the eighteenth century army officers paid musicians for providing the music for entertainment and social functions. Murray writes:

The officers of the eighteenth century sought more sophisticated entertainment, and music, in the civilian circles in which they preferred to move when not on duty, played a major part in almost every social occasion. It was … a logical step for the officers to provide themselves with music of a similar sort to solace their leisure hours. The officers … had to finance the project themselves usually by paying a monthly subscription into a band fund…. [In 1803] authority was given for one soldier from each of the 10 companies in the battalion to be employed as a musician and for him to play in the band. One non-commissioned officer was allowed to be employed as “Master of the Band”\(^\text{286}\)

Such band-masters may well have compiled the *Campbell I* manuscript and the first of the Leadley manuscripts.

The first decade of the nineteenth century, with the threat of invasion by the French, saw the establishment of local troops of reservists and with them small bands

---

of musicians. A broadside ballad of the time, ‘The Local Militia’, by J. Jennings of Fleet Street, commences:

The local militia are men of high renown,
Give credit to their country, and honour to their crown.
All with their muskets shouldered to meet the daring foe,
To go with Lord - - - that valiant hero.

CHORUS

Our fifes and drums shall beat, the band shall sweetly play
While the Local Militia lads, shall boldly march away. 287

This ballad illustrates the use of music as a tool for instilling military discipline into the corps of troops. Music was often an essential part of the marching drill for militiamen.

Holloway and Black, who printed the ballad in their collection Later English Broadside Ballads, set the context for the composition of the ballad:

In 1803, about 45,000 men were raised for the militia, and in 1806 an Act was passed to raise 60,000 men.

Difficulties were experienced, and in 1808 the local militia was established. ‘Lord - - - ’ was left blank so that the gap could be filled in with the name of the local commanding officer (the Lord Lieutenant). 288

With this large increase in recruitment to the militia, a commensurate enlargement of training facilities, including marching band provision, was necessary. This manuscript contains the requisite pieces, and more besides, for such a purpose. The collection includes many regimental marches and does not have a regional or specific garrison

focus. The inclusion of many social dance melodies suggests that the volume may well have been used for officers’ mess entertainment as well as drill and parade purposes.

The manuscript compilation juxtaposes music of violence and combat with prim social dance melodies, adding a bizarre, ironic incongruity to its contents. One piece sums up this incongruity. The untitled piece #180 (pages 84/85), written by William Reeve, contains ‘March’, ‘Battle’, ‘Groans of the Wounded’, ‘Retreat’, ‘Quick Step’, and ‘Dance after the Battle’. ‘Groans of the Wounded’ precedes ‘Dance after the Battle’, revelry following horror. ‘Dance of the Battle’ is a humble attempt at triumphalism in comparison to the scale of the climax of Tchaikovsky’s 1812 Overture, for example, yet it is emblematic of this era, with the fear of French invasion and xenophobia fuelling patriotism and nationalism.

The military content of the manuscript displays evidence of the violence of war not only in its titles but also in the martial nature of the pieces. Reeve’s composite piece, with its six distinct elements, falls outside the AABB form of the majority of the pieces in the collection. Piece #180 is very different in form from the other pieces in the manuscript in its composite nature, but it is emblematic of the contents of the entire manuscript in depicting the carnage of the battlefield alongside the sociability of the dance floor.

Synesthetic, evocative sonic depictions, like those used in piece #180, attempt to create visual manifestations and physical presence; they may form a powerful, often amusing or tragic impression in the mind of the recipient. Vernacular music utilises sounds to evoke chickens, hounds and horses – the sounds of everyday life. The canon of traditional music features ‘Jenny’s Chickens’, ‘The Hens March to the Midden’, ‘Meggy’s Foot’ and the epic ‘Fox Chase’, and there are many other examples of such pieces to be found within the traditional music canon.
Later examples may be found within other popular musical genres. In jazz, blues and pop, the sound of transport is often mimicked, with the car taking over from the train in the second half of the twentieth century as a dominating force within all urban life. There is a wide acceptance of this sonic canvass, as over the years we have heard ‘Take the 'A' Train’, ‘The Chattanooga Cho Cho’ and Gary Newman’s ‘In Cars’, which create a musical backdrop to our hurried existence. BBC’s Top Gear presenters screech around the racetrack to the Allman Brothers Band’s instrumental hit ‘Jessica’, generating excitement spiked with danger in a gas-guzzler’s frenzy. The marching band of the early nineteenth century was the motivating force of the army on the move; the quality and efficiency of logistics and transport were determining factors in the outcome of battle. The marches from manuscripts of martial music formed the musical accompaniment to the theatre of war.

The collection contains pieces from the constituent parts of the British Isles. Two Acts of Union were passed in 1800, and they brought into being the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Ireland in 1801. This unity is reflected in the contents of the volume and the makeup of the British army. Many recruits came from Scotland and Ireland; the inclusion of familiar marches and songs would have fostered high morale and esprit de corps.

Martial, social dance and popular song music performed in military ensembles of this era, encompassing repertoires like those contained in this manuscript, laid the foundations for the development of the brass band movement later in the eighteenth century. Trevor Herbert acknowledges this impact of the militia and church bands in the formation of the brass band movement.289 The first brass band was formed in Stalybridge in 1809. The interplay between church bands, social dance bands, brass

concert and marching bands is evident to this day, with musicians moving freely between ensembles.

What follows are detailed notes on each of the melodies within the compilation. As stated, many pieces are without names; identifying the pieces and establishing their provenance is an ongoing task. It is hoped that these notes will contribute to the body of knowledge regarding this time of conflict.

4.2 Notes on Contents

All titles, their punctuation and capitalisation are as per manuscript. The unnamed and untraced items are included in Appendix 4 to give the reader a full overview of the contents of the manuscript. Unnumbered pieces have been allocated bracketed numbers, thus: [#]. Melodies juxtaposed in the manuscript sometimes appear to emanate from common sources. They contain similar rhythmical and melodic characteristics to one another, which reinforces this conjecture. Some of the melodies untitled in the manuscript have been traced by the use of incipits; this thesis provides a title and details of provenance wherever possible, but some melodies remain nameless and anonymous. The writer of the manuscript included fewer titles in the second half of the compilation. Where titles appear, they seem to have been added after the notation of the melodies. In pieces #32, #42, #70 and #74, for example, the titles have been written around high-register notation. The task of titling appears never to have been completed; some pieces, perhaps, were nameless.

What follows are notes on the provenance of the included pieces, their composers, their printers, the longevity of their use, details of their social contexts and other pertinent facts. The full extent of the history and pedigree of some melodies has been shortened, and it is hoped that this brevity does not detract from an overview of the selection of pieces from printed sources into the vernacular canon. Many of the
melodies in the manuscript are taken from songs, and words from broadside ballads have been included in some cases in order to exemplify their popular adoption and the interconnections between the marches, dance tunes and songs.

Maggie Lawder, inside front cover.

There are many spelling variations of the title of this piece, for example: Maggie, Maggy, Moggy, Lauder, Lauther, Lawder, and Laidir. For the song melody, which was published in Dublin (1724\textsuperscript{290}), see Fleischmann’s *Sources of Irish Traditional Music*,\textsuperscript{291} #442, Vol. I. For the instrumental version, published in London (1738),\textsuperscript{292} see #783, Vol. I. The melody has appeared in many subsequent publications through to the twenty-first century. Variations have been adapted for violin, Scottish pipes, Northumbrian pipes, and Border pipes. Seattle writes:

Like other “big” tunes, “Maggie Lauder” does not have a fixed form but appears to behave like a living entity, evolving and taking on different characteristics in different environments. It


\textsuperscript{292} Cooke, Benjamin, *Twenty Four Country Dances for the Year 1738: With Proper Tunes Figures or Directions to Each Dance. The Dances Perform’d at Court and Publick Entertainments, the Tunes Proper for the Violin, German Flute or Hoboy, and Several of Them within the Compass of the Flute*, London, 1738. See Feischmann, vol. I, p.84.
changes according to where and when it is played, on which
instrument and by whom. Seattle’s examination of the melody cites ten settings for bagpipes, violin, etc., along with capacious notes and analysis, much of which is valid. His evidence demonstrates that the melody of ‘Maggie Lawder’ lends itself readily to variation. This adaptability may account, in part, for its sustained popularity amongst pipers and fiddlers wishing to demonstrate mastery of their chosen instrument.

A version is contained in the manuscript compilation of James Winder (1835–41). The inclusion of ‘Maggie Lawder’ in Winder’s book is further evidence of the melody’s popularity during the first half of the nineteenth century. Like the majority of the settings of this melody, Winder’s version is set in D major. His version comprises three sections whereas the Campbell I manuscript setting, in C major, has only two. Chris Partington writes in 2004, ‘[I]t is possible that his [James Winder’s] instrument, at least on some occasions, was the clarinet’; the same might be observed of Campbell I.

The melody, along with variations, has been published as recently as 2000 as part of the repertoire of the Clough dynasty of Northumbrian pipers, which demonstrates its well established place in the canon of traditional melodies (as does Seattle’s analysis of 2009). This melody was added to the collection after the main body of the book was written; it was adhered to the inside front board of the book rather than included in its pages. The pen nib used was broader than that used in the main body of the collection, lending the notation a heavier appearance.

---

'Rule Britannia’ was composed by Thomas Arne (1710–1778). Chappell, writing in 1855, states:

The music of this “ode in honour of Great Britain,” which, according to Southey,297 “will be the political hymn of this country as long as she maintains her political power,” was composed by Dr Arne for his masque of Alfred, and first performed at Cliefden House, near Maidenhead, on August 1, 1740.298

Chappell attributes the words of the piece to the Scottish poet James Thomson, who co-wrote Alfred with David Mallet.299 Sir Richard Southey’s prediction has certainly proved true. Both the song and melody have found their way into works by Handel, Beethoven, Wagner, Strauss, et al., and it remains, to this day, one of the most well-known of British national songs. The title is spelt and punctuated as ‘Rule, Britannia!’ in the original composition, but the compiler of this manuscript uses a single ‘n’ in ‘Britania’ and omits the punctuation. This spelling variation is only one of many that occur in the titles of pieces in this collection.

As a statement of purpose, at the outset of the book, the tune carries with it political and nationalistic connotations and significance, especially in light of the fact that the volume was more than likely the property of a military bandsman. The lines ‘Britons never, never, never will [shall] be slaves’ must have summarised the

297 Robert Southey (1774–1843), an English poet, biographer, essayist.
determination instilled within the members of the militia throughout the country when the threat of a French invasion seemed imminent at the outset of the nineteenth century. ‘Rule, Britannia’, along with ‘Speed the Plough’, is today the regimental march of the Royal Norfolk Regiment, demonstrating its continuing attachment to the military. The song continues to be performed alongside Sir Henry Wood’s Fantasia on British Sea Songs in the jingoistic culmination to the BBC’s Last Night of the Proms.

The Harriott, p.1, #2.

‘The Harriott’ is from Thompson’s Compleat Collection of 200 FAVOURITE COUNTRY DANCES, Vol. IV (c.1780). The Company of Fifers and Drummers website demonstrates extensive use of this march by re-enactment fife and drum bands in the United States. For example:

---

300 The Company of Fifers & Drummers, P.O. Box 277, Ivoryton, CT, http://companyoffifeanddrum.org/, accessed 12.07.10.
There is a transposed setting of the piece in the manuscript of John Rook, p.44.  

Willie was a wanton wag, p.1, #3.

Early printings of this piece are to be found in Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin, Vol. I #702, p.127. These include W. Thomson’s *Orpheus Caledonius: or, A Collection Of Scots Songs Set to Musick by W. Thomson* and James Johnson’s *The Scots Musical Museum, in six volumes, Consisting of Six Hundred Songs with proper Basses for the Piano Forte* (Edinburgh,

---

301 Rook, John, Ms., *Multum in Parvo*,  
http://www.cl.cam.ac.uk/~rja14/musicfiles/rook/rook_pages/index.htm, accessed 05.08.12.
1787–1803). The words of the piece were written by Robert Burns (1759–1796) in his poem ‘Bonnie Jean: A Ballad’. The first stanza reads:

There was a lass, and she was fair,
At kirk and market to be seen;
When a’ our fairest maids were met,
The fairest maid was bonnie Jean.
And ay she wrought her mammie’s wark,
And ay she sang sae merrilie;
The blythest bird upon the bush,
Had ne’er a lighter heart than she.\(^{302}\)

Burns’s poem, to the tune ‘Willy was a Wanton Wag’, was arranged by Haydn for London-based Scottish publisher William Napier.

**Quite the Thing, p.2, #4.**

This piece is arranged in two parts with the harmony made up of parallel thirds with some sixths. The key signature appears only on the first line of each part, as with the majority of pieces in the manuscript. The piece may be a march or possibly a lullaby. The A part of the melody is identical to that of ‘I Am Quite the Thing’, which is

---

contained in an anonymous early nineteenth-century manuscript from Staffordshire, forming part of The Village Music Project online collection. This version has been given a metronome setting somewhat faster than that of a lullaby, placing the tune into jig tempo. To impose metronome speeds on pieces two centuries after they were notated in manuscript form is a somewhat dubious practice, no doubt part of a homogenisation process of adapting melodies to fit current performance practice.

The Blue Bells of Scotland, p.3, #5.

This perennially popular piece is arranged in two parts, set in D major and pitched in high flute/clarinet register. Chappell, quoting from Stationer’s Register, points out that “The blue bells of Scotland, a favourite ballad, as composed and sung by a Mrs Jordon at the Theatre Royal, Drury Lane,” was entered at Stationer’s Hall on the 13th of May, 1800, and the music published by Longman and Co. The melody was also known at the outset of the 19th century as ‘The Blue Bells of Ireland’ and remains to this day prominent in the public canon.

Niel Gow, p.4, #6.

This piece was undoubtedly named after the Perthshire born fiddle/violin player and was most likely written by him. Neil Gow (1727 – 1807) composed and published many Scottish dance tunes and allegedly claimed the melodies of others as his own. The Duke of Atholl was Gow’s patron, and Gow worked for the Duke professionally, playing music for dancing. His compositions are now regarded as a foundation of Scottish violin playing. The same tune, set in G major, is to be found in John Peacock’s *Favourite Collection (of Tunes with Variations) Adapted for the Northumberland Smallpipes, Violin or Flute*, Newcastle, circa 1810.  

Lady MacIntosh’s Reel, p.4, #7.

In *The Fiddler’s Companion*, Kuntz notes that this piece ‘appears in Robert Bremner’s 1757 collection as “Knit the Pocky” (whose own “Lady Mackintosh’s Reel” is another tune).’ He also points out that the version in Vickers’ manuscript book (1770) is mistakenly set in D major and should be in D minor.

---


Duke of Gloucester's Troop, p.6, #10.

This is a well-crafted composition in six sections, and it is well suited to the trumpet or clarinet. Pitched in G major, the first section is a fanfare commencing with held notes taken from the harmonic series G D G', followed by a prolonged, arpeggiated chord of G major in common time. The next three sections in triple time, 3/8, are based on chords of I and V7, with arpeggios extending over one and a half octaves. The final two sections are set in a brisk 2/4 with rapid semiquavers culminating in a return to the arpeggiated chord of G major. The ‘troop’ is used as a call signal for the soldiers in camp or garrison to, as Donald Mattson and Louis Walz explain, ‘assemble the men for duty, inspection and guard mount.’\footnote{Mattson, Donald and Louis Walz, \textit{Old Fort Snelling Instruction Book for Fife}, Minnesota Historical Publications, St. Paul, 1974, p.99.} The form of this piece is the same as that of other ‘troops’ in the manuscript see ‘Buff’s Troop’ (p.205), ‘Bugle Troop’ (p.411), ‘The Duke of York’s Troop’ (see p.208), which display similar stylistic features. I have, as yet, been unable to trace the composer or source of these pieces, but they provide good examples of short, militaristic music.
Hornpipe, p.7, #11.

The first bar of this hornpipe is identical to that of ‘The Wind that Shakes the Barley’, printed in Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin (#5455), which contains other similar common phrases. The tune is set in G major, and although it contains no C#, in bar seven a modulation into the dominant is implied in the B section. Such modulations, especially into the dominant or relative minor, are a feature found in both song and dance melodies of the later part of the eighteenth century. The omission of the dominant leading note may just be an error, or it could be a modal feature.

Sweet Lillies of the Valley, p.7, #12.

This song melody was written by the composer and musician Hook (1746 – 1827), who was organist at the Marylebone Gardens (1768 – 1773) and Vauxhall Gardens (1774 – 1820). Hook wrote many ephemeral and popular pieces, including Sweet Lass of Richmond Hill. An identical setting of the tune is found in the J. Jones manuscript (1801, North Shropshire). The song text was published by Charles Wilson in his collection of ballads, The Myrtle and Vine (1800).

Nelson’s Waltz, p.7, unnumbered [12a].

Unnumbered and undoubtedly added to the manuscript later than the main body of material, this piece is more commonly known as ‘Lord Nelson’s Waltz’. A variant, in C major, is to be found in William Mittell’s manuscript (1799, New Romney, Kent).

The waltz became fashionable in Britain during the Regency period, having first evolved at the end of the eighteenth century. Peter Gammond and Andrew Lamb point out:

After invading European music about 1770 the waltz gradually replaced the stately and artificial minuet. One of its first appearances in piano music was in c.1766 in a sonatina by Haydn, the normal minuet being replaced by a ‘mouvement de Walze’.

The tune was printed in Collection of Dance Music for the Pianoforte as ‘Lord Nelson’s waltz’. An Auckland City Library display notes that it was ‘[p]rinted and sold by G, 18--.’ The ‘G’ of the display is George Walker. Frank Kidson writes: ‘Besides the popular songs of the day, George Walker issued a series of country dances for the pianoforte, in folio. This reached to at least 38 numbers, No. 4 being dated 1804, No. 16, 1808, and No. 38

---

published after or about 1814. There is no entry for Walker in The New Grove Dictionary of Music.

Paddy O Rafardie, p.8, #14.

Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin (#4345) cite as the source of this jig John Macpherson Mulhollan’s Selection of Irish and Scots Tunes, Consisting of Airs, Marches, Strathspeys, Country-Dances, etc. Adapted for the Piano Forte and German-Flute (Edinburgh, 1804).

Ca Ira, p.9, #15.

This piece was published in James Aird’s, Selection of Scotch, English and Irish and Foreign Airs, vol. IV. Anecdotal evidence claims that the original lyrics for ‘Ah Ça ira’ were taken from a Parisian street singer named Ladré (c. 1790). Many other myths and stories surround the piece, including one attributing the song’s inspiration to Benjamin Franklin, who at Second Continental Congress in commenting on the American Revolution reputedly used the expression, ‘Ça ira’ [It’ll be fine]. Franklin later became American Commissioner to the Court of Louis XVI and a popular figure with the French people. The melody was not composed for the song and is believed to have

---


been composed by Bécour or Bécourt, a drummer at the Opera, but there is no evidence to support this conjecture.

Brewer’s dictionary illustrates the aristocratic credentials of the melody, stating: ‘It went to the tune Carillon National, which Marie Antoinette liked to strum on her harpsichord.’ The first verse of the song with translation is as follows:

Ah! Ça ira, Ça ira, Ça ira
Le peuple en ce jour sans cesse répète,
Ah! Ça ira, Ça ira, Ça ira
Malgré les mutins tout réussira.
Nos ennemis confus en restent là
Et nous allons chanter Alléluia!

Ah! It'll be fine, It'll be fine, It'll be fine
The people on this day repeat over and over
Ah! It'll be fine, It'll be fine, It'll be fine
In spite of the mutineers everything shall succeed
Our enemies, confounded, stay petrified
And we shall sing Alleluia

The song acquired revolutionary significance during the 1790s with its adoption by the Sans-culotte. The first verse of Revolutionary’s parody followed by its translation is:

Ah! Ça ira, Ça ira, Ça ira
les aristocrates à la lanterne!
Ah! Ça ira, Ça ira, Ça ira
les aristocrates on pendra!
Si on n’les pend pas

316 Ibid, p.20.
On les rompt pas
On les brûlera ...

Ah! be fine, It'll be fine, It'll be fine
The aristocrats to the lamp-posts
Ah! It’ll be fine, It'll be fine, It'll be fine
The aristocrats, we’ll hang them!
If we don’t hang them we’ll break them
If we don’t break them
We’ll burn them ...

The adoption of the piece by Sans-culotte provides a stark example of its downward mobility through the echelons of French society, from the aristocracy to the proletariat, within a short time-span. The melody was later used as a march by Bonaparte’s Army. The song’s mantra, ‘Things will work out’, exudes a positive philosophy, and given the tune’s rhythmical nature and popularity, its adoption by the military seems almost inevitable.\textsuperscript{317}

S. J. Adair Fitz-Gerald, writing in 1901, relates several anecdotes surrounding the piece’s origins although they appear to be merely a reinforcement of myth and hearsay:

One of the earliest French revolutionary songs ... is Ça ira and we must set its date down to October 1789, when Parisians marched to Versailles.... The melody ... was composed by a...

\textsuperscript{317} Ibid p.20
player in the orchestra at the opera named Bécour or Bécourt, and was known as “Carillon National”.318

Various lyrics are set to the tune, with the twentieth century’s most notable rendition being that by Edith Piaf, recorded in 1954.319 Piaf’s interpretation of the song includes a militaristic accompaniment throughout on snare drum with fife-like, piccolo introduction. Her heartfelt rendition culminates in a stirring crescendo with modulations rising from Eb first to E then to F – enough to stir the blood of any revolutionary Gaul.

The piece is eminently suitable for marching, with the recurring rhythmical feature:

This is a much-utilised figure in side-drum playing and is found in many marches throughout the Campbell I manuscript. The melody has been deployed to accompany a contre-danse known as ‘Carillon National’, the same title of the original melody, as stated, and is popular with French-Canadian folk dancers to this day.

It is a matter of some intrigue that ‘Ça ira’ was included in the manuscript under scrutiny, a collection of mostly British pieces, and adopted by the Yorkshire Regiment as its regimental march. Below is the arrangement by Mark Andrews of ‘Ça ira’ as used by the Yorkshire Regiment today.320

As with most current Regimental Marches, ‘Ça ira’ is much played and recorded. Ardal Powell points out the Yorkshire Regiment’s historic links with the deployment of the fife as a military instrument. He writes:

At the Hanoverian accession to the English throne in 1714, fifes once again appeared with drums, having last held a prominent place at the coronation of James II in 1685, but now in a new form with a key like that of the flute. In 1747 the Duke of Cumberland, the Commander-in-Chief of the British Army in Flanders and the younger son of George II, ordered a fife and drum in camp at Maastricht, and the nineteenth Yorkshire Regiment, of the Green Howards, became the first marching regiment to re-adopt the fife. George II reviewed an Artillery parade in 1753 that included a fife major and five fifers as well as a drum major and ten drummers.321

I have quoted Powell at length as his account of the re-introduction of the fife into British martial music gives a clear indication of how well established the fife was by 1810, the probable date of the manuscript. ‘Ça ira’, a piece particularly well suited to the fife, was widely included in military repertoires of its time.

A detailed account of the acquisition of the ‘Ça ira’ regimental march by the Green Howards is given by H. M. Tillotson:

The 14th Foot were a part of the British expeditionary force under command of the Duke of York in 1793. During the approach march into France, the British column encountered a heavily fortified French camp at Famars blocking the route to Valenciennes, just south of what is now the Franco-Belgian frontier. The 14th and 53rd (Shropshire) Foot were ordered to clear the heights so as to open the route. The action was fierce, with the French revolutionary troops tauntingly singing the current popular song “Ça ira, ça ira, ça ira les aristos à la lanterne”, referring to the pre-guillotine practice of stringing up aristocrats on street lamp posts. When checked by the French defenders, Lieutenant-Colonel Welbore Ellis Doyle rallied the 14th with the shout, “Come on lads, let’s break the scoundrels to their own damned tune. Drummers, strike up Çaira” – and so they did, and the French broke.

By order of the Duke of York, ‘Ça ira’ was adopted as the quick march of the 14th Foot, the only march known to be taken in
battle. Today, “Ça ira” is the first part of the modern regi-
mental march, the second being “The Yorkshire lass”.322

The concept of melody being ‘taken in battle’ gives rise to intriguing musicological implications concerning possession and the spoils of war. It appears that the loser’s sonic identity, with its attached high French revolutionary significance, becomes in this instance an emblem of victory for the British, with the significance of the piece transferred and increased by its having been acquired in battle. The repetitive nature of the rhythmic pattern and melody will have assisted the swift adoption of the piece by the British troops. One must speculate regarding the manuscript’s possible other associations with the Green Howards; perhaps it belonged at one time to the regiment. The fact that the volume was discovered in York, plus the connections of the fife and ‘Ça ira’ with the Yorkshire Regiment, give rise to this conjecture.

Roger Waters, bass player and founder member of the progressive rock band Pink Floyd, composed an opera entitled Ça ira in 1998.323 The scenario of Waters’s opera is the French Revolution. The melody ‘Ça ira’, played on piccolo, is featured alongside ominous sounds of thunder and howling wolves in the opening bars of the overture, ‘The Gathering Storm’. The employment of ‘Ça ira’ in this instance is as a signifier, evocative of the period with its links to the Guillotine and the Reign of Terror.

In pondering the visually provoked signification of pictures, Barthes comments on their impact on the recipient: ‘[Pictures, melodies] are more imperative than writing; they impose meaning at one stroke, without analysing or diluting it’.324 I would assert that the same applies to melodies; ‘Ça ira’ is a signifier, a myth-vector, and a collation of historical events evoked by a simple melody with repetitive, rhythmic urgency.

Grenadier’s March, p.10, #18.

Winstock dates this march to about 1776. Writing in 1970, he states, ‘By the time of the Napoleonic Wars this march was accepted throughout the Army’. Winstock also notes that the march is still ‘heard in slow time at the trooping of the colour’.

Money Musk, p.10, #19.

This much-performed melody is believed to have been composed by Daniel Dow (c. 1776) as ‘Sir Archibald Grant of Monymusk’. The tune is to be found in many major collections of Scottish music. Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin cite Joshua Campbell’s *Collection of New Reels and Highland Strathspeys* (1786) as being the first publication containing the melody. They fail to mention Dow. David Johnson observes:

> Many minuets by Daniel Dow … appear in manuscripts of the 1765–85 period with no ascription at all, and one can only discover who the composers were by referring to printed collections.

---


He goes on to make further observations pertaining to the nature of ‘folk’ and ‘art’ music and the establishment of a folk music canon:

[F]iddle music was partly classical and partly folk. It was folk in so far as it was essentially unharmonized and based on monadic folk-idiom with gapped-scale melodies; in so far as it forgot the names of its composers, was kept going by amateurs, and developed its repertory – by classical standards – very slowly. It was classical in so far as it was transmitted on paper, and was influenced by classical violin technique.\(^{327}\)

These observations are of significance to this study in that they highlight the difficulties of establishing the provenance of pieces whilst highlighting common ownership of such melodies.

**Number one, p.11, #21.**

Kuntz includes this melody in his *Fiddler’s Companion*, stating that the piece is Northumbrian in origin.\(^{328}\)

**Roslin Castle, p.11, #22.**

---


This setting (#22) of the funeral march ‘Roslin Castle’, in A minor, is virtually identical to the D-minor setting in #187, the final piece of the manuscript written on the back inside cover of the book. This slow march, often performed either in E or A minor, was used for military interments throughout the army. Camus observes, ‘[I]t is likely that “Roslin Castle” was the most commonly performed funeral march of the [American] revolution’.  

James Kendrew, who worked in York from 1803 to 1848, printed blackletter, broadside ballads of the song ‘Roslin Castle’.

---

**ROSLIN CASTLE.**

'TWAS in the season of the year,
When all things gay and sweet appear,
That Colin with the morning ray,
Arose and sang his rural lay.

Of Nanny's charms the shepherd sung,
The hills and dales with Nanny hung;
While Roslin castle heard the strain,
And echoed back the cheerful strain.

Awake, sweet Muse! the breathing spring
With rapture warm, awake and sing!
Awake and join the rural song;
Who hath the morning with a song?

To Nanny raise the joyful lay,
O! bid her haste and come away;
In sweetest smiles herself appear,
And add new graces to the song.

O hark, my love, on every spray
Each feathered walker turns his lay;
'Tis beauty bemoirs the ravish'd throng,
And love inspires the melting song;

Then let my requited notes arise,
For beauty darts from Nanny's eyes,
And love my rying boom inspires,
And fills my soul with sweet aures.

O come, my love! thy Colin's lay
With rapture calls; O! seem'st awe!
Come, while the Muse this weakness shall twine
Around that molten brow of thine.

O hither haste, and with thee bring
That beauty blooming like the spring;
Those graces that divinely shine,
And charm this ravish'd breast of mine.

---

**THE ANSWER TO ROSLIN CASTLE**

FROM Roslin Castle's echoing walls,
Resound my shepherd's solemn calls,
My Colin bids me come away,
And tender demands I should obey,

His melting strain and tuneful lay,
No more the charms of love display,
I yield—no longer can refrain,
To own my love and bless my strain.

No longer can my heart conceal,
The painful-pleasing flame I feel;
My soul retracs the amorous strain,
And breathes back in love again.

Where lasts my songster? from what grove,
Does Colin pour his notes of love;
O bring me to the happy bower,
Where mutual love may bliss secure.

Ye vocal hills that catch the song,
Repeating as it flies along.
To Colin ears my strain convey;
And say, I haste to come away.

Ye zephyrs soft that fan the gale,
Wait to my love the soothing tale,
In whispers all my soul express,
And tell I haste his arms to bless.

---

Figure 10: ‘Roslin Castle’, broadsides.

Between 1840 and 1866, Preston printer John Harkness published ‘The Answer to Roslin Castle’.  

Such ‘answer songs’ are fairly common with several found in the twentieth century. For instance, Kitty Wells in her 1952 song, ‘It Wasn’t God Who

---


197
Made Honky Tonk Angels\textsuperscript{332} is a reply to the Hank Thompson 1952 hit, ‘The Wild Side of Life’.\textsuperscript{333}

\textbf{The Rakish Highland Man, p.12, #23.}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{TheRakishHighlandMan.png}
\end{figure}

‘The Rakish Highland Man’ was published in Aird’s \textit{Selection of Scotch, English and Irish and Foreign Airs}, Vol. III. It would appear that the compiler of the manuscript acquired many pieces from the Aird publications.

\textbf{Hey my Nanny, p.12, #24.}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{HeymyNanny.png}
\end{figure}

Andrew Kuntz traces this slip jig to the mid-eighteenth century:

The melody appears in the \textit{Drummond Castle Manuscript} in the possession of the Earl of Ancaster; it is inscribed "A Collection of Country Dances written for the use of his Grace the Duke of Perth by Dav. Young, 1734". Robert Bremner prints a version in his 1757 “Collection of Scots Reels”.\textsuperscript{334}

The melody is also to be found in Vickers’s manuscript in A major.\textsuperscript{335}


\textsuperscript{334} Kuntz, Andrew, \textit{The Fiddler’s Companion (Traditional Tune Archive)}, http://www.ibiblio.org/fiddlers/HES_HEX.htm, accessed 01.02.12.

Within a mile of Edinbrough [sic], p.12, #25.

Apparently the scribe has added the title of the melody after writing the musical notation. The space between ‘of’ and ‘Edinbrough’ in the title accommodates conveniently the high D on the ledger line above the staff.

The song “Twas Within a Mile of Edinbrough Town’ was written by Thomas D’Urfey. Simpson writes:

This tune [‘The Scotch Haymakers’] to Thomas Scott’s play *The Mock-Marriage*, 1696, Act III … begins “"Twas within a Furlong of Edinbrough Town,” and the tune is sometimes given that name. Henry Purcell wrote the music for two other songs in the play, and contemporary reprints include his name; this song is so credited … and is doubtfully admitted to the canon in the Purcell Society.\(^{336}\)

Simpson recognises the melody as being of English origin but adopted by the Scots. Referring to ‘The Bonny Grey-Eyed Morn’, he states:

It is worth noting that the Scotch Quality of the piece derives chiefly from the use of the proper name “Jockey”; neither text nor music has any real Scotch accent. But Scotch songs were becoming fashionable in the theatre [1697], and not unnaturally

the titles began to advertise even such incidental Scotch quality as is here.\footnote{Ibid, p.52.}

The song has been adopted as a Scottish traditional song. The first stanza is as follows:

'Twas within a mile o’ Edinburgh town,
In the rosy time of the year;
Sweet flowers bloom’d and the grass was down,
And each shepherd woo’d his dear –
Bonnie Jockie, blythe and gay,
Kiss’d sweet Jenny making hay;
The lassie blush’d and frowning cried,
“Na, na, it winna dae; I canna, canna, winna,

\section*{My Lady, p.13, #26.}

\begin{center}

\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{image.png}

\end{center}

This is a simple arrangement for two instruments. In piping parlance the term ‘seconds’ is associated with basic harmonies of this nature.
Careless Salley, p.15, #29.

A variant of ‘Careless Salley’ is to be found in William Winter’s manuscript, dated 1850.339 The melody is also in Vol. II of the Leadley manuscripts.

Cupid Recruiting Sergeant, p.16, #30.

This piece was published in Aird’s Selection of Scotch, English and Irish and Foreign Airs, Vol. 1. The press gang and the recruiting party feature in many folk songs and ballads. The George Farquhar play The Recruiting Officer (1710) and The Recruiting Serjeant: A Musical Entertainment by Isaac Bickerstaff and Charles Dibdin (1770) are both based on this mode of enlistment.

True Courage, p.17, #34[i].

This song was written by Dibdin (1740–1814). The first stanza is as follows:

Why what’s that to you if my eyes I’m a wiping?

---

A tear is a pleasant, d’ye see, in its way;
'Tis nonsense, for trifles, I own, to be piping
But they that ha’n’t pity, why I pities they.
‘If of courage you’d know, lads, the true from the sham,
'Tis a furious lion in battle, so let it;
But, duty appeas’d, 'tis in mercy a lamb'.³⁴⁰

Note the adjective ‘piping’ (line three): particularly pertinent in a collection of music for the fife, clarinet, etc.

**Tom Tough, p.18, #34[ii].**

This piece was also written by Dibdin.³⁴¹ Both of these consecutive songs of Dibdin are numbered thirty-four. Lesley Nelson-Burns writes: ‘In 1803 the British government paid him [Dibdin] to write a series of song to “keep alive the national feeling against the French.”’³⁴² His song ‘Tom Bowling’, which was written prior to these on the death of his brother Tom, is still much performed. One has to speculate that ‘Tom Tough’ was also written in memory of his elder brother who was killed at sea.³⁴³ Tom, like Jack, is a

---

generic name for a sailor. He also wrote ‘Gallant Tom’, ‘Poor Tom’ and ‘Tom Truelove’s Knell’. The first stanza of ‘Tom Tough’ is as follows:

My name, d’ye se’s Tom Tough, I’ve see’d a little service,
Where mighty billows roll, and loud tempests blow:
I’ve sail’d with valiant Howe, I’ve sail’d with noble Jervis,
And in gallant Duncan’s fleet I’ve sung out Yo! heave ho!
Yet more shall ye be knowing, I was coxen to Boscawen,
And even with brave Hawke have I nobly faced the foe;
Then put round the grog, so we’ve that on our prog,
We’ll laugh in care’s face, And sing Yo! heave ho!
We’ll laugh in care’s face, And sing Yo! heave ho!344

Peggy’s Love, p.18, #35.

This is a version of the much-played ‘Lord MacDonald’s’ (reel), printed in Gow’s third collection, of 1792.345 The tune also forms part of the core repertoire of traditional Irish music today. Bars 1–3 commence with 'snaps', a characteristic trait of many Scottish melodies. The melody is also known as ‘Little Peggy’s Love’.

Abram Newland, pp. 18 and 19, #36.

This piece is written on bottom staves, recto and verso, thus conserving space. Its title is a monetary reference. Brewer’s *Dictionary of Phrase and Fable* (1898) states: ‘Abraham Newland: A bank-note. So called because, in the early part of the nineteenth century, none were genuine but those signed by this name’. Abraham Newland (1730–1807) was the chief cashier of the Bank of England (1782–1807). Although the title of the piece is spelt differently, there is a strong possibility that ‘Abram Newland’ may have been the common parlance rather than ‘Abraham Newland’.

Newland was a musician. John Keyworth, the Curator of the Bank of England Museum, writes in a brief biography of the man: ‘As a young man he showed a great fondness for music and it is thought that he acted for a time as organist at a Southwark Church’. The tune is written across the bottom staves of pages 18 and 19. It is numbered in sequence, so it was not a later addition to the manuscript. Wilson includes the song in his 1800 publication *Myrtle and Vine*. The song commences:

‘Abraham Newland’

Sung by Mr. Davis, at Sadler’s Wells.

There ne’er was a name so handed by fame,

‘Thro’ air, thro’ ocean, and thro’ land,

As one that is wrote upon every bank note,

And you all must know Abraham Newland.

---

Oh, Abraham Newland!

Notified Abraham Newland!

I have heard people say, sham Abraham you may,

But you must not sham Abraham Newland.

(#37)

There is no melody with this number in the manuscript.

**Buffs Troop, p.19, #38.**

‘Buff’ in the title refers to the protective leather jacket worn by soldiers. Kuntz writes, ‘A buff coat was a distinguishing mark of a soldier of the seventeenth century and was a very stiff leather jerkin or jacket worn during the English Civil War.’

**Robinson Crusoe, p.19, #39.**

This piece is named, undoubtedly, after Daniel Defoe’s novel *Robinson Crusoe*, first published in 1719. The work captivated the public imagination instantly and remains

---

popular to this day. A rhythmically similar jig was published in Septimus Winner’s banjo tutor of 1864.

**Bugle Quick March, pp.20 and 21, #41.**

This march is placed on verso and recto of adjacent pages. The B part to the piece contains an attempt to obliterate an error of transcription. This is the only such feature in the manuscript.

**Lass if I come near thee, p.21, #42.**

This piece was included in the Vickers Manuscript as ‘Lass If I Come Nigh Thee’ (#65). Seattle notes\(^350\) that it is contained in Vol. I of Aird’s 1782 publication, *A Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs*, and Niel Gow and Sons’ *Complete Repository*, Vol. II (1799). A different melody is utilised for the Burns song ‘Wha is that at my Bower Door’. The version below is taken from Dick’s *Songs of Robert Burns* of 1903.\(^351\)


\(^{351}\) Dick, James C., *The Songs of Robert Burns, Now First Printed with the Melodies for Which They Were Written, a Study in Tone-Poetry with Bibliography, Historical Notes, and Glossary*, H. Frowde, London, 1903.

http://openlibrary.org/books/OL7136984M/The_songs_of_Robert_Burns_now_first_printed_with_the_melodiesfor_which_they_were_written, accessed 12.09.11.
often used pre-existing melodies for his songs, which appears to be the case in this instance.

The Rout is come, p.21, [#42a].

‘The Rout is come’ was printed in James Bond’s *National Melodies.* The following setting is taken from James Rook’s manuscript, p.110.

---

Duke of York’s Troop, p.22, #43.

A simpler version of this piece is published in Aird’s *Selection of Scotch, English and Irish and Foreign Airs*, Vol. IV.

God Save the King, p.22, [#43a].

The national anthem has been added to the verso and recto pages 22 and 23 very much as an afterthought; it is unnumbered.

Duke of York’s Quick Step, p.23, #44.
This piece was published in *The Gentleman’s Musical Companion* of 1803 in D major, see below. As with many pieces in this collection, the melody has been transposed into a key more suited to wind instruments.

![Image](image1.png)

**Moll in the Wood, p.23, #45.**

This jig is contained in Flieschmann, Vol. I #4076, and taken from *O’Farrell’s Pocket Companion for the Irish or Union Piper*, 4 Vols. (1804–16). The melody is a popular session tune to this day.

**Drink to me only, p.24, #46.**

This well-known song is claimed by Wall Callcott (1766–1821), a pupil of Haydn, and it was published in *A Select Collection of Catches, Canons and Glee*, by John Callcott (c.1790). The publication of this arrangement may have been the instigator of its popularity in America, especially with glee singers and barbershop quartets. The melody is commonly

---

thought to be by an unknown composer, predating the Callcott publication, but Callcott undoubtedly arranged the piece. Chappell, writing in the 1850s, states: ‘All attempts to discover the author of this simple beautiful air have hitherto proved unavailing, and, in all probability, will remain so’.355

The words to this well-known song are from ‘To Celia’, by Ben Johnson (1572–1637).

Song to Celia

Drink to me only with thine eyes
And I will pledge with mine;
Or leave a kiss but in the cup,
And I'll not look for wine.
The thirst that from the soul
doeth rise
Doth ask a drink divine;
But might I of Jove's nectar sup,
I would not change for thine.
I sent thee late a rosy wreath,
Not so much honouring thee
As giving it a hope, that there
It could not withered be.
But thou thereon didst only breathe,
And sent'st it back to me;
Since when it grows, and smells, I

---

swear,

Not of itself, but thee.

Gentle Cupid, p.24, #47.

The Gentleman’s Magazine: June, 1733 contains the following verses, attributing them to Jonathan Swift (1667–1745).\(^{356}\)

---

\(^{356}\) Sylvanus, Urban, *The Gentleman’s Magazine; or Monthly Intelligence for the Year, 1733*, June 1733, XXX, Gent, http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=U9kRAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA320&dq=%22Gentle+Cupid%22+tune&ei=LaUMTMKBE43y0gT43XR&sa=X&ved=0CBQQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=%22Gentle%20Cupid%22%20tune&f=false, accessed 07.06.10.
These verses are also attributed to Alexander Pope (1688–1744); the poem is included in George Gilfillan’s *The Poetical Works of Alexander Pope* (2004).

My time O ye Muses was happily spent, p.24, #48.

The words to this much-parodied popular song, ‘A Pastoral’, were written by John Byrom (1691–1763). Below, the tune is mistakenly attributed to ‘Byron’.

---


The manuscript version of this melody is undoubtedly intended for marching, as with many others of the song tunes included. A two pulse per bar emphasis, as is used in many marches today, would equate the 6/8 to a 2/4 march. The words of broadside ballads and songs of the time are an essential part of the reception of the melodies in the soldier’s ear and mind. I doubt that soldiers would have identified with the words above, but its parodies may have suited marching soldiers. For example, the ten-verse ‘A Slang Pastoral (1780), by R. Tomlinson, commences:

My time, O ye kiddies, was happily spent,
When Nancy trigg’d with me wherever I went;
Ten thousand sweet joys ev’ry night did we prove;
Sure never poor fellow like me was in love!
But since she is nabb’d, and has left me behind,
What a marvellous change on a sudden I find!
When the constable held her as fast as could be,
I thought ’twas Bet Spriggins; but damme ’twas she.

With such a companion, a green-stall to keep,
To swig porter all day, on a flock-bed to sleep,
I was so good-natur’d, so bobbish and gay,
And I still was as smart as a carrot all day:
But now I so saucy and churlish am grown,
So ragged and greasy, as never was known;
My Nancy is gone, and my joys are all fled,
And my arse hangs behind me, as heavy as lead.360

I winna marry oney man, p.25, #49.

The Burns song ‘Sandy O’er the Lea’ commences, ‘I winna marry ony man but Sandy o’er the lee’. The melody was published as ‘Sandy O’er the Lea’ in Vol. II of Aird’s collection of 1782 and also as ‘Mr. Baird’s Favorite Reel’, by Neil Gow, in 1788. Aird’s setting is in G major whilst Gow’s in D major. There exists, also, a Strathspey dance entitled ‘Sandy O’er the Lea’, which forms part of the current Scottish Country Dance repertoire.

Handel’s Clarionett, p.25, #50.

Below is ‘Handel’s clarenet’ from Jackson’s manuscript, page 34.

With both set in D major, a simple harmony, a third above the melody, is created by #50 when the two pieces are played together. The B section of #50 would need to be played four times. As with the Jackson setting of ‘Lovely Nancy’ (Jackson manuscript p.11), we are provided evidence that the compilation contained single parts belonging to a larger arrangement. It is difficult to ascertain how many other such cases are to be found in the manuscripts.
Sir David Hunter Blair's Reel, p.25, #51.

This reel is named after the wealthy Scottish entrepreneur and Lord Provost of Edinburgh Sir David Hunter Blair, Baronet (1778–1857), who financed the construction of Edinburgh’s South Bridge. It was published in The Mackintosh Collections, book four (1803). The piece is contained in Benjamin Rose’s manuscript compilation from Dorset, dated 1820.

Frog and Mouse, p.26, #52.

Published in Thompson's Pocket Companion for the German Flute (1797), the tune is associated by Kuntz with the song, 'The Frog He Would A-wooing Go' and others.

Brighton Camp, p.26, #53.

This piece is an interesting 6/8-time version of the evergreen 2/4 march ‘Brighton Camp’ or, as a song, ‘The Girl I Left Behind Me’.

The Preston Barracks was the home to the Brighton Garrison, but the ‘Brighton Camp’ is more likely to refer to transit camps at Shoreham. Preparations were made for possible French invasion along the south coast at the end of the eighteenth century. The possibility of the French landing near Brighton and then marching on London led to an expansion of the military presence in the area. There was an enlargement of the cantonments at nearby Shoreham-by-Sea as staging posts for troops bound for the continent at the turn of the century. This gained apace in the first few years of the nineteenth century with thousands of troops embarking for battle with Napoleon’s armies.

The simplicity and memorability of the tune has ensured its popularity for both marching and dancing purposes. The initial descending phrase is eminently suitable for playing on woodwind instruments. Its most recent notable incarnation was during the Second World War, in the Glen Miller arrangement ‘American Patrol’, which remains a dance-band standard to this day.

**Push about the Jorum, p.26, #54.**

A jorum is a drinking vessel. This is a much-published melody. Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin cite Charles and Samuel Thompson’s *Thompson’s Compleat Collection of 200 Favourite Country Dances* (Vols. II-III, 1770–1785), as the earliest publication.

---

The Fly, Quick March 22\textsuperscript{nd} Regiment, p.27, #55.

The current quick march of the 22\textsuperscript{nd} (Cheshire) Regiment is ‘Wha Wadna Fect for Charlie’. When contacted in 2010, the regimental museum had no record of ‘The Fly’ being associated with the regiment.

Tit for Tat, p.27, #56.

The melody is included in James Aird’s \textit{Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs}.\textsuperscript{365} As with a large percentage of pieces in the compilation, this piece has been transposed from D major to C major.

Caledonian Laddie, p.27, #57.

This piece was first published in O'Farrell’s \textit{Pocket Companion}, Vol. II, and transposed from D major.\textsuperscript{366} The following broadside ballad was printed by Harkness of Preston. A copy appears on the National Library of Scotland website.\textsuperscript{367}

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{365} Aird, James, \textit{Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs}, vol. II, McFadyen, Glasgow, 1785, #85, p.31.
\end{footnotesize}
This is a much played and written about march found in many manuscripts and published collections of both the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. It is an extended version of ‘Ca Ira’ (p.9, #15), dating back to late eighteenth century. Kuntz, in his extensive notes on the melody, observes that the piece is ‘from a collection of French
cotillions dated 1791 whilst Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin trace the piece back to Light’s *Art of Playing on the Harp - Lute - Guitar* (London, 1785). ‘The Downfall of Paris’ has been adopted into the canon of Irish traditional music as a set dance and hornpipe. The scribe utilises starkly contrasting, capitalised dynamics including ‘PD’.

**The Devil in Ireland, p.31, #63.**

A jig bearing the same title is contained in Joshua Gibbons’s manuscript (1823–26).

**Nelson’s Waltz, p.31, #65.**

The modulation into C major in the final sixteen-bar section is a feature of ‘art music’ rather than social dance melody.

---


Lake of Killarnie, p.32, #66.

The song commencing ‘On the lake of Killarney I first saw the lad’ was written by William Shield. Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin note that the piece was ‘[a] much admired song in The Double Disguise’, yet they include the melody amongst pieces from Shield’s Robin Hood or Sherwood Forest of 1784.371

New Highland Laddie, p.33, #67.

This march has been utilised over the centuries by the Scottish regiments. The tune was published in John Benson’s and John Playford’s Booke of New Lessons for the Cithern and Gittern, printed in London (1652).372 Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin cite 17 later published versions of the tune up to 1850, establishing it as one the most played of all Scottish melodies. Many verses have been set to the tune, the most well-known being those by Robert Burns. The first stanza is:

Highland Laddie

The bonniest lad that e’er I saw -
Bonie Laddie, Highland laddie!
Wore a plaid and was fu’ braw -
On his head a bonnet blue -
Bonie Laddie, Highland laddie!
His royal heart was firm and true -
Bonie Laddie, Highland laddie!\(^{373}\)

Chappell, in considering Ranters’ hymns, quotes the maxim, ‘Why should the devil have all the pretty [best] tunes?’\(^{374}\). This represents a shift in context from the secular to the religious rather than the more common inverse. We have then a further example of the re-contextualisation of melody. Chappell uses a hymn written to ‘Bonnie Laddie, Highland Laddie’ to illustrate the use of secular melodies for religious purposes. The following stanza was set to the tune:

Brethren, I must haste away,
Hallelujah, hallelujah;
Here I can no longer stay,
Hallelujah, hallelujah;
Happy, happy may you be,
Hallelujah, hallelujah;
Unto all eternity,
Hallelujah, hallelujah.\(^{375}\)

Chappell, encapsulating Victorian sensibilities, goes on to state:


\(^{375}\) Ibid, p.749.
If the original words should be coarse, or indelicate, they are thought the more to require this transformation. I do not stop to enquire whether the hearers can readily divest themselves of the old associations, – the motive is good without doubt, however ill-directed the effort.\footnote{Ibid, p.748.}

The English evangelist Rowland Hill (1744–1833) and the Primitive Methodists were the first to utilise the maxim “Why should the devil have all the best tunes?” Under the Ranters’ guise, the melody changes in its associated performance space and in its deployment purpose thereby reaching a wider public. This example of re-contextualisation demonstrates how melodies appear to take on a life of their own. A broadside\footnote{National Library of Scotland, \textit{The Word on the Street}, http://www.nls.uk/broadsides/broadside.cfm/id/15803, accessed 11.09.09.} c. 1700, held in the National Library of Scotland, features its own ‘Proper Tune’. It is probably one of the earliest extant set of words of ‘The New Highland Laddie’, which has its own separate melody.
This differing melody was included in William Thompson’s *Orpheus Caledonius* (London, 1725), both as a song and as a dance/march melody.

---

The song’s inclusion in the popular *Orpheus Caledonius* ensured widespread dissemination of both the song and melody.

As a quick step, the melody is often used for highland dancing and also forms part of the core repertoire of the war pipes. Many variations on this piece have been written for both pipes and fiddle. A variant is the Scottish reel ‘Kate Dalrymple’, which itself is set to words, demonstrating what many refer to as ‘the folk process’.
British Granadier’s [sic], p.34, [#70a].

This piece is much akin to ‘The New Bath’ in Playford’s Dancing Master of 1686.379 Chappell likens it to ‘Sir Edward Noel’s Delight’, ‘All You That Love Good Fellows’380 and ‘The London Prentice’, stating: ‘The commencement of the air is rather like “Prince Rupert’s March”’, and the end resembles “Old King Cole”’. He then goes on to comment, ‘[T]here is not any tune of a more spirit-stirring character, nor is any one more truly characteristic of English music’.381 Simpson, whilst considering ‘The Devil to Pay’ from D’Urfey’s Pills to Purge Melancholy, states: ‘The “British Grenadier’s” clearly descends from this old tune’.382 This manuscript version differs slightly from that which is currently played by the military.

Loch Vach, p.35, #71.


**My Nanny O**, p.35, #72.

Writing in *Early Scottish Melodies* (1900), John Glen castigates Chappell for claiming in *The Popular Music of the Olden Time* that this piece is of English origin. Glen’s rant demonstrates the significance placed on establishing the national origins of such pieces during the first part of the twentieth century. He writes: ‘He [Chappell] ought to have given his English version of the air, and to have stated from what source he had derived it’. For an extensive history of the melody, see Kuntz’s *Fiddler’s Companion*. This manuscript version is a transposition of the D-major setting from volume one of Johnson’s *The Scots Musical Museum* (1787). Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin trace the melody to *George Skene’s Musick Book* (1715–1717), which is held by the National Library of Scotland.

---

The Patriot’s Briton, p.35, [#72a].

This melody is a version of the ‘The New Rigged Ship’ or ‘Piper’s Fancy’, which was published in the first volume of Peter Kennedy’s ‘Fiddler’s Tune-Book’. The inclusion of the tune in this accessible collection of folk-dance melodies ensured its popularity in the second half of the twentieth century.

The Waterman, p.36, #73.

A ballad opera, The Waterman, was written by Dibdin and was first performed at Haymarket Theatre in 1774. Below is a playbill for a performance of the work in 1859 at The New Royal Pavilion Theatre, demonstrating its enduring popularity.

389 Kennedy, Peter, The Fiddler’s Tune-Book; 100 Traditional Airs, Hargail Music Press, New York, originally published by The English Folk Dance and Song Society, London, 1951, #90, p.44.
This march is printed by both R. Bride (1776) and Samuel Thompson (1780) in their collections of country-dance tunes. The piece may refer to the Assembly Rooms at Falmouth or the assembly of troops at Falmouth before embarkation to the continent. The piece, usually performed in G, is included in the repertoire of current revivalist musicians.

This piece was printed by Aird as ‘Lady Shaftbury’s Strathspey’. (See Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin, Vol. I, #2705.)
The song ‘Listen to the Voice of Love’ was written by Hook. Based on the arrangement above, from the later publication *The British Minstrelsie*, the manuscript transcription includes the introductory ‘symphony’ as well as the melody of the song.

This is the tune ‘Corn Rigs’, which dates back to the seventeenth century. Kuntz gives a detailed history of the piece and states that ‘the tune was printed in the Panmure 9454

---

MS, *Seventy-Seven Dances, Songs and Scots Airs for the Violin* (c. 1675). The tune still forms part of both the English and Scottish country dance repertoires.

**Untitled, p.45, #93**

![Image](image1)

This is a version of the well-known slip jig ‘Andrew Carr’, which is to be found in the current repertoire of the Northumbrian pipes.

**Untitled, p.45, #94.**

![Image](image2)

This is a simple jig in the Dorian mode. The B part of the tune demonstrates a simple recapitulation to the initial melody, making the piece a rounded entity.

**Untitled, p.46, [#96a].**

![Image](image3)

This piece is ‘La Belle Catherine’, also known as ‘Come Dance and Sing’ or ‘German Spaw’. The notes accompanying *The Itinerant Band’s* recording *Jefferson and Liberty* state:

---


“La Belle Catherine” is a French fife tune, and is reputed to have been played during the Battle on the Plains of Abraham, one of the last decisive battles of the French & Indian War. It had become a very popular fife and fiddle tune by about 1780 and over time, “Belle Catherine” turned into the dance tune now known as “Dance and Sing”.

Johann Hummel wrote a set of six variations for pianoforte on ‘La Belle Catherine’.

The tune was printed in Aird’s Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs, Vol. 4.

A setting identical to Aird’s is to be found in Benjamin Rose’s compilation from Dorset dated 1820.

Granthem’s, p.47, #97.

Note the modulation into the dominant in the B section of the melody followed by recapitulation into the tonic, which is also in evidence in ‘La Belle Catherine’ [#96a], with its lingering on the high A in the B section of the melody, followed by D.C. The two tunes, in contrasting keys but with similar formats, may well have been played as a ‘set’. ‘La Belle Catherine’ is untitled and unnumbered and has evidently been added to the compilation as a later addition.

**Untitled, p.47, #98.**

![Image](image1)

This is ‘Polly Put the Kettle on’, which was a signalling muster for breakfast in garrison or camp. The melody is also contained in Benjamin Rose’s manuscript compilation of 1820.399

**Untitled, p.48, #100.**

![Image](image2)

This is ‘The Mason’s Apron’, a reel that is still much performed, along with its variations, especially on violin or accordion.

**Cary Owen, p.48, #102.**

![Image](image3)

---

399 Ibid, p.20.
This piece, more commonly known as ‘Gary Owen’, was placed on the page before #101. Piece #101 extends over four staves whilst #102 uses two. The implication is that the numbering has been retained from the work from which the melodies were copied. It also implies that the numbering has significance as common reference for players performing from two or more books

**Untitled, p.50, #103**

![Image of sheet music]

This is ‘Over the Hills and Far Away’ with variations. Winstock cites the source of the song as D’Urfey’s *Wit and Mirth: Or Pills to Purge Melancholy*, but he observes that ‘[o]nly with the French Wars of 1793–1815 do soldiers report this song, especially as a loath-to-depart, one of the tunes traditionally used when a regiment left its cantonments’. ⁴⁰⁰ Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin publish a virtually identical setting to that in Johnson’s *The Scots Musical Museum*, Vol. I, of 1787. ⁴⁰¹ The song has recently reached a wide audience due to its inclusion in the popular television series *Sharpe*, based on the historical novels of Bernard Cornwell.

**Jammie Dang the Weaver, p.55, #115.**

![Image of sheet music]

---


This reel is more often known as ‘Jennie Dang the Weaver’ or ‘The Furze Bush’, amongst other titles. It dates from the mid-eighteenth century and has remained in the popular canon since that time, being printed in many major collections.

**Cameron House, p.56, [#117].**

Note the pencil line on which the title is written, demonstrating the meticulous care taken by the scribe in her/his creation of the manuscript. The melody is identical to that printed in Aird’s *Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs*, volume V. The following tune, ‘Gunnings delight’, is also identical to the Aird printing. Items #117–#119 have similar rhythmical characteristics. Placed on the same page, they would have been eminently suited to be played as a ‘set’ following each one another.

**Gunnings delight, p.56, [#118].**

This piece is variously titled as ‘Miss Gunning’s or Cummings Reel’ or ‘Delight’. The tune was published in *Thompson’s Complete Collection of 200 Favourite Country Dances* (1755). The melody was also published by Aird in Vol. I of his *Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs* (1782).

---

402 Aird, James, *Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs*, volume V, McFadyen, Glasgow, 1782, #199, p.74
As with many such dance melodies, a transcription from volume one of William Thompson’s publication is currently available on the internet via The Village Music Project website. This setting in A major is appropriate for violin whereas the manuscript is more suitable for wind instruments.

**The Carle He came ower the Croft, p.56, [#119].**

This piece was published in *Orpheus Caledonius* (1725) as a song and separately as a melody arranged for flute. Glen states: ‘We have not discovered this tune in any collection prior to the *Orpheus*. The rest of the contents of this early, landmark collection of Scottish songs are arranged both as songs and flute melodies.

---

The melody in the manuscript is a variant of this song. As stated, what is significant about the collection *Orpheus Caledonius* is that its contents are in two forms, i.e., song with melody plus un-figured bass and a separate setting for the flute. This early publication demonstrates the dual deployment of melodies and illustrates a symbiotic relationship between dance and military music and song melody. The work was republished in 1733 and expanded to contain 100 songs in two volumes.
Rose Tree, p.57, [#121].

Kuntz, in his online *Traditional Tune Archive*,\(^{406}\) gives a detailed history of the melody, including its appearance as a song in the opera *The Poor Old Soldier* by William Shield (1782) under the title, ‘A Rose Tree in Full Bearing’. He goes on to state:

James Aird gives the melody the title “The Dainty Besom Maker” in his first volume of Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs (c. 1778) … the tune was printed in Thompson’s 24 Country Dances for the Year 1764 under the title “The Irish Lilt”.

Simplicity and ease of recollection have contributed to the tune’s popularity, which endures to the present day.

Ca the Ewes, p.57, [#123].

This plaintive melody was put to a song by Burns and subsequently arranged by both Vaughan Williams and Benjamin Britten under the title ‘Ca’ the Yowes’.

Lady Caroline Lee’s Waltz, p.58, [#124].

Also known as ‘The Gloucester Waltz’, and reputedly composed by the enigmatic Lady Caroline Lee, this piece is included in Jane Austen’s manuscript (2:25). Gammie and McCulloch state that it was ‘arranged as Rondo for pianoforte…London c1800. They go on to point out that ‘[t]hough various entries in DNB (National Dictionary of National Biography) may point directly to her [Lee] or her family, no conclusive evidence of identity can be found’. The waltz is contained in several other manuscripts, including the Thomas Sands Manuscript dated 1810.

My Ain Kind Dearie, p.59, [#128].

This is a song by Burns, ‘My Ain Kind Dearie’. Known also as ‘The Lea Rig’, this tune has many variations written to its theme. This three-sectioned version in the manuscript demonstrates elements of the melody’s adaptability. As with the first tune in this collection, ‘Maggie Lawder’, this piece has become an integral part of the Scottish pipe and fiddle repertoire. The piece is to be found in Jane Austen’s music manuscript (2:33), with seven sets of variations by Domenico Corri (1746–1825). Below is a set of

---

408 Ibid, p.38.
variations recently published, written by Northumbrian small-pipe player Tom Clough.\textsuperscript{411}

Clough’s virtuoso playing and adapted chanter enabled the rendition of ‘Lea Rigges’ in A major whereas he played ‘My Ain Kind Dearie’ with variations in the key of G major, more playable on the Northumbrian pipes.\textsuperscript{412}

\textsuperscript{411} Ormston, Chris and Julia Say, \textit{The Clough Family of Newsham}, Northumbrian Pipers’ Society, Newcastle, 2000, p.112.

\textsuperscript{412} Ibid, p.111.
These two sets of variations demonstrate how song melody with a simple motif is adopted into vernacular usage, developed and extended. Variations on ‘Lee Rigg’ are to be found in Rook’s manuscript (1840), demonstrating the longevity of sets of variations of this type.

Cupid's Waltz, p.63, [#138].

Peter Kennedy included Cupid's Waltz in his two-volume publication The Fiddler’s Tune-Book. This landmark collection, along with Hugh McDermott’s Allen’s Irish

---

414 Kennedy, Peter, The Fiddler’s Tune-Book; 100 Traditional Airs, Hargail Music Press, New York, originally published by The English Folk Dance and Song Society, London, 1951, p.34.
Fiddler,\textsuperscript{415} formed the basis of the repertoire available to the reviver ‘folk fiddler’, in print in the mid-twentieth century. These two collections, along with Kerr’s Merry Melodies, were the only mass-circulation collections readily available in music shops until O’Neill’s Music of Ireland\textsuperscript{416} was reprinted in the 1970s. The waltz section of the popular ‘barn dance’ called ‘Swedish Masquerade’ is a variant of ‘Cupid’s Waltz’. Kennedy’s setting of the tune places the Campbell I C-section first, exemplifying the interchangeable nature of the sections of the piece.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{swedish-masquerade.png}
\caption{Swedish Masquerade}
\end{figure}

Bath Waltz, p.63, [#139].

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{bath-waltz.png}
\caption{Bath Waltz}
\end{figure}

‘The Bath Waltz’ is to be found in many of the manuscripts emanating from the late eighteenth century and early nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{417} As a result of current enthusiasm for traditional social dance material, it is available both online and in print. Clare, the Northamptonshire poet, has three distinct versions of ‘The Bath Waltz’ in his manuscript compilation. Two are virtually identical to the version above, but pitched in Bb major and G major;\textsuperscript{418} a third is an unrelated waltz tune. It would appear on

\textsuperscript{415} McDermott, Hugh, \textit{Allan’s Irish Fiddler}, Mozart Allen, Glasgow, n.d.
\textsuperscript{417} Kuntz, Andrew, \textit{Fiddler’s Companion (Traditional Tune Archive)}, http://www.ibiblio.org/fiddlers/BARN_BB.htm, accessed 29.01.12.
inspection that the manuscript version of ‘The Bath Waltz’, above, was taken from the same source as Clare’s setting, as yet untraced.

**Mozart’s Grand Waltz, p.64, [#141].**

This piece may also be found in James Nuttall’s manuscript (c. 1830) from Rossendale, Lancashire. Whether composed by Mozart or not, this piece appears to have acquired popularity in the first half of the nineteenth century. Virtuoso double bass player Domenico Dragonetti’s arrangement of the piece for piano was published c. 1820 in Edinburgh.

**Cheltenham, p.65, [#143].**

The four 3/8-time pieces #143–#146 form a set of waltzes that share rhythmical characteristics. I suggest they were taken from a common source, as yet untraced. There exist two not dissimilar melodies entitled ‘The Cheltenham Waltz’. One is to be found a

---

manuscript book (1830) compiled by C. J. Fox of Beverley, housed in the Kidson Collection at the Mitchell Library in Glasgow. The other version is contained in the music manuscript of Northamptonshire ‘peasant’ poet Clare. Both are available through the *Village Music Project* and other websites.

**Untitled, p.66, [#146].**

[Image of sheet music]

This waltz is contained in Benjamin Rose’s manuscript compilation of 1820. Rose’s setting is in two parts and is identical except for the omission of the third part. He uses the title the ‘Copenhagen Waltz’. The piece is to be found in several other manuscript compilations from the first half of the nineteenth century (those of James Winder and John Moore, for example); it is therefore clear that it was in popular circulation. Renditions are to be found on You Tube.

**Bard’s Legacy, p.66, [#147].**

[Image of sheet music]

---


421 Pollock, Lorna, accordion, [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kiX7aaWXYKw](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kiX7aaWXYKw), accessed 06.06.12.
This jig, which remains popular to this day, was published in *O'Farrell's Pocket Companion for the Irish or Union Pipes* in four volumes (1804–1816).\(^{422}\) With the exception of its transposition into D major, the O'Farrell setting is identical.

\[ \text{Coolin, p.67, [#148].} \]

The ‘Coolin’ is a much-played slow air that forms part of the current core repertoire for the uilleann pipes. The air was published in Aird’s *Selection of Scotch, English and Irish and Foreign Airs*, vol. 5, and also in Niel Gow’s *Part Second of the Complete Repository of Original Scots Tunes, Strathspeys, Jiggs and Dances*, Edinburgh (1799–1817). ‘The Coolun with Variations’ is contained in Jane Austen’s manuscript (2:22).\(^{424}\) Gammie and McCulloch state that the Irish song, ‘Oh! The Hours I have passed in the Arms of my Dear’, is set to this melody and speculate that the variations are by William Shield (1748–1828), composer and one-time organist of Newcastle Cathedral.\(^{425}\) The air was noted between 1792 and 1805 by Bunting,\(^{426}\) and O’Neill published a set of variations on the melody in


1903.\textsuperscript{427} Kuntz, in his extensive notes on the tune, cites the Grattan Flood as the basis for his suggestion that ‘[t]he tune was played by Irish harper Charles Fanning for the first prize … at a harp festival organised at Grannard in 1781’.\textsuperscript{428} Thomas Moore is often credited with the setting of the melody and words to the piece. It remains a popular item performed at weddings in Ireland today.

**Scots over the Border, p.67, [#149].**

More commonly known as ‘The Scotsman Over the Border’, this tune has been much played as part of the revival of Celtic music at the end of the twentieth century and the beginning of the twenty-first century.

**Sweet Kathlane Macree, p.67, [#150].**

This melody was published in London (1808) in B. Crosby’s *The Irish Musical Repository*, a collection of Irish songs.\textsuperscript{429}

\textsuperscript{428} Kuntz, Andrew, *Fiddler’s Companion (Traditional Tune Archive)*, http://www.ibiblio.org/fiddlers, accessed 04.08.10.
Little Harvest Rose, p.68, [#153].

This melody is written across the bottom staves of pages 68 and 69. The song was collected by Edward Bunting (Ms. 28, #81), who published the melody in *A General Collection of Irish Music* (1796). The source from which the compiler of the manuscript most likely obtained the melody is Smollet Holden’s *Collection of the Most Esteemed Old Irish Melodies* (c. 1807). O’Neill published the piece in his *Music of Ireland, Eighteen Hundred and Fifty Melodies*, amongst his collection of the compositions of Turlough O’Carolan (1670–1738). O’Sullivan does not list the melody in his collection of O’Carolan pieces; therefore, he may not have considered it to be the work of the composer.

Oh Nanny, p.69, [#154].

This song, composed by Dubliner Charles Thomas Carter, is also contained in the music manuscript of Jane Austin [3.03], where it is arranged for voice, violins and

---

cembalo. Austin’s manuscript contains four verses of the song using the name ‘Nancy’ rather than ‘Nanny’. The melody is also contained in the 1820 manuscript compilation of Benjamin Rose from Dorset.\textsuperscript{534}

\textbf{The fair Woman, p.69, [#155].}

Fleischmann and Ó Sáilleabháin categorise this melody (Bean bhán) as a spinning song.\textsuperscript{435} The piece was printed in Vol. I of Edward Bunting’s \textit{General Collection of Irish Music}, published 1796. Thomas Moore set the melody to the verse ‘Turn Thy Wand’ring Steps, Fair Maid’, published in \textit{A Selection of Irish Melodies} (1807).

\textbf{The Wandering Harper, p.70, [#156].}

This melody was first published as ‘The Unfortunate Rake’ (c1805) in \textit{Collection of Quick and Slow Marches, Troop, etc. for the Piano-forte or Harpsichord composed by Smollet Holden}.\textsuperscript{436} Holden’s melody utilises the harmonic minor scale whereas the manuscript setting is in the Dorian mode, with the exception of the final slow section, which utilises D#s. Crosby published the melody in \textit{The Irish Musical Repository} (London, 1808). The melody was latterly included as a two-part double jig, ‘The Unfortunate Rake’, in \textit{O’Neill’s Music...
of Ireland, Eighteen Hundred and Fifty Melodies,\textsuperscript{437} demonstrating its place in the Irish Diaspora in Chicago. The piece forms part of the current Irish core repertoire of traditional tunes. The third strain of the melody in the manuscript setting is a slow air in 3/4 time. The inclusion of the low D# as the leading note in the final cadence renders the piece eminently suitable to be played on a single-keyed, open-system fife.

Figure 15: Single-keyed, open-system fife

Lloyd and Vaughan Williams point out that an eighteenth-century broadside ballad called ‘The Unfortunate Lad’ was printed by Henry Such of Union Street (Borough, London),\textsuperscript{438} in their notes on the song ‘The Young Girl Cut Down in her Prime’. This is a gender change from the more usual soldier, sailor, boy, etc. Lloyd and Vaughan Williams take their example from The Folk Song Journal IV, p.325:

At the end of the eighteenth century a homilectic [sic] street ballad spread in England concerning the death and ceremonial funeral of a soldier ‘disordered’ by a woman…. [It is still [1959] a common song in the British army…. In America, the song has been adapted to the cattle range (‘The Cowboy’s Lament’ or ‘Streets of Laredo’) and the gambling hall (‘St. James’s Infirmary’). The motive of the ceremonial funeral remains constant, despite all the transformations of the chief character.\textsuperscript{439}

The final part of the manuscript version, being a lament, leads one to speculate that it may well have been utilized for funeral ceremonies. The Bodleian Library Allegro Catalogue of Ballads\(^{440}\) contains several versions of the following text:

![Image of 'The Unfortunate Lad' text]

Figure 16: ‘The Unfortunate Lad’

The final verse describes the funeral cortège, with pipes and drums sounding. The pipes in this case may well have been fifes and/or flutes. Many of versions of this ballad, like this one, focus on the Lock Hospital, which opened in 1749 and was the first hospital for the treatment of venereal disease. A comprehensive study of the ballad and its significance in folklore is contained in “‘The Unfortunate Rake’ and his Descendents’, written by Kenneth Lodewick in 1955 for The Journal of the Western Folklore Society.\(^{441}\) This is undoubtedly one the unreferenced sources of Lloyd’s notes on the ballad. Lodewick writes:

\(^{440}\) Bodleian Library Allegro Catalogue of Ballads, http://www.bodley.ox.ac.uk/ballads/ballads.htm, Harding B 15(341a) accessed 03.08.12.

The earliest version “The Unfortunate Rake” was a soldier’s song. The hero died of syphilis contracted from a camp follower. Almost all armies of that day had an army of prostitutes and other hangers-on with it, a situation which had been common for centuries.  

The melody in the manuscript is a variation of the ‘Rogue’s March’, which was played at the ceremonial cashierment, i.e., dishonourable dismissal, of soldiers.

**I was the boy for Bewitching them, p.70, [#157].**

![Image](image1.png)

This piece is identical, in every detail, to that published in Crosby’s *The Irish Musical Repository* (London, 1808).  

**Cushlamachree, p.70, [#158].**

![Image](image2.png)

Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin trace this melody to James Aird’s *Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs, Adapted for the Fife, Violin or German Flute*, Vols. I-VI (Glasgow, 1790–97), under the title ‘Pastheen Fuen’, i.e., ‘The Fair-haired Child’.

---

442 Ibid, p.98.  
444 Ibid, p.523.
Cushlamachree is Erse and translates as ‘darling of my heart’ or ‘my heart’s child’. The melody has words written by John Philgot Curran (1750–1817). The first stanza is:

Dear Erin, how sweetly thy green bosom rises!
An emerald set in the ring of the sea.
Each blade of thy meadows my faithful heart prizes,
Thou queen of the west, the world’s cushlamachree.

In the mid-eighteenth century, at a high point of emigration from Ireland, the following variant parlour ballad was published.\(^445\)

Tekeli is a village near Kladovo, Kazakhstan, now Serbia. The melody was written by James Hook (1746–1827). Fleischmann and Ó Súilleabháin write:

[Published in Lee’s Collection of Country Dances for the Present Year, c.1795 (This collection has been misdated, and should be ascribed to c.1810). ‘New Tekeli’ (Title taken from John Hooke’s Tekeli The Siege of Mongate, a grand Meli Drama, as performed at the Theatre Royal, Dury Lane, London, 1808).]

The melodrama, written by John Hooke, was first performed in 1806, with incidental music provided by his father James. The work is to be found in three forms, as David Jackson explains: ‘three-act or two-act melodrama or burletta with songs’. The three acts were first performed in 1806, and the abridged New Tekeli was first performed in 1809. As the work is latterly attributed to Theodore Hook (1788–1841), one must presume he contributed to the libretto of the two-act form of the work. The melodrama was widely performed in Britain and the United States during the nineteenth century. A poster for the Theatre Royal in Hull, dated 3 September 1849, attributes the authorship to Theodore Hook and lists the performers as:

TEKELI or THE HUNGARIAN PATRIOT

author: Hook, Theodore Edward, Mr., 1788–1841

---

actors: Mr Pritchard, Mr John Langford, Mr. Bellair, Miss. Laporte, Mr Bower.  

Drops of Brandy, p.74, [#166].

A much-printed and played tune, this slip jig is confined to one octave. It continues to be a firm favourite amongst players of traditional music. This is especially so amongst pipers as its range, in many versions, falls easily onto the nine-hole simple chanter.

The Duke of Cumberland's March, p.79, [#176].

This march is made up of an A section of 11 bars and a 22-bar B section.

The Hawthorn, p.79, [#177].

Kuntz states that this is a ‘Scottish, Air. A part of James Oswald’s suite for 12 flowers in each of four seasons’.

---

The Wandering Sailor, pp.80 & 81, [#178].

This is the only song with lyrics in the compilation. Composed by Samuel Arnold (1740–1802), ‘The Wandering Sailor’ was published by Thompson, c. 1793, with flute accompaniment. This may well account for the inclusion of the melody and words in this collection of instrumental pieces. The song is taken from the comic opera Summer Amusement or an Adventure at Margate (1779), with libretto by W. A. Miles and M. P. Andrews.

450 Kuntz, Andrew, Fiddler’s Companion (Traditional Tune Archive), http://www.ibiblio.org/fiddlers/HAS_HAZ.htm, accessed 29.01.12.
The Duke of Kents March - Arranged for Clar’s. 1, 2 & C Fife, p.82, [#179].

This is the one piece in the collection arranged for three instruments. The ‘C Fife’ would sound a whole tone below the written pitch whereas the clarinets would be non-transposing in concert C. This piece gives a good indication as to the instruments on which the whole of the collection was intended to be played. A large proportion of the melodies in the collection are at this pitch.

Sweet Sleeps the Moon, p.83, [#180].

The song ‘Sweet Sleeps the Moon’ was composed by Shield. This is an elaborate development of the melody, most likely an accompaniment to the song.
Untitled – [Troop], ‘Battle, Groans of the Wounded, Retreat, Quick Step, Dance after the Battle’, pp.84 & 85, [#182].

The first section of this composite piece has the title ‘Troop’ written in pencil above the first staff rather than in the usual ink. The initial march is played to this day and forms part of the canon of traditional Irish music. It was published in Aird’s Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs, Vol. 4.\textsuperscript{451}

Transposed into C major for the manuscript, this piece, as Aird’s publication states, is from *Oscar and Malvina*, by William Reeve (1757–1815). Halliwell writes:

Reeve’s composing career was given an unexpected boost in 1791; William Shield resigned from Covent Garden, leaving a pantomime, *Oscar and Malvina*, unfinished. Reeve completed the piece, and its success secured his place as the composer of many of the Covent Garden operas and pantomimes over a period of fifteen years.\(^{452}\)

---

Reeve was noted for his adaptations of other composers’ work, if not blatant plagiarism. Halliwell continues:

During this time he earned a reputation for unashamedly borrowing and adapting the music of other composers, adding these works to his own compositions to create simple, memorable tunes for populist productions.

To the contrary, this would appear not to be the case with this set of melodies, which resemble in format Francis Ketzwara’s later work *The Battle of Prague*, which was written in 1798 for piano, violin, ‘cello and optional drums. Ketzwara’s composition, later arranged for piano, became one of the most popular pieces of the early nineteenth century. The extract below is from a copy in the Levy Collection[^453] and illustrates Ketzwara’s populist deployment of ‘God Save the King’ in a ‘Bohemian’ piece, thereby stirring up British nationalist fervour during the Napoleonic Wars. Victoria Parakilas writes:

This was neither the first nor the most elegant publication of the work, but it was an important one in making it one of the bestselling pieces of the era, especially in the English speaking world. It may seem odd to find ‘God Save the King’ at the moment of victory in a work commemorate a battle between Austria and Prussia, but Ketzwara … knew his market.[^454]

[^454]: Parakilas, James, *Piano Rolls: Three Hundred Years of the Life with the Piano*, Donnelley and Sons, Willard, Ohio, 1999, p.90.
This piece is contained in the Brontë music collection held in the library of the Brontë Museum, Haworth.

Yarrow Vale, inside back cover, [#186].

Kuntz\textsuperscript{455} attributes the music of this Scottish song to John Watlen and the words to Patrick Macdonald. A virtually identical setting in D major is to be found in the Rook\textsuperscript{456} manuscript (p.198).

\textsuperscript{455} Kuntz, Andrew, \textit{Fiddler’s Companion (Traditional Tune Archive)}, http://www.ibiblio.org/fiddlers/YA_YEK.htm, accessed 29.01.12.
This is a D-minor setting of #22 (page 11).

4.3 Conclusion to Chapter Four

This manuscript compilation contains music for use in three main areas, namely, dance, military and song. These three types of music are shown to be interchangeable, often having similar tempi. The pieces are rounded, eminently playable settings of tunes that are, for the most part, well-crafted, exuding the sense of extensive prior use. The manuscript may have been used either for performance or pedagogy, or it may have served simply as a repository of melodies. It is a military bandsman’s collection, with many martial pieces appearing alongside items suitable for performance in the mess. The numbering of pieces suggests that they needed to be easy to access; the numbers may have aided other musicians referring to their own copies of the compilation. Atkinson, Vickers and Jackson all numbered the pages of their manuscript collections, not the individual pieces, as this compilation does.

4.3.1 Contents

This is a collection of melodies. Many are popular song airs whilst others are dance tunes or marches, a large proportion containing two pulses per bar, i.e. in 2/4 or 6/8 time. They are simple, short and easy to commit to memory. A few have extensive

variations written on the main melody whilst the majority consist of two simple eight-bar phrases. However, there are six arrangements in two parts comprising the melody plus a basic harmony containing what piping circles term ‘seconds’. One of these arrangements is written out as two separate pieces, both numbered #108 by the compiler; they appear to be for clarinet and transposing ‘C’ fife. ‘The Duke of Kent’s March’ (#179 page 255) is the only piece arranged in three parts, specifying two clarinets and transposing ‘C’ fife. These arrangements show that the contents of the compilation were not played in isolation.

A large number of tunes are marches, some with specific regimental designation. Generic titles such as ‘March’, ‘Quick March’ and ‘Quick Step’ present problems with identification as do the 57 untitled pieces. This is also the case with Vol. I of the Lawrence Leadley collection of manuscripts. Some of the generic and untitled tunes from Campbell I have been identified through comparison with incipits from other collections. The identification of these pieces demonstrates that the melodies do have titles that have simply been omitted from the compilation. It is hoped that including copies of the actual melodies in this work will enable further identification. Titles give some indication of the provenance of melodies although they are often just meaningless labels. Those including the names of prominent individuals, such as the Duke of York or Nelson, are placed alongside long forgotten individuals, such as Mr Weatherill or Mr Wright.

Some melodies are taken directly from song arrangements and may have formed part of larger orchestrations, as introductory ‘symphonies’ are included. The flexible role of melody for use in both song and dance extends back to Playford’s Dancing Master, and pieces will have been used for song and dance as well as for military purposes.

The work of popular composers of the time is well represented in the compilation. Pieces from the stage and from London’s Pleasure Gardens, by composers
such as Dibdin, Hook and Shield, give a clear indication of the impact of their work on musical fashions at the outset of the nineteenth century. These pieces sit alongside works by Handel and Arne. March tunes often used the melodies of popular songs. These airs were utilised to boost morale and esprit de corp. Throughout the collection, melodies of songs are included without the lyrics by which they are commonly accompanied. Popular song melodies were evidently a rich source of material for the musical accompaniment of marching. A similar exchange between dance tunes and marches is also evident; social dance melodies and marches share an emphasis on strict tempo and use many of the same tunes.

4.3.2 Sources

Publications contemporary with the manuscripts provide the source of many of the dance melodies, and an established canon is in evidence, with some tunes dating back for decades. Dance tunes and marches from Aird’s, Johnson’s and O’Farrell’s collections are to be found alongside others’ pieces from earlier publications, such as *Orpheus Caledonius* and *Pills to Purge Melancholy*. Popular dance tunes show the transition from the older country dance to the, at the time, risqué waltz, which was just gaining a foothold in Britain in these first few years of the nineteenth century. The majority of pieces from these collections have been transposed into keys and a pitch suitable for woodwind instruments, namely, the clarinet and fife.

The inclusion of the melodies to some of Dibdin’s sea songs show the collection was not solely centred upon the music of the army although the majority of pieces would appear to have been. The songs Dibdin was commissioned to write were intended to bolster moral, so they are appropriate additions to this compilation.
4.3.3 Deployment

This is not a collection of military command pieces. The ordering of the day, in garrison or camp, was regulated by signals given by drum, bugle and fife, from reveille to tattoo. The manuscript features one example of such a command signal, the untitled tune #98, which appears to be a version of ‘Polly Put the Kettle on’ (page 232); this was used as a breakfast call at this time. The military pieces are otherwise restricted to ‘troops’ and marches. Many melodies in the compilation are taken from Scottish- or Irish-published collections. This reflects the composition of the British Army during the Napoleonic wars, with many recruits hailing from Scotland and Ireland. The Peninsular War (1808–1814) saw action for the Black Watch, 42nd Regiment, at Talavera in 1809, and the Connaught Rangers at Badajoz in 1812. These are only two of the legion of battles and skirmishes fought during this conflict.

The influence of the wars with France is, as one would expect in a compilation of military pieces of this time, much in evidence. Nationalism, jingoism and the march into battle pervade the pages, leaving an unsettling feeling of bloodshed and slaughter in the contents of the manuscript. The musical notation is transcribed with military precision, as if done under orders. The manuscript is indeed an emblematic reflection of its time.

5 Chapter Five: The Leadley, Benwell, Rippon and Norris Manuscripts

5.1 Introduction

This chapter examines the contexts and contents of the handwritten, nineteenth-century musical manuscripts of Lawrence Leadley, Amelia Benwell, Francis Rippon and William Norris. These compilations demonstrate greater variety in contents to those scrutinised in Chapters Three and Four. This is a reflection of the expansion, development, diversification and increased availability of music that occurred before a backdrop of economic growth, industrialisation and urbanisation during the Industrial Revolution. Social and political developments gained pace with the rise in the economic power of the bourgeoisie and a reawakening of religious consciousness; these are evident in these compilations. Dave Russell summarises:

Three key processes, expansion, diversification and nationalism, can be identified operating within the field of popular music during this period [1840–1914]. There was clearly a huge expansion in musical activity of all types, as even the most random set of statistics illustrates.\textsuperscript{458}

It was during the Romantic period, at the end of the eighteenth century, that notions of ‘folk music’ were first fostered; by the latter half of the nineteenth-century, efforts had been set in motion to seek out and examine the survival of earlier forms and modes of such music.

Developments in musical instrument technology, plus the increasing availability of factory-produced instruments of reasonable quality, coincided with a rise in the

number of people playing, especially amongst the emerging middle classes. German and French violins produced by piecework factories in Saxony, the Mittenwald and Mirecourt met the aspirational demands of an increasing number of amateur musicians. The rise and substantial growth of the brass-band movement during the nineteenth century was similarly influenced by both technical developments and the increased availability of instruments. Pianos, likewise, were produced in increasing numbers as the century progressed, and their ownership became a mark of social status. As Russell notes,

It is clear that piano ownership permeated some way down the social scale. The upper echelons of the working class were certainly buying pianos by the 1860s[,] and by the 1880s they were certainly common in traditional musical locations.459

A cheaper, more portable and less cumbersome instrument, the concertina, patented by Charles Wheatstone in 1844, gained popular acceptance, with a quarter of a million being produced by 1910.460 Lawrence Leadley’s first manuscript displays some evidence that pieces were being attempted on the Anglo-German concertina at this time. For example, it includes ‘Prince of Orange’. James Merryweather writes: ‘The hymn tune ‘Prince of Orange’ has the numbers 1 to 5 above the notes which are buttons of an Anglo-German concertina’.461 These numbers have been added as an aid to the performance of the melody on the Anglo concertina; they are thus an interesting example of performance from notation on an instrument that is usually played ‘by ear’. Military music acquired uniformity as playing standards improved. The School of Royal Military Music at Kneller Hall, Tottenham, opened in 1857. Its establishment was

459 Ibid, p.139.
460 Ibid, p.140.
prompted by the cacophony produced by the massed bands of the British army (resulting from the use of mismatched arrangements of the National Anthem) at the celebration of Queen Victoria’s birthday in Scutari, Turkey (1854). The music manuscripts of Norris and Rippon bear evidence, respectively, of the impact of Kneller Hall and the growth of the Brass Band Movement upon the advancement of military music in the second half of the nineteenth century. They form an interesting contrast to the contents of Campbell I, with its simple melodic pieces and settings.

Printed music, though more freely available, was still expensive at this time. For example, novelist Anne Brontë found it necessary to compile a manuscript collection of hymns and songs in order to fulfil her role as a governess at Thorp Green near York in 1843. Rastall writes:

In the 1840s sheet music was relatively very much more expensive than it is now, so that it was common for manuscript collections to be made for personal use. Anne’s position … probably made it desirable for her to copy for her own use at Thorp Green some of the music in the parsonage at Haworth.462

Anne’s much-maligned brother Patrick Bramwell Brontë also compiled a collection of pieces in manuscript form for his lessons on the flute; the compilation commenced in November 1831. A member of Three Graces Masonic Lodge, Haworth, he is recognised more for his skills as an organist than as a flautist, playing in his father’s church at Haworth and local masonic lodges. A record of Bramwell playing the organ appears in the minutes of Airedale Lodge of Free and Accepted Masons on Christmas Day, 1838.463

---

Bramwell’s manuscript book for flute is a small compilation of simple melodies, but it nonetheless shows the continuity of the male tradition of flute playing and gives an interesting insight into pedagogical pieces of the time.

The two manuscript volumes of Bristol governess Amelia Benwell, like Anne Brontë’s compilation, provide a candid insight into mid-eighteenth century bourgeois culture. Benwell’s manuscript is dealt with in particular depth because of its unique features. Firstly, it is the only manuscript under consideration with a female author. Secondly, it represents a rare and significant snapshot of bourgeois Victorian culture. Finally, it exemplifies the prominence of the piano in the parlour culture of the mid-eighteenth century. This and the other manuscripts examined in this chapter encapsulate the cultural, social and working lives of their compilers. What follows is an examination of these compilations; their contents, provenances, roles and social settings are scrutinised, and they are placed in a wider context.

5.2 The Lawrence Leadley Manuscript

There are seven volumes in this collection, six of which are handwritten and one of which is a bound volume of printed keyboard music. They contain dance tunes, marches, opera overtures, song settings, hymns and psalms that were gathered together by Lawrence Leadley (1827–1897). In his youth Leadley trained as a carpenter in the North Yorkshire village of Helperby and latterly graduated to become an architect based in Bradford. A selection of pieces from these manuscripts was published in 1994 by James Merryweather and Matt Seattle under the title *The Fiddler of Helperby: Victorian Music from a North Yorkshire Village*. Merryweather kindly lodged the product of his

---

research in the York Room at the York City Library. This consists of correspondence, copies of legal documents, photographs and other research notes, along with photocopies of Books I to V. Books VI and VII were not copied. Merryweather writes, ‘[S]orry, I didn’t copy Books 6 & 7 (idiot)’—his comments in brackets, not mine.

Figure 18: Lawrence Leadley

Merryweather’s research focuses on the man, his life and the village of Helperby, its environs and church. The research notes contain evidence of a thorough genealogical investigation of the Leadley family plus Leadley’s life and career, first in Helperby and latterly in Bradford. Inevitably there is a certain amount of conjecture contained within the published work, but a clear, if brief, biography of this ‘fairly unexceptional man’\textsuperscript{465} is attempted. Merryweather demonstrates an understanding of the depth and variety of Leadley’s repertoire while Seattle concerns himself with bringing the selection of melodies and hymn settings into publishable format, adding guitar chords and providing notes on the provenance of some of the tunes.

\textsuperscript{465} Ibid, p.3.
Both authors of the publication agree that Leadley was a violin player and that the manuscripts were likely also used for other instruments. Referring to Book I, Merryweather states, ‘Instruments mentioned in full are flute three times, bassoon once and bugle once’.\(^{466}\) He also notes, as mentioned previously, the numbered notes of ‘Prince of Orange’, which indicate the buttons of an Anglo-German concertina. My observation here is that the 20-button Anglo-German concertina was introduced into this country after 1834. (Uhlig designed the original 20-button German concertinas in 1834,\(^{467}\)) Merryweather mentions this date, but his implication is that the Anglo-German concertina was one of the instruments used in the performance of the melodies in Book I. The Anglo-German concertina’s affordability and playability made it popular for the performance of simple dance melodies soon after 1834, but full mass-production of the Anglo-German concertina did not commence until the second half of the nineteenth century; cheap, piece-work, factory produced violins began to be mass produced around the same time. I suggest that someone learning the Anglo-German concertina has added the numbers to this piece at a later date. It may well be the case that some of Leadley’s melodies were played on the Anglo-German concertina later in the nineteenth century.

Only a small proportion of the collection is reproduced in the Dragonfly publication. These focus, as one would expect, on those pieces peculiar to the Leadley manuscripts. The largest proportion of the publication is given over to vernacular dance music, and the few hymn settings included are of interest to performers of West Gallery music. Merryweather, a member of the West Gallery Music Association, the Bagpipe Society and the early music ensemble *The York Waits*, demonstrates in his research a perceptive, open view on Leadley’s manuscript collection and his role as a musician. In Merryweather’s commentary there is a refreshing absence of a folk revivalist agenda;

\(^{466}\) Ibid, p.5.  
there is no attempt to claim zealously Leadley’s collection for the genre. Books I-IV are given over to dance music, etc., and Vols. 5 and 6 hymns and psalms; Vol. 7 contains further dance music, especially quadrilles and waltzes.

My comments and analysis build upon Merryweather’s work and utilise the copies of the Leadley manuscripts lodged in the York City Library. The manuscript books demonstrate the increasing sophistication of Leadley’s musical literacy and instrumental capabilities over the course of his life. The volumes commence with the naïve hand of a child, struggling with spellings and musical notation whilst attempting simple melodies on his chosen instrument, leading latterly to the more complex scores of an individual with a more-than-competent command of his instrument and musical notation.

5.2.1 Book I

Merryweather speculates that Book I is not written in Leadley’s hand and that the manuscript ‘was written in the 1820s or 1830s by one of Leadley’s seniors … and that the young Lawrence Leadley gave them their titles’. I would add that not only the titles are in a young, naïve hand but also the G-clefs, which appear to grow in neatness and style as the volume progresses. These clefs are similar in style to those in the other volumes in this collection. This would indicate that the young Leadley assisted in the production of the volume, leaving the actual notation, which is written with some haste, to a mentor.

I agree with Merryweather’s conjecture that the majority of pieces in this first book were intended to be played on wind instruments. It is my contention that this volume is one of a set of band arrangements, of which the accompanying manuscripts

---

469 Ibid, p.5.
are now lost. The direction ‘solo’ is used in ‘Downfall of Paris’, and in ‘Duke of Norfolk’s March’ a note is held for four bars. In both these cases the implication is that other instruments are involved in the setting. There are also many pieces with several bars’ rest in the score; for instance, ‘Duke of York’s March’ (#47) has sixteen bars of silence indicated. Not only does this imply the presence of other instruments in the performance of the piece, but it is strong evidence of the work of a musically educated arranger. This is certainly not the work of an unlettered peasant or the inspired proletariat.

As with the *Campbell I* manuscript, a large proportion of the book is given over to marches, tunes suitable for marching or melodies of a militaristic nature. For example, along with the ‘Duke of Norfolk’s March’ we have many ‘Quick Steps’ (20 in total in Leadley’s Vol. I), which would be eminently suitable for marching as well as dancing. ‘March No.1’ (page 62 in Merryweather’s copy) is followed by ‘Troop’, a piece for parading and displaying regimental colours, which takes the same musical form as the ‘Troops’ found in the *Campbell I* manuscript. A significant proportion of the melodies in this first book of Leadley’s collection fall outside the common AABB form of the simple social dance tune. They are numbered and labelled with generic titles, for example, ‘Quick Step’, ‘March’ and ‘Waltz’. The pitch and range of the pieces in this book is also similar to those to be found in *Campbell I*, and one must speculate that both volumes must also have a military band pedigree. I would suggest that the pieces contained within this first volume of Leadley’s were derived from similar sources to those found in *Campbell I*. I suggest that this is a military bandsman’s collection. As one would expect, the melodies intended for marching incorporate rhythmical figures that are undoubtedly derived from military drumming. For instance, ‘Duke of Norfolk’s March’ (Vol. I) and ‘Dragoon March’, both from this first book of the Leadley collection, have rhythmical figures of this sort:
There are many other instances of the deployment of this and similar rhythmical features.

There are 16 waltzes in Book I, which is indicative of the increasing popularity of this dance in the first part of the nineteenth century. These are written either in 3/8 time or 3/4 time, with an equal number of melodies in each category. The majority of waltzes in the earlier Campbell I manuscript are written in 3/8 time. This may well indicate a shift in the tempo of the waltz during the early part of the nineteenth-century or just a change in the notation convention. Hornpipes are also well represented in the collection, indicating the popularity of the dance and this type of melody at this time. Jigs in 6/8 have a dual purpose; they may be utilised for marching (with two pulses per bar) or danced to. One cannot ascertain the specific purpose by inspection. For example, we have the melody #32, which is entitled ‘Quickstep’. It is in 6/8 time and could be utilised for either marching or dancing. One important aspect of the music contained in these volumes is that the majority of melodies are for practical usage rather than passive listening. By contrast, there are some airs, song settings and novelty pieces that may well be intended for a listening audience rather than used for dancing, parading or marching in Book III of the collection. For example:
The notation in Book I demonstrates competence on the part of the scribe. There are few corrections in the notation, but there is much evidence of poor layout and uneconomic use of space. The ‘Liverpool Hornpipe’ has two settings in the volume, one written across the bottom staves of two consecutive pages in what appears to be a different hand. This second setting has obviously been added to the collection at a later date. As with many of the other manuscripts under consideration in this study, the key and time signatures in many cases are only written at the beginning of each piece. There is a noticeable lack of ornamentation in the notation apart from a couple of trills and a few grace notes. Dynamics, tempi and other musical directions are also utilised sparingly throughout. The settings of the melodies demonstrate a reasonable degree of musical sophistication and are directed at musically literate individuals with a basic to moderate command of their instrument. Many of the melodies in this volume would have to be played in third position on the violin and are not suitable for a beginner, which Leadley surely was in the early 1830s.

The contents of the compilation are derived from diverse sources with little or no acknowledgement of provenance. However, titles give some indication as to the printed sources from which the melodies were derived. The ‘Coronation Quickstep’, which is #19 in the collection, may refer to the coronation of George IV (1821), William IV (1831) or Victoria (1838). There are no precise indications of date in the volume. The setting of the song, ‘Oh Nanny Wilt thou gang with me’ (#1), cites ‘Webb’s 3: Set of Airs’ as its source. As yet, I have been unable to trace ‘Webb’. The piece, composed by Dubliner Thomas Carter (1735–1804), has an instrumental introduction in the manuscript, which precedes the vocal melody with the label ‘Song’. No words are given in this arrangement. This melody only was included in O’Farrell’s
Collection of National Music for the Union Pipes (1804) and was much published during the first half of the nineteenth century. The original song words, entitled ‘Oh Nanny wilt thou fly with me’, were written by Thomas Percy (1729–1811), an English cleric who became Anglican Bishop of Dromore, Ireland. Focusing on one particular piece gives a glimpse of the intriguing history that surrounds the content of this first book in Leadley’s collection.

The volume was undoubtedly written for use in performance, and we can only speculate as to the venues and occasions for which it was compiled. There is evidence of much ‘wear and tear’, and the volume is in a somewhat dilapidated state. The book may have been simply used to assist in committing the tune to memory. There is little in the tune titles to link them to the village of Helperby and the area of North Yorkshire where Leadley was raised. To claim these as Yorkshire tunes is a mistake. Referring to them as tunes ‘from Yorkshire’ is equally wrong. Both Handel’s Messiah and Gay’s Beggars Opera have been performed in the county, but performance locality alone affords them with no distinguishing musical traits peculiar to the county.

Likewise, this is the case with interpretation and style. We may speculate as to which instruments these melodies were played on, but how do we know what subtle nuances were employed in their original rendition? Standard notation has been employed in the written record of these melodies, and any interpretation can only call on the conventions of performance of the era from which the manuscript emanates. Merryweather speculates much regarding the composition of the ‘Helperby Village Band’, without presenting any concrete evidence as to its makeup. As is the case with most other counties in England, there is no evidence of distinct musical conventions in

---

471 Kuntz, Andrew, Fiddler’s Companion (Traditional Tune Archive), http://www.ibiblio.org/fiddlers/OH.htm, accessed 12.10.09
North Yorkshire concerning the performance of this type of music. There is also no credible evidence of a continuing social dance music tradition in the locality.

The only tune title that refers to place, apart from those referring to the Duke of York, is ‘Lord Harwood’s [sic] Quick Step’, which has been added in the hand of the young Leadley. Harewood House is a stately home in Yorkshire. There are many references to the Duke of York in melody titles contained within contemporary manuscripts, and these undoubtedly refer to Prince Frederick, who held the title from 1784–1827. The title was not awarded between 1827 and 1892, when Queen Victoria bestowed it on her eldest son. The inclusion of ‘The Coronation Quick Step’ possibly refers to the coronation of William IV, which took place in 1831; this would reinforce the suggestion that the manuscript was produced in the early 1830s.

5.2.2 Book II

This volume is written in the young hand of Leadley, and the neatness, spacing and style of the notation improves, somewhat, as the volume progresses. The copperplate handwriting of the tune titles demonstrates a similar development, with a couple of attempts to mimic printed typeface. For example:

![The Game Chicken]

This second volume contains transcription errors, especially of a rhythmical nature, e.g., positioning of bar lines and duration of notes. For example:

![In the days we went Gipsying [sic] (above)]

In this excerpt from ‘In the days we went Gipsying’ [sic] (above), a piece taken from a drawing-room ballad, as previously stated, the fourth bar is made up of only three quavers, and bar six is missing a beam to connect its quavers; a bar line is also omitted.
at the beginning of the penultimate bar. This example also illustrates ink ‘bleed through’ from the obverse page; there are many pages affected by this.

The book has been much used, bearing well-fingered pages, and it is in a poor state of repair. Staves appear to have been hand-scored using a ruler. Some of these are poorly executed; due to this and instances of ‘bleed-through’, certain staves have not been used for notation.

There are between five and eight staves per page. There is pagination plus numbering of pieces, along with melody titles, which give three points of reference to enable the user to access the required piece. This would assist with the manuscript’s use in conjunction with other musicians in performance. As with the Jackson manuscript, there are two pieces with brief dance instructions, one of which has mistakenly been allocated a tune number – a child’s error.

This verifies that the book was used for dancing and not just as a tune repository. The ‘bleed through’ of ink from the obverse page reduces the clarity of this page. This is also the case with other pieces in the book. Several of the melodies are very basic and easily played by the beginner on the violin; these would have been suitable for the young Leadley learning his instrument. Bowing directions, along with other expression and ornamentation marks, are included sparsely throughout. There are
no lyrics with the song airs or other writings. As with the first volume in the Leadley collection, apart from ‘The Long Room of Scarborough’ and ‘The York Quadrille’, there few references to local place names in the melody titles. Each melody is named with a distinct title, with the exception of two, the generic ‘Quick Step’ and ‘Trumpet March’. Unlike in the previous volume, much of the content is given over to country-dance tunes, along with song airs, hymns, marches and waltzes. The volume contains one example of a ‘Troop’, this being in the same form as those to be found in Book I and the Campbell I manuscript.

5.2.3 Book III

This volume is written in the adolescent hand of Leadley. It is autographed: ‘Lawrence Leadley aged 14 1842’. The progression of Leadley’s expertise on the violin is reflected in the inclusion of pieces demanding third-position playing. The book has no pagination or tune numbering, with the exception of some sporadic numbers attached to pieces, with no apparent sequence or logic. The titles of the melodies demonstrate pan-European roots. Apart from titles referring to the countries of the United Kingdom, there are:

‘Bohemian Air’
‘Danish March’
‘French Allemande’
‘Hungarian Air’
‘Hungarian Waltz’
‘Spanish Dance’
‘The Spanish Patriots’

The collection is an internationalist repertoire. This contrasts starkly with the trend toward patriotic introspection found increasingly in the many national song and melody publications of the second half of the nineteenth century. Not only do we have the international flavour of the melodies and dances in Leadley, but we also find the fascinating cultural juxtaposition of the Irish jig, ‘Murphy Delaney’, sharing the same
page as ‘J. Haydn’s Celebrated Movement from the Surprise’. The positioning of a ‘rude’ Irish jig alongside a piece from the Viennese Classical Tradition exemplifies the eclectic nature of the collection whilst demonstrating the breadth and wide-ranging nature of Leadley and his audiences’ musical tastes at this time. There appears to be a continuum in terms of sociological class and musical idiom, but this deductive analysis may reflect a twenty-first century, genre-based take on that which was the norm during Leadley’s time.

5.2.4 Book IV

This book is the manuscript of an able musician, with varied and sophisticated content. Merryweather’s conjecture is that ‘Lawrence Leadley appears to have given up his musical skills when he forsook Helperby to start a new life in Bradford’.

Merryweather uses the lack of evidence pertaining to Leadley’s musical activities in Bradford to justify this statement. He states, ‘[A]ttempts to show him making music in his Bradford years have proved fruitless’. I cannot imagine for one moment that this collection emanated from the North Yorkshire village of Helperby. I feel sure that the varied mélange of its far-reaching content is that which was performed in the Drawing Rooms, Ballrooms and Assembly Rooms of the cosmopolitan, woollen mill town of Bradford in the mid- to latter part of Leadley’s life.

The content gives us a good insight into the musical tastes and fashions in social dance of the middle classes of not only Bradford but of similar industrial centres in the second half of the nineteenth century. A publication directed towards the popular dance musician is Kerr’s Merry Melodies, printed 1870 and 1877. These collections, arranged for the violin, contain a similar mix of pieces albeit with a Scottish bias. The first book

---

in the series of four has a title page that boasts, ‘Specially arranged for the Ballroom’, giving a clear statement of purpose.

Both the Leadley Manuscript IV and Kerr’s publication contain melodies taken from the popular canon of classical music and opera. Kerr’s *Fourth Collection* has a section of pieces suitable for accompanying dances entitled *Operatic Melodies*, with extracts taken from ‘The Magic Flute’, ‘Rigoletto’, ‘La Sonnambula’, ‘The Flying Dutchman’ and many others. This collection provides a stark example of the downward filtration of music through the echelons of nineteenth-century society. This collection has been available continually since its first impression and still forms a cornerstone of the Scottish violinist’s repertoire.

The selection of pieces in the manuscript is symbolic of Leadley’s adoption into the expanding bourgeoisie of this Northern manufacturing town, when Britain was gaining a reputation as ‘The Workshop of the World’. From humble beginnings in Helperby, Leadley had established himself as clerk of works, freelance architect and teacher at the Bradford Mechanics’ Institute. He moved residence to the affluent middle
class area of the city known as ‘Poet’s Corner’. Such embourgeoisement was for the fortunate. Leadley was one of the many who moved from the countryside to the towns during the Industrial Revolution. He was astute enough to be able to make the most of the carpentry and construction skills that he had acquired during his youth in Helperby.

The manuscript has twelve staves of music per page, as does its contemporary *The Rook Collection*, which leads one to speculate that such manuscript paper was available commercially during the 1850s. I have already commented on the sophistication of the arrangements but would add that they are undoubtedly specifically for the violin. Detailed bowing direction is given along with grace notes, embellishments and indication of dynamic expression. These are not arrangements for solo instrument but require supporting accompaniment from piano or other orchestral instruments.

The Leadley collection has four distinct elements in its makeup, the diversity of which demonstrates the popular musical tastes of the first half of the nineteenth century. Firstly, there are the melodies from the early part of Leadley’s life, which have their origins in the country dances and marches of the eighteenth century and early nineteenth centuries. Secondly, the collection contains the music of Bradford’s *nouveau riche* of the mid-nineteenth century, including high-brow, operatic and classical aspirational pieces. Next, the collection contains church music, exemplifying Victorian morality. Finally, it features printed drawing-room ballads and piano pieces. Leadley’s collection of printed music was not copied by Merryweather and therefore has not been examined as part of this study. A similar collection of printed music accompanied the

---


Jackson collection when it came to light in the early 1970s. This, likewise, is not available for scrutiny as part of this research.

The piano became the prominent instrument for amateur music making during the nineteenth century, with banks of printed music being stored in music cabinets, stands and piano stools. Many of these collections have been dispersed or destroyed; some, like the Brontë collection in the Haworth museum, have been preserved. The Lawrence Leadley collection is a family heirloom, as is that of Joshua Jackson, and it is to the respective families’ credit that the volumes have been preserved and made available for performance and research.

5.3 The Amelia Benwell Manuscripts

5.3.1 Physical Attributes

These are a pair of handwritten music manuscripts created by Amelia Benwell (1830–1920), with inscriptions identifying her as the compiler. With a few exceptions, this is a collection of drawing-room ballads and songs with piano accompaniment. On the title page of the first volume, she writes, ‘Amelia Benwell, Upper Easton, October, 1847’. On the second volume title page is written ‘Amelia Benwell, January 21st 1848’. Vol. I has the date 18 September 1849 at the foot of the last page of music. The latter pieces may have been added as an afterthought. The date of the 2 May 1850 is written on page 138 of Vol. II, implying that it took two years and four months to complete the transcription of the songs.
The first volume has 148 pages numbered in pencil, and the second volume has 138 pages, likewise numbered in pencil. Judging by the time and care taken in the production of these two volumes, they were obviously a very large part of her life, and as such they are a charming remnant of a young, capable Victorian woman’s musical enthusiasms. The first volume has pasted inside the front board a print of a lady playing a Chappell cabinet piano. This may well be a manifestation of Amelia Benwell’s self-image.

The print, taken from a published book of piano instruction, shows a well-dressed Victorian lady at a cabinet piano on a stool; beside her are a canterbury for music and a plant in a vase with a stand. The first volume has Benwell’s name on the front board.
The music consists of 12 hand-ruled staves to each page. The paper is of good quality. A steady improvement in the style of the transcription is a noticeable feature as the book progresses. Vol. I measures 240 x 288mm and Vol. II 234 x 295mm. Both were originally bound with a cloth spine and cardboard. The bindings were in a state of severe disrepair in 2010. Both volumes showed deterioration, with both ageing and use; therefore, they have been rebound. This has been carried out sympathetically, using similar materials, in order to restore their original condition. The front of Vol. I had a label pasted to the original board establishing Benwell’s ownership of the book.

Vol. II is simply labelled ‘Music Book’, which has been carefully written in pen and ink imitating print.

There are several other, similar attempts to highlight the titles of songs, including:
The above are evidence of the considerable time spent on the titles of the compilations and exemplify the scribe’s calligraphic skills. The headings for some of the songs appears to be an imitation of the form found on printed sheet music.

Above is a published sheet of the melody for ‘It is Better to Laugh than be Sighing’, from the Library of Congress Performing Arts Encyclopaedia. Such pieces are regarded by Scott as ‘detachable song’, composed with solo recital in mind. The mixing of print fonts was a feature of printed sheet music throughout the nineteenth century. The bulk

of the writing in the manuscript is executed in a neat copperplate script in ink, which was most likely originally black, now much faded to light brown.

The question must be asked – why were these compilations gathered together? What motivated Amelia Benwell, and to what use were her manuscripts put? There is no conclusive answer to these questions. As with the other manuscripts in this study, conjecture and speculation are the only tools available to one attempting to establish the actuality. Perhaps they were created out of boredom for Benwell’s amusement, or perhaps they were a means of acquiring copies of the songs, creating a performance score or producing a teaching resource … all or any one may have motivated the scribe.

As with other compilations, this collection is evidence of a selection process. There were hundreds of songs and ballads printed in sheet music form throughout the nineteenth century, from which only a selection have been chosen for inclusion in the manuscript. Benwell has focused on sentimental ballads and songs suitable for performance in the Victorian parlour; they are the songs of her era. With the exception of the extracts from The Messiah and Judas Maccabaeus, ‘Te Deum’, ‘The Lancers’ and a few shorter dance pieces and hymns, the contents provide a reflection of popular song compositions from the first half of the nineteenth century. It is a repertoire taken from a bourgeois Bristol household that gives a clear picture of Victorian sensibilities and sentimentality. Benwell may well have created this as a copy from which to sing, thus enabling her to move away from the piano and face the domestic audience. There are several instances of the later lyrics of verses to songs being pasted onto the pages of music to avail their rendition.

The development of the piano gained apace after 1800 with the adoption of the iron frame and the introduction of the upright piano. The upright piano action, as Hipkins states, ‘was originally patented by Wornum in 1826, although not practically
introduced in pianos until 1829. These and other developments enabled reasonable quality instruments to be mass-produced at affordable prices for the emerging middle classes. The expansion of the railway system assisted the distribution of both sheet music and pianos. By the time Benwell compiled these manuscripts, the piano was well established as the instrument du jour for musical soirees. She may well, of course, have played a grand piano in her employment as a governess (see below). Parlour song sheets were falling in price with technological developments in music printing, but they were still by no means cheap. In the 1850s, as Scott points out, ‘a vocal score of Messiah could be purchased for 4s., the price that in some cases was paid for a single drawing-room ballad’.

The cost of purchasing printed copies of ballads may well have prompted the creation of Benwell’s volumes. Sheet music was available through travelling libraries and may also have been ordered from catalogues. In Bristol, which was a port, a focus of routes and an expanding commercial centre, printed music would have been abundantly available during the first half of the nineteenth century. James Parakilas comments on the availability and dissemination of printed music at this time. He states:

[A]lthough music consumers might be guided by reviews when they bought music from a shop or ordered it from a publisher’s catalog [sic], in many cases they bought music about which they could know nothing. They subscribed to publication projects that were announced in the press – an experience of paying for a product not only before the reviews were in, but even before it existed”… It would be

482 Ibid, p.53.
hard to convey how important periodical publications were to musical life and commerce – and … to consumers like Jane Austen who lived in places where there were no music shops – at the end of the eighteenth century and well into the nineteenth. Subscribers to a periodical received, once a month or at some regular interval, a piece or collection of music chosen for them by the editors of the periodical. The contents of these periodicals give a remarkable picture of the printed music that great numbers of music lovers owned and performed in their homes.483

‘Mourir Pour La Patrie’, from Benwell’s collection, is taken from such a periodical. Some of the printed words, in English, on the reverse of the clipping, are discernible on the original.

What follows are the results of my investigation into the life of Benwell. The lives of Atkinson, Vickers, Jackson and Leadley have been documented by other researchers, but Benwell’s details have not as her manuscripts are not in the public domain. This is a brief outline of her life in Bristol in the mid-nineteenth century.

- 1830 - Amelia Benwell was born on 19 February 1830 at 5 Richmond Place, Coronation Road, Bedminster, Bristol, Somerset. Her parents were Joseph & Charlotte Benwell. 484

- 1847 & 1848 - Benwell’s manuscript books are dated thus, one for each year. Vol. I is inscribed, ‘Amelia Benwell, Upper Easton’. Vol. II has Benwell’s name plus ‘Harriot Perfect’ (or possibly ‘Perfut’), written by Benwell’s hand.

- 1851 - Census: no trace in Bristol, as yet.

- 1861 - Census (see below): According to the 1861 census, Benwell was living at 1 Charlotte St: ‘Lodger, unmarried, 29 years, Governess, born Bristol’. The head of house is ‘Michael Edkins, married, 41yrs, Master Builder, born Bristol’. Edkins was married to Lucy Ann, 36, born in Long Ashton, Somerset. Their children were Blanche, 11 years; Russell, 9 years; Jessie, 8 years; Lucy, 7 years; Stanley, 4 years; and Laura, 2 years. The household had 13 people, including Benwell, William Saunders (Michael’s brother-in-law), Elizabeth Edkins (Michael’s cousin) and two servants. Pigott’s Directory of Gloucestershire (1830) lists a ‘Michael Edkins, Painter – House, Sign etc., 1 North Street, Bristol, Gloucestershire’. The man of the family with whom Benwell resided, to whom this description may refer, would be only have been 19 years old in 1830.

---

Above are the entries from the 1861 census for the parish of St. Nicholas, Bristol.

Genealogist Rosalind Batchelor has traced further details of Benwell’s life to add to the research above. Additional biographical details are as follows:

- Amelia’s parents were Quakers: Joseph Benwell, an accountant, and Charlotte (nee White).
- The 1871 census reveals that Benwell was living in Scarborough at 46-47 Newborough Street, the business of grocer and Quaker John Rowntree, and was the housekeeper of a household of assistants and apprentices.
- In 1891, Benwell was living in Torquay and working as housekeeper for John Horniman, retired tea dealer, and his wife Ann, also Quakers.
- In 1901, Benwell was visiting Weston super Mare at a boarding house.
- In 1911, Benwell was in Torquay visiting the house of Walter Oldfield and his wife Mary.
- Benwell died in Torquay on 17 November 1920, leaving £5591 3s 6d.

Amelia Benwell would have been seventeen years old in 1847, the date of the commencement of the first music volume. In 1861 she is recorded as living at one
Charlotte Street, which is a large end-terrace house closer to the centre of Bristol than Upper Easton (whence Benwell hailed). Upper Easton now forms part of inner-city Bristol whereas Easton itself is now an area warranting European Community priority assistance.

Benwell’s employment as a governess in Charlotte Street, an affluent part of the city, would have been a reasonable occupation for a young woman in the mid-nineteenth century. Her family were members of the Society of Friends, and her later employment as housekeeper was in Quaker households.

The contents of Benwell’s compilation display some characteristics that would point to her Quaker convictions. For example,


Peace at Home, be our prayer,
While we hear from a-far
The clamour of strife,
And the echoes of war,
The clamour of strife
And the echoes of war.
In lands all around us
Stern carnage may roam,
Our prayer and our watchword
Should be, Peace at Home!

Chorus:
Peace at Home! Peace at Home!
Our prayer and our watchword

This is the first verse of a song/hymn, with piano arrangement, that was printed in the *Illustrated London News* as a plea for peace in the revolutionary atmosphere that engulfed
Europe in the late 1840s, with insurrections and the toppling of monarchs. Jason Shute draws attention to the Chartist meeting on Kennington Common, London, in 1848, as the final attempt by the Chartists to attain their goal of electoral reform.

For more than a moment it looked like Britain would be caught up in revolution…. Worried readers of the Illustrated London News were provided with the words and music of ‘Peace at Home be our prayer’. A last attempt by the Chartists to pursue their ten-year-old cause, by holding a mass demonstration on Kennington Common, was defeated as much by the weather as by the Home Secretary’s special constables.485

Benwell’s copy of this song from the London Illustrated News is pasted into her manuscript compilation. Its inclusion denotes an affinity with the sentiments of the song. Quaker involvement in the Chartists’ movement was at its outset supportive. However, philanthropic Anti-Corn Law League member and Quaker Joseph Sturge, who initially championed the Chartist cause, became a protagonist in the schism during the meeting at the December Conference of 1842, which ‘split the organisation in two’.486 The schism arose over bourgeois involvement in Chartism, with Sturge and his followers supporting the establishment of the ‘Complete Suffrage Association’, which included opposing the Corn Laws.487 One presumes that Benwell and her family, as Quakers, would have held similar views to Sturge.

Benwell, her accountant father and family will have espoused the tenets of Quaker thinking as epitomised by Alex Tyrrell’s insight into the political philosophy of Sturge.

The mainspring of his actions was a sense of Christian duty derived from his Quakerism. He was also influenced by his association with radical nonconformists who shared his antipathy for the aristocratic Anglican élite which dominated British political life. He has been seen as one of the many wealthy Quakers who attempted to alleviate the problems of the age by their philanthropy.\textsuperscript{488}

This is the political and economic climate in which Benwell was raised. Her attitudes and philosophy were also likely moulded by a sense of duty deriving from her Quaker upbringing.

The money she left on her death suggests that the career ‘in service’ on which she had embarked in 1847, when the first volume of her collection was compiled, appears to have provided a prosperous, full life. Elizabeth Morgan, in her positioning of \textit{The Virtuous Virtuosa: Women at the Pianoforte in England, 1780–1820}, emphasises the economic and social forces exerted on women in the domestic, bourgeois home environment of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century. She writes:

Women could only cultivate accomplishments if they possessed the time and money to do so. Thus, skills in music, drawing, and the like testified to the pedigree and breeding of an entire family, rendering accomplishments valuable commodities on the marriage market.\textsuperscript{489}

The Victorian middle class maintained such stereotypical objectives up to and beyond Benwell’s time. Her role as governess would have involved the instruction of Edkin’s


children in musical and other obligatory skills in the large household of a Bristol master builder.

5.3.2 Contents

There are 104 items in this collection, counting those pieces from the *Messiah, Judas Maccabaeus* and the *Lancers Quadrille* as separate items. The inclusion in the manuscript of title, composer and lyricist – plus, on occasion, other sources by Benwell – has assisted with the tracing of many of these songs and ballads. A large number of the music sheets were published in Britain, America and Australia, with common arrangements and settings. Chetham’s Library (Manchester), the Library of Congress collection, the Levy collection at John Hopkins University in the United States and the National Library of Australia provide internet access to rich sources of information regarding the provenance of the songs and ballads contained within the collection. Both the Australians and Americans, with Western cultural histories far shorter than that of the United Kingdom, appear to place greater import on Victorian printed sheet music in their online connections.

The relevance of these two manuscripts to this study lies in their manifestation of popular repertoire. Firstly, the broad nature of the content, which encompasses art song and popular song alongside dance and military pieces, gives a vivid insight into musical performance of the mid-eighteenth century. This multifaceted canon provides a glimpse of the actuality of popular taste across a wide-ranging social stratum of society. These compilations document popular culture before the rise of the music hall.

Secondly, the collection reinforces the impact of printed music on popular tastes. The pieces are all taken from printed sources, the practice used by the other manuscript compilers in this study. Thirdly, the contents reflect a continuing musical tradition, with works such as *The Messiah* juxtaposed with ephemeral sentimental parlour songs. Scott’s
thesis purports that the parlour and drawing-room songs are the genesis of the popular music industry and the ‘music market’.\textsuperscript{490} Both ephemeral and longstanding elements are common features of manuscript collections, being a mix of both continuity and innovation. Fourthly, several items demonstrate how pieces find their way from composed, printed sources into the classification ‘traditional’, exemplifying mobility between current genre boundaries.

As Benwell was employed as a governess, a comparison of her compilation with that created by the poet and novelist Anne Brontë whilst she worked in the same occupation throws interesting light on both their music and work. Brontë was employed at Thorp Green, Little Ouseburn, near York from 1840–1845, and her compilation (dated 1843) consists of songs and hymns arranged for piano.

Anne’s music copying is not expert. Harmonies seem conventional, as though possible made up by Anne herself after copying the air. She writes laboriously, sometimes making errors, but the book is an important indicator of her musical taste, which finds a reflection in her poems.\textsuperscript{491}

The Brontë piano accompaniments are basic, especially in comparison to those of Benwell, which are exact copies of the song-sheet arrangements. Anne Brontë (1820–1849) would have been 23 years old when she created the volume. She had received piano lessons from ‘A. S. Sunderland, the organist of Keighley parish church’,\textsuperscript{492} along with her siblings, but she is not generally deemed as accomplished a pianist as her sister, Charlotte. Kathryn White notes that Brontë draws from her experiences as governess at Mirfield and Thorpe Green in her novel Agnes Grey.

Anne Brontë depicts ... the social isolation, emotional starvation and frustrations of governess’s life. The novel’s apparent simplicity of style veils a direct and cutting exposé of middle class values, morality and religion. The author reveals the repellent cruelty, materialism and chauvinism with which young women had to cope. *Agnes Grey* opens the eyes of society to the injustices of the governess’s position.  

It is the realisation of this predicament that leads one to consider that a motivation for Amelia Benwell’s creation of her music manuscript may well have been an escape into the fantasy world of the drawing-room ballad.

The content of Brontë’s manuscript differs greatly from that of Benwell, with half of the former’s 34 pieces being hymns; Brontë’s is also much smaller in content than Benwell’s. The hymns reflect Brontë’s religious upbringing and convictions. The majority of the Benwell manuscript content consists of secular, contemporary, popular songs, more appropriate for adult performance and listening. The inclusion of these worldlier pieces leads one to the understanding that Benwell may well have used her compilation as a singer/pianist rather than as a teacher. Richard Rastall, in his facsimile reproduction of the Brontë song book, traces many of her pieces back as far as the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Like Benwell’s, Brontë’s compilation reflects the sentimentality of the Victorian era. The volume includes three Burns songs, alongside three pieces by Thomas Moore, a waltz by Beethoven and pieces by Handel, Mozart and popular composers of the times, such as Thomas Bayly.

What follows is an examination of the contents of Benwell’s two volumes. As she provides the names of composers and lyricists in many instances, and the majority of pieces have titles, the tracing of the provenance of songs has proved a less onerous

---

task than that of tracing the melodies contained in the *Campbell I* manuscript. Within the volume we have examples of ‘stand-alone’ operatic arias being arranged for drawing-room performance and of parlour ballads (later printed as broadside ballads) being adopted into the canon of ‘traditional’ song. The social mobility of these pieces is founded on the adaptability and memorability of their melodies. The arrangements and accompaniments are not carried into the new social settings and performance spaces; it is the melody that is the mobile entity.

5.3.2.1 Volume I

**Mourir Pour La Patrie, I, p.1, #1.**

This piece appears on a printed sheet pasted to the page, with words in French. Translated as ‘To die for the fatherland/homeland’, the music was written by Alphonse Varney, with words from the play *Le Chevalier de Maison-Rouge*, by Alexandre Dumas and Auguste Maquet. The anthem was sung during the French Second Republic (1848–52) with the refrain taken from the song ‘Roland à Roncevaux’, by Claude-Joseph Rouget de Lisle, who penned ‘The Marseillaise’. A translation in English is pasted to the foot of the page. As the volume is dated 1847, the piece may have been added to the collection after 1848. The Crimean War did not take place until 1854, but the British were involved in lesser campaigns in India a few years prior to that date, so it may then have been used to stir up patriotic fervour. The piece displays typical jingoistic features, promoting valour, courage and heroism. The line ‘[t]he noblest of deaths is for freedom to die’ is reminiscent of the luring of young men as cannon fodder in *Campbell I*. The inclusion of this patriotic French anthem, with its French nationalist origins, is somewhat out of keeping with the rest of Benwell’s compilation. However, it exemplifies the diverse nature of pieces found in her manuscripts.
We may be happy yet, I, p.2, #2.

This song was taken from the grand opera seria *The Daughter of St. Mark*, by Michael W. Balfe (1808–1870), with libretto by Alfred Bunn. The words for this ballad appear on a black letter ballad, which may be found in Chetham’s Library *Axon Ballad Collection* and also the Bodleian Library *Allegro Collection*. This is an example of a broadside ballad being taken from opera and finding its way, via drawing-room song, to the street. The song exemplifies the downward filtration of culture through the echelons of society, the black-letter ballad completing the ballad’s path from opera to street song.

Figure 19: ‘We May be Happy Yet’

Balfe’s settings of the ballad become a favourite, being published in both Australia and the United States. Appearing at the commencement of Vol. I, ‘We may be happy yet’ is a fittingly sentimental song for the opening of parlour soirees. The melody of the piano introduction or symphony to the song is labelled ‘Trombone Solo’, indicating that the accompaniment is taken from a larger arrangement. There are inconsistencies in the

---

order of placement of the flats in the key signature, which is Eb in Benwell’s transcription. Five unused lines of musical staves are left at the end of the piece, and the next song commences with a fresh page.

The Ivy Green, I, p.5, #4.

Charles Dickens wrote the words to the poem; the music, written in 1838, is by Henry Russell (1812–1900).\(^4\) The sleeve notes to the c.d. The Music of Dickens and His Time, by the Seven Dials Band, states:

This piece, recited in The Pickwick Papers (Ch. 6) by the clergyman of Dingley Dell, proved to be Dickens’s most popular song. The piano setting is by Henry Burnett, Dickens’s brother-in-law.\(^5\)

Below is the title page of an American arrangement by H. S. Sartoni with a dedication to J. W. Bradley.

![The Ivy Green Waltz](image)

Araby’s Daughter, I, p.8, #5.

---


The words are from Thomas Moore’s ‘long narrative poem on an Eastern subject’, ‘Lallah Rookh’, which was published in 1817. This epic Romantic poem was republished many times during the 1820s along with his popular *Moore’s Irish Melodies*. Violinist George Kiallmark (1781–1835) composed the music c. 1824. Kiallmark’s entry in the *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* states:

> His works for the piano included Introduction and Variations to “Roy’s Wife”, Introduction to “Last Rose of Summer”, Variations on “Home, Sweet Home”, and *Les fleurs de printemps* in six books. He also wrote a number of songs, among them “Maid of Athens”.  

As with many of Moore’s melodies, the song was carried to America as part of Irish Diaspora culture. The following is the title page of the piece published in Philadelphia, the destination of many Irish emigrants.

---

The melody was included in Francis O’Neill’s *Music of Ireland: Eighteen Hundred and Fifty Melodies* (1903), as part of his collection taken from the Irish community of Chicago.\(^{502}\)

As part of O’Neill’s collection, the piece is now regarded as ‘traditional’ and is included amongst online collections in ABC musical format.\(^{503}\)

This is an exemplar case of the adoption of an air into vernacular usage. With origins obscured by the passage of time, it comes to be regarded as ‘traditional’. Settings of the piece are to be found in differing keys in numerous arrangements.

My Father Land I, p.11, #6.


A copy of the printed sheet is in the Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection.\footnote{Barnett, John and W. F. Moncrief, ‘My Father Land’, Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, Box 043, Item 109, https://jscholarship.library.jhu.edu/handle/1774.2/6270, accessed 11.09.10.}

This is an identical arrangement to that transcribed by Benwell into her manuscript. It is also one of the few instances where noticeable difficulties have been experienced by her in copying the melody – understandable with one stave having only four lines!

The transcription also demonstrates inexperience with the placement and order of the key signature, as in the following extract, which also demonstrates a vocal variation, ‘as sung by Mrs Hughes’. There is no indication in the manuscript as to whom Mrs Hughes might be.
This strophic song has the second verse written on a small piece of notepaper, attached to page 13 along the left margin.

This insertion, above, is pasted at right angles to the music and is much faded. I suggest that rather than having subsequent verses at the end of the piece, the compiler placed verses in the body of the manuscript to enable the vocalist to see both the music and the lyrics. This will have assisted the singer in the performance of the song.

Again patriotism rears its head, here, with the sentiments of the song reflecting the nationalist fervour much in evidence during the second half of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries throughout Europe.


The words are taken from the poem of the same name by Felicia Hemans (1793–1835), and as the manuscript and the printed edition state, ‘The Music by her sister’, Harriet Brown.505 The song is an apt addition to Quaker Benwell’s compilation.


These printed waltzes, arranged for piano, give a clear indication of the source of the many dance pieces that found their way into the compilations of the eighteenth century, for example, that of Leadley. ‘The Kremlin Waltz’, in 3/8 time, appears to be a fragment of a longer piece, i.e., the last thirty-five bars. ‘The Moscow Waltz’ is in 3/8 time rather than the later 3/4 time waltz signature.

Non Più Andrai, I, p.25, #10.

Benwell writes, ‘From the Opera Le nozze di Figaro Mozart’. Figaro performs this aria at the culmination of the first act of the opera. The manuscript version is an arrangement for solo piano and has fingering marked throughout. One must speculate that the piece may well have been used for teaching purposes.

Tu vedrai sventurata, I, p.27, #11.
Benwell writes, ‘From the Opera of “Il Pirata” by Bellini’, this is an arrangement for solo piano and has fingering marked throughout. Again the scribe demonstrates problems with the positioning of both time and key signatures.

**Aurora Waltzer, I, p.28, #12.**

Benwell acknowledges Labitzky as the composer. Bohemian violinist Joseph Labitzky (1802–1881) composed many dance pieces; the *Aurora-Waltzer* (op.34), was one of his most popular.\(^{306}\) In 3/8 time, this manuscript setting is a simple arrangement for piano.

**When last I said Farewell, I, p.29, #13.**

The song is preceded by the following introduction, without citation, in quotation marks:

> The melody, sweet as it is simple and pathetic in style, creates when sung by the Swedish Nightingale (Jenny Lind) on the mind and feeling indescribable; it was taught to her by her early friend and master, Herr Berg of Stockholm and has ever been her favourite song. It was the last she sang in public the evening previous to her departure from Vienna for England.

This would appear to be taken from the published music sheet. A similar form of introduction is used in song fourteen, ‘Jenny Lind’s Last Night in England’, below.

**By the sad sea waves, I, p.32, #14.**

Popularised by the singing of Jenny Lind and composed by Jules Benedict, the song is taken from the opera *The Brides of Venice*.\(^{307}\)

The title page of the song is an example of sheet music becoming a work of art in its own right.

**I saw from the Beach, I, p.34, #15.**

From Moore's Irish Melodies and, as the manuscript states, ‘Arranged by Mr J. Stevenson’, this song was later published in Boosey and Company’s Royal Edition of The Songs of Ireland.\(^5\)

---


The manuscript setting of the piece is identical to one published in Baltimore, with a more elaborate arrangement in A major.

509 Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, Box 043, Item 066, https://jscholarship.library.jhu.edu/handle/1774.2/6270, accessed 11.09.10.

The following, from the Levy Sheet Music Collection, is the same arrangement as that in the Benwell collection. It is published as the ‘Authorized Edition of Jenny Lind’s Music’.  

Lind's London debut was on 7 May 1847, the year of the commencement Benwell’s first volume. The inclusion of songs from Lind’s repertoire and featuring her is indicative of the singer’s popularity at this time. It also demonstrates that Benwell was very much in touch with contemporary tastes and modes. It would seem logical that, as a role model, Lind would figure large in the musical aspirations of the young Amelia Benwell.

Love Not, I, p.39, #17.

The manuscript and following printed sheet in the National Library of Australia Digital Collection have identical accreditation, i.e. ‘The Poetry is by The Honourable Mrs.

---

Norton, Music by J Blockly. The layout of the musical notation is taken from this setting with little variation. This is an indication of the extent to which Benwell attempted to create a replica of the original publication.

**Long Long Ago, I, p.40, #18.**

‘Long Long Ago’ was written in 1833 by Thomas Haynes Bayly (1797–1839), the son of a wealthy lawyer from Bath. This is also a copy of the original arrangement.

---

Figure 20: ‘Long, Long Ago’

The melody to ‘Long, Long Ago’, above, has passed into the repertoire of the Northumbrian pipes, as in the setting above from the *Charlton Memorial Book*.\(^{514}\)

**My mother dear, I, p.43, #19.**

A copy is held in the Library of Congress Sheet Music Collection, which states that the song was published in New York in the 1830s by Frith and Hall, who attributed it to Samuel Lover (1795–1868).\(^{515}\)

**The Old Arm Chair, I, p.45, #20.**

---


The three verses are taken from a four-verse poem by Eliza Cook (1818–1889) and set to music by H. Bussell. Below is the front-sheet of the music in the Levy Sheet Music Collection.

Lovely Night, I, p.47, #21.
Above is a copy of the ballad held in the Levy Collection,\textsuperscript{516} pitched in \textit{Eb}, a minor third higher than the Benwell version in \textit{C}. The music is by J. H. Tully and words are by Mark Lemon.

\textbf{Teach oh teach me to Forget, I, p.49, #22.}

The printed copy above is in the Levy Collection.\textsuperscript{517}

\textbf{My Skiff is on the Shore, I, p.54, #24.}

A printed sheet attributing the poetry to Spencer Follett and the arrangement of the song to A. Willingford is below. The piece is arranged as a ‘blackface minstrel’ song for ‘The Ethiopian Serenaders’ in a copy held in The Library of Congress Collection.\textsuperscript{518} The

\textsuperscript{516} Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, https://jscholarship.library.jhu.edu/handle/1774.2/3481, accessed 15.09.10.
\textsuperscript{517} Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, https://jscholarship.library.jhu.edu/handle/1774.2/30430, accessed 15.09.10.
\textsuperscript{518} Library of Congress Catalogue Record, http://memory.loc.gov/cgi-bin/ampage?collId=mussm&fileName=sm2/sm1848/440690/mussm440690.db&recNum=1&itemLink=h%3Fammem%2Fmussm%3A@field%28NUMBER%2B@band%28sm1848%2B440690%29%29&linkText=0, accessed 19.09.10.
Willingford setting, in D major, features both solo voice and a duet for mezzo-soprano and tenor/alto.

The Light of other days, I, p.56, #25.

The music was written by Balfe (1808–1870) to words by Alfred Bunn. The aria is from Balfe’s opera The Maid of Artois (1836). Composer, performer and director, Balfe turned to the composition of popular song when his income from more prestigious sources waned, setting the poems of Longfellow and others to music. His melody for ‘Come into the Garden Maud’ by Tennyson is perhaps his most well-known contribution to Victorian popular culture. Brown writes: ‘In addition to his operas, Balfe wrote about thirty-five songs, among the most well-known being ‘By Killarney’s Lakes’, ‘Come into the garden, Maud’, and ‘Excelsior’. His Seven Poems by Longfellow (c.1855) contains some of the best English art songs of the period’.519 The aria ‘The Light of Other Days’ is easily adapted to drawing-room performance, being a ‘stand-alone’ piece. The song was

undoubtedly written in anticipation of its being performed in the Victorian parlour, a lucrative consideration of which Balfe was aware. Scott states:

He was not concerned … with trying to thrill the opera audience with the virtuosity of vocal displays by characters on stage; musical fireworks might win admiration for the singer but they would hamper sales of the song.\textsuperscript{520}

We have, then, arias that were written with a view to drawing-room performance. Scott refers to Balfe’s soprano air ‘The Dream’, from his opera \textit{The Bohemian Girl}. He states, ‘[I]t relies in no way upon any knowledge of its function in Act II nor … is any understanding of the opera’s plot necessary when making sense of the words’.\textsuperscript{521} This consideration of the marketing of songs and melodies has previously been demonstrated with the sale of song sheets from the operas \textit{The Follies of the Day} and \textit{The Magic Cavern} at Covent Garden in 1785 (see section 3.5). Such pieces were, from this evidence, written with re-contextualisation in the mind of their creators at their conception.

\textbf{The Girl I left behind me, I, p.61, \#27.}

This popular march and song is written as a simple dance tune arrangement for piano without words in the manuscript.


\textsuperscript{521} Ibid. p.19.
The melody was first printed as ‘The Girl I Left Behind Me’ by Maurice Hime in Hime’s Pocket Book for the German Flute or Violin, Vol. IV (Dublin, 1810).\textsuperscript{522} It is under the title ‘Brighton Camp’ that Fleischmann traces the piece back to James Oswald’s The Caledonian Pocket Companion, Book X (c. 1751), where it is entitled ‘The Gimblet’.\textsuperscript{523} ‘Brighton Camp’ is utilised as a march, a song and as a dance tune. It is one of the most widely spread airs occurring in Britain, the United States, Australia and, indeed, throughout the English-speaking world. The following mid-nineteenth century broadside ballad from the Axon Collection\textsuperscript{524} illustrates the vernacular usage of the song.

For extensive notes on the piece, see my annotation of Campbell I, #53.

![The Girl I left behind me](image)

**Figure 21:** ‘The Girl I left behind me’


\textsuperscript{523} Ibid, Vol. 1, p.248.

This piece is printed and bound into the volume. The print states, ‘Arranged Expressly for this Work, The music composed by M. R. De Lisle’. It is the French national anthem, with words translated into English. It is an interesting addition to the collection, likely included due to the eminently memorable nature of the melody and the lasting English fascination with French culture.

**Mourir Pour le Patrie, I, p.63, #29.**

This piece is a ‘Parisian Chant’, printed on the reverse of ‘The Marseillaise’ and written by D’Alphonse Varnie.

**Far o’er the Sea, I, p.64, #30.**

‘The Poetry by Mrs Hermans. The music by Phillip Knight Esq.’. This sheet of paper, of smaller size and quality inferior to that of the rest of the manuscript, has been pasted into the volume.

Below is a setting of the poem to a different melody, published in Sydney c. 1857.525

---

The Captive Knight, I, p.66, #31.

‘The words by Mrs Hermans. The music by her sister’. The piano introduction has the comment, ‘Military music in a distance’. There are several references to trumpets in the lyrics of this strophic ballad, and the last verse of five shows melodic variation.

A copy of the printed ballad is in the National Library of Australia sheet music collection. The cover states: ‘Most respectfully dedicated to Sir Walter Scott’. The lyrics owe much to Scott’s Ivanhoe for inspiration. The song is based on a poem by Felicia Hermans (1793–1835), and as the manuscript states, ‘Music [is] by her sister’, Harriet Brown (d.1858). The poem has five verses, all of which are deployed in the song. The piano introduction is based on a repetitive marching drum rhythm.

---

The manuscript setting appears to be an exact copy of a sheet held in the Levy collection.\footnote{Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, http://levysheetmusic.mse.jhu.edu/levy-cgi/display.cgi?id=114.041.000;pages=5;range=0-4, accessed 22.09.10.}

Kathleen Mavourneen, I, p.71, #32.

Written in 1837 by Fredric Crouch and Marion Crawford, the song was much sung by Irish soprano Catherine Hayes (1818–1861). Hayes had a successful career as an opera singer in Italy, France and England. She toured the world, visiting Australia and the United States, and she was particularly well known for her rendition of ballads.\footnote{G. C. Boase, rev. J. Gilliland, Oxford Dictionary of National Biography, http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/12754?docPos=2, accessed 22.09.10.} The National Library of Scotland’s *The Word on the Street* collection of broadside ballads includes a copy (shown below) of the song c. 1849. The commentary is quoted at length.

“Kathleen Mavourneen” is a song narrated by someone imploring his lover to awake before he has to leave her and Ireland for ever. Songs of parting were common in broadside
ballads, and the narrators were often men facing transportation or preparing to join the army. Here, the narrator’s reasons for leaving are not given, but as it is an Irish ballad it is likely that he is being forced to emigrate for economic reasons. Both Ireland and the Scottish Highlands experienced large-scale emigration in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, especially during periods of crop failure.

Early ballads were dramatic or humorous narrative songs derived from folk culture that predated printing. Originally perpetuated by word of mouth, many ballads survive because they were recorded on broadsides. Musical notation was rarely printed, as tunes were usually established favourites. The term “ballad” eventually applied more broadly to any kind of topical or popular verse.529

This is an example of a writer imposing preconceived notions and histories onto a ballad and in doing so contributing to the myth surrounding ‘folk song’. The commentary includes both fact and fallacy. The writer commences with a summary of the sentiments of the song, which is then, by implication, projected as a reinforcement of folk song/ballad communal creation. ‘[D]erived from folk culture’ deprives the piece of its drawing-room provenance by imposing ‘folk’ credentials. The song did become well known and much sung, especially in American during the Civil War, and with its Irish theme, it was adopted in Ireland and by its diaspora. That the piece was clearly adopted into vernacular usage, being composed originally for the middle classes, illustrates a downward filtration of culture.

The major part of this song is missing from the manuscript as the leaf with pages 72 and 73 has been torn carefully from the book, with only the piano introduction remaining.

Figure 22: ‘Kathleen Mavourneen’

32. Lancers Quadrille or Duval of Dublin, I, p.74, #33.

This set of dances comprises ‘La Dorset and Figure (The Cage)’. 
The edition above is taken from the Levy collection.\textsuperscript{530} It is by the French music publisher, piano manufacturer and composer of popular dance music Camille Schubert (Prilipp) (1810-1889), who wrote several quadrilles and waltzes. The popularity of the quadrille during the nineteenth century is highlighted in Merryweather’s introduction to the Leadley Collection.\textsuperscript{531}

\textbf{Lancers I, p.75, #34.} ‘Contin’d’.

This piece is labelled ‘Lodoiska’.

\textbf{Lancers I, p.76, #35.} ‘Con’d’.

Benwell notes ‘From The Beggars Opera’.

\textbf{Lancers I, p.77, #36.} ‘Contin’d’.

Entitled, ‘Les Graces’.

\textsuperscript{530} Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, http://levysheetmusic.mse.jhu.edu/otcgi/llscgi60, accessed 19.09.10.

Lancers I, p.78, #37. ‘Con’d’.

Entitled, ‘Les Langeis’[?].

Art Thou in Tears, I, p.79, #38.

With music by F. Nicholls Crouch and words by Edward J. Gill, this identical arrangement is held in the National Library of Australia’s Sheet Music Collection.\(^{532}\)

Our Village Church Yard, I, p.82, #39.

‘Words by T. Blake Esqe. The music by B. Taylor’. Benwell has placed the words for the second verse of the song over the top of the vocal music line.

The Last links are Broken, I, p.91, #42.

The rendering of this song in 6/8 time contains errors in transcription, with an omitted bar incorrectly inserted:

![Sheet music](image)

The Better Land, I, p.94, #43.

A copy of this ballad, with ‘[w]ords by Mrs Hermans, Music by Fredric H. Cowen’, is held in the National Library of Australia.533

Annie Laurie, I, p.97, #44.

This well-known Scottish ballad was set to music by Alicia Anne Scott and was performed by both Jenny Lind and Catherine Hayes.534

---

Banks of Allen Water, I, p.104, #49.

‘Banks of Allen Water’ was written by Charles Edward Horn for the opera Rich and Poor in 1812. Horn, a singer, also wrote stage shows, songs and gleeis, including ‘Cherry Ripe’, which is widely regarded as a folk song.\(^{535}\)


This is a printed waltz for piano in 3/8 time composed by G. Robertson.

Behold! how brightly breaks the Morning, I, p.108, #51.

‘The Barcarole from Masaniello by Auber’. Auber’s opera, La Muette de Portici, is usually known in Britain as Masaniello. It was first performed in London in 1829. Clive Brown writes, concerning the significance and popularity of this five-act opera:

> Besides being the first grand opera, La muette de Portici was one of the great operatic successes of the nineteenth century. By 1882 it had had 505 performances in Paris, and it was performed in translated versions throughout Europe.\(^{536}\)

The inclusion of the piece in Benwell’s compilation reflects its popularity and how she and her household were in touch with the musical fashions of their time.

Wood man spare that tree, I, p.112, #52.

The Folk Music Site, an online collection of songs and ballads, categorises this piece, by implication, as a folksong. Lesley Nelson-Burns writes:


The words to this song are a poem written by George Pope Morris in 1830. The music was written by Henry Russell. The song was published in 1837 and was extremely popular in America. Morris was born in Philadelphia in 1802. He was a well-known journalist and poet who founded the *New York Mirror* in 1823 with Samuel Woodworth. Russell, an English born pianist, songwriter and singer, lived in America for several years and enjoyed great success.\(^{537}\)

The decision to include the piece in this folk song collection gives rise to an interesting question pertaining to genre boundaries. Is it the song’s age, ecological implications, provenance or basic appeal that warrants its inclusion into the folk-song canon? The writers of the piece are known, and the original intent was for it to be sung as a drawing-room ballad. Again, the piece has the *je ne sais quoi* that enables it to move between differing performance spaces thereby extending its usage and deployment.

Peace at Home, I, p.115, #53.

The printed copy of this hymn/song is taken from the *London Illustrated News*, as previously stated in the biographical details of Benwell.

My Skiff is on the Shore, I, pp.117/118, #54.

This is a simple piano duet in which the bass and treble parts are written on verso and recto pages. (See the printed song #22, page 54.) This duet arrangement, retaining the original key, is a combination of the song melody played in the treble with harmony and the accompaniment from the printed version forming the bass part.

And ye shall walk in silk attire, I, p.121, #56.

The Levy Collection record states: ‘Air by a Lady. The Symphonies & accompaniments by Henry R. Bishop’.\(^{538}\)

List to the Convent Bells, I, p.123, #57.

This piece was composed by John Blockley with editions printed in England, U.S.A. and Australia. Copies are held in the National Library of Australia, the Library of Congress and the John Hopkins University collections.

A Childs first Grief, I, p.128, #58.

The words to ‘A Child’s first Grief’ by ‘Mrs Hermans’ are set to music by C. H. Bishop. The same stanzas are contained in Little Songs for Little Singers, a collection of the song compositions of Max Braun.\(^{539}\)

The heart bow’d down, I, p.130, #59.

‘The heart bow’d down’ taken is from the opera The Bohemian Girl by Michael Balfe, first performed at Drury Lane Theatre in 1843.

The Irish Emigrant, I, p.133, #60.

The inclusion of this song in the collection was particularly pertinent at the height of the potato famine, 1847 and 1848, the dates of the two manuscripts.


This song is based on the union between Walter and Florence in chapter 57 of *Dombey and Son* by Charles Dickens, first published in 1848.\(^\text{540}\) It is fair to assume that Benwell empathised with the ill-treated daughter of Paul Dombey.

**My heart is Sick, I, p.146, #64.**

Benwell writes, ‘Written in the mould of a Jacobite song of which was the Old [Charles?].’

**Warriors Joy I, (March – Violin Cello), p.148, #65.**

The only piece in the collection intended for ‘cello.

**Untitled, I, p.148, #66.**

This piece is a four-part hymn tune, words omitted, in B♭ major. At the foot of the page is the date ‘Septr. 18\(^{\text{th}}\) 1849’.

**5.3.2.2 Volume II**

This second volume commences with extracts from *Messiah* and *Judas Maccabaeus* by Handel. The inclusion in Benwell’s compilation of these much-performed works by Handel demonstrates his enduring popularity in this country. The mammoth task of transcribing these extracts is precisely and accurately executed.

**Messiah** – Handel

**Comfort ye, II, p.1, #67a.**

Every Valley Shall be Exalted, II, p.3. \#67b.

Oh thou that tellest..., II, p.6, \#68.

Rejoice greatly, II, p.10, \#69.

Behold and see, II, p.16, \#70.

*Judas Maccabaeus* – Handel

Oh Judas! May these noble..., II, p.22, \#71.

From mighty Kings he took the Spoil, II, p.24, \#72.

I saw thy form, II, p.29, \#73.

The words to this tune were set by Thomas Moore to the Irish traditional air ‘Domhnall’\(^{541}\) (Donald). Benwell gives only the first verse of the three-verse song. The melody is known in Ireland by Moore’s title and appears in O’Neill’s collection.\(^{542}\)

This version of the melody from *O’Neill’s Music of Ireland* omits Moore’s lyrics.

*Te deum Laudamus*, II, p.30, \#74.

Both the Anglican and the Roman Catholic Churches use this prayer. It was included in the Anglican *Book of Common Prayer* (1549). A loose, printed copy of this work was found placed between the leaves of the book.


The Tyrolise (sic) Evening Hymn, II, p.34, #75.

‘Written by Mrs Hemans. The music by her sister’. There are two sets of words to this piece. Benwell writes: ‘New words to the Tyrolise (sic) Hymn by Rev. E Bagnell’.

Although the words are attributed to Felicity Hemans (1793–1835) in both the Benwell version and that from the New York Mirror543 (1838), above, the first line of the verse is also attributed to John Milton.

I'll hang my harp on a willow tree, II, p.37, #76.

‘The Poetry by T. Haynes Bayly Esq.’. The music was composed by William Guernsey (1817–1885).

The printed version above is from 1840s New York and is taken from Ball State University’s Digital Media Repository. Although it is not the same version as Benwell’s copy of this ballad, the practice of placing the second verse over the vocal line is used, in several instances, by Benwell. (See also ‘The Village Church Yard’, Vol. I, p.82.)

A version of this ballad was collected by John Quincy Woolf Junior from the singing of Almeda Riddle in Arkansas, U.S.A., on 22 August 1957 under the title

---

‘Weeping Willow’. The recording forms part of The John Quincy Wolf Folklore Collection held at Lyon College, Batesville, Arkansas. The recording verifies the ballad’s transition from drawing-room ballad to folksong. Riddle’s appealing, unaccompanied rendition bears stylistic traits reminiscent of the ‘high mountain’ singing found in the Appalachian Mountains. The ballad survived for over a hundred years as a cultural entity and has been carried, by merit of its endearing melodic qualities, into a very different context from the original Victorian parlour. F. C. Brown, in his collection of folklore from North Carolina, is not aware of the song’s origins as a drawing-room ballad, as is shown in his 1952 publication.

The song is now regarded as an American folksong with no acknowledgement of its drawing-room provenance. Versions are to be found in many collections of traditional songs from the United States. Henry Brinley Richards wrote extensive piano variations on the melody.

The Officer’s Funeral, II, p.44, #78.

‘Words and music by The Honourable Mrs Norton’.

---

Above is a copy of the sheet music for the song taken from the Digital Collection of The National Library of Australia. The title page of the sheet music is a work of art in itself. Benwell's transcription is identical to this arrangement.

The Glory of all Nations, II, p.47, #79.

This song is militaristic in nature, as one might expect, with bugle and drum imitation in the piano introduction.

The Hardy Norsemen’s House of Yore, A Norse National Song. II, 50, #80.

---

The song is set in four parts (Treble, Alto, Tenor and Bass) and has a preamble written by the composer ‘R. L. Peursal of Wills Bridge’.

Robert Lucas de Pearsall (1795 – 1856) was born in Bristol and was called to the bar in 1821; however, his main interests were music, history, heraldry and genealogy. These led him to the continent, where he eventually took up residence in Switzerland. This song is included in several hymnals and has been performed, because of its Scandinavian references, as an Anglo/Norse song. Below is a summary of a concert performed on 7 May 1908 at Steinway Hall, London, with the song at the culmination of the programme.

**SUMMARY OF ODES.**

(a) Welcome to Iceland. Chorus, Contralto and Tenor Solos. The King is bid welcome, and expression is given to the joy which the Icelandic people feel in his having honoured their country with his presence. In the second and following verses Fjallkonanp (the Mountain Queen, emblem of Iceland) is made to welcome the King.

---

(b) Dana Gramur (King of Denmark). Tenor Solo and Chorus. An address to the King, who is asked to listen to the ancient tongue. In the Solo a comparison is made between the warlike spirit of older times and the more peaceful tendencies of the present day. In the third verse mention is made of the late King which is followed by a chorus of praise and welcome.

(c) Danmerkurljoti (Ode to Denmark). Soprano Solo and Chorus. Ode to Denmark, founded on one of the best known Danish National song(s, which is used as a Canto Fermo, and sung in Danish. (d) Heilir Frzendur (Hail Kinsmen). Duet for two Basses. Ode to the Danish Members of Parliament, who, with the King, were the guests of Iceland.

(e) Brotherhood of the Four Northern Nations. Chorus. The sentiment of Brotherhood between the four Northern Nations, who, like the branches of a tree, are sprung from the same root. THE SELECT CHOIR. Accompanied by the Composer.

The other items were:

Songs .. “Autumn” Lanse-Miilter, “I Love Thee”, Grieg, “Swedish Folksong”, Arranged by Dannstrom .. .. Miss HODOLFA LLOMBINO.

Song .. “The Viking’s Grave” Sueinbjorn Sueinbjornsson .. Mr. W. A. PETERKIN Accompanied by the Composer.

Miss ADELAIDE DODGSON and Mr. A. C. HANDLEY-DAVIES.

Part Song .. “Iceland” Sceinbjorn Sceinbjornsson

Part Song .. “The Hardy Norseman’s House of Yore”,

Pearsall

THE SELECT CHOIR.

Soprani – Master LESLIE COLE, Miss K. PRICE PRICE.

Contrahi – Miss CONSTANCE M. SMITH, Mrs. M. HUGHES.

Tenori – Mr. ALBERT A. MAIDEN, Mr. WALTER CARR.

Bassi – Mr. JACK MORGAN, Mr. GILBERT LAWSON.

NATIONAL ANTHEM – GOD SAVE THE KING. 549

Oh softly sleep, II, p.54, #81.

The words are an extract from ‘Clan-Albin, The Maid of Duart’, printed in The Novelist’s Magazine, 1833. 550

Oh softly sleeps my baby boy.

Rocked by the mountain wind,

549 Society for Northern Research, Orkney Shetland and Northern Society, Saga Book of the Viking Club, University of London, King's College, 1908–1909, pp.7–9, accessed 22/02/2011.

Thou dream’st not of a lover false,  
Or of a world unkind.  

Oh sweetly sleep my baby boy,  
Thy fairy claps, my little joy,  
Shall soothe her aching breast.  

Wake! Wake and smile, thou baby boy,  
My heavy heart to cheer,  
The wintry blast howls on the hill,  
The leaf grows red and scar.  

Oh, tell me! Tell me, baby boy,  
How shall I hear thy cry,  
When hungry gnaws thy little heart,  
And death lights on thine eyes!  

Oh was it meet my baby boy  
That thou such weird shouldst dree?  
Sweet heaven forgive thy false father,  
His wrongs to thee and me.  

Benwell’s manuscript copy appears to be incomplete, with the last line of the first verse omitted and only the first two lines of verse two copied out. With two blank pages following this song, one must assume that the lullaby is incomplete.  

*Jenny Lind's Song, II, p.57, #82.*
Benwell writes: ‘In infancy when gay and young…’

I Love the Night, II, p.60, #83.

This is a setting of the poem ‘I Love the Night’ by American poet George Pope Morris (1802–1864).

I love the night when the moon streams bright
On flowers that drink the dew--
When cascades shout as the stars peep out,
From boundless fields of blue;
But dearer far than moon or star,
Or flowers of gaudy hue,
Or murmuring trills of mountain-rills,
I love, I love, love--you!
I love to stray at the close of the day,
Through groves of forest-trees,
When gushing notes from song-birds’ throats
Are vocal in the breeze.
I love the night--the glorious night--
When hearts beat warm and true;
But far above the night, I love,
I love, I love, love--you!

The music to this song is by Henry Russell (1812–1900), a baritone singer, pianist and songwriter. Russell trained at the Bologna Conservatory; he then worked in both England and North America, writing over 600 songs. Lamb, in his biography of Russell, writes:

He [Russell] reckoned that his songs had an influence on such issues as the abolition of slavery and (with ‘The Maniac’, 1840) the private lunatic asylum. His other songs included ‘Woodman! Spare that Tree!’ (1837), ‘The Ivy Green’ (1838), ‘A Life on the Ocean Wave’ (1838), and ‘The Old Arm Chair’ (1840), which are regarded as an important element in the evolution of an American popular song tradition. Russell himself has been described as the most important American songwriter before Stephen Foster.\(^{551}\)

A copy of ‘I Love the Night’ is in the Levy Collection\(^{552}\) and is pitched in E major whilst Benwell’s copy, the same arrangement, is transposed into Eb major. Benwell has dated the manuscript copy 30 August 1849.

Come away to the glen: Cavatina, II, p.80, #88.

\(^{552}\) Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, Box 121, Item 121.045, p.1, accessed 19.10.10.
The sheet music copy states that the song was composed by William Francis Lancelott, sung by Mrs. Waylett and published by J. Bingley & W. Strange c. 1846. There is a discrepancy, with regard to the writer of the lyrics, between the National Library of Australia record and the manuscript. Benwell states: ‘Written by A Berry’ whereas the library record states that the piece was ‘written by A. Koyne’.

**The Sea, II, p.83, #89.**


**God Save the Queen, II, p.91, #91.**

A simple arrangement of the National Anthem for piano, with three verses.

**Home Sweet Home, I, p.92, #92.**

The popularity of this song, written by Sir Henry Rowley Bishop (1786 – 1855), continued well into the twentieth century. Scott writes:

> Widespread as the song’s fame was in the late 1820s, its celebrity and cultural importance increased towards the end of Bishop’s life when it became a favourite of the ‘Swedish Nightingale’, Jenny Lind.

The melody was also later utilised for dancing. Below is an arrangement of ‘Home Sweet Home’, from Kerr’s ‘Merry Melodies’, juxtaposed with a ‘German Schottische’. This shift of role from song to dance tune would

---

have been actuated and assisted by the melody’s popularity and common usage.

It is Better To Laugh Than Be Sighing, II, p.101, #95.


The printed arragement above is for guitar and is from the Levy Collection of sheet music.  556

The Soldier’s Wedding, II, p.111, #96.

Benwell writes: ‘Songs of a Conscript No. 4, written by C. Jeffreys, transcribed by C. Glover’.

Why doth the Bride look so sad, II, p.114, #97.

Benwell notes, ‘Music and words by G. Lindley’, ‘February 14th 1850’.

The Blighted Flower, II, p.118, #98.

Benwell dates this page as ‘Feb’y 23rd 1850’. Below is a broadside ballad from the Chethams Broadside Ballad Collection.\(^{557}\)

Figure 23: ‘The Blighted Flower’

This is another example of a parlour ballad being produced, without music, as a ballad sheet. It is assumed that the melody of the piece is known by the purchaser, in itself is a measure of the popularity of the ballad. This practice may well account for some of the variation in folk-song melody encountered by the late Victorian and Edwardian collectors.

Thou art gone from my gaze, II, p.121, #99.

‘Thou art gone from my gaze’ is also known as ‘The Spirit of Love Keeps What Over Me’. Both words and music were written by G. Linley. There are several differing published copies in the Levy collection.\(^{558}\)


---


The transcription of this piece towards the end of Vol. II of Benwell’s compilation demonstrates the precision and artistry of her calligraphy.

Beautiful Venice, II, p.130, #102.
Benwell notes, ‘Arranged by J. Valentine’. The piece, with words by J. E. Carpenter and music by J. P. Knight, is written in 12/8 time\textsuperscript{559} whereas Valentine is in 6/8 time; there do not appear to be any other changes in the arrangement.

**The White Squall, II, p.133, #103.**

‘By T. A. Barker’. Published by Chappell and Co., London. At the foot of the page is written ‘Amelia Benwell 2nd May 1850’. This is a ‘Sea Song’ depicting the wreck of a bark.\textsuperscript{560}

**Italian Air, II, p.144, #106.**

Items #104 and #105 are roughly sketched melodies with no bar lines and stems missing from the notes. This is an attempt to notate melodies rather than copy them from sheet music.

**Index**

Benwell’s volume culminates with an ‘Index’ listing all the song titles and their page numbers.

### 5.3.3 Benwell Manuscripts: Conclusion

This compilation provides a snapshot of popular drawing-room culture of the mid-nineteenth century. As with the other manuscripts in this study, the pieces in Benwell’s manuscript were personally selected by the compiler. Benwell’s faithful and diligent transcriptions exemplify precision, focus and exactitude. The precise motive(s) for the creation of the compilation is (are) impossible to ascertain. The pieces are free standing

\textsuperscript{559} Knight, J. P. and J. E. Carpenter, ‘Beautiful Venice’, Johns Hopkins University, Levy Sheet Music Collection, accessed 16.08.12.

arrangements of songs for piano, representing its establishment as the preeminent instrument of the century. It is likely Benwell made these copies as a score to enable the vocalist to perform away from the piano while the pianist played from the original sheet music. The cost of the printed sheet music from which these pieces were transcribed would have been considerable. The contents reflect Victorian sentimentality and are very much of their era. They reflect developments in musical instrument technology and the diversification of repertoire. Many pieces in the manuscripts emanated from the contemporary opera stage and were adapted for popular performance whilst others were reproduced as broadside ballads, illustrating vernacular adoption. Like the other manuscript collections considered in the thesis, Benwell’s manuscripts exude a sense of human contact and utilitarian functionality as well as intrinsic beauty.

5.4 The Francis Rippon Manuscripts

5.4.1 Physical Attributes

These two small manuscript books are lodged at the Yorkshire Regimental Museum in Clifford Street, York. Each measures 150 x 118mm and is bound with cardboard covers. They are a military bandsman’s books and inscribed ‘Francis Rippon, Solo Cornet, East York Militia’, in copperplate script. Rippon’s handwriting is of varying quality and legibility, with considerable care taken with some titles. Other titles and attributions are illegible whilst several others contain spelling errors.

Inscription
One is led to speculate as to whether or not Rippon’s hand is responsible for the musical notation. The musical staves are drawn with a Brause pen in Vol. I whilst in Vol. II they are printed.

The condition of the two books is somewhat tired, with evidence of much use and general wear-and-tear. Pages appear to be missing from both volumes, but nonetheless a clear picture of the nature Rippon’s repertoire may be deduced from those remaining.

The size of the books suggests that they would readily fit into a musical instrument case. The prolonged battering that the corners of the books appear to have received is
most likely the result of such housing.

5.4.2 Contents

The content of the volumes consists of marches, dance tunes and songs, many of which demonstrate a considerable degree of complexity. As is the case with the Campbell I manuscript, there are several untitled pieces identifiable only numerically. Pieces do appear to be parts from larger arrangements. ‘The Awkward Squad’ from Vol. II contains tacet bars, for example.

The mere fact that ‘solo’ is employed as a direction in many instances vindicates this assumption. The deployment of rhythmical figures derived from drumming is evident as follows.

The inclusion of Handel’s ‘Dead March in Saul’ is a stark reminder of the often grim functionality of some martial music. The original is in the key of C, and it has likely been transposed to suit the range of the cornet. Murray describes the ceremonial context of the piece:
Approaching the cemetery, the cortège broke into slow time once again and, at this final stage of the journey, it was customary for Handel’s “Dead March in Saul” to be played, all the drums rolling throughout, the bass drum marking every seventh beat only.  

With the coming of the railways, army mobility ceased to rely on marching as its primary transportation. Consequently, a more ceremonial role was allocated to the military band.

The melody ‘God Bless the Prince of Wales’ has assisted with the dating of these manuscripts. Henry Richards composed the tune in 1862, with words in Welsh by John Hughes for the Caernarfon Eisteddfod. George Lindley wrote English words in 1863 to mark the marriage of The Prince of Wales, the future Edward VII, to Alexandra of Denmark. As the piece is preceded in the manuscript by ‘[The] Danish National Anthem’, it would seem probable that the two pieces were played to mark the union. Further indications of date are given by the inclusion of the melodies of two Stephen

---

Foster songs, namely, ‘Massa’s in de Cold Ground’ and ‘My Old Kentucky Home’, which were first published in New York in 1852 and 1853, respectively. The circulation of these popular songs was wide-reaching and lasted well into the twentieth century.

That the melodies were included in books compiled in the 1860s indicates the songs’ popularity, the compiler’s awareness of current tastes and his willingness to accede to audience demands.

A. J. Barker, in his history of the East Yorkshire Regiment, provides an early photograph that includes the band. His footnote states: “The 2nd Battalion at Poona in 1876…. [T]he band is on the right incongruously wearing a bowler hat”.562

Elsewhere in his work is a copy of ‘The Regimental March … 1772 March of the 15 Regt’. Barker’s observation reads:

This old copy of the March was sent to the Regiment in 1907 by German War Office…. The reverse of the original sheet is printed with “The Highland March”; it seems likely … that it is a sheet taken from an eighteenth century book of marches.563

This piece is not included in the Rippon Manuscript but forms part of the reglemental history of The East Yorkshire Militia.

The brass band movement, by the second half of the nineteenth century, was firmly established as part of the cultural landscape, especially in the north of England. The military marching bands of the early part of the century, those that performed the ‘Regimental March’ above, were based on woodwind instruments. Brass instruments, such as the cornet, superseded fifes and clarinets and became the melody-carrying instruments of the military band.

The pieces included in these two volumes are moderately demanding in terms of musicianship and form part of practical, fit-for-purpose arrangements. Rippon would appear to have been a ‘rank and file’ band member and may well have been a part-time militia man. The individual volumes demonstrate distinct musical features and demarcation. Vol. I contains marches and ceremonial pieces whilst Vol. II contains military pieces, plus popular songs and dance melodies. The song and dance melodies in Vol. II, however, retain a martial flavour, with several pieces set as marches. There appears to be a distinction between the music for the parade ground and pieces for entertainment in the mess in the two volumes. As with Campbell I, many of the marches are untitled, with only numbers used for identification.
The composer or arranger, ‘Mr?[?] Martin’, is acknowledged in this march (above) from Vol., which passes from 6/8 to 2/4. This book contains many pieces attributed to Martin, and they appear to be taken from the same source. The unsavoury stain might at best be candle wax. With the exception of ‘God Bless the Prince of Wales’, ‘Fear Not Britannia’s Honour’s Safe’, ‘The Dead March in Saul’ and ‘Danish National Anthem’, the whole of this first volume is given over to untitled marches.

Vol. II contains two command pieces, ‘Setting up the Wash’ and ‘Tattoo’. Along with polkas, quadrilles and waltzes appears ‘The Quaker’s Wife’. This melody has been used as both a dance tune and march since the early eighteenth century. Kuntz writes: ‘As a march, it was published in Captain Robert Hinde’s (1720–1786) *Collection of Quick Marches*. He speculates that the piece may be far older. The tune for the eighteenth-century Jacobite Ballad ‘Johnnie Cope’ is also included, along with other old Scottish pieces, for example, ‘The Campble’s [sic] are coming’.

---

5.5 The Norris Manuscript

5.5.1 Physical Attributes

The front inside board of this volume is inscribed ‘Pte. R. W. Norris, 6th November, 1886, Firmoy [sic], Ireland’. The dealer from whom I purchased the manuscript, when asked about its provenance, commented, ‘I am sorry I don’t have any more information about this. It was with some other songbooks I bought several years ago’.

The manuscript measures 240 x 290mm and is bound in cloth-covered boards with the word ‘Music’ embossed in gold in the centre of the front cover.

The volume has 46 printed, 12-stave manuscript pages, with five remaining blank. One leaf may well have been torn from the book. Both the front and back inside boards are pasted with scrap cuttings of cartoons, caricatures and portraits.
These collages give us some insight into the personality of Norris, with humour in the juxtapositions and contents of the clippings. I suggest that these would have been a source of amusement for the musicians whilst sat at the band desk waiting to play for the officers. The main portrait featured on the front inside board is Frederick Archer (1857–1886), the most successful flat-race jockey of the second half of the nineteenth century. The shock of Archer’s suicide on 8 November 1886 would have been much to
the forefront of newspaper and periodical pages at the time of the compilation of the manuscript. The portrait of the woman on the inside rear board is nameless.

The musical notation is mostly written in a very experienced hand, exhibiting style and confidence. This suggests it is not the hand of a young bandsman but an experienced copyist.

Above is the second variation on the Victorian favourite ‘Home Sweet Home’, exemplifying panache in the execution of the notation. Below is Norris’s autographed copy of ‘Away with Melancholy’ (17 November 1886).

He has ‘copied’ these variations rather than composed them himself or written them out from memory, just like I have argued of the majority of manuscript compilers considered in this thesis. Here is also an example of one of several solos and cadenzas included in the compilation that demonstrate command of instrument. With several references in the compilation to solo clarinet, it is fair to assume that Norris was a clarinettist. As in the other manuscripts considered in this thesis, the handwriting in the compilation is at times difficult to discern or even illegible.
5.5.2 Contents

Bandsman Private Norris appears to have been a member of the British Army stationed at the Fermoy Barracks in Fermoy, County Cork, which was a Garrison Town until 1922 and is now part of the Republic of Eire. During the nineteenth century, it grew to be the largest British military base in Ireland. Prior to the establishment of the Irish Free State, there was accommodation for almost 3,000 troops in Fermoy; their presence must have had considerable impact on the local economy.

Apart from business connections, the officer class had little or no social contact with the townspeople. They had their own club known as the Gentlemen’s Club at the main entrance to the Grand Hotel. The Club was open to retired Military Personnel of the Officer class whose social contact was solely with the owners of the bigger houses in the vicinity of Fermoy. They had the use of the Military Bands for the entertainment of their friends, for garden parties and other social functions.\textsuperscript{565}

McGrath’s observations regarding this insularity of the ‘Officer class’ in Fermoy sheds light on a social, cultural and musical divide created by the occupying military force. Social, cultural and religious differences are maintained and reinforced by such closed, illiberal regimes. The ‘Military Band’ to which Paudie McGrath refers is, more than likely, that in which Norris played.

This collection consists of dance tunes, airs with variations and song melodies. The variations on ‘The Blue Bells of Scotland’ are written for Bb clarinet as are the ‘English

Airs’. There are no marches in this collection, which implies that this compilation was intended for social entertainment or concert performance.

1. Sweethearts, Valse, Nos. 1, 2, 3.
2. Penelope Valse, Nos. 1, 2, 3.
3. Mine Again Waltz, Nos. 1, 2, 3.
4. I Never can forget
5. Quadrille. Chilperie, Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5.
6. Nine O-clock Galop
7. Now and then – Polka
8. Canebrake Schottische.
10. English Airs, B♭ clarinet
11. Home Sweet Home
12. Tom Bowling
13. ‘Air with Var. Away with Melancholy’
14. Waltz. Mon – Amour
15. The P and O Polka
16. Hornpipe
17. Valse, Love’s Dreamland
18. Highland Home Schottische
19. Valse. Queen of the Fairies
20. Clar. Solo from Ill Travatore
21. Lancers La Fille De Madame Augot
22. … Mazurka …
23. Myosoties Waltz
The absence of Irish pieces is notable. Both Scotland and England are represented in titles. Dibdin’s 1789 ‘Tom Bowling’ is included in the repertoire, along with the well-established ‘Blue Bells of Scotland’ and the aforementioned ‘Home Sweet Home’. Many of the melodies include sets of technically demanding variations, specifically written to demonstrate the ‘virtuosity’ of the instrumentalist.

In comparison to the contents of Campbell I, Norris’s repertoire demonstrates greater sophistication. This is undoubtedly a result of the establishment of The Royal Military School of Music at Kneller Hall, London (1857), when standards of musicianship, performance and uniformity in military bands improved considerably.

The Military School of Music quickly achieved the results desired by its founder and, thirty years after its foundation, during the Queen’s Jubilee, was granted the title Royal, becoming the Royal Military School of Music.\textsuperscript{566}

The level of Norris’s playing capabilities, which far exceed those the compiler of Campbell I likely possessed, suggest that Norris certainly benefited from the establishment of the Royal Military School of Music.

\textbf{Conclusion to Chapter Five}

The rise in the prominence of the middle classes is much in evidences in these collections compiled during the Victorian era. Music-making was an important aspect of the bourgeois household and provided a catalyst for social interaction. This is exemplified by the Benwell compilation. The Norris collection demonstrates the professional training of military bandsmen. High standards of musicianship are also evident in the latter volumes of the Leadley collection. The contents of these collections show a move away from the eighteenth-century country-dance genre. Pieces

\textsuperscript{566} National Archives, \textit{Corps of Army Music, Royal Military School of Music, History}, http://tna.europarchive.org/20110106102426/army.mod.uk/music/, accessed 15.03.12.
demonstrate greater diversity in both form and sources. The presence of items with martial connections continues to form a sizable proportion of the contents of the collections. The interdependence of popular song, music from the stage, dance and military music continues from the previous century.

6 Chapter Six: Concluding Discussion

6.1 Part One: Observations and Analysis

6.1.1 Methodology

Some areas in the domain of this research topic remain impenetrable. A number of pieces that are untitled and of unknown provenance remain untraced; the identifying of tunes is an ongoing project. Before the introduction of performance royalties and copyright protection, it was not common practice for performers or transcribers of short marches or dance tunes to credit a specific source.

The manuscripts and their contents are primary sources akin to rich archaeological sites, relinquishing slowly their hidden secrets after much coaxing. Tracing the provenance of pieces opens windows, exposing large banks of ephemeral music that time has deleted from the popular canon. What particular qualities do those melodies display that warrants their inclusion in a collection as opposed to those omitted? This question of selection and rejection is one with which artists have tussled for centuries. Certain pieces contain that je ne sais quoi which today equates to the difference between a hit record selling millions and a flop sinking into oblivion. The editors of The Apted Book of Country Dances (1958) comment on the contents of five country-dance publications of the latter part of the eighteenth century:

It must be admitted that the great majority of these dances are extremely poor. The Editors believe that, out of the whole lot,
they have selected the only dances worth preserving. The selection of tunes has been a further problem; but since in the original, the connection between tune and dance seems generally quite fortuitous, the Editors have not scrupled to replace a poor tune by a better one from the same collection.\(^{567}\)

Such filtration based on aesthetic judgements and notions of quality that are adopted by the compilers may be seen in manuscripts such as Vickers and Jackson. This complies with the ‘selection’ constraint that forms part of the International Folk Music Council (I.C.T.M.’s) 1954 definition of folk song: ‘selection by the community which determines the form or forms in which the music survives’.\(^{568}\) Selection remains a feature of many of the recent revivalist publications and does not only apply to ‘folk’ music.

The grouping of pieces and ordering of tunes within these collections provides an indication of their purposes; they give insight into the resourcefulness and capabilities of the compiler. Events and characters are recorded by means of titles and thereby allocate historical significance. Detailed, evidence-based analysis of manuscripts has its advantages as it avoids the imposition of preconceived notions pertaining to role, purpose, genre, performance, origin, etc. A research agenda centred on and dictated by findings allows for objectivity.

6.1.2 Establishment of Format: The Handwritten Manuscript

The formats of the manuscripts examined in this thesis demonstrate common features. They are musical instrument-specific, succinct and reflect the requirements of the


compilers and their audiences. Some (e.g., Atkinson, Vickers, Jackson and Leadley) are intended for violin and others for clarinet (e.g., Campbell I and Norris) or piano (e.g., Benwell); they are concise, purpose-led collections. The history of the manuscript format is interesting, extending long before the printed collections that influenced the composition of the compilations in this study.

Western notation of secular music has its origins in the church. One can only speculate as to the makeup of the secular songs and instrumental music of the time prior to the introduction of notation. The introduction of notation enabled the coordination of diverse elements into harmony (or dissonance) in ensemble singing and playing. An early example of a secular song is ‘Summer is Icumen in’ (c.1250); the manuscript below demonstrates the coordination made possible by the introduction of notation.569

Figure 24: ‘Summer is Icumen in’

The handwritten manuscripts featured in this thesis are similar tools for harmonic and melodic coordination; they are the simple regimentation of the unison performance of marches or dance melodies. As cultural repositories, the manuscripts have served as vectors for the dissemination of melody. The collection of an instrumentalist’s repertoire in a compact, easily transportable volume is an eminently practical development of musical notation. The scarcity and cost of printed music, as stated earlier in the thesis, likely motivated the creators of the collections. Many of the compilers of these volumes imitate print fonts in their transcriptions of the titles of the melodies. These manuscripts are substitutes for printed collections containing the compilers’ desired contents.

6.1.3 Roles and Deployments

The roles and deployments of the manuscript repertoires examined in this thesis have similarities and differences. Some, such as Jackson and Campbell I, are for accompaniment of dancing and marching; others, such as Benwell, are for song performance and parlour entertainment. The Campbell I manuscript contents are melodies intended for performance on fife or clarinet, whereas the contents of the Benwell volumes are songs with piano accompaniment. The parlour and the parade ground are starkly differing contexts, yet similar forces are evident in the way in which the compilers tailored their repertoires to meet their requirements. Strength and appeal of melody, I would suggest, are vital ingredients of the selection process. A commonality of format is displayed throughout individual manuscripts. Ultimately, for all the compilers, the deployments and selection of pieces depended on their intended social contexts.
The dance airs are the melodies of courtship; they provided a catalyst for social interaction in both polite and less salubrious settings. This thesis does not challenge the notion that music is embedded in the community, but it does question the extent to which community moulds format and impacts formation. Individual performers have been shown to have impact on style whereas technological features of instruments may influence the fundamental makeup and structure of the music.

The pedagogical use of the manuscripts is self-evident. ‘A New Minute’ and ‘A New Lesson’ (pages 67 and 68, respectively) in Atkinson’s manuscript, exemplify his role as a dancing master. Bramwell Brontë’s flute manuscript is a school boy’s instrument instruction book. It is a collection of pieces for practise on the instrument, and it would have been taken down by Brontë from the teacher’s collection. The Leadley II compilation is a similar schoolboy collection. We need to remember that such rote learning by imitation and the copying of notation was regarded as valid practice for centuries.

6.1.4 Cultural Indicator and Record of Popular Music

As stated previously, we do not know how the contents of these manuscript books sounded in original performance. The dances and modes of performance exist only in ephemeral moments in time. Our constructs regarding original performance are merely conjectural. Many of the instruments that are used in revival performances of these pieces were not invented or had not developed into their current form when these manuscripts were first used. For instance, Playford melodies may be performed on the concertina nowadays, yet the concertina was not invented or in common usage until after 1850.

Although the manuscripts do not tell us how the included pieces were performed, the content of the manuscript compilations is a reflection of trends in
music contemporaneous to the time from which they emanate. Unlike the agenda of the revivalist, the manuscripts are not retrospective in outlook but include pieces popular in their own time. Today military marches also include current popular pieces, establishing an emblematic bond whilst fostering esprit de corp. The inclusion of pieces such as ‘Massa’s in the Cold Ground’ and ‘My Old Kentucky Home’, in the Rippon manuscript, illustrate that such practice has long been undertaken.

As stated previously, the music selected from the popular milieu gives insight into aspirations, fashions, conventions and attitudes. Titles of pieces mention protagonists, events and places, including those that may not be considered significant, or may be forgotten, today. Whilst containing pieces named after Nelson and Lady Hamilton, Campbell I also has pieces named after the long forgotten Abraham Newland (#36, pages 18 and 19), the chief cashier of the Bank of England.

Our current perspectives are clouded by the over-abundance of data. Within each of the manuscripts there exists a subjective perception of culture and the insight of the individual compiler, which is in turn a reflection of the demands of her/his audiences and their social bases.

6.1.5 Copyright

One question raised by the examination of manuscripts in this thesis is whether music available on the internet in the ABC notation format should be regarded as falling under the laws that apply to standard musical notation copyright. It may be argued that traditional music, by its very nature, does not belong to any one individual but to the people themselves. The posting of digital images of original manuscripts makes them accessible to all, and as their content is out of copyright on grounds of age, they are within the public domain. The investigation of the manuscripts in this thesis shows the
benefit of the widespread availability of this material, but ownership remains a difficult question due to the complexity of the laws surrounding copyright.

### 6.1.6 Development and Canon

The contents of the manuscripts examined demonstrate the gradual evolution and development of popular taste. Increasing complexity in the makeup of the pieces mirrors the similar development in ‘art’ music. The pieces in the Leadley collection are more complex than those in the Jackson’s manuscript, for example. This reflects the advancement and development of range and harmony in music from the Classical to the Romantic periods. The introduction of new musical instruments and technological advances in other established instruments is accompanied by a commensurate change in canon.

The manuscript compilers’ reliance on printed sources is evident throughout the whole sample. For example, the *Campbell I* manuscript has consecutive pieces drawn from Crosby’s *Irish Musical Repository* (1808) and many pieces taken from the late eighteenth century volumes of Aird’s *Selection of Scotch, English, Irish and Foreign Airs*. The manuscript compilers gathered material from a wide range of publications and undoubtedly from similar handwritten compilations. The music and songs of Hook and the stage material and sea songs of Dibdin are to be found in the *Campbell I* manuscript alongside pieces from the country-dance canon and the marching-band repertoire. These wide-ranging sources encapsulate the popular musical tastes of the early 1800s. By tracing the sources of a large proportion of the contents of the compilations, a general flow of material from print to manuscript is confirmed.
6.1.7 *Score: A Restriction on Performance?*

The manuscripts are a form of notation, a vehicle for conveying melody. One of the most striking differences between the performance of ‘folk’, jazz, world and other musics and that of ‘classical’ music is classical music’s use of the score. The regimentation imposed by the strait-jacket of a written music restricts, within set parameters, the growth, variation and further development of a piece. Score, in this regard, is equivalent to ossification.

Tradition and convention, via rote learning and memory, influence the performance of vernacular music. The score sets and imposes parameters. In mathematical terms, the score might be described as an ‘eigenvector’: a special carrier, the means by which sound is communicated by written symbols. Without the parameters set by the score, diversion in interpretation – both intentionally and unintentionally – results in transformation, variation and development.

The manuscripts are not as prescriptive as classical music scores, often presenting the bare bones of a melody only. However, they do fix performance; they are a setting down of tunes. They establish tunes’ salient features and provide a starting point for performance interpretation and variation.

6.1.8 *Parts*

These manuscripts were not used in isolation. The evidence verifies this with the use of directions such as ‘solo’ and ‘symphony’, periods of silence and attributes that indicate accompaniment, e.g., melodies ending on the third note of the scale or being a single note held over several bars. The gathering together of an ensemble’s repertoire in a folder is common practice in many genres of music. In popular music and jazz, referring to an individual piece as a ‘number’, which is kept in a ‘pad’, is common parlance and has been so throughout the twentieth century. Any of the three reference
points of page number, item number or title may be used to locate a piece during performance. Vickers, Leadley and Benwell each have indexes in their compilations, and all the other manuscripts examined utilise pagination, titles and item numbers to a lesser or greater extent. The evidence of part-writing in these manuscripts is further indication of the influence of art music on their contents. They are, perhaps, one stage back from vernacular adoption and single melodic form.

6.1.9 Titles

Titles assist in establishing the provenance of melodies in the manuscripts. Writing in Sinsear (translated as ‘ancestor’) in 1981, on the nomenclature of Irish dance melodies, Breandán Breathnach states:

[T]unes and titles are not related musically. The name merely is a tag to help one recall the associated tune. It does not represent verbally a sentiment allegedly expressed in the music.\(^{570}\)

Breathnach acknowledges the interplay between song airs and dance tunes and the difficulties that may be encountered in establishing which came first. A large proportion of traditional dance melodies are not set to lyrics and are not based on song melodies. Titles are merely labels, as Breathnach asserts. These titles do, however, enable the musicologist to investigate provenance; they are a key that provides a link to variants and published versions of the melodies. Titles and numbers are used in performance by ensembles for expedience. Some are generic and are merely statements of purpose or category, for instance, ‘Jig’, ‘Polka’, ‘Waltz’, ‘Hornpipe’, ‘Quick Step’ and ‘March’. These are dance types, which give indication of purpose whilst providing an insight into the dance fashion of the era. Any one tune may be labelled with many titles. A straightforward example is the Scottish double jig ‘Kenmure’s up and Awa’ (Campbell II,

The amassing of differing tune titles holds a fascination to some, who engage in a collection practice akin to musical philately. Seattle, in his numerous publications, and Andrew Kuntz, on his Fiddler's Companion website, both go to great lengths to list as many titles of a particular melody as possible, including spelling variations. This practice is of some use in that it makes it possible to establish the provenance of melodies, but it should not be regarded as an end in itself. However, the variation in labels, as with melodic variation, is in the nature of ‘folk’ musics and is an integral part of their intrigue.

In the Campbell I manuscript, some titles notably omit the definite article, for instance, ‘Rose Tree’ or ‘Cupid Recruiting [sic] Sergeant’ whereas others, ‘The Carle He came ower the Croft’, include it. The omission of titles of melodies in many of collections has proved problematic; identification has been a slow, time-consuming exercise. A significant number of untitled pieces have been traced by means of incipits. If other collections are codified in a similar manner, further tunes can be named and traced.

6.2 Part Two: Theoretical Considerations

6.2.1 Critiques of Theories of the Origin of Folk

The manuscripts are different from collections of folk songs gathered specifically for their ‘folk’ credentials, yet such folk collections often shape present day attitudes toward manuscript contents. Indeed, the current perception of manuscript music is moulded by attitudes toward the study of folk more broadly. Folk-song analysis is easily applicable to the vernacular instrumental music contained in handwritten manuscripts. Indeed,
theories of folk and their associated baggage are often applied to the study of traditional music; however, this approach is not necessarily always appropriate.

Harker, in his 1985 publication *Fakesong: The Manufacture of British ‘Folksong’ 1700 to the Present Day*, presents a harsh critique of folk music, debunking many of the falsehoods surrounding the creation, collection and revival of British folk song. He recognises, as Frank Kidson did many years before him, the impact of printed sources on the folk tradition and emphasises the ‘mediation of songs within a wider framework’. For Harker, context and background are paramount. His controversial volume scrutinises with academic rigour the compilers, collectors and people for whom this music forms an integral component of existence. Harker sheds light on the sources of British folk song with plausible arguments coupled with banks of convincing evidence (though some dispute it); he has, of course, the benefit of hindsight in the construction of his critique. Like Lloyd, Harker adopts a Marxist stance, recommending the reading of Thompson and Williams along with Trotskyist Tony Cliff for the political, social and economic background necessary to an understanding of his work.

Some scholars are uncomfortable with Harker’s radical polemic. For example, Vic Gammon, an ex-University of Leeds lecturer and former folk music course-leader at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne, takes issue with what he sees as Harker’s undermining of the established folk song consensus. Gammon’s writings are mainly confined to folk-song commentary and do not pertain to the broader issues this thesis concerns. However, what is pertinent to this study is that Gammon edited, along with Anne Ploughman, *A Sussex Tune Book* (1981), which contains melodies gleaned from five Sussex manuscripts dating from the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.

---


The publication was the first to bring such music back into present day circulation and heralded many similar revivalist collections.

Gammon has taken up the folk-song mantle with much well-researched and informed analysis. With the establishment of the folk music degrees at the University of Newcastle, there came recognition of the validity of the genre. The previously quoted example of Gammon fighting the corner for traditional ‘style’ in the singing of West Gallery Music is to be found in his article ‘Problems in the Performance and Historiography of English Popular Church Music’.\textsuperscript{573} Evidence of singing style taken from the oral tradition, which Gammon cites (American Hymn recordings and psalm singing from the Hebrides), differs greatly from the performance style of modern revivalist exponents of West Gallery Hymn singing. Gammon’s argument highlights a boundary conflict between the interpretation and execution of early music and that of evidence-based folk style; such debate is healthy.

There is no doubt that the performers of period pieces of music could learn much from traditional styles and modes of performance, but I feel sure that the reverse is also true. Likewise, the performance of revivalist traditional dance music could learn from present day early music interpretations – and vice versa. Gammon’s arguments with regard to hymn-singing are extracted from a review of Tangent L.P. (issued by Hamish Henderson of the School of Scottish Studies at The University of Edinburgh in 1978, \textit{Scottish Tradition 6: Gaelic Psalms From Lewis}) by Lloyd in the magazine \textit{Traditional Music} No. 2. Lloyd’s argument is taken up by Gammon in somewhat bombastic style in his criticisms of West Gallery Hymn singing styles. Lloyd states:

What the Gaelic populations and the American hillfolk have preserved is a once general Puritan psalm singing style.

Doubtless the special ingredient that the Gaelic singers added to standard practice was the elaborate kind of ornamentation they drew from their general folk music tradition.\textsuperscript{574}

Lloyd argues that the style of hymn-singing was similar to that of traditional music rendition, implying that the stylistic similarity justifies the labelling of the music as ‘folk’ music and thus its inclusion in the domain of traditional music. This is the basis of Gammon’s polemic, i.e., the emphasis on stylistic norms and interpretation are a means by which criticisms pertaining to the validation and ‘authenticity’ of what material may be included in the category of ‘folk music’ are rebuffed. Gammon emphasises stylistic criteria to sidestep anomalies in the makeup of traditional music.

The boundaries between such musics as ‘folk’, ‘art’ or ‘early’ are a comparatively recent construct as is the whole notion of genre. Those musicians from the late eighteenth and the nineteenth centuries who compiled the music manuscripts containing their repertoires – like those contained in this thesis – did not consider such divisions. It is most certainly the case that these musicians were comfortable with performing a varied repertoire.

### 6.2.2 Downward Filtration of Culture in the Twenty-First Century

The music contained within the manuscripts falls within the remit of traditional music due to changes in the concept of traditional music that have occurred in recent decades. The boundaries of folk music have expanded in recent years such that music hall songs and other popular music have been accepted into the canon of traditional music. As a result, in the twenty-first century a greater emphasis is placed on performance style. By emphasising performance, the restricting constraints of ‘traditional folk song’ are

avoided. Thus items from art music are neatly brought under the umbrella of folk song whilst lying strictly outside the International Folk Music Council’s (I.C.T.M.) definition.

The inclusion of art music as part of vernacular culture reflects the downward filtration of culture. As Gammon states:

[A]rt music can become vernacular music if performed according to popular stylistic norms. I take the view that it is not the origin of the music that is important, it is the usage that is of crucial interest.\(^{575}\)

Certainly this view is superficially valid, but one needs to take issue with the exact meaning of ‘popular stylistic norms’. This concept is in a constant state of flux. Stylistic norms vary with time and space and from individual to individual. The performer and audience create and determine interpretations within wide parameters, hence most of such analysis is conjectural. There is foolish arrogance in asserting that any one interpretation has historical or traditional validity. The consideration of style as being at the centre of ‘folk’ song validation is far removed from notions of folk song held by Sharp and the early folk song collectors.

The manuscripts contain examples of non-‘folk’ melodies being taken up by the compilers for performance. Although there is no evidence other than that contained in the manuscripts of violinists Jackson or Turner being called upon as jobbing musicians to perform theatrical, classical or art music works, this certainly was the case. From page 146 of Jackson’s manuscript, for example, we can see evidence of music other than ‘folk’ dance music.

We have here a sophisticated piece (‘Happy Land’) in Bb written in two parts, which appear to be part of a larger setting. This is not the score of a musically uneducated peasant and is not the only evidence within the manuscript to suggest musical training. On page 11 of the Jackson manuscript, we have the melody ‘Lovely Nancy’:

From Chappell's *Popular Music of the Olden Time*, the melody in Eb to the song, ‘Lovely Nancy’.\(^{576}\)

---

The musical typeset prints the key and time signatures once only in Chappell’s *The Popular Music of the Olden Time*, i.e., at the outset of the piece. This convention is employed in many of the manuscripts, as seen above in the extract from page 136 of Jackson’s collection. This is common practice in the manuscripts, saving both ink and paper, plus adding to the speed of transcription. The song ‘Lovely Nancy’, as Chappell points out, is taken from the ballad opera *The Jovial Crew* or *The Merry Beggars*, written by Richard Brome, first staged in 1641 and published in 1652. He also states: “‘Lovely Nancy’ was turned into a Country Dance in Vol. I ii [sic] of Johnson’s Collection, 1744.”\(^\text{577}\) The melody of the original, if transposed into G major, is a major third below

\(^{577}\) Ibid, p. 787.
that of Jackson’s setting. This has been ‘corrected’ in the Bowen and Shepherd publication of 1998.578

Figure 26: ‘Lovely Nancy’ II

From the Deacon publication579 of John Clare’s manuscript, the setting of the melody is thus:

Figure 27: ‘Lovely Nancy’, III


Clare’s version is the standard form of the melody, which may be found in many manuscripts of the early eighteenth century. Callaghan sheds further light on the melody’s provenance. He lists the many manuscripts in which the piece is to be found, also stating:

Popular long before the waltz … [i]t appears in “Calliope” or “English Harmony” in 1746, Thompson’s “Horn Tutor” in 1775, and “Longman” (1796). Widespread military use, including “Beating the Retreat”, is probably a factor in its popularity. Common also in US.  

Figure 28: ‘Lovely Nancy’, IV

Callaghan prints the melody and variation above, without citation, but as the book cover states, ‘[T]his is not an academic exercise’. Works of this kind participate in the reinforcement of a constructed ‘folk tradition’ with their adherence to the theories of Sharp et al. Callaghan acknowledges the role of the military in the proliferation of such melodies but fails to emphasise its full impact on music-making during the latter part of the eighteenth and early nineteenth century. ‘Lovely Nancy’ illustrates how performers like Jackson played for country dancing and for the theatre; their repertoires were varied.


Ibid, p.85.
The contents of the majority of musical manuscript compilations display a wide range of sources with varied musical forms. The recent drive to publish pieces from the manuscript books of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century musicians has involved pruning those pieces that do not fall into the genre of ‘folk’ as perceived today. For example, the 2007 *William Winter’s Quantocks Tune Book* omits 75 pieces. Geoff Woolfe, in his introduction, states:

The vast majority of the 377 tunes in this collection are dance tunes, but the manuscript contains over 50 song tunes (nearly all without words) and other items. Most of these have been omitted from this collection.\(^{582}\)

This is also the case with the 1998 publication of Joshua Jackson’s 1798 tune book,\(^{583}\) which is a ‘selection’ from the original manuscript. This misrepresentation is akin to Baring-Gould’s bowdlerisation of the folk song verse a century earlier.

There exists an idealised picture of the folk fiddler who, in his rustic idyll, plays for nymphs and shepherds to dance on the village green. The truth of the matter is that these violinists and other similar musicians may have been of variable competence and most certainly employed idiosyncratic styles. However, as Gammon states, their image as we receive it is the result of generations of misrepresentation: ‘All revivalists run the risk of misrepresenting what they are seeking to revive, and this is especially true when music has come down to us almost entirely by manuscript and print’.\(^{584}\) The music from these manuscripts is adaptable and in vogue, but a faithful representation of the original role and purpose of the music is far removed from the steamroller-like gestalt of the revivalist.

---

One of the main tenets of the International Folk Music Council’s (I.C.T.M.) definition of folk song is continuity. Continuity is indicated within the canon, but the canon also exhibits considerable flexibility. Fashions and modes impact, mould, change and replace what is sung and played. The process through which the canon develops is not one of constant addition or erosion; the canon is subject to the surges of fads and fancies. Within the contents of the manuscript compilations under investigation in this thesis, there is striking evidence of canonical variety.

The International Folk Music Council’s (I.C.T.M.) definition of a folk song lists variation as an integral element in folk music development and evolution. This characteristic, as the definition states, ‘springs from the creative impulse of the individual or the group’; it emanates from the communalist, evolutionary theory of the creation of folk music.

If the definition of traditional music is adhered to with its essential element of ‘variation’, definitive versions of melodies are anachronisms. Printed sources often provide a set format on which variation may be based. The problem is that printed sources may differ, with the same tune found in numerous publications with differing settings in each – this is the nature of the music.

### 6.2.3 Areas for Future Research

Areas for future research and work include twenty-first century amateur vernacular music making: its role, context, instrumentation and repertoire. The session phenomenon, for example, is part of a wide array of performance that falls outside the domain of professional musicians.

---

585 Appendix 1.
The uncovering of further dormant manuscripts may also provide fuller insight into vernacular music and performance repertoire. For example, the Benjamin Rose\textsuperscript{586} compilation, published in 2012, has expanded the resources available to researchers of traditional music. Also, the collection of John Baptiste Malchair of Oxford, uncovered by Susan Wollenberg, gives evidence of provincial popular music of the late eighteenth century.\textsuperscript{587}

As fresh evidence is made available with the digitisation of both manuscript compilations and period printed collections, greater insight into the true nature of this aspect of popular musical history emerges. I write in the hope that future research is carried out using objective methodologies to establish a full picture of the music and its social contexts. Further work is also required in establishing a traditional music database that may be interrogated to identify melodies, containing both incipits and melody.

6.3 Concluding Remarks

In retrospect, twentieth-century revivals of folk music in the British Isles sought to consolidate canon, views, roles and definitions. However, the associated nebulous concept of an organic culture generating gems of poetic and melodic merit is a mythical ideal. People sing and perform as a means of expression; it is they who decide what folk music is, and this lies outside the constraints set by experts.

The veritable ‘gold mine’ of material that has come to light as a result of the rediscovery of handwritten music manuscripts of performing musicians from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries has been swept up as part of the revival of folk


music. Consequently, the music included in these compilations has, by default, been compartmentalised as part of a ‘folk’ genre. This thesis has shown that the varied contents of the manuscripts must be viewed in the broader context of the history of music.

7 Epilogue: *Campbell II: A Twentieth-Century Manuscript*

The same theories that this thesis applied to Vickers, Atkinson, and the other manuscripts examined above also apply to the current musical milieu. What follows is an examination of the context and makeup of a ‘revivalist’ folk dance manuscript compilation from the 1980s. At this time in the second revival of interest in folk music, there was a move towards the performance of what were regarded as traditional dance music pieces, both for dancing and as session performance.

The second half of the twentieth century saw a shift in the interests of composers of art music. No longer was nationalism a driving force, as it had been in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Experimentation in dissonance and sound possibilities led composers away from the people’s music, folk music. Interest in the performance of early music also gained apace in the second half of the century, and the traditional music of the folk was side-lined by the musical cognoscenti as these new soundscapes and areas of experimentation were opened up and explored. The promotion of social dance and its music was continued in the second half of the twentieth century by organisations such as the English Folk Dance and Song Society, The Royal Scottish Country Dance Association and Comhaltas Ceoltóirí Éireann. These societies and associations encouraged participation in social dancing
throughout the British Isles, and in England the legacy of Sharp’s educational initiative was still in evidence in schools.

After the austerity of the 1940/50s and with the rise of a separate teenage identity, a second revival of interest in folk music began. The major record companies invested in the promotion of ‘folk’ acts, and protest singers and folk song clubs sprang up in their hundreds throughout the British Isles.

It is within this musical climate that the final handwritten musical manuscript of this study was compiled. The *Campbell II* manuscript is a combination of two sets of traditional social dance melodies and other music that was used for dances in the 1980s. Both components of the collection are handwritten. As with the manuscripts from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, this compilation contains a wide range of material ranging from the music of the Beatles to Playford melodies. There are many Irish pieces, and the second component is devoted solely to Scottish dance music.

This is not an in-depth scrutiny of these two collections, but it draws attention to the manuscripts’ similarity in purpose and format to the compilations dealt with in this study (dating all the way back to Atkinson’s manuscript of 1694). *Shared features* include the use of a wide range of printed sources and the gathering together of required melodies in one volume in a workable form. The seven-volume *Community Dances Manual*, published by the English Folk Dance and Song Society, was one rich source of material for the several dance callers employed by the band. The sources of the melodies include a wide array of the traditional publications that had become available at the time the compilation was produced. Advances in photocopying technology assisted with the duplication of band parts. The music in this compilation was used to accompany folk dances throughout Yorkshire and Lancashire. On one

---

occasion, in 1984, they formed the basis of a fund-raising folk dance evening at Shipley Town Hall in aid of the striking miners.

The collection is a mixture of the popular country-dance music used for ceilis and barn dances during the 1980s. Features like the numbering of sets, labelling of tunes and gathering together of pieces with like tempos demonstrate the practical side of a working band’s music pad. The practical purpose of the collection reveals continuity with the manuscripts dating back to the late seventeenth century.
8 Appendices

8.1 Appendix 1: Folk Song: A Definition

At its Conference in Sao Paulo in 1954, the International Folk Music Council formulated the following definition:

Folk music is the product of a musical tradition that has been evolved through the process of oral transmission. The factors that shape the tradition are as follows:

(i) continuity which links the present with the past;

(ii) variation which springs from the creative impulse of the individual or the group; and

(iii) selection by the community, which determines the form or forms in which the music survives.

The term can be applied to music that has been evolved from rudimentary beginnings by a community uninfluenced by popular and art music. It can likewise be applied to music that has originated with an individual composer and has subsequently been absorbed into the unwritten living tradition of a community. The term does not cover composed popular music that has been taken over ready-made by a community and remains unchanged, for it is the re-fashioning and re-creation of the music by the community that gives it its folk character. This definition (or description) is not wholly satisfactory, and it inevitably lacks precision, but it may
perhaps be accepted as a guide to the fundamental concept of folk music.\textsuperscript{589}

8.2 Appendix 2: \textit{Campbell I} Incipits

8.2.1 C-Base Incipits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Incipit</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C Ab Ab Ab Ab C Eb Ab' G Eb Eb</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Ab Ab Ab Bb C Db Bb Bb Db Eb</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Ab Ab Bb Ab Ab Eb C F Eb C Ab</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Ab Ab C Bb Ab F F F# Ab Bb C</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Ab Ab Eb C F Eb C Bb Ab G Bb</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Ab Bb G Ab Bb C Eb C Ab Bb G</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Ab C Ab F# Ab Bb E C Ab E</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Ab Eb Eb C Ab' Ab' G F Eb Eb F</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A A Bb A Bb F Eb F A Bb C'</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A A C E D C B G G B D</td>
<td>62a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A A G C C E D D A' D F</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A Bb C D E Eb D D C F, G A,</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A Bb C D G F C F G F G</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A Bb G F F F F E D C F</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A C A F F' F' E D C Bb A</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A C A G F, A C A C Bb A</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A C D F D C D C Bb A G</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C A C F C A Bb A A G F G</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C A F A C F' C A D' F' C A
C A F C B G G B C A F C
C A F C D B A C D E F G
C A F F F G A b G E G C
C A G A F A F D F C A C
C A G E G G C D C D E D
C A G E G G E G C A G E
C A G E G G E G C C C D
C A G F E G G B b A F A C

C B b A b D b C b D b F D b B b C E b
C B b A b F E b C A b C E b A b C F
C B b A b G F E b G A b G G E b D
C B b A b G F G E b C D E b C D
C B b A G A G b B b E b D b C E b A b C b
C B b A G F F E D C b A G
C B b C A b G F G A b B b C b b C
C B b C D b E b A b F G A b B b A b C b
C B b C F G A b B b G A b E b C A b
C B b D b C b b C A b B b A b B b C D b
C B b F A A F A C B b A F A
C B A A G E C B C C D E
C B A G A B C E E F D C
C B A G F F F F C F F A
C B C D E F G G E A A F
C B C E C A C G G A B C
C B D C B D C C D E F E
\[
\begin{align*}
&\text{C C Ab Bb C D b D b Bb G G E b F} & 2 \\
&\text{C C A A C C A A C B B A} & 82a \\
&\text{C C B b D b C B b A b G F F E b G} & 61a \\
&\text{C C B C D D D C D B B A B} & 145 \\
&\text{C C C A C F' G' A' F' G' E C} & 96 \\
&\text{C C C B b A b D b D b D b C B b C C} & 32 \\
&\text{C C C B b A b E b B b B b A b B b C} & 48 \\
&\text{C C C B b G B b B b E b C C C D} & 8 \\
&\text{C C C B A G C B A G F E} & 182 \\
&\text{C C C A F E G E C C C} & 157 \\
&\text{C C C C B b A b C E b A b F E b F} & 68 \\
&\text{C C C C C C C F C C C C} & 141 \\
&\text{C C C C C E C E G G G G} & 142 \\
&\text{C C C C C' B b' A b E b C C B b A b} & 108[i] \\
&\text{C C C D b E b F F F F F # A b} & 36 \\
&\text{C C C C E C D D D D F D} & 78 \\
&\text{C C C C G C E E E E C E} & 139 \\
&\text{C C C G' F' E D C G A E,} & 108[ii] \\
&\text{C C D C B A G C C C C} & 12a \\
&\text{C C D C B A G C C C D} & 65 \\
&\text{C C D D E D C B C D E} & 46 \\
&\text{C C D E F G C D D E F} & 1 \\
&\text{C C D C B b A G F F ' E F'} & 176 \\
&\text{C C E b B b B b E b A b A b} & 76 \\
&\text{C C E C C C E D B G G} & 72a \\
&\text{C C E F G E G C G E D} & 184
\end{align*}
\]
C C C G E G' G E C C D  147
C C D b C B b A b A b B b A b G F G  143
C C D b C B b C C D b C B b A b C  69
C C D b E b D b C B b A b A b A b A b B b  130
C C D B D B C C D B D B  44
C C D B G G B C C D B E  164
C C D C B C D E E D E F  43a
C C D C C D C C D C C D  15
C C D C D C C D F E D  62
C C D D E D E F G A F E  133
C C D E b E b F G B b G C' E b C'  167
C C D E b F D E b E b E b D C B b  101
C C D F E D C E G F E D  111
C C E D D E C C E E D C  67
C C E E D C B C G C E G  148
C C G A G A B G G C G C  52
C C G E F G E C C A B C  135
C C G G A G A G G C B C E  56
C D b B b C A b B b C D b E b C D b B b  134
C D b C A b B b A b B b C A b A b C F  21
C D b C A b F G A b B b C B b G E b  129
C D b C B b C B b A b A b' A b' E b F A b'  153
C D b E b A b B b C D b F F F B b A b  59
C D b E b E b F E b A b A b B b C D b D b  124
C D B b A B b G F E F C B b A  26
C D C A G F D E b F D C A  11
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sequence</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CEEFEGECCECD</td>
<td>34[iij]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEEGC'GGCC'EG'G'</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGABC'BGECEG</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGAC'C'BGC'C'BG</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGCA'AFAGEGFD</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGC'A'C'GCDFEG</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGC'AGGGGDFE</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGC'B/ A'GDB/ D'F' E'</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGC'C'B'A'GAGFE</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGC'C'BCBCBAG</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGC'E'D'C'GAAAA</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGEFAGECEGE</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGEGEC'GC'GE'D'</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGEGEGEDCDE</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEGGEFDBCBCC</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFABbCAFFGABbA</td>
<td>42a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFAFC'FAFC'FAF</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFAFCFBbDCFADF</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFAFDFCFGFSA</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFDFCFCAABbDCA</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFEDCABbCDCA</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFEDCADDDECFE</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFFABgFFEebEbebFG</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFFAAGFEDCA</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFFAGECCEFBBE</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFFAGFGAFF'CD</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 8.2.2 G-Base Incipits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Incipit</th>
<th>Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G Ab Bb Bb C Bb Eb E F G A b Ab</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Ab Bb Bb C D Eb B b F B b G' Bb</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Ab Bb Eb F G A b C C C F Eb</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Ab F G Eb F G A b B b G A b F</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Ab G Eb F Eb F G Eb E b G C</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Ab G F G F Eb E b E b E b B b C E b</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A b B C A F A G A b b G G'</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A b b C D B b D C A F G A</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B A B C B A G B C D</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B A B D E D E G' A B</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B A B G E E G F# G A</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B A B G F# G A B E A</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B A G E' D B G, D G F#</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B A G F G A D G A B</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B B C A B G A B A A</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B B G D D B G' G' D B'</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B C D' B G G F# G A B</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B C D C B A G A B C</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B C D C B E D G A B</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B C D D E C B C D B</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B C D D E D G' F# E E</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B C G A F G E D B B</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B D E D D C B A G A</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G A B G D G B D G' D E D</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
G A B G G E E F# G D E D  72
G A C D C D E C A D E D  186
G A C D C E C E D C E D  106
G A D C A C A G F F E F  123
G A F E F D C B C G F E  26
G A G A B A G E E D C D  103
G A G B D B D B A B A C  49
G A G B D B G F# E D, D, E  161
G A G B G A G B A B C B  1
G A G D B G B D F C C B  119
G A G F# G D D’ B A C F# G  99
G A G G A B C E’ C A A A  75
G A G G A B C G F E C G  173
G A G G B D E D D C B D  140
G A G G B’ G G E G G D G  148
G A G G’ D B D G’ G A G G’  86
G Bb A G F D A Bb Bb Bb A A  158
G Bb Bb A b C C Bb A b G F E b D b  34[i]
G Bb Bb A G C Bb Bb C D b E b Bb  87
G Bb Bb C D b E b F E b D b Bb G Bb  3
G Bb Bb D b C Bb A b C Bb G A b F  104
G Bb Bb F E b F G Bb Bb E b C C  20
G Bb F Bb E b D E b F Bb C C A b  77
G Bb F D C Bb G G Bb’ G’ F Bb  185
G Bb F G A b F G G G Bb F G  61
G Bb G Bb G A b C F A b G Bb E b  112
G B A G A B G G D E A B
G B A G D G B G D G B E'
G B B C B D B G G B G A
G B B D G' D D G' G' B' D' D'
G B D B C E' D B G B D B
G B D B D B D B A G A B
G B D B D B G' D G' D B' A'
G E G A C A G A G F E D
G B D D B C A F# G F# G B
G B D E F# G' F# D B G B D
G B D E G' G' F# D G' G' F# D
G B D G' B' A' G' D E E E E
G B D G' E C E D B D C A
G B D G' E' G' D G A C B D
G B D G' F' E' D D F' A' C' B'
G B D B G' G' E G' E D B G'
G B D G' G' F# G F# G F# E D
G B D G' G' F# E D E D C B
G B G G G B G B D B B
G C A C G C G E F A G E
G C B A G E A A B G C B
G C C B b D E b C b G F E b C
G C C C D' E b D B b G F E b D
G C C D C C D E D B G B
G C C D E b C C G' G' F F E b
G C C D E D E C A D E F

392
G C C D E' C C B A G E C  
G C C E_b D C C B_b B_b B_b C D  
G C C E D B G G A C F A  
G C C E D C D E C C' G A  
G C C E' E' D C B C A G E  
G C E C A C G C D C D E  
G C E C G C F A G C E C  
G C E F G E C C D E F E  
G D B G C C E D G D B C  
G D B G D E A G F# E D G  
G D B G G A B C B G D C  
G D B G G B G C B A G  
G D B, D G A B C D B A G  
G D D B A G F# G G G G D  
G D D D C B_b D B_b G A C A F  
G D D D D D B D E G D D  
G D E_b D C D E_b D C B_b A B_b  
G D E_b D C D E_b D C B_b A B_b  
G D E D E D E D G B D G  
G D E D G' A' B' G' F# E D D  
G D G A B D C B A G A B  
G D G' D' B' G' D G' B' G' D B'  
G D B D G A B A G D B D  
G D, B, D, G A B E D B A G  
G D, B G D E D C B G C A  
G D, B G D, B G D D B A G  
G D, B G D, B G D D B A G
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chord Sequence</th>
<th>Time Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G Eb Bb Bb G Eb' Eb' D C Bb Bb C</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Eb Eb' Bb G C Bb G F Eb D F</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Eb Eb Eb Eb Eb G Bb Eb' D Bb Bb Bb</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Eb Eb Eb F G A b F F G A b</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Eb Eb F Eb Eb Bb G C Bb G Eb'</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Eb Eb G F Eb C C D b Eb F G</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Eb F D Eb F G Bb G Eb F D</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Eb G Eb D b Eb F Eb C G Eb C</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E C C D E F D B D G</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E C E G C' G E A C' G E</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E C G A D D A G E C G</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E C G A F# E G A B C D</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E D B D D B D G E D B</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E D B D D B D G G G A</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E D B D D G A G A B A</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E D C B D D F E C E G</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E D E C E C A C G E G</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E E D G G B A A E' A C</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E F F E F C B b C E F G</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E E G B A G F# D D F# A</td>
<td>62a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E F D C C' C C B A G C</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E F G A B b C B b A A G C,</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E F G A D C G C D C D D</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E G C G E F F E E D C</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E G E C C' C' B A G F E</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G E G E D C, E G E G F E</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
G F G A\# G F G E \# F E \# F G 157
G F E \# A\# G F A\# C A\# F G B\# 16
G F' E \# C B\# G E \# B B \# E \# B E \# G E \# 101a
G F E \# D C B\# D E \# D D B A 102
G F E \# D C D B\# G A\# B G A 53
G F E \# D E \# F B\# A G B B \# E \# G 118
G F E C E E C E G F E C 166
G F E D C C B A G F E D 178
G F E E D B G F G G A G 85
G F G A\# B B\# E \# C D E \# F E \# G' 58
G F G C D E \# F D E \# B B \# G E \# 39
G F G E \# D C D E \# F G F G 45
G F# A G F# A G G A B C B 28
G F# E D C C C C G C C E 110
G F# E D E F# G B B C A G 5
G F# G A B C D D B E E C 84a
G F# G B G E G D D E F# G 165
G G A\# B B\# A\# G F E \# B E \# E \# B F 130
G G A\# G F E \# B E \# F D C D 143
G G A\# G F G G A\# G F E \# B G 69
G G A A B A B C D E C B 133
G G A B B B\# C D F D G' B\# B' G' 169
G G A B B C A B B B B A G F 101
G G A C B A G B D C B A 111
G G A F# A F# G G A F# A F# 44
G G A F# D D F# G G A F# B 164
GGAGEDCA bCAG
GGAGFGAB BAC
GGAGGAGGACBA
GGAGGAGGAGGA
GGBAABGGGBAG
GGBBAGF#GDGBD
GDBCGBGGEF#G
GDDDEDEDDGF#G
GDEDEF#DGDGDG
GGF#GAGAF#EF#F
GGGAABAGF#GAB
GGGABCDGAAABC
GGAGFEDCC'BC
GGAGF#EDGGGA
GGAGF#EDGGGD
GGGabFFFBbEbEbG
GGBCBDBDGD'BA
GGGBGGGBAF#D
GGGDBDDDBGGG
GGEGC'D'E'C'D'BG
GGFDFFBbGGGA
GGF#EbaBbAbA bGFGG
GGF#EbaBbFFFFEG
GGGADCC'BC
GGGADF#EDGG
11
43a
62
15
67
148
135
56
52
2
82a
61a
145
46
1
176
65
12a
76
184
72a
147
96
8
32
48
8.3 Appendix 3: Comments by Chris Webb and Trevor Cooper

Comments on the volume (*Campbell I*) by Chris Webb, Keeper of Archives, Borthwick Institute, York, 03/11/08.
C. W. “The first thing that strikes me is that it is obviously a very clear copy book. Just looking through the pages it’s very clear that nobody’s had to correct anything, so it’s obviously been done in a very careful and considered way and it’s been done in groups. You can tell by the changes of the ink, and slight changes in the handwriting. Whoever’s done it, they’ve sat down and done a few at one time and then done and then a few at another time and there’s an obvious break at ‘My Father’ and the previous group probably ends with ‘Quick Step – Mr Wetheril’ and you’ll be able to look, I think, at that throughout the book and see things. As for dating there’s some obvious clues.”

S. C. “There’s ‘God save the King’, ‘Nelson’s Waltz’ and ‘Lady Hamilton’s New Waltz.’”

C. W. “So we must be before 1837, well I mean, Nelson started getting famous quite late in the eighteenth century. He died in 1805 and you’d think it might have been possible to do it before then. But we have Mozart as a death date, you could probably find out who Lady Ann Lee is.”

S. C. “There is the French revolutionary song ‘Ca Ira’, which is the March of the Yorkshire Regiment.”

C. W. “There is another group with his thick quill’s, he or she, you can’t tell whether it’s male or female, at all. From the writing you’d say it was probably – it could be anywhere between 1800 and 1850, it’s very difficult to date handwriting very closely. But if it’s 1800, it’s somebody who’s just learning to write in 1800 because it’s new letter
shapes – it’s not somebody who’s been writing for a long time, so I would guess, it’s probably 1810, 1820 but I wouldn’t base too much on that.

It doesn’t show a huge amount of use, except, all this dirt round here, this is evidence of pages turned, ‘cause that’s where they’re going to get hold of the page and turn it – like that. But it’s in good condition. It’s not been used outside.”

S. C. “It’s not been used on the march.”

C. W. “Yes that’s really what I’m getting at.”

S. C. “There are melodies which are written straight across the bottom of two pages, in order to conserve paper.”

C. W. “You’d be able to find out when Sir David Hunter Blair was around. With tunes like these Sir David Hunter Blair might have been around in 1520. It’s not much help. That’s a datable tune – ‘Drink to me only’.”

S. C. “Oh yes but that’s very old.”

C. W. “It’s actually got some tempo markings, there, which he doesn’t usually have, does he?”

S. C. “There are some dynamics and tempo markings. Towards the end of the book there’s no names on the tunes at all, which does create quite a problem.”

C. W. “Whoever’s doing it is copying from another source.”
S. C.  “That’s what I thought.”

C. W.  “I don’t think they’re remembering this ‘cause there’d be mistakes, and “there aren’t any. So it could be somebody who’s set this as an exercise. Was this originally stuck down?”

S. C.  “When I got it, yes.”

C. W.  “Well, that suggests that it wasn’t bought as a pre-ruled book music book.”

S. C.  “I thought, you have one of these staff pens which draw five lines at once and if you look very carefully at these, they are not consistent – the density of the lines.”

C. W.  “It’s obviously not printed but it’s obviously but it’s the lines are ink lines as well. It does does look as if it’s been bought as an ordinary blank book.”

S. C.  “Is that half foolscap?”

C. W.  “Em, I always forget out the sizes of books. It’s a slight, odd shape.”

S. C.  “It’s not quite a rectangle.”

C. W.  “No. Oh, you have some words written here.”
S. C. “Oh yes there’s a song, and there’s a piece denoting a battle – with the ‘Groans of the wounded.’”

C. W. “And it was in these hard covers when you bought it.”

S. C. “Yes and the spine was broken – I’ve had it professionally repaired.”

C. W. “We don’t know when they’ve been cut out, they could have been cut out by a subsequent owner, or they could have been cut out by the person who’s made the book. There isn’t really a clue as to when that happened.”

S. C. “The numbering ceases, and so does the titling.”

C. W. “Well, it may be, I think, it’s all one person and it may be towards the end of the period he got bored with it and never went back to it, got ill, died, you know, all kinds of things can happen. But I’m satisfied that it’s a single person working on it. I don’t think it’s several. It’s quite a nice thing.”

Additional comments on the volume by Trevor Cooper, Senior Conservator, Borthwick Institute, York, 03/11/08.

T. C. “From the evidence we can see, there are sewing stations on the front loose leaf and on the back loose leaf. Which would indicate that these were actually sewn into the volume and not tipped on the back, as an end leaf. More than that I can’t tell you. And the ones that are missing, the stubs that are in, one of the stubs is from
the section in front of the stubs and the other two from the section behind but, I mean, they could have been torn out donkey’s years ago. They are old tears, if they were brand new or anything it would be clean and crisp and they’re not. That’s all I can tell you. I would advise you to leave well alone. The thing I would advise is that you get it put in a box … the leather still needs to breath. A bookbinder will make you a little box for it. You don’t want it lining in with felt, ’cause it will pull all the moisture out, just a standard paper lining. Sorry I can’t be of any more help.”

8.4 Appendix 4: Watermarks and Countermarks

The following is an email from Peter Bower, paper historian and member of the British Association of Paper Historians. His comments relate to photographs of counter and watermarks from the Campbell I manuscript. This analysis helps establish the manuscript date to c. 1810.

Dear Stephen

Jean Stirk of BAPH has passed your watermark query on to me. I will deal with the images by file name:

THE WATERMARK

Watermarks 034.JPG and Watermarks 036.JPG

Both show the top half of a watermark comprising an un-ornamented Fleur-de-Lys above a shield.
The full shield has a simple Bend (heraldic term for a diagonal stripe running across the shield), part of which is visible in the top left of the shield. Although this shield is based on the coat of Arms of the City of Strasbourg (and is known as the Strasbourg Bend) this paper is English. The Strasbourg bend was used by paper mills across Western Europe as a mark of quality from the early seventeenth century onwards.

In addition, this combination of a Fleur-de-Lys above a Strasburg Bend denotes a particular size of paper: Royal, nominally 19 x 24 inches, although there was considerable variation in actual sheet size between the products of different mills. It was also used to indicate another less common sheet size, Super Royal, nominally 27 x 19 inches.

In eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century papermaking practice, sheets were generally watermarked with a device centred in one half of the sheet and countermarked with a makers name, or a mill name, often accompanied by a date, centred in the other half of the sheet.

THE COUNTERMARK

Waterermark 2a.JPG
reading BU... the last letter visible is a D (see Watermarks 006.JPG for the rest of the countermark)

Watermarks 006.JPG
reads ... GEN
These are two halves of the countermark BUDGEN, a mark used by John Budgen, who operated one of two papermills called Dartford Mill, Dartford, Kent from c1800–1819, having succeeded his father Thomas Budgen, for at least some of this period in partnership with George Wilmott.

Most Budgen watermarks have the initial J in front of BUDGEN, except during the period when he was in partnership with Wilmott. Very little evidence exists for the papermaking partnership between John Budgen & George Wilmott, except an insurance policy dated 1808. This policy gives us some idea of the scale of the mill, valuing the mill itself at £2000, the wheels, gearing and fixed machinery and utensils at a further £2000 and the rag house at £300 (1).

The partnership did not last many years for the last BUDGEN (without a J) and BUDGEN & WILMOTT watermarks known all date from 1812. By June 14 1819 John Budgen was bankrupt and ordered “to surrender at Guildhall London”(2) Five days later he was a “prisoner for debt in the Kings Bench Prison”(3) John Budgen never resolved his financial troubles and died a prisoner in the Kings Bench Prison sometime in 1820.(4) The J BUDGEN watermark however continued to be used for some years by his successors at the mill.

Your paper was probably made between 1808–1812. In the early nineteenth century there was quite often a considerable delay between the making of a particular paper and its use. You give no measurements, but unless the sheets have been trimmed quite oddly, judging by where the part marks fall in the sheet – very close to the spine and one edge of the page, the manuscript must be relatively small – Royal 16mo or Super Royal 16mo?
You might also be interested to know that Budgen’s paper is also found in use by artists such as J M W Turner and John Constable for both drawings and correspondence.

I hope this is of use and interest.

with best wishes

Peter

Notes

2. London Gazette, June 14 1819.

Peter Bower

Paper History and Analysis

64 Nutbrook Street

London SE15 4LE

United Kingdom

Watermark: Fleur-de-Lys
8.5 Appendix 5: Untraced Pieces from *Campbell I*

Untitled, p.5, #8.

Untitled, p.5, #9.
She winna let me be, p.8, #13.

Highland Dance, p.9, #16.

Dance, p.9, #17.

Highland Dance, p.11, #20.
Quick Step by Mr Wright, p.14, #27.

Untitled, p.15, #28.

Untitled, p.16, #31.

Bell Hall, p.16, #32.
Untitled, p.17, #33.

Bugle Troop, p.20, #40.

All hail the happy day, p.28, #58.

Untitled, p.28, #59.
Slow March, p.29, #60.

German Hymn, p.29, #61.

Dance, p.29, [#61a].

Dance, p.30, [#62a].

Nelson’s New Waltz, p.31, #64.

London March, p.33, #68.
Quick Step, p.34, #69.

Milking Her Cow, p.34, #70.

Quick Step by Mr Wright, p.37, #75.

Quick March F, p.37, #76.
Quick March, p.38, #77.

Quick March, p.38, #78.

Sweet Flowers of Yarrow, p.39, #79.

Dickey Gossip, p.39, #80.
Untitled, p.40, #81.

M[c?] Lees Farewell, p.40, #82.

Untitled, p.40, [#82a].

Untitled, p.41, #83.

Untitled, p.41, #84.

Lady Hamilton’s New Waltz, p.41, [#84a].
Quick March 42nd Reg., p.46, #95.

Untitled, p.46, #96.

Untitled, p.48, #99.

Untitled, p.49, #101.

Untitled, p.49, [#101a]

Untitled, p.50 #104.
Untitled, p.51, #105.

The North’s Farewell to the Caledonian Hunt, p51, #106.

Untitled, p.51, #107.

Untitled, p.52, #108(i).

Untitled, p.52, #109.
Untitled, p.53, #108(ii).

Untitled, p.53, #110.

Untitled, p.54, #111.

Untitled, p.54, #112.

Untitled, p.54, #113.
Scotch Air, p.55, #114.

Untitled, p.55, #116.

Quick Step 2nd Batn. Royals, p.57, [#120].

Untitled, p.57, [#122].

North Devon Waltz, p.58, [#125].
Untitled, p.64, [#142].

Trumpet, p.65, [#144].

Orange, p.66, [#145]

St George’s Birth day, p.68, [#151].

Quadrille, p.68, [#152].
Hornpipe, p.71, [#159].

Quick Step Mr Weatherill, p.71, [#160].

My Father, pp.72 & 73, [#161].

Untitled, p.73, [#162].
Untitled, p.74, [#163].

Untitled, p.74, [#164].

Lincolnshire Hornpipe, p.75, [#167].

Slater's Hornpipe, p.75, [#168].

Untitled, p.75, [#169].
No my Love no, p.76, [#170].

Untitled, p.76, [#171].

Untitled, p.77, [#172].

Untitled, p.78, [#173].

Untitled, p.78, [#174].
Untitled, p.78, [#175].

Untitled, p.83, [#181].

Untitled, p.86, [#183].

Cuttler’s Hornpipe, p.86, [#184].
8.6 Appendix 6: Untraced Pieces from the Benwell Manuscripts

8.6.1 Vol. I

The Happy Gypsy, I, p.19, #8.
They deem it a sorrow gone by, I, p.51, #23.
The Bride’s Farewell, I, p.86, #40.
Peshal [?], I, p.88, #41.
Waltz, I, p.99, #45.
March in the Bastille, I, p.100, #46.
German Air, I, p.101, #47.
Fantasia A L’Ecossaise, I, p.102, #48.
Some fairy spell around me Played, I, p.119, #55.
If I were a Fairy, I, p.137, #61.
The Druids March, I, p.145, #63.

8.6.2 Vol. II

The Gypsy’s Life, II, p.40, #77.
The Bridal Blessing, II, p.62, #84.
The Bridal Waltz, II, p.65, #85.
My native Village home, II, p.74, #86.
At the sound of the merry horn, II, p.77, #87.
The Sailors Grave, II, p.88, #90.
Rise Gentle Morn, II, p.94, #93.
They Have Welcomed Me Again, II, p.97, #94.
The Roman Girl’s Song, II, p.124, #100.
The Treasures of Sleep, II, p.139, #104.
Rhonda Air, II, p.144, #105.
9 Resource List


Shepherd, Robin. *English Dance and Song*, vol. 73, no. 2. London: English Folk Dance and Song Society, 2011.


**Compact Disc and Vinyl Record Recordings and Notes**


Websites

ABCnotation.com.


<http://www.cl.cam.ac.uk/~rja14/music/index.html> (accessed 5 August 2010)

Bainbridge, Jim. *The Living Tradition*.


Clark[e], William, Manuscript, c. 1770,


Nelson-Burns, Lesley. *Contemplator’s Short Biography of Thomas D’Urfey, (1653–1723).*


Farne, Folk Archive Resource North East.


Folkopedia, English Folk Dance and Song Society.


<http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=U9kRAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA320&lpg=PA320&dq=%22Gentle+Cupid%22+tune&source=bl&ots=VITGApul5NW&sig=G08pauBg84XWMrf6n130_wCFcA&hl=en&ei=LaUMTMKBE43y0gT43NRb&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CBQQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=%22Gentle%20Cupid%22%20tune&f=false> (accessed 7 June 2010).


Hummel, J. N. La belle Catherine.


Johns Hopkins University. Lester S. Levy Sheet Music Collection.

<http://levysheetmusic.mse.jhu.edu/> (accessed 11 September 2010).


Meadows, Thomas. Thespian Gleanings; A Collection of Comic Recitals, Songs, Tales, &c. Including a Variety of Comic Sketches, from Dodd’s Lecture on Hearts; A Farce Called, Who’s to Blame; or, No Fool Like an Old One; and Many Originals, 1805.


Murray, David. The Murray Collection, Glasgow Broadside Ballads. Glasgow: The University of Glasgow Library, Special Collection.


Rampant Scotland. *Traditional Scottish Songs.*


*Rank, J. Encyclopaedia.*


Roud, Steve. *Roud Folk Song Index,* English Folk Dance and Song Society.

Russell, H. *The Music of Henry Russell, (1812–1900).*


Scholarship Library. <https://jscholarship.library.jhu.edu/handle/1774.2/9056>

(accessed 12 October 2009).


<http://web.lyon.edu/wolfcollection/songs/riddleweeping1240.html>

(accessed 16 February 2011).


(accessed 7 June 2010).

**Musical Works**


