Singing in ‘The Peg’:
The Dynamics of Winnipeg Singing Cultures During the 20th Century

Muriel Louise Smith
Doctor of Philosophy

University of York
Music

September 2015
This thesis is dedicated to my parents,
William Moore (1910-1982)
Ann Moore (1916-2011)
who inspired, demanded excellence, and loved me.
Abstract

The research begins by establishing Winnipeg, as a city comprised of many different European immigrant communities where the dominant British-Canadian culture reflected the Canadian national consciousness of the early 20th century. After an outline of early musical life in the city, four case studies demonstrate how the solo vocal and choral culture in Winnipeg represents a realization of the constitutive, continuously forming and mutable relationships between peoples of differing identities. In all of these case studies, I investigate how this culture has been shaped by social and political actions through transnational connections over the 20th century. The first two case studies are underpinned by the theories of cultural capital and gender. The first focuses on the Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (1900-1920s), an elite group of Brito-Canadian women who shaped the reception of high art singing among their peers primarily through their American connections. The second investigates the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (1920s-1950s), a dynamic group of businessmen and musicians who sought to reinforce Brito-Canadian cultural supremacy by developing a choral culture and establishing a music competition festival based on British models and enforced by British musical associations. The third and fourth case studies are examined through the lens of diaspora and identity, underpinned by social capital. One examines the changing perspectives towards vocal repertoire and its performance in the urban Mennonite community from the 1950s until the end of the century, and how this has shaped high art vocal culture in Winnipeg. The final case study investigates the mutable political and social transnational relationships between diaspora Poles and those in the homeland, as reflected through the activities of the choir of Winnipeg’s Sokół Polish Ensemble. This thesis contributes to the knowledge on transnational musical relationships that shape urban and diaspora musical cultures in Canada.
# LIST OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Contents</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Accompanying Materials</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author's Declaration</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 1: Introduction/Theories/Methodology</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Introduction</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Thesis Statement</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Theoretical Framework</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pierre Bourdieu: <em>habitus</em> and field</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pierre Bourdieu: cultural capital</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Diaspora Theory</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Urban Ethnomusicology</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Gender Theory</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Literature Review, Conclusion and Contribution to Scholarship</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Towards a Research Methodology</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Historical Musicology</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ethnomusicology</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Interviews</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Observation and Participation</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Historical Introduction to Winnipeg</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 2: The Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg</strong></td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Early Years</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Membership</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The WMC as a Business</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Guest Artist Recitals</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Case Study 1: The Rubin Goldmark Lecture</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Case Study 2: The North End Extension Work

Interlude: Winnipeg 1914

Case Study 3: Music Inspired by Childhood

Interlude: 1916-1917

Case Study 4: Emma Roberts

Interlude 1918-1919

Conclusion

Chapter 3: The Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg

Prologue

The Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg

Membership

Club Structure and Activities

Case Study 1: The Development of Winnipeg’s High Art Choral Culture

The Winnipeg Male Voice Choir

Hugh Ross, Holy Trinity Choir and the New Sacred Repertoire

Hugh Ross and the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir

Hugh Ross and the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir

Douglas Clarke, Peter Temple, and Filmer Hubble

The Waning of Ethnocentric Ideals

Ethnocentric Disjunctures

Case Study 2: The Manitoba Music Competition Festival

The Inaugural Manitoba Competition Music Festival (MMCF) 1919

The Influence of the British Federation of Music Festivals (BFMF)

The Introduction of British Adjudicators to the MMCF

Cloning the Model

The Impact of Adjudicator Comments on High-Art Reception
Chapter 4: Mennonite Influences on Winnipeg Choral Culture

- Prologue
- Introduction
- Mennonite Immigration to the Canadian Prairies
- The Urban Mennonites of Winnipeg
- Choral Singing as an Expression of Mennonite Identity
- The Mennonite Brethren Choral Tradition
- Canadian Mennonite Bible College and George Wiebe
- Mennonite and non-Mennonite Musical Connections in Winnipeg 1920-1950
- Mennonite Bible Colleges
- The Significance of Post-Graduate Studies
- Mennonite Choirs Attain Recognition
- Church Music Seminars
- Interactions with the non-Mennonite Community post 1975
- Hymn Sing
- The Winnipeg Singers
- Henry Engbrecht: the University of Manitoba and Community Singing
- Conclusion
- Epilogue

Chapter 5: Sokół Choir of the Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble

- Introduction
- Diaspora, Transnationalism, Calibrations, and Fields of Tension
- Polish Identities in Winnipeg
- The Dissemination of Polish Choral Culture in Winnipeg
- Communist Poland Creates a National Music Culture
- Richard Seaborn and the Performance of State Folk Group
Chapter 6: Conclusion

Appendix I: Recital Programme of Emma Roberts

Appendix 2: British and Brito-Canadian Choral Directors, Winnipeg, 1919-1950

Appendix 3: List of Festival Repertoire 1919

Appendix 4: Text–Translations–Score ‘Wiązanka Warszawska’

(‘Warsaw Medley’)

Definitions: Formatting of Citations and Bibliography

Glossary

Bibliography
| Figure 1: | WMC 1906-07 Season of Weekly Programmes. | 64 |
| Figure 2: | WMC Charitable Donations 1911-1920. | 71 |
| Figure 3: | List of Songs presented in four Forum Concerts. | 88 |
| Figure 4: | Programme of the People’s Forum Concert, 30 November 1913. | 89 |
| Figure 5: | Newspaper clipping (photograph) of Winnipeg Male Voice Choir, 1918. | 111 |
| Figure 6: | Repertoire for Winnipeg Male Voice Choir Concert, 20 December 1920. | 115 |
| Figure 7: | Newspaper clipping (photograph) of Hugh Ross. | 117 |
| Figure 8: | Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir: Partial Programme. | 123 |
| Figure 9: | Photograph of Ben Horch (left), George Wiebe (seated) K.H. Neufeld (standing) and unidentified students. | 167 |
| Figure 10: | Photograph of Victor Martens (Tudor Bowl Winner, 1953) with his wife, Dorothy Martens (Rose Bowl Recipient, 1965). | 169 |
| Figure 11: | Photograph: L.to R.: David Falk, Theo Lindenbaum and Viola Horch-Falk. | 176 |
| Figure 12: | Photograph of Henry Engbrecht. | 188 |
| Figure 13: | Photograph of Sokół Choir on Mother's Day, 1938. | 214 |
| Figure 14: | Photograph of Oskar Kolberg. | 215 |
| Figure 15: | Illustration in Mazowsze Concert program, 1964. | 217 |
| Figure 16: | Photograph: Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble Promotional photo, ca. 1965. | 218 |
| Figure 17: | Photograph of Richard Seaborn | 219 |
| Figure 18: | Newspaper clipping of the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, winners of the Tweedsmuir Trophy at the Winnipeg Music Festival, 1964. | 221 |
Figure 19: Screen shot of Sokół Choir taken from *Ce Coin de Terre*. 224

Figure 20: Sokół Choir ca. 1976. John Standing, Choral Conductor is third from left in the back row. 227

Figure 21: Tadeusz Biernacki, Sokół Artistic Director, ca. 1981. 229

Figure 22: Popular Songs in ‘Warsaw Medley’ 234
LIST OF ACCOMPANYING MATERIAL

CD of Musical Examples (formatted to be played on computer only)

1 O Haupt voll Blut und Wunden_J.S. Bach_Canzona Audience_13 April 2014.m4a.

2 So nimm den meine Hände.m4a

3 Welch ein Freund ist unser Jesus.m4a
   #16 from Canzona singt Deutsche Kirchenlieder, 2010.

4 CBC Hymn Sing _ God Night God Bless You.m4a

5 Szła dziewczka.m4a
   #1 from Songs of Poland – Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, 1984.
   Soloists, Valentine Wojtas, Roman Papalski

6 Gonią juz Górale trzody.m4a
   #5 from Songs of Poland – Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, 1984.

7 Na Pravo Most, Na Lewo Most.m4a
   #5 from Przeboje Socjalizmu – The Best to Idzie Młodość, 2006.

8 Warszawski Dzień.m4a
   #7 from Przeboje Socjalizmu – The Best to Idzie Młodość, 2006.

9 Czerwony Autobus.m4a
   #5 from Przeboje Socjalizmu – The Best to Idzie Młodość, 2006.

10 Ja Przygod To Tylko W Warszawie.m4a
    #11 from Przeboje Socjalizmu – The Best to Idzie Młodość, 2006.

11 Jak Młode Stare Miasto.m4a
    #17 from Przeboje Socjalizmu – The Best to Idzie Młodość, 2006.
PREFACE

The journey that has culminated in the writing of this document was born of a lifelong love for singing, my quest to find social spaces in which I could feel musically ‘home’, and a curiosity about place. The desire to find musical ‘home(s)’ has been formed primarily out of my migrant lifestyle of over 25 years as a military wife, who had no choice in the location to which she would be moving, and who often experienced the sense of not quite belonging in the new place, that is, until it was nearly time to leave again. This process of gaining entry, becoming part of something – acceptance, and then departure was repeated in nine different locations, in three countries, and on two continents. With each move, I profited personally and professionally by forging relationships with people of differing identities, by gaining a mutating awareness and appreciation of cultural distinctiveness in an increasingly homogenous global world, and by acquiring analytical and interpersonal skills that aided in the transition from one musical space to another, and one geographic place to the next.

In moving to the city of Winnipeg (2007), which had been the only location made by personal choice since 1980 (my husband had retired from the military by then), finding musical spaces or ‘homes’ was approached with more permanency. It was here that my curiosity about place came to the fore, particularly when Winnipeggers asked, ‘Why did you move here?’, often followed by ‘Winnipeg is a great place to be from, but not to move to’. On another level, an English friend who had once performed at the internationally recognized New Music Festival in Winnipeg, that is held annually in January when the thermometer can drop to -30 Celsius for days if not weeks at a time, remarked that the weather was so cold, no wonder everyone remained indoors and made music. I came to see Winnipeg, not only in its historic sense as a community in an isolated location, as in an island in a sea of prairie landscape, but also as a city where some still are of an opinion, and unfairly so, that it is second-rate to other Canadian cultural centres. I set out to find out why this was so, and this thesis is an attempt to begin to answer those queries. What do I want people to consider about the nature and musical meaning found in Winnipeg’s high solo vocal and choral culture? How has this culture been shaped by, and how has it influenced, social, spiritual and political life?
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It has been a pleasure to follow this research path and complete the thesis. There are many people who have made this journey possible, beginning with Dr. John Potter who inspired me to take on this project, Dr. Jenny Doctor for her guidance in choosing the topic and advising me in the early years of the research. I am indebted to Dr. Áine Shiel, for taking over the role as my adviser, and for her continued support and wise counsel over the past four years. I would also like to extend my gratitude to two Winnipeg scholars, Dr. Peter Letkemann, for sharing his knowledge as a Mennonite musicologist, and for his generosity by introducing me to many in the Mennonite musical community, and to historian Dr. Daniel Stone, for helping me sort out the complexities of Polish history, and for sharing his joy and knowledge of folk culture. I am deeply thankful for my friendship with Christine Tabbernor, who introduced me to, and facilitated my participation in and observation of both Polish-Canadian folk ensembles, and for the hours of conversations about the intricacies of Polish-Canadian culture in Winnipeg. My gratitude also extends to Sokół member Jerzy Bibik, for his help with Polish translations. The individual narratives and knowledge that were shared through the interview process has not only enriched this thesis, but has also enriched and humbled me, in as much that people have trusted me to tell their story. This has been a great privilege, and I can only hope that I have served them well. The last to thank, but not the least, is my family. Thank heavens for adult children, who can sympathize, be enthusiastic, or just arrive with wine! Finally, to my husband, perhaps the most generous person I know, thank you, and as we say in our family, ‘it’s been quite a ride’.
AUTHOR’S DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is a presentation of original work and I am the sole author. This work has not previously been presented for an award at this, or any other, University. All sources are acknowledged as References.

Portions of a previously published article on the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble are included in Chapter 5 of this thesis. In accordance with requirements of the journal MUSICultures, and those governing the presentation of theses at the University of York, the full reference for this article is listed below.

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION/THEORIES/ METHODOLOGY

Introduction
As a socially constructed cultural phenomenon music is constitutive, rather than reflective of society (Titon, 2008; De Nora, 2003; Brah, 1996; Hennion, 1995) meaning music and society are co-produced. Within this framework, people – performers, listeners, producers, impresarios, publishers and others are ‘actors’ who, by their individual and collective musical actions, create diverse and distinct music cultures that impact on and contribute to the sculpting of society.

Jeff Todd Titon (2008) represents music culture ‘as a group’s total involvement with music: ideas, actions, institutions, material objects – everything that has to do with music’ (3). Music cultures are variable in purpose, representation, size, length of existence and potency. They can be as small and intimate as the music of a family, or as large as an international music culture understood by peoples sharing it through modern technologies.

This thesis examines a music culture, investigating some dynamics that shaped the singing culture – solo and choral – in the city of Winnipeg over the twentieth century. It traces the complicated network of influences and outcomes for musicians of varying backgrounds and aspirations, considering especially the Canadian, British, Polish and Mennonite cultural origins, and the teacher-student successions and styles that emanated from transnational connections. As a music culture specific to locus and period, the culture is a product of numerous music cultures, agencies of varying dimensions and purposes, some transient, others more enduring, with each agency focused on their individual goals and courses of action. Four case studies, The Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (WMC), the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (MMC), the Mennonite Community, and the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble have been chosen to illustrate the thesis statement.

Thesis statement:
This thesis demonstrates how the solo vocal and choral culture in Winnipeg represents a realization of the constitutive, continuously forming and mutable relationships between peoples of differing identities, and investigates how this
culture has been shaped by social and political actions through transnational connections over the twentieth century.

**Theoretical framework:**
In searching for an approach with which to analyse the music cultures that form case studies in this thesis, I chose to employ Pierre Bourdieu’s theory of cultural capital (1986), the concepts of *habitus* and field as one of the bases of inquiry. These theories still exert strong currency even though the relevance of aspects of the theory of cultural capital in respect to the passage of time, changing lifestyles and technologies, and the relevance of aesthetics and the art object, has been questioned over the past decade. I will address these in due course.

The theory of cultural capital has been employed by a variety of scholars including Lucy Green (2003, 1997), who has examined music education, cultural capital, gender and social identity; Ola Stockfelt (1997), who has investigated the relationship between modes of listening and different musical conditions in daily life; Latour (1989), who sought to expose the relationship between social forces and science by attempting to undermine the idea that scientific theories were accepted or rejected primarily through experimentation, evidence or reasoning; DiMaggio (1982), who focused on agents who mobilize cultural structures; Hewison (2014) who has investigated the value of culture as a form of capital for the British government and its economy, illustrating how government control can be detrimental to creativity; and Guillory (2013) who has examined problematic issues in literary canon formation where cultural capital, as a method of social exclusion through race and gender rather than class and its acts of judgement, provides both the basis for a new historical account of the process of canon formation, and the social conditions giving rise to the debate about canon.

Over the past few decades, numerous scholars have questioned the relevance of Bourdieu’s theories of cultural capital, *habitus*, and field, searching for new theories and language in which to discuss the relationship between music and society in a post-constructionist way. The concern centres on Bourdieu’s lack of analysis of the aesthetic qualities of art, his refusal ‘to admit either the mediating effects of art or the creative decisions of the producer. This translates into a denial or artistic value beyond the *social* value of art in cementing certain taste clusters or positions’ (Prior, 2011, 131).
Georgina Born (2010) critically investigates the work by a variety of scholars who attempt to introduce aesthetics into Bourdieusian theory. While she considers their approaches valuable, she maintains that something is still lacking. Born sees the need for a new theory of cultural production, a ‘post-positivist empiricism’ that encourages ‘a reinvention in relation to five key themes: aesthetics and the cultural object, agency and subjectivity, the place of institution, history, temporality and change, and the problems of value and judgement’ (Born, 2010, 171). She encourages an interdisciplinary approach, aiming to redirect the field of criticism towards one that ‘is focally concerned with the social and material, the temporal and ontological, as these mediate and imbue the aesthetic’ (198).

Moving away from Bourdieusian concepts of taste structured by social ordering and power relations, other scholars, in searching for a new dialectic, developed, engaged, and discussed theories that might offer a better analysis of the relationships between agents and agencies in the contemporary musical climate of rapidly changing technologies. Through various ethnographic case studies, DeNora (2000) examines the role of music in identity construction within personal and social life, illustrating that music is constitutive of human agency. She argues that the study of music sociology moves towards an engagement with people doing something with music – music as an action, rather than a reaction to boundaries and power. Hennion (2007) argues that music aficionados are continually assertive and engaged in how music enters their lives, where musical taste is an activity, rather than an individual characteristic. He encourages engagement with Actor Network theory that treats objects as part of social networks, assigning agency to human and non-human agents (2007).

American sociologist Richard A. Peterson’s (1992) ‘cultural omnivore’ thesis, based on empirical data, illustrates that taste and class in contemporary culture in the United States contradicts Bourdieu’s ‘distinction’ theory, whereby American higher-class individuals responded more openly to diversity in musical styles from high art to popular. This theory has proved relevant in UK studies as well (Goldthorpe and Chan, 2007).

In an overview of the adoption and practice of Bourdieusian theories, and the debate and movement away from the same, Prior (2011) outlines possible issues in the search for a new music sociology of aesthetics that might arise, not limited to the finding of ‘precise terminology and language in the absence of an
established sub-discipline’ (133), but also involving the questionable return to a terminology that conjures up pre-determined meaning affiliated with 19th-century Romanticism. While those who move away from Bourdieu may well create a theoretical structure that may appear to be less imperialist, there is concern ‘that it is precisely in its attempt to capture the domain of the aesthetic that it continues this imperialism’ (Prior, 2011, 134). Prior argues for those who engage in aesthetics, there are clear advantages and disadvantages to Bourdieu’s theories.

There is clearly much to be gained by a critical engagement with aesthetics, but also much to lose if sociology attempts to leapfrog its own grounds in an attempt to move beyond itself. Bourdieu’s is not the only game in town when it comes to the analysis of art and culture, but it is clearly the most developed, sophisticated, and most importantly, sociological (Prior, 2011, 135).

Even though Bourdieu’s ‘ageing out’ theories (Prior, 2013) may be problematic, particularly in responding to rising global mediation in the last four decades of the twentieth century, it remains a useful framework from which to analyse the four music cultures in this thesis, as the methodology, addressed later in the chapter, is founded primarily in historical musicological practices.

**Pierre Bourdieu: habitus and field**

Central to Bourdieu’s theory is the concept of *habitus* and field. *Habitus*, drawn from Latin, is defined as a disposition, an inclination, a condition or a state that is often in reference to the body. Bourdieu theorized *habitus* as a ‘system of acquired dispositions functioning on the practical level as categories of perception and assessment or as classificatory principles as well as being the organizing principles of action’ (Bourdieu, 1990, 12-13). Simply put, *habitus* is the way in which an individual makes sense of his/her world as a member of a particular social group where the embodiment of the group begins with the socialization of the individual early in childhood.

An example of habitus as a mode that operates below the level of consciousness is arguably provided by the Mennonite community of Winnipeg (and
other Mennonite communities world-wide), where learning to sing in four-part (Soprano, Alto, Tenor, Bass) harmony through attendance at church services and other community events has and continues to inform the Mennonite identity. Depending upon the Mennonite affiliation to which a person is associated, the embedding of this musical coding begins in early childhood, with the child as a listener in the soundscape of musical tradition and history. With maturity, the ability to find one’s place within the music’s harmony becomes second nature. Yet this ‘natural’ way of being represents a practice that is less than 160 years old, illustrating that ‘habitus is embodied history, internalized as second nature so forgotten as history [itself]’ (Bourdieu, 1990, 56).

While habitus is central to individual and community identity, Bourdieu maintains it is also fundamental to the understanding of class structures in society.

That is why an agent’s whole set of practices (or those of a whole set of agents produced by similar conditions) are both systematic, inasmuch as they are the product of the application of identical (or interchangeable) schemes, and systematically distinct from the practices constituting another lifestyle (Bourdieu, 1986, loc 3685).

In other words, social identity is founded in difference where preferences and taste illuminate similarities and differences between individuals, drawing together those of similar likes and dispositions. Habitus structures practices and perceptions of practices into group identities, i.e., rich/poor, Christian/non-Christian etc. Group identities are then structured into ‘logical classes which [has] organized the perception of the social world itself’ (Bourdieu, 1986, loc. 3698).

Within group identities, Bourdieu asserted that taste establishes an individual’s place within a specific group, and can illustrate the differences between classes.

The system of matching properties, which includes people...is organized by taste, a system of classificatory schemes which may only very partially become conscious although, as one rises in the
social hierarchy, lifestyle is increasingly a matter of what Weber calls the “stylization of life” (Bourdieu, 1986, loc. 3744).

The case study of the Women's Musical Club of Winnipeg is an example of differences becoming apparent as individuals attempt to elevate their social position.

In 1894, six enterprising and musically educated women established the Women's Musical Club (WMC) of Winnipeg. They were the wives of Winnipeg's entrepreneurial migrants (financial, legal and commercial), who brought with them expectations of social status and cultural activities, the former being attained, but the latter not fulfilled in their new city. For these women, the creation of a socially-acceptable (Scott, 2007; Solie, 1994) and ‘familiar’ (Smith, 2010) entity, a musical club, became vital considering, at least at the outset, that it provided the women with a suitable social outlet and a means to share their interest and knowledge in high art music.

Bourdieu posited that the possession of economic capital does not necessarily signify the possession of social capital (Bourdieu, 1986). Unlike the long-established cities of Eastern Canada, Great Britain and the United States of America (USA), the economic and cultural elite of Winnipeg was not one and the same. Women from the culturally established families, notably those of the entrepreneurial migrants, were familiar with the etiquette and requirements of their social standing while the city’s early economic elite have been characterized as the ‘uncultured nouveau-riche’ (Bumstead, 1996, 6-8), families transitioning from tradesmen to capitalists, whose men had prospered during Winnipeg’s boom years. Establishing the WMC as a private institution, where new members were accepted only through the recommendation of existing members, limited the size of the association. In the early years, this form of gatekeeping was anchored in cultural and social capital, and only those with similar interests and knowledge as the existing members were admitted. By creating boundaries of inclusion/exclusion through the rules of membership, the WMC created a structure of power in which membership became coveted by those who desired to raise their status in society, chiefly Winnipeg's early economic elite. In summarizing Bourdieu’s theory of class (1984), as it is acutely relevant to this example, Titon and Turino (2004) remarked that ‘the cultural attainments of the nouveau-riche would be recognized as
counterfeit by members of the actual elite precisely because they do not result organically from deep socialization' (10). While this postulation presents an accurate representation of the attitude noted by some WMC members, the various club executives between 1895 and 1920 chose to admit the nouveau riche, but registered exclusively as ‘associate members’. This indicates that the new members would not have been considered cultural equals as they lacked a comprehension of high art music as understood and presented by the WMC executive. This example also illustrates *habitus* in relationship to Bourdieu’s concept of field, in as much that financial elitism (wealth) carried more weight than cultural elitism in this social space and frontier place at the cusp of the 19th and 20th century, where changes in taste could be achieved through education and increased exposure, something which became the focus of the WMC.

*Habitus* considered both as structuring and structured determines an agent’s place within the Bourdieusian (1983) concept of field. A field is a structured social space, one with its own rules, opinions and hierarchies. They include but are not limited to economics, law, arts, education and politics. Bourdieu theorized the cultural field as a subsection of the field of economics.

The specificity of the literary and artistic field is defined by the fact that the more autonomous it is, i.e., the more completely it fulfils its own logic as a field, the more it tends to suspend or reverse the dominant principle of hierarchization; but also that, whatever its degree of independence, it continues to be affected by the laws of the field which encompasses it, those of economic and political profit (Bourdieu, 1993, 38-39).

In the early years of the WMC, associate members who lacked the cultural coding or ability to play an instrument or appreciate high art music in a learned sense were accepted into the club, primarily to enhance the economic and political standard of the club.

Bourdieu (1993) also argues that fields are places of struggle, where the maintenance or improvement of an individual’s position within and between fields is attained and retained through power. The theory of field as it refers to literature can be applied to other art, including music.
The *space of literary or artistic position-takings* (Bourdieu’s italics), i.e. the structured set of the manifestations of the social agents involved in the field – literary or artistic works, of course, but also political acts or pronouncements, manifestos or polemics, etc. – is inseparably from the *space of literary or artistic positions* defined by possession of a determinate quantity of capital. The literary or artistic field is a *field of forces*, but it is also a *field of struggles* tending to transform or conserve this field of forces. The network of objective relations between positions subtends and orients the strategies which the occupants of the different positions implement in their struggles to defend or improve their positions (i.e. their position-takings), strategies which depend for their force and form on the position each agent occupies in the power relations (Bourdieu, 1993, 30).

Fields often intermingle or collide, as illustrated by the case study, The Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (MMC), where political angst perceived by the Brito-Canadian community reflexively influenced the field of arts. By 1910, increased immigration from Slavic countries reduced Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadian community (those of British birth or ancestry) to a demographic minority. Fearing their cultural tenets were being undermined (Artibise, 1979), the MMC, comprised of businessmen and professional musicians of Brito-Canadian heritage, sought to establish cultural institutions that would not only reflect their heritage, but also determine cultural taste.¹ By developing Winnipeg’s music competition festival based on the British model and affiliated with British institutions, the MMC were able to shape musical repertoire and praxis in the city. This established British authority and confirmed Brito-Canadian cultural supremacy as a force that remained absolute for nearly 50 years.

¹ While Artibise utilizes the term Anglo-Canadian to refer to the ethnic group of Britons or their descendants, I prefer the term Brito-Canadian, coined by Kurt Korneski (2015). In Canada, Anglo-Canadian usually refers to a Canadian of any ancestral past whose mother tongue is English.
Pierre Bourdieu: cultural capital

Bourdieu theorizes capital as ‘accumulated labo[u]r...[which] when appropriated on a private, i.e., exclusive basis by agents or groups of agents, enables them to appropriate social energy in the form of reified or living labo[u]r’ (1986, 83). It is a resource, a form of currency utilised throughout all fields that assists in the acquisition of power and social mobility. There are three fundamental types of capital: economic (financial wealth), social (social relationships and contacts) and cultural (knowledge and legitimized accreditations). While financial capital can be immediately exchanged for money, cultural and social capitals, (e.g., a person’s ability to play an instrument at a professional level and their skill to network social contacts to gain paid work) may also be converted into financial capital.

The theory of cultural capital offers an approach for analysing the singing cultures in Winnipeg. Cultural capital refers to non-financial, social assets including but not limited to ‘cultural knowledge, competences and dispositions’ (Johnson 1993, 7). This can include education, intellect, mode of speech and/or dress, and home address. Bourdieu theorized cultural capital into three distinct but connected elements: ‘embodied’, ‘objectified’, and ‘institutional’.

Embodied cultural capital is expressed by a deep familial socialization, where traditions and cultures are both consciously acquired or passively inherited. This type of capital is transmitted over a long period of time, becomes imprinted upon one’s way of thinking and being, and dies with the owner. As an example, I previously referred to Mennonite children finding their place within the Mennonite four-voice choral space as a function of habitus, yet the ability to sing chorally and the repertoire with which it is associated constitutes cultural capital, for the acquired skill is accumulated through a long process, shaped through familial and Mennonite community pedagogical approaches.

A homology of acquisition exists between the two non-Brito-Canadian case studies, the Mennonite and Polish-Canadian singers. For the latter, learning to sing in four-part harmony may not always be a reflection of habitus, although the recognition, reception, and performance of repertoire often learned in childhood represents embodied cultural capital. For both groups, embodiment is evident in the preference of language of performance, German for the Mennonites, and Polish for the Polish-Canadians, representing a real or ‘imagined’ mother tongue.
Consciously acquired cultural capital reflects how much time and effort is given to its acquisition, and in turn can give the owner other forms of capital, social and economic. In the early 1920s, the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg pursued a cultural vision directed towards the development of a high art choral culture, mirrored on the British choral tradition. For nearly three decades, the club recruited highly capable musicians from Great Britain to direct its various choirs (The Winnipeg male Voice Choir, and the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir). These men were trained in British music academies, and disseminated British choral culture and British repertoire influencing the Brito-Canadian choral culture in Winnipeg. As highly trained musicians, they possessed cultural capital, obtained economic gain, and by coming to Winnipeg, advanced their symbolic capital, being the axiomatic ‘big fish in a small pond’.

Symbolic capital, as a sub-category of cultural capital represents prestige, celebrity bound in ‘a dialectic of knowledge (connaissance) and recognition (reconnaissance)’ (Bourdieu, 1990, 22, cited Johnson, 1993, 7). Symbolic capital in the form of academic capital is assessed through degrees and diplomas, while the granting institutions, through the prestige of their name, may influence the degree of symbolic capital bestowed upon the bearer of said degree. Regarding the British choral directors, their ethnicity and association with British music academies magnified their symbolic capital in Winnipeg, considering the MMC’s deliberate effort to establish high art culture in the city, centred solely on British tradition. Legitimized musical accreditation, particularly from British music academies, instituted and taught by British musicians, reinforced Brito-Canadian cultural supremacy in the city, as was the case generally throughout Canada in the first half of the twentieth century (Tippet, 1990).

Cultural dominance in a more intimate setting is illustrated through the formation of a systematic scale ranking symbolic capital, established by members of the Women’s Musical Club that determined the role and status of an individual within the organization. ‘Active’ members, or those with knowledge and competence of high art music, became the educators, teaching the ‘associate’ and ‘student’ members – those with little or no knowledge of high art music, through a variety of activities intended to elevate cultural knowledge. Bourdieu remarked that ‘a work of art has meaning and interest only for someone who possesses the cultural competence, that is the code, into which it is encoded’ (Bourdieu, 1979, 2).
Understanding the code sets an individual apart from those who lack the comprehension of that particular code. Accessing it can provide an individual with knowledge that alters their cultural capital and promotes social mobility beyond economic mobility. In Winnipeg, it became important for the active members of the Women’s Musical Club, that is the culturally elite to school the economic elite in the ways of their new social class, one perceived commensurate to their high economic status. The active members of the WMC were, in part, by enacting their agenda, shaping musical taste in their community and beyond in their high art image.

Cultural capital in the ‘objectified state’ is represented by material goods, writings, paintings, instruments and recordings, and retains properties ‘which are defined only in relationship with cultural capital in its embodied form’ (Bourdieu, 2002, 87). The objects themselves are transmissible as economic capital, but the comprehension of, or the ‘consuming’ of the objectified state is established and enabled in the embodied capital. Simply put, owning a piece of art represents economic capital, yet understanding the intent of the artist, the meaning and purpose of the art, and the relationship of that specific work of art in its time and place within the lineage of art history, is indicative of the aspiration to a comprehensive understanding and represents embodied cultural capital (Bourdieu, 2002, 93). For WMC associate members – those who were allegedly engaged in attaining the cultural knowledge presented at WMC meetings, the possession of high art recordings and the economic means enabling their attendance at high art performances illustrates the symbiotic relationship between economic and objectified cultural capital. Developing an understanding of performance praxis, the knowledge of specific musical works within the context of their place within an historical timeline, and the ability to discern the calibre of a performance changes the objectified capital into its embodied form.

Another example is found in the repertoire of the Polish-Canadian choir Sokół, where the performance of a series of songs made popular in Poland in the decade immediately after World War 2 represent objectified capital, by reinforcing an utopian vision of the newly-born Polish communist state. This repertoire was written, performed and mediated by Polish individuals in Poland who either supported the fledgling communist Polish state or were otherwise complicit in the creation of communist propaganda in musical form. It became part of Sokół’s
repertoire in the 1980s, introduced by Tadeusz Biernacki who had recently immigrated to Canada, and considered by him to be simply pop music of the 1950s. Given that many choir members were fervently anti-communist, the transmission of these songs by the choir, without the understanding of their purpose and their history within the fields of art and politics, illustrates the complex and somewhat contradictory nature of Bourdieu’s concept of cultural capital. While performance of this repertoire in concert provided economic capital for the group, the acceptance of this music by the choir and Polish community, either by choosing to ignore the political subtext or by lacking an historical understanding, suggests differing levels of objectification by acknowledging one narrative over another.

Beginning in the 1970s, members of the Sokół choir and their affiliated dance group attended summer folk arts programmes in Poland supported and wittingly developed by the Polish government to engage diaspora Poles with their cultural heritage. After completing a programme over a period of four summers, individuals attained the designation of an instructor of Polish folk song and dance. This accreditation was held in high esteem in Winnipeg’s Polish community and elsewhere in the diaspora where Polish folk (song and dance) ensembles had been established. This certification assured members that their instructors understood the complexities of Polish folk culture.

Bourdieu (1986) theorizes that the objectification of cultural capital in the form of academic capital counterbalances the association of objectification with embodied cultural capital as both hold the same designations, meaning they die with the bearer. Institutional capital in the form of an academic qualification confers upon its holder ‘a certificate of cultural competence…of [a] conventional, constant, legally guaranteed value with respect to culture’ (Bourdieu, 2002, 88). Qualifications, when given a monetary value, can establish conversion rates between cultural and economic capital (Bourdieu, 1986).

Music qualifications, significantly those from the Royal Academy of Music, and the Royal College of Music in London, England, and later on from the Royal Conservatory of Music, Toronto, in the form of ascending competence of Associate, Licentiate or Fellowship diplomas, became an important signifier of proficiency within the high art music community of Winnipeg, and aided in establishing Brito-Canadian cultural supremacy beginning in the period
immediately after World War I and waning by the 1950s. As the Brito-Canadians were drawn to their British heritage to gain institutional capital, the Mennonite community, tied to their Germanic roots and faith affiliation, obtained their qualifications in German music academies and Mennonite-affiliated colleges in the USA. Institutional capital in the form of diplomas and degrees elevated the cultural and social capital of Mennonites in Winnipeg, and was converted into economic capital through employment as professional musicians and teachers from private to public, primary to tertiary education.

While Bourdieu’s theories of cultural capital, habitus and field remain valuable tools in the analysis of the high art singing culture in Winnipeg, diaspora theory becomes critical in understanding the evolving relationship between the dominant Brito-Canadian and those of the Mennonite and Polish communities.

**Diaspora Theory**

The key concepts of diaspora (Conner, 1986; Sheffer, 1986; Safran, 1991; Clifford, 1994; Butler, 2001; Alfonso, Kokot and Tölöyan, 2006; Quayson and Daswani, 2013) and transnationalism (Alfonso, Kokot and Tölöyan, 2006; Tölöyan, 1996, 2007; Quayson and Daswani, 2013) have been and often continue to be used interchangeably in discussions of nation and identity. Recent anthropological research, including but not limited to the companion edited by Quayson and Daswani (2013) has attempted to disentangle the many different readings. Quayson and Daswani begin by outlining some key concepts that comprise the historical notions of diaspora. These include, but are not limited to

… the time-depth of a dispersal and settlement in other locations; the development of a myth of the homeland; the attendant diversification of responses to homeland and host nation; the evolution of class segmentation and conflict within a given diaspora alongside the concomitant evolution of an elite group of cultural and political brokers; and the ways in which contradictions among the various class segments end up reinforcing different forms of material and emotional investment in an imaginary ideal of the homeland (Quayson and Daswani, 2013, 3).
Rather than limiting the concept of diaspora, diverse prescriptive criteria illustrate the complexity of diaspora, in which a single diaspora group is a ‘discrete entity…formed out of a series of contradictory convergences of peoples, ideas and even cultural orientations’ (Quayson and Daswani, 2013, 3).

While sharing some of the above conditions for diaspora, the Mennonite and Polish communities of Winnipeg are also open to divergent readings of homeland. Until the latter part of the 20th century, Polish diaspora notions of homeland consistently focused on the desire for the return of a democratic nation-state, most likely in response to centuries of political, social and cultural repression by occupying neighbour states. For some Polish-Canadian ethnics (those born in Canada of Polish heritage), the identification with an imagined or real place reaffirms their identity as a member of a transnational family distinct from other Canadians. One young woman, born in Canada in 1978, remarked to me, ‘My Polish culture is all, because that Polish heritage – that love of a country that you do not live in, but have your roots [in] is so ingrained that I cannot imagine life without it’ (Interview, Renata Gawlik, 27 April 2011).

For Mennonites, the intricate notion of homeland as a specific geographic location seems less relevant when compared to that of the Polish diaspora. This stems from Mennonite identity as an ethno-religious group who trace their origins to the Protestant Reformation of the 16th century when numerous and divergent groups of northern European peoples separated from the Catholic Church, establishing Protestantism and Anabaptism, the latter to which Mennonites are affiliated. Widely persecuted for their beliefs, the more conservative disengaged from society in general, forming tight-knit self-reliant communities. For some groups, migration became a means of avoiding religious persecution, military service and other attempts by outsiders to influence their beliefs and lifestyle. While Mennonites consider themselves a Germanic people, drawing on a geographical area as the birthplace of their faith, it is their religious belief community that can also be considered the homeland, a place where ‘religion is not only political but has political relevance in other spheres of life’ (Daswani, 2013, 44).
Another interpretation of homeland can be drawn from the reading of biblical text and the act of migration. In imagining their people, some Mennonites have referenced Moses, who led his people to the ‘Promised Land’ (Harry Loewen, 1999 – B. Froese, 2015). For Mennonites who strictly adhered to their faith interpretations and practices, the ‘Promised Land’ signified a location or locations where they could live separately and unimpeded by political and social influences from the outside world. Within this frame, beginning in the late 16th century, some Mennonites moved eastward from Holland and Germany to the Vistula Delta, and onwards to Ukraine. In the late 19th century, many of the ‘Russian’ Mennonites, those who had lived in Ukraine for nearly a century, migrated to the rural Manitoba. A geographical homeland often represented religious and cultural repression, yet the idea of a ‘religious’ homeland may well have made the act of migration more acceptable, if not more endurable.

In the 1870s, Mennonite immigration to Manitoba was secured through very liberal Canadian federal government promises that included the right to develop and administer a private education system sympathetic to Mennonite ways. When the province of Manitoba established its public school system in 1916, and withdrew the right to maintain private education structures, Mennonites considered this a form of persecution. By 1927, over 1,000 conservative Mennonites migrated to Paraguay. Kachig Tölöyan notes that ‘diasporas are resolutely multilocal and polycentric, in that what happens to kin communities in other areas of dispersion as well as in the homeland consistently matter to them’ (2007, 651). Mennonite Canadians and their Paraguayan friends and kin continue to share concerns and interests, including but not limited to the cultural practice of choral singing. As an example, in the autumn of 2014, eminent Mennonite choral director Henry Engbrecht travelled from Winnipeg to Paraguay, to share his knowledge and conduct amateur choirs in Mennonite communities in that country. For some in Paraguay, Canada is considered the homeland.

In the past decade, another reading of homeland, relevant to the rural Canadian Mennonite community between 1950 and 1975, has come to light. Historian Royden Loewen (2006) postulates the concept of diaspora within a diaspora by considering the economic, social and cultural effects that agricultural mechanization and commercialization of the mid-20th century had upon two Mennonite communities, one in Manitoba and the other in Kansas, USA. He
proposes that ‘to understand the fragmented North American countryside as diaspora is to understand the profound nature of those changes’ (R. Loewen, 2006, 5). In accord with post-colonial writers (Cohen, 1997; Bammer, 1994; Hoerder, 2002) Loewen submits that the migration of individuals rather than entire communities can constitute a diaspora in which the displaced individuals, often of minority status, recreate communities in the new locale that over time incorporate many new members, bringing diversity to a one-time cohesive and homogenous group. The rupturing of Mennonite agricultural communities can be understood as this form of diaspora.

Loewen sets up his thesis by providing statistics reflecting the change in rural and urban populations between 1950 and 1970, in which the number of agricultural producers, those living on family farms in Canada and the USA decreased by half from 2.8 million to 1.4 million (6). He further submits that the rural population in 1980 represents only one-fifth, a decrease of 28 million, when compared to rural populations in 1930 (6).

Statistically Mennonites represent one of the last North American rural ethnic groups to leave the farm as many avoided modernization until the last quarter of the 20th century. In 1972, 65% of practicing North American Mennonites (Canadian, American and Mexican) still lived in communities with a population of less than 2,500, and 34% were still on farms (R. Loewen, 2006, 7). Succumbing to mechanization, commercialization and competition, many farmers not only were forced out of farming but were also torn from rural living, migrating to non-rural and urban areas, where they encountered significant social and cultural change. The historic family farm, where the familiar patterns of kinship had developed over generations transformed into the imagined homeland, and connection with the land became part of the mythology (R. Loewen, 2006).

Transnationalism is often paired with diaspora and ‘encompasses not only the movement of people, but also of notions of citizenship, technology, forms of multinational governance, and the mechanisms of global markets’ (Quayson and Daswani, 2013, 4). In examining the relationship between transnationalism and worldwide religious communities, Daswani suggests,

Belonging to an imagined transnational religious community becomes an important way to momentarily step outside ethnic or
national boundaries…This transcendental logic of belonging is a powerful way of bringing religious migrants together, in presenting worldviews that are holistic within that virtue-community, even if they are in tension with the values of the host society (2013, 44).

Being part of an imagined transnational religious community, national boundaries lack their traditional appeal and pertinence. Religious and cultural tenets expressed in a variety of ways including choral singing form bonds between Mennonite communities worldwide.

The Polish diaspora, while it cannot be considered a transnational religious community, has historically been rooted in Roman Catholicism. At times the church has served as a passive, yet subversive role during times of political unrest. In examining the origins of democratization in Poland, Michael Bernhard (1993) suggests,

Judeo-Christian ethics whether religiously inspired or not, are the foundation upon which the social and moral expectation of most Poles are based. This is important on a pre-political level because popular resistance to the party state [communist state] in large measure sprang from this moral foundation. Thus, while the Church was not a political opposition, it publicly espoused many of the values for which the opposition struggled (137).

Within the diaspora, nationalist songs and hymns that were outlawed in Poland were sung freely in Canada (Interview, Frank Filip, 30 April 2011). Many Poles continue to remain culturally and politically interested and active in relation to homeland.

In the late 1960s, the Polish communist government developed successful summer programmes designed to draw diaspora peoples to Poland who were interested in language and cultural retention. Over the decades, diaspora Poles continue to value these courses, while technological advances and political unrest and reform have encouraged more individualized contact with Poles in the homeland who are interested in the same cultural practices. As examples, Polish folk dance instructors in Winnipeg use YouTube to source new music from
traditional music ensembles in Poland and in the diaspora to augment their repertoire, while the director of the Polish-Canadian choir Sokół capitalizes on his contacts in Poland to engage Polish high art singers as guest artists in the Winnipeg concerts.

As a lens to examine cultural, political and social change within ethnic communities and between ethnic communities and the Brito-Canadian host society between 1900 and 1950, transnationalism illustrates how profoundly global connections have moulded the choral culture in Winnipeg. During the first half of the 20th century a complex transnational relationship between Brito-Canadians and Great Britain existed. Great Britain was perceived either as an imagined or real homeland for those of British ethnicity or birth. Being a member of the culturally, politically and economically dominant culture, either by birth or by ethnicity, provided a distinct level of social capital for Brito-Canadians, which was further ingrained by state institutions and policies. Affiliations with and the modelling of British cultural institutions profoundly shaped high art music making in Canada between 1900 and 1960, even though the majority of high art and popular entertainment that appeared on Winnipeg stages between 1900 and 1930, British or otherwise, came via the USA, and were engaged through American impresarios.

Theories of transnationalism illustrate that the circuits of movement of people, ideas, and products enabled by technologies profoundly alters the way in which people engage with and create the society in which they live. Diaspora space, or the space in which these circuits of movement take form, includes ‘the entanglement of genealogies of dispersions with those of ‘staying put’ (Brah, 1996,18, cited in Daswani, 2013, 4), as in the city of Winnipeg inhabited by those who migrated as ‘immigrants’, their children as ‘ethnics’, and those who consider themselves to be indigenous, the Brito-Canadians. This demonstrates the imbalance in the paradigm, as Brito-Canadians were not indigenous. Yet, their association to Empire, even as a sojourner, new immigrant, ethnic, or Canadian of British heritage, provided a level of cultural capital to them distinct to others in the diaspora space. I find Brah’s (1996) understanding of diaspora as a structuring and restructuring series of social and moral relationships beneficial to my examination of music within the diaspora space of Winnipeg. The question
remains, how does one investigate cultural activities and repertories through the lens of diaspora?

Su Zheng (2010) summarizes the essence of the 20th-century models that have been historically applied in the study of European folklore in North America as being engaged with three diachronic stages, notably import, retention and modification (Dégh, 1968-69), resistance, breakdown and reconstitution (Klymasz, 1970), or survival, conservation, and syncretism (Leary, 1984). Within this model immigrants were often portrayed as ‘simple folk’ whose cultures were unsophisticated and immutable. Likewise, assenting to the cessation of continuous contact with the homeland, the relationship to homeland music was primarily examined as a ‘homogenous and reified cultural package’ (Zheng, 2010, 16). The essentialist ideals of preservation and authenticity were prevalent in the academic discussions of musical repertoires and performance practices within diasporic communities. While this model could be employed to analyse the Polish folk tradition, it falls short because of the complexities of multi-generational identities and the meaning and practices of music within the various cultural landscapes.

The above theories, once considered sufficient in investigating European immigrant cultures, revealed deficiencies when used in examining the cultures of non-European immigrants. For example, Steven Loza (1994) examined Chicano and Mexican music in Los Angeles, and argued for a comprehension of a diversified Chicano society that is formed ‘bilingually, bimusically and biculturally’ (55). Using the cultural theories of space, place and displacement, Zheng (2010) investigates Chinese/Asian musical traditions in multiple locales. Through extensive fieldwork in New York City and in China, and examined under the lens of cultural theories concerning space, place and displacement, she investigates how Asian Americans ‘claim America’ in their cultural life and reveals how Chinese/Asian musical activities respond and react to national and transnational cultural politics.

In analysing the transition to democracy by Bulgarians and the impact of social cultural management on folk art ensembles focusing on the fluctuating ideals of tradition and authenticity on the repertory of folk ensembles, Donna A. Buchanan (2010) employs a discourse of genre and social function that follows the transition from repertoires and musical practices once located in ritual to an urban practice, reified into local popular musics and exported as authentic tradition.
These readings have widened my understanding of diaspora and its meanings at the turn of the 21st century.

The affinity between Mennonites and choral singing is inextricably bound historically to group identity as a faith-based people where migration was perceived to insure, at least for periods of time, the resoluteness of Mennonite values. Other diaspora communities articulate identity through the act of music making, where the narratives of dispersal are many and varied. The Polish community of Winnipeg drew on the act of choral singing to express national pride of homeland, to retain a connection with their historical roots, religious beliefs and practices, and to develop and shape a mutable Polish-Canadian identity, a transnational identity that connected and still connects homeland, immigrants and ethnics, yet is distinct in its own locale.

In this thesis, the homeland represented in post-World War 2 Polish popular music became part of the imagined urban homeland for multi-generational Winnipeg Poles, romanticizing the city of Warsaw, the rebuilding of the Polish state and the positivity of everyday life under communist rule. This suggests a disconnection between real and imagined places and associations. On one hand, the rhetoric and activities of many World War 2 Polish veterans in the city and elsewhere in the diaspora promoted and worked toward the return of a democratic Poland free from communist rule. On the other hand, this same group of Winnipeg Poles, at times became the enabler by which this popular music repertoire, developed and disseminated by communist Poland's cultural bureaus was promoted and celebrated by Winnipeg Poles.

In searching for a way to understand this dichotomy, I looked to Tina Ramnarine, who uses the concept of ‘calibration’ in her analysis of carnival performances in museum spaces as a way of theorizing disjunctures between social reality, representation and translation. Calibration can provide insights into diasporic conversations about musical practices in multicultural contexts, with a continuing ‘ethnomusicological commitment to musical ethnicities’ (2007, 4). Most appealing to Ramnarine is ‘the emphasis [placed] on things not fitting, on adjustments in the musical and social world, and on the contradiction between discourses’ (6), particularly pinpointing the disassociations between representations and realities. I find calibration very useful in analysing the
disassociation between political ethos and cultural representations as presented by some in the Winnipeg Polish community.

_Urban Ethnomusicology_

Urban ethnomusicology as ‘a unit of ethnomusicological study in its own right’ (Reyes Schramm, 1979, 3) initiated a conversation about place as a complex network of individual and group associations. Early studies on the urban place focused on ‘the fate of traditional musics in modern cities’ (Nettl, 1978, 3) in non-western countries. Others investigations centred on the preservation, mutation and representation of the musics of European diaspora ethnic communities in the USA, for example: Harriet Pawlowska’s (1961) monograph on Polish music in Detroit, Stephen Erdely’s (1964) investigation of folk singing among Hungarian immigrants and ethnics in Cleveland, and Charles Keil’s (1966) study of the transition of African American music traditions from southern rural to northern urban centres.

Rather than investigating a specific sub-culture in an urban setting, social anthropologist Ruth Finnegan (1989), in her ground-breaking research identified and detailed the local amateur ‘popular’ musical cultures of an urban centre, Milton Keynes, at a specific time, the early 1980s, ‘in order to uncover the structure of the often-unrecognized practices of local music-making’ (Finnegan, 2007, xvii).

A focus on the existence and interaction of different musics, on musical practice rather than musical works, and on the amateur rather than professional side of music-making [that] reveals the hitherto unsuspected scope of music-making, with far-reaching implications for our lives today (Finnegan, 2007, 10).

Finnegan describes what Titon (2008) characterizes as ‘music cultures’, a group’s complete relationship with and commitment to their music, the repertoire, practice, the community connections and much more, illustrating local music as ‘an active collective practice rather than just a passive mass-controlled consumption or the solitary contemplation of musical works’ (Finnegan, 2007, 297). Finnegan’s successful effort to not engage with personal judgements of taste is undeniable. She questioned social theories of taste and status, and encouraged a discourse
about aesthetics and value of musics other than classical or high-art, all the while engaging with the community and their music. (Finnegan, 2003, 2007; Frith, 1992).

Finnegan’s research (2003, 2007) has, in some ways, guided aspects of my study of the choral culture in Winnipeg. This is most apparent in my attempt at a non-agendized approach in the Mennonite and Polish chapters, permitting the research to take shape particularly through extensive one on one interviews, and through participation as a listener at a variety of concerts, backed by traditional musicological practices including but not limited to archival research examined through various theoretical perspectives. With a strong musical background, I am also able to reflect upon repertoire as musical entities in their own right, outside of their purpose as a product of a cultural practice.

The constantly mutating urban space of Winnipeg and its music cultures can be problematic to investigate, particularly since this thesis covers the late 19th to early 21st centuries. At the cusp of the 19th and 20th centuries, Brito-Canadian, and to a lesser extent, the French-Canadian cultures were the most visible in the city. As Winnipeg’s population grew rapidly due to emigration primarily from eastern European countries, concerns founded largely on fear of the foreigner arose among many in the dominant Brito-Canadian community. Some Brito-Canadians sought to allay this fear by organizing a variety of community events that included, but were not limited to, handcraft fairs and concerts where immigrant groups introduced their cultures to the broader community. In this space, the representation of newcomers as ‘simple folk’ made them appear somewhat less threatening to the Brito-Canadians (Henderson, 2005).

In 1928, Winnipeg’s burgeoning ethnic communities were featured in a highly publicized multi-concert celebration titled the New Canadian Folksong Festival, an event that I will return to in Chapter 5. Inclusion at this point helps to illustrate how many different European folk music cultures existed in Winnipeg during the first quarter of the 20th century. Choral groups ranging from a quartet of Swedes, a double quartet of Dutch singers, to choirs of approximately 40 singers each from the Icelandic, Norwegian, Ukrainian, Dutch, Polish, Mennonite, and German communities participated in this festival (Plans, MFP, 16 June 1928, 4 (B)). Other immigrant communities, the Romanians, Hungarians, Italians, the
Czecho-Slovaks, and the Jugo-Slavs, were represented through instrumental and/or dance performances.\(^2\)

The Jewish people are not represented in this festival. On one hand, overt discrimination by the dominant society has been documented (Artibise, 2012). On the other hand, Christianity in its various forms offered a unifying factor between the Brito-Canadians and those invited to participate in the festival. It is also probable that Jews were considered as hyphenated peoples (i.e., Polish-Jew or otherwise) thereby individuals were associated with the country from which they emigrated. Aside from this festival and akin to many immigrant groups, the Jewish community established and continues to retain their own community or synagogue based choirs. Although no longer in existence, the Winnipeg Jewish Folk Choir, established in 1910, was valued as it eased the Jewish immigrant experience (Chisvin, 2011, 3).

By mid-century, the paradigm of Canadian nationality was moving beyond biculturalism (i.e., British and French) towards the multicultural and multi-racial model that defines Canada in the early 21st century. The Hungarian and Ukrainian communities in Winnipeg developed folk ensembles, mirroring that of the Poles in the early 1900s. As of 2015, the choirs of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble (c.1908), Deutscher Chor Winnipeg (German Choir Winnipeg, est. 1948), the vocal ensemble of the Kapisztran Hungarian Folk Ensemble (est. 1960), Chorale des Intrépides (The Choir of the Fearless) of the Franco-Manitoban community (est. 1960), the Ukrainian O. Koshetz Choir (est. 1946) and the Hoosli Ukranian Male Chorus (est. 1969) remain very active, performing in the city and province-wide.

Winnipeg’s vibrant music cultures of the end of the 20th century continue to stem from the movement of, and the exchanges between peoples. Between 1991 and 1995, 44 percent of all immigrants to Winnipeg came under the family sponsorship programme (i.e., individuals sponsored by family members already living in the city), with the Philippines being the largest source country for immigration of this type. Between 1981 and 1996, 27 percent of immigrants settling in Winnipeg came as refugees, compared to 14 percent overall in Canada.

\(^2\) In current terms, Czecho-Slovak represent people from the Czech Republic and Slovakia, while the Jugo-Slavs represent people from the independent states of Serbia, Croatia, Kosovo, Montenegro, Macedonia, Slovenia, and Bosnia/Herzegovina.
during this period. Even though only four percent of Ethiopian and El Salvadorian refugees immigrating to Canada between 1981 and 1996 came to Winnipeg, they represent the two largest refugee populations to settle in the city during this same time. In his analysis of the 2001 Census, policy analyst Daniel Klymchuck (2003) considers the acceptance of refugees as a reflection of 'Manitoba's need for people, rather than a highly developed social consciousness' (2). As of 2010, and under the Manitoba government’s Provincial Nominee Programme founded in 1999, which supports economic migration, the three largest groups immigrating to Winnipeg in the first decade of the 21st century included 5,026 individuals from the Philippines, 2,168 from India, and 1,021 from China (Community Trends Report, 2012). Aboriginal and Métis peoples (Aboriginal and European mix) account for more than 10 percent of Winnipeg’s total population, a higher percentage than any other city in Canada. While Aboriginal music making marks a strong component in the revitalization of their cultures, it is a subject out of the scope of this thesis.

Singing, especially in the genres of pop and music theatres, and the enjoyment of karaoke can be considered an important aspect of Canadian Filipino popular culture where transnational connections remain strong. For example, Filipino Canadian child pop singer Maria Aragon (b. 2000) signed a recording contract (2011) in the Philippines after her cover of Lady Gaga’s hit ‘Born this Way’, posted on YouTube, was brought to Lady Gaga’s attention. Within months, Aragon had appeared with Lady Gaga in concert, in an international interview on the Ellen DeGeneres programme (National Broadcasting Corporation), and performed in a variety of Canadian national events. Aragon’s rise to international popularity that led to the recording contract was instant because of her affiliation with Lady Gaga, as her voice was typical of an 11-year-old untrained singer. Without doubt, Aragon’s success has inspired other young singers, Filipino or otherwise, in Winnipeg and beyond. Chorally, the Filipino religious affiliation to Catholicism lends itself to congregational singing, however, choral singing as a secular cultural practice is not particularly visible in Winnipeg’s Filipino-Canadian culture.

At the time of writing, it is premature to discuss the impact that the most recent immigrants, many of whom have arrived from the African continent, will have upon the vocal cultures of Winnipeg. For others, the act of community singing affiliated with an ethnic identity remains relevant. Numerous choirs,
including, but not limited to, Sólskritkan Kór (Icelandic Choir) and the Scandinavian Canadian Choir have been established in the last decade of the 20th century.

Some choirs that continue to thrive centre their repertoire on a specific genre including, but not limited to barbershop (Assiniboine Choir, the Winnipeg Golden Chordsmen Barbershop Chorus) or gospel singing (Spirit’s Call Choir), while others are concerned with developing young voices, an example being the numerous children’s choirs under the umbrella of Pembina Trails Voices. Furthermore, there are gender-specific choirs (Women of Note, and Riel Gentlemen’s Choir) and others such as the Rainbow Harmony Project (est. 2005), an LGBT (lesbian, gay, bi-sexual and trans-sexual) community choir that also expresses identity through an association with sexuality and gender.

Throughout the 20th century, social adjustments stemming from political, economic, cultural and theological changes and exchanges illuminate the vicissitudes of gender roles. Gender theory proffers another lens through which to analyse how these changes have influenced music cultures in Winnipeg.

**Gender Theory**

Historian John Tosh (2007) argues that prior to the last quarter of the 20th century, historical accounts were ‘characterized not merely by the exclusion of women, but by a strict gendering of the public/private divide….the private sphere of family and household was women’s – and thus outside history – just as the public sphere belonged to men – and should therefore be written about without reference to women’(2).

Beginning in the 1960s, the narratives of second wave feminism, which will be discussed in due course, reconstructed history, relating the experience of women in traditional roles as wives and mothers, and non-traditionally as public figures. When the feminist movement broadened to include the structure of gender, the family began to be analysed comprehensively as illustrated in the seminal work of Davidoff and Hall (1987) who considered the family as a relational entity in which gender and class operate jointly. The varied and numerous explorations of women’s activities in the public space (Bond and Domosh (1998), Gordon and Nair (2003)) encouraged a scholarship that reflected upon men’s activities in the private space, an attempt at equalling out the narrative of private
and public. According to Tosh (2007), this raised questions of the validity of the distinction itself, noting how each impinges on the other.

Gender distinctions of masculine and feminine, and the more recent readings of LGBT – lesbian, gay, bi-sexual and trans-gender, suggest the fluidity, mutability and complexity of the construct, where gender-related terms are commonly thought to suggest sexualities and most significantly to define identities. This contrasts to the terms, male, female and intersex, which denote biological difference.

Philosopher Judith Butler (1990) argues that gender is performative, in so much that gender identities are socially constructed according to cultural standards and produced through repetitive actions as a learned phenomenon beginning in childhood. While acknowledging the realities of gender within the activities of daily life, feminist theorist Teresa de Lauretis, suggests gender is representational and self-representational, meaning ‘the representation of gender is in its construction’ (1987, 3). The constructive process that develops male and female into a masculine and feminine, a gendered system, represents a ‘socio-cultural construction and a semiotic apparatus’ (1987, 5) that assigns meaning (value, status, prestige etc.) to individuals within their specific culture, and is ‘always intimately connected with political and economic factors in each society’ (1987, 5). This leads to an asymmetry that is ‘systematically linked to the organization of social and economic inequality’ (Collier and Rosaldo, 1981, 275, cited de Laurentis, 1987, 5).

How has this constructive process shaped the roles of men and women within music cultures? What values has western culture assigned to these gendered representations? How has this shaped the solo vocal and choral narratives in Winnipeg? I briefly outline some of the significant political, social, and legal principles, beginning in the 18th century that formed the gender roles that shaped western society, and particularly those of the middle class.

Throughout his writings, philosopher Jean Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778) reiterated his belief in the moral superiority of the patriarchal family. The French revolution (1789-1799) further influenced class division and shaped gender roles for the western world well into the 20th century. Revolutionary political discourse and subsequent changes to French law, also enacted in other western countries, reduced the rights of women, excluding them ‘from the freedoms and rights in the
new codes that extended the civil and legal rights of middle-class males’ (Reich, 1993, 130). Historian Peter Gay (1999) summarized the effect of the elimination of women’s rights, saying, ‘throughout the bourgeois century [19th century], all across the Western world, women remained virtual chattels in the hands of their fathers, and later, of their husbands’ (174).

In conjunction with the reduction in rights was the elevation of the Romantic notions of womanhood. Rousseau’s pronouncements, reflecting the ideal of the patriarchal family, anticipated the middle-class nuclear family of the 19th century, where the men were educated to be self-governing and the women educated to be subordinate to men. He promoted gender inequality, revealed as follows: ‘woman was made to please man’, her education should be relative to a man’s, and ‘she must be devoted, reserved and … should exhibit to the world as to her own conscience testimony to her virtue’ (Bell, Bell and Offens, 1983, vol. 1, 44, 46 and 49, cited Reich, 1993, 133). The Romantic notion of the role of women as nurturer to the family came to be understood and acted upon in so much that motherhood became sacramised, restricting women’s representations outside of the notions of domesticity. Sociologist and political theorist Herbert Marcuse (1933), in a discourse on gender and the rise of the middle class, remarked:

Running parallel to the liberation of man as a ‘citizen’ whose whole existence and energies be devoted to ‘society’ and its daily economic, political struggles is the commitment of woman and whole being to her house and family, and the utilization of the family as ‘refuge’ from ‘daily struggle’ (Marcuse, 1933, n.p., cited Reich, 1993, 132).

This exemplifies a patriarchal, ‘self-perpetuating ideological system’ (R. Stone, 2008, 146-47) where male-dominance was assured. In this space, women became marginalized (Bell, Bell and Offens, 1983; Reich, 1993), and were defined, and in some instances are still defined, through difference as compared to male norms (Tosh, 2007; Reich, 1993). These norms became not only representative of masculinity, but also came to be understood as the only norms for an entire society, half of whom – women – remained silenced, or in the least, un-chronicled.
By analysing the evolution of some of the prescribed standards that effected and symbolized masculinity, particularly for the British middle-classes of 19th and early 20th century, comparisons of how gender shapes culture can be drawn to highlight similarities and differences between two societies, the British in Great Britain and the Brito-Canadians, those who emigrated from, or were the descendants of British peoples, in Winnipeg, Canada.

In investigating the structure of masculinity in Victorian England, Tosh (2007) suggests that masculinity was constructed in three arenas – work, home, and all-male associations. By the Victorian period, the home and the cult of domesticity had already been rendered feminine, however, domestic life was important to both genders. Domesticity, rendered as the idea of ‘home’, with all its meanings for Victorian men, became the foundation of male self-identity in the Victorian era (DeBerg, 2000). In pre-industrial times, men and women had worked together towards greater security for the family, albeit in separate roles (e.g., on the farm, in the household forge). With the rise of the industrial revolution, the fragility of the male role as the patriarch, the father, the leader of the household, was decimated. As men transitioned from home businesses and farms to factories and offices, the masculine image of father as the ‘family patriarch’, was affected, leaving him with less control over children and home rules, primarily because he was absent from the home for many hours daily and six days per week. On the other hand, women predominantly remained in the household and assumed greater responsibility over domestic matters. If necessary, because of divorce, the husband’s death, or the loss of his business and personal wealth, women worked for monetary gain outside of the home environment. However, if the husband was still alive, the wife working outside of the home, aside from philanthropy, was considered a sign of masculine failure.

Changes in the type of work performed by men resulted in a new definition of masculinity stemming from the idea of business as a battle and the office as a battleground where ‘ruthlessness and aggression were prized’ (De Berg, 2000, 18). This highly masculine reading of the middle-classes' work place is integral to the development of, and the high value placed upon the concept of ‘home’ as a place of refuge, comfort and security, removed from the struggles of work.
In summing up how domesticity became central to bourgeois culture – the middle classes of Victorian England, and integral to the construction of masculinity, Tosh states,

To establish a home, to protect it, to provide for it, to control it, and to train its young aspirants to manhood, have usually been essential to a man’s good standing with his peers. Domesticity represents something else. It denotes not just a pattern of residence or a web of obligations, but a profound attachment: a state of mind as well as a physical orientation. Its defining attributes are privacy and comfort, separation from workplace, and the merging of domestic space and family members into a single commanding concept [in English, ‘home’] (2007, 4).

The notion of ‘home’ for the middle classes in Victorian England signalled masculine success. A middle-class lifestyle implied that a man was prosperous in business. He was a husband to an adoring and obeying wife who was not required to work, and father to a contented family. Yet neither men nor women were totally accepting of, gratified or satisfied with the contradictions and the illusionary charms of ‘home’.

One of the issues that tarnished ‘home’ derived from the lack of balance between home life and friendship that led to a sense, significantly among men, that marriage and friendship were mutually exclusive (Tosh, 2007). After marriage, many men retained and frequently socialized with their close male friends away from the home. This was contrary to the social life of women, whose socializing was restricted almost entirely to the home. Male socializing, its extent and negative effect upon the family, was publicly discoursed frequently in the press throughout much of the 19th century (Tosh, 2007). The masculine social location of the 18th century had moved from public spaces, the racecourse, tavern and coffee house to private spaces, distinct and separate from home, however, still maintaining the sense of propriety necessary for an individual’s status. These included associations and private clubs of numerous diversions and purposes, where membership was graded according to status and income (Tosh, 2007). Of significance is the development of formal associations for public life where men of
like-minded political, intellectual and philanthropic goals developed associations of civic interest ‘which underpinned their claim to be public men and members of the body politic’ (Tosh, 2007, 132). Women’s involvement in civic affairs often revolved around cultural and social aspirations relating to women’s issues such as health and education.

Masculine ideals of success, the concepts of home and domesticity, the exclusion of women from civic life, and the division of labour between the sexes is intrinsic to the development of the middle classes in Victorian, meaning British, 19th-century society, interpreted to include the period until World War I (i.e., the long 19th century). In understanding some aspects of how men perceived and built their world, comparisons can be drawn between the British ideals and realities of gender roles, and those of Brito-Canadians in Winnipeg during the same time frame. These will be examined in the respective chapters on the two gender-exclusive musical clubs of Winnipeg.

In 1915, the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg was established as a private institution, with a greater purpose than presenting evenings of musical entertainment. The ethno-centric membership of middle-class men drew on their heritage as British, their social status and professions as businessmen or musicians, to shape the city’s civic image as a cultural centre.

In comparison, the Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg, founded in 1894 as an exclusive club, was intended as a small intimate association of friends who wanted to keep up their interest in music in a city where high art culture was rarely available. The frontier mentality that existed in the burgeoning city of Winnipeg further enforced limits upon the women, already restrained by status and gender. While their vision did not include grandiose civic plans, they shaped the reception and performance of high art music within and beyond the group, influenced music education in the city and province, and pushed gender roles beyond the norms. The dissimilarity of gender roles offers a lens through which to investigate these two exclusive associations.

Throughout the 1980s, broader feminist studies focused on gender politics, gender inequality and sexuality, while feminist studies in musicology centred on the role of women in Western art music: Bowers and Tick (1986) who emphasized the process through which women’s contributions to Western art music has been shaped; Block’s (1988) bibliography of women in American music; Fuller’s (1994)

Gender-centric research examined women’s music within the broader context of gender relations that saw women’s musical activities as a way of reinforcing, changing or protesting gender relations in a variety of cultures (Koskoff, 1989). *Women Singers in Global Contexts* (2013) touches upon vocal gendering as ‘a product of a complex interplay between anatomical differences and socialization into culturally prescribed gender roles’ (4) focusing on the ‘contrasting possibilities for expression for men and women within a given society’ (Dunn and Jones, 1994, 2). By moving away from narratives of restriction and victimhood, to ones of ‘success, accomplishment and pleasure’, gender discourse in music cultures and societies is re-contextualized (Hellier, 2013, 6).

In the last decade of the 20th century, feminist theory, through the lens of difference, embraced gay and lesbian studies, cultural and performance studies, and semiotics, demonstrated in the works by McClary (1991) who, in combining cultural criticism with musical studies explored gender-based metaphors in the discourse about music; Cusick (1994) who encouraged a discourse on gender as a power relationship between performer, listener and repertoire through her analysis of performances of Schumann’s *Frauenliebe und leben*; and the seminal volume *Queering the Pitch* (Brett, Wood and Thomas, 1994, 2013), that brought gay and lesbian musicology into focus. These texts have not only informed my understanding of feminist viewpoints on gender and music, but also have encouraged a wider reading of gender as representative of identity, difference and meaning.

The writings of Reich (1993) who investigated the influence of gender politics on the lives of amateur and professional women musicians in 19th-century Europe; Solie in her discourse of gender and the piano (1994, 2004 – B), and her inquiry into the role of opera as a gendered event in western culture (2004 – A), and Scott’s (1989, 2012) discussion of music performance and repertoire in the Victorian parlour firmly establish gender roles exhibited by the middle classes in Winnipeg during the early 20th century. In my research, I follow Hellier (2013) in examining women’s musical successes and accomplishments as a lens through which to analyse women’s musical activities. I do not ignore the political, societal and cultural ideologies that have marginalized women in music and throughout
society as a whole, but I also seek to illustrate how some in the Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg capitalized on their prescribed roles as mother, wife and family educator, enhanced by their position in society and their ability as musicians, to influence the attitude towards and the understanding of female musicians and their activities within Winnipeg society. Of interest is the way in which these women drove change in the broader Winnipeg community by exercising their social status and encouraging male members of their family who held positions of power in the city to make decisions that would support their aspirations. Analysing masculine and feminine gender roles in conjunction with status offers another approach in which to explore the development of the high art vocal and choral cultures in Winnipeg.

**Literature Review, Conclusion and Contribution to Scholarship**

The literature review has concentrated chiefly on texts that are integral to the theoretical foundation upon which I base my thesis. Other relevant literature centres on a variety of subjects including, but not limited to, the historiography of Winnipeg, of Poland, and of Anabaptism as it pertains to the Mennonites, sociological studies on identity conflict in Mennonite society, and identity in transnational and diaspora communities. These will be addressed in the methodology section below.

There are three possible reasons why this thesis can be considered a significant contribution to scholarship. It offers a multidisciplinary approach to investigating an urban music culture in the Canadian context that represents a realization of the constitutive, continuously forming and mutable relationships between peoples of differing identities. It traces the influence of Brito-Canadians and their transnational connections on the development of high art culture, during the historical period when Canada was considered politically and socially a bicultural nation (English and French), and part of the British Empire. It then follows the waning of British, and the rise of Canadian musical authority during the politically and socially transitive mid-century era that marked the naissance of Canada’s self image as a multicultural country.

Secondly, the ethnographic study on Polish-Canadian music making in Winnipeg contributes to the growing body of work on Polish-Canadian music cultures in Canadian urban centres, and more broadly, on the North American
continent. This investigation also forms a continuum with the historical material explored in Chapters 1 and 2, in that Brito-Canadian and transnational relationships contributed to shaping a distinct Winnipeg music culture.

While there are many authoritative studies on Mennonite music making, this is probably the first to investigate the integration of Mennonite singers and choral conductors into the broader Winnipeg high art music culture and to consider the consequences of this synthesis for both Mennonite and other musical communities in the city.

Taken as a whole, the thesis may be of interest to those who focus on urban cultural studies, transnational connections, vocal and choral cultures, and to those with an interest in Winnipeg local history.

Towards a Research Methodology
The framework developed for the analysis of this research project is multidisciplinary drawing on methods from historical musicology and ethnomusicology, underpinned by sociological and anthropological theories. My involvement in certain amateur musical groups in the community, my work as an adjunct professor at two universities in the Winnipeg area, and my friendships and curiosity guided my selection of case studies.

Historical Musicology
In the discipline of historical musicology the analysis of source materials has played a primary role in music research. Roberta Montemorra Marvin (2004) points out the changes in scholarship practices of the mid-1980s that amounted to a movement away from source study, towards a different method that was ‘considered to be more cultural, ideological and interdisciplinary’ (2). This became problematic and divisive among scholars, creating the two camps of ‘new’ and ‘old’ musicology, the former engaging in theoretical and cultural approaches, and the latter remaining firmly aligned with established methods. By the end of the 20th century, equilibrium was beginning to return to the field, and source studies were seen anew. In a discussion about the return of balance in the discipline, Marvin writes,
Now, traditional and contemporary approaches have really come into balance: source studies have been balanced by new theoretical applications and modes of inquiry and newer ideologies have incorporated documentary evidence.

In researching the development of the city over the 20th century by investigating the exchanges between its peoples, its place within the Canadian political, economic and social landscape, and its transnational relationships, I drew chiefly on document analysis of primary and secondary resources. These included the collection of primary source materials on the city of Winnipeg before World War I, edited by Alan Artibise (1979), that gave me a sense of the city as a dynamic economic and commercial centre, yet one divided on ethnic grounds and suffering from severe social issues. Kurt Korneski’s (2007, 2015) discourse on the impact of British imperial ideology on non-British immigrants, the processes of acculturation and assimilation, and the conflicts between immigrants and the dominant Brito-Canadian society has informed my knowledge on immigration and settlement in the Canadian west.

The peer-reviewed *Manitoba History Journal* proved a useful source for information on public figures, political, economic, social and musical activities that shaped Winnipeg throughout the 20th century. Of significant value are the local newspapers, *Winnipeg Town Topics, The Winnipeg Tribune, the Manitoba Free Press* (*Winnipeg Free Press* from 1931), in which systematic searches revealed source material and corroborative evidence.

In researching individual case studies, the methods of data collection for the Women’s Musical Club (WMC) and Men’s Musical Club (MMC) of Winnipeg were comprised of methodical investigations of archival collections and systematic searches of local newspapers. The Fonds of the WMC, held at the Archives of Manitoba, are quite extensive. For the period between 1900 and 1925, they include the constitution and bylaws, detailed financial reports, audited financial statements, correspondence, monthly and committee meeting minute books, a few concert programmes, a Scrapbook of newspaper articles, and a listing of their library holdings. Of great significance are the published annual meeting booklets, dated 1906-07, and consecutively from 1910-11 to 1931-1932. (The years 1907-08, 1908-09, and 1909-10 are missing.) These provide comprehensive information
on the club’s membership, the activities and expenses. The President’s annual report offers her personal insight into the achievements, failures and aspirations of the group. Corroborative material was derived from systematic searching of local newspapers, *Winnipeg Town Topics*, the *Manitoba Free Press*, and *The Winnipeg Tribune*.

The Fonds of the MMC held at the University of Manitoba Archives are less extensive than those of the WMC and comprises secondary reports on the history of the MMC choirs and the Manitoba Music Competition Festival, a few primary resources including letters from British conductors and reports on the Canadian Federation of Music Festivals. A secondary source is the monograph published in 1935 by George Mathieson, aka. G. Sharp Major, the MMC’s secretary who wrote about the activities and the personae of the club. The style of writing, the lack of chronological ordering, and general tone of the book indicated that validation from other sources such as the *Manitoba Free Press* and *The Winnipeg Tribune* was necessary. The nearly complete collection of programmes from the Manitoba Music Competition Festival from its earliest days until the 1950s offered insight into the transnational relationship between the administrators of the Manitoba Music Competition Festival, and the British Federation of Music Festivals, the governing body of British musical festivals. It also facilitated a detailed examination of the vocal and choral repertoire, the set test pieces and the own-choice songs. Articles by British and Canadian musicians on their impressions of the Canadian festival movement during the 1920s and 1930s were published in the fledgling British academic journal *Music and Letters*.

Critical analysis of written sources remained at the fore in the investigation of the vocal music cultures of two diaspora communities, the Mennonites and the Polish-Canadians in Winnipeg. Unable to speak German or Polish, I was restricted to sources written in, or translated into English. One of the more critical and certainly most difficult of concepts for me to grasp in the investigation of the Mennonite community, was the complexities of mutable Mennonite identities in relationship to Anabaptist theology. Through a series of case studies that focused on identity-in-conflict, Sociologist Leo Driedger (1988) remarked that ‘sacred-secular, dualist-wholist, stability-change, responsibility-freedom, community-bureaucracy, boundaries-networks, and unity-diversity dialectics’ have been ever present among the Mennonites (208).
Sacred-secular, stability-change, responsibility-freedom, and boundaries-networks form the dialectics that best provided a structure in which to analyse the social identity changes that occurred in the urban Mennonite community of Winnipeg in the second half of the 20th century. Driedger (2010) suggests that in developing urban roots and an urban identity, conflict among Mennonites was inevitable. Using Mennonite choral culture as an example, he states, 'Music has always been integrated in Mennonites’ devotion, worship and celebration. However, trying their wings in new types of music – and in the change from choral singing to the use of string, wind and electronic instruments – has created conflict (295). Even within the vocal culture, changes in repertoire (sacred to secular) and praxis (choral to solo singing), was often received with resistance.

To understand this resistance and its resolution, a comprehension of the history of Mennonites and the evolving structure of Mennonite society in Winnipeg was necessary. Two online encyclopaedias, the Global Anabaptist Mennonite Encyclopedia, and the Encyclopedia of Canada’s Peoples, provided concise articles outlining Mennonite history and the doctrine of Anabaptism. The following secondary sources enhanced my understanding: the comprehensive histories of Mennonites in Canada, two by Frank H. Epp (1974, 1982) and the third by T.D. Regehr (2012), and Loewen and Nolt’s (2012) investigation of Mennonite society in North America. Secondary sources on Mennonite choral culture traces the tradition from Russia to Canada (Berg 1985), examines the influence of Mennonite Ben Horch upon Mennonite music making in the mid-century (Letkemann, 2007), investigates the resistance and resolution of a mutating music culture (J. Dueck, 2004, 2005, 2011), and reviews the activities and impact of the choral programme at Canadian Mennonite Bible College (R. Schellenberg, 2006-07). The peer-reviewed Journal of Mennonite Studies, numerous Mennonite community and college newspapers, and the Winnipeg city newspapers provided additional or corroborative information. CDs of choral music, audio and visual documentaries rounded out the secondary sources. Primary source material will be discussed in the ethnomusicology section later in this chapter.

In the final chapter featuring the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, secondary source study focused on the construction of ethnic identity (Barth, 1969, 1981; Appadurai, 2003; Radhakrishan, 2003), on diaspora and transnationalism in identity and community formation (Braziel and Mannur, 2003;
Alfonso, Kokot and Töloyan, 2013; Quayson and Daswani, 2013), on assimilation and accommodation (Park and Burgess, 1921; Kymlicka, 1988; Kivisto, 2000), and on identity and arts in diaspora communities (Titon and Turino, 2004). Writings about Polish identity in the Canada and America (Renkiewicz, 1982), in Chicago (Erdmans, 1998), in Winnipeg (Heydenkorn and Kogler, 1998; D. Stone, 2003; Patalas and Izydorczyk, 2003), and a series of interviews with Polish immigrants to Winnipeg (Blackmore, 2014) informed my knowledge on Polish diaspora identities. Additional secondary source on identity, diaspora and transnationalism was accessed through selective searching in various journals (e.g., Diaspora: A Journal of Transitional Studies and International Migration).

The music culture represented by the activities of Sokół choir illustrates the complexities of musical identities in diaspora communities. Unlike music that is composed, notated and published, and where the expectations of performance are consistent, folk music cultures have historically been oral and aural traditions. While this may still be the case in some countries and in some ethnic communities in the diaspora, it is not so within the Polish diaspora. As constitutive of the society in which it is developed, a music culture will be shaped by numerous factors including political, social, and technological changes, leading to differences in the representations of folk music, and in this case, within diaspora communities.

Before examining Winnipeg’s Polish choral culture, or comparing it to activities in Toronto (Wrazen, 1991, 2007), Detroit (Savaglio, 1996, 2004), and within the Polish Singers Association of America (Blejwas, 2005), it was essential to gain an understanding of folk music cultures in Poland Czekanowska (1990), followed by readings on the choral traditions in Poland (Pękacz, 2002; and Zakrzewska-Nikiporczyk, 1997, 2006). By having some comprehension of the folk and choral culture in the Polish homeland, I was able to assess the changes in Sokół’s repertoire and performance practice in respect to transnational relationships between Winnipeg Poles, others in the diaspora and those in the homeland.

Non-textual sources included professionally recorded CDs of Sokół choir, and of popular Polish songs from the 1940s and 1950s, videos accessed on YouTube, DVDs, publicly, professionally and privately produced of performances by Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble. These allowed me to compare repertoire, performance practice and gain insight to the influences that shaped repertoire and praxis.
One on hand, the study of primary and secondary source materials, as a fundamental aspect of historical musicology, has grounded this investigation. On the other hand, techniques of fieldwork, collection of primary data have been shaped by methods based in the discipline of ethnomusicology.

Ethnomusicology

In its earliest form, ethnomusicology was understood as the analysis of non-Western musics, often in comparison to Western art music. Ethnographers in seeking to document the music cultures of others developed a research method – fieldwork. This entailed gaining entry into the culture, observing, participating, recording, photographing and transcribing. Through this process ethnographers attempted to understand the nature and purpose of the music within its culture.

In recent decades, new approaches to fieldwork in ethnomusicology have addressed the value of the relationships that the researcher develops in the field. In assessing the significance of relationships of this type, Nettl (2007) writes, ‘Everything that comes later – analysis, interpretation, theory – depends on what happened in the ‘field’ (ix). What is most significant is ‘how the field experience changed them [the researchers] and their ideas, and how as visitors [they] changed their hosts’ (x). While I cannot hope to account for how I may have changed my hosts, if at all, I can attest to how my experience with Mennonites choristers and choir directors has broadened my ideas on the purpose or the mode of their choral music culture. I have a stronger understanding of the correlation between the spiritual sense of the music, as perceived by the individual music maker, and how the performance of the music is a physical representation of that spirituality. I suggest that the best of Mennonite choral performances illustrate the powerful connection between singers of similar spirituality and the music that they hold dear.

In the mid-20th century, ethnomusicologists began to look at urban settings as a locale in which to study ethnic music cultures – Pawłowska’s (1961) discussion of singing in the Polish community in Detroit, Nettl’s (1978) investigation of the changing transmission of Persian classical music in Tehran, and Riddle’s (1978) examination of music clubs and ensembles in San Francisco’s Chinese community. Ruth Finnegan’s (1989) monogram on amateur music making in Milton Keynes demonstrates how studies of local musicians and music cultures
contributed to the newer ideas of ethnomusicology in the urban environment. In the preface to the 2007 edition of this book, she revisited the reasons why she enjoyed uncovering the ‘hidden musicians’ of Milton Keynes, saying,

Most of all it involved human beings, not just abstractions or generalisations, and the complex and diverse pathways they so impressively both trod and created irrespective of the ways the scholars thought they should be behaving (xv).

I have found this to be true, especially in the investigation of the Polish-Canadian music culture represented by the activities of Sokół choir. In 1989, Finnegan pointed out,

that we should not assume...that we already know what in fact should still remain as a question for investigation. It is easy to think that we already know or agree on what is most ‘important’ about music, how it should be defined and judged, how people value and experience different aspects of our culture, or how far people’s lives are determined by, say, governmental decisions, the mass media, socio-economic class – or the practice of music. But these questions need both further thought and empirical investigation on the ground before we can accept the sometimes unquestioned conclusions of, say, the mass society theorists or the class-dominated visions of some social scientists, at least as far as local music goes; for when these and similar assumptions are investigated at the local level, the reality turns out to be rather different (9).

Had it not been for the opportunity to spend many enjoyable hours observing, participating and interviewing members of the Polish and Mennonite communities, my comprehension of their music cultures, although there is still much to know, would be so much more limited had I not been the recipient of their generosity, and been accepted warmly into their homes, rehearsal rooms and at their concerts.
**Interviews**

Between 2007 and 2014, I held 47 formal interviews with three different groups of people. In the early years of the research I interviewed Winnipeg singing teachers, whose ages ranged from 50 to 93, in order to grasp the lineage of British teaching in the city. The second group represented multiple generations involved in one or both of the two Winnipeg Polish-Canadian folk groups, Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble and the dance troupe, S.P.K. Iskry (Stowarzyszenie Polskich Kombatantów Iskry, Polish Combatants Association Spark). My interest focused on the interactions between the Brito-Canadian and Polish communities, transnational relationships between Poles in the diaspora and those in the homeland, and the changes in repertoire and praxis, concentrating primarily on Sokół as it has been in existence for over 100 years. The final group that I interviewed were primarily singers and choral conductors from the Mennonite community. The core of these interviews encompassed aspects of Mennonite faith practices, their concept of service and outreach, and the correlation between profession and faith practices.

Three sets of questions, one for each group, were developed. The interviewee received a copy of the questions a few days in advance of the interview with the knowledge that the questions were only guidelines and the conversation would be open, given there might be something that the participant wished to share. This proved most valuable, because if the interview is too prescriptive, one might miss valuable information.

Almost all interviews were recorded, and transcribed at a later date. The majority of interviews were conducted in person, and a few were telephone conversations because some members of the Mennonite community no longer lived locally. In respect to ethical concerns, each participant received a form titled ‘Agreement for the Dissemination of Interview Information’, that outlined the purpose and scope of the project, and how the information from their interview would be shared. It also listed guidelines that the researcher would follow and outlined the rights of the participants. Individuals were given the opportunity of remaining anonymous, if aspects of their interview were included in the thesis, however no one chose this option.
Observation and Participation
The practices of observation and participation as aspects of ethnographic research can provide valuable information. In observing rehearsals of Mennonite and Polish choirs, I was able to ascertain the types of the relationships that existed between choristers and their directors, and gain insight into the capabilities of the musicians and their commitment. By participating in conversations before and after rehearsals, I came to understand the social value that is attached to being a chorister.

I attended numerous Sokół concerts over the seven-year period of this research project. As an audience participant, I became very familiar with some of the folk repertoire, and took pleasure in watching members of the group reach new levels of musical experience. As an observer at the same concerts, I noted continually high audience numbers that demonstrates the significance of the choir to the Polish-Canadian community in Winnipeg. The choir continues to be considered a vital community asset. Ruth Finnegan (1989), in speaking of her experiences with the amateur musical communities of Milton Keynes, says that her study ‘has implications for our understanding of musical – and social – practice in general, and what it means both for its participants and for wider relationships in our society’ (xviii). My study of a Polish-Canadian music culture as expressed through the activities of Sokół choir attempts to explore these implications, and to demonstrate what choral activities mean for participants in the choir and how these activities have influenced vocal culture in Winnipeg more generally.

Historical Introduction to Winnipeg
In the late 1870s, Winnipeg newspaper publisher Alexander Begg described the early years of the settlement that would become known as Winnipeg. He reminisced ‘no city council, no bank, no insurance office, no lawyer, one doctor, one policeman, no taxes, nothing but freedom – perhaps lacking the advantages of civilization (Begg and Nursery, 1879, 8). Forty years later, Winnipeg was nicknamed ‘the Chicago of the north’, when William E Curtis of the Chicago Record Herald wrote:

All roads lead to Winnipeg. It is the focal point of the three transcontinental lines of Canada...It is a gateway through which all the commerce of the east and west, and the north and the south
must flow. No city, in America at least, has such absolute and complete command over the wholesale trade of so vast an area (Curtis, 1911, n.p., quoted Artibise, 1977, 23).

In less than half a century, the land surrounding the forks of two major prairie river systems the Red and the Assiniboine, had transitioned from ‘a scattered settlement of individual free traders, their stores and houses, outside of the confines of the Hudson Bay company’s Fort Garry’ to a city with a population of over 130,000 (J.M.S. Careless, 1979, 13). This history of the growth of Winnipeg as a significant commercial and cultural centre within and beyond Canada’s borders presents a complex political, social and colonial narrative. To comprehend this narrative is to respond to the basic fact, posited by Adele Perry (2001), that settlement and dispossession are ‘mutually dependent and deeply entwined’ (194) in the shaping of society and culture in settler societies, including Canada. By imagining the West as ‘empty’ through the dispossession, and disenfranchisement of Aboriginal and Métis (Aboriginal and European mixes) peoples, historian Kurt Korneski argues:

Canada experienced a process whereby proponents of a transcontinental program of settle colonialism in northern North America projected a particular social vision. Having articulated this imagined future, these same people set to work convincing and compelling those who already existed in the region, and those who migrated to it, to order their lives in ways that made the vision a reality (2015, 4).

For centuries, the geographical location at the forks had been a meeting place for aboriginal peoples. Contact with Europeans began in the 17th century, significantly with the expansion of the British fur trading monopoly, the Hudson’s Bay company recognized as ‘the oldest incorporated, joint-stock merchandising company in the English speaking-world’ (Ray, 2009, n.p.). The company strategically located a fort at the forks of the Red and Assiniboine Rivers, now the centre of Winnipeg.

In 1811, Thomas Douglas (1771-1820), Fifth Earl of Selkirk, bought controlling interest in the Hudson’s Bay Company and attained a land grant of
120,000 square miles from the company for colonization in the Red River Valley (the Canadian provinces of southern Manitoba, eastern Saskatchewan, north-western Ontario, and the American states of northern Minnesota, eastern North Dakota and north-eastern South Dakota). The first colonists, Scots who had been displaced by the highland clearances, arrived at what was to become known as the Selkirk Settlement, affiliated to, and under the governance of the Hudson’s Bay Company even after the confederation of Canada in 1867. The other non-Aboriginal residents of the Red River Valley, the area along the river to the south of the forks of the Red and Assiniboine, were French-Canadian and Métis, men who had been affiliated in one way or another with the Hudson’s Bay company.

Just four years prior to confederation, British investment in the western half of northern North America was heightened when the International Financial Society, a group of influential Scottish businessmen, bought controlling interests in the Hudson’s Bay Company. This created a significant commercial shift, as most of the new shareholders were less concerned with the fur trade than with real estate speculation and economic development of the soon to become Canadian West. In 1870, the fledgling Canadian government purchased 2.8 million hectares of arable land known as Rupert’s Land from the Hudson’s Bay Company, a vast tract that spread across the prairies and north into the sub-arctic. One crucial reason for this purchase stemmed from the fear of American expansion northward.

The Canadian government developed what has become known as the National Policy, in an attempt to create a national, continent-wide economy and link the country from coast to coast. There were three foundational elements. Public support was required for the building of transcontinental railways that would transport immigrants to farm the prairies, and move agricultural and other goods to points across Canada. High manufacturing tariffs would be placed on all manufactured goods imported into Canada, in turn encouraging the development of the country’s own manufacturing industries. The third element, a broad immigration policy, was instituted, as people were needed to build the railways, settle the farms and buy what would be Canadian manufactured goods.

In 1870, the province of Manitoba was founded, with a population of approximately 12,000 individuals. Migration from elsewhere in Canada was encouraged. The government’s promise of free land under the Dominion Land Act, with its many and diverse conditions, drew much interest and many new residents.
Three independent visions for the new province arose. The Métis wanted the *status quo*, for the province to remain as their homeland where they could continue to farm along the banks of the Red and Assiniboine Rivers. The descendants of French-Canadian fur-traders supported by the Roman Catholic religious orders that served their community envisioned Manitoba as a second francophone province, strengthening their political position in Canada. However, immigration from Quebec was unsuccessful for a variety of reasons. The third group, who came in the tens of thousands from the province of Ontario, saw Manitoba as an agricultural frontier. They migrated in self-organized groups, creating towns and farming communities across the province, building a Protestant, English-speaking society. Their vision was to dominate. Other early immigrant groups to arrive in the 1870s had emigrated from abroad. They included the German-speaking Mennonites from Russia who transplanted their ethno-religious culture to southern Manitoba, and the Icelanders, who immigrated to the shores of Lake Winnipeg in 1873 after a severe volcanic disaster in Iceland. Other immigrant groups would soon follow, and change the face of the province, and the fledgling community of Winnipeg.

Incorporated in 1873, with a population of approximately 3700, Winnipeg’s founding commercial opportunists of the 1870s and 80s shared a common set of values (Artibise, 2012). These men were aggressive expansionists, interested in creating wealth and power for themselves and their community. They understood that the railway was a vital key to commercial success. Given their control of civic politics, they exploited municipal capital to entice railway entrepreneurs. In 1872, Winnipeg’s first rail link negotiated 390 miles of wilderness, south to the American city of St. Paul, Minnesota. This is significant, as all commercial and leisure interests travelled this north-south route. Critically, there was no other quick method of transportation to connect Winnipeg with the rest of Canada. Rail links spreading out from St. Paul, extended 350 miles south-east to Chicago, and onward to cities in eastern Canada, and the American cultural centres of Boston and New York. These routes were well travelled by Winnipeg citizens, even after the development of cross-Canada rail networks.

It would be another thirteen years (1885) before the first Canadian transnational railway, the Canadian Pacific Railway, was completed. It routed through Winnipeg, connecting the city eastward and westward to the rest of
Canada. Because of its geographical position, Winnipeg became the main western hub, with extensive rail yards that would employ thousands of workers. The young city garnered the name ‘Gateway to the West’.

The prospects of a quickly expanding economy enticed many entrepreneurs and business professionals from Great Britain, America, and the province of Ontario. The principle of loyalism strongly underpinned British and imperial ties in this early population. The roots of loyalism are grounded in the American revolution of 1776 when 5,000 to 6,000 citizens who remained loyal to the British crown migrated to Upper Canada, now the province of Ontario, where they created a conservative culture based on British-centric ideology. The loyalist myth was moulded through the generations, producing ‘deep family traditions of reverence for Queen and Empire’ (Page, 1972, 4). Allegiance to the Empire served as a tie that bound the Ontarians together with the more recent British immigrants. Urban historian Alan F.J. Artibise (1979, 1984) has analysed population trends in Winnipeg between the years of 1874 and 1889. His findings confirm that immigration from Great Britain and Ontario ‘established the essentially Anglo-Canadian nature of the city … a quality that was not to be seriously challenged until the post World War II era’ (Artibise, 1984, 363). This reflects the Canadian national consciousness at the time, as part of the British Empire.

Winnipeg of the 1890s as pointed out by Korneski (2015) ‘was quite literally the child of the kind of state-building programme that underpinned British and Canadian policy for the first 50 years or so of Canadian history’ (3). The web of connections between government policies, individual, corporate and government investment initiatives, and improvements in farming techniques that led to high wheat prices, launched the city into an economic growth period. Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadian business community benefitted from the boom. Cosmopolitan in outlook, they lived with their wives in exclusive neighbourhoods, socialized in a variety of activities usually within private clubs, and holidayed frequently in America and Europe. Some were tradesmen turned manufacturers who had achieved financial success quickly and were somewhat inexperienced in the ways of their social order. Historian Jack Bumstead characterizes these people as Winnipeg’s ‘uncultured nouveau-riche’ (J.M. Bumstead, 1994, cited D. Nerbas, 20014, 42). As an example, James Henry Ashdown (1844-1924) arrived in Winnipeg in 1868, setting up a tinsmith business. Through successful real estate speculation and judicious
entrepreneurial activities, he achieved millionaire status by 1910. While Ashdown, and others of his social background focused on growing their wealth, their wives tried to develop the social skills and cultural pursuits essential to their station.

Somewhat like its residents, Winnipeg of the 1890s was also covered with a thin veneer of high art culture. High art agencies included military and community bands, club orchestras, the Winnipeg Philharmonic Society and Winnipeg Operatic Society established in 1882 and 1883 respectively. Within a decade, several music education facilities had been established (Hartman, 2000-2001). Historian James B. Hartman (2000-2001) records the inclusion of high art repertoire, a Mozart overture, Schubert symphony, and songs by Wagner in local concerts of the 1880s. In January 1892, a newspaper article announcing new concert repertoire, to be performed by the decade old Apollo Club orchestra, suggested what Winnipeggers enjoyed to hear.

New music that has been sent for are the following pieces: Overture[s] to L'Africaine, Masaniello, The Persian Peasant, ‘Gavotte from Mignon, ‘The Turkish Patrol’, ‘Selections from Ivanhoe and Olivette.’ This is almost all music of a very light and bright character; perhaps, however, they intend to tackle something more classical later on. However, in taking up the above well known and popular numbers they are probably making a move in the right direction, that will at all events find favour with the majority of their audiences....They are at present at work on ‘Der Freischutz’ and ‘The Magic Flute’ (Music and Drama, MFP, 16 Jan 1892, 4 (C)).

The city lacked the refinement of the longer-established eastern cities, and many of its economically elite residents were somewhat deficient in the high art knowledge that helped to define bourgeois culture. However, they were keen to elevate the city’s cultural image, and for some, the performance of opera symbolized urban refinement and civilization (Budnick, 1983).

---

Touring opera companies had occasionally visited Winnipeg, for example, the Nathan’s English Comic Opera Troupe performed Robert Planquette’s comic operetta *The Chimes of Normandy* to an enthusiastic and appreciative crowd in September 1880 (Hartman, 2000-2001). Hartman suggests that the enthusiasm displayed by Winnipeg’s musical public encouraged the development of cultural institutions, both in structure and content. The Princess Opera House with a seating capacity of 1,378 opened in 1883. It would complement and enhance the city’s meteoric commercial rise and reduce its frontier image (Budnick, 1983).

The Princess Theatre was inaugurated on 14 May 1883, with a production of Flotow’s *Martha*. Other operas were presented over a period of days by the same touring company, C.D. Hess Grand English Opera Company and included the two grand operas, Charles Gounod’s *Faust*, and William Wallace’s *Maritana*; Daniel Auber’s comic opera *Fra Diavolo*, Michael William Balfe’s ballad opera *Bohemian Girl*; and three operettas Gilbert and Sullivan’s *HMS Pinafore*, and Edmond Audran’s *The Mascot* and *Olivette*. The operas were well received, however, concerns arose.

The management of the Princess Theatre had numerous hurdles to cross if their aspiration for the venue, as the centre of high art culture in Winnipeg, was to be achieved. First of all, they attempted to educate the patrons about appropriate behaviour in the theatre. Secondly there was the perennial problem with the issue of prostitutes. Their presence was considered an insult to respectable women, and was enough to discourage some women of upright character from attending the theatre (*Winnipeg Daily Times*, 26 May 1883, cited Budnick, 1983).

As was typical of the period, in a North American community situated far from the routes touring companies usually travelled, Manager Charles Wallace Sharp was unable to book the number of touring attractions needed to keep their theatre financially solvent. It was not until 1897 that he attracted a permanent stock company to the theatre, and was able to give Winnipeggers year-around high-art theatrical entertainment – sending his stock company on tour to the outlying communities of Portage la Prairie and Brandon when visiting companies performed in the Princess. It was terribly unfortunate that after showing such promise as a centre for high art, the Princess Theatre burned to the ground in 1892.
The destruction of the Princess left a gap in the cultural life of the city. Corliss Powers Walker (1853-1942), an American businessman who owned several successful theatres in North Dakota, saw an opportunity for expansion in the fast growing community north of the American border. In 1897, he moved to Winnipeg, to lease and personally manage the newly remodelled Winnipeg Theatre. His friend, railway tycoon J.J. Hill had encouraged and possibly financed the move. Their business relationship included cheaper rail travel for theatre companies appearing at the Winnipeg Theatre. Affiliated with the Theatrical Syndicate, a New York organization that controlled the bookings of the top theatrical entertainments between 1896 and 1910 in theatres across North America, the Winnipeg Theatre was never dark.

In 1907, Walker dropped the lease on the Winnipeg Theatre and built his own 1800-seat state-of-the-art playhouse. At the inaugural concert, Mayor James Ashdown was enthusiastic: ‘My own thoughts are almost that I could conceive myself in the city of Boston … or in the city of New York…It is the first metropolitan theatre we have in the great northwest’ (Walker Theatre…, MFP, 19 Feb 1907, 1(F)).

Walker’s daughter, Ruth Harvey described the varied performances appearing at the new theatre. These included ‘repertory companies in new plays and old, grand operas, musical comedies, symphony orchestras, minstrel shows, concert artists, ballets, magicians and mind readers, lecturers, and even political meetings (Harvey, 1949, 16). Compared to the other city theatres, which were often filled with less than sober transient workers watching vaudeville and perhaps even riskier entertainments, the Walker Theatre was the centre of bourgeois culture in Winnipeg at this time. It fulfilled a need in the city, but was unable to quench the thirst of a certain group of women, who desired to influence musical taste within their cultural sphere and the community around them. These formed the Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg.
**Chapter 2: The Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg**

In the summertime you felt the wide flat earth soaking up the sun and the hot dry air was sweet with the scent of wild roses, vibrant with the rustle of growing wheat. In the spring or fall the wild birds came over in migrating armies. Every day, then, if you looked along the horizon you could see geese and ducks moving in long, undulating lines and arrow wedges. And in the night you would wake to hear their incessant urgent honking. Winter brought days of stabbing wind and frost thick nights when you could hear the trains chugging miles away across the prairies. Fantastic mornings when the sky was a pearly monotone with one large, cold, lemon-coloured sun and four others – sundogs – gleaming around it. Blinding days when the sun shone from cloudless blue on a dazzle of white. Evenings so red the world seemed on fire. And nights when the whole sky quivered and shifted – emerald, rose and violet – with the shimmering of the Northern Lights. And Winnipeg, then, was as dynamic as the skies over its head (Harvey, 1949, 11-12).

**The Early Years**

In 1894, the Women’s Musical Club (WMC) was set in motion by six friends from the economic and cultural elite of Winnipeg, who entertained each other in their elegant drawing rooms, with the intent of furthering their musical education. For a few years, the group’s gatherings were informal and quite sporadic. The impetus for becoming a more formal association may have been driven by two critical musical developments in the city.

In 1894, approximately 500 people in Winnipeg were studying music (Hartman, 2000-2001). In establishing the Winnipeg Conservatory of Music, several of the city’s musicians joined forces to teach a wide variety of instruments, plus harmony, music history and orchestration. They advocated a class system of instruction ‘as a better method of teaching for less money’ (Hartman, 2000-2001). The quality of instruction may have been inconsistent, although one of its founders, flautist and violinist Paul Henneberg had occasionally performed as part
of the then noted Mendelssohn Quintet of Boston, a position that gave him, and by affiliation, the conservatory a certain amount of credibility (Hartman 2000-2001). Some teachers (Mrs. Osborne, Mrs. Evans, and Mrs. Higgins) would become members of the WMC, while still others (cellist Mr. Baly of the Men’s Musical Club) would often assist at the WMC weekly meetings.

Four years later, in 1898, the Winnipeg Piano Teachers’ Association was founded with eighteen members. Their aims included developing a curriculum for the teaching of piano, and establishing levels of proficiency for teachers. A good percentage of the initial WMC membership came from the Piano Teachers’ Association who were interested in shaping musical standards. (First Annual Meeting, Archives of Manitoba (AM), WMC, MG10/C7 File 7, Scrapbook 1906-1959, p.1 (A), c.1900).4 If the teachers were dissatisfied with the overall quality of education offered at the conservatory, they might mould musical standards by educating women through WMC programming, and thus influence how women in their social group chose music teachers for their children. On the balance, middle-class women of this era made many of the household decisions with regards to the activities of children (Tosh, 1999).

In November 1899, the first official meeting was held, when a constitution was drawn up, officers were elected, and an annual educational programme, based on ‘weekly meetings’, was developed. Each week was themed consisting of a small lecture on the chosen subject supported by musical performances. While the lectures became less frequent, they remained part of the overall programming. See Figure 1 (page 65) for an example of the seasonal programming.

Established as a private institution, with inclusion only through recommendation by two other members, joining the WMC became an aspiration for many of Winnipeg’s bourgeoisie. For some, being seen at what was considered an exclusive club was enough, while others intended to develop their musical knowledge. The founding members were determined that education was the priority, for it quickly dispensed with the drinking of tea until the end of each

---

4 I have been not been able to establish the date or journal from which this article is taken. The title of the article ‘First Annual Meeting of the Women’s Musical Club’ suggests a date of April 1900. It is the initial article glued into the WMC Scrapbook 1906-1959. However, there are articles dated earlier than 1906 in the scrapbook, so it appears that it has been incorrectly labeled by the Archives of Manitoba.
meeting, and established their ‘strict rule and principle of keeping silent during the performance of music’ (First Annual Meeting, AM, 1900, 1B)).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Programme Title</th>
<th>Member</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nov 5:</td>
<td>Chamber Music, Women Song Writers</td>
<td>Mrs. Sterling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 12:</td>
<td>Richard Strauss</td>
<td>Miss Falconer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 19:</td>
<td>Russian Composers</td>
<td>Miss Elliott</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 26:</td>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>Mrs. Laing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec 3:</td>
<td>Nature Music</td>
<td>Mrs. Higginson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec 10:</td>
<td>French composers</td>
<td>Mrs. Machray</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec 17:</td>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>Mrs. Semple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan 7:</td>
<td>Schumann</td>
<td>Mr. Nares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan 14:</td>
<td>Etudes, Songs by Grieg</td>
<td>Mrs. Landry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan 21:</td>
<td>Russian Composers</td>
<td>Mrs. Fletcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan 28:</td>
<td>17th Century Composers</td>
<td>Mrs. Nanton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feb 4:</td>
<td>Beethoven and Brahms</td>
<td>Mrs. Brant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feb 11:</td>
<td>French composers</td>
<td>Mrs. Chisholm &amp; Mrs. Beauchim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feb 18:</td>
<td>Chamber Music, Women Song Writers</td>
<td>Mrs. C.S. Riley &amp; Mrs. Keator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feb 25:</td>
<td>Composers of the opera</td>
<td>Mrs. Bryce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar 4:</td>
<td>Chopin and Song cycle</td>
<td>Mrs. Osborn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar 11:</td>
<td>Concerto, Italian Songs</td>
<td>Miss Patterson and Mrs. Wade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar 18:</td>
<td>Russian composers</td>
<td>Miss MacDowell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar 25:</td>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>Miss Fortin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 1:</td>
<td>Annual meeting and request day</td>
<td>Members</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1: WMC 1906-07 Season of Weekly Programmes, listing date, programme title and member responsible for the programme

Between 1899 and 1905, the reporting of club activities in local newspapers indicates a change in the status of the club on two levels. Articles on club activities and its first annual meeting were published in the weekly gossip, social and entertainment paper, *Winnipeg Town Topics*, published between 1898 and 1913, a magazine that would have been read by many women of the economic elite. In a sense, publication in a social and entertainment magazine trivializes the intended purpose of the WMC as a forward thinking educationally-minded group. Yet, inclusion in the *Winnipeg Town Topics* signifies the exclusivity of the club. During the same period, the club received minimal press coverage in the *Manitoba Free*

---

Press, and usually only on the ‘Women’s page’ and within the socialite column ‘Through Mi Lady’s L’orgnette’ (Through My Lady’s Opera Glass). The WMC appeared to be taken more seriously, as a group with a purpose, after the 1907 concert engagement of pianist Fanny Bloomfield-Zeisler. Notifications, reports and critiques on the weekly meetings, guest artist concerts and the annual meeting were published in the ‘Music and Drama’ and ‘Musical World’ columns. The broader readership and the purpose of the *Manitoba Free Press*, compared to that of the *Winnipeg Town Topics*, suggests that the club had been elevated from a women’s social club to one with a broader purpose.

**Membership**
All of the club’s membership derived from Winnipeg’s economic elite, but unlike some of the longer-established cities of Eastern Canada (Toronto, Ottawa and Montreal), America (Boston, New York, Chicago) and the major centres of Great Britain, the economic elite and culturally elite in Winnipeg were not the same. The difference between the two becomes clearer in examining the club’s structure that featured three different types of membership: active, associate and student. In the early years of the club, active members came from the culturally elite and were musically educated, often to a high standard. They were responsible for club administration, programming and performing the musical numbers at the weekly meetings. In contrast, women whose social class had elevated quickly because of their husband’s business successes during the economic boom of the 1890s, moving them from working class to the nouveau-riche, became associate members as they lacked a high culture foundation or musical knowledge. As Bourdieu argues, ‘nothing more clearly affirms one’s “class”, nothing more infallibly classifies, than tastes in music…there is no more “classificatory” practise than concert going or playing a “noble” instrument’ (Bourdieu, 1979, 18). The audience at WMC weekly meetings was comprised of associates and students. The latter were probably young school graduates who were studying music privately and were invited occasionally to perform at weekly meetings.

Women from the culturally established families were familiar with the etiquette and requirements of their social class. Their concept of education, philanthropy and social pursuits would have been defined by 19th-century values. Given their background and cultural connections, they often served on the
Executive and Programme committees. The 1906–7 Executive reads like a who’s who of Winnipeg.

President Mrs. George Galt (née Margaret-Jane Smith of Montreal (1862-1915)) was married to George Galt (1855-1925), who came from a long established Ontario family, and whose father had been the Chief Justice of that province. In 1882, George Galt moved to Winnipeg to manage the family’s wholesale tea-importing company, Blue Ribbon Teas. During his career, he held important positions at a variety of businesses, not limited to the following: President of Blue Ribbon Teas, Vice-President of Great West-Life Assurance Company, a director at the Canadian Bank of Commerce and at the Northern Mortgage Company. He maintained memberships with the most elite social clubs in Winnipeg, Toronto and Ottawa. Their home at 460 Wellington Crescent was situated in the most exclusive residential area of Winnipeg (Goldsborough, 2014).

Vice-President Mrs. Augustus Nanton (née Ethel Constance Clark 1873-1942) was born in Hamilton, Ontario. Her husband’s family traces their lineage on the maternal side to an important loyalist family (Jarvis), and on the paternal, to England, where his father had been educated at Eton and Oxford. Even though Nanton (1860-1925) left school at thirteen to help support his family due to the early death of his lawyer father, his family connections remained critical to his success. He came to Winnipeg in 1884, and opened the brokerage firm Osler, Hammond and Nanton, affiliated with the Toronto firm Osler and Hammond, the company that had taken him on in his youth. His company grew to be an important link between the financiers of Great Britain, Toronto and Montreal and was considered one of the principal investors in and developers of Western Canada. By 1910, Nanton had become one of Winnipeg’s millionaires. Over his career, he sat on a variety of company boards from the Hudson’s Bay Company and the Canadian Pacific Railway to the Northern Trust Company and the Winnipeg General Hospital (Goldsborough, 2014A).

Corresponding secretary Miss Jean Culver, the daughter of a prominent lawyer also from Ontario, married Conrad Stevenson Riley (1875-1960) in 1906. His English-born family moved to Winnipeg in 1882 and only three years later established the Canadian Fire Insurance Company. C.S. Riley joined the family firm in 1899. Some of his business appointments over his career included chairman of his father’s company, chairman of its associated company Canadian
Indemnity Company, Vice-President and a director of the Winnipeg Electric Company, member of the London, and chairman of the Canadian board of the Hudson’s Bay Company, and director of the Royal Bank of Canada and of the Montreal Trust Company, Governor of the Winnipeg Hospital Board and the Winnipeg School Board (Goldsborough, 2014B).

A number of the WMC Executive were musically educated. For instance, pianist Mrs. W. Sanford Evans (née Irene Mary Gurney 1869-1951) received advanced musical training at the New England Conservatory of Music in Boston. As a child of a successful Ontario manufacturing family (Gurney Iron Foundry), their family home address on Jarvis street in Toronto, signalled wealth. Gurney was active as a musician in her hometown, being a founding member of the Women’s Musical Club of Toronto (1899). In 1900, she married Evans and moved to Winnipeg. As a member of the Winnipeg WMC’s Programme committee she and others like her were central to developing the musical taste of other club members (Goldsborough, 2014C). As the wife of Sanford Evans, she retained her high status position. Educated at Victoria and Columbia universities, author, publisher, politician and staunch imperialist Mr. Evans (1869-1949) also originated from Ontario. He moved to Winnipeg in the late 1890s, founded the daily newspaper The Winnipeg Telegram, and entered politics. He was Mayor of Winnipeg from 1909-1911, and a representative in the Manitoba Legislature, and in 1922, the leader of the provincial Conservative Party (Goldsborough, 2014D).

These examples clearly outline the financial and social advantages that the Executive of the WMC enjoyed. It also illustrates the web of connections that linked political, civic and business interests to social status. By using connections (business, social and political contacts) as the beneficiaries of their family’s (husband’s, father’s) status, the women of the WMC were able to achieve certain goals. Of critical importance was their ability to travel to the cultural centres of New York, Boston, Chicago and lesser so, to Toronto, to source artists for WMC concerts. In their estimation and according to their taste, these concerts would inform and demonstrate ‘good music’ to their members and the wider community, as the guest artist concerts were open to the public. Education was the Executive’s fundamental and motivating aspiration. At the first annual meeting in April 1900, retiring President Mrs. Higginson remarked,
You have an opportunity in your hands which many people might envy, that of helping to mould public taste, you may not see the results at once and must not be discouraged, but in doing your very utmost with a truly public spirit, you will materially benefit future generations by your earnest and unselfish endeavour (First Annual Meeting, AM, WMC, MG10/C7 #7, Scrapbook 1906-1959, p.1 (B)).

At times over the next two decades, the WMC would draw severe public criticism for their elitism, bringing to the forefront the contradictions associated with their exclusive policies based on class and ethnicity, and the club’s vision of itself as a public educator. In her weekly column ‘Over the Teacups’ of 02 October 1916, journalist Alison Craig chastised the WMC for not reaching out to less fortunate Canadians and new non-British immigrants by making more of its concerts financially accessible, and by retaining ethno-centric policies that precluded women musicians of other ethnicities from attaining membership.

We have with us [in Winnipeg] some 45,000 who come from alien shores and the great majority of the people are much farther advanced in the soul appreciation of music, than Saxon you and me. But we are doing little [or] nothing to claim this great musical gift for Canada. In their own homelands, music and good music, was a matter of everyday hearing. Here they have the arias of great masters replaced by the umpity ump of the Fluff Sisters of the X___ Circuit. And just garden-variety Canadians, also usually have a taste for higher things if ever they had the means to satisfy them. Have we not the right to look at the Women’s Musical Club for pioneer missionary work endeavour in this field?...Talents carry with them, or should do so, some responsibility of service (Craig, 02 October 1916, 23 (C)).

While Craig’s text may be somewhat of an exaggeration with regards to the type of music people preferred, it is highly likely that most concerts of high art music were unaffordable for many of the lower economic classes.
In scanning numerous club membership rosters between 1900 and 1920, I found very few non-British names with the exception of French-born pianist Gabrielle Mollot (1875-1931), suggesting overall the club maintained its ethnocentric membership policy. However, the WMC, in their attempt to present the best musicians possible, occasionally presented Winnipeg singers of non-British ethnicity. On 5 November 1917, Russian born coloratura soprano Miss J.A. Filipowska performed the operatic aria, ‘Ernani Involani (Ernani) by G. Verdi, as the assisting artist to Winnipeg pianist Eva Clare.\(^6\)

While the WMC was restrictive in membership, it was similar to other musical clubs in eastern Canada and America as it offered the opportunity for women of all ages to share their musical talents, educate their fellow members and socialize within a safe, single-gendered environment, a combination that suited the mores of the day. By 1906, reflecting the rapid population growth of the city, the membership had grown to 480.\(^7\) This included 83 active, 343 associate and four student members. Average attendance at weekly meetings numbered 225. In 1912-13, membership reached its peak of 657, 119 active, 523 Associate, and fifteen students. Throughout the war years, the number of active members hovered between 106 and 119, and the associate members fluctuated around 500 until the 1918/19 season, when they decreased to 355. On an average, around 200 people attended weekly meetings over the war period. One reason for the fall in membership may have been the Spanish Influenza epidemic that raged in Winnipeg between October and December of 1918. All public meetings over six people were cancelled, schools were closed, and public movement severely restricted (Jones, 2007). It is highly plausible that some members succumbed to the pandemic while others did not renew their membership as nearly half of the yearly meetings were cancelled. Within two years, the membership had been revitalized, with 146 active and 518 associate, equalling 664 in total.

---

\(^6\) The spelling of this singer’s name varies as it is recorded in Winnipeg papers: Phillipowska, Filipowska, and then after marriage, Filipowska-Steffanson or Steffanson Filipowska. She trained at the Royal Imperial Academy of Music in Vienna, and began a promising operatic career in Europe that was interrupted by World War I (Madame Johanna Steffanson Filipowska, MFP, 17 March 1923, 28 (C)).

\(^7\) All membership data is sourced from the WMC’s Annual Reports 1906/07-1920/21 (AM, WMC, MG10 C7/3, #14, Annual Reports).
The WMC as a Business

As a business, the WMC was financially self-sufficient and received most of its revenue from annual dues. From 1900 until after the World War I, the dues remained the same—$3 for an associate member, $2 for an active and 50 cents for a student. Other revenue came from donations and ticket sales for concerts that were open to the public and included guest artist recitals. Budgets were set annually and varied depending on the membership count. During the 1910s, the budget hovered between $2000 and $3000. Commencing in 1912, the WMC supported a variety of charities funded from the proceeds of concerts performed by club members. During the war years, 1914-18, their charitable interests turned towards supporting the war effort and aiding returning soldiers. Figure 2 (page 72) lists the club’s charitable donations from 1911-1920. By 1914, the club had also begun to channel surplus money into a variety of investments, aiding their interests, which by this time included a scholarship programme for promising Winnipeg musicians.8

Guest Artist Recitals

As early as 1900, the WMC were encouraged by respected male musicians in Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadian musical community to assume the role of impresario. Pianist and musical entrepreneur James Tees ‘urged the club to assist in every way possible the visits of high class concert artists’ (First Annual Meeting, AM, WMC, MG10/C7, File 7, Scrapbook 1906-1959, p.1 (A)). This objective was achieved in 1907, with the well attended and financially successful concert by Austrian-born American pianist Fanny Bloomfield-Zeisler (1863-1927), coming seven years after former club president, Mrs. Higginson had remarked that having lived in the city since 1887, she had ‘yet to hear a pianist of first rank’ (First Annual Meeting, AM, WMC, MG10/C7, File 7, Scrapbook 1906-1959, p.1 (B)). As one of the first American female virtuoso pianists, Bloomfield-Zeisler had broken out of the ‘lady pianist’ mould (Hallman, 2006) – that of a demure drawing room amateur. While this may have been controversial for some, conflicting with middle-class mores of the era, Bloomfield-Zeisler would have still been attractive to the WMC.

8 All financial data is sourced from the WMC’s Annual Reports 1906/07-1920/21 (WMC, MG10/C7/3, #14, Annual Reports).
Executive, as they were interested in presenting models of excellence for the younger active members in the club.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Beneficiary</th>
<th>Amount Donated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1911-12</td>
<td>Mme Albani Fund</td>
<td>$50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>Survivors of the Titanic</td>
<td>$100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913-14</td>
<td>Women’s Hospital Ship</td>
<td>$150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>Red Cross Society</td>
<td>$575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1915</td>
<td>Student Scholarship</td>
<td>$350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1916-17</td>
<td>Returned Soldiers Assoc.</td>
<td>$200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manitoba Patriotic Fund (proceeds from 3 recitals)</td>
<td>$200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manitoba Red Cross (proceeds from Holy Trinity concert)</td>
<td>$93.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student Scholarship</td>
<td>$50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918-19</td>
<td>Women’s Tribute Fund (Victory Concert)</td>
<td>$154.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1919-20</td>
<td>Children’s Aid (Yuletide Concert)</td>
<td>$100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 2: WMC Charitable Donations 1911-1920**

In theorizing gender difference and genius in music, Christine Battersby (1989) argued that genius in Western aesthetics is located within assumptions of gender. A woman is distinguished not by her biology, but in ‘the way society characterizes her because of her biology’ (1989, 154, cited Solie, 1995, 9). Historically, although the art form was seen to symbolize a feminine psyche, genius in music has primarily been ascribed to men through representations of masculine sexual virility, while genius in women, is often defined in terms of ‘those male characterizations of women…that have been identified as particularly harmful’ (Citron, 2000, 70). In assessing the reception of professional women musicians appearing in concert in early 20th-century Winnipeg, particularly through the judgement of music critics of varying levels of expertise, one can see that this attitude prevailed to a certain degree. Reviewing Bloomfield-Zeisler’s performance, a critic was surprised by her passion. In exuding strength and
character, she was reported to be ‘a shade too forceful’ (Music and Drama - I, MFP, 21 November 1906, 10 (C)). Being powerful as a woman performer was contextualized only in comparison to men, represented by such gender-loaded statements as ‘she [Boomfield-Zeisler] played like a man’ (Music and Drama - I, MFP, 21 November 1906, 10 (C)). This financially successful concert encouraged the WMC to assume the role of impresario, not only to the benefit of club members, but also in order to shape musical taste in the wider community.

It became the norm for the club to bring ‘to the city each year, musicians of note, who might not have been heard otherwise’ (Women’s Musical Club, MFP, 6 April 1907, 29 (A)). Between 1907 and 1925, the club engaged many artists, local and international, rising and established. Unlike the weekly meetings, all visiting artist concerts were opened to the public. Many of the guests were pianists (Mme Bloomfield Zeisler (1906-07 season), Louise MacDowell (1916-17), Leonard Heaton (1919-20), Myra Hess (1921-22) and Ernest Seitz (1924-25); or singers (Brabazon Lowther (1907-08), Mabel Beddoe (1910-11), Mme Hesse-Sprotte (1910-11), Marcus Kellerman (1912-13), Alma Johnson-Porteous (1913-14), Emma Roberts (1916-17) and Amelia Galli-Curci (1920-21), and violinists (Maud Powell (1907-08), and Isolde Menges (1916-17). On one hand, by primarily choosing pianists, violinists and singers, the club consciously or subconsciously concurred with late 19th-century bourgeois cultural values and gender roles that encouraged or discouraged the study of certain instruments by women (Reich, 1993; Solie, 1994, 2004b). However, attitudes were changing, for women cellists were presented in concert (May Mukle 1916-17), and represented in WMC membership, notably Programme Director (1912-14) Mrs. Mortimer Scott, and active member Miss Edwina Higginson (Annual Report – A, 1914). On the other hand, the WMC engaged women musicians, particularly young rising artists (English violinist Isolde Menges, the singers Canadian Mabel Beddoe and American Emma Roberts) to inspire club members by ‘bringing into their lives examples of art that will encourage them in their own work’ (Annual Report – C, 1916-17, 8-9).

Educating their members became the club’s central purpose. At times a tension arose between the status of the WMC as an exclusive, financially-elite Brito-Canadian organization, whose weekly meetings and guest concerts were available only to those who could afford to belong to the club, and the role that
would define them as a socially-conscious group who were interested in shaping musical taste in the wider community. I have chosen two case studies that illustrate these diametric points, The Goldmark Lectures of 1905, and the North End Extension Work of 1914.

**Case Study 1: The Rubin Goldmark Lecture Recitals 1905**

In the autumn of 1904, the WMC engaged New York academic Rubin Goldmark to deliver a series of four lectures; a customary approach of the era primarily intended to educate, and also to entertain. Although active members often gave short lectures at weekly meetings, this was a fresh venture for the Club principally because of the subject – Richard Wagner’s *Ring* cycle. Wagner’s model of *Gesamtkunstwerk* in which poetry, staging, scene design, action and music are organically connected expressions of a single dramatic ideal presented an extremely complicated concept to express or to comprehend, especially for Club members with little musical knowledge. Wagner’s music was extremely popular amongst the American elite at the time (Horowitz, 1998), and those in Winnipeg who were able to access American high art concerts would probably have been equally enthused. On another level, the information gleaned from the lectures might provide additional material for use in the weekly meetings by the active members of the WMC. One fact is for certain, Goldmark proposed the topic. (Minute Books, AM, WMC, MG10 C7/4, File 18, 1904-1910) He is remembered today as a musician ‘whose views reflected the prevailing thoughts of the post-Romantic generation’ (Tomatz, OMO, 2015) which embraced a fascination with German Romantic composers, especially Wagner.

Rubin Goldmark (1872-1936) was an American composer and educator who lived most of his life in New York City. After completing his education at City University New York Goldmark studied at the Vienna conservatory – piano with Anton Door (1833-1919) and theory with Johann Nepomuk Fuchs (1842-1899). Upon his return to New York in 1891, he taught at various conservatories, received composition lessons from Antonín Dvořák (1841-1904) and rounded out his piano training with Rafael Joseffy (1852-1915). From 1900-12 Goldmark taught at the New York College of Music and from 1926-36, he was the first head of composition at Julliard School of Music, where, for a short time, he taught Gershwin and Copland.
Complementing his academic profile, Goldmark was the ‘official lecturer’ for the Henry W. Savage English Opera Company. The company was founded in 1896 in Boston and performed grand opera in the English language, differentiating itself from another arm of the company that staged musical dramas and comic opera. As a promoter of new repertoire for the company, Goldmark’s role was vital to the success of the company. The purpose of the lecture was to acquaint the audience with the opera’s storyline and main melodic themes, while the goal was to stir up enough interest to achieve financial success for the company. The speaking engagements usually occurred approximately six weeks before opening night, and just prior to the start of ticket sales (Hypatia, MFP, 14 January 1905, 8, (A)). Newspaper reviews establish Goldmark as a charismatic speaker with excellent pianistic skills (Music and Drama – C, MFP, 4 February 1905, 8 (B)). Presumably he must have enjoyed this role for he delivered hundreds of these lectures throughout his career (Tomatz, 1966).

The Henry W. Savage English Opera Company had been crisscrossing America annually since 1900, visiting numerous centres including Chicago, Illinois, and the twin cities of Minneapolis and St. Paul, Minnesota (Horowitz, 1998, 245). For Winnipeg citizens who were interested in attending a high art opera the twin cities offered the closest location, approximately one-day travel by train. It was also customary for the Minneapolis - St. Paul and Chicago theatres to advertise their upcoming opera seasons in the Winnipeg newspapers (Music and Drama – F, MFP, 20 March 1905, 3 (C)). Although there is no evidence to confirm that the advertising was worthwhile – or confirmation of passengers travelling to Minnesota-St. Paul specifically for the opera – there is also no evidence for the opposite. Logically, a business would not continue to advertise if the revenue proved insufficient. Significantly, ‘grand’ opera, with notable singers was rarely offered in Winnipeg in the early 1900s. What was available was not to the taste of the WMC Executive, the programme committee, and many members of the WMC.

In the early 1900s, few opera companies included Winnipeg in their ‘American’ tour (Skene, 1990). Those that came to the city usually performed light or comic operas, as was the case when the Deston stock company arrived in June of 1899. Over three days they performed **Bohemian Girl** by Balfe, **The Mikado** by Gilbert and Sullivan and **The Chimes of Normandy** by Robert Planquette (Music and Drama - A, MFP, 07 June 1899, 3 (B)). The review noted that the operettas
were well sung and acted, and at a popular price. However, a large appreciative audience remained elusive. ‘It is surprising that Winnipeggers do not take a more lively interest in the short season of opera’, reported C.W. Handscomb, the music reviewer for the MFP (Music and Drama – A, MFP, 07 June 1899, 3 (B)). Six years later, the situation had not improved, and may have even deteriorated. Harriet Walker, co-owner of the Winnipeg Theatre – the only city theatre that presented ‘high art’ – bemoaned the fact that many in Winnipeg enjoyed ‘bad’ musical comedies.\(^9\) She stated ‘I would rather believe that local theatre goers have not learned to discriminate than to believe they deliberately prefer such cheap theatre tinsel’ (Harriet Walker, ‘The Matinee Girl’, Winnipeg Town Topics, 11 November 1905, 10 (B-C)).\(^10\)

Within this cultural climate the WMC strove to introduce change, and was encouraged through public comments. In an interview with the Manitoba Free Press, visiting artist, American baritone David Bispham (1857-1921) remarked, ‘Women’s clubs all over the continent are helping greatly in the development of the musical standard’ (Music and Drama – G, MFP, 4 April 1905, 8 (B)). At the Annual Meeting 1906-07, WMC President, Mrs. Sanford Evans, commented on the special circumstances and opportunity that presented itself before the club. Winnipeg’s economy was booming, the population rapidly growing, and the prominence of the city rising. She stated:

> Perhaps in no city on the continent is a club such as this called to be so vital a factor in the artistic life of a community. Our unique position, geographically and commercially, the cosmopolitan nature of our population and the unusually large percentage of persons of

\(^9\) Although the Winnipeg Theatre was the only theatre to present ‘high art’, it also presented many productions that were not. It was part of the Theatrical Syndicate’s chain of theatres, so most of its season was set leaving few options for the local management. Besides, presenting only ‘high art’ would have meant financial failure. Mrs. Walker felt obligated to educate Winnipeg’s concert attending audiences, attempting to raise their interest in high-art drama and musical productions through writing informative and educational articles on music and theatre reviews of Walker Theatre productions in the society magazine, Town Topics.

\(^10\) Harriet Walker was probably referring to the production, The Hottest Coon in Dixie, which offered a chorus of dusky maidens or ‘the Tenderfoot’, advertised as an operatic comedy, which had been performed multiple times in Winnipeg (Winnipeg Theatre, MFP, 11 November 1905, 8 (G)).
culture and experience make our position one of responsibility to the greatest promise (Music and Drama – G, *MFP*, 4 April 1905, 8 (A-B)).

While still financially unable to engage a ‘big name’ performer, the club executive followed a different path. Rubin Goldmark’s lectures on Wagner presented an important educational opportunity within their budget. Since he was lecturing on *Parsifal* in St. Paul in February 1905, he agreed ‘to come to Winnipeg at a greatly reduced rate’ (Hypatia, ‘Through Milady’s Lorgnette’, *MFP*, 14 January 1905, 8 (A)).

The arrangements were completed with Goldmark’s fee fixed at what was deemed the reasonable price of $300. The four evening lecture-recitals were offered as additional fare to the weekly meetings and open to the public. The ticket price was set at $2.00 for the series and the dates confirmed for February 17, 18, 20, and 21, 1905. The event was advertised for weeks prior to Goldmark’s arrival through short articles in the *Manitoba Free Press* and other local papers. The publicity was well designed, quoting glowing reviews of lectures presented in numerous American cities – Washington, Salt Lake, and New York City. The *Musical Courier*, a preeminent New York music trade publication praised Goldmark’s delivery through well-chosen language, his ‘perfect’ knowledge of the subject, and his ample pianistic ability (Music and Drama – C, *MFP*, 04 February 1905, 8 (B)). Another article urged the purchase of tickets sooner than later as the lists were selling rapidly (Music and Drama – B, *MFP*, 28 January 1905, 27 (B)). Winnipeg audiences were encouraged to attend as ‘the privilege of listening to such lectures [was] not too frequent [an] occurrence in Winnipeg’ (Music and Drama – B, *MFP*, 28 January 1905, 27 (B)). Goldmark’s affiliation with the Henry W. Savage English Opera Company suggested prestige and acclaim, even though in musical circles his own professional credentials would have been more than sufficient. Critical to the WMC’s higher purpose of education through ‘high art’ is found in the quote from New York’s *Musical Courier*. ‘They [the lectures on the Ring cycle by Wagner] have done more than anything else to pave the way for a successful opera season’ (Music and Drama – C, *MFP*, 04 February 1905, 8 (B)). While the Walker Theatre promoted some high art culture, an opera season presenting opera, rather than operetta, had been an elusive aspiration.
For the members of the WMC Executive, remembering they were some of the better musically educated of the group, the nineteenth-century value of self-improvement was essential. Attending lectures on various topics provided one way of self-education. Evans, who was WMC president in 1904, was an accomplished musician. The lectures on Wagner would have been of great interest to her and other active members. By expanding their knowledge of this particular subject they would be able to gradually educate the membership, influencing reception of classical singing within the context of opera.

Wagner was stylistically complex compared to Winnipeg’s average fare of Gilbert and Sullivan operas and may have been out of the realm of understanding for many of the associate members. Furthermore, four lectures in five days demanded an enormous time commitment. Moreover, some of the associate members belonged to the WMC because it provided ‘a place to be seen’, an exclusive club, and a necessary step upward on the social ladder. Would these people support the endeavour of their Executive?

Prior to engaging Goldmark, the Executive had demanded a guarantee of $300 in ticket sales, pressuring the associate members, a tactic that was sometimes required especially when out of their realm of musical comfort. This and more was received, allowing this series to at least be financially neutral, unlike the previous guest concert that had left the club with a $64 deficit. Nevertheless, given the considerable amount of advertising and the ticket sales, the initial audience numbers must have been disheartening. C.W. Handscomb, writer of the ‘Music and Drama’ column in the Manitoba Free Press strongly chastised the readership.

It must be quite an experience for an artist who is accustomed to facing an audience that fills a large theatre, to come to Winnipeg and give his famous lecture recitals in a small auditorium with an audience that scarcely fills three-quarters of it. To be sure it was an appreciative audience … but the numbers hardly warranted any hope of Winnipeg being a musical centre in the near future at any rate (Music and Drama – D, MFP, 20 February 1905, 3 (D)).
Then the tone of the article changed to address the misconceptions about Wagner's operas, commenting that 'the general public feels that one must be a musician to appreciate Wagner's operas, and no doubt that is true to a certain extent', but quickly adding 'but it is not true of Mr. Goldmark’s lectures' (Music and Drama – D, MFP, 20 February 1905, 3 (D)). Rubin Goldmark delivered the lectures in a seemingly entertaining fashion, in which he provided a synopsis of each opera, demonstrated the connections between individual plots to the overall storyline while ‘painting vivid word-pictures of the stage settings’ (Mr. Harold..., MFP, 21 February 1905, 3 (C)). The review of his lecture on Die Walküre indicates that Goldmark introduced the audience to the concept of the leitmotive, as a melodic fragment imbued with meaning, by performing the themes and demonstrating how each portrayed certain characters and the different emotions assigned to them. He continued by playing specific works, for example, ‘The Ride of the Valkyries’, and then discussed some of the connections between, and the thematic transformations of the same leitmotives. ‘The bewildering and intensely picturesque beauty of the music [was] made so simple by his [Goldmark’s] explanations and illustrations that one who has never studied music at all can understand and fully enjoy the beautiful themes’ (Music and Drama – D, MFP, 20, February 1905, 3 (D)). This simplistic introduction to Wagner’s ideal of Gesamtkunstwerk was critical to a more sophisticated understanding of Wagnerian opera within Winnipeg cultural circles.

At the end of third lecture, an announcement was made. Goldmark would remain in Winnipeg for an extra day and give a final address on another Wagner opera, Parsifal. The event was deemed sufficiently important for the Winnipeg College of Music to postpone their junior recital, primarily because some teachers involved in the recital were WMC members (Music and Drama – E, MFP, 22 February 1905, 3 (C)).

For thirty years after Wagner’s death, the Bayreuth Festival had maintained a monopoly on Parsifal, a fact that may have added interest to Goldmark’s address. In December 1903, while still under copyright, the opera had received its unauthorized American premiere at the New York Metropolitan Opera, staged by
Savage’s company.\footnote{11} Within one month of Goldmark’s visit to Winnipeg, Parsifal, performed in English, triumphantly opened in Minneapolis (Music and Drama – F, MFP, 20 March 1905, 8 (C)).

The lecture series, considered as an attempt to demystify Wagner’s musical language, introduced club members and the wider community to Richard Wagner’s Ring cycle, a work that was pivotal in the evolution of musical style in the nineteenth century. It is highly likely the lectures fulfilled the personal interests of the Executive, as some were drawn to modern music. On another level, the intensity of the programming (five lectures in six days) and the subject choice illustrates the WMC’s uncompromising approach to shaping the reception of high art music by pushing boundaries, including that of comprehension. In 1907, when reporting on the programming of the WMC’s weekly meetings, a Winnipeg music critic (probably C.H. Handscomb) remarked,

Concert programmes must be designed to attract a mixed audience, and the artist is limited to such music as will suit the varied taste of his listeners. But there [are] no such limitations here [meaning the WMC]. Whatever best illustrates the plan laid down by the committee, provided it maintains the high degree of excellence required, finds a place. Much new work is thus heard (Women’s Musical Club, MFP, 06 April 1907, 29 (B)).

The active members planned to reinforce Goldmark’s discussions in their weekly meetings soon after the completion of the lecture series. The WMC’s final meeting of the 1904-05 season featured the music of Wagner, specifically piano transcriptions of the two choruses – one each from Das Rheingold and Götterdämmerung (AM, WMC, MG10/C7, File 7, Scrapbook 1906-1959, p. 4).\footnote{12}

\footnote{11} The premier was 24 December 1903 with single performances each week for the following five weeks.
\footnote{12} Between 1906 and the beginning of World War I, club records and newspaper articles indicate that only two performances of music from the Ring cycle appeared in the programming of the WMC. These include ‘Siegmund’s Love Song’ from Die Walküre, sung by Mr. Joseph Granbeck, a guest artist at the weekly meeting of November 25, 1912, and the piano transcription ‘Magic Fire’ arranged by Brassin and performed by pianist Miss Macdowell at a community concert supported by the WMC on February 1, 1914. Other performances may have occurred as not all the WMC meetings were
The Goldmark lectures were deemed such a success that he was re-engaged for the 1905-06 season. At the cusp of January and February 1906, he presented lecture-recitals on three additional Wagner operas *Die Meistersinger von Nürnberg, Lohengrin and Tristan und Isolde*.\(^{13}\) The dates were critical. Winnipeg’s first grand opera festival, presented by Henry W. Savage and his English Opera Company, commenced on March 5th, 1906, ran for three days and presented five operas. The opening production was Wagner’s *Lohengrin*, followed by Puccini’s *La Bohème*, Verdi’s *Rigoletto*, Gounod’s *Faust*, and Wagner’s *Tannhäuser*.

The exclusive nature of this event cannot be ignored. The prices from $1 for unreserved seating to $4 for box seating were nearly four times more expensive than the regular theatre prices at the Winnipeg Theatre that ranged from 25 cents to $1.50, and many times more expensive than at the popular vaudeville theatre, the Dominion, where seats cost from 10 to 25 cents (*MFP*, 17 March 1906, 9 (C)). Clearly, only the financially elite attended the opera.

The WMC did not have any direct influence on the repertory presented by the Winnipeg Theatre. However, their interest in the reception of opera within the wider Winnipeg community was duly noted and supported by the press. The WMC’s interest in high art, Mrs. Walker as an associate member in the club and co-owner of the Winnipeg Theatre, Rubin Goldmark as a spokesperson for Henry W. Savage English Opera Company, and the opera company’s affiliation with the Theatrical Syndicate created a web of connections and a momentum that brought ‘high art’ in the form of grand opera to Winnipeg.

*Interlude 1912-1913*

By the 1912-13 season, the WMC’s membership had risen to 657, of which 117 were active members, 523 were associate members, and fifteen were student members. The number of club events fluctuated slightly from year to year. The

\(^{13}\) A fourth lecture on national elements in music, supported by WMC members singing folk songs from numerous countries – Hungary, Italy, Sweden and France, provided lighter fare and rounded out the series.
1912-13 season comprised nineteen meetings, four guest recitals and numerous open days. The weekly meetings remained exclusively for members, except for Open days when the public could attend upon purchase of a $1 ticket.

The club continued to present guest artists, with the firm intent to educate and inspire their audience, members and non-members alike. On 4 November 1912, American baritone Marcus Kellerman, well known to Winnipeg audiences because of his prior city concert engagements (1910 and 1911), was contracted as the guest artist for the WMC’s first open meeting of the season. Kellerman’s voice was described in the San Francisco Call as ‘mellow, almost mellifluous with the sensuous charm of the Italian, but is also deeply expressive and powerful’ (Kellerman, Marcus ‘Press Notice’, n.d.). The repertoire was standard for the period, particularly for an afternoon concert and expressly for a women’s musical club. It comprised a combination of parlour songs, such as ‘Mamy’s Song’ by Harriet Ware, Lieder including ‘Die Rose, Lilie, die Taube, die Sonne’ from Dichterliebe by Robert Schumann, and lighter fare, for example, ‘Pirate Song’ by American composer Henry R. Gilbert, and the popular ‘Invictus’ by Bruno Huhn, recognized as such because of its repeat performance by WMC guest artists, including soprano Mabel Beddoe in 1910.

The second guest concert for the season presented the American composer and pianist Charles Wakefield Cadman (1881-1926), assisted by the soprano Harriet Marple (dates unknown). As a composer of high art music, he wrote for nearly every genre, yet, it was his interest in American aboriginal music, and its inclusion in his compositions, that brought him early recognition. For a period he had lived with the Omaha and Winnebago tribes studying their musical styles and making ethnographic cylinder recordings for the Smithsonian Institute. From 1909 to 1923 Cadman travelled North America, with a stop in Winnipeg, giving a lecture recital, titled ‘American Indian Music Talk’ on American aboriginal music, and illustrating how he had incorporated aspects into his compositions (Campbell and Tawa, OMO, 2015).

The Winnipeg Tribune’s music critic, Chas Wheeler, belittled Cadman’s attempt, remarking that ‘the subject is of such vast extent that even this learned and original musician had to confine himself to a few trivial examples of Omaha, Winnebago and Ojibway songs with his own fanciful ideas in adapting the curious tonal themes [into his work]’ (Chas. Wheeler, ‘Music and Drama’, WT, 10
Michael Pisani (2008) successfully argues that Cadman’s interest in American aboriginal music is connected to 19th-century Romanticism, and the use of folk music in the development of national styles. It also represents the long 19th-century interest in exoticism that would, in my opinion, have had continued appeal with the members of the WMC. Cadman’s subject being unordinary fare for the WMC may well have drawn in a broader audience base.

Cadman’s song ‘From the land of the sky blue water’, one of the four of the song cycle Four American Indian Songs, Opus 54, published in 1909, was popularized in part via an April 1910 recording by the famous American soprano Lillian Nordica. This song entered the repertoire of the WMC only a few months later, when, on 07 November 1910, Toronto soprano Mabel Beddoe, performed it and two others from the song cycle, in a WMC guest artist concert. ‘From the land of the sky blue water’ was sung at least two more times in WMC events: on 04 January 1915 by New York tenor Craig Campbell, and on 01 March 1915, by soprano Louise Mackay. While the WMC purported to be interested in shaping high art in the city, the club was not adverse to other music, depending upon what they perceived its status to be. It appears that songs sung by Nordica garnered status, reinforced through performance by WMC’s guest artists.

The other guest artists of the 1912-13 WMC season were not singers, but are included here to underscore the discrepancies that existed between the musical and social worlds inhabited by the WMC and others of their class in Winnipeg during first decades of the twentieth century. Tina Ramanarine (2007) uses the concept of ‘calibrations’ that emphasizes the minute changes between these two worlds, and ‘on the contradiction between discourses’ (6).

American violinist, Louis Persinger (1887-1966) and pianist, Croatian/Austrian Milan Sokoloff, both recent graduates of the Conservatories of Leipzig and Brussels (WT, 26 January 1909, 7 (E)) came to Winnipeg in 1908 to teach at the newly established Imperial Academy of Arts and Music (MFP, 12 December 1908, Sec 2, 3 (F-G)). After an unknown period in Winnipeg, Persinger

14 An incomplete list of other Cadman songs included in WMC weekly meetings or guest artist concerts include ‘The White dawn is stealing’ (07 November 1910), The Moon Drops Low (07 November 1910, 04 January 1915), ‘Far off I hear a Lover’s Flute’ (19 January 1914, 10 March 1915), ‘I hear a thrush at eve’ (19 January 1914), the song cycle Idylls of the South Sea (29 November 1920) and an unknown title from Four American Indian Songs, Op. 45 (18 February 1918).
moved to the USA in order to pursue a performance career, returning to perform occasionally in Winnipeg. Louis Persinger is remembered primarily as the teacher of Yehudi Menuhin, who wrote that Persinger ‘has done perhaps more than anyone else to establish a genuine American school of violin playing’ (Boris Schwarz, OMO, 2015). Accompanying Persinger at the Winnipeg concert of 03 February 1913 was Russian born, American Jew Samuel Chotzinoff (1889-1964), who had studied piano in New York. He came to prominence as an accompanist, touring with Jascha Heifitz in 1919.

The final guest artist concert/open day of the season, dated 17 March 2013, featured pianist Milan Sokoloff, a Winnipeg piano teacher, who had been heard various times at WMC meetings, showcasing his students and playing second piano for transcriptions of operatic solos (Women’s Musical Club – A, MFP, 21 November 1911, 2 (B)). Assisting him in the performance was Minneapolis bass Mr. Knudson, who sang high art repertoire, i.e., Schubert's ‘Die Lotusblüme’ and ‘Der Doppelgänger’ from Schwanengesang (News Notes and Comments, WT, 15 March 1913, Sec 2, 15 (A)).

All four concerts are distinct, making for a diverse season. The American influence remained strong, with all artists but Sokoloff, considering their nationality, if not their ethnicity, American. American musicians, trained at home and/or abroad, continued to influence the shaping of high art music within the elite world of the WMC. However, the dichotomy between representations and realities comes to the fore, when examining the discriminatory attitudes held by many Brito-Canadians towards eastern European immigrants. While referring to the average working class immigrant as ‘these foreigners’ (Annual Report, 1913-14, AM, WMC, MG10 C7/3, File 14), the WMC, in engaging Sokoloff and Chotzinoff as guest artists, considered only their capability as musicians, rather than their status as immigrants. The men gained entry into the dominant culture through their status as high art musicians.

Persinger can be heard on YouTube www.youtube.com/watch?v=9t1MgPz-SEE, as concert master and solo violin with the San Francisco Symphony in the recording of Rimsky-Korsakov’s Capriccio Espagnol, conducted by Hertz.

Between 1909 and 1915, the many musical activities of Milan Sokoloff are reported widely in the Winnipeg Tribune. After that period, he appears to have left the city for the USA. Newspaper notices indicate he also taught in Cleveland, USA (Studio Notes, WT, 6 September 1919, 24 (C)).
The WMC still remained the exclusive domain for certain Brito-Canadians, meaning those who were already part of Winnipeg’s economic and political elite, and for others who strove to climb the social ladder. This was not about to change, but a social movement had been developing in the city in response to the high immigration levels of non-English speaking peoples, that would demand the attention of the club’s Executive and its active members. The bias against non-British immigrants so strongly rooted in the psyche of Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadians seemed of little consequence when choosing guest artists. However, the social problems caused by high levels of immigration to the city came to bear upon the WMC, pinpointing the tension between exclusivity and education.

Case Study 2: The North End Extension Work
Between 1900 and 1910 Winnipeg’s population had exploded from 50,000 to 136,000, and by 1911, 19% of Winnipeg’s population were immigrants from continental Europe. When the Canadian government’s aggressive immigration policies failed to attract the volume of the ‘preferred’ Northern European immigrants (Germans, Austrians and British) needed to settle the west, their sights moved to Eastern Europe. However the Poles and Ukrainians were considered by many to be a lesser class of immigrant (Artibise, 1984, Smith, 2009). They struggled with a myriad of issues from housing to language, education and employment. A dichotomy developed in the Brito-Canadian community, whereby their prejudice against non-British immigrants was coloured by a concern for the maintenance of Canadian values, meaning those defined by Brito-Canadian ideals.

In the 1910s, the suffrage movement began to attract women and men of Protestant, Anglo-Saxon origins, most of whom belonged to the educated urban middle-class – ‘professionals, clergymen, a few reform-minded businessmen and their wives’ (Bacchi, 1976, 433). The suffragette agenda grew to one of broad social reform; while retaining the earlier goal of votes for women, it also embraced work-place safety, public health, child labour, prohibition of the production and sale of alcohol, prostitution and the ‘Canadianization’ of immigrants (Elections Canada, 2007, 64-65). There was a growing fear amongst the social activists that city planners would not address the basic needs of the newcomers in a timely manner. This would encourage ethnic enclaves and discourage full integration leading to
the erosion of Canadian values. This developed into a significant concern for all
classes of Winnipeg's Brito-Canadian community, now a minority group, as
immigration had reshaped the demographics of the city (Artibise, 1984).

Some church groups became active developing social programs in the
North End. Established in 1892, the All People’s Mission began as a Methodist
Sunday school, an outreach programme intended for immigrant children that
became a non-denominational community centre. Between 1907 until 1913,
mission superintendent, J.S. Woodworth, developed many non-denominational
humanitarian programs to help immigrants integrate more quickly to Brito-
Canadian society (Dooley, 2008).

In May 1913, J.S. Woodsworth and WMC active member Miss Falconer, a
volunteer at the All People’s Mission, approached the WMC with a proposal that
would extend their influence, by providing concerts as part of an outreach
program. Middle and upper class women, encouraged by the broader suffrage
movement, were often involved in charitable work. The WMC’s project, titled the
North End Extension Work provided a way in which they could offer service.

The concert series was established under the umbrella of the People’s
Forum, founded by J.S. Woodworth of the All People’s Mission. The Forum strove
to impart the values of Brito-Canadian culture, significantly that of a robust work
ethic and the ideals of temperance and care of family, to immigrants through its bi-
weekly lecture and discussion series that covered a variety of subjects, ‘political
theory, current events, literature and music’ (Dooley, 2008 – B).17 Speakers were
chosen frequently, but not exclusively from the dominant community, for example,
John Dafoe, the editor of The Manitoba Free Press.18 The Sunday afternoon
lectures were often followed by an evening concert that featured music and dance
from one of the immigrant communities.

The WMC’s North End Extension Work offered free concerts two Sundays a
month throughout the winter season of 1913-14. The inaugural concert on the
afternoon of 16 November 1913 was not that well attended. The WMC realised
that their advertising in English through the People’s Forum advertisements in the
Brito-Canadian papers was not reaching the class of people for which the concerts

17 For more information on the activities of the All People’s Forum, see Chris Dooley,
2008 – A.
18 Dafoe’s wife would become the President of the WMC (1920-1923).
were intended (Special Features, AM, WMC, MG10 C7/2, File 9). Changing plans, some 3,000 handbills were printed in four languages (Ruthenian, English, German and Polish) and circulated to the target audience living in the North End.\footnote{In early twentieth-century Winnipeg, ‘Ruthenian’ described an eastern Slavic ethnic group, mainly Ukrainians, who emigrated from an area that today includes the Ukraine, Belarus and parts of western Russia.} A full house, of approximately 700 people, mainly children, attended the second concert on 30 November 1913 (The City Today, \textit{WT}, 01 December 1913, 6 (B)). The WMC was committed to achieving success with the North End Extension Work programmes.

According to the project plan of two concerts monthly, there should have been nine or ten concerts between November 1913 and the end of March 1914. There is no record of individual concert programmes in the WMC archives, and little coverage in the local papers – only four superficial reviews in The \textit{Manitoba Free Press}. These short articles list the program, the club and guest performers, with some commentary on which number was preferred, as indicated through the amount of applause. \textit{The Winnipeg Telegram} offers even less, listing primarily the program and performers. Through this small sampling of news articles and the WMC annual records for 1913-14, some conclusions can be made about programming, reception, and the place of song within this concert series.

The WMC perceived that the North End ethnic communities had ‘little time for the pursuit of high culture or pursuit of the high arts’ (\textit{Annual Report} 1913-14, 3). This was probably true amongst the adults, but not having the time for high art, and not having any understanding of high art are entirely two different points. The presumption that all Slavic and Jewish immigrants were poorly educated, in part because of their economic and language situations, was exacerbated by the prejudice encouraged through ‘venomous racist comments’ that circulated in the Brito-Canadian press until World War I (Hyrniuk and Strambrook, 2009, 460). There were high art musicians living and working in the North End. In 1914, the European School of Music situated in the heart of the North End headed by pianist Helen Saslazsky (probably a misprint for Sazlavsky) and violinist Prof. Gorbovitzky
– Jews from Germany and Russia respectively – had been teaching students for at least one year. (Professor Gorbovitsky, WT, 07 March 1914, 3, (C)).

By examining the choice of vocal repertoire presented in the concerts, it is possible to come to some conclusions about the role of song to suggest that the WMC harboured some misconceptions about North End citizens and their knowledge of high art music. Over the four concerts, there were twenty-four solo songs sung by eleven different singers in sixteen separate program items. Two selections were listed as TBA (to be announced); those titles were not revealed in the reviews and have not been included in this analysis. However, solo songs still represent just over half of the forty individual performances on the four programs. This did not typify the programming the club’s weekly meetings, but reflected standard practice for variety concerts of this era.

Reflecting upon the fact that the majority of songs in this program series were ballads, it seems as though the WMC thought the audience would be more familiar with this type of song. It is highly likely that some of the audience members would have attended vaudeville shows and were familiar with many popular ballads. In one sense, the choice of ‘song’ offered a place of security after which more complex musical forms could be introduced, or subsequently a place of return and repose after such an experience. Depending upon the song it may have also effected certain emotions. See Figure 3 (page 89) for a list of songs performed in the four concerts.

This hypothesis is supported by the order of music in all four programs, in which the structure appears calculated to provide a gentle ebb and flow, encouraging the audience to expand their listening experience, but never to be overwhelmed. After the opening ‘tone setting’ work, the next piece was consistently a ballad sung in English. Many were well known and would have been performed by amateur and professional musicians in virtually all communities in

---
20 Both Gorbovitzky and Sazlawsky are not listed in the 1911 census leading to the presumption that they arrived after 1911, or their names were spelled differently at that time. In 1926, Prof Gorbovitzky teamed up with WMC soprano Mrs. Burton Kurth, pianist Leonard Heaton and numerous other musicians to perform a concert for Dr. Chaim Zhitlovsky, a noted Yiddish philospher and author. The association with highly proficient Brito-Canadian musicians confirms his status as a well-trained musician.
North America. A prime example is the parlour song ‘A Perfect Day’ by Carrie Jacobs-Bond (1862-1946).21

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song Title</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It is not because your Heart is Mine</td>
<td>Lohr</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romance</td>
<td>Schumann</td>
<td>Lieder</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Still, wie die Nacht</td>
<td>Bohm</td>
<td>Lieder</td>
<td>German</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Perfect Day</td>
<td>Bond</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irish Love Song</td>
<td>Lang</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beloved, It is Morn</td>
<td>Aylward</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Holy City</td>
<td>Adams</td>
<td>Art Song</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heilige Nacht</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>Religious</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For the Lord is Mindful of his Own</td>
<td>Mendelssohn</td>
<td>Oratorio</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O Liebe diché</td>
<td>Grieg</td>
<td>Lieder</td>
<td>German</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dawn</td>
<td>Attrib. J.C. Bach</td>
<td>Art Song</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown Eyes</td>
<td>Teresa del Riego</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berceuse</td>
<td>Goddard</td>
<td>Aria</td>
<td>French</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frühlingzeit</td>
<td>Becker</td>
<td>Lieder</td>
<td>German</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindoo Song</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grass and Roses</td>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du Bist die Ruh</td>
<td>Schubert</td>
<td>Lieder</td>
<td>German</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Dream</td>
<td>Rubenstein</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Nettle Song</td>
<td>Burr...(illegible)</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mon désir</td>
<td>Nevin</td>
<td>Art Song</td>
<td>French</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O For a Burst of Song</td>
<td>Allison</td>
<td>Ballad</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3: List of Songs Performed in the Four North-End Extension Work Concerts

The paradigm of ‘ebb and flow’ – more complex music alternating with more simple music – occurs in all programs, with the clearest example from the November 30th concert. See Figure 4 (page 90) for the November 30th concert programme. The first work, the complex double quartet ‘Crucifixus’ from an untitled

---

21 Bond had already established herself as a successful parlour song composer when this song was published in 1910. Its popularity soared and within one year over eight million copies of sheet music and five million recordings had been sold (Carrie Jacobs-Bond Finding Aids, 3, Library of Congress).
mass with text in Latin, served to establish the club’s status. Selections 3, 6, 8, and 9 were instrumental compositions. The interspersed vocal selections included four English ballads. Sandwiched between a piano solo and the Bond ballad was ‘Still wie die Nacht’ (Still as the Night) by Carl Bohm, the only German Lied on the program.22

Although Bohm (1844-1920) is largely unknown today, he was a renowned and financially successful composer of his day. So prosperous was he that his publisher Simrock remarked that the revenues from Bohm paid for the publication of Brahms (Bohm, Carl, OCM, 118). ‘Still wie die Nacht’, No. 27, Opus 326, was published in 1913 in German with English and French translations. The currency of the publication date signifies its status as novel and highlights the WMC’s interest and capacity to access new music. Considered a Lied, the song was published in volumes of art songs for young singers alongside Schubert’s ‘Was ist Silvia’ and Schumann’s ‘Die Lotus Blüme’ well into the 1930s.23

North End Extension Concert
Grand Theatre
Sunday, November 30, 1913

1) Double Quartet      Crucifixus        Palestrina
2) Song               It is not because your heart is mine      Löhr
3) Piano              Romance          Schumann
4) Song (cello oblig.) Still, wie die Nacht     Bohm
5) Song               A Perfect Day     Bond
6) Violin              Liebesfreund     Kreisler
7) Song               An Irish Love Song     Lang
8) Piano              Romanz Op. 24 #9     Sibelius
9)                    Largo          Handel
10) Violin             ‘Oriental’ Kaleidoscope Op. 50 #9     Ceasar
11) Song               Beloved, it is Morn     F. Aylward

Figure 4: North End Extension Programme, 30 November 1913.

22 There was one Lied on each programme in this series. This song was recorded by Richard Tauber, Emma Eames, Ernestine Schumann-Hinck and other renowned singers, keeping its popularity alive for the first half of the twentieth-century.
23 ‘Still wie die Nacht’ was published in Art Songs for School and Studio. Boston: Oliver Ditson and Company, 1930.
Whether the song was sung in German or English is of specific importance in this case. Although the title was written in German in the programme, there is no definitive evidence that it was sung in German. However, a review of a WMC weekly meeting provided a clue that supports this song being sung in its original language, noting that a song sung with a German title ‘was sung in German’ (Women’s Musical Club - B, *MFP*, 6, (D)). Logically, this meant that a *Lied* titled in English was sung in translation. Of significance was the singer, Kate Hemming, known in Winnipeg as a recitalist who performed songs in their original language, unlike other WMC singers, Mrs. Counsell and Mrs. Fortin whose repertoires indicate they, rarely sang in any language other than English (Miss Hemmings Recital, *WT*, 25 February 1914, 6, (D)). For the audience, some of whom would have spoken German as their first or even second language, a song written by a contemporary German composer, sung in German may well have been evocative, offering a sense of ‘home’ within the foreignness of Winnipeg. For the WMC, songs sung in their original language was gaining credence, a reflection of their high art taste.

In conclusion, the role of song was three-fold. The ballads and art songs provided a place of comfort from which to embark or return from a journey of musical exploration, while the performances of the operatic and oratorio arias may have expanded the audience’s knowledge of vocal repertoire. For some members of the audience, the *Lieder* would have offered a connection to their homeland.

Throughout these concerts the WMC maintained their Victorian values of ‘improvement’ by giving their members more opportunities to perform, and by broadening their horizons to include philanthropy outside their social milieu. It is possible that by doing this work, they came to see the ‘foreign’ residents in a different light. At the annual meeting of 1913-14, WMC President Mrs. Higginson remarked that despite the considerable expense of the project, ‘the Board feels that they have been justified, in that they [the WMC] have strengthened their stakes and lengthened their cords in extending the uplift of music to these men and women of other nations’ (*Annual Report* 1913-14, 9). She encouraged the club to dwell ‘upon the success of the North end Extension Work, reading [from] an editorial from one of the dailies which highly commended the Club’s move in this direction’ (*Annual Report* 1913-14). The Club had planned to continue the concerts in the following year, but plans were curtailed because of the outbreak of
war. However, they were committed to return to the program once the war had ceased. The tensions between their status as elitists and their interest in broader education would remain contested, but other concerns took precedence during the dark years of the war.

Interlude: Winnipeg 1914

During the hot Winnipeg summers, the economic elite of the city enjoyed the season at their lakeside cottages, some 200 kilometers to the east of Winnipeg. In the summer of 1914, lakeside conversations would have turned to the state of affairs in Europe. After Britain’s declaration of war against Germany on 04 August 1914, WMC member Irene Evans, in a letter to her husband, wrote, ‘I dread the return to the city…. The Moon almost full – such peace – the world beyond in a nightmare…’ (Letter from Irene Evans to Husband, 1914, cited in Blanchard, 2010, 11). Upon returning to Winnipeg, Evans, entered into a space of rupture disguised as patriotic enthusiasm.

From across Canada, fully 23,211 of the 36,267 men in the first contingent that sailed to England in October 1914 were born in Great Britain and had migrated to Canada (Blanchard, 2010, 39). Western Canada’s contribution equalled 15.5 percent of the total. This reflected the demographics of the period when a quarter of Canada’s male population between the ages of eighteen and forty-five resided in western Canada (39). Included in this group were husbands and male children of WMC members (Blanchard, 2010, 11).

In her opening speech at the WMC’s annual meeting of 1914-15, president Mrs. Higginson, remarked, ‘This year, fraught with grave anxieties for everyone, has been felt, too by the Club, who have followed a policy of retrenchment wherever possible’ (Annual Report – A, 1914-15, 8). The club, while maintaining over 500 members, had cancelled all outside engagements, used local artists where possible, reduced membership fees, and through their revised concert series supported a variety of wartime benevolent funds. WMC Executive successfully managed the club through the first year of the war, retaining the status quo, with 29 cub meetings of which were six guest artist concerts. However,

---

24 The benevolent funds included the Red Cross, Manitoba Patriotic Fund, and the Women’s Hospital Ship (Annual Meeting – C, 1916-17, 12).
the reality of war, the casualties and death toll had yet to truly affect Winnipeg citizens.

One month after the WMC annual meeting in March 1915, during the second major battle of the Ypres salient (22-25 April 1915), Winnipeg lost hundreds of its young men. Only six officers and 231 other ranks, of the 1,000 strong Winnipeg Rifles reported for first parade after the battle (Blanchard, 2010, 92). And this was just the first wartime engagement for Winnipeg regiments. The often cheerful letter home was replaced by the official yellow telegram, the distant imagined European battlefield edged closer, and the home front space of rupture had been ripped wide open.

**Case Study 3: Music Inspired by Childhood**

The ‘homefront’, as a place where non-combatants mobilized in support of the war, is discernable also as sphere of gender dichotomy where traditional identities of women were questioned and new identities were framed. Over the length of the war, most women of the WMC would become involved in a variety of activities, from knitting socks to performing at charity functions, all in support of the war effort. In piloting the club through five years of war, the Executive dutifully and willingly attempted to redefine gender roles, and the relationship between gender and music within their class and by extent, the broader society.

As the war took its toll on all in Winnipeg, the WMC Executive, as women whom by nature and expectation were concerned with the welfare of their families, expanded their programming to include concerts for young children. With a renewed energy they focused on the youth in the club and children in their families and community. This focus may have provided a source of power in an otherwise powerless situation, a way of ‘holding it together’, a means of coping with wartime news.

---

In 1915, the WMC’s pre-war plan to develop a scholarship program was realised. The first recipient, 26-year-old Winnipeg singer Winona Lightcap (1888-1945), who would later be recognized as an influential vocal teacher in the city, travelled to New York in the autumn of the same year, to study for a three-month period with professional reciter, diseuse Kitty Cheatham (1864-1946), acknowledged as the foremost performer and composer of children’s music of her era (Jackson-Martin, 2009). Cheatham, a WMC guest artist in February of 1914, would have appealed to the WMC socially and artistically. Her association, albeit as a performer, with the ethnically exclusive (those of British heritage) Imperial Order of Daughters of the Empire in New York (Society Home and Aboad, New York Times, 18 February 1912, Sec 7, 2 (D)), an international women’s charitable organization with a branch in Winnipeg (established 1914) would have established an ethnic connection, while Cheatham's inclusion in the same social circles as opera singer Lillian Nordica (Activities in Clubland, New York Times, 27 April 1913, Sec 7, 3 (B)) suggests an affiliation with high art.

The WMC Executive would be well served by having a WMC member capable of performing the innovative repertoire. Upon Lightfoot’s return to Winnipeg, the WMC introduced their new programming, three concerts specifically designed for children, emulating the example provided by the New York Symphony, who during their annual season provided recitals for children (Annual Report – A, 1914-15, 9). This case study examines how the WMC used song to encourage the comprehension of ‘art music’ from an early age.

The children’s concerts were open to the public and presented on the club’s regular meeting day and time of Mondays, 3 pm on January 10th, February 7th, and March 13th, 1916, implying that the audience probably consisted of pre-school children, between the ages of four and six years, parents, club members and other adults. Each concert highlighted Lightcap’s newly acquired knowledge of children’s music and by her own admission, the majority were songs written by Cheatham.

While attempting to engage children on their level with age-appropriate repertoire, including but not limited to ‘Shopping for sleep’, ‘Fairy Children’, ‘Cantebury Bells’, Schumann’s ‘Guardian Angels’ and Mozart’s ‘Lullaby’ (Women’s Musical Club, MFP, 08 February 1916, 9, (C); Music Inspired by Childhood, MFP, 14 March 1916, 7 (D-E)), the concerts delivered a well-devised opportunity to commence shaping musical taste in the next generation. Lightfoot had opened the
January 10th concert with the high art song, Tchaikovsky’s ‘Legend’, followed by children’s songs interspersed with instrumental selections that included the piano solo, *The Golliwog’s Cakewalk* by Debussy, an arrangement for two pianos from *The Nutcracker* ballet by Tchaikovsky, and a chamber orchestra arrangement of *Toy Symphony* by Haydn.26 Concert reviewers remarked that Miss Lightcap had achieved the special interpretation required in order for ‘these peculiar songs’ to have an effect upon children (Women’s Musical Club - C, 9 (C); Music Inspire by Childhood, *MFP*, 14 March 1916, 7 (D-E)). A single criticism came from the reviewer J.P. of the *Manitoba Free Press* who felt that the song ‘Le Chat’ (The Cat) should have been sung in English for the benefit of the audience of primarily English-speaking children (Women’s Musical Club –B, *MFP*, 08 February 1916, 9 (C)). On the contrary, singing the song in the language it was written offered the opportunity to introduce a high art convention, the performance of song in its original language.

Club records confirm that 408 children in total attended the concerts, which were deemed financially successful, but more significantly, the concerts made ‘for true educational progress’ (*Annual Report* – B, 1914-15, 12). By broadening the scope of their interests, somewhat outside the boundaries of high art, the WMC had softened their image of exclusivity at least for a short time. Although the vocal repertoire did not represent ‘high art’, a conversation was initiated about professional roles for women singers, not only as ‘serious’ music performers, but also as composers and educators in the field of early music education.

**Interlude: 1916-1917**

The club’s successes during the first two years of the war were overshadowed by the dark reality of a seemingly unending conflict and the apprehension and fear this knowledge conveyed. War does not distinguish between class, and members of the WMC were intimately affected. In 1916, tragedy struck for WMC member Harriet Waugh, wife of the mayor of Winnipeg (1911, 1915-1916) as her eldest son Douglas returned home disabled. In the following year, her second son, Alex, age

---

26 This work has been attributed to Joseph Haydn, but recent scholarship proposes that Leopold Mozart probably wrote the piece, with the toy instrumental parts added by M. Haydn.
22, would be killed at Cambrai (Blanchard, 2010, 11). Events such as these may have conceivably made some people question the war, whether or not their opinions were voiced publicly. For the WMC, it seemed to fuel the club’s sense of duty particularly towards the women in their own social strata.

In the autumn of 1916, the pre-war policy of engaging visiting artists had been revived with a ‘view of helping in the higher education of the young people’ (Annual Report – C, 1916-17, 8). In an address to the club, president Mrs. Higginson reflected upon the previous years, saying,

These years, though fraught with sadness through the horrors of war, can never come again for the rising generation, and in as far as it is possible it is the duty of the Club to counteract the abnormal conditions by bringing into their lives examples of art that will encourage them in their own work (Annual Report – C, 1916-1917 8).

Higginson travelled to New York to network with artist management agencies and returned full of enthusiasm. The club records noted, ‘there was a plethora of artists to choose from’ (Annual Report – C 1916-1917, 8) from which the Executive frequently chose women singers and pianists as role models for their youth, reflecting once again the ingrained 19th-century gender ideals. Over the next three seasons (1916-1917, 1917-1918, 1918-1919), of the eighteen guest artists engaged, ten were women. Of these, six were singers, and only two were not local, New York soprano Emma Roberts (05 March 1917) and Chicago contralto Molly Byerly Wilson (7 January 1918). Often the recitals were shared between two artists, as in the 05 November 1917 concert featuring Winnipeg musicians, pianist Eva Clare and soprano Johanna Filipowska.

I suggest that the WMC Executive sensed the profound changes that the war would have on their way of living and even more for the younger members of the club. As a result of the wartime losses of a generation of men, the chance for women to attain the traditional role of wife and mother was reduced. In the long 19th century, the ability to play an instrument to a high standard had been an asset that made a woman more marriageable. In the 20th century, this same ability would serve a new purpose, that of self-sufficiency. I propose that the WMC
engaged successful women artists, cellist May Mukle, pianist Mrs. Edward MacDowell, sopranos Emma Roberts and Amelita Galli-Curci, not only to encourage the youth of the club, but also as an examples of financial independence.

Case Study 4: Emma Roberts
The contralto from Kentucky, Emma Roberts (no dates available) had made her New York debut in 1916 and her Winnipeg debut in 1917. Through Roberts, the club's agenda of engaging a young artist of great skill to encourage Winnipeg’s young singers was fulfilled. The printed programme for the 05 March 1917 public concert was an educational tool in itself, as it is the first, of all surviving WMC programmes of this period, to include translations of foreign language texts, making the song texts accessible to all. For a late afternoon concert, Roberts’ repertoire was well chosen. The program began with 18th-century Italian songs that would have been well known, followed by two contemporary French chansons, and a series of British folk songs and ballads of a lighter vein. This format was standard programming for the period, altering art songs and ballads, the familiar with the un-familiar. See Appendix 1 for Robert’s concert programme. The music critic for the Manitoba Free Press approved of the repertoire, declaring, ‘It was not only eclectic in its constructive character…it was arranged with evident regard for the tastes and whims of an audience, no matter how fickle’ (RJ, ‘Emma Roberts Delights…’, MFP, 6 March 1917, 6 (B)). In this instance, fickle might have indicated lacking in high art knowledge.

That same evening, under the patronage of the Duchess of Devonshire (Lady Evelyn Cavendish (1870-1960)), Roberts featured at a private gala concert performed by members of the WMC. At the request of the Duchess, this WMC organized concert celebrated her husband’s visit to Winnipeg in the high status capacity as Governor General of Canada, which at the time was the most significant political appointment in Canadian and British Empire relations. Robert’s repertoire included two songs by contemporary composers, ‘The Year’s at the Spring’ by American Amy Beach, and ‘The Eagle’ by Canadian George Grant-Schaefer (1872-1939), who, at the time was the head of the vocal department at North Western School of Music, in Evanston, Illinois which
illustrates once again the intricacies of transnational movement and relationships between Americans and Canadians. Robert’s repertoire choice infers that she might have been a political person. By choosing compositions written by political neighbours, a fostering of American, Canadian and British relations is suggested, given the strong possibility that British and Canadian nationalities meant one and the same to Roberts.

Conversely, these two songs, both under one and half minute in length, and contrasting in character showed off Robert’s voice. Her status as a high art performer had been established earlier that day, but not in the presence of the cultured Duchess. Robert’s final song, the aria, ‘Mon coeur s’ouvre à ta voix’, from the opera *Samson and Delilah* by Saint-Saëns may have been indicative of the more high art-oriented company to which she was performing.

The two concerts that featured Roberts also illustrate the tensions between exclusivity and education. The purpose of Robert’s daytime public recital was purely educational. The repertoire was accessible for broad audience appeal, and applicable for youthful voices in training. The evening concert reaffirms the ethnic affiliation and exclusivity of the club. The Duchess, whose political and social status was superior to anyone in the WMC, had turned to the highest status high art group in the city, the economically and politically elite Brito-Canadians who were ever faithful to the ideals of empire.

*Interlude: 1918-1919*

Tensions between exclusivity and education, publically discussed and acted upon since 1914, may have continued to simmer under the surface, hidden by more pressing social, personal and community matters that had arisen during the war years. The incremental movement away from exclusivity mirrored the transition of positions of influence in the club as one generation gave way to the next. The women who were shaping the club towards the end of the war were a mix of both generations, the older women whose cultural norms and attitudes had been formed in the 19th century, and a younger generation, many of whom were more responsive, politically and socially, to the post-war needs of the broader community. Individual members who had sought political equity and social justice
for women, continued to encourage and support the re-evaluation and evolution of women’s traditional roles.27

As the war entered its final year, some members of the WMC focused their energies on a public project, enhancing the provincial secondary school education through the inclusion of music credits. The WMC proposed that music education would no longer be considered a luxury in the post-war world, but a necessity (Annual Report – E, 1918-19, 3). Schools had emerged as ‘the front lines of attempts to spread culture to the masses’ (Regelski, 2006, 4), in response to the sacrilization of high art and its performance spaces which had made high art concerts unavailable to anyone but the rich (Levine, 1998).

Certainly, this scheme ‘to place music as an optional subject in the curriculum of high schools, graded and taught by private teachers’ (Annual Report – E, 1918-19, 4) signified, however naively, an attempt to make individual music lessons easily accessible to more young people of all social classes. On one level, the scheme would advance the knowledge of high art music in the coming generation, the one that would shape the post-war world. On another level, creating a broader income stream would enhance the goal of financial independence for some WMC women. Ironically, while trying to establish the study of music as an inclusive activity, the status of club president, Kathleen Fletcher as the wife of the Deputy of Education for the province of Manitoba, certainly gave credence to the idea that exclusivity of position might well enhance outcome.

As a first step, achieved early in 1919, the WMC, the Winnipeg Pianists’ Association and the Men’s Musical Club, the group that would become responsible for promoting the competitive music festival in Manitoba, developed the first registry of music teachers in Canada. Prospective members were required to achieve the Associate level diploma from the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, England, or from the Toronto Conservatory of Music in Canada, modelled on the British system. This demonstrates the strong connection to Great Britain by the musical elite of Winnipeg, and the presumed superiority of a British

27 Among the names on the first page of a 1915 petition presented to the provincial government of Manitoba by the Manitoba Political Equity League that demanded enfranchisement for women, are members of the WMC, women from politically and economically powerful Winnipeg families: Catherine Bawlf, Annie S. Riley, Jean Culver Riley, and Emily Drewry-Machray (Photograph of Political Equity League, Events, 173/5, 1915).
product, all the while reaffirming their ethnic status as part of the dominant culture. Mrs. Higgison, Mrs. Evans and others in the WMC became MMTA associates. This established a new ‘exclusive’ group, one based on education rather than birthright.

By linking the proposal for music in school curriculum with a ready supply of registered teachers, the viability of the school program was enhanced. One might suggest that students taking music as an optional subject would be taught by the best qualified in the province, and most critical for the WMC, if successful, employment would probably be offered to some of their members. Through dogged perseverance by the three organizations, the first music credits were awarded in Manitoba schools in 1926, taught by members of the MMTA. Unlike the social restrictions placed on women teachers in the classroom, music teachers, no matter their marital status, remained part of the education system.

**Conclusion**

As a summation, the integral elements in this analysis of the Women’s Musical Club and how their activities shaped the vocal culture in Winnipeg are: the cultural and educational aspirations of trans-located, transnational women; the political relationship between Great Britain and Canada; the ties of ethnicity and the ideals of loyalism that bound the Brito-Canadian elite of Winnipeg to the British Empire; the railway to America that facilitated high art musical exchanges with artists of numerous nationalities, the social movements and wartime conditions that splintered some gender and class norms.

In the twenty or so years that had passed between the inauguration of the club in 1894 and the second decade of the 20th century, great social change had shaped Winnipeg’s economic and social elites. In her examination of the role of music in identity construction within personal and social life, Tia DeNora (2000) suggests that music is constitutive of human agency. Her notion of music as an action, rather than a reaction to boundaries and power, is valid in assessing the changes in the club during this quarter century.

The WMC was formed in part because of the boundaries that existed in the social world during the 19th century. These encouraged single gendered associations affiliated with culturally sanctioned activities. Women from the middle and upper classes were expected to be highly proficient pianists and/or singers,
and as prescribed by social norms performed primarily at home or at charity events. The WMC offered a single gendered environment where the club leaders shaped performance practice and repertoire. In the twenty of so years that cover the period of this study, the WMC as impresario engaged many singers of quality – Mabel Beddoe, Emma Roberts and Amelita Galli-Curci, whose repertoire not only illustrated excellent choices for entertaining an audience with a varied high art knowledge, but also expanded the repertoire of WMC members and the broader community to include the contemporary composers Amy Beach, Liza Lehmann, Cécile Chaminade, and Roger Quilter among others. Over the period, the frequency of songs sung in English translation lessened, suggesting that singers received language instruction, and that the preference for the performance of song in its original language had risen.

WMC exclusivity based upon birthright and economic status was a reaction to the fear felt by the Brito-Canadian community to the perceived undermining of their cultural institutions because of the influx of non-British immigrants to Winnipeg. Being resilient yet pliable, the club evolved, adapting to the social and political stresses of the early 20th century. In these spaces of transition, music was constitutive, actions influenced by social and political worlds that encouraged an increased understanding of high art repertoire and performance praxis, all the while shaping and invigorating women’s roles in philanthropy, business, education and the arts. Yet, they remained bound to the long 19th-century gendered musical roles for women. From the start, the WMC had aspired to high cultural standards, setting goals and achieving many. In 1920, even though WMC President, Mrs. Fletcher was speaking specifically about the development of the MMTA and the proposed system of school music credits, her words could apply to the overall success of the club in its first quarter century. She remarked, ‘these achievements are an indication that we stand for bigger things than merely entertaining ourselves with our weekly programmes and our cups of tea’ Annual Report – E, 1918-(19, 3). The successes of the WMC between the late 1800s and the 1920s inspired the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg, the next gendered group who profoundly impacted Winnipeg’s high art vocal culture.
CHAPTER 3: THE MEN’S MUSICAL CLUB OF WINNIPEG

As easily as springtime lilting its way through the city April comes to Winnipeg with its song and its music, the season of festival…. It’s a blending of young voices enjoying the wonderful way that different notes can come together and make harmony. It’s parents understanding the words, and others who can find their meaning in the music alone. The common meaning that tells of winds and bright sun and rich black earth and the prairie harvest coming sweetly (Listen to the Prairies, 1945 (1:21-1:30 and 19:20-19:58)).

Prologue
Between 1880 and 1900, Winnipeg’s population quadrupled to approximately 40,000, attracting immigrants from Great Britain and many entrepreneurial Brito-Canadian migrants from eastern Canada. This economically and demographically dominant British-heritage group established the Brito-Canadian nature of the city. However, their numerical superiority would not last. As immigration to the western plains escalated, Winnipeg, as the commercial centre supporting this settlement process also grew. Immigrants came not only from the preferred countries of Great Britain, USA, Germany and Scandinavia, but also from numerous Eastern-European countries. By 1913, the population of the city had more than tripled from 42,000 in 1901 to 150,000 in 1913, (Artibise, 1984). The 1911 Canadian census indicates that no other city in Canada had a higher proportion of European-born residents. Winnipeg also had the highest percentage of Jews and Slavs (Ukrainians, Poles and Russians) and the lowest proportion of British of any city in English Canada (cited Artibise, 1984). The Brito-Canadian community of Winnipeg had become a demographic minority and their culture was deemed by some to be in peril (Artibise, 1984). Urban historian Alan Artibise (1984) considers that fear of the foreigner was a reason why the Brito-Canadian community became ‘more entrenched in their own group consciousness’ (372). It is into this setting than an alliance of chiefly Brito-Canadian businessmen and male musicians joined forces with the intention of shaping musical taste in their city. Their actions were
influenced by individual and group experiences and their aspirations for the new home of Winnipeg, and were stimulated by their strong sense of belonging, as citizens of the British Empire, shaped by 19th-century cultural and gender norms.

_The Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (MMC)_

On 11 December 1915, the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg was founded by Brito-Canadian middle-class businessmen and high art musicians, exemplifying the continuation of the 19th-century model of homosocial leisure activities that saw the ‘development of formal associations for public life’ (Tosh, 1999, 126), many of which were committed to the improvement of its members or to the reform of society (Tosh, 1999). In the published memoirs of his involvement in the high art music community in Winnipeg, founding member, George Mathieson, wrote, ‘the general desire [of the MMC was] to be recognized as the younger brother of an older sister, the “Women’s Musical Club,” and, as history has proved, no happier title could have been selected’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 3). The MMC aimed to shape the reception of art music in their city according to their Brito-Canadian tastes, mirroring many of the objectives of the Women’s Musical Club, including educating their membership through musical programmes, lectures and discussions on musical topics; assisting musicians of talent and merit resident in the province of Manitoba; performing the role of impresario by engaging distinguished artists to perform in Winnipeg; encouraging and assisting any organization inaugurated in the Province of Manitoba for the promotion, extension, or elevation of the art of music; and discouraging any individual or group that they considered was debasing the art of music in their city (Constitution and Bylaws, UMA, MMC, MSS 11, Box 1).

The MMC may have considered themselves, at least early on in their existence, to be a copy of the Women’s Musical Club. Certainly they followed some of the pathways, such as weekly concert and lecture series open only to members and their guests, and the presentation of musical concerts under the

---

28 G Sharp Major is the pseudonym for George Mathieson, an influential figure in the Men’s Musical Club for nearly 50 years. His book _Crescendo: A Business Man’s Romance in Music._ Winnipeg: Bulman Brothers, 1935, narrates his personal experiences and offers insights into the MMC’s activities during the first fifteen years of the club’s existence.
auspices of the club in support of numerous wartime benevolent funds (Constitution and Bylaws, UMA, MMC, MSS 11, Box 1). However, given their sex and gender role as family provider, club meetings were held on Saturday evenings from October to March, with Ladies Night held on the last Saturday each month, when an invitation to attend club concerts was extended to wives and female friends (Constitution and Bylaws, UMA, MMC, MSS 11, Box 1). While evening meeting arrangements would not have been a consideration for women’s clubs, they were completely appropriate and socially acceptable for men’s clubs of this era (Tosh, 1999).

Another factor that distinguishes the two clubs is based not only upon gender roles, but also societal expectations. During its first two decades of existence, the women’s club had been primarily devoted to the education and development of its members. For the MMC, the distinction between a club committed to improving its membership and one that focused on a broader picture of improvement, education or reform of society was considered vital to the public standing of its middle-class members. The attention to civic duty, ‘to pursue intellectual, political and philanthropic goals … underpinned their claim to be public men and members of the body politic’ (Tosh, 1999, 132). This cultural principle was heightened as a result of the Brito-Canadian community’s fear that the culture of their city, which they considered to be British, was being eroded by the influx of immigrants from non-British backgrounds (Artibise, 1984). It would only be a matter of a few years before the MMC sought to shape Winnipeg’s high art musical world by developing choirs modelled on the English cathedral tradition and festivals that imitated the British amateur festival movement.

Membership
In 1916, membership into the MMC, set at the maximum of 200 individuals, was accomplished initially by invitation, and later on by application. In its first year, there were 120 members. By 1941, 21 of the original members were still active in the club, and in 1941, membership exceeded the original set limit with 264 members.

Members were chosen almost exclusively from the Brito-Canadian business and musical communities. In 1915, most if not all were well respected in their chosen fields, giving status to the new endeavor. All would have been too old to
enlist for service in World War I. Approximately thirty percent of the initial membership were professional musicians, and the others were listed as ‘professional men, lawyers, chartered accountants, ministers, teachers, university professors, doctors, railway men, manufacturers, retail and wholesale dealers, grain men, and newspaper men’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 14).

The club chose, as its first president, the Very Reverend Dean Coombes (1856-1922), born in Stockport, England and educated at Cambridge. From 1911 until his death in 1922, Coombes served as the Dean of St. John’s Anglican Cathedral. Founded in 1820 and the oldest Anglican parish west of Ontario, this was one of the churches at which many of Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadian elite worshiped. Coombes’ position at the Cathedral was, I submit, one way that the club gained immediate status among the Brito-Canadian community.

The three vice-presidents were selected from the musical community. English-born and educated, baritone Robert Watkin-Mills (1849-1930) is recognized today as a ‘full member of that band of oratorio singers, who were the pride of musical England in the Victorian Age’ (J. McPherson, 2007). He achieved success in his solo career as a concert and oratorio singer, becoming identified with works such as Messiah and Judas Maccabaeus. In 1914, he moved to Winnipeg, and accepted the position of choirmaster at Broadway Methodist Church. In 1922, he and his wife Elsie Cantell, singer and organist, moved to Toronto to set up a private vocal studio (J. McPherson, 2007 – A).

Welshman, Dr. Ralph Horner (1848-1926) had studied at the Leipzig Conservatory (1864-1867). Then he attained a Bachelor of Music in 1893, followed by a doctorate in 1898, both from Durham University, England. His portfolio career included directing numerous church and community choirs, directing touring Gilbert and Sullivan productions for the D’Oyly Carte Opera Company, and in 1887, musical direction of the Strand Theatre in London. From 1888, he lectured at the University of Nottingham, where his students included the composer Eric Coates. He arrived in Winnipeg in 1909 as the Director of the Imperial Academy of Music and Arts. From that year until 1914, he was also the musical editor for Winnipeg Town Topics, a weekly paper whose readership included the Brito-Canadian business elite, and in which he wrote many articles on a variety of musical subjects (Ralph Horner, 2007). Horner, a longtime member of
Winnipeg social and musical circles, has been described as ‘Winnipeg’s grand old man of music, and one of her best known citizens’ (Larsen, 2005).

The third vice-president, Montreal-born impresario, musician and retail merchant, Joseph Tees (1862-1922) came to western Canada in the 1880s, and served in the Canadian militia during the North-West Rebellion (1885). Nothing is known of Tees’ formal musical training, however, there is documentation supporting his extensive involvement in Winnipeg’s musical community as a soloist at various churches and as a manager of ‘leading artists on western tours’ (Joseph Tees Dies, MFP, 01 April 1922, 6 (E)). Over his 40-year residency in Winnipeg, and as a purveyor of sheet music, gramophones, and musical instruments, Tees would have acquired a real and effective understanding of the changing musical interests of two generations of Winnipeg consumers. In some ways he served as a barometer of musical taste and as a link to the very community that he and the other MMC members wished to influence.

The positions of treasurer and secretary were allocated to members from the business community. In his professional life, Treasurer, Canadian-born Charles William Nassau Kennedy (1866-1920) was the vice-president of Commercial Loan and Trust, a director in numerous major insurance, real estate and development companies while maintaining a large personal real estate portfolio. His wealth and business acumen were well recognized in Winnipeg society (Mr. Kennedy dies, MFP, 07 May 1920, 3 (A-D)). His civic duties included but were not limited to the musical groups, the City Cadet Band, Kennedy Orchestra, Apollo Club, and Philharmonic Society, thus establishing his credentials as a public man (Goldsborough, 2013 – E).

Chosen as secretary, Scottish-born George Mathieson (1873-1951) immigrated to Canada in 1911, and entered the grain trade business soon after his arrival in Winnipeg. In his professional life, he achieved the vice-presidency of the Norris Grain Company in 1947, and from 1939 to 1941, served as president of the Winnipeg Grain Exchange, Canada’s only agricultural commodities exchange and futures market (Kearns, 2006). In 1944, Mathieson was appointed as the Canadian vice-president on the International Chamber of Commerce (Cummings,

29 The Northwest Rebellion was a violent insurgency between the Canadian government and the Métis and Aboriginals peoples living in what are now the provinces of Saskatchewan and Alberta.
‘Festival Faces…’ *MFP*, 13 March 1949, 11 (F-G)). As a music enthusiast he helped to establish the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra and served on a variety of boards of musical groups, the most significant being as the Secretary of the MMC from 1916 to 1944, when he took on the role of President (Goldsborough, 2014 – F). His more than forty-year commitment to the MMC, significantly as the ‘organizing genius and driving power’ behind the Manitoba Music Competition Festival (Cummings, ‘Festival Faces…’ *MFP*, 13 March 1949; 11 (E)) earned him the title ‘grand old man of the festival movement in Winnipeg and the whole dominion’ (Cummings, ‘Festival Faces…’ *MFP*, 13 March 1949, 11(E)).

Members at large for the first Council of the MMC included but were not limited to the University of Manitoba’s first physiology professor, Dr. Swale Vincent, the English born and Royal Academy of Music trained violinist, John Waterhouse, the English born and Guildhall-trained singer, conductor, and composer, W.H. Anderson, and the only non-Brito Canadian in the club, French-Canadian violinist and luthier Camille Couture. These members of the MMC would shape the club’s vision.

**Club Structure and Activities**

Secretary, George Mathieson considered that the combination of professional musicians and businessmen gave the club vitality (G. Sharp Major, 1935, 14). Indeed, the businessmen ensured that the club structure was based on solid business and financial models, in line with their business activities. In 1916, the annual fees for all members were set at $7 annually, significantly higher than those of the Women’s Musical Club. Fees were not revised until 1965, when they were lowered to $5 annually or $50 for a life membership. This came about because of the club’s successes in strategic financial planning and through the development and structuring of sub-organizations within the club. Each individual entity – the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir (MVC), established in 1916, the Manitoba Music Competition Festival, inaugurated in 1918, and the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir (WPC) – was responsible for its day-to-day running and budget control. (Constitution and Bylaws, UMA, MMC, MSS11 Box 1). This gave members the opportunity to use their individual business skills for the club’s ultimate purpose – to shape Winnipeg’s high art culture, and by extension, the city’s profile as a cultural centre.
The members of the MMC wielded political and financial powers that were bound within an entrepreneurial spirit. They focused on elevating the status of their city by developing and implementing grand civic-minded cultural schemes. It is highly conceivable that they looked to the city of Chicago as their civic model, considering Winnipeg had been given the nickname ‘Chicago of the North’ in 1911, by reporter William E. Curtis, of the Chicago Record Herald (Curtis, 1911 quoted Artibise, 1977, 23).

Before embarking on their civic duties that would shape high art music cultures in Winnipeg, the MMC felt the need to have their own clubhouse, endorsing the 19th-century norms that determined the course of many homosocial activities. This is in contrast to the Women’s Musical Club, which always used a variety of public buildings for their activities, and never considered the need to own, nor would have had the financial means to purchase a clubhouse.

In its first year, the MMC held its meetings in the ballroom of the impressive Royal Alexandra Hotel, built by the Canadian Pacific Railway as a showpiece and considered at its opening in 1906 to be one of finest hotels in Canada (Goldsborough, 2015). Even though it supplied the status requisite for the MMC, it did not fulfill their aspirations as civic men. In 1917, the MMC formed the Music and Arts Company Limited, the purpose of which was to raise capital to purchase the Adanac Club (Canada spelled backwards), the building that housed a Winnipeg exclusive social organization that supported the political party, the Conservative Party of Canada. The Adanac Club was no longer able to carry the expenses on their venue, the former residence of one of Winnipeg’s founding families, entrepreneur and millionaire James H. Ashdown.

Renamed ‘The Music and Arts Building’, it became ‘a specialized music centre in the city’. (G Sharp Major, 1935,11). The venue offered studio space for music teachers and rehearsal space for numerous musical groups, including but not limited to the United Scottish Choir, the Winnipeg Orchestra Club, and the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir. The Recital Hall (the ballroom in Ashdown’s day) was reserved for dances on Friday evening and MMC recitals on Saturday evening. In the early years of the Manitoba Music Competition Festival, the venue would also provide performance space for festival classes (G Sharp Major, 1935, 13). In his memoirs written in 1935, George Mathieson’s remarked that upon the purchase of their club’s home, ‘the business minds of the MMC were now able to move their
plans forward to help develop musical appreciation within the city of Winnipeg’ (12).

The list of MMC’s involvement in civic activities is extensive and varied. They include the joining of forces with the WMC and MMTA to urge the educational authorities to institute music credits in high schools in Manitoba, the support for building the city’s first concert hall, the Winnipeg Auditorium in 1932, being instrumental in the development of the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra established in 1948, and backing the plan for the major expansion to the University of Manitoba’s School of Music in 1967. Much of this came to fruition through their 1944 sponsorship of the formation of the Winnipeg Civic Music League.³⁰ The League served in advisory or active positions in musical matters of civic importance (Gibson and Maley, 2006).

Of their many musical interests, two MMC activities were significant in shaping the high art singing cultures in Winnipeg. These form two intersecting case studies, including the recruiting of young British musicians who influenced the way in which choral music would be performed in Winnipeg, and the development of the Manitoba Music Competition Festival, modeled on the British amateur competition festivals.

Case Study 1: The Development of Winnipeg’s High Art Choral Culture.
The development of Winnipeg’s high art choral culture, critically influenced by British principles of choral singing which were implemented by British musicians, can be considered an act of music imperialism in so much that British immigrants and British ethnics in Winnipeg, and across Canada generally, realised the ideals and sentiments of Great Britain.³¹ Canada, a dominion of Great Britain, was considered a country with a ‘substantial scope either for the reproduction or for the replication of a domestic-British hierarchy across the seas into the empire’ (Cannandine, 2001, 27). Along with the construction of a societal structure based

³⁰ The predecessor of the League was probably the Bureau of Music comprised of ‘many members of the MMC’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 22). It functioned as a sub-group of Winnipeg’s Board of Trade, a self-serving, yet crucial association of businessmen interested in raising the profile of their businesses and the city as a whole.

on hierarchies of race and economies, where British people of all classes perceived themselves as superior to other immigrant or ethnic Canadians (Cannandine, 2001), many British immigrants and ethnics also sought to replicate British institutions, magnifying symbolic capital and actively reaffirming British dominance (Bourdieu, 1993).

On another level, and in accordance with Tia DeNora (2000), music is constitutive of human agency. People embark on activities influenced by their interests and the notions of the time. George Mathieson remarked on the impact of British choral directors on MMC choirs, saying, ‘the members are not only better choristers, but their horizon has been greatly widened’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 29). He recalled that each British conductor, in their subordinate role as organist and choirmaster at Holy Trinity Anglican Church, wielded much authority in the development of the choir, resulting in Holy Trinity’s choir becoming ‘a stimulus to all church choirs…[where] the urge to high performance [was] continuously evident’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 29).

There were numerous British-born and trained choral directors that impacted, some significantly more than others, the high art choral culture in Winnipeg between 1917 and the early 1950s. In this investigation, I have chosen to discuss only a few of the choral conductors that were in the employ of the MMC, particularly as space is not available to discuss the influence of each one, and for some, little is recorded of their activities during their short tenure in Winnipeg. See Appendix 2 for a list of the choral conductors, their accreditations and the position each one held and the period of time that each was employed by the MMC.

There were eight British-born and educated choral directors and one Canadian-born of British ethnicity that influenced Winnipeg’s high art choral culture. The list is comprised of George Price (1873-1919), Cyril F. Musgrove (1887-1921), Hugh Ross (1898-1990), Douglas Clarke (1893-1962), Peter Temple (no dates), Bernard Naylor (1907-1986), Donald Leggat (no dates), and Lucien Needham (b.1929).

Two other British-born men, while being influential in the city of Winnipeg, primarily as organists, teachers and in a secondary role as choral conductors with MMC choirs, are listed separately from the above group because they were

32 In this context, ‘all church choirs’ implies choirs associated with churches that were comprised primarily of British immigrant or ethnic members.
musically educated in Canada. In one sense, they represent the second generation of naturalized Canadian musicians in Winnipeg influenced by Hugh Ross. Herbert Sadler (1894-1955) moved to Canada in 1911 with his parents. Nothing is known of his studies in England, but in Winnipeg he took organ lessons with Hugh Ross and Douglas Clarke, and became the choral director of the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir between 1939 and 1944, taking over in wartime when access to British musicians ceased. One other important figure, British-born Filmer Hubble (1904-1969), who came to Canada at age 17 also studied with Ross. In his work as an accompanist he would impact singers in the broader community (See Chapter 4: Mennonites). Between 1945 and 1949, he conducted the MVC and the Winnipeg Philharmonic choir (WPC), in the period of post-war adjustment.

A secondary figure, Canadian-born tenor George Kent (1915-2007), influenced by his Yorkshire-born father and brothers, who were tenor soloists at various Winnipeg churches, received his vocal training in Canada. As a young boy he was a member of the Winnipeg Boy’s Choir, a group who’s training mirrored the Anglican choir school tradition, and which was administered by the MMC. In one sense, Kent was the product of the MMC’s aspirations to develop Winnipeg’s high art choral culture based on the British choral tradition. Kent, a MVC conductor from 1955 to 1957, was the first MVC conductor to have been chorally trained by the Winnipeg Boy’s Choir. His inclusion here is to illustrate the lineage of British influence on choral singing in Winnipeg during the first half of the 20th century.

The Winnipeg Male Voice Choir

The Winnipeg Male Voice Choir comprised almost exclusively of men from the MMC was the first choir to be founded by the club. The idea for developing the MVC was germinated shortly after the club’s first recital in which a previously established vocal quartet of MMC businessmen had performed. The quartet grew to a double quartet, and on 11 April 1916, the club formally recognized the MVC, as a dependent organization of the MMC.

English-born George H. Price (c.1873-1919), a founding member of the quartet and the MMC, became the MVC’s first choir director. Price’s musical background included an unknown term as the principal bass in the York Male Voice choir (Winnipeg has fine..., MFP, 18 May 1918, 18 (A)) and as a chorister at St. Michael le Belfrey, also in York, UK. Around the turn of the 20th century, Price
immigrated to Pittsburgh, USA where he was employed as a soloist at Christ Church, a position he held for a period of six years prior to moving to Canada (Winnipeg has fine..., *MFP*, 18 May 1918, 18 (A)). He arrived in Winnipeg at some time between the years of 1907 and 1911.\textsuperscript{33}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure5.jpg}
\caption{The Winnipeg Male Voice Choir (*MFP*, 18 May 1918, 18 (B-G))}
\end{figure}

Under Price’s direction the MVC choir grew to forty-five members. The repertoire during his tenure covered a variety of genres from patriotic music intended primarily for wartime benevolent concerts, part songs of English folk melodies, the ever popular Gilbert and Sullivan choruses to high art works by Gounod, Elgar, Stanford and Davies. The repertoire for the choir’s public premiere on 29 April 1916 comprised ‘Hymn Before Action’ by Walford Davies, ‘A Vintage Song (Lorelei)’ by Mendelssohn and ‘The Beleaguered’ and ‘The Long Day Closes’ by Arthur Sullivan, reflecting wartime sentiments. During Price’s tenure, newspaper reviews indicate that the concerts were well attended. Not all critiques were full of praise giving a more realistic view of the quality of performance presented by the choir in its formative years. Criticism referred to issues of performance style that could be overcome by additional training (Musical Events – A, *MFP*, 08 May 1919, 8 (B)). However, Price was praised for the ‘efficient way in which he has made the choir into a unity [of] splendid singing voices’ (Musical

\textsuperscript{33} Price arrived in Winnipeg between 1907 and 1911, as he is listed in the 1911 census but not the one from 1906.
Events, *MFP*, 04 April 1919, 10 (C)). His conducting of Elgar’s ‘There Rolls the Deep’ received the following enthusiastic review.

This was given with magnificent effect, the roar of the waves, the thunder of the restless sea being reproduced in remarkable fashion. Swelling smoothly from an exquisitely pianissimo to a thundering fortissimo, the choir outdid the other praiseworthy efforts [in this concert] (Musical Events, *MFP*, 04 April 1919, 10 (C)).

Price’s influence in the MMC was short lived, for he died in November 1919, after a sudden and brief illness (G Sharp Major, 1935, 26). The loss of Price at a time when the MVC was attaining success in the city ‘forced a course of action which had important effects, not only on the choir itself, but on the musical growth of Winnipeg’. (G Sharp Major, 1935, 29) The MMC devised a plan whereby they would actively recruit a well-trained English musician to direct the MVC. With their business and social connections, they were able to expand the employment offer to include the position of organist and choirmaster at Holy Trinity Anglican Church. This was a wealthy parish that included many of Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadian middle class families. The two posts would ensure a base salary that could be enhanced by teaching while the affiliation with Holy Trinity and the MMC would provide instant status.

There is no documentation regarding the club’s administrative procedures in advertising for, or choosing the successful candidate. Yet, there is evidence that a web of relationships was developing between the MMC and British musicians in New York and England that significantly influenced the decision-making process. The first indication of this network’s existence is in 1918 when Price headed a subcommittee to develop a plan for initiating a competition music festival in Winnipeg, the second case study to be examined in this chapter. He had been given this task because he was

34 Alec Scott, as leader of the MMC’s orchestra, temporarily took the post of MVC director and conducted the choir in the March 1920 concert that featured soloist Percy Grainger (G Sharp Major, 1935, 30; Musical Events - B).
the only club member who had any experience with this type of event (G Sharp Major, 1935, 20). The two adjudicators for the inaugural Manitoba Music Competition festival in 1919 were highly respected English organists, choir directors, educators and composers: Herbert A. Fricker from Toronto and T. Tertius Noble from New York.\(^{35}\) It is highly probable that Noble and Price knew each other as they had lived in the city of York at the same time, which might also be the reason why the MMC approached Noble in New York, not Fricker in Toronto to find a replacement for Price. On one level, New York, rather than Toronto, was still perceived by Winnipeg’s social elite as the centre of high art in North America. On another level, it would have made good sense to use the MMC’s long established contacts. In his memoirs, Mathieson remarked that ‘it was through the good offices of Mr. Noble’ that the next conductor [Cyril Musgove] of the MVC came to Winnipeg (G Sharp Major, 1935, 30).

Cyril F. Musgrove ARCO (1887-1921) had been the assistant organist at York Minster from 1910 to 1914, under Noble. He was also organist at St. Michael le Belfrey, York, the smaller church near the Minster in which Price was a member of the choir. (G Sharp Major, 1935, 31) This was the initial connection that sparked nearly a half-century relationship between the MMC and British choral conductors linked through a transnational web. It would be honed through the rapport that grew between the MMC and British adjudicators, who would come annually to adjudicate at the Manitoba Music Competition Festival.

Cyril F. Musgrove is the first British musician to shape choral singing through work with the MMC in Winnipeg between 1920 and 1950, and whose

\(^{35}\) Noble was organist and choirmaster at York Minster from 1897 to 1913. He was lured to the USA and became responsible for music activities at St. Thomas Anglican Church, New York, a position he held until 1945. By establishing the St. Thomas Choir school (1919) Noble transferred the English choral tradition of Anglicanism to New York. As of 2013, it remains the only boarding school in the USA at which the all-male student population (age 8-14) undergoes a rigorous training in liturgical music alongside an academic programme of maths, science, arts, French, Latin and theology (Jarnot, 2001). In Leeds, Fricker had founded and directed the Leeds Philharmonic (1900-1917), and the Leeds Symphony Orchestra (1902-1917), and had been chorus master for the Leeds Festivals (1904-1913). He was chosen to succeed A.S. Vogt as the director of the Toronto Mendelssohn Choir, immigrating to Canada in August 1917 (Ruth Pincoe, 2007).
documented musical background illustrates a high level of education. The Winnipeg newspapers supply some information confirming the musical path that Musgrove intended for the MMC. As an endorsement of his capabilities in private teaching, Musgrove listed himself in an advertisement as a specialist in boys’ voices. Up to this time, no other Winnipeg singing teacher had promoted him or herself in a publication in this manner. This set Musgrove apart from other singing teachers in the city. By moulding young male singers from a very early age, a distinctly British sound might well be eventually transferred into Winnipeg’s singing culture.

As conductor of the MVC, Musgrove premiered in a grand concert with British singer Gervase Elwes as featured soloist. The repertoire for this concert was almost entirely British and presented the works of contemporary composers Roger Quilter, Rebecca Clarke, Balfour Gardiner, John Ireland, Peter Warlock, Ernest S. Farrar, Henry L Lee, Edward Bairstow, Samuel Coleridge-Taylor and Granville Bantock. See Figure 6 (page 116) for concert repertoire. Although the solos would have been chosen by Elwes, a concert of entirely English music indicates a pride in contemporary English high art music. It also fulfills the MMC’s aspiration to shape musical taste in the city according to their Brito-Canadian taste, while the dissemination of new solo vocal works would serve to enhance the repertoire of Winnipeg singers.

With their new conductor, the MMC formed great plans for the MVC’s 1921-22 season that included an American tour of five cities, with Chicago being the highlight. By achieving positive reviews from a Chicago performance, the MMC would gain cultural capital for their city. To help ensure success, the young, yet eminent Australian pianist and composer Percy Grainger had been engaged as the soloist for the tour. He was also commissioned to compose two choral works specifically for the MVC to perform on this tour, ‘Anchor Song’ with text by Kipling, and ‘A dollar and a half a day’, an arrangement of a sea shanty.

The future looked bright for the choir but tragedy struck in August 1921: while on holiday in Ontario, Musgrove died in a swimming accident. The MMC honoured Musgrove by burying him beside their previous conductor George Price in Winnipeg’s Elmwood cemetery. Without doubt the club mourned their loss, however practicality necessitated finding a replacement conductor.
as quickly as possible. For a second time, the MMC’s expanding transnational network came into play.

Earlier that year, George Dyson (1883-1964), composer and teacher at the Royal College of Music (RCM), had adjudicated at the Manitoba Music Competition Festival. With his encouragement, seconded by RCM head administrator Hugh Allen, a young (aged 23) Hugh C.M. Ross, FRCM, BA and DMus Oxford, (1898-1990) became the next director of Winnipeg’s MVC.
As a recent graduate of the highly respected School of Music at Oxford, the MMC considered the engagement of Ross as a coup. His arrival in Winnipeg was heralded in the newspapers through a series of articles beginning two weeks prior to his arrival on 21 October 1921 (Studio Notes – A, WT, 21 October 1921, 40 (D)). The narrative outlined his responsibilities as musical director of the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir, and organist/choir director at Holy Trinity Church. Adding a church position to Ross’s responsibilities enhanced his salary and widened his sphere of influence.

**Hugh Ross, Holy Trinity Choir and the New Sacred Repertoire**

In an interview soon after settling in Winnipeg Ross summarized his intentions for musical growth in the city. At Holy Trinity, Ross would continue the work of Musgrove by ‘introduc[ing] more and more good and also difficult music . . . [and by providing] opportunities for organizing the congregational singing more than it is at present’ (Hugh Ross to Give Recital, MFP, 05 November 1921, 39, (D)). There are references to support at least four attempts to better congregational singing whereby those interested in church music gathered to sing with the massed choirs from Young Methodist, Broadway Baptist, Holy Trinity and Westminster Church, conducted by Ross. The events were under the aegis of The Canadian College of Organists, in which he was a member. The aim was to ‘develop more robust congregational singing and popularize the finer types of hymn tunes’ (Congregational Singing, MFP, 17 January 1925, 22 (E)). On a cold January evening in 1925, with the temperature a chilling minus 25 Celsius, a faithful singing congregation of unknown proportions gathered to sing hymns at Westminster Church to the hymn tunes known as Abridge, Darwell’s 148th, Lasst Uns Erfreuen and Pange Lingua.36 Before the group singing

---

36 These hymn tunes would have been very familiar to the congregation. The tune ‘Abridge’ was composed by Quaker Issac Smith (1734-1805) and used for at least five hymn texts in numerous Protestant hymnals during the nineteenth century. John Darwall’s (1731-1789) setting of the 148th psalm supplied the music for at least fifteen different texts in *The New Universal Psalmodist* (1770), perhaps the most well known being ‘Rejoice, the Lord is King’, with text by Charles Wesley (1707-1788). *Lasst Uns Erfreuen* is the melody for at least five different hymns, including ‘All Creatures Great and Small’, first printed in *The Public School Hymn Book* (1919) and ‘Ye Watchers and Ye Holy Ones’, in *The English Hymnal*, with the harmony
commenced, church organist Herbert Sadler, who was taking lessons from Ross, entertained the congregation with a short concert.

Figure 7: Hugh Ross (MFP, 5 Nov 1921, 39 (C))

Although reported as a ‘marked success and [as an activity that] will do much to popularize the best musical material in current hymnals’ its success was probably limited (Congregational Singing, MFP, 17 January 1925, 22 (E)). These infrequent gatherings were held on a Sunday at 8:45 pm, after the evening service, and with the expectation that enthusiastic individuals from three congregations would meet at the fourth church. Whether this joint congregational singing practice was attended by a sense of obligation or not, it is one that ceased composed by Ralph Vaughan Williams. The final hymn was probably ‘Now my tongue the mystery telling’, the Latin text by Thomas Aquinas was translated by Thomas Caswell (1848-1878) and set to the tune Pange Lingua, published in Hymns, Ancient and Modern (1861).
to be advertised or reported in the press after 1925, leading to the conclusion that it reached its natural death.

That aside, Ross remained committed to championing contemporary sacred music. Newer English carols were introduced to the Holy Trinity community through the choir at the 1922 Christmas carol concert. These included, ‘The Ox’ and ‘As Joseph was Walking’ by R.R. Terry (1865-1938), ‘Welcome Yule’ by Hubert Parry, published in 1917 and ‘Of a rose, I sing a song’ by Arnold Bax (1883-1953), published in 1920. (Carol Service Gives, *MFP*, 30 December 1922, 10 (B)). Ross presented Bax as the new generation of English composer following in the English tradition of Stanford and Parry. On the other hand, Terry was a very significant figure in the early twentieth-century revival of the Tudor church music, principally as he was the first to liturgically perform the three and five part masses of William Byrd (1539-1623). The Tudor revival coincided with Ross’s formative years and possibly some aspects of this movement would have shaped Ross’ outlook on liturgical music. Nevertheless, Ross’s choice of music was not restricted to contemporary British composers. Under his leadership, Trinity choir had presented Winnipeg’s first performance of Brahms’s *Requiem*, at Easter in 1922 (*Good Friday Music*, *MFP*, 13 April 1922, 8 (D)), and Spohr’s *Last Judgement* on Good Friday in 1925 (*Sunday in Wpg Churches*, *MFP*, 04 April 1925, 40 (C)).

Newspaper accounts of Ross’s new musical additions to the repertoire of Holy Trinity’s choir lessened after the first two years of his tenure in Winnipeg. This might signify that new music at Holy Trinity became un-newsworthy or there may have been less of it as time passed. Yet, in the *Manitoba Free Press (MFP)*, a widely-read Winnipeg newspaper founded in 1872, there are over 260 articles between 1921 and 1927 that mention Ross, including reports on events from Holy Trinity Church to articles on Ross’s various musical activities in the wider community. Critically, the editors of the two major newspapers, Dafoe of the *Manitoba Free Press* and John James Moncrieff of the *Winnipeg Tribune (WT)*,

---

37 Terry was the organist and director of music at Westminster Cathedral from 1902 to 1924, and a musicologist by interest. He is known for the establishment of *motu proprio*, an aspect of the papal decree of 1903 by Pope Pius X that laid down general principles for the performance of liturgical music. Terry resigned from Westminster after increasing criticisms of his choice of works. For more information on Terry and *motu proprio* see articles in Oxford Music online.
were both members of the MMC. It was in the best interest of the club to promote Ross’s capabilities as a musician, to publicize his ethnicity as British and to portray the contemporary British repertoire as new and exciting, with the underlying message that establishing the British choral tradition was beneficial to all of Winnipeg society. This last outcome was evinced through Ross’s activities with the MVC, and the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir (WPC).

Hugh Ross and the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir (MVC)
The MVC provided the more public medium compared to the position at Holy Trinity, through which Ross and the MMC could develop choral technique and influence musical taste. During the first interview of 1921 Ross confided that he was ‘sure that [he could] obtain fine modern music for them [MVC] to sing, because [he knew] several of the greatest living English composers and some of the younger men also’ (Hugh C. M. Ross to Give Recital, MFP, 05 November 1921, 39 (C-D)). The repertoire for the choir’s first American tour, although chosen prior to Ross’s engagement, was comprised chiefly of music by the British composers, Granville Bantock, Percy Grainger, Edward Elgar, T. Tertius Noble and Samuel Coleridge-Taylor.

One may never know the information that Ross received regarding the capabilities of the MVC prior to his taking the initial rehearsal. Whether the choir lived up to his expectations or not, it is apparent that an intense three-month long rehearsal period ensued in order to prepare the choir for March 1922 tour. G Sharp Major’s narrative speaks volumes in respect to the members’ view of this concentrated practice period, however Ross’s opinion, fears and frustrations remain unknown.

The experience of the Choir under his [Ross] leadership during the first four months was one of the most trying through which the members ever came. His energy was tireless and the members had to work as they had never worked before. His mind functioned at lightning speed, and it demanded concentration to try to keep pace with him. His sense of absolute pitch made him sensitive to the slightest variation and the time he spend endeavouring to overcome this failing, more or less common to all choirs, seemed
out of proportion. Some of the rehearsals were nearly torture, but his musicianship and his gifts were so remarkable in the eyes and to the ears of the singers that they stayed with him. The effect of these weeks was never lost; the men came closer to Hugh’s ideals, and he in turn moderated his speed nearer to their limitations. But his dynamic personality was always present and at times by sheer weight carried the choir over some rough spots (1935, 38).

Clearly, Ross had high standards and expectations. There was much at stake including Ross’s reputation as a competent choral conductor and the MVC’s reputation as a highly-skilled choir. Indubitably, the MVC had to rise to the occasion and Ross was seen by the MMC as a ‘lifesaver’. Within four months of his arrival in Winnipeg, Ross accessed the all-important American audience that enhanced his career leading to guest conducting opportunities in USA and ultimately his departure from Winnipeg.

The 1922 American tour by the MVC included concerts in Duluth (10 March), in Milwaukee (11 March), Chicago (13 March), St Paul (14 March) and in Minneapolis (15 March). Civically, it was in the choir’s best interest to ensure its performances were of a high calibre as the MVC emerged as the cultural emissary for the city, promoting Winnipeg as a high art community. Significantly, as the MVC shaped how others culturally saw Winnipeg, many of the choristers were also cultivating business relationships in the cities where the choir performed. When the opportunity arose at the various receptions given for the MVC during their tour, specific members spoke publicly about commerce and culture in Winnipeg (G Sharp Major, 1935, 58). It was an advantageous situation for the MMC businessmen, who could promote their businesses and publicize their city as one with artistic integrity.

From civic advertising to business promotion, the American tour was a resounding success, with Ross achieving international recognition, and the gratitude, respect, and trust of the MMC. The choir’s celebratory ‘sold out’ concert upon its return home was followed by an enthusiastic article in the MFP, filled with excerpts from American reviews of the tour. Ross was described as
young and tall. . . [with] a bit of a drawing room manner at the first – something of the charming sophisticated awkwardness that is nicely English. . . But there’s fire in his baton when climaxes loom and [when] orders are required[,] tenderness for contrasted moods. His choir answers him like some delicately tuned instrument (Milwaukee Journal, cited in Another Triumph for Grainger, MFP, 09 March 1922, 15 (C)).

Regardless of stature and manner, the reviews consistently emphasized the choir’s responsiveness to their conductor.

These Winnipeggers for the most part staid and middle-aged gentlemen of means and position, gave . . . so splendid a volume and sweetness of song – disclosed so perfect balance and control, that involuntarily one covets something equally good for Milwaukee (Cited in, Another Triumph for Grainger, MFP, 09 March 1922 15 (C)).

The Chicago American praised the choir’s technique, cultivation of their style, musicianship, and the extraordinary clarity of their articulation for ‘when language is sung as these men sing it, English becomes beautiful’ (Cited in, Another Triumph for Grainger, MFP, 09 March 1922, 15 (C)).

For the MMC’s chronicler G Sharp Major, the reviews, and this statement in particular, implied that choirs singing with English diction, rather than Canadian or American diction, were infinitely superior (G Sharp Major, 1935, 39). While this exhibits ignorance about standard English diction for singers by ‘G Sharp Major’ who readily admitted his musical deficiencies, it also on some level reinforces the notion of British superiority.

The many positive reviews strengthened the resolve of the MMC to continue forging their musical path that was steeped in British tradition, for it was not only shaping musical taste, but fashioning Winnipeg’s civic image to their liking. The reviewer for the Chicago British American Herald voiced a change in the usual opinion of Manitoba. He said, ‘We [Americans] used to think mostly of No 1 hard wheat, prize livestock when Manitoba was mentioned. After this week
we shall think of something [that is] not supposed to flourish in the prairie province – fine music’ (Cited in, Another Triumph for Grainger, MFP, 09 March 1922 15 (C)). In his memoirs, G sharp Major pointed out that ‘the press showed an appreciation without exception . . . of the civic and international significance of our visit of the amateur choir . . . whose membership represent[s] the business and professional life of Winnipeg’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 39). Ironically, at the homecoming concert open to all of Winnipeg, the most applause was accorded to the rollicking popular melody ‘Rolling down to Rio’ by Edward German that had been included in the programme specifically for this event. MMC secretary, George Mathieson (aka G. Sharp Major) could not hide his disappointment, saying, ‘While, therefore, the leaven was working, it had only permeated a limited section of the body politic, and it was evident that there would always be room for further broadening of musical sensibility among many citizens’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 41). After all, it was early days for the MVC and British influence upon choral singing in Winnipeg.  

Ross and the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir

Within a month of returning from the 1922 tour, the energetic Ross established a mixed voice SATB choir ‘The Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir’ (WPC), combining four middle-class church choirs, Holy Trinity, Home Presbyterian, Young Methodist and Central Congregational, thus establishing the 150-200 voice choir as Brito-Canadian, representative of the congregations to which these churches served. It would remain distinctively Brito-Canadian for decades because of the propensity for the WPC to draw its membership almost entirely from the Brito-Canadian community.

The idea for developing the Philharmonic Choir may have been encouraged, and the nascent hastened, by the word of caution given by organist, educator and festival adjudicator, H.C. Perrin (1865-1953). After hearing the

---

38 In the following year, the choir embarked once again on a tour, this time longer, travelling for thirteen days, visiting the Canadian cities of London, Toronto and Ottawa, as well as Milwaukee, Minneapolis, St. Paul, Detroit, Chicago and Brooklyn, culminating in a performance at Carnegie Hall in New York City, where the ‘genius and skill of Mr. Ross’ (Winnipeg Male Voice Makes Splendid Impression, MFP, 10 March 1923, 4 (C)) and the ‘magnificent singing’ (4 (C)) of the choir was praised.
various sections of children’s works at the 1921 Winnipeg Manitoba Competition Festival, he remarked, ‘one cannot but be struck with the possibility of influencing them towards proper taste and appreciation of good music’. He immediately added, ‘the various churches have an important mission in this field of work. A great deal of music poses as good because it is performed in the church, whereas it is really of a meretricious order and very little higher than the level of jazz and kindred music’ (WMVC in Final Concert, *MFP*, 16 April 1921, 43 (C)). For the MMC who aspired to shape high art music in Winnipeg, this statement may have been enough to stir them into action.

**Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir**  
Concert December 11, 1922

1. Blessing, Glory and Wisdom and Thanks  
   J.S. Bach
2. Three English Folksongs  
   a. The Willow Tree  
   b. Bobby Shaftoe  
   c. The Water of Tyne
3. Death on the Hill  
   Sir Edward Elgar
4. On Himalay  
   Granville Bantock
5. Since thou, O Fondest  
   Hubert Parry
6. The Swing  
   Selim Palmgren
7. Fire, fire my heart  
   Morley

*Figure 8: Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir: Partial Programme (With Philharmonic, 9 Dec 1922, 42, (C))*

Ross’s objective for this new group was ‘the study and performance of choral works of a certain modern character both accompanied and unaccompanied’ (Hugh C.M. Ross to Form…, *MFP*, 08 April 1922, 14, (A)). For the premiere, featuring the American soprano Anna Case (1888-1984), Ross preceded the concert with a lecture recital on the evening’s repertoire, a practical and established method of educating the audience. See Figure 8 for the choral repertoire for this concert. Over Ross’s six-year tenure, repertoire for his choirs would be greatly influenced but not restricted by, his affiliation with and affection for, contemporary British composers. Repertoire over this period included a performance of Ralph Vaughan Williams *A Sea Symphony*, for chorus and
orchestra on 22 April 1924, only fourteen years after its inaugural performance at the Leeds Festival in 1910, and many smaller works including but not limited to songs by Frank Bridge (‘Mantle of Blue’ and Thy Hand in Mine’), Ralph Vaughan Williams (‘Sweet Little Linneth’, ‘Hugh’s Song of the Road’ from Hugh the Drover, and ‘Gaily I go to Die’), and Roger Quilter’s ‘Now Sleeps the Crimson Petal’.

In 1927, Ross resigned from his positions with the MMC, and moved to New York City, becoming the Choral Director of the Schola Cantorum. As a very important figure in the development of the choral culture in Winnipeg, Ross not only influenced music in the Brito-Canadian community, but also in the Mennonite community. His influence will be discussed in Chapter 4.

**Douglas Clarke, Peter Temple, and Filmer Hubble**

British directors became the norm for MMC choirs. From 1927 to 1929, the highly capable musician Douglas Clarke, while ‘not considered a good conductor’ (McLean, 2007) held the reins of the two MMC choirs. He is remembered for the performance of Bach’s *St Matthew Passion*, held over two evenings, 2-3 April 1928. The reviews indicate that perhaps the work was too difficult for all concerned. In reporting on the second night the critic wrote, ‘It was good enough to lay the ghost of Bach that may have stirred uneasily more than once during the previous evening’ (*Improvement Noted…, MFP*, 04 April 1928, 8 (C)). He continued, ‘There was a feeling from the start that Mr. Clarke, the singers and the orchestra had come to grips with the music and that instead of the spider-like gait of Monday, there was a steady progress ahead to the end’ (*Improvement Noted…, MFP*, 04 April 1928, 8 (C)). Perhaps, understanding that his strengths lay in other musical ventures, Clarke returned to England where he completed an MA (Cambridge) in 1930. Upon completion, he moved to Canada, accepting the position of the Dean of the Faculty of Music at McGill University in Montreal, where he remained until 1955 (McLean, 2007).

Next in line was Peter Temple (1929-1931), who had been a student at Oxford, when Ross accepted the post in Winnipeg. Knowledge of Ross’s achievements and future in New York was probably encouraging to Temple (Winnipeg MVC Welcomes… *MFP*, 10 October 1929, 7 (B)). It is probable that Winnipeg was beginning to be perceived as a stepping stone, a place for young British conductors to hone their skills, before embarking on greater challenges.
During his two-year tenure, Temple, who was perceived as more of an 'orchestral than choral conductor' (G Sharp Major, 1935, 76) directed the WPC’s premiere of ‘Fantasia on Christmas Carols’ on 6 January 1930 (Pleasing Performance, MFP, 07 January 1930, 7 (C)). Temple returned to England in 1931, and might be best remembered for his interest in developing an orchestra in Winnipeg and for a letter that he wrote in support of a new concert hall, a proposal highly encouraged by the MMC (Music, MFP, 12 December 1931, 32, (A-B)).

The Waning of Ethnocentric Ideals

There were other choral directors in this British choral lineage, listed here with the years that they conducted MMC choirs: Bernard Naylor (1932-35, 1938-39) recognized today primarily as a composer of choral works, Lucien Needham (1957-60), a music educator at the Universities of Manitoba, Brandon and Lethbridge in Canada, and Donald Leggat (1953-55), of whom little is written, but whose words give some insight into the health of the MMC choirs in the 1950s, a direct result of the MMC’s continued ethnocentric policies.

While in Winnipeg, Leggat struggled to make a living in his numerous jobs: as the director of the MVC, the WPC and the Winnipeg Boys Choirs, and in 1954, as the host for a new Canadian Broadcasting Corporation radio programme, where he chose, played and commented on high art recordings. In his letter of resignation, dated 16 April 1955, Leggat gives some indication of the underlying issues at the MMC that, in his opinion, may have been symptomatic of the difficulties he was experiencing in regards to his position. He wrote,

I think the musical future of the city should be intimately linked with the club. But, I think the club must first become more truly – more widely – representative of the community. It will then enjoy the support of the various leading figures in the community, and then you will be in a position to appoint a British conductor, offering him a reasonable prospect of success’ (Correspondence Incoming, UMA, MMC, MSS11, Box 1, File 2).

Nearly forty years had passed since the inception of the MMC. By the mid 1950s, Winnipeg’s population had grown to 350,000. The tensions between ethnic...
communities that had existed in the 1920s had ceased, and second and third-
generation non-Brito Canadians were making their mark socially, economically
and politically. As it was in other parts of Canada, Brito-Canadian power was
waning in Winnipeg, as exemplified by the election of the first non Brito-Canadian
mayor in 1956, Ukrainian-Canadian Stephen Juba. Yet, the MMC still retained its
ethnocentric ideals, even though membership in the MVC and the WPC fluctuated
so much at times that it caused concern amongst the MMC administration and the
choristers. The MVC never regained its pre-war status, finally breaking with the
MMC in 1960. It acquired a new name ‘The Winnipeg Male Chorus’, and as of
2015, still exists, performing a few concerts a year in communities throughout
Manitoba.

The MMC’s ethnocentric policies were also detrimental to the health of the
WPC, as many good singers of other ethnicities were excluded from its
membership. In the 1950s, contentious issues were raised in a letter by an un-
named member, as to what sort of choir the WPC should be, based on repertoire
and membership. With its base membership at 100, and swelling to 150 for some
concerts, the choir ‘was too large for a capella works of any time and most choral
and orchestral works to the end of the 18th century, and too small for most choral
and orchestral works of the 19th and 20th centuries’ (Correspondence Incoming,
UMA, MMC, MSS 11, Box 1, File 2). The author of the letter makes various
suggestions, including the creation of a smaller choir of hand picked choristers to
perform works that required excellent musicianship and smaller forces. In regards
to raising a larger choir he/she wrote,

Winnipeg, like the rest of Canada, is becoming year by year less
and less Anglo-Saxon. It would probably be impossible even now,
and in any case not obviously desirable, to rely on the Anglo-
Saxon population for more than two thirds of a good choir of 250
singers. Therefore the representation and management of such a
body should begin by not being entirely Anglo-Saxon
(Correspondence Incoming, UMA, MMC, MSS 11, Box 1, File 2).
This suggests that there was some movement towards the acceptance of singers of other ethnicities, however the administration remained solidly Brito-Canadian.

**Ethnocentric Disjunctures**

Of critical importance in the dynamics of Winnipeg’s choral and solo vocal culture, are the relationships that formed in non-MMC musical activities between individuals from the Brito-Canadian choral community and Winnipeg musicians from other ethnic backgrounds. In this context, Filmer Hubble comes to the fore. In 1921, at the age of 17, Filmer Hubble (1904-1969) immigrated to Winnipeg, where he studied with Hugh Ross and became his assistant at Holy Trinity Church. Hubble, a member of the MMC, conducted the WPC from 1945 to 1949. However, he is fondly remembered ‘as something of a father figure to young Winnipeg musicians in the 1940s and 1950s. A benign and generous spirit, he was never idle, yet never too busy to help and fees were often brushed aside’ (Gibson, 2007). Hubble played an important role in the lives of many young musicians in Winnipeg. One in particular was a young Mennonite singer named Victor Martens who recalled Hubble as a wonderful musician, and as a sympathetic accompanist who was highly supportive of singers (Interview, V. Martens, 05 April 2014).

The relationships that developed between individual MMC musicians and non-Brito-Canadian musicians illustrate a disjuncture between the attitudes of ethnocentricity in the MMC through its membership and activities, and the actions of some of its members. It might be argued that the activities of individual MMC musicians and the relationships they forged (e.g., Hubble and Martens) was part of a grand scheme to establish British culture amongst other ethnics. However, I submit that the interactions between individuals of Brito-Canadian and non-Brito-Canadian communities extend DeNora’s (2000) theory that recognizes the role of music in the construction of identity, not only within personal and social life, but also in professional life. This will be discussed in detail in Chapter 4, but a short introduction here will illustrate the extension of DeNora’s theory, focusing on the impact of Brito-Canadians upon individuals in Winnipeg’s ethnic communities.

Unintentionally at times tensions arose in the Mennonite community that may have been caused in some way by inter-community musical networks. As will become apparent in Chapter 4, by the 1950s, Mennonites actively engaged Brito-Canadian musicians to teach their youth in post-secondary institutions, yet, the
scope for the future of trained Mennonite singers remained limited to church musical activities. At this time, the prevailing attitude throughout most of the Mennonite community towards the public performance of music – sacred, secular, high art or not, also remained firm. On one hand the purpose of musical performance was solely for glorifying God, not the exaltation of the performer or the music. On the other hand, Mennonites were encouraged to apply themselves, to excel in their chosen activities. Grappling with these discrepancies became especially problematic for some young Mennonite singers who were introduced to a different way of thinking about singing, and new repertoire and praxis by their Brito-Canadian teachers and other non-Mennonite musical contacts. This led to some Mennonite singers in Winnipeg moving beyond their community-established boundaries. In this instance and of interest here, are the networks that developed between individual Brito-Canadian musicians and those from other ethnicities that impacted upon Winnipeg’s high art vocal community. The results of these networks, especially the teacher-student, and Brito-Canadian and non-Brito-Canadian ones, are part of the narrative of the second case study, the Winnipeg Music Competition Festival, which was instituted in 1919 by the Men’s Musical Club.

**Case Study 2: The Manitoba Music Competition Festival (MMCF)**

The British amateur competitive music festival movement traces its roots to a modest choral event held in the village of Sedgewick, Cumbria, England in 1885. The organizer Mary Wakefield (1853-1910), the child of a rich Quaker businessman, had received an excellent musical education and had developed into a fine mezzo-soprano capable of a professional career. It was curtailed because of her father’s resolve against women making money, a prevailing attitude of the time structured on class and gender sensibilities (Tosh, 1999). As with many women of her middle-class background, she used her musical skills for philanthropic and educational purposes. For a biography on Wakefield and her influence on the amateur music competition movement, see Amanda Jane Griffin. ‘The Amateur competition Movement: Shaping Identity through Participation in the Manx Music Festival 1892-2005’, PhD diss. University of Durham, UK, 2006.
participation in competitive classes during the day, followed by a combined choir concert in the evening.

Inspiration for the Cumbrian festival was drawn in some ways from the Welsh *Eisteddfodau*, a cultural festival developed in the early 1800s, as an approach to define and maintain Welsh identity at a time when the importance of national identities were coming to the fore. The first festival took place in 1819 in Camarthen, Wales, and was comprised of competitions that featured Welsh music, drama, poetry and dance (Griffin, 2006). As the Welsh immigrated to England and elsewhere, the *Eisteddfodau* competition was established as a marker of Welsh identity. In England, as the Welsh became established in the upper-middle classes of English society, the idea of festival as a marker of national identity may have transferred to the English community. However it was class and industry that provided the greatest impetus for the British festival movement in Britain (Griffin, 2006), and in Canada.

Changes in the meaning of ‘class’ from the 18th to the 19th centuries greatly impacted the way in which people saw themselves. Historian Edward Royle, (1987) focusing on British social history writes,

The actual language of ‘class’ began to be applied to social structures in the 1790s….These words in their earliest contexts, [were] purely descriptive and were often used interchangeably with ranks and orders, but a distinction of meaning gradually emerged. The older term [class] implied hierarchy and a division of society according to legal and social status, to which economic power was of course integral; but with class the economic dimension became paramount. Instead of a multiplicity of status groups within the social hierarchy, bonded together by community, deference and paternalism, horizontal classes were observed and distinguished according to their access to and control over economic resources, in conflict with one another about the distribution not only of economic but also political, social and ideological power (43).
In seeking to shape high art culture according to their Brito-Canadian ideals, the MMC were able to develop grand civic schemes because of their sphere of influence, which was a direct result of their ethnic, class, gender and socioeconomic status in Winnipeg. The Manitoba Competition Music Festival, inaugurated by the club in 1919, was modeled on the British amateur music festival movement.\(^{40}\) On one level, the Manitoba festival could be considered an ethnic marker, like the Welsh *Eisteddfod*, in so much that the Brito-Canadians were a demographic minority drawing on an valued and prominent cultural activity from their real or imagined homeland. On another level, it was a civic enterprise that grew out of post-war nationalism, an enthusiastic sense for the future, and the sincere belief that a festival would be culturally beneficial to Winnipeg people of all ages and from all communities.

In the ‘Foreword’ of the 1919 MMCF festival programme, Dean George F. Coombes (the President of the MMC), placed emphasis on the value of music in post war society comparing its importance to that of national freedom through democracy, and continued by outlining the purpose of festival. He wrote,

> It is not too much to say that the encouragement of Music is a matter of national importance. It is not enough to make the world “safe” for democracy: it must be made the happy home of intelligent, contented, cultured peoples – intelligent through a wise system of education, contented because of humane economic conditions of labour and living, culture through acquaintance with the treasure of literature and art. Among the last-named Music takes a foremost place… To encourage this community effort [the MMC’s effort], to stimulate individual performers to greater proficiency, to foster the study and practice of concerted and choral music, and generally, to raise the standard of musical taste and efficiency throughout our province, is the object of our Musical Competition Festival (MMCF Programme, 1919, np).

By drawing on the successful British model, and through transnational relationships between the MMC and British adjudicators, vocal repertoire, and

\(^{40}\) The Winnipeg festival was not the first in Western Canada. Festivals had been held in Edmonton (1908) and Regina (1909).
performance praxis of high art music in both the public, through private music lessons, and state, through classroom singing, the vocal cultures in Winnipeg and elsewhere in Canada would be shaped by British musical ideals until the second half of the 20th century.

The Inaugural Manitoba Competition Music Festival (MMCF), 1919
In his memoir, club secretary George Mathieson (1935) wrote that the development of the inaugural MMCF was left to the MVC’s first conductor, George Price and a sub-committee, given that Price was the only one with any experience in these matters, as he had sung in a competition in York, UK, prior to his departure for Canada (G Sharp Major, 1935). The regulations and format for the Winnipeg festival were drawn up based on programmes and other data that had been attained from festivals in England. (G Sharp Major, 1935). The inaugural festival was held over three days from May 13-15, 1919. There were 271 entries in 35 classes, with 2,500 performers (counting choristers). Out of the 35 classes, 24 were voice related: nine classes for choirs, nine classes for solo voice (children and adults), and the remaining seven for either duets, trios or quartets. The majority of the repertoire, 19 out of 24 songs, all of which were set by the MMC festival administration were composed by British composers. (See Appendix 3 for a listing of vocal repertoire.) The Manitoba Free Press and The Winnipeg Tribune published daily articles, reporting on the classes and quoting the two adjudicators, English organists and choirmasters, Herbert A Fricker (1868-1943) and T. Tertius Noble (1868-1953), who encouraged the community to support the endeavour of festival for the betterment of Winnipeg (Adjudicators Say…, MFP, 16 May 1919, 8 (C-D)).

The Influence of the British Federation of Music Festivals (BFMF)
In 1922, the MMCF was the first of the Canadian festivals to join the British Federation of Music Festivals, an association founded in 1921, whose purpose was to regulate the competition festival movement in Great Britain. The long-term impact of this transnational relationship would be felt by generations of Canadians countrywide who were involved in competitive music festivals as competitors, as teachers, and as audience participants.
One of the most significant outcomes of this relationship was the shaping of reception of high art music according to British standards. This involved a concerted effort towards educating the public. In each MMCF programme during the formative years of the festival (1922-1928) an article on the purpose and value of festival was published directly following the ‘Foreword’. Its placement suggests a position of importance, and in which the content can be considered educationally progressive year upon year, often discussing the value of festival in shaping high art reception in Winnipeg. This is evident in an article titled ‘The Higher Competition’, published in the 1923 MMCF programme. It focuses on the purpose of festival, and the sense of worth that one achieves in being part of the festival, whether as a performer or as an audience member.

The unknown author has gleaned what he/she regards as pertinent information on the significance of adult education with an emphasis on education through music, rather than education in music. Purported to be taken from a British government publication of the Board of Education (1921), the article suggests that Canadians should submit to the greater authority, that of British expertise, on this subject. The writer reiterates the 19th century concept that suggests the power of music has the ability to affect a person’s emotions and shape their actions whether for good or for bad purposes. It continues,

For this reason, if no other, those who are interested in social welfare cannot be indifferent to the character of the music which reaches the people. Good music does not necessarily arouse noble emotions, or bad music ignoble; but some kinds of bad music appeal, and are intended to appeal to the lower nature of man, and at best, bad music has no meaning and no value…. All of our witnesses have agreed that the people do not demand bad music; they are given it. When offered the choice of good or bad music, they choose good. (MMCF Programme, 1923, 2).

The article conveys the idea that ‘good’ music doesn’t necessarily make anyone a better person, nor does ‘bad’ music make anyone bad, however, the implication remains: does anyone really want to take a chance of being negatively influenced by listening to ‘bad’ music? Acting upon this idea, the article suggests
that the purpose of festival also includes the teaching of the difference between ‘good’ music, meaning high art music, and ‘bad music’, which probably included every other type of music, including jazz. By being involved in festival, ‘every competitor is not only inspired to a higher understanding of good music but is a stimulus to other competitors, and exerts a powerful educational influence on the audience’ (MCMF Programme, 1923, 3). This substantiates the concept of education through music as a way to shape musical taste in the wider community.

The writer continued in his/her encouragement of festival participation. I propose that the following text, written in the closing paragraph struck a deep chord with the festival public, who, like all in the community, were rebuilding society after a most devastating war. It claimed, ‘to compete at the festival is a mark of good citizenship’ (3), suggesting doing otherwise would mark one as not a good citizen. I submit that this powerful text was presumably aimed at middle-class men, who were still influenced by 19th-century masculine gender ideals. Their family duties included educating their children to the standards of their class, and that now encompassed participation in the festival.

The 1927 MMCF Programme featured an article in which the festival committee boasted of the growth of entries that recorded an increase from 35 classes, and 2,500 participants in 1919, to 111 classes and 8,500 participants in 1926 (2). Audience numbers also had risen year upon year, from 2,000 in 1919 to 12,000 in 1926. The expansion in classes and participants was largely due to the support given to the festival by the Board of Education who encouraged classroom participation in choir competition classes. In 1923, over a two day period, approximately 1200 children each day participated in the school choral classes (Plunket-Greene, 1923, 362). As an additional incentive, individual schools were exempt from paying competition fees. The statistics were considered ‘tangible evidence’ (The Higher Competition, 1923, 2) of the progress of festival.

The content of the next paragraph in this commentary continues along the same thread as the 1923 article, suggesting that reception by the public for high art music had not changed. The author noted that people listen to any music that captures their interest. He continued,

It is on this reaching out for something new, that the composer[s] of ‘popular’ music fatten, because that section of the public to
which they appeal has not yet tasted ‘better’ music. You cannot expect the public to be attracted to a performance of Schubert’s *Unfinished Symphony* [my italics]. But take the main theme from it, make it a waltz in ‘Blossom Time’ and it is all over the town! ‘The public do not demand bad music. When offered a choice of good or bad, they choose the good’ (‘The Higher Competition - A, 1926, 2).

The author accepts that one way to shape reception to high art may be through the use of high art melodies in popular tunes, a method that was used frequently by writers of dance and other popular musics of the era. It is significant that the author articulates that changes in public attitude toward high art music transpires over a long period of time, and in unexpected ways, including the MMCF as a means of bridging the gulf between the tastes for popular and high art music. The competitor refines his/her taste through the study of high art music, but also offers ‘to the thousands of the audience a wealth of music…of which numbers of them are unaware’ (‘The Higher Competition - A, 1926, 3).

The most significant change in reception would arise because of the intensive musical training that over 4,000 Winnipeg school children received annually in preparation for the festival. The influence of that training could be brought forward into their lives, ‘to say nothing of an influence on posterity’ (3). Added to the musical training the children received in the classroom or in private lessons, the shaping of their knowledge and that of the community would also come from the critiques and comments of the British adjudicators, who in the eyes of MMC Secretary Mathieson held ‘discriminating insight’ (G Sharp Major, 1935, 61).

*The Introduction of British Adjudicators to the MMCF*
Between 1919 and 1922, the adjudicators for the budding festival were drawn from a small group of four highly competent musicians – Fricker, Noble, Canadian-born A.S. Vogt and American-born H.S. Perrin. As the festival grew in popularity, the administrators recognized that they needed to tap into a larger pool of adjudicators to maintain the educational relevancy of their project. Community interest in what adjudicators had to say was a vital aspect of shaping high art reception. To
reassert the idea that festival was for all people, musically trained or not, a newspaper article outlined the abilities of the adjudicator to express his commentary in a simplified manner, and reinforced the principle of self-improvement. It stated,

\[\ldots\text{adjudicators should have the gift of expressing their criticism in language readily understood by the layman.\ldots}\]

The layman hears the best of music, then he hears both music and performance analysed in simple, easily understood manner. It is due to this feature that the Festival has come to wield an influence for musical culture in the community comparable to the benefits of a university extra-mural course in any of the kindred arts’ (Song and Music..., *MFP*, 27 April 1935, 5 (A)).

The MMC festival committee sought to attract some leading British musicians who had vast experience in adjudicating at festivals. In 1922, the MMCF approached the administrators of the other Western Canadian festivals, and successfully coordinated festival dates thus creating a chain of festivals. This was used as a drawing card to attract adjudicators, as it insured sufficient volume of work over the shortest period of time.\(^{41}\) At times, the selection of British adjudicators proved to be problematic because the preferred ones were sometimes too busy to come to Canada. The problem was exacerbated as the Canadian festival chain grew and adjudicators remained in Canada for months rather than weeks. At other times, the BFMF offered their advice on which adjudicators should attend the Canadian festivals. In 1927, the British federation suggested Dr. James Lyon, Sir Richard Terry, Sir H. Walford-Davies and T.F. Dunhill for the Canadian tour, however, the Winnipeg administrators balked because they did not want to make decisions on behalf of the other festivals. However, these problems did not yet exist when the first trio of Anglo-Irish adjudicators, composer, conductor, and examiner Granville Bantock (1868-1946), Irish baritone Harry Plunket-Greene (1865-1936), and New York based T. Tertius Noble (1868-1953), officiated at the

\(^{41}\) There does not seem to have been any attempt to access the American market, as there were musicians of quality in New York, Boston and Chicago that would have been able to adjudicate.
1923 Western Canadian festivals (Saskatchewan, Alberta, Vancouver, Winnipeg) and the eastern festival in Toronto, Ontario.\footnote{I have listed the provincial names for the festivals in Saskatchewan and Alberta, because the festival venue alternated yearly between Prince Albert, Regina and Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, and Calgary and Edmonton, Alberta.}

In the first of two festival tours (the other was in 1932), Harry Plunket Greene adjudicated the vocal and choral classes. In his report on the state of the Canadian festivals published in *Music and Letters* (1923), he wrote in a colloquial manner about his experience of adjudicating in Canada. He spoke of the differences in the festivals, that is the Toronto festival had hardly any choirs, but many solo singers, which was quite the opposite in Winnipeg, where the few solo vocal classes were considered ‘so poor as to be almost negligible’ (361-62). On the other hand, Plunket-Greene remarked that ‘the choirs were splendid, and up to the level of any of the English festivals’ (362). Whether this was really true or not, he was certainly promoting Winnipeg as a choral city, so much so that he included a comment that he hoped the *Winnipeg Male Voice Choir* would perform at the 1924 Empire Exhibition in London.\footnote{The MVC did not attend the Empire Exhibition, citing the lack of finances.}

As an outcome of this article, published in a recognized academic journal and authored by a highly regarded singer, a certain status may have been bestowed upon the Canadian festivals, in which the job of adjudicating in Canada may have become more attractive to British adjudicators. Indeed, the tone of the article suggests that the Canadian tour, while it had its moments of discomfort (e.g., the trains lacked private sleeping accommodation), it was overall an enjoyable adventure.

While Plunket-Greene’s article may have enticed some British musicians to adjudicate at the Canadian festivals, essentially it was the affiliation between the MMCF and the BFMF that established the nearly forty-year relationship with British adjudicators of varying quality and the MMCF and other Canadian festivals. Between 1923 and 1950, Winnipeg hosted many highly respected British musicians including, but not only H.S. Roberton, Thomas H. Dunhill, Edgar Bainton, George Dodds, Frederic Staton, Arthur Benjamin, Alec Redshaw, Leonard Isaacs and Michael Head. Australian-born, British educated Arthur Benjamin also adjudicated at the festivals, and encouraged young musicians of
quality to study at the music colleges in London. Some adjudicators were repeat
visitors, as an example, between 1927 and 1945 Staton officiated at ten Winnipeg
festivals.

**Cloning the Model**

From 1926 onwards and primarily under the administration and direction of the
MMC, the representatives from the Canadian festivals met annually, affiliated as
the Canadian Federation of Music Festivals (CFMF). At the first conference,
discussions focused on adjudicator fees, competition dates, the unifying of
repertoire, and the retention of a high standard of adjudication. The Canadian
federation strengthened their ties with the BFMF by requesting a British associate
be appointed to represent them at BFMF meetings. In 1928, Hugh Roberton was
the first in a long line of British adjudicators to agree to this arrangement.
According to Roberton, his first priority was to help ‘standardize
management… and unity of conception’ (Canadian Federation of Music Festivals,
UMA, MCC, MSS11, Box 6, File 22, 1928, 5). He proposed the unifying of the
system of numbering and naming classes, modelled on that of the British festivals
to which he remarked ‘that the best methods survive’ (5). Canadian festival
programming, as with many of its other aspects was closely modeled on its British
counterpart, illustrating British influence even at the administrative level.

Roberton also strongly recommended that a training programme be instated
to develop Canadian adjudicators. Even in these early days (1928), he reported
that the demands for ‘top-notch’ British adjudicators were greater than the supply.
However, he added that ‘there were other “seconds” doing quite good work’.
(Canadian Federation of Music Festivals, UMA, MCC, MSS11, Box 6, File 22,
1928, 5). Over the ensuing decades, Canadian music professionals acquired
adjudication skills through various means including but not only by understudying
British adjudicators, and presiding over the growing number of smaller provincial
festivals.

**The Impact of Adjudicator Comments on High Art Reception**

The two local newspapers, *The Winnipeg Tribune* and the *Manitoba Free* Press,
played an important role in shaping high art vocal music in the city of Winnipeg. As
a member of the MMC, the general editor John W. Dafoe of the *Manitoba Free*
Press ensured that festival events were reported upon daily, sometimes with several articles appearing in the same publication, and often headlining alongside other front-page news. Through the commentary, the papers also reinforced the MMC’s cultural aspirations, including emphasizing the difference between ‘good’ and ‘bad’ music.

In the endorsing of the MMCF’s desire to differentiate between ‘good’ and ‘bad’ music, the Winnipeg Tribune quoted Sir James Aikins, who had adjudicated the original composition class in 1925. The parameters for the class involved setting original text to music with the subject being the province of Manitoba. The song had to be suitable for school-age children (no age limit noted). No award was presented for this class because the quality of composition was deemed not up to the festival standards. However, Adjudicator Aikens found the opportunity to speak against jazz. He is reported to have said,

There may be jazz in verse as well as jazz in notes, tone and rhythm. Jazz might descend to the vulgar in verse…. It could never ascend beyond the natural and commonplace. It might degrade but it could not elevate fine taste. That being so, there should be no jazz taught in music to school children. Otherwise they could not expect children to have a fine taste in music and that was what was desired in such festivals as this’ (At the Music Festival..., MFP, 09 May 1925, 12 (A)).

This reinforced the tone set for the festival, as one that aspired to develop children’s taste for high art music, rather than the popular musics of the day, including jazz.

In an article of 1925, an emphasis was placed on the educational purpose of the festival. Adjudicator Dr. Lyon declared, ‘It [is] no good merely to pat the people on the back and send them home thinking there [is] nothing to be improved upon’ (Music Competition is Underway, MFP, 01 May 1925, 7 (B)). Over the years, newspaper articles reported on adjudications of festival performances that offered cursory information on numerous subjects: the difference between chest and head tone, the shaping of vowels and consonants, diction, nasal resonance rather than nasal tone, breath support and control, on singing legato, the necessity of a...
relaxed jaw, on overcoming performance nerves, the conveyance of the text, repertoire choice, and honesty in one’s performance. This type of coverage increased the public’s awareness of what made a ‘winning’ performance, according to British and Brito-Canadian standards of the day. The festival adjudicators frequently praised many of Winnipeg’s choirs. In 1927, Frederic Staton remarked ‘What struck us tonight...[is] this young country of yours [is] rapidly overtaking the Old Country in choral singing, both technically and artistically’ (High Praise is..., MFP, 28 April 1927, 1 (B)).

A decade later, some of the critique on vocal technique that had been abundant in the 1920s had lessened, particularly in the assessment of choral groups. In his 1935 critique of St. Stephen’s Broadway United Church choir, Adjudicator Gordon Slater remarked on their performance, saying, ‘...It was a good round tone, no forcing, a splendid attack, and the voices were used naturally, a splendid interpretation’ (St. Stephens-Broadway..., WFP, 01 May 1935, 1 (A)). In his 1940 adjudication of a senior high school choir Moody ‘hoped the audience [had] noticed that the bases were a good foundation [and] the voices blended well’ (One Mark Apart..., WFP, 05 April 1940, 10, (B)). In the same year, a choir from Somerset School, trained by Filmer Hubble, also the conductor of the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir, was praised for its silvery quality, and the second place boy’s choir possessed ‘a cathedral tone’ so pure that one ‘couldn’t tell which country they came from’ (Scenic Songs. WFP, 11 April 1940, 5 (C)). Participating in the Winnipeg festival had vocally shaped more than one generation of children. By the late 1930s, some classroom teachers had been festival participants in their youth, and they continued the tradition, entering school or classroom choirs into numerous choral classes.

However, even as late as the 1930s the standard of much of the solo vocal work was considered not up to that of the choral (St. Andrews Lose..., MFP, 05 May 1928, 29 (A) and Highlights of Music Festival..., MFP, 12 May 1930, 2 (A-D)). In 1940, a Winnipeg Free Press headline read ‘Opera Howls: Adjudicator Scores Shrieking Vocalists’. John Goss, in adjudicating the operatic class said,

‘I've listened to lots of bad singing in my time but I've never heard such a concentration of it as this afternoon. I say this, not to be funny, but because it is literally true...at the operatic preliminaries
we heard some screeches and howls which were hardly human’... He said that the world of opera was tempting for young voices because of the characters that were portrayed. ‘But the rules are the same as for other singing...They must [at first] learn to sing simple tunes. It was not only cheek to choose celebrated big arias, but also they would destroy their young voices on them’ (Opera Howls, WFP, 08 April 1940, 8 (A-B)).

When questioned about the solo singing in the city, the MMC could only respond that there were some fine voices, but they chose not to enter into festival. I propose that these singers had already established themselves as soloists in the city, and they felt that they did not need the approval or criticism of adjudicators. Another possible reason why the solo singing was apparently not up to the standard of the choral singing is because of the nature of the use of the voice and its training. Vocal training that one might receive through a choral experience cannot be compared to years of private study. Choristers can be exceptional musicians, but that does not necessarily make them capable of being a soloist. A final possibility for poor solo singing can only be the lack of quality in the vocal teaching that was available in the city at the time. This would change, particularly because some British adjudicators took interest in specific festival performers.

Aside from their principal purpose, adjudicators influenced the Winnipeg musical community in other ways. They sometimes performed in solo concerts, setting a standard of excellence for aspiring Winnipeg musicians, and confirming their expertise for the role of adjudicator, as did T. Tertius Noble on May 16th 1919 (The Great English Organist, MFP, 26 April 1919, 25 (E-F)), or in a supporting role, as in the April 3rd 1939 concert featuring young Winnipeg cellist Lorne Munroe, accompanied by Arthur Benjamin (Will Appear in Concert..., WFP, 01 April 1939,16 (C-D)). Furthermore, adjudicators and expressly Benjamin, himself a colonial from Australia, made it possible for Munroe and other highly promising young Winnipeg musicians (e.g., organist and educator Hugh J. McLean and pianist and educator Glen Pierce), to study at the Royal Academy in London. Pierce returned to Winnipeg and as a secondary school music teacher, he shaped the next generation of Canadian students, patterned on his own British-sponsored music educational experience.
Winnipeg soprano and festival participant Gladys Whitehead also trained at the Royal Academy of Music, under the guidance of English singers John Coates and George Dodds, both of whom were major figures in the British festival movement and had adjudicated at the Winnipeg festival. Whitehead would become one of the first Winnipeg singing teachers of the post-World War II era to develop Winnipeg solo singers who were consistently praised by the British adjudicators. Viola Horch Falk, David Falk and Victor Martens, all of whom are Mennonites, were three of her pupils who won top accolades in the festival and went on to have international careers as soloists and educators. They are included here to illustrate an early link between the Brito-Canadian high art musical community of the mid-20th century and that of the Mennonite community, an ethno-religious group that came to the fore of the high art choral and solo vocal community of Winnipeg during the last quarter of the 20th century.

The relationship between Canadian pupils and the British music conservatories was mutually beneficial. The schools extended their influence in Canada, and the pupils benefitted from a musical education that was not yet possible to attain in Winnipeg (Interview, Glen Pierce, 14 May 2009). Without the festivals, and in particular the British adjudicators, this avenue would not have been as viable.

British Influence on Repertoire Performed at Canadian Festivals

In his 1923 article, Plunket-Green noted that there were significant improvements to be made across the festivals. He wrote, ‘In the matter of performance, enthusiasm and efficiency of organisation their festivals can stand comparison with any of our own, but the class of music chosen was not good enough’ (Plunket Greene, 1923, 369).

In a discussion about repertoire at the first annual meeting of the Canadian Federation of Music Festivals (1926), concern was voiced about how to equal out the standards of the test pieces, so that the adjudicators could assess the standard attained at all festivals more easily. The plan was not so easily achieved because of the difference in standards between some of the smaller festivals and that of Winnipeg. An agreement was reached, in that the federation would request sample copies suitable for Festival purposes from a selected list of British publishers. The syllabi would be developed from these samples. It was noted that
'lots of useless stuff' was received, but enough appropriate music was attained to make suitable choices. Most importantly, all the music would be available. The Manitoba festival being the largest in the Federation exchanged lists of their repertoire choices with the other festivals.

Close examination of repertoire lists from the Winnipeg festival in the years 1919, 1920 and then in five-year increments, up to and including 1950, discloses that the majority of vocal and choral repertoire was drawn from the British school and published by Novello, Curwen, Boosey and Company, Stainer and Bell, Edward Arnold and Company, and Oxford University Press. This illustrates the influence of the BFMF on test pieces chosen by the Winnipeg festival, which were almost exclusively from British repertoire. Within a decade of the inaugural festival, many of the own choice selections were also chosen from this preferred repertoire as illustrated by Robertson’s 1928 report on the Canadian festivals, in which he noted that the standard of test pieces selected had shown considerable advance and 'in Manitoba particularly, the standard of the competitor’s “Own Selections” was admirable, showing they had taken to heart some of the strictures passed by [baritone] Mr. Campbell McInness [1874-1945] two years ago' (Report of the 3rd Annual Conference: CFMF, UMA, MMC, MSS11, Box 11, Folder 22, 5).

As an example of British influence in repertoire, the 1935 festival offered 102 vocally related classes out of 165 classes in total. A small sample of the set test repertoire is as follows: ‘As Vesta was from Latmos Hill Descending’ (Weelkes), ‘Now is the Month of Maying’ (Morley), ‘Sing we and Chant It’ (Morley), ‘The Passing of the Moon’ (Purcell), ‘Fine Knacks for Ladies’ (Dowland), ‘Dreams’ (Hubert Parry), ‘Shall we go dance’ (Stanford), ‘Spring Sorrow’ (John Ireland), ‘Where Corals Lie’ (Elgar), ‘Cloths of Heaven’ (Dunhill), ‘A Song of the Virgin Mother’ (Bainton), ‘Dream Valley’ (Roger Quilter), ‘Love’s Prisoner’ (Armstrong Gibbs) and ‘My True Love Hath my Heart’ (Thiman).

The repertoire chosen for vocal and choral classes between 1919 and 1950 points to the success of the MMC in establishing a high-art vocal culture in the city of Winnipeg. By implementing primarily British choral and vocal music in the

---

44 In 1950, 116 out of 212 festival classes were vocally related. Of these, 74 songs came from the British repertoire, 5 from Canadian repertoire, 3 each by Handel and Mendelssohn, 22 were own choice (unknown) and 6 from German repertoire. The remaining 4 would have been repeated performance for finals in the trophy classes.
festival as test pieces, and by encouraging ‘own choice’ repertoire to be drawn from the same pool, at least two generations of school children were vocally shaped by the MMC’s Brito-Canadian image.

**Conclusion**
In Winnipeg and throughout Canada, the MMC was unswerving in its devotion towards implementing what their Brito-Canadian members deemed as the best musical standards based on the advice and support of the BFMF. Through participation in choral activities, generations of Winnipeg school-aged children were to some extent musically shaped by the paradigm of the Manitoba Music Competition Festival. Between 1919 and 1945, most of the repertoire disseminated through the festival’s syllabi was British and issued through British publishing houses, while performance standards were instituted and maintained by British adjudicators. The *Manitoba Free Press* and *The Winnipeg Tribune* were instrumental in shaping performance and reception of the vocal and choral high art culture in Winnipeg. Through the guidance of their editors, who were both MMC members, the print media advertised the event, promoted the status of the British adjudicators based on ethnicity, informed its readership on daily festival programming, and reported on adjudications.

Applying the theory of DeNora (2000), the activities of the MMC fully illustrate how the actions of a few dedicated individuals can shape and impact society in profound ways. Their class, gender and ethnicity afforded them the authority, capability and dynamism to fulfill their aspirations. The MMC was the driving force behind establishing a musical standard in Winnipeg and across Canada that was seeded in their imagined vision of a Brito-Canadian society and cultivated through their association with the BFMF. In the second half of the twentieth-century Canadian musical identity grew in step with the country’s evolving status as a multi-cultural society, which rejected British influence as fervently as it had once been sought (Tippet, 1990; Kuffert, 2003). Yet the festival movement continued to flourish as an upholder of musicals standards, infused with Canadian repertoire and adjudicated by Canadian musicians. Competing in a competition music festival is still considered by many aspiring musicians and their teachers as a valued experience for musical growth.
CHAPTER 4: MENNONITE INFLUENCES ON WINNIPEG CHORAL CULTURE

Then you will recite to one another psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs; you will sing and make music to the Lord with your hearts.

Prologue
Over the centuries, Mennonites have spread from their origins in Germany, Holland and Switzerland to fifty-seven countries, and now include people from many different races and ethnicities, forming numerous Mennonite identities. In 2003, and counting only the baptized members of the Mennonite and Brethren in Christ churches, there were over 1.3 million worldwide. In 2001, there were 191,465 Mennonites in Canada. The province of Manitoba had the largest population, 51,540 Mennonites in Canada, and Winnipeg with 18,240, measured as the largest urban population of Mennonites in the world (Statistics Canada, 2001, Cited Thiessen, 2013, 166).

Introduction
In this chapter, I investigate the rise of Mennonite choral conductors and singers to positions of prominence in Winnipeg between 1975 and 2000 and what this has meant to the broader musical community. The majority of research on Mennonite music making has been undertaken by scholars of Mennonite ethnicity and faith (Arnold Schellenberg, 1968; Doreen Klassen, 1989, 1995, 2002; Bertha Klassen, 1993; Wesley Berg, 1985, 1988, 1991, 2001, 2003; Marlene Kropf and Kenneth

45 Affirming world Mennonite populations is challenging because Mennonite and Mennonite Brethren in Christ churches are the only ones to maintain international statics. Since Mennonites practice adult baptism, their statics do not include children, youth, or Mennonites who have not joined a specific church. If they did, the population would probably double. (Thiessen, 2013, 166)

46 I do not address the relationship between Mennonite identity and the differing styles of musical expression as presented in their worship services. For an overview of this subject and the tensions that can arise, see Jonathan Dueck, 'Worship Wars, World Music and Menno-nots: Recent Studies in Mennonite Music', The Journal of Mennonite Studies, (2005), 131-45.
Nafziger, 2001; Rudy Schellenberg, 2006; Peter Letkemann, 1987, 2007; and Jonathan Dueck, 2004, 2005, 2011) and focuses on the role of music and repertoire as moulded by and practiced within the many interpretations of Mennonite ethnicity and faith.

Royden Loewen (2008) suggests that 'ethnicity and religion are intertwined in a dynamic and pliable manner’ (357). For contemporary Canadian Mennonites, the imagined self-perceptions of what it is to be Mennonite highlights contested scripts, divergent as their lifestyles and communities. In a summation of Loewen’s (2008) investigation of the role ethnicity plays in contemporary Canadian Mennonite lives, Janice Thiessen (2013) lists six different possible categorizations of Mennonite identity: embracing ethnic identity with a de-emphasis on religious tradition; simultaneous embracing of ethnicity and religious tradition; simultaneous embracing of ethnicity and Canadian evangelicalism; urban rejection of ethnicity and embracing of social activism; conservative rural connection of faith and ethnicity; and simultaneous embracing of ethnicity separated or distinct from religion (167). This research focuses on the Mennonite identity that simultaneously embraces ethnicity and religious tradition. As in other studies, Russian-Mennonites and their descendants form the main ethnic group in this narrative. I follow the approach taken by Doreen Klassen (1989), Wesley Berg (1985) and Jonathan Dueck (2005) who treat Russian Mennonite ethnicity as an identity where boundary maintenance is strongly marked – ‘constructed and defended (closed) and sometimes negotiated and transgressed (opened) in relation to broader society’ (Dueck, 2005, 127). Language and a particular choral tradition present robust cultural markers.

The research and findings of Mennonite scholars have profoundly influenced my reading of Mennonite choral culture as it has evolved from the steppes of Russia to the Canadian Prairies and into urban spaces. Nevertheless, as a non-Mennonite, my perspective on the topic of Mennonite music making, principally the choral culture, is received and analysed through a different and distinct lens, one outside of the culture. Moreover, my interest in this subject lies within a broader context, the shaping of Winnipeg’s choral culture, in which individual Mennonites have played important roles over the last forty years. To that end, I have drawn upon existing research as a basis for locating the point of
departure from where Mennonite singers and choral conductors rose to dominate positions of influence within Winnipeg singing cultures.

By identifying relations of power – political, social and religious – and examining how they impacted, and were negotiated by Mennonite musicians within and outside their community, this discourse attempts to interpret how Mennonites rose to positions of prominence as conductors and educators, within Winnipeg’s choral culture, beginning in the last third of the twentieth century. I trace the shifting relations of influence between the musical communities of Mennonites and Brito-Canadians, observing the rise of one and the decline of the other. This research adds to the body of knowledge on Mennonite choral traditions by presenting these traditions as a diasporic phenomenon, located within mainstream music making in the urban center of Winnipeg, as a space somewhat distanced from their purpose and praxis in Mennonite church services. The chapter draws on two relevant ethnographic theories – Loewen’s theory of diaspora (2006) and Tina Ramnarine’s theory of calibrations (2007) – and touches upon three social theories: Pierre Bourdieu’s theory of cultural capital (1984), Giles, Howard, Coupland, Coupland’s (1991) theory of linguistic accommodation, and Park and Burgess’s (1921) theory of accommodation.

Mennonites are an ethno-religious group who trace their origins to the Protestant Reformation of the sixteenth century when numerous and divergent groups of northern European peoples separated from the Catholic Church, establishing Protestantism and Anabaptism, the latter to which Mennonites are affiliated. Widely persecuted for their beliefs, the more conservative disengaged from society in general, forming tight-knit self-reliant communities. For some groups, migration became a means of avoiding religious persecution, military service and other attempts by outsiders to influence their beliefs and life style.

The notions of diaspora and transnationalism have often been used interchangeably in discussions of migrant peoples. Recent anthropological research, significantly Quayson and Daswani (2013), has attempted to disentangle the many different readings. They begin by outlining the historical reading of diaspora to which certain conditions must be met. These include, but are not limited to
... the time-depth of a dispersal and settlement in other locations; the development of a myth of the homeland; the attendant diversification of responses to homeland and host nation; the evolution of class segmentation and conflict within a given diaspora alongside the concomitant evolution of an elite group of cultural and political brokers; and the ways in which contradictions among the various class segments end up reinforcing different forms of material and emotional investment in an imaginary ideal of the homeland (Quayson and Daswani, 2013, 3)

As a migrant community, the Mennonite diaspora meets many of the historical criteria for diaspora as will be illustrated throughout this chapter. The Mennonites in Winnipeg, similar to other diaspora peoples, cannot be seen as a ‘discrete entity but rather as being formed out of a series of contradictory convergences of peoples, ideas and even cultural orientations’ (Quayson and Daswani, 2013, 3). Multiple immigrations and generations of Mennonites with divergent theological beliefs and religious practices shaped by the social and political narratives of homeland and host nation comprise the urban Mennonite community of Winnipeg.

*Mennonite Immigration to the Canadian Prairies*

Over the last three centuries, there have been several key migrations within Europe and four immigrations to North and South America (Harry Loewen, 1999 - B) involving two distinct groups of European Mennonites, the Swiss-South German and the Dutch-North German-Prussian groups. The majority of Manitoba Mennonites who are the subject of this study are affiliated ethnically to the second group, the Dutch-North German-Prussian Mennonites.47 Throughout the 16th and

47 The Swiss-South German Mennonites moved to the Alsace and the Palatinate, and by the end of the seventeenth century had crossed the Atlantic to start a new life in the North American colony of Pennsylvania. After the American War of Independence (1776), some 2,000 Swiss-South German Mennonites, known today as Pennsylvanian Mennonites migrated to the British North America, acquiring land from private owners in the Niagara Peninsula, York and Waterloo Counties in what is present day Ontario, Canada, where they established strong communities. Another emigration from the USA to Canada occurred in 1917 when the American government invoked conscription as it entered into the mire of World War I.
early-17th centuries, Mennonites migrated from the Netherlands, moving progressively eastward to Prussia and Polish-Prussia in part to avoid persecution and military service, and in part for economic reasons. At the waning of the eighteenth century, the Prussian Mennonites migrated to South Russia (modern-day Ukraine) at the invitation of the Russian Empress Catherine the Great. For nearly a century, the Mennonite population in Russia grew and through their hard work and success, their religious, cultural and educational institutions thrived.

In the mid-19th century, Russian political changes began to whittle away at the privileges to which Mennonites had become accustomed. When their military exemption was threatened and Mennonite men were obliged to perform alternate service to the state, whole communities considered immigration to the Americas.

In 1872, a delegation of Russian Mennonite elders visited sites in the USA and Canada to explore the possibilities of developing new settlements on the prairies, a landscape that was similar to their home on the steppes of South Russia. Between 1872 and 1880, approximately 7,000 Russian Mennonites immigrated to Manitoba, the greater majority of Mennonite immigrants settled in the mid-western USA. This was the first of three significant Mennonite migrations to Manitoba from the Russian territories.

---

48 Catherine the Great offered Mennonites among other European settlers large tracts of arable land, a permanent exemption from military service, some degree of self-governance, including the right to establish schools and teach in their own language, privileges that exceeded those of the local Ukrainian and Russian peasants. On the other hand, Russian law forbade Mennonites from subdividing their land, from marrying out of or leaving their colonies and proselytizing amongst the Russian Orthodox Christians. Any infractions could result in the revocation of their privileges.

49 The exemption from military service combined with several years of drought and poor crops motivated more than 18,000 of Prussian Mennonites in Russia to leave for North America. At this time the Canadian government was actively seeking immigrants, particularly of British, Scandinavian and German nationality, to develop the agriculture industry in its newest province Manitoba, and expand the Canadian presence into its Northwest Territories, the modern-day provinces of Saskatchewan and Alberta. Although the Mennonites came from Russian territories, they considered themselves a Germanic people as did the Canadian government.

50 The Mennonites were the first large block of Europeans to immigrate to Manitoba followed soon after by the Icelanders. Much of the land that was settled by the Mennonites had been home to numerous Aboriginal and Métis (mixed blood) peoples who were removed to make way for European colonists. Aside from generous land agreements of some 500,000 acres divided between two settlements, the civil liberties of cultural and educational autonomy and exemption from military service were negotiated between the Canadian government and the Mennonites.
Establishing their communities based on congregational affiliation, the Mennonites transplanted their social structure and village life-style from Russia to the Canadian prairies. Over the next forty years, this pioneering group of conservative Mennonites and their descendants created a distinct rural Canadian Mennonite society. It was shaped by the hardships of homesteading, by the conflicts with the provincial government over control of schools and municipal organizations, and by the tensions over religious doctrine within their own congregations. This group of pioneering Mennonites became known as ‘Kanadier’ (Canadian), distinguishing them from the next wave of immigrants (John J. Friesen, 1990). The second major immigration to Canada began soon after the Russian Revolution of 1917. As an ethno-religious community under the rule of a communist and atheist government, Mennonites were greatly concerned not only for their way of life, but also for their individual survival. Between 1922 and 1930, the years in which restrictions by Soviet Union and Canadian governments became problematic for Mennonites who wanted to emigrate, the Canadian Mennonite Board of Colonization and Canadian Pacific Railway worked in partnership to help over 21,000 Mennonites come to Canada. Approximately 10,000 of these settled principally in rural Manitoba. The new community of the Russländer (Russian) Mennonites was distinct from the Kanadier in its religious, political, educational and economic outlook. In contrast to the Kanadier (s) who left Russia in order to maintain a conservative lifestyle, the more socially progressive Russländer (s) had remained, adapting their lifestyle if and when necessary to the shifting Russian political and social milieu.

Accommodation, as an aspect of assimilation theory, was first introduced by Chicago sociologists Robert Park and Ernest Burgess (1921) as a model of social interaction for investigating racial and ethnic social change that occurred in the USA between 1890 and 1930. They defined accommodation as an approach in which individuals and groups make the necessary alterations in their social world

Conflicts arose between the provincial government and the Mennonites over the control of municipal and educational organizations. At the outbreak of World War I, when the government attempted to secularize schools, and institute English as the language of education, schisms within the colonies resulted in the more conservative groups of Mennonites emigrating from Manitoba, migrating to Mexico and Paraguay. Although military exemption lasted throughout World War I, it became a contentious and dividing issue in World War II.
in order to limit conflict, and to strengthen relationships between dominant and less-dominant groups of peoples co-existing within a society, as did the Mennonite Russländer community in Russia. Russländer accommodations included developing political acumen enabling them to respond to changes in the Russian political landscape, elevating education standards to compete in the Russian economy, expanding career opportunities beyond the realm of agriculture, and complying with language laws.

Compared to the Kanadier who left Russia in order to maintain their conservative lifestyle, the Russländer community had made social and political adjustments that allowed them to continue to flourish and grow their society in Russia until severe political actions that shook the very foundations of what it meant to be Mennonite made further accommodation impossible. The upheavals of World War I and the Bolshevik Revolution (1917) inflicted serious damage on the social and economic fabric of Russländer society. Many lost property and family, and emigration to Canada was seen as the key to their survival. While some were able to pay their own fare and start-up costs in Canada, most arrived in abject poverty, in debt to the Canadian Pacific Railway, taken in by the Kanadier community who found that many of the newcomers were unfamiliar with the farm work they were expected to do. The shared cultural attributes of non-resistance (Wehrlosigkeit), the use of German as the language of worship, the endorsement of endogamy, an affiliation with a Germanic heritage, and real and imagined histories provided some common ground between the two groups. Yet the

---

52 Political historian James Urry (2006) refers to Russian Mennonite society in the period before WWI as an idealized ‘Golden Age’, ‘a place and a time when the hidden potential of Mennonite life had been most realized and its destruction was the greatest tragedy to befall Mennonites’ (loc. 5314).

53 As a result of the Winnipeg General Strike of 1919, all immigrants, British and non-British alike, were required to settle in rural Manitoba. The Canadian government was highly concerned about immigrants who might support communist labour movements, and their possible influence in urban centres, which might exacerbate an existing political problem. The Russländer experience during the Bolshevik Revolution had produced the opposite effect, instilling anti-communist and anti-labour sentiments in the majority of their community (Urry, 2006).

54 Nonresistance is an aspect of Mennonite theology that is distinct from the terms pacifism and nonviolence, and is based on biblical readings of the Sermon of the Mount (Matthew 5: 38-42) where Jesus says ‘If someone strikes you on the right cheek, turn to him the other’. Mennonites have historically interpreted this passage to mean that people should do nothing to physically resist an enemy. An application for Mennonites and other Anabaptist groups was to teach conscientious objection of
tensions between the Kanadier and Russländer were inevitable and immediate because of their divergent experiences and variety of religious expression. The new immigrants were perceived by the Kanadier as ‘arrogant, worldly, and unwilling to engage in manual labour’, while the Russländer saw their hosts as being ‘simple-minded, uncultured, afraid of education, and too satisfied with tradition’ (Doerksen, 1993, 1).

Many Russländer were better educated and some had been the wealthy land and industrial elite of Mennonite society in pre-revolutionary Russia. Despite the immigration restrictions on domicile, some moved to the city in the 1920s to pursue careers in business and the professions (Urry, 2006). Others migrated nearer to the city into a still un-cleared area of bush in the municipality of North Kildonan, where they established themselves as market gardeners, chiefly in chicken and egg production. Here they had the opportunity to exploit ‘the benefits of trade and industry in Winnipeg’ (Lohrenz, 1951, cited Urry, 2006, loc. 4722). Being in proximity to the city, their children were offered better opportunities for education, leading to greater career choices.

The Urban Mennonites of Winnipeg
The urban mainly Russländer community retained their ideals of ‘cultural separation based on religion, the German language and endogamy’ (Urry, 2006, loc. 4894), yet their recent experiences of political change in Russia, despite their attempts at limited accommodation, indicated that engagement with the ‘world’ was necessary. ‘Wealth, education, and political contacts’ (Urry, 2006, loc. 5314) were required to develop their society and maintain their identity within pluralist Winnipeg. This signified a shift in the way many urban Mennonites saw military conscription to their youth. Suggested readings and an extensive bibliography on the Mennonite concept of nonresistance that illustrates a shift in perspective given the context of time can be found under the heading, ‘Nonresistance’ (1956 and 1991) in GAMEO. See. http://gameo.org/index.php?title=Nonresistance. While nonresistance may be considered by some distinct from pacifism, some Mennonite scholars including Jonathan Dueck (2005), have chosen to eliminate the distinction, and use the term pacifism to describe the resistance to military service.
themselves, the juxtaposition of maintaining aspects of their faith while engaging a cosmopolitan community.\textsuperscript{55}

Raymond Breton (1974), a distinguished Canadian sociologist in the field of ethnic group relations, suggests that the building of institutions by minority groups is necessary for survival. The more institutionally complete their society, the better they maintain their identity. Between 1920 and 1950, the growing Winnipeg Mennonite community of chiefly Russländer immigrants built the foundations of the expansive and complex urban Mennonite society that exists today in Winnipeg. They founded seven congregations (North End Mennonite Brethren, South End Mennonite Brethren, North Kildonan Mennonite Brethren, Schönwieser, Sargent, Bethel, and North Kildonan Mennonite Church) supporting multiple expressions of Mennonite faith, a hospital (1928), a senior-citizens home (1948), a private high school (1946), and two national colleges (1944 and 1947). Mennonite values and identity were also disseminated through print media.\textsuperscript{56}

After World War II, approximately 7,000 Mennonite refugees from the Soviet Union immigrated to Canada, with some 1,000 arriving in Manitoba. They entered into the fabric of Winnipeg, settling mainly in the East Kildonan and Elmwood area, where a strong Mennonite presence already existed. Sometimes these newcomers worked for other Mennonites in the newly developing Mennonite manufacturing and business community, and often the women worked in non-


\textsuperscript{56} This contribution was so influential that the city became known in wider Mennonite circles as ‘a Mennonite media Mecca’. (Driedger, 2010, 159) In 1878, the German language newspaper \textit{Die Mennonitische Rundschau} began as the Nebraska Ansiedler, changed its name and moved to Elkhart, Indiana in 1880 and to Scottsdale, PA from 1908-1923. In 1923, the publication office was moved to Winnipeg. It provided important information on community, denominations and world affairs to Mennonite and other German-speaking immigrants and served the community for over eighty years, ceasing publication in 2007. \textit{Die Rundschau} was the older of two German-language Mennonite newspapers that were available in Winnipeg. The second, \textit{Der Bote}, was founded in Rosthern, Saskatchewan in 1924 and moved its offices to Winnipeg in the 1970s. As of 2005, there were still about 3,000 subscribers to this publication, 2,000 in Canada, 600 in Germany, 300 in Paraguay and Mexico, and 50 each in the US, Ukraine and Russia. (Driedger, 2010, 151) After 1950, many English-language Mennonite newspapers, denomination and scholarly journals were founded and published in Winnipeg.
Mennonite homes as house cleaners. Musicologist Peter Letkemann, who came to Canada in this wave of immigration, recalls as a child in the mid-1950s going with his mother to be her translator, when she ‘cleaned for the English’ in a River Heights home in Winnipeg (Interview, Peter Letkemann, 06 September 2013). Into this world of urban adjustment, where the new Russian Mennonite immigrants forged a community with earlier groups, came the third or fourth generation Kanadier, many of whose farming livelihoods had been erased by economic and industrial changes. This further compounded the complexities of Mennonite society in Winnipeg.

Loewen’s (2006) investigation of the dispersion of Mennonite farming communities to non-rural and urban areas in the mid-20th century suggests ‘a diaspora within a diaspora’, the displaced farmers encountering significant social and cultural change, yet finding their place within the wider Mennonite community of Winnipeg. Loewen’s research offers another way of thinking about diaspora, and this is beneficial in understanding the significant role choral singing plays in the discourse of identity between multiple generations of the differing groups that comprise the Mennonite community in Winnipeg. I suggest that beginning in the late 1940s, the city as a locus, whose divergent peoples were impacted by post-war political, social and religious values, provided the perfect environment for the confluence of Mennonite peoples to create a new urban identity in part expressed through, and recognized by, choral singing. I agree with sociologist Leo Driedger (2010) who claims, ‘In the urbanization process, they [Mennonites] had to bridge cultures creatively, making music [and] sharing values through the arts’ (2010, 12). Essentially, choral singing as a Mennonite social and religious activity helped to bind the community together, in one sense as a way of lessening the influences from the wider society, yet in another sense also as a means for integration and recognition in the wider community.

Choral Singing as an expression of Mennonite Identity

Choral singing is central to Canadian Mennonite identity. Its growth as a cultural signifier began in Russian Mennonite colonies in the second half of the nineteenth

---

57 Peter Letkemann (1986) has extensively researched Russian Mennonite choral singing tradition in Russia. Wesley Berg (1985, 1986, 1988, 2003) traces the development of the choral singing tradition from Russia to the Canadian Prairies, introduces the key
century and was shaped by changing trends in education and influenced by amateur German choral movements. A pathway to its development came via a critical social and theological change, a response by a certain group of Mennonites who were critical of ‘kirchliche’ Mennonite faith and practice. Historian John. B. Toews (1993) in his study of Mennonite and Russian/Soviet relations aptly describes ‘kirchkliche’ Mennonite society in Russia from the arrival of the first Mennonite migrants in 1788 to the period when the new denomination, the Mennonite Brethren were founded in 1860. He states, ‘Mennonites in Russia – geographically isolated, intellectually anaemic and spiritually impoverished – “had become a society to themselves. Religion and politics had intermingled, church and state had become one”’ (Toews, 1982, 31, cited 1993, 7). The schism in the Mennonite community, the formation of the bibliocentric denomination (Toews, 1993) of Mennonite Brethren with their spiritual renewal and new faith practice led to a change in both musical praxis and repertoire for their community. Four-part congregational singing, led by a choir, became an important form of musical expression in the life and worship of the community. Choirs also performed an important social function by providing a culturally acceptable activity for young people to meet and socialize while spreading the gospel.

Between the 1890s and the late-1920s, the time period in which Mennonites in Russia gradually lost many privileges, freedoms and prosperity owing to Russian assimilationist policies, the cultural value attached to choral singing rose. When language restrictions were imposed by the Russian government limiting the use of German as the language of instruction in Mennonite schools, the continuation of the Mennonite choral tradition, as one way of maintaining the German language, was repositioned out of the classroom and into the community, primarily the church.

Music was considered ‘one of the most potent forces for maintaining the interest of young people and for encouraging them to remain true to the faith of their fathers’ (Berg, 1985, 38). The development of choirs and the training of directors gained a certain resolve. A choral conductors’ association was established (c. 1898), with song festivals (Sängerfeste) and directing workshops (Dirigentenkurse) becoming more frequent. World War I and the ensuing Bolshevik individuals responsible for the continuation of choral singing in Canadian Mennonite rural communities, and examines repertoire and praxis prior to 1950.
revolution destroyed the ‘hidden potential’ of Russian Mennonite society (Urry, 2006, loc. 5314), just as Mennonites were ‘about to enter the mainstream of the Western musical tradition’ (Berg, 1985, 38).

Emigrating from Russia in the 1920s, the Mennonite musicians Franz Thiessen (1881-1950), Kornelius Neufeld (1892-1957), John Konrad (1889-1962) and David Paetkau (1903-1972) became central figures in continuing the Russian Mennonite choral tradition in Canada where choirs were quickly established in the new prairie locales. In 1927, a choir was formed in Grunthal, Manitoba, even before a congregation was founded, with Mennonite Brethren and Kirchlicher Mennonites singing together (Berg, 1985, 56). In North Kildonan, the Mennonite Brethren started a choir in 1928, followed by the General Conference (GC) Mennonites in 1933.\footnote{General Conference Mennonite Church, one of the three main Mennonite groups in North America, the others being Mennonite Brethren and Mennonite Church, was formed in 1860 with three Mennonite congregations. By 1955, there were over 50,000 members in 224 congregations spread over North and South America. The formula for uniting congregations that varied widely in customs and practices was founded on an agreement in essentials (theology), and freedom in non-essentials (practice). In 1999 a new structure was approved, with the Mennonite Church Canada founded in 2000, and the Mennonite Church USA in 2002.}

In Canadian prairie Mennonite communities, the education of Mennonite singers and choir conductors was undertaken through Dirigentenkurse, conducting workshops, and Sängerfeste, choral festivals, the latter being a valued enterprise in which amity between Mennonite communities was celebrated, and visions of a larger musical world imparted. Irmgard Baerg (b. 1942), an internationally acclaimed Mennonite concert pianist, spoke about the importance of Sängerfeste during her childhood, growing up in rural Manitoba. She remarked, ‘[It was] an incredibly important musical experience that makes you see far beyond your own little activities on the piano or singing’ (Interview, 27 Jan 2014). The presentation of partial or complete complex works such as Mendelssohn’s Paulus, Loewe’s Das Sühnopfer, Romberg’s Das Lied von der Glocke, Haydn’s Creation, and Handel’s Messiah stimulated the desire by some to further develop their musical skills.

Over the first half of the 20th century there were four highly respected Mennonite choral conductors active in Winnipeg and area – the three who had emigrated from Russia, Franz Thiessen, K.H. Neufeld, John Konrad, and Lutheran-born Ben Horch. These men engaged with Mennonite communities, both

\footnote{General Conference Mennonite Church, one of the three main Mennonite groups in North America, the others being Mennonite Brethren and Mennonite Church, was formed in 1860 with three Mennonite congregations. By 1955, there were over 50,000 members in 224 congregations spread over North and South America. The formula for uniting congregations that varied widely in customs and practices was founded on an agreement in essentials (theology), and freedom in non-essentials (practice). In 1999 a new structure was approved, with the Mennonite Church Canada founded in 2000, and the Mennonite Church USA in 2002.}
rural and urban, as educators at the conducting workshops and choir directors at the choral festivals. After the establishment of the two Winnipeg-based national Mennonite bible colleges, Mennonite Brethren Bible College (MBBC) in 1944 and Canadian Mennonite Bible College (CMBC) in 1947, the education of choral conductors was institutionalized. This left the Sängerfeste tradition in the hands of travelling musical directors who, after 1955, were often young recent graduates of the two colleges.

For generations of Canadian MB and GC communities, singing in four-part harmony, developed through Sängerfeste and Dirigentenkurse, strongly signified their identity as a diasporic ethno-religious people, which was inextricably linked with Mennonite worship service and community fellowship. Choral singing expresses embodied cultural capital, as theorized by Pierre Bourdieu (1984), a deep familial socialization, where traditions and cultures are both consciously acquired or passively inherited. Even as late as the 1980s, many Mennonite children instinctively learned to sing in harmony through their attendance at church and other community social events (Interviews, David Klassen, 12 May 2014; Elroy Friesen, 27 Sept 2014). In 1985, under the umbrella of the Mennonite colleges church seminar series, American conductor Robert Shaw directed a large Mennonite choir in Winnipeg, assembled from the best Mennonite amateur singers from Ontario, the prairie provinces and British Columbia. He noted the ‘natural sound…unanimity and smoothness’ of the choir, and suggested this was due on one hand to physiology, ‘If you look at the choir, you see a lot of cousins’ (D. Martens, 1985, 9). On the other hand and in accordance with Bourdieu’s theory Shaw remarked, the choristers ‘ sang the same way…the same hymns for the same reasons – and…in four parts. There is also a very great intellectual and spiritual commitment…which is also unanimous’ (D. Martens, 1985, 9, cited R. Schellenberg, 2007, 98). Sound File 1 is an example of the commitment to the music, performed as Shaw noted. It is uncut and raw, recorded on my iPhone from my seat in the audience. The chorale in this recording, ‘O Haupt voll Blut und

59 For a detailed narrative of these four men, and their significance and value to Mennonite musical development, see Chapter 5 of Berg, Wesley. ‘Five Dedicated Leaders’ in From Russia with Music, Winnipeg: Hyperion Press, 1985, 64-79. See also Peter Letkmenna’s discussion of Thiessen, K.H. Neufeld and John Konrad in Ben Horch, Winnipeg: Old Oak Publishing, 2007.
Wunden’ (‘O Head, full of blood and wounds’) is sung in four parts in German by the mainly Mennonite audience attending the 13 April 2014 performance of *St. Matthew Passion*, performed by the Winnipeg baroque ensembles Canzona and MusikBarock, conducted by Henry Engbrecht. It illustrates the strong tradition of SATB (soprano, alto, tenor, bass) singing that developed over the years, shaped by lay ministers, and educators from in and outside of the tradition.

*The Mennonite Brethren Choral Tradition*

The familiar hymns of the Mennonite Brethren church are based on the gospel tradition. In 1954, A.H. Unruh, administrator of the Mennonite Brethren Bible College, remarked, ‘Among the Mennonite Brethren, songs expressing the joy and certainty of salvation were preferred to those expressing longing for salvation and a holy way of life. Evangelistic songs became better established . . . The lighter English melodies were also sung more than the chorales’ (A.H. Unruh, 1954, 744, cited in Berg, 1985, 20). The basis of the repertoire included the spiritual folksong, popular in Germany in the first half of the 19th century and illustrated by the hymns in Sound File 2: ‘So nimm denn meine Hände’ (‘Take Thou my Hand, O Father’). German translations of American gospel hymns, for instance Sound Files 3: ‘Welch ein Freund ist unser Jesus’ (‘What a friend we have in Jesus’), gleaned from the late-nineteenth-century American and English revival movement of Moody and Sankey, were added to the repertoire. By 1900, the gospel music of the Mennonite Brethren church was characterized by simple melodies, rudimentary harmonies, and rousing refrains and texts that tended to stress subjective religious experience (Berg, 1985, 20). In mid-century Winnipeg, this repertoire, the *Kernlieder* (core songs) continued to be the core music of the MB congregations (Letkemann, 2007, 226-236).

Within most Mennonite congregations, music was utilitarian and considered ‘good’ only if it was able to help accomplish something, presenting the message of Christ and growing church membership. With the changes in environment from rural to urban, the influences of modern technologies including the radio, and exposure to non-Mennonite peoples with their many ways of living, choral singing, as it had been in Russia, was recognized as an invaluable tool to guard, guide and nurture Mennonite youth. At the 1946 MB Northern District Conference, Mennonite Brethren musician Ben Horch, in his role as a music educator and
drawing on the nineteenth-century ideals of building Christian character through choral singing, stated,

> Whoever has the youth, also has the future, and whoever has singing and music has the youth. Singing and music have an ennobling influence on people, particularly on maturing young people. We must provide something better and more solid than what the world can offer (Yearbook of the Northern District Conference, 1946, 62, cited in Regehr, 2012, 261).

Maintaining the interest of the youth was imperative as Mennonites practice adult baptism. Without engaging the youth and guiding them to baptism, church membership would quickly decline. Being in a church choir reinforced Mennonite faith, aided in preserving an endogamous community, while cultivating the philosophy of service, the act of giving back to your community.

Music served a purpose as an expression of Mennonite faith and theology. However, art for art's sake was an unfamiliar and potentially dangerous concept for many Mennonites. The question ‘Can the arts serve to glorify the Lord?’ continually fuelled debate in Mennonite communities, arising first with Franz Thiessen in the 1920s (Berg, 1988), and in the decades that followed, continuing with Ben Horch (Letkemann, 2007), and remaining part of the Mennonite Brethren conversation into the 1970s. As Mennonites, such as Ben Horch at the Mennonite Brethren Bible College (MBBC) in Winnipeg, began to achieve elevated levels of proficiency, they sought new and more complex repertoire such as G.F. Handel's Messiah, the chorales of J.S. Bach, H. Schütz’s Christmas Oratorio, Brahms’s Requiem, Walton’s Belshazzar's Feast and Britten's War Requiem. Increased musical proficiency, the use of soloists and the introduction of languages other than German often created strong tensions between musicians and many MB elders. Theologically, music provided a conduit to express a Christian message. Music was subservient to text. With the addition of classical repertoire, it appeared to some that the roles had been reversed, with the musical performance raised to a position of greater importance than the Christian message. Solo roles were thought to encourage self-importance, egotism and pride, utterly unlike the intrinsic Mennonite qualities of humility and modesty espoused by the MB leadership. Like
other MB singers studying at MBBC between the 1940s and 1970s, Victor Martens recalls that ‘we were always told never, never art for art’s sake, don’t get too serious about music, it’s too worldly’ (Interview, Victor Martens, 05 April 2014).

It is at this point, that I turn to Bourdieu’s theory of field to furnish a framework through which contentious, yet salient ideas will be investigated in this chapter. Fields are places of struggle, where agents are encouraged to maintain or elevate their position within and between (Bourdieu, 1983). Through this lens, MBBC represents a structured social space, one with its own rules, opinion, hierarchies etc. From 1940s to the early 1970s, the school’s objective, to educate ministers and lay preachers was clearly defined. Its purpose as a post-secondary theological institution, MBBC illustrates the difficulty with the concept of field, for it fits not only in the field of education, but also in the field of religion. In this nebulous space, increased conflict occurred as another field – art, with its own agents and agencies, was introduced.

As music education at MBBC became shaped by agencies outside the Mennonite tradition, the enhanced repertoires, the purpose and elevated levels of performance created friction between those who adjusted to the new ideas and those who retained older ideals including, but not limited to the intention of music within Mennonite Brethren community. The following examples illustrate the complexity of the conflict.

At MBBC, even into the 1970s, there was much debate amongst the college administration about the performance of art music, even works with Christian text. This significant power struggle, the administration in conflict with the head of music, reached a climax in the academic year 1970-71, while MBBC Musical Director William Baerg (b. 1938) was on sabbatical and Howard Dyck (b. 1942), an alumnus of MBBC who had recently returned from post-graduate study in Germany, covered Baerg’s position.\(^6\) As part of his responsibilities, Dyck would conduct the combined oratorio choirs of CMBC and MBBC, each comprised of students and community members, under the title of the Mennonite Oratorio Choir in an oratorio concert, an annual event that dated back to 1965. This fifth large

---

\(^6\) Dyck had just completed two years of study at the Nordwestdeutsche Musikakademie in Detmold, Germany where he studied orchestral, choral and opera conducting with Martin Stephani. After completing his studies, he accepted the two year-long position at MBBC.
A collaborative event combined the artistic strengths and aspirations of the MBBC teacher and choral conductor George Wiebe, and Dyck who planned to present Benjamin Britten’s *War Requiem*, a relatively new powerful non-liturgical setting of the requiem mass, in which the traditional Latin texts are interspersed with the war poetry of Englishman Wilfred Owen. Early on in the project, MBBC’s President Victor Adrian raised questions about the work’s theological soundness. Dyck explained that the mass setting functioned as a framework through which the pacifist message, the core of Mennonite beliefs ‘Wehrlos’ or non-resistance, was conveyed. This was to no avail; Adrian vetoed the project on the basis that a requiem is a mass for the dead, and ‘Mennonites do not pray for the dead’. (Interview, Howard Dyck, 24 March 2014).

A new programme was devised: J.S. Bach’s Cantata 80, *Ein Feste Burg, Te Deum* by Anton Bruckner, and William Walton’s *Belshazzar’s Feast*. Once again, Adrian found issue with each work. He would have preferred to have the Bach cantata sung in English rather than the original German, an argument he lost (Interview, Howard Dyck, 24 March 2014). This example illustrates a shift in the language of worship in some Mennonite churches. On one hand it suggests that ‘outreach’ to the wider community was an important point for Adrian and other MB ministers. On the other hand it demonstrates the acculturation process (Alba and Nee, 2003) whereby Canadian-born Mennonites and their offspring were naturally more comfortable with Canadian culture than recent immigrants, and as an example, desired ‘more English services [in their church] . . . which their youth preferred’ (Driedger, 2004, 51). In either event, language became a point of friction.

The Latin text of the Bruckner *Te Deum*, whose Romantic musical idiom would have been understood and enjoyed by the Mennonite community, proved problematic on two accounts: some in the Mennonite community still unquestionably associated Latin with Roman Catholicism and secondly, the

---

61 British composer and pacifist Benjamin Britten wrote the War Requiem over a period of two years, 1961-1962. It was commissioned for the consecration of Coventry Cathedral (30 May 1962), a fourteenth-century edifice that had had been destroyed during the bombing of Coventry city during World War II. He chose nine poems of Wilfred Owen (1893-1918), a British poet who was killed in action just one week prior to the signing of the armistice that ended World War I. Posthumously, Owen became revered as a war poet.
message of the Christian text would be inaccessible for the audience. Dyck had been prepared to compromise, writing an English translation of the Bruckner text. At the first combined rehearsal of MBBC and CMBC choirs, when Dyck informed the CMBC choir that the *Te Deum* would be performed in English, they walked out in protest. Dyck remembered thinking, ‘this is fantastic, this is exactly what I wanted’ (Interview, Howard Dyck, 24 March 2014). The Bruckner was performed in Latin possibly because of pressure applied by Wiebe and others at CMBC (Interview 24, Howard Dyck, March 2014), who were not restricted by the same religious doctrine and cultural retention concerns as the MBBC administration.

The third work on the programme, Walton’s *Belshazzar’s Feast*, proved the most contentious because some at MBBC considered its dissonant harmonies to be in opposition with Mennonite teachings of the harmony in Christian living. President Adrian assured Dyck that the audience would loathe the work. On the contrary, Dyck reported that ‘the Mennonite crowd… went nuts after the Belshazzar. They were stomping and cheering, and Mennonite crowds don’t tend to do that’ (Interview, Howard Dyck, 24 March 2014, Schellenberg, 2006, 78). What does this signify? On one hand, it suggests that audience members displayed a progressive outlook on music, and their taste was broader than the repertoire normally offered at MB and GC churches and colleges. On the other hand, Ronald Gibson, the highly respected non-Mennonite concert reviewer reported, ‘We would hope to see a full hall for their next presentation’, indicating that audience numbers were not as large as they could have been or were expected (Gibson – B, WPF, 20 March 1971, 9 (C)). This being the first 20th-century work performed by the choir, reception may have been a reason for non-participation. On the whole, the review of *Belshazzar’s Feast* is favorable, with ‘nothing but admiration for Mr Dyck and Mr Wiebe and their dedicated singers’ (Gibson – B, WPF, 20 March 1971, 9 (C)).

This work made a strong impression on non-Mennonite and Mennonite journalists alike for one year later *Belshazzar’s Feast* was still part of a conversation. In advertising for the 1972 oratorio concert, the staff writer for the English-language *Mennonite Mirror* re-assured the readership by writing, ‘After choosing a relatively obscure work – Walton’s *Belshazzar’s Feast* – last year, the choirs are now preparing the well known *Creation* by Haydn…’ (*Mennonite Mirror*, 7 March 1972, 7 (A)). Mennonite musicians continued to push the boundaries of
reception, particularly within the MB conference, where music had been subservient to text and to purpose, and for over a century, drawn primarily from a canon of less complex music with simple text.

**Canadian Mennonite Bible College and George Wiebe**

On the other hand, during the mid century, and within the GC congregations, music also served as an evangelical tool, however a different attitude towards repertoire was fostered. Retrospectively assessing the changes in repertoire, George Wiebe referred to three principles that governed how he chose music during his tenure (1954-1993) as musical director of the three choirs: CMBC A Cappella Choir - later renamed CMBC Chamber Choir, CMBC Oratorio Choir, and the College Chorus at the Canadian Mennonite Bible College, Winnipeg. The music had to nurture the congregation as the spirit of the church, with only the ‘best music…be[ing] used in the worship of God’ (Schellenberg, 2007, 33). To Wiebe, this was classical music. Thirdly, music making should be cooperative, meaning that music making should be shared (Schellenberg, 2007). When visiting CMBC’s constituent churches, Wiebe would often introduce a new work, for instance, a Bach chorale, by discussing its theological and musical value, and teaching the congregation by using the CMBC choir. In this way, he shaped congregational repertoire.

In examining the repertoire of CMBC’s Oratorio choir, it is evident that working within the parameters of music with Christian text, Wiebe strove to develop a taste for classical music in the GC community by presenting a different and unfamiliar work each year. These included Mendelssohn’s *Paulus* (1962), J.S. Bach’s *Johannes Passion* (1964), the *Weihnachts-Oratorium* (I-IV) (1967), and *Matthäus Passion* (1969), Handel’s *Johannes Passion* (1965), *Israel in Egypt*

---

George Wiebe (b. 1927) was raised in a musical family where his father took ‘the lead in promoting enthusiastic singing in the home’ (Interview, George Wiebe, 22 December 2013). The repertoire was comprised of German hymns and folk songs, augmented by English folksongs learned at school. Wiebe joined the local youth choir at age 17, which greatly contributed to his sense of self worth and social acceptance. It also awakened and nourished a religious and spiritual awareness. Wiebe recalled, ‘Singing in choir was, for me, the most natural way of expressing these awarenesses.’ (Interview, George Wiebe, 22 December 2013). At 22, he began with formal musical training at MBBC under Ben Horch, studying piano with Mrs. Arnold Regier, the wife of the CMBC president, and voice with Gladys Whitehead. At the age of 28, he became responsible for the fledgling music department at CMBC.
(1967), and the *Dettingen Te Deum* (1969), Arthur Honegger *Une Cantate de Noël* (1970), and Alan Hovahness *Glory to God* (1970). These performances shaped high art reception and performance standards, particularly, but not only, in GC audiences, but also in other Mennonite congregations and non-Mennonite people, as the concerts were well publicized and open to the public.

In summary, variations in interpretation of scripture, expressions of faith, and concerns regarding cultural retention between GCs and MBs greatly impacted choral repertoire and performance practice during mid-century Mennonite music making, where MB choristers and conductors were highly restricted in their choice of repertoire compared to those of the Conference of Mennonites. By the mid-1960s, the choirs of the two conferences began to work together, breaking down barriers, forging a more cooperative relationship between the conferences, even though differences in biblical interpretation and theological understanding persisted.

These historical barriers, deriving from different readings of theology and real or imagined histories separated MB and GC congregations from each other and from the wider community. Yet both groups, beginning in the second quarter of the twentieth century, first with individuals and followed by institutions, accessed and employed the best non-Mennonite, mainly Brito-Canadian musicians in the city of Winnipeg, to educate Mennonite musicians in the two colleges. Here Tina Ramnarine’s theory of calibration (2007) regarding ‘things not fitting together’ is relevant as a way of theorizing disjunctures between social reality, representation and translation, on ‘adjustments in the musical and social world, and on the contradiction between discourses’ (6).

**Mennonite and non-Mennonite Musical Connections in Winnipeg, 1920-1950**

In the first half of the twentieth century, the majority of urban Mennonites lived in Winnipeg’s multi-ethnic North End and in the outlying market-gardening villages of the Kildonans, where they tried to balance the influences of Brito-Canadian society, that is school curriculums and attitudes shaped by British imperialism, with

---

Mennonite theology and culture.\textsuperscript{64} To the Brito-Canadian musical elite, the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg, the Mennonites represented the other, even though the two communities shared sacred choral repertoire and lineages of Germanic choral traditions. Ironically, each group was striving to achieve choral excellence within their own ideals and boundaries. Over the decades, their trajectories intersected with more frequency, with Mennonites singers gradually being noticed by the Brito-Canadian community, as they participated in Brito-Canadian sponsored events such as the Winnipeg Competition Music Festival.

The first to be influenced by this world was Ben Horch (1907-1991). He would become the singular most influential Mennonite musical figure of his generation.\textsuperscript{65} The Horch family settled in Winnipeg’s North End, a multi-ethnic community comprised mainly of Germans, Mennonites, Jews, Poles, Ukrainians, and other east Europeans. Within this ethnic community, the diverse cultural groups, often separated by language and culture, were equally impoverished. Economics, language, culture and the geography of the expansive Canadian Pacific Railway yards divided those in the North End from Winnipeg’s dominant society with its British orientation. Experiencing first-hand the struggle by ethnic groups to find an identity within the dominant culture became a central focus driving Horch’s vision for music making within the Mennonite community. Later in life he recounted ‘I saw the need for Mennonites as a whole to be represented by something that would find acceptance with that which was the highest in the dominating culture around us and I knew it would be music’ (Letkemann, 2007, 237).

Horch was one of six children born into an ethnic German, Lutheran family who emigrated from the Odessa region of southern Russia (now Ukraine) to Winnipeg in 1909. Not of Mennonite heritage, the Horch family joined the North-End Mennonite Brethren church within a few years of their arrival in Winnipeg (Letkemann, 2007, 39). Family activities and key events from his childhood informed his vision for Mennonite music making. At home from an early age, Horch listened to recordings of the music of Bach, Schubert, Beethoven, Brahms

\textsuperscript{64} Mennonites first settled in the municipality of North Kildonan in the late 1920s. In 1972, The Kildonan municipalities and ten other municipalities in the Greater Winnipeg area amalgamated, becoming new wards in the City of Winnipeg.

\textsuperscript{65} The biographical information on Ben Horch is taken from Peter Letkemann’s detailed biography \textit{The Ben Horch Story}, Winnipeg: Old Oak Publishing, 2007.
and Richard Strauss. Only retrospectively did he become aware that this particular musical environment set him apart culturally from the majority of children in the Mennonite Brethren community whose musical tastes were shaped primarily by the church, and reinforced at home. In preparation for a high school production of Shakespeare’s *Twelfth Night*, Horch received a gift from his teacher: a series of voice lessons with American-born Burton Kurth, one of Winnipeg’s prominent voice teachers at this time. Horch later continued his lessons in exchange for being a chorister at Broadway Baptist Church, where Kurth was choirmaster. This opened up a new world for the young man, one influenced by the most musically and artistically proficient that the Brito-Canadian culture in Winnipeg had to offer.

In 1921, the British conductor and recent graduate of London’s Royal College of Music and Oxford University, Hugh Ross, assumed the posts of organist/choir director at All Saint’s Anglican Church, a centre of worship for Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadian elite musical director of the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir (MVC), and within a year, director of the newly-established Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir. He introduced new repertoire, raised the standard of the Male Voice Choir, and pushed the boundaries of membership suggesting that he was not as ethnocentric as the administration of the Men’s Musical Club whose adamant regulations deemed that only Brito-Canadians would fill the ranks of the two choirs.66

In 1925, during Ross’s fifth season in Winnipeg, the nineteen-year old Horch was invited to sing with the Male Voice Choir (Letkemann, 2007, 75), an invitation made possible probably by his association with Kurth, a member of the MMC. This exception, breaking the MMC’s norm of ethno-centric membership, illustrates Ramnarine’s (2007) theory of calibrations of things not fitting. It is highly probable that post-war deficiencies meant there were fewer men to fill the choral ranks, leaving the MMC no alternative but to draw on singers from other ethnicities. It is also highly probably that Ross was far more interested in making music with the best musicians Winnipeg had to offer, unconcerned about ethnicity or Brito-Canadian cultural concerns. Horch’s name omitted from the programme (Letkemann, 2007) more likely illustrates a clerical error, rather than suggesting

---

66 The club held fast to its Brito-centric ideals, ignoring advice to include singers from other ethnicities that would have sustained and benefited the choirs. See Chapter 3.
that the MMC preferred not to acknowledge non-Brito-Canadian choristers. That aside, the young Horch benefited from this arrangement.

Watching Ross in rehearsal shaped the young Mennonite’s ideals of musical communication, ultimately influencing the manner in which Mennonite choral music in Winnipeg would be performed, and contrary to Mennonite conducting style of the time. The primarily lay Mennonite musical directors emphasized the vertical chord-to-chord approach to music by beating time up and down with their right hand, reinforcing a non-linear singing style, where the musical line was ancillary to the enunciation and meaning of the text. Ross, because of his ethnicity and through his musical training in English academies, opened up a new world for the young Mennonite. Horch recalled, ‘Of all the people I’ve studied with, I still don’t know of anyone who came near him [Ross] in the power of communication, in artistic strength and power. He was not just academic music making; it was total communication’ (Siemens, 1974,12-13, cited Letkemann 2007, 76). Horch mimicked Ross’s conducting style, employed his rehearsal techniques, and through his experiences singing with the best Brito-Canadian choirs in the city (the Male Voice Choir and the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir) ‘capitalized on the British school of musical training…[from the] fluency of chant…the Romantic warmth, line, flow, lyricism, [and] approach to diction’ (Letkemann, 2007, 85-86).

Between 1930 and 1980, Ben Horch held many musical roles in the Mennonite community. See Figure 9 for photograph of Ben Horch and at a choral workshop. Perhaps the most important position was as an educator at the Mennonite Brethren Bible College (1945-51 and 1952-55) where he influenced an entire generation of MB and some GC musicians. While at MBBC, he developed the music programme, conducted the A Capella and Oratorio choirs, introduced new repertoire, and altered the role of choral music in their faith-praxis.67

Mennonite Bible Colleges

The formation of the two Mennonite Bible Colleges in Winnipeg, the Mennonite Brethren Bible College (MBBC), founded in 1944, and the Canadian Mennonite

67 Other roles included workshop leader and conductor at Mennonite Brethren choral conducting workshops and choral festivals throughout western Canada, as a radio producer for the Mennonite Radio Station CFAM in Altona, Manitoba (1957-1959) and for the national broadcaster, the CBC in Winnipeg (1959-1972).
Bible College (CMBC), established in 1947, signifies the strength of Mennonite presence in Winnipeg, while illustrating that cultural isolation included a separation not only from the wider community but also from other Mennonite groups. Their purpose was similar: each intended to train members of their affiliated conferences as teachers, missionaries and ministers, choir conductors, song leaders and accompanists, establishing music programmes that emphasized choral music and underscored the objectives of each college. Music was utilitarian in so much that it was seen as a tool in building the kingdom of God. The colleges did not set out to develop professional musicians in any capacity (Letkemann, 2007, 256). Yet the Mennonite principle that encouraged excellence in any given profession could not be ignored by those in the community whose vision for Mennonite music making was greater than the expectations of their faith doctrine and its practices.

Figure 9: Photograph of Ben Horch (left), George Wiebe (seated) K.H. Neufeld (standing) and unidentified students. MAO XV-19.3-2001-14-351 - Version 2
The MBBC administration was unwavering in its approach towards the purpose of music as an evangelical tool, yet with Horch’s musical connections within the broader community, highly qualified teachers, principally Brito-Canadians who were the best the city had to offer, were appointed to teach MBBC pupils. The new music department included the English composer and singing teacher W.H. Anderson (1882-1955), who had studied at the Guildhall School of Music in London and with the singers Mattia Battistini and Manuel Garcia. Advanced theory classes were taught by Dutch-born organist Dr. Frans Niermeier (1903-?), who gained his Doctor of Music in 1940 from the University of Toronto. From 1952 to 1955, Canadian soprano Gladys Whitehead, a student of W.H. Anderson, Burton Kurth and W. Campbell McInnes also taught at the college. Horch credited Whitehead with establishing the college’s excellent vocal reputation (Letkemann, 2007, 291). During her short tenure, she taught Victor Martens, William Reimer, Peter Koslowsky, David Falk and Viola Horch-Falk, nearly all of those listed went on to post-graduate studies and then professional singing or academic careers in music.

In 1953, with only one year under Whitehead’s tutelage, Victor Martens (b. 1931) won the Tudor Bowl (est. 1926), awarded for the most outstanding performance for Grade B vocalists in the Winnipeg Competition Music Festival. He was the first Mennonite recipient of this prestigious award. Martens now held a position of status within the Mennonite community. Soon after his success at the festival, Martens was engaged as the leading tenor at St. Stephen’s Broadway United Church, with Whitehead as the leading soprano from 1951-57, and under the direction of the prominent conductor and organist Filmer Hubble (1904-1969). This opportunity mirrors that of a generation earlier, when Horch sang under Kurth at Broadway Baptist Church. See Figure 10 (page 170) for a photograph of Martens and his wife, Dorothy.

Martens considers the team of Whitehead and Hubble as key to the development of singers in the Mennonite community at that time, with Gladys as coach and Hubble as accompanist. He recalled,

Gladys Whitehead was the one who taught me [to] sing on the breath, not with the breath. She is the one who insisted that I tried to sing a decent *mezza di voce*, being able to crescendo and decrescendo.
She was the one that said, never louder than beautiful…She knew what a lyric line was [and] what beautiful text was…[Hubble] had wonderful facilities with words, [he was a] wonderful musician [and] he could accompany anything. If you were in his hands you were always presented in the best possible situation (Interview, Victor Martens, 05 Apr 2014).

Figure 10: Victor Martens (Tudor Bowl Winner, 1953) with his wife Dorothy Martens (Rose Bowl Recipient, 1965), University of Manitoba Digital Archives.
Echoing Horch’s music experience under Kurth and Ross, Martens recalls, ‘I was studying at the MB[BC] and I had that dual kind of [life] all along. That made life quite different for me, relative to some of the other earlier Mennonite boys who went to study [at MBBC]. They didn’t have that sort of worldly connection’, one that supplied a wider musical education, strongly influenced by excellent musicians of the Brito-Canadian community (Interview, Victor Martens, 05 Apr 2014). The outside influence that came from participation in festival and non-Mennonite choirs may have also contributed to the thirst for musical excellence that led some Mennonites to take advantage of opportunities including post-graduate studies.

*The Significance of Post-Graduate Studies*

The strategic nurturing and educating of Mennonite youth at familial and community levels was fundamental to the professional success of individual Mennonites, benefitting the community as a whole. Within the home, the church or school, an expectation to excel and to respond to a higher calling was imprinted upon the youth. Eminent choral conductor Henry Engbrecht (b. 1939) suggests that,

Mennonites in the choral community were driven as singers and choral conductors…to do this thing. We can call it a higher calling, or call it God leading us in very specific ways, but the drive to excel [was] something we saw…in farming, in business, everywhere…We were nevertheless asked to take advantage of an opportunity that was there. (Interview, 15 August 2013)

Almost all Winnipeg Mennonite musicians interviewed remarked that one of the strongest, most vital characteristics of the Mennonite community is the way in which Mennonites provided and still provide opportunities for their youth to grow in their chosen profession. In 1963, Engbrecht was hired as the choral director for Mennonite Collegiate Institute, a private secondary school in Gretna, Manitoba,
the same high school that he had graduated from only five years earlier. In the spring of 1965, at the CBC’s request Engbrecht’s school choir performed on the CBC radio programme ‘Prairie Choirs’. The purpose of ‘Prairie Choirs’ was to showcase the best of Manitoba choirs, from school to ethnic, church and community. Producer, Ben Horch, had an ulterior motive in developing the programme. He wanted to make Manitobans aware of the fine singing that was happening in the Mennonite communities across the province. For Engbrecht and his students from a small rural Mennonite school, it seemed incredible that the choir would be heard on national radio. This contributed greatly to school spirit and created a huge buzz in the community. It also affirmed the choir’s high standard of performance and Engbrecht’s ability as conductor and teacher.

In making plans to leave for post-graduate study, Engbrecht was humbled when MCI’s principal Paul J. Schaefer, not only encouraged him to return to MCI after the completion of his degree, but made arrangements for MCI's board to loan the young man $5,000 to help pay for his studies. Fostering Engbrecht’s choice of career, offering him his first teaching job as a musician, financially supporting his post-graduate studies and retaining his teaching position illustrates how Mennonite musicians were encouraged and cultivated by and within their community. In return, the support that one received during developmental years was to be gifted back to the community. Choral directors or singers were expected to return to their roots to perform, conduct and teach, as Engbrecht has done. This ideal, seen as an aspect of rural Mennonite life, was transferred to urban Mennonite communities in Winnipeg.

In the 1960s and 1970s, very few, if any, Canadian universities offered post-graduate studies in choral conducting, compelling some Winnipeg Mennonites to enrol at American universities. George Wiebe earned his Masters of Music degree at Southern California, Los Angeles, in 1962, and William Baerg completed the same at Peabody Institute of Music in Baltimore, Maryland, in 1972 and a Doctor of Musical Arts (DMA) in 1978. Wiebe went on to complete a Doctor of Music at the University of Indiana, Bloomington in 1980. Given their background, other Mennonites were drawn to faith-affiliated institutions. Henry

---

68 Founded in 1889, MCI’s initial purpose, the training of teachers for Mennonite rural schools, shifted to offering secondary education, from Grade 9 to 12. In the 1955-56 academic year, 179 students were enrolled, taught by 6 teachers, and the principal.
Engbrecht attained a Bachelor of Music from Bethel College, North Newton, Kansas, and his Masters of Music from Southern Methodist University in Dallas, Texas, with further graduate studies undertaken at the University of Cincinnati and the University of Oregon.

Diverse internationally recognized conductors affiliated with numerous American post-secondary institutions have played a significant role in shaping Winnipeg Mennonite conductors. Wiebe includes John Finley Williamson, Robert Shaw, Charles Hirt, Helmut Rilling, Fiora Contino and Julius Herford as conducting influences from his periods of study in the USA (Interview, George Wiebe, 21 December 2013). Lloyd Pfautsch, Helmut Rilling, and Robert Shaw were influential in forming Engbrecht’s conducting style (Interview, Henry Engbrecht, 30 September 2013). Most recently choral specialist Elroy Friesen completed his Doctor of Musical Arts in 2006 from the University of Illinois, and vocal coach and collaborative pianist Laura Loewen, received her Doctor of Musical Arts from the University of Minnesota in 2005. Both are employed in the music faculty at the University of Manitoba. The moulding of Mennonite musicians by American conductors in American institutions is considerable, however, between the 1950s and the 1970s, there was another school that profoundly influenced three generations of Winnipeg Mennonite singers and conductors, the Nordwestdeutsche Musikakademie (NDM), in Detmold, Germany, now Hochschule für Musik Detmold.

In 1946, under the guidance of composer and teacher Wilhelm Maler (1902-1976) and singing pedagogue Frederick Husler (1889-1969), NDM was established in Detmold, a provincial city that had survived the war remarkably unscathed in comparison to the larger centres of Berlin, Cologne, Frankfurt, Leipzig, Munich and Stuttgart. The close ties that grew between generations of Winnipeg Mennonites and NDM arose by happenstance. In the early 1950s, Cornelius F. Klassen, related by marriage to Ben Horch, was stationed in Frankfurt with the Mennonite Central Committee. Through his encouragement Horch attended NDM (1951-52). This singular event had crucial and far-reaching

---

69 Winnipeg Mennonite Cornelius F. Klassen (1894-1954) who worked for the Mennonite Central Committee as the European Commissioner for Refugee Aid and Resettlement in Frankfurt, Germany, suggested that Horch should study in Germany. The Klassen and Horch family were related through marriage. Horch’s brother Emmanuel had married Klassen’s sister Agatha (Letkemann, 2007, 266-267).
consequences for Mennonite conductors, singers and the choral culture in Winnipeg. A bridge had been built between Detmold and Winnipeg Mennonites, one that lasted for decades.

At NDM, Horch focused on choral and orchestral conducting, composition and music history, while enriching his musical experience by attending many concerts. It was in the concert hall, rather than the lecture room where he felt he learned the most, extending his repertoire to include many German Baroque composers, from ‘Schütz and Buxtehude, to Telemann and Bach’ (Letkemann, 2007, 283). On his return to Winnipeg, he introduced his choirs at MBBC to innovative ways of performance he had encountered at NDM, including a vocal technique called ‘Zwerchfell’ (diaphragm). This entailed the use of the diaphragm in detached singing of runs, as was done in Germany in the performance of Baroque oratorio (Letkemann, 2007, 291). Horch encouraged the next generation to engage with more Baroque repertoire, including but not limited to the motets, cantatas and passions of Bach, while inspiring many to continue their education at NDM (Letkemann, 2007, 283).

Between 1947 and 1958, a protagonist in the development of Winnipeg Mennonite musicians at NDM was choral conductor, pedagogue, and composer, Kurt Thomas (1904-1973), a central figure in the revival of German Protestant church music that began in the 1920s. His sacred compositions are based primarily on Baroque styles, ‘mixing purity of harmonic language with contrapuntal rigour’ (Krellmann and Levi, OXO). As a pedagogue, Thomas developed a disciplined approach to choral technique, choral rehearsals and conducting, compiled in Lehrbuch der Chorleitung (Choral Method), a method in which

---

70 Thomas studied conducting and theory in Leipzig with Straube and Grabner and composition in Darmstadt with Arnold Mendelssohn, the son of a cousin of Felix Mendelssohn-Barthody. In 1925, at the age of 21, Thomas became a lecturer in theory and composition at Leipzig conservatory. In 1928, he attained the position of choir director at the Institute of church Music in Leipzig. Later posts included teaching at the Berlin Musikhochschule (from 1934), Director of the Musisches Gymnasium in Frankfurt (1939-45), Kantor of the Frankfurt Dreikönigkirche (1945-56), Professor at Nord-west Academie at Detmold (1947-58), and Director of the Thomaskantorei and Thomasschule in Leipzig (1958-61). At the Thomaskirche, he was J.S. Bach’s thirteenth successor, a position that continues to carry great reverence for some musicians worldwide. In 1961, while on choir tour in West Germany, he relinquished his position at the Thomaskirche, a post that often had him at odds with the socialist art policies of the German Democratic Republic. He resumed his post at the Frankfurt Dreikönigkirche, and accepted the directorship of the choirs, Cologne Bachverein and the Frankfurt Kantorei. (Krellman and Levi, 2007-2015)
generations of European conductors were trained, and a text that is still considered an exceptional resource for choral conductors.\footnote{It was first published in 1935, and has been reprinted multiple times in numerous languages, with the most recent publication in 2003.} Letkemann (2007) suggests that Horch did not engage with the Thomas method because he had already developed his conducting style, based on the British model of Ross, Peter Temple and Douglas Clarke, that he had experienced in Winnipeg. However, Victor Martens, William Reimer, David Falk, George Wiebe and William Baerg represent the next generation of Winnipeg Mennonites who studied at Detmold and brought aspects of the Thomas method to their conducting (Letkemann, 2007, 282). Two other influential conducting pedagogues in Detmold that shaped Winnipeg conductors William Baerg (1963-1966) and Howard Dyck (1968-1970) included Martin Stephani, Thomas’ successor at Detmold and Alexander Wagner. (Interviews, William and Irmgard Baerg, 27 January 2014 and Howard Dyck, 24 March 2014). A further influential teacher was Professor Wilhelm Ehmann at the Westfälische Landeskirchenmusikschule in nearby Herford, who taught George Wiebe and Peter Letkemann.

Mennonite singers also drawn to Detmold studied with the highly respected singing teacher, bass Frederick Husler (1889-1969). Born in Utah, USA, of Swiss and German parentage, Husler at the age of eight returned to Germany after the death of his father. His interest in singing, for which he ‘had little natural aptitude’ encouraged him to dedicate his life to understanding the singing voice (Ron Murdock, 2014, n.p.). Mainly self-taught, he became recognized as an expert not only in the development of the singing voice, but also in safe practices that led to vocal longevity. From 1922 to 1929, the Ensemble of the Kroll Opera (Berlin) under Otto Klemperer was placed under Husler’s guidance and care. Conductors Furtwängler, von Karajan and Sargent sought his advice when vocal problems arose amongst their singers (Ron Murdock, 2014). Singer and Alexander Technique instructor Ron Murdock, who studied with Husler from 1966 to 1969, sums up the pedagogue’s vocal philosophy:

Husler maintained that man, by nature, possessed a singing instrument. If there was a problem with the voice, he worked from the point of view that either parts of the instrument must then be
underdeveloped or out of balance in some way with the rest of the instrument. Teaching, for him, was a case of bringing the various vocal elements together in a balanced whole. Such a positive approach had deep beneficial psychological impact on singers who came to him for help (Ron Murdock, 2014, n.p.).

Many of Husler’s students including German baritone Gert Feldhof (b. 1931), his brother Bass Heinz Feldhof (b. 1939), Hungarian Heldentenor Sándor Kónya (1923-2002), English soprano Jane Manning (b. 1938) and Canadian lyric soprano Annon Lee Silver (1938-1971) achieved international recognition.

In 1958-1959, tenor Victor Martens, a graduate of MBBC, had the opportunity to attend Detmold, where he studied with Husler.72 In a discussion of Husler’s pedagogical style, Martens recalls that above all Husler considered himself a teacher and a singing coach, rather than a performer who taught. In developing the singing instrument, Husler returned to an earlier style of teaching, daily 15-30 minute lessons with each student offering close scrutiny over the development of individual voices. Ideally, this approach, in comparison with weekly lessons, should have eliminated the issue of a student practising incorrectly for a period of days. For Martens, this intensive coaching, where Husler analysed the voice, prescribed specific technical exercises and most significantly, explained the ongoing process to the student, has formed the foundation of Marten’s vocal pedagogical style (Interview, Victor Martens, 5 April 2014).

Victor Martens recalls a young baritone, Theo Lindenbaum (Figure 11, page 177) teaching students in Detmold and enhancing his pedagogy training by observing lessons taught by Husler. In 1961 when the senior pedagogue retired, Lindenbaum stepped into his position. He may well have been the most influential pedagogue with respect to the training of Mennonite singers during the 1960s and 1970s. Mennonite students, mainly from MBBC including William Reimer (1961-1964), David Falk and Viola Horch-Falk (1961-1965), William Baerg (1963-1966), Alvin Reimer (1968-1971), and Henriette Schellenberg (1970-1975) continued their studies under Lindenbaum at Detmold, while others had the opportunity to

72 Through precise technical training, Husler eliminated the ‘considerable break’ that existed between Martens’ registers (Interview, Victor Martens, 5 April 2014).
study briefly with Lindenbaum during his tenure as visiting professor at CMBC in 1966 (Mennonite Archives Ontario, 1966).

Figure 11: L.to R.: David Falk, Theo Lindenbaum and Viola Horch-Falk. CA MAO XV-19.3-1992-14-492

Studying at the *Nordwestdeutsche Musikakademie*, immersion in the German cultural scene, and the teachings of Husler, Lindenbaum, Thomas, Stephani, and Ehmann significantly impacted Mennonite vocal culture, solo and choral, in Winnipeg and across Canada. Repertoire unfamiliar to the Mennonite community was introduced, including, but not limited to, the works of the German baroque composers Bach and Schütz, and the twentieth-century composers Kurt Thomas and Hugo Distler. Mennonite singers William Reimer, Alvin Reimer, John Martens and Henriette Schellenberg would become widely recognized internationally as Bach oratorio and German *Lieder* specialists. Their influence as teachers shaped not only the students at MBBC and CMBC, but also others at various Canadian, American, and German universities and music academies.73

73 Mennonite singing teachers taught at various Canadian universities. An incomplete list includes the University of Guelph, the University of Western Ontario (now Western
Mennonite Choirs Attain Recognition

By the late 1960s, George Wiebe and William Baerg, teachers at CMBC and MBBC respectively, began to work collaboratively on a scale much larger than any previous joint college performance. Enthused by their studies in Detmold and the USA, they envisioned a choir able to present the major oratorio works of Bach, Handel and Schütz to Brahms, Honegger and Ives, by augmenting their combined college choirs with alumni and singers from the Mennonite community.

On Sunday December 12, 1965, the newly founded Mennonite Oratorio Choir (MOC) presented the first of its many future collaborations, heralding in a new era of cooperation amongst the colleges and conferences with a performance of Bach’s *Weihnachts-Oratorium*, conducted by George Wiebe. The work was sung in its original language – German, still the preferred language of some in the community, and the text considered theologically sound, a concern often voiced by MBBC administrators. Accompanying the choir was a large complement of musicians drawn mainly from the Mennonite community in Winnipeg, an orchestra made up of forty musicians, fifteen amateurs and twenty-five hired from the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra. The vocal soloists came almost exclusively from MBBC alumni. Rounding out this event was guest cello continuo player, Mary Oyer, a professor at Goshen College, a private Mennonite College in Goshen, Indiana, USA. The emphasis that directors Wiebe and Baerg placed upon interpreting the Christian text stems from Mennonite tradition of placing the value of text over that of music. The concert programme records the directors’ expectations of a high level of performance even though the choir was not a

---

University), Waterloo Lutheran University (now the University of Waterloo). Their influence also extended outside of Canadian borders to Goshen College, Indiana and the State School of Music in Hannover.

74 The A Cappella Choirs of the two colleges had a long history of combining forces at joint campus events.

75 The orchestra comprised forty musicians, fifteen amateurs and twenty-five who were hired from the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra, an arrangement facilitated by Albert Horch, a WSO flautist and brother of Benjamin Horch. Three of the four soloists were MBBC alumni. Viola Horch-Falk (alto) and David Falk (bass), the daughter and son-in-law of Benjamin Horch, had just returned from their four years of post-graduate study in Detmold, and were now teaching at Goshen College in Indiana. MBBC Music Director Victor Martens (tenor) sang the role of the Evangelist. The soprano soloist, Ingrid Sawatzky was a fourth year student at the college. (Horch, 2007, 347).

76 Students who had completed the three year course at CMBC could transfer their credits to Goshen College, complete a fourth year and attain a Bachelor’s degree.
‘professional’ choir, noting ‘it was a worthy task, this matter of performing great music, especially when associated with divine truths’ (Schellenberg, 2006, 373). The concert encouraged more collaborative events between the two colleges, and the two conferences and at times included non-Mennonite individuals and organizations.  

By the early 1980s, the choir came into the sight of Kazuhiro Koizumi, the conductor of the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra (WSO). On December 9-10 1983, the MOC and the WSO performed Beethoven’s Symphony No. 9 under the baton of Koizumi. This was followed by three performances of Bach’s Weihnachts-Oratorium on December 6-8, 1985, also conducted by Koizumi. The relationship between the MOC and the WSO continued with performances of Beethoven’s Missa Solemnis (Dec 5-6, 1987) with Koizumi, Britten’s War Requiem (Nov 25-26, 1989), Beethoven’s Symphony No. 9 (Sept 28-29, 1991) and Handel’s Messiah (Dec 7-8, 1991) with Bramwell Tovey, WSO conductor. The Mennonite choir had finally achieved recognition in the city as an alternative to the WSO’s usual choral partner, the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir, a choir founded, and until the 1970s distinctively part of Winnipeg’s Brito-Canadian community.

Church Music Seminars
The high standard attained by the MOC was achieved, to some extent, through another joint project – workshops called Church Music Seminars, whose initial and primary purpose was to train the mainly lay congregational music leaders and to address musical concerns affecting their individual churches. Church seminars originated from a concern for the changing state of choral music within MB and CM conferences, in that there was a shift from traditional musics towards more

---

77 This first MOC concert pointed out to the MB and CM colleges alike that collaboration was highly beneficial. It meant pooled resources, no duplication of performances, no competition for audience or community resources, ultimately and favorably impacting college budgets. Artistically, the MOC could perform the oratorio works that called for a very large vocal contingent. Administratively, the strong and successful publicity campaign with ads on radio, television and in print represents a new and highly commercial approach for Mennonites to promote a concert, and would have brought the event to the attention of non-Mennonites. In a single event, the MOC had reached a much wider audience than any other choir for either Mennonite college with over 2,600 drawn from Winnipeg, rural southern Manitoba and as far away as Saskatchewan and The Pas in northern Manitoba. (Schellenberg, 1997, 59) For the next 15 years, the MOC choir performed many large oratorio works.
contemporary repertoire and performance praxis. In a sense, this was a natural progression growing historically out of the Sängerfeste tradition and more recently, through choral collaborations, and enhanced through higher education. Between 1975 and 1985, Mennonite church musicians of differing calibres from amateur to professional and from communities across Western Canada and parts of the USA attended the annual weekend seminar in Winnipeg. As Wiebe and Baerg’s aspirations grew, so did the scale of their seminars drawing in participants from the Mennonite colleges and the University of Manitoba, in addition to the lay church musicians. A large enrolment awarded the opportunity to invite top choral specialists to instruct at the seminars. When choosing guest conductors, such as Charles Hirt (1977), Lloyd Pfautsch (1979), Howard Swan (1981), Robert Shaw (1985), and Helmut Rilling (1989), Wiebe and Baerg invited individuals ‘who could hold the ideal [for them], not only musically but also in a spiritual sense’ (Schellenberg, 2006, 90). The religious ideal behind music making, and the Mennonite principle of excellence, remained as strong as ever.

From 1983 until 1991, the seminar also offered advanced choral conducting seminars, where students developed techniques using excerpts from major works of the canon. In 1989, the internationally renowned German conductor Helmut Rilling (b. 1933) held a master class in which he worked with twelve young conductors and a forty-voice choir. Having the opportunity to participate in this and other seminars motivated and inspired a new generation of singers and conductors within Winnipeg’s choral community, Mennonite and non-Mennonite alike.

There are several significant outcomes that arose out of the sixteen-year history of the Church Seminar. On an individual basis, those who took part, from the lay choral musician to the student attending one of Winnipeg’s post secondary music schools, were given the opportunity to work with a multitude of excellent conductors, to sing challenging works and expand their repertoire. This raised the standard of singing to a new level. (Schellenberg, 2006, 102). Within the Mennonite community, church seminars elevated levels of music education, shaped reception through repertoire selection, while developing new collaborative relationships between musicians of divergent Mennonite conferences and non-Mennonites alike. For many in Winnipeg’s Mennonite community, these acts of musical cooperation heralded the beginning of a broader working relationship that
resulted in the three colleges, MBBC, CMBC and Menno-Simmons College amalgamating in 1999 under the title of Canadian Mennonite University (Interview, William and Irmgard Baerg, 27 Jan 2014).

The rise of the Mennonite singer, chorister and director in Winnipeg can be viewed as part of the acculturation process of an immigrant people. As a framework for analysis, acculturation has often been examined either as individual or group process. In this case, both are relevant and necessary, as individual acculturation led the way for the group change. Choral singing has been a significant and vital part of Mennonite ethno-religious agrarian heritage since the mid-nineteenth century, first in Russian territories and then on the Canadian prairies. In becoming urbanites, Mennonites continued to draw on this heritage to keep their community together in a vain attempt to shut out ‘worldly’ influences. However, individual acculturation through music encounters began as early as the 1920s with Ben Horch tapping into the wider choral community in Winnipeg. While British conductor Hugh Ross shaped Horch’s understanding of choral music, the latter impacted the next generation of Mennonite musicians, who then significantly expanded their knowledge of music by attending non-Mennonite post-secondary institutions. As more individual Mennonites deviated from the musical norm in their culture, the group process of acculturation also quickened. Over the decades, the changing attitudes towards the purpose of music, the elevation in performance standards, the acceptance of music as a profession, and the Mennonite work ethic created the perfect environment for the Mennonite musician to excel, facilitating the acculturation process of the Mennonite people. In the final section of this chapter I illustrate how Mennonite musicians influenced Winnipeg’s choral culture in the last quarter of the twentieth century by examining their involvement in non-Mennonite musical activities.

Interactions with the non-Mennonite community post 1975

Through the 1960s and 1970s, the broader Canadian discourse involved questioning what it meant to be Canadian within a multicultural society where the imagined and real acceptance and integration of the country’s myriad peoples and cultures constituted a stronger Canada. Government policies on multiculturalism

78 See Raymond H.C. Teske, Jr. and Bardin H. Nelson (1974) for a literature review on the different ways of analyzing acculturation.
were instituted in a variety of ways through numerous avenues promoting cultural
diversity. In its position as the national voice of Canada, the Canadian
Broadcasting Corporation (CBC) was and is mandated to reflect the country’s
changing dynamics. As Canada attempted to distance itself from a British colonial
past, an already opened door had significantly increased American influence on
Canadian radio and television broadcasting. Concerned about the impact of
Americanization upon its people, the government set a quota for Canadian
content, developing new television and radio programming reflecting Canadian
values and culture of the era. Within this public space in Winnipeg, Mennonites
were beginning to make their mark as the battle to include ethnic musics and
musicians in CBC programming had been won.

Beginning in the 1970s, a lineage of Manitoba-born Mennonites, fondly
known as ‘the Manitoba Mennonite Mafia’ (Konrad, 2012) influenced music
programming at the CBC in Winnipeg, Toronto and Ottawa alike. They include
Winnipeg’s Harold Redekopp (b. 1942), Howard Dyck from Winkler, MB, and Eric
Friesen from Altona, MB. In his 31-year career at the CBC, Redekopp developed
many national music programmes that included Jürgen Gothe’s Disc Drive and a
Canadian Opera Company Series, and oversaw programming that included major
music competitions. Early in his career Redekopp moved to Toronto where he
created a new network programme Mostly Music (1976) featuring classical music
performances, and hired Howard Dyck as its host, the conductor who had
introduced Winnipeg Mennonite audiences to Walton’s Belshazzar’s Feast. Dyck
would later host the CBC programmes Choral Concert (1980-) and Saturday
Afternoon at the Opera (1987-2007). Eric Friesen and Howard Dyck first honed
their craft at CFAM Altona (Golden West Radio), the radio station where Ben
Horch had introduced classical programming in the 1950s. At the CBC, Friesen
hosted the first morning music programme in Canada, The Eric Friesen Show,
followed by other appointments including hosting Onstage at the Glenn Gould
Studio. In 2014, he returned to Winnipeg to help establish Golden West Radio’s
newest classical music station, Classic 107, in response to the reduction of
classical music programming on CBC Radio Two (2008.) Through their work at the
CBC over a period of forty years, Friesen, Dyck and Redekopp significantly
shaped what Canadians heard and understood about classical music.
**Hymn Sing**

The television show *Hymn Sing* produced at CBC Winnipeg is arguably one of the most successful music programmes, spanning three decades from its inception in 1965, as a 13-week filler, quickly morphing to a 36-week annual series that ended in May of 1995. The format for the weekly half-hour programme included group and solo selections. The repertoire consisted primarily of well-known hymns, such as ‘The Old Rugged Cross’ and ‘Amazing Grace’, songs often derived from Protestant hymnals. Brian Freeland, an Anglican Minister and head of CBC Religious programmes in the 1960s, considered *Hymn Sing* to one of CBC’s best investments, designed for those participants, singers and listeners who find singing ‘the most meaningful way to express their faith’ (CBC Television, AM, U-15-2-19 File 12, p. 8). In choosing *Hymn Sing*’s production city, he recalled looking around Canada for the ‘most likely breeding ground for singers, and chose Winnipeg’, noting, ‘They sing well in Winnipeg’ (8). The strong choral culture developed over the decades through national and international associations played a role in developing this image of Winnipeg. The music programmes in the Mennonite colleges acted like a magnet, attracting singers to Winnipeg from Mennonite communities across Western Canada – Winkler, Manitoba, Glenbush, Saskatchewan, La Glace, Alberta and Fraser Valley, British Columbia – adding to the pool of singers upon which *Hymn Sing* could draw.

In the search for young choristers (under the age of 25), stringent requirements were set with the emphasis on vocal training, choral experience, performance skills, and highly developed sight-reading abilities (CBC Television, AM, U-15-2-11 File 31). In the programme’s first year, almost all of the 16 singers were Mennonites. This changed from year to year, however Mennonites were well represented over the show’s lifetime (CBC Television, AM, U-15-2-19, File, 12 p 8).

As an audience, the Mennonite community held enough power to institute change in the programme’s format. During the inaugural year, the choristers often walked in time to the music, creating visual interest by changing the formation of the choir, and logistically, allowing a soloist to move in or out of a place of prominence. Complaints from the Mennonite community flooded in. Walking while singing was considered akin to the forbidden activity of dancing. In subsequent years, the singers remained still and the camera moved (Grescoe, 1969, 9, (D)).
Conversely, Mennonites performing on television did not seem to present any contradiction, as the music – hymns and gospel music associated with Mennonite tradition – was glorifying God, and not promoting the singer, even though the show itself garnered a large fan base giving singers a position of status. That aside, the singers of *Hymn Sing* presented an image that Mennonites preferred, clean-cut and religious.

Youthful, wholesome young people singing familiar hymns and gospel music appealed to the loyal fans, demographically middle aged or older from diverse Christian denominations, living from coast to coast in Canada and in the northern USA. In 1969, ‘over 1,094,000 lonely, shut-in or God fearing fans watched *Hymn Sing* on 26 of the country’s 44 CBC affiliated stations’ (Grescoe, 1969, 8). Aside from possibly stereotyping the audience, small communities such as my hometown of Nipigon, Ontario, had access to only one television channel, the CBC. This may have contributed to the high audience numbers. In a letter to the CBC, a listener from Nashwaaksis, N.B. wrote, ‘In this day of the hippie, with precious little for the old people to praise, *Hymn Sing* fills a need…it is really thrilling to listen to those young voices…[the singers] are a credit to this country’ (Grescoe, 1969, 8). Sound File 4 features the signature farewell song, sung at the closing of each programme, a simply constructed song that helps to illustrate the popularity of this programme among a certain demographic whose knowledge of music bordered on the simple.

For some Mennonite singers, being part of *Hymn Sing* presented an opportunity to express their faith. John Neuman, a 24-year-old bass from the Fraser Valley, BC expressed his ability to sing as a God given gift and ‘therefore feels an obligation to use that gift for the praise of God’ (Hymn Sing, AM, U-15-2-19 File 12, CBC Communications 40/12 Hymn Sing chorus). Over the lifetime of the programme, *Hymn Sing* provided over 500 Winnipeg-based singers under the age of twenty-five, Mennonite and non-Mennonite alike, the opportunity to perform professionally on national television, tour from coast to coast, and record numerous LPs. It was a training ground for professional singers, one in which primarily young Manitobans gained the advantage. A 1985 *Hymn Sing* Chorus fact sheet, reported, ‘Many [ex-choristers] are contributing greatly to the musical life of their communities, performers, teachers, choral directors, and music ministers in schools, universities, colleges and churches’ (CBC Manitoba Television Publicity
Records, AM, U-15-2-11 File 31). Included in this group are the music educators and performers, bass Mel Braun, choral conductor Elroy Friesen who continue to shape the next generation of singers at the University of Manitoba, and through their involvement in musical activities in the city and beyond, including other CBC-sponsored bodies.

The Winnipeg Singers

In the early 1970s, Harold Redekopp, the music programmer at CBC Radio in Winnipeg, asked William Baerg, choral director and CMBC music professor, to found a choral group to provide concert broadcasts of a professional standard. Other major Canadian centres had or were establishing professional chamber choirs: Tudor Singers of Montreal active from 1962 to 1975, Vancouver Chamber Choir founded in 1971, and later, the Elmer Iseler Singers of Toronto, established in 1979.\(^\text{79}\)

Not to be outdone by other regional CBC stations, the Winnipeg Singers was founded first as a 30-voice choir, later reduced to a 20-24 voices, and devoted to the ‘exploration of sacred and secular works of all eras’.\(^\text{80}\) The choir is historically connected to Winnipeg’s English choral tradition, tracing its origin to the 14-voice madrigal choir the Oriana Singers, formed in 1936 by composer and conductor W.H. Anderson. In 1942, the choir renamed as The Choristers grew to 20 voices, and began weekly national CBC radio broadcasts performing secular music. A decade later, in 1952, the broadcast title of the Chorister programme was changed to *Sunday Chorale* and the repertoire altered from secular to sacred, reflecting the new image. This format continued until the programme was cancelled in 1974. Over its 38-year history, the choir, under its various names was directed by three men, all of whom were educated in the British choral tradition: composer and choral director W.H. Anderson (1942-1955), organist Filmer Hubble (1955-1969), and composer and tenor Herb Belyea (1969-1974) (Winters, 2013). Many of its choristers were also of the Brito-Canadians community such as Belyea’s sister-in-law, the respected Winnipeg singing teacher Phyllis Thomson (b. 1934). For over fifty years of CBC sponsorship, the purpose of each of its choirs,

---

\(^{79}\) The Tudor Singers was founded in 1962, but was reorganized as a chamber choir of 17-24 voices in 1975.

\(^{80}\) There are some discrepancies in dates depending on the source.
with the Winnipeg Singers being the most recent in the lineage, has remained the same, to present choral performances of the highest quality possible.

In 1973, only two years after the Winnipeg Singers were formed, CBC shifted its emphasis, moving away from studio-recorded programs towards the transmission of live public performances, signifying an end to state funding for the choir. The group continued to flourish, developing a four-concert season supported by various sources of funding, private, corporate and provincial.

In their home city, the Winnipeg Singers achieved recognition as ‘a first-rate choir… [with] some of the very finest singers [in] the city’ (Harris, WFP, 28 Oct 1985, 19 (D)) and has twice won the Healey Willan Award for choral excellence, a competition for amateur choirs sponsored by Canada Council (1985 and 1987). The choir gained national recognition through radio broadcasts, an international tour in Germany and Austria, including holding the position of choir in residence at the Classical Music Festival in Eisenstadt, Austria (1989), an extensive tour of Western Canada (1989), and a performance at the Toronto International Choral Festival (2002).

The Winnipeg Singers is still considered to be the premiere chamber choir in the city. The choir’s success was and continues to be dependent in part from its leadership. From its inception in 1971 until 2003 (the period of this research), the directorship remained almost entirely in the hands of a series of Mennonites, William Baerg (1971-1983), tenor John Martens (1985-87), a joint directorship between bass/educator Mel Braun, and tenor/educator Vic Pankratz (1988-1999), and conductor/educator Rudy Schellenberg (1999-2003), and the non-Mennonite Wayne Ridell (1983-1985). In 2003, Russian-born conductor Yuri Klaz assumed the role (www.winnipegsingers.com).

In the last quarter of the twentieth century, the directors maintained the choir’s high standard of performance, enhancing the repertoire, and expanding their audience appeal. The repertoire is broad, from well-known classical works, – Poulenc’s Gloria, Rachmaninoff’s All Night Vigil (Opus 37), Haydn’s Teresa Mass to the twentieth century compositions of Wilhelm Stenhammer and Veljo Tormis.

---

81 The Winnipeg Singers continued to be involved in CBC-promoted activities when invited, e.g. its participation in the CBC Winnipeg Festival of 1975, with a concert of ‘Great Choral Music of the Church’ (Great Choral Music…, WFP, 17 May 1975, 106 (E)).
They continue to perform works by Canadian composers – Lionel Daunais, Eleanor Daley, Saul Irving Glick, Murray Schafer and have commissioned new music including works by the Manitobans Michael Matthews, Sid Rabinovitch, and Leonard Enns. The choir has performed with many different groups, including, but not limited to the local French-Canadian group Les Danceurs de la Riviere Rouge, the Tudor Singers, Elmer Iseler Singers, Vancouver Chamber Choir, Manitoba Chamber Choir, Hymn Sing chorus, and the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra. A total of four records have been produced, two, *O Praise ye the Lord* (1997) and *Prairie Voices* (1998), under Mennonite directorship.

The influence of these conductors on Winnipeg singers over the last quarter of the twentieth century is significant and has been crucial to the continued high standard of performance of many choirs in Winnipeg. As an example, Vic Pankratz, in his role as the music teacher at Westgate Mennonite Collegiate, encourages choral singing through the numerous choirs in his school, funnelling his best and most interested students into Prairie Voices, Winnipeg’s internationally recognized youth choir, age 18-25, a choir he directs in the community.\(^2\) In 2013, choristers who had aged out of Prairie Voices started a new choir, Horizons, under the joint director-ship of Scott Reimer and Leanne Cooper-Carrier, both of whom are from the Mennonite choral tradition, trained by Schellenberg, Braun, Friesen and others at either the University of Manitoba or Canadian Mennonite University. They are the next generation of the directing, conducting lineage that began in the early twentieth century in the Mennonite colonies of rural Manitoba. Over the generations and alongside the changes in Mennonite ways of thinking, engagement with the broader world, attainment of higher education, and maintenance of the principles of excellence, stewardship and outreach have shaped Mennonite musical ideals. Choral leaders working within and outside the Mennonite community with Mennonites and non-Mennonites alike have, and continue to make a strong impact on Winnipeg choral culture.

---

\(^2\) Prairie Voices was founded in 2000, by Elroy Friesen at the behest of some of his former high school students. The group has received several awards for excellence, the most recent in 2014, where they won a gold medal, Champions Competition, Mixed Youth Choir category, in Riga, Latvia, at the 9th International Choir Games.
Henry Engbrecht: the University of Manitoba and Community Singing

For more than a quarter of a century, one musician, Henry Engbrecht (Figure 12, page 189) has profoundly influenced singers and conductors in Winnipeg’s choral culture through his numerous roles in the Mennonite and non-Mennonite community: the Director of the Choral Programme at the Marcel A. Desautels Faculty of Music, University of Manitoba (1978-2006), the rehearsal conductor of Manitoba Opera (1974-1979), artistic director and conductor of the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir (1975-1982, 1983-1990), and the founder, artistic director, and conductor of the chamber choir Canzona (1989-2014). When describing Engbrecht’s character, long-time colleague Mel Braun, said, ‘He [Engbrecht] always made things happen wherever he was…He was ambitious and saw possibilities. He's a choral builder and he does it because he cares about people and he cares about the music’ (Andrea Ratutski, CBC News, 11 April 2014, n.p.).

Engbrecht’s quiet, forthright, yet charismatic approach to music making is grounded in his Mennonite background, explicitly his ideals of excellence supported by a strong work ethic, his student experience at CMBC as a chorister, and in the tradition of Sängerfeste. In 1978, when Engbrecht was hired as the Choral Director at the University of Manitoba’s School of Music (now the Marcel A. Desautels Faculty of Music), the school, established in 1964, had been in existence for less than fifteen years, and principally functioned as a performance-oriented centre for keyboard players. Vocal ensembles were limited to a school chorus that met once each week comprised of the majority of the students with limited or no vocal training, and the University Singers, an informal group of students with some vocal training.

In Engbrecht’s view, the arrogant and exclusive attitude fostered by some faculty members ingrained a deep separation between the on campus activities at the School of Music and that of the music community in Winnipeg and surrounding towns, resulting in minimal, if any, collaborative work. The school’s philosophy of ‘if they want us, then let them come to us’ exhibited outright opposition to Engbrecht’s experience and the Mennonite way of demonstrating the value of, and garnering community support for, a college music programme by touring its ensembles to constituent churches and communities (Interview, Henry Engbrecht, 20 June 2014). In growing the choral programme, Engbrecht instituted this Mennonite mode of operation. University choral concerts were performed in city
churches rather than on campus, eventually drawing in large audiences, while community outreach commenced in 1979 with two visits to high schools, one urban and the other rural. Local touring would become an annual event.

Figure 12: Henry Engbrecht in Rehearsal, Winnipeg Free Press, 2014

In a calculated move, Engbrecht first took the choir to a high school with a large concentration of Mennonite students in the farming community of Niverville, approximately 30 km south of Winnipeg. Engbrecht wanted a receptive audience
as an encouragement to the university choir, as some members did not see the value and reason for touring. This school was chosen for two reasons, first because Engbrecht had the support of the school’s principal, who understood the purpose and dynamics of the visit, and secondly, because of the size of the school. From his experience as a teacher in a small rural school, Engbrecht knew that the student body would be respectful and well disciplined. As many were Mennonites, choral singing was part of their community tradition, offering an audience who understood the practice, even though some of the repertoire performed that day may have been unfamiliar. The purpose of the visit, and Engbrecht’s ulterior motive, was to demonstrate to his choristers the dynamics that arise from community engagement through choral singing. He wanted to get them ‘hooked’. Within a few years, the questions posed by choristers changed from ‘Do we have to go?’ and ‘When will we be back?’ to ‘When can we go on tour?’ (Interview, 20 June 2014). By reaching out to communities in the city and beyond and using the choir as a role model, Engbrecht cultivated musical ambassadors for the university, setting standards of deportment and professionalism to encourage respect for the art, and instilled a positive attitude towards and the inspiration to be involved in community choirs. Within a few years, their tours grew to include communities in Manitoba, Saskatchewan and Alberta, while continuing to workshop with high schools within and outside the perimeter of the city.

Developing the programme was not without its challenges. In 1978/79, the University Singers comprised nearly half of the student body, but only a few had any voice training. Engbrecht recalls one student who ‘brayed like a donkey… a sound that was not pleasant’ (Interview, Henry Engbrecht, 20 June 2014). He added that that person should not have been there, but ‘we were scraping the barrel, paying the dues, blazing the trail…. cajoling, convincing and teaching’ (Interview, Henry Engbrecht, 20 June 2014). In the same year, the fledgling University Choir participated in the Mennonite Church Seminar weekend. Working with internationally recognized choral director Howard Swan, they heard other student choirs, including the two well-rehearsed, and vocally balanced Mennonite College choirs. Significantly, this event introduced aspects of the Sängerfeste and Dirigentenkurse tradition to students at a non-Mennonite institution. In this space, the University of Manitoba choristers observed what was happening in the other institutions in the city, imagining the possibilities for their vocal ensemble. In 1990,
University Singers won the Chamber Choir Competition in the CBC sponsored National Choral Competition, which gave recognition to the choir, its director and the university, elevating the status of the choral programme locally and nationally.

By developing strong relationships between the solo voice and choral departments, the quality of singer in the choral programme rose. In 2000, there were six choirs at the University of Manitoba, all auditioned groups, with five of the six directed by Engbrecht, and the Bison’s Men’s Chorus directed by musician and high school choral director, Steve Denby.

Gradually Engbrecht developed closer working relationships between the choral programmes at the University of Manitoba, Brandon University, and the two Mennonite colleges (after 2000, Canadian Mennonite University), always ‘hoping to grow the profile of choral singing’ (Interview, Engbrecht, 20 June 2014). He developed workshops, which he called the Three-Choirs Festivals (or Four-Choirs Festival depending on the number of choirs) that involved two or more high school choirs, rural and urban alike, and the University Singers. It was Sängerfeste without the religious overtones, with choirs rehearsing throughout the day, and performing in the evening in their separate formations and collaboratively as a huge choir. Those involved returned home with an enthusiastic attitude toward community singing.

In the broader choral community, Engbrecht overlapped his choirs, combining singers from the university choirs with the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir in preparing for larger works with the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra. Moreover, he networked, finding or creating opportunities for young soloists. In 1989, strongly encouraged by former students who shared his love of baroque music, Engbrecht agreed to direct ‘one-time only’ a chamber choir comprised of 16-24 soloist-calibre singers to perform a concert of baroque music. The singular event was followed a year later by another concert that was so well received that a concert season was established and Canzona was founded. A few years later, the group was offered private funding. This helped to establish it firmly in the Winnipeg arts community. The music of Bach and Handel formed the foundation of their repertoire, enhanced by the other works including Jan Dismas Zelenka’s Missa Dei Filii, Nicola Porpora’s Vespers of 1744, and André Campra’s Requiem. For many years Canzona shared the stage with MusikBarock, at the time Winnipeg’s premiere chamber orchestra specializing in baroque music. The choir has produced five
professional recordings, including three that celebrate the heritage of Mennonite *kernlieder* (core hymn repertoire), a project that was proposed to the choir even though they do not consider themselves a Mennonite choir (Interview, Henry Engbrecht, 20 June 2014). After 25 successful seasons, Engbrecht retired, placing the choir in the hands of Elroy Friesen, who has also assumed Engbrecht’s role as Director of Choral Studies at the University of Manitoba. The lineage of Mennonite influence in Winnipeg continues.

**Conclusion:**

During the 20th century, Mennonite influence in the development of Winnipeg’s high art choral culture has grown exponentially, however, not to the exclusion of those from other cultures within the Canadian mosaic. In Winnipeg of the 1920s, with its Brito-Canadian cultural elite, supported by British colonial and empire ways of thinking and being, Ben Horch was driven to develop musical pathways that would help Mennonites integrate fully, as musical equals, into Brito-Canadian society. This path was not devoid of opposition from both groups. Between 1920 and 1950, Brito-Canadian choirs traditionally excluded singers from non-British immigrant communities, unless it was a benefit, as an example, Ben Horch singing with the Winnipeg Male Voice Choir. On the other hand, many in the pre-1960s Mennonite community preferred and tried to maintain a separation from some aspects of Canadian society, perceiving Canadian ways as too worldly. Mennonite attitudes concerning the purpose of music strained under pressure from shifting theological ideals, where structures of power waged war against an increasingly high art Mennonite performance community, shaped by recurring activities within the broader society, including private music lessons from non-Mennonites, performance in the Winnipeg Music Festival, and post-secondary education in Canada, the United States and Europe. Ramnarine’s theory of calibrations (2007), of things not fitting, often helps to shed light on these developments. A case in point was the employment within Mennonite faith-based schools of the 1940s and 1950s of the best non-Mennonite musicians that Winnipeg could offer, but

---

83 As an example, Russian conductor Yuri Klaz, who immigrated in 2000, and as of 2014, directs the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir, the Winnipeg Singers, First Mennonite Church and Shaarey Zedek Synagogue choirs.
questioned whether their schools should develop or were developing professional musicians.

Choral singing as embodied cultural capital in the Mennonite community was enhanced through private music tuition, church seminars, and higher education. This led to the elevation of institutional capital amongst Mennonite musicians: the greater the participation, the more recognition was gained within the whole of Winnipeg’s music community. Bramwell Tovey, in discussing the 1989 performance of Benjamin Britten’s War Requiem with the Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra and a 380-voice choir, credited ‘people like Henry Engbrecht of the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir, William Baerg and of the Mennonite Oratorio Choir, John Martens of the Winnipeg Singers and Stuart Thomson [Winnipeg Boys Choir] with making his mission possible’ (Tony Davis, WFP, 24 Nov 1989, 41(D)). Three of the four conductors mentioned were Mennonites, as were many of the choristers.

The Mennonite philosophies of stewardship, the shared responsibility to develop others to the fullest, and the act of outreach (i.e., giving back to your community), illustrates how the Mennonite value system was and continues to be embodied not only within the Mennonite choral society, but also across all of Winnipeg’s choral community. Laura Loewen, collaborative pianist and Associate Professor at the Marcel A. Desautels Faculty of Music, recalled the mentors throughout her developing years that supported her love of music, and recognized her innate ability to accompany, saying, ‘all along I had these choir guys [Gary Froese and Vic Loewen at Westgate Mennonite Collegiate, Henry Engbrecht at First Mennonite Church] who were helping me, giving me opportunities, and letting me develop confidence…They were always really supportive’ (Interview, Laura Loewen, 19 August 2013). Loewen is only happy when there is a balance between performing and teaching. She remarked, ‘this is the way that I have been able to respect the great parts of the Mennonite heritage, that feeling part of a larger community and being responsible to people. Working at the university has allowed me to do that’ (Interview, Laura Loewen, 19 August 2013).

Within the framework of living as a Mennonite an individual’s actions as part of the faith community are important, but the restrictions on those actions have and may still create tensions for that same person. Laura Loewen stated, ‘I do not know any Mennonite musician who ha[s] not dealt with the tension between
what they do as a performer [and the theology that states] performance is a form of showing off’, which was unacceptable even as late as the 1980s (Interview, Laura Loewen, 19 August 2013). They somehow worked within the overbearing ‘monolithic culture’, pushing the boundaries, ‘taking risks living big lives, living really vibrant lives…There is no one way of being Mennonite’ (Interview, Laura Loewen, 19 August 2013).

Mennonite musicians, and in this case, singers and conductors strove to develop their ability, shared their knowledge through performing and teaching, and gave their best to the whole choral community in Winnipeg and beyond. They drew and continue to draw on their Mennonite heritage and their training to enhance music in their home city of Winnipeg.

**Epilogue**

Historian Royden Loewen (2006) contends that it is ‘the interests and behaviour of the local community that propels societal changes’ (9). These structures can be understood ‘only in so far as they are created at each instance in everyday life’ (9). In the first half of the 20th century, Mennonite musician and community leader Ben Horch strove to achieve his vision for Mennonites, that of acceptance by and into the dominant Brito-Canadian society. Through an acculturation process, he introduced Mennonite choirs to a wider audience by featuring them on CBC programming and by instituting aspects of the English choral tradition, thereby shaping the way Mennonite music would be performed, and made available opportunities for singers to gain knowledge from Brito-Canadian musicians, and experience through participation in Brito-Canadian choirs. By tapping into the Brito-Canadian music community, individual Mennonite singers were encouraged to enter the Winnipeg Music Festival. By winning the festival’s most prestigious vocal awards, they achieved city-wide recognition for themselves and by extension their community.

At mid-century, the two Mennonite colleges in Winnipeg, CMBC and MBBC were established. Educational networks, particularly those of American and German post-secondary institutions, broadened repertoire and influenced standards of singing and conducting. The commitment to high standards of performance, developed through, but not limited to an association with numerous eminent conductors of international standing, were influential in establishing the
credibility required for Mennonite choirs to be recognized in the city and nationally.

In the second half of the 20th century, British influence on Canadian culture declined as Canadians strove to develop a culture that reflected the diverse communities that comprised Canadian society. By the 1970s, Mennonites were well integrated into Canada’s multicultural society and their voice shaped many aspects of Canadian cultural life. Established Winnipeg choirs, once the domain of Brito-Canadian musical directors and choristers, came to be directed by Mennonite musicians. For three decades, Mennonite choristers, recognized nationally for their musicality, comprised at least half of the chorus featured on the popular television programme *Hymn Sing*. Henry Engbrecht, who developed the choral music programme at the University of Manitoba, integrated the Mennonite tradition of, and their commitment to, community singing into the broader Winnipeg society. Over the last half of the 20th century, Mennonite singers, choir conductors, and musical directors have profoundly influenced the choral culture in Winnipeg.
CHAPTER 5: SOKÓŁ CHOIR OF THE
SOKÓŁ POLISH FOLK ENSEMBLE

There is no longer such a place as home: except of course for the home we make, or the homes that are made for us . . . which is anywhere and everywhere, except the place from which we began. (Salman Rushdie, 1992, 57)

Introduction

Over the past two hundred years, thousands of ethnic Poles have crossed the Atlantic Ocean to start a new life in the Americas. Many trace their origins to – and have arrived from – countries other than Poland. Wherever they settled, whether Detroit or Chicago in the USA, and Toronto or Winnipeg in Canada, many of their individual and collective histories have contributed, and continue to contribute, to an image of shared identity as members of a distinct ethnic community within both their immediate locale and the broader Polish diaspora, linked to a real or imagined Polish homeland. The expressive practices of culturally based musics as articulators of a “hyphenated” Polish identity (e.g., Polish-Canadian, Polish-American) have played an important role in and are affected by local, national and transnational cultural politics, and shared and contested histories. Existing research on this subject has focused on the Polish communities in the United States (Brozek, 1985; Thomas and Znaniecki, 1996), Detroit (Savaglio, 1996, 2004) and in Chicago (Erdmans, 1998), the Górale, or Polish Highlander culture of the Greater Toronto Area in Canada (Wrazen, 1991, 2007, 2013), and the connection between class identity and musical choices in Polish American culture (Keil, 1985; Savaglio, 1996, 2004). In this chapter, I consider how diaspora and identity formations, transnational influences and trans-Atlantic connections coloured by local and global politics have shaped the repertoire and performance praxis of the over 100-year-old choir of Sokól (Falcon) Polish Folk Ensemble (henceforth referred to as Sokól Choir), all the while maintaining its relevance to the Polish-Canadian community in Winnipeg.
These changes have been shaped by numerous events, determined in part by political and social philosophies. Strong historical factors including the partitioning of ancestral lands beginning in the late 18th century and the systemic suppression of the Polish language, education and culture in the homeland over the 19th century remain ingrained as an aspect of a shared narrative. Over the 20th century, shifting political ideologies and advanced technologies that support a new transnational world have and continue to shape the identities of Polish people in the homeland and the diaspora.

**Diaspora, Transnationalism, Calibrations, and Fields of Tension**

The key concepts of diaspora (Conner (1986), Sheffer (1986), Safran (1991), Clifford (1994), Butler (2001), and Quayson and Daswani (2013)) and

---

Three partitions of Polish lands by the Austro-Hungarian, the Prussian and Russian empires between 1772 and 1795 culminated in the loss of Poland’s status as an independent country and its elimination from the map of Europe. Poles living in all three partitions – the Prussian, the Austrian and the Russian – initially retained their cultural and educational rights, with Poles in the Austrian partition having the most local autonomy. By the second half of the nineteenth century, these rights were being eroded. In the Russian partition, insurrections by the Poles were quelled and 80,000 ethnic Poles were forced into exile within Russian or beyond its borders. The Polish language lost its official status, and education and publications in Polish were limited. In the last quarter of the nineteenth century Poles in the Prussian partition were also subject to denationalization measures. As an example, the Polish language was restricted in public forums, an aspect of the Germanification process of *Kulturkampf* – the spreading of German influence eastward – that was designed to assimilate the Poles or force their emigration. Poles in Galicia, part of the Austrian partition, considered an impoverished area, emigrated due to the lack of available agricultural land. For a detailed account of historical events that led to Polish migrations in the 20th century, see Chapters 1 and 2 in Paula Savaglio’s *Negotiating Ethnic Boundaries: Polish American Music in Detroit* (2004), Chapters 4 to 7 in Jerzy Lukowski and Hubert Zawadski’s *A Concise History of Poland* (2006), or Chapters 2 to 4 in volume 2 of Norman Davies’s *God’s Playground: A History of Poland: 1795 to the Present* (2005). For a history of Polish immigration to Canada, see the article ‘The Poles’ in *The Canadian Encyclopedia* (Historica-Dominion Institute 2012b), and on Polish immigration to Manitoba see Chapters 1 and 2 in Victor Turek’s monograph *Poles in Manitoba* (1967).

The three Polish partitions were reunited as a democratic state from 1919 to 1939, invaded by Germany in 1939 and divided by Germany and the Soviet Union through a secret accord. Poland emerged after the war as a communist state, and in 1989, after a final period of political unrest, returned to a democratic state. The name of the Polish homeland has changed over the centuries: the Polish Lithuanian Commonwealth known also as the First Republic (1569-1794), the Russian Prussian or Austrian partitions (1795-1918), the democratic state of the Kingdom of Poland or the Second Republic (1918-1939), followed by the communist state of the Republic of Poland (1944-1952), and the Polish People’s Republic (1952-1989). Since 1989, the democratic Republic of Poland is also referred to as the Third Republic.
transnationalism (Tölöyan, 1996, 2007; Kokot, Tölöyan, and Alfonso, 2003; and Quayson and Daswani, 2013) have been and often continue to be used interchangeably in discussions of nation and identity. In the attempt to refine the discourse, current research, as it pertains to our increasingly globally networked world, is broadening the dialogue, yet continues to reminds us of the polysemy of the subject. Quayson and Daswani (2013) list the most common among diverse conditions that must be met before a dispersed people are considered a diaspora:

- the time-depth of dispersal and settlement in other locations; the development of a myth of the homeland; the attendant diversification of responses to homeland and host nation; the evolution of class segmentation and conflict within a given diaspora alongside the concomitant evolution of an elite group of cultural and political brokers; and the ways in which contradictions among the various class segments end up reinforcing different forms of material and emotional investment in an imaginary ideal of the homeland. (Quayson and Daswani, 2013, 3)

Transnationalism is a social phenomenon where the ideas of border and the notion of nation are diminished because of a heightened interconnectivity between people. The ‘various flows, counter flows and the multi-striated connections’ between Polish-Canadians, other Canadians, Poles in the diaspora and in the homeland has and continues to define Polish identity in the diaspora (Quayson and Daswani, 2013, 4).

In his overview of ‘diaspora’, Mark Slobin (2003) argues that little changed in ethnomusicological discourses about migrations, ethnic groups, minorities, hybridity and acculturation between 1970 and 2000. These discourses presented diasporic communities as ‘non-uniform, historical and political formulations’ (Ramnarine, 2007, 3), shaped by displacement and the constructs of nationalism and transnationalism. The essentialist ideals of preservation and authenticity were

---

86 For an overview of current research on diaspora and transnationalism see Quayson, Ato and Daswani, Girish, 'Introduction – Diaspora and Transnationalism'. In A Companion to Diaspora and Transnationalism, Quayson and Daswani, eds. Chichester: Blackwell Publishing, 2013, 2-27.
prevalent in the academic discussions of musical repertoires and performance practices within diasporic communities.

Some newer frames of reference have been developed to analyse cultural shifts created by mobility in a postcolonial and global world, presenting different approaches from which to analyse diasporic subjects while illuminating the complexity of diaspora studies. Tina Ramnarine’s (2007) use of the concept of ‘calibration’ provides insights into diasporic conversations about musical practices in multicultural contexts. Most appealing to Ramnarine is ‘the emphasis [placed] on things not fitting, on adjustments in the musical and social world, and on the contradiction between discourses’ (6), which can reveal the disassociations between representations and realities. I find calibration very useful in analyzing the disassociation between political ethos and cultural representations as presented by some in the Winnipeg Polish community particularly between 1950 and 1989. On one hand, the rhetoric and activities of many World War II Polish veterans in the city and elsewhere in the diaspora promoted and worked toward the return of a democratic Poland free from communist rule. On the other hand, this same group of Winnipeg Poles, at times became the enabler by which a folk repertoire, developed and disseminated by communist Poland’s cultural bureaus, came to represent ‘authentic’ Polish folk culture in Winnipeg.

In studying the impact of music and media on aspects of multiculturalism in late 20th-century Sweden, Dan Lundberg, Krister Malm and Owe Rönstrom (2003) developed a conceptual model for observing contemporary musical life. They identified ‘contradictory tendencies’ or ‘fields of tension’ around twelve poles: homogenous–diversified, pure–mixed, global–local, great tradition–little tradition, collective–individual, and mediated–live. They describe the three tension fields most relevant to this study as follows:

- On the one hand, musical life is becoming increasingly homogenous. The same types of institution, recorded music, performance, etc. are to be found in all countries. On the other hand the number of styles and forms is increasing and musical life is becoming more diversified.
- On the one hand the number of mixed styles of music is increasing while on the other there are strong tendencies towards the
preservation of musical styles, “genuine” and “authentic” performance and ethnic and other forms of cleansing in the area of music.

- On the one hand increasing numbers of musical styles are arising that achieve *global* distribution. On the other hand *local* musical styles seem to be becoming increasingly important to many. (2003, 62)

They argue, ‘between at least two contrary sources of power there arises currents of different strengths and directions. Together these form a multi-dimensional *energy* sphere. In its simplest form a tension field has two poles’ (63). For Lundberg, Malm and Rönstrom, a musical phenomenon can cover the gamut from being as broad a category as the folk music of Poland, to a specific work of music, a type of ensemble or a performance style. Each phenomenon may be drawn toward one pole or another, depending on the forces to which it is subjected. In this discussion I use the three tension fields itemised above (homogenous–diversified, pure–mixed and global–local) as conceptual tools for analyzing the changing praxis of Sokół Choir. I also draw on the construct of ‘festival’ as a force responsible for repertoire and praxis change (Bendix, 1989; Cooley, 2005), the concept of sponsored performance proposed by Wrazen (1991, 2007), and I examine the influence of politics on folk repertoire and performance practice in Poland (Chomik (1971), Czekanowska (1990), Milewski (2013), Pękacz (2002), Zakrzewska-Nikiporczyk (1973, 1979)). My discussion of ethnicity draws on the concept of intragroup maintenance (Savaglio (2004), Erdmans (1998)) as an extension of boundary (Barth (1969, 1981)), and Harms’s (2000) and Radhakrishnan’s (2003) suggestion that ethnicity is mutable and context-specific. I apply diaspora theory, as presented by Savaglio (2004) and Wrazen (1991, 2007) in their studies of Polish expressive arts in Detroit and Toronto, to Winnipeg’s Polish community.

---

Polish Identities in Winnipeg

Some of the same events that initiated the mass migration of Poles have also shaped Polish identities in the diaspora. The historical factors that have served as the impetus for the mass migration of Poles throughout the 20th century include the lack of available agricultural land in Galicia in the late 19th century, and Canada’s immigration policy of the same period that encouraged agricultural immigration in order to populate western Canada; the displacement of Poles during and in the aftermath of the two world wars; the social, economic and political outlook of communist Poland; and most recently emigration from a democratic Poland influenced by a global economy.

The Polish-Canadian community in Winnipeg has more similar roots with the Polish-American community in Detroit than it does with the Polish-Canadian community in Toronto. This emerges particularly in respect to Wrazen’s (1991) study that focuses on the Górale community in Toronto, the majority of whom emigrated in the 1970s and 1980s from the southern area of Poland called the Podhale, in the foothills of the Tatra Mountains. Savaglio’s investigation of Poles in Detroit reveals a less homogenous group where the label ‘Polish-American [has] enforce[d] an outsider’s sense of commonality on a group of people who do not address issues of politics, religion, or music uniformly’ (Savaglio 2004, 13). While they do share a common national descent, the variations that exist in the Polish community in Detroit derive from the melding of peoples from ‘at least three massive movements out of Poland over the last one hundred years’ (2004, 14).

The Latin word ‘Polonia’ meaning ‘Poland’, has come to signify the Polish diaspora of both the Poles living in and those outside the homeland, while the adjectives ‘old’ and ‘new’ are designations referring to specific migrations. The term ‘Old Polonia’ is the label Poles in Detroit accord to the groups of Poles who immigrated from 1870 to the onset of WW II. The designation ‘New Polonia’ indicates the groups of Poles who immigrated in the immediate aftermath of WW II. The smaller groups of immigrants in the 1960s and 1970s fitted themselves into ‘New’ Polonia. Savaglio’s research in Detroit supports the existence of difference between the ‘Polonias’ in their political orientation, educational background, use of the Polish language, and number of generations (2004, 14). The differences are mirrored in the Winnipeg locale.
While Savaglio considers the number of generations in her comparison of the two Polonias, Mary Erdmans (1998) in her examination of politics within the Chicago Polish community between 1976 and 1990, expands on these divisions by distinguishing between ethnics (native-born Americans of Polish descent) and immigrants (foreign-born Poles). This distinction between immigrants, ethnics and the subsequent generations who consider themselves Polish-American is relevant in terms of their group and individual relationships to the real or imagined homeland – Poland – and to the notion of what it means to be Polish.

On one hand, the varied perceptions can cause tensions between groups and be the source of intragroup boundaries. On the other hand, they can enrich the local Polonia environment. Tensions between and cooperation among ethnics and immigrants, as in Erdman’s study, occurred and continue to occur not only in the large ‘p’ politics of Winnipeg’s Polonia, but also in their cultural politics.

Comparable to the Detroit group, the majority of Winnipeg’s Old Polonia community immigrated to Manitoba in the period between the late 19th century and World War I. They were a religious, hard-working, poorly educated, often illiterate and impoverished people that emigrated from Galicia in the Austrian partition (Austro-Hungarian Empire). However, unlike their American counterparts, many migrants had agricultural knowledge, specifically targeted by the policies of Clifford Sifton (1861-1929), Canada’s Minister of the Interior (1896-1905), who sought peasants to farm the Canadian prairies. Smaller numbers of Polish immigrants continued to arrive in Manitoba throughout the 1920s, many remaining in Winnipeg. In a study completed in the early 1950s on the 268 members of Winnipeg’s Polish Gymnastic Association Sokół, 194 or 72.7 percent reported Galicia as either their or their parents’ place of origin (Turek, 1967, 32). Many from this wave of immigration found employment in the burgeoning railroad industry, and, within a generation, some children of homesteading families, meaning those who had received agricultural land grants, had also moved to the city (Heydenkorn, 2008). Like their American counterparts, Winnipeg’s ‘Old Polonia’ tended to divide its political interests between local and Polish ones, with many of the Polish-born aspiring to return to Poland. After 1918, when the democratic Polish Second Republic was re-established, their political interests turned more toward Canadian issues.
During the interwar years, Winnipeg’s Polish population was the largest in Canada, growing from 11,228 in 1931 to 36,550 a decade later. The city had earned the name of the ‘Polonia Capital of Canada’ (Pernal, 1989, 6). Poles developed a strong community, with four parishes in the city, three of which possessed regular parochial elementary day schools. Polish and Canadian news was disseminated through two newspapers, the Gazeta Katoleka (Catholic Gazette) and Czas (The Times), and a variety of religious and secular organizations, some based on American-Polish models were established. Turek lists 54 Polish organizations in Winnipeg between 1902 and 1940. The life of some associations was very short while others are still in existence today.

Polish Gymnastic Association Sokół was founded in Winnipeg in 1906 and is the oldest secular Polish organization in the city. Its roots are based in the youth sport movement of the same name, which began in the Czech provinces of the Austro-Hungarian Empire in 1862. The model rapidly spread across the Slavic world, with each nation redefining Sokół for its own purpose. Central to the Polish Sokół movement within Europe was the development of ‘physical alertness and mental preparedness for the struggle for national independence’ (Turek, 1967, 207). The movement spread to American immigrant centres with the Winnipeg association as an affiliate until 1927 when it became an autonomous organization. While the Winnipeg branch retained its European ideals, it developed as a mutual aid society, providing assistance to newcomers through loans and insurance. As well, its social programmes – by elevating their members’ educational and language standard – helped Poles to forge a place in the new society. ‘The pride its members felt for their rich heritage’ (Bibik n.d.) was exhibited through the activities of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble.

In the decade following WW II, Winnipeg’s Polish community grew dramatically as many displaced Poles immigrated to Canada and into the city. The roots of ‘New Polonia’ were not situated in a geographic locale but were formed through their singular but collective experiences in WW II as civilian detainees or political prisoners in Soviet work camps, as combatants, and as internationally displaced persons. The political and social ideals of the newcomers, shaped through their experiences, changed the dynamics of Winnipeg’s Polish society. Neither group could understand the struggles that the other had endured from Old Polonia’s experience of pioneering in the prairies to New Polonia’s narrative of
survival during WW II. This led to the establishment of a self-interest group – the Polish Combatants Association, where the wartime experiences and political ideology of its members created a strong fraternity that distinguished them as representatives of New Polonia, distinct from those of Old Polonia. Politically, New Polonia devoted their lives to opposing communism in their homeland, and building their lives in Canada.  

There are two other smaller immigration groups of Poles in Winnipeg, the ‘Solidarity’ group who immigrated in the 1980s and 1990s, and the most recent, economic migrants arriving after 2000. My interviews with and observations of these two groups form an extremely small sampling, and are based entirely upon those who are involved in the Polish cultural ensembles. These newer immigrants remain connected to friends and family in Poland, develop friendships outside of the Polish community, and maintain their ethnic identities through their affiliations in the Polish community. Many are highly educated professionals who have enhanced the Polish organizations with their skill set and have contributed greatly to the wider Winnipeg community (Blackmore, 2014).

The migration of the 1980s and 1990s is historically referred to as the ‘Solidarity immigration’ and reflects the period of political unrest leading to martial law in Poland as it transitioned from a communist to a democratic state. According to Polish-Canadian researchers Heydenkorn and Kogler, immigrants of ‘Solidarity’

---

88 The Polish Combatants Association or S.P.K. – *Stowarzyszenie Polskich Kombatantów* – was founded in Italy as an ‘embryo or reservoir for future army formations’ by Polish ex-servicemen upon demobilization at the end of WW II (Heydenkorn, 1985, 112). Branches of the organization whose ‘aims were mutual assistance and opposition to communism in Poland’ opened throughout the Polish diaspora in communities wherever significant numbers of ex-servicemen immigrated (Stone, 2003, 17). The 350 veterans who arrived in Winnipeg on November 15, 1946 soon opened S.P.K. Branch #13, developing social and cultural programmes, as had Polish Gymnastics Association Sokół two generations before. However, their story is not as successful, for the S.P.K. mandated that only veterans could become members. A generation later, they instituted a membership drive focused primarily on their own offspring and extended to Poles who had defected from communist Poland. This drive met with some success. However, in 2012, the branch closed, adhering to its natural course, as the membership list grew shorter with the passing of its elderly members. Yet, during its existence, it played a very important role in the maintenance of Polish culture in Winnipeg, and its legacy, the Polish Dance Ensemble S.P.K. Iskry, continues to carry the acronym of the founder.

89 Interviews were conducted among members of both Polish ensembles in Winnipeg: Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble and the dance ensemble S.P.K. Iskry.
showed minimal interest in the life of Polonia, keeping in contact with organizations to receive economic or charitable aid, or ‘to use established organizational buildings for recreational purpose’ (1988, 112). Their study was based on interviews conducted during the 1980s in the Toronto region. To a certain extent, this is mirrored in Chicago’s Polish community of this era. However, some immigrants feared persecution of family members still living in Poland by the Polish state ‘not because they had been involved in any anti-state activities in Poland, but because of their political involvement [in Polonia associations] in Chicago’ (Erdmans, 1998, 77). In her oral history project on Poles who came to Winnipeg as part of the Solidarity immigration, historian Magda Blackmore did not find any correlation of the political concerns felt by Chicago Poles and those from Winnipeg Poles of the same era. My interviews have revealed that immigrants to Winnipeg of this era were focused on establishing a life within the general Winnipeg community. While some were connected with the Polish community, others were not. Immigrating in 1985 as a child of eleven, Agata Plozanski, now in her thirties, related that her family had little to do with the Polish community. They moved into an area of Winnipeg where there were no other Polish children and most of her neighbours and school friends were Filipino. She had not attended a Polish cultural event or even heard of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble until 2011 when she joined the group to develop connections in Winnipeg’s amateur musical theatre community, contrary to other Poles who joined to connect with their heritage. Her emotional response after a month of rehearsals with Sokół Choir was of surprise and excitement. She said, ‘There is a part of me that has been awakened … [I] was swimming in Polish’ and ‘it made me feel part of a community’ (Interview, Agata Plozanski, 27 April 2011). Four years on, she continues to be a member of Sokół Choir.

On the other hand, being part of Winnipeg’s Polonia by taking part in cultural activities not only helped some immigrants ease the pain of separation from family and friends left behind in Poland, but also reinforced their reasons for leaving the homeland. Frank Filip arrived in Winnipeg in July 1981, leaving behind a political and economically unstable Poland, where state control extended to aspects of religious practice including the alteration of text in Polish hymns that espoused a democratic nationalist flavour. He recalled, ‘In Poland, we could sing the altered words “God bless our country”. In Canada, we could sing the real
words, “Give us Lord our country back free” (Interview, Frank Filip, 30 April 2011). The significance of being able to sing a specific text without fear of reprisal created a responsibility felt by some immigrants of this era to uphold and preserve the traditions, language and cultural heritage of Winnipeg’s Polonia.

Significantly, many from this immigration group had different cultural backgrounds than those of New and Old Polonia. They had experienced the cultural programmes developed by the communist government of Poland beginning in the 1950s which shaped the reception of high art music among its citizens. Others in Winnipeg’s Polonia community including pianist, musical director and conductor Tadeusz Biernacki, pianist and educator Monika Łukomska, and organist Mirosław Szarek are highly trained musicians, the beneficiaries of communist Poland’s state-funded education programmes of the 1960s and 1970s. Biernacki and Łukomska have been involved in shaping the repertoire and praxis of Sokół Choir for over thirty years.

The latest and ongoing immigration period comprises those who emigrated as citizens of the current democratic Polish state. In conversation with some recent arrivals, I have learned that they consider themselves economic migrants who are very content with the opportunities that relocation to Canada has provided. This group’s full impact on Polish-Canadian culture in Winnipeg remains to be seen, however there is one man who is extremely active within the Polish-Canadian cultural community. In 2007, at the age of twenty-two, teacher, organist and singer Michał Kowalik immigrated to Canada. He immediately joined Sokół Choir, where he quickly became a regular soloist. Over the past seven years, he has completed two post-secondary degrees, a Bachelor of Music and a Bachelor of Education, both from the University of Manitoba. Currently, Kowalik teaches music at an elementary school and performs as a member of the Manitoba Opera chorus. He has also taken on additional commitments in the Polish community, as organist and choir director of the Polish parish’s Holy Ghost Church and deputy musical director of Sokół Choir. Highly respected in Winnipeg’s high art community, Tadeusz Biernacki, the conductor who has guided the choir for the past thirty-two years, has been instrumental in helping Kowalik reach his musical goals. Succession plans may be in progress that will see Kowalik eventually take over the directorship of Sokół Choir from Biernacki, whose influence will be discussed later in the chapter.
The Dissemination of Polish Choral Culture in Winnipeg

As in the Detroit study, this investigation relies upon Savaglio’s extension of Fredrik Barth’s (1969, 1981) explanation of boundary maintenance. Savaglio suggests that ‘a line of separation between groups . . . is maintained through constant renegotiation and interaction . . . [and that it] refer[s] on another level to boundaries and distinctions within the one group’ (2004, 6). She reinforces her theory through Anthony Cohen’s observations of differing alliances found within a community:

The ‘commonality’ which is found in community need not be uniformity. It does not clone behaviour or ideas. It is a commonality of forms (ways of behaving) whose content (meaning) may vary considerably among its members. The triumph of community is to so contain this variety that its inherent discordance does not subvert the apparent coherence which is expressed by its boundaries. (Cohen 1985, 20)

Thus Barth’s concept of ascription – the attributes that define belonging to a specific group – either by others or by self is an inherent aspect in the discussion of intergroup boundaries, and is equally essential in ‘the maintenance of intragroup boundaries’ (Savaglio, 2004, 6). Savaglio’s interpretation and extension of Barth’s explanation of boundaries, supported by Erdman’s intragroup distinctions is particularly relevant when investigating the changing repertoire and praxis of Sokół Choir, as will shortly become clear.

In his history, *Poles in Manitoba*, Turek (1967) reports that ‘the most popular form of music [was] vocal music, particularly choral performances’ (230). In the first decade of the 20th century, Polish parish choirs that sung in parts existed in Winnipeg and some provided music for secular purposes, but the Sokół Choir, formed under the patronage of the Polish Gymnastics Association Sokół in 1908, occupied ‘the most prominent place’ (230).

Choral singing in multiple parts is not a feature of traditional Polish folk culture. Songs from the folk repertoire were primarily monophonic. However, in the 19th century, the development of choral singing as a transnationally influenced
tradition was dependent upon political and social factors in each of the three Polish partitions, with a blossoming and re-signification occurring in the diaspora.

The development of choirs in partitioned Poland was subject to diverse influences, such as social prejudices and the policies of cultural control put into effect by the governing bodies of each annexed territory. In Galicia, politically part of the Austro-Hungarian Empire, the organization of Polish societies was illegal until 1867. Choral singing as a secular activity performed by Poles emerged relatively slowly in Galicia, compared to the Polish territory in the Kingdom of Prussia. Historian Jolanta Pękacz (2002) proposes that the choral movement failed to thrive in Galicia because of strong social prejudices that involved an ‘aversion to mixing with one’s social inferior’ (146), resulting in choirs whose members came from the same Polish professional or social group. Limited membership and ostracism doomed many choirs to failure.

During the last quarter of the 19th century, Poles in the Prussian partition were subjected to various denationalization measures, and to ‘germanification’ as part of the ‘Kulturkampf’ campaign initiated by Otto von Bismarck. Choral singing as a Germanic secular social activity had developed early in the 19th century. The Prussian government encouraged choral singing in German amongst the Poles in an attempt at assimilation. However, secular choral groups like their sacred counterparts resisted these attempts and in turn played an important role in supporting a Polish national identity. Choirs had artistic and political aims and were often harassed and repressed by the authorities (Zakrzewska-Nikiporczyk, 1979). It is not surprising that those who emigrated and settled in North America during the last quarter of the 19th century used choral singing to signify Polish culture as part of a national identity in the new locale.

In the early years of 20th-century Winnipeg, the majority of Poles emigrated from the Austrian partition of Galicia, and were of the peasant class. A Polish choir under the auspices of Polish Gymnastics Association Sokół was established in 1908 and there was a lively exchange between Polish-American and Polish-Canadian organizations during this period, making it likely that there was some contact between Polish-Canadians in Winnipeg and the Polish Singer’s Alliance, an American association of amateur Polish choirs (Turek, 1967). Winnipeg was developing as a centre of excellence for choral singing, largely as a result of associations with professional, highly-respected British musicians and British
musical institutions. These connections would prove to be influential in shaping the Sokół Choir’s performance practices in the second half of the 20th century.

From its inception, Sokół Choir provided entertainment at Polish community events, secular and sacred (Turek, 1967). Its earliest documented public performances outside the Polish community were in 1914 under the direction of Kazimierz Sielski. Somewhat ironically, three of these were musical entertainment for events sponsored by the People’s Forum, an assimilationist group which sought to communicate the values of Brito-Canadian society to non-English speaking immigrants, and the All People’s Mission, a Christian organization that assisted immigrants in adjusting to life in Winnipeg, which was also assimilationist despite respecting the values of those it regarded as ‘ethnics’. A report of this event in the Manitoba Free Press recorded that the Polish choir sang its national airs in a most able manner (Reviewed Work All People’s Mission, MFP, 16 Dec 1914, 18 (B)).

After WW I immigration to Canada resumed and many of the newly arrived Polish immigrants were better educated than the earlier group. In 1925, Helena Garczynski, a ballet dancer and recent immigrant, formed the Sokół dance group. The first documented joint performance with the choir was at the 1929 Canadian Pacific Railway Festival, an early multi-ethnic celebration, where the group adopted the name Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble.90

The ensemble participated in many events within the Polish community, including Sokół Polish Gymnastic Association’s 25th and 30th anniversaries (1931 and 1936 respectively), a Polish Veteran’s Dinner in 1937, Mother’s Day 1938 and Epiphany celebrations in 1938 and 1939. In 1940 the ensemble performed at the annual Springtime in Poland Ball, where they presented ‘expressive forms of folk dancing with vocal accompaniment, some of which ha[d] not yet been performed in Winnipeg’ (Presentation of Folk Dances..., WFP, 01 April 1940, 7 (C)).

90 The Canadian Pacific Railway Festivals (1927-1931) were a series of music and folk art festivals whose purpose was to explore Canada’s cultural resources. It is of great significance to musical evolution in Canada because it was an early instance of a major Canadian corporation supporting the arts, and was “an early attempt to promote serious composition by Canadians, taking into account, moreover, the folk material of the country as a source for such composition, and one of the early concerted attempts to acquaint Canada’s many different musical communities and audiences with each other” (‘CPR Festivals’, The Canadian Encyclopedia, 2012). On another level, the CPR was acting in its best interests supporting its patrons, the immigrant community.
In 1928, under the direction of P.T. Andree, Sokół Choir was the Polish representative at the New Canadian Folk Song Festival. Facets of this event illustrate the complex nature of immigrant and ethnic relations between Brito-Canadians and newcomers, while gauging the porosity of these lines of differentiation and association.

The New Canadian Folk Song Festival was one of a series of 16 festivals organized by John Murray Gibbon (1875-1952), the general publicity agent of Canadian Pacific Railway. Taking place between 1927 and 1931, the events were held in various communities across Canada. Each one modelled on a different theme relating at some level to the community in which it was presented.

In his analysis of the prairie CPR festivals, musicologist Stuart Henderson (2005) states ‘the events focused either on bridging a chasm separating dominant and subaltern racial categories or celebrating the significance or dominance of particular groups’ (Henderson, 2005, 115). The Winnipeg festival was an attempt at the former, and distinguishes between the assimilationists who thought the new immigrants could be Canadianized and the exclusionists who felt that Eastern Europeans should not be allowed to immigrate to Canada.

The counter-narrative of racism smouldered behind the creation and production of the CPR festivals, an attempt to dispel its omnipresence in the white

---

91 Gibbon is recognized as one of the most prominent developers of Canadian culture of the early 20th century. For a detailed biography see Gary Bret Kines. ‘Chief Man of Many Sides: John Murray Gibbon and his contributions to the Development of Tourism and the Arts in Canada’. MA thesis, Carleton University, Canada, 1988.

92 The Stoney Indian Programme, Banff Springs Hotel, 4 September 1927, included First Nations songs and dances. Although the title emphasized ‘first nations’ music and dance, as the core of the programme, in reality, it highlighted the colonist, British members in the community. Among those singled out was the first white woman to settle, and the white child to be born in the area. In 1928, the Folksong and Handicraft Festival in Quebec City included the 13th-century pastoral play Le Jeu de Robin et Marion by Adam de la Halle, and a ballad opera to Louvigny de Montigny’s libretto ‘L’ordre de bon temps’, based upon French explorer, and the founder of Quebec, Samuel de Champlain. For CPR Festival information see the MA theses of McNaughton (1982) and Kines (1988), and article by Henderson (2005).

Brito-Canadian male hegemonic Canadian society.\textsuperscript{94} In Winnipeg of the 1920s, the relationship between the Brito-Canadian community and immigrants was possibly at its worse during the city’s fifty-year history. During the first two decades of the 20th century, rapid growth quadrupled Winnipeg’s population, from 42,000 in 1901 to 179,000 in 1921 with Jews, Poles and Ukrainians forming the predominant immigrant group. As early as 1901, the media promulgated an immigration policy of exclusion.

There are few people who will affirm that Slavonic immigrants are desirable settlers, or that they are welcomed by the white people of Western Canada…Those whose ignorance is impenetrable, whose customs are repulsive, whose civilization is primitive, and whose character and morals are justly condemned, are surely not the class of immigrants which the country’s paid immigration agents should seek to attract. Better by far to keep our land for the children, and children’s children, of Canadians, than to fill up the country with the scum of Europe. (\textit{Winnipeg Telegram}, 13 May 1901, cited in Artibise, 1984, 372).

City resources were unable to cope with the increase, nor was there the political will to make changes, leaving many of the immigrants living in unsanitary, overcrowded conditions that contributed to the myth of the inferiority of their race. Racial tensions were exacerbated as the Brito-Canadian community of Winnipeg, although retaining economic and cultural supremacy until after World War 2, had been reduced demographically to a minority since 1910. They feared their cultural tenets were being undermined, particularly as the Poles and other Slavic

\textsuperscript{94} For reading on the issue of racism in Canada, see Paula Jean Draper et al. Nation of Immigrants: Women, Workers, and Communities in Canadian History, 1840s-1960s (1998), as it pertains to the CPR Festivals, see Henderson, Stuart. ‘While there is Still Time…’: J. Murray Gibson and the Spectacle of Difference in Three CPR Folk Festivals, 1928-1931 (2005). For a period view of the problem in Winnipeg, see Woodworth, James Shaver, Strangers Within Our Gates; or, Coming Canadians (1911), and the novel The Foreigner: A Tale of Saskatchewan (1909) by Ralph Connor. For contemporary analytics of the subject as it pertains to Winnipeg, see Artibise, Alan. ‘Divided City: The Immigrant in Winnipeg Society, 1874-1921’ in \textit{The Canadian City: Essays in Urban and Social History} (1984).
immigrants were perceived to exhibit ‘an ethnic pride, one borne out of oppression and reinforced through the teachings of their leaders’ (Artibise, 1979, 372). Within this unstable, racially charged environment, a festival celebrating the ‘other’ was hosted. Gibbon was a strong advocate of the Canadian mosaic ideal, an inclusive society of democratic pluralism where the immigrant maintained aspects of his culture. Within a presentation format, all Canadians could celebrate various divergent ethnic cultural icons – national dress, food, music, and dance. By displaying certain cultural aspects through festival, ethnicity could be better managed and controlled (Bohlman, 1988). The ulterior goal focused on the maintenance ofBrito-Canadian tenets, with ethnic communities, over several generations, melding invisibly into the dominant society.95

In Winnipeg, the CPR festival comprised eight concerts over a four-day period, 20-23 June 1928, and promised ‘400 performers from 15 ‘racial’ groups in picturesque songs, dances and costumes’ (Eight Concerts…, MFP, 19 June 1928, 18 (B-G)). At that time, the term ‘racial’ interchangeable with ‘ethnicity’, also implied others, foreigners, not Brito-Canadians. The ‘new Canadian’ choirs, instrumentalists, dancers and ensembles represented the following ethnic communities: the Icelanders, Ukrainians, Norwegians, Swedish, Danish, Dutch, Italian, Polish, Yugoslavian, Rumanian, Hungarian, Czechoslovakian, and Germans. Four soloists, Patricia MacDonald of New York, the Danish baritone, Poul Bai, the Polish or Russian coloratura soprano Johanna Filipowska-Stefansson of Winnipeg, and vaudeville performer Leo Silkin rounded out the event.96 Gibbon was more concerned with the success of the venture, than authenticity. The presence of professionally trained performers helped to sell tickets, while adding prestige and credibility to the event.

95 John Murray Gibbon’s monograph Canadian Mosaic: The Making of a Northern Nation (1938) influenced Canadian immigration policy of the following decades, leading to Canadian multicultural policy in the 1970s. He envisaged Canadian society as a mosaic with each immigrant group retaining its aspects of it culture, yet contributing to Canadian culture as a whole. In his world, the background of the mosaic, comprised Brito-Canadian values and cultural tenets. See Gibson (1938) for his construct of Canadian mosaic. See Henderson (2005) for a discussion of Gibbon’s concept of mosaic.

96 Bai, recognized in his home country as a man of great talent, taught at the Royal Conservatory of Toronto from 1927 to 1932, and performed at numerous folk song festivals organized by the Canadian Pacific Railway. In 1944, he founded ‘Opera Promenade’ a new opera company in Toronto. Johanna Filipowska Stefansson,
The Friday evening concert featured Filipowska-Stefansson, Bai and Macdonald supported by various Slavic groups including the Polish Sokół Choir and folk dance group. Patricia MacDonald introduced the music of Poland by singing two Polish folk songs in English translation. Recognized internationally as a ‘brilliant sympathetic interpreter’ of Romanian, Polish, Czechoslovakian and Yugoslavian music, including songs from the regions of the Danube and Vistula, she sang ‘Kazor’, a lullaby from Krakow, and ‘Smutna jeşi doła ma’ (Sad destiny) (Eight Concerts…, MFP, 19 June 1928, 18 (C)). The review of MacDonald’s performance reports on her abilities, and illustrates the method in which immigrant musics were made accessible.

Miss MacDonald’s costume lent authenticity to her interpretations. She was for all the world a peasant woman of Poland as she sang touchingly and realistically the little lullaby. It was an example of perfect vocal art and pantomime (Fresh Surprises Found…, MFP, 23 June 1928, 3 (D)).

In her research on Brito-Canadian representations of Canadian aboriginal peoples, Sarah Ahmed (2000) describes this form of play acting – representing oneself as another (here, MacDonald as a Polish peasant woman) as a way of making the ‘other’ accessible. In this case, the Brito-Canadian can be seen as the agent and the Pole as the ‘other’; the representation of Polishness is made ‘white’, meaning Brito-Canadian, since the songs were sung in translation and performed by an American of British heritage. That aside, MacDonald’s renditions, as with other CPR festival performances, was a calculated act facilitated by Gibbon, intended as

---

a catalyst to re-shape Brito-Canadian perceptions of Poles and other Eastern European immigrants from undesirable to desirable immigrants.

On the other hand, Joanna Filipowska-Stefansson, whose surname denotes Polish or Russian ancestry, and who was married to a Swede or Swedish-Canadian, is singing what appears to be high art duets, with the Danish tenor Bai. Filipowska-Stefansson was no longer considered an ‘other’ for two reasons: her high-art capability and her marriage to a Swede, an immigrant from a preferred, northern race. Her ability as a high-art singer gave her the cultural capital, which set her in a different category from those immigrants enacting folk culture. Bai’s northern European ethnicity and his professional status as a singer and professor at the Toronto Conservatory of Music (modelled on the British Royal College of Music, and headed by British organist Healey Willan) insured his acceptance in Brito-Canadian society. In contrast to MacDonald’s performance where English translation of a foreign text was deemed necessary, the foreign language text of duets sung by Bai and Filipowska-Stefansson appears to be of no consequence at all. The concert reviewer reported:

Two singers whose sheer personality held the audience through long singing numbers were Poul Bai, Danish baritone, and Madame Johanna Filipowska Stefansson. Nine-tenths of the audience, not being Danish on the one hand, nor Russian on the other, could not understand a word of what Mr. Bai or Madame Stefansson was saying. It might have been vituperation and indeed in places, sounded like it. But no one cared, nor asked to understand, so entertaining were the performers throughout (W.E.I., MFP, 25 June 1928, 6 (B)).

---

98 Canadian immigration policy at the turn of the twentieth century initially favoured British, American and northern European immigrants. The Protestant North Europeans were pictured as a hardy northern race whose ‘virtues of self reliance, initiative, individuals and strength’ were more akin to the Canadian image, contrary to the image of Roman Catholic and Orthodox eastern Europeans who were seen as ‘degenerate and lacking in energy and initiative’ (Barber, 1972, xiv). The myth of the Canadian northern race, as a people who excelled in the harsh climate became a marker of nationalism and an expression of pride. It had been reinforced by the British imperialist sense of mission and Kipling’s ‘white man’s burden’ that portrayed the Anglo-Saxon race as the bearers of the highest values of Christianity and civilization (Barber, xiv).
The two ethnic singers, particularly Filipowka-Stefansson, singing high art illustrates the porosity of the boundaries between Brito-Canadian society; in this space she was seen as exotic rather than foreign. Sokół Choir, in national dress, singing their folk songs, with a strong chest voice sound that exemplified the ‘other’. The choir performed at two events, and the reviewer for the *Manitoba Free Press* recorded a positive reception to the Polish folksongs that offered a stirring and climactic end to the programme (Fresh Surprises Found…, *MFP*, 23 June 1928, 3 (D)).

![Sokół Choir on Mother’s Day, 1938](image)

**Figure 13: Photograph of Sokół Choir on Mother's Day, 1938. (Archives of Manitoba)**

Song repertoire, performed by Winnipeg Poles of this period probably included folk and religious songs learned in childhood. See Figure 13 for photo of choir at the time when this repertoire would have been sung. Others would have come
Figure 14: Photograph of Oskar Kolberg. (Oskar Kolberg Museum, Przysucha, Poland)

from the 36 volumes of *Lud. Jego zwyczaje, sposób życia, mowa, podania, przysłowia, obrzędy, gusła, zabawy, piesni, muzyka i tańce* (*Peoples: Their habits, way of life, speech, stories, proverbs, rituals, witchcraft, fun, songs, music and dances*), a compilation of folk traditions from all Polish regions, collected by famed Polish ethnographer Oskar Kolberg (1840 - 1890). All except three posthumous volumes were published between 1857 and 1890. Large, incomplete collections of the original publication are in the libraries of the two Winnipeg Polish folk ensembles (Sokół and Iskry). Some volumes have also been found in second

---

99 Oskar Kolberg (1814-1890) was a Polish ethnographer, folklorist and composer. In 1842, he published his first collection of folk melodies, *Polish Folk Songs* (*Pieśni ludu polskiego*), transcriptions for voice with piano accompaniment, which was met with much criticism because of his addition of piano interludes, inaccurate harmonisation, and ‘excessive interference’ with melodic simplicity (http://culture.pl/en/artist/oskar-kolberg). Undaunted he published further compilations of *Wedding Folk Songs* (*Pieśni ludu weselne*) and *Ritual Folk Songs* (*Pieśni ludu obrzędowe, Kogutek, gark, okrężne*). However, he is most remembered for his ethnographic work documenting the folklore of all the Polish provinces and the publication of 85 volumes of Polish folklore including but not only songs, stories, jokes, dances and rituals, known as *Peoples: Their habits, way of life, speech, stories, proverbs, rituals, witchcraft, fun, songs, music and dances* (*Lud. Jego zwyczaje, sposób życia, mowa, podania, przysłowia, obrzędy, gusła, zabawy, piesni, muzyka i tańce*). These works were reprinted in 1961 under the title *Dzieła Wszystkie (All the Works).*
hand bookstores in Winnipeg, indicating that it is highly probable that the books were privately owned by Polish-Canadians early in the first half of the 20th century. Kolberg's other books of folk song transcriptions with piano accompaniment may have also been in circulation.

Until 1945, the Polish community in Winnipeg – Old Polonia – had been largely a homogenous society where new immigrants were welcomed and assimilated into Polish Canadian culture as it evolved locally. The influx of post-war immigrants of New Polonia, whose roots were not situated in a geographic locale but were formed through their singular but collective experiences in WW II as civilian detainees or political prisoners in Soviet work camps, as combatants, and as internationally displaced persons changed the dynamics within the community. Politically, these people devoted their lives to opposing communism in their homeland. Their experiences also shaped their outlook on culture retention in the new locale. For ‘New Polonia’ it was imperative that the Polish language, its history and culture be kept alive. This was achieved in a variety of ways, one of which illustrates a disjuncture between their political views and their desire to enrich Polonia culture. A relationship developed between Winnipeg’s Polonia community and the Polish communist state that ultimately shaped the song and dance repertoire of Sokół.

**Communist Poland Creates a National Music Culture**

Shortly after the end of WW II, the communist government of Poland instituted a cultural development programme that emulated the Soviet model and built on the Polish folk tradition through the establishment of dance and choral ensembles in schools, universities and factories. ‘Regional identities [were] manipulated into an integrated national identity through wise [political sleight of hand] manoeuvres by governmental bodies,’ aimed at developing a sense of national pride (Czekanowska 1990, 120). As another tool to instill nationalism and cultural pride, two national folk ensembles were formed: the State Folk Group of Song and Dance ‘Mazowsze’ in 1948, and the Polish National Song and Dance Ensemble ‘Śląsk’ in 1953. These groups comprised professional singers, dancers and instrumentalists who performed highly stylized folk repertoire, which Polish ethnomusicologist Anna Czekanowska refers to as ‘artificially created’ (118) song and dance repertoires.
It is a commonly accepted fact that the tendency to shape dance cycles is now maintained mainly by show forms that juxtapose various varieties of dance and zones of tempo (slow-fast). This use of old national and folk dances, which was recorded by Kolberg in the nineteenth century (Kolberg, 1857) and has survived in transformed versions and dramatized form in the amateur movement (1990, 118).

The song tradition was also reformulated to be aurally more interesting than the traditional representation of monophony and two-part harmony. Of significance how the national ensembles’ shaped performance praxis throughout the diaspora. Through judicious promotion – Mazowsze was ‘acclaimed throughout the world’ (Celebrity Concert Series, 1963, n.p.) – and its presentation of a highly-polished, beautifully crafted product invoked nostalgia for an imagined place. The performance practice of Polish folk repertoire in the diaspora was changed because many Polonia folk ensembles desired to emulate the performances and appearance of Śląsk and Mazowsze, as in Figures 15 and 16.

Figure 15: Illustration in Mazowsze Concert programme, 1964. (Archives of Manitoba, P3287/71 Celebrity Concerts, p. 8.)
Richard Seaborn and the Performance of State Folk Group of Song and Dance ‘Mazowsze’

There was much excitement in Winnipeg’s Polish community when an announcement revealed that Mazowsze would perform in the city on January 18, 1964, as one of the few Canadian concerts during its second tour to North and South America. Sokół’s conductor at this time was Richard Seaborn, a highly respected Winnipeg musician trained at the Julliard School of Music, New York. Over the years, he served as the concertmaster of the Winnipeg Symphony, as the music director for CJAY TV, as a regular performer on CBC radio, and as a politician in the Manitoba Legislature (Gordon Goldsborough – I, 2013). See Figure 17 (page 220) for a photo of Seaborn.

Over the years, he served as the concertmaster of the Winnipeg Symphony, as the music director for CJAY TV, as a regular performer on CBC radio, and as a politician in the Manitoba Legislature (Gordon Goldsborough – I,
Seaborn was one of the 5,500 people who attended the Mazowsze concert where he would have noted the differences in performance practice between the Polish and Polish Canadian groups. The visiting ensemble comprised a choir and a dance group. This division of the praxis removed some of the performance issues, particularly breathlessness, that occurred when the performers sang and danced simultaneously, as had been the common practice in a Polish village setting that was representative of the repertoire they were singing. Secondly, the Mazowsze choir performed four-voice (SATB) arrangements of typically monophonic folk melodies specifically created for Mazowsze’s performances. The stylized repertoire and performance practice presented by Mazowsze and Śląsk became recognized globally by many inside and outside the Polish tradition as representative of genuine ethnic Polish folk. In Winnipeg, this new representation was accepted readily.

Figure 17: Photograph of Richard Seaborn (*Manitoba Calling*, September 1947, p. 7.)
Sokół Choir had been performing some choral arrangements, two to four parts, of folk and religious songs under their previous director, violinist and chartered accountant Jan Sapinski. However, the Mazowsze, and Śląsk arrangements certainly captured Seaborn’s interest. During his eleven years as conductor of Sokół, Seaborn transcribed over seventy four-part songs from the recordings of both Mazowsze and Śląsk, sometimes arranging the transcription to best suit the voices in his choir. The new arrangements re-shaped the praxis, from singing monophonic or two-part folk songs to SATB arrangements of folk songs and some contemporary Polish songs. These formed the basis of Sokół’s folk repertoire for nearly two decades. Sokół’s apparent acceptance of this repertoire as authenticate Polish folk music illustrates a disjuncture as presented by Ramnarine (2007) – an acceptance of a repertoire and performance practice that was created in part as propaganda by the Polish communist government, the same government that was despised, especially by New Polonia Poles.

Within the context of how folk melodies had once been performed in Poland, this adaptation of folk repertoire – four-part choral arrangements – performed by professional musicians became accepted as authentic Polish folk music by many in the diaspora, thus moving the pendulum towards a new representation of Polish music in a global context. For those performing the folk songs in four-part harmony, as an example ‘Szła dzieweczka’ (Young girl walking), the new style presented a new and exciting way of performing Polish folk music.

Transcribed by Seaborn in January 1967, Szła dzieweczka (Sound File 5: ‘Szła dziewczka’) is a simple strophic folksong, found in the repertoires of Mazowsze and Śląsk. It tells the simple tale of a conversation between two youths. A young girl walking is stopped by a young man. She tells him that she does not give her bread away for a kiss. He tells her to wait, and not run away, but come to the quiet grove with him. The arrangement is for SATB, soprano and tenor solo and kapela, a small accompanying band of musicians. By embracing the new arrangements as part of their ethnic tradition, Sokół entered into a new

---

100 In the most recent YouTube videos by Mazowsze (1992), it is evident that the songs have again been arranged, adapting to a more contemporary style. Search YouTube under Mazowsze.
space, one that aligned the group with the Brito-Canadian choral tradition, reinforced by the Winnipeg Music Festival.

In the spring of 1964, perhaps using two of these new arrangements, the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble won the Lord Tweedsmuir Memorial Trophy (Figure 18) in the ‘folk song choir’ class at the Winnipeg Music Festival, beating rival Ukrainian Bandhura Male Chorus by a single point. Adjudicator Frederick Carter remarked that although Sokół’s tone was rough, the performance ‘was virile and exciting, barbaric and lyrical by turns and always directly communicating’ (At the Festival: Poles take Tweedsmuir, WFP, 18 April 1964, 2 (C)).

Figure 18: The choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, winners of the Tweedsmuir Trophy at the Winnipeg Music Festival, 1964. (Orphaned Photograph, possible Napoleon Photo Studio, Polish Gymnastic Association Sokół, Winnipeg.)

Even though Seaborn would have been pleased with the outcome, as a professional musician, and in his ‘aim to raise [the] group to national stature’ (Canadians Celebrate Polish Independence, WFP, 11 Nov 1963, 38 (D)), he
understood that one mark between standings signified the choirs were of equal skill. At some point after this event, Seaborn proposed a separation of the Sokół Choir and dance ensemble, which was granted in 1966. This change allowed for the improvement of choral qualities while implementing the new performance ideas he adopted from Mazowsze. By his departure in the early 1970s, Seaborn had established the new repertoire and praxis that represented an aspect of Polish-Canadian culture in Winnipeg. During this decade, the role of Sokół Ensemble as a public face of Polish-Canadian expressive arts was enhanced by the Canadian government’s multiculturalism policies that offered new and different performance opportunities.

**John Standing, Multiculturalism and the Media**

By the 1960s, the term ‘multiculturalism’ was beginning to be employed with more frequency by governmental agencies to signify the increasing diversity of Canada’s population. In 1971, the federal government under Pierre Trudeau implemented policies to protect and promote the cultural heritage of all Canadians, while encouraging them ‘to integrate into Canadian society and take an active part in its social, cultural, economic and political affairs’ (Canadian Multiculturalism, 2012). This was an exciting time for many ethnic groups across Canada, celebrating their heritage and introducing their individual cultures to other Canadians through numerous and varied activities. As an example, over a period of 44 years beginning in 1970, Sokół Choir has represented an aspect of Polish-Canadian culture at Winnipeg’s Folklorama festival. Planned as a singular event for the 1970 centenary celebrations of the province of Manitoba, Folklorama was designed ‘to provide a world tour of about twenty countries without leaving the city’ (World Tour – Easy Way, *WFP*, 31 July 1970, 3 (H)). Folklorist Pauline Greenhill (2001) remarked that Folklorama ‘is remarkably successful at representing geographic and national ‘there’ as actually “here”, and ethnic and cultural “other” as truly part of ‘self” (1235). The representation of multiculturalism as characterized by the early Folklorama festivals signified a change in Winnipeg’s self-image from a homogeneous Brito-Canadian society to a cosmopolitan community promoting strength through cultural diversity. The festival’s initial success was deemed a powerful tool for civic boosterism, the act of promoting an
event with the goal of improving the city’s image, and the festival developed into an ongoing annual event.

The festival has been one of Sokół’s most highly attended “sponsored performances,” defined by Wrazen (1991) as ‘any performance that is the result of some pre-arranged agreement between the performers and others who act as sponsors be they inside or outside the community’ (174). This agreement between the folk ensembles and the organizers of Folklorama fuelled the development of highly polished yet stylistically divergent repertoire presented by the Polish-Canadian groups. It has figured prominently in Canadian celebrations with live performances at the Canada’s 1967 centennial celebrations in Victoria, the 1976 Commonwealth Games in Edmonton and at Expo ’86 in Vancouver.

Additional performance opportunities resulted as CBC radio and television created programming which reflected the new multicultural policies and the changing face of Canadian demographics. This was a golden period for Sokół and other ethnic folk groups that appeared on a variety of television and radio programmes, including ‘Ce Coin de Terre’ (This Corner of the Earth). This 1974 series was created for Radio Canada, the French-Canadian television network, and re-released in 1977 as ‘Worlds Together’ on CBC’s English language network.\footnote{The programming for ‘Ce Coin de Terre’ included the Japanese, Filipino and Russian communities from Vancouver, the Greeks from Montreal, the Ukrainians from Edmonton, the German, Bolivian and Bulgarian communities from Alberta, and the Jewish and Polish peoples from Winnipeg.} Set in the Mennonite Heritage Village in Steinbach, Manitoba, the documentary presents various social celebrations that might have taken place in a village in Poland, as imagined and researched by the CBC, and expressed by Sokół.\footnote{The programme set in the Mennonite Heritage Village offers another conversation about imagined place and authenticity.}

Programmes promoting ethnics, Polish-Canadian interpreting their culture, capture a moment in time, a specific, yet singular image that represents ‘their culture’ to others, in this case, Canadians from coast to coast. Can a programme of this nature reinforce the ideal of a tradition as understood by the group, and furthermore, validate the notion of what is or has become recognized as ‘authentic’
repertoire or performance, thus subscribing to preservation of said tradition? In the context of Sokol's repertoire, what is considered 'authentic' and worth preserving

by Winnipeg Polish-Canadians leans towards a perceived ‘pure’ pole as theorized by Lundberg, Malm, Rönstrom (2003). This ideal of Polish folk music (four-part arrangements), as presented by Sokół, was further strengthened by the knowledge attained by the children of New Polonia who, beginning in the late 1960s, attended summer folk (music and dance) courses in Poland. These courses, devised by the communist Polish government exclusively for its diaspora peoples, promoted an artificially created folk repertoire with the purpose of establishing a homogenous Polish communist society. This exemplifies the complexity of diaspora relationships, on one hand, with the homeland, and on the other, the adopted country, and the role of musics, deliberately manipulated or

Figure 19: Screen shot of Sokół Choir taken from Ce Coin de Terre. (Nicolas, Doclin. dir. and ed. Ce Coin de Terre, Société de Radio-Canada, VHS, 1975. 20:58-22:17.)
otherwise employed for specific purposes. With the best intention, and following its mandate to promote multiculturalism, the programme ‘Ce Coin de Terre’ introduced Canadians to representations of various ethnic cultures within the Canadian mosaic.

For the members of Sokól, representing Canadian Poles on CBC national television was an exciting opportunity (Interview, Jerzy Bibik, 15 June 2011). It is without doubt that Sokól members worked on elevating their performance standards for their premiere on national television. Helping them to achieve this goal was music educator and choral conductor John Standing (1931-2013), who accepted the role of choral director in 1972.\textsuperscript{103}

Many of the British conductors and adjudicators who made their mark on Winnipeg choral culture during the second quarter of the twentieth century influenced John Standing’s approach to singing and choral conducting. He is remembered as having ‘an elegance to his style that begat extraordinary results. He didn't just conduct - he instilled… a musical aesthetic’ (Mariam Bernstein, cited from Standing Obituary, \textit{WFP}, 20 April 2013, n.p.). Standing had never worked with an ethnic choir before, and he was surprised to find that they ‘didn't stand still’, meaning that they used rudimentary choreography in their performances (Interview, John Standing, 22 March 2011). He continued to use Seaborn’s arrangements as this had resonance within the Polish community, and in other events where Polish-Canadian culture was presented to other Canadians. Standing, true to his choral training, focused on developing the vocal sound of the choir. One of his aims was to develop consistent vowel sounds among the choristers. This was not an easy task. Standing did not speak Polish, but he devised a method that would help to achieve his aim. When he heard song text in which the vowel sound was inconsistent he would ask choir members to pronounce the word for him. Slight differences in dialect created discussions amongst choristers as to which pronunciation was correct. The members would leave the decision up to Standing. After hearing the options he always chose the

\textsuperscript{103} John Standing (1931-2013) taught Music, French and English at J.B. Mitchell and Kelvin High School. He conducted several different church choirs over his career, and was involved in the administration of the Winnipeg Music Festival. He directed many community choirs including the Grad Choir, Manitoba Youth Choir, National Youth Choir, Polish Sokól Choir, Winnipeg Girls Choir, as well as the chorus of the Manitoba Opera and Gilbert and Sullivan Society of Winnipeg (Obituary, 19 April 2013, np).
pronunciation that best achieved his goal of producing not only a clear vowel sound, but also the most beautiful tone, based on his Brito-Canadian musical upbringing.

In 1976, the Sokół Choir under Standing travelled to Poland to compete in the Festival of Polonia Choirs. This event drew many Polish choral groups from across the diaspora. Standing had encouraged the choir to include some French and English Canadian folksongs as part of their competition repertoire for he saw the group as representing Canada, rather than Poles competing against Poles. This act re-signified the purpose of the group within the contextual framework of the competition. Sokół’s presentation was different from the other competitors in three ways: their repertoire included non-Polish folk songs (songs from their adopted country); their stage presentation incorporated the wearing of traditional Polish costumes; and their performance was enhanced through rudimentary choreography. See Figure 20 (page 228) of the choir at this time. Conversely, the Polish American choir was attired in the red, white and blue stars and stripes of the American flag, while the Polish choir from Germany sported the traditional concert dress of black tie and formal gown.104

What does this say about each group’s ethnic and national identities, and their relationship to the homeland? The concert dress of the choir from Germany may have indicated the long tradition in that country of community-based choral singing. Conversely, folk dress may have not been a signifier as important to Poles living in the European diaspora as it was to those in North America. The American dress, even within the context and era, cannot singularly be associated with the ‘melting pot’ theory where ethnicity is subservient to an over-arching democratic American culture. It does support Erdmans’ research on the Chicago Polish community of the 1970s and 80s, illuminating diaspora politics where ‘delegates from Polish organizations composed of American citizens [saw themselves as an] inseparable component of the great American nation [and would work with Poland in cultural exchanges only, pledging full solidarity and loyalty to America first]’ (Brozek 1985, 190, cited in Erdmans, 36).105 Winnipeg ethnic Poles followed the

---

104 There is no indication whether the Polish choir from Germany was from East or West Germany.
105 Winnipeg ethnic Poles followed the same philosophy as their American neighbours. On one hand, some in the Winnipeg Polish community attempted to discourage the choir
same viewpoint with regards to the arts as their American neighbours. The Polish traditional dress worn by Sokół members, combined with the performance of Canadian folk material, illustrates an outward expression of their commitment to the ideals of Canadian multiculturalism that ‘encourage[d] racial and ethnic harmony and cross-cultural understanding’ (Canadian Multiculturalism: An Inclusive Identity, 2012). Significantly, within this context, Sokół Choir members who were self-defined as ‘Polish’ in Canada were considered ‘Canadian’ in Poland by the adjudicators and the other choirs. Not only was their repertoire re-signified, but also what being Polish-Canadian meant was re-defined.

Figure 20: Sokół Choir ca. 1976. John Standing, Choral Conductor is third from left in the back row. (Orphaned photograph, possibly Napoleon Photo Studio, Polish Gymnastic Association Sokół, Winnipeg.)

from competing in this festival because they felt that taking part in cultural activities organized and funded by Poland somehow indicated the choir’s support for the Communist state and its increasingly repressive actions against Polish citizens (Interview, Bibik, 15 June 2011). On the other hand, it was many of these same people that sent their children to study Polish folk song and dance at summer programmes in Poland, designed for Polonia groups and supported by the Polish communist state. They did not seem to see the irony in this situation.
The differences in performance practice between the Polish-Canadians and those from the U.S. and Germany, notably the dress of each choir and their use of choreography, illustrates not only the hyphenated identity of each choir, but also is representative of the different political ideologies, ‘melting pot’ versus ‘multiculturalism’ while expressing the norms of their individual distinct choral cultures. For this competition, the hyphenated identity did not extend to repertoire except for Sokół Choir who included the traditional Canadian folk song ‘Farewell to Nova Scotia’, sung in English, in its programme. The choir and the judges accepted this disjuncture in their repertoire: Sokół Choir won three top honours at the 1976 festival.

As part of this event, the Sokół Choir toured Poland for one month, performing at various venues. The key event, which would change the direction of Sokół, occurred in Częstochowa, where the Pochondnia Male Voice Choir hosted the Canadian choral group. Here, the Polish Canadians met the choir’s accompanist, Tadeusz Biernacki. In 1978 Biernacki came to Winnipeg under the guise of a student visa, with no intention of returning to Poland. In 1980 he took over as director of the Sokół Choir, a position he still holds. His professional affiliations are many and of high profile. In Winnipeg, he is the Musical Director of the Royal Winnipeg Ballet and Assistant Conductor and Chorus Master of the Manitoba Opera. Clearly, the Sokół Choir is a labour of love, tied to ethnic affiliation and personal commitment.

In 1980, when Biernacki took over as director of the Sokół Choir, it was the first time in twenty years that the choir would be lead by a Pole. Val Wójtaś, a choir member for over forty years, remarked that Seaborn and Standing were ‘meticulous and [through their guidance] the choir became disciplined’, but Biernacki ‘brought that Polish influence and an understanding – the emotional connection with the music – he brought colour that wasn’t there before’ (Interview, Val Wójtaś, 29 April 2011). See Figure 21 (page 229) of Biernacki in the early 1980s.

Biernacki’s arrangement (Sound File 6) of the Goralé (highland) song ‘Gonią juz Goralé trzody’ (‘The Mountaineers are chasing pigs’, music by A. Klucznioł, text by W. Krzemiński) is a convincing example of the new vitality he
brought to the choir during the 1980s. 

Figure 21: Tadeusz Biernacki, Sokół Artistic Director, ca. 1981. (By permission of Tadeusz Biernacki, Jane Bibik, private collection, Winnipeg.)

Unlike his Brito-Canadian predecessors whose aspirations for Sokół included developing the sound of the group to replicate that of a choir trained in the English choral tradition, Biernacki, through his understanding of the Polish folk tradition, encouraged the use of the ‘white voice’ sound – a strong chest voice, placed further back from the vocal resonators that creates a darker, more hollow tone – a vocal quality that is often present in Slavic folk singing. Musical interest is created by a dynamic mix of textures from instrumental interludes to a male trio (TBB), and SATB choir, tempo and dynamic changes, and successful applications of *ritenuto*.

The arrangement presents a strong homophonic, chordal style, where the depth and colour of the choral sound is distinctively Slavic. This may well be an aspect of

---

Polish musician Alojzy Klucznik (1914-1962) became the first conductor of the Polish Radio Choir (Chór Polskiego Radia) formed in 1948. Włodzimierz Krzemiński (1919-2011), poet, songwriter and journalist was interred in a Stalag for his part in the September Campaign of 1939 where he helped to organize cultural activities. Upon his release in 1946, he contributed to Polish Radio cultural and journalistic programming.
the contemporary representations of folk music that Biernacki referred to as a ‘European influence’ (Gair, *WFP*, 18 October 1987, 38, 6). It firmly supports Czekanowska’s theory of ‘artificially created repertoire’ as this song is a representation of Goralé folk repertoire with text and music newly composed by artists in the employ of the state-influenced Polish Radio. Polish émigrés of this era (Solidarity Polonia) were disseminating new repertoire in Winnipeg and elsewhere in the diaspora. As theorized by Dan Lundberg, Krister Malm and Owe Rönstrom (2003) the axis of global-local shifted towards the global on account of the dissemination of Polish music (pop and folk) written and performed by individuals in the employ of the communist state, being introduced to ethnic Polish Canadians, many of whom were generations away from their roots.

Biernacki’s new interpretations were founded in cultural and political philosophies, events and exchanges that shaped his musical language throughout his youth in communist Poland. The cultural policies of the Polish state also created a disjuncture between the reception, education and consumption of high art versus folk art between Poles in the homeland and those in the diaspora.

*Disjunctures: Communist Poland’s High Art Ideals Versus Folk Culture for Polonia Communities*

After World War II Poland’s growth in the industrial and service sectors encouraged a shift in population from rural to urban areas. Within two decades great gains were made in elevating education levels, improving the health of the new urban residential worker, advancing women’s rights, and raising the overall standard of living. However, as the baby boom generation of the 1950s reached maturity, the inability of the state to keep pace socially and economically led to an overall dissatisfaction, and inspired the Solidarity movement. In one sense, the Polish society of the 1950s to 1970s was shaped by the state’s avid patronization of high art culture. This was in part accomplished by educating those who exhibited talent to a very high standard, and by making high art music accessible to people of all classes. This elevated standards of music education, performance and reception. In another sense, the Polish state also supported the development of a stylized folk culture. Through their international performances, the state dance and song groups Mazowsze and Slaśk exhibited what some in the diaspora would come to accept as ‘authentic’ Polish folk repertoire.
Again a disconnect emerges between what was offered to the Polish people in the homeland, as exampled by the high art education for its citizens, in contrast to the support given by the Polish state to Polonia folk groups through the development of folk art education, fostered at summer schools and lauded at competitive festivals. Some differences became evident between Winnipeg’s Polish-Canadians and the new immigrants of this era grew out of the high art/folk art dichotomy.

On one hand, some Winnipeg Polish Canadians could not understand why many new immigrants were uninterested in Polish-Canadian folk culture. As an example, one Winnipeg dancer remarked that it is mainly the second and third generation of Polonia that is currently keeping traditional Polish dance alive in the city. On the other hand, many newcomers did not comprehend why the maintenance of their folk tradition was so valued by Polish-Canadians as it was an aspect of Polish heritage that was practiced by few in the homeland and retained primarily as an historical representation. At times, Polish-Canadians perceived this indifference as an attitude of cultural sophistication, and the newcomers saw the Polonia Poles as culturally simple. Biernacki, as a product of Polish post-war society, and shaped by his extensive musical training was able to meld the various political and social groups together through song and performances that were relevant to both groups.

As an example, the annual celebrations of National Independence Day, on November 11th commemorates the 1918 restoration of the democratic Polish State (the Second Republic). It was one cultural event observed in unity by all Polish-Canadians. In this moment, the cultural disjunctures between new immigrants and Polish-Canadians were minimized, if not erased. One current Sokół choir member emotionally recalled this event. He said,

It was on November 11 [1981], Polish Independence Day ... and it was my first year in Canada. In Poland, at that time ... the communists were fighting to stay in power.... So when you came here [Winnipeg], you were uprooted.... [It] was very emotional to hear Sokół [Choir], here in Canada, far away, thousands of miles

107 The tension between the two immigrations of Polish-Canadians resembles that of the Kanadier and Russländer Mennonites.
from home, [and then] you saw the dancers! The Sokół movement deemed to continue the Polish community, language, roots [and] traditions here in Canada (Interview, Frank Filip, 30 April 2011).

In the following spring (April 1982), Sokół Choir and Dancers staged a concert in aid of ‘relief operations’ to help those in need in Poland. (Carter, WFP, 26 April 1982, 256 (A)). The performance, deemed a success by reviewers, audience and ensemble members, featured a re-enactment of a Highland Wedding and was Sokół’s first documented attempt to present a piece of theatre. Yet, the introduction to the concert review by Casimir Carter, reporting for the Winnipeg Free Press, provides an alternate reading to what he felt marked the most significant point in the concert. He wrote,

There was a spontaneously emotional response from the audience as it stood up and joined the Sokół Polish Choir and Dancers in the singing of ‘Let Poland be Poland’, the Solidarity movement’s rallying song (Carter, WFP, 26 Apr 1982, 24 (A)).

By celebrating historic national holidays (November 11) and addressing the contemporary political climate, Sokół Choir, with Biernacki’s direction, was instinctively responding to community interests and concerns, because of their vested interest as members of that specific ethnic community.

**Tadeusz Biernacki: Inspiration and Commitment**

The Sokół Choir under Biernacki’s guidance has become an organization where young and old singers, new Polish immigrants and Polish-Canadians, some generations removed from their roots, connect to share in a variety of music. His influence has been seminal to the choir’s viability and continued successes. At times Biernacki still uses some of Seaborn’s arrangements, however, he has re-arranged and orchestrated the folk melodies into medleys, often grouped together by regional affiliation, reflecting the praxis change in Sokół’s dance ensemble.

Polish popular music from the 1930s to 1970s has also become part of the repertoire, arranged into medleys with titles that indicate the subject of the songs, i.e., ‘Wiązanka Partwzancka’ ‘(Partisan Medley’), comprised of well-known
resistance songs from World War II and ‘Wiązanka Krywańska’, (‘Krywańska Medley’), folk songs arrangements from the Krywańska region in the Tatra Mountains.

In the ‘Wiązanka Warszawska’ (‘Warsaw Medley’) Biernacki rearranged the refrains from eight songs, popular in Poland between the 1950s and 1970s, that speak of the restoration of the Old Town, (e.g., ‘Na Pravo Most, Na Lewo Most’, ‘Czerwony Autobus’) and the revitalization of Warsaw, a growing city where new houses were built on a daily basis. I have been able to identify seven of the melodies that derive from the ‘mass song’ repertoire – state authorized popular song – a product of socrealizm, a political conditioning born of Joseph Stalin’s ‘socialist realism’ of the 1930s, and promulgated by the Polish Ministry of Art between 1947 and 1954, that saw composers and performers negotiating political tightropes, where ‘every artist was a casualty’ (A. Thomas, 1995, 403). The subjects for mass song repertoire were drawn from a variety of sources – historical and folk – i.e., revolutionary songs (‘Warszawianka’ by W. Święcicki), and the political uprising of 1830 (‘Warszawianka’ by K. Kurpiński). Others composed to popular music styles were drawn from contemporary themes arising from the period of reconstruction after World War II. ‘Wiązanka Warszawska’ (‘Warsaw Medley’) is an example of this subject type. On one hand the rebuilding of cities expressed a hope for the future. On the other hand, some text nostalgically remembers pre-war places, people, and a former way of living. Figure 22 (page 235) lists the songs from this medley.


108 These popular songs were first arranged by Seaborn, and came from the Mazowsze/Slaśk repertoire.

109 Four songs in this medley were performed by Chór Czejanda, a well known quartet of the 1950s, and one song by the prolific and highly celebrated and singer Irena Samtor (b. 1934), who began her career as a singer with the State Folk Group of Song and Dance ‘Mazowsze’. These artists collaborated with the political ethos of Polish Radio, and gave many concerts at home and in various communist countries at that time, including Bulgaria, Czekoslovakia, East Germany, Hungary and the USSR.

110 ‘A Tiny Sign’ (Małeńki Znak), sung by Irena Samtor is available by accessing YouTube, searching under her name and the song title in Polish.
(See Appendix 4 for text translations of the songs and the score of Biernacki’s arrangement of ‘Wiązanka Warszawska’ ‘Warsaw Medley’.

1. Na *Pravo Most, Na Lewo Most*  
   (Right Bridge, Left Bridge)  
   Chór Czejanda 1951

2. *Warszawski dzień* (Warsaw Dawn)

3. Unknown

4. *Czerwony Autobus* (Red Bus)  
   Chór Czejanda 1955

5. Unknown Title  
   from the movie *Przygoda na Mariensztacie* (Advenure in Marien Town)  
   Mazowsze 1953

6. *Jak przgoda to tylko w Warszawie*  
   (Going to Warsaw on an Adventure)  
   Chór Czejanda 1955

7. *Maleńki Znak* (A Tiny Sign)  
   Irena Samtor

8. *Jak Młody, Stare Miasto*  
   (How Young Old Town)  
   Chór Czejanda

Figure 22: Popular Songs in ‘Warsaw Medley’ (Title, Artist, Recording Date if known)

Ramnarine’s theory of disjuncture gains relevancy in the discussion of these post-war Polish popular songs, on one level speaking to ethnic Winnipeg Poles of the multiple strataums of immigration and generation, and on another level to the Poles (Polonia or homeland) who had experienced first-hand the reconstruction of Warsaw, and illustrates a multi-layered disjuncture.

During WW2, over 80 per cent of Warsaw had been razed. Much of the city was rebuilt with grey apartment buildings, in a sense ‘communist ideology in architectural form’ (Episode 72, New Old Town, 2013). Yet ‘Old Town’, the historic center of Warsaw, an area of the city that dates back to the 13th century, was restored, or at least, re-imagined. Even though great lengths were taken to preserve a sense of authenticity by rebuilding the facades using salvaged stone and bricks of similar style, the intention of the new communist government was to
reinvent a more beautiful version of Old Town. While 20th-century photographs and plans were still available as possible guides, the inspiration for the restoration was taken from the paintings of 18th-century Italian artist Bernardo Bellotto (1721/2-1780), a master of the Venetian ‘verdutista’ style – where paintings precisely documented cityscapes. However, it has been suggested that Bellotto used artistic license in his paintings, making improvements to the cities, rather than matching the 18th-century reality (Episode 72, New Old Town, 2013). In the post-war reconstruction, the exteriors of Old Town buildings were restored to resemble the paintings, and are evidently different when compared to some existing photos of the 1920s (Episode 72, New Old Town, 2013). No attempt was made to recreate the interiors leaving a disjuncture between the old looking exterior and the modern interiors. The title of the song Jak młode Stare Miasto (How Young, Old Town) and its text – ‘Find an old store, a blind alley, a street, an entryway and find a shadow of the past’ – illustrates the disjuncture between reality and representations, that faced Warsaw residents in post-war Poland.

Greater disparities occurred in the redevelopment of Nowym Świat (New World Street). Between the two world wars, the buildings of Nowym Świat, with its many cafes and shops, had evolved with a hodge-podge of new levels added above some of the original edifices. In the renewal, any indications of the previous commercial development were not restored. The redevelopment of Nowym Świat was restricted to a series of buildings of only three stories in height. For some, this represents the erasure of the democratic society and the establishment of the egalitarian communist order (Episode 72, New Old Town, 2013). Another song text from the ‘Warsaw Medley’ speak of these changes and indicates that all was not well – ‘With a pining mind, I wander in Nowym Świat (New World Street). I wish that I could enter [find] familiar nooks [places]’ (Małeński Znak (A tiny sign)). In a sense, this is a ‘disjuncture in a disjuncture’. The intention of the state authorized songs of ‘Warsaw Medley’ in illustrating the rebirth of a ‘better’ Warsaw under communist rule, gave the opportunity for the lyricists to speak in veiled ways about the disparity that Warsaw residents sensed between the reality and representation of rebuilt city.

111 King Stanislaus Augustus Poniatowski ascended to the Polish throne in 1764, and commissioned Bellotto to paint views of the Polish capital. From 1768, until his death sixteen years later, Bellotto completed twenty-six verdute paintings of Warsaw.
Over twenty-five years after the demise of Radio Poland’s ‘mass song’ era this group of songs in an arrangement by a Solidarity era immigrant, performed by and to the different immigrations and generations of Winnipeg’s Polonia, also suggests a disjuncture between representations and realities.

The children and grandchildren of Old Polonia and even some of New Polonia would have not been aware of the forces and effects of socrealizm upon Polish culture, which proved evident when I questioned a few current members of Sokół Choir. The repertoire communicated an imagined city, but also nostalgia for a style of pop song that shared elements with American swing performed by a young, handsome male quartet, similar to the American 1950s groups, *The Crew Cuts or The Four Lads*.

As many immigrants of New Polonia had not lived in Poland since 1940, it is highly unlikely they would have known these songs for even contact with relatives in Poland during the 1950s was problematic. For most Winnipeg Poles, this repertoire was introduced through Mazowsze in the early 1960s. Through political principles and activities during and after the war, many Winnipeg Poles would have harboured an interpretation of the political conditioning happening in Poland, but it was not sophisticated enough to recognize the development and dissemination of a specific song/text style, as an approach to political indoctrination within the post-war Polish context. When asked about the association of these songs, as a propaganda tool created by the communist regime, Jerzy Bibik, a 50-year veteran of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, while unaware of their purpose, remarked that the songs do not convey obvious political messages, therefore were readily accepted by Sokół Choir and New Polonia Poles (Jerzy Bibik, Interview, 27 February 2016). Again, the reading of the text was embraced within a framework of nostalgia – the longing for a city. Yet they were unaware that Old Town and the Nowym Świat that they had known in their youth had been replaced by a facade.

On the other hand, by the time the songs in the medley format (arranged by Biernacki) were part of Sokół’s repertoire, the communist government in Poland was struggling to retain power. The Solidarity immigrants accepted this repertoire as light-hearted popular songs that reflected the era of post-war reconstruction, while enjoying the style of swing music reminiscent of their youth, or for their children, as a genre in revival. When asked about the roots of the songs in the
medley, the Solidarity immigrants, their children and those of New Polonia who enjoyed singing this music, were unaware of the ‘mass song’ repertoire and its purpose.

For Biernacki, adding repertoire within the grasp of his choir’s capabilities that was also appealing to the group and their audience was often the sole purpose behind his choices, while remaining relevant to the Polish community in Winnipeg was critical to maintaining the choir’s popularity. Overall Biernacki has increased Sokół’s repertoire by approximately 500 songs of differing genres, with the majority in Polish. The group has produced two professionally recorded albums of Polish, one liturgical, and the other, folk and popular musics.

Biernacki, with his worldwide connections to the Polish musical community, has contracted highly respected Polish and Polish-Canadian singers, soprano Mariola Płazak-Śchibich, Kinga Mitrowska, Maria Knapik-Sztramko, mezzo-soprano Lucja Herrmann and baritones Krzysztof Biernacki and Paolo Szot to perform with the Sokół Choir. Although Sokół still performs folk music at various events during the year, the changes in repertoire and performance have reformulated its expressive practices. The repertoire has become more diversified, yet Sokół Choir can make claims to authenticity by retaining Polish as its language of performance.

By presenting artists of such high calibre audience expectation is changed. It also provides an impetus for the choir to prepare and perform to its highest standard and presents ‘role models’ for aspiring musicians in the Winnipeg Polish community. As an example, in 2006, Sokół Choir combined with the University of Manitoba’s Cantata Singers performed the North American premiere of Handel’s Messiah in Polish, featuring Krzysztof Biernacki and introducing a young Polish singer, Michał Kowalik.112 Both these Polish-born men had been encouraged by

---

112 Baritone Krzysztof Biernacki, no relation to Tadeusz Biernacki, born and raised in Poland, attained degrees from the University of Manitoba (B. Mus), the University of Western Ontario (M. Mus) and University of British Columbia (DMA). His professional credits include opera, oratorio and solo concerts in Italy, Germany, France, Czech Republic, Norway, Macedonia, Serbia, Poland, Spain, Canada and the USA. He holds the position of Associate Professor/Head of Voice and Opera at the University of North Florida in Jacksonville, USA (www.krzysztofbiernacki.net). Michał Kowalik was born in Czestochowa, Poland. He holds B. Mus and B.Ed degrees from the University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Canada. He is an active member of Manitoba Opera Chorus, the organist and choir director at Holy Ghost Church, assistant direct of Sokół Choir, and an elementary school music teacher (www.sokolensemble.ca).
Tadeusz Biemacki to continue their musical studies. This has benefitted the individual singers, Sokół Choir and the wider community as well.

At one time, the younger generation viewed the choir as ‘an old people’s group’ and there was some concern that the choir might cease to exist unless the next generation joined. From the 1990s onwards, and separate from its annual Christmas concerts that features traditional and contemporary Polish Christmas music, also relevant to the community’s Christian heritage, Sokół performances have included shows based on a variety of musics – pop, theatre and light opera – as well as the staging of a complete opera by Polish composer Stanisław Moniuszko. This development, particularly over the last decade, has insured the health and viability of the choir by drawing in the younger generation, not only as performers but also as audience participants.

**Conclusion**

Central to this study of choral singing in Winnipeg’s Polish community are the two concepts of ethnicity and diaspora. ‘Ethnicity is part of a constant process of diachronically connected but changing identities’ (Harms, 2000, 69) where the boundaries of ethnic identity are constantly shifting within individual contexts, and ‘the present [is] always in the process of becoming the future’ (69). Each wave of Polish immigration to Winnipeg integrated people with divergent identities based on personal experiences, shared and contested histories, who along with their Canadian offspring have guided the expressive practices of Sokół. As meaning-endowed activities, ‘the arts contribute to diasporic identity formation, maintenance and transformation’ (Titon and Turino, 2004, 4). Sokół has been shaped through cultural connections to Poland. It has been influenced by political views at the global and local level. Interactions with others in Polonia and with those from outside the tradition have in a variety of ways reformulated these expressive practices.

Ramnarine’s theory of calibration has been beneficial for understanding the contradictions between discourses—the disjunction between representations and realities, such as the superseding of New Polonia’s political views by the community’s desire to preserve Polish culture that necessitated an acceptance of certain repertoire and performance practices, created by and disseminated through the government of communist Poland.
Broadly speaking, while musical life is becoming increasingly homogenous, the number of styles and forms presented by Sokół Choir has increased. From 1910s to the 1950s, the repertoire of Sokół Choir was comprised primarily of homophonic and two-part singing that often accompanied folk dancing. In the 1960s, the choir and dance troupe separated. From then until the 1990s, song repertoire evolved to include medleys of Polish popular song and many SATB arrangements of folksongs copied from the repertoire of Mazowsze and Ślaśk. Over the past decade, the musical life represented by Sokół Choir has become increasingly diversified with the addition of Broadway tunes and classical repertoire. While folk song is still sung on various occasions, there is less of a tendency towards a preservation of musical style, however by continuing to sing the majority of the repertoire in Polish, Sokół Choir retains a sense of ‘authentic’ performance, where language defines authenticity.

Sokół is equally balanced in the global/local field, singing repertoire (opera, oratorio and operetta) that is recognized globally, and by performing songs from many different genres arranged by Biernacki that preserves a local musical style. The audiences continue to return because each performance is well prepared, exciting and encompasses music for all ages and tastes. The praxis has also changed over the decades progressing from a choir who used rudimentary choreography in their representation of folk culture to a choral group who can present fully dramatised opera and musical theatre scenes. The changes in performance practice and repertoire have kept Sokół current, responding to the needs of the community. Michał Kowalik, one of Sokół’s youngest members and new to Canada, summed up Sokół’s mandate in saying, ‘Sokół is … about bringing Polish people together’ (Interview, Michał Kowalik, April 30, 2011).

In Pierre Bourdieu’s theory of cultural capital (1986) embodied cultural capital is expressed by a deep familial socialization, where traditions and cultures are both consciously acquired or passively inherited. This type of capital is transmitted over time, becomes imprinted upon one’s way of thinking and being. As an example, when referring to her Polish ancestry, a Sokół chorister born in Canada remarked, ‘My Polish culture is all because that Polish heritage – that love of a country that you do not live in, but have your roots is so ingrained that I cannot imagine life without it’ (Interview, Renata Gawlik, 27 April 2011). For over one hundred years, Winnipeg Poles have maintained a close-knit, but not a
homogenous community that values and encourages the transmission of ethnic
cultural currency from one generation to the next. Polish language, sacred and
secular rituals, folk traditions and high art cultures are kept alive and current
through the activities of Sokół Choir, and connections to other Poles in the
diaspora and in Poland. The musical activities of Sokół Choir present a powerful
image of actors in a community continually negotiating and evaluating their cultural
capital, shaped by various diverse influences, commonalities and disjunctures.
Sokół Choir has over the century successfully grown and adapted. It continues to
remain relevant to the Winnipeg Polish community, thus ensuring its longevity and
continued appeal into its next century.
CONCLUSION

This thesis has considered some of the dynamics of the solo vocal and choral culture in Winnipeg over the 20th century, by examining four different case studies, approached through the lens of various theories – gender, reception, diaspora and identity, and underpinned by Bourdieu’s theory of cultural capital. The conclusion presents the findings of individual chapters in relationship to the thesis presented at the outset of the document, which stated,

_The thesis demonstrates how the solo vocal and choral culture in Winnipeg represents a realization of the constitutive, continuously forming and mutable relationships between peoples of differing identities, and investigates how this culture has been shaped by social and political actions through transnational connections over the 20th century._

The multidisciplinary framework developed for this study drew on aspects of historical musicology, that being the systematic searching of primary and secondary sources, and the analysis of those documents. This was combined with an empirical approach stemming from enthomusicology’s notions of fieldwork, including personal interviews, participation and observation of rehearsals and performances. After considering the findings in an overall synopsis, the conclusion offers possible further directions to research.

_The Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (WMC)_

In the late 19th century, Winnipeg was a rapidly growing frontier community, a gateway to the vast western prairie, shaped by Canadian nation-building policies, in which the sensibilities of its dominant Brito-Canadian community reflected the national sentiment of the era as part of the British Empire. The city was covered with a thin veneer of respectability, its social worlds mirroring the tastes of the vast majority of its population, young men of differing social classes and ethnic identities, to whom saloons, brothels and various other entertainments appealed.

In founding the Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg in 1894, upper-status women were responding to prescribed 19th-century social and gender norms that
informed their interests and set their boundaries. The club, while providing a social outlet, was perceived by some as a lifeline because of the void in high art culture and other appropriate forms of, and avenues for, entertainment in the fledgling city. On the other hand, because Winnipeg lacked the cultural and social foundations, structures and even strictures of longer established metropolitan communities of eastern Canada and the USA, from which the WMC often drew its models, the high-status women musicians represented in the Executive and active members of the WMC were able to extend their boundaries. They became paid employees as music teachers in Winnipeg’s earliest arts conservatory, and later as private music teachers supporting the province’s change in musical education without affecting the masculine gendered notion that suggested that a man failed at his duty of being a husband if his wife accepted paid employment.

The membership of the single-gendered exclusive club multiplied in stride with the growth of the city. New members came from the ‘nouveau-riche’ elite, who lacked the cultural background required of their new status. The Executive of the WMC, in their desire to shape high art music among their peers, emerged as cultural leaders in their community, as impresarios who used their transnational connections to contract high art musicians of varying professional status to perform for the club and wider community, as philanthropists who supported a scholarship programme that encouraged their youth to expand their musical education through transnational associations, and as educators who developed high art cultural programmes for children shaped by American models, and as one of the driving forces behind establishing high school credits based on private music tuition.

The outcomes of the WMC, initially shaped by 19th-century gender and social norms, were born through their desire to make a difference in their community. By using their cultural and economic capital to forge transnational relationships, they influenced the high art vocal culture in Winnipeg to the betterment of society as a whole. Through their perseverance in staying the course with their vision, they inspired others, especially the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg to embark on developing their own transnational cultural projects that reflected their gender-specific economic and social capital.
The Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg (MMC)

By the 1910s, the demographics of Winnipeg had altered significantly through immigration, so much so, that the once numerically superior Brito-Canadians had become a minority. Fearing their Brito-Canadian cultural tenets would be undermined by other ethnic communities, the still politically and economically advantaged Brito-Canadians were stimulated into action.

By capitalizing on social and economic capital as exhibited in their dominance in civic and commercial affairs, the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg, a gendered and socially elite group of Brito-Canadian businessmen and musicians forged their cultural ideals based upon British models, intent on reinforcing their cultural superiority in the city. By actively recruiting British musicians as musical directors/conductors for MMC choirs, and as adjudicators for the music competition festival, the MMC facilitated the mirroring of British vocal and choral culture, repertoire and praxis, in Winnipeg and beyond. The club’s affiliation with the British Federation of Music Festivals, and their significant involvement in the establishment of a Canadian Federation of Music Festivals insured that their Brito-Canadian cultural vision would remain a prevailing force in high art communities across Canada, a dynamism that lasted for nearly a half century.

The MMC, at least in principle, maintained ethno-centric regulations regarding club membership, yet mutable relationships developed between individual members and musicians from other ethnic communities, allowing some non-Brito-Canadians to become choristers in MMC choirs. This direct contact between the highly trained British musicians and non-Brito-Canadian choristers facilitated the transfer of conducting styles and performance praxis to other Winnipeg singing cultures, including but not exclusively the Mennonites and to a lesser extent, the Polish-Canadians.

After World War II, the waning of Canadian identity that had once been tied to its association with Great Britain reflected the country’s cresive image as a multi-cultural society. Yet, the outcome of the activities of the Men’s Musical Club, especially that of the Canadian music competition festival movement, remains a vital element in the education pathway of many aspiring young Canadian musicians.
The Vocal Cultures of Winnipeg Mennonites

Mennonites have lived in or near the city of Winnipeg for nearly 100 years. The activity of choral singing has been integral to the urban communities of Mennonite Brethren and General Conference congregations as a representation of their spirituality and of their ethnicity, as a diaporic ethno-religious community. In the first half of the 20th century, group singing served as a means of boundary maintenance. By keeping Mennonite youth engaged in this social activity, external cultural influences were somewhat decreased. This proved successful as a measure in safeguarding individual church and congregation populations. A few individuals (e.g., Ben Horch) capitalized on their abilities as choral singers and integrated into the choirs of the Men’s Musical Club. Through this experience, British conductors and British choral culture influenced individual Mennonites.

In the 1940s, two Mennonite theological colleges were established that offered music education programmes for the purpose of training church musicians. At Mennonite Brethren Bible College, networks between Mennonite students and Brito-Canadian singing teachers and accompanists were facilitated by music programme director, Ben Horch, illustrating the multi-general influence on the musical practices of Mennonites by British musicians and their musical traditions. Through these associations, entrance into, and high achievements at the music competition festival brought Mennonite musicians, and Mennonite singing cultures into the sights of Winnipeg’s high art community.

Beginning in the 1950s, national and transnational webs of conductor and singer networks, developed through various activities (e.g., choral workshops organized by the Mennonite colleges in Winnipeg), and through post-graduate studies primarily in the United States or Germany, formed new aspirations amongst Mennonite musicians and re-framed perspectives on vocal repertoire and praxis within the Mennonite community. An outcome of these constitutive, forming and mutable relationships, is represented by the high number of national and internationally recognized Mennonite singers and choral conductors who have achieved positions of musical prominence and influence in Winnipeg. Commencing in the last quarter of the 20th century Mennonites have, and continue to shape the high art singing cultures, solo vocal and choral, in the city of Winnipeg.
The Choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble

The chapter on the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, although distinct from the other case studies that focus on high art vocal and choral cultures in Winnipeg, demonstrates that non-high art music cultures are equally susceptible to transnational influences. The musical culture of the Polish-Canadian community in Winnipeg, as presented by the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble, illustrates a cultural product formed out of a convergence of multiple generations of peoples of contradictory Polish identities, ideas and cultures. Established in 1908, the choir’s earliest documented public performance as the representative of the Polish-Canadian community was in 1914, in the same series of events supported by well-meaning assimilationist groups in which the Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg developed their concert series ‘The North End Extension Work’. Little is documented of their repertoire, but since there was a lively connection between Poles in Canada and America, it is probable that the choir was aware, if not influenced by, the Polish Singer’s Alliance of America, a large network of Polish-American choirs.

In the 1960s, Richard Seaborn, a Winnipeg-born professional musician of Brito-Canadian heritage, shaped the repertoire and performance practice of Sokół choir based upon a representation of Polish folk repertoire instituted by the communist government of Poland as a means of developing a national culture. This repertoire, as the new representation of Polish folk music, was disseminated internationally in the 1960s by the two Polish national folk ensembles, Mazowsze and Śląsk, in which the SATB arrangements of their folk song repertoire was introduced to Sokół, transcribed from Mazowsze and Śląsk recordings by the choir’s director, Richard Seaborn. Other transnational influences on Sokol’s repertoire and praxis originated from programmes instituted by the Polish government, including choral festivals, and summer courses on folklore.

In 1971, the Canadian government adopted a national multicultural policy affirming the value of Canadians of all ethnicities. Throughout the 1970s and 1980s, national programmes and local festivals created opportunities for ethnic groups to perform, and in the case of the Polish-Canadian community, local interest in Sokół activities, and their transnational relationships to Poland grew, despite elevated political tensions in the homeland.
Some of the Poles that immigrated to Winnipeg in the 1980s, as a result of political strife in the homeland, were highly trained musicians who brought a musical sophistication to Sokół choir by adding high art music – Handel’s Messiah (sung in Polish) and scenes from Polish composer Moniuszko’s opera Straszny Dwór (The Haunted Manor) to their repertoire, and by expanding transnational relationships by hiring highly-respected Polish singers as guest artists for their concerts.

Over its 100 years of existence, the music culture represented by Sokół choir has been shaped by Brito-Canadian choral traditions, influenced by the cultural creations of Poland’s communist era, and has continually transformed to reflect current transnational relationships while remaining relevant to its supportive public, the Polish-Canadian community of Winnipeg.

*Directions for Additional Research*

There are strands of this thesis that afford possibilities for further research. One study might investigate the relationship between repertoire change in music competition festivals in Canada and the development of a Canadian musical identity, distinct from British influence. This might entail examining the vocal repertoire in the Winnipeg festival over a period of 40 or 50 years, to see if a correlation exists between the rise of a Canadian identity founded on the principles of multiculturalism and a change in the number of Canadian-composed songs, as represented in the ‘test’ pieces of the festival.

The chapter on the Mennonite community presents the beginnings of a larger study on Mennonite musicians in Winnipeg that might examine the role of gender in the phenomenon of husband and wife musical teams over multiple generations, e.g., George and Esther Wiebe, William and Irmgard Baerg, and Rudy and Henriette Schellenberg. The influence of these couples, on Winnipeg’s high art music cultures, has yet to be documented.

While this study has investigated the influence of transnationalism on Winnipeg Mennonite choral culture a further study could examine how Winnipeg Mennonites are shaping music cultures in other Mennonite communities in the diaspora, and particularly in those places (Mexico and Paraguay) where Mennonites regard Manitoba as the homeland.
Overall Findings
This thesis is grounded in the notion that music, as a socially constructed cultural phenomenon, is constitutive, rather than reflexive of society (Titon, 2008; De Nora, 2003; Brah, 1996; and Antoine Hennion, 1995). Music cultures, while being comprised of many variable characteristics of which some are distinct and others are shared, can also be perceived as entities that are continually mutable. Each of the four case studies investigated in this thesis, while representing specific music cultures, also illustrate some dynamics of a larger music culture, that of the singing culture in Winnipeg.

British Agency, Authority and Associations
British influence through agency, authority or association, presides directly or indirectly, and to varying degrees of significance in all four case studies, representing the strongest unifying thread that weaves between, and ties the individual music cultures into one. Individually as immigrants or ethnics, and collectively as subjects of the British Empire, the Women’s Musical Club were self-identified as British. Their authority and determination as a force for shaping musical taste, rather than their associations with specific British agencies, even though many of their guest artists were of British extraction, provided the inspiration for the activities founded by the Men’s Musical Club. By adopting agencies of British tradition, and by employing British musicians as the authority, the Men’s Musical Club, who also self-identified as British, developed their Brito-Canadian choral culture. Often, but not always inadvertently, through personal and professional relationships with members of other ethnic communities and over multiple generations, some aspects of the Brito-Canadian choral culture were adopted by the other choral cultures in this study. Some elements of the British choral performance praxis were adopted by Mennonite choirs, introduced by Ben Horch and gleaned from his personal association with British conductors and Brito-Canadian choirs. Esteem for Brito-Canadian directors and conductors grew in the ethnic communities as individual conductors shared their expertise. In the Polish community, the great admiration for John Standing’s abilities as a choral conductor that still resonates amongst those who sang under Standing’s direction was fully recognized when Sokół choir achieved first place at an international choral competition for Polish diaspora choirs. This success elevated Standing, and his
particular method of choral directing, in the eyes of the Polish-Canadian community in Winnipeg.

The most dominating and lasting British influence was the development of the Manitoba Music Competition Festival. Generations of Winnipeg citizens, from children to adults, from all classes, ethnicities and economic backgrounds, were indoctrinated by this British musical agency, the adjudicators accepted, more in the early years than the latter, as the only authorities. Festival repertoire for singers has changed over the decades, transitioning from a primarily British repertoire to one that is much broader and not culturally prescriptive. As a valued element in a young musician’s education, participation in festival remains as relevant today as it did generations ago.

**The Impact of Transnationalism**

The impact of transnationalism resounds far beyond that of the British influence. One consideration reflects its presence in identity formation. Ethnic and spiritual identities forged in diaspora communities, associated with concepts of real or imagined homelands, and constructed over multiple generations, have profoundly shaped the musical cultures of the Mennonite and Polish-Canadians subjects of this study.

As the Mennonite community transitioned from rural to urban living, it maintained its ethno-religious principles, of which choral singing on one level served as an activity that kept the youth engaged in the community in an aim to lessen non-Mennonite urban social influences. On another level, it represented and outwardly exhibited a community’s spiritual commitment expressed through a specific musical style and repertoire. Beginning in the mid-century, aspirational shifts in the Mennonite musical community encouraged transnational education opportunities. At this time, the preferences for post secondary, and post-graduate institutions illustrate the Mennonite ethno-religious identity, as the preferred universities outside of the two Winnipeg Mennonite colleges were either faith-affiliated (e.g., the American Goshen College whose roots are in Anabaptist tradition), or representative of Mennonite ethnic heritage as a Germanic people. The multi-generational association with, and the agency and authority of *Nordwestdeutsche Musikakademie* in Detmold, Germany, profoundly affected the development of Mennonite high art choral culture in Winnipeg. Choral activities in
Winnipeg were also facilitated through individual transnational relationships between local Mennonite conductors and those of non-Mennonite heritage living and working in North America. Through this association and authority, the Mennonite choral culture as represented through Winnipeg activities received national recognition for its musical expertise and sensibility. What had once been perceived by the wider community as an ethnic choral culture, had, by the 1980s become a significant force in Winnipeg’s high art choral culture. By the year 2000, highly-educated and respected musicians of Mennonite faith and ethnic backgrounds were well-represented in Winnipeg, as teachers at all levels of state education and in private studio teaching, as internationally-respected performers, and as choral conductors and singers participating in myriad choral opportunities. They represent a lineage of Mennonite musicians who have, and continue to inspire and shape Winnipeg’s high art solo vocal and choral cultures.

One consideration in examining the transnational influences on the Polish-Canadian music culture as expressed through the activities of the choir of Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble are changes in political policy in Canada and Poland in the second half of the 20th century, compounded by the significance placed on maintaining language and culture by ethnic communities in the diaspora. This retention of culture was extremely important to the Polish-Canadians in Winnipeg who had been subjected to cultural repression in Russian work camps in the early years of World War 2. Their total distrust for the Polish communist state, their resolve to support the return of democracy in Poland, and their desire to instill Polish language and culture into their children presented a dichotomy because the same despised Polish state had created new and exciting representations of Polish folk music that appealed to Winnipeg Poles. This was backed by summer programmes in Poland, that taught Polish folk culture and were intended for diaspora Poles.

After World War 2, the Polish communist government sought to develop a national identity in which the many regional folk music cultures were reconstructed, and in a sense homogenized, to represent a national folk identity. This new repertoire and praxis was expressed worldwide through the two national Polish folk song and dance groups, Mazowsze and Śląsk, created and financed by the Polish state. In the 1960s, Sokół choir adopted both the repertoire and praxis
of this new Polish music culture, and for decades, this music formed the core of Sokół choir’s repertoire.

In Canada during the 1960s, the awareness of multiculturalism grew both as a sociological phenomenon, and as a political ideology. In the 1970s, and as an outcome of the national policy of multiculturalism, ethnic communities were encouraged to develop and maintain associations that would exhibit and enhance their ethnic status. For Sokół Choir who had been in existence for over half a century, the festivals celebrating ethnic diversity, and other opportunities for performance, locally and nationally, live or on film, inspired the group to reconnect to the homeland to tap into the programmes of folklore studies designed especially for diaspora communities by the Polish state. The political undercurrents in the development of, and the participation in these programmes are significant. This can be understood from the Polish-Canadian perspective as an unsuccessful attempt by the Polish communist state to soften its image, using the folk agencies as a tool for spreading propaganda.

At the same time that the Polish government was reaching out to its diaspora in support of their folk music cultures, it continued to maintain its national programme that encouraged the reception and performance of high art music among Poles in the homeland. This dichotomy would bring tension into the Polish Canadian community in Winnipeg, where folk, rather than Polish high art culture enjoyed a position of importance. In the 1980s and 1990s, with the immigration to Winnipeg of Poles from the generation who were education in the high art culture, new musics were integrated into Sokół’s repertoire, creating a new relevance for the group within Winnipeg’s Polish-Canadian community. In the 21st century, transnational agencies and associations remain vital to Sokół choir by providing access through current technologies to Polish culture, generated in the homeland and in the many diaspora communities scattered across the globe.

Final Comments
This thesis represents a journey towards understanding the thesis set out at the beginning of this document, that suggests that the solo vocal and choral culture in Winnipeg represents a realization of the constitutive, continuously forming and mutable relationships between peoples of differing identities. Through applications of historical musicology and ethnomusicology and by examining social and political
actions through transnational connections, the four case studies have illustrated the thesis. This work represents one understanding of only a fraction of the kaleidoscope of musical cultures in Winnipeg, suggesting an invitation for further research that might enhance this and other studies, as part of the current body of knowledge on musical cultures in urban centres.
APPENDIX 1: RECITAL PROGRAMME OF EMMA ROBERTS
5 March 1917 (Annual Report – C, 1917-1918, 33)

Monday Afternoon, March 5th, 1917

RECITAL BY EMMA ROBERTS
CONTRALTO

I.
“Lungi Dal Caro Bene”..........................Secchi
(When two that love are parted)

When two lovers are separated forever, frequently the most
brave-hearted longs for death as a relief. Were it not for the
guiding hope of meeting, never to part, life would have been
lived in vain.

“Danza, Danza!”..........................Durante
(Dance, Oh Dance, Maiden Gay)

The singer addresses a maiden who is hidden to dance to the
lilt of the song. The murmuring waters and the sighing
breezes join in the invitation. The eager feet respond and
tirelessly keep time to the rhythm as the song goes on and on.

“J’ai pleure en Reve”..........................Hue
“Les Papillons”..........................Chausson

II.
“Would God I were the Tenderness Blossom”.........Old Irish
“The Next Market Day”.............................Old Irish
“Deep River” (Old Negro Melody)................Arranged by Burleigh
“Wind Song”..........................Rogers
“The Danza”..........................Chadwick

III.
“The Soldier’s Bride” (In Russian)..................Rachmaninoff
“At the Pain” (In Russian).......................Rachmaninoff

FOLK SONGS OF LITTLE RUSSIA

(a) “The Peasant Girl”

Out beyond the green, green meadow, a peasant girl with a
black ox was ploughing. She would like to sing but does not
know how, so she asks a Cossack boy to play his violin for her.
The Cossack begins to play, but the girl cannot think at whom
he is making eyes. “Is it the cattle that he looks so lorn-
gingly? No, for the cow and the ox will soon die. It must be
at me, for my silver-white face will never die.”

(b) “Mother Warned Me”—(In Russian)

Over and over again my mother warned me to keep my
playmates out of the garden. Oh, mother, how often thou
last warned me.

(c) “Buckwheat Cakes”—(In Russian)

A woman wanted some flour to make buckwheat cakes, but
her husband was sick and could not grind the meal, so the
woman sifts it instead, telling her husband it will be just as
good. The husband sits and waits patiently for the cakes, but
something is wrong with the flour; the cakes always burn,
until he says in despair: “I might have known it! Bad luck
always comes to a man who listens to his wife.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name, Education</th>
<th>Musical Life in UK</th>
<th>Period of time In Winnipeg</th>
<th>MMC Responsibilities</th>
<th>Professional Life after Wpg</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>George Price (1873-1919) Education unknown.</td>
<td>Probable bass with York Male Voice Choir and at St. Martin le Belfrey, York.</td>
<td>7 or more years 1911-1918</td>
<td>C - MVC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyril Musgrove (1887-1921) ARCO</td>
<td>1910-14: Assistant Organist at York Minster under Tertius Noble. 1915-1919: Organist probably at St. Michael le Belfrey, York</td>
<td>1919-1921</td>
<td>C – MVC, O &amp; CM – Holy Trinity Church</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Temple*</td>
<td></td>
<td>1929-1931</td>
<td>C – MVO, WPC O &amp; CM – Holy Trinity Returned to England</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Years</td>
<td>Details</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert Sadler</td>
<td>1894-1955</td>
<td>Arrived in Winnipeg, 1911, remained until his death, 1935-44 C:WPC and MVC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donald Leggat*</td>
<td>1953-55</td>
<td>C: MVC and WPC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucien Needham</td>
<td>b. 1929,</td>
<td>1957-1960 C: MVC and WPC, Taught Universities of Manitoba, Brandon and Lethbridge, Canada.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ARCM, AGSM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:

AGSM – Associate Guildhall School of Music
ARCM: Associate Royal College of Music
ARCO: Associate Royal College of Organists
BA: Bachelor of Arts
BMus: Bachelor of Music
C: Choral Conductor
CM: Choir Master
FRCO: Fellowship, Royal College of Organists
MA: Master of Arts
MVC: Male Voice Choir
O: Organist
WPC: Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir

* Biographical information on Peter Temple and Donald Leggat is limited, other than their affiliation with the MVC and WPC.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Vocal Parts</th>
<th>Composer/Song</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bass Solo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Church Choirs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Voice Quartets TTBB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ladies Vocal Trios</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soprano and Tenor Duet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cont and Baritone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenor and Bari or Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo Sight Reading (all voices)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Voice Quartets</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TENOR SOLO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOPRANO SOLO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BARITONE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary Church Choir</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choral Societies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo Girls under 15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo Boys</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public School Chorus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contralto</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Voice Choir</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church choirs (&lt;30)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All church Choirs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mezzo Soprano Solo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Voice Choirs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church choirs (&gt;31)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bass Solo</td>
<td>Blow, Blow thou Winter Wind</td>
<td>Sergeant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Church Choirs</td>
<td>Send out they Light</td>
<td>Gounod</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Voice Quartets TTBB</td>
<td>O Peaceful Night</td>
<td>Edward German</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ladies Vocal Trios</td>
<td>Lift Thine Eyes (Elijah)</td>
<td>unaccomp Mendelssohn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soprano and Tenor Duet</td>
<td>Maying</td>
<td>Alice Mary Smith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cont and Baritone</td>
<td>Love is meant to make us glad</td>
<td>Edward German</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenor and Bari or Bass</td>
<td>It was a lover and his lass</td>
<td>R.H. Walthew</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo Sight Reading (all voices)</td>
<td>Test piece chosen by adjudicator</td>
<td>J. Sarjeant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Voice Quartets</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TENOR SOLO</td>
<td>O Happy Eyes (unaccomp)</td>
<td>Elgar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOPRANO SOLO</td>
<td>I'll sing thee Songs of Araby</td>
<td>Clay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BARITONE</td>
<td>Solveig's Song</td>
<td>Grieg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary Church Choir</td>
<td>Send out thy light</td>
<td>Gounod</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choral Societies</td>
<td>Daybreak</td>
<td>Edward Broome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo Girls under 15</td>
<td>Golden Slumbers</td>
<td>Old English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo Boys</td>
<td>The Minstrel Boy</td>
<td>Irish Air</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public School Chorus</td>
<td>Chant sans Paroles (u)</td>
<td>Tchaikovsky</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contralto</td>
<td>Like to the Damask Rose</td>
<td>Elgar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Voice Choir</td>
<td>Hymn Before Action (unaccomp)</td>
<td>Walford Davies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church choirs (&lt;30)</td>
<td>Save us oh Lord (unaccomp)</td>
<td>Bairstow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All church Choirs</td>
<td>O Gladsome Light (unaccomp)</td>
<td>Sullivan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mezzo Soprano Solo</td>
<td>Ah, Love, but a Day</td>
<td>Protheroe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Voice Choirs</td>
<td>Rest thee on this mossy pillow</td>
<td>Smart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church choirs (&gt;31)</td>
<td>Blessed Jesu (Stabat Mater)</td>
<td>Dvořák</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 4: TEXT/TRANSLATIONS/SCORE OF ‘WIĄZANKA WARSZAWSKA’ (‘WARSAW MEDLEY’)

Jerzy Bibik, a Polish-born Canadian and a member of Sokół Choir for over 50 years, translated the songs literally, With his guidance I wrote the prose translations that are included in this appendix.

Song 1: Na praw most, na lewo most (On the right bridge, on the left bridge)
Na prawo most, na lewo most
A dołem Wisła płyńie.
Tu rośnie dom tam rośnie
dom zgodziny na godzinę
Autobusy czerwienią migają
Zaglądamy do okien tram-wa-[om].
Wciąż większy gwar
Wciąż więcej nas w Warszawie najmilsym zmiast.

A bridge to the left, a bridge to the right
And below the Vistula is flowing.
Here a house is built, and there a house is built,
They are growing [being developed] by the hour.
The buses are flashing their red colour,
And looking into the windows of the streetcars.
There is more and more noise of conversation
There is more of us in Warsaw, the most pleasant of towns.

Song 2: Warszawski dzień (Warsaw Day)
Nad Wistłą warszawski dzień
I mknie tramwajem
Do szkół odnowa do biur od nowa
Gna do rusztowań warszawski dzień
Co sił wra mionach ile tchu w piersi
Dla swej stolicy w sercu najpierwszej
W ciażroz śpiewany Warszawski dzień
Nasz pracowity warszawski dzień

Over the Vistula, the day [dawn] rises in Warsaw
And the streetcars are speeding
Going anew [once again] to schools, offices and scaffoldings
With as much strength we have in our arms and breath in our chest
[Our love] For our capital [city], first in our hearts
In Warsaw, we are always full of song
On our busy day[s] in Warsaw

Song 3: Unknown
Ach zamiesz kać a zamieszkać wysoko
I zapraszać gołębie zobloków
Zukochaną wychylić się zokien
Ma Starówkę gdzie radość I spokój
A jeżeli nie mieszkać to iść I zobaczyć pięknie tu dziś.

Oh to live high [in the new apartment blocks] and
to invite pigeons down from the clouds.
With a beloved who leans out of the window in the Old Town
And if you do not live there, go and see how beautiful it is there now.

Song 4: autobus czerwony (Red Bus)
Autobus czerwony raźno tak mknie (Przez ulice mego miasta mkie Mi ja
nowe jasne domy i ogrodow chłodny cień
(Czasem dzie wcze spojrzenie nam rzuci kwiat)
Rzuci ku nam jak płoniemy kwiat
Nowy jest nie tylko Nowy Świat u nas now każdy dzień

A red bus is briskly speeding through the streets my city
And is passing new bright homes with cool shady gardens.
Sometimes a girl that gives us a glance
That feels like a flaming flower
Not only is Nowy Świat (New Street) is new,
Every day is new.

Song 5: Unknown Title (from the movie Przygoda na Mariensztacie (Adventure in Marien Town))

W tym mieście codzie mie od rana przeży wasz to samo co krok.
Zdumienie ulica nie zana ośnienie nie znany ci blok.
Im dalej tych cudów tym wieće to trasa to tunel to gmach.
I znou ośnienie w kwiecistej sukience.
Ładna jesteś jak ładna jesteś jak ach.

In this town from the morning, you live through the same thing every step of the day,
Astonishment at the streets, and dazzled by the new apartment blocks
As there are more and more beautiful miracles, a new path, a new tunnel and a new building,
It again bedazzles me, as if in a flowery dress
You [Warsaw] are beautiful to us, you are beautiful to us.

Song 6: Jak przgod to tylko w Warszawie – Going on an adventure to Warsaw
Jak przy go da to tylko w Warszawie
Jak Warszawa to gdy kwitną bzy
(z chłopem takim jak ty),
A jak tańczyć to tylko walczyka w Warszawie
A jak tańczyć to z panną taka jak ty
Król Zygmuncie Powiedz nam czyś
Widział Warszawę tak piękną dziś
Jak przy go da to tylko w Warszawie, w Warszawie
(z chłopem takim jak ty)
When it comes to an adventure, it is only an adventure in Warsaw
Especially in May when the lilacs are blooming
And if one wants to dance, one should only waltz in Warsaw,
And if it is a waltz, it should only be with a girl [boy]* like you.
King Zygmunt, have you ever seen
Warsaw so beautiful as it is today
When it comes to adventure in Warsaw, in Warsaw,
It should be only with a girl [boy] like you.

* The words ‘girl’ or ‘boy’ are interchangeable, depending on whether a man or woman is singing the song.

** Song 7: Maleńki Znak (A tiny sign)**
Gdzie na mapie świata maleńki znak,
gdzie sie Wisła wpłata w Warzawski trakt.
A domki są visa vis o krok od siebie, o krok.
Błędzi Nowym Świat em stęs
kni ona mysł
Gdzie stare miasto co tkwi nad rzeki brzegiem
Chciał bym gdzieś w znajome zakątki is.

Where on the map, is the tiny sign [mark]
Where the Vistula intertwines among the Warsaw streets.
With a pining mind, I wander in Nowym Świat (New Street)
I wish that I could enter [find] familiar nooks [places].
Where the Old town that is located on the banks of the river.
Where the houses are across from each other, and a step away from each other.

** Song 8: Jak młode Stare Miasto (How Young, Old Town)**
Znalezł stary sklepik zaulek jakiś ulicz sierń I odszukać tu przeszłości swej cień.
Jak młode stare mia sto jak młody Nowy Świat
Jak światel w Wiśle jasność
Jak uśmiech naśnych lat.
Find an old store, a blind alley, a street, an entryway and find a shadow of the past.
As new as the Old Town, as new as Nowy Świat (New Street)
As the brightness of the lights reflect in the Vistula
Like [It resembles] the smile of our age [times].
Mmmmm [humming]
As a bricklayer with his rough hands can [skillfully] lay brick [in order to rebuild the city].
Such a song, real, youthful, and alive
Such a song, real, youthful, and alive
I’d like to give to you.
Such a song, real, youthful, and alive
Such a song, real, youthful, and alive
I’d like to give to you.
Wiązanka Warszawska

Na prawo most na lewo most a dołem Wisła płynie.

Tu rośnie dom tam rośnie dom zgodziny na godziny.

Autowy czerwień mi-gają zaglądają do okien tramwają.

Wciąż wiecznie nas w Warszawie najmilszym miast.

Wciąż większy gwar

Waszawski dzień waszawski dzień

Nad Wisłą wstaje i mknie tramwajem
Wiazanka Warszawska

S A

Gna do rzu-to- wań waszawski dzień.

T

doszkóld-no-wa do biurod no-wa.

S A

Co siń wra-mie-rach i-le tchu wpier si dla swej slo-li cy wsrecu naj-pierszej.

T


S A

Wciąarożyte-wany

T

i za-przaęgo-lebie zo-bło-ków.

S A

Ach za-mieskaż-mieskaży-so-ko

T

Za-

S A

na Stu-rówkędzie radość i spo-

T

chana wy-chylić się zo-

kien

A je-
Wiązanka Warszawaka

Przez ulicę miasta mknę. Młode
Autobus czerwony från to mknę. Nowe jasne
Domy i ogrodowchłody cień. Rzucił, kurniak płonęmy
Czesem dziewczę spojrzenie nam rzuści
Kwiat. Nowy jest nie tylko nowy świat u nas nowy każdy dzień
W tym miejscu dziennie rana przeżywam to samo co krok. Zduszenie uлицa nieznana, ośnienie nie zna ciebie blok
Wizańska Warszawska

da-lej tych ru-dów tym wię-cej to tra-ż to tu-nel to gmach.

I znówu ol-iniewkwo-dle tej su-ki-en-ce. Ładna jesteś jak, ładna jesteś jak

w Warszawie wznaje

jak przygodno tylko w Warszawie jak Warszawie

gdy kwit-ną bazy.

A jak tańczyć to tyl-ko wa-czyć-kę w Warszawie.

zchlep-cem ta-kim jak ty. Kró-łu Zygm-an-cie

A jak tańczyć to zpa-ną ta-ką jak ty.
Wiązanka Warszawska

powiedz nam czyś wizual Warszawy tak piękna jak dziś.

Jak przygoścą to

w Warszawie, zchłopem takim jak ty.

tолько w Warszawie, w Warszawie jak Warszawa żona taką jak ty.

Solo

Gdzie namąpie świata małżeński zań, gdzie się Wiśla wpłata chodząc dzieciństwo - żm -

Solo

w Warszawskim tyń, zi - kąść mięc.

Gdziesto - re miasto czerwio nad rzeki brzegiem.
Wiazanka Warszawska

Solo

S A

A domki są, tisz-tisz, o krok od siebie, o krok.

T B

187.

S A

Znaleź sta-ry skle-pik za-ułek ja-ksią-li-cię sień i

T B

187.

S A

od-szukać tą prze-sło-ści swej cień.

T B

od-szukać prze-sło-ści cień.

190.

S A

Jak mło-die sta-re mia-ste jak mło-dy No-wy Świt.

T B

Mmm
Wiszanka Warszawska

Jak światło w Wiśle jasne, jak w śniegu naszych lat.

Jak murarz szorstką ręką postra - fiće glebko klaść,

Ta - ką pio - sen - kę młodo - ą ży - wą,
ta - ką pio - sen - kę chcę ci dać.

Ta - ką pio - sen - kę chcę ci dać.


Ta - ką pio - sen - kę praw - dzi - wą chcę ci dać.
DEFINITIONS: FORMATTING OF CITATIONS AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

The format for the bibliography follows Chicago style with some exceptions. These are primarily newspaper articles where the author is unknown and are listed alphabetically by the article title, followed by newspaper title, date, page and (column. Newspaper articles that are part of a series, where the author is unknown, are listed by their title, followed by an alphabetic designation (e.g., Music and Drama – A) correlating to a date range from oldest to newest, followed by newspaper title, date, page and column number.

An in-text citation recognizing the work of other scholars is comprised of author, date (e.g., Tosh, 2007). Citations for quotations are based on in-text (author date, page), where applicable. Listed below are the exceptions:

- If the source does not include a author’s name, as an example, newspaper articles from Winnipeg newspapers, the Manitoba Free Press (after 1931, the Winnipeg Free Press), and The Winnipeg Tribune. In this case the citation includes the first few words of the title of the article, followed by ellipses if necessary, the newspaper title, full date and page and column, as in (Plans, MFP, 16 June 1928, 4 (B)) or (St. Andrews Lose…, MFP, 05 May 1928, 29 (A)). There are no quotation marks around the title of the article.

- If the source, either as an single entry or one in a series, is a regular (daily, weekly) titled column in a newspaper (e.g., 'Music and Drama'), and is without an author, the citation is as follows: title of the column, newspaper, date, page and column, as in (Music and Drama, MFP, 16 January 1892, 4 (C)). If there are multiple citations of the same column, all with different dates, the citations are alphabetized correlating to a date range from oldest to newest. As an example: (Music and Drama - A, MFP, 07 June 1899, 3, (B)) through to (Music and Drama - I, MFP, 21 November 1906, 10 (C)). There are no quotation marks around the title of the article.

- If a source from a newspaper (e.g., an advertisement for ticket sales) does not include an article title or author, the citation comprises the newspaper, full date, page and column as in (MFP, 17 March 1906, 9 (C)).

- If a source was accessed from an electronic book that does not include page numbers, the citation comprises the author, date, and location number, as in (Urry, 2006, loc. 5314).
GLOSSARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AM</td>
<td>Archives of Manitoba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA</td>
<td>Bachelor or Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFMF</td>
<td>British Federation of Music Festival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFMF</td>
<td>Canadian Federation of Music Festivals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DMA</td>
<td>Doctor of Musical Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DMus</td>
<td>Doctorate of Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRCM</td>
<td>Fellowship Royal College of Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAMEO</td>
<td>Global Anabaptist Mennonite Encyclopedia Online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC</td>
<td>General Conference Mennonites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAO</td>
<td>Mennonite Archives of Ontario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MB</td>
<td>Mennonite Brethren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFP</td>
<td>Manitoba Free Press</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMC</td>
<td>Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMCF</td>
<td>Manitoba Music Competition Festival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MVC</td>
<td>Winnipeg Male Voice Choir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCM</td>
<td>Oxford Companion to Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMO</td>
<td>Oxford Music Online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPFE</td>
<td>Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPK</td>
<td>Stowarzyszenie Polskich Kombatantów (Polish Combatants Assoc)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Town Topics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMA</td>
<td>University of Manitoba Archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WMC</td>
<td>Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WPC</td>
<td>Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WT</td>
<td>The Winnipeg Tribune</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Text-based


‘Adjudicators Say Winnipeg Should Foster Festival’. Manitoba Free Press. 16 May 1919, 8 (C-D).


‘Advertisement for a Concert by Faculty of the Imperial Academy of Music and Arts’. The Winnipeg Tribune. 26 January 1909, 7 (E).

‘Advertisement for the Opening of the Imperial Academy of Music and Arts’. Manitoba Free Press. 12 December 1908, Section 2 ‘Features and Dramas’, 3 (F-G).


‘Another Triumph for Grainger and Choir’. Manitoba Free Press. 9 March 1922, 8 (C-D).


‘At the Festival: Poles take Tweedsmuir’. Winnipeg Free Press. 18 April 1964, 2 (C-E).


‘Big Stars to sing in Local Opera Season’. *The Winnipeg Tribune*. 17 March 1923, 10 (D).


______. ‘Types of Ethnic Diversity in Canadian Society’. VIII World Congress: Languages and Culture Policies Sessions (August 1974), 1-34.


‘Carol Service Gives Rare Satisfaction’. Manitoba Free Press. 30 December 1922, 8 (B).


‘CBC Winnipeg Festival’. Winnipeg Free Press. 17 May 1975, 36 (F).

‘CBC Winnipeg Festival now in its Fourteenth Year’. Winnipeg Free Press. 17 May 1975, 106 (E).


‘Correspondence Incoming’. Fonds of the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg, MSS 11, Box 1, File 2. University of Manitoba Archives, Winnipeg, Canada.


Craig, Alison. ‘Over the Tea Cups’. Manitoba Free Press. 02 October 1915, 23, (A-D).


http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com.ezproxy.york.ac.uk/subscriber/article/grove/music/22001


http://www.mhs.mb.ca/docs/features/timelinks/reference/db0061.shtml


http://www.mhs.mb.ca/docs/features/timelinks/reference/db0043.shtml


‘Eight Concerts in Connection with The New Canadian Folk Song Festival’. Manitoba Free Press. 19 June 1928, 18, (B-G).


Erdely, Stephen. ‘Folksinging of the American Hungarians in Cleveland’. 
*Ethnomusicology* 8 (1964), 14-27.


http://soc.sagepub.com/content/44/4/642.short


http://www.vanderbilt.edu/history/dept/michaelbess/Foucault%20Interview

‘Fresh Surprises Found in Programme at Third Folk-Song Concert’, Manitoba Free Press. 23 June 1928, 3 (C-D).


doi: 10.1111/imig.12066


http://www.mhs.mb.ca/docs/sites/royalalexandrahotel.shtml


‘Good Friday Music’. *Manitoba Free Press*. 13 April 1922, 8 (C-D).


Grescoe, Paul. ‘They sing it like it used to be’. Canadian Magazine, 31 May 1969, 8-9.


Handscomb, C.W. ‘Grand Opera Tonight. Manitoba Free Press. 5 March 1906 8, (B-C).

(A). ‘Grand Opera Festival’. Manitoba Free Press. 5 March 1906, 8 (B-D).

(B). ‘Grand Opera Festival’. Manitoba Free Press. 7 March 1906, 8 (B-D).


Harris, Neil. ‘Singers Fail to Reach Potential in Birthday Tribute to Handel’. Winnipeg Free Press. 28 October 1985, 19 (D-F).


Hymn Sing, Fonds of the CBC programme Hymn Sing. U-15-2-19 File 12 CBC Communications 40/12 Hymn Sing chorus. Archives of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Canada.


‘Improvement Noted in Part II of Passion’. The Manitoba Free Press. 4 April 1926, 8 (C-D).


‘Joseph Tees Dies at Home in Calgary’. Manitoba Free Press. 01 April 1922, 6 (E).


http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com.ezproxy.york.ac.uk/suscriber/article/grove/music/2894pg3#S28794.2.1.3.8


*Frontier Background* 19 (2003), 1-10.


Leggat, Donald. ‘Letter of resignation’. Fonds of the Men’s Musical Club of Winnipeg MSS 11 Box 1 File 2 Correspondence – Incoming, University of Manitoba Archives, Winnipeg, Canada.


*Manitoba Music Competition Festival Programme*. 1919.

_______ - B. 1923.

_______ - C. 1927.


http://www.gov.mb.ca/labour/immigration/programs/nominee_program.html

Manners, Mary. ‘Fresh Surprises Found in Programme offered at Third Folk-Song Concert’. *Manitoba Free Press*. 23 June 1925, 3 (C-D).


*Ethnomusicology* 16/2 (1972), 360-371.


‘Miss Hemming’s Recital’. The Winnipeg Tribune. 25 February 1914, 6 (D).

mm. ‘Oratorio Shapes Up for Colleges’, Mennonite Mirror 1/7 (March 1972), 8 (A).


‘Mr. Kennedy dies at home in Parkdale’. Manitoba Free Press. 7 May 1920, 3 (A-D).


‘Music and Drama’. Manitoba Free Press. 16 January 1892, 4 (C)).

_______(A). Manitoba Free Press. 07 June 1899, 3 (B).


_______(D). Manitoba Free Press. 20 February 1905, 3 (D).

_______(E). Manitoba Free Press. 22 February 1905, 3 (B-C).

_______(F). Manitoba Free Press. 20 March 1905, 3 (C).

_______(G). Manitoba Free Press. 4 April 1905, 8 (A-B).


_______(I). Manitoba Free Press. 21 November 1906, 10 (C).

‘Music Competition is Underway’. Manitoba Free Press. 01 May 1925, 1 (B-C) and 7 (A-C).


______(B). *Manitoba Free Press*. 05 March 1920, 12 (D)


‘One Mark Apart’. Winnipeg Free Press. 05 April 1940, 10 (A-E).

‘Opera Howls: Adjudicator Scores Shrieking Vocalists’. Winnipeg Free Press. 8 April 1940, 8 (A-C)


Pernal, A.B. ‘Recent Polish Publications on Canada and the Emigration from Poland to Canada’. Manitoba History 17 (1989), 37-42.


‘Pleasing Performance’. Manitoba Free Press. 07 January 1930, 7 (C)).


‘Presentation of Folk Dances at Springtime in Poland Ball’. Winnipeg Free Press. 01 April 1940, 7 (C-D).


Reviewed Work All People’s Mission’. Manitoba Free Press. 16 Dec 1914, 18 (B)).


_____ (B). ‘The Duchess Attends Recital’. *Manitoba Free Press*. 6 March 1917, 6 (B-C).


‘Scenic Songs’. Winnipeg Free Press. 11 April 1940, 5 (C).


http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com.ezproxy.york.ac.uk/subscriber/article/grove/music/21387


http://www.victorianweb.org/mtparlorsongs/scott1.html


‘Society Home and Abroad’. New York Times. 18 February 1912, Section 7, 2 (D).


‘Song and Music will Delight Winnipeg for Duration of Festival’. Manitoba Free Press. 27 April 1935, 5 (A-B).

‘Special Features in connection with the North End Extension Work’. Unsigned letter, Women’s Musical Club of Winnipeg, MG 10 C7/2, File 9 Correspondence In, Archives of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Canada.

St. Andrews Lose to First Church. Manitoba Free Press. 5 May 1928, 28 (A).
‘St. Stephens-Broadway United Church Choir Wins Musical Festival Honours’. 
_Winnipeg Free Press_. 01 May 1935, 1 (F-G).


_______(A). *The Winnipeg Tribune*. 21 October 1921, 40 (D)


_______. *The Manitoba Music Competition Festival Programme*. 1926, 2-3.


‘The Winnipeg Male Voice Choir’. *Manitoba Free Press*. 18 May 1918, 18 (B-G)).


‘Will Appear in Concert’. Winnipeg Free Press. 01 April 1939, 16 (C-D).


Winnipeg Daily Times. 26 May 1883, np.

‘Winnipeg has fine Male Voice Choir’. Manitoba Free Press. 18 May 1918, 18 (A-B).


‘Winnipeg Male Voice Choir in Final Concert’. Manitoba Free Press. 16 April 1921, 48 (C).


‘Winnipeg Male Voice Choir Welcomes New Leader’. Manitoba free Press. 10 October 1929, 7 (B).


Winnipeg Telegram. 13 May 1901, n.p.

‘Winnipeg Theatre’. Manitoba Free Press. 11 November 1905, 8 (G).


‘Women’s Musical Club’. Manitoba Free Press. 6 April 1907, 29 (A-B).

______ (A). The Winnipeg Tribune. 21 November 1911, 2 (B).

______ (B) Manitoba Free Press. 25 February 1915, 6, (D).

______ (C). Manitoba Free Press. 08 February 1916, 9 (C).


*Yearbook of the Northern District Conference*, 1946. 62.


http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com.ezproxy.york.ac.uk/subscriber/article/grove/music/49527-2001-01-20#S49527.3


**Musical Scores**

Biernacki, Tadeusz, arr. ‘Wiązanka Warszawka’ (Wiązanka Medley). Winnipeg, Canada: Tabierna Music Inc., nd

**Discography and Videography**

Bjerring, Gudrun, director and producer. *Listen to the Prairies*. National Film Board of Canada, 1945, 35 mm film, reissued as DVD.


_______. *Ta Święta Noc Christmas with the Sokol Polish Folk Ensemble*. Producer, Henry Kuzia, Century 21 Studios PSC-84-02, 1984, compact disc.

______. *Songs of Poland*. Century 21, Studios, Winnipeg, Canada, May 1984, compact disc.


______. *Musical Journey through the Enchanted World of Operettas*. Musical director, Tadeusz Biernacki, producer Kazimierz Malkiewicz, recorded at St Mary’s Academy Auditorium, Winnipeg, Canada, on 24 May 1996, DVD.


______. *Koncert Kolęd (A Christmas Concert)*. Musical director, Tadeusz Biernacki, producer Kazimierz Malkiewicz, recorded at St. Boniface Cathedral, Winnipeg, Canada, on 10 January 2010, DVD.

______. *Musicale, Ach Te Musicale (Musicals, Oh Those Musicals)*. Musical director, Tadeusz Biernacki, producer Kazimierz Malkiewicz, recorded at Jubilee Place Concert Hall, Winnipeg, Canada, on 29 May 2011, 2 DVDs.

______. *A Christmas Opus*. Musical director, Tadeusz Biernacki, producer Kazimierz Malkiewicz, with Melos Folk Ensemble, La Chorale des Intrépides, and Kapisztran Hungarian Folk Ensemble, recorded at St. Boniface Cathedral, Winnipeg, Canada on 16 January 2011, DVD.

______. *Koncert Kolęd (A Christmas Concert)*. Musical director, Tadeusz Biernacki, producer Kazimierz Malkiewicz, recorded at St. Boniface Cathedral, Winnipeg, Canada, on 15 January 2012, DVD.

______. *Koncert Kolęd (A Christmas Concert)*. Musical director, Tadeusz Biernacki, producer Kazimierz Malkiewicz, recorded at St. Boniface Cathedral, Winnipeg, Canada, on 13 January 2013, DVD.
_______. *100th Anniversary Concert*. Musical Director, Tadeusz Biernacki, choreographer Derek Gale, producer Kazimierz Maliewica, recorded at Pantages Playhouse Theatre, Winnipeg, Canada, on 27 September 2014, DVD.


**Websites**

99% Invisible. 99percentinvisible.org

Assiniboine Chorus. www.assiniboinechorus.org

The British Empire website. www.ualberta.ca/~janes/EMPIRE.html#links

Centre Culturel Franco-Manitobain. ccfm.mb.ca

Citizenship and Immigration Canada. www.cic.gc.ca

Cornelius L. Reid website. http://home.earthlink.net/~corneliusreid/2.html

German Society of Winnipeg. www.gswmb.ca

Global Anabaptist Mennonite Encyclopedia Online. www.gameo.org

Historica Canada. http://historicacanada.ca

History in Focus: Empire website. www.history.ac.uk/ihr/Focus/Empire/index.html#ion


Hoosli Ukrainian Male Chorus. www.hoosli.com

Institute of Canadian Music (ICM) website. www.utoronto.ca/icm/links.html
Kapisztran Hungarian Dance Ensemble of Winnipeg.
   https://www.facebook.com/kapisztranensemble

Manitoba Government. gov.mb.ca

Marxist Internet Archive. www.marxists.org

Michel Foucault Website. michel-foucault.com


O. Koshetz Choir. www.koschetzchoir.org

Pembina Trails Voices. www.pembinatrails.ca/program/pembinatrailsvoices

Polanie Polish Song and Dance Association. www.polanie.ca

Polish Combatants Association, Ottawa. www.spkottawa.ca


Rainbow Harmony Project. www.rainbowharmonyproject.ca

Scandinavian Cultural Centre. www.scandinaviancentre.ca

Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble. www.sokolensemble.ca

Sólskrikjan Kór

The Tennessee Encyclopaedia of History and Culture. tennesseeencyclopaedia.net

The Winnipeg Golden Chordsmen Barbershop Chorus.
   www.goldenchordsmen.com

Winnipeg Male Chorus. www.winnipegmalechorus.org

Winnipeg Music Festival. www.winnipegmusicfestival.org

Women of Note. www.womenofnote.ca

**Interviews**


(Biographical interview)
Baerg, Irmgard and William (music educators, pianist (Irmgard) and choral conductor (William)), in discussion with author, 27 January 2014, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical interview, relationship between teaching, performing and the Mennonite faith)

Barker, Jacquelyn (singing teacher), in discussion with author. 30 April 2010, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical interview, influences include singer James Richardson and Herbert Witherspoon)

Belyea, Audrey (music teacher, pianist) in discussion with author, 12 January 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Interview about her husband, Herbert Belyea, tenor and choir director. Includes many names of musicians who influenced high art music in Winnipeg pre 1950.)

Bibik, Jane (member of SPFE), in discussion with author, 15 May, 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, thirty years of singing and dancing with Winnipeg’s Polish groups Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble and Kuranty.)


Biernacki, Tadeusz (conductor, pianist) in discussion with author, 7 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Interview about Polish folk music, historical aspects in Poland and the globalization of its music in Polonia. Biernacki’s thirty-year relationship with Sokół Polish Folk Ensemble as its Musical Director.)

Braun, Mel (tenor, singing teacher), in discussion with author, 27 September 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Interviews revolves around the relationship between Braun’s profession as a singer, university teacher and his Mennonite faith).

_______, in discussion with author, 09 October 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Vocal training in Detmold, Germany).
Depauw, Linda (soprano, singing teacher), in discussion with author, 7 October 2010, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, lineages of pedagogy, career as session singer in the UK and teacher in Winnipeg.)

Dyck, Howard (conductor, CBC radio host), in a telephone discussion with author, 24 March 2014. Interviewer in Winnipeg, Manitoba and subject in Waterloo, Ontario. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical interview, influences and conflicts at MBBC, Detmold)


Engbrecht, Henry (music educator, conductor), in discussion with author, 15 August 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, education as a choral conductor, the influence of the Mennonite community, Ben Horch, MBBC)

______, in discussion with author, 10 September 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection. (Mennonite influences on choral conducting in Winnipeg, additional biographical information)

Filip, Franciszeu and Michał Kowalik (members of SPFE), in discussion with author, 30 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, the value of SPFE within the Polish community in Winnipeg)

Friesen, Elroy (music educator, choral conductor), in discussion with author, 27 September 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, musical training and being raised Mennonite)

Gawlik, Renata (Polish dance teacher and choreographer, member of SPFE and SPK Iskry), in discussion with author, 27 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, involvement in SPFK and SPK Iskry, her commitment to keeping Polish folk heritage alive through her teaching)
Harding, Margot (singing teacher), in discussion with author, 4 October 2010, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, singing teachers, lineages of pedagogy, singing career.)

Howard, Dorothy (music educator, soprano), in discussion with author, 25 January 2012, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, early singing training in Winnipeg, Frances Adaskin, Saskatchewan, professional career, contemporary Canadian music)

Jensen, Karen (music educator, soprano), in discussion with author, 16 January 2009, Winnipeg, Manitoba. (Biographical, the value of music festivals)

Klassen, John and Bertha (community musicians), in discussion with author, 18 September 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. (Biographical, music making within the Mennonite community)

Koop, Margery (singing teacher, producer), in discussion with author, 23 September 2010, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, singing teachers, lineages of pedagogy, career as singer, teacher, producer.)

Kovach, Christine (teacher, Polish dance instructor, choreographer), in discussion with author, 28 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s own private collection (MP3). (Biographical: involvement with SPK Iskry since childhood and her training as a choreographer of Polish folk dance. Family lineages as her grandfather founded SPK Iskry.)

_______, in discussion with author, 14 November 2012, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s own private collection (MP3). (The future of SPK Iskry since the interview of 28 April 2011, discussion of the dance ‘Cyganskie’ – inclusion of eastern-European gypsy dance into Polish-Canadian repertoire.)

Kowalik, Michal and Franciszeu Filip (members of SPFE), in discussion with author, 30 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, the value of SPFE within the Polish community in Winnipeg)
Kulas, Gladys (Polish dance instructor and choreographer), in discussion with author, May 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, studying in communist Poland, evolution of Polish dance in the diaspora, involvement with SPFE and SPK Iskry)

Langtry, E.Bozena (Polish dance instructor, choreographer), in discussion with author, 18 March 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, SPK Iskry Polish Folk Ensemble, Henry Lorenc)

Letkemann, Peter (author), in discussion with author, 06 September 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, music in the Mennonite community, Ben Horch)

Loewen, Laura (music educator, collaborative pianist), in discussion with author, 19 August 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, being Mennonite and a professional musician)

Martens, John (tenor, singing teacher), in discussion with author, 03 October 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical interview, Hüsler, Gladys Whitehead, and vocal pedagogy)


Neufeld, Frank (amateur Mennonite singer), in discussion with author, 19 September 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, emphasis on choral singing in the Mennonite community in Winnipeg.)

Pierce, Glen (music educator, vocal coach, conductor), in discussion with author. 14 May 2009, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical)
Ploszanski, Agata (member of SPFE), in discussion with author, 27 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, the re-awakening of her Polish heritage after a twenty-five year hiatus.)

Redekopp, Harold (CBC Broadcaster, Administrator), in telephone discussion with author, 02 April 2014. Interviewer in Winnipeg, Manitoba and subject in Amherst Island, Ontario. (Biographical, employment at the CBC, Canadian multiculturalism, Ben Horch)

Seaton, Frances (choral conductor), in discussion with author, 1 November 2010, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, pedagogical lineages, ethnicity)

Standing, John (music educator, choral conductor), in discussion with author, 22 March 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Standing’s six-year commitment as the Musical Director of SPFE)

Tabbernor, Christine (member of SPFE, Polish dance instructor), in discussion with author, 29 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (SPFE, SPK Iskry, politics within the Polish community, dance training in Poland.)

______, in discussion with author, 14 November 2012, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3) (the dynamics of SPFE in the 1960s.)

Tabbernor, Elizabeth (member of SPK Iskry, Polish dance instructor), in discussion with author, 21 May 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (SPK Iskry, dance training in Poland, Polish dance in the diaspora.)

Tanner, John Dr, (medical doctor, choral conductor), in discussion with author, 28 March 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection, (MP3). (Tanner’s two years as Musical Director of SPFE, Polish culture in the diaspora)

Thomson, Phyllis (soprano, singing teacher), in discussion with author, 20 April 2009, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical)
Wach-Dueck, Cathy (soprano, singing teacher), in discussion with author, 12 November 2010, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical, Manitoba Opera, influences of Ukrainian heritage)

Whyte, Melanie (soprano, singing teacher), in discussion with author, 01 October 2010, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Transcript, author’s private collection. (Biographical, singing teachers, lineages of pedagogy, style of singing.)

Wiebe, Esther and George (music educators, pianist (Esther), choral conductor (George)), 21 December 2013, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Transcript, author’s private collection. (Biographical, relationship between teaching, performing and the Mennonite faith)

Woodmass, Wilma (soprano, singing teacher), in discussion with author, 14 August 2009, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (Biographical)

Wotjas, Valentin (member of SPFE), in discussion with author, 29 April 2011, Winnipeg, Manitoba. Recording: author’s private collection (MP3). (40 years with SPFE)

**Performances**


______. 2010. Koncert Kolej (Christmas Concert), St. Boniface Cathedral, Winnipeg, Manitoba, 10 January 2010.


______. 2014. 100th Anniversary Concert, Pantages Playhouse Theatre, Winnipeg, Manitoba. 27 September 2014.