Doubles and Duplicity: Topics in Vienna

Around the Long *Fin-de-Siècle, 1874–1928*

Danielle Kathleen Hood

Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

The University of Leeds

School of Music

August 2015
The candidate confirms that the work submitted is her own and that the appropriate credit has been given where reference has been made to the work of others.

This copy has been supplied on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

© 2015, The University of Leeds, Danielle Kathleen Hood.

The right of Danielle Kathleen Hood to be identified as Author of this work has been asserted by her in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the following for their support, help, and friendship throughout this project.

My supervisor Professor Martin Iddon has provided all of the above with good humour and endless patience and for this I am truly indebted. This project would certainly not have been as interesting to write without him. I am also grateful for Dr. Michael Spencer’s advice and insightful comments as second supervisor to this thesis. Special thanks go to Dr. Clive McClelland for his friendship and guidance.

I would like to thank Professor Derek Scott, Dr. Daniel Holden, Martin Curda, and the other members of the SMA writing club, for their comments on chapter 5, and to Professor Raymond Monelle for his help in the early stages of this project.

Finally, I would like to thank my family. My parents and grandparents for instilling in me a love of music and books which has persisted all my life, and for pushing me to achieve anything I wanted. I am most grateful to my husband, Ian, to whom this thesis is dedicated, for being my sounding board, for listening to far too many waltzes, and for loving and supporting me, thank you.
Abstract

Topic theory was originally proposed as a method of analysing diatonic eighteenth-century music; twentieth-century non-tonal and twelve-tone compositions have largely lain untouched. Monelle's concept of formulating a historical trace answers the criticisms made of topic theory—its superficial and axiomatic style—by grounding each topic through an investigation into its historical representations. Analyses within this thesis of texted works by Mahler, Schoenberg and Webern create a Viennese topical sphere from which multivalent networks of signification form. Subsequently, links emerge between these networks and the unique political and cultural situation in Vienna, with works of literature, Freud's psychoanalytical theories, and cultural alienation. Through rhetorical devices, such as irony or satire, their meanings become duplicitous, overturning their traditional associations, in particular, the waltz's relationship with its predecessor, the Ländler, which reflects the psychoanalytic concept of the double and the primal trauma.

In addition, each chapter includes an analysis of a contemporaneous operetta in order to demonstrate that the topics found in the art music of the period were common outside of the intellectual “circle” and perhaps understood by the common theatre audiences. The thesis concludes with works by Webern, demonstrating that despite his revolutionary aphoristic style, the underlying narratives parallel the yearning for nature from Mahler's generation and critique the conventional portrayal of their feeling of bourgeois alienation and acceptance of society's constraints rather than their forced derivation from them. By merging the psychological expression of Schoenberg with the cultural representation of Mahler, he combined the radical and the revolutionary and made them conventional. Ultimately, this thesis shows that not only are there topics in the music of twentieth-century Viennese composers, a premise already beginning to be investigated by others, but further that the topics are signifiers of the culture in which they are situated—they are quintessentially Viennese.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements iii
Abstract iv
Table of Contents v
Lists of Examples, Figures and Tables vi
List of Abbreviations xii
Introduction 1
Chapter 1: Topic Theory 8
1. Topical Lexicography 17
1.1. Learned Style 18
1.2. Dances 25
1.3. Sensibility/Empfindsamkeit 32
1.4. Singing Style/Singing Allegro 33
1.5. Military Style 35
1.6. Hunt Style 37
1.7. The Pastoral Topic 41
1.8. Low Class Topics 42
1.9. Structural Topics 44
1.10. Late Eighteenth- to Early Nineteenth-Century topics 46
1.11. Topic Analysis in Action 49
1.12. Late Nineteenth- to Early Twentieth-Century Topics 57
Chapter 2: Viennese History and Topics 58
2.1. Liberalism and Rationalism 59
2.2. Psyche 63
2.3. Romance 69
2.4. Authenticity 72
2.5. Judaism 73
2.6. Nationalism 79
2.7. Style Hongrois 92
**Chapter 3: Narrativity in Strauss, Mahler and Zemlinsky**

3.1. Changing Associations 113
3.2. Oppositions 121
3.3. Inflection 126
3.4. Pictorialism 134
3.5. Mahler’s Symphony No. 4, First Movement 140
3.6. Cultural Referencing through Topical Narrative: Mahler’s Symphony No. 7, First Movement 150
3.7. Conclusion 165

**Chapter 4: Inner Expression in Lehár and Schoenberg**

Case Studies 174
4.1. The Uncanny in Schoenberg’s *Fünf Orchesterstücke* Op. 16 174
4.2. Lehár’s *Die Lustige Witwe* 194
4.3. Schoenberg’s *Pelleas und Melisande*: Hidden Agendas in the Sonata Form 205
4.4. Chapter Conclusion 226

**Chapter 5: Dualism in Webern**

5.1. Kálmán’s *Gräfin Mariza* 232
5.2. Infinite and Static: the Double in Webern’s Symphony Op. 21 243
5.3. “A Bourgeois Manqué”: Tonio Kröger in Webern’s String Trio Op. 20 267
5.4. Webern’s *Fünf Canons* Op. 16 285
5.5. Chapter Conclusion 304

**Conclusion** 307

**Bibliography** 313
**Lists of Examples, Figures and Tables**

**Examples**

1.1. The *passus duriusculus*. Monelle, SM, 73

1.2. *Ombra*. Gluck, *Don Juan*, No. 30, bb. 9–16

1.3. *Tempesta*. Gluck, *Don Juan*, No. 31, bb. 11–18


1.5. Gavotte. Bach, J.S., French Suite, Suite VI, bb. 11–18

1.5a. Bach, J.S., English Suites, Suite III, G minor. Gavotte II (ou la Musette), bb. 1–4


1.7a. Beethoven, Contradanse No. 1, bb. 1–6

1.8. Singing Style. Haydn, “The Heavens are telling the glory of God”, bb. 1–4


1.11. Horn Fifths. Mozart, Sonata in F, K. 332, bb. 9–17


1.14. Turkish Style. Beethoven, *Turkish March*, bb. 1–4

1.15. *Coup d’Archet*. Mozart, Symphony No. 38 in D major (“Prague”), K. 504, First Movement


2.1. Lehár, *Das Land des Lächelns*, “Dein ist mein ganzes Herz”, bb. 4–6


2.3. Lehár, *Paganini*, “Deinen süßen Rosenmund,” bb. 6–8

2.4. Strauss II, J., *Die Fledermaus*, No. 4: Terzett, bb. 3–7

2.5. Strauss II, J., *Die Fledermaus*, No. 5, bb. 13–16
2.6. “Mamenyu, Lyubenyu”, bb. 1–6
2.8. Strauss II, J., *Die Fledermaus*, Act II, No. 11a, Figure 18
2.10. Strauss II, J., *Die Fledermaus*, No. 8, Figure 4
2.11. Strauss II, J., *Der Zigeunerbaron*, No. 13, bb. 1–9

2.13. Strauss II, J., *Die Fledermaus*, No. 11, bb. 4–8
2.15. Cimbalom Evocations. Liszt, *Hungarian Rhapsody*, No. 11, bb. 1–2
2.20. The Bókazó. Kálmán, *Gräfin Mariza*, no. 4, bb. 29–32

3.7. Nachtmusik. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/ii, bb. 1–12
bars 1–3


3.10. Pastoral *Nachtmusik*. Mahler, *Kindertotenlieder*, “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n”, bb. 1–4

3.11. Mahler, *Kindertotenlieder*, "Wenn dein Mütterlein", bb. 1–4


3.13. River Figure. Mahler, *Des Knaben Wunderhorn*, “Des Antonius von Padua Fischpredigt”, bb. 9–12

3.14. River Figure. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 133–135


3.16. Light Figure. Mahler, *Des Knaben Wunderhorn*, “Der Schildwache Nachtlied”, bb. 44–45

3.17. Light Figure. Mahler, *Kindertotenlieder*, “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n”, bb. 52–54

3.18. Birdcalls. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 302–305


3.20. Pastoral Introduction. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 1–3

3.21. Theme A. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 3–7

3.21a. Theme A1 and Horn Call. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 7–11

3.21b. Theme A2. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 32–33

3.21c. Theme B. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 38–41

3.21d. Theme C. Mahler, G., Symphony No. 4/i, 58–59

3.22. Pastoral. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 94–98

3.23. Theme A. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 2–4

3.23a. Dotted Funeral March Rhythm. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, 1–4

3.23b. Noble March Theme. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 19–23

3.24. Development of Theme B. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 147–154

3.25. Salon Music. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, 80–86

3.26. Theme C. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 118–126

3.26a. Romance. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 114–120

3.27. Chorale and Fanfare. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 258–263
3.28. Light Figure. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, b. 317

4.1. Nachtmusik. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 1, bb. 1–3

4.2. Fugue. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 1, bb. 26–40

4.3. Singing Style. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 2, bb. 1–8

4.4. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 2, bb. 151–154

4.5. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 2, bb. 174–178

4.6. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 3, bb. 1–5

4.7. Lehár, Die lustige Witwe, No. 2, bb. 48–50

4.8. Ombra and pianto topics with Melisande lost theme and fate theme, Schoenberg, Pelleas und Melisande, bb. 1–5

4.8a. Melisande Theme. Schoenberg, Pelleas und Melisande

4.9. Golaud Theme. Schoenberg, Pelleas und Melisande, bb. 27–31

4.10. Golaud Wedding Bond Theme. Schoenberg, Pelleas und Melisande, bb. 44–47

4.11. Pelleas Theme. Schoenberg, Pelleas und Melisande, bb. 89–97


5.1. Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No. 6, bb. 1–8

5.2. Lombard. Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No. 9, bb. 7–10

5.3. Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No. 1, bb. 53–57

5.3a. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 1, bb. 24–33

5.4. Motivic Similarities in Bars 1–26 and 43–end. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/i

5.5. “Melodic Line” Formed from Row. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/i, bb. 25–35


5.7. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/ii, Variation IV, b. 50


5.8a. Horn Row Form. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/ii, Variation II, bb. 23–26

5.9. Webern, String Trio Op. 20/i, bb. 1–6

5.10. Webern, Zwei Lieder nach Gedichten von Rainer Maria Rilke Op. 8, No. 1, bb. 1–3

5.11. Webern, Passacaglia Op. 1, Fig. 13, String Parts Only

14, “Abendland III”, bb. 8–10
5.13. Webern, String Trio Op. 20/i, bb. 10–11 272

Figures
1.1. Structural Diagram of Topical Associations 15
1.3. An Analysis of Mozart’s Piano Sonata in F Major, K. 332/i, First Movement, bb. 1–22 53
1.4. A Paradigmatic Analysis of the Topics Present in Beethoven’s Op. 132, bars 1–120, as outlined by Agawu 55
1.4a. Revised Paradigmatic Analysis of Beethoven Op. 132 56
3.1. Overall Topical Narrative of Mahler’s Kindertotenlieder 130
3.2. Structure of Mahler’s Fourth Symphony, its Themes and Dominant Classes 150
4.1. Positional and Functional Analogy Between the Sonata Cycle and Sonata Form 210
5.1. Reversals Diagram Taken from Mark Starr “Webern’s Palindrome”, 132 244
5.2. Pitch Row Order of Variation IV. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/ii 255
5.3. The Connections Between the Variations Which Created a Unified Form 256

Tables
1.1. Hierarchy Inspired by Ratner’s Presentation of Topics 10
1.2. Hierarchy for Topical Categorisation 14
1.3. The Similarities Between the Three Large Topical Classes 41
2.1. A List of the Viennese Topics Discussed Above With Their Signifiers 104
2.2. The Topics Present c. 1900, Their Topical Classes and Associative Classes 106
3.1. March Types in Des Knaben Wunderhorn 133
3.2. Musical Narrative of Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, Showing Form, Themes, Topics and Urban/Rural Opposition 142
3.3. Musical Narrative of Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, Showing Form, Themes and Topics 153
List of Abbreviations


Introduction

In his article concerning the formal associations of topics, William Caplin states that ‘[t]he theory of musical topoi (or topics) has emerged in recent decades as a powerful tool for the analysis of musical expression within tonal repertories’.\(^1\)

Proposed by Leonard Ratner, topic theory originated as a methodology aimed at the music of the eighteenth century.\(^2\) Thirty-five years later, topic analysis has gained in popularity: the topical universe of the eighteenth century expands, while at the same time analysts reinforce and collate the meanings of the identified topics. Although analytical offerings are concentrated in eighteenth-century music, there have been ventures into nineteenth- and twentieth-century works. These include accounts of specific conventional topics found in post-1900 works, such as the Dance of Death in Mahler’s Sixth Symphony by Robert Samuels, the use in Britten’s “Night-Piece” of topics originating in Italian opera by Christopher Wintle, Jory Debenham’s identification of the pastoral topic in Janáček, and the lament topic found in Ligeti, Adés, and other twentieth-century music by, respectively, Richard Steinitz, Edward Venn, and David Metzer.\(^3\) Others have focussed on pushing the conventions of the topics, as in the fourth chapter of *Music Semiotics: a Network of Significations—In Honour and Memory of Raymond Monelle* edited by Sheinberg, in which Michael Spitzer looks at “The Topic of Emotion”, Nicholas McKay isolates “dysphoric states” in Stravinsky, and Yayoi Uno Everett investigates temporal and gendered topics in John Adams’ *Doctor Atomic*.\(^4\) In the recent International Conference on Music Semiotics, musical topics are seen as signs of ethnic identity (Melanie Plesch, Paulo de Tarso Salles and Acacio Piedade), and are found in popular and film music, such as the devil as topic in Black Sabbath by Paolo Ribaldini and William

---

Echard’s Psychedelia topical class. Nevertheless, in broad terms, there has been a gap in the employment of this method with regards to the Second Viennese School. This thesis aims to go some way to filling the gap left by previous scholars by considering the presence of topics in the works of twentieth-century composers, including Gustav Mahler, Arnold Schoenberg and Anton Webern.

The main premise of this thesis is to show not only are there topics in the music of twentieth-century Viennese composers, but also that the topics are signifiers of the culture in which they are situated, that is, they are quintessentially Viennese. In this respect, Monelle’s concept of formulating a historical trace for each topic is extremely useful. The criticisms made of topic theory tend towards its superficial nature, that analysts often merely label topical references, rather than derive meaning from them. Joseph Kerman criticises topics as ‘axiomatic’ and, with regard to the theory as a whole, he argues that ‘Ratner and [Deryck] Cooke are open to criticism not because they are wrong […], but because they do not deal adequately (or at all) with the association of music with extramusical categories on other levels, beyond the primal’. Similarly, in her opening statement of a review of Raymond Monelle’s *The Sense of Music*, Susan McClary writes that:

> [t]he subfield of music semiotics arose to address the “problem” of meaning in music, but its proponents often restrict the scope of their inquiries to formalist correspondences—as though they were attempting to decipher texts in an unknown tongue without the benefit of a Rosetta stone. The advent of topic-oriented interpretation has advanced the range of justifiable statements a bit. Yet the mere labelling of topics in masterworks produces in me the kind of dismay I would feel if an art critic were to explicate Picasso’s *Guernica* by proudly identifying the “horsie”, without somehow noticing the creature’s anguished grimace or the other figures on the canvas.

---

6 Although it is beginning to be filled by scholars such as Alexander Carpenter, Alan Street, Arnold Whittall, Michael Klein, Michael Cherlin and Julian Johnson, see chapter 3 onwards for full literature list.
It is the ‘mere labelling’ of topics which McClary is opposed to; that analysts tend, in her view, to identify the topic without questioning its place in the formal structure, why it is juxtaposed with, or opposed to, another topic in the narratological syntax. Both Kerman and McClary thus evaluate topic theory not on its ability to reveal the meaning of music; rather, it is the way in which this method has been used—the axiomatic interpretations which have, in these scholars’ eyes, so far been presented, and, admittedly, on which Ratner based the initial staging of his theory. Their criticism is that often there is no interpretation possible, or at least offered, beyond the manifest stylistic referent. One might infer, then, that topics are transhistorical, that they exist outside of history and so have no extra-musical meaning independent of the composition. Monelle’s solution to McClary’s “problem of meaning” is to situate the topics in the surrounding culture, rather than just within musical texts, developing the theoretical basis of topical syntax to include the idea of a historical trace. Monelle grounds each topic through an investigation into its historical representations, providing literary and iconic instances of, for example, the galloping horse from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, setting up a ‘web of references’ to substantiate the connections between the horse, the hunt, the military, and the masculine. As McClary states, ‘Monelle’s pursuit of topics leads him from music analysis back into the world at large’; that is, with regards to this thesis, the Viennese social, cultural and political sphere.

To create a Viennese topical sphere it is important to understand what topics already exist, their associations, both with each other and with the ‘larger world’, and how they interact to form a narrative from which meaning is extracted. As such, a survey of the composers’ texted music is needed. By analysing how topics are juxtaposed with the text, whether they are consistently analogous to it, or contradict it and by doing so form a subtext, networks of signification can be formed. In his essay “Music, Voice, Text”, Massimo Cacciari comments on such a relationship:

> [t]he text poses a limit, but, in posing it, it questions. The language does not happen between two languages at peace with each other or on parallel tracks. The text is radically assumed as an interrogating presence, to which the response is—diverse, not neutral. […] Thus even at this new level, it is not the “what” of the text, its informative context, that really counts. Rather,

---

9 Ibid.
10 Ibid., 327.
it is the general presence of another system beside the musical signs, of expressive signs which are also thoughts.\textsuperscript{11}

Hence, it is through (the) music’s relationship to (the) text that topical categorisation can occur, and from which come the narratives based on satire, irony or veracity, all of which are in evidence in the works analysed throughout this thesis. The integration of topic theory with narrativity is not unexplored. In her series of articles employing both methodologies in the works of Bartók, Márta Grabócz posits ‘that a narrative analysis founded on the use of topics deepens our understanding of musical works’. She identifies sixteen characteristic topics, including “the ideal”, “the grotesque”, Nature’s “calm face” and “menacing face”, and “Elegy”.\textsuperscript{12} Using similar techniques to those found in this thesis, she defines topics as ‘signifying musical units which, while being bound to one recurrent musical formula in terms of contour, rhythm, tempo, instrumentation, tonality, and so on—refer always to the same expressive content so long as they are kept within one style or the works of one composer’.\textsuperscript{13} The difference between Grabócz’s definition and the central premise of this thesis, and the definition given by Danuta Mirka in my first chapter, is that here topics are expected to continue their signification out of context, or intermedially; that is, across the works of different composers, and when imposed in other stylistic genres.

The numerous systems of categorisation proffered by scholars since Ratner’s initial presentation of the theory has led to an ambiguity which the first chapter aims to amend. The unique political and cultural situation in Vienna in this period (1874–1928), which scholars have named the “Vienna Circle”, means that the topical associations are broad, connecting with philosophy, psychology, literature and the transformation of the class system.\textsuperscript{14} An outline of the topical

\begin{itemize}
\item Grábocz, “The ‘Preludio’”, 128.
\item See Carl E. Schorske, \textit{Fin-de-Siècle Vienna: Politics and Culture} (New York: Vintage, 1981); Edward Timms, “Cultural Parameters between the Wars: A Reassessment of the
associations of the eighteenth-century topical universe in chapter 1 leads to an identification of the main cultural themes of fin-de-siècle Vienna in chapter 2, and subsequently the presentation of new topics suggested by these themes. Chapter 3 demonstrates the creation of a palpable musical narrative through topical interaction, both with other topics and with the work’s texts, such as opposition, inflection and contemporary cultural association. It demonstrates that what Kerman called the ‘primal’ signification of the music is enhanced by the multivalence of topics. A change or discontinuation in topical associations leads to a collapse in traditional meanings, emphasising the importance of the topics’ historical placement. This chapter also introduces the way in which the methodology is utilised throughout.

In chapters 3–5, there are analyses of at least two texted pieces, although in practice more analyses of texted pieces by each composer were carried out, in order to collate specific topical characteristics or signifiers associated with certain words—as the pianto is associated with “lagrime”—or textual subjects, such as the presence of the romance topic’s signifiers within romantic songs as outlined in the second chapter. In addition, each chapter includes an analysis of a contemporaneous operetta in order to demonstrate that the topics found in the art music of the period were common outside of the intellectual “circle” and may have been understood by the common theatre audiences. Chapter 3 investigates the operetta Die Fledermaus by Johann Strauss II (1874), and the works of Mahler and Zemlinsky. Mahler’s music has already been discussed with regards to topical signification by Monelle and Agawu, although not in any great depth. Agawu lists topics regularly found in Mahler’s music, and suggests possible significations, but does not substantiate these suggestions. Monelle states that while it would be ‘perverse to claim that Mahler never employs musical topics […] always the effect is one of montage’, rather than a meaningful narrative. Others, however, have been more receptive to the idea of topics in Mahler’s music. Julian Johnson utilises topics to distinguish Mahler’s expressive voice, and, along with Vera Micznik, offers topical references in the Third Symphony; Constatin Floros includes topical signification in

---


his consideration of ‘every hermeneutic hint of Mahler[’s symphonies] […] [as he] strive[s] to decipher his symbolic language’; and Robert Samuels provides a comprehensive semiotic study into Mahler’s Sixth Symphony.\footnote{17} Byron Almén posits an integration of topics and narrative archetypes in Mahler’s Fourth and Sixth Symphonies and Raymond Knapp looks at innocence and vulnerability in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony.\footnote{18} Mahler’s music therefore seems the obvious starting point from which to ground the historical trace for works by composers who held his music in high esteem, and to demonstrate how topics work in the long \textit{fin-de-siècle}. Schoenberg, for example, wrote that ‘it is important to me, therefore, to say here that I consider Mahler’s work immortal and that I rank it beside that of the great masters’.\footnote{19} This provides a fundamental Viennese topical territory from which to analyse the non-tonal music of Schoenberg and the best-selling operetta \textit{The Merry Widow} (Franz Lehár, 1905). Consequently, chapter 4 is the semiotic apex of the thesis as it shows that while the tonal conventions in Schoenberg’s music are lost, the learned conventions of meaning are not. Not only that, but while Schoenberg’s musical language diverges from that of contemporary popular music, the inherent musical narrative does not. This chapter also introduces the correlation between music and psychoanalysis, in particular Freud’s concept of the uncanny, which presents in both the serious and the light music of the time.\footnote{20} The final chapter deals with what Anne Schreffler calls the ‘extremes’ of the musical landscape of Webern.\footnote{21} The texted piece chosen here is the last pre-twelve-tone work by the composer, \textit{Fünf Canons}, Op. 16 (1923), and is preceded in the chapter by two twelve-tone compositions, the String Trio, Op. 20 (1927), and the Symphony, Op. 21 (1928). These works are set against \textit{Gräfin Mariza}, the 1924 operetta by Emmerich Kálmán, all demonstrating that despite the seeming incomprehensibility of Webern’s


\footnote{18} Raymond Knapp, “Suffering Children: Perspectives on Innocence and Vulnerability in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony” \textit{19th-Century Music} 22, no. 3 (Spring, 1999), 233–267.


\footnote{20} Part of this chapter can be found published as “Schoenberg’s \textit{Pelleas und Melisande}: Hidden Agendas of the Sonata Form” \textit{Musicology Review} 8/i, (2013), 62–82.

musical language, the conventional topical signification is both present and still based in the traditions of the past.

The last three chapters therefore serve to establish that the cultural transformation is mirrored by the music, and that the new topics established—those discussed in chapter 2, the *Nachtmusik* topic of Mahler in chapter 3, or the uncanny topic established by Schoenberg (chapter 4)—continue to be present in the next generation and the music of Webern and Kálmán. The thesis thereby ends by revealing that, despite the revolutionary ‘cerebral’ language in which it is written, Webern’s music is based more firmly in the (Viennese) past than his mentor, and that his music is reactionary, reaching back to Mahler’s Vienna, while extending his aphoristic style far beyond that which had come before.
Chapter 1: Topic Theory

Leonard Ratner, in his 1980 book *Classic Music*, formulated an analytical methodology to explore the plurality of different styles within the music of the eighteenth century. Ratner drew attention to the referential and mimetic qualities of the music, positing that ‘music developed a thesaurus of characteristic figures’ typically derived from cultural contexts such as dance, worship, ceremony, the hunt and the military, as well as from the life of the lower classes.\(^\text{22}\) He further defined topics into two categories: “types”, fully worked-out pieces; and “styles”, which are figures and progressions within a piece. He immediately qualifies this categorisation, however, with the statement that ‘the distinction between types and styles is flexible; minuets and marches represent complete types of composition, but they also furnish styles for other pieces’.\(^\text{23}\) These recognisable figures are then lifted out of context, thus enabling a string quartet to evoke a military fanfare, or an orchestra to play an aria, which leads to Danuta Mirka paraphrasing Ratner’s definition of topics as ‘*musical styles and genres taken out of their proper context and used in another one*’.\(^\text{24}\)

Although Ratner qualified his categorisation as “flexible”, the distinction between “style” and “type” blurs almost to incomprehensibility. In his description of the different dance types there are numerous references to specific dance styles, for example the polonaise, which Ratner describes as a ‘rather serious and deliberate style’, and, just prior to this, he references the ‘Swabian allemande style’.\(^\text{25}\) Moreover, in his previous chapter, Ratner outlines two other levels of signification: the high, middle and low styles; and the chamber, church and theatrical styles, with which some of his topics are consequently associated. Ratner ascribes the proposition of the classification into the high, middle and low styles to Johann Adolphe Scheibe, although Mirka adds that others, including Johann Mattheson, also made the observation.\(^\text{26}\) Ratner paraphrases Scheibe’s description of each style:

> The *high style* must be stately and emphatic; the harmony must be full, the ideas fully carried through, the melody rich in invention, fresh, lively, and

\(^{22}\) Rattner, *CM*, 9.
\(^{23}\) Ibid.
\(^{26}\) Mirka, introduction, 4.
elevated. It should be used only for heroes, kings, and other great men and noble spirits; magnanimity, majesty, love of power, magnificence, pride, astonishment, anger, fear, madness, revenge, doubt, and other similar qualities and passions can only be expressed in the high style.

The middle style is ingenious, pleasant, and flowing; it must please the listener rather than excite him or lead him to reflection. The melody must be clear, lively, flowing, and well turned; harmony must serve only to make the melody clearer and must never dominate. [...] Joy, delight, love devotion, modesty, and patience are best imitated in this style.

The low style avoids all clever elaborations. [...] It represents nature in its simplest form, and is used for low-born persons and for objects and situations associated with them. Its characteristic embodiment is the shepherd; some others are beggars, slaves, poor prisoners, and farmers.27

The significance of this quotation is that it demonstrates that these styles are not based solely on society’s class system, but that the emotional character of the music denotes its placement within these categories. Robert Hatten notes, therefore, that it is the ‘degree of dignity’ that is the determining factor.28 As such, he provides a table (reproduced here as Table 1.1) which represents his interpretation of the hierarchy of Ratner’s original presentation.29

Hatten’s table emphasises the aforementioned issue with the terminology associated with topic theory. The other two classifications posited by Ratner (via Mattheson, Scheibe and Meinrad Speiss) and adopted by Hatten, Mirka, Monelle et al., are also termed “style”, consequently creating an additional ambiguity in the classification hierarchy. A further complication is that this table is presented by Hatten under the subheading “Understanding Expressive Genres in Music”, and introduced as a summary of the ‘historical classifications of musical topics’ supplied by Ratner.30 This not only adds a new, undefined, term—genre—but also places the third sub-category “topics” as an historical classification of itself. While Hatten does acknowledge the ‘overlapping use of terms’ and the ‘inevitably messy categories’, he does not attempt to resolve the problem.31

29 Ibid., 74.
30 Ibid.
31 Ibid., 75.
Table 1.1: Hierarchy Inspired by Ratner’s Presentation of Topics.32

I. Codes of feelings and passions, linked to:
   a. Pace, movement, tempo
   b. Intervals
   c. Motives used to symbolise affect

II. Styles based on:
   a. Locale/occasion/situation
      i. Ecclesiastical/church style
      ii. Chamber style (galanterie)
      iii. Theatrical/operatic style (relative to chamber style)
   b. Degree of dignity
      i. High style
      ii. Middle style
      iii. Low style

III. Topics, either:
   a. Types (fully worked-out pieces), such as dances (minuet, contradanse etc.) in high, middle or low styles; or
   b. Styles (figures and progressions within a piece)
      i. Military, hunt
      ii. Singing style
      iii. French overture
      iv. Musette, pastorale
      v. Turkish music
      vi. Storm and stress
      vii. Sensibility, Empfindsamkeit
      viii. Strict, learned style (vs. galant, or free style)
      ix. Fantasia style

IV. Pictorialism, word painting and imitation of sounds of nature.

Nevertheless, the characters that Scheibe connects with each of the high, middle and low styles are still class conventions; the high style is for ‘heroes, kings, […] great men and noble spirits’, while the low style embodies shepherds, ‘beggars, slaves, poor prisoners, and farmers’. The emotional characteristics which follow—‘power, magnificence, pride’, or ‘joy, delight, [and] love’—are stereotypical character

32 Ibid., 74.
traits associated with the classes, attributed to them by educated members of the upper class. Hence, these are idealised versions of the different classes, just as some topics are romanticised versions of an ideal rather than significations of the brutal truth.\textsuperscript{33} It is therefore important when analysing a work topically to understand the period of time from which the piece comes, since, as Monelle points out, ‘both signifier and signified have their roots in the social, cultural, and technological world. In the case of indexical topics, the signifier—the sign, embodied in a musical event—will naturally tend to be contemporary’.\textsuperscript{34} He presents as an example the hunt topic:

It is a little surprising to find that the heroic, manly, noble hunt evoked by music, portrayed in operas and described in hunting books, was not very much practiced in the lands of its chief currency, the Austro-German territories of eighteenth-century Europe. Hunting was cowardly and ignoble, and the fanciful mythology of the noble hunt was cultivated partly to redeem this. The musical topic was significative of an older, more sporting hunt, but it was also significative of the falseness of contemporary heroism [...].\textsuperscript{35}

The ‘historical trace’ of each topic, as Monelle terms it, will then enable the analyst to form a coherent plotline from the topical narrative. A discourse then evolves through this notion, merging topics from contrasting classes, or subtly altering the topics to mock the class with which they are associated. In Micznik’s article, “Mahler and the Power of Genre”, the author suggests that Mahler’s music has ‘slipped into a parody version of a waltz with grotesque overtones’.\textsuperscript{36} By transferring the waltz into a low register—orchestrating the theme with trombones, bass clarinet, bass tuba and double bass—and inserting large leaps into the melody, Mahler has altered the initial association of the dance with the ballroom and ‘hurled it into the street’.\textsuperscript{37}

In his 2008 book \textit{Music as Discourse}, Kofi Agawu attempts to solve the terminological problem by labelling the high, middle and low styles as topics in their

\textsuperscript{33} For example the hunt, which is associated with nobility and the thrill of the chase, rather than a vicious blood sport, or the medieval valour and heroism of the military style, ideals far removed from the horrors of war.
\textsuperscript{34} Monelle, \textit{TMT}, 29–30.
\textsuperscript{35} Ibid., 30.
\textsuperscript{36} Vera Micznik, “On Mahler and the Power of Genre” \textit{The Journal of Musicology} 12, no. 2 (Spring 1994), 137.
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid.
own right, and placing them in his topical universe alongside extant topics, such as the learned style, the march and the polonaise. He avoids the distinction between “type” and “style” altogether, and discusses the location/occasion categorisation only in terms of eighteenth-century “public realms” of topics and nineteenth-century “private realms”, a division originally suggested by Johann Georg Sulzer, who groups the church and theatrical styles as “public” and the chamber style as “private”. In her Introduction to the Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory, Mirka attempts to define Ratner’s original presentation. She argues that “[i]f styles encompass broad affective zones, genres composed in these styles are related to specific affects’. Mirka continues:

This concerns, in particular, the instrumental genres that Mattheson calls ‘small Pièces’ [in which] each genre receives its typical affect. For example, the affect of the allemande is one of a ‘contented or satisfied spirit’, of the bourrée ‘contentment and pleasantness’, of the courante ‘sweet hopefulness’, of sarabande ‘ambition’, of the rigaudon ‘trifling jocularity’, of the passapied ‘frivolity’ [...] Affective characters of larger pieces are less specific. In symphonies, which form introductions to operas or church or chamber music, ‘the expression of affects [...] would have to conform to those passions which predominate the work itself’.

Mirka, therefore, equates these ‘small compositions of determined character’ with Ratner’s “types”. ‘By contrast’, she writes, ‘larger compositions “of undetermined character”, that is, such “which can acquire every character”, are the genres that create opportunities for topics to mix together’.

It appears, then, that the difference between “style” and “type” is merely one of size. If a small piece is of one “determined” character, the topic involved is a type; if it is a larger “mixed” piece, it is a style. Even here, the difference between a style associated with topic, or one associated with function, location or degree of dignity is not clearly defined. The following diagram therefore attempts to refine this division. First, however, one more level of classification must be acknowledged.

39 An affect is the emotional complex associated with a specific topic.
40 Ernest C. Harris, Johann Mattheson’s Der Volkommene Capellmeister: A Revised Translation with Critical Commentary (Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research, 1981), 467, quoted in Mirka, introduction, 7.
41 Mirka, introduction, 21.
Monelle describes three musical topics, the pastoral, hunt and military, as ‘great topical worlds that constitute musical and cultural genres’. These topics include multifarious signifiers, which, Monelle suggests, make the signifieds ‘complex and elusive’. As such, included within the stages of classification are also multi-level topical associations, here named as large topical classes (also sometimes called super-topics, or ‘dialects’). These are collections of musical gestures and topics which, when used in conjunction with each other, define a larger topical class.

The purpose of this chapter is to identify the conventional topical universe as understood by composers and listeners at the end of the nineteenth century. Hence, the topics provide evidence of how composers and listeners understood their own era and the goal is therefore to provide a source of insight into how the music may have been heard contemporaneously. In tandem with the cultural themes examined in the next chapter, those inherent specifically in the Viennese fin-de-siècle, the “story” level of the hermeneutic reading will be based less on the interpretants subjective construal than an attempt at an historically objective appraisal. Table 1.2 below sets out the classification system used within this thesis. It is in the order in which the work will be analysed, from the identification of the progressions, motives, intervals, pace or tempo, etc., which signify the topic—or subtopic of a larger topical class—to the categorisation of that topic into its respective associations of determination, class and finally social purpose. Not all topics will signify both social class and purpose, just as not all topics are part of a larger class. Figure 1.1 is a structural diagram that sets out the associations of each topic within the Classical system. It shows that the associations are not always straightforward; for example, the pastoral topical class can signify all three social classes, depending

---

42 Monelle, TMT, 5.
43 Ibid. A symbolic sign depends upon learned cultural codes to unite what Ferdinand Saussure terms a concept and a sound-image—terms that are replaced by Jean-Jacques Nattiez with signified and signifier, respectively. Therefore, ‘arbou’ is a sign as it carries the concept ‘tree’. The word ‘tree’ however, has nothing in common with a tree, but is understood to carry this signification and is therefore a symbol. Symbolic signs are considered, by Saussure, as being ‘arbitrary’, as their origins have been lost or forgotten and are therefore used through habit. However, Hatten feels that since even habit and usage provide a basis for the correlation of sound and meaning, arbitrariness is perhaps deceptive. An indexical signification is based on a dynamic relationship of causality between two entities, which Monelle explains occurs when ‘a hole in a pane of glass brings to mind the bullet that passed through it’. (Jean-Jacques Nattiez, Music and Discourse: Towards a Semiology of Music, trans. Carolyn Abbate (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990); Monelle, SM, 15).
45 The “story” level referred to here is a term used in narrative methodology and is explained fully in chapter 3 of this thesis.
on the signifiers present within the music, but the four dance subtopics are all low class. Similarly, the fantasia topic does not belong to a larger topical class, nor is it associated with a social class; instead, based as it is on C.P.E. Bach’s piano sonatas, it is classed as chamber music. The dotted lines appear when the topic is not connected to the first line it crosses, for example the sensibility topic is not a dance, but is connected to the middle class and chamber music. Figure 1.2 provides an analysis of the three topics presented in the first seventeen bars of Beethoven's Op. 132 (bars 1–4, 8–10, and 12–17), demonstrating the way in which a topical narrative can begin to form through the oppositions created by the different classifications. In this brief analysis, all three “purposes” are present, as is an opposition between the high and middle class that could be interpreted as a dialogue between the public and private realms.

Table 1.2: Hierarchy for Topical Categorisation.

1. Signifiers
2. (Sub-)topic
3. Topical Class
4. Determination:
   a. Style
   b. Type
5. Social Class:
   a. High Class
   b. Middle Class
   c. Low Class
6. Social Purpose:
   a. Public:
      i. Church Music
      ii. Theatre Music
   b. Private:
      i. Chamber Music

Figure 1.1: Structural Diagram of Topical Associations. 

Figure 1.1: Structural Diagram of Topical Associations. 

---

46 The break in the overarching line above the lament and pianno indicates that, while the two topics are associated with both the theatre and the church, there is no association between the two categories “Church” and “Theatre”.
Figure 1.2 [next page]: Analysis of Beethoven, String Quartet no. 15, Op. 132, First Movement, bb. 1–17
1. Topical Lexicography

Ratner presents a lexicon of topics, which has since been expanded by other scholars. Having explored how a topical narrative can be constructed through a hierarchy of associations, what follows is a formulisation of each topic: their musical signifiers, what they signify and their placement within the associative hierarchy. The topics are arranged in a quasi-chronological order, starting with topics principally associated with the Baroque era and ending with topics associated with the late eighteenth to early nineteenth centuries. Later topics will be discussed in the following chapters within the Viennese cultural context.

47 See Kofi Agawu (1991) and (2008); Monelle (2000) and (2006); and Mirka (2014), among others.
1.1. Learned Style

The 'learned style' as a topic was originally described by Ratner as signified by 'imitation, fugal or canonic, and contrapuntal composition, generally'. He distinguishes between the learned style and the strict style, which 'sets firm rules for harmonic and melodic progression, creating a smooth connection of slowly moving melodies and harmonies; its simplest and most traditional form was the alla breve progression in whole- and half-notes'. The style itself, however, was present in discussions of musical style well before then, for example in Heinrich Christoph Koch's Musikalisches Lexicon (1802) and Alfred Einstein's Mozart: His Character, His Work (1945). Rather than distinguishing between the two styles, Keith Chapin includes the strict style under the umbrella term “learned style”. He suggests that the term “the learned style”, in the singular, is a twentieth-century neologism that is as anachronistic as it is useful, and refers to a number of styles linked theoretically and culturally. This is therefore a topical class, which includes more specific subtopics, all with their own signifiers and associations which will alter the dialect of the musical narrative. Elaine Sisman explains that

[c]onnecting learned style with rhetoric are several separate but related complexes of ideas: the idea of an older, antiquated style dependent upon strict rules; the idea of a musical topos or topic; the idea of an elevated style; and the idea of difficulty inherent in learnedness, and thus the propriety of taxing the understanding of the audience.

In addition, Sisman offers what she calls the 'oversimplification' that 'everything that is not learned, in this period [Classical], is “galant”, including “Classical” (or “galant”) counterpoint'. Chapin concurs with this to an extent, noting that ‘this ethos of learnedness and poise was often opposed to that of sensibility and sentiment, despite the many overlaps between them in both social background and compositional technique. In his essay “Learned Style and Learned Styles”, Chapin sets out seven subtopics: the strict, bound, fugal, church, stile antico, grave and elaborate styles, only some of which will be presented here. The strict, bound, alla

---

48 Ratner, CM, 23.
49 Ibid.
50 Keith Chapin, “Learned Style and Learned Styles”, OHTT, 301.
51 Sisman, Mozart: The Jupiter Symphony, 68.
52 Ibid., 71.
53 Chapin, “Learned Style”, 301.
breve and fugal styles are closely linked. The strict style refers to the ‘mechanical rules’ of dissonance treatment and part writing, for example, the resolution of suspensions and placement of parallel fifths and octaves.\textsuperscript{54} The bound style signifies limitation and adherence to a law, whether it is an imitative comes “bound” to the dux in a canon, or a suspension “bound” over into the next bar by a slur; while the fugal style refers solely to procedures of imitation and canon.\textsuperscript{55} These are associated with church music because of their serious nature.\textsuperscript{56} Sisman does warn, however, that not all imitation signifies the learned style. She points specifically to the motivic imitation in the first movement of Mozart’s “Prague” Symphony as an example of “secular counterpoint” which is not associated with this style.\textsuperscript{57} Once again, it is the rule-based fugues and canons which signify the learned style in this case. The alla breve topic is based on the alla breve meter (2/2) and is recognised by its long breve rhythm, forcing the slow movement of the strict harmonic progression in first species counterpoint (see Examples 1.17a–c).

Chapin’s suggestion that there is a ‘church style’ once again demonstrates the confusion in topical categorisation. Chapin explains that ‘[s]ince the sixteenth century, the church had been the refuge of ornate and highly developed musical styles, in particular those animated by relatively equal polyphony or imitative counterpoint’.\textsuperscript{58} This suggests, then, that styles such as the strict or bound style are associated with the church, rather than church music itself being a style—and therefore a topic.

The “consciously archaic” connotation of the learned style is defined by the stile antico, signified by the polyphony of the Catholic mass and the ‘notions of antiquity’ present in motets.\textsuperscript{59} In addition, the works of J.S. Bach and Palestrina are considered to be in the antique style, as their practices ‘offered the opportunity for late-century musicians simultaneously to look back nostalgically to a past culture and to indulge in their own time’s cult of genius’.\textsuperscript{60} Chapin also includes in the stile antico subtopic trio sonata texture, the oratorio chorus and the French overture. The description of the elaborate, or wrought style, is the final style described by Chapin,

\textsuperscript{54} Chapin, “Learned Style”, 304. For a fuller formulation of the strict style see chapter 5.
\textsuperscript{55} Ibid., 305.
\textsuperscript{56} Heinrich Koch, \textit{Musikalisches Lexicon} (Hildesheim: George Olms, 1964), cols. 1,451–1,452, quoted in Ratner, \textit{CM}, 23.
\textsuperscript{57} Sisman, \textit{Mozart: The Jupiter Symphony}, 70.
\textsuperscript{58} Chapin, “Learned Style and Learned Styles”, 306.
\textsuperscript{59} Ibid., 308.
\textsuperscript{60} Ibid.
and, as he notes, is the style which moves the learned style ‘toward the ethos of the high [class] in general’. Chapin writes that

With “elaborate” or “wrought style” (gearbeitete Schreibart) one moves both to the broadest conception of the learned style and also to the heart of its logic, to the issues that held together the panoply of styles in a loose stylistic and conceptual field. The term can refer to the strict discipline required for dissonance control, to the figural elaboration of simple counterpoint, to the imitative treatment of a theme, or to polyphonic textures. It can also point to highly developed textures in general, including those characteristic of the fantasia and the symphony, or to what was later described as ‘motivic-thematic working’.

This style embodies the opposite end of the learned spectrum to the alla breve and strict styles, as, though still strictly disciplined, it is the complexity of the music which is signified here. The learned style topical class can therefore be summarised as a rule-based, “consciously archaic” style which signifies the educated high class and is mostly associated with the church. Its signifiers include disciplined dissonance control, fugal imitation and either homophonic or polyphonic counterpoint.

1.1.a Lament

The lament topic is signified by the collective appearance of two motives, the pianto and a ‘bass line that descends stepwise from the tonic scale-degree to the dominant, thus spanning an interval of a perfect fourth’. It became associated with ‘expressive vocal music containing mournful text’, in the early to mid seventeenth century, ‘most especially’, William Caplin notes, ‘in works that were titled “lamento”’. The descending tetrachord is often chromaticised, which increases the mournful quality of the expression. The progression is then termed passus duriusculus (lit.: “somewhat hard passage”), which could be combined with an ascending chromatic line in the upper voices. Monelle provides a short case study on this figure, following in the footsteps of Peter Williams’ 1997 book, The

---

61 Ibid., 310.
64 Ibid.
65 Ibid., 417.
Chromatic Fourth during Four Centuries of Music. As a progression within a piece it is termed a style that is high class—as it signifies a powerful emotion (grief)—and, although usually associated with the church, could also be associated with the theatre as an affected (acted) emotion.

Example 1.1: The passus duriusculus. Monelle, SM, 73.

1.1.b. The Pianto

The pianto is a motive based on a descending semitone that can be traced back to the sixteenth century, where it was used to illustrate words such as lagrime [tears] and pianto [weeping]. As Monelle explains, ‘the association of this motive with the pianto, the idea of weeping, seems sufficiently established in this early repertoire for us to assume that it was heard originally as a literal icon’. However, by the seventeenth century it had become ingrained enough that when used in the lament of Dido within Purcell’s Dido and Aeneas, there is ‘no mention of tears or weeping but the general sentiment of grief is enough to yield the pianto motive within the very first gesture’. At this time, therefore, the motive’s signification had become indexical, merely associated with a sigh, rather than a physical representation of one. Presently, Monelle posits, ‘it is very doubtful that modern listeners recall the association of the pianto with actual weeping; indeed the later assumption that this figure signified sighing, not weeping, suggests that its origin was forgotten. It is now heard with all the force of an arbitrary symbol, which in culture is the greatest force of all’. Clive McClelland also suggests that the pianto is a figuration characteristic of the ombra topic (outlined below), but that in this case ‘its momentary dissonance [is] used to express not longing but fear or pain’.

_____________________

67 Monelle, SM, 68. An iconic sign resembles an object, concept or sound. For example, a road sign with a picture of a tunnel warns you of the tunnel up ahead, or the sound of a sigh ‘means’ sighing or weeping.
68 Ibid.
69 Ibid., 73.
1.1.c Ombra

Ombra is a term for music traditionally used for an operatic scene involving the invocation of the supernatural. The style can be traced back to seventeenth-century Italy and France, with operas based on the legends of Orpheus, Iphigenia and Alcestis continuing to capture the imagination well into the eighteenth century. The ombra topic evokes the emotion of fear in a musical composition. McClelland characterises the ombra topic in his book, Ombra Music in the Eighteenth Century, as generally of a high class, slow, sombre and sustained. It uses shifting minor keys with ‘unexpected dissonances’ which are bold and chromatic.\(^71\) The melody is exclamatory with repeated patterns (ostinati) in the bass, tremolo effects and repetitive figuration. The rhythm is restless and syncopated, often with ‘ponderous dotted rhythms and pauses’. The instrumentation is unusual, frequently including trombones with dynamic contrasts, sudden outbursts and unexpected silences.\(^72\) To demonstrate this he provides an example (reproduced below as Example 1.2) from Gluck’s Don Juan, no. 30 (1761).

In Ratner’s original exposé of topic theory he places the ombra topic as a subset of the fantasia style, demonstrating the similar features while at the same time identifying signifiers associated with the ‘church’ (alla breve and stile legato) whose main characteristics are a rhythmic regularity that is anathema to the fantasia style.\(^73\) This opposition in style within ombra is, perhaps, what gives it the unpredictable nature perfect for portraying the supernatural on stage; it is, certainly, what makes a convincing case for ombra to be a separate topic.

By the end of the eighteenth century, Ratner states, ombra had become recognisable as representing ‘ghosts, gods, moral values, punishments—and to bring forth feelings of awe and terror’.\(^74\) Although he concentrates on the music of the eighteenth century, in the final chapter of his book McClelland discusses the pervasion of the ombra topic into the nineteenth century. The signification of ombra at this point still leans heavily on the use of tonality; the composers utilise minor keys and dissonances occurring over dominant pedals. Other signifiers, based on rhythm, timbre and melody, are indicated, particularly the dactylic rhythms found in

---

\(^72\) Ibid., 225.
\(^74\) Ratner, CM, 24.
Schubert’s Lieder Der Tod und Das Mädchen (1817) and In der Ferne (1828). In addition, McClelland demonstrates the presence of *ombra* in Krommer’s Symphony in D Op. 40 (1803), citing the ‘angular string melody’ which gives way to ‘material built on a descending chromatic line with countermelodies in the wind’, followed by a passage ‘alternating loud and soft bars with repeated quavers’. A fuller exploration of this topic is made in the second and third chapters as *ombra* plays a significant part in the narratives of Mahler and Schoenberg’s works.

*Example 1.2: Ombra.* Gluck, Don Juan, No. 30, bb. 9–16.

1.1 *d* Tempesta

The archetypal features of what Ratner originally termed the *Sturm und Drang* topic are ‘driving rhythms, full texture, minor mode harmonies, chromaticism, sharp dissonances, and an impassioned style of declamation’. These characteristics increase the instability of the topic, making it more appropriate for transition and development sections, and thus often seen in opposition to metrically stable topics such as dance rhythms. The term was coined by music historians to ‘refer to some early manifestations of Romanticism—the expression of subjective and intense personal feelings’ in Haydn’s music. This retrospective acknowledgement of the link with Romanticism in Haydn’s music serves to clearly define the *Sturm und Drang* topic as Classical. It is this retrospective label, however, that has made scholars uncomfortable. Abigail Chantler, in her article “The Sturm und Drang Style Revisited”, notes that ‘since the application of *Sturm und Drang* as an

76 Ibid., 227.
77 Ratner, CM, 21.
78 Monelle, TMT, 9.
79 Ratner, CM, 21.
historical construct to the study of music is implicitly reliant on the notion of *Zeitgeist* [...] it does little to facilitate an historical understanding of the music it purports to describe'.

Monelle also points out that *Sturm und Drang* 'has become a modern myth to associate the Haydn symphonies of this period with the literary movement thus named'.

To this end, McClelland posits the adoption of the term *tempesta* for all storm-related references. He explains that the term acknowledges the origins of *Sturm* not in Haydn’s symphonies, but in early opera, since the musical language clearly derives from depictions of storms and other devastations in the theatre. [...] Scenes involving storms, floods, earthquakes, and conflagrations had appropriately wild music, and the musical style is often reflected in scenes involving flight or pursuit, and even metaphorically in depicting rage and madness.

McClelland’s aim in choosing this term was to provide a counterpart to *ombra*, two styles he insists are complementary, the main difference being the ‘fast, agitated’ tempo of *tempesta* music, while *ombra* tempi are invariably ‘on the slow side’.

These two topics often exist side by side in *opera seria* as ‘[d]isorder in the elements in Classical mythology (and therefore in much of opera seria) is almost invariably instigated by irate deities, and frequently quelled by benevolent ones, so the supernatural associations are clear’.

Example 1.3: Tempesta. *Gluck, Don Juan, No. 31, bb. 11–18.*

---

82 Monelle, SM, 28.
83 McClelland, “*Ombra and Tempesta*”, 281.
84 Ibid., 281–282.
85 McClelland sets out both topics’ characteristics side by side in his chapter in *OHTT*, 282.
86 Ibid., 282.
1.2. Dances

1.2.a. Sarabande

The sarabande is part of the larger topical class of dance; however, as different dances represent different times and social classes they will each be discussed separately. As such, the sarabande, minuet, gavotte, bourrée and contredanse will be discussed here, while a depiction of the low class dances—the musette, gigue, pastorale, and siciliano—will be discussed under the pastoral topical class to which they also belong. As most upper class dances can be traced back to aristocratic courts and ballrooms, they are not, as such, associated with church, chamber or theatre music. However, as these types of composition were often written or transcribed for the piano for use in the salon in the nineteenth century, they can be associated with chamber music. Leonard Ratner observed that ‘there is hardly a major work in this [Classical] era that does not borrow heavily from the dance’.

This, Eric McKee suggests, is ‘not surprising given that social dancing, whether in the ballroom, in the beer hall, or in the home, was by far the most popular social activity of the time’. Moreover, McKee writes that

the choreographies of each dance (and the manner in which one performed them) were associated with particular feelings or motions of the soul (Gemüthsbewegungen), ethical states, and indications of one's social class. And, according to eighteenth-century writers, the vocabulary of

---

Ratner, CM, 18.

Eric McKee, “Ballroom Dances of the Late Eighteenth Century”, OHTT, 164; also see Lawrence M. Zbikowski, “Music and Dance in the Ancien Régime”, OHTT, 143–163.
dance gestures encompassed the entire gamut of the human condition from grave to gay, from noble to vulgar.\textsuperscript{89}

The sarabande was popular from the late sixteenth century as one of the main movements of the Baroque suite, in which it was usually preceded by the courante. Best known today from Bach’s stylised instrumental versions, it originated in Latin America, where it was known for its fast, lively triple meter and salacious reputation. In the seventeenth century, however, the dance migrated to Italy and France, where, in the \textit{ballet de cour} and the ballrooms it developed into the slower, statelier version that is better known today.\textsuperscript{90}

The sarabande’s central features are its slow tempo, prompting it to be described by Ratner as a slow minuet; triple time, with an emphasis on the second beat; and ‘heavily dotted rhythms and lavish ornamentation’.\textsuperscript{91} The dance is often in a minor key, which, along with its serious character represents the high class.\textsuperscript{92} The most common structure for this dance is AABB, though variations and rondo forms may also be found.


\begin{music}
\begin{tabular}{c}
\musicinput{Example14_1.png} \\
\musicinput{Example14_2.png}
\end{tabular}
\end{music}

\textsuperscript{89} McKee, “Ballroom Dances”, 164.
\textsuperscript{91} Ratner, \textit{CM}, 11; Allanbrook, \textit{Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart}, 37.
\textsuperscript{92} Ratner, \textit{CM}, 12.
1.2.b. Gavotte

The gavotte is a French court dance in duple time, commonly *alla breve* meter, from the late sixteenth century to the late eighteenth. The later gavottes often had a pastoral affect (outlined more fully below) and were frequently employed in the Baroque suite, often appearing after the more serious movements like the sarabande. The dance itself consists of repeated four or eight bar phrases and is uncomplicated rhythmically and harmonically. It is notable for its ‘caesura’ after the second crotchet of the bar and the half-bar anacrusis (usually two crotchets), a rhythm which Ratner claims ‘accommodated a melody of elegance, poise, and self-containment’.\(^{93}\) To provide a strong rhythmic bassline to this melody, Alberti basses are often used as their ‘tick-tock’ rhythms ‘help to accentuate the separate strokes of the three strong beats’.\(^{94}\) The pastoral associations of the gavotte are exemplified by J.S. Bach’s setting of the dance in the third English suite for keyboard, which has a drone bass similar to that of the musette (Example 1.5a).\(^{95}\) In the nineteenth century many lightweight drawing room pieces were written in the gavotte style, therefore transferring its associations from the aristocratic ballroom to the *galant* chamber style.\(^{96}\)

---


Example 1.5a: Bach, J.S., English Suites, Suite III, G minor. Gavotte II (ou la Musette), bb. 1–4.

1.2.c. Minuet

The minuet style uses a triple time signature (either 3/4 or 3/8), a moderate tempo, and generally begins on the downbeat. Melanie Lowe provides the minuet’s signifiers:

It is a triple-meter dance in binary form; the three beats of its measure are stressed nearly equally, giving the dance a steady rhythmic profile; the first beat of each two-measure group has a slightly heavier accent, corresponding to the minuet dance step, the pas de menuet; and most minuet strains contain an even number of measures since the pas de menuet took two measures to perform. [...] Its texture is typically homophonic, with a simple and normally unembellished melodic style; in its hierarchical and symmetrical phrase structure, the minuet epitomizes Classic structural balance and contrast. Moreover, the minuet is the


Allanbrook attributes the dance’s affected ‘restrained elegance’ to its steady rhythm—commonly a crotchet followed by four quavers—hence Ratner’s suggestion that it was ‘associated with the elegant world of court and salon’.\footnote{Allanbrook, \textit{Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart}, 34; Ratner, \textit{CM}, 9; Allanbrook also links this dance with the ancien régime, an observation paralleled by Eric McKee, who noted that it was one of the only dances still performed in court in the eighteenth century. He states that it was ‘artfully simple yet fiendishly difficult to master, the minuet not only was the choreographic ideal of natural(ized) grace and noble simplicity, but also represented the collective historical weight and power of the ancien régime. Thus the minuet was both a current dance and a historical dance’ (Eric McKee, “Ballroom Dances”, 168).} ‘Indeed’, Lowe notes, “‘noble’ was the first word of choice among 18th-century critics to describe the Classic minuet’s affect’.\footnote{Lowe, “Grace”, 173–174.} Sulzer, for example, characterises the minuet as having ‘a noble and charming deportment, but combined with simplicity’.\footnote{Sulzer, \textit{Allgemeine Theorie}, 3, 388; Lowe, “Grace”, 173–174.} This simplicity, however, does not contradict the nobility inherent in this topic; rather it indicates the Enlightenment’s aesthetic concept of noble simplicité, which Lowe observes ‘imparts further sincerity’.\footnote{Lowe, “Grace”, 174.} Scheibe places this in opposition to the high class connotations of the learned style, as he ‘consider[s] “the natural” and “the clear” to be true signs of the good style, two values clearly opposed to the “artificial” and “indistinct” style of fugal writing and counterpoint’.\footnote{Scheibe, \textit{Critischer Musikus}, 274, quoted in Lowe, “Grace”, 175.}

The fundamental style of this dance, however, is such that it is capable of great ranges of expression, as Ratner illustrates by providing examples of the dance with an ‘elegant vein’, a ‘rustic flavour’, and a ‘deeply pathetic mood’.\footnote{Ratner, \textit{CM}, 10.} It is, therefore, a valuable integration topic, one which can ‘tolerate the overlay of another style or topical reference’ such as the military, hunt or pastoral (outlined more fully below).\footnote{Allanbrook, \textit{Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart}, 35–36.} Since this dance is able to integrate with lower class topics, for example in the rustic manner suggested by Ratner, it is possible it could itself be seen as having interchangeable associations. However, it is more likely that its use instead highlights the differing classes of the topics, creating juxtaposition between the dance and the topic with which it is integrated.

1.2.d. Bourrée and Contredanse

Also a relative of the march and the gavotte, the bourrée’s foremost signifiers are its *alla breve* meter, a crotchet upbeat, a steady crotchet movement and the use of the syncopated figure of crotchet–minim–crotchet (Example 1.7).\(^{105}\) This rhythm can also be seen in Example 1.7a, which is a contredanse, rather than a bourrée, although as discussed below the difference between the two dances is minimal. The bourrée ‘was rather lively in manner, calling for lightness in performance’; this ‘*di mezzo carattere* (“of the middle rank”)’ style was frequently used in Classical music, although not as the structure for an entire movement.\(^{106}\)

Ratner says of the contredanse: ‘if we quicken the pace of the bourrée, the music will be in the style of the contradanse’.\(^{107}\) In “Ballroom Dances of the Late Eighteenth Century”, McKee provides an account of the ‘prototypical features’ of the contredanse, identifying three types: the *contredanse anglaise*, the *contredanse française* and the *contredanse allemande*. The main difference between the three dances is the number of participants. The *contredanse anglaise* required ‘multiple couples (at least three) arranged in squares, rounds, or longways, performing a sequence of figures’.\(^{108}\) The *contredanse française* and the *contredanse allemande* ‘required four couples arranged in a square formation to perform a series of nine, ten, or twelve figures called entrés (or changes)’.\(^{109}\) McKee notes, however, that the Viennese favoured the *contredanse anglaise*—Allanbrook suggests that the name in fact may have descended from the English *country-dance*—hence that is the dance referred to in this thesis.\(^{110}\)

\(^{105}\) Allanbrook, *Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart*, 48. For an exploration of the choreography of the bourrée, and the relationship between the steps of a dance and the music, see Lawrence M. Zbikowski “Music and Dance in the Ancien Régime”, 143–163.


\(^{107}\) Ibid.


\(^{109}\) Ibid., 167.

\(^{110}\) Ibid., 168; Allanbrook, *Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart*, 63.
The musical markers of this dance give it a ‘spirited, playful and gay character: [...] lively tempo, major mode, clear and uncomplicated melodic organization, and simple rhythms with a swinging gait (triplet figures are common), [and] are set in duple meter, either simple (2/4) or compound (6/8)’. Simplicity, McKee claims, citing the lexicons of Jean-Jacques Rousseau, Charles Compan and Koch, is at the core of the contredanse. It is not the noble simplicity of the minuet, however, but the rustic simplicity of its origins in the English village, which therefore associate it principally with the lower class. Allanbrook explains that contredanses portray customs, amusements, and love intrigues of the common people. Movements and leaps are a little less abandoned, but still lively, rather mischievous, and very striking. They must always be amusing and merry. The main thing in them is agility, a quick, artful movement, and a mischievous affect.


Example 1.7a: Beethoven, Contradanse No. 1, bb. 1–6.

---

113 Allanbrook, Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart, 63.
1.3. Sensibility/Empfindsamkeit

In Matthew Head’s definition of sensibility, he states that it refers ‘to human disposition, not to musical materials. It identified a capacity to respond with pleasure or pain, with feeling, and with self-awareness to the impressions made on the body and mind by the senses. Consciousness, subjectivity, and reflexivity are key terms in conceptualising sensibility, which referred not simply to a capacity to be moved but also to an awareness of that capacity and its moral obligations’.\textsuperscript{114} It served as an early defence of sense (in this instance referring to the senses and emotions) over reason and rationalism, and was also therefore a reaction to the ‘strict’ or ‘learned’ style.\textsuperscript{115}

Ratner posits this topic as a parallel to tempesta, using the dramatic fluidity that shifts quickly from one emotion to another to support this theory. However, the intimate quality of C.P.E. Bach’s keyboard sonatas (as the main proponent of this style) helps to distinguish this refined topic from the more declamatory tempesta style.\textsuperscript{116} In similar fashion to the tempesta topic, this topic has also been defined as a ‘pre-Romantic’ Classical topic.\textsuperscript{117}

According to Ratner this style is signified by ‘rapid changes in mood, broken figures, interrupted continuity, elaborate ornamentation, pregnant pauses, shifting, uncertain, often dissonant harmony’.\textsuperscript{118} Monelle, however, states that the ‘style of Empfindsamkeit is largely founded on the affective appoggiatura, a component of the ‘pianto’ topic’.\textsuperscript{119} While still associating it with the keyboard fantasias, it is the appoggiatura that Monelle claims gives the music its emotional disposition:

Here the formula always resolves a dissonance and is always stressed; that is, it is an appoggiatura. An example is given from a fantasia in the Musikalisches Vielerley of 1770. It shows a series of pianti, each dissonant, ending with the recitative formula of a falling fourth. In this very chromatic passage, all figures are minor seconds. Elsewhere, major seconds

\textsuperscript{114} Matthew Head, “Fantasia and Sensibility”, OHTT, 264.
\textsuperscript{116} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{118} Ratner, CM, 22.
\textsuperscript{119} Monelle, SM, 31.
alternate freely with minor, often keeping the figure within the mode. This is the true style of *Empfindsamkeit* [...] And, indeed, the figure may rise as well as fall.\(^{120}\)

### 1.4. Singing Style/Singing Allegro

Ratner describes the singing style as 'music in a lyric vein, with a moderate tempo and a melodic line, featuring relatively slow note values and a rather narrow range'.\(^{121}\) Sarah Day O'Connell disparages this description as 'certainly the shortest—and arguably the least clear'.\(^{122}\) In an attempt to clarify the style, while also admitting it 'is complicated, multifaceted, and elusive', O'Connell identifies the signifiers of the singing style as features of vocal composition and vocal performance. She writes that '[a]спектs of vocal performance that could serve as signifiers of the singing style, then, include vibrato, *messa di voce*, legato, *dragg*, and *rubato*'.\(^{123}\) The compositional features, initially, are summarised by Koch, in his *Musikalische Lexicon*:

> ‘Singing’ [*Singend*] is generally the quality of melody that makes it able to be performed with ease by the human voice. In particular it is understood, however, to indicate a comprehensible and smooth melody, as opposed to the uneven, angular, or so-called Baroque. [...] In a limited sense, one uses the word ‘singing’ or *cantabile* also (1) in order to distinguish the gentler portions of a piece from the very active, so one says, for example, the singer performed the passagework better than the *cantabile* or singing phrases; (2) one indicates with *cantabile* or ‘singing’ a phrase of slower motion, the melody of which is to such a great extent singable, that no acquisition of training and the like is required.\(^{124}\)

O'Connell emphasises Koch's use of the word "comprehensible" as the main compositional signifier, which leads to the topic's signified, described by O'Connell

---

\(^{120}\) Ibid., 70–71.

\(^{121}\) Ratner, *CM*, 19.

\(^{122}\) Sarah Day O'Connell, “The Singing Style”, *OHTT*, 238.

\(^{123}\) Ibid., 248. “Dragg” is defined by the early eighteenth century singing master Pier Francesco Tosi as ‘When on an even and regular Movement of a Bass, which proceeds slowly, a Singer begins with a high Note, dragging it gently down to a low one, with the *Forte* and *Piano*, almost gradually, with Inequality of Motion, that is to say, stopping a little more on some Notes in the Middle, than on those that begin or end the *Strascino* or Dragg.’ (Pier Francesco Tosi, *Observations on the Florid Song*, ed. Gregory Blankenbehler (Lexington: Pitch Perfect, 2009), 77; Capitals in original)

\(^{124}\) Koch, *Musikalische Lexicon*, 1,390–1,391.
as ‘the culture of singing, the network of associations around the act of singing’. Through explorations of literary examples from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries the author conveys certain ‘established [cultural] tropes: beauty and simplicity; the amateur, feminine, private domain; the service to “social pleasure” that, in turn plays an elevating role “advantageous to the heart, taste, and understanding”’. Ratner also identifies a subset of the singing style, the singing allegro. The difference between the two, it seems, is purely one of speed. The singing allegro, however, refers to ‘a song-like melody set in quick tempo; it is accompanied by steadily repeated rapid notes or by broken chord figures’. It is the ‘perpetual and even motion of the “Alberti” bass figure’ that is the defining feature of this topic, a signifier also associated with the aria, thus cementing the song-like facet of this instrumental topic. Ratner also identifies a subset of the singing style, the singing allegro. The difference between the two, it seems, is purely one of speed. The singing allegro, however, refers to ‘a song-like melody set in quick tempo; it is accompanied by steadily repeated rapid notes or by broken chord figures’. It is the ‘perpetual and even motion of the “Alberti” bass figure’ that is the defining feature of this topic, a signifier also associated with the aria, thus cementing the song-like facet of this instrumental topic.

Example 1.8: Singing Style. Haydn, “The Heavens are telling the glory of God”, bb. 1–4.

Allegro

Monelle claims that the singing allegro as a topic was not recognised by eighteenth-century historians such as Koch (1802) and Daube (1797). The singing style as it is represented in instrumental music, however, was separated by Koch into the singing style and the flowing style. The flowing style consisted of ‘largely narrow intervals, which are played smoothly rather than accented’, while the singing style contained ‘many leaping intervals and many stressed notes’. As Day O’Connell explains, the associations of the singing style rely heavily on the cultural trace of the particular instance analysed. For example, if it is an aria, it has associations with the high class, church music and theatre music. The Lied is

125 Day O’Connell, “The Singing Style”, 239.
126 Ibid., 254. The novels mentioned are Mary Hays The Victim of Prejudice, 1799, George Eliot Middlemarch, 1874.
127 Ratner, CM, 19.
128 Ibid.
129 Allanbrook, Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart, 8.
130 Koch, Musikalisches Lexicon, 554; Johann, F. Daube, Anleitung zur Erfindung der Melodie und ihrer Fortsetzung (Vienna: Funk, 1789), 10, quoted in Monelle, SM, 26.
131 Koch, Musikalisches Lexicon, 1,390.
associated with middle class chamber music, while folk song is associated with low class theatrical music.

1.5. Military Style

The military style topical class has two signifiers: the military march (including the equestrian march), and the trumpet call or fanfare. The topic evokes overtones of the noble houses and their court guards, as well as suggestions of medieval valour and idealistic heroism. It is a topic that has endured through the ages, having been found in Mozart's compositions through to Wagner's, despite the changing face of war. Monelle explains why, despite the way in which war has developed through the centuries, the topic is still recognisable, even by audiences of the twenty-first century:

Even a straightforward topic like the military fanfare may function associatively for a modern audience, who are sensitive of the slightly strutting pomp of the figure’s character without realizing that this is conveyed by its origin as a military trumpet call. In this case, the topic is functioning, in the first place, through the indexicality of its original signification; the latter has been forgotten, and the signification has become arbitrary, to use Saussure's term.  

1.5.a. The Fanfare

A fanfare is in essence a rhythmised arpeggio, making it an exceptionally portable topic capable of employment in nearly any formal aspect. For example in Edward Elgar’s Pomp and Circumstance No. 2 (Example 1.9) it is utilised to reintroduce the opening subject. Whether it is orchestrated for the trumpet, or another instrument, this topic is indexical as it reproduces styles and repertoires from somewhere else, rather than replicating something specific, in this instance the parade ground. Therefore the ‘rhythmised arpeggio’ may be played on other instruments, or altered chromatically to produce a ‘dysphoric fanfare’. The fanfare itself can have contrasting functions, as a trumpet ‘signal’ to give orders to the troops, or as a flourish used with ‘purely aesthetic or ceremonial intentions’.

---

132 Monelle, TMT, 113; For further discussion of this topic see Andrew Haringer, “Hunt, Military, and Pastoral Topics”, OHTT, 197–203.
133 Monelle, SM, 67.
134 Agawu, PWS, 48; also see Stephen Rumph, “Topical Figurae: The Double Articulation of Topics”, OHTT, 503–506.
135 Monelle, SM, 17.
136 Ibid., 43.
137 Ibid., 136.

1.5.b. The March

The march evolved from the ‘parade ground and battlefield, where its moderately quick duple meter, dotted rhythms, and bold manner quickened the spirit’.\(^{138}\) The dotted rhythms, the march’s main signifier, ‘are the most felicitous impetus for stepping in time, since a short, snappy upbeat emphasises the note which follows it’.\(^{139}\) The phrases are often organised into two-bar units, employing major tonalities, and characteristically, although not essentially, wind and brass orchestration (Example 1.10).

In the eighteenth century, the march had both dance and ceremonial associations. It served to remind the audience of the ‘cavalier and manly virtues ascribed to him’.\(^{140}\) The march, like the minuet, is easily adapted to different situations, and therefore has various recognisable varieties, for instance, rustic, civic, church, military and funeral.\(^{141}\) Monelle also outlines ‘equestrian marches’ which are in compound time, 12/8 or 6/8, as the dotted rhythms and triplet signifiers are easily adapted to this metre. The distinction between the two can be heard in the ‘galloping’ rhythm of the equestrian march accentuated by the compound time signature, bringing to mind the cavalry charges rather than infantry marches, and is connected to the noble horse of the hunt topic. The military topic is also linked to the hunt topical class through similarities in their brass calls. The fanfare and the horn

\(^{138}\) Ratner, CM, 16.
\(^{139}\) Allanbrook, Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart, 117.
\(^{140}\) Ratner, CM, 16.
\(^{141}\) Monelle, SM, 26.
fifths (sometimes also termed horn calls) are similar due to their rhythmic properties, the difference being that horn calls are usually harmonically based on a tonic–dominant–tonic progression, whereas the fanfare is arpeggio based. The connotations of the topics are both aristocratic, but with an urban outlook for the military topic and a rural aspect to the hunt (outlined below). This is shown in chapter 3.


1.6. Hunt Style

Culturally, the hunt is often portrayed as a favourite pastime of the nobility, and it is this learned convention that Ratner uses to justify the high class association of this topic. Monelle, however, acquaints the reader with the idea that ‘much hunting was ignoble, squalid, and cruel during this period’.\textsuperscript{142} It is, then, ‘the cultural hunt—the chasse écrite—that remained heroic and glorious’.\textsuperscript{143} It is the idea of the hunt, rather than the bloody reality of it, that is symbolised by this topic, making the signification arbitrary in a way similar to the military topic outlined above. The hunt topic eventually became synonymous with the forest, an association which continued through the Romantic period, and thus with the myths and fairy stories that emerged from the forest—nymphs, dryads etc.—adding romantic and supernatural facets to the topic. Generic hunt signifiers include ‘6/8 meter, triadic melodies outlining primarily tonic and dominant chords, horn-call bicinia, and regular

\textsuperscript{142} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{143} Ibid.
periodicity'; however, in addition two common subtopics of the hunt topical class are outlined below.144

1.6.a. Horn Fifths

Contained within the broad topical class of the hunt are two subtopics—horn fifths and the horse topic. In contrast to the military trumpet signal, the hunting horn sounded only a single note, therefore their calls were merely rhythmic.145 Despite this, hunting signals, outlined fully in Monelle’s *The Musical Topic*, are numerous, with many different connotations. Horn fifths, like the fanfare, are normally associated with 'announcements and opening gestures'.146 However, because, like the fanfare, the horn fifth can ascend or descend, it can be utilised as both an opening and closing gesture.147 The harmonic process is also distinct in this topic, employing a motion from tonic, to dominant and back again, giving it a stable and quite powerful characteristic sound.148

*Example 1.11: Horn Fifths. Mozart, Sonata in F, K. 332, bb. 9–17.*

![Example 1.11: Horn Fifths. Mozart, Sonata in F, K. 332, bb. 9–17.](image)

1.6.b. The Horse

Although often connected with the hunt topic, for obvious reasons, this topic signifies several contrasting images. Largely confined to music of the period after about 1800, the topic of the galloping horse references the 'medieval, legendary or fictional times', a noble creature, with a valiant association.149 The horse has been found in evidence in texted pieces such as Brahms’s *Magelone* songs (1869) and Schumann’s *Wilde Reiter* (from the *Album for the Young*, 1848).150 Monelle posits that there are two types of musical horse, the first in triplets in equal quavers, often very rapid (Example 1.13), and the second type in a dotted quaver rhythm, requiring it to be played slower if it is to be kept precise. A good example of this second type

146 Agawu, *PWS*, 45.
148 Ibid., 119.
149 Monelle, *SM*, 47.
150 Ibid., 44–60.
is “Die Post” from Schubert’s song cycle *Winterreise*, Op. 89 (Example 1.13a). The two types signify different facets of the topic; the first type may ‘often refer to the aspect of war and battles’. The second type, with its dotted rhythms and 6/8 metre, is easily combined with the march topic to form an equestrian march. As such, Monelle justifies that ‘the earlier horses have clearly a great deal of symbolic signification; the noble horse is not merely an icon, but a true musical topic’. The equestrian topic, like the fanfare, has a dysphoric form, typically associated with the witches’ Sabbath, as, for example, in Berlioz’s *Symphonie Fantastique*, where the idée fixé ‘turns into a grotesque version of the second type, shrieked by the E flat clarinet’ (Example 1.12).

*Example 1.12: Dysphoric Horse. Berlioz, Symphonie Fantastique, “Song d’une nuit du sabbat”, bb. 41–49. Piano score arranged by Liszt (S. 470, 1836).*

---

151 Monelle, *TMT*, 54.
152 Ibid., 56–59.
153 Ibid.
154 Monelle, *SM*, 47.

The hunt topic is associated with the low-style pastoral topic, as it connotes the countryside, with forests and open fields through which the hunt chases; yet rather than being associated with the rural peasant class, as the pastoral topic tends to be, it instead signifies the rural aristocracy. Through the hunt style’s link with the military and the pastoral topic, it can be used as a pivotal topic within the dialectic of the work so that a piece can begin with the military topic and end with the pastoral topic without the use of any major transformative devices.

Table 1.3 shows the signifiers that can be used as the fulcrum which the discourse can pivot around, or can be used to give more depth to a superficial dialectic. For instance, the hunt topic can be introduced within a pastoral setting to provide a more complete landscape in which the work is set.

*Table 1.3: The Similarities Between the Three Large Topical Classes.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Signifier</th>
<th>Signifier</th>
<th>Signifier</th>
<th>Connotation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Fanfare</td>
<td>March dotted rhythm</td>
<td>Horse triple meter</td>
<td>Military Aristocratic Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunt</td>
<td>Horn fifth</td>
<td></td>
<td>Horse triple meter</td>
<td>Aristocratic Rural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pastoral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dance dotted rhythm</td>
<td>Dance triple meter</td>
<td>Peasant Rural</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.7. *The Pastoral Topic*

Where most topics can be codified as *either* high, middle or low class, the pastoral topic encompasses all three. This topic is a large topical class which encompasses a hierarchy of topics and signifiers that, singly or combined, imply the pastoral topic. At the lowest level are signifiers that cannot be used individually, and therefore cannot be called topics, for example the timbre of the flute and oboe, or bagpipe drones which mimic the shepherd with his pipe, a classic pastoral image. These become significant only when combined with subtopics that are recognisable when functioning alone; in this case, the musette, siciliano, gigue and the pastorale itself. These are subtopics rather than fully-fledged topics because even when they do function independently of the others they still imply the pastoral world, signified by
pedal points and ostinati, promoting temporal and harmonic stasis, and ‘the quality of simplicity from which a cultivated person could learn’. This quality is achieved by limiting the vocal range and minimising leaps, while keeping the rhythm repetitive and dance-like.

Monelle quotes Hermann Jung when suggesting that the signifieds of the pastoral topic are two conflicting views of country life: the ‘heavenly paradise’ on one hand and the ‘evocation of brute peasantry’ on the other. These polarised associations became more significant in light of the dream of escapism that became common in the early 1900s, when industrialisation drew labourers into the towns and cities. The town dwellers longed to “get back to nature”, or at least their idealised, simplified version of this idyllic paradise; this topic then highlighted the town dwellers’ attitude of superiority over the peasant population.

Hatten, rather than suggesting that these represent conflicting views, instead suggests they are the product of a ‘gradual (historical) growth process in which the pastoral is raised in significance from rustic simplicity or gracelessness; through the revaluation of simplicity as elegant and graceful [...] leading to the elevation of simplicity to sublimity, suggesting spiritual grace, serenity, or transcendence’. In this way, Hatten bridges the gap left between the heavenly and earthly pastoral of Monelle’s concept.

1.8. Low Class Topics

1.8.a. Turkish Style

Because the low class is more the upper class’s notion of the lower class, rather than a real representation of the lower class, these topics tend toward the comic or grotesque. For example, the opera buffa style and Turkish music were often used to inject some comedy into a scene, or piece of music. Turkish music, as Mozart knew it, was used to evoke nuances of exotic places and was the result of ‘long military and diplomatic confrontation of Western nations with the Turks. The Turks had a colourful military style called janissary music, using drums, triangle, winds and cymbals’. In Mozart’s opera Die Entführung aus dem Serail (1782), he used Turkish inferences as comic counterpoint to Osmin’s rage, invoking the ‘play’ on

---

156 Ibid., 220.
158 Hatten, Musical Meaning in Beethoven, 80.
159 Ratner, CM, 3.
160 Ratner, CM, 21.
topics that is so easily executed when utilising the class system that is being outlined. Although for many topics the meaningfulness of the class signification can change through time, the signification of nationalistic topics has remained the same into the nineteenth century as they are linked to the Volk, folk or commoner.

Jonathan Bellman suggests that Turkish music, as a topic, is in fact a stylised dialect, loosely based on the real thing.\textsuperscript{161} Ralph Locke, in his book \textit{Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections}, provides an extensive list of the gestures of \textit{alla turca} style:

Keys with few sharps or flats; simple harmonic vocabulary with little harmonic change; sudden shifting from one tonal area to another; duple meter; repeated notes (or thirds) in melodies and repeated brief rhythmic figures; specific repeated rhythmic patterns; unison textures and parallel part writing; melodies decorated by neighbour notes or escape notes; long note-values at the beginning of a phrase; quick melodic decorations; melodic motion that moves rapidly stepwise up and down or “hops” back and forth between two notes; loud playing and full instrumentation; percussive instruments; modal touches in the melodic line; phraseological inanity or impulsivity; simplicity of phrase structure and form; and other features that somehow “characterise” the area and its inhabitants.\textsuperscript{162}

Bellman posits that these signifiers suggest a ‘lack of musical sophistication’ through a ‘mechanical approach to music-making’, which lends an air of contempt to the music, highlighting its use as a source of comic value.\textsuperscript{163}

\textit{Example 1.14: Turkish Style. Beethoven, Turkish March, bb. 1–4.}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{example114}
\caption{Example 1.14: Turkish Style. Beethoven, Turkish March, bb. 1–4.}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{161} Jonathan Bellman, “Toward a Lexicon for the \textit{Style hongrois}”, \textit{The Journal of Musicology} 9, no. 2 (Spring 1991), 218.


\textsuperscript{163} Bellman. “Toward a Lexicon for the \textit{Style hongrois}”, 218.
1.8.b. Opera Buffa

*Opera buffa* rose to popularity in Italy and then abroad over the course of the eighteenth century. As a comic opposition to *opera seria*, *opera buffa* reflected a perception of everyday life with both comic and serious characters. This was achieved using local settings and dialects, cementing the association of the topic with the lower classes, and an often witty observation of the human condition within a contemporary context.\(^{164}\) The topic as recognisable in instrumental music is, Mary Hunter writes, ambiguous. Ratner describes ‘comic-rhetoric’, rather than *opera buffa* specifically, as ‘quick juxtapositions of contrasting ideas, short lively figures, active interplay of dialogue, light textures, marked articulation, [and] unexpected turns’.\(^{165}\) The main signifier for this topic, Allanbrook suggests, is ‘an all-inclusive image of a peopled topological space, […] without the precise story-bound meanings that a text provides’.\(^{166}\) Therefore, a variety of contrasting topics, particularly contrasting in class, will inevitably bring into play ideas of dialogism and theatricality, at which point, Hunter explains, opera will be invoked.\(^{167}\) The signifiers listed by Hunter that ‘most effectively and unambiguously’ signify the *opera buffa* topic are

a) patter, b) short, neutral, recitative-like vocal fragments within a more highly profiled orchestral "blanket", and c) highly gestural and illustrative orchestral accompaniments. These are devices that essentially never appear in serious opera, and that are routinely used at the most "stereotypical" moments of opera buffa.\(^{168}\)

1.9. Structural Topics

The Mannheim rocket (not discussed here), *coup d’archet*, brilliant style and cadenza topics are all firmly rooted in the Classical style as common features in the works of Mozart, Haydn and others.\(^{169}\) They are united by their formal possibilities as each of these topics is suited to a certain place within a piece of work, whether it

---


\(^{165}\) Ratner, CM, 395.


\(^{167}\) Hunter, “Topics and Opera Buffa”, 62.

\(^{168}\) Ibid., 79.

\(^{169}\) A description of the Mannheim rocket has been omitted because it does not appear within the music analysed in the following thesis. A discussion of the topic can be found in Caplin, "On the Relation of Musical Topoi in Formal Function", 166.
is as an initiating progression, like the Mannheim rocket, or more fitting as a cadential function, like the brilliant style. Moreover, as these topics are so closely associated with a particular section of a piece, they add an extra element to the discourse when used elsewhere.

1.9.a. Coup d’archet

The *coup d’archet* (Example 1.15) is a fast, ascending, triplet upbeat that is often played as a unison tutti passage. This device, Sisman claims, reflects ‘the grand-style drama not only of the overture but of the Paris-Mannheim symphonic style which tended to begin with a big tutti passage in unison’.

In this way, it is usually associated with the beginning of a work. However, it can also be used at the end as ‘a return to grandeur in a closing gesture’.

*Example 1.15: Coup d’Archet. Mozart, Symphony No. 38 in D major (“Prague”), K. 504, First Movement.*

1.9.b. Brilliant Style

The term “brilliant” is used to describe virtuosic, rapid passages with repeated semiquaver rhythms, which Ratner claims display ‘intense feeling’. Monelle, however, disagrees with this, stating that ‘their purpose is generally to indicate a shift of temporality’. He goes on to link the topic with the notion of ‘Classical topics’, positing that ‘since shifts of temporality are a vital part of the indexicality of Classical music, the identification of the “brilliant style” is a matter of importance’.

The brilliant style is also one of the topics ascribed a possible formal function by Caplin, as, ‘if a given case of the brilliant style brings about a general liquidation

---

174 Monelle, *TMT*, 27.
of motivic content, then that topic might lend itself well to a cadential function.

Galeazzi confirms that brilliant passagework is often employed after passages of gentle character, and that in instrumental music the most difficult passages close with a final cadence. The cadenza topic (see Figure 1.2) is a section of music that brings to mind the improvisatory cadenzas of the Classical concerto. While bearing similarities to the virtuosic technicalities of the brilliant style it is the rhythmic flexibility that sets it apart from the previous topic.


1.10. Late Eighteenth- to Early Nineteenth-Century Topics

By the beginning of the nineteenth century, the topical world began to reflect the changes that were emerging in the musical landscape. Emotional meaningfulness became more important to composers; hence, topics became centred on emotion and drama. Formal considerations also became less strict, works took on a larger

---

176 Francesco Galeazzi, Elementi teorico-practici di musica (Rome: Pucinelli, 1796), 256, quoted in Agawu, PWS, 27.
scale, and composers began utilising topics that reflected this transformation. Similarly, other topics ‘went out of style’, for example the structural topics expounded above. Other topics, such as the sensibility style, the bourrée and contredanse outlined above, and the fantasia topic below, while existing before the nineteenth century, became more prominent in the 1800s as their employment was more suited to the Romantic style.

It was at this point that the middle classes began to form, and certain topics became synonymous with the middle class. With the technological advances that came with the industrialisation of Western Europe, small-scale manufacturing gave way to large-scale industry, and subsequently large-scale capitalists. Karl Marx initially introduced the notion of the bourgeois class as a primary category in his explanation of the development of capitalism. In Marx’s usage of the term he did not always infer only the owner of factories, but also often included doctors and lawyers, and the term has since come to include any urban dweller whose life is stable and whose income is not derived from manual labour.177 Moore classifies the bourgeoisie as ‘the town dwellers, mainly the upper stratum’, the people that both fostered and profited from the industrialisation of the towns.178 Through the industrial revolution, Gill therefore suggests, the middle class ‘destroyed feudal, patriarchal relations and replaced them with the commodity tie that Marx saw as being the hallmark of capitalism’.179 By expanding their businesses to such a large scale, the bourgeois class were able to buy nobility, purchasing land and titles, which is how they were able to construct a new set of social relations and institutional structures. With regard to the topical situation in the late 1700s, this means that there were not middle-style topics of the time. Only retrospectively have these topics been placed in this categorisation.

The bourrée and contredanse were two such middle-class topics. The rising bourgeoisie of the early nineteenth century who sought to gain entrance to the aristocracy, or rise to a higher standing in their own class, often mimicked the style of living they aspired to. The eighteenth-century court dances were considered easy to learn, and as dance halls became more common these dances became

179 Gill, Bourgeoisie, State and Democracy.
particularly popular. The lament and pianto topics also changed association, as they gradually came to be associated with the sensibility topic.

1.10.a. Fantasia

In earlier centuries the term fantasia described an imaginative idea, as opposed to a structured formal composition. The two key aspects of the fantasia were that it lacked text, and was therefore free of the confines of word-setting, and was designed to exhibit the contrapuntal expertise of the composer.\textsuperscript{180} Common between the fantasias of the nineteenth century and earlier periods was the idea of the piece being left to the composer to ‘add, diminish and alter at his pleasure’.\textsuperscript{181} The nineteenth-century genre, however, is always notated whereas the earlier composers often improvised. C.P.E. Bach, the composer to whom both Monelle and Ratner credit the establishment of the fantasia, categorises these types as the strict fantasy (notated) and the free fantasy (remaining unmeasured and improvised). The treatment of the source material, Bach stressed, must display ‘a high level of originality in an effort to overwhelm and surprise the listener’.\textsuperscript{182} His technical suggestions to achieve this include meandering through various tonal centres as a means of ‘disorienting the listener’.\textsuperscript{183}

For Romantic composers the fantasy offers an alternative to rigid forms, such as the sonata form, and an opportunity to explore a more creative genre; and in this period, Eklund posits, there is a second facet to the fantasia as it is ‘applied to virtuoso pieces based on a given theme from a popular source’.\textsuperscript{184} These fantasias were often derived from sources such as opera arias or national folk tunes resembling a theme and variations structure. The fantasia style is recognised by a strong feeling of improvisation. It should display ‘elaborate figuration, shifting harmonies, chromatic conjunct bass lines, sudden contrasts, full textures or disembodied melodic figures’.\textsuperscript{185} In short, it should be structurally, rhythmically and harmonically ambiguous, implying a ‘lack of order and discipline’.\textsuperscript{186}

\textsuperscript{180} Jennifer Lynn Eklund, \textit{Ferdinand Ries and the Concerted Fantasy} (Master’s thesis, Bob Cole Conservatory of Music, 2010), 50–51.
\textsuperscript{181} Thomas Morley, \textit{A Plaine and Easy Introduction to Practicall Musicke}, repr., (Westmead, UK: Gregg, 1971), 181, quoted in Eklund, \textit{Ferdinand Ries and the Concerted Fantasy}, 51.
\textsuperscript{182} Eklund. \textit{Ferdinand Ries and the Concerted Fantasy}, 53.
\textsuperscript{183} Ibid., 60.
\textsuperscript{184} Ibid., 58.
\textsuperscript{185} Ratner, \textit{CM}, 24.
\textsuperscript{186} Agawu, \textit{PWS}, 114.
1.11. **Topic Analysis in Action**

To understand the notion of topic analysis it is crucial to see how one topic is used in different situations, how it changes throughout a piece, or how it differs between different works. As such, what follows is a demonstration of how the *alla breve* topic functions in three different pieces: two of Beethoven’s String Quartets, Opp. 18 and 132, and Mozart’s Quintet in C, K. 515.

The first illustration of this topic is from the first movement of Beethoven’s String Quartet in A minor, Op. 132. The topic appears as the opening phrase of this movement, immediately creating a contrast between the learned style, of which the *alla breve* is a part, and a sense of fantasy created by ‘slow tempo, soft dynamics, and generic thwarting of expectations’. Here the topic is presented as an ‘almost fugal-expository imitation’ in *alla breve* tempo. The music then proceeds, from bars 9–10, to exemplify the cadenza topic, which, being in such opposition to the strict opening topic, serves to highlight both topics, lending them more significance than if it had vaguely merged into something similar. This immediately sets up a contrasting topical discourse rather than a complimentary one: for example, had it been followed by a chorale, the topical class of the learned style would still be in play and there would be less scope for narrative interpretation.

The *alla breve* topic reappears throughout the movement, each time bringing with it the same four-note motive, shown in bars 1–2 in the bass in Example 1.17a, illustrating that a topic can be used as a tool to help signpost the important moments for a listener. The learned topic also recurs without the *alla breve* subtopic, but each time it is integrated with another topic, the gavotte or the march (Example 1.10). In this way, the subtopic of *alla breve* is given dominance by being placed on its own where its larger topic is always integrated with a second topic.

Another of Beethoven’s String Quartets, Op. 18, No. 3, also opens with the *alla breve* topic (see Example 1.17b). In this instance the topic is coupled first with a melody in the style of the *galant*, and then as an accompaniment to the cadenza topic. Structurally, the *alla breve* topic is the first to appear in the exposition, development, recapitulation and the coda, before giving way to other topics. This presents a different discursive structure from that presented in Op. 132. Here the *alla breve* topic works in the harmony as a background topic, with the dance in the

\[187\] Ibid.

\[188\] Ibid.
foreground, rather than the topics appearing as sequential segments as they did in Op. 132.

Lastly, this topic can be seen in Mozart’s Quintet in C, K. 515, first movement. This topic appears in many other of Mozart’s String Quintets, as detailed in Agawu’s *Playing With Signs*.

In these quintets it is often coupled with its topical class, the learned style, as it is in this work. It first appears at bar 34 as an accompaniment to another signifier of the learned style, a canonic imitation derived from the melody of the previous sensibility theme (bars 4–5, 9–10 etc.). This is followed by the simplistic melody and bass drone of the pastoral topic, the statement of which echoes the contrasting discourse of Op. 132, as, in combination with a change of melodic content, it changes the class associations of the work from high class learned convention to the rural peasantry associated with the pastoral. The *alla breve*/learned topic becomes the main subject, or ‘fully fledged’ as Agawu puts it, at bar 171 (Example 1.17c), remaining so until the music resolves into a musette topic, a subtopic of the pastoral and therefore moving once again from high to low class associations. In this piece, then, the *alla breve* can be seen as a transitory topic between the two class systems.

*Example 1.17: The Alla Breve Topic.*

(a) *Beethoven, String Quartet Op. 132, bb. 1–6.*

(b) *Beethoven, String Quartet Op. 18, No. 3, bb. 1–7.*

---

189 Ibid., 88–89.
Having seen how one topic can act in different ways in different works there follows an exploration of Agawu’s complete analyses of the first movements of Mozart’s Piano Sonata in F Major, K. 332 and Beethoven’s String Quartet in A minor, Op. 132.190 These works have been chosen as they represent a wide range of topics and styles of composition.

1.11.a. Mozart, Piano Sonata in F Major, K. 332, First Movement

This analysis has been chosen because of the ‘topical interplay’ that is at the heart of the movement. Agawu suggests the topical discourse ‘unfolds, enhancing, contradicting, predicting, or simply highlighting the harmonic points being made’.191 The first topic is an ‘aria accompanied by an Albertilike [sic] bass’, coupled with a ‘suppressed musette’.192 The musette topic has been identified through the pieces ‘refusal to make explicit its potential harmonic activity’, giving the phrase a harmonic

---

190 Ibid., 80–99.
191 Ibid., 44–45.
192 Ibid., 45.
stasis redolent of the musette pedal.\textsuperscript{193} Straightaway, then, the contrasting play of topics, which Agawu states as important to this movement, is portrayed. Agawu uses the ‘historicist nature of Mozart’s discourse’ and ‘the adaptation of topical material to structural articulation’ as good reasons for finding topics in this work; however, he does not really provide a meaningful interpretation of the specific topics used.\textsuperscript{194} The juxtaposition between the aria topic and the learned topic is based solely on the ‘unsingable’ and ‘jagged’ quality of the melody in the second phrase (bars 5–9), an effect that could have been produced with any number of given topics.

By placing this section within the hierarchical system (Table 1.2 and Figure 1.1), the multilevel associations inherent throughout become clear. On a purely musical level the opposition can be seen between the smooth aria topic, and later between the minuet (bars 9–12) with the ‘jagged’ learned topic. It would seem, therefore, that the conventional associations of the class system make the interpreted plot lines apparent. The class distinction between the high-class aria and the low-class musette set the scene: the aria is identified by its song-like melody, while the musette is identified by its harmonic and structural signifiers. The learned topic is therefore dissimilar to both the aria’s melodic characteristics and the musette’s harmonic and structural characteristics.

The learned topic leads in turn to the high-class minuet (emerging in bars 9–12), which then becomes the main topic of the movement, although Agawu suggests it has been there in the background throughout. Agawu describes the process the minuet goes through as ‘varying degrees of foregrounding’, this being superseded from bar 41 onwards when the topic appears only as itself, not joined by any others as it is in the previous occasions.\textsuperscript{195} As the minuet continues in the background at bar 12 it is ‘fused’ with a set of hunt-calls, producing a minuet in hunt style rather than two separate topics. This fusion results from the fact that ‘the horn duet’s intervallic pattern is entirely compatible with the meter-invariant minuet’.\textsuperscript{196} The requisite repetition of the hunt call is also used to emphasise the closure at the end of the phrase, thereby taking advantage of a structural element of this topic. This element, Agawu argues, is what ‘lends weight to an interpretive approach rooted in topic’, and goes on to suggest that without the notion of topic, it would be

\textsuperscript{193} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{194} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{195} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{196} Ibid.
difficult to provide a convincing argument for the 'juxtaposition at the beginning of a sonata of two periods'. While what Agawu argues is certainly vital when looking at this music, he does not actually present a meaningful topically rooted analysis. However, by exploring the topics present throughout the section a unifying factor can be found: that of the pastoral topical class. The musette-like harmonic stasis, the simplicity of the learned topic's imitation and the unison of the minuet provide the gracefulness associated with the pastoral, confirmed further by the use of hunt-style horn fifths (Figure 1.3).

Figure 1.3: An Analysis of Mozart's Piano Sonata in F Major, K. 332/i, First Movement, bb. 1–22.

The next period opens with a 'plunge into D minor' and two related topics, tempesta and fantasia. The opposition of this section is not just a topical one as the key has suddenly changed to minor, the pace has accelerated and the music is less melodically consistent. Tempesta is the predominant topic here, although as both topics signify instability it is not an important issue. The marked contrast of the unpredictability and declamatory style of the tempesta topic to the simplicity and harmonic stasis of the pastoral topic is important, however, and as such has a bearing on the structural potential of the topic. As detailed earlier the instability of the topics makes them perfect for these inherently variable transitional passages, helping the music to progress to the next theme. Of the rest of the exposition, the minuet continues its dominance, overlaid with fleeting appearances of other topics. The 'amoroso sentiment', with its 'stroking two-against-three rhythm', emerges

---

197 Ibid.
198 Ibid., 47. Agawu's use of the term Sturm und Drang in this analysis has been replaced by the term tempesta, in order to maintain consistency.
briefly in bars 49–50, and the tempesta from bar 56, giving way to a ‘musette-like stasis’ in bar 67. Finally, ‘as is appropriate to the tonicisation of the second key, a flourish in the form of brilliant style (bars 86–90) confirms the priority of C major’. The simplicity of the initial section has therefore been lost; the rhythmic intricacies of the other topics, culminating in the most complex of topics—the brilliant style—have taken over.

1.11.b. Beethoven, String Quartet in A Minor, Op. 132, First Movement
As discussed above, the first movement opens with a fusion of the alla breve/learned style and the contrasting fantasia topic. This is followed in bars 9–10 by a cadenza, suggested by its ‘improvisatory, virtuosic and unmeasured manner’. There is then an allusion to the march in the dotted figure of the cello in bar 11, ‘whose narrow range and sighing effect hints simultaneously at singing style’. This march is, however, a ‘defective’ march as it is missing its downbeat; the ‘ideal’ march does not occur until the end of the movement.

Within the march we hear ‘hints’ of the learned style in bars 15–17 in a canonic discourse between the first violin, viola, and second violin, before a ‘celebratory triadic outline’ depicts a fanfare. It is, perhaps, the presence of the fanfare at this point that retrospectively confirms the allusion to the march that Agawu hears from bar 11, as the dotted rhythm alone is not enough to signify this military topic. It is possible to consider this passage as an illustration of the sensibility topic, however, as the appoggiatura signifier is present throughout the passage, as is the sentimental mood. This topic would also explain the sudden shifts in mood and tempo, what Ratner terms ‘interrupted continuity’, and would correspond more suitably with the minor mode of the piece than the traditionally major march topic.

Agawu does eventually recognise this topic, suggesting that ‘given its disposition within a musical context in which contrast is a premise and such aural flights emerge almost unannounced, we can hear hints of the midcentury sensibility style in measures 19–21’. However, the appoggiatura signifier of this topic is missing from the unison passage, leaving the style recognisable to Agawu only through the sentimental affect normally associated with the topic.

---

199 Ibid., 48.
200 Ibid.
201 Ibid., 114.
202 Ibid.
203 Ibid.
The violin cadenza reappears at bar 22 followed by the sensibility topic from bar 23 onwards, at which point Agawu proposes it ‘begins to establish itself as the main topic’, as can be seen in the revised paradigmatic analysis (Figure 1.4a). A ‘striking, if parenthetical’ gavotte may be heard from bar 40, the opening phrase of the dance imitated from bars 40–43, alluding to the learned topic, and underpinned by the prevalent dotted rhythm. Finally an Italian aria appears, arriving with the second key, ‘complete with an introductory vamp and a near-heterophonic presentation’. Other than the brilliant style, which appears only from bar 176 onwards, no new topics emerge from this point on.

Figure 1.4: A Paradigmatic Analysis of the Topics Present in Beethoven’s Op. 132, bb. 1–120, as outlined by Agawu.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alla Breve</th>
<th>Cadenza</th>
<th>March</th>
<th>Fanfare</th>
<th>Sensibility</th>
<th>Learned Style</th>
<th>Gavotte</th>
<th>Brilliant Style</th>
<th>Fantasy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1–8</td>
<td>9–10</td>
<td>11–19</td>
<td>19–21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>23–29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23–29</td>
<td>28–29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30–35</td>
<td>36–40</td>
<td>40–60</td>
<td>40–60</td>
<td>60–63</td>
<td>60–63</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75–92</td>
<td>75–92</td>
<td></td>
<td>79–102</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102–105</td>
<td>105–113</td>
<td>105–119</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>113–119</td>
<td>119–120</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

204 Ibid.
Figure 1.4a: Revised Paradigmatic Analysis of Beethoven Op. 132.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alla Breve</th>
<th>Cadenza</th>
<th>Sensibility</th>
<th>Fanfare</th>
<th>Learned Style</th>
<th>Gavotte</th>
<th>Brilliant Style</th>
<th>Fantasy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1–8</td>
<td>9–10</td>
<td>11–19</td>
<td>19–21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>23–29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23–29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30–35</td>
<td>36–40</td>
<td>40–60</td>
<td>40–60</td>
<td>60–63</td>
<td>60–63</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64–74</td>
<td>75–92</td>
<td>75–92</td>
<td>79–102</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102–105</td>
<td>105–113</td>
<td>105–119</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>113–119</td>
<td>119–120</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As to the possible ‘plot’ of the movement, Agawu concludes that this is derived from ‘the erratic surface, the understatement of most topics, and the overall quality of instability’.\textsuperscript{205} The oppositions between high and low classes are also mentioned as an ‘attractive framework for a plot’.\textsuperscript{206} This framework is augmented by the inclusion of the notion of sensibility as the main topic, as sensibility is associated most with the middle-class bourgeoisie, but the work is peppered with statements of high-class topics, such as the learned style, \textit{alla breve} and aria. The element of contrast that is mentioned at the start of the discussion of this movement is explained in these conclusions. The instability is formed through the opposition of metrically stable (the \textit{alla breve} and the gavotte) with the intrinsically unstable (the cadenza, sensibility and the aria). The topics themselves are not the ‘clear and forthright’ representations of the Mozart sonata, but ‘understated allusions’, recognisable but ‘lying at strange angles underneath the new surface’.\textsuperscript{207}

Throughout Agawu’s analyses of these two pieces he uses topics to explain the surface oppositions within the works. He touches briefly on the associations with the class system, but does not go so far as to provide a meaningful interpretation of these events. Monelle, however, provides full historical and cultural traces for most topics, but does not tend towards analyses of pieces; rather it appears it is the background of the topics themselves he focuses on in his books, which concentrate specifically on topic analysis. It is clear from Agawu’s analyses, moreover, that he

\textsuperscript{205} Ibid., 117.  
\textsuperscript{206} Ibid.  
\textsuperscript{207} Ibid., 116–117.
feels that topic analysis is not useful purely on its own, but as the extroversive side of a coin, with an introversive analysis (usually paradigmatic or a form of Schenkerian analysis) on the other. By understanding the topical associative hierarchy, however, it should be possible to provide a rounded interpretation of works, or sections of works, with the ‘codes of feelings and passions’ level contributing to the introversive aspect of the analysis.

1.12. Late Nineteenth to Early Twentieth-Century Topics
In the exposition of the fantasia topic it was shown how Romantic composers used the topic to provide them with an alternative structure to the strict Classical form. While some topics are categorically Classical or Baroque in nature, the Mannheim rocket and the learned style being two examples, other topics become transformed, or ‘lie at strange angles underneath a new surface’ as Agawu suggests.\(^{208}\) As the Romantic period continued, so the historical and cultural situation also changed. Composers moved away from the symphonic structure towards large-scale tone poems. Both literature and music became more centred on passion and emotion, and the topics that then emerged as central reflected this. Moreover, just as new topics emerged between the Baroque and Classical period, so new topics emerge within the Romantic era, and therefore bestow a precedent for the manifestation of twentieth-century topics. This also then presents the question whether it is also relevant where, as well as when, the topics emerge, and whether they can therefore be significant to a specific area as well as era. As such, the next chapter provides a survey of the preceding and contemporary culture surrounding the Second Viennese School in order that any “new” topics which emerge from their music can be historically situated.

\(^{208}\) Ibid..
Chapter 2: Viennese History and Topics

If topics are historically situated, then to understand the significance of the topics used in the music of fin-de siècle Vienna it is vital to achieve an understanding of the cultural-historical framework that surrounds the works analysed in this thesis. This should help not only to form a comprehensive narrative provided by known topics, but also to reveal the topics that have disappeared and why, and explain how other topics and their associations have transformed. It will also facilitate the identification of new topics that have emerged because of the critical historical moment in which the music was conceived. By isolating the main themes and issues that occurred at the turn of the twentieth century in Vienna it should be possible to reveal associations between the significant themes and the new topics.

In the last fifty years, the importance of Viennese culture at the turn of the twentieth-century has begun to be recognised and a number of hypotheses offered to explain the significance of this time. The new styles that surfaced at this point in history appeared to be independent of the past, as if, in Carl E. Schorske’s words, ‘history had become useless to [them]’. 209 This is not completely so, however: history had not become ‘useless’, but rather the young Viennese had become disheartened with where their past had brought them. It was not only in music that this aversion to the past was occurring; similar movements were emerging in literature, architecture, philosophy and politics simultaneously. As Allan Janik and Stephen Toulmin have pointed out, attempting to explain one of these movements without exploring the others would be to ignore the most significant point, ‘namely that they were all going on in this same place at this same time’. 210 One can therefore conclude that not only did these movements have an effect on each other’s development, but that the political and social development of Austria at the time had a part to play in their formation.

Schorske, in his authoritative work on fin-de siècle Vienna, presents the thesis that the remarkable emergence of such progression within the arts, psychology and politics, was a result of the ‘failure of liberalism’. 211 This theory proposes that the modernists ‘assaulted’ the ‘value system of classical liberalism-in-

209 Schorske, FV, xvii.
ascendancy within which they had been reared'.\textsuperscript{212} Schorske sets out the different reasons why the failure of liberalism affected the leading figures of the time, focusing on a movement away from the previous generation's rational life into an instinctual one, and the use by the liberals of 'undemocratic devices' to retain power. He also looks at how the artists attempted to integrate with the aristocracy through art, and how the rise of nationalism and anti-Semitism affected Viennese life and politics.

2.1. Liberalism and Rationalism

When in 1867 the Liberal party came to power in Vienna, they came to be associated with rationalist intellectuals and the highly moralistic bourgeois class. The basic beliefs of the Liberals were their faith in reason and progress, their economic power and their cultural elitism. They were characterised by their pro-German stance, resentment of the Catholic Church, and 'a profound distrust of anti-intellectual trends'.\textsuperscript{213} In this way, the Liberal party connected less with the liberalism of the revolutionaries of 1848, and more with the capitalists and, therefore, the Jews.\textsuperscript{214} Meyer explains that the rise of many Jews into ‘financially comfortable circumstances’ caused anxiety in the artisan and shop-keeping classes whose economic territory was threatened.\textsuperscript{215} The Liberal’s method of maintaining power was also questionable, as Janik glibly writes: ‘the liberals were not very liberal and in their own illiberalism provoked an even more dangerous illiberalism that destroyed them politically’.\textsuperscript{216} Here, Janik refers to the act of restricting the franchise to men paying over 10 florins in tax. This excluded the working classes and the Bürgerum or “little men”, alienating, in essence, approximately ninety-five percent of the population, but, crucially, not the “financially comfortable” Jews, prompting the famous quotation from Robert Musil’s novel The Man without Qualities: ‘before the law all citizens were equal, but not everyone, of course, was a citizen’.\textsuperscript{217} The expansion of the franchise, which began in 1882, meant that the disgruntled artisans gained a vote, and in 1897, in an increasing atmosphere of anti-Semitism, the Liberals lost power to Karl Lueger and the Christian Social Party.

\textsuperscript{212} Schorske, FV, xxvi.
\textsuperscript{213} Margaret Notley, “Brahms as Liberal: Genre, Style, and Politics in Late Nineteenth Century Vienna”, 19th-Century Music 17, no. 2 (Fall 1993), 108.
\textsuperscript{214} Schorske, FV, 117–118.
\textsuperscript{216} Janik, “Vienna 1900 Revisited”, 34.
Schorske presents the thesis that the remarkable emergence of such progression within the arts, psychology and politics was a result of the ‘failure of liberalism’. Meyer sums up Schorske’s argument, explaining that ‘Schorske suggests that the rapid rise and equally rapid decline of the fortunes of liberalism caused such bitter disappointment on the part of Vienna’s bourgeoisie that it retreated from the political scene and sought refuge in the aesthetic sphere’. The values of the old Viennese bourgeoisie centred upon rationalism and positivism—upon the ideal of a man with disciplined conformity and moralistic good taste—and it was against this that the young Viennese rebelled. They felt there was a side to life that could not be dealt with rationally, an emotional side their fathers were repressing, and to them ‘human beings ignored emotions at their peril’. Within the universities, Schorske writes, the politics of Richard Wagner and Friedrich Nietzsche formed the new cultural rationale. He explains that,

[c]ritical of the rational state and the scientific spirit, both thinkers exalted archaic Greek culture as models for the regeneration of German society. Wagner added to the glorification of the polis the special allure of Germanic myth, thus enriching his archaic communitarian vision with a national-populist appeal for the young German militants. Both thinkers affirmed instinct, vindicating its claims against "bourgeois" reason and the analytic spirit.

Schorske suggests that the ‘generational rebellion against the fathers’ and their values could be the reason for the ‘sharp break from a tie with the past’, but only on

---

218 This term is taken from Janik, “Vienna 1900 Revisited”, 32.
220 Rationalists are defined as those that argue we can best understand the world through reason and logic, not only through experience. They are usually associated specifically with three Renaissance philosophers: Descartes (1596–1650), Leibniz (1646–1716) and Spinoza (1632–1677) who reacted against the authoritative tradition of the ideas set out by Aristotle in the fourth-century BC in favour of rational and scientific investigation. The key notions are first a priori knowledge—“Some ideas are true independent of experience”, such as mathematical propositions, things which are true by definition, and self-evident truths (e.g. ‘I think therefore I am’). Second is the concept of innate ideas—“Some ideas are present from birth”, they do not require proof or experience, but are merely concepts present from birth (e.g. ‘I have a body’). Last is logical necessity—“Some things cannot be conceived of as otherwise”. This is the idea of necessity; specifically something is true because it cannot be otherwise—it is an absolute certainty. For example: ‘I have to study to pass my exams’ is not a logical necessity, you might just be lucky enough or bright enough not to have to study and is therefore an empirical necessity which you know to be true through previous experience; but ‘to have three things I must have more than two’ is a logical necessity.
221 Hannah Hickman, Robert Musil & the Culture of Vienna (Kent: Croom Helm, 1984), 45.
the most obvious level.223 It is interesting however that Schorske, unlike other scholars, considers both of the generation’s values—the first moral and scientific, and the second aesthetic—as part of the liberal culture. Other scholars portray the new generation as moving away from the political altogether and, Beller suggests, into the ‘cultural temple of the aesthetic and psychological, where the historical world held no sway’.224 Beller continues that modernism therefore appears to be the ‘introspective response of artists and thinkers who, in Schorske’s phrase, ‘were not so much alienated from their class as with it’.”225 Meyer attributes this wholesale alienation of the bourgeois class to a collective guilt due to their continued social and economic power despite Liberalism’s political demise.226 Their response, she claims, stems from their self-perception of being ‘in contrast to a decadent, self serving, exploitative, and corrupt nobility whose continued political power was justified by nothing but the chance of birth right’.227 Hence, moral clarity became the maxim of the bourgeois class. The 1873 stock exchange crash, caused predominantly by Liberal economic policies, left the bourgeoisie partially responsible for the misery faced primarily by the lower classes.228 As such, Meyer argues that the authors of the time, represented in her article by Hugo von Hofmannsthal, Arthur Schnitzler and Leopold von Andrian, characterised their protagonists as ‘victims […] under siege’, and as Other to both the aristocrats and the working class, effectively marginalising themselves as ‘outsiders’.229 Meyer explains that

[t]orn as Vienna 1900’s writers are, between a flight from politics into culture and an inclusion of politics in culture, they try to straddle both positions by inscribing into their texts the figure of the split bourgeois subject who is alternately blamed for his own position and vindicated as a victim of forces greater than himself.230

In rebellion against the duplicitous nature of these moral values, Karl Kraus became the spokesman of the modernists in an attempt to ‘bite at the hypocrisy that

223 Schorske. FV, xvii.
224 Beller, introduction to Rethinking Vienna 1900, 2.
225 Ibid., 3.
227 Ibid., 4.
228 Ibid.
229 Ibid., 6.
230 Ibid., 10.
passed in Old Vienna for morality, and at the twaddle that passed for art’. His polemical articles in Die Fackel, the newspaper he wrote and produced, were aimed mostly at the lack of integrity displayed by his fellow Viennese. Janik and Toulmin provide a plausible explanation as to why these satirical attacks on others became so important to the development of modernism:

This was a society in which all established media, or means of expression—from the language of politics across the board to the principal of architectural design—had seemingly lost touch with their intended ‘messages’, and had been robbed of all capacity to perform their proper functions. [...] Kraus’s one-man debate had wider implications also. Very soon it woke echoes in other fields of intellectual and artistic activity, and broadened into the demand for a critique of the means of expression used in all fields—for example, for a stripping away of all that conventional and meaningless decoration with which sentimentality had encumbered the creative arts, so as to restore the expressive capacities they needed in order to fulfil their original and proper functions once again.

Hermann Broch labelled this outdated and hypocritical sense of morality a ‘value vacuum’ and it is here that Janik challenges Schorske’s ‘failure of liberalism’ thesis with what he has called the ‘critical modernism’ paradigm. This idea turns on the notion that ‘the most important contribution of fin-de-siècle Vienna to our culture is a particularly sceptical healthy reaction against the spellbinding power that modernity exerts upon us’. Janik describes critical modernism as a ‘scathing diagnosis’ of the great amount of power ascribed at the time to art to move us emotionally, and a ‘strategy’ for contending with the narcissistic and theatrical ‘religion of art’. Among those he counts as critical modernists are Arnold Schoenberg, Hermann Broch, Georg Trakl and Ludwig Wittgenstein.

---

231 Janik and Toulmin, Wittgenstein’s Vienna, 69–70.
232 Ibid., 30.
233 Janik, “Vienna 1900 Revisited”, 40.
234 Ibid., 40–41.
2.2. Psyche

2.2.a. Freud as the Central Psychoanalytical Personality

The central essay in Schorske’s collection is based on the conceptual patricide at the heart of the psychological theme running throughout the rest of the work. The protagonist of this chapter is, ironically, the staunch liberalist Freud. Schorske posits that until the 1890s the political tension existed between the liberals and the conservatives. Closer to the turn of the century, however, the changed social strata caused conflict between the lower classes and the old elites. Freud, the author explains, ‘belonged to the group most threatened: Viennese liberal Jewry.’

Schorske outlines how, through a series of analyses of his own dreams, Freud had to ‘neutralise politics by reducing it to psychological categories’. This, along with the death of his father in 1896, led to his basic analytic principle outlined in The Interpretation of Dreams: that a dream is the fulfilment of a wish, or in subsequent chapters that ‘a dream is a (disguised) fulfilment of a (suppressed) wish’, what Freud calls the principle of distortion. The first dream, of Irma’s Injection, represented his professional frustration and self-doubt. The second dream of The Uncle with the Yellow Beard, expressed the ‘unseemly moral consequences’ stemming from the political hindrance within his professional career (namely, not making professor because of his religious beliefs). His wish signified within the dream is for the power to eradicate his professional frustration, by ‘step[ping] into the minister’s shoes’. Therefore, his professional wish disguised his political one:

It is only now that I begin to see that it translates me from being in the sombre present to the hopeful days of the bourgeois Ministry, and completely fulfils what was then my youthful ambition. In treating my two estimable and learned colleagues, merely because they are Jews, so badly, [...] I am acting as though I were the Minister; I have put myself in his place. What a revenge I take upon his Excellency! He refuses to

235 Schorske, FV, 185.
236 Ibid., 186.
237 Sigmund Freud. The Interpretation of Dreams, in vol. 4 of SE, 119.
238 The dream consisted of his examination of his friend Irma in which he found an infection in her throat and chest, caused in his dream by his colleague, Dr. M, administering an injection of propionic acid with a dirty syringe.
239 Schorske, FV, 187. Freud describes a dream in which his friend ‘R’ is his uncle, for whom he feels great affection. In the dream, his friend’s face is altered, elongated and ‘surrounded’ by a yellow beard.
240 Ibid., 187.
appoint me Professor extraordinarius, and so in my dream I put myself in his place. 241

From the principle of distortion, Freud wove analogies to explain the essential nature of consciousness. Schorske explains that '[t]he dream thought confronts the same problem in the psyche of the dreamer as “the political writer who has disagreeable truths to tell those in authority”'. 242 If there is a strong censor, the writer must disguise his assertions; the two social powers, ruler and people, are then comparable to the two psychic forces, superego and id. Freud argues that 'one of these forces constructs the wish which is expressed by the dream, while the other exercises censorship upon this dream-wish and by the use of censorship, forcibly brings about distortion in the expression of the wish'. 243 This is the basis of the unconscious, the two psychic forces acting upon the ego (or I) to balance one another. The unconscious is formed, Freud suggests, as a repression of the Oedipus complex, the desire to have sexual relations with the parent of the opposite sex in rivalry with the same-sex parent. As Freud's theories at first centred on male children, the father is the child's rival, against whose rules and restrictions the child rebels.

2.2.b. Freud's Oedipal Complex: the Father/Son Conflict of the Failure of Liberalism

In The Interpretation of Dreams, Freud analyses several of his own dreams in order to discuss his various theories. The Revolutionary Dream describes the Oedipus complex, while also acting as an analogy to Schorske's failure of liberalism thesis. In this dream, Freud experienced an outburst of anger at the aristocratic Count Thun and fled through the halls of the university, 'that is, through academia', Schorske notes. 244 The final scene is set on a railway station platform in the company of his dying father, who, because of his blindness, needs Freud to hold a urinal for him. Schorske terms this dream his 'last explosive hail-and-farewell to politics', but also observes that in his own analysis Freud focussed not on the political rejection but on the final scene. He recalled how in reality his father had reprimanded him for urinating in his parent's bedroom, that he had 'disregarded the rules which modesty lays down'. 245 His Father responded that the 'boy will come to

241 Freud, The Interpretation of Dreams, 136.
242 Schorske, FV, 187.
243 Freud, The Interpretation of Dreams, 193, quoted in Schorske, FV, 187.
244 Schorske, FV, 195.
245 Freud, The Interpretation of Dreams, 216.
nothing’, hence, by helping the old man to urinate it is as if he says, ‘[y]ou see I have come to something’, taking vengeance of an intellectual kind, not on Count Thun, as he wished to do in his waking life just before he had the dream, but on the father.246

The Oedipus complex is not, therefore, just a conflict between a boy and his father, but an individual and society, as Freud explains:

A Prince is known as father of his country; the father is the oldest, first, and for children the only authority, and from his autocratic power the other social authorities have developed in the history of human civilisation.247

As such, it is a metaphor for Schorske’s thesis; the central principle of Freud’s political theory being that politics is reducible to the conflict between father and son, and that the conclusion, drawn from the Revolutionary Dream, is conquest of the father through flight into academia. Michael Roth explains that ‘for all, generational and political conflict are represented in private terms or are imagined as inevitable Oedipal combat’248 Schorske simplifies this as ‘patricide replaces regicide; psychoanalysis overcomes history. Politics is neutralised by a counterpolitical psychology’.249

2.2.2. Psychology in Literature

The theme that runs throughout Schorske’s essays is the ‘psychological man’ who emerged out of the political frustration of the time.250 ‘Anxiety, impotence, [and] a heightened awareness of the brutality of social existence’ were the central features of the Viennese people.251 Therefore, he argues, there was a rebellion against the liberal credo of morality and reason above all else—a rebellion against the contemporary authority which led to a turn inwards toward the psyche and the instinctual life—to a flight into academia and art. To illustrate this, Schorske begins by discussing the psyche within the literary works of Hofmannsthal and Schnitzler, the latter of which, Roth notes, diagnosed the tension between politics and the

246 Ibid., 193.
247 Ibid.
248 Michael S. Roth, “Performing History: Modernist Contextualism in Carl Schorske’s Fin-de-Siècle Vienna”, The American Historical Review 99, no. 3 (June 1994), 733.
249 Schorske, FV, 197.
250 Ibid., 5.
251 Ibid.
psyche ‘with extraordinary acumen’. However, Roth continues, while admirably ‘unmask[ing] the pretensions of society’s values’ Schnitzler was ‘unable to generate any values of his own’.

Hofmannsthal, on the other hand, Roth writes, attempted to ‘imagine an art that would offer a communal possibility beyond these crises rather than only describe them’. Schorske comments that

engagement in life, Hofmannsthal felt, demands the capacity to resolve, to will. This capacity implies commitment to the irrational, in which alone resolution and will are grounded. Thus affirmation of the instinctual reopened for the aesthete the door to the life of action and society.

It is, then the “capacity to will”, to desire, or as Freud puts it to “wish” that leads one towards the psychological, or instinctual. Schorske then examines Hofmannsthal’s The Tower (Der Turm), written in 1927, his assessment of which symbolises the political crisis of the time:

The father justifies political repression, as the Austrian liberals had done, by the rationale of order based on law. His subjects, his imprisoned son among them, are excluded from participation in the ceremony of the whole; hence they turn to aggression. Where law ignores instinct, instinct rebels and subverts order. [...] The poet prince, however, masters his aggressions and seeks to redeem the society with a new dynamic form of social order, a form inspired by the unifying, non-repressive paradigm of art.

Hence, Hofmannsthal campaigns for a fusion between the instinctual and the rational, for a need to comprehend human feelings as well as rational, restrictive and often corrupt morality.

2.2.2. The Rational and Psychological as Topics
The transformation that developed from rationalism shows society moving from the previous generations’ positivist, disciplined conformity through the next generation’s

252 Roth, “Performing History”, 730.
253 Ibid.
254 Schorske, FV, 19, quoted in Roth, “Performing History”, 731.
255 Schorske, FV, 19.
256 Ibid., 21.
257 For further links between Hofmannsthal, Schnitzler and Freud see Meyer, “The Insider as Outsider”, 7.
rebellion into the psychological, before finally resulting in Kraus’s authentic ideal. However, it has not been shown how this relates to the music of fin-de-siècle Vienna. When identifying the ‘rational’ as a topic, allied with the first mode of the transformation, it becomes clear that it is a topical class. It is signified by the structures of the Classical period, for example, sonata form, rondo form etc., as well as the use of diatonic harmony and traditional orchestration. The topics that also signify this topical class are the learned style, chorale topic and the aria topic; topics mostly associated with the high style and the (Catholic) church. The alliance of these subtopics with the sociological concept of rationalism can be clarified both in the foundation of tonality, as Peter J. Martin and Max Weber posit, and in its opposition to the emotional and the representation of the psyche. As John H. Mueller describes: ‘Either we have language, meaning, discourse, and reality (the orderly, the rational, the cerebral), […] or we have the unstructured world of ruptured, ecstatic, jouissance, replete with luscious, Dionysion, hedonistic pleasures’.258 Regarding the former, Martin writes that ‘the development of the music [i.e. Western polyvocal music] necessitated a system of notation, but that system itself stimulated further development in the direction of rationalisation—imposing standard practices permitting greater complexity, facilitating compositional work by specialists and the development of musical theory’.259 The learned topic embodies the rationalisation of music, it is the ‘orderly’, ‘rational’ and ‘cerebral’ side of Mueller’s coin, the second side of which is the second phase of the transformation outlined below. This topic also possesses links with the overt Classical architecture of the Ringstraße. This monumental construction, Schorske asserts, became a ‘symbolic focus of [the modernist] critique […] “Ringstrassenstil” became a quite general term of opprobrium by which a generation of doubting, critical, and aesthetically sensitive sons rejected their self-confident, parvenu fathers’.260

259 Martin, Sounds and Society: Themes in the Sociology of Music, 224.
260 Schorske, FV, 25. For further investigation into architecture and Vienna 1900 see Tag Gronburg, Vienna: City of Modernity, 1890–1914 (Bern: Peter Lang, 2007).
The second phase of the transformation witnesses the arrival of what can be termed psychological topics. Some of these topics are ‘pre-Romantic’ topics, for example sensibility style (Empfindsamkeit), ombra and tempesta, whose emotional significance make them more suited to the music of the time. For instance, although tempesta is traditionally associated with Classicism, it is a perfect topic to present emotion within a work, and is therefore classed here as a Romantic topic. The term ‘Romantic’ has been generally applied to the post-Beethoven period, from roughly 1830 to the beginning of the twentieth century. Initially it grew as an opposition to the formal aspects of Classicality, with Karl August Kahlert, a nineteenth-century musicologist, explaining the difference as ‘classical composers being more interested in the formal structure of music, romantic composers in free, untrammelled expression’. This development of expression was shared in the political and intellectual worlds, growing through the discovery of the individual as a prevailing force. As the practice of patronage began to disappear, the focus on the individual gave Romantic music an inner quality. This gave composers the opportunity to ‘make their own statement’; and, according to the influence of Kant’s philosophical position, ‘the romantic artist, privileged by his genius, would reveal the world was grounded in self’, hence, the growing exploitation of expression as the basis of aesthetic value over formal considerations. For their newfound expressive desires, German composers began to look to other arts for inspiration, especially poetry, and particularly that of Goethe and Schiller. This propensity led to the rise of the Lied, a genre Jim Samson suggests ‘might sustain a claim to be the quintessential romantic genre’, a statement he qualifies succinctly:

In its intimate, confessional character it epitomised the autobiographical character of romantic art. In its narrative, descriptive aspects it reflected the programmatic, referentialist tendencies of the music of the period. In its evocation of folksong it echoed a wider nineteenth-century idealisation of Volksgeist. And above all in its response to the new lyric poetry of the early nineteenth-century it provided a model of the Romantic impulse towards a fusion of the arts.

---

261 Samson, “Romanticism”.
263 Ibid., 600.
Formal differences between Romantic and Classical works also began to be explored. Works became monadic, considered as single units containing their own meaning and not referencing other genres or eras, but instead utilising an ‘ideology of organicism’.264 Through a preoccupation with unity, whole pieces were conceived and built around a basic shape or idea: a Grundgestalt. Structural weight was then given to the development of this motive, weakening the Classical foundation of a tonal structure. Where tonal structure was still employed, it shifted away from strict diatonic harmony towards more chromatic elements, affecting an increasingly dissonant quality to works. This notion of non-referential art, of which ‘absolute’ music became the epitome, demonstrates the concept of Romanticism as defined by its opposition to Classicality and its ‘Apollonian’ features, and gives rise to the next step of the transformation towards ‘authenticity’.

2.3. Romance

With the emergence of emotion within the works of fin-de-siècle composers, a Romance topic was also destined to appear. This topic can be found in abundance among the songs of operettas, where, as always, love is a popular central theme. This topic is signified first by a moderate tempo and the presence of either an Alberti bass, or an ascending pizzicato bass. The melody is rhythmically regular, usually extending to crotchets and quavers only, no quicker, and often takes the shape of an arch. The instrumentation is string-based with a range that extends over the octave, sixth or seventh. These signifiers stem from the romances (and romanzas) of the eighteenth-century opéra comique, including François-André Danican Philidor’s Le sorcier (1764), Pierre-Alexandre Monsigny’s Le roi et le fermier (1762) and André Grétry’s L’amitié à l’épreuve (1770). Heartz describes the operatic romance as being in the rhythm of the slow gavotte, or gavotte tendre, employing an overall major-minor-major structure, and in alla breve time.265 It is also often accompanied by plucked strings to simulate the guitar (e.g. Pedrillo’s romance “In Mohrenland gefangen war” in Mozart’s Die Entführung aus dem Serail (1782)).266 Jack Sage adds that ‘the genre’s strophic form, unadorned melody, subordinate

264 Ibid.
accompaniment and simple expression’ gave the music its ‘qualities of naturalness, simplicity and naivety’.  

Examples of this topic can be found in “Dein ist mein ganzes Herz” from Das Land des Lächelns (Example 2.1), one of the most famous love songs written for the tenor Richard Tauber (affectionately labelled Tauberlied by Franz Lehár himself). The rising pizzicato bass and octave doubling in the strings is clear, as is the moderate tempo marking. From Lehár’s Paganini, we can see this topic in “Deinen süßen Rosenmund” (Examples 2.2 and 2.3)

```
   G        D        F          C          G
Dein ist mein ganzes Herz! Wo du nicht bist, kann ich nicht
```


```
   C        E        G          D          A
Allegretto \( \frac{3}{4} \)
```

Example 2.3: Lehár, Paganini, “Deinen süßen Rosenmund”, bb. 6–8.

Johann Strauss II uses this topic as a method of accentuating the duplicity of this emotion in *Die Fledermaus*. In No. 4 “So muß allein ich bleiben” (Example 2.4), the topic appears at the beginning of the song when Rosalinde mourns the jailing of her husband for eight whole days. However, as is clear by this point, none of the three protagonists intends to stay alone and all are planning secretly to go to Prince Orlofsky’s ball. As the song becomes more ironic the romance topic disappears. In No. 5 “Trinklied” (Example 2.5), the romance topic appears briefly from bars 13–20, when Alfred speaks of the misleading nature of love, juxtaposing the topic against the text to accentuate the satirical nature of the song.

*Example 2.4: Strauss II, J., Die Fledermaus, No. 4: Terzett, bb. 4–7.*

A synopsis and fuller topical analysis of *Die Fledermaus* can be found in chapter 3 under section 3.1.i: “Austrian Identity in *Die Fledermaus*.”
2.4. Authenticity

While Schorske exposes the revolutionary new utilitarian trend that marked the 'critical modernists' through looking at the work of Otto Wagner, it is Timms who introduces the reasons for this sudden cultural change: that the difference between the façade of Austrian life and the economic and social reality were like 'the costumes of a public masquerade.' The resplendent military uniforms were 'designed to divert away attention from the fact that military pay was appallingly low' and 'the colourful artifice in civilian dress as well concealed an underlying instability'. This aesthetic smokescreen, based on the pre-industrial eras, resonated on a far larger scale to take in the architecture itself. This type of aesthetic nostalgia added to the "myth" of a secure city at ease.

The architect Otto Wagner's overruling concept was to move away from the overtly ornamental Baroque and Renaissance styles, instead letting the functionality of the object, room or building he was designing be the point of departure for the design itself. In 1895, Wagner suggested that 'all modern forms must correspond to new materials and the new requirements of our time, if they are to fit modern mankind. [...] What is impractical can never be beautiful'.

This radical departure from the conservative Viennese habit of copying ornate styles of the past reverberated throughout the culture of the time, exemplified

---

270 Ibid.
by such modernists as Loos, another architect, Kraus, as seen above, and Schoenberg and his pupils, such as Max Deutsch. In Smith’s exposition of Schoenberg and his circle, the author conducted an interview with Deutsch, in which he explained what Loos and Schoenberg were doing: ‘[f]irst, in general manner, necessity […] and the second term is intensity. That is the criterion that you can find in the works of these four men [Kraus, Loos, Schoenberg and Kokoschka]. And that is, too, Schoenberg’s way to teach for the students—what is absolutely necessary. Write down what is necessary! And don’t write down what you are really not very […] [clear about].’

It is Webern’s work that provides, perhaps, the clearest example of this aspiration to reveal the structure of a piece rather than veil it with complicated expression and ornamentation, thereby producing a sparse, simple, but ultimately striking work.

2.5. Judaism

Austria had long been a Catholic country, so much so that it was not until 1867 that Jews were granted full emancipation. It was in this context that Karl Lueger and Georg von Schönerer rose to power in the 1880s, and it is the introduction of these two figures, along with Theodor Herzl, the founder of Zionism, which enables Schorske to look at anti-Semitism as a major theme. The assimilation of the Jewish people into Austrian culture, he states, with most scholars’ agreement, was not wholly possible; however much their traditions disappeared to be replaced with German affectations, ‘they could not outgrow the status of “converts” to that nationality.’

The liberals became associated with this ‘Other’ people and in turn the status of the Jews shared in the triumphs and misfortunes of the Liberal party. Owing to this association it was relatively straightforward for the Christian Social Party, led by Lueger, to gain power, a move made smoother by Lueger’s anti-Semitic tendencies being far less violent than those of his counterpart Georg Ritter von Schönerer.

Schorske, however, only discusses the ‘Jewish problem’ with regard to anti-Semitic activity in the context of the politics of the time, and even in that way it is not portrayed as the major concern that it was. The lax attitude that Lueger himself had towards this policy is testament to this, and Schorske cites Lueger’s famous quotation as proof: “Wer ein Jude ist, bestimme ich.” (“Who is a Jew is something I...”)

272 Smith, Schoenberg and His Circle, 38.
273 Ibid., 25.
274 Schorske, FV, 129.
275 Ibid.
Steven Beller argues instead that it was the dominance of the educated Jews in the bourgeoisie that actually led to the phenomenal changes that occurred at the time. Because of the high conversion rate from Judaism to Catholicism, Beller looks at Jewish descent to provide the proof for this claim, which, as Schorske himself submits, is legitimate owing to the perceived lack of full assimilation.

It is the Jewish tradition of early education that Beller cites as the reason for this predominance. Their faith led Jews to educate their children early, as young as three or four, so that they could read the Talmud and therefore understand and follow their faith as soon as possible. The more liberal Jewish parents became, the more liberal the education—that is, they no longer read only scripture—but the early start remained. This emphasis on education therefore explains why there were a large number of Jews in the intelligentsia and, aligned with the fact that Jews were denied jobs within the bureaucracy (the only other jobs really available being as lawyers, doctors or merchants), it becomes obvious why so many were drawn to the arts.

Within the circles of music two not completely opposing slants on Judaism were evolving simultaneously. On the one hand there were the anti-Semitic followers of Wagner and the equally prejudiced parody of Jewish characters in Viennese operettas. On the other hand, the alternating veneration and criticism of Jewish musicians such as Mahler and Schoenberg continued alongside the financing of the theatres and operettas by Jewish businessmen.

In the latter case, the matter of such a revered conductor (Mahler was at this time known better as a conductor than composer) being a Jew became most evident when Mahler set as his goal the job of conducting at the Court Opera House. When he was appointed as director of the Royal Hungarian Opera House the news, Karpath states, ‘came as a bombshell throughout the city [...] Let it not be forgotten that Mahler was at the time still a Jew—he was baptised only later, in
Hamburg—and this fact alone was such to cause a sensation'. But Mahler himself knew that to go further would require an extra sacrifice: ‘As things now stand in the world, my Jewishness blocks my entry into any Court Theatre. Neither Vienna, nor Berlin, nor Dresden, nor Munich is possible for me. That’s how the wind blows everywhere at present.’

Mahler’s conversion to Catholicism, while securing him as director of the Vienna Court Opera, was not enough to stem the critics, as part of an article from the Reichspost in 1897 shows:

> At the time we already had an inkling of the origin of this celebrity and we therefore avoided publishing anything other than the bare facts about this unadulterated – Jew [sic]. The fact that he was acclaimed by the press in Budapest of course confirms our suspicion. We shall refrain completely from any over-hasty judgement. The Jews’ press will see whether the panegyrics with which they plaster their idol at present do not become washed away by the rain of reality as soon as Herr Mahler starts his Jew-boy antics at the podium.

The former aspect—the representation of Jews in opera and the effect of Wagner’s essay—can be exemplified, according to Camille Crittenden, through the portrayal of the incompetent lawyer ‘Blind’ in the first act of Strauss’ Die Fledermaus:

> Wagner asserted [in his Judaism in Music (1850), an essay well known in Viennese musical circles] that since the Jew has no European language as ‘mother tongue’, he cannot artistically or adequately express himself, ‘creaking, squeaking, buzzing’, and turning phrases into incoherent babble. [...] Strauss eventually demonstrates Blind’s ‘babble’ with a patter-like catalogue of everything he has to do as a lawyer [...] His monotone, syllabic recitation is reinforced in the orchestra by horns and trumpets, contributing the blaring, nasal tone Wagner ascribed to Jews.

---

281 Reichspost, April 14, 1897, quoted in Mahler, His Life, Work and World, 125.
This was not the only time Strauss’s portrayal of Jewish characteristics was so overt, despite the subtlety he usually employed, and was subsequently exaggerated by the actors, for at least once he sketched a “satiric waltz song” with an anti-Semitic text.\textsuperscript{283} Nevertheless, operetta was not explicitly anti-Semitic; the censors, in fact, warned the composers to tone down any nationalist or Jewish characteristics.

2.5.a. Jewishness as a Viennese Topic

Owing to the widespread emigration of the Jewish nation, all attempts to define ‘Jewish music’ have faced many difficulties. The music of the Jewish Diaspora developed mostly within the context of their religion by following the musical laws set out for them, such as the ban on musical instruments within the synagogue leading to a tradition of vocal music, or the regulation that men should not hear a female vocalist. Their music also developed alongside the music of the societies into which they had integrated. It is therefore often difficult to distinguish ‘authentic’ Jewish characteristics when analysing nineteenth-century art music. Edwin Seroussi poses the question: ‘where exactly are the limits between the music “made by Jews, for Jews, as Jews” […] and the music “made by Jews, as musicians, for all listeners”. A further question arises with music created by non-Jews but used by Jews within their own communities’.\textsuperscript{284} This issue makes a topical cultural and historical trace exceptionally complex. However, despite the problems faced by the assimilation and combination of Western and Jewish styles, by considering a cross-section of Jewish songs, traditional and from the stage (theatre and cabaret), certain distinguishing features do begin to emerge. Although they are not restricted solely to Jewish songs, nor do all Jewish songs contain these features, they are prevalent enough to be considered Jewish significations.

Considering the oral tradition of long-established Jewish songs there is a distinct lack of documentation, and therefore most of the information is relatively recent and consequently of relatively dubious value when looking for a historical cultural trace, which is what is needed to fully investigate and confirm it as a topic. However, after the emancipation of the Jews in Europe in the second half of the eighteenth-century the liturgical basis of most of Jewish music began to change.

\textsuperscript{283} Ibid., 102.
Following the spread of rationalism, the canonic religious texts began to be studied in a more scientific and critical way. The culture of the societies into which Jewish communities were assimilating also began to influence them, leading to the imitation of behaviour and exposure to the new culture’s literature and arts. Secular and liberal Jewish people began to emerge, and with them a more liberal view of the music, directing them to relax the original bans and introduce musical instruments and mixed choirs. The use of musical instruments consequently became the ‘hallmarks of the Jewish Emancipation in the modern era’.

In the case of identifying signifiers for most ‘ethnic’ musics (e.g., Hungarian, Romanian etc.) it is most often the characteristics of folk songs that are investigated and formulised. The problem inherent in taking this approach when exploring Jewish music is the notion that characteristics should be present globally (throughout the various Jewish communities), and extend beyond the cultural and linguistic boundaries of the separate nations, to be considered truly Jewish. Despite this dilemma, there are some common characteristics.

Whether it is of a religious or secular nature, a text performs an important part in accentuating Jewish traditions. Although the text of a song does not have to be in a Jewish language, it does help to mark the song as Jewish, and ‘hinders oral tradition from extending beyond Jewish practices’. Even when the text is not in a Jewish language, it is still often about Jewish historical events (for example, the pilgrimage songs of Iraqi Jewish women), or a way of exemplifying typical family and community life (such as “Mit A Nodl, On A Nodl” [With a Needle, Without a Needle]). However, the topical merit of textual signification is ambiguous, as it would not be recognisable in untexted works.

Example 2.6: “Mamenyu, Lyubenyu”, bb. 1–6.

Example 2.6

Ibid.
Ibid.
Ibid.
Ibid.
Ibid.
Improvisation has distinctive significance in Jewish music that is particularly linked to its original oral traditions. This can be seen in songs such as: “Doina”, by Edward Huw Jones, and “Mamenyu, Lyubenyu”, a folk song (Example 2.6). There is a strong similarity between the recitative of the Jewish song seen here and the hallgató style from the Hungarian-Gypsy style. This connection is substantiated by the categorisation of the Doina style, which Edward Huw Jones includes in his Klezmer: Jewish Music of Celebration as a Romanian folk song. Bartók found similar style songs in the Ukraine, Persia, Iraq and Algeria, and stated that it was ‘undoubtedly of Persian-Arabic origin’. However, the term improvisation can also refer to the concept of ‘recombining the traditional through performance to create the new’, which can refer to the numerous arrangements and adaptations of folksong in Western styles which makes it so hard to define precisely. Wherever folksongs were adapted for the Yiddish Stage, popular theatre songs also transformed over time into folksongs (for example, Abraham Goldfaden’s Raisins and Almonds, 1882).

There are two main accompaniment types: a recitative style and an oom-pah style. The recitative style consists of chords, accompanying an improvisatory melody influenced by cantillation, in either the upper instruments or voice. Cantillation means to chant in free rhythm in plainsong style, and is used in connection with Jewish liturgical music, but while the melodies are certainly influenced by this style they are not as strict as might be expected. The melody is embellished with grace notes, glissandi and other such ornamentation. This style tends, although by no means exclusively, to be used for prayers or solemn/reflective music and songs concerned with the Jewish faith. The oom-pah accompaniment, in accordance with the Western tradition, tends more towards everyday songs, cabaret songs and songs about the Jewish way of life and its people.

---

293 Seroussi, “Jewish music”.
Finally, there is the melodic element, specifically the use of the melodic minor scale, which gives the music its distinctive Eastern flavour. Jehoash Hirshberg identifies these musical traits ‘as emanating from the inner Jewish soul’, and calls this the ‘genetic-psychological model’, quoting Nadel’s characteristics of synagogue music. These include ‘recitative, melodic diatonicism, anapaestic rhythm and structural parallelism, to which he added meditative tendencies, mixed tonalities and irregular rhythmic changes’. The signifiers of the ‘Jewish’ music that the Viennese audiences would have understood include chordal accompaniment with cantillation style and embellished melodies for solo voice or instrument. Alternatively, they can also be signified by a dance-like up-tempo oom-pah accompanying a cabaret style song. The text will be in Yiddish or German, and concern either liturgical subjects or the everyday life of the common Jew.

2.6. Nationalism

In his article assessing Schorske’s ‘powerful work’, Scott Spector counters Schorske’s ‘failure of liberalism’ thesis, suggesting that ‘such a conclusion would assume that the cultural sphere was at least imagined to be separate from the sphere of political conflict, when in fact, especially in Weltsch’s Prague, just the opposite was supposed’. In response to the argument of ‘modern culture as political surrogate for a marginalized liberal bourgeoisie’, Spector suggests instead that politics inhabited the modern cultural sphere, and that culture was used to marginalise the other nations within the Empire. Consequently, the fin-de-siècle culture, based on Germanic ideals, evolved ‘as a combative site of identity construction and defence, and as an instrument of power over those outside of the privileged national/cultural circle’. Spector explains:

[[the ‘liberal’ component of German liberalism, the commitment to liberal politics, had undermined the ‘German’ component in late nineteenth-century Bohemia. If German hegemony was to be preserved in some form, the discourse which privileged the Germans as the unique Central European Kulturation had to be recovered and reinforced. Further, there

---

294 Arno Nadel, Jüdische Liebeslieder (Volkslieder) (Berlin: Benjamin Harz, 1923), quoted in Edwin Seroussi, et al., "Jewish music”.
295 Ibid., 691.
296 Ibid., 697.
297 Ibid., 697.
was a need to address the conflict between a German claim to power, legitimated by ‘culture’, and the competing Czech claim, legitimated by liberal ‘politics’. The establishment of the primacy of culture, then, became more important than ever.298

Similarly to the Jews being seen as outsiders or “Others”, the nations that made up the Dual Monarchy of Austria-Hungary were never felt to be fully part of the Empire.299 This was not only a product of Austro-German racism, but also came about through attempts made by the smaller nations to retain their heritage and language, and to further their independence. Language became a major catalyst of nationalist protest. The liberal bureaucracy was attempting to germanise the imperial administration, to make it more streamlined, while at the same time the most prestigious gymnasia and universities were mainly German speaking. The Austrian tie with Germany, Austria having been the head of Prussia at one time, was strong and it was felt that the German culture was superior to that of the ‘Other’ nations. This push towards German nationalist sentiment by the administration led, seemingly inexorably, to Hungarian and Czech reactions. For example, the Hungarians demanded hegemony over their army and for their soldiers to communicate in Hungarian, while the Czechs campaigned for a university that taught in their own language.

It has been discussed above that the liberals’ “social base” was comprised mostly of those of German nationality. Schorske describes how the German liberals thought to use nationality to their own advantage, by functioning as ‘tutor and teacher’ to the minority peoples, rather than ‘keep them as ignorant bondsman’ as the aristocracy had done. With this munificent gesture nationality itself would hold together the multinational state.300 By joining with the masses against a common foe—the aristocracy—the liberals hoped to form a cohesive whole. However, every

298 Ibid., 697–698.
299 The “Dual Monarchy” is another name for the Austro-Hungarian Empire, named such because of Emperor Francis Joseph’s standing as King of Hungary and King and Emperor throughout the rest of the Monarchy. This is a direct result of the Compromise, or Ausgleich of 1867, an agreement between the emperor and the Magyar leadership of the Hungarian diet intended to turn the Habsburg Monarchy into a German-Magyar condominium with the Magyars ruling Hungary and the Austrian Germans ruling the rest of the Empire. This act, unsurprisingly, caused a certain amount of negativity throughout the rest of ‘the lands represented in the Reichsrat’ (This is the official name of the Austrian aspect; ‘Austria’ was not its legal name until 1915) because they felt neglected by this apparent favouritism. Count Richard Belcredi, at the Ministerial Council meeting on 1 February 1867, asserted that ‘the monarch should not rely on specific nationalities but be above them all’ (Beller, A Concise History of Austria, 143).
300 Schorske, FV, 117.
German nationalist sentiment articulated against the ‘enemy above’ produced antagonistic action from the Slavic patriots below. When the Germanism was played down by the liberals it resulted in them being ‘branded as traitors to nationalism by an anti-liberal German petite bourgeoisie’.  

At one point, the Austrian Empire had been the largest empire in Europe. However, in the 1700s and 1800s it gradually lost its territories, along with its military might. In 1858 Austria was defeated in the Franco-Austrian War and in 1866 by the Prussians at Königgrätz. This led to a new self-consciousness within the empire, which resulted in a profound emphasis on Austrian cultural and musical prowess. The Austrians searched for a new identity, one that could be used to show the rest of Europe that they were still a powerful force in some way, and found one in Strauss’s debut of his composition the ‘Blue Danube Waltz’ at the 1867 World Exhibition in Paris. Crittenden illustrates the way in which Strauss became ‘a symbol of power and prestige equally as important in the popular imagination as territorial control or political alliances’, and Traubner agrees, claiming he was ‘as cherished as the venerable Emperor himself’.

As the Austro-Hungarian Empire’s military prowess was withering, its urban life was also changing. In 1781 serfdom was abolished, meaning that men who could not afford tenure on the land moved into the cities and towns. From the 1800s onwards, therefore, peasant reforms and industrialisation within the city of Vienna led to a large influx of labour into the capital. During the decade ending in 1890 the population rose to almost double, and by 1910 it had risen from under 1,000,000 to over 2,000,000. In this case, Edward Timms notes that

the economic and social changes which in Britain had been spread over three centuries were in Austria crammed into a period of forty years. [...] The process of modernisation, far from strengthening the state (as in the German Reich), accelerated the tendency towards disintegration, as each national group asserted its own identity.

---

301 Ibid., 117.
304 Timms, Karl Kraus: Apocalyptic Satirist, 12.
Therefore, in direct proportion to the rise of this Viennese identity crisis, the nationalist sentiment in and towards the other nations of Austria also rose, precipitated by this industrialisation of the cities and towns.

### 2.6.a. Austrian Identity: the Waltz Topic

The waltz as it is known today originated from the *Deutsche Tanz* or *Ländler*. The *Ländler* is a German folk dance in 3/4 and was most common in Austria, Switzerland and Southern Germany. It was generally a slow dance, although it was often performed faster in the west (Switzerland and Tyrol). Despite the rareness of rural dances in 3/4 time, its unsophisticated form helped it to gain popularity with the upper classes. This was due to the ‘gliding and whirling’ dance steps that formed the dance, regularly accompanied by *Paschen* or rhythmic hand clapping and stamping. This raucous dance was in pronounced opposition to the stately minuet that was performed by the nobility of the time, and was procured by the Austrian court for use during their feasts when dramatic representations of scenes from peasant life were acted out and the *Ländler* was used to entertain. It is possibly in this way that the dance most associated with the rural peasantry also began to become associated with the Austrian court.

The dance is usually in a major key, diatonic, with a melodic tendency towards arpeggio figures which may have been influenced by Alpine songs. The instrumentation comprises two violins, double bass and a wind instrument, for example a clarinet, or in earlier times, a shawm or recorder. Romantic composers often used this dance to evoke peasant or rural settings, for example, the Waltz in Act One of Weber’s *Die Freischutz* is more likely a *Ländler*, as is the Carinthian tune from Berg’s *Violin Concerto*. Vera Micznik also looks at how Mahler uses the *Ländler*, although his own version of it, and mentions the ‘rawness’ of the dance. This coarseness inherent in the early dance is the main point in which the waltz diverges from its original state to become the smooth, decidedly upper-class version that became so entwined with the Austrian national identity. Berg uses this to highlight class separation in his opera *Wozzeck*; a *Ländler* plays for the apprentices, soldiers and servant girls, but when the Drum Major is dancing with Marie it is a |

---

306 Ibid., 223.
307 Micznik, “Mahler and “The Power of Genre”. The *Ländler* can be found in the second movement of Mahler’s Ninth Symphony at bars 1, 369 and 523.
waltz they dance to. The Ländler used here, despite its atonality, is still recognisable through the presence of arpeggio figures in the wind instruments and the oom-pah accompaniment in strings. The inclusion of the horns in this section also adds to the pastoral feel that is characteristic of the Ländler (Example 2.7).

The Viennese waltz, on the other hand, is topically associated with the middle and upper classes. As this dance moved into the city ballrooms, its steps became smoother and a ‘gliding motion replaced the boisterous motion of the folk dance’. The phrases now become fuller, the use of minor keys and modulations more prevalent, and the instrumentation tends towards the full orchestra rather than the ‘fiddles’ of its predecessor. Allanbrook identifies the harmonic and temporal signifiers of the waltz, asserting that ‘the beat tends to be perceived on the measure level, and supporting harmonies rarely change more than once a measure, producing the cliché of the “oom-pah-pah” accompaniment, a salient feature both of the Deutsche Tanz and of the modern waltz’.


---

309 Allanbrook, Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart, 63.
However, this dance also caused a sensation when introduced into polite society. The use of the closed position with couples facing each other, the man’s arms around the woman’s waist, was seen as lascivious and ‘erotic’, and in some countries, for instance Swabia and Switzerland, the waltz was prohibited.³¹⁰ Gammond suggests, however, that it was precisely this sensationalism that made the waltz so popular, and composers so eager to write them.³¹¹ The pioneer of waltz composition was Michael Pamer (1782–1827), but it was Johann Strauss (who started his career in Pamer’s orchestra) and his son Johann Strauss II that made the dance what Allanbrook describes as ‘both an emblem and a natural end of the tumultuous social changes which took place at the turn of the century’.³¹²

The signifiers of the Viennese waltz in its classical form, as opposed to waltzes from other cultures, is the ‘slight anticipation of the second beat of the bar known as the Atempause (literally ‘breathing-space’), which gives the music an enchanting lilt.³¹³ In the French version of the waltz, the first beat of the bar is lengthened, while the English waltz returns all three beats to an equal length. The other characteristics of the Viennese waltz are its rigorous speed, introduced by Strauss senior, and soft, romantic melodies, coined initially by Joseph Lanner, another member of Pamer’s orchestra. It was Strauss II, however, who united these two characteristics, and it is to him that the national love of the Viennese waltz is chiefly credited.³¹⁴

The main reason that it was Strauss II, rather than his father, who made the Viennese waltz famous was that he successfully transferred the dance from the court ballrooms to the theatres; thus, the dance was no longer purely in the domain of the upper classes, but instead could be enjoyed, and performed, by all. In the second act finale of his most famous operetta, Die Fledermaus, the noble waltz is heard (Example 2.8). Indeed the use of the word ‘noble’ here is not merely an affectation: the topical association of the Viennese waltz is decidedly aristocratic, and Strauss has highlighted this association by placing it with the character Prince Orlofsky.³¹⁵ The Atempause is accentuated here by the vocal entries on the second beat of the bar, both in the solo entry and in the chorus parts (Example 2.8, from figure 18).

---

³¹⁰ Gammond and Lamb, “Waltz”.
³¹¹ Ibid.
³¹² Allanbrook, Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart, 63.
³¹³ Gammond, “Waltz”.
³¹⁴ Ibid.
³¹⁵ Although the part was written for, and is traditionally sung by a woman.
Example 2.8: Strauss II, J., Die Fledermaus, Act II, No. 11a, Figure 18.

There are multiple associations of the Viennese waltz. First, it is associated with Vienna itself, as the city’s, and therefore Austria’s, national dance, exemplified by the premiere of the “Blue Danube Waltz” by Johann Strauss II at the World Exhibition. The work was considered successful because it gave Austrians hope after the military and political defeats they had been suffering just before 1867 by showing the world that they were still forerunners when it came to cultural achievements. This also helped lend the waltz to nostalgic purposes. Nostalgic songs, such as Strauss’ “Voices of Spring” (Op. 410) and “Tales from the Vienna Woods” (Op. 325), and Rudolf Sieczynski’s “Vienna, City of My Dreams”, were all written in the waltz genre.\[316\] The nostalgia present, however, is only a yearning for the city as it used to be: it is a purely urban nostalgia, the waltz representing Vienna alone rather than Austria as a whole.

Second, the waltz symbolises the aristocratic class and the monarchy specifically. The waltz had begun its rule of the upper classes in the court ballroom, so the aristocracy had made it their own in emulation of their Emperor. For example, Strauss wrote the Kaiser-Walzer in 1889 as a toast for Franz Joseph to extend friendship to the German Kaiser Wilhelm II. The waltzes themselves continue to bear march-like qualities; the use of dotted rhythms, wind fanfares and accented

\[316\] Rudolf Sieczynski: 1879–1952.
marcato quavers signify the military topic throughout (Example 2.9). This added to the sense of Austrian national identity: the ceremonial life of the Emperors had always been a central part of Viennese life, to the point where it became as artificial as the decadent clothes and architecture, and the waltz reminded them of this essential part of their heritage.

This leads to the third aspect, which is the portrayal of *Wiener Schmäh*, which, in Beller’s words, ‘is essentially the talent for telling lies in an attractive manner. It is the verbal form of the kind of baroque architecture where all marble was really exquisitely painted wood’. The citizens of Vienna likely knew the artificiality of their decadence (indeed it is what Kraus, Loos and Schoenberg campaigned against throughout their careers) and, since the lower classes were not financially capable of this type of deceit, *Schmäh* became the contrivance of the upper and middle classes.


![Langsames Marschtempo.](image)


In *Die Fledermaus* all three aspects are present. In the famous Act Two waltz, it is the aristocratic associations and decadent lifestyle that are in the foreground initially, but as the waltz progresses the deceptive relationship between Frank and Eisenstein becomes the topic of the other guests’ conversation. Throughout this operetta the waltz is mostly associated with duplicity. This can be seen in the finale to Act One (No. 5) when Alfred attempts to persuade Rosalinde to consummate their relationship (Example 2.5). When the jailer enters, a series of deceptions lead them to convince Frank that Alfred is Rosalinde’s husband Eisenstein, a further lie which lands Alfred in prison. The final example, No. 8 from Act Two (Example 2.10),

---

shows Adele, Rosalinde’s chambermaid, trying to convince the aristocratic party guests that she is one of them, after having been mistakenly identified by her employer as a cook.

In Franz Lehár’s *Die Lustige Witwe*, the association with duplicity is emphasised in No. 4 “Bitte, Meine Herren”, sung by Hanna and a male ensemble. Hanna sweeps into the Pontevedrian embassy with her many admirers, but while they sing of their admiration, Hanna declares that she is not so naive as to think they are flattering her for no reason, but rather because of her financial status. This demonstrates that Hanna was not only aware the men were being false, but also that she was happy for it to continue, so long as it remained charming and flattering.

There are two main waltzes in *Der Zigeunerbaron*, one Viennese, the other a Hungarian-flavoured waltz. No. 13 “So voll Fröhlichkeit gibt es weit und breit” is a song about the bright wide streets of Vienna, and ‘the women, wine, and song in a city where everyone understands love’.\(^{318}\) This is a specific example of the Viennese waltz, with a rhythmic quality that accentuates the pause on the second beat, using quaver rests (bars two and four), the third and first notes tied across the bar line between bars 4 and 5 and dotted notes on the second beat in bar 6 (Example 2.11). The treasure waltz in No. 9, on the other hand, owing to the quaver upbeat to each bar—which in performance is often shortened to a semiquaver—places the accent on the first beat of each bar, giving it a foreign air. Then, to provide the listeners with proof that the waltz is not Viennese, in bar 46 Czipra’s solo begins to use the upper fourth of the Gypsy scale, A-B♭-C♯-D, to add Hungarian flavour to the waltz tempo. The oboe doubles her voice, with a clarinet flourish at the end; both instruments are significant to the Hungarian style.

*Example 2.10: Strauss II, J., Die Fledermaus, No. 8, Figure 4.*

Example 2.11: Strauss II, Der Zigeunerbaron, No. 13, bb. 1–9.

2.6.b. Nationalism as Exotic ‘Other’

Folk music in Vienna was used in two distinct ways, both to give the minorities a sense of independence and identity, and to highlight the contrariness of their culture to the Austrian German culture, and therefore the imbalance between the two nations. Judit Frigyesi writes that

\[ \text{[i]n this context, nationalism appears to be a political force used in the discourse—or, better, struggle—between smaller and larger nations: it is a negative force when used to oppress the smaller nations and a positive one when used to liberate the oppressed ones.}^{319} \]

As such, nationalism is linked to the portrayal of Jews and Judaism in music as an exotic Other, meaningfully undistinguished from incongruent nations other than as in opposition to “Viennese”. Bartók similarly suggests the link between folk music and the peasant class, implying that the other nations were regarded as “uncultured” and therefore subordinate:

folk music is the music of the class of population least affected by city culture, a music of a more or less great temporal as well as spatial extent, which is or sometime was alive as a spontaneous manifestation of musical

\[\text{319 Judit Frigyesi, “Bela Bartók and the Concept of Nation and Volk in Modern Hungary”, The Musical Quarterly 78, no. 2 (Summer 1994), 255.}\]
impulse. According to this definition the peasant class, being the least
affected by city culture, should be the carrier and propagator of folk
music.\footnote{Bartók, Essays, 316.}

The disparate nationalities stirred to patriotism by the inequalities of the time used
folk music as a source of rebellion against the Empiric rule. Bartók, although living in
Budapest at the time, announced in a letter to his mother in 1903 that he intended to
‘carry on the nationalist struggle against Habsburg domination by scrupulously
avoiding the German language and speaking only Hungarian’.\footnote{Kate Trumpener, Music and the Racial Imagination (Chicago: University of Chicago
Press, 2000), 406.} Hence, as the Czech and Hungarian universities were campaigning to educate and learn in their
own language, so were composers writing in theirs. However, they continued to use
the same source material as the German Austrians: the march. Patriotic marches
are found throughout Viennese art music; for example, Act One of Die Lustige
Witwe begins with a march that proclaims the sadness of the Pontevedrian people
at being away from home, but the best illustration is the finale of Act Two of Die
Zigeunerbaron. At this point Barinkay, Zsupán and Ottokar are leaving to join the
Hussars to fight in Spain. The finale contains a recruiting march (taken from No. 12
½), and also a cavalry march in compound time, which among other Hungarian
characteristics uses fanfares on the clarinet rather than trumpet, the clarinet being
the second solo instrument in Gypsy music after the fiddle.

The theatre composers instigated the use of folk music as a way of
introducing the exotic and a sense of Other into their operettas. Crittenden states
that Viennese operetta often features ‘overt and specific reference to regions of the
Habsburg monarchy in general and to Vienna in particular. This subjectified Vienna
is often established in opposition to some Other’, for example, Pontevedria in Die
Lustige Witwe, or Hungary in Die Fledermaus and Der Zigeunerbaron.\footnote{Crittenden, Johann Strauss, 120. For extensive discussion of the exotic Other in Western
music see Jonathan Bellman, The Exotic in Western Music (Boston: Northeastern University
Press, 1998); Georgina Born and David Hesmondhalgh, Western Music and Its Others
(Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000); Matthew Head, Orientalism, Masquerade,
and Mozart’s Turkish Music (London: Royal Musical Association, 2000); Ralph Locke,
Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009);
Catherine Mayes, “Cultural Associations of Turkish and Hungarian-Gypsy Styles in the Late
Eighteenth Century and their Compositional Implications”, OHTT; Derek B. Scott,
“Orientalism and Musical Style” The Musical Quarterly 82, no. 2 (Summer 1998), 309–335.}

Vienna itself is usually represented by a waltz or polka, both of which symbolise the
ceremonial nature of the Empire and the aristocratic nature of the city. Songs
alluding to the decadence of life, for example, “The Champagne Song” from Die Fledermaus, or “O Vaterland” from Die Lustige Witwe, also reference it.

2.6.c. The Polka

As mentioned above, the polka is associated with the aristocratic class, and by extension Alt Wien, despite the fact that the dance originated in Bohemia. This is because the polka was not a folkdance; it did not evolve from a nationalist dance in the way the waltz or mazurka (outlined below) did. Instead, the polka was an urban social dance dating no further back than the 1830s. Gracian Černušák describes the trends rapid proliferation through the European upper classes:

The polka was introduced to Prague in 1837 and appeared in print the same year in Berra’s collection Prager Lieblings-Galopen für Pianoforte. In the following years innumerable polkas were written by such composers as Hilmar, Joseph Labitzky and Josef Neruda, and were published in collections of dances or in special series with picturesque or topical titles. In 1839 the band of a Bohemian regiment took the polka to Vienna, and that year it also reached St Petersburg. The Prague dancing-master Jan Raab introduced it to Paris in 1840, though it was not until 1843–4 that it became the favourite dance of Parisian society. On 11 April 1844 the dance was first performed in London by Carlotta Grisi and Jules Perrot on the stage of Her Majesty’s Theatre.

Once in Vienna versions of this dance were composed and performed by Strauss I and Joseph Lanner, who developed two distinct forms: the Polka française and the Schnell-Polka. In the words of both Andrew Lamb and Stanley Goscombe—in their biographies of Bohemian composer Joseph Labitzky and Hungarian bandmaster Josef Gungl, respectively—the Viennese Strauss family ‘overshadowed’ the Bohemian composers, which perhaps explains the dance’s subsequent association with the Austrian court and the Viennese upper class. However, the dance still retains its ‘notions of Czechness’, and has been incorporated into ‘art’ music, such as Smetana’s String Quartet no. 1 JB 1:105 (1876), the second movement of Dvořák’s Czech Suite Op. 39 (1879), and his Slavonic Dances Op. 46, No. 3 (1878). The sudden swell of popularity this dance enjoyed, leading to its adoption by the Strauss family, while still being

---

324 Ibid. Capitals in original.
'unconsciously Czech', as Černušák suggests, provides a multivalent aspect to this topic: it is, in essence, both Viennese and Other.

The polka is usually in ternary form with eight-bar sections, sometimes with a brief introduction of coda. It is in duple time, and played at a moderate speed, with the exception of the schnell-polka, which is similar in tempo to the galop. Characteristic rhythmic patterns are made up of quavers and semiquavers, generally without an upbeat (Example 2.12). These rhythms follow the distinctive 'half-step' performed by the dancers. These characteristics can be found in Strauss’s *Die Fledermaus*, initially as the ball theme, which Carl Dahlhaus suggests acts as 'a sort of musical emblem or leitmotiv for Falke’s intrigue', a concept discussed below in chapter 3 (section 3.1.a). The polka also appears in Act Two, No. 11, when the guests at Prince Orlofsky’s ball toast champagne as the King of all wines over a polka (Example 2.13), which echoes the *Champagner-Polka* Op. 211, written by Strauss fifteen years before.

*Example 2.12: Characteristic Polka Rhythms.*

*Example 2.13: Strauss II, J., Die Fledermaus, No. 11, bb. 4–8.*

---

326 Ibid.
2.7. Style Hongrois

The indications of the Other, exotic nationalities often cite the pastoral side of life, such as in Rosalinde’s csárdás: “die Sonne so klar, / wie grün deine Wälder, / die lachend die Felder”. This pastoral idyllic idea appealed to the Viennese imagination, symbolising ‘freedom, nonconformity, and independence from the constricting mores of society’. Because of the close relationship Austria had with Hungary over the other Slav peoples, which culminated in the Compromise in 1867 by which the Austrian Empire became the Dual Monarchy of Austria-Hungary, these references were often in Hungarian (or style hongrois) or Gypsy styles.

2.7.a. Signifiers

In his book The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe, Bellman sets out a lexicon of individual gestures separated into several broad categories: imitations of the instruments most commonly used by the Gypsies; rhythmic figures derived from the Hungarian language and common ornamental and dance rhythms; melodic gestures, including coloured intervals; and harmony. Catherine Mayes claims that the origin of the style hongrois from dances, rather than the hallgató style—“to be listened to”—is unsurprising.

The verbunkos, for example, drew on well-known elements of Hungarian social dances, such as would be performed at weddings, and, through inclusion in Western composers’ Hausmusik, became ‘synonymous with Hungarianness’. The association of Hungarian-Gypsy music with dancing, Mayes claims, was commercially sound, with hundreds of published collections appearing from the 1780s–1820s. In her analyses of these collections Mayes notices that, while the first half of the dances were ‘jovial and flirtatious’, the second half were often in the minor, had forte dynamics, with, on occasion, the indication maestoso, which acknowledged that, in addition to its purpose as dance music, this music aided military recruitment. Mayes explains that

327 (The sun so clear, / how green the forests, / the laughing fields) from No.10 Csárdás, Die Fledermaus.
329 In 1867, after the shattering defeat at Kőnnigratz, Emperor Francis Joseph agreed to terms made by the Magyar leadership intended to turn the Habsburg Monarchy into a German-Magyar condominium, with the Magyars ruling Hungary and the rest of the Empire ruled by Austrian Germans. The result of this agreement was the Ausgleich, or Compromise of 1867. Beller, A Concise History of Austria, 142–143.
330 Ibid., 221.
331 Ibid., 226.
the primary character of most Western European representations of Hungarian-Gypsy dances is one of jovial or trifling simplicity rather than of ‘warlike rage’ [which] reflects the desire of Western Europeans to translate an impression of Hungarian-Gypsy music that served their own needs and tastes.\textsuperscript{333}

It is, however, important to note Mayes’ use of the phrase “Western European representations”. The \textit{style hongrois} detailed above is a representation. It is not Hungarian music, or Gypsy music, but a stylised version of what people perceived these musics to be. This is what Bartók railed against: that what Liszt and Brahms called “Hungarian” and Sárosi called “Gypsy”, is in fact neither. In the same way that the military topic signifies nobility and medieval chivalry, rather than the bloody reality of savage warfare, the \textit{style hongrois} has no basis in Hungarian music, as confirmed in particular by its most prevalent signifier, the Gypsy scale. The characteristics of this style instead derive from varied origins, such as the Turkish style (from which comes the use of percussion, particularly cymbals, the importance of the repetition of the third, upper neighbour notes, the drone and harmonic stasis), and the Hungarian-Gypsy folk dances such as the \textit{verbunkos} and the \textit{csárdás}.\textsuperscript{334}

Bellman’s categories are outlined below and illustrated with examples from art music sources and from the operetta in question.

\textbf{2.7.b. Instrumentation}

The instrument commonly associated with the \textit{style hongrois}, characterised by rhapsodic elements, small, jangling ornaments and grace notes, non-melodic extremes of range and pizzicato, is the fiddle. The fiddle player was in the primary position within the ensemble, and acted in place of a conductor, who was never present. Hence, he performs the \textit{friss} sections with virtuosity, and the slow \textit{hallgató} style with rubato overwhelmed by improvised expression. At the end of these \textit{fiorituras} the whole band plays chords and long notes, briefly grounding the soloist

\textsuperscript{333} Ibid., 226.
before he progresses to the next flourish. The hallgató style was not only the provenance of the fiddle, however; middle range woodwind, such as the clarinet, oboe, or the more traditional táratakó were also used for this type of expression.\textsuperscript{335} The táratakó is described by Bellman as ‘a shrill, shawmlike instrument that dates back to the Hungarian independence movement of the late seventeenth century’, although this instrument is generally superseded by the clarinet or oboe (Example 2.14, including vocal and tárakátó improvisation).\textsuperscript{336} The bagpipe was also important within Hungarian folk music, but like the táratakó the instrument itself had all but died out, while the drone fifth characteristic of the bagpiper’s style, now played by the double bass or cello, had lived on. This, Bellman suggests, is the possible origin for the propensity towards harmonic stasis in the style.\textsuperscript{337}

One final instrument, which is fundamental to Gypsy bands as accompanist or soloist, is the cimbalom. A malleted string instrument, it initially had no sustaining pedal, although this was added in the nineteenth century. When evoking this instrument, usually on the piano, composers such as Liszt and Schubert used tremolo effects, for example, in the openings of Liszt’s Hungarian Rhapsody Nos. 11 (Example 2.15) and 12.

\textit{Example 2.14: Vocal Improvisation. Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No.1, bb. 52–56.}

\textsuperscript{335} Bellman, \textit{The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe} (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1993), 103.
\textsuperscript{336} Ibid., 103.
\textsuperscript{337} Bellman, “Toward a Lexicon for the Style hongrois”, 227.
Vocal imitation is evoked using parallel thirds and sixths, and grace notes, often falling from more than a fifth above the melody. The parallel “voices” descend from folk singing traditions in Eastern Europe and are voiced equally, with neither melody taking precedence. It is noteworthy, particularly in the methodological context of topic theory, that the commercial Gypsy bands never employed vocalists (although Bartók states that ‘real, non-musician rural Gypsies’ did have songs which were never performed in public); this is one area which Bartók uses as evidence that Gypsy and Hungarian music are so different. He notes that

in the folksong, text and music form an indivisible unity. Gypsy performance destroys this unity because it transforms, without exception,

\[\text{Example 2.15: Cimbalom Evocations. Liszt, Hungarian Rhapsody, No. 11, bb. 1–2.}\]

\[\text{Lento a capriccio}\]

\[\text{una corda}\]

338 Bartók, “Gypsy Music or Hungarian Music?”, 252.
the vocal pieces into purely instrumental ones. This alone suffices to prove the lack of authenticity in Gypsy renderings of music, even with regard to popular art music. If a person were compelled to reconstruct our popular art music with the aid of Gypsy bands alone, he would find the task impossible because half of the material—the texts—is lost in the hands of the Gypsies. 339

Consequently, the gestures that mimic the voice in the style hongrois are in fact stylised representations of what were already imitations of Hungarian folk-song by Gypsy instrumentalists.

The first song from Kálmán’s Gráfin Mariza is an exemplification of vocal imitation within style hongrois, with the introductory melody, passed between the clarinet, oboe and violin, displaying many of the rhythms outlined below (Example 2.14). The song is sung by Manja, a Gypsy fortune-teller in love with Tassilo, and the vocal entry signifies this through the use of the alla zoppa rhythm and what Warren terms the estam, or esztam (oom-pah) accompaniment. In this style of accompaniment the offbeats are accented, de-emphasising the onbeats to accentuate the alla zoppa style. 340 The clarinet doubles the voice, and is itself doubled at parallel thirds, creating a further layer of mimesis to the vocal gesture described above. Therefore, the vocal imitation is now paralleling the actual vocal line.

2.7.c. Rhythms

Many of the rhythmic characteristics of the style hongrois derive from the angular traits of the Hungarian language. Others are ornamental rhythms used for effect and expression. In the former category lies the spondee, the choriambus and the Lombard, while the alla zoppa, dotted and triplet rhythms, and the bókazó originate more from dance rhythms than textual sources.

The spondee is a metrical foot consisting of two long notes which have the effect of halting quicker motion, an effect similar to the one a full stop has on a sentence (Example 2.16). Of all the rhythms outlined here, it is the least likely to appear in an operetta, and indeed no such use has been found, as it stops the music so suddenly. Within an operetta, designed to be danced to and for the public to be able to sing and play along with at home, this rhythm would not have been easy to assimilate into the exceedingly Western structures needed for maximum

339 Ibid., 252.
commercial viability. The choriambus, long-short-short-long, is commonly seen in Bartók’s folksong settings, linking it closely to the Hungarian language (Example 2.17). The accented short-long is the Lombard (Example 2.18), while the accented short-short-long is termed the Hungarian anapest.


*Example 2.18: Lombard. Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No.6, bb. 1–8.*

Example 2.20: The Bókazó. Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No. 4, bb. 29–32.

The *alla zoppa* rhythm is one of the most common in the style, and consists of a crotchet between two quavers, or a minim between crotchets, giving a syncopated flavour to the music. The *bókazó*—“capering”—rhythm is, Bellman states, one of the clearest indications of the style, and appears most frequently at the end of phrases; hence Liszt referred to this rhythm as the ‘Magyar cadence’. This rhythm originated from a heel- or spur-clicking figure common in Hungarian dance. The Hungarian’s history as equestrian nomads helps to explain the significance of this spur-clicking dance rhythm to the *style hongrois*. This rhythm also has a melodic contour associated with it: a turn beginning on the upper neighbour note.

### 2.7.d. Dance Forms

The *verbunkos*, a Hungarian term derived from the German *Werbung*, meaning “recruitment” or “courtship”, is a dance played by Gypsies to lure village boys into the army. The recruiters would often force Gypsies to accompany their enlistment campaigns with this upbeat dance to give an impression of ‘jolly, carefree army life’. The characteristics of the *verbunkos* include duple meter, a gradual increase in tempo from very slow to very fast, and a profusion of instrumental ornamentation. An example of the *verbunkos* within *Gräfin Mariza* can be found in Mariza’s entrance music, No. 4.

Beginning slowly, and gradually increasing in speed until the *vivo* marking of the instrumental final passage, Mariza’s entrance represents the power and independence of this aristocratic woman, signified by the stately processional falling crotchet chords. Mariza invokes the Gypsies, singing “Höre ich Zigeunergergen”. This is significant in two ways. Acting similarly to a *verbunkos* it calls to the Gypsies. Traditionally this would have been a call to arms in the dance’s original capacity as a recruiting march; here, however, it indicates that the Gypsies work for Mariza,

---

342 Ibid., 17.
which, according to Sárosi, is historically accurate. Gypsy musicians, Sárosi explains, gravitated to places where there was a possibility of making money. This meant they often obtained patronage from aristocrats or minor nobles. Only in the larger towns and cities, like Budapest or Vienna, were they able to settle without patronage. The signification of the Gypsy music is highlighted within this song, the text echoing Liszt’s indications of ‘freedom and defiance’ from the seventh of his Hungarian Dances: “klingt ein toller, sehnsuchtsvoller, heißer wilder Csárdástraum / rot wie Blut und heiß wie Feuer, komm’ und mach’ die Seele freier, spiel’ dazu, Zigeuner!” (Sounds like a great, yearning, hot wild csárdás dream / red as blood and hot as fire, come and make the soul free, play along, Gypsies!). The words also bring to mind the dual meaning of the word Werbung: the text is passionate, more so than one would expect from a call from one’s employer. The verbunkos therefore introduces the character of Mariza, and pre-shadows the theme of her courtship with two men inextricably linked with the Gypsies. A solo violin accompanies Mariza with style hongrois rhythms such as the anapest and Lombard, and the estam accompaniment with ornamentation such as turns and grace notes. At figure 6 (marked Breit) the cimbalo is evoked with tremolo figures in the orchestra, and from here until the csárdás begins the music alternates between fast and slow, with the solo violin and the voice sounding together.

The csárdás is possibly a later version of the verbunkos, although, Bellman claims, if so it incorporates elements of the nóta song style. The nóta songs are a folk-influenced genre, combining aspects of both Viennese and verbunkos music. They were often composed by minor nobles, described by Bellman as ‘people for whom professional musical performance and involvement would have been unthinkable, and were often sentimental in nature’. These songs tended to be slow, with the marked rhythms of the Hungarian texts giving them a distinctive character.

The famous Lied performed by Tassilo, the disguised count who nevertheless has an unexplained connection with the Gypsy community on Gräfin Mariza’s estate, could be seen as in the nóta style. The Lied is a slow waltz, which

---

344 Ibid., 16.
345 A third signification, that of the uncanny will be investigated in the later topical narrative.
347 Bellman, The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe, 21.
begins in a minor key, but becomes more traditional in the second part. The minor waltz relates well to the *Lied*'s text, which is a melancholy reminiscence for “My Vienna”. Moreover, the key connotes the *style hongrois*, in direct opposition to the waltz structure. The second half, although more traditionally scored, is performed in a *rubato* manner more fitting to the Hungarian *parlando-rubato* style of singing; also, while the lush string orchestration suggests the romance topic, the solo violin which doubles the voice adds the Hungarian flavour to the *Lied*.

The *csárdás* is a traditional Hungarian dance and has two sections: *lassu* or *lassan* (slow) and *friss* or *friska* (from the German *frisch*, fresh or fast). The opening section is a slow, measured, 4/4 dance, often resembling a ‘presentation step’ or a ‘metrically free, rhapsodic approach’. The fast section consists of either one, or several songs, which represent a loss of control and emotional abandonment. The dance is still popular in Hungary today, and often takes the form of a medley of tunes progressing from slow to fast, rather than the traditional two-part form.

The most famous song from *Gräfin Mariza*, “Komm Zigány!”, which appears at the beginning of the first act finale, is a *csárdás* that emerges after Mariza confirms her engagement and sends leftover wine out to her bailiff. The insult Tassilo feels at this gesture prompts the emotive song, a lament that he too was once a fine *csárdás* cavalier, “Auch ich war einst ein feiner Csárdáskavalier”. The passion felt in this song encompasses the *lassu* section of the dance form, with an instrumental dance in the *friss* section marked *Presto* and *langsamer beginnen, immer schneller werden*. Both sections contain all the elements of the *style hongrois*: the rhythmic signifiers, the *estam* accompaniment, the ornamented improvisation, the parallel thirds and the augmented second interval of the Gypsy scale, as shown in Example 2.21.

---

349 Quotations from, respectively, Bellman, “Toward a Lexicon for the *Style hongrois*”, 217; Bellman, *The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe*, 21.
The 'impression of Hungarian-Gypsy music', cited above, translates to the manipulation, or evolution, of the topical signification of the style hongrois topic. The Gypsies' way of life, travelling as they did from city to city, picking up different cultural characteristics, had the result that, with relatively little transcription on paper, the musical gestures evolved to include many different styles, and consequently multiple layers of association. Bellman suggests that because of this lifestyle what the Gypsies and their music represented to the Romantic sensibility is encapsulated by Liszt's performance instruction at the beginning of the seventh Hungarian Rhapsody, which reads: "To be played in the Gypsy style, defiant, and yet melancholy". To the popular imagination, the Gypsy symbolized freedom, nonconformity, and independence from the constricting mores of society.350 [...] The parallels in Liszt's case are obvious: the self-conscious simplicity of his Magyar spirit and pietistic leanings sits in marked contrast to his cosmopolitan pretension and associations with wealth and aristocracy.351

Anna Piotrowska agrees that the image of the idealised Gypsy musician, constructed both in literature and within musical works, 'has been considered the embodiment of the inspired creator, possessing the specific features of the sensitive romantic artist. He was seductive while at the same time free and rebellious, and his separateness from bourgeois society was strongly emphasised'.352 His music,

351 Ibid., 216.
therefore, signified similar qualities. ‘The idealised concept of Gypsy music’, Piotrowska goes on to explain, ‘only loosely related to the musical practices of real Romanies, fulfilled the romantic hankering after exotic, charming, and highly emotional music’. Freedom and defiance were not the only significations of the style, according to Warren. He identifies the misconceptions the Austrians held concerning the Magyars. Despite their political partnership, the Hungarians were viewed at times by the Viennese as ‘savage, uncivilised foreigners from the East’. Additionally, the memory of the Magyar allying themselves with the Ottoman Turks in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries against the Austrians added to the mistrust. Their refusal to assimilate into the culture, but instead to thrive as societal outsiders, added to the fascinating “defiant freedom” aspect the *style hongrois* signified, while simultaneously overlaying it with the fear of the unknown and Other.

This ambiguity in the signification of the Hungarian-Gypsy musical style is discussed by Mayes in a comparison between the *alla turca* and the Hungarian-Gypsy musics. She posits that ‘that music *alla turca* and early representations of Hungarian-Gypsy music cannot, for the most part, be considered discrete topics from a stylistic point of view is due ... to the fact that they were largely constructed by the same culture’. Mayes explains that the perception of Eastern Europe as a cohesive whole during the Enlightenment meant that the Hungarians were classified along with the Turkish as Western Europe’s ‘barbaric Other *par excellence*’. Recent research on the differences between Gypsy music and the *style hongrois* is provided in Piotrowska’s detailed history *Gypsy Music in European Culture*, in which she outlines the two models of academic consideration, the assimilative and non-assimilative models:

> In the period following the French Revolution right up until the beginning of the twentieth century, the assimilative model was based on the concept of the nationality propagated within the whole of Europe. As such, Gypsy music was presented as an integral component of European culture, a form

---

353 Ibid., 1.
354 Warren, "The *Style Hongrois* in the music of Johann Strauss Jr.", 38.
355 Ibid.
356 Ibid.
357 Mayes, “Turkish and Hungarian-Gypsy Styles”, 215–236.
358 Ibid., 217.
359 Ibid., 217.
that joined with local musical idioms to create national musical traditions in individual countries. Meanwhile, within the nonassimilative model, Gypsy music was presented as belonging to a distinct culture, whose outlook was inherently alien to European civilisation. The nonassimilative model employed the concepts of exoticism (Orientalism) and race, weaving Gypsy origin, musical characteristics, and thinking on the culture of Gypsies into an interdependent web.\textsuperscript{360}

Using specific dances and rhythms, such as the \textit{verbunkos} or \textit{csárdás}, the \textit{style hongrois} represents Hungarian-Gypsy music in particular, rather than a generic Other, and has a particular significance in Vienna owing to the presence of a ‘culturally learned recognition’. It is therefore part of the assimilative model outlined by Piotrowska. It is not the alien Other, the exotic presence used to provide the audience with a form of escapism, but a familiar Other, which, as suggested above, evokes familiarity, but also fear and dread of the unknown. It could therefore be understood as a manifestation of the uncanny: ‘that class of the frightening which leads back to what is known of old and long familiar’.\textsuperscript{361}

Fear was not the only negative connotation this style achieved. Shay Loya suggests that the authenticity of this ‘much perverted imitation of older and more authentic’ folk music resulted in ‘an aesthetic depreciation of the value of Hungarian Gypsy-band music in scholarly discourse inside and outside Hungary’.\textsuperscript{362} He further notes that Bartók deemed there to be a dichotomy in ‘the aesthetic sympathy between peasant music and highbrow musical modernism and its supposed opposite: the unholy union between fake folklore and lowbrow romanticism’.\textsuperscript{363}

The Hungarian style is obviously not the only national style that was common at this time, although it is the most prevalent. Another style worth investigating, made popular by Chopin in the Parisian salons of the nineteenth century, is the Polish \textit{mazurka}.\textsuperscript{364} There are three basic types of mazurka. The \textit{oberek} is the fastest of the three, originating in central and western Poland; the mazurka (or \textit{mazur}) is slower but still lively in character, while the \textit{kujawiak}, a dance

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{360} Piotrowska, \textit{Gypsy Music}, 13.  \\
\textsuperscript{361} Freud, “The Uncanny”, 220.  \\
\textsuperscript{362} Shay Loya, \textit{Listz’s Transcultural Modernism and the Hungarian-Gypsy Tradition} (New York: University of Rochester Press, 2011), 118.  \\
\textsuperscript{363} Loya, \textit{Listz’s Transcultural Modernism}, 123.  \\
\end{flushright}
from the Kraków region, is of moderate tempo, with longer phrase lengths. All three variants are in triple meter; are usually accompanied by a drone on the tonic, or tonic and dominant; and feature a \textit{tempo rubato} that lends the dances a rhythmic freedom.\textsuperscript{365} The instruments most commonly used in this folk tradition consist of violins (which may play the melody or the drone), drum and harmonium.

The three dances are distinguished not only by their tempo but also by their varied placement of accented notes. In the \textit{oberek} the accent falls on the last part of the second measure; in the \textit{kujawiak} the main stress is placed on any part of the fourth bar of the phrase; and in the \textit{mazur} the accents can be placed according to the composer's whim, creating an irregular character to the dance with its free pattern.\textsuperscript{366} This dance has similarities with the German \textit{Ländler} (the triple time and melodic diatonicism), and with the rhythmic freedom of the Hungarian \textit{hallgató} style, but it is the inclusion of the tonic-dominant drone which places it apart from either of these, while at the same time associates it firmly with the more general pastoral folk topic.

2.8. Vienna 1900: Topical Sphere

In summary of the 'new' topics, Table 2.1 provides a full list of the topics discussed above with their signifiers, while Table 2.2 demonstrates how these topics interlock with the extant topics.

\textit{Table 2.1: A List of the Viennese Topics Discussed Above With Their Signifiers.}

\begin{itemize}
  \item Rational:
    \begin{itemize}
      \item Classical forms
      \item Diatonic harmony
      \item Traditional orchestration
      \item Learned style
      \item Chorale topic
      \item Aria
      \item Ecclesiastical genre
      \item Biedermeier
    \end{itemize}
  \item Romantic:
    \begin{itemize}
      \item Psychological:
    \end{itemize}
\end{itemize}

\textsuperscript{365} Downes, "Mazurka".
\textsuperscript{366} Anne Swartz, "The Polish Folk Mazurka", \textit{Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae} 1, no. 4 (1975), 250–252.
Sensibility  
Ombra  
Tempesta

- Romance topic:
  - Moderate tempo
  - Alberti bass
  - Ascending pizzicato bass
  - Rhythmically regular
  - Arch shape
  - Octave strings

Authentic:
- Sparse orchestration
- No ornamentation/embellishment

Judaism:
- Vocal tradition
- Liturgical text (optional)
- Jewish language, or about Jewish historical or home life
- Improvisation between chordal accompaniment (similar to Hungarian hallgató)
- Oom-pah or recitative accompaniment.
- Melodic minor scale melody

Nationalism:
- Austrian:
  - Waltz:
    - Oom-pah-pah accompaniment
    - Atempause
    - Rigorous speed
    - Romantic melodies
  - Ländler:
    - Major and diatonic
    - Alpine arpeggio figures
    - ‘Rawness’

- Style Hongrois:
  - Nóta:
    - Slow tempi
    - Rhythms following text
  - Csárdás:
    - Two sections
    - First: slow and rhapsodic meter and melody, in duple time
    - Second: stricter time and melody. Often dance-like.
  - Hallgató:
    - Highly virtuosic
    - Between the soloists flourishes the band play chords and long notes.
  - Solo fiddle
  - Spondee rhythm
  - Choriambus
- ‘Gypsy scale’

- Polish mazurka:
  - Fast oberek
  - Slow but lively mazurka
  - Moderate dance *kujawiak*:
    - All three: triple meter, accompanied by a drone, *tempo rubato*.

*Table 2.2: The Topics Present c. 1900, Their Topical Classes and Associative Classes.*
Chapter 3: Narrativity in Strauss, Mahler and Zemlinsky

The editors of *Narrative in Music Since 1900*, Michael L. Klein and Nicholas Reyland, state that the convention when discussing musical narrative is to start with Jean-Jacques Nattiez’s “famous question, “Can one speak of narrativity in music?”, and Nattiez’s equally famous answer: “no”.

The approaches to a theory of musical narrative have been as varied as the objections. Carolyn Abbate and Nattiez both argue that music is mimetic rather than diegetic, hence, as Abbate states, it has no past tense. Lawrence Kramer also rejects the idea of a narrator: “various elements of an instrumental piece may confront this presiding subject with agencies but not with agents, with personifications but not with persons.”

Music, Kramer states, is a supplement to narrative, it cannot be a narrative itself.

These objections arose in answer to narrative theories put forward by Edward T. Cone and Fred E. Maus, and in subsequent decades the solutions have varied. Maus, for example, links music to drama, in that the action within a play is immediate and in the present, therefore negating the need for a past tense. Most notable is Klein’s 2004 article “Chopin’s Fourth Ballade as Musical Narrative” in which he cites Paul Cobleby:

> Recent work on narrative [...] has shown the difficulty of maintaining the distinction between mimesis and diegesis. J. Hillis Miller, for example, argues that Sophocles’ Oedipus Rex fails as an example of mimesis, because the action in the play is ‘made up almost exclusively of people standing around talking or chanting.’ Paul Cobleby argues that a telling is also a showing, because the creator of a narrative in any medium chooses...
to reveal some events, while hiding others. Accordingly, Cobley defines narrative as the 'showing or telling of these events and the mode selected for that to take place.' Under this definition, music’s failure of the diegesis test ceases to impact its status as a narrative artform.

Common to these approaches is the recognition of a similarity between musical and literary discourse, and the definition of narrative as a transformation of semantically meaningful units over time, whether the units are themes, motives, figures, tonal events or topics. Anthony Newcomb refers to an analogy between literary and musical patterning. Byron Almén, led by Hatten’s hierarchically structured “markedness” concept, defines narrative as ‘track[ing] the effect of transgressive shifts or conflicts on a prevailing cultural system, as inflected by that which is important to the observer.’ Almén is not the first to highlight the importance of the interpretant. Newcombe and Eero Tarasti also emphasise the listener's role in the creation of a narrative: ‘it is subjective in that it depends on the education, intuition, and talent of the individual critic-interpreter.’

Led by Tarasti's analysis of Chopin's Ballade in G Minor, Almén cites this as an ‘important insight' about musical narrative:

Musical narrative is fundamentally dependant on the listener’s, analysts, and/or performer’s interpretation. […] Of course, a successful—that is to say, persuasive—interpretation will be significantly guided by the phenomenal data, but a great deal of leeway remains with respect to the shaping and contextualising of these data.

This is significant in this thesis because of the analytical process employed. With each following case study, the first analysis has been prepared with no prior knowledge of the piece or any extant literature on the music. This somewhat corresponds to Cone’s ‘First Reading’ of a detective story (or a Brahms Intermezzo) in which he advocates three readings of the story in order to fully comprehend it. The first reading ‘refers to any reading based on total or partial ignorance of the

events narrated'.\textsuperscript{378} This ensured that the initial topical analysis was unbiased, that is, that other interpretations, or previous interpreter’s conventional perceptions, did not colour the eventual analysis put forward in this thesis. With the “blind” analysis complete, an investigation into the surrounding literature shows a connection between the revealed topical narrative and the encircling contemporary culture and current literature. For example, the connections found to psychoanalysis in Schoenberg’s works that is preceded by such scholars as Klein, Kramer, Richard Cohn, Michael Cherlin and Alexander Carpenter.\textsuperscript{379}

This thesis begins with a reorganisation of Hatten’s topical hierarchy, designed to assign rank within the topical universe in order to create a musical narrative through markedness, as outlined by Hatten and Almén. The resulting diagram is instead similar to a syntactic diagram, and therefore follows more closely a theory of musical narrative derived from literary sources—such as Gérard Genette, Seymour Chatman and Martin McQuillan—in which different levels of association can be navigated without necessarily connoting rank.\textsuperscript{380} Chatman explains ‘that […] all narratives, in whatever medium, combine the time sequence of plot events, the time of the histoire (“story-time”) with the time of the presentation of those events in the text, which we call “discourse-time”’.\textsuperscript{381} Vera Micznik further explains how these two levels of narrative apply to music:

\begin{quote}
[\textit{u}nder the heading ‘Story’, I abstract from the two works the ‘musical events’ themselves [the signifieds] and analyse their meanings from the simplest to the more complex—from explicit to implicit—semiotic levels […] as a demonstration of what makes them ‘events’. And under ‘Discourse’, I examine the particular mode of unfolding (the presentation) [the signifiers] of these events within the ‘musical formal discourse’ of the respective movements and the capabilities of the ‘discourse’ itself to produce
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{378} Cone, “Three Ways of Reading a Detective Story”, 79.
\textsuperscript{379} For a full literature review on this subject, see chapter 4.
\textsuperscript{381} Chatman, “What Novels Can Do That Films Can’t (and Vice-Versa)”, 435–436.
meanings through ‘gestural and intertextual connotations’ and through ‘temporal manipulations’.\textsuperscript{382}

In each case study throughout the thesis a similar model of analysis has been used, that is, each begins with an identification of the signifiers within the piece and then an exploration of their position within the temporal and cultural/historical landscape of the work.

The above literature on narrative in music centres on what Susan McClary describes as ‘the music that narrates by itself’, the European canon stretching roughly from Vivaldi to Mahler (1700–1900).\textsuperscript{383} Thus, despite her claim that ‘even the most austere, apparently self-contained of the pieces produced within this repertory attain their coherence and effectiveness as cultural artefacts through processes aligned with narrative’, McClary dismisses the notion that non-tonal music can resemble narrative.\textsuperscript{384} In fact, she writes, ‘beginning with Debussy, Stravinsky, and Schoenberg and extending to the experiments of John Cage, the avant-garde music of the twentieth century has been self-consciously ANTI-narrative.’\textsuperscript{385} Jann Pasler, however, lists anti-narrative as one of ‘three significant innovations’ stimulated by ‘twentieth-century composer’s attempts to thwart listeners’ expectation of narrative’.\textsuperscript{386}

anti-narratives and nonnarratives both challenge important aspects of narrative, but still have narrativity (i.e. some organising principle). […] Works without narrativity try to eliminate completely the listener’s predilection to seek for narrativity.\textsuperscript{387}

Anti-narrative relies on a frustration of narrative expectation through interruptions of the temporal processes, and ‘change without narrative transformation’. Stockhausen’s “moment form”, or Jonathan Kramer’s “moment time”, exemplified in Pasler’s chapter by Stockhausen’s \textit{Carré} (1958–9) and \textit{Stop} (1965), produces this

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{382} Vera Micznik, “Music and Narrative Revisited: Degrees of Narrativity in Beethoven and Mahler” \textit{Journal of the Royal Musical Association} 126, no. 2 (2001), 199–203.
\item \textsuperscript{383} Susan McClary, “The Impromptu That Trod on a Loaf: Or How Music Tells Stories” in \textit{The Narrative Reader}, 168.
\item \textsuperscript{385} McClary, “The Impromptu That Trod on a Loaf”, 167.
\item \textsuperscript{387} Ibid.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
type of signification. Therefore, there is still a degree of narrativity, rather than an absence of it. The frustration of narrative temporality in *Stop*, for example, is offset by the sense of narrative provided by the organising principle of the twelve-tone row. Reyland’s analysis of Lutosławski’s *Livre pour orchestre* also explains anti-narrativity as a modernist structure that in *Livre*, and in spite of Lutosławski’s original intentions, is ‘ultimately subjugated to the classicist narrativity of its emergent symphonism’.

Non-narrative works are ‘works that may use elements of narratives but without allowing them to function as they would a narrative’. These elements are related and derive from one another; however, the transformation through time that defines narrative does not occur. Klein outlines non-narrative as ‘music with no tonality, no themes, no sense of causality or transformation, no organising principle whatsoever, in fact; just a set of independent sound worlds, textures, or blips of acoustic matter’. He goes on to outline a fourth signification: neo-narrative. ‘Here’, Klein writes, ‘is music in search of new ways to tell stories. Sometimes the rhythmic drive of this music is enough to give us a sense of musical plot, or the everchanging timbres of orchestral colour stand in for transformation, or the gradual motion through register lends us a sense of musical agency’. Klein suggests that Schoenberg’s music fits into this category, citing Boulez that Schoenberg’s ambition was to ‘create works of the same nature as those of the old sound-world which he had only just abandoned’. Reyland develops the four corners of Klein’s semiotic square (*narrative, neo-narrative, anti-narrative, non-narrative*) through examples of ‘narrative negation (disnarration, denarration, bifurcating narration, [and] subjunctive narration)—some of which will be discussed in the following case studies, for example disnarration in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony. In the same volume, Almén and Hatten discuss twentieth-century narrative techniques such as developments in temporality, tropological or agential narratives, and myth, while Márta Grabócz also

---

391 Ibid., 41.
393 Ibid., 5.
395 Reyland, “Negation and Negotiation” in *Music and Narrative since 1900*, 35.
tackles temporality in opera. The acceptance of narrative (in some form) is querying, however, by Lawrence Kramer, who suggests both that ‘modernity does not make narrative disappear but instead renders it inoperable’, and further, that ‘modern narrative becomes a version of Lacan’s objet petit a, the locus of a desire that at best must accept its endless deferral in lieu of fulfilment’. Kramer, like McClary, cites Mahler as the last inherently narrative composer. With many other exemplars of narrative centring on Mahler’s works, the discussion on how topics and narrative devices (changing associations, opposition and inflection) integrate to reveal subtextual “stories” begins with this composer’s works and his contemporaries, Alexander von Zemlinsky and Johann Strauss.

On their own, topics evoke a specific signification, as explored in the previous chapters. When new topics are imported into an existing topical field, relationships form between the topics, creating narratives. New meanings are generated by the interactions of the various topics, depending on the marked differences of each new affect. If the topics are relatively similar, the topical field will be largely unaffected; the narrative may be flavoured or distilled, but ultimately it will be the same. With markedly different topics, say the pastoral and learned styles, their juxtaposition will create a palpable narratological dialogue. Topics are not always imported as a whole: they can be fragmented so that not all their signifiers are present, and therefore only inflect the existing topical field. In this instance, new meaning is generated giving rise, perhaps, to a satirical or idealistic narrative. Additionally—and this was highlighted in the previous chapters—topics often correlate with a specific period, so the composition date and cultural background of the work being analysed is important. As such, musical affects associated with each

---

397 Kramer, “Narrative Nostalgia: Modern Art Music off the Rails” in Music and Narrative since 1900, 165.
399 Robert Hatten calls the relationships between topics “tropes”, discussing the interaction between a topic and its new context in linguistic terms, e.g. as metaphorical, ironic or synecdochical. Hatten’s terms work more as linguistic similes for the terms used here, which are more direct and tend towards the musical analysis rather than a linguistic or semiotic analysis. (Hatten, “The Troping of Topics in Mozart’s Instrumental Works”, OHTT, 514–538; Hatten, Interpreting Musical Gestures).
topic may change, or become stylised, as in Baroque dances or Classical symphonic devices like the coup d’archet.

This chapter initially explores the various narratological devices outlined above, as well as the part pictorialism plays in topic theory, through examples taken from the works of Mahler and Zemlinsky. In addition, Johann Strauss II’s operetta Die Fledermaus (1874) is analysed, in order to provide cultural context within a more popular style and to demonstrate that composers writing for popular consumption did not necessarily make a distinction between audiences that had or lacked musical education. Once the formation of the musical narrative has been demonstrated, analyses of the first movements of Mahler’s Fourth and Seventh Symphonies are presented as exemplars of how topical interactions form coherent, and culturally situated, musical narratives.

3.1. Changing Associations

In the previous chapters, the signifiers and signifieds of topics were outlined from which a narrative could be created, dependant on their syntagmatic placement. However, through their interaction with each other and with the libretto of an operetta, or the text of a song, the signified of a topic can be altered. For example, if a topic is consistently used in conflict with what happens in the text, a new complex of associations is formed. Moreover, over time the associations of certain topics could change, moving from an apparently sincere representation of class to a satirical commentary on contemporary life. In chapter 2, Strauss’ use of the waltz’s associative complex in Die Fledermaus was shown to be distorted to present a tarnished view of the aristocracy. It is not only the waltz which is altered in this operetta: Strauss distorted the class associations of other topics, such as the Ländler and the recitative to illustrate not only the characters’ class, but also their morality. This type of social commentary was not restricted to operettas, but can also be seen in the use of the waltz and Ländler in Mahler’s Des Knaben Wunderhorn, in particular the fisherman’s story in “Rheinlegendchen”, as outlined below.

3.1.a. Austrian Identity in Die Fledermaus

The original high-class associations and the connection to Vienna of the Ländler, waltz and polka were cemented in the early 1800s by Johann Strauss I, who developed, formalised and expanded the waltz from its rustic, unrefined beginnings as the Ländler. By the time Die Fledermaus was written, in 1874, Johann Strauss II had begun to use the waltz, the polka and the Ländler in a slightly distorted manner.
The upper classes symbolised *Alt Wien* and, by extension, the decadent good old days of ‘carefree escapism and hedonistic pleasure’.\(^{400}\) While the lower classes suffered the consequences of their defeat in the Franco-Austrian war and the crash of the stock market in 1873, the upper classes continued to demonstrate an opulence they no longer possessed. Through the musical narratives discussed below, the apparent deceitfulness of the aristocracy inflects the waltz and polka in Mahler’s music, as will be demonstrated later, but this topical subversion was explored first in *Die Fledermaus*. This operetta is based around the premise of a practical joke; deception is therefore the strongest theme throughout the plot. At every major development of the intrigue—with each new lie—Strauss used one of the two topics associated with Austrian national identity, the waltz or the polka.

The first plot theme of *Die Fledermaus* is the juxtaposition of upper- and lower-class protagonists, a plot Strauss explicates by using the comic opera device of a masquerade in which the characters’ real identities can be hidden behind costumes. The operetta encapsulates the hedonistic atmosphere of the pre-Lenten festival season, known in Vienna as *Fasching*, with which Strauss was associated. This celebration is marked by heavy drinking, masked balls and exchanging the “Du” form of address in disregard of the social barriers of the everyday (the finale to the second act, particularly in “Brüderlein und Schwesterlein”, is a poignant acknowledgement of this environment).\(^{401}\) The other theme emplots duplicity in a narrative which is arguably reliant upon the main theme. It tells the story of a practical joke: the revenge of “the bat”. As the prank plays out, the victim, Eisenstein, is convinced to go to a ball rather than prison by his old friend, Dr. Falke, in revenge for Eisenstein’s previous joke, which left him wandering the streets of Vienna in a bat costume after the last ball. Falke convinces him to go to the ball because he knows Eisenstein will be caught out by his bad behaviour. As expected, when he gets to the party, Eisenstein attempts to commit adultery (although, as events turn out, with his own wife) and becomes the best of friends with the prison director, who has already mistakenly incarcerated someone else in his place.

These are the two themes set out by the libretto, but the interplay between the libretto and the topics suggest that this is not just the light comedy that it appears on the surface. All set in motion in Vienna, the story is geared towards Prince Orlofsky’s ball, the noble setting enabling a satirical view of aristocratic Vienna. The ease with which the characters are persuaded to commit immoral and

\(^{400}\) Beller, *A Concise History of Austria*, 118.
\(^{401}\) Crittenden, *Johann Strauss*, 133.
illegal acts and the part that champagne plays in the story matches the decadent way of life to which the critical modernists of the time were (ostensibly) opposed. This is a narrative based on *Wiener Schmäh*—a notion which, as noted above, combines a certain snide humour with, in Vienna at least, a sort of winning charm, encoding just this idea of humorous duplicity—in which Strauss employs the topical equivalency of leitmotif to highlight the immoral and artificial natures of the characters, whether upper or lower class.

The distorted associations of the waltz topic here have already been discussed in the previous chapter. However, similar topical alterations can be seen in the finale to Act One, which begins with a minuet. As outlined earlier, the minuet is a high-class topic often integrated with other topics. In this case, it is not integrated as such but acts as a counterpoint to the following *Ländler* at bar 13 (Example 3.1). At bars 66–73, the minuet separates the recitative (bars 59–65) from the *Ländler* (74–81). The recitative, a high-class topic, sung by an upper-class protagonist with seemingly moral intentions, is performed by Rosalinde as she wonders why Eisenstein will not ‘take the hint’ and leave. The *Ländler*, a low-class dance, is sung by Alfred, a lower-class character, as he forgives her for being untrue to him in an attempt to persuade her to commit an immoral act: Alfred tells Rosalinde that love is an illusion, so she may as well enjoy herself. While the use of both of these topics is analogous to their historically sedimented meaningfulness, the minuet that separates the two is distorted. The elegant high-class dance is used as Alfred implores Rosalinde to drink quickly so he can take advantage of her, therefore corrupting the high-class associations of the minuet. The waltz then dominates the rest of the finale as Rosalinde resigns herself to her immorality, with the famous line: “Glücklich ist, wer vergisst, was doch nicht zu ändern ist” (Example 3.1a).

The possibility that Strauss was intentionally mocking the upper classes is suggested by investigating the Act Two finale, No. 11. This is an insightful portrayal of the effects of social drinking, beginning with a polka that toasts champagne as the “König aller Weine!” (king of all wines!). The party continues in customary fashion with a hymn to universal brotherhood, utilising a round, resembling a drinking song. It begins with a slow waltz, but from bar 149 the entries become fugal (Example 3.2), beginning with the main characters singing until, at bar 161, the
chorus also joins in. The *alla breve* topic emerges between bars 183–191 and 207–221, adding to the hymnal effect of this mostly *pianissimo* tutti section (Example 3.2a).


The use of the waltz here—and the appearance of the Fledermaus waltz in the ballet that follows—becomes significant when considering the dance as a symbol of Viennese identity. The use of the waltz, the pride of the city, as a signpost for every devious intrigue throughout the operetta provides an insight into the common feelings in Vienna towards the aristocratic classes. In both these situations, the waltz accompanies text extolling the virtues of drink—in the first, it is implied by the feeling of goodwill to all that is the direct consequence of too much champagne, and the camaradery which leads to drunken rounds which were often bawdy and lascivious.\footnote{For example, Mozart's Bona Nox, Difficile lectu mihi mars K. 559, “Leck mich im Arsch” K. 231.} In the second, however, the text is more blatant—“Liebe und Wein gibt uns Seligkeit” (Love and wine give us bliss)—and the waltz is preceded by national dances from Spain, Russia, Scotland, Bohemia and Hungary until the Austrian dance is performed by the guests themselves, rather than the dancers. The fact that the national dances were considered entertainment to be performed by employees (the ballet girls), whereas the waltz is danced by the guests themselves, highlights the class distinctions present here. The guests consider the national dances rustic, peasant, low-class affairs, but the Viennese waltz is associated with the aristocracy (society balls) and therefore danced only by them. Prince Orlofsky’s call to dance (bars 512–515) also separates the dances, providing an introductory fanfare to the Austrian section which serves as a dismissive act to the ballet girls and, as such, the national entertainment. This confirms the perceived status of the waltz as the Austrian national dance, and, combined with the class associations, the hedonistic way in which the topic is used seems to confirm that Strauss is trying to convey a satirical message to the audience.

3.1.b. Mahler and the Waltz

Mahler’s manipulation of the class associations of the waltz and Ländler has been discussed by others, notably by Vera Micznik in her analyses of the Ninth Symphony where she comments on ‘the aggressive infringements of the established laws of order of “high art” [the waltz and minuet] through the intrusion of “low” genres [the Ländler] in the middle movements’.\footnote{Micznik, “Mahler and the Power of Genre”, 148.} In Micznik’s article the idea is only taken as far as the opposition between ‘high’ and ‘low’, but, with the added connotations discussed above, a further layer of signification can be exposed. Where Strauss utilised both the Ländler and the waltz as indicative of Wiener
Schmäh, Mahler returns the associative value of the Ländler to its original pastoral signification. Monelle argues that this change was possibly because of the emergence of the new bourgeois class:

‘high pastoralism’ was aristocratic, and there was no pretence of any real interest in the peasantry. The bourgeois, however, liked to imagine that his cultivation of the folksong betokened a true love of the ancient, the simple, the collective, and a sentimental respect for the unlettered rustic. Unfortunately, ‘folksong’, both in Germany and Scotland, was vitiated by a desire to civilise and tame its oddities. [...] The aristocratic pastoral was purely conventional, and came clean about this. The bourgeois pastoral was earnest, spiritual, and a little dishonest.404

An example of one such musical narrative in Mahler’s works is found in “Rheinlegendchen” from Des Knaben Wunderhorn (1892–1898). This song begins on the banks of the German river Neckar, narrated by a reaper who, distraught at losing his sweetheart, imagines throwing his ring into the water to be carried from the Rhine into the ocean, and there to be eaten by a fish. A pastoral Ländler accompanies his musing, the 3/8 meter and arpeggio figures throughout confirming the topic (Example 3.3).


404 Monelle, TMT, 227–228.

The imagined fish is headed for the King’s table, where the King will find it. The reaper’s sweetheart will see it and hasten back, bringing with her the ring to reunite them. Hence, as the fish reaches the King, the Ländler becomes a Viennese waltz as the tempo slows slightly and the instrumentation changes with the strings dominating the texture (Example 3.3a). The Viennese waltz here, then, could signify the city Vienna itself, or the Viennese aristocracy as it does in Strauss’ Die Fledermaus. The sweetheart is obviously also held in high esteem by the reaper, one of high enough class to be dining with a king, yet one who hastens back to the fisherman while the Viennese waltz continues. This suggests that the reaper hopes he is seen as akin to the King in the eyes of the maiden, in contradiction with the earlier topic of the Ländler that illustrated his plight up to bar 70. The contrast between the reaper and the King, between the Ländler and the Viennese waltz, symbolises the opposition between the country and the city. The country is portrayed by the “good” reaper whose sweetheart is stolen away by the shallow urbanity of the city. The continuation of the Viennese waltz when his love returns, however, suggests that the goodness portrayed by the Ländler is no longer relevant. The shallowness of both the imagined actions of the sweetheart, and the connotations explicit in the expectation of the reaper of what is needed to win her back, is scorned by Mahler, as demonstrated by the maintenance of the waltz to the end of the song.

The way in which Strauss I, his son, and then Mahler, used the Ländler demonstrates the way in which a topic’s signification can change. Monelle suggests
this change parallels the changing class structure of the period, with the idealism of
the aristocracy giving way to the earnest but dishonest bourgeois view of the lower
classes. The Ländler changes from the simple rustic dance of Strauss I's ballroom,
to the representation of the lower class's dwindling morality in Strauss II's Die
Fledermaus. Mahler appears to return the Ländler to its original signification: from
the low-class narrator's view the waltz represents the immoral King, while the
Ländler signifies the good reaper. However, the narrator's morality is also
questionable. "Grasen" used to be a euphemism for having an amorous adventure,
or “sowing wild oats”, in which case, it would seem the reaper yearns less for a lost
sweetheart than merely for one who will stay with him. Consequently, while the
Ländler seems on the surface to be a low-class dance in opposition to the high-
class waltz, returning to the innocence of Strauss senior's time, it still carries the
taint added by his son.

3.2. Oppositions

To create a working narrative, whether in literature or music, meaning is often
derived by oppositions between themes, characters or imagery; for example,
between good/evil, light/dark or natural/supernatural. In the musical narratives
explored in this chapter the established oppositions which will be discussed, and
which are by no means an exhaustive account, are between high- and low-class
ideals and protagonists, rural and urban concepts, stability and instability, and
Classicism and Romanticism. As these oppositions are often juxtaposed—for
example a high-class urban character, or a low-class rural shepherd—they will be
discussed as they appear within the narratives of the analysed works.

3.2.a. Die Fledermaus

As with many comic (buffa) operas, one of the main themes of Die Fledermaus is
the relationship between the classes present. The main protagonist, Eisenstein, is a
private gentleman with no title; other characters include a prince, a singing teacher,
a maid and a prison director. It is through the mixture of these class stereotypes, the
disguises the characters don during the ball, and their contrivances throughout that
the plot develops, with the topics often providing a counterpoint to the libretto rather
than harmonising with it. The opening of Act One offers an example of the high/low
class juxtaposition. It begins with the pastoral topic, in this case a rustic pastoral
signified by a simple melody, bird call, a horn drone and triplet rhythm. At this point
it is a low-class singing teacher and a maid who are on stage, but when the maid
Adele receives a letter from her sister inviting her to the ball a high-class topic—the ball theme polka—begins to play.


However, this high-class topic is still overlaid by low-class pastoral signifiers (associated with the low-class characters) such as the birdcall accompanied by the clarinet drone (bars 39–42, marked a), and the cadenza that introduces her character at bar 38 (marked b), which imitates a bird’s song (Example 3.4). The significance of the inflection of the pastoral allusions onto the urban polka is multivalent. Superficially, it merely continues the pastoral illustration of the low-class characters while introducing the ball theme which is the focal point of the operetta. Subjacent to this, the combination of the bucolic pastoral and the sophisticated ball theme opening the first act immediately presents the main storyline to the audience: the conflict between the classes.

3.2.b. Des Knaben Wunderhorn

The high-/low-class conflict can also be seen in the fourth song of Des Knaben Wunderhorn, “Wer hat dies Liedel erdacht”, a virtuosic aria topic illustrating a love song to an innkeeper’s daughter. The burbling accompaniment signifies the aria topic with brilliant passages (bars 33–45 in Example 3.5) that confirm the high class of this song. In opposition to this high class, however, pastoral signifiers are present throughout, although they are particularly prominent in the first nine bars (the horn drone and oboe melody). From bar 67 the pastoral signifiers dominate the aria with
an arpeggio figure in the first violins, which, when combined with the triple time signature, suggests a low-style Ländler. An inversion of the vocal melody in the clarinet (Example 3.6) before the oboe doubles the voice at bar 77 points towards the pastoral, but at bar 81 the brilliant topic overrides the Ländler once again. The tension is perhaps between the high aria, which represents the esteem felt by the narrator for the innkeeper’s daughter’s character, and the low Ländler, which symbolises the pastoral locale, and her actual low-born status.

In “Lied des Verfolgten im Turm”, the opposition is between the stability of the military topic and the instability of the tempesta topic, a pairing that Mahler also uses in the development section of the first movements of his Fourth and Seventh Symphonies, discussed below. Here, the stability of the military topic seems to be associated with a noble hopefulness, as the prisoner insists that his body may be imprisoned but not his mind. This notion is born of optimism, rather than through any anticipation of victory over his captors, as the tempesta topic is never completely subsumed.


The song begins with the *tempesta* topic introducing a fanfare melody sung by the prisoner declaring “Die Gedanken sind frei” (thoughts are free), which then descends into chromaticism as “sie rauschen vorbei wie nächtliche Schatten” (they rush by like nocturnal shadows). The prisoner’s voice alternates with that of his beloved, a maiden signified by the pastoral topic. As the prisoner speaks again (bar 29) the *tempesta* topic returns. Although the melody is based around the fanfare from the beginning, the military topic is not signified as such, the fanfare alone not qualifying as sufficient signification. The trumpet, however, now plays a more significant part in this section, particularly the descending arpeggio. At bar 65 the march becomes the dominant topic, the trumpet fanfare overshadowing the *tempesta* signifiers. The rhythm is now a steady 12/8, with the emphasis on the first quaver of every beat, as hope briefly flares within the soldier: “Mein Wunsch und Begehren, niemand kann’s wehren! / Es bleibt dabei: die Gedanken sind frei”. (No one can resist my wish and desire! / The fact remains, thoughts are free). The maiden’s pastoral song returns, but as it advances the topic integrates with the *tempesta* topic as she mourns for her love from the other side of the prison door. The *tempesta* topic is signified here by the reappearance of the semiquaver figures in the violins, and the progressively more chromatic elements, which once again dominate the march as the prisoner swears to leave love and hope, so that the maiden will stop grieving, finally reiterating that all thoughts are free with a trumpet fanfare.

### 3.2.c. Zemlinsky

Within the works of Zemlinsky the use of oppositions to create a narrative are particularly conspicuous when compared with Mahler’s coalescent style. Where, contrasting topics and motifs are amalgamated and juxtaposed in Mahler’s compositions, Zemlinsky’s works are more easily segmented, the various topics and motives alternating rather than overlapping. Within the *Lyrische Symphonie* (1922–1923), for example, the opposition between Classical and Romantic is illustrated within the second song, “O Mutter, der junge Prinz”, where the topics alternate between a classical, elegant dance and a pentatonic national dance. This Classical impression is signified, in Constantin Floros’s words, by ‘the simplicity and treatment of themes, to the simple key relationships, to individual melodic turns (such as the chromatic suspensions), and to the ornamentation (occasional grace notes, written-
out turns, and inverted mordents). Its opposition, Romanticism, is signified by freer styles of expression, for example, the tempesta or fantasia topics, the rise of nationalism, and the idealism of folk and nature, hence the national topic. (This is by no means a full account of the signifiers for Romanticism, just some that are pertinent to this discussion.) A similar narrative, to ‘O Mutter’ is also present in the “Intermezzo” from Zemlinsky’s String Quartet No. 4, Op. 25 (1936), which features an alternation between a pentatonic national dance and lyrical singing style. “Sie kam zum Schloß gegangene” from his Sechs Gesänge, Op. 13 (1913) likewise employs a Classical gavotte altered through its amalgamation with the Romantic national topic, a narrative which will be discussed below in the section entitled ‘Inflections’.

3.2.d. Lyrische Symphonie

In “O Mutter, der Junge Prinz” from the Lyrische Symphonie a young, poor girl instructs her mother that, as the prince will soon pass their door (and despite the knowledge that he will not spare her a glance), she must look her best. In the second verse, she tells her mother that as the prince went past she threw her necklace in front of his carriage as a gift and it was crushed beneath the wheels without anyone, particularly the prince, noticing. The musical narrative begins with a spritely, excitable version of the national topic, signified by the use of triplets, short phrases and the solo violin and oboe melodies. This sense of nervous anticipation illustrates the girl’s excitement at the coming fairytale moment when the prince will pass her door and, in her imagination, see her. The national element, which becomes more recognisable at bar 23, characterises the young girl, while the dance aspect of the topic illustrates the ritual being performed by the girl and her mother as she strives to look her best. At the thought of the prince an elegant gavotte emerges.

This opposition is compounded by the brief interruption, before the gavotte resumes, by the national dance at bars 40–42. At bar 67, however, the national dance returns, grotesquely altered to symbolise the passing parade, the horn taking the melody louder with each repetition until at 71 it appears grossly distorted, possibly signifying the narrator’s psychological state as the parade reaches and passes her by unnoticed. From bar 72 the national/Classical alternation continues

405 Constantin Floros, Gustav Mahler: The Symphonies (Aldershot: Amadeus Press, 1994), 119. In this instance, Floros is in fact discussing Mahler’s Fourth Symphony; however, the impression described is just as relevant in “O Mutter”.
until the music begins to disintegrate into the *tempesta* topic at bar 139, suggesting the disillusionment of the young peasant girl as she watches her dreams get crushed to dust, just as her necklace was, because of her lowly station.

Oppositions can therefore bring action to a musical narrative. The character/narrator can contest with different characters, locations or circumstances, just as in a literary narrative there is always a contrasting element to the plot. When the opposition does not produce a conflict it can be used to provide a balance, such as the military and pastoral topics, which, while they are not in direct opposition to each other, signify two contrasting concepts.

**3.3. Inflection**

Topics can be altered through inflection to add further signification or shading. For example, the pastoral topic can be altered to signify a night-time landscape or a march can be inflected to create different styles like a noble march or a marching band. As discussed above, there is a difference already between the aristocrat’s conventional view of the rustics symbolised by the pastoral and the bourgeois class’s ‘earnest, spiritual, and a little dishonest’ view.\(^{406}\) However, the pastoral topic signifies not only the rustic peasants, but also the countryside in which they live. The pastoral can therefore signify a character, a locale or a frame of mind (the idealisation of the simple life). By altering the orchestration, key, rhythm or pitch, or by integrating the pastoral with a different topic, a composer can add another layer of signification, intimating, for instance, a change in time, locale, class or mood (hopeful, contemplative, spiritual etc.).

**3.3.a. Pastoral Topic**

3.3.a.i. *Nachtmusik*

In Mahler’s Seventh Symphony, movements two and four are titled “*Nachtmusik*”. The second movement begins with the pastoral topic altered to signify the night: the third horn answers the first horn part, muted and *piano* to make it sound far away, thereby creating distance. The sparseness of the orchestration and the moderate tempo give the music a subdued atmosphere suggesting the stillness of night. The use of the clarinet and oboe in conjunction with the horn from bar 10 confirms the pastoral topic.

\(^{406}\) Monelle, *TMT*, 227–228.
The signification of Nachtmusik in this movement has a precedent in the first song of the Wunderhorn cycle, “Der Schildwache Nachtlied” (Example 3.8). The military topic dominates this song, symbolising the protagonist (a sentinel on guard at night who mourns the meeting with his sweetheart which he cannot attend), while the pastoral topic sets the scene. The military-style fanfares in the opening bars are orchestrated with pastoral instrumentation: the horns, clarinets and oboes with the low strings. As seen in Symphony No. 7, the sparse texture creates the stillness of night and the range of the instruments (high wind and low strings) creates a feeling of space. This temporal inflection is confirmed through the text and the title: “Die Schildwache Nachtlied”, just as it was in “Nachtmusik”.

Example 3.7: Nachtmusik. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/ii, bb. 1–12.

In the fourth song of Zemlinsky’s Lyrische Symphonie, “Sprich zu mir Geliebter”, the Nachtmusik appears again, inducing what Marc Moskovitz identifies as ‘a sensuous mood evocatively depicting the mystical, nocturnal world of the lovers’. Zemlinsky achieves this effect through the employment of sparse textures, high string drones, and descending figures in the low bass bassoon and bass tuba. A string duet begins the song, passing the melody between the solo violin and the viola, contrasting between the light and dark colours of the string section, then at bar 29 the trumpet and clarinet double the voice. Although this atmospheric device is present throughout this song, it is most apparent at bars 26–33, “Nur die Bäume werden im Dunkel flüstern / Die Nacht wird bleichen” (Only the trees will whisper in the dark / The night will pale), and 85–97, “Die Nacht ist dunkel / Die Sterne sind im Wolken verloren”, (The night is dark / The stars are lost in clouds) when the text confirms the implications of night.


3.3.a.ii. Pastoral Inflection in Mahler’s Kindertotenlieder

Although pervasive in Mahler’s work, Nachtmusik is not the only way in which the pastoral can be inflected. Other inflected pastorals can also be seen within Kindertotenlieder (1901–1904), through the combined narratives of “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgehn”, “Wenn dein Mütterlein”, and “Oft denk ich, sie sind nur ausgegangen!” In this song collection, the narrative spans a metaphorical day in the life of a father who has lost his child, from the dawn after the death and the incredulity that it could happen to him, to the evening and his resignation and acceptance. Via the overall musical narrative, the pastoral topic changes from night music to day music. The table below shows the temporal sequence of the topical narrative beginning with the sun rising after the death of the child during the night. The next two songs do not specify the time of day in them, but in each song the child is awake, which would imply day time. The second song’s text illustrates the narrator looking forward to the fate of the child, which would intimate it is morning, while the third song dwells on an event in the past, perhaps suggesting the afternoon. Song four is firmly based in the daytime and the lullaby of the fifth song places it in the evening: the children are now resting peacefully.
The first song, “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n” describes the father’s incredulity that life will go on; the sun will still rise for everyone else despite the death of his child. The first line: “Now will the sun so brightly rise, as though no evil befell last night!” tells the listener two things. First, it situates the song temporally: ‘Now will the sun […] rise’ suggests it is just before dawn, the beginning of a new day but still night, and second it tells us that ‘evil befell’ the narrator, although it does not yet reveal what that evil was. The same combination of wind instruments at the beginning of the song, as in the other examples, signifies the pastoral topic, while the sparse texture and wide pitch range between the high woodwind and low horns create the feeling of space so important to this topic, which, when combined with the temporal situation of the text, symbolises night. The subdued atmosphere created here suggests darkness, both emotional and literal, particularly when integrated with the lament topic from bar 4, signified by the pianto motif in the bassoons and horns and the D minor key.

Example 3.10: Pastoral Nachtmusik. Mahler, Kindertotenlieder, “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n”, bb. 1–4.

The third song “Wenn dein Mütterlein” is illustrated by a different pastoral: a contemplative serene air inflected with spirituality from the accompanying learned topic, but one which, while the instrumentation still intimates darkness, does not suggest night specifically. This song describes the narrator’s memory of his daughter following her mother into the room to see him. It is a different type of...

---

408 All translations by Deryck Cooke, taken from Donald Mitchell, Gustav Mahler: Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death (Woodbridge: Boydell, 2002), 92.
pastoral world signified here, in contrast to the night music of the first song. It is a simplistic pastoral, signified by the temporal and harmonic stasis in the bass and the repetitive rhythm that Henri-Louis de La Grange claims suggests ‘both the heaviness of the father’s heart and the mother’s footsteps’. The narrow range of the melody, both in the cor anglais and the voice, lends a contemplative, saddened air to the pastoral world (Example 3.11), and when the time signature changes to 3/2 the ecclesiastical allusions begin to suggest a more spiritual grace. The reference to the church and the chorale topic that appears at bars 19–20 are significant (Example 3.15). The topical class of the learned style, to which the chorale belongs, represents “the past” placing the father’s depiction of his daughter following her mother into the room firmly as a past experience: a memory.


The pastoral topic appears once more in “Oft denk ich, sie sind nur ausgegangen!” In this hopeful song, the narrator imagines that, instead of being dead, the children have just stepped out, wandering the hills in the sunshine where they will meet soon. This self-imposed illusion is illustrated by an altered gavotte—the four-bar regular melody and the tick-tock bass, which are signifiers of the gavotte, are present, but it is the syncopation in the cellos that moves the topic away from the dance—along with the pastoral effect often present. The pastoral topic is therefore inflected by the modifications imposed upon the dance, falsifying the sense of

optimism and hope the bright pastoral topic implies. In the other songs, the father's memories were all tinged with the knowledge that they are just that. Here, there are two layers. He fools himself that the children are just walking, taking the path into the hills [Sie machen nur den Gang zu jenen Höh'n]. This happy scene of sunshine and countryside is overlaid by the second, more symbolic layer. The father knows he is fooling himself; the uneven phrase lengths of the "false" gavotte jar with the music's otherwise bright sound. The Nachtmusik topic is also present, alternating subtly with the pastoral through changes in orchestration and intervallic differences in the melody. In the introduction, the melody rises a major sixth; when the narrator enters it is with a diminished sixth. The orchestration is cut from an almost full ensemble to only the cellos, bassoons and viola. The light figure then reintroduces the rest of the orchestra for figure 2. His words also indicate he knows what has happened: the "path to the hills" represents the path to heaven, and "[t]hey have started before us" means they have died before us, but "we'll overtake them, up on the hills" implies an acknowledgment of his own mortality.

By the last stanza the light now is full daylight; however, "Der Tag ist schön auf jenen Höh'n" (The day is fine upon the hills) indicates that although the day is fine for the children it is perhaps not for the father. The children are in the "light" of a distant land, while the father is left behind in darkness. Here, then, the "light" is the light of heaven, adding to the double layer of signification as the father hints towards the final stanza of song 5: that the children are in a "better place" than he is. This is suggested by the dissonances in his final line and the use of the drone in the cello and bassoon—the same combination (although not the same melodic content) as the Nachtmusik seen in the opening stanza.

The inflected gavotte also appears in Zemlinsky's "Sie kam zum Schloß gegangen" from his Sechs Gesänge. The same tick-tick bass can be seen, with short phrases and a conjunct melody in D major, as well as the syncopation which occurs in Kindertotenlieder. The gavotte itself signifies the court life of the castle and the nobility of the central character. The slow tempo and heavier texture, coupled with the chromatic melody and harmony, give this song the air of a nocturne, which is somewhat appropriate considering the metaphorical implications of the Queen's death when she leaves with the mysterious woman.

3.3.b. March
The march is utilised throughout Des Knaben Wunderhorn, with many of its songs concerned with soldiers and the horror of war. The noble affect of this topic is undermined by topics associated with fear or anxiety. This collection of songs
encapsulates four different forms of the march topic. In “Der Schildwache Nachtlied”, it is a subdued noble march that accompanies the sentinel in his duty, signified by fanfares (Example 3.8), until a funeral march emerges, signified by the snare drum and coup d’archet figures. The cavalry march appears next in “Trost im Unglück”, with the 6/8 meter and galloping rhythms. “Lied des Verfolgten im Turm” returns to the noble march as, although the meter is compound like in “Trost”, the crotchet-quaver gallop is not present. Here it alternates with a less stable topic, tempesta, emphasising the strength and consistency of the march against the transitory nature of the tempesta topic. The noble march is also utilised in “Wo die Schönen Trompeten Blasen”, but now the formal aspect of the march is employed, the dotted rhythms are accented and the trumpet alone plays the fanfare. Finally, the funeral march dominates the last two songs. The implacably slow tempo, low instrumentation and minor key that opens both songs, and the snare motif that introduces “Der Tambourg’sell”, signify this dark topic. However, in “Revelge”, a marching band also makes an appearance at bar 30, the bright major key, fortissimo dynamic markings and full texture contrasting the opening dirge as the drummer is hopeful for rescue from the passing soldiers. The differences between these march types are explained fully in the table below:

Table 3.1: March Types in Des Knaben Wunderhorn.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Tempo</th>
<th>Rhythm</th>
<th>Motif</th>
<th>Meter</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Class and affect</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Noble</td>
<td>Slow-Moderate</td>
<td>Dotted, steady accomp.</td>
<td>Trumpet fanfare</td>
<td>4/4, 2/4, 12/8</td>
<td>Major (often C or D)</td>
<td>Aristocracy Nobility Moral/Good</td>
<td>“Lied des Verfolgten im Turm”, bars 56–57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cavalry</td>
<td>Moderate – Fast</td>
<td>♩ ♪ ♪ ♪ ♪</td>
<td>Fanfare in 3rds or 5ths</td>
<td>6/8</td>
<td>Usually Major</td>
<td>Nobility, but associated with hunt.</td>
<td>“Trost im Unglück”: bars 8–12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marching Band</td>
<td>Moderate – fast</td>
<td>Dotted, steady accomp.</td>
<td>Full texture, use of higher woodwind, cymbals and bass drum</td>
<td>4/4, 2/4</td>
<td>Major</td>
<td>Infantry (Low class), Parade or celebration.</td>
<td>“Revelge”, bars 30–33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The column marked “class and affect” in Table 3.1 indicates that the different inflections given to the march topic can create different associations and oppositions
in the musical narrative. The subdued march in “Der Schildwache Nachtlied” begins with the noble march set within the Nachtmusik as discussed above, confirming the military nature of the sentinel, while the funeral march, which emerges from bar 4, maintains the darkness of the preceding topic and forecasts the murderous outcome of his watch. In “Wo die Schönen Trompeten Blasen” the funeral march seems unconnected with the text: the story of a soldier appearing at the door of his beloved and asking for her hand in marriage. However, as the libretto continues it emerges that the soldier is dead; it is his ghost that visits the maiden as she weeps for him before returning to his “home of green grass”, his grave in the earth. Within “Revelge”, the marches distinguish the situations of the various characters; the funeral march illustrates the dying drummer boy who lies in wait for his comrades’ help. The marching band illustrates marching soldiers as they pass him, although the bright major key is in direct opposition to the text, as they are defeated and march to their death. The use of this upbeat topic to exemplify this act is multivalent: within the music the bravery of the soldiers and their dignity as they face their fate lays alongside a commentary on the idealised notion of war as noble and courageous, while in the text the horrific reality of the consequence of defeat is acted out.

The two examples given here as inflected topics are by no means the only topics that can be affected in this way, but there are topics that cannot be inflected. For example the coup d’archet has a very specific signifier, as does the pianto and the lament. If any of the signifiers were inflected the topic itself would change; it is not possible, for instance, to have a happy lament. Hence, the associations of these topics cannot be changed through time, and they signify the same in Mahler’s and Zemlinsky’s music as they did in Purcell’s.

3.4. Pictorialism

There are certain musical figures or elements within Strauss, Mahler and Zemlinsky’s music which do not qualify as topics but do recur within nearly every work analysed here. While all topical references rely on a certain level of mimesis to be recognisable, there are varying degrees of representation which occur, and labelling everything ‘topic’ is treacherous. In his Music as Discourse Agawu outlines eighteen ‘topics’ which are readily apparent within Mahler’s music, including

410 “Da ist mein Haus von Grünem Rasen”.
411 The lament can be found in Purcell’s “When I am Laid in Earth” from Dido and Aeneas Z. 629 (1680), and “O Let Me Weep”, The Fairy Queen Z. 629 (1692), among others.
birdcalls, the bell motif and the horn call. While all of these figures are instantly recognisable to the listener, they are so because of their mimetic nature. Birdcalls, Monelle therefore suggests, are iconic, such as the cuckoo from “Lob des Hohen Verstandes”. Nevertheless, to call a birdcall a topic, which Ratner describes as types or styles rather than iconic motifs, is perhaps blurring the distinction between topic and pictorialism. Mirka warns that neither Ratner, Agawu or Allanbrook use ‘the concept of topics in reference to pictorialism’. Monelle’s justification in doing just that lies in the fact that ‘topics may be glimpsed through a feature that seems universal to them: a focus on the indexicality of the content, rather than the content itself’. That is, as Mirka states, ‘[i]conic topics feature an iconic relation between the sign and its object and an indexical relation between the object-as-a-sign and its signification’. Therefore, ‘Monelle’s “iconic topics” are not topics because they do not form cross-references between musical styles or genres’; rather, they arise from ‘direct musical imitation of non-musical sounds’. However, pictorial effects can, over time, become a learned convention, and therefore gain associations through indexicality. The cuckoo, for example, is an icon signifying both a cuckoo—through direct imitation—and the associative emotional complex of the coming of spring. A birdcall, therefore, signifies the pastoral topic—as a horn-call signifies the hunt—hence it is a signifier of a topic but not a topic itself. Therefore, these icons play a large part in the creation of the musical affect of various topics, and consequently, the construction of a topical narrative.

The bell motif Agawu mentions in his list of topics is present in the first and last songs from Kindertotenlieder, the first and fifth movement of Symphony No. 4, and Zemlinsky’s “Die drei Schwestern”. Donald Mitchell suggests that the glockenspiel strokes in the first song of Kindertotenlieder, “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n”, ‘punctuate the mourning of the song’, thereby confirming their

---

412 Agawu, Music as Discourse, 47.
413 Mirka, introduction, in OHTT, 33.
414 Monelle, SM, 17.
415 Mirka, introduction, in OHTT, 33.
416 Ibid., 37.
417 As such, Mirka suggests dividing musical signs into two classes: ‘musical imitation of other music (topics) and imitation of extra-musical sounds’ (Mirka, introduction, 35–36). The second class is further divided into ‘musical imitation of passionate utterances’, and ‘musical imitation of natural sounds (pictorialism)’ (Ibid., 36). However, this concept breaks down when considering the pianto and the noble horse topics. The pianto is an imitation of a passionate utterance, while the noble horse, signified by the mimetic gallop, is a natural sound, both of which are considered topics. Mirka later admits that it is the indexical relationship between a sign and its object which is of importance, thereby negating the need for the further classifications.
signification of death (as death knells), but he also points towards the fact that the glockenspiel makes the bells sound “childlike” and compares them to other ‘bells associated with childhood events (sleigh bells, fairy bells)’ as opposed to the larger tubular bells more commonly used in this circumstance. In Zemlinsky’s song the bells, used as a bright introduction to the orchestral arrangement, also signify the death wish the sisters are willing to pay for, the brightness signifying the hope that the wood, sea and city oracles have that their knowledge will dissuade the sisters. However, with this deathly association in mind, the sleigh bells that begin Mahler’s Symphony No. 4 shed a different light on the national topic they accompany, a hypothesis that will be discussed in the full analysis of the first movement below. Examples of pictorialism within Mahler’s works, other than those identified by Agawu, are the ‘light’ figure, an ascending major arpeggio often in the harp, and the ‘river’ figure, a constant stream of burbling semiquavers (Examples 3.13 and 3.14).

In “Antonius” the river figure describes the rushing water through which the fish swim. These almost constant running semiquavers are passed between violins 1 and 2 and provide an accompaniment to the vocal line, while the clarinet and oboe interjections, similar in rhythm and appearance to the river figure, are instead used as a counterpoint to the voice. In Mahler’s Symphony No. 4, the river figure appears underneath a rustic dance, from bars 125–144, signified by drones in the bass clarinet, an ostinato figure in the double bass and birdcalls in the flute and bassoon.

Example 3.13: River Figure. Mahler, Des Knaben Wunderhorn, “Des Antonius von Padua Fischpredigt”, bb. 9–12.

Example 3.14: River Figure. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 133–135.

418 Mitchell, Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death, 79. The seventh movement of Luigi Nono’s Il canto sospeso (1955–1956) uses the glockenspiel in just the same way.

© Copyright 1914 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 5540

Example 3.16: Light Figure. Mahler, Des Knaben Wunderhorn, “Der Schildwache Nachtlied”, bb. 44–45.

Example 3.17: Light Figure. Mahler, Kindertotenlieder, “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgehn”, bb. 52–54.

The river figure also appears in Zemlinsky’s “Die drei Schwestern”, although inflected by the ombra topic in which it occurs. Rather than the flowing, bubbling brooks from Mahler’s songs, the figure now signifies the sea, a powerful oracle which is capable of showing the three sisters the past. It has been transformed into a chromatic figure which descends a fifth, growing gradually louder to a climax at bar 34. This chromatic descent (usually from tonic to dominant) is also a signifier of the ombra topic demonstrating how pictorialisms can be fitted into the general atmosphere of a piece, adding another degree of mimesis away from true iconography.

The light figure appears mostly in Kindertotenlieder, a song cycle filled with polar images of light and dark (see Example 3.17). The first example of this is in “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgehn”, which begins in darkness (illustrated by the Nachtmusik discussed above). Finally, the sun begins to rise at bar 47, as the contrary motion melodies in oboe and voice become diatonic and are joined by the ‘light’ figure, ascending arpeggios, in the harp. The father offers the listener advice: “Du mußt nicht die Nacht in dir verschränken / mußt sie ins ew’ge Licht versenken!” (You must not enfold the night within you / you must immerse it in eternal light!). This does not seem to be advice he is able to follow or believe, however, given that
the sun is not yet allowed to rise: no topic is wholly signified here, partly because all the constraints previously on the orchestra remain, so only half the orchestra is being utilised; and partly due to the pictorial nature of what is occurring. The figure’s second appearance in the cycle is in the second song “Nun seh’ ich woh!”. The child’s father contemplates the death of the child as an act of fate. He subjects a single moment (the moment of a look in his child’s eyes) to intense scrutiny and signification. More than just eyes, they hold in them the fate of the child, as if in one look the father could have seen the consolation he so badly needs. He also feels he should have known, and by knowing perhaps acted to turn the child away from, this destiny. The dark atmosphere is set immediately through the sparse texture, using only muted low strings, clarinet in A (to give a murkier sound), horn and bassoon. The two chords, which are the focal points of the four-bar introduction, are dissonant, the first a G minor chord with a sharpened fourth, the second including the supertonic. The sigh motif is utilised, combined with an appoggiatura, signifying the topic of sensibility. The dark mood is lightened subtly by the ascending arpeggios in the harp, the light figure that in the first song symbolises the ‘eternal flame’, and which here illuminates the darkness as the dark flame is reflected in the child’s eyes.

In “Der Schildwache Nachtlied” the ascending arpeggio (Example 3.16) initially appears to represent the ascension into the light from the Nachtmusik that preceded it, but its symbolisation of God and faith is retrospectively affirmed as the narrator expresses his belief that to have God’s blessing is ‘all possessing, who so believes!’. This becomes more poignant when his time, like the child’s, is cut short as he dies at the end of the song. When the figure appears in Symphony No. 7 (discussed fully below), just as the main character, identified in what follows as Florio, breaks free of Venus’s seductive spell, it is the light figure that symbolises this fateful act. The hero is saved by his faith in God, just as in Kindertotenlieder the light figure presents faith and the eternal flame, or as the fate of the child to rest in heaven. Similarly, in Zemlinsky’s “Die Drei Schwestern” it is the oracles’ faith that the knowledge of the present will counteract the sister’s wish for death. Hence, the light figure symbolises not just ‘light’ but also ascension achieved through faith, whether to heaven after death, or to a better state of life through belief.

In the following analysis of Symphony No. 7, the musical narrative is compared to Eichendorff’s novella Das Mamorbild, in which Florio is the protagonist.
Birdcalls are already a conventional icon within music, so it is not a surprise to find them in *Die Fledermaus* or any of Mahler’s works. In Strauss’s operetta, they appear alongside the pastoral topic to introduce Adele as a low-class character (see Example 3.4). Within Mahler, the iconic nature of the birdcall remains in places, for example, the birdcalls in Symphony No. 4 and the nightingale and cuckoo in *Des Knaben Wunderhorn*. However, in “Der Schildwache Nachtlied” from that same collection the birdcalls are less iconic and are integrated with the fanfare topic. Modified fanfares within the march section of the song (bar 6) appear inverted in the pastoral section from bar 13, now seeming to symbolise birdcalls. They could also have another signification because they appear once more in this collection in “Lied des Verfolgten Im Turm” when the pastoral topic accompanies the maiden’s yearning to be reunited with her loved one. This yearning is the same emotion the sentinel displays when he thinks of his ill-fated meeting with his sweetheart. Again, it is the idealised notion of pastoral versus the man-made “stability” of the military topic that is at play here. The urbanite is constrained by his or her industrial life, as the soldier is constrained by the orders from his superiors. The birds do not have these constraints, however. The feeling of freedom and openness of the countryside invokes a promise of wish-fulfilment. The spring associations that are also evoked by the birdcalls, and the romantic emotions that go along with that season, could also explain the yearning for loved ones being symbolised, while their similarities to the fanfares suggest not only the nature of the characters—that they are soldiers—but also symbolise the military constraints that are placed upon their desired freedom.

*Example 3.18: Birdcalls. Mahler, Symphony No. 4, bb. 302–305.*


---

420 See Monelle, *SM* and *TMT*; Jung, *The Pastoral Topic*. 

It has been argued above that pictorialisms are not topics, but that they can still contain the ability to be associated with a certain concept, whether it is to signify class or emotion, or whether it is to insert into the music a recognisable image which reinforces the mood, character or locale of the intended narrative. These icons can then be inflected by the mood of the topics in which they are present, such as the *ombra* river figure, or the childish bell motif seen in *Kindertotenlieder*, Symphony No. 4 and “Die Drei Schwestern”, advancing the degrees of mimesis further away from an ‘authentic’ representation of an object and thereby adding another tier to its signification.

3.5. Mahler’s Symphony No. 4, First Movement

Having demonstrated the ways in which topics can be used to create narrative within individual songs, it is the purpose of this analysis to show that the overall musical narrative of the first movement of Mahler’s Symphony No. 4 contains examples of oppositions, inflections, ironic use of topics and pictorialism. In order that a full understanding of these devices can be achieved, including how they work to elucidate an overall “plot” contained in a musical narrative, a full analysis of the first movement of the symphony follows.

The first movement of the Fourth Symphony is dominated by a conflict between high/low class and urban/rural styles, for example, between the pastoral style of the introduction and theme C, and the *galant* singing style of themes A and B. These contrasts expand in the development to include the concepts of control, represented by “man” (the military topic), and instability, represented by “nature” (*tempesta* topic). By creating the following topical narrative of these conflicts
throughout the movement, an ironic social commentary is uncovered: a satirical view of the feeling of superiority over the lower classes and other nationalities evinced by the “socialites” of Vienna. Table 3.2 sketches out this narrative, including the topics and the urban/rural oppositions.

3.5.a. Topical Narrative

The symphony opens with a pastoral introduction, signified with ornamented repeated notes in the flute at an interval of a fifth, birdcalls in flutes 3 and 4 and a cadenza semiquaver figure in the clarinets reminiscent of the river figure from the Wunderhorn poem “Des Antonius von Padua Fischpredigt”.


421 Raymond Knapp instead suggests a narrative which revolves around the nostalgic evocation of both the ‘innocence and mortal vulnerability of [a Christian] youth’. His analysis hinges on the way in which the sleigh bells intrude upon the symphony as they belong ‘both to a wintery outside and to memory’. Knapp’s methodology, a tonal analysis combined with comparative analogies with symphonies by Beethoven, Mozart and Haydn is coloured by Knapp’s preconception that the symphony concludes with Mahler’s song “Das Himmlische Leben” (Raymond Knapp, Symphonic Metamorphoses: Subjectivity and Alienation in Mahler’s Re-Cycled Songs (Middletown: Wesleyan University Press, 2003), 217–237.)
Table 3.2: Musical Narrative of Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, Showing Form, Themes, Topics and Rural/Urban Oppositions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>False Recap.</th>
<th></th>
<th>Coda</th>
<th>Dev.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bar</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>Intro.</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A1</td>
<td>A2</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Intro</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Pastoral</td>
<td>Singing style</td>
<td>March, hunt horn call</td>
<td>Bright march</td>
<td>Legato singing style → sensibility</td>
<td>Pastoral dance</td>
<td>March (from A)</td>
<td>Pastoral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban/Rural</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>U + R</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>R/U conflict</td>
<td>liquidation</td>
<td>R</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th></th>
<th>Recap.</th>
<th>Bridge</th>
<th>Coda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bars</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>A, A1, A2</td>
<td>Coda</td>
<td>A, A1</td>
<td>A1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topics</td>
<td>Polka/horn call → singing style</td>
<td>Pastoral, river figure</td>
<td>Tempesta and military</td>
<td>Tempesta dominates military</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban/Rural</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R/U</td>
<td>R/U</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bars</td>
<td>341</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Polka</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>Brilliant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban/Rural</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>U</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Theme A (Example 3.21) immediately moves the narrative from the country pastoral to the *galant* singing style, with a high-class Classical melody over an Alberti bass. The urban setting is continued in theme A1, as a march rhythm leads to a triplet horn call at bar 10. The horn call briefly signifies the hunt topic, creating a link between the first two topics: the hunt being a rural pastime often undertaken by nobility. Theme A2 also signifies the march topic with a bright clarinet melody based on the tonic arpeggio, the section ending on a dominant fanfare.

Theme B, a slow, legato singing-style melody in the cellos accompanied by the rest of the string section, is introduced at bar 38. The singing style, as in theme A, represents *galant* music, placing it firmly as an urban topic. The oboe takes over at bar 41, the texture gradually increasing until at bar 45 the sensibility topic (another urban/*galant* topic) emerges, signified by a series of appoggiaturas leading to a climax at bar 54.

*Example 3.21: Theme A. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 3–7.*

*Example 3.21a: Theme A1 and Horn Call. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 7–11.*

*Example 3.21b: Theme A2. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 32–33.*

*Example 3.21c: Theme B. Mahler, Symphony No. 4/i, bb. 38–41.*
The closing section to the exposition heralds a new theme (C) based loosely on the horn call motif from bar 10. After the climactic texture of the sensibility topic, this simplistic pastoral dance figure creates a shocking contrast—not only between the texture and orchestration, but also between the classes. From the galant chamber style of the singing style and the sensibility topic, the listener is returned to the simplistic rural setting of the introduction. This rural/urban distinction is the central premise of this closing section. When at bar 60 the strings take over, the restrained elegance of the salon resurfaces for only three bars before rescinding control to the pastoral dance. A brief return of the first subject march topic (bar 66) provides another fleeting textural contrast before the motives liquidate over the last five bars of this section. The introduction returns in its original key, creating a false recapitulation and lending a rondo character to the movement. Theme A then returns greatly varied, with simultaneous renditions of A, A1 and A2. The different motifs of the theme combine, keeping their original topical signifiers. Thus, the singing-style classicism of theme A is heard simultaneously with the triplet horn call and marching band dotted rhythm, seen most clearly at bar 85. This false recapitulation reintroduces the initial contrast between the introduction and theme A, but also confirms the urbanity of them all. As the themes are developed motivically the expectation is that their topical associations may also change. However, as the urban correlation remains it would seem this symbolism is an integral part of the theme, and so for the theme to remain recognisable the topic must also remain so. The coda (bars 91–101, Example 3.22) plays with this interaction between motivic and topical development by introducing the dotted rhythm of A in the flowing legato style of theme B and adding drones in the bassoon, double bass and horns, creating the overall effect of a graceful pastoral section.

The development begins with the introductory section accompanying an eight-bar violin solo playing the march theme (A1). The use of the solo “fiddle” confirms the nationalistic qualities of the introduction: the grace notes in the clarinets’ repeated notes, the improvised-style semiquavers in the flutes then bass clarinet, the unusual percussion, and now a solo fiddle all suggest the national
This means that, within this movement at least, “national” is linked with “pastoral”. After this six-bar sojourn into the country, urbanity is reintroduced with a polka rhythm that accompanies the horn triplet figure. The aristocratic aspect to the hunt topic is accentuated by the society dance, while the dance itself is denigrated by the pastoral aspect of the hunt, giving a mocking slant to the figure. The full Classical theme A returns completely at bar 112, until at bar 125 the coda theme of bar 91 is restored as the central theme of a pentatonic pastoral dance, complete with drones (bass clarinet), ostinato bass (double bass), birdcalls (flute and bassoon) and the river figure in the strings.


The last 93 bars of the development contain a miniature, but far more intense version of the battle for domination between nature and man that is the plot of the movement. At bar 145 dissonant fanfares in the C clarinet, flute and oboe (bar 146 the flutes and oboe repeat a high D♯ over the C clarinet’s C♯) are made more severe by the high range and use of the raw sound of the C clarinet. The discordance of this section, coupled with the increasing franticness of the semiquavers in the strings and the muted diminished minor chords in the trumpets suggest the nature topic, tempesta. The E♭ Clarinet, which joins the orchestration at bar 48, confirms the military topic alluded to by the fanfares, suggesting that the tempesta topic is integrated with the military topic (representing man). The tempesta topic continues to dominate for the next 53 bars as the introduction and theme A are varied, modulating through F minor, C minor, and D minor. However, at bar 209 the

---

422 The lack of the more dominant characteristics of the style hongrois or the Turkish style prevent a more definitive identification of this topic than “nationalistic”.
military topic overwhelms the tempesta domination with a marching band style signified by the brighter, steadier rhythms, the high range of the flutes and E♭ clarinets, and trumpet/horn themes. The percussion now includes the bass drum, cymbals, triangle and glockenspiel. These are all instruments used in marching bands, but they also add to the tumultuous tempesta ambience. This contest for control between the transitory tempesta topic and the rhythmically stable military topic seems won as the tempesta topic pushes towards the triple fortissimo climax at bar 221, but as the climax subsides a series of trumpet fanfares, reminiscent of the fanfares that introduce the “Tuba Mirum” (bar 92) of Verdi’s Messa di Requiem (first performed in 1874), sound, emerging from the subdued texture to close the development.

The urban domination restored, the recapitulation returns to the Classical singing style, varying the order and location of the motives while still maintaining their individual thematic and topical integrity. After a bridge recapitulates the marching band style of bars 209–220, theme B returns. The lyrical nature of the original theme here is not kept; rather, theme B appears as a noble march; marked Schwungvoll (full of drive/bold), the accented quaver accompaniment in the lower strings and bassoons signify this change. The theme is now not just urban, but aristocratic as the noble march is most commonly associated with the Emperor or the state. At bar 283 theme C returns, with an almost exact replica of its original appearance at bar 58. The major difference here is that the pastoral dance is overlaid briefly at bars 285–291 with a Classical-style lyrical violin and violin solo melody, keeping the association urban, rather than the original rural.

This is immediately contrasted by the start of the final coda at bars 298–310. The introductory theme begins the coda, but now with a nationalist inflection. The violins, flute and lower strings introduce a rising ornamented semiquaver figure based on the B major scale with a flattened sixth. When combined with the pizzicato dance accompaniment (second violins and viola) this finally confirms the nationalist topic alluded to in the opening bars of the movement. Within the sphere of topical association, national music is considered low class. It was also considered to tend towards the comic, suggesting a ‘lack of musical sophistication’.423 When seen in the context of the upper/lower class narrative presented here this lack of sophistication is superimposed onto anyone who does not live in the city: peasants and other nationalities alike. Birdcalls throughout (bars 304, flutes; 305 and 308, 

clarinet; and 309–310, oboes) confirm the pastoral sphere in which this nationalist topic rests. From this ultra-rural section, the Classical theme A re-emerges before the simplistic grace of the pastoral theme from bar 91 takes over for 17 bars. At bar 341, however, the high-class aspect states its superiority, as a polka-style dance leads to the dotted march topic. It is the brilliant topic, however, evoking the final Classical cadences of Mozart, which ends the movement.

3.5.b. War of the Classes
This movement presents an account that exemplifies the narrative of oppositions within the social class, set out in a way that the highest keeps subsuming the lowest. In the three-bar introduction, it is very much the pastoral notion that is being denoted: rather than nature being represented it is instead the nobility’s idealised concept of the simple shepherds that is explicated. The repeated notes ornamented with grace notes and the sleigh bells are very precise quavers, not the dotted rhythms that are more normally associated with the peasant dances: they have been urbanised. Because rurality is so idealised, it appears as an ironic view of how the urbanites see the lowly rural peasants, and included among this disparaged number are members of different nationalities (i.e. anyone who is not upper-class Viennese). The more defined allusions to the style hongrois and the Turkish style add another level, that of fear and alienation. The signified of these styles include freedom, nonconformity, independence and separateness from bourgeois society. Yet this perceived separation led to a feeling of mistrust of the Other, a fear of the uncivilised foreign savages.

The negative connotations of these two topics are, perhaps, why Mahler no more than alluded to them. Whenever the pastoral topic appears, for example at bars 91–101, it is graceful, giving it the appearance of being over-simplistic—mimicking the supposed view the upper classes have of the lower classes as ‘noble savages’—or providing us with another hint of the irony inherent throughout the plot. Mahler is perhaps suggesting that the peasants are closer to spirituality and grace than the nobility (bolstering Monelle’s earlier comment of the bourgeois view of peasants as “earnest” and “spiritual” and confirming the satirical view Mahler is portraying of the high-class Viennese superiority complex). The sleigh bells themselves add to the perceived simple nature of the peasants, as they are associated with childhood. Ryan Kangas, though, has investigated the supposed

---

childish associations of sleigh bells and suggests that at this time this signification was perhaps, if not erroneous, at least an idealised perception. In his article, Kangas quotes from two sources with which Mahler would have been acquainted: “Jingle Bells” and Dostoevsky’s *The Brothers Karamazov* (1880). Within these sources, the sleigh was the setting for sexual experiences devoid of the innocence of childhood, or that just marked the end of that part of the characters’ lives. He also outlines the fact that sleigh bells were used as a warning of the sleigh’s approach, as it glides almost silently over the snow, and as such were heard as a threat of harmful accidents. Kangas therefore suggests that:

> [w]hen considered in terms of this complex network of associations, the sleigh bells in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony begin to sound like a token of childhood in some ways and a threat to it in others. Heard specifically in the context of their functional use, the sound of sleigh bells would be quite arresting, encouraging those who hear them to pay more attention to their surroundings to avoid the possibility of being injured. To the extent that sleigh bells would encourage such attentiveness, perhaps Mahler draws on their presence in a shared experience of winter travel to reinvent the premier coup d’archet heard at the beginning of a symphony, another eighteenth-century convention.

The signification of the sleigh bells therefore create an opposition of meaning—the innocence of childhood against the threatening warning—a layering of signification in which the “correct” answer is undecidable. If this notion of a warning is combined with the association of childish simplicity and nationalism put forward above then the hypothesis that this is a satirical commentary by Mahler on the idealisation of the peasant class by the upper classes gains plausibility. The representation of the ideal nationalist pastoral here is an example of disnarration, a consideration of ‘what did not or does not take place’. Reyland, commenting on Hatten’s analysis of Beethoven’s “Hammerklavier” piano sonata, describes a disnarration as ‘a what-might-have-been, imagining the possibility of transcendence but not its actual

---

427 Ibid., 233.
attainment in this story'. The presented artificiality of the pastoral is thus a disnarration. The battle between nature/man or rural innocence/urban society does not actually occur; the rurality is an image, a vision—or in Mahler’s case possibly a nostalgic childhood memory—of an idealised simplistic natural world.

Within the development section, the intensified contrasting of country and city is demonstrated succinctly in the oppositions between instability and stability. The \textit{tempesta} topic is an unstable topic, signifying as it does the unpredictable aspects of nature’s fury, and, as the personification of nature at this point, it lays the association of instability on the rural idiom. The inherent stability of the military topic here represents rational man (as opposed to the irrationality of the undisciplined), creating an insight into the view of the narrator of which is superior here, as manufactured stability wins, but with a dark, funereal fanfare heralding its victory.

The recapitulation and coda, however, return to the parodic caricature of class relationships that has pervaded the majority of the movement. The Classical theme B, now an ultra-urban noble march, with the pastoral theme C overlaid by a Classical ambience, is contrasted immediately with a \textit{buffa}-esque rendition of the Turkish topic: the highest of the high set alongside the lowest of the low, the noble alongside the comic relief.

The movement finishes with the brilliant topic creating an overtly Classical cadence. This topic, associated with the Classical period, to begin with suggests an earlier period. Mahler is perhaps leaving the listener with the impression that the superiority of the higher classes belongs in an older time: the polka, an artificial society dance popular in the mid-1800s, leads to this Classical device synonymous with the past masters of a compositional form which is being changed beyond all recognition by Mahler’s contemporaries and students. As the superiority of the Empire began to dissolve, the class system changed as a middle-class emerged. Modernism crept into the arts, architecture and music, and the elite, who were the upper class, possibly began to seem worn and tired. The diagram below shows the structure of the symphony and which class—the urban upper class (U), or the rural lower class (R)—is dominant, particularly when two classes are struggling for supremacy.

The introduction and exposition are set very firmly in opposition as the rural introduction gives way to the urban exposition and the statement of the traditionally

\footnote{Nicholas Reyland, “Negation and Negotiation: Plotting Narrative through Literature and Music from Modernism to Postmodernism” in \textit{Music and Narrative since 1900} eds. Michael L. Klein and Nicholas Reyland (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2013), 37–38.}
Classical subjects. At each transition, every unstable point, rurality returns and seems victorious as it enters the development, where the Classicality of theme A is subsumed by the rural intro and C theme. The triumph of urbanity at the beginning of the recapitulation, however, seems to be a pyrrhic victory as the funereal fanfares introduce the Classical themes, and the hypocrisy of that victory is emphasised by the insincere innocence of the sleigh bells, and the equally artificial society polka. The final brilliant topic, signalling the Classical finale, places these views firmly in the past. This, the narrative implies, is where decadent Alt Wien should lie, enabling a return to nature and innocence.

Figure 3.2: Structure of Mahler’s Fourth Symphony, its Themes and Dominant Classes.


In Mahler’s Fourth Symphony, a narrative is created through which an ironic ideology is considered, suggestive of the undercurrent of ill feeling that was rife within Vienna at a time of political and economic instability. Within the Seventh Symphony, a literary influence is instead used to create the narrative, one encapsulating the fading German Romanticism from which the increasingly modernist composers, such as Schoenberg, were beginning to turn. The musical narrative not only elucidates the correlation between music and literature but also highlights cultural themes prevalent within fin-de-siècle Vienna, thereby situating the work historically, for example, the Jewish overtones and the conflict between the ethical rational life over instinctual, emotional life exemplified by the rivalry between
real love and the magical seduction of Venus, an opposition which will be explored in full later.

Although Mahler did not supply a programme for the Seventh Symphony there is evidence of programmatic elements within its second and fourth movements. La Grange suggests that Mahler had in mind two specific works by Eichendorff when he wrote the symphony: the poem Das Ständchen, and the novella Das Marmorbild. Thus far, these works have only been connected to the two Nachtmusiken (movements two and four). Alma Mahler wrote that ‘while composing his Nachtmusiken, he had visions of Eichendorff’s poetry, rippling fountains, German Romanticism. Other than that, this symphony is without programme’. However, through an analysis of the topical narrative of the first movement, a similar plot to that of the novella Das Marmorbild becomes visible.

Underlying the conflict between Bianca and Venus in the novella is the battle between monotheism and paganism, as the evil seductress Venus, a pagan deity, is ultimately overcome by a pious song, presumably of religious origin. Mahler hints, however, that the religion itself, though Christianity in the novella, is in the musical narrative Judaism, stating that: ‘[i]n the first movement […] there are also typically Jewish things (You know that I am a Jew!) such as the trombone solos’.

What follows outlines the way in which the musical story depicted by the topical discourse of the first movement of Mahler’s Seventh Symphony mirrors the literary plotline of Eichendorff’s Das Marmorbild in its formal outline. This narrative is sketched in Table 3.3 below. The analysis therefore depicts the symphony’s first movement as an analogy of the novella, as the plot points—the character and scene descriptions, the meeting of lovers and villains, and the traumatic events and resolutions—coincide with each other in the parallel art forms. As the analysis demonstrates, the correspondences between the two plots are not exact, but are close enough that the similarities seem unlikely to be wholly coincidental, not least given Alma Mahler’s testimony regarding the specific influence of Eichendorff, even if she seemed to think that this was restricted to other movements of the symphony. In his narrative analysis of Mahler’s Ninth Symphony, Newcomb describes the movement as a Bildungsroman, a literary genre that focusses on the moral growth of

the protagonist as the character transforms from youth to adult. There has been some criticism of his approach, notably by James Anderson Winn and Lawrence Rosenwald, and to a certain extent Hayden White (as he asks whether the content of the ending of the symphony is the result of Mahler’s ideology or Newcomb’s).\footnote{James Anderson Winn, review of Music and Text: Critical Inquiries, ed. Steven Paul Scher Notes, Second Series 50, no. 2 (December, 1993), 604–608; Lawrence Rosenwald, review of Music and Text: Critical Inquiries, ed. Steven Paul Scher in 19th-Century Music 17, no. 2 (Autumn, 1993), 204; Hayden White: “Commentary”, in Music and Text: Critical Inquiries, ed. Steven Paul Scher (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 297.} Winn suggests that ‘in discourse about music, a middle ground between verifiable technical observations and impressionistic metaphorical claims remains elusive’, implying that at times Newcomb slips from technical musical analysis and expressionistic proclamations.\footnote{Winn, review of Music and Text, 607.} However, while Newcomb was comparing the narrative story produced by the musical events within the symphony, with stereotypical narrative events of a work of fiction, this analysis of Mahler’s Seventh suggests that there is a direct correlation between the movement and a specific novella: Das Mamorbild. It therefore distinguishes itself from the criticisms levelled at Newcomb. An awareness of the difficulties inherent in this type of comparative methodology can be seen in the final chapter’s analysis of Webern’s String Trio, which while compared with a specific novel, Tonio Kröger, does not claim any autobiographical link between the composer and the author, or the novel itself. Instead there is a conditional supplement: that is the acknowledgement of Christopher Booker’s Seven Basic Plots in order to recognise that the music followed certain themes common to German Romantic literature, not to a specific title.\footnote{Christopher Booker, The Seven Basic Plots: Why We Tell Stories (London: Continuum, 2004).}
Table 3.3: Musical Narrative of Symphony 7, Movement 1, Showing Form, Themes and Topics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>Transition</th>
<th>1st Subject</th>
<th>Trans</th>
<th>Trans</th>
<th>2nd Subject</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bars</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A'</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Arioso</td>
<td>Noble</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td>Jewish</td>
<td>Fanfares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td>March</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hunt</td>
<td>Salon Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Salon Hunt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Romance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Noble</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>March</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Development</th>
<th>Recap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bars</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Hunt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arioso &amp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Salon =</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fantasia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sensibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tempesta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Military</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chorale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pastoral</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Military</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Romance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Light'</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Funeral &amp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Romance =</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hunt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Noble &amp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>learned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Learned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>National</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chorale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alla Breve</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Military</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Light'</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Funeral &amp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Romance =</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hunt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Noble &amp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>learned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Learned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>National</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chorale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alla Breve</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Military</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Light'</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Funeral &amp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Romance =</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hunt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Noble &amp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>learned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Coda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bars</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.6.a. Das Marmorbild

Eichendorff’s Das Marmorbild, written in 1818, tells of the story of Florio, a young nobleman, freed from responsibility and travelling through Italy. On his approach to the city of Lucca he encounters the singer Fortunato, who leads him to a celebration of spring. There he meets a beautiful maiden, Bianca, with whom he appears to fall in love at first sight, and she with him. At the feast he composes a song to her, declaring his love, and she allows him to kiss her. At the end of the feast, however, a dark stranger, the cavalier Donati, steps into the marquee and greets Florio as an old acquaintance, but Fortunato immediately dislikes Donati. That night Florio is plagued by dreams of Bianca as a siren who attempts to sink his ship and, waking, decides to go for a walk. In time he comes upon a garden next to the lake’s edge where a marble statue of Venus stands. Florio stares, unable to avert his gaze. When the statue appears to look back at him, he starts and runs in fright back to the inn.

The next morning Fortunato gently chides him for his moonlight wanderings, before leaving Florio. The young noble returns to the lake but cannot find the statue again; instead, he finds himself in a garden by a palace eavesdropping on a beautiful lady’s song whose features closely resemble the marble statue. As he attempts to find the singer he instead stumbles upon Donati, lying asleep, appearing as if dead. Upon waking the cavalier he extracts a promise that he will be introduced to the lady the next day and leaves in a state of exultation. The next day Donati instead invites Florio to a hunt. The young noble is repulsed by the idea that he should hunt on the Sabbath and Donati leaves in disgust, whereupon Florio goes to church plagued by thoughts of love and lust.

The next evening Fortunato invites Florio to a masked ball with the intimation that there he will meet an old acquaintance. He dances with Bianca, who is disguised as a Greek girl, but the lady is also there dressed identically and Florio becomes confused as to who is who. After the lady takes off her mask and reveals herself to him she invites him to her house the next evening. When he then sees Bianca he becomes indifferent to her, as his mind wanders to the impending meeting. At this indifference Bianca becomes distraught; she had dreamed of marrying Florio the night she met him and now he has acted as if a stranger to her.

Eventually Florio finds himself at supper with Donati in the house of the mysterious lady. The lady herself leads Florio by the hand and begins to seduce him. Florio feels he has known her since childhood, as do all men, the enchantress herself remarks. At these words Florio describes paintings of her on the walls of her
house, and remembers where he has seen her before, as he had seen paintings like these in his youthful fantasies of eroticism. The strain of a song filters through the window, sung by Fortunato, and seems to waken Florio, as he exclaims: “Lord God, do not let me lose my way in this world!” As a thunderstorm approaches Florio sees the enchantress begin to turn back into the marble statue he had first seen and he runs from the room.

The next morning finds Florio leaving Lucca and meeting three other travellers on the way: Fortunato, Pietro (Bianca’s uncle) and a young boy. As they leave the city Fortunato relates a myth of the ruined temple on the hill which Florio recognises as the palace of the Lady. The myth recounts the story of Venus, who haunts her ruined temple and tempts young men into losing their souls to her. At this story the young boy lifts his head to reveal that it is in fact Bianca. Florio sees her and falls in love with her anew, telling her: “I feel like a new man; I sense that everything will turn out aright, now that I have found you again”.

3.6.b. Florio

If the musical narrative of the first movement of the Seventh Symphony maps on to that of Das Marmorbild, then the forty-nine bar introduction of the first movement of the Seventh Symphony introduces both the character, Florio, and the plot of the movement/novella: the conflict between the supernatural and the rational. In Eichendorff’s novella, Florio rides into town and is instantly distracted by the ‘delicate fragrance[s]’ and the ‘colourful procession’ of people walking along the avenue. His poetic nature (the aspiration of which he shyly admits to the singer Fortunato) is expressed by an arioso melody in the tenor horn. The arioso, a style of opera singing between recitative and aria, humanises the instrumental solo and evokes its literary stylistic counterpart, poetry, as a form of expression that lies between speech and song. The accompanying topic symbolises the supernatural sub-plot through the utilisation of the ombra topic. This topic is signified by the slow tempo instigating a creeping terror, the dotted rhythms symbolising heartbeats or footsteps (either the approach of impending menace or the procession of a funeral) and the tremolando in the strings and clarinets, which, when combined with forte-piano markings at bar 6, create fear and agitation. The rational sub-plot is expressed by the noble march topic that begins at bar 19; the stability of the march symbolises the solidity of the

rational ideology, while the noble aspect refers more to the alleged morality of that ideology within this narrative than to just the social class of the character. As discussed above, while the ideology undoubtedly stems from a religious viewpoint, the religion associated with the character is Jewish. This is suggested by the use of the trombone as a solo instrument at bars 27–31 and the flute cadenza at bar 39, which displays Jewish connotations from the placement of chords either side of the neighbour-note based flourishes and the accidentals providing a minor key.  

Example 3.23: Theme A. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/I, bb. 2–4.

![Example 3.23: Theme A. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/I, bb. 2–4.]


3.6.c. The Hunt Topic

The first subject begins at bar 50 with the hunt topic. The tempo marking is 2/2, which could also indicate a cavalry march; however, with the use of the horns as the melodic instrument combined with the driving ostinato signifying the galloping horse it seems more likely to signify the hunt. The hunt topic illustrates three different aspects of the novella. It not only suggests certain aspects of Florio’s character, and at the same time the moral of the story, but also situates the action within a natural environment and, as it is associated with myth and adventure, gives an overview of some of the themes of the storyline. This topic is associated with the ideal of

---


This instrument is entirely ecclesiastical [...] the instrument is ancient, and, it would seem, an invention of the Jews: for there appear references already in the Old Testament to tone changes on wind instruments, and this is unthinkable aside from trombones. [...] It is certain that the sound of the trombone is truly intended for religion and not at all for secular use.
hunting, rather than the brutal reality; it is hence correlated with nobility, courage, joy and being one with nature. Fitzpatrick suggests that ‘the hunt stood for all that was desirable in worldly virtue, representing a new embodiment of the older ritterlich-höfisch [chivalrous-courtly] [...] ideals which were at the centre of aristocratic thought’. The valiant associations of this topic connote two levels of signification here. They describe not only the character’s aristocratic bearing, but also his personality traits. These lead to the happy conclusion of this cautionary tale, as it is through his moral and pious nature that he escapes the clutches of Venus and narrowly avoids losing his soul to the enchantress. The hunt topic also symbolises nature, immediately placing the listener outside. The horn evokes the woodland, and thus mystery, romance and the unknown, so once again two levels of signification are represented. The first is the superficial pastoral setting of the novel. It begins in a park with a celebration of spring, and throughout the novel most of the important moments of the plot happen in gardens. The second is the evocation of supernatural and romance suggested by the topic, which as discussed above are the primary sub-plots of the novel.

As the plot develops throughout the first movement the hunt topic also changes with each recurrence. When it returns for the second time at bar 145 it is beginning to develop. Theme B returns but in a semi-canonic manner so that between bars 148 and 154 the fanfare figure (from bars 53–54) enters five times in different instruments (Example 3.24). At this point in the narrative, Florio has met Bianca (represented throughout the narrative by theme C and outlined fully below), but not yet Venus (contrastingly represented by the tempesta topic) and as such his character is confused by the emotions that he is suddenly faced with, hence the development of the theme. It is also the point at which he wanders into the garden to clear his head, and therefore the introduction of the mythical aspect of the story.

The third time the hunt topic returns, at bar 373, it lasts only six bars before giving way to the noble march juxtaposed with the learned topic signified by the imitation in the strings and brass throughout the section. This symbolises the rational/moral/religious victory, represented by the hunt and noble march, over the pagan deity’s seduction, symbolised by the preceding ombra topic.

---

3.6.d. The Central Conflict Between Rational and Magical Love

The development of the topics throughout the movement represents the conflict between Florio’s real inamorata and her magical rival. Notably the ‘real’ beloved, Bianca, is denoted by theme C, while the topical narrative develops around her depending on the action of the plot. This suggests an element of intransigence in her character such that she is signified by a physical presence: a specific motive, hence identifying her as the actual love interest. The supernatural love, Venus, is represented instead by the fantasia and tempesta topics, both of which are of a transitory nature and neither of which have a specific motive associated with them. Venus therefore has no physical presence within the music, confirming not only the supernatural nature of the character but also the hallucinatory element to her relationship with Florio. The struggle is seen from Florio’s viewpoint. It is an internal battle which is awakened within the nobleman from his first realisation of his love for Bianca. This previously unburdened young man is suddenly confronted with the concept of responsible love and its consequences, for it is marriage that Bianca has planned for them. This leads to his dream of her manifestation as a siren sinking his ship, the trauma of which leaves him susceptible to the charms of Venus. This conflict is illustrated by the placement of the topics within the musical narrative and the way in which they interact with each other, through juxtaposition and integration, to create the literary narrative of Das Marmorbild.

As Florio enters the city, Fortunato directs him to a park where a spring celebration is underway. It is here that he first glimpses Bianca as she plays badminton, and she notices him. A brief flirtation ensues signified by the salon music in the transition at bar 79 (Example 3.25). The section’s compound duple time and minim upbeat suggest a dance while the elegant Straussian melody (still based
on fourths) and countermelody in the strings give this section a *galant* air, retrospectively reflecting the romance topic, which appears as the second subject at bar 118. The dance element is given a dream-like, almost drunken quality as the main theme in the violins begins on the weaker third beat of the bar, rather than the strong beat as is usual. The horns contribute to this effect with falling chromatic interjections, thereby setting the scene of the feast.


![Example 3.25: Salon Music. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, 80–86.](image)

*Example 3.26: Theme C. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 118–126.*

![Example 3.26: Theme C. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 118–126.](image)

*Example 3.26a: Romance. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 114–120.*

![Example 3.26a: Romance. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, bb. 114–120.](image)
Soon after he first catches sight of Bianca, Florio declares his love for her by composing a poem and persuading her to kiss him. This love is expressed by a lyrical romance topic complete with octave doubling in the strings, expressive pauses at the top of the arch-shaped melody and ascending pizzicato figures in the bass (Example 3.26a). The romance topic accompanies the introduction of the second subject: theme C (Example 3.26).

This dream of inner conflict is shown at bar 174 as a development of theme A—the arioso melody which represents Florio himself—is accompanied by the salon music from bar 79. Both keep their original signifiers, but now, in B minor, the effect approaches the Fantasia style, the 3 against 2 rhythms, chromatic horn lines and full texture making it harmonically and rhythmically ambiguous. It is the fantasia element that suggests that this is a dream, the minor key, chromaticism and rhythmic divergences creating an unstructured atmosphere, while the solitude of the arioso points to the internalisation of emotion that Florio experiences at the thought of Bianca, signified by the salon music.

At bar 196 there is a reiteration of theme C, but the topic is now the sensibility style, a musical aesthetic expressing intimate sensitivity. Heartz and Brown suggest Empfindsamkeit served as an early defence of sense over reason and rationalism and it is certainly used in this way here. As Florio’s senses overtake him he stumbles outside to take a walk ending eventually at a garden where he finds the statue of Venus. In his panic over his dream and the events preceding it he begins to let his let his emotions overbear his reason; the fact that it is theme C, the theme which the romance topic initially accompanies, that is accompanied by the sensibility topic confirms what Florio is affected by, which is to say his love for Bianca.

The remainder of the development (bars 212–272) is concerned with the battle between rationalism and sensibility (between Bianca and Venus). At bar 212 theme B is accompanied by both the military and tempesta topics: constant changes in rhythm, dynamics and texture signify the latter topic, while the dotted rhythms and fanfare figures throughout signify the former. The tempesta topic has connotations of an earlier time, the term originally coined to refer to retrospective links with Romanticism seen in the music of Haydn, and is therefore seen as a Classical topic. The ‘past’ associations of this topic, in addition to the turbulence and instability also caused by its utterance, clearly represent the mythological magic inherent to the

---

440 Heartz and Brown, “Empfindsamkeit”.
mysterious lady with whom Florio becomes obsessed. The representation of Venus by the *tempesta* topic is ultimately confirmed by the way in which she is revealed to be the marble statue:

> Meanwhile the thunderstorm seemed to be coming ever nearer; the wind, between whose gusts a solitary strain of the song would fly up and rend the heart all the while, swept whistling through all of the house, threatening to extinguish the wildly flickering candles. The next moment, a lengthy flash of lightning illuminated the duskening chamber. Then Florio suddenly started back a few steps, for it seemed to him that the lady was standing before him, rigid, eyes shut, with extremely white countenance and arms.\(^\text{441}\)

The military topic, by contrast, is epitomised by its stability, characterised by its steady rhythm and even phrases, and is used in this context to symbolise the real and rational beloved. The conflict between the magical and real are therefore symbolised by the juxtaposition of the *tempesta* and the military topics as Florio is thrown between his beloved and her rival.

Just as Venus begins her seduction, a pious song is heard through the open window. It is an old song familiar to Florio, but it troubles Venus, unsurprisingly, as it is the catalyst which frees Florio from her grip. In the musical narrative, this is illustrated by the appearance of a chorale at bars 259–261, punctuated by fanfares (Example 3.27). This learned subtopic is heralded by a complete change in sonority as the *tempesta* topic is banished by the topics which form the rational topical class (the chorale topic, learned style and the alla breve topic at bars 313–316). The ancient song, which takes Florio back to his childhood, is replaced at bar 367 by a pastoral section with nationalist overtones, signified by the chromatic repeated notes in the violins, solo violin and cor anglais. The national topic is often used to signify a longing or reminiscence of home, folk songs often expressing a wish to return to the green hills, lands or fields of home. Here it coincides both with the familiar song and with Florio’s realisation that he has indeed seen Venus before in pictures from his childhood: “Then the feeling suddenly flew through him, as if borne on the strains of the song outside, that at home, in the days of early childhood, he had ofttimes seen such a picture”.\(^\text{442}\)

\(^{441}\) Eichendorff, *The Marble Statue*, 40.

\(^{442}\) Ibid., 38.
The last section of the development, from bar 298, begins with what Floros calls ‘a religious vision’, while La Grange comments that it is ‘a moment of pure ecstasy’. This moment is signified by the military chorale at bar 256, which returns as a series of fanfares at bar 299. The learned style is associated with an ecclesiastical locale, which gives this section its religious atmosphere and is also signified by the cadences affected from bars 304–307, the first an interrupted cadence before the perfect cadence at bar 307, and the alla breve topic which emerges at bars 313–316. The power of Fortunato’s song swells ‘with ever increasing power’, causing the seductress to turn back to the statue, and is symbolised by the religious fervour that runs through this section. This spiritual understanding, as Florio sees Venus for what she is, leads to the lyricism of the major key romance topic, which includes the ‘light’ figure and develops themes B and C together. His final rejection of the rival explains the disappearance, from bar 317, of theme A, the internal obstacle to the fulfilment of his love for Bianca which manifested within his dream. The light figure represents, as it does in Des Knaben Wunderhorn and Kindertotenlieder, the acknowledgement of God, and the hope that that this acceptance gives to those who may be on the wrong path.

Example 3.28: Light Figure. Mahler, Symphony No. 7/i, b. 317.

---

This moment of rationality does not last, however. Themes B and C, joined by the funeral march and romance topics, bring Romanticism to the fore once again, the integration of which creates a slow, *ombra* topic, confirmed by the tremolo strings, woodwind and string drones, and solo trombone and tenor horn melodies. With Florio’s understanding of the situation comes a ‘deadly horror’, for as Venus begins to turn back into a statue other supernatural occurrences begin:

Tall flowers in planters had begun to hideously wind and intertwine like colourfully-spotted rearing snakes; every cavalier on the arrases suddenly looked like him and gave him a malicious smile; both of the arms that held the candles strained and stretched themselves longer and longer, as if a giant were struggling to work his way out of the wall; the hall filled up more and more, the flames of lightning threw horrible lights among the forms, through which throng Florio saw the stone statues thrusting for him with such violence that his hair stood on end.  

Florio then attempts to find the cavalier Donati, but finds only a ‘lowly hut, completely overgrown with vine leaves’. The funeral march and topic symbolise Florio’s experiences and his comprehension of the supernatural nature of his adventure.

The recapitulation sees a return of the hunt topic, integrated with the noble march and the learned style to indicate rationalism’s victory, and leads to a recapitulation of the salon music and the romance topic in their original forms, which is to say they are not integrated with any other topic and again accompany theme C. This is significant as when they appeared in the exposition they represented Florio’s relationship with Bianca, and in this position they represent the resurgence of this relationship as she joins him, her uncle and Fortunato on their travels.

### 3.6.e. Structural Innovation

The musical structure itself is also innovative within this first movement. The topics’ relationship with conventional sonata form is different from the way in which they worked in earlier symphonies. In the Fourth Symphony, for example, the motivic development is the central variant throughout the first movement. Each motive has its own topical correlation and as each returns, even with the development inherent to the sonata form, the topic returns with it. In this way the topical language is often

---

444 Eichendorff, *Das Marmorbild*, 38.
layered according to how many themes are being used at a time. In the Seventh Symphony, however, the relationship between theme and topic is reversed. Adorno describes the motivic process succinctly as an ‘always different yet identical figure’, indicating that the motives (although differing enough to be able to identify three recognisable ‘themes’) are all built on the interval of a fourth and all consist of a quaver–dotted quaver–semiquaver rhythm (although often temporally augmented or diminished).\textsuperscript{445} Without this clear motivic definition to signpost the structural sections (exposition, development etc.) the topics provide structural signification instead. This can be seen through the use of the hunt and the romance topic as subjects one and two. Theme B had already appeared in the introduction, but the hunt topic was not used until the exposition. It subsequently returned at the start of the development and the recapitulation effectively marking these structural points.

The topical narrative of this movement can therefore be seen to act in different ways. One topic, the hunt, can be seen to have three different levels of signification, representing the ethical personality of the main character and the plot of the story, and situating the story within the natural surroundings of parks and gardens. Other topics are used to represent only one aspect of the plot or character. For instance the salon music represents Florio’s first meeting with Bianca, the tempesta topic represents Venus and the rational topic symbolises one side of the conflict between magical and real love. These topics are then developed into a narrative through their interaction with each other, through integration, juxtaposition or their placement in respect of other topics.

In an ostensibly abstract symphonic first movement where one would not expect to find a narrative—where the composer, indeed, specifically claimed that there was no narrative—a topical approach enables the construction of a narrative that corresponds to that in Eichendorff’s novella, emphasising the ways in which music, specifically topics, index other cultural media. The historical specificity of such indexing is suggested by the presence of topics which appear to be particularly linked to fin-de-siècle Vienna, such as the Jewish and the rational topics, which mirror contemporary social issues and interests: here the political issues of anti-Semitism and the ‘failure of liberalism’, which Schorske suggests was caused by the movement away from the rational life towards the ‘instinctual' emotional existence, appear to have been particularly potent. The topical references and the

narrativisation which is communicated through them suggest that even if Mahler was right to claim that ‘the language of music has communicated immeasurably more than the word is able to express’—this ‘more’ is key: that music’s referential frame is always already in excess of a linguistic one—this does not mean that it was not simultaneously capable of expressing, topically, narrativisations of and commentaries upon the world in which Mahler, for one, lived.446

3.7 Conclusion

The above topical analyses conducted on pieces by Strauss, Mahler and Zemlinsky have demonstrated the multivalency of topics. The hunt topic, for example, when used in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony, provided a link between the urban aristocracy and the rural pastoral. In the same composer’s Seventh Symphony the topic’s signification expanded to indicate the character’s ethical personality and his aristocratic status, and to situate the story in woodlands and parks, which, by extension denoted mystery, romance and the unknown. The hunt topic’s levels of signification expanded because of its interaction with the Eichendorff novella; other topics gain levels of signification through their historical traces, such as the funereal fanfares in Symphony No. 4, which echo the fanfares in Verdi’s Messa da Requiem, or their interaction with other topics or pictorialisms, such as the sleigh bells that flavour the pastoral topic. In the case of the sleigh bells, however, more connotative levels emerged after their interaction with other topics, as the narrative progressed. The innocence of the introduction was only retrospectively understood as idealistic and unobtainable once the hedonistic urban topics had subsumed it.

Among the analyses of former scholars on Classical works such as the string quartets by Mozart and Beethoven, topics have been shown to be stable, with secure signifiers and secure meanings. As the format of compositions transformed—symphonies got longer, tone poems, Lieder and song cycles became more prevalent, and traditional forms, like sonata form, were altered—the topics associated with these traditions were also either transformed or discontinued. Topics can, therefore become associated with a particular era, such as the learned style’s association with the Baroque, or the brilliant style’s association with the Classical. As the music analysed here moves past the Romantic period and into the twentieth century the origins of modernity within this particular analytical field emerge.

Schorske’s suggestion that Jung Wien moved away from the previous generation’s rationality, towards the instinctual inner mind of Schopenhauer and Freud, is paralleled in Mahler’s song cycles, just as the burgeoning class wars are satirically treated in his Fourth Symphony and Zemlinsky’s “O Mutter”. The dissolution of rationality in Viennese culture signifies the dissolution of fixed rules. Topics now begin to exhibit instability, signs do not have fixed relationships with their signifiers and there occurs a collapse of meaning. By tracing topics outside of the musical field, however, and by comparing them with the inherent culture with which composers were familiar, i.e. the literary, philosophical, and political atmosphere in which they lived, topics can be situated historically. Hence, by placing the analyses in a different context new meanings can be found, and the instable nature of topics can be recognised as ‘modernity’ rather than a lack of analytical integrity. The alterations of traditional structures mentioned above, the degree to which topical signification can expand and collapse, and the irony which pervades the narratives in both popular and art music, may help to inform the analyst about the broader culture in which the works were composed. The expectation, then, would be that as the culture continued to change so would topical associations. Designed as a reaction to the dissolution of the diatonic system Schoenberg’s twelve-tone music displays the ‘healthy scepticism’ against the ‘spellbinding power that modernity exerts’. As such, as rule-based systems return, topical signification may also return to its established conventional associations.
Chapter 4: Inner Expression in Lehár and Schoenberg

Discussing topics and form in Mozart, Agawu states that ‘topics have no independent existence; they are agents of intermittent inter-textual signalling’. He goes on, paraphrasing Stephen Rumph, to imply that a topical discourse, alone, cannot expose an underlying syntax. By this Agawu means that, for him and other scholars such as Allanbrook, topics are ‘witty allusions’, surface texture which provide additional signification but are still subjugated by the fundamental tonal and formal process.

This is, to some extent, true when analysing eighteenth-century music, which is the purpose for which Ratner originally proposed topic theory, but, when analysing nineteenth- and twentieth-century music, topics become less dependent on this fundamental base. With the move away from Classical structures and conventional tonal progressions, by the time of composers such as Wagner and Mahler, that base had become less firm, while the expressive potential of the music had become more important. The release from the tonal system effected by Arnold Schoenberg at the beginning of the twentieth century meant that expressive potential was no longer informed by the tonal structure of the music. Narrativity in Schoenberg simultaneously invokes and refuses traditional (tonal) narrative gestures, for example in Almén’s analysis of Schoenberg’s Op. 19 No. 4. As noted in the last chapter, Klein places Schoenberg in the neo-narrative position on his map, positing that ‘when Boulez writes that Schoenberg’s ambition was “to create works of the same nature as those of the old sound-world which he had only just abandoned”, we might say that Schoenberg was confirming musical narrative albeit with a new discourse’. For Elisheva Rigbi this new discourse parallels the movement from lyric poetry to modernist prose in twentieth-century literary fiction, and she defines musical prose as free musical diction, that is, the irregular, ambiguous, indistinct or absent parsing of the temporal flow of music. She goes on to explain that

One might be inclined to conclude that musical prose reduces the prospects for musical narrativity to almost nil. However, the opposite is the

---

447 Agawu, “Topics and Form”, 476.
case. The greater the plurality (as indeterminacy or as fragmentation), the lesser the intra-opus, “syntactic” support for musical meaning, and the more the listeners must resort to external frames of reference in order to make sense of the music, let alone make it meaningful. In other words, if musical prose as the fractured musical given is musical discourse, then the listeners must construct some kind of musical story in order to make any sense of it [...] [using] associations, intertexts, topoi, or simply generic or stylistic logic. 452

Thus, in the early 1900s, Schoenberg’s use of expressive gestures echoes surrounding cultural, philosophical and aesthetic theories, particularly those of Freud. The portrayal of expression had begun to look inwards, to the articulation of the inner consciousness, rather than the outside world. In agreement, Ernst Krenek asserted that:

Atonality has given speech to the individual, liberating him from delusive chains and seductive illusions. By intensifying the expression of personal emotion to the utmost, it has demonstrated the loneliness and alienation of humanity as clearly as possible. 453

The problem remains, however, of the presence of topics in the absence of the “fundamental tonal and formal process” Allanbrook and Agawu claim is essential, the very absence of which McClary suggested removed the potential for narrative, as noted earlier. 454 Agawu notices ‘a dislocation of the signifier from the signified’ in the nineteenth century, explaining that

while the morphology of various topics is retained by Romantic composers, their conventional association is displaced. Thus, one way of describing the Classic-Romantic relationship is in terms of a morphological continuity and a referential discontinuity. 455

454 See introduction to chapter 3.
455 Agawu, PWS, 137.
Monelle simplifies this statement: ‘you can still hear topics in Romantic music, but they do not mean the same thing’. As previously discussed, Monelle repeatedly states that the formulation of signification, or meaning, of topics relates to the social and cultural history in which they are deployed. Monelle and Agawu both acknowledge the presence of topics in Mahler’s works; accordingly, having ascertained which topics are prevalent within his works, one can look forwards, tracing these topics through the works of Schoenberg and, in the next chapter, Webern.

The programmatic nature of some of Schoenberg’s earlier works, particularly Pelleas und Melisande and Erwartung, as well as the songs (Opp. 1, 2, 3, 6, 8, 12, 13 and 15 etc.) provides a topical sphere, the similarities between works offering proof that Schoenberg used specific signifiers to denote specific meanings, such as certain emotions, events or locations. Ethan Haimo states that ‘with little warning and with minimal precedent, Schoenberg went from writing intensely motivic music to writing music in which there were no repeated themes, no recurrent motives, and a complete avoidance of learned devices’. Despite this, in his essay “A Self-Analysis” Schoenberg writes, ‘May I venture to say that, in my belief, even works of my third period, as, for example [...] the Five Orchestral Pieces, Op. 16 [...] are relatively easy to understand today’. The meaning, it is proposed below, must therefore come from a different learned tradition rather than ‘recurrent motives and devices’. Topic theory fills this void.

Descriptions of the uncanny in music are not restricted to Schoenberg’s music. Susanna Välimäki provides a comprehensive survey of psychoanalytic signification in music in her book Subject Strategies in Music, in which she observes the uncanny in Tchaikovsky’s Symphony No. 6, the Pathétique. Categories of the uncanny in music range from figurations of automata and ventriloquism, such as in

---

456 Monelle, TMT, 8.
Abbate’s *In Search of Opera* and Klein’s *Intertextuality in Western Art Music*.\^461 Wojciech Stepięń and Joseph Kerman investigate ogres, trolls and other magical grotesques; Richard Cohn, Klein and Peter Smith highlight uncanny tonal repetitions and progressions in nineteenth-century instrumental music; and Cherlin focuses on tonal quotations in non-tonal works.\^462 There have been various examinations of figuring the double, such as Kramer’s “other-voicedness”; David Schwartz examines Schubert’s settings of Heine’s “Der Doppelgänger” and “Ihr Bild”; and Kurth similarly juxtaposes music against poetic text, and poet (Heine) against composer (Schubert) and two ‘philosopher-critics’ (Derrida and Nietzsche).\^463

The idea of Schoenberg referencing Freudian psychoanalysis within his early music is not a new one, having been previously discussed by scholars such as Alan Street, Alexander Carpenter, Michael Klein and Michael Cherlin.\^464 However, the thrusts of these arguments have focussed on either the textual representation of anxiety, or uncanny allusions within the music, exposed through the relationship between the music and the text. In my first case study, however, it is shown that there are specific topical signifiers that represent hysteria and the uncanny, in such a way that one can outline a new topical class.

Although numerous analytical links have been made between Schoenberg and Freud, there are not known to be any direct personal links; other than having met and commissioned the *Erwartung* text from Marie Pappenheim (the sister of


one of Freud’s more infamous cases, Anna O.), Schoenberg was not known to have read any of Freud’s works or met him directly. Reinhold Brinkmann suggests that the reason why this link between the two is continually made is ‘the central idea of introspection as the primary figure of thought’ which ‘characterise[s] the origin and the structure both of Freud’s psychoanalytical theory and of Schoenberg’s atonal compositions. Thus, he continues, ‘with an identical social and historical accentuation, “Freud’s Vienna” could also be named “Schoenberg’s Vienna”, just as philosophers rightly call it “Wittgenstein’s Vienna” and art historians call it “Schiele’s Vienna”’. To augment this sociocultural analysis Brinkmann cites the psychoanalyst Bruno Bettelheim from his essay “Freud’s Vienna”:

In Freud’s time, the cultural atmosphere in Vienna encouraged a fascination with both mental illness and sexual problems in a way unique in the Western world—a fascination that extended throughout society. […] The origins of this unique cultural preoccupation can be traced to the history of the city itself, but most especially to the concerns and attitudes foremost in the minds of Vienna’s cultural elites just before and during the period in which Freud formed his revolutionary theories about our emotional life. […]

The greatest of Freud’s works [The Interpretation of Dreams] is one of introspection; in it all interest is devoted to the innermost self of man, to the neglect of the external world, which pales in comparison to the fascination of this inner world. That this turn-of-the-century Viennese chef d’oeuvre was indeed the result of desperation at being unable to change the course of the external world and represented an effort to make up this deficiency by a single-minded interest in the dark underworld, is attested to by the motto which Freud put at the beginning: Virgil’s line: “Flectere si nequeo superos, Acheronta movebo” (“If I cannot move heaven, I will stir up the underworld instead”). This motto was a most succinct suggestion that turning inward toward the hidden aspects of the self was due to a despair that it was no longer within one’s ability to alter the external world or stop its dissolution; that therefore the best one could do was to deny

importance to the world at large by concentrating all interest on the dark aspects of the psyche.\textsuperscript{466}

Brinkmann’s view, then, harks back to that of Janik and Toulmin, cited in chapter 2, that the link between the various disciplines, particularly in this instance music and psychoanalysis, is ‘that they were all going on in this same place at this same time.’\textsuperscript{467} The artificiality of liberalism and moral values effected repression, particularly of sexual desires within the upper classes. Eva Weissweiler has argued that Pappenheim’s libretto for \textit{Erwartung} is essentially an attack on the repression of the upper classes, represented by the Woman. Breuer’s analysis, she claims, supports her argument in his speculation that Anna O.’s hysteria resulted from her upbringing as a typical upper-class Viennese girl. Bryan Simms summarises:

She had been assiduously protected from life, kept in a monotonous, sheltered family routine. But her intellect and curiosity about the world could not be suppressed, and her only outlet was through daydreaming, [...] [which] began to dissociate her conscious from her unconscious faculties, inviting traumatic events and emotions in her life to be repressed into the unconscious.

Simms concludes, however, that Schoenberg did not embrace this subtext, asserting that the basic subject of the opera is the representation of emotions heightened by fear.\textsuperscript{468} It is a combination of the opposition to bourgeois rationalism and the portrayal of emotions which brings Schoenberg to the representation of the unconscious. In a letter to Ferruccio Busoni in 1909, Schoenberg stated that

\begin{quote}
[i]t is \textbf{impossible} for a person to have only \textit{one} sensation at a time.
One has \textit{thousands} simultaneously. And these thousands can no more readily be added together than an apple and a pear. They go their own ways.
\end{quote}


\textsuperscript{467} Janik and Toulmin, \textit{Wittgenstein’s Vienna}, 18.

And this variegation, this multifariousness, this *illogicality* which our senses demonstrate, the illogicality presented by their interactions, set forth by some mounting rush of blood, by some reaction of the senses or the nerves, this I should like to have in my music.

It should be an expression of feeling, as our feelings, which bring us in contact with our subconscious, really are, and no false child of feelings and ‘conscious logic’.\(^{469}\)

It was ‘conscious logic’, then, that Schoenberg contested: the ‘classical notions of beauty and refinement’, that the ‘affluent Viennese middle-class music lovers’ retained.\(^{470}\) Schoenberg’s defence, Botstein claims, was ‘his assertion of artistic integrity [which] assumed a nearly puritanical façade of ethical superiority’, summarised by the composer himself in “Brahms the progressive”:\(^{471}\)

> Great art must proceed to precision and brevity. It presupposes the alert mind of an educated listener who, in a single act of thinking, includes with every concept all associations pertaining to the complex. This enables a musician to write for upper-class minds, not only doing what grammar and idiom require, but, in other respects lending to every sentence the full pregnancy of meaning of a maxim, of a proverb, of an aphorism.\(^{472}\)

Schoenberg’s statement unites the above strands of cultural context and topical narrative—his superiority is apparent in the assumption that only an “educated listener” with an “upper-class mind” can comprehend his music, and the expectation that his music works similarly to topical association, in that, for example, a waltz signifies a 3/4 dance and a satirical commentary on the Viennese elite.

The previous chapter showed that topics are present in music by Strauss, Mahler and Zemlinsky, a conclusion already drawn by many others, including Monelle and Agawu.\(^{473}\) Also discussed was how topical narratives work, the


\(^{470}\) Leon Botstein: “Music and the Critique of Culture”, 4.

\(^{471}\) Ibid., 7.

\(^{472}\) Schoenberg, “Brahms the Progressive”, *Style and Idea*, 72.

\(^{473}\) Monelle, *SM*, 170–195; Agawu, *Music as Discourse*, 253–280. The conclusions reached by these scholars primarily regarded the structural and introversive meanings which topics
meaning inferred by the ordering and interaction of topics within a composition’s syntax, and it is this method of garnering meaning from the music which is important when linking this art form to its contemporaries in art, literature and philosophy. As such, this chapter consists of three case studies in which compositions by Franz Lehár and Schoenberg are analysed topically in the manner developed in the previous chapter.

The first case study develops the “uncanny” topical class, based on Freud’s 1919 article, within Schoenberg’s Op. 16 and to a lesser extent his Op. 15, Erwartung (1909). The second examines the most commercially successful operetta of its time, Die lustige Witwe. The inclusion of what is considered ‘light’ music in this chapter demonstrates that the themes found in the non-tonal art music compositions of Schoenberg were not only considered within the realm of the coffee house intellectuals and artists, but also by popular music composers, like Lehár. Demonstrated within the third study, of Schoenberg’s Pelleas und Melisande Op. 5, are the ways in which Freudian theories of the repression of the unconscious combine with the study of melodic variation, topical narrative and the play’s original plot to inform the structure of the work.

Case Studies

4.1. The Uncanny in Schoenberg’s Fünf Orchesterstücke Op. 16

4.1.a. Introduction: From Ombra to the Uncanny

Ombra signifiers appear regularly in eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century compositions, but, as suggested at the beginning of this chapter, when faced with the emancipation of dissonance that occurred around 1908 in Schoenberg’s compositions, some of those signifiers became obsolete. Strong harmony dissolved as motivic development overtook tonal progression; as such, progressions can no longer ‘surprise’, or can only surprise, which amounts to the same thing. Not only have the signifiers changed, the ombra topic’s meaning has also altered. The topic here is no longer only associated with the external fears of the supernatural but rather, with the advent of psychoanalysis, the fear and terror being portrayed is an internal struggle between the conscious and unconscious. The audience is no

can elucidate, while these analyses further reflect on the referential meaning of the works’ topical narrative.
longer expected to experience fear vicariously through the characters on a stage, as in an opera, but are instead subject to an anxious representation of their own psyche—an internalisation of expression that began with works such as Mahler’s *Kindertotenlieder*.

In the early 1900s, therefore, the topic had become similar to the sublime. Edmund Burke’s 1756 treatise on the sublime and the beautiful posits that the origin of the sublime, like that of the *ombra* topic, lay in terror.

Whatever is fitted in any sort of way to excite the ideas of pain, and danger, that is to say, whatever is in any sort terrible, or is conversant about terrible objects, or operates in a manner analogous to terror, is a source of the *sublime*; that is, it is productive of the strongest emotion which the mind is capable of feeling. I say the strongest emotion, because I am satisfied the ideas of pain are much more powerful than those which enter on the part of pleasure.474

The setting of the drama in the forest—in a natural location—in conjunction with the *ombra* topic and, with the introduction of the ostinato fugue, the learned style signifies the sublime in a way made familiar in Romantic music. Rosen, in his 1995 discourse on Romanticism, suggests that ‘it was the lyric poetry of landscape that was the chief inspiration in the development of the *Lied*, and gave vocal music the grandeur that had until then been reserved for opera or oratorio’.475 In this way, he posits that the song cycles ‘realised one of the ideals of the period: to give the lyrical expression of Nature an epic status, a genuine monumentality, without losing the apparent simplicity of a personal expression’.476

The representation of Nature in music, however, is not, according to Rosen, enough. In this aspect, he defers to Schiller’s 1794 review of Johann Matthiasson’s poems: ‘there are two ways that Nature without living creatures can become a symbol of the human: either as representation of feelings or as representation of

476 Ibid., 125.
ideas’. Expanding on this, Rosen states that ‘what Schiller demands is that the poet and the artist show us the correspondence between the sensuous experience of Nature and the spiritual and intellectual working of the mind. Only this can give landscape the dignity of epic poetry and religious and historical painting’. In his *Critique of Judgement*, Kant describes the sublime as exactly this opposition between vicarious, external perception and personal experience and interpretation, stating that ‘for the beautiful in nature, we must seek a ground external to ourselves, but for the sublime one merely in ourselves and the attitude of mind that introduces sublimity into the representation of nature’. Moreover, Kant suggests there is a duality to the perception of the sublime:

The feeling of the sublime is a pleasure that only arises indirectly, being brought about by the feeling of a momentary check to the vital forces followed at once by a discharge all the more powerful, and so it is an emotion that seems to be no sport, but dead earnest in the affairs of the imagination. Hence charms are repugnant to it; and, since the mind is not simply attracted by the object, but is alternately repelled thereby, the delight in the sublime does not so much involve positive pleasure as admiration or respect, i.e. merits the name of a negative pleasure.

The concept of duality within emotional perception continues in Freud’s concept of the uncanny, particularly in relation to doppelgängers and subsequently the unconscious, both of which are discussed fully below. The movement described above, from the indirect experience of dread to an intimate sensation of anxiety, suggests that it is no longer the *ombra* topic which is now being utilised. The music is now in the realm of the uncanny.

---

4.1.b. Psychoanalysis in Schoenberg

Schoenberg wrote his *Fünf Orchesterstücke* in 1909, in response to Richard Strauss’s request for ‘a few (not too long) pieces to have a look at’.\(^{481}\) This came in what Simms has described as ‘the midst of his most fertile and optimistic period as a composer’.\(^{482}\) During this period Schoenberg wrote four major works: the *Three Piano Pieces*, Op. 11, *The Book of the Hanging Garden*, Op. 15, *Fünf Orchesterstücke*, Op. 16 and *Erwartung*, Op. 17. Originally untitled, his publisher requested he add titles to the five pieces in 1912, as ‘compositions with the title “pieces” don’t get off the ground’.\(^{483}\) Although Schoenberg was initially resistant to this idea—‘titles give things away’—he eventually assigned the pieces obscure and technical titles, along with equally enigmatic rationales, here presented in brackets as in his original letter:

1. “Premonitions” [*Vorgefühle*] (everyone has these);
2. “The Past” [*Vergangenes*] (everyone has this too);
3. “Chord Colours” [*Farben*] (technical);
4. Peripeteia [*Peripetie*] (probably general enough);
5. “The Obligatory Recitative” [*Das obligate Rezitativ*] (maybe “fully developed” or “endless” would be better).\(^{484}\)

Alexander Carpenter groups Op. 16 with the other works from the period 1908–1909. He classifies them under the heading ‘psychoanalytic’ as, he posits, ‘they articulate Schoenberg’s preoccupation with his own neurosis—a kind of hysteria manifest in repressed memory—and reflect a compositional approach that echoes Freud’s contemporary writings on the nature of the unconscious’.\(^{485}\) Carpenter’s reference to ‘Schoenberg’s neurosis’ is a reference to the consequences of his

---

\(^{482}\) Ibid., 71.
\(^{483}\) Ibid., 74.
\(^{484}\) From Schoenberg’s diary in Simms, *The Atonal Music of Arnold Schoenberg*, 74. The titles of the five pieces were adjusted in later editions. The second piece was changed from *Vergangenheit* to *Vergangenes*, the third piece was repeatedly renamed; from “The Changing Chord”, to “Colours”, then “The Changing Chord (Morning on the Traunsee) became “Colours” (Summer Morning on the Lake). In 1949, English equivalents were formulated. The terms chosen by Schoenberg and his assistant Richard Hoffmann were “Premonitions”, “Yesteryears”, “Summer Morning at a Lake”, “Peripetia” and “The Obligatory Recitative”.
\(^{485}\) Carpenter, “Schoenberg’s Vienna, Freud’s Vienna”, 145.
wife’s affair with a family friend, Richard Gerstl, for whom Mathilde Schoenberg eventually left Arnold. She was persuaded to return to her husband, at which point Gerstl committed suicide, a loss felt keenly by husband and wife as he had been a close friend to them both.486 Philip Friedheim, however, suggests that “Premonitions” [Vorgefühle] may reflect the “fear that Schoenberg felt as he approached a new unknown”, i.e., the stylistic beginning of his atonal period.487 This view is only valid in retrospect, but Straus provides some evidence to support it:

[Schoenberg] imagined himself as having been forcibly expelled from an Eden of musical common practice: ‘My destiny had forced me in this direction[…] The Supreme Commander had ordered me on a harder road’. Who is this Supreme Commander, this cruel and unforgiving God? It is the tonal tradition itself, its weight and prestige pushing Schoenberg painfully forward.488

Although Carpenter places Op. 16 and Op. 17 into the same “psychoanalytic” group, a topical narrative of the Fünf Orchesterstücke shows that, in the context of Erwartung, the pieces have more in common than their shared psychoanalytic characteristics. Moreover, it is possible to use the texted monodrama as a “key” to unlock the structure of these small, and according to Schoenberg, unstructured pieces.

In Carpenter’s article on the connections between Erwartung and the early history of psychoanalysis, he focuses on the case studies from The Studies on Hysteria, and the later Dora case fragment, linking them to the libretto by Marie Pappenheim. While the libretto is a vital part of the monodrama, the topics which are presented throughout Erwartung, and the presence of motivic quotations taken from the Fünf Orchesterstücke, show that it is instead the concept of the uncanny which is used here, and themes associated with that concept, such as anxiety, repression and the castration complex.

4.1.c. The Uncanny

‘The Uncanny’, Freud writes, ‘belongs to all that is terrible—to all that arouses dread and creeping horror; it is equally certain, too, that the word is not always used in a clearly definable sense, so that it tends to coincide with whatever excites dread’.\(^{489}\) Freud then defines the concept of the uncanny further as ‘that class of the frightening which leads back to what is known of old and long familiar’.\(^{490}\)

To demonstrate the latter definition Freud explores the two meanings of the word *heimlich*. The primary meaning is ‘familiar’, ‘native’ or ‘belonging to the home’.\(^{491}\) The secondary meaning of the word *heimlich*, is to conceal, keep or do something secretly, which is to say something kept hidden *behind the doors of the home*. This ambivalent meaning develops, moving from something secret, like an affair, to something that is withdrawn from knowledge, becomes unconscious, and finally to something which is hidden and dangerous, until it coincides with its opposite, *unheimlich*.\(^{492}\) The uncanny, then, does not signify the supernatural in the way the *ombra* topic does; it signifies something which is ‘familiar’. The topic here is not associated with the external fears of the supernatural but with the advent of psychoanalysis, the fear and terror being portrayed an internal struggle between the conscious and unconscious.

Freud employs Hoffmann’s story “The Sandman” to explore the concept of the uncanny, the main theme of which is the character of the Sandman who tears out children’s eyes. The story centres on a student, Nathaniel, who was threatened with the Sandman by his mother when he was young. Nathaniel began to associate the figure of the Sandman with the ‘repulsive’ lawyer Coppelius, who visited his father. Hoffmann describes a scene in which Nathaniel creeps in and spies on his father and the lawyer, who catches the small boy and threatens to put out his eyes with hot coals. His father begs the lawyer to stop, at which point Nathaniel falls ill for a long time. Hoffman does not make it clear whether the scene is real or a young boy’s fantasy, i.e. a continuation of Nathaniel’s association between Coppelius and the Sandman. A year later the father dies in an explosion in his study and the lawyer Coppelius vanishes without a trace.

\(^{490}\) Ibid., 220.
\(^{491}\) Ibid., 222.
\(^{492}\) Ibid., 225.
As a betrothed student, Nathaniel meets two more men: an optician, Coppola, and a ‘mechanician’, Spalanzi, who has built an automaton, Olympia, with whom Nathaniel falls in love. When Nathaniel interrupts them quarrelling over Olympia the optician carries off the doll, leaving Olympia’s bleeding eyeballs on the ground. Spalanzi seizes them and throws them at Nathaniel’s chest saying that Coppola had stolen them from him. Nathaniel’s recollection of his father’s death and his childhood dread surface once more and he succumbs to a fresh attack of madness.

Once Nathaniel has recovered, and is betrothed once again to his fiancée, the couple go for a walk up the tower of the town hall. Nathaniel looks through the spyglass that Coppola gave him and falls again into a fit of madness. He tries to throw his fiancée off the tower. She is rescued, but he throws himself off instead with a shriek of ‘Yes! Fine eyes – beautiful eyes’, once it is revealed that it was the lawyer Coppelius that Nathaniel had seen through the spyglass.493

4.1.d. Castration Complex
This story figures the uncanny in various ways. Superficially, it is a small boy’s terror of the ‘wicked man who comes when children won’t go to bed, and throws handfuls of sand in their eyes so that they jump out of their heads all bleeding’.494 The dread of losing one’s eyes, Freud explains, ‘is a terrible fear of childhood’, and in his study of dreams he suggests that

the anxiety about one’s eyes, the fear of going blind, is often enough a substitute for the dread of being castrated. The self-blinding of the mythical criminal, Oedipus, was simply a mitigated form of the punishment of castration—the only punishment that was adequate for him by the lex talionis.495

Within Schoenberg’s Fünf Orchesterstücke, the castration complex is signified using the depiction of the forest in the first piece “Vorgefühle”. The first piece begins with the Nachtmusik topic (Example 4.1), signified by the sparse texture and instrumental combination of cello and low woodwind. This topic, named after the

495 Ibid., 231.
Nachtmusik movements from Mahler’s Seventh Symphony, is widely used throughout Mahler’s work to signify a night-time pastoral locale. It is often used to signify fear within that locale, as in “Der Schildwache Nachtlied” and “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n”, and in Zemlinsky’s “Sprich zu mir Geliebter”.


At bar 10, the topic changes, at first glance to the ombra topic, the movement signified by the change in instrumentation, from cello and lower woodwind to strings, oboe and particularly the trombone Hauptstimme, as well as the change in rhythmic pace. However, this topic is used by Schoenberg to signify a tense forest atmosphere, a fearful, anxious mood that can be seen in the opening of Verklärte Nacht, Pelleas und Melisande, “Wir Bevölkerten die Abend-düstern” from Das Buch der Hängenden Gärten Op. 15 and “Nacht” from Pierrot Lunaire. Therefore, it is the signification of this topic at this point that has changed, rather than the signifiers themselves.

In The Interpretation of Dreams Freud ascribes symbolic signification to forests, suggesting that ‘the female organ [is] symbolised by a landscape’, what he terms the ‘geography of sex’, and that a dense forest symbolises female pubic hair, a representation he uses to analyse the dream of Dora in his Fragment of an Analysis of a Case of Hysteria. Simultaneously, the multiplication of the phallic symbol (the tree) signifies castration. Freud discusses this phenomenon further in “The Medusa’s Head”. Freud suggests that the decapitation of the head of Medusa symbolises castration. When a young boy first sees the female genitals, it appears as a void surrounded by hair. He believes that the woman has been castrated; he thinks that as he has a penis then so does everyone else. When he sees his mother/sister without one he believes their penis has been removed, and therefore that his may be too. In the case of Medusa’s Head, Freud explains that

---

496 Freud, The Interpretation of Dreams, 91.
the hair upon Medusa’s head is frequently represented in works of art in the form of snakes, and these once again are derived from the castration complex. It is a remarkable fact, that, however frightened they may be in themselves, they nevertheless serve actually as a mitigation of the horror, for they replace the penis, the absence of which is the cause of the horror. This is a confirmation of the technical rule according to which a multiplication of penis symbols signifies castration.497

In addition to the multiplication of phallic symbols, the forest locale also signifies, to Schoenberg at least, a specific theme: that of two lovers in a moment of crisis. In Verklärte Nacht the woman is terrified of telling her new lover that she is pregnant with someone else’s child; in Pelleas und Melisande, Melisande is terrified, lost and confused until she meets Golaud. Similarly, in Erwartung the woman is delirious, searching for her lover who has failed to meet her and in “Wir bevölkerten die abend-düstern” a man mourns the loss of his lover with whom he had enjoyed wandering under the ‘gloomy bowers’. This is significant because among the validations Freud provides for the association between the loss of eyes and castration is the intimate connection Hoffmann paints between the anxiety about the eyes and Nathaniel’s father’s death. The Sandman appears each time ‘in order to interfere with love’.498 He separates Nathaniel from his betrothed, his best friend (Clara’s brother) and Olympia. Freud goes on to say that

Elements in the story like these, and many others, seem arbitrary and meaningless so long as we deny all connection between fears about the eye and castration; but they become intelligible as soon as we replace the Sandman by the dreaded father at whose hands castration is expected.499

4.1.e. Doubles: the Doppelgänger and the Unconscious

Freud discusses the theme of doubles within his interpretation of the Sandman. He suggests that his father and Coppelius represent two opposites into which the ‘father-imago is split by [Nathan’s] ambivalence’.500 Where one tries to blind him, the other lovingly intercedes. Later, Professor Spalanzani and Coppola reproduce the

499 Ibid., 232.
500 Ibid., n232.
double representation of the father-imago, reincarnations of Nathaniel’s “two” fathers. Moreover, Freud shows that, as these ‘new editions’ are also Olympia’s fathers, then the doll is associated with Nathaniel, his ‘dissociated complex which confronts him as a person’.\textsuperscript{501} In \textit{Pelleas und Melisande} the link between the doppelgänger and the unconscious is explored in connection with the brothers Golaud and Pelleas, and to the split personality of the character Melisande. That link is also recognised in the duality of the word \textit{heimlich}, where its meaning develops to ‘something that is withdrawn from knowledge, it \textit{becomes unconscious’}. In Op. 16 it appears, because of the use of the singing style in the second piece and the \textit{Lied} style in the fourth piece, that there is only one character here, and as such it is the divide between the conscious and unconscious that is being revealed through the topical narrative.

The first example of the unconscious in the \textit{Fünf Orchesterstücke} can be seen in the fugue at bar 26 of the first piece, which signifies the learned style, taking the form of an ostinato-like quaver exposition starting in the cello (Example 4.2).

\textit{Example 4.2: Fugue. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 1, bb. 26–40.}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example42.png}
\caption{Example 4.2: Fugue. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 1, bb. 26–40.}
\end{figure}

The exposition runs for 10 bars and is built on the intervals of the opening cello motive. The ostinato style of this exposition and the drone in the bassoons and bass clarinet create the uncanny atmosphere using violent outbursts with strong dynamic contrast introducing each new exposition entry. The learned style also particularly signifies the past; this topic is associated with composers such as J.S. Bach. This signification, coupled with the ostinato figures that form the fugue in the first piece

\textsuperscript{501} Ibid.
and return regularly throughout the work form what Cherlin terms ‘time shards’. ‘These’, Cherlin states, ‘involve the use of a steady pulse-stream, set in contrast to its immediate musical environment, and expressing a sense of altered, “uncanny” time [...] Time shards are uncanny, at least in a large part, because their regular pulse-streams evoke a ghostly presence of the way that time “used to go”’. Cherlin is here referring to the music’s ‘tonal precursors’, the ‘ghostly presence’ of which, in post-tonal music, can be invoked through ‘musical rhetoric, motivic development, even orchestration’. The music thus becomes uncanny.

However, while these ‘time shards’ do indeed seem unheimlich in the surrounding teleological, developmental music, if a comparison is drawn between Fünf Orchesterstücke and Erwartung, a more comprehensible parallel between Freud’s theories and these periods of suspension may be Freud’s outline of hypnoid states from his Studies of Hysteria. Josef Breuer, the co-author of this book, describes the hypnoid state as a ‘second consciousness’ caused by ‘psychical traumas’ or ‘any experience which calls up distressing affects such as those of fright, anxiety, shame or physical pain’. This state can take the form of a physical reaction, such as an uncontrollable rage or an epileptic-like fit, or a sudden inability to speak or move: in the case of Anna O., the case on which Erwartung is supposedly based, she lost the ability to speak her native German and became almost completely paralysed. Freud similarly links paralysis to the castration complex in his fragment “The Medusa’s Head”. Freud writes that ‘The sight of Medusa’s head makes the spectator stiff with terror, turns him to stone’, thus further associating the hypnoid state and its symptoms with the uncanny.

Breuer associates the hypnoid state with hypnosis and dreams that occur while the patient is awake, suggesting that if a person is prone to daydreaming this can then lead that person to develop hysterical symptoms:

This is perhaps one of the reasons why in the anamnesis of hysteria we so often come across the two great pathogenic factors of being in love and sick-nursing. In the former, the subject's longing thoughts about his absent loved one create in him a ‘rapt’ state of mind, cause his real environment to

---

503 Ibid., 176–7.
505 Freud, "The Medusa’s Head", 273.
grow dim, and then bring his thinking to a standstill charged with affect. [...] Once this has happened, the hypnosis-like state is repeated again and again when the same circumstances arise; and the subject, instead of the normal two conditions of mind, has three: waking, sleeping and the hypnoid state. We find the same thing happening when deep artificial hypnosis has been frequently brought on. [...] We find them in a number of fully-developed hysterias, occurring with varying frequency and duration, and often alternating rapidly with normal waking states. On account of the dream-like nature of their content, they often deserve the name of ‘delirium hystericum’.506

The hypnoid state returns, owing, Breuer claims, to the reminiscence or memory of the cause of the hysteria: the traumatic event that caused the psychological wound. ‘When the attack makes its first appearance, it indicates a moment at which this hypnoid consciousness has obtained control of the subject's whole existence, it points, that is, to an acute hysteria; when it occurs on subsequent occasions and contains a memory, it points to a return of that moment.’507

Therefore, when Cherlin posits the concept of ‘uncanny time’, it is not only the temporal interruption that signifies the uncanny, but also the ‘double conscience’.508 Freud describes the repression of the unconscious thoughts and feelings by the conscience as ‘investing the old idea of a “double” [doppelgänger] with a new meaning’.509 In the case of hysteria the unconscious thoughts are what the patients believe would be unseemly reactions to the circumstances in which they find themselves. Their ego represses these reactions as it represses the urges of the id and superego, therefore creating the ‘split’ or ‘second consciousness’.509

Within Op. 16 there are three main occurrences of this “second state”: in the second piece, “Vergangenes”, the third, “Farben”, and the fourth, “Peripetie”. The second piece is characterised by what Simms terms ‘an unmistakable return to the earliest style of atonality’.510 With allusions to D minor in the first and last sections of this ternary piece the singing style topic which begins the piece takes on a dirge-like quality, highlighted by the drones in the first three bars, the low pitch of the melodies

507 Ibid., 15.
508 Ibid., 12.
and the overtly sparse texture—no more than five instruments at a time (Example 4.3). These signifiers also suggest a night-time pastoral topic; however, the legato style and melodic nature of the *Hauptstimme* lead to the conclusion that it is the singing style that is present here. The ambiguity between the presence of the pastoral and the singing style once again suggests that there is a character present within the forest, that the forest implies the psychological aspect of the narrative as much as, perhaps more, than the physical location. The singing style invokes the concept of a person—a song must be sung by someone—with the night pastoral signifying the forest.

*Example 4.3: Singing Style. Schoenberg, Fünf Orchesterstücke, No. 2, bb. 1–8.*

The developmental B section, from bar 151, introduces seemingly new material, a characteristic melody containing either a quadruplet or sextuplet (Example 4.4). Despite the new rhythmic groupings, the topical and intervallic content are familiar. The *Hauptstimme* (containing the quadruplet rhythms) are reminiscent of the slow lyrical lines from the first part of the A section, while the *Nebenstimme*, and interjecting cadenza passages in the flutes and clarinets (bars 156–7 and 165–9), resemble the short birdsong phrases of the second part. The intervallic content of the two themes, which has until now remained mostly within the confines of the major third, begins to develop to include fourths and fifths. Within the lyrical themes, however, this seems to be because the pitches have been displaced up or down an octave. If the pitch were to be replaced within the same pitch range as the rest of the melodic line the intervals would more closely resemble the original A section. By displacing these pitches climactic moments are created, tensions are created and released through the wide leaps in the melody, particularly the rising lines in the E♭ clarinet and first violin at bar 162 which, after reaching the apex of the melodic arch, relinquish the melody to lower instruments. The E♭ clarinet and violins give way to clarinets, oboe, cello and trumpet then to the bass clarinets, horns and bassoons. The first violins begin to climb again at bar 173, but interrupting their ascent.
suddenly at bar 175 is a celeste and flute ostinato. This displacement of familiarity adds to the feeling of the uncanny, the sense that the material that is being presented is simultaneously familiar and unfamiliar (Example 4.5).

The piece’s momentum, caused by the intervallic development, stops and is instead held in a dream-like stasis for ten bars. The use of the celeste adds to the dreamlike quality, associated as it is with the lullaby, as the overlapping, continuousness of the figure creates the sense of temporal suspension. These ten bars represent the hypnoid state, the period of time when the character is in a ‘hypnosis-like’ or dream-like state. Bars 182–184 are the only instance in the piece where more than five instruments are playing rhythmically in unison, this dissolving at bar 184 with triplets, quadruplets and sextuplets all competing as the first violin and viola perform a demisemiquaver cadenza.


As suddenly as it appeared the dream disappears at bar 185 as a fugue once more drives the piece’s momentum forward. The fugue now has another level of signification to it, that of the rational topic. The rational topic centres around the moralistic virtues displayed by the older generation of Viennese, the idea that emotions should be repressed in favour of morality and disciplined conformity. Classical forms, diatonic harmony, the learned style and the chorale style signify this topic, which is meaningful as the psychological trauma is seemingly “repressed” by its presence. This is similar to Freud’s theories on civilisation. In his “Civilisation and its Discontents”, Freud writes that the entry into civilisation comes at the cost of repressing human natural instincts, that to be accepted as part of society one must suppress all urges that do not conform. Once again, this links with the castration complex, as, according to Freud, one of the first instincts a boy must suppress is the desire to kill his father, whom he believes will castrate him as punishment for desiring his mother.

Set against this momentum, however, is another ostinato in the second clarinet and first bassoon. The earlier lyrical quadruplet motif is now set alongside a memento of that dream, the ostinato all that remains of the previous episode, a lingering reminder of the repressed trauma. The interrupted climax begins to build again, reaching its peak at bar 194 in not only the high pitch range and utilisation of
large intervals, but also the orchestration. For the first and only time within this piece all the instruments play simultaneously for four bars. However, the singing style that has pervaded the rest of the piece remains, signified by the Hauptstimme marking on the first violin part, the statement of the fugal subject at bar 190 leading the other instruments, nearly all of which are marked Nebenstimme and therefore seen as accompanying the violins. After the climax the fugue dissolves, but the ostinato remains, a reminder of the unconscious.

The A section returns at bar 205 with a solo statement of the main theme in the oboe over a horn drone, reconfirming the pastoral signifiers of the original A section. The second part of the A section then returns with stretto entries of the main lyrical theme, the quadruplet fugue subjects all appearing in the same order as they appeared earlier the piece. The “dream” ostinato in the celeste and flutes and a drone in the cor anglais provide a cohesive background over which each of these themes can be heard. The hysteric has returned to his normal life, but the traumatic event still hovers in the background.

The third piece is an extended dream sequence, a slow moving fugue in the outer parts with a faster moving, sensibility-style centre. With regards to the castration complex this is a significant image, symbolising the void in the centre of a female’s genitals, the space where the penis should be. The principal representation of the primal trauma is now placed at the centre of both the work and the musical representation of the uncanny. Burkhart demonstrates that this void is not only present in regards to the temporal stasis of the piece when compared to the surrounding pieces, but also within the piece itself. In his analysis of the fugue he shows that the first and eleventh chords are held for several bars; ‘thus’, he posits, ‘the statement of the canon is set off by absence of motion at its beginning and end’. The third piece, therefore, creates a void at the centre of the work (Example 4.6).

The pastoral topic is present here, as indicated by the title often given it: “Summer Morning by a Lake”. The overlapping rhythmic nature of the chord creates a constant movement, similar to the relentless movement of the “river” figure in Mahler’s “Antonius”. This piece, more than any other, provides the link between the Fünf Orchesterstücke and Erwartung.


The combined symbolism of feminine sexuality and the scene of the lake are synonymous with the events that precipitated Dora’s anguish, the inappropriate sexual proposal by Herr K, the husband of the woman who nursed her father while he was ill, and with whom he had an affair. In *Erwartung* it is Dora’s dreams which are interpreted in the music—the burning house and the woods—while here it is the original, real event which is figured. This suggests that the connection between *Erwartung* and the *Fünf Orchesterstücke* is less than coincidental, the five pieces representing an event that led to the case of hysteria, diagnosed through the succeeding monodrama.

The fourth piece demonstrates the acceleration of the changes between the normal/conscious, and hypnoid/unconscious, states of the hysteric through sudden changes in instrumentation and an alternation between the *tempesta*-inflected fanfare topic and the *Lied* style. “Peripetie” begins with the inflected fanfares, the dynamics and style of attack a marked contrast to the strictly controlled second piece. This piece uses the instrumentation in blocks of colour to create demarcated characteristics by which the fanfares are presented. The woodwind use wide interval leaps with a traditional triplet form, the trumpets and trombones play a semiquaver chromatic wedge figure and the trumpets and upper strings a demisemiquaver repeated chord, echoed at a slower pace by the upper woodwind. It is the horn triplet ostinato-style fanfare at bar 267 which is marked as the
hauptstimme, however, suggesting that this fanfare topic signifies the nobility and
chivalry associated with the hunt call as much as the call to war, which is signified
by its association with the military and tempesta topics. The association with the
hunt topic here links the fanfare section with the calmer, but still dark pastoral style,
signified by the horn drone and the chromatic bassoon accompaniment to the
clarinet melody beginning at bar 271. It also once again highlights the desire to
conform to the morals of the civilised world. Given the limited use of the
hauptstimme in this piece—emphasising only one instrument at a time, rather than
several as in the previous pieces—and the soloistic treatment of the themes in the
calmer periods, this piece appears to be in the Lied style. This gives the piece a
personal atmosphere, a feeling of internalisation in which the calmer solo parts
seem to represent a solo voice, one person, whose emotional control slips and
returns to create the rondo form of the piece. With each return of the stormy fanfare
ostinatos the person seems to have less control.

As detailed above, the first section, from bar 265–270, splits into clearly
separated blocks of colour. The third section mirrors the first section initially, with
bars 283–299 beginning with three blocks, the woodwinds and strings forming one
block, the brass forming the other. However, the blocks quickly disintegrate, with the
texture thickening as the instrumental sections are independent of each other, while
continuing to work cohesively within themselves. The best example of this comes
between bars 292–298 where the three different types of fanfare play
simultaneously, their frequency increasing to a climax at bar 299.

The Lied style tries to return at bar 299 but the dynamic attacks and the
continuation of the fanfare topic suggest that the control has slipped completely as,
despite the sudden change in orchestration, the calmness does not return. From bar
312 instruments enter canonically, causing the orchestration to thicken gradually.
However, despite the stabilising structural implications of the canon, the lack of a
uniform time between entries—some have 1 beat, others 2–3—denies the
stabilising effect until even the introduction of ostinato figures at bar 323 fails to
steady the anxiety that is being projected, as eventually four different ostinatos are
running concurrently.

4.1.f. The Anxiety of Alienation, or Entry into Civilisation
Simms posits that the final piece, “Das obligate Rezitativ”, is a waltz, Street
identifies it as the earlier Ländler, but if either of these interpretations is correct (and
there are certainly signifiers present which would indicate they are) then the triple
time dance has been distorted beyond any point of clear-cut recognition.\textsuperscript{512} Certainly just from listening to the piece it is hard to pick out the waltz time or the entries on the second beat which could signify this topic: the strong beats on which the dance is traditionally built are obscured by the two-bar hypermeter of the small motivic line. This piece uses the sensibility topic, evoking emotional tensions and releases using dynamics and rising and falling lines. The appoggiatura, which is the mark of this topic, is obviously moot in such an atonal piece. However, the constant tension and release that is the mark of the suspension is created with dynamics, particularly quick crescendo and decrescendo; rhythm, using dotted rhythms; and rests, so that the instruments come in on the off-beat and sigh motifs; coupled with wide leaps up to provide emphasis on the higher note. The association of the sensibility topic with the middle-class chamber style suggests that it is the waltz, the more civilised of the two dances, which is presented; however, there is no certainty, which in itself is significant.

The waltz signifies Viennese society, as seen in Strauss's \textit{Die Fledermaus}; the \textit{Ländler} signifies the peasant dance, the rustic version of the triple dance, before it became civilised. The dissolution of the dance’s rhythmic and harmonic signifiers therefore symbolise the character’s psychological state in two ways. First, the liquidation of the dance’s strong beat, the loss of a steady and secure base rhythm symbolises the loss of the character’s conscious ability to order and control his thoughts/unconsciousness. Second, it represents the uncanny in the same way the rational topic did in the second piece. The transformation of the uncivilised \textit{Ländler} to the civilised waltz symbolises the man’s entry into civilisation. The obligation in the title could then refer to the obligation of conforming to societal rules, the repression of basic human instincts. The dissolution of the dance’s signifiers, combined with the interaction of the two dances with the sensibility topic, represents the character’s total loss of control; the affected normalcy needed to ingratiate oneself into society has dissolved, leaving him alienated. This could symbolise the loss of the character’s sense of belonging to his chosen society, that of the Viennese musical circle. The waltz and the \textit{Ländler} here also form a relationship akin to a double. The waltz represses the \textit{Ländler}, but the similarity of the signifiers for each dance mean that they are simultaneously present.

\textsuperscript{512} Street, “Narrative and Schoenberg’s \textit{Five Orchestral Pieces, Op. 16},” 176.
As detailed above, Schoenberg felt he was becoming isolated from the modern composers he admired because of his new methods. He looked for support from Richard Strauss, who then remarked to Alma Mahler, ‘[i]t would be better for him to shovel snow than to scrawl on music paper’. The inflection of the waltz by the sensibility topic supports both these levels of signification. The sensibility topic denotes a personal emotional impression, supporting the interpretation that the character is in isolation, an interpretation also supported by the title “Das Obligate Rezitativ”. A recitative is a solo vocal line with continuo accompaniment that traditionally connected the arias of an opera or oratorio, pushing on the dramatic action. In the eighteenth century the recitative was often accompanied by the orchestra and became more elaborate. This device was used to illustrate ‘moments of intense dramatic crisis (disasters, irreconcilable decisions, general stress), mental confusion (particularly madness), magic scenes and other suitable moments’. It therefore seems appropriate that Schoenberg chose this title for this piece, in which ‘mental confusion’, or hysteria, has completely taken over the character. He has not, however, used that term precisely; rather, he has called it “The Obligatory Recitative”. In melodic terms, the obbligato is a musical line that is in some way indispensable, but it can also indicate an obligation to something, a self-imposed duty. In this case, this refers once again to Schoenberg’s sentiment that his ‘destiny’ has forced him towards his compositional style.

4.1.g. Conclusion

The traditional *ombra* topic relies to a certain extent on tonality, specifically the subversion of harmonic expectation. With the advent of the emancipation of dissonance came a change in signifiers, and subsequently a transformation in the signified itself. Where the eighteenth-century *ombra* topic represented fear of the supernatural, the move towards a more private signification in the nineteenth century led to the topic signifying an internal expression of anxiety. This personalisation of fear parallels the concept of the sublime, which Kant describes as a duality of perception between the attractive and the repugnant. The intimate sensation of anxiety, however, also denotes the psychoanalytic theories of Freud, in particular the uncanny.

---

Alexander Carpenter, who suggested that this work is a representation of Schoenberg’s neurosis owing to his wife’s affair, grouped the *Fünf Orchesterstücke* under the heading of the psychoanalytic. Others, such as Friedheim and Street, suggest it was a reaction to his alienation from contemporary composers owing to his new compositional method. The scholars agree, however, that there is a strong link between the work and Freud’s theories of hysteria, dreams and the uncanny.

A topical narrative of the *Fünf Orchesterstücke* has revealed a correlation with the castration complex, signified by the representation of the forest, and the link between this and the plot of distressed lovers—suggesting that Carpenter’s theory that the work denotes Schoenberg’s marital problems is possible. The use of ostinatos and repeated figures, Cherlin’s “time-shards”, symbolise hypnoid states and introduces the concept of the double or second consciousness. The opposition of these states with the rational topic suggests a parallel conflict, that of man’s struggle to repress his natural instincts in order to enter into civilisation, a narrative demonstrated particularly in the fifth piece. In this finale, civilisation is represented by the waltz, the dissolution of which is combined with the sensibility topic to represent the anxiety of the character as he is alienated from society by his obligation to his composition methods—his ‘forced destiny’.

The duality presented throughout this work is, therefore, not only within the concepts of the split consciousness, or the doppelgänger, but also in the anxiety presented by the dramatic action of the narrative. Both readings—that it represents Schoenberg’s marital problems or his lack of musical acceptance—are apparent within this work, neither subsuming nor overbearing the other. What is clear, however, is that with the release of the tonal structure and the internalisation of fear and anxiety it is the uncanny topic that is now figured within this work. In the following case study the uncanny is not presented as definitively as in Schoenberg, but rather exists in the subtext of the plot, and in the relationship between the libretto and the musical narrative.

### 4.2. Lehár’s *Die lustige Witwe*

#### 4.2.a. Introduction

*Die lustige Witwe*, written in 1905 with music composed by Franz Lehár, was an extremely popular and commercially successful operetta. Its plot follows the rich Pontevedrian widow Hanna, her old flame Danilo, the Baron’s wife Valencienne and her seducer Camille. With a libretto by Viktor Léon and Leo Stein, the operetta is a
musical adaptation of Der Gesandtschafts-Attaché by Henri Meilhac and Alexander Bergen.

The son of a military bandmaster, Lehár travelled the Austro-Hungarian Empire as a child, collecting musical characteristics and folk songs from each place. At twelve, he studied composition under Dvořák, among others, at the Bohemian Conservatory of Music in Prague. As such, his music utilises the same nationalistic narrative types encountered in the previous chapter from Mahler and Zemlinsky. His musical narratives often place smaller Other nationalities in the position of underdog to Austria, or more specifically Vienna, but none of Lehár’s operettas demonstrate this more aptly than the plot of Die lustige Witwe.

Set in the Pontevedrian embassy in Paris, Baron Zeta holds a ball at which Hanna Glawari, a rich widow, is a guest. Hanna's husband died and left her millions, so Baron Zeta wishes to ensure she marries another Pontevedrian to keep the money in the country and thereby save the small country from bankruptcy. Baron Zeta has in mind Count Danilo, his aide, who prefers spending time at his favourite club, Maxim's, being entertained by the can-can dancers, the Grissettes. Once Danilo arrives it is revealed that Danilo and Hanna were lovers before her marriage but Danilo's uncle refused to let them marry as Hanna had nothing to her name. They are still in love but Hanna refuses to marry him until he says "I love you"; he refuses to admit his love as he does not want it to seem like he is after her money.

Meanwhile, Baron Zeta's wife Valencienne has been flirting with Camille, who proclaims his love by writing it on her fan. Valencienne assures him she is a respectable wife. They lose the fan, which finds its way to Baron Zeta, although he is unaware who owns it. To remove him from temptation, Valencienne volunteers Camille as Hanna’s partner in the “Ladies' Choice” dance. All the men hover around Hanna, hoping to be her partner and have a chance of marrying her for her money, but Hanna wants the only man who does not seem interested: Danilo. He claims the dance but instead tries to auction it off for ten thousand francs. Having eliminated the interest of the last few suitors Danilo attempts to dance with Hanna, which she now refuses, so he dances alone.

Act Two is set in Hanna’s garden. The hostess entertains her guests by singing an old Pontevedrian song, “Vilja”. Baron Zeta tries to identify the owner of the fan, ordering Danilo to carry out the investigation. Zeta arranges a meeting with Danilo and Njegus, an embassy secretary, in the garden pavilion to discuss the fan, which Danilo accidentally leaves in the garden. Valencienne and Camille find it as
they meet and Valencienne further resists Camille’s advances by writing "I am a respectable wife" on the fan in response to his declaration of love. Camille persuades Valencienne to go to the pavilion with him, so they can say goodbye. When Zeta appears for the conference, Njegus—having seen the lovers enter the summerhouse—rescues Valencienne through the back door. Zeta thinks he saw his wife in there; meanwhile, Hanna has taken her place. Emerging, she announces she will marry Camille, leaving Baron Zeta worried at losing the money to a Parisian, Valencienne distraught at losing Camille and Danilo furiously jealous. Danilo tells the story of a Princess who cheated on her Prince and then storms off to Maxim’s. Hanna realises that he loves her and rejoices.

Act Three takes place in Hanna’s ballroom, which she has decorated like Maxim’s, complete with the Grissettes. When Danilo arrives, having found the real Maxim’s empty, he demands that Hanna give up her engagement for the good of Pontevedra, and is delighted when Hanna tells him she is not really engaged to Camille. Danilo still will not declare his love for her because of her money. Baron Zeta suddenly remembers that the fan is Valencienne’s and swears he will divorce her and marry Hanna himself, but Hanna tells him she loses the money if she remarries. Danilo is jubilant at this news and immediately declares his love and asks Hanna to marry him, at which point Hanna tells him she will lose her money only because it will become her husband’s. Valencienne proves her fidelity by showing her husband her response to Camille’s declaration and all ends well.

4.2.b. Verismo as Inner Consciousness

The topical narrative reveals the difference between this operetta and Strauss's Die Fledermaus, in that rather than the narrative revealing a satirical subtext, such as the high-/low-class division, here it follows almost exactly what is expressed in the text. The opposition seen so much through Strauss and Mahler's music, between stability and instability, between dances/marches and the tempesta/sensibility topics, is here, it seems, replaced by what is revealed to be simply a love story. That is not to imply that either the plot or the accompanying music are simplistic, but rather that they reflect Richard Traubner’s suggestion that ‘Lehár opted not for the galloping foolery of Offenbach and his Parisian and Viennese followers but for the heady romanticism of verismo composers like Puccini. [...] [He] was ultimately responsible more than any other composer for changing the course of Viennese
operetta from its original dependence on satire and fantasy to romantic sensibility.515

The term “verismo” describes realism in opera. A style developed in the 1870s in Italy, it includes compositions such as Pietro Mascagni’s *Cavalleria Rusticana* (1889). Its stories typically followed people of the lower classes, moving away from the mythological or royal subjects of previous operas, and often using gritty storylines with unhappy endings. In this sense, *Die lustige Witwe* is not typically veristic; although its characters are not royal, they are from within the upper echelons of their respective governments, and there is no real unpleasantness in the plot. What Traubner refers to, therefore, is the lack of contradiction between the music and the libretto. Lehár has used the music to echo the text, validating the characters’ emotions and actions, and enhancing the audience’s understanding of the drama, rather than adding other levels to it; Matteo Sansone describes this as the ‘total consistency of form and content’, that is, the topics present within this operetta are closely linked with the dramatic action.516 Where in *Die Fledermaus* a song about how a wife would miss her husband while he was in jail is accompanied by an upbeat *schnell-polka*, here the romance topic accompanies a love song, a cavalry march illustrates a ‘silly cavalier’ and a mazurka emphasises the Balkan nationality of the main characters.

Thus, it is the music rather than the libretto that demonstrates the verismo qualities of this operetta. Both Bernard Grun, in his biography of Lehár, and Richard Traubner, in his history of operettas, note that instead of the libretto describing a specific reality, it is instead a reflection of its period:

Because toasts here dissolved in chansons, and mass demonstrations in vocal ensembles. Because castles turned into little arbors, the head of state suddenly appeared as “silly, silly, cavalier”, and the suffragette as siren of the ball. Because concern with scientific and technical problems made way for the study of women, women, women; the Pomp and Circumstance march for the waltz of silent lips and whispering violins.

515 Traubner. *Operetta*, 244.
Because, in fact, all melancholy and solemnity turned triumphantly into sparkling exuberance.\textsuperscript{517}

\textbf{4.2.c. Freudian National Friction}

In addition to the ‘intoxicating glamour’ of \textit{fin-de-siècle} Vienna, the dramatic plot set out by the musical and textual narrative reflects the contemporary political issues inherent in the dissolving empire, for example, the friction between Austria and the Other countries, and the economic downturn.\textsuperscript{518} Pontevedro is commonly thought of as a thinly veiled reference to the Balkan state of Montenegro, for various reasons including the use of the names Baron Zeta, whose surname is the name of a river in Montenegro, and an old name for the South of Montenegro; and Danilo, who takes his name from a Montenegrin Prince.\textsuperscript{519} Moreover, the original Danilo costume was the full regalia of the Crown Prince of Montenegro.\textsuperscript{520} However, other nationalities are also present, creating ambivalence within the Pontevedran identity. The topical language, that is the topics that are actually titled in the score (polonaise, mazurka etc.), are associated with Poland, Czechoslovakia, Russia and Hungary. The placement of the mostly Polish topics and the Eastern inflections suggest Pontevedro is both Poland and Montenegro; it is also similar to the word which results when you fuse the two names. The consequent duality of the national identity here introduces Freud’s concept of the split personality, in which there is a second state of consciousness, a “double” consciousness. Claire Rosenfield suggests the double could be ‘a juxtaposition of two characters; the one representing the socially acceptable or conventional personality, the other externalising the free, uninhibited self’.\textsuperscript{521} Here, rather than there being two characters, there are two distinct representations of character.

The Parisian (Western) characters portrayed in this narrative are morally underhanded: two are suitors after the widow’s money, while another attempts to seduce a married woman. This view of the Parisians is demonstrated by a topical

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{518} Traubner, \textit{Operetta}, 249.
\textsuperscript{520} Grun, \textit{Gold and Silver}, 116.
\end{flushright}
field containing marches, polkas and the *romanze*, while the Pontevedrian's topical field, including national topics, is shown as morally upstanding. The waltz, Vienna's national dance, is also set against this dialogue as the signifier for real (ethical) love.

### 4.2.d. A Topical Love Story

The plot follows the course of two love stories, the first of which is introduced almost immediately as the Parisian Camille attempts to seduce the Baron's wife Valencienne. She refuses him, stating that "Ich bin eine anständige Frau" (I am a respectable wife), although it is clear that if she were single she would not refuse Camille's love. The song itself is a contredanse, the Western dance topic forcing the serious subject of adultery into a light-hearted frame, while also confirming the high social status of the characters. The eastern topic is alluded to briefly as Valencienne realises the consequences of the proposal. An A♭ in the score gives the triplets a minor flavour to the words "Ich kann nur verlieren, / und Sie nichts gewinnen". (I can only lose, / and you win nothing). This links the national topic with ethics and morality and Western topics with unscrupulous behaviour from the beginning of the operetta.

*Example 4.7: Lehár, Die lustige Witwe, No. 2, bb. 48–50.*

The second love story of the plot emerges as Hanna enters, followed by two suitors who are complimenting and flattering her. The rich widow knows their motives, "Die Herr'n sind liebenswürdig sehr / Gilt das meiner Person? / Ich fürchte dies gilt mehr / meiner vielfachen Million!" (You gentlemen are very kind, / is that due to my person? / I fear it is due more / to my multiple millions!) and over a mazurka paints herself as a naive Pontevedrian. However, as she states plainly that "Erst wenn wir armen Witwen reich sind, / Ja, dann haben wir doppelten Wert!" (when poor widows are rich, / we have double the value) it is the waltz instead that emerges. The difference between the two dances is minimal; both are in triple time and moderate in speed,
although the mazurka always has an ornamented or quaver rhythm on its first beat. The similarities between the mazurka and the waltz suggest they are the same dance, the distinction caused by the use of a variance in the dialect rather than a different language, causing the topics to fold into one another, signifying two different aspects of the same concept. The mazurka signifies morality while the waltz signifies ethical real love. The mazurka accompanies the innocent straightforward nature of the small nation, Pontevedro, both through the naivety Hanna initially portrays and her description of how men in her homeland do not court women with compliments: they do not 'play the hypocrite'. The waltz accompanies Hanna's frank account of the intentions of the Parisian suitors, suggesting that this topic is here linked with this dishonourable intent, seemingly confirmed by the interjections of the suitor's unconvincing protestations. The use of the waltz topic in this way is similar to its utilisation in *Die Fledermaus*, where the waltz appeared at every misdirection, intrigue or categorical lie and therefore satirically correlated Vienna's national dance with immorality. In *Die lustige Witwe*, however, it is not the actual immoral act that is being accompanied, but rather the uncovering, or laying out of that act.

The next song introduces Hanna's old flame Danilo, who extols the virtues of Maxim's. The song illustrates the story of the lackadaisical ambassador who pines for his fatherland, employing can-can rhythms but setting them at a much slower pace. The absence of the bolder instruments that often play this dance (the brass and percussion are replaced by clarinets and flutes) and the slower tempo sung in a rubato manner gives the usually lively dance a yearning quality which matches Danilo's mood, while still signifying the spirited club in which he finds his refuge. The alterations of the topical signifiers of the can-can show the dual nature of Danilo's personality. He enters the club after painting himself as an apathetic lecherous man. However, it is soon revealed that he is the most moral man in the whole cast. He loves Hanna but refuses to marry her to avoid being seen as a gold digger. The can-can's association with scandal and sex (and Paris) represents what he shows to the world after being denied his true love when young. The retraction of the signifiers that make the can-can a dance reveals that Danilo's personality is the opposite of that which he shows on the surface.

In the Act One finale the ladies' choice dance begins and the Parisian suitors crowd around the rich widow, hoping to be picked. They campaign for the dance, echoed by an accompanying march, but Hanna awards it to the only man not interested, Danilo. The topic then changes to a polka as he accepts, but then
auctions the dance for ten thousand francs to go to charity. The polka, a Western dance (in the sense that by 1905 it had been accepted as an Austrian dance), accompanies Danilo’s auction, where the emphasis is on the unethical side of marriage, i.e. marriage for money rather than love. This is not to say that Danilo himself is unethical, but rather that he is now revealing the Parisians’ unprincipled interest in Hanna’s money rather than her love. This proves too much for the campaigners who, while interested in Hanna’s money, are not inclined to spend their own. The finale finishes with a waltz. Once Danilo has seen off the opposition he tries to persuade Hanna to dance with him. Greed has been defeated, and the right two people are left, a situation which retrospectively confirms the waltz topic in Hanna’s earlier song “Bitte, meine Herren” and also echoes the finale to Act Three, the famous waltz “Lippen Schweigen”. The waltz is therefore coded in both acts as the topic for ethical, morally upstanding love as opposed to the underhanded covetous materialism shown by the suitors, and both Danilo and Hanna are now also associated with morality.

As Act Two begins Hanna is throwing a party at her house and entertains her guests with the song “Vilja”. This mythological love song is a polonaise, a slow Polish dance in triple time; it gives way to a csárdás that is inflected with the Gypsy scale to add Eastern inflections. The folksong entertainment continues as Danilo joins in a song about a couple taking a romantic carriage ride, a veiled attempt by Hanna to reveal her feelings to Danilo, suggesting he is the ‘silly cavalier’ who doesn’t realise the maiden wants him. A prancing horse signifies the cavalier while the ornamented fifth drone in the bass and drums and the folk language (’hoplahot und hoplahot’) signify the national topic, specifically an Eastern march.

As Valencienne and Camille steal away to the pavilion to say goodbye, the men, including Baron Zeta and Danilo, begin to sing about how to handle women. This song, which also acts as the last song of the operetta, cements the association between the Western topics and a chauvinistic attitude towards women, the flippant text accompanied by alternating march and polka topics.

Valencienne has decided to end the relationship by giving Camille back the fan with “I am a respectable wife” written on it, and he charms her into kissing him goodbye in the pavilion. Camille tries his seduction once more with his song “Wie eine Rosenknospe”, the cloying sweetness of which is emphasised by the romance topic’s octave doubling in the strings, pizzicato bass and pastoral inflections in the flute, harp and strings. While Camille sings Baron Zeta spies them through the
keyhole, but the ensuing swap (Hanna takes Valencienne's place) causes consternation to all the men there. It therefore begins with the \textit{tempesta} topic, indicated by the rapid string semiquavers. This topic lasts momentarily and is the only instance in the operetta of such a turbulently emotional topic. It is a significant moment of emotional turbulence as it heralds the change from verismo style representation to the depiction of an inner consciousness, and brings to the fore the use of the double within the story. Once Hanna takes Valencienne's place Camille sings the same love song to her to prove he was with her. The song is sung as an exact replica, suggesting that Valencienne and Hanna are identical, that the couples could be switched easily. The Act Two finale is concerned with misrepresentation of intent. Hanna replaces Valencienne, and then lies about her engagement to make Danilo jealous, a lie that has consequences for all the characters. The \textit{tempesta} topic gives way to a polka after only six bars as exclamations of disbelief turn into demands for an explanation; the Western topic confirms the fraudulent actions of Hanna.

Danilo's jealousy causes him to give the advice "Verlieb' Dich oft, verlob' Dich selten, / Heirate nie!" (Fall in love often, get engaged seldom, / marry never!). Another follows this opinion: that in marriage the man is superseded by the woman, until there is no trace of him left. Over a mazurka, and speaking as a diplomat, he explains that marriage should be a pact for two, but soon a pact for three will supervene. Danilo claims this is due to the woman's 'open door policy'. This refers to the 1899 policy granting multiple Imperial powers access to China, but none full control. In Danilo's statement, China is analogous with marriage, which should be between a man and a woman, but is soon interfered with by the woman's friends, children or affairs. When he mentions this open door policy, and that it is the woman's fault, it is to the tune of "Da geh' ich zu Maxim" but not the can-can topic that originally accompanied this melody. Instead, the romance topic is present, signified by the rising arpeggio movement in the bass and the strings doubling the voice. The topic belies Danilo's words, illuminating how he really feels about marriage, and marriage to Hanna in particular as it is to her his words are directed. He regards the club Maxim as a homely place, somewhere he is comfortable and able to relax. The connection made here by the combination of the can-can melody and the romance topic, transfers his affections from the club to his idea of marriage to Hanna.

Over a cavalry march, Hanna tries to make light of marriage, joking that it will be "[g]anz nach Pariser Art!" (entirely in the Parisian style). Valencienne joins
her in the chorus accompanied by a marching band, the two march topics then alternate until Danilo stops the artificial forced happiness. The two marches represent the artificiality of this song, symbolising both the negative connotations now associated with Paris, and a reminder that Hanna is deliberately misleading the other characters. The reason for Hanna's announcement of her engagement to Camille is purely to force Danilo to declare his feelings for her, just as "dummer, dummer Reitersmann" was sung as a hint to Danilo of her acceptance of him. The cavalry march therefore serves as a reminder of the earlier song. The marching band topic symbolises an aspect of celebration, reminiscent of crowds, parades and overdone decorations, all the "Rass" and "Spaß" ("pizzazz" and "fun") Hanna foresees in her Parisian marriage. The final song of the act is a story Danilo tells of a prince and princess, in which the princess tries to make the prince jealous in the same manner as Hanna has just tried. Even in this song Danilo's inner consciousness is demonstrated by the topical choice, in this case the romance topic, as it expresses what Danilo feels for Hanna and the reason why he leaves at this point to go to Maxim's. This is the point at which the topical narrative begins to revert to its verismo origins, as, with his story, Danilo has revealed to Hanna that he is still in love with her.

The setting for Act Three is Hanna's villa, which she has decorated as Maxim's for Danilo, complete with the Grisettes joined by Valencienne. They dance and sing, the topic alternating between a steady march and a Parisian galop. The position of this song at the beginning of the third act definitively joins the text and narrative back together, in essence bringing the topical narrative back to the conscious level. The combination of the morally corrupt Valencienne, the Grisettes—who epitomise the superficial relationship between men and women—and the Parisian dance solidifies the symbolisation of Paris as immoral.

**4.2.e. Conclusion**

There is an ironic aspect to the use of verismo in an operetta, made more so by the fictional, yet no doubt recognisable, nation in which it is set. While there are operas with serious natures, showing the dark realism of modern life, operetta is meant to be, Richard Traubner exclaims, full of ‘[g]aiety and lightheartedness, sentiment and
Glamorous satire is undoubtedly present in this operetta, coupled with the verismo aspect of the topical narrative. What this characteristic achieves, however, is to introduce the concept of the double. There are two sides to the operetta—its fictional libretto and setting, and the realism caused by the consistency between the topical and textual plots. Within this larger dual structure the two parts also connote the double. The nation of Pontevedro is formed by fusing Poland and Montenegro, giving it a split personality. The music is not flavoured with non-Western signifiers; instead, definitive established topics refer to a specific country. However, by representing the country in this manner, the composer takes advantage of the real-life social and cultural climate of the time to heighten the emotions of the audience. They are not only supporting a faceless underdog but recognise it as the repressed Other of their own country.

The realism inherent within the relationship between the topical narrative and the plot also illuminates a split or inner consciousness. The topics reveal the real desires and emotions of the characters, which in the first and third acts are consistent with the libretto. In the second act the topics continue to show the underlying desires of the characters—their inner consciousness—while on the surface they are lying to each other.

It is at this point in the story that the double concept makes its most obvious appearance in the swap of the couples. The link between Valencienne and Camille, and Hanna and Danilo, is highlighted by the trajectory the two romances take. Valencienne and Camille have the traditional romance, within the established theatrical language: the feigned resistance and exaggerated seduction sealed with an espied final kiss. Hanna and Danilo, however, do not have a romance, or seduction, until Valencienne and Camille finish theirs, represented by the switch in the pavilion. Combined, the two add up to one whole romance, suggesting that the two couples were also part of the representation of the split personality within this work.

Most significant are the oppositions throughout the operetta—Pontevedra/Paris, ethical/immoral, the respectable woman/the adulterous man, ballroom/Maxim’s—but representing all of these oppositions are the relationship between the waltz and the mazurka, and the waltz and the march or polka. The mazurka represents not only the East, but a pragmatic naivety, particularly with

---

522 Traubner, Operetta, viii.
regards to romance, as seen in Hanna’s description of Pontevedrian men, and the wish of Baron Zeta that she marries a Pontevedrian for the fiscal good of the country. The march and polka represent the immoral gold diggers and adulterers of Western civilisation. The waltz is always set in opposition to one of these dances, acting as the point of repression or as a pivot between the immoral West and the naive East. It represents real, ethical love, exemplified most clearly in Danilo’s actions. As a self-styled immoral man he frequents Maxim’s, signified by the French can-can. The polka plays while he auctions Hanna’s dance, but a waltz accompanies their dance and signifies the recognition of their feelings. Danilo’s story of the prince and princess, in a way similar to Freud’s dreams, uses an unrelated story to infer meaning to signify his own repressed emotions, and is accompanied by a romantic waltz. Finally, the happy-ending is also, without need of explanation, a waltz. As such, the waltz acts as the only true representation of love, in opposition to the falsity of marrying for money or practicality. This is in contrast to the way in which the waltz signified deceptiveness in the previous chapter, but similar to its signification in Schoenberg’s Op. 16 above. Its signification of ethical behaviour is consistent with Schoenberg’s view of the superiority of Viennese civilisation, a theme continued in the next case study.

4.3. Schoenberg’s Pelleas und Melisande: Hidden Agendas in the Sonata Form

4.3.a. Introduction
The question of form in Pelleas und Melisande is a vexed one, and has been so since Alban Berg’s 1920 Kurze Thematische Analyse. Berg's attempt to map the form as a symphony with four movements can be seen in his introductory passage:

Never is it purely descriptive; the symphonic form is always perceived as absolute music. Indeed, in the four main parts [Hauptteile] of this symphonic poem the four movements of a symphony are also clearly manifest: namely, a big opening movement in sonata form; a second movement consisting of three shorter episodes and thus in three sections (in one of its scenes, at least, this movement displays a scherzo-like
character); a long-drawn-out Adagio; and, lastly, a finale constructed as a recapitulation.\textsuperscript{523}

Derrick Puffett claims that this was hardly a surprising stance for Berg to hold as

\[\ldots\] sonata form was, for German composers and theorists in the second half of the nineteenth century, not just one form among many but the highest form, the principal form (Hauptform). \[\ldots\] Berg's interpretation of Pelleas, then, had a clear historicist agenda: it was meant to reaffirm the traditionalism at the heart of the Second Viennese School's view of itself—a view which, first devised as defence mechanism, quickly became dogma, then critical commonplace.\textsuperscript{524}

Puffett goes on to explain that 'such an idea, which seeks to turn a piece of fin-de-siècle programme music into something "pure" and "abstract" (and thus more fitting for late twentieth-century consumption), is profoundly subversive aesthetically'.\textsuperscript{525}

Haimo goes further regarding Pelleas's programmatic implications, stating that 'Everything about [Berg's abstract symphonic design] is wrong'.\textsuperscript{526} Berg, Haimo insinuates, had a 'hidden agenda', to distance the piece from the programmatic element that by 1920 had become criticised by Hanslick and his supporters as 'inferior to abstract music'.\textsuperscript{527} What if Haimo's intuition that there is a hidden agenda is right, but that agenda is not what he thinks? This hidden agenda is possibly the key to our understanding of this work, but Berg's agenda was not just to distance the work from its programme as Haimo suggests; rather it was an attempt to present Schoenberg's treatment of the two aspects of the work: form and programme.

What follows describes the interaction between these two aspects, focussing in particular upon the way in which this interaction simultaneously appears to "refuse" sonata form, in a manner seemingly analogous to Freudian repression, while also "staging" the sonata cycle through the deployment of a topical narrative. This description is intimately informed by conceptions of multivalence, as theorised

\textsuperscript{524} Ibid., 224.
\textsuperscript{525} Ibid., 217.
\textsuperscript{526} Haimo, Schoenberg’s Transformation of Musical Language, 94–95.
\textsuperscript{527} Steven Vande Moortele. Two Dimensional Sonata Form: Form and Cycle in Single-Movement Instrumental Works by Liszt, Strauss, Schoenberg, and Zemlinsky (Belgium: Leuven University Press, 2009), 105.
in musical terms by James Webster but, perhaps more importantly here, in more general semiotic terms by Roland Barthes. For Webster, in his analysis of the music of Haydn and Mozart, a multivalent approach suggests that a musical work ought to be ‘understood as encompassing numerous different ‘domains’: tonality, musical ideas, rhythm, dynamics, instrumentation, register, rhetoric, ‘narrative’ design, and so forth’.528 Where Webster has ‘domains’, in S/Z, Barthes posits analogous ‘codes’: proairetic, hermeneutic, cultural, semic and symbolic, a terminology that Louise Rosenblatt charges as idiosyncratic.529 Yet the intent bears comparison to Webster’s approach. Barthes’ process shows that the particular code of reading impinges vitally upon the meaning any reader infers from a text; though his codes are, more or less, arbitrary, they aim at representing particular tropes of critical reading, such that ‘the five codes create a kind of network, a topos through which the text passes (or rather, in passing, becomes a text).’530 Each ‘pass’ through a text, a musical text too as Webster demands, reveals different meanings, different ‘depths’ and ‘secrets’. Describing the symbolic, Lavers suggests that ‘the logic of symbol is multivalence and reversibility, the logic of dreams and fantasies’, which is to say that once signs become symbols they are dreamlike and amenable to a multiplicity of readings.531 It is just such a multivalent reading which is at stake here. The ‘domains’ investigated here are theme and topic. However, rather than analysing each domain separately, as in Webster’s and Barthes’ approaches, here it is precisely the way in which domains (or, as the case may be, ‘codes’) interact that provides the meaning and, consequently, the structure of the work. The multivalent aspect of the analysis therefore refers to the different levels of signification within the topics, such as traditional signification, in the portrayal of location and representation of the psychological state of the character or situation present within the programme. This interaction consequently highlights the Freudian themes of the “unconscious” and the “uncanny” which, in turn, begins to answer the questions about the form of this work posed by Berg et al.

528 James Webster, Musical Forms, Form and Formenlehre (Belgium: Leuven University Press, 2010), 128.
529 Louise M. Rosenblatt, The Reader, the Text, the Poem: The Transactional Theory of the Literary work (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University, 1978), 170.
531 Ibid.
4.3.b. Multivalence as Hidden Agenda

At no point does Berg suggest that this is a “pure” abstract work. He does not assert that it is *not* descriptive, but rather that it is ‘never purely descriptive’. He is suggesting that the abstract symphonic form co-exists with the programmatic content of the work, creating two levels of signification which are not always clear when analysed solely formally or thematically. Carl Dahlhaus’s notion of ‘four separate conceptions of form interacting with each other’ begins to explain this multi-level signification as he states that:

In the first place the work can be understood as a succession of musical scenes. It is not difficult to recognise the outlines of Maurice Maeterlinck’s lyric drama in the symphonic poem [...] the themes which form the basis of the symphonic development are reminiscent of leitmotifs in music drama [...] [F]rom the combined effect of the personal and scenic motifs [...] grows a musical form which resembles a narrative.

Thirdly, the form of the work can be explained as a result of the four movements of the symphonic cycle being compressed into a single span [...] As Alban Berg recognised, the scene by the well is [sic] a scherzo, the farewell between Pelleas and Melisande an Adagio; the recapitulation of the themes functions as a finale. Fourthly, there are the outlines of a sonata form which embraces the entire work. The idea of ‘projecting’ the four movements of a sonata onto the outlines of a sonata allegro (with exposition of principal and subordinate themes, elaboration and recapitulation) had already been put into effect by Liszt in his B minor Sonata; and it was taken up by Schoenberg in his First Chamber Symphony, Op. 9, as well as in *Pelleas und Melisande*. This fourfold planning [...] implies aesthetically that the musical form, by virtue of its complexity, is able to accommodate the literary subject without abandoning its own autonomy.

The implication within Dalhaus’s conceptions, however, is that only the leitmotifs form the narrative and the sonata form is in opposition to this, whereas in actuality, as I will argue in further detail below, the sonata form can also be seen as a

---

532 Puffett, “‘Music that Echoes within One’ for a Lifetime”, 250.
narrative type. Specifically, the sonata principle shares certain potent structural kinships with Aristotelian drama, following the same dramatic construct of “introduction” (what Aristotle calls protasis), “rising action” (epitasis, in musical terms the exposition), “climax” (catastasis or development), “falling action” and “dénouement” (catastrophe, recapitulation/coda). This analogy can be extended to include the characterisations of the main theme as protagonist and subordinate theme as antagonist, or vice versa, and in some cases, the inclusion of the tritagonist, the cause of the protagonist’s suffering.

4.3.c. Signification of Formal Dimensions

Vande Moortele expands upon the ‘projection’ of the sonata form onto the work as a whole in his book on *Two-Dimensional Sonata Form*. He outlines a framework in which the sonata cycle (the overlying dimensions of the whole work) and the sonata form (the local dimensions of the single movement) interact. Taken from the theories of Marx and Riemann, Vande Moortele posits the hierarchical organisation of the musical form into five different levels, demonstrated in Table 4.1. Within this taxonomy, topics occur at the segment level: the main topical class replaces the main theme group, the second topical class replaces the subordinate theme group, and so on. Figure 4.1 lays out the organisation of the sonata cycle in three or four movements.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cycle</th>
<th>Overlying dimension of the entire work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Form</td>
<td>Dimension of single movements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Recapitulation, development etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Segment</td>
<td>Main theme, transition etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part</td>
<td>Theme A, A’, B etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

535 Vande Moortele. *Two Dimensional Sonata Form*, 101–123.
536 Ibid., 18–19.
This is not to say that all the elements of the sonata form consistently express structural or semantic functions within the sonata cycle. It is possible both for the individual units of the sonata form to be uncoordinated with the sonata cycle, or not be active within the process at all. In *Pelleas* both of these events occur as Vande Moortele places the development of the sonata cycle beginning in the last stages of the first movement and shows the two inner movements to be ‘inactive’ within the sonata cycle.\(^{538}\) This then creates the issue that if the inner movements are in this case inactive, then the dramatic climaxes of the literary narrative (Maeterlinck’s play), and consequently the programmatic aspect of the work, are also inactive. The slow movement in particular contains the dramatic climax of the programme, Pelleas and Melisande’s love scene and the murder of Pelleas and mortal wounding of Melisande. Hence, despite the similarities between sonata form and Ancient Greek drama, Vande Moortele dismisses the link between musical and programmatic narrative by denying the important plot points within the overall structure. Therefore, there must be another level of signification that can encompass the musical material that is here discounted and can provide a link between the form and programme of this piece. A topical narrative demonstrates this level.

\(^{537}\) Ibid., 18.
\(^{538}\) Ibid., 119.
4.3.d. Narrative of the Topical Sonata Cycle: Freudian Repression of the Sonata Form

Table 4.2 maps all of the above formal hypotheses alongside the topical narrative and the thematic ordering. The shaded areas delineate the formal outline of the sonata cycle as suggested by the syntagmatic axis of the topical structure. This structure is set against the sonata form of Berg’s original analysis because of the issues arising from the difference in the placement of the development section within Vande Moortele’s analysis. Vande Moortele posits changes to Berg’s thematic analysis such that the first movement has the development that was lacking in Berg’s analysis. Vande Moortele therefore has to alter what Berg said in order to make sense of it. The development section that Vande Moortele picks out, from bars 113–136, is not a thematic or syntactic development but is rather based on other factors, such as ‘tempo changes, a combination of thematic material from various parts of the exposition, and a rather wayward modulatory trajectory’. Vande Moortele justifies this decision because the outlined factors ‘generate a loose texture that is more in line with what we expect from a development than with a closing group’. The equivocal nature of this section as the development in Vande Moortele’s reading suggests that Schoenberg did not intend to use the thematic or tonal content to pinpoint such structural pillars. Yet the explanation of the deferment of the developmental section below allows these structural pillars to survive as structural pillars and, perhaps yet more significantly, allows Berg’s reading to be understood without amendment.

---

539 Ibid., 116.
540 Ibid.
Table 4.2: Form of Schoenberg's Pelleas und Melisande.

Theme key:
ML: Melisande Lost
M: Melisande
G: Golaud
GWB: Golaud Wedding Bond
WB: Wedding Bond
P: Pelleas
E: Eros
F: Fate
J: Jealousy
L: Love
IL: Innocence Lost
DD: Death Dance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fig</th>
<th>Act/scene</th>
<th>Berg</th>
<th>Vande Moorte</th>
<th>Tonal</th>
<th>Topical</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>D/d</td>
<td>Ombra/ pianto</td>
<td>ML. 0.2: Fate theme, 0.6 Fate ostinato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>M and ML</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hunt, G, M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tempesta, M condensed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>First theme</td>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td>F maj</td>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td>GWB 5.3: in KBass and KFaggot: M inverted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>First theme</td>
<td></td>
<td>First subject</td>
<td>Romance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>A maj</td>
<td></td>
<td>GWB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fanfares, Repressed fate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Transition (6 after 8)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra → romance</td>
<td>Fate, WB, 8.10: M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Second theme group</td>
<td>Second theme</td>
<td>E maj</td>
<td></td>
<td>P,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hunt, alt romance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td>Codetta (11.7)</td>
<td>Development (11.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Romance</td>
<td>P, 11.7: M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D min: A⁷</td>
<td></td>
<td>P, 12.4: M, 12.8: E and P, 12.12: F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td>Development recap.</td>
<td>Recapitulation</td>
<td>F maj</td>
<td></td>
<td>G, M condensed, WB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>Coda space</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cadenzas, E, P, M.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Scherzo-like 2nd movt.</td>
<td>Series of Episodes</td>
<td>A maj</td>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>Waltz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;Scherzo&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Fanfare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Second subject</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>J, E, P, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>8 before 25: alla breve</td>
<td>P, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>3.2 Episode 1</td>
<td>Pastoral/romance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>M, E, P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>March/tempesta/ombre/coup d’archet</td>
<td>J, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td>E, WB, F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.6</td>
<td>3.3 Episode 2</td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>WB, E, J</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Ombra/fanfare</td>
<td>F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>4.4 Adagio Intro</td>
<td>Slow Movement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Romance/pastoral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>E, WB, M. in BC: segues straight from WB→M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>4.4 Love scene</td>
<td>E maj</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Syncopated romance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td>E, L</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>D maj to sust. V of E</td>
<td>Sensibility</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ML,M, E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>M, WB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Begins in A♭</td>
<td>43.8: E, P, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Begins in F</td>
<td>L, E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td>L, E, M, F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>4.4 Coda</td>
<td>Over F pedal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>47.6: M, P, G</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>E,G, P, M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>48.6: F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>F pedal to E, then D</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Recapitulatory finale. 1st movt. Intro.</td>
<td>Development continued</td>
<td>C♯ min</td>
<td>Recapitulation</td>
<td>ML, DD; M, LI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ombra/pianto</td>
<td>M, LI, P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Death dance</td>
<td>M, WB, DD, P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>c♯ pedal</td>
<td>DD, LI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td>GWB, J, LI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td>First theme recap.</td>
<td></td>
<td>D min</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Love theme recap.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Episode</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ombra</td>
<td>DD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4 before 62: Hymn</td>
<td>M, E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
<td>Epilogue</td>
<td>Coda</td>
<td></td>
<td>Epilogue</td>
<td>GBW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FINALE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hymn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Romance/sensibility</td>
<td>M, P</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3.e. Topical and Thematic Multivalence

Within this analysis there are three levels of topical signification. These levels mean that each topic can affect the thematic and structural narratives in different ways. The placement of the themes within these levels then changes the signification of the themes. On the most basic level topics signify traditionally; that is they represent recognisable types or styles of music such as a waltz type, or a military style. On another level they signify locations, for example the pastoral topic evokes the countryside or the military topic the parade ground. Finally, topics can also signify the psychological state of a character; the romance topic is an excellent example of this, as are the Tempesta and sensibility topics, all of which suggest the emotion of a character. The introduction of Pelleas und Melisande sets the different levels of signification out in the forest scene, where the use of the ombra topic, in conjunction with the pianto topic, reveals the main character, Melisande, the character’s turbulent psychological state and the opening locale of the forest.

The ombra topic, signified by the use of low instruments, sparse texture, chromatic intervals and hesitations produces the tense forest atmosphere. Although this topic is not conventionally synonymous with the forest, Schoenberg’s similar use of it at the beginning of Verklärte Nacht and “Wir Bevölkerten die Abenddüstern” from Das Buch der Hängenden Gärten Op. 15 suggests that this topic is
related to such an environment in Schoenberg’s music more generally. The rhythmic quickening of pace through the first eleven bars paints the wind and increases the feeling of anxiety and confusion. The *pianto* topic in the cello accompanies the English horn’s ‘Melisande lost’ theme. The rising three semitones then the drop of an augmented fourth of the theme (this drop emphasised by the contra-bassoon doubling), coupled with the dynamic swell, indicates weeping and sighing. The syncopated *pianto* figure in the cello underscores this indication, confirming the emotional context of fear, confusion and grief.

*Example 4.8: Ombra and pianto topics with Melisande lost theme and fate theme, Schoenberg, Pelleas und Melisande, bb.1–5.*

© Copyright 1912, 1939 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 34134

---

541 All further names for themes are taken from Michael Cherlin’s analysis of *Pelleas und Melisande*, in Cherlin Schoenberg’s Musical Imagination, 68–154.
4.3.f. The “Unconscious”

The Fate theme interrupts the melody at bars 2 and 4, before becoming an ostinato in the double bass and contra-bassoon at bar 6. This portentous theme, seen here in the bass clarinet, appears throughout the work at points of dramatic importance as 'catastrophic intrusions', usually associated with the character Golaud (at this point it is the meeting of Golaud and Melisande that initiates the theme's entrance).\(^542\) Within the introduction this theme has two significant levels. First, it signals the pervasive sense of fate over the plot—an as-yet-unknown event is destined to happen—and it is destined to happen in as sudden a manner as the motive earlier interrupted the initially stagnant texture of the *ombra*. The major triad that ends the theme acts against the persistent chromaticism that surrounds it, increasing the effect of the interruption. Second, it introduces the Freudian themes that permeate this work. The repression of the unconscious as a process within this work also occurs on two levels: the section and segment dimensions of Vande Moortele’s hierarchy. The id, which Freud describes as being unconscious, constitutes the pleasure-seeking part of our personality. Whether it is lustful or aggressive, we are born with urges, wishes and obsessions that are constantly pushing for satisfaction and being persistently repressed by the ego. At the same time, the superego is similarly repressed as it pushes for ethical perfection.\(^543\) Here the concept of the unconscious emerges as the ostinato fate theme acts to control the anxious undercurrent of the forest that, with its quickening pace, threatens to erupt and destroy the semblance of control on the surface.

The correlation between the fate theme and the repressed unconscious continues from figure 3 when a new theme, a hunting call, enters in the horns. Its

\(^{542}\) Ibid., 73.
declarative dotted rhythm and large intervallic leaps are a stark contrast to the more chromatically contoured Melisande theme (Examples 4.8a and 4.9). The theme, associated with Golaud, is played by three unison horns until the last note, at which point they spread into a C major chord. The swirling repetitions of the Melisande theme and the ‘Melisande lost’ theme cease as that starkly major chord brings a moment of calm to the anxiety of the preceding section, conversely to the fate theme’s parallel interruption in the first 11 bars. The hunt call affects here both the music that has preceded it and what is to come. The hunt topic evokes the woodland, although it is now a different type of woodland than the *ombra* topic symbolised. The sparse texture remains, but the tension has receded, leaving a more homophonic, consonant, pastoral topic while at the same time signifying noble chivalry and moral attitudes, thereby changing the mood for the next section.

*Example 4.9: Golaud Theme. Schoenberg, Pelleas und Melisande, bb. 27–31.*

4.3.g. The “Uncanny”

The oboe at figure 1 presents the Melisande theme. The oboe states it only once before passing it to the English horn, transposed down a tritone. It is then transposed down another tritone by the bass clarinet. The atmosphere created by the *ombra/pianto* does not change, and neither does the ‘Melisande lost’ theme diminish, placing the Melisande theme both in the same physical forest locale and in the same psychologically turbulent state as the ‘lost’ theme. Indeed the Melisande lost theme could be considered a fragment of the Melisande theme, built as they both are on the semitone movement (labelled x in Examples 4.8 and 4.8a). This introduces the second Freudian theory in this piece: the uncanny. This theory was presented by Freud based on the arguments of Otto Rank. He begins by examining the German word *unheimlich*, meaning ‘uncanny’ or ‘unfamiliar’, as opposed to *heimlich*, meaning ‘familiar’ or ‘native’. As such, Freud suggests ‘we are tempted to conclude that what is “uncanny” is frightening precisely because it is *not* known and familiar’. Of course, not everything is frightening because it is

544 Otto Rank, *Der Döppelganger* (Vienna: Internationaler Psychoanalytischer), 1,925.
545 Freud, “The Uncanny”, 220.
unfamiliar, but the ‘Melisande lost’ theme represents an unknown character in Maeterlinck’s play. When the character is introduced she is sitting beside a pool weeping, a golden crown has slipped from her hair into the water and she is dressed as a princess. She is unknown to the audience and to Golaud, which thus characterises her as unfamiliar and, with the accompaniment of the *ombra* and *pianto* topics, uncanny. At figure 1 the Melisande theme is presented simultaneously with ‘Melisande Lost’. The Melisande theme is not yet familiar, but the constant repetitions of the theme, here and as the most consistent theme through the work, make it familiar. The Melisande theme seems to suppress the ‘Melisande lost’ theme; as such, the labelling of ‘Melisande lost’ as uncanny is only comprehensible retrospectively once the Melisande theme becomes familiar. Thus, at first the simultaneous presentations of the familiar and uncanny sides of the Melisande theme give the symbolised character a split personality, a “double self”, as it were, in which the id (Melisande lost) opposes the ego (Melisande).

Although Freud begins his discussion of the double in relation to two people ‘who are considered identical by reason of looking alike’ he goes on to suggest that in the sense that it is seen working in this theme it is linked to the unconscious. Freud posits that:

> A special faculty is slowly formed […] to be able to oppose the rest of the ego, with the function of observing and criticizing the self and exercising a censorship within the mind, and this we become aware of as our “conscience” […] this renders it possible to invest the old idea of a “double” with a new meaning and to ascribe many things to it, above all, those things which seem to the new faculty of criticism to belong to the old surmounted narcissism of the earliest period of all.\(^{546}\)

The Melisande lost theme disappears at figure 3, when the Golaud theme enters, and does not appear again until figure 50, when the sonata cycle’s recapitulation begins. ‘Melisande’ could therefore be seen as the controlling ego that suppresses the ‘Melisande lost’ id, signified concurrently by the *ombra* topic, as it also disappears here. At figure 50 it is Melisande’s unconscious state that is being symbolised and as such her control on her id has been lost. On a larger scale the Melisande theme also acts as the work’s ego repressing the first movement’s thematic development section at figure 14. Although the main Golaud wedding bond

\(^{546}\) Ibid., 227–228.
theme returns here, the Melisande theme returns only very briefly in the oboe and in a condensed manner, effectively denying a complete development of the first theme group. It is not until figure 22 that the group returns completely and signals the arrival of the *ombra* topic, the second subject within the narrative of the topical sonata cycle. The overlying topical presentation of the sonata cycle, shown in Table 4.2, expounds the use of two topical classes to represent the sections of the sonata cycle.

**4.3.h. Exposition**

The romance topic accompanies the main theme group at figure 5, signified by the full texture, octave doubling in the strings, swelling dynamics and arch melodies. As the harp runs are added the music becomes more ecstatic, particularly when the romance topic is inflected with fanfares. The fanfare topic has significance on three levels. First, it is a retrograde version of the fate theme, which, Cherlin suggests, 'seems to express an "unconscious" or repressed awareness of the fate to come'. Once again, the fate theme is associated with repression, but here it symbolises the repressed id rather than the controlling ego. Second, the fanfare also carries its own signification. Associated with the military and the aristocratic class it signifies the royal nature of the protagonist Golaud, and possibly also of Melisande, as Maeterlinck describes her as dressed in finery when she is first found.

The third level of signification is the fanfare's formal implications as a signal of announcement, forewarning or premonition. In this case it signals the entrance of the Pelleas theme, symbolising Golaud's younger stepbrother, which is preceded by the first of Cherlin's 'catastrophic intrusions' of the fate theme. The warning becomes clear now as at figure 8 the fate motive breaks free from its earlier repression and is stated outright by the trumpets, E♭ clarinet, piccolo and violins. The use of the trumpets for this theme is significant in that it is a trumpet that plays the theme associated with Pelleas at figure 9, rather than the French horn, English horn and bass clarinet with which the Golaud theme was initially presented, and which play the 'repressed' fate fanfares. The emphasis has therefore now been moved to the tragic cause of the action in this symphonic poem, the meeting of Pelleas and Melisande.

---

The introduction of the Pelleas theme at figure 9 is accompanied by the march topic. This is signified by the dotted rhythms and steady on-beat accompaniment in the violins, violas, horns and bassoons, and is inflected with the pastoral topic illustrated by the flourishes in the clarinets. Once again the topical signification works on two levels, indicating the locale of the royal castle and Pelleas’s “youthful and knightly character”, which Schoenberg expresses with the use of both the march and the ebullient sound of the E trumpet. An equally high-spirited horn fanfare complements the trumpet, possibly signifying Golaud’s joy that his brother and wife have met. Pelleas is here introduced as the antagonist of the play, the opposition against which the protagonist (Golaud) must contend.

The march theme (Example 4.11) alternates momentarily with the romance topic from the fourth bar of figure 9 to figure 10 as the second part of the Pelleas theme is taken by the flutes while the fate theme appears, just once, in the bassoons. The dynamics of the fate theme are only mezzoforte to the flute’s forte marking, so it is meant to be only a subdued echo of the premonition from figure 8. At figure 10 the march topic begins to transform into the cavalry march, signified by the saturation of staccato triplets to indicate the cavalry horse, the rhythmic fanfares in the horns and bassoons, and the pastoral inflections in the clarinets. This topic is associated, to a greater extreme than the march, with Pelleas’s noble character, as in addition to its association with the nobility of war it evokes the image of an officer rather than a common foot soldier. The infiltration of the romance topic into the second theme group links the topical signification of the march and the romance. When the march then begins to transform into a cavalry march the links solidify through the similar signifiers that the cavalry march and the hunt topics share (the galloping horse signifiers and the fanfares/ horn calls). The link with the hunt topic brings the topical signification full circle back to the hunting horn that originally signified Golaud in the introduction. At figure 10 the horn now signifies Pelleas and
continues to do so until his death at figure 49. This “swap” in the instrumentation signals a “swap” in the roles of the characters within the drama, which is demonstrated in the topical second subject starting at figure 22.

At figure 22 the Golaud theme appears suddenly, accompanied by the ombra topic. At this point in the drama Melisande drops her wedding ring and at the same time Golaud falls from his horse. The ombra topic here, signified by the use of the trombones to play Golaud’s theme (Example 4.12), gives an iconic representation of the dramatic action. The association of the ombra topic with oracles, the supernatural and the uncanny makes the theme’s use here especially significant to the plot.


© Copyright 1912, 1939 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 34134

The return of the ombra topic, which in the introduction signified the id, symbolises the id’s freedom from repression. This signifies not only Melisande’s unconscious id acting to break her wedding vows, but also the correlation between the Golaud theme and the ombra topic, and the confirmation of the character as a false protagonist (a character who is initially presented as the protagonist but is actually the antagonist). This swap between the brother’s character roles confirms the association with this section and the uncanny, according to Rosenfield’s suggestion that the double represents the ‘socially acceptable personality’ in opposition to the other ‘free, uninhibited self’. In this work the Golaud theme is initially presented in a good light, the horn melody breaking through the murk of the introduction with the C major chord. Once presented, the Pelleas theme almost immediately becomes entwined with the Melisande theme and the romance topic, suggesting his character is the uninhibited one, acting on his love for Melisande when he should have repressed his urges. It is, instead, the Golaud theme that eventually loses control as it approaches figure 48, the accompaniment of the violent presentation of his theme

by the *ombra* topic and the subjugation of his theme by the jealousy theme at figure 28 demonstrating this swap from protagonist to antagonist. The premonition of death and subsequent fall from grace that the doppelgänger provides, and which is suggested by Golaud’s theme’s low range and falling contour, is not in fact his but caused by him. A moment of relative calm passes before the *ombra* topic returns fully at figure 23. The following topics fall into the same dark topical class—the *tempesta* and the *coup d’Archet*—providing the second subject topical class.


© Copyright 1912, 1939 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 34134


© Copyright 1912, 1939 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 34134

At figure 25 a dream-like stasis is imposed on the music, what Cherlin terms a 'sense of temporal suspension' which 'seems to suggest a history of "thens" contained in an extraordinary "now"'.

This short recapitulation of the romance topic is signalled by the stretto entrances of the theme, which give the sensation that the music is wrapping around itself, never ending, the octave strings and the full texture (despite the relatively sparse orchestration). The twenty-bar reprise of this section is seen as a brief transition or episode within the second subject, necessary within the dramatic course of the plot to give the Golaud theme justification for the direction it now takes. Programmatically, Golaud must have his suspicions confirmed by seeing Pelleas and Melisande together in the castle in order that he has an incentive to murder his stepbrother. By encapsulating the section of music—‘wrapping it around itself’—Schoenberg can place a seemingly out-of-place topic within the second subject. The ‘dream-like’ quality it possesses places it outside of

---

the temporal time frame, thus outside the syntagmatic axis, and in turn, the section is able to act independently of the formal narrative while still being essential to the literary narrative.

4.3.1. Development and Recapitulation: The End of Repression

The sonata cycle development begins at figure 33 with the development of the romance topic and the modulation of the key. The themes which are developed first are the Pelleas, Melisande and Eros themes, all of which are from the second theme group. This is the consequence of the earlier swap between the roles of Pelleas and Golaud. The theme group associated with Pelleas has now been given the principle position. The topical development occurs when the romance topic is inflected with other topics, in this instance the pastoral, alla zoppa (to create a syncopated romance topic) and sensibility topics. This development coincides with the slow movement of the work and the end of repression for the characters. The revelation of Pelleas as the protagonist lifts the need for the Melisande theme to assert control over the other themes by repressing their desires, either for the characters’ actions in the plot or for the long awaited development of the sonata cycle. The Pelleas and Melisande themes at 33 are accompanied by the romance topic, inflected by the pastoral. This inflection supplies the music with the multi-level signification of the outside locale and the happy, in love, psychological state of the characters. The sensibility topic, which emerges at bar 41, is a musical aesthetic similar to the romance as, associated with mid- to late-eighteenth-century Germany, it expresses intimate sensitivity, to ‘touch the heart and move the affections.’ It served as an early defence of sense (in this instance referring to the senses and emotions) over reason and rationalism, and was therefore a reaction to the strict or learned style. The use of this topic affects only the growing emotional turbulence of the symbolised characters. It suggests an understanding by the characters that what they are feeling is against the rules, just as this topic acts out against the “rules” of the learned style.

The development continues with the ombra topic at figure 45, and with the Golaud theme group adding to the Pelleas theme group until at 48 there are simultaneous statements of the Golaud, Melisande and Pelleas themes. The death-

\[^{550}\text{Heartz and Brown “Empfundsamkeit”}.\]
\[^{551}\text{Ibid.}\]
blows, symbolised by the percussion section, accompany the last intrusion of the fate theme until a final solo presentation of the Pelleas theme announces his death.

The recapitulation at bar 50 begins with the *ombra* topic, symbolising the victory of the antagonist and categorising the programmatic narrative as an Ancient Greek tragedy, in that, with the return of the *ombra* Melisande has lost control and eventually her life, Pelleas has been murdered, and the antagonist, Golaud, is the only one left alive The first movement introduction returns, although altered. The Melisande lost theme is clearer now, not the murky disoriented forest, but comprehensible as if seen in the hindsight of a memory. The *pianto* topic also returns, symbolising now not the weeping of a young girl but the fall from grace of the three main characters. The loss of control by the ego, represented by the Melisande theme, has led to this tragic end and is symbolised by the *passus duriusculus* at figure 51. This interval of a fourth that is “filled in” by the duplication of semitones, particularly in combination with the *pianto* topic, signifies the topical class of the lament. The use of this topic here symbolises the grief of the tragedy that has passed. But the use of the literary device of the mortally wounded Melisande reliving her memories while unconscious suggests it is possibly also the guilt of the character that could have changed the outcome, had her theme/ego continued repressing the others as it did in the first 33 figures.

The lack of the movement inherent in the introduction gives this section a feeling of suspension, similar to the earlier stasis at figure 25, but here it is the lack of motion rather than the continuous circling of the theme which creates the temporal stasis. The Melisande theme is interjected by the ‘Melisande lost’ theme and the new ‘death drive’ theme, based on the Eros theme. One more new theme is introduced two bars before 52: innocence lost. This theme has its origins in the Melisande theme; while its ‘rhythmic shape, tonal directness, and homophonic presentation’ are more closely related to the opening of the Golaud theme, its contour is closer to Melisande's. Its dotted rhythm, jaunty character and on-the-beat accompaniment gives this theme the appearance of a death dance, adding to the signification of the *ombra* topic. The rhythmic stability of this theme jars against the fluidity of the preceding few bars, the disjointed effect disrupting the stasis surrounding it, effectively adding to the dreamlike quality of the section. Fragments

---

of other themes intrude, such as Pelleas theme and the wedding bond, like memories flashing through Melisande’s unconscious.

According to Berg’s analysis Melisande finally dies from her wounds at figure 61. Significantly, at this point it is the Eros theme that then symbolises her death, after a cadenza based on the Melisande theme. Thematically and topically her final moments actually occur just before figure 59. Here her death is signified in the same way as Pelleas’s death, with her theme played completely on its own and dying away. The fact that the final full rendition of her theme is played by the English horn, the instrument that played the Melisande lost theme, and the second and clearest rendition of her own theme, lends this theory credence, while the plagal cadence two bars before 62 signifies the finality of her death.

The Golaud theme leads the funeral march at 62, the beginning of the epilogue, which quickly descends into the sensibility topic. This demonstrates that it is no longer Melisande who is acting as the controlling ego, as it has been throughout the work; it is now Golaud. His sadness at losing Melisande is represented by the disintegration in the firm resolve of his theme, with the other themes intruding in fragments over the emotional turbulence of the sensibility topic.

4.3.j. Conclusion
The question posed by previous scholars about Pelleas und Melisande is whether Berg’s original presentation of the work in sonata form was feasible. Previous research has so far concluded that, due to Pelleas’s programmatic nature, the idea that it can also have an ‘abstract’ symphonic form was ‘profoundly subversive’. The answer to the question of form has therefore been essentially unequivocal: it either is in sonata form (Vande Moortele’s conclusion) or it is not (in this Puffett and Cherlin both agree). The above discussion has shown that the reason why the conclusions reached by former research are contradictory is that the reality is ambiguous: it both ‘is’ and ‘is not’ simultaneously. This is where the real meaning lies, as the initial staging of the sonata form is ‘repressed’ at the level of form, while it continues to play out at the level of the sonata cycle. The narrative, formed by the thematic and topical analysis, makes sense of the form through its multivalent function. By not limiting the analysis to single ‘domains’, such as theme, topic and so forth, connections have been made between the formal functions, the thematic groups and the topical content, most prominently through the relationship between the ombra topic and the main theme group, thereby providing viable reasons for the issues found in the previous analyses. Hence, not only do the programme and form
co-exist but also, in fact, it is the programmatic nature of the work that informs its structure. The taxonomic system, taken from Vande Moortele’s *Two-Dimensional Sonata Form*, provides a framework onto which one can map the musical narrative, becoming a useful tool with which to explain the levels on which the topical sphere functions. When combined with the application of the Freudian theories of repression and ‘doubles’ the initial refusal of the unfolding sonata form is explained through the deferment of the development until the first subject’s topical class is developed at figure 33. This shows that it is at the level of the sonata cycle in which the overall form is at play. The ‘scherzo-like’ second movement acts as a musical decoy, keeping as it does within the second subject’s topical class, while the ‘inactive’ third movement in Vande Moortele’s proposed form is now exposed as the development of the sonata cycle. The repression of the other themes by the Melisande theme ceases at figure 50; this cessation is made possible by the amalgamation of Freud’s concept of the double and the Greek dramatic action centred around the triad of protagonist, antagonist and tritagonist. The exchange in roles between Pelleas and Golaud—the gradual uncovering of Golaud as the false protagonist—explains the final ‘vexing’ question of the recapitulation: the return of the first group themes with the second subject’s topical class. Through the mapping of the topical narrative onto the programme as set out by Berg, the first theme group becomes inextricably linked with the second topical class. The character of Golaud, portrayed by a declarative theme, becomes associated with the *ombra* and *pianto* topics. This provides a multivalent representation of his ‘uninhibited, criminal personality’, his grief at losing his wife and brother, and finally the freedom from repression of the Melisande lost theme from the control of the Melisande theme before it fragments and develops throughout the recapitulation. The multivalent signification of the topical narrative therefore resolves the difficulty of expressing sonata form within a work known for its thematic uncertainty.

**4.4. Chapter Conclusion**

The way in which topical signification changes was demonstrated in the previous chapter. In the examples given—the waltz and the *Ländler*—the change mirrored the cultural transformation of *fin-de-siècle* Vienna. This chapter has demonstrated that the topical development has continued to mirror the cultural trends of the time, which, in addition to the question of national friction, include the internalisation of expression in line with the emergence of psychoanalysis. In Lehár’s *Die lustige Witwe* both of these cultural issues are represented. The story is set in the “fictional”
nation of Pontevedro, with music that conspicuously includes undeniable Polish and Montenegrin signifiers. The characters are also divided into nationalist narrative types, with morally underhanded Parisians and ethically upstanding Pontevedrians. The friction between the Austrians and the Other nations is not an issue that is touched on by Schoenberg, however. Lehár has continued to present the nationalistic satire portrayed by Mahler and Strauss, while Schoenberg has broken away from this, seemingly concentrating instead only on the expression of the inner mind (in the works analysed here at least).\textsuperscript{553} Where both composers relate, however, is in the presentation of Freud’s doppelgänger. In \textit{Die lustige Witwe} this concept is introduced by the way in which the topics interact with the text. In Mahler and Strauss, the topics often conflicted with the text, creating musical subplots which belied the literary narrative. In Lehár’s opera the topics follow the text in the first and third acts, in a verismo fashion, divided by the second act’s inner consciousness as the topical narrative diverges from the text to create a split personality, the two couples acting as the socially responsible and immoral halves of the same love story.

In Lehár’s case, the topics still signified traditionally, using the same conventions understood by Strauss’s audience. However, Schoenberg’s representation of the unconscious materialises because of the transformation of the \textit{ombra}’s associations, owing to his consistent use of the topic in other works in the same context. As the \textit{ombra} topic is persistently used when the action is in a dark forest, the emotional complex linked with that locale becomes correlated with the \textit{ombra} topic. Hence, the \textit{ombra} transforms from a fear of the supernatural to a personal anxiety of the unknown.

Despite this development in topical connotations, the devices explored in the previous chapter that are used to create the topical narrative are still very much present. Opposition is used to create a narrative between the uncanny topic and the rational topic in Schoenberg’s Op. 16, similarly suggesting (as in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony) a discontentment with society. In Mahler, this expressed a wish for an escape from society’s restrictions into a simple rustic life. In Schoenberg, it expresses the inability to follow society’s rules and the consequent anxiety that this

\textsuperscript{553} In topic analyses conducted on all of Schoenberg’s published songs no overt national topics were found other than a folk song topic found in “Einfältiges Lied”, from \textit{Brettl-Lieder} (1901), a song about a King who goes for a walk dressed as a commoner. The wind knocks off his hat, uncrowning him to the delight of the narrator. The folk topic here is used to signify simplicity rather than any national folk song.
Engenders. In addition, when topic analysis interacts with something else its expressive potential increases. The combination of Vande Moortele’s Two Dimensional Sonata Form with Freud’s theories and the topical narrative, for example, answered the question of the structure of *Pelleas und Melisande*, a conclusion which would have been hard to reach using only one form of analysis. Interaction between topics and text was also demonstrated in the previous chapter, and is again seen to be important here in the verismo narrative of *Die lustige Witwe*, and finally, in the first case study in which Schoenberg’s Op. 17 acted as “key” to the interpretation of Op. 16. Nevertheless, these interpretive tools do not denote topic theory as superfluous, as the conclusions reached above are formed by analysing the work topically first and using the supplementary theories or texts to enhance and explain the significance of the narrative. Meaning is, therefore, expanded and strengthened by its relation to other disciplines. As such, when analysing what is considered abstract music, such as that by Webern, the way in which topics signify should change further, as, without reference to the external cultural world, the levels of signification should contract.
Chapter 5: Dualism in Webern

Anne Schreffler states that Schoenberg, Berg and Webern’s ‘adoption of the twelve-tone method [...] opened the gates of renewed misunderstanding, as they were accused of being cerebral note counters’. The non-tonal musical language had already broken so far away from the moorings of tonality that both the musical establishment and the listening public rejected them, but with the advent of twelve-tone technique these composers’ music was considered incomprehensible. Although it was Schoenberg who introduced this compositional method, Webern cultivated his own characteristics, best described, Schreffler suggests, as ‘extremes’. His music’s brevity, its extreme quietness—many pieces never rise above pianissimo—its structural complexity and its lyricism are all qualities discussed by scholars in recent times. However, until the late 1990s scholars concentrated almost solely on the “cerebral” aspects—structure, pitch classes, intervallic placement and row forms. From 1998 onwards, Julian Johnson, Kathryn Bailey and Schreffler, among others, have begun to place the music within its cultural context, although, with the exception of Johnson, none have considered meaning within the works themselves. Although Webern’s ‘aphoristic expression’ is often considered, what is being expressed, or its significance, is rarely discussed. Using historically traced learned conventions—topics—in conjunction with other interpretive tools, such as form, psychoanalytic theory and comparative analysis with other art forms, it is possible to demonstrate that Webern’s music is not an abstract exercise in the cerebral, but an expressive music situated in the culture surrounding it. A topical analysis of the works therefore provides a deeper understanding of the musical expression, and of the changing interwar culture, as the choice of pieces studied in this chapter have twofold significance. The first is that they were composed just after the First World War when the Austro-Hungarian Empire had fallen and the Austrians were dealing with the economic and political backlash of defeat. Second, the pieces span the progression of Webern’s musical

555 Ibid.
style from ‘free atonality’ to twelve-tone technique, and the consequent evolution of his musical aesthetic.

Three examples of Webern’s work are offset against an operetta, Gräfin Mariza, by Emmerich Kálmán, an example of light music in which, in a way similar to the examples given in the previous chapter, it can be seen that the narrative follows a parallel path with that of Webern’s music, despite the vast difference in musical aesthetic. In the second study a formal and topical analysis of Symphony Op. 21 reveals a narrative in which contradictions and reversals, both in the form and the topical narrative, are prevalent. The third is a topical analysis of the composer’s first twelve-tone work, the String Trio Op. 20, which demonstrates a link between the musical narrative and Thomas Mann’s novella Tonio Kröger. Finally, the fourth study investigates the use of Lacanian methodology as an interpretive tool to expose and explain the dialectic between male and female signifiers in Webern’s Fünf Canons Op. 16.

As will be demonstrated in these case studies, as Webern assimilates the twelve-tone technique he reverts to the pre-1900 plotlines laden with dialectics based on rationalism and positivism, alongside the psychoanalytic paradigms of Schoenberg’s non-tonal works. With the narratological change came an aesthetic one. The innovation of the twelve-tone technique provided Webern with a structural system which could be used in a way similar to diatonicism, a theory discussed further in section 5.2.a below. Arnold Whittall, among others, describes the change of musical character from anxiety and turbulence to something ‘more serene’, and claims that

this difference suggests an analogy—deriving from Nietzsche—of great importance to the evolution of twentieth-century music, and alluded to explicitly by both Schoenberg and Stravinsky: ‘When the Dionysian element rules, ecstasy and inchoateness threaten; when the Apolline predominates, the tragic feeling recedes’.

The philosophical dichotomy between Apollonian and Dionysian thinking reflects the political changes of fin-de-siècle Vienna outlined in the first chapter—a movement away from Alt Wien rationalism and positivism towards an instinctive, expressionistic liberalism. What Whittall describes is a reversal of this progression back to the rationalist design of the Empirical age. Although he feels this serenity is achieved in the Symphony, written in 1928, he posits that ‘of all Webern’s compositions before Op. 21 none anticipates the atmosphere of his later works more closely than the second of the Five Canons on Latin Texts’. Bailey explains that the calmness combines with a return to more traditional material, both formally and narratologically, noting that ‘[Webern’s] comments about himself and his music […] show an unswerving commitment to tradition, to the idea that in contributing to the ‘New Music’ he was also upholding values of the past’. Whittall concurs, suggesting that the tranquillity arose from a newfound contentment in his personal and professional life:

Family support, Jone as muse, and Schoenberg—by way of twelve tone technique—as teacher provided a ‘core of stability’ able to compensate Webern for continuing professional and financial stresses and strains, and to promote a form of musical expression in which transcendence if not the dissolution of sorrow and anxiety could be realised in sound.

However, Bailey does counsel that the analyst is predisposed to judge the music revolutionary or perceive it to be within a traditional context. As such, by choosing an analytical method based on the identification of learned conventions, this seeming contradiction between “New Music”, evident in the sound and compositional method of the works, and “tradition”, signified by the use of structural techniques such as canon and the use of sonata form, illustrates the foremost paradigm of Webern and his works, that of paradox and conflict.

---

558 Whittall, Exploring Twentieth-Century Music, 23.
560 Whittall, Exploring Twentieth-Century Music, 23.
561 Bailey, The Twelve-note Music of Anton Webern, 2. Bailey explains that ‘Analysis is a human activity, and an analyst’s predisposition in this respect is surely of the same nature as a preference for gin or whiskey, the chief difference being that most people are aware of their taste preferences, whereas aesthetic bias seems to be in many cases unconscious.’ This is particularly significant in regards to such a method as topic analysis in which perception is, to a certain extent, subject to the analyst’s personal opinion. This thesis attempts to tackle this problem by providing a historical trace for each topic.
This chapter therefore demonstrates that despite the aesthetic difference between the musical language of Mahler and Webern, and between ‘light’ and ‘art’ music, the conventional themes of class struggle remain. The abstract works so inspirational to later composers, such as Luigi Dallapiccola and Pierre Boulez, are, in truth, indexical of the surrounding culture of fin-de-siècle Vienna in which the political climate was characterised by the clash between the bourgeois and “the people”.

5.1. Kálmán’s Gräfin Mariza

Emmerich (Imre) Kálmán was born in Siófok, Hungary, in 1882 and studied at the Royal Academy of Music in Budapest alongside fellow students, Bartók and Kodály. After the turn of the century, he became a composer and music critic for the Hungarian newspaper Pesti Napló, during which time he won several composition prizes for works including orchestral tone poems, piano pieces and art songs.562

Both The Merry Widow and Strauss’s Die Fledermaus had an effect on Kálmán, particularly when his original career aspirations as a concert pianist were thwarted by early arthritis in his hands and his need to start earning money because of his father’s financial downfall. Although his earlier compositions were of a sufficient quality to win him scholarships to study in Bayreuth, Munich and Berlin, he found it difficult to find a publisher and, consequently, financial gain. Jesse Wright Martin writes that ‘it became increasingly evident to him that success could only be found in the theatre—he himself was reputed to have said, “If it goes on like this, I shall have to write an operetta”’.563 Bistron, in his biography of the composer, describes this decision:

Stopping off in Vienna on his way home, he attended several performances of Lehár’s new Merry Widow and was captivated by its caressing airs, sweeping waltzes and unusual orchestration. Back in Budapest, he resolved to quit his newspaper job and devote himself entirely to operetta.564

563 Ibid., 5.
I’ll go to Vienna…and do the same as Lehár! Everybody burst with laughter, but I went …all the same. I thought it would be just for a couple of weeks—and this couple of weeks turned out to be 24 years.  

Considering his background, it is maybe unsurprising that Kálmán’s operettas—and here Gräfin Mariza is no exception—are, as Traubner puts it, 'more specifically Hungarian than Lehár’s due to his “Hungarian phrasing’." Traubner goes on to state that the operetta was one of the best of all the Hungarian-Austrian conciliations apart from Strauss’s Zigeunerbaron […] In their searing way, songs like “Komm, Zigány” and the entrance song of Sylva Varescu [Gräfin Mariza in the original German version] have become virtual Hungarian folk songs as well as stock international operetta depictions of Hungary itself.

Martin agrees, noting that even when writing non-Hungarian dances, such as waltzes or foxtrots—the inclusion of which, Martin implies, were deliberate attempts at commercialism—Kálmán ‘infused them with a distinct Hungarian sound’. Quoting from Sárosi’s survey of Gypsy music, Martin summarises the characteristics of this sound as pentatonic, although other modal keys may also appear, the use of distinctive rhythms, and melodies which specifically employ the ‘minor scale with two augmented seconds—the so-called “Hungarian” or “Gypsy scale”’. At this point in the discussion, however, Martin also includes a quotation from the Harvard Dictionary of Music’s article on “Hungarian music”, which credits the discovery of Hungarian folk music to Bartók and Kodály. This accreditation is quite correct, but the implication that the music Martin is discussing is Hungarian folk music, the same music catalogued by Bartók and Kodály over forty years, is erroneous. In an article translated and published in 1970, Kodály ascertains that, next to rhythm, the

565 Ibid., 5.
566 Traubner, Operetta, 273.
567 Ibid., 268–273.
primary characteristic of Hungarian folk music is pentatonicism, not what he terms the 'so-called “Magyar scale”', which Martin claims is so specific to this music.\footnote{Zoltán Kodály and Stephen Erdely, “Pentatonicism in Hungarian Folk Music” \textit{Ethnomusicology} 14, no. 2 (1970), 228.}

In two articles dealing with the lexicography of Hungarian peasant music Bartók considers the common perception of the Hungarian musical characteristics. He posits that there is confusion between actual peasant music and ‘artistic imitations’, attributing this difference to the proliferation of Gypsy musicians and the confusion between the two.\footnote{Béla Bartók, “Hungarian Peasant Music”, trans. Theodore Baker, \textit{Musical Quarterly} 19, no. 3 (July 1933), 267. Whether the music being described originates from the Hungarian peasant or the Gypsy bands has been under debate since Bartók began his investigation into the genuine Hungarian folksong. Warren states that in the sixteenth century the Hungarians were actively discouraged from dancing or secular music-making. It therefore became socially unacceptable to be a Magyar musician. The Gypsies, however, were not restricted and took up the Hungarian national music as their own, although mixed with other styles, such as the Turkish or Oriental styles, and their own interpretive traditions (Warren: 2012, 28). As Gypsy musicians continued their nomadic lifestyle, they began to perform elsewhere, such as Vienna, where they were often confused with lower class Hungarians.} Moreover, there is disparity between what composers believe is Hungarian or Gypsy and what is genuinely from these cultures. Bartók cites Liszt’s book \textit{Des Bohémiens et de leur Musique en Hongrie} (1859) as the sole work on Hungarian music—which was true until Bartók himself began to publish his collections—and blames him for most misunderstandings in the subject. ‘[Liszt] had heard’, Bartók suggests, ‘that Hungarian music, which inspired him to the composition of his pieces in Hungarian style, exclusively as played by Gypsies and considered it to be a specifically Gypsy music’.\footnote{Bartók, “Hungarian Peasant Music”, 267. For a fuller explanation of Liszt’s book, his views on Gypsy music and the reactions to it see Anne Piotrowska, \textit{Gypsy Music}, 34–42.} ‘Nevertheless', Bartók writes, it is neither a Gypsy product nor Hungarian peasant music. Among the melodies employed by Liszt in his Hungarian Rhapsodies, and by Brahms in his Hungarian Dances, there are scarcely four or five genuine peasant melodies, and even these appear in a much distorted, “Gypsy-like” form. All the remainder are art-melodies in folk-music style. [...] For instance, they imported the step of an augmented second (with which we are familiar in the so-called "Hungarian scale", but which is never found in the Hungarian peasant melodies) from the Balkans, or still further away, into the Hungarian art-music in folk-music style.\footnote{Bartók, “Hungarian Peasant Music”, n267.}
Consequently, the characteristic ‘Gypsy scale’ identified by Martin and Sárosi as an essentially Hungarian characteristic is more likely, according to Bartók, to have originated in the Balkans or with the Turks or Arabs, and been acquired by the Gypsies ‘during their wanderings’. Liszt’s Hungarian Dances and Kálmán’s operettas are not, then, written using the Hungarian peasant idiom; rather, they are written in the Hungarian style, or the style hongrois.

5.1.a. Synopsis
Count Tassilo has suffered great financial difficulties and now works for the Countess Mariza as the bailiff to her estate, near the Hungarian border. Operating under the name of Törek he works to earn a dowry for his sister Lisa, who is unaware of the family’s situation. The countess is rarely there, and the servants and peasants treat him well, so he enjoys his service. Suddenly the countess returns to celebrate her engagement with Baron Zsupán, who she confesses to Lisa is not real, but rather a name she picked to discourage suitors after seeing Strauss’s operetta, The Gypsy Baron.

Shockingly for Mariza, her fake fiancé turns out to be a rich pig farmer from Varaždin. Zsupán sees the engagement in a paper and arrives at the party ready to persuade Mariza to marry him anyway. Zsupán is relentless in his claim, but Mariza has no real interest in him as she has been immediately attracted to her new bailiff, Tassilo, who is surprised to find that Lisa is part of Mariza’s entourage and begs her to keep his identity secret. The party moves to the park, and as a kind gesture, Mariza sends out wine for her bailiff. Tassilo has also fallen for the countess, but finds the gift condescending and humiliating, and, alone in the park, sings a melancholy song “Auch ich war einst ein feiner Csárdáskavalier!” (I too was once a fine csárdás cavalier!). Mariza and her guests overhear the song, and the following csárdás “Komm, Zigány”, and ask him to repeat it. His refusal offends Mariza, who fires him immediately. The guests begin to leave for the cabaret, when Manja, a Gypsy fortune-teller, tells her that within one month she will find true love with a cavalier. Mariza decides to stay at the estate, and, regretful of her earlier actions, asks Tassilo to remain.

As Act Two begins, Baron Zsupán admits to Lisa that if it were not for his pursuit of Mariza, his attentions would turn to her. The feelings between Mariza and

Tassilo deepen as they try to move past their supposed differences in station. The jealous Prince Populescu steals a letter Tassilo had written which suggested he almost had Lisa’s dowry. He convinces Mariza that Törek is not who he says he is, that he has been spending too much time with Lisa (whom nobody realises is his sister) and is only after Mariza’s money. Mariza turns against Tassilo and once again dismisses him. As he leaves, however, he greets Lisa as his sister. Mariza is shocked, but delighted as she realises the truth and that he does really love her.

In Act Three Tassilo confronts Mariza for a job reference; however, both are too stubborn to admit their feelings. Unexpectedly, Tassilo’s wealthy aunt arrives with the news that she has bought back his properties and he can reclaim his title. As he and his sister prepare to depart, Zsupán intercepts them and asks for Lisa’s hand in marriage. Mariza, finally convinced that Tassilo is not after her money, then also appears and they confess their love.575

5.1.b. Topical Narrative
As with Die Fledermaus and Die lustige Witwe, the themes of this operetta are misrepresentation and the perceived differences in class between the main characters. The style hongrois signifies both these levels in the formulation given in chapter 1. The defiant freedom of the gypsies, particularly in light of what Bellman called their ‘independence from the constricting mores of society’, illustrated by the opposition between Gypsy and Western music, symbolises the class divide.576 In Act One, while Tassilo poses as Törek, a lowly bailiff, Mariza stands apart as both a noble and his employer, and the style hongrois is prevalent. However, as the class divide dwindles or is ignored, the Western style reigns, and the style hongrois returns only once the relationships begin to sour, ironically because of the misrepresentation of the character’s social class.

The stylistic differences are also used to give the audience a hint as to the characters’ cultural background. The simultaneity of topical influences in the third song uniquely captures the situation the character Tassilo is in at this point. He is speaking frankly to a friend who knows his true status; he enjoys the job of bailiff

575 A fuller version of this synopsis may be found in Wright Martin, “A Survey of the Operettas of Emmerich Kálmán”, 117–118, from which the above abbreviated version is drawn.

576 The term Western music is used here as a general term in opposition to the style hongrois. It therefore encompasses diatonicism, Viennese dances such as the waltz, the foxtrot and the polka, and non-nationalistic topics.
and the life on Mariza’s estate, but misses his home and wishes to be himself once more. Hence, the style hongrois rhythms and E minor key inflecting the Viennese waltz present the two aspects of the character’s situation. “Schwesterlein”, a duet between Tassilo and Lisa, is also a waltz, this time with pastoral inflections, particularly the horn calls and the string drone at the beginning. The lack of Hungarian influences within this song suggests that Tassilo’s true character, that which reaches back to his childhood—represented by his sister and the pastoral topic, which is used only here and in the children’s nursery rhyme of song No. 2—lies within the Viennese rather than the Hungarian sentiment. Similarly, despite Baron Zsupán being associated with the Gypsy baron from Strauss’s operetta, his introductory duet with Mariza is based on a military topic, with only hints of the style hongrois (the Lombard in the introduction and chorus, Example 5.1). This may be because Varaždin, the character’s home, is a city in Croatia rather than Hungary.

Example 5.1: Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No. 6, bb. 1–8.

Songs Nos. 9 to 12 are also mostly lacking in Hungarian signifiers, as the romance blossoms between the two couples, Tassilo and Mariza, and Lisa and Zsupán. At this point, however, Mariza is still engaged to Zsupán, Tassilo is posing as Törek and his relationship to Lisa is still secret. Lisa and Zsupán’s love duet appears to have the odd allusion to the style hongrois, for example the Lombard in the second bar of the vocal line and the grace notes in the bass part at bar 20 (Example 5.2). However, these add to the upbeat nature of the duet and subsequent dance, which, in combination with the dotted rhythms and trumpet interjections at the end of each phrase, leads to the possible conclusion they are just rhythmic devices to add a dance-like “hop” to the melody. Similarly, Mariza and Tassilo’s love song is a dotted cavalry march followed by a brilliant waltz, as they begin to declare their feelings.

Example 5.2: Lombard. Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No. 9, bb. 7–10.
The significance of the use of Western dance forms in the songs of the second act and the *style hongrois* in the majority of the operetta emphasises the work's historical grounding. The conventions of Traubner's "golden age" of operetta are condensed in *Gráfin Mariza* to produce exactly the kind of commercial creation Bartók belittled in his essays of the 1940s. Bartók writes that

> [t]he music that is nowadays played "for money" by urban gypsy bands is nothing but popular art music of recent origin. The role of this popular art music is to furnish entertainment and to satisfy the musical needs of those whose artistic sensibilities are of a low order. This phenomenon is but a variant of the types of music that fulfill the same function in Western European countries; of the song hits, operetta airs, and other products of light music as performed by salon orchestras in restaurants and places of entertainment.\(^{577}\)

The blatant commercialisation of this operetta can be exemplified through comparisons between this operetta, *Die Fledermaus* and *Die lustige Witwe*, which all exhibit similarities to the point of parody. For example, the use of the waltz in the duet between Tassilo and Lisa, "Schwesterlein", mimics the "Brüderlein" waltz in *Die Fledermaus*. The storyline in which couples "swap" partners in the second and third acts follows the plot of *Die lustige Witwe*, as does the inclusion of the song "Ja! Heut um Zehn sind wir um Tabarin, / wo hundert Flaschen Schampus steh'n" (Yes! Today at ten, we will be in the Tabarin, / where there are hundreds of bottles of bubbly). This song is similar to "Da geh' ich zu Maxim" from *Die lustige witwe*, and echoes the champagne polka in *Die Fledermaus*.

‘The Gypsy idiom’, Bellman states, was ‘gradually becoming a series of tired clichés rather than a vibrant musical dialect’.\(^{578}\) Consequently, the signifiers of the *style hongrois* outlined in chapter 2 are not wholly relevant in a work such as this. The musical dialect has been used to express an exoticism, which is intended to

---

\(^{577}\) Bartók, "Gypsy Music or Hungarian Music?", 241–242.

\(^{578}\) Bellman, *The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe*, 215.
appeal to an audience but not offend their patriotism. Catherine Mayes, in her article “Reconsidering an Early Exoticism”, cites Ralph Locke’s term ‘non-exotic exoticism’ with regards to this manifestation of Hungarian-Gypsy music.\(^{579}\) Locke suggests that although most early Western representations of Hungarian Gypsy music ‘evoke a foreign place and foreign people, they generally do not do so through stylistic means’.\(^{580}\) Both Mayes and Locke discuss published Hungarian-Gypsy dances which were not written using the signifiers of the style hongrois, but instead, Mayes claims, ‘conform[ed] to “the rules of music” that would have been more understandable to the public, and therefore more marketable—exactly the adulteration Bartók railed against in 1947.\(^{581}\) Bellman calls this process ‘the final “taming” of the style hongrois. The music remains on the less-vivid, “amateur” level of deployment, but is elevated to the largest commercial market and theatrical circumstance’.\(^{582}\) He continues that

> [t]he once-powerful Gypsy stereotype is sanitised and coupled with the denatured music to sing of a completely stock kind of romantic allure, a bland and largely unthreatening Other, a thoroughly prescribed kind of freedom, and to produce a wholly prescribed and inoffensive exoticism. [...] the plot [here he refers to Lehár’s Gypsy Love, Strauss’s Gypsy Baron and to Kálmán’s “Hungarian-Viennese shows”] reduces the complexities of the Gypsy stereotype to pap.\(^{583}\)

Despite the obvious commercialism of Gräfin Mariza, Bellman’s description of the “Hungarian Viennese show” as “pap” misses the significance of the subtext. In the first song of the operetta, the character of the Gypsy fortune-teller Manja introduces a form of the uncanny topic. Her song begins “Glück ist ein schöner Traum, / Glück wächst auf jedem Baum” (Happiness is a beautiful dream, / it grows on every tree) and is saturated with style hongrois signifiers. While the apparent conclusion is that she is a Gypsy and the style hongrois illustrates her character, the ambivalent connotations of the topic suggest there is deeper meaning. The signifiers of “happiness”, “dream” and “tree” indicate that happiness is dependent on love. The


\(^{580}\) Locke, Music Exoticism: Images and Reflections, 22.

\(^{581}\) Mayes, “Reconsidering an Early Exoticism”, 170.

\(^{582}\) Bellman, The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe, 215–216.

\(^{583}\) Ibid.
signifier “tree” has multivalent significations of both male and female genitalia; however, a single tree rather than a forest usually signifies a phallus, which would be consistent with the gender of the singer (as a woman, her desire for love would traditionally signify a man). The phallus also signifies desire, which juxtaposes with the signifier “dream” to signify the castration complex from the uncanny topic detailed in the previous chapter. The hongrois gestures—the Lombard, anapest, alla zoppa rhythms and vocal improvisation—also denote the uncanny. The vocal improvisation is doubled at a third by tăragató that, as mentioned earlier, adds a further level to the mimesis (Example 5.3). The voice mimics instrumental improvisation, with a clarinet mimicking the voice, adding another level: a second state. Although the improvisation is written out in this operetta, it represents the non-scored virtuosic abilities of the Gypsy primas (leader), in which the whole band plays chords and long notes, while the soloist plays fiorituras. The signifiers for the hypnoid state were a traumatic event, for example a falling forte passage ending on a loud chord (Example 5.3a), followed by an ostinato, a temporal device to take the listener “out of the moment”, to arrest the temporal progression. In these moments of improvisation, the forward momentum halts. The primas can take as long as they like over the fiorituras, as the rest of the band pauses for them.

The next presentation of this signifier is in the finale when Tassilo is insulted by Mariza’s gesture of sending wine out to him as if he is a common servant. The improvisatory section leads to “Komm Zigány!” which begins with his protestation that he was also once a fine cavalier. This song is the reason Mariza sacks him, when she hears the song and demands he repeat it. Hence, the song epitomises the two elements which the uncanny has so far accompanied, that of the double (Tassilo’s hidden alter ego) and that of desire.

Example 5.3: Kálmán, Gräfin Mariza, No. 1, bb. 53–57.
As further evidence for the correlation between the uncanny topic, the *style hongrois* and the themes of love and alter ego, an example of the binary signification—that of the conscious, rather than the unconscious—can be made of the duet between Tassilo and Lisa, song No. 5, “Sonnenschein hüll’ dich ein”. (Sunshine envelops you.) This waltz distinctly lacks any *style hongrois* signifiers, which, as mentioned above, is possibly because it is Tassilo’s and Lisa’s “true selves” who are singing. There is innocence to their song as they recollect their childhood, jumping in fields.
in the sunshine. They are being open and honest with one another and they are siblings, so not in love. As such, there is no place for the uncanny in the text, and so it does not appear in the narrative.

Three levels of signification are therefore present in the style hongrois. The first is the illustration of the characters themselves and their backgrounds. Manja is a Gypsy fortune-teller and consequently the topic used during her song contains all the signifiers of the style hongrois. Mariza is a Hungarian countess, so is also afforded the hongrois signifiers, although as she is not a Gypsy, the signifiers are less prevalent. Zsupán is Croatian, and so has signifiers that allude to exoticism, rather than specifically Hungarian origins. Finally Tassilo and Lisa are Viennese, so when they duet it is a Viennese waltz which accompanies them. However, within Tassilo’s songs there are often style hongrois allusions, referencing the fact that he is pretending to be Törek, a bailiff with Gypsy associations.

The next level connotes the relationship between the characters. Mariza and Zsupán’s relationship is honest: he intends to marry her because she said they would, rather than for love, and he tells her as much. In Lisa and Tassilo’s relationship there is also not romantic love, and therefore no hongrois signifiers. Between Mariza and Tassilo, however, as they are falling in love in the first act, but not admitting it, the signifiers are abundant. In addition to their concealment of their love for one another, there is also the misconception of Tassilo’s hidden past. The layers of secrets between them therefore suggest Freud’s conception of the uncanny, the third level of signification, where the German word for “covert”, heimlich, is folded into the word for “uncanny”, unheimlich. Once juxtaposed with the themes of desire and the familiar Other, the hidden past becomes synonymous with an “alter ego” signified by the temporal stasis provided by the primas’ fiorituras. As such, the operetta balances on the edge between revolutionary and conservative.

Gräfin Mariza has therefore presented the traditional operetta theme of misrepresentation through multiple levels of mimesis. It is simultaneously a blatant parody of the Golden Age operettas and a continuation along the path to New Music.\(^{584}\) The use of the double hinted at by Strauss’s apparent exploitation of the

---

\(^{584}\) Traubner outlines the various “Ages” of operettas: the Golden Age approximately encompasses the 1860s to the 1920s, and therefore the previous operettas by Strauss and Lehár. The time of Kálmán’s Gräfin Mariza is categorised by Traubner as “Silver Vienna”. Traubner, Operettas, 261–286.
waltz topic has developed into the utilisation of Schoenberg’s uncanny topic, which is itself a subtext of a relatively uninspiring, but commercially seasoned, plot.

5.2. Infinite and Static: the Double in Webern’s Symphony Op. 21

5.2.a. Introduction

The Symphony Op. 21, written in 1928, comprises two movements, the first in sonata form, the second a theme and variations, and utilises the twelve-tone system of composition. When Webern discussed his Symphony in a series of lectures in 1932, now collected under the title The Path to New Music, he declared that ‘greater unity is impossible’. Despite the network of connections Webern creates, the piece is peppered with contradictions and conflicts, with reversals on all levels of the work. In her article “Webern’s Opus 21: Creativity in Tradition”, Kathryn Bailey discusses the way in which Webern transforms rather than diverges from tradition in his use of row forms.

In the last lecture of The Path to the New Music, Webern summarises the second movement of his symphony as an attempt to ‘create as many connections as possible’, thereby justifying its basis on a twelve-note row the second half of which is the retrograde of the first. As such, the number of row forms reduce to twenty-four, rather than the usual forty-eight. Webern’s subsequent treatment of these rows using canons and palindromes creates a network of connections leading him to the above declaration. This is the first of many analyses of this piece which centre almost solely on the row structure of the work, in particular the utilisation of canons and the symmetry of palindromes which allowed Webern to construct a larger scale work than his previous compositions.

586 Ibid., 56.
588 Ibid. Donna Lynn’s article chronicles the compositional process of the row through Webern’s sketches and demonstrates how, originally the row was four three-note gestures, in which the second (G♯–A–B♭) is the mirror image, by retrograde inversion, of the first (G–F♯–F); Donna Lynn, 12-Tone Symmetry: Webern’s Thematic Sketches for the Sinfonie, Op. 21”, The Musical Times 131, no. 1,774 (Dec., 1990), 644–646. See also George Perle, “Webern’s Twelve-Tone Sketches” The Musical Quarterly, 57, no. 1 (Jan., 1971), 1–25. Other literature on the composition of the rows, and the possible segmentation of the music includes Catherine Nolan ‘New Issues in the Analysis of Webern’s 12-Tone Music” Canadian University Music Review, 9, no. 1 (1988), 83–103.
H. Wiley Hitchcock’s article, for example, written in answer to R.P. Nelson’s claim that Webern’s comments on his symphony were ‘imprecise and conjectural’, aims only to prove the precision of Webern’s own analysis through a formal breakdown of the row series and transpositions of the second movement. Mark Starr concentrates more on the palindromic aspects of the second movement, although he does introduce an investigation on the palindromic treatment of not just the rows, but also the dynamics and timbre. As an example, Starr illustrates the way in which all the various musical elements, which he categorises as pitch, rhythm, instrumentation, dynamics and articulation, do not always follow the canonic treatment of the rows; hence, in the second voice in variation 2 (rows P6 and P10) the pitch and rhythm are in canon, while the remaining three are not. He then demonstrates how this formulation is reversed in variation 6; here, it is in the first voice (rows P2 and P11) where the elements are split (Figure 5.1).

Figure 5.1: Reversals Diagram Taken from Mark Starr “Webern’s Palindrome”, 132.

None of these analyses, however, makes any comment on the overall form of the symphony, concentrating as they do on the second movement, nor is there a discussion about the context of the piece in the symphonic genre itself. This discussion was left to later scholars, such as Christopher Ballantine and Peter

---

590 Mark Starr, “Webern’s Palindrome”, Perspectives of New Music, 8, no. 2 (Spring/Summer 1970), 127–142.
591 Ibid., 132.
592 One insightful analysis based solely on the first movement of the Symphony is Lejaren Hiller and Ramon Fuller, “Structure and Information in Webern’s Symphonie, Op. 21” Journal of Music Theory 1, no. 1 (Spring 1967), 60–115. This is a comparative study between a structural analysis (of the row series) and an information theory analysis.
In his overview of the work, Brown cites Webern’s justification for the absence of the third movement as following the traditions set out by Beethoven, but calls it ‘ironic in light of the many aspects of Opus 21 that are outside of normal cyclic and, even more specifically, symphonic practice’. However, other than the length of the work and the small size of the orchestra (‘only nine quiet instruments and ten minutes’) Brown does not clarify which aspects are ‘outside symphonic practice’, concentrating in the most part, just as the scholars mentioned above, on the row form and palindromic structure.

It is the question of the symphonic tradition that Ballantine endeavours to answer, as he suggests that, while

the two-movement work is at a technical level pure monism, built as it is on the implications of a single tone row [...] it unmistakably engages with the traditional symphonic ethic of musical dualism insofar as it is profoundly and uniquely involved with a polarity of Symmetry and Asymmetry.

What follows is, once again, an analysis of the structure in terms of the treatment of the row in which there is ‘a struggle against imbalance and asymmetry’, where ‘each section has some greater or lesser “fault”, which calls for a renewed attempt and so propels the music on into the next variation.’

This seeming preoccupation with the form of Webern’s Symphony is summarised concisely by Ballantine:

[t]here is no reason in principle why the dialectic should not make itself felt as, say, structure; why, that is, the music’s own form of coming into being should not be subject to countervailing demands or principles, and why


Ballantine, *Twentieth Century Symphony*, 194. How prevalent symmetry actually was in the music of the composers of the Second Viennese School is discussed in David J. Hunter and Paul T. von Hippel, “How Rare is Symmetry in Musical 12-Tone Rows?” *The American Mathematical Monthly* 110, no. 2 (Feb., 2003), 124–132. The authors demonstrate that although symmetrical rows were rare in Viennese twelve-tone music, they are far rarer in the universe of all row classes.

therefore the conflict should not realize itself as tensions internal to the music's own structural process.  

What this fixation appears to suggest, then, is that the traditional dialectic felt between ‘disjunct keys and themes’ in traditional symphonies, and the extra-musical meaning created by this dialectic, is not present in Webern’s work. The reason for this concentration by scholars on the technical aspects of Webern’s works seem to be a “tradition” of understanding Webern’s music as what critic Olin Downes described in a review in the New York Times as ‘the ultimate significance of nothing’.  

Even Brown, who, having written his overview of the Symphony in 2003, therefore had available to him interpretive techniques which were not available to the newspaper critic in 1929, claims that this work has ‘none of the overt Romanticism that informs Schoenberg’s Opus 9. Webern seems to have erased from his symphony the ghost of Gustav Mahler and the Viennese symphonic tradition’.  

It is this claim that the present study endeavours to overturn: that there is no “Viennese” quality to the Symphony, that it cannot be interpreted as a musically meaningful work, only as a technical exercise in unity and conciseness. ‘The music’, Busch suggests—although it is important to note she is not referring specifically to the Symphony, rather her thoughts are a general commentary on understanding Webern’s compositions—‘evidently seems to frighten people; at all events it does not make things easy for them. It has not become familiar, or at least not self-evident, even to experienced interpreters’. Busch also comments that while traditional musical concepts were important to Webern, appearing consistently throughout his writings on his works (for example The Path to New Music), musicologists have shied away from regarding the music as in any way traditional. This is possibly one of the most overlooked sources available for the argument that, rather than Webern’s music being revolutionary, in fact it is steeped in tradition. It has been noted by Peter Stadlen, a pianist who studied Webern’s Op. 27 with the composer, that, in The Path to New Music, Webern describes the journey towards twelve-tone composition as a progression in line with tradition. It was not a sudden

---

597 Ibid., 186.
rebellion against tradition, just the next step along the path.\textsuperscript{601} It was the essence of the collapse in meaning in Freud’s uncanny: ‘that class of the frightening which leads back to what is known of old and long familiar.’\textsuperscript{602} The unfamiliar musical language, which Busch claims frightens people, lies over Classical foundations: the sonata, and theme and variations.

This analysis seeks to rectify the misapprehension described by Busch through a topical narrative, a type of analysis based on conventional, long-established signs. It investigates the theme of reversal within the Symphony presented on three different levels in an analysis similar to that of \textit{Pelleas und Melisande} in the previous chapter. These levels are, first, the structure of the movements; second, the topical narrative; and third, an exploration of how the work follows, simultaneously, the external referential paths set out by Mahler and Strauss, and the psychological turn inwards explored by Schoenberg. The formal analysis establishes the foundation of the argument, discussing the ways in which the Symphony slips between traditional and new paths in its construction. It will then be demonstrated how the topics interact with the structure and each other to form a narrative in which traditional significations are upturned to form oxymoronic topics such as the urban pastoral in the second movement. The individual explorations of these domains then combine with a social and cultural exploration positing that the binary oppositions between society and nature espoused by Mahler and Strauss are still present in combination with the expression of the inner psyche from Schoenberg’s “New Music”, as the unfamiliar musical language represses, or hides, the familiar traditional forms and social issues.

5.2. \textbf{a. Form}

\textbf{First Movement}

The first movement of the Symphony is in sonata form, which Bailey suggests follows the binary outline of the Classical form as both sections, the exposition and the development/recapitulation, are repeated.\textsuperscript{603} However, the formal expectations are subverted, as the tonal identity does not follow the traditional course—that is, the exposition ends away from the tonic and the recapitulation returns to it. In

\begin{itemize}
  \item\textsuperscript{601} Peter Stadlen, “The Webern Legend”, \textit{The Musical Times} 101, no. 1,413 (Nov. 1960): 695.
  \item\textsuperscript{602} Freud, “The Uncanny”, 218–219.
  \item\textsuperscript{603} Bailey, \textit{The Twelve-note Music of Anton Webern}, 163.
\end{itemize}
Webern’s rendition, the row series of the exposition, bars 1–26, repeats exactly in the recapitulation, bar 42 to the end. Hence, although this piece cannot be discussed in terms of traditional tonality, the comparative structural system, i.e. the row order, does not return to the “tonic” when the second theme is recapitulated; instead, it retains the transposition pattern of the exposition. That Webern may have intended this analogy with tonality is addressed by Busch:

The title originated with Schoenberg, yet with a variant: ‘Composition with 12 Notes’. In his 1932 lectures, Webern continued to speak of composition in 12 notes. This enabled him to create in his listeners’ minds the connexion with a conception of music into which the new methods of composing could also be seamlessly incorporated. [...] One might say even one with some degree of concreteness, insofar as this spatial conception enables the ‘concrete’ musical experience of music that ‘is in C major’ to be communicated by analogy.604

Further, as noted in the chapter introduction, Arnold Whittall confirms that ‘all three [Schoenberg, Berg, and Webern] used terminology suggesting that they needed to project the new developments against a tonal background: they tended to refer to the Prime as “T” (tonic) and the transposition of the basic series at the tritone—not at the perfect fifth—as “D” (dominant).605

Bailey also identifies two other departures from the Classical form: the use of the canon, which tends to be associated with the development rather than the exposition, and the difference between the melodic material of the exposition and the recapitulation.606 The two are usually melodically similar; however, while the row structure here is an exact replica, the musical material is different. The exposition’s themes are also presented unconventionally in that, as Bailey puts it, ‘Webern has rotated the exposition ninety degrees, so that events one customarily encounters in succession in this section occur simultaneously instead’.607 The two themes share the exposition, as Canon I and Canon II, the first utilising more lyrical material, while the second uses shorter notes and angular phrases with pizzicato and staccato markings.

607 Bailey, The Twelve-note Music of Anton Webern, 166.
Bailey recognises that the conclusion that this piece is in sonata form is not universally recognised; other scholars have presented it as ternary, or described it as ‘structural variation’. However, while the musical material is superficially different, when looked at closely it is only a rhythmic diminution and textural augmentation of the original material (Example 5.4). As such, although this demonstration of the similarities confirms Bailey’s assertion that the movement is structured in sonata form, it disagrees with her conclusion as to how much Webern altered it.

Example 5.4: Motivic Similarities in Bars 1–26 and 43–end. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/i.

Theme 1: bb. 1–6.

Theme 2: bb. 3–7.

Theme 1 and 2: bb. 44–47.

609 Ibid.
The row form of the recapitulation is only one of the ways in which the Symphony’s first movement differs from traditional sonata form; the movement’s development is also significant. In *Fundamentals of Musical Composition*, Schoenberg discusses the nature of the development, which he terms the elaboration or *Durchführung*: 610

The elaboration is essentially modulatory, and for very good reasons. [...] In the exposition, though some parts modulate and others express a (related) contrasting tonality, apart from transitions, everything stands solidly within the region of definite tonality. In other words, the harmony is essentially stable. This requires a different kind of contrast in the elaboration. 611

Schoenberg then lists examples of contrasts between the exposition and the elaboration, most of which are based on tonal modulations but also include rhythmic features, thematic material, structure and length. What is clear is that the traditional development section, as Schoenberg would have taught it to Webern, tends towards instability and lacks ruling features other than that it contrasts with the stable exposition.

This is possibly the most significant way in which Webern has reinterpreted sonata form in the Symphony. The development (bars 26–42) is an extremely strict symmetrical structure, not the unstable ‘working out’ which Schoenberg describes in his essay. Consisting of a pair of mirrored canons, one of prime rows and one of inverted rows, all four voices are identical with respect to rhythm and segmentation (Example 5.5). These are set within a palindrome, which pivots between the last quaver of bar 34 and the first quaver of 35. Therefore, the development acts independently from the rest of the Symphony. Other than one of the rows corresponding with the last row of Canon II (P11), so that there is a continuation in some form from the exposition to the development, the palindrome structures the section into a self-contained module ending with a general pause on the bar line preceding bar 46. This is a reversal of the function of the traditional development, and forms the basis of the topical analysis. In that later section, it will be suggested

610 Schoenberg’s choice of the term ‘elaboration’ rather than development stems from his conviction that ‘[development] suggests germination and growth which rarely occur. The thematic elaboration and modulatory ‘working out’ (*Durchführung*) produce some variation, and place the musical elements in different contexts, but seldom lead to the ‘development’ of anything new’ (Schoenberg, 1967, 206).

that the implication of perpetuity in a section removed from the rest of the movement is analogous with the ostinati in Schoenberg’s Opp. 15 and 16, and *Pelleas und Melisande*, signifying Freud’s repressed hypnoid, or second, state.

*Example 5.5: “Melodic Line” Formed from Row. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/i, bb. 25–35.*
Second Movement

The second movement is a theme and variations form, the theme of which is the first time the prime row is played by one instrument, in this case clarinet. The structure of the movement corresponds to Schoenberg’s description of a theme and variations movement in *Fundamentals* in that the theme is ‘simple’ and ‘consists of closely related motive-forms’.

These small motives (labelled a–d, illustrated in Example 5.6), can be seen in various states of development throughout the seven variations. However, the Symphony differs from the traditional variations form in one significant sense. In his lecture of 1932, Webern stated that the theme and variations is as close to total unification as is possible, containing not just thematic, but also serial and formal unity:

The second movement of my Symphony (Op. 21, written in 1928). It's peculiar in that the second half is the cancrizan of the first. This is a particularly intimate unity. So here there are only 24 forms, since there are a corresponding number of identical pairs. In the accompaniment to the theme the cancrizan appears at the beginning. The first variation is in the melody a transposition of the row starting on C. The accompaniment is a double canon. Greater unity is impossible. Even the Netherlander didn't manage it. In the fourth variation there are constant mirrorings. This variation is itself the midpoint of the whole movement, after which everything goes backwards. So the entire movement is itself a double canon by retrograde motion.

The unity, or to use Schoenberg's word, 'comprehensibility' of the Symphony is akin, in Webern’s opinion, to Goethe’s *Urpflanze*—the primeval plant in which ‘the root is in fact no different from the stalk, the stalk no different from the leaf, and the leaf no different from the flower: variations on the same idea’. In the same way as the development of the first movement’s sonata form deviates from the Classical convention, so too the inherent unity of Webern’s variations departs from the essentially paratactic tradition outlined by Sisman and Schoenberg. Sisman equates variation form to the oratory style parataxis. She contrasts the ‘fragmented,
“chopped up” paratactic style with the ‘rounded’ hypotactic, or periodic style.\textsuperscript{615} Hernstein Smith categorises these opposing styles through the internal connections among the variation segments. She writes that

> When repetition is the fundamental principle of thematic generation, the resulting structure will tend to be \textit{paratactic}; that is, the coherence of the poem will not be dependent on the sequential arrangement of its major thematic units. In a non-paratactic structure [...] the dislocation or omission of any element will tend to make the sequence as a whole incomprehensible or will radically change its effect. In paratactic structure, however, [...] thematic units can be omitted, added, or exchanged without destroying the coherence or effect of the poem’s thematic structure.\textsuperscript{616}

Thus, the Symphony’s second movement is not paratactic; if one section is removed the palindrome is compromised and the movement becomes structurally incomprehensible. The cohesive substance of the conventional variations form is only thematic, unlike the tonal and thematic comprehensibility of structures such as the sonata form. Rosen argues that, in the nineteenth century, Classical forms, including the variation form, took on features of the sonata, such as the integrity of both the harmonic and thematic structure.\textsuperscript{617} Consequently, rather than the paratactic, ‘abstract model of variation form’ of the Classical period, Webern references the Romantic form of works such as Beethoven’s \textit{Appassionata} sonata, Op. 57.\textsuperscript{618}

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{615} Elaine Sisman, \textit{Haydn and the Classical Variation} (London: Harvard University Press, 1993), 8.
\item \textsuperscript{617} Charles Rosen, \textit{The Classical Style: Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven} (New York: Norton, 1972), 438.
\item \textsuperscript{618} Sisman, \textit{Haydn and the Classical Variation}, 10.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}

This radical digression from tradition parallels Samuel Taylor Coleridge and Hegel’s development of idealism and organicism in the nineteenth century. In her article “The Living Work”, Ruth Solie reviews the advancement of biological philosophy over mechanistic thought, noting that this ‘particular manifestation of idealism places much emphasis on the transcendence of the multifarious, diverse substances of the apparent world in a higher and unified reality’. Solie describes a reorientation of philosophical consideration, from the prevalence of the ‘part-to-whole construction of the world’ hypothesis in pre-Romantic times, to one in which ‘the whole is primary

619 German Idealism began with Kant’s *Critique of Pure Reason* (1781), and was taken up by philosophers such as G.W.F Hegel, Johann Fichte, Friedrich Schelling and Arthur Schopenhauer.

and its constituent parts derived therefrom. The Symphony's unified departure from paratacticism, then, encompasses Coleridge's concept of the organism:

The difference between an inorganic and organic body lies in this: In the first [...] the whole is nothing more than a collection of the individual parts or phenomena ... while in the second, the whole is everything, and the parts are nothing [...] Depend on it, whatever is grand, whatever is truly organic and living, the whole is prior to the parts.

Therefore, despite the superficial difference of the sections, each variation connects to another, revolving around the pivot point at bar 50 (Figure 5.2). Variation five is the retrograde of variation three; six is the retrograde of two; and seven of one. Variation four is the only one which is not obviously symmetrical, using a subtler type of palindrome, but it does contain the pivot point. Instead, there is an intimate pitch relationship between P0 and I3 in which the reversal takes place on two levels. The pairs of notes in the rows remain intact and operate as units as shown in Figure 5.2. Bailey explains how this is significant, stating that

in the outer tetrachords, the units appear in reverse order in the answering row, while the internal order of their elements is unaltered. Conversely, the order of the units within the central tetrachord is the same in both rows, but the internal order of their members is reversed. At no point in the row do both levels reverse simultaneously. Thus none of the tetrachords is answered by its exact retrograde; this is prevented by the maintenance of the original ordering at one level or the other.

The whole is therefore an integral network of connections rather than the linear thematic variations of old, which makes it, in Coleridge's, Goethe's and Webern's eyes, truly organic.

*Figure 5.2: Pitch Row Order of Variation IV. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/ii.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P0</th>
<th>A F#</th>
<th>G Ab</th>
<th>E F</th>
<th>B Bb</th>
<th>D C#</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I3</td>
<td>C Eb</td>
<td>C Eb</td>
<td>D C#</td>
<td>F E</td>
<td>Bb B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

621 Ibid., 150.
5.2.b. Topic Analysis

First Movement
The exposition begins with the Nachtmusik topic, signified by the low range of the instruments and the scarcity with which they are used. The higher violin and clarinet are employed only briefly in each canon, and again use only low pitches. The melodic movement is slow and steady, like footsteps, which, combined with the pizzicato technique, could suggest the ombra topic; however, with the absence of sul ponticello technique and with the utilisation of a horn call as the melodic base of the first canon signification veers more towards the pastoral. This could suggest a location, similar to the way in which Schoenberg used the ombra topic in his Opp. 16 and 17 to signify dark forests, which without the ombra signifiers may now have become the mountains so important to Webern. In Freud’s Interpretation of Dreams, the psychoanalyst suggests that ‘many of the landscapes seen in dreams, especially those that contain bridges or wooded mountains, may be readily recognized as descriptions of [female] genitals’, and therefore signify the castration complex. In his analysis of the second movement of the Symphony, Johnson emphasises the signification of nature throughout the theme and variations, which he then associates with the gravesites of Webern’s parents, citing the evidence that Webern was visiting the sites in Schwabegg when the pieces were written. The overwhelming effect of the Nachtmusik topic is a sense of space and stillness, which, combined with the enclosed row progression, creates an environment at

624 Freud, The Interpretation of Dreams, 356.
once infinite and static, but which is opposed by the use of the two canons. This environment might be held to emulate Webern’s mountain climbing experiences: Moldenhauer notes that Webern’s ambition when climbing ‘was not for conquest; he wished only to immerse himself in the wonders of nature and in the stillness of the heights’.  

The Nachtmusik topic also has darker connotations of mourning, as seen in Mahler’s “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n” from Kindertotenlieder and “Der Schildwache Nachtlied” from Des Knaben Wunderhorn. Hence, this topic acts multivalently; the mountains and graves are signified simultaneously, as are the notions of time eternal and the finality of death. There is also, according to Schreffler, a third level evoking Webern’s religious beliefs: ‘a pantheistic piety that blended elements of Lutheranism and nature worship with his native Catholicism, were never closely associated with an institutional church’. Moreover, Schreffler notes, Webern drew religious inspiration from musical and literary sources more than theological ones, for example the folk poetry of Rosegger, which, while relegated to anthologies of children’s literature after the Second World War, was at the time respected in literary circles. A recurring theme within Rosegger’s stories is that of God represented in nature. In Mein Himmelreich, Rosegger exclaims:

I would still have found such a tightly knit, unified world of belief upon the awakening of my reason. And if I had not encountered something like this, no church, no pulpit, no altar, no pious mother and no father to point me to God, I believe that I would still have believed from the depths of my being. I imagine that for example the flower, the storm, the stars in the heavens, the mountains, the sea, the entire world-essence life!

---

626 Schreffler, “Mein Weg geht jetzt vörüber,” 320.
627 Ibid., 325.
This would certainly resonate with Webern’s idea of nature, as set out by Julian Johnson, and would further polarise the dichotomy between the idyllic mountainside and the Vienna metropolis. Schreffler, here citing Dean Garrett Stroud, explains that

God’s presence in nature, according to Rosegger, is revealed most immediately and purely on the mountain peaks [...] The mountain excursions that figure so prominently in his stories represent the voyage into the soul, in which “the mountain represents the goal of the journey, and [...] serves as the place where union with the Divine is most likely to take place.”

The diminution of the rhythmic values from bar 13 onwards, however, begins to move against the static nature of the Nachtmusik topic as it increases the temporal movement, while at the same time the tempo markings—calando (bars 17 and 19) and ritardando (bar 23)—attempt to reduce the temporal movement. This appears to create a restrictive atmosphere, similar to that produced by the instrumentation constraints in the Op. 16 Fünf Canons, discussed in the final case study.

Once again, then, there is a reversal at play within the topical narrative. The temporal movement of the second half of the exposition only appears to create restrictions that have actually been present throughout the entire 26 bars. These constrictions take the form of the learned style, signified by the canonic structure. The learned style acts similarly here as when Webern employs it in his Op. 16 (shown later), as it is placed in opposition to the pastoral topic. The learned style, and particularly the strict style subtopic, connotes both the church and the adherence to laws. Therefore, the perpetuity implicated by the Nachtmusik topic and the repetition of the exposition is reversed by the structured canons of the themes, effectively overturning the signification of the strict style. Hence, Webern integrated the signified “church”, the goal-led restrictive style, with the signified “nature”, containing signifiers which connote space, stillness, expansion and perpetuity; therefore, to all intents and purposes, reversing both significations to include the other. Tom Service echoes George Benjamin’s thoughts that there is a ‘sense of stasis in this first movement of the Symphony, the uncanny feeling that time is not moving like an unstoppable arrow, but rather softly expanding and exploding in all

directions, like the growth of a crystal—or [...] a snowflake’. The atmosphere of “expansion” ironically causes the Nachtmusik canons to act similarly to the ostinati in Schoenberg’s works to signify the hypnoid state and, subsequently, the notion of the double consciousness, or unconscious. Freud states that if something is ‘withdraw[n] from knowledge, it becomes unconscious’, it is repressed. In the above quotation, Busch suggests that the traditional musical concepts (such as form) are not “self-evident”, but hidden by the unfamiliar musical language, withdrawn from the surface and therefore repressed.

The a tempo in the second time bar, bar 25, signals the beginning of the development and the apparent temporary relaxation of the restraints. The canonic entries are closer together, the dotted semibreve entries, based on theme one, begin only a bar apart, the high violin line causing dissonances alien from the calm stillness of the exposition. Where the exposition entries were always on a crotchet beat, the entries here are often on the second or sixth quaver of the bar, adding syncopation to the sensation of movement initiated by the shorter canonic intervals and dissonances—a movement swiftly arrested by a silent pause at bar 34. The closer entries turn the long notes into drones, which underscore birdcall figures and grace notes in the harp, clarinet and strings. This suggests that the pastoral is still dominant, but with brighter allusions than the previous Nachtmusik. The pivot point at bars 34–35 is an example of Cherlin’s uncanny “time-shard”. A steady pulse stream in a musically static environment—in this case, in between two pauses—it is, Cherlin writes, ‘the ghostly presence of the way time “used to go”’, referring to the teleological characteristic of Classical music, and therefore referencing the music not only from the previous bars, but also from an earlier tradition. The ombra signifiers also present here, the low cello and harp notes, the grace notes, and the triple pianissimo dynamic marking, confirms the time shard as a signifier of the uncanny topic.

The row form is also worthy of note here as each row follows the same rhythmic pattern, creating a strictly imitated melodic line. This appears contrary to the idea of this section as a development of bars 1–24 as it is far stricter than the

---

previous section, where developments are usually unfettered and unstable, as seen in previous case studies where the *tempesta* topic has been utilised, for example, Mahler’s Fourth and Seventh Symphonies. However, in each of these the unstable topic has juxtaposed a stable, goal-oriented topic like the military topic, which in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony dominated the *tempesta* signifiers. This, combined with the tonal progression—leading traditionally, albeit on a winding path, to the tonic of the first theme—formed an extended transitory period leading to the recapitulation. As discussed above, however, this development section is an enclosed unit in which two stable topics, the strict style and the pastoral, are juxtaposed.

Although the second eight bars of the development are the retrograde of the first eight bars, the topic alters slightly. The pastoral topic now incorporates the allusions to the *ombra* topic absent from the first half of the movement, caused initially by the *ombra* signifiers of bars 34–35 colouring the subsequent material, but also because of the placement of the grace notes. In order for the grace notes to appear before the main note, the pitches of the two notes affected are swapped. This means that, rather than a long low note ending on a higher pitch, an elevation which lightens the mood of the musical material, there now appears a short high note that drops quickly to a lower long note (clarinet, bb.32 and 37; violin II, bb. 32–33, 36–37), an action which invokes an anticipatory mood of anxiety or dread. This change is emphasised by the addition of staccato accents to the quavers, giving them a harsher quality. The gradual metamorphosis into the *ombra* topic continues in the four bar transition, bars 42–46, which introduces harmonics, *forte-piano* dynamics and an A minor stretto chord unexpectedly resolving onto a high C# triple *pianissimo* quaver in the harp. At bar 46 the *ombra* topic is fully manifested, signified by harmonics, *sforzando* and *forte-piano* and *forte* dynamics, high range orchestration, and dissonant chords. The alpine horn call is now brash, with no mute and a *forte* dynamic marking, and the bird song is peppered with grace notes and harmonics, and *is* muted, therefore subtly altering the signification from a bright, spacious pastoral to a harsh, subdued unstable hunt. The retrograde of the movement therefore reverses the signification of the topics (Table 5.1). What seem to be small alterations in articulation and technique produce substantial changes in signification. The pivot acts as a turning point between the conscious and the unconscious, signified by the double coding of the various inflections of the pastoral topic.
Table 5.1: Topical and Formal Structure of Webern’s Symphony Op. 21.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>bb. 1–24</th>
<th>25–32</th>
<th>34–35</th>
<th>36–41</th>
<th>42–45</th>
<th>46–end</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td>Development</td>
<td>pivot</td>
<td>Retrograde</td>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>Recapitulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strict Style</strong></td>
<td><strong>Strict Style</strong></td>
<td>Pastoral</td>
<td><strong>Ombra</strong></td>
<td>Pastoral</td>
<td><strong>Ombra</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nachtmusik</strong></td>
<td>Pastoral</td>
<td><strong>Ombra</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ombra</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ombra</strong></td>
<td>Hunt</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Second Movement
The chordal nature of the accompaniment and the slow, steady crotchet movement of the clarinet’s prime row statement suggest a recitative style, although one with a calm lyricism. The first variation takes the form of a mirrored canon played by the string quartet. The syncopation, alternating pizzicato and arco articulation, and grace notes combine with what Johnson termed the ‘light, tripping figures’ which, he claims, signify early spring.\(^{631}\) Certainly, it is the pastoral topic signified here, but Webern once again constrains it within an extremely strict structure associated firmly with the learned topic and therefore urbanity, rather than rurality. The simultaneity of these two topics could then be considered an “urban pastoral”, an oxymoron describing the employment of a “man-made” topic such as the learned style in a structural role within which pastoral musical signifiers have been utilised as musical material. The divergent nature of these topics is exploited in the second variation as a brash hunt topic takes over. All the instrumental voices here are palindromic, rotating around the beginning of bar 29, except the driving horn quavers, increasing the impression of moving forward after the previous two calmer topical fields. The hunt topic presented highlights the collision between the rural and urban topical associations, as it is not the chivalrous, noble atmosphere normally signified by the hunt that is suggested here, but a vulgar parody, ironically closer to an authentic hunt than the romanticised version traditionally symbolised.

At bar 34 an abrasive fanfare introduces the third variation and the *tempesta* topic, with the *forte* fanfares introducing the beginning and end of each row, all of which elide by two notes: 11/1, 12/2. Alternating between I3/RI3 and P6/R6, the palindrome pivots around bar 39 and a moment of stillness reminiscent of the uncanny topic at bars 34–35 in the first movement, which was the pivotal bar for the

\(^{631}\) Ibid., 201.
development's palindrome. The *tempesta* topic gives way at bar 45 to the fourth variation's waltz topic. This is the only variation which is not palindromic, but it does contain the palindromic centre of the piece at bar 50. Unlike the first movement, where the musical material and the row are in retrograde, the musical material from this point on is not the same as the first half. Some aspects of the previous variations remain intact—the horn standing apart from the palindrome in variations II and VI, and some of the motives are repeated in their original form—but the overall melodic material is unrecognisable to the listener.

The waltz topic of variation IV contrasts the previous *tempesta* topic with its slow lyricism, which Johnson asserts ‘relate[s rhythmically] directly to the Schwabegg pieces such as the slow movement of Op. 24’. In the example Johnson cites, from bars 19–22 of the Concerto, one can see the rhythmic similarities with the fourth variation of the Symphony, but, owing to the differences in articulation, dynamics and instrumentation the effect in the Concerto is quite forceful, almost aggressive, and therefore in stark contrast to the waltz seen here. Johnson proposes that the gravesites, and the surrounding landscape, were ‘the physical embodiment of a *Heimat* rooted in his family past’. It is interesting then that the waltz topic is used in this context, as its traditional association is with the cultured upper classes of the city and therefore carries urban rather than pastoral connotations. While slower and more lyrical than the usual Strauss waltz, possibly suggesting a wistful nostalgia, it still carries the double coding of the Viennese waltz seen in the previous chapter. Signifying the upper-class Viennese identity, the waltz also invokes the *Ländler*, associated with the low-class primitive Austrian peasant who is simultaneously idolised as happy and simple. This double signification of the waltz therefore epitomises the relationship between the elevated society and the brute peasantry, the yearning for the freedom of nature and the obligations inherent in being part of civilisation.

---

632 Ibid., 202. This piece, along with the Quartet Op. 22, and the String Quartet Op. 28 were written after Webern's visit to his parents' grave sites in Schwabegg and Annabichl in July 1928. In each of these works Webern sketched a programmatic outline in his sketchbook with references to the mountains and to these two places. The Symphony is not directly linked in the sketchbook to a particular place, however, there is a plan outlined, dated November–December 1927:
   I. Rondo: lively – sun
   II. Variations: moderately
   III. Free form: very calmly – moon.
The variations movement was completed in March 1928, four months before his visit, and in June he completed movement III, which was published as the first movement.

633 Ibid., 187.
In addition to the evocation of the double by the waltz topic, at the centre of the fourth variation there is a bar of repeated notes, another uncanny “time-shard”, used once again at the pivot point. Bailey demonstrates that although this bar appears to relax the strictness Webern has shown in the rest of the work, in actuality all of the notes except the central B♭ in the clarinet are in their proper place within the row (Example 5.7).

That this bar is contained within the only inaccurate palindromic variation is significant. As suggested by the second variation horn figures, the unconstrained line drives through the non-linear accompaniment, signifying a movement of some sort. Johnson posits that ‘the centre of the palindrome, the mystery of the fourth variation, transforms the nature imagery of the first half into the increasingly “abstract” journey of the second’. In the second variation, the movement is suggestive of the galloping hunting horse; here it implies a different type of journey, in which the musical narrative refocuses from the external world to the internal psyche.

*Example 5.7: Webern, Symphony Op. 21/ii, Variation IV, b. 50, from Bailey, The Twelve-Note Music of Anton Webern, 175.*

The tense ostinato of the fifth variation retrospectively confirms this uncanny narrative, and consists of accented staccato semiquavers overlaid with a cowbell-like triplet figure in the harp. In a 1932 letter to Adorno, Webern expressed his happiness that Adorno had interpreted these figures as such: ‘And when speaking of the harp passage in the fifth variation of my Symphony you interpret it as

---

“cowbells”, this image makes me extremely happy, because I gather from that you have rightly heard. The pastoral references in the ostinato, and the suspenseful atmosphere generated by the staccato and accent articulation of the repeated semiquavers, suggest that this is a signifier of the repression seen in the first movement, in which the signifieds “church” and “nature” collapsed into each other. It creates an impression of a tense atmosphere but includes signifiers traditionally associated with idyllic cowherds living simplistic lives. The tense mood of the fifth variation continues as the large leaps and sudden alterations in dynamics and rhythms echo the brash hunt topic, including the non-palindromic horn, of the second variation. The clarinets each play a row (I10 and P2) and then the retrograde of that row so that they are palindromes, but the horn has two rows which run simultaneously and are not palindromic. This is the retrograde of the second variation row series, in which the horn quavers alternate between I0 and P11 (Example 5.8).

Example 5.8: Horn Row Form. Webern, Symphony Op. 21/ii, Variation VI, bb. 63–73.


In this instance, however, the horn is not playing driving quavers, but rather the rhythm is unpredictable and unstable. The rests act as simultaneously anticipatory and restraining, in that the variation does not progress as a goal-oriented driving force, but nevertheless leads to variation VII, an inflected repeat of the first variation’s pastoral topic. Finally, the coda repeats the rows from the theme, P0/R0,

---

but neither the topic nor the motivic material is similar. Instead, a solo violin melody plays a lyrical line, more suggestive of a folksong than of a recitative. The absence of the canon in the coda is significant; the freedom from restriction combines with the simple folksong of the peasants, symbolising the return to the surface of the structure repressed throughout the movement. Bailey also claims significance for the simplistic coda in this way, positing that it is one of the only parts of the movement where it is likely the listener will hear the ‘ingeniously constructed’ palindrome without the benefit of a score:

To the listener is presented the most deceptively simple string of variations, each with its own distinctive instrumentation, rhythms, articulation, and so forth—features which do not recur in symmetrical fashion. The listener could never be expected to know that he is hearing a palindrome which encompasses the movement as a whole. [...]. He will hear the numerous small palindromes in [the] Variations [...] but will probably not hear any complete section as a palindrome until the Coda.  

Bailey describes the organic nature of this movement as she suggests that the parts are incomprehensible until they have all been heard: ‘the whole is everything, the parts are nothing’.  

The construction of the topical syntax means that individual topics are meaningless outside their context, whether that is within the narrative of one piece, or their position within the cultural context as a whole. However, until the whole narrative is realised, it is not entirely possible to understand the unifying qualities of the piece under the surface complexities. Bailey claims this impenetrable surface is ‘carefully contrived’ by Webern, as in some variations, such as Variation I, ‘it is unlikely that the listener will hear two mirror and retrograde canons in this variation because of his inability to comprehend the wealth of complex relationships which are exposed in a very short period of time’. In Variation V, on the other hand, the simplicity of the variation ‘entirely hides the real structure’. The ‘real structure’, or meaning, is therefore repressed beneath surface signifiers which act similar to a series of images in a dream, becoming clear only once analysed as a whole. Freud describes dreams in the same way, as a ‘rebus’, a series of

637 Coleridge, Table Talk, quoted in Solie, “The Living Work”, 150.
639 Ibid., 193.
‘hieroglyphics, whose symbols must be translated, one by one, into the language of dream-thoughts’. Once translated, these seemingly unconnected symbols are understood as a whole, just as, without an understanding of each variation’s structure and topical narrative, the topical meaning in Webern’s Symphony cannot be revealed.

5.2.c. Conclusion

Most analyses or descriptions of Webern’s Symphony, and indeed most of his works, concentrate on the technical compositional method, in this case the twelve-tone technique and his use of symmetry. Even Webern’s own comments on the work focus on the unifying element of the tone row and the thematic and formal connections which embody Goethe’s conceptual organicism. The superficiality of these analyses—the fact that they direct their attentions only to the surface functionality, without investigating the expressionistic quality of the works—is summed up by Brown, when he states that ‘Webern seems to have erased […] the Viennese symphonic tradition’. However, although Webern’s comments regarding the Symphony itself focus on its formal unity, the basis of the surrounding lectures is to situate the ‘new’ method within the compositional tradition of the Netherlanders and Classical composers.

Busch’s observation, that the music “frightened” listeners through its unfamiliarity, brings to light the aspect in which Webern’s music follows Viennese traditions, not only as set out by Webern’s mentor, Schoenberg, but also by Mahler and Strauss. The analysis of the three domains of form, topical narrative and Freudian methodologies have demonstrated that, although the Symphony is based in tradition, there are reversals at play, moments where there are twists on the conventions almost to the point of parody, particularly in the topical domain. In the first movement the sonata form is altered, with neither the ‘tonality’, the thematicism nor the use of canon following the Classical conventions. The exposition and first half of the development exhibits the multivalent properties of the integration of the strict and Nachtmusik topics, the infinite and the static signifying the amalgamation of the signifieds “church” and “nature” and the notion of the double. The narrative therefore encompasses commentaries from both Alt Wien and “New Music”. The ironic social narratives inherent in Strauss’s Die Fledermaus and Mahler’s Fourth

\[640\] Freud, The Interpretation of Dreams, 277.
\[641\] Brown, The Symphonic Repertoire, 883.
Symphony and *Des Knaben Wunderhorn* are present in the repression of intrusive reality on the civilised utopian ideal, while the psychoanalytical uncanny topic symbolises the repression of the very traditions Mahler and Strauss mocked, shown by the final tranquillity as the traditional structure is revealed in the coda. The second movement confirms the melding of these two narratives with the utilisation of the waltz/Ländler double at the pivot point of the variations. The topical meaning of the waltz, both as an Austrian dance and an upper class topic is double-coded with the Ländler signification. As the waltz developed from the Ländler, the lower-class dance is necessarily present simultaneously: the waltz is a Ländler that has entered civilisation. A waltz, in Freudian terms and in Webern’s hands, is always already a repressed Ländler.

5.3. “*A Bourgeois Manqué*”: Tonio Kröger in Webern’s String Trio, Op. 20

5.3.a. First Movement Form
The String Trio, written in 1926, was the first of the group of purely instrumental twelve-tone works which followed Webern’s exclusively vocal middle period. The composer originally intended the Trio to have three movements. However, like Opp. 21, 22 and 23, after struggling with the third movement he abandoned it and moved the slow second movement to the beginning. The published first movement was therefore written after the second; consequently, following Bailey’s hypothesis outlined in the previous case study, the prime row of the twelve-tone piece is the first row of the second movement. This trio has been subject to analyses of the pitch row by Haimo (1986) and Bailey (1991), both of whom set forth a ternary structure based on the row orders. Table 5.2 is taken from Bailey’s analysis in her book *The Twelve-note Music of Anton Webern*.

---

Table 5.2: Tertiary Structure of Webern’s String Trio, Movement 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Start</th>
<th>End</th>
<th>Structure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1–3</td>
<td>R4 P4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st Section</td>
<td>A: 4–10</td>
<td>I4 R19 R4 R11 I2 R18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B: 10–15</td>
<td>R3 R7 I8 P0 P7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A: 16–21</td>
<td>I4 R19 R4 R11 I2 R18 R3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd Section</td>
<td>C: 22–30</td>
<td>I10 P5 R16 I1 P6 P8 R8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C: 31–40</td>
<td>I10 P5 R16 I1 P6 P8 R8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>41–43</td>
<td>R4 P4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd Section</td>
<td>A: 44–51</td>
<td>I4 R19 R4 R11 I2 R18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B: 51–56</td>
<td>R3 R7 I8 P0 P7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A: 57–63</td>
<td>I4 R19 R4 R11 I2 R18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coda</td>
<td>64–65</td>
<td>P4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The significance of the abandoned third movement is touched upon by Julian Johnson as he explains the meaning the ABA form had to Webern. Not only does this form have symmetrical potential, a preference Webern is well known for, but also, Johnson suggests, ‘the tripartite structure delineates an essential transformative process, of an inward withdrawal from the material world in order to prepare a new spiritual outgoing’. The ABA structure presents on different levels within Webern’s compositions: in his unfulfilled attempts at three-movement works and in the structure of the individual movements, such as the first movement of the Trio. This, Johnson posits, ‘was for Webern the paradigm of art itself’.

It was definitive of art’s relation to nature. Art’s abstraction of nature was constituted in exactly this process, in a ‘death’ of external materiality by an inward transformation through which its spiritual content was redeemed from the contingency of the material. This is the root of Webern’s concern with the ABA forms from the Op. 1 onwards.

The notion of a spiritual withdrawal, suggested by Johnson, can be seen not only in the ternary structure of the first movement, but also by a topical analysis that illuminates the themes of the work as a whole. However, these themes reveal not

---

644 Ibid., 176–177.
the abstraction of art from nature, but rather the conflict between the artist and the bourgeois sensibilities of his society.

5.3.b. Topical Narrative
The three-bar introduction is an example of the ombra topic, signified by the pianissimo dynamics with muted strings, the drone in the violin part in bar 2 coupled with the low pizzicato footsteps in the cello and the use of harmonics throughout to evoke an unnatural, sinister atmosphere. When episode A begins as an upbeat to bar 5 the melancholic atmosphere persists, as the suspension with which this section begins signifies the sensibility topic. This manifestation of this topic is very similar to that in “Das obligate Rezitativ” from Schoenberg’s Op. 16, in that, although the suspension beginning the section is the only one within these six bars, the topic is signified through the quick crescendo-decrescendo dynamics, the offbeat entries and wide leaps (Example 5.9). The placement of the melody in the viola part adds to the melancholic atmosphere of this section that only brightens once it reaches episode B at bar 10.

Hence, there is an immediate juxtaposition of two opposing topics. Ombra precedes the sensibility topic, which traditionally signifies urban salon music. While both evoke a clear emotion, the first connotes wariness, a fear of the unknown, which in Schoenberg’s works indicated a forest at night and psychological anxiety, rather than a supernatural fear as in eighteenth-century compositions. The topic is also used in Op. 8, Zwei Lieder nach Gedichten von Rainer Maria Rilke. In the first song, “Du, der ich nichts sage”, repeated notes in the horn, a muted trumpet fanfare, sudden high storzando notes in the harp, and pizzicato and am Steg articulation in the cello all indicate the ombra topic in the same way as it is seen in the String Trio (Examples 5.9 and 5.10). The text confirms the topic as it continues “dass ich bei nacht weinend liege” (You, whom I am not telling that I lie crying at night).
Example 5.9: Webern, String Trio Op. 20/i, bb. 1–6.


This suggests that Webern is using the topic to exemplify inner turmoil in much the same way as Schoenberg. Two other examples of this (and the examples given here are not the only ones within Webern’s works) occur in the Passacaglia, Op. 1,
rehearsal figure 13, and *Sechs Lieder nach Gedichten von Georg Trakl*, Op. 14 “Abendland III”, bars 8–11. In the *Passacaglia*, the strings are instructed to play pizzicato, or *sul ponticello* when playing with the bow. The tempo is moderate, (crotchet = 58), and the rhythm mimics footsteps, similar to the rhythm played by the cello in the String Trio (bar 6). Either side of this topic, from figures 11–13 and figures 19–20, there are triplet ostinatos evoking a dream, linking these topics even more directly with the uncanny topic. The uncanny topic is also utilised in the Op. 14, as the *ombra* signifiers outlined above in the cello part are combined with an ostinato in the bass clarinet. These signifiers illustrate text that reads “Ihr weithin dämmern vom Ströme! / Gewaltig ängstet schaurige Abendröte im Sturmgewölk” (Your darkening currents! / Powerful travails in the terrible afterglow of the storm clouds), and which serve to confirm the presence of the uncanny topic.\textsuperscript{645}

*Example 5.11: Webern, Passacaglia Op. 1, Fig. 13, string parts only.*

\textsuperscript{645} Own translation.
The sensibility topic is, as mentioned above, associated with the chamber style and the upper classes or bourgeoisie. It expresses intimate sensitivity and passionate emotion. The allusion to the Lied suggested by the melody in the viola inflects the already emotive topic with German Romanticism, also connected with the bourgeois class, rather than the “older” rational upper class.

At bar 10 the tempo marking is ruhig (calmly), and in the viola at bar 11, sehr zart (very tender). This adds lightness to the driving staccato repeated-note figure enhancing the hunt topic, signified in particular by the repeated semiquaver to quaver figure that depicts a galloping horse. The grace notes, long glissandos and proliferation of major third intervals connote the pastoral topic, implying the hunting horse rather than the warhorse (Example 5.13).

The tempo marking Verlöschend (extinguishing) guides the narrative back to the melancholy, but less stable, return of the A material. By the third bar of this episode (bar 18) the rhythmic tempo increases to syncopated semiquavers which alternate between arco and pizzicato articulation, creating an atmosphere of instability and anxiousness which dissolves completely at bar 21, the Verlöschend tempo marking and the molto rit. emphasising the increased rests and the hesitancy evoked because of them.

The sensibility topic returns briefly at bar 22 as a short introduction to the C material, which is in the *Lied* style from bar 23, the accompaniment of which quickly metamorphoses into a folk song as the speed increases into light dance rhythms with grace notes, pizzicati and dotted rhythms. The *Lied* melody continues over this accompaniment, however passed to the viola and then cello, before returning to the violin at bar 30. The class differences highlighted in the first 16 bars are more prominent in this section as the bourgeois chamber styles are at the outset inflected with restless articulation and then further transmute into a low-class folk song.

This episode finishes at bars 29–30 with a palindrome, formed by an elision of rows P8 and R8, which also coincides with the centre of the movement’s structure and its temporal centre. The second C episode, bar 31, begins with a rhythmically similar pattern as bar 22, but with alterations in pitch, articulation and dynamics that also change the topical meaning. The low pitch, triple *pianissimo* dynamics without crescendo/decrecendo markings and the *am Steg* marking indicate the return of the *ombra* topic from the introduction. The brevity of the sensibility topic is also not repeated here as the *ombra* topic is extended through the next five bars. The cello melody of bars 32–33 evokes the first movement of Schoenberg’s Op. 16 and the quick demisemiquaver duplets with grace notes, harmonics, pizzicato articulation and *sforzando* and *sforzando-piano* markings provide a very different atmosphere to the previous manifestation of the C episode’s rows.

The darkness of the second section persists, becoming frantic as the *ombra* topic accelerates into the *tempesta* topic at bar 37 with stretto *forte-piano* entries, beginning with the high C# in the violin. This outburst lasts only 3 bars before dissolving into the third section’s introductory palindrome and the *ombra* topic.
Immediately the difference between the A material at bar 4 and here is apparent. The long falling glissando in the violin part is emphasised, as the minim is the second longest note in a piece populated mostly with semi- and demisemiquavers. The lyrical melody of the first section is missing and the increased use of pizzicato makes the episode less fluid than the chamber style sensibility topic would allow. When the B material re-enters at bar 51 the lightness of the hunt is also not restated. The tempo marking is now *lebhaft* rather than *ruhig* and the dynamics are mostly *sforzando-piano* and *forte*. In addition, the cello has a repeated A–D♭ figure which acts like a drone, suggesting this is now the *tempesta* topic. At bar 56 the tempo accelerates to the beginning of the final statement of the A material and a fervent statement of the *Lied* melody from bars 4–5. The tempo immediately slows to *leicht* and *ruhig*, indicating the return to the sensibility topic. The Coda ends with a chord made up of the last segment of row P4, which Bailey refers to as the “tonic” of the movement.

The conflict between the chamber topics and nature topics in the first half of the movement dissolves in the second half. The *ombra* topic is consumed by the *tempesta* topic, which also subsumes the sensibility and *Lied* styles. This topical narrative echoes that outlined in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony, where chamber styles are juxtaposed with nature topics to form a satirical view of the feeling of superiority over the lower classes and other nationalities evinced by the ‘socialites’ of Vienna. In this case, however, because of the internalisation of expression, it seems as if it is one character’s view of himself and his station in life. In this way, the narrative conforms to the themes often found in German literature at the turn of the century, particularly a selection of works by Thomas Mann. In the semi-autobiographical works *Buddenbrooks* (1901) and *Tonio Kröger* (1903), there is a feeling of general discontentment between the bourgeois, or upper class, and artists of all disciplines. The narrative outlined above mirrors the disparity the writer Tonio Kröger feels between his life as an artist and his life as a member of the bourgeoisie, what his friend describes as a ‘bourgeois on the wrong path, a bourgeois *manqué*’. His father, a consul, disapproves of his son’s career choice, and within himself, Tonio agrees with him, divulging that ‘nobody but a beginner imagines that he who creates

---

must feel'. In order to depict life adequately in art, he claims, one should be able to keep a safe distance from human experience, not something he feels he can do. His life, depicted by Mann in a series of episodes from childhood to adulthood, is consumed by the dislocation he feels in comparison with his peers, particularly his first loves, Hans and Inge. Tonio understands and mourns the differences between them; both of these characters are wealthy, blond, blue-eyed and popular. They are comfortable within their lives, preferring such pastimes as riding and dancing, not reading the emotion-filled play *Don Carlos*.

In *Buddenbrooks* this theme is exemplified by the relationship between Thomas Buddenbrook and his son, Hanno. Thomas is the upstanding businessman, his family having built up a good business over three generations. Hanno, on the other hand, follows his mother into music, a pastime his father does not approve of, much like Tonio Kröger’s father. This theme is exemplified by Mann’s employment of Wagner’s music, which Hanno is fascinated by but Thomas abhors. Wagner’s music is used in Mann’s stories, both in *Buddenbrooks* and *Tristan*, as a metaphor for emotionality and passion, that which is contrary to a rationalist’s way of life. In the first movement the themes are analogous with those outlined above; Tonio recognises the ambivalence of his nature, the clash between the bourgeois and the artist, and in his final letter to Lisbeta he acknowledges that this tension, his ‘bourgeois love of the human, the living and usual’ could be what makes his work better. Such similarities could be coincidental, particularly in view of the theory that there are only so many plots on which all stories are based. Christopher Booker explores this hypothesis in his book *The Seven Basic Plots: Why We Tell Stories*, in which he outlines seven storylines which, while they are ultimately related to deeper thematics, at first sight appear quite distinct from one another. Within Booker’s scheme, *Tonio Kröger’s* closest fit is with the ‘Comedy’ plot, the resolution of the protagonist’s conflict through clarification and recognition. While the generic nature of Booker’s premise can explain the similarities found between the first movement of the String Trio and *Tonio Kröger*, the topics which unfold within the second movement of the trio can be compared with specific events within the short story and therefore show a marked correlation, rather than mere commonalities. It is important to note, however, that, as with previous analyses, there is no suggestion

---

647 Ibid., 96.
648 Ibid., 131; Christopher Booker, *The Seven Basic Plots: Why We Tell Stories* (London: Continuum, 2004), 7.
649 Booker, *The Seven Basic Plots*, 7.
that there is necessarily a direct causal relationship between the String Trio and *Tonio Kröger*, simply that a comparison between these two pieces of work constitutes a useful interpretive tool. Nevertheless, the specific proximities between *Tonio Kröger* and the String Trio are so striking that I believe it enlightening to speak of them in harness.

### 5.3.3. Second Movement Form

In the preface to his collection of short stories, *Stories for Three Decades*, Thomas Mann professes that music had an influence on his art:

> Here [in *Tonio Kröger*] probably I first learned to employ music as a shaping influence in my art. The conception of epic prose-composition as a weaving of themes, as a musical complex of associations, I later on largely employed in *The Magic Mountain*. Only that there the verbal leitmotiv is no longer, as in *Buddenbrooks*, employed in the representation of form alone, but has taken on a less mechanical, more musical character, and endeavours to mirror the emotion and the idea.\(^650\)

H.A. Basilius and Calvin S. Brown have both produced studies on how musical form affects literary prose, highlighting particularly the use of leitmotiv and the way in which a narrative can be structured similarly to musical sonata form. In these literary analyses, in concurrence with other scholars’ studies (a more complete review of which can be found in Basilius’s 1944 article), Wagner’s influence has been cited as the major catalyst of musical integration into literary prose.\(^651\) Throughout the short story, certain repetitions have been highlighted and demonstrated to have an influence on the structure of the story; Brown, for example, examines the short repetitions of the description of Tonio’s father:

> The first is, to all appearances, merely a physical description: the father was ‘a tall, carefully dressed man with thoughtful blue eyes, who always wore a wild flower in his buttonhole’. This formula is repeated when Mann speaks of the father’s death; and when Tonio, a literary man of note, lives in large cities, but finds no joy of heart there, it is suggested that perhaps his heredity from this identically-described father is responsible. Finally,

---

\(^650\) Mann, *Stories of Three Decades*, Preface, vi.

when Tonio revisits his home (now a library), he thinks of his father in these same terms. Through these repetitions the motive gradually comes to stand for the bourgeois element both in the father and in Tonio.\textsuperscript{652}

Smyth uses the leitmotiv of music itself in his chapter on music as metaphor, suggesting that at every key moment in Tonio’s artistic evolution, music plays a crucial role. Hence, Smyth writes, ‘the music both enables and represents life and love—precisely those experiences from which Tonio has come to feel cut off’.\textsuperscript{653}

In Brown’s opinion, the presence of leitmotiv is not usual in a piece in sonata form, the structure set forth by both Brown and Basilius, and he therefore identifies that the repeated passages which form the four sections of the sonata are ‘necessarily somewhat long’, hence his identification of the shorter leitmotivs as exemplified above. It is in this regard that Basilius’s earlier article expands upon the themes of the novella, rather than concentrating solely on the repetitive leitmotiv.

The core of the Novelle is the opposition of the two themes ‘I am artist’, [...] and ‘I am bourgeois’. [...] One ‘hears’ the opposition and eventual resolution of these two themes presented in terms of a statement, followed by a digression, followed in turn by a restatement of the original statement [...] and, as Mann manipulates it, it assumes the character of the most highly developed of the ternary forms, that of the \textit{sonata-allegro} with its sequence of exposition-development-recapitulation.\textsuperscript{654}

Basilius identifies the winter setting and the dismissal of school as the introduction; the principal theme is, he posits, a three-part song revolving around Don Carlos, which acts as a metaphor for the relationship between Tonio and Hans. The subordinate theme deals with the unrequited love triangle between Tonio, Inge and Magdalena, which leads to an introspection on happiness, the principal material returning as Tonio remembers Hans and his lack of loyalty to the boy. The development encompasses the conversation between Tonio and Lisabeta, with the recapitulation once again taking the form of a three-part song ‘revolving about a literary figure, only that now the literary figure is the successful artist Tonio’. Finally,

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{654} Basilius, “Thomas Mann’s Use of Musical Structure”, 289–290.
\end{flushleft}
the coda consists of the letter to Lisabeta concluding with 'a restatement of the beautiful perfect cadence which closed the principal theme of the exposition'.

Although there is no evidence that Webern’s String Trio was written with this story in mind, there are immediate, and striking, similarities between the literary structure outlined above and the musical structure of the Trio’s second movement. This movement is in sonata form, established by Kathryn Bailey’s row analysis, which can be seen in Table 5.3. However, without an analysis of the meaning of the musical material itself, in this case using topic analysis, the similarities are coincidental at best. The following topical narrative of the second movement demonstrates that the plot of the movement follows closely that set out by Basilius.

Table 5.3: Sonata Form of Webern’s String Trio Op. 21/i.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>1–9</th>
<th>-P0</th>
<th>I9</th>
<th>R5</th>
<th>I6</th>
<th>RI3</th>
<th>P11</th>
<th>P1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 1</td>
<td>10–26</td>
<td>P0</td>
<td>P5</td>
<td>RI2</td>
<td>P1</td>
<td>R6</td>
<td>R6</td>
<td>R0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>26–40</td>
<td>P6</td>
<td>I11</td>
<td>I6</td>
<td>P1</td>
<td>P3</td>
<td>RI8</td>
<td>P7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 2</td>
<td>40–59</td>
<td>P9</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>R7</td>
<td>P11</td>
<td>RI4</td>
<td>I5</td>
<td>I3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing</td>
<td>60–73</td>
<td>RI8</td>
<td>RI8</td>
<td>I6</td>
<td>P9</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>78–83</td>
<td>RI1</td>
<td>P8</td>
<td>RI1</td>
<td></td>
<td>I1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>84–94</td>
<td>RI11</td>
<td>P10</td>
<td>RI2</td>
<td>RI4</td>
<td></td>
<td>R6</td>
<td>I11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>94–102</td>
<td>P10</td>
<td>R5</td>
<td>RI6</td>
<td>RI5</td>
<td>RI0</td>
<td>R0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>102–118</td>
<td>R10</td>
<td>P3</td>
<td>I0</td>
<td>P7</td>
<td>RI3</td>
<td>I4</td>
<td>I2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recapitulation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 1</td>
<td>118–130</td>
<td>P0</td>
<td>P5</td>
<td>RI2</td>
<td>P1</td>
<td>R6</td>
<td>R6</td>
<td>R0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>131–144</td>
<td>P6</td>
<td>I11</td>
<td>I6</td>
<td>P1</td>
<td>P3</td>
<td>RI8</td>
<td>P7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing</td>
<td>163–174</td>
<td>P2</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>R0</td>
<td>P4</td>
<td>RI9</td>
<td>I10</td>
<td>I8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coda</td>
<td>175–179</td>
<td>P6</td>
<td>I6</td>
<td>I4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[655\] Ibid., 290–295.
5.3.d. Topical Narrative

Exposition: The ‘fair and living' conflict

The second movement opens with the Nachtmusik topic, although it is inflected with the tempesta topic. The ethereal atmosphere is provided by the pervasive harmonics and pizzicato articulation, the slow tempo and the expression marking sehr getragen und ausdrucksvoll. Even the rows create an encompassing atmosphere, although not one aurally perceptible, as Webern uses segmented layering. In other words, each 1–2 bar section has its own row, creating moments in time rather than the linearity of the usual row form (Example 5.14).


This helps to create a mood or depict an environment in which the second movement can take place, perhaps the twilit streets of Tonio’s hometown when he returns in his thirties. The ‘dusky, dreamily familiar streets’ onto which Tonio alights are wreathed in thick smoke, the town full of ‘narrow gables’ and ‘pointed towers peering above the roofs close at hand’, which he spies before walking on, while remarking that ‘everything is so little and close together here’. His mood is dark, although not for a reason he can readily understand. It leads him to silence: ‘Hush, hush, only no talk. Only don’t make words!’ The ‘dusky, dream[y]’ Nachtmusik signifiers are combined with sudden dynamic changes and a denser timbre that signify the tempesta topic and Tonio’s dark mood as he paces through the damp

656 Mann, Death in Venice and Other Stories, 107.
657 Ibid., 107.
wind, which gradually becomes more prominent over bars 5–7 as the tempo accelerates and becomes more contrapuntal, until at bar 8 it is the primary topic.

This dominance is brief, however, as at bar 10 the sensibility topic accompanies the first theme’s material. Signified by the unresolved suspensions of the first three bars and the tender atmosphere of the theme and accompaniment style, the sensibility topic is inflected by allusions to the waltz. Although written in a duple meter, the rhythm of the accompaniment is almost exclusively triplet crotchets, with a rest on the first crotchet. This mimics the oom-pah-pah accompaniment rhythm of a Viennese waltz. Moreover, traditionally Strauss II often wrote a four-bar introduction, which can be seen here from bars 10–13 as the prime row is formed into two suspensions, the statement of which leads to the waltz’s melody at bar 14. These four bars are retrospectively confirmed as the introduction as, at the recapitulation of the first theme at bar 118, the prime row is incorporated into the drone at the end of the development and the first theme begins with an inverted version of the C–B–C♯ upbeat. This could be significant on two levels, one musical, and the other literary. The four-bar introduction could mean that it is a quotation of a waltz rather than just a generic waltz-like passage. This would suggest that Webern was making a deliberate attempt to signify something specifically, whether Strauss himself, aristocratic balls, Vienna or Viennese identity, or merely the bourgeoisie, as was seen in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony. As a literary device, the introduction may act as a change in circumstances, like a change of scene in a film. The location has been set; now the main character/love interest/thematic materials are introduced.

The transition disrupts the tender waltz with a mechanical ostinato-like triplet figure, which itself is interrupted by strident fanfares at bar 31 and the dissolution of the waltz into the tempesta topic, although allusions to the waltz are still present at bars 36–37. The tempesta topic is traditionally used in the transition, being an unstable, but driving topic and therefore a useful link between the stable themes. The ostinato, on the other hand, is not traditionally used here; as a very static topic, it is not well suited for a transitory section. The sensibility-inflected waltz, and the emotive Lied at bar 41, represent the romantic sub-themes of Tonio Kröger, particularly the first theme waltz as it conjures the image of his dance with Inge, which ends badly as he embarrasses himself by dancing the female part of the
dance. That this is the source of his angst is suggested by the subsequent ostinato transition that signifies the unconscious. In the same way as the waltz represents Inge, the percussive section, which could signify the more masculine side of nature, could represent Hans, the soft feminine signifiers of the flowing pastoral having been replaced by a mechanical image of it, similar to Hans’s enthralment in the technologically advanced pictures of horses.

The transition leads to a leisurely second theme in the Lied style at bar 41. Distinct from melody and accompaniment or singing styles because of its emotionality, it represents German Romanticism, hence its symbolisation of the writer Tonio. There are quick dynamic changes, stretto entries, and energetic dotted rhythms that lend a passionate air to the section, belying the rather mechanical Classical singing styles—due to their main signifier, the Alberti-bass—seen in eighteenth-century music. As the waltz symbolises Inge, and the mechanical ostinato Hans, the Romantic Lied represents the artistic aspect of Tonio’s character, in contrast as it is with the bourgeois. The row placement also follows the same style, with P9 in the violin part, outlining the melody and R18 repeated and shared in the viola and cello parts. Once again, however, the tenderness of the Lied is disturbed by sudden forte unison dotted fanfares that introduce the percussive close of the exposition at bar 60. This appears to pay homage to Mahler’s use of percussion to imitate nature, as a folk dance emerges briefly at bar 63 before hardening back into the percussive fanfares of bars 69–73. In this way it is also an introduction to the subject matter of the development, the conversation between Tonio and Lisabeta, which is initiated by the advent of spring, which they both agree is ‘really not very conducive to work’. Tonio further declares that ‘spring makes me nervous too; I get dazed with the triflingness and sacredness of the memories and feelings it evokes’.

**Development: The Bourgeois Manqué**

At bar 74 there begins a development of the musical and topical material from the introduction, a slower version of the Nachtmusik groups of three repeated notes is slower and in the triplet crotchet rhythm similar to the waltz, therefore connecting the location (his home town signified by the Nachtmusik) with the old love (signified

---

658. The dance in the story is not in fact the waltz, but a French dance, the quadrille, which later incorporated elements of the waltz and was often performed and composed by Josef Lanner and Strauss.
by the waltz). At bar 84, the second development section, the waltz melody is outlined by row R6, the minim accompaniment and the expression marking *wieder sehr ruhig* providing a brief moment of calm before the *tempesta* and theme two material returns at bar 88. The row I11 elides at both ends with its inversion, RI11, at the beginning and P10 halfway through (I11–P10: 11/6, 12/5). The elision and compression of the rows, in comparison to the horizontal linearity of the previous four bars, adds to the frenetic *tempesta* topic signified by the *sehr lebhaft* marking, the harsh dynamics and col legno and pizzicato articulations. The *tempesta*-inflected *Lied* that follows the development of the waltz illustrates the ‘memories and feelings’ central to the understanding of Tonio’s character, which he exposes through a series of stories he imparts to Lisabella, all designed to exemplify the conflict between ‘warm, heartfelt feeling [...] [and] the irritations and icy ecstasies of the artist’s corrupted nervous system’.660 This topic continues through the third section of the development, crescendoing to a homophonic climax at bar 102 with two accented chords. Seeping into the fourth development section, it gradually calms into an inflected pastoral topic signified by the grace notes, scotch snaps and the drone from bars 113–117.

*Recapitulation: A Journey Past the Point of Departure*

The recapitulation, beginning at bar 118 with a violin fanfare, leads into an unadulterated pastoral section and the recapitulation that also occurs within the story. The A material here signifies nature, with its grace notes, trills and wide leaps alluding to bird calls. The quiet dynamic markings keep this section calm and moderate, as does the tempo marking of minim = 56. However, the pizzicato articulation and the sudden and brief *sforzando* and *forte* markings at bar 127 keep the *tempesta* topic in mind, lurking behind the calm lightness of the pastoral. The pastoral connotations, combined with the A material, help to dispel the twilit cast of his memories of his hometown. When Tonio awakens in his native town it is broad daylight, and as he wanders through the familiar streets he relaxes. The ostinato transition, which signifies his childhood friend Hans, recurs at bar 131, as Tonio follows the same path as their childhood walk home from school.661 The *tempesta* fanfares also reappear at bar 135, although lower; the cello semiquaver B descends an octave to a B♭ and the violin falls almost two octaves from C–C♯. The row

---

660 Mann, *Death in Venice and Other Stories*, 96.
661 Ibid., 109.
material for the transition is not the same as in the exposition, despite the musical material being related; however, as discussed above the recapitulation of theme 2 is almost identical, the only difference being that the parts are redistributed. Placing the melody of the Lied in the viola part gives the section a darker atmosphere than in the exposition. The interjections, now made by the brighter violin rather than the cello of the exposition, serve to fragment the Lied rather than accompany it, thereby affecting an almost nervous or anxious atmosphere. Continuing along the path Hans and he followed from school, Tonio returns to his childhood home. As he approaches ‘his heart gave a throb of fear’ as he imagines his father coming out and ‘taking him to task on his excesses’.\textsuperscript{662} The house, he realises, has become a public library, a contradiction not lost on the conflicted artist, who describes it as a ‘most unhappy alteration’.\textsuperscript{663} On the surface, the house is the same: the half-illegible motto above the entrance, the set out of the house and the walnut tree in the back garden, just as in the second theme the surface—the melodic material—is the same, while the functional aspect has changed: the home is now a library/the row form is different. The anxious atmosphere is caused by these changes. Tonio’s tour of the library takes him to the bedroom where his father had died and finally to his own bedroom. The feeling of familiarity is highlighted here by Mann as Tonio picks up a book he knew well, a subtle symbol of the clash between the two facets of his life.

At the hotel in which Tonio stays in Denmark, he sees a brother and sister walk through the dining hall on their way to a ball. The resemblance is such that he names them Inge and Hans, prompting him to rush to the ballroom and watch them dance. The fragmented Lied at bar 144 and the following hunt topic, uninfected with the melancholia that has pervaded the rest of the movement, represents his recollection of his past feelings of isolation, as evinced by the use of the introductory material which represented his home town, and himself, signified by the Lied. The fragmentation of the Lied is due to the final understanding that he no longer loves these two people; the emotion that drove the initial sensibility has dissolved.

Despite the years between his memories and the present, Tonio returns forlornly to his room.

\textsuperscript{662} Ibid., 110. \textsuperscript{663} Ibid.
He was exhausted with jealousy, worn out with the gaiety in which he had had no part. Just the same, just the same as it had always been. Always with burning cheeks he had stood in his dark corner and suffered for you, you blond, you living, you happy ones! And then quite simply gone away. Somebody must come now! Ingeborg must notice he had gone, must slip after him, lay a hand on his shoulder and say: ‘Come back and be happy. I love you!’ But she came not at all. No, such things did not happen. Yes, all was as it had been, and he too was happy, just as he had been. For his heart was alive. But between that past and this present what had happened to make him become that which he now was? Icy desolation, solitude: mind, and art, forsooth!664

The closing section, from bar 163, returns to the tempesta fanfares of the transition before becoming fully immersed in the tempesta topic at bar 172, after a brief alla zoppa rocking segment form bar 170–171. The rows follow the rocking motion of the dotted rhythms as they flit quickly between the three parts, particularly I6, which alternates from the cello to the violin and back in bar 170, row R3 mimicking the motion in bar 171. The tempesta topic continues until the end, the tempo markings forcing the topic with directions of sehr getragen, wieder sehr lebhaft and, at bar 90, pesante. This section parallels Tonio’s inner thoughts in this final episode:

He thought of the dreamy adventures of the senses, nerves, and mind in which he had been involved; saw himself eaten up with intellect and introspection, ravaged and paralysed by insight, half worn out by the fevers and frosts of creation, helpless and in anguish of conscience between two extremes, flung to and fro between austerity and lust; raffiné, impoverished, exhausted by frigid and artificially heightened ecstasies; erring, forsaken, martyred, and ill—and sobbed with nostalgia and remorse.665

5.3.e. Conclusion
There is no direct evidence to suggest a definitive link between Webern’s String Trio and Mann’s Tonio Kröger. However, the topical narrative presented in the above analysis shows that the themes which pervade Mann’s story also infuse the Trio. The spiritual withdrawal, which Johnson posits is associated with this work, is introduced in the composition’s first movement. The second movement follows

664 Ibid., 129.
665 Ibid., 130.
much more precisely the themes and structure set out in the novella. Moreover, the topical narrative illustrates the inward transformation of the character that is, eventually, reconciled with the contrasting influences on his life. The introductory material, and the Nachtmusik topic, signifies his home, particularly his return to it. The twilit ethereal streets complement his bitter memories better than the reality of daylight signified in the recapitulation. The recapitulation acts in both the literary and musical format as a catalyst towards the resolution of the coda. Everything is the same: the rusty gate, the train that passes him and the motto above the door of his parents’ home. Simultaneously, there are changes, much as in a traditional recapitulation where the previous material is used but in an altered form; his house has been turned into a library, an ironic alteration considering the writer’s inner conflict when living there. In the exposition, while the first theme, the waltz-inflected sensibility topic, might signify Inge, it concurrently can be heard to signify the isolation Tonio feels so strongly, not just from the ‘blond and blue-eyed’, but also from the bourgeois society they represent, not least when that topic is placed alongside the Romantic Lied which signifies his own emotive personality. The development is also constructed traditionally. In the literary sense, it is the point at which Tonio expands on the themes exposed in the exposition through his rather one-sided conversation with Lisabeta.

The specificities of the comparisons drawn here certainly lead to the assumption that the similarities between the text and the music are more than simply the commonalities found in Booker’s hypothesis. It is more likely that two artists living in the same period and the same environment—although Mann lived in Munich and Webern in Vienna—would have been affected by the same issues and so it is not altogether surprising that there should be such specific correlations within their works.

5.4. Webern’s Fünf Canons Op. 16

5.4.a. The Learned Style
The strict style, a subtopic of the learned style that encapsulates this work, is used here to structure the five pieces, signified by the use of the canon. In his original introduction to topics, Ratner distinguishes between types, which are fully worked out pieces, and styles, which he characterises as ‘figures and progressions within a
He does accept, however, that the distinction is ‘flexible; minuets and marches represent complete types of composition, but they also furnish style for other pieces’. Hence, although the strict style is considered a topic, and used in that way by scholars—that is, as a signifier of church music and rule-led composition—Monelle further suggests that the different styles refer usually to social purpose rather than signification. ‘Thus’, he explains, ‘the church style, and indeed the “strict” style, were simply the styles most appropriate to church music.’

Keith Chapin contextualises the strict style within the topography of the learned style. The term differs in its definition, save for the acknowledgement of its marked opposition to the “free” styles. Originally, the term described an approach to part writing and treatment of dissonance, for example the avoidance of parallel fifths and octaves, and the preparation of suspensions. Koch, in his Musikalisches Lexikon, also suggested that ‘one must not only minutely observe the mechanical rules of composition, but […] also the style in which a melodic theme is developed through the means of various transpositions and imitations.’ Chapin also suggests that there are differences between the definitions of the term ‘strict’ due to geographic divergence. Koch, a Thuringian, identifies different characteristics than the Austrian, Johann Georg Albrechtsberger, who, Chapin advocates, aimed at a plainer style:

By strict style, I mean that style that is written only for voices without any accompaniment of an instrument. It has more rules than the free style. The reason for this is that a singer does not hit tones as easily as an instrumentalist.

The Op. 16 canons, hardly surprisingly, do not follow the laws of tonal progression set out by Koch. They also do not adhere to the main distinction the musicologist made between the strict style and the free style: that in the free style ‘dissonance need not be prepared.’ They do follow other laws, however, marking them in

---

666 Ratner, CM, 9.
667 Ibid.
668 Monelle, SM, 29.
670 Koch, Musikalisches Lexikon, 1,447–1,448.
671 Johann Georg Albrechtsberger, Gründliche Anweisung zur Composition (Leipzig: Breitkopf, 1790); quoted in Chapin, "Learned Style and Learned Styles", 304.
672 Koch, Versuch, I, (1782), 155; quoted in Ratner, CM, 23 (Koch’s italics).
opposition to “free styles”, in this case a strict canon in three parts and the development of what will become, in Op. 17, twelve-tone technique. That it follows the Austrian characteristics of the strict style can be seen within Webern’s use of the voice in this canon for high soprano, clarinet and bass clarinet. The clarinets always begin the canon, with the voice imitating, creating a restrictive atmosphere as the voice valiantly struggles against the very problems set out by Albrechtsberger over a hundred years before these pieces were written, a struggle noted by Julian Johnson in his analysis of the Fünf Canons:

The voice, as the sign of corporeality in music, is subjected to an abstraction that seems to disfigure it. In a heightening of subjective lyricism the voice has to go beyond its own reach, to transcend its own human limits. [...] The voice is beautiful in these songs in that it represents a lyrical subjectivity, but it is disfigured in that lyricism. It is so heightened that it turns into a denial of the corporeal limits of the voice, and in its intense painful desire for transcendence is disfigured through asceticism. Asceticism is perhaps a helpful way of understanding the role of the Op. 16 canons, which impose absolute discipline of the canonic dux upon the voice, more often an instrumental one, a more-than-human one (in terms of range and agility).\(^ {673}\)

This is one of the more obvious ways in which Webern’s composition twists, or alters, the traditional signifiers of the topics. The songs follow strict laws, but not in any way the ones originally specified; he ostensibly writes for one instrument, seemingly either oblivious to, or, more likely, highlighting the limitations of the voice as it is forced to follow an instrument known for the ease with which it can traverse its large range.

The last aspect of the Fünf Canons that situates it within the learned style is the religious text. Of the five Latin texts Webern uses here, three (I, III and V) are taken from Catholic liturgy sung on Good Friday, and concern Christ’s crucifixion. The other two do not derive from the Easter period. The fourth song is an antiphon sung in Mass; the second, “Dormi Jesu”, is not part of the Catholic Latin breviary at all, but can instead be found in Des Knaben Wunderhorn, entitled “Schluß”. However, the poem’s history is longer, beginning with Samuel Taylor Coleridge

copying the poem down from the print of a virgin in a German Roman Catholic Church. The use of religious texts, alongside the music’s canonic nature, suggests a different term, the bound style. Chapin catalogues the various definitions of this term as referring to a ‘note being bound over by a slur’ or ‘a secondary contrapuntal voice “bound” to a plainchant cantus firmus; that is, it is not freely composed’. It is further defined as ‘an imitative voice that is “bound” to another, that is, imitate[s] the first voice throughout a passage, as in a canon’. Finally there is Johann Mattheson’s definition of the ‘bound, single voiced, and properly named church style’. The term “church style” now gains significance. Rather than circumscribing technique, it evokes a place and function, the definition of “style” as Monelle described it. It signifies the church and its incumbent qualities, that is, it is the musical representation of an ethos of learnedness, rationality and, above all, stricture. Therefore, as well as the actual words of the text having value, the choice of text itself has significance, placing the music within this sphere of meaning.

Despite the nuances between each of the terms outlined above, it is clear how learned styles coalesce into a single topic, and, therefore, how each of these terms can be applied in this topical narrative. The overwhelming significance of the use of this topic is the concept of following laws. As mentioned above, this piece does not follow tonal law, and at first glance does not follow any perceivable methodology. However, although the piece is often cited as the last truly atonal work by Webern, when analysed using Forte’s set theory it becomes clear that this is not completely the case. There are no row formations, so it is not serial, but at the same time all twelve tones are recited within almost every textural block (Table 5.4). This law is not followed rigidly; all twelve tones are not present all of the time in the same way in which the rules of dodecaphonicism, or even tonal progression, are not always rigidly obeyed. However, it does point towards a system preceding the advent of the twelve-tone method.

675 Chapin, “Learned Style and Learned Styles”, 304.
676 The Five Canons on Latin Texts, op. 16 were written in 1924 and are still said to be the last of Webern’s truly atonal pieces. However, Moldenhauer has shown that he had experimented with dodecaphonic composition as early as his op. 9 in 1913. He also wrote out row charts in his sketches for “Crucem tuam adoramus”, the fifth of the five canons, and on the same page as his sketches for “Christus Factus Est”, the first canon there is a sketch for a piano piece in strict row style (Moldenhauer and Moldenhauer, Anton Webern: A Chronicle of his Life and Work (London: Gollanz, 1978), 310).
Moreover, the restraint placed upon the voice by the strict imitation of the clarinets, discussed above, is, as Johnson puts it, symbolic of the ‘absolute discipline’ of the canonic form. The effect that the wide leaps and angular melodic lines have on the voice serve to highlight the law that they are constrained by, emphasising this concept of the piece.

5.4.b. Lacan
To be able to ascribe any meaning to the use of the learned style within this piece, other than the generic implications outlined above, a method of interpretation is required. In the previous chapter, the uncanny topic was compiled using Freudian methodologies, and in the previous case studies of this chapter, this topic has appeared in Webern’s music. The topical narrative of the Fünf Canons, however, shows that the psychological hysteria present in Schoenberg’s works is not what is presented here. Rather, a dialectic between male and female signifiers is juxtaposed with traditional and strict conventions, or laws. This has led to a different interpretive model being explored that is more suited to the narrative: the psychoanalytic technique of Jacques Lacan. Lacan continued to build on Freudian techniques, developing a model based on Freud’s concepts of the ego and the id. His first presentation of this was “The Mirror Stage as Formative of the Function of the I”, in which he explores how the unconscious, or the subject, and the ego, or “Ideal-I” is formed.\textsuperscript{677} The unconscious, Lacan explains, is formed when the child first sees his image in the mirror, and understands it to be himself.

Unable as yet to walk or to stand up, and held tightly as he is by some support, human or artificial, he nevertheless overcomes, in a flutter of jubilant activity, the obstructions of his support, and fixing his attitude in a slightly leaning forward position, to hold it in his gaze, brings back an instantaneous aspect of the image.\textsuperscript{678}

This is the first time the child thinks of itself as “I”, a being separate from others, and in a relationship with an image it understands as representing itself. Lacan writes that ‘we only have to understand the mirror stage as an identification, in the full sense that analysis gives to the term: namely, the transformation that takes place in the subject when he assumes an image’.\textsuperscript{679} Lacan named this mental process the imaginary, one of three ‘realms’ or orders of the psyche. A sensory realm, it houses the notions that issue directly from sensorial perception, including those which, because of the mirror stage, proceed from the body’s image. The child then projects its ideal identity, that which it wishes to be, onto this image. It thus effectively splits itself into an unconscious, the parts of its identity it has no control over, and the ego, its “ideal-I”. The ego is constructed with notions such as ‘I am English’, or ‘I am a good child’, conscious concepts about one’s identity. It is only through language that the unconscious is revealed. Lacan’s subject utters signifiers that reveal his unconscious without being aware of what they mean, but which can be interpreted by an analyst.

At this point, not only does the child understand itself in relationship to its own image, but realises that, as a whole being separate from its mother and not fragmented, it has a place in society. Its understanding of others was already there as an explanation for its mother’s absences. Whenever she was away from the child, it was because ‘Daddy needs me’ or ‘I must go to work’. Therefore the child is already aware of a third element to his life, this Other which desires attention from Mother. By understanding its wholeness, it begins to realise that it too has a part in this societal pecking order, and that it is not at the top. This is the first act of repression for the child, and that which both Lacan and Freud claim creates the unconscious. The sudden loss of its mother as a part of the child creates a lack, such that the child desires the end of the alienation it feels. Its desire for its mother

\textsuperscript{678} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{679} Ibid., original emphasis.
is seen as a desire for incest, which the child immediately represses under the 
{name of the father}, the term given by Lacan to the law prohibiting the child’s 
incestuous desires. Lacan explains that:

The moment in which the mirror-stage comes to an end inaugurates, by the 
identification with the imago of the counterpart and the drama of primordial 
jealousy [...], the dialectic that will henceforth link the I to socially 
elaborated situations.

It is this moment that decisively tips the whole of human 
knowledge into mediatisation through the desire of the other, constitutes its 
objects in an abstract equivalence by the co-operation of others, and turns 
the I into that apparatus for which every instinctual thrust constitutes a 
danger, even though it should correspond to a natural maturation—the very 
normalisation of this maturation being henceforth dependent, in man, on a 
cultural mediation as exemplified, in the case of the sexual object, by the 
Oedipus complex.\textsuperscript{680}

[...] It is in the {name of the father} that we must recognise the support of the 
symbolic function which, from the dawn of history, has identified his figure 
with the figure of the law.\textsuperscript{681}

Lacan based aspects of his psychoanalytic technique on Saussure’s linguistic 
theory: that language sets human beings apart from other animals. Therefore, if 
language makes us human, then the rudiments of the human psyche should be 
found in language. The mirror stage is, therefore, ‘the symbolic matrix in which the I 
is precipitated in a primordial form, prior to it being objectified in the dialectic of 
identification with the other, and before language restores to it, in the universal, its 
function as subject’.\textsuperscript{682} For Lacan, the unconscious subject is comprised of symbolic 
elements, which manifest themselves in dreams, as slips of the tongue or speech 
mannerisms, creating what he termed the discourse of the unconscious.\textsuperscript{683} These 
elements are signifiers; they represent an idea of an object. Lacan emphasises the 
particular perception that a symbol—what Saussure called signs—signifies ‘the

\textsuperscript{680} Ibid., 6. 
\textsuperscript{681} Ibid., 74. 
\textsuperscript{682} Ibid., 2. 
\textsuperscript{683} Ibid., 61.
permanence of a concept. His discussion of Freud’s use of the phallus elucidates the difference between signifier and signified:

The phallus can be better understood on the basis of its function here. In Freudian doctrine, the phallus is not a fantasy, if we are to view fantasy as an imaginary effect. Nor is it as such an object (part-, internal, good, bad, etc.) inasmuch as ‘object’ tends to gauge the reality involved in a relationship. Still less is it the organ—penis or clitoris—that it symbolises. And it is no accident that Freud adopted as a reference the simulacrum it represented to the Ancients.

For phallus is a signifier, a signifier whose function, in the intrasubjective economy of analysis, may lift the veil from the function it served in the mysteries. For it is the signifier that is destined to designate meaning effects as a whole, insofar as the signifier conditions them by its presence as a signifier.

Moreover, he points out that because it is the conception that is important, it is the signifier and not the signified that is primary. The signifier carries the emotional weight that causes the repression. Therefore, in the unconscious, Lacan states, there can be no signifieds, only signifiers. If signifieds were also present, then the meaning of the signifier would be inflexible; the emotional ties would remain immovable so that the signified, once repressed, would forevermore be irretrievable. Lacan suggests instead the use of metonyms, a trope in which one word or phrase is substituted for another that suggests it, for example, “Westminster” for the British government.

I shall refer only to the example given there: ‘thirty sails’. For the disquietude I felt over the fact that the word ‘ship’, concealed in this expression, seemed, by taking on its figurative sense, through the endless repetition of the same old example, only to increase its presence, obscured (voilait) not so much those illustrious sails (voiles) as the definition they were supposed to illustrate.

684 Ibid., 71.
The part taken for the whole, we said to ourselves, and if the thing is to be taken seriously, we are left with very little idea of the importance of this fleet, which ‘thirty sails’ is precisely supposed to give us [...] By which we see that the connection between ship and sail is nowhere but in the signifier, and that it is in the word-to-word connection that metonymy is based.686

Therefore, Lacan states, what is repressed is a chain of signifiers—a signifier in a certain relationship with other signifiers—so that the signifier is still accessible in other contexts.687 This acts in a way similar to that described in the analysis of Webern’s Symphony above, by Freud's *The Interpretation of Dreams*, in which a dream is a rebus that can be solved by analysing the articulated signifiers of the subject. In this way, Lacan accesses the repressed events in the unconscious of the subject.688 Lacan terms the unconscious the symbolic, the second order of the psyche. This realm holds language, the Other, and all the laws and assumptions that govern human society and thought. As Sheridan notes,

the symbols referred to here are not icons, stylised figurations, but signifiers [...] differential elements, in themselves without meaning, which acquire value only in their mutual relations, and forming a closed order. [...] Henceforth it is the symbolic, not the imaginary, that is seen to be the determining order of the subject, and its effects are radical: the subject, in Lacan’s sense, is himself an effect of the symbolic.689

5.4.c. Interpretation of Topical Narrative

Previous studies have identified the projection of Lacan’s realms of the real, imaginary and symbolic onto the listening experience690 and tonal progression and formal structure as ‘drive and desire’.691 Smith and Schwartz both categorise the

tonic as 'lack', or objet petit a in post-tonal music, while Bergemon finds it in the signification of the real in Debussy's transcendence of the word in his settings of Baudelaire's poems. Sarah Reichardt identifies the real as the traumatic rendering or rupturing of the symbolic in Shostakovich's Four String Quartets. The mapping of the "gaze" within musical and critical discourse has been explored by Ian Biddle, Schwartz, and Kramer. A psychoanalytical perspective of opera, particularly the relationships between characters—and, by extension, those of the composer—and the depiction of (sexual) violence on stage is offered by Kramer, Slavoj Žižek and Mladen Dolar, and allies closely with studies of gender by Biddle, Abbate and Linda and Michael Hutcheon. Katherine Bergeron identifies the "signifying chain", [as] a linguistic structure that generates meaning through relations of contiguity—potentially endless series of signifiers, of differentiated linguistic elements. Within Debussy's Cinq poemes de Baudelaire the chain of signifiers acts as a horizontal series of musical 'events', for instance, 'the curious whole-tone interruption, at the end of the first melodic period, that blossoms over a chromatic passing tone in the bass as if to "open out," like a strange flower, the tonal implications of the piece'. The present analysis instead explores the chain of signifiers within the paradigmatic axis, as a hermeneutic chain from the narrative


693 Sarah Reichardt, Composing the Modern Subject: Four String Quartets by Dmitri Shostakovich (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008).


696 Bergeron, "The Echo, the Cry, the Death of Lovers", 138.

697 Ibid., 144.
level of discourse to the level of story. It is clear, then, that topical discourse lies firmly within the symbolic order. Even with regards to iconic topics such as bird song, as these are still representations of something—an unmistakable representation—they are a symbolic concept nonetheless. As has been previously discussed, a topical narrative has a similar structure to language as it is organised as a chain of signifiers. As such, the topics that inflect the learned style within the Fünf Canons need to be studied in order to gain any real sense of the meaning of the piece.

**Christus Factus Est**

The first song, along with the fourth and fifth, utilises what Johnson and Philip Tagg would designate masculine signifiers. The strident clarinet trills of the first song, angular melodies, faster tempos, leaps, and rests that combine with the suddenly shifting dynamics and meter changes to add offbeat accentuation, all signify masculinity. The fanfare figures inherent within the canonic dux also lend this song masculine connotations, the military being an exclusively male profession at the turn of the twentieth century. The fanfare is the first topical reference of the piece, emphasised by the forte marking and accents. The trills make the clarinet’s timbre brasher than usual to sound more like the brass instrument traditionally associated with the fanfare topic. This figure then reappears at bar 4, and finally, in the vocal line at bars 5–6. This last appearance of the fanfare topic appears more significant than in previous manifestations, due to its length and diversity. Beginning with an upward arpeggiac fanfare, there then appears a repeated note fanfare, highlighted because it is different to the clarinet parts, which have two crotchets rather than two quavers then a crotchet. The final two minims of the phrase, which in the clarinet parts are forte-piano and slurred, are, in the voice, accented and forte. The phrase also begins on the second highest note of the vocal line, the sudden leap and dynamic providing even more emphasis on the word “mortem”. All these factors—the elevating fanfares, masculine signifiers, high range and emphasis on the word “death”—combine with the second section, from bar 8, to signify God’s elevation of Christ, expressed in the text “Propter quod, et Deus exaltavit illum: et dedit illi nomen, quod est super omne nomen” (For which God exalted him and gave him that name, which is above other names).

At bar 8 the texture of the piece changes. The steady minim movement is shortened: the distance between entries is now only crotchets and the rhythmic tempo has quickened to quavers. The legato moments in the first half of the song are replaced by accented staccatos and a proliferation of *forte* and *sforzando* dynamics. Even once the opening minims return, the shortened entries mean that the voice is now syncopated against the clarinets. The change in tempo here is similar to previous settings of this text; for example, the Gregorian chant, and the motets, one by Renaissance composer Felice Anerio and one of three settings of this text by Bruckner composed in 1884. This similarity again suggests the traditional nature of the songs, with the stylistic consistencies confirming the learned topic.

**Dormi Jesu**

A lullaby sung by the Mother to her baby Jesus, the second canon “Dormi Jesu” uses only voice and clarinet to create an intimacy that is echoed by the slow rocking *Lied* style of the canonic line and the quiet dynamics that never rise above *piano*. The calmness is accentuated by the constant 4/4 tempo; this is the only song which does not change meter throughout. The melodic content is saturated with minor second intervals, although registrahly displaced an octave apart, such as the F♯–G in the vocal line in bar 3, or placed between the voices, for example, the F against the E in bar 4, then the E♭ against the D in the clarinet and voice respectively (Example 5.15).


This adds to the rocking quality of the lullaby and creates a series of moments that are reminiscent of learned style suspensions within the canonic movement. In this piece, although the overwhelming topic is feminine, masculine signifiers are present although in a less immediate fashion. The text confirms the feminine associations,
describing the mother praying for the child to sleep. The imagery suggests, however, that the mother does not want the child to wake up—she laughs when he sleeps and weeps when he wakes. To ‘awake’ or ‘wake up’ is often used as a metonym for a realisation, a sudden understanding or identification of the truth—such as the child’s identification of his image and the forming of the unconscious. Bailey demonstrates that in Webern’s succeeding twelve-note compositions one must look at the order of composition to find the prime row. Hence, it is the first sung row of the first movement written, not necessarily the first movement published, that contains the untransposed prime.699 This song, although published as the second movement, was the first movement to be written. As such, it represents the beginning of the piece, the beginning of Christ’s life. The mother and the baby feature here at a point before the child is aware, and therefore in the Real order. However, with the inflection of the feminine topic (the Lied) upon the encompassing masculine one (the learned style), the song seems not to symbolise the actual Real order, but rather the idea of it, visualised as the symbol of desire. The subject’s longing for a return to the Real and desire for the phallus is transferred in his memory to his mother; it is she, he claims, who wishes he had not wakened, rather than himself. This retrospective realisation of the Other enforces the similar way in which Ratner’s topics and Lacan’s symbols function. In many circumstances, a topic is a stylised version of a represented concept, for example the portrayal of shepherds as happy, dancing simpletons in the pastoral topic, or the nobility of the hunt. Thus, the stylisation of the Real here fits with Lacan’s insistence on the importance of modern linguistic analysis.

This passion of the signifier thus becomes a new dimension of the human condition in that it is not only man who speaks, but in man and through man that it speaks; in that his nature becomes woven by effects in which the structure of the language of which he becomes the material can be refound.700

Man therefore colours any concept with his own perceptions and conceptions; the notion then proffered is not Real/real, but a symbol of what he believes his desire to

be. By placing this song second in publication, then, Webern introduces the full-grown man first, thereby seemingly confirming this retrospective analysis.

*Crux Fidelis*

In the previous case study on Schoenberg’s Op. 16, the castration complex was signified by Schoenberg in his depiction of the forest signifying the uncanny topic. This topic contains signifiers similar to those of the *ombra* and the *tempesta* topics—quick changes in dynamics, rhythmic pace, wide leaps and octave displacement—which signify psychic anxiety. These signifiers are present in four of the five pieces in the *Fünf Canons*, the best example of which is the third song, “Crux Fidelis”. In this piece, the symbolic wood represented is not the living forest of Schoenberg’s music, but the cross on which Christ died, which in this song is compared to a forest and found to be ‘nobler’.

Faithful cross,
one noble tree among all;
no forest brings forth such
foliage, flower or bud.
Sweet wood, sweet nails,
sweet burden you support.\(^{701}\)

In this stanza the cross is a living tree unlike any other, which is significant in two ways. Its initial significance is in the way in which the cross is worshipped in the Catholic faith as the image of Christ. The cross is seen as an icon of Christ, in the same way as the Eucharist (the unleavened bread and wine symbolising the body and blood of Christ). Moreover, it represents Christ as our salvation. In linguistic terms, the cross is therefore a signifier, by which Christ, and by extension hope of salvation, is signified.

The second way in which this one tree is significant is that, in Freudian terms, one tree represents the male genitalia, while a multiplication of the penis symbol—a forest—represents the female genitalia. As, in this case, the text so strongly implies one tree, one cross, it can be interpreted as symbolising the penis. But as the text goes on to say that ‘no forest brings forth such foliage, flower or bud’,

\(^{701}\) Allan Forte, *The Atonal Music of Anton Webern* (Yale University, 1998), 353.
it appears to imply a hierarchy between the feminine and masculine. This will be examined further in the next paragraph, and within the overall topical narrative.

In addition to the signifiers listed above there is also the use of pitch class sets that confirm the signification of the cross through the use of a traditional referent—specifically the cross motif found in eight pieces by Liszt—which in turn quotes the Gregorian chant “Crux Fidelis”.702 The pitch class set that makes up Liszt’s cross motif and the Gregorian chant, 4-23, is the same as the set used for the opening motif illustrating the text “Crux Fidelis” in Webern’s third song (Example 5.16).

The nature of the pitch class sets throughout the rest of the piece also presents the gender-associated symbolism of the piece. As outlined above, the text represents the contrast between the cross and a living forest. The depiction of nature, both Johnson and Tagg assert, connotes the ‘maternal’ or ‘feminine’. This is important because at the climax of the song, where the voice lifts to its highest note and the dynamics reach their peak, the text highlighted is “fronde, flore, germine” (foliage, flower or bud), natural images which in this case symbolise not only Christ but also the beginnings of life. The contrasting imagery connected with what should be the dead wood of the cross and the life it “brings forth” is represented by the unnatural bass clef of the B♭ clarinet part and the soft dynamics. It is uncommon for B♭ clarinet music to be in any clef other than treble, so this change highlights the clarinet’s subsequent return to its natural clef and the ascending vocal line, supported by the pitch class set used here by Webern (012347, 6-Z36). Moreover, this pitch class set is related to nearly all of the other sets within the piece, and either contains or complements all the sets used in the final four bars, as if the two bars of this set have metaphorically “brought forth” the rest of the piece (Table 5.5).703 Crucially, however this set does not relate in any way to the cross pc set, 0257 (A), thus underscoring the contrast of masculine and feminine imagery.

Table 5.5: Pitch Class Set Relations in Song III.


703 Example 5.16 shows the segmentation of the score that produced the pc set analysis.
Asperges Me

In the fourth song, “Asperges Me”, only the bass clarinet and voice are used, giving this song a darker ambience that lies closer to Mahler’s *Nachtmusik* topic, with a sense of space conveyed by the range difference between the low instrument and high voice. Therefore, although it is the only other song with reduced orchestration, it does not inspire the same intimate atmosphere as “Dormi Jesu”. The melodic lines are both legato and relatively low in comparison with the other songs, the voice reaching only G♯4. The dynamics stay within the piano range, with the exception of bars 9–10, where a crescendo and decrescendo enclose a forte marking. This shift occurs at the words “Miserere mei, Deus” (Take pity on me, God), with the voice singing her highest note on “Deus”.


© Copyright 1928 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 9522
The darkness created by the Nachtmusik topic combines with the otherwise feminine signifiers, the legato articulation, quiet dynamics and proliferation of triplet figures. These are all signifiers that correlate with the night pastoral, which is also suggested by the nature imagery of the text: the hyssop plant, and becoming “white as snow”. The inflection of the pastoral with darkness and space once again gives negative connotations to the feminine, which are exacerbated by the text as it deals not with Christ, as the others do, but with the normal people, the congregation, the sinners for whom Christ died. The congregation are asking God to make them clean. This suggests that to become “white as snow” they must be separated from the feminine—the mother—by the father. In Lacanian terms, the law of the name-of-the-father, the repression of the incestuous desire, is the only way to “live cleanly”, that is, to live the way society dictates.

Crucem Tuam Adoramus

The darkness of the Nachtmusik topic is contrasted with the exaltation of the fifth canon. The text of this song is an antiphon from the Solemn Afternoon Liturgy for Good Friday.

Lord, we venerate your cross
and praise and glorify
your holy resurrection.
For behold, because of the wood
joy has come to all the world. 704

This song is more homophonic than the previous four, as can be seen particularly from bars 3–5, where the rhythm moves consistently every semiquaver, except for the triplets at the end of each phrase. Because of this homogenous movement it sounds as if the clarinets are accompanying the voice, whose loud dynamics and upward leaps over an augmented octave provide a definite sense of exaltation. The fanfare-like leaps in the voice combine with the constant, driving semiquaver movement to signify the joy that ‘has come to all the world’. These signifiers can be traced back to such works as the Aria “Rejoice Greatly” from Handel’s Messiah (1741), Beethoven’s “Ode to Joy” (1824) and Tchaikovsky’s 1812 Overture (1880).

The only bars that do not signify joy and veneration are 6 and 7. The tempo of the song drops substantially, from crotchet = 84 to 58. The melodic arch, which has been present throughout, is inverted, while the dynamics are simultaneously reduced from forte to piano to pianissimo. However, through a continuation of the interpretation of the symbolisation of the cross, this sudden and temporary change can be explained. The text at this point symbolises the friction between the “venerated cross”, the masculine symbol, and the suggested inferiority of the “wood”, the feminine symbol according to Freud: ‘Wood generally speaking, seems, in accordance with its linguistic relations, to represent feminine matter (Materie). The name of the island Madeira means wood in Portuguese’.

This friction is caused by the understanding that it is the ‘inferior’ woman that gave birth to Christ, that caused ‘joy to come to all the world’. The constant homophonic movement and the lack of exaltation, of fanfares, at a moment when the language used, both musically and textually representing the feminine, signifies the lack of, and therefore the desire for, the Other. The sudden fracture of the homophonic structure signifies the rupture between the child and his mother, and the ideal “I” and the ego. This subtext can then be interpreted as representing the primal trauma, the identification and repression of desire for the mother, signified with the metonym ‘wood’. This is confirmed by what could be considered a hypnoid state, one of Cherlin’s ‘uncanny time shards’ at bars 6 and 7 (Example 5.17), which forms a brief calm, quiet period of beats that are more regular with a slower tempo, illustrating the line ‘ecce enim propter lignum’ (For behold, because of the wood).


© Copyright 1928 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 9522

---

5.4.d. Conclusion: Overall Narrative

The first song uses signifiers associated with the masculine—the military topic, brash fanfares and articulation, and angular melodic shapes. The text describes God’s elevation of Christ through his death, and that God ‘gave him that name / which is above all other names’. The interaction described between God and his son excludes any female relation: the mother is lacking. In this way, God separates the son from his mother; as in the name-of-the-father, the paternal influence helps the child to move from an exclusive mother/child relationship to his place in the outside cultural world: the symbolic. The symbolic is signified here by Webern’s reference to the traditional settings of the hymns, his similar treatment of his own setting places it in context with the ‘outside cultural world’ of the Gregorian chant, the motets and the learned style. The retrospective idealisation of the Real, signified within “Dormi Jesu”, works as a signifier that symbolises the subject’s desire for a return to the Real, the desire for the phallus central to Lacanian thought. This representation of desire leads to the central song, which is significant in the uncanny topic. “Crux Fidelis” signifies the repression of the primal trauma, using the topic that symbolises the unconscious. The textual and musical language within this song demonstrates the ambivalent nature of signifiers; that they can be subject to multivalent interpretations. The textual image of the cross—the one tree above all which is the symbol of hope and salvation—is combined with the cross motif and its pc set, 4-23, which is unrelated to any of the others and is therefore unique within the song: one set, one motif and one cross, which in Freud’s eyes signifies the phallus. The opposing imagery, the natural, feminine signifiers illustrated by the pc set (6-Z36), is placed apart from the phallus imagery. This elides with Lacanian thought, however: where the mother would complete the child, thus the mother is the phallus. The masculine and feminine symbols fold in on one another to form a chain of signifiers, an interpretation of which is only possible once all the signifiers are identified. This chain, combined with the use of the uncanny topic, which is the musical representation of the unconscious, symbolises the primal trauma and the repression of this into the unconscious, signified explicitly by the presence of the hypnoid state. At this stage, the use of religious imagery becomes less tangible: although the text specifically refers to Christ, it has become a portrayal of “man” and his journey into civilisation and realisation, rather than the explicit story of Christ. The “character” of Christ has become a signifier himself, as the ultimate symbol of the relationship between man and paternal law. This is further suggested in the next song “Asperges Me”, in which man asks the ultimate symbol of the father, God, to
facilitate his separation from the mother, from the phallus and from the taboo that is his incestuous desire. Through his repression of this desire, he can gain God’s/father’s/society’s acceptance and “be clean”. The exultation of the final song completes the child’s entry into society. The male signifiers of the cross and the fanfare-like leaps are arrested briefly by the hypnoid state of bars 6–7, the signifier for the unconscious and therefore the primal trauma. The joyful exterior returns, however, denoting a return to “normality” and conformation.

Johnson writes that Webern’s overt interest in religious texts during this period runs ‘hand in hand with the renewed dependence on Schoenberg and the return to strict contrapuntal forms […] This is perhaps the dearest sign of his search for some more universal, over-arching order, a search which permeates these works’.706 Johnson also relates Webern’s need to submit to authority, whether to the church, the state, his mentor/father figure Schoenberg, or to “The Method” of serialism itself: what Anne Schreffler terms his ‘almost pathological reverence for authority’.707 He therefore makes a case that these pieces stand out from the “maternal” world in which Webern had ensconced himself up until now, and instead seize the structure of the “paternal law” presented through the canonic form and religious texts.

In these pieces one may well find a coming together of the apparently disparate, or even antithetical, areas of Webern’s musical enterprise – the maternal construction of nature and the paternal imperative for syntactical order.708

It is the ‘coming together’ that, it seems, characterises Webern’s compositional style in the Fünf Canons. As noted in the introduction to this chapter, it was expected that Webern’s compositional style would follow Schoenberg’s, and to some extent, for example the use of the twelve-tone technique, it has. However, the signifiers presented in this work, those of the traditional learned style, the religious text, the use of the cross motif and pc set, and the temporal references to previous settings

of the same texts, place the songs in the context of their cultural world and societal norms. Where topical analyses of Schoenberg’s works showed a character falling apart as they became alienated from society, those of Webern’s works demonstrate an acceptance of and by society’s conventions.

5.5. Chapter Conclusion

As Schoenberg’s pupil, there is an expectation of Webern’s music that the revolutionary aspect of his mentor’s life and works would be imitated and advanced. Indeed, as detailed throughout this chapter, if one concentrates purely on the technical aspect of his compositional method, this expectation appears justified. The extreme nature of Webern’s musical language, his brevity—whether his short movements, or ability to ‘expand a moment of stillness’, as Schoenberg noted—extreme dynamics or structural complexity, leads to the conclusion that his music is ground-breaking and modern, rather than immersed in the Viennese tradition.709

However, through formal, topical and comparative analyses of these three works, it has been shown that this is not completely true: Webern’s music is expressive, and, more significantly, historically situated. The analysis of the Symphony has revealed a realistic commentary on the yearning for stability and peace, represented by nature, both within his personal life and in the political and cultural setting. The String Trio uses a comparative analysis to demonstrate an inward journey in which the character is reconciled with the contrasting influences on his life: that of bourgeois rationalism and art. And the Fünf Canons are described in terms of the Lacanian process of the mirror stage, when the subject’s unconscious is formed. Webern places the Canons in a traditional context that illustrates the subject’s acceptance of and by society’s conventions.

As such, the narratives of these three case studies represent a journey from a clash between bourgeois sensibilities and the conventions of the church and society to the acceptance of a dualistic nature, mirroring Mann’s character Tonio Kröger, of artist and noble, of composer and conductor, of nature worshipper and Catholic, and of revolutionary and reactionary. In this sense, the paradoxical nature of Webern once again comes to the fore. In Whittall’s description of Webern’s musical progression, he describes the change from Webern’s earlier works to Op.

709 Ibid., 253.
21 as one from anxiety and turbulence to serenity. He goes on to quote Nietzsche's analogy of the Dionysian and Apollonian binary, which he feels describes this change. In the introduction it was suggested that this movement reflects the move from rationalism to expressionism, a shift which informed the transformation of musical aesthetics in both Mahler's and Schoenberg's musical language. Instead, the narrative that has emerged appears to be a contradiction of the surface manifestation. The case studies have been arranged in reverse chronological order, to illustrate more clearly the journey from societal uncertainty to acceptance, but this means that the Apollonian sentiment has been shown to belong to the piece with the most conflicted narrative. That Whittall chooses to connect *Dormi Jesu* to Op. 21 as an additional example of the Apollonian element is therefore significant, as it is the song which is connected within the narrative to the primal trauma while employing the calmest surface texture.

The contradiction that is “Webern the reactionary” is therefore demonstrated within this chapter, and it is set alongside a piece of music which, on the surface, is as conventional as Webern is radical. Kálmán's *Gräfin Mariza* is an operetta written by a Hungarian composer for ostensibly commercial purposes. A story that on the surface follows *opera buffa* themes of love, mistaken identity and class distinction is presented by the composer as epitomising the uncanny. The *style hongrois* signifies the Other, but not the ‘barbaric Other *par excellence*’ from Johann Strauss's time that Jesse Wright Warren described in her dissertation. Rather, this is the familiar Other that pervades Freud's concept of the uncanny. The multivalent signification of the Hungarian-Gypsy music gives the operetta, the 'light' music, a darker side, an underlying subtext which follows in the footsteps of Schoenberg with more surety than his most devoted pupil. In the previous chapters, operettas have been used to show that the other works under consideration were still situated within the Viennese institution, that in spite of their differing surface language the narratives coincided with the cultural context of the time. The understanding by scholars that Webern represented something different is true, then, but only with regard to Bailey's description of Webern as a man of contradictions. Webern continued his mentor's exploration of the psyche by including the uncanny topic in his works, but simultaneously moved away from the cultural expectations set out by the operetta and regressed into the past. This return to tradition is represented through both his reiteration of Romantic social commentaries, and the foundation of his works, topically and structurally in the learned style.
Conclusion

The problems inherent in the definition of a musical topic stem from the ambiguous categorisations offered by Ratner at the methodology’s inception in 1980. There have been numerous attempts at clarification, such as Hatten’s hierarchical classification system, and Mirka’s statement that topics are ‘musical styles and genres taken out of their proper context and used in another’. The aim of this thesis is not to resolve this ambiguity, although it does work from the premise that Monelle’s approach—his insistence on a historical trace for all known and new topics—is the most constructive. More significantly, rather than further defining topics, it has been shown that their signification expands past their ‘original’ conventions through their interaction with each other and the surrounding culture, in a sense fusing Monelle’s approach with Mirka’s. They evolve, just as any language evolves as the culture around them changes, which means that while a topic can superficially signify one thing, the cultural associations attached to that topic by its historical embeddedness provide multiple levels of meaning simultaneously: they are multivalent. Through rhetorical devices, such as irony or satire, their meanings become duplicitous, overturning their traditional associations. This is not to say that music can lie: George Steiner poses this philosophical riddle as he asks if ‘music, in its autonomy, can be false?’ In parentheses he adds: ‘[f]alse to what?’ and it is this that perhaps provides the answer. If music is understood within a specific cultural context, or learnt convention, the use of irony or a multiplicity of meaning subjects the topic to reversal. It is not false, but equivocal. A topic, therefore, can “mean” in precisely the same way as Freud’s heimlich “means” both homely and covert, both familiar and uncanny. The striking similarity between psychoanalysis and topic theory is the parallel between the overall musical narrative and Lacan’s chain-of-signifiers, or Freud’s “rebus”. Classical music is logical, based on developments easily followed even without the score, hence sonata form’s analogy with Aristotelian drama. With a fragmentation of musical language, one needs to piece together signification through disconnected, often seemingly nonsensical images, the significance of which often only becomes clear once all the pieces are in place, once the whole chain is present.

710 Mirka, “Introduction”, 2; italics in original.
711 George Steiner, Errata: An Examined Life (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997), 79.
712 Freytag, Technique of the Drama, 114–140.
The seeming stability of the significations suggested in chapters 1 and 2 is undermined by the multivalency of topics. The topical signification chart from chapter 2 (see Table. 6.1) therefore forms only a basis, a starting point from which to build a topical narrative. It would be impossible to show the extent of the signification of the Viennese topical universe demonstrated in this thesis in a structural diagram. However, that a chart could have been built in the first place puts in question whether the fragmentary nature of topical signification is actually a particularly Viennese quality, or whether the act of analysis has evolved along with the topics. In eighteenth-century music, topic analysis runs alongside conventional formal and diatonic methodologies and has mirrored their seeming stability. With different analytical techniques, or with a deeper understanding of the culture surrounding earlier musics, it may become clear that topics were always inherently unstable. For example, in an analysis of different settings of Mignon’s poem “Kennst du das Land”, including settings by Beethoven and Schubert, William Dougherty posits ‘that a poem’s pliability in the setting is virtual, because the music filters, limits, directs, modifies, or ignores the poem’s potential alternative interpretations’. This, he notes, takes place as ‘the musical fabric envelops the poem, [...] imposing its structure and mode of expression on the poetry’. However, although topics are used in Dougherty’s analytical workings, the main thrust of his argument centres on Paul Steven Scher’s concept of poetry’s ‘signifying potential’, rather than specifically topic theory, but his conclusions are similar, in that the poem is capable of multiple interpretations: an ‘intriguing diversity of interpretative paths’. In the musics examined in this thesis, then, music seems to aspire to the quality of poetry, in this sense at least.

The waltz introduces this simultaneity of meaning in Strauss’s Die Fledermaus. The relationship between the text and the music paints a satirical commentary that mirrors the duality of the culture, that is, the representation of the upper class as false, misleading and immoral. The waltz’s relationship with its predecessor, the Ländler, reflects the psychoanalytic concept of the double and the

---

713 As outlined in chapter 1 and posited by Caplin, “On the Relation of Musical Topoi to Formal Function”.
715 Ibid.
716 Ibid., 140.
primal trauma, as the waltz is seen in Mahler and Zemlinsky’s works as the civilised Ländler. The Ländler, therefore, signifies more than is shown in the structural diagram from chapter 2. It is not just a low-style dance topic associated with the pastoral, but a primeval form of the waltz, a representative of the uncivilised. The full rendering of the uncanny, however, is not seen until Schoenberg’s deployment of the uncanny as a topic, as outlined in chapter 4. While Lehár’s operetta continues to tackle external nationalistic questions through the evocation of the double, Schoenberg concentrates on the individual’s expression of his or her inner consciousness. As such, he moves away from the cultural norm, the traditional conventions used by Lehár to reach the widest audience to secure commercial success. The opposition between the rational and the uncanny in Mahler expresses a wish to escape from society, while in Schoenberg it expresses an inability to follow these rules: ‘[m]y destiny has forced me in this direction’, he complained. Surprisingly, the topical methodology has exposed Webern as situated more in external culture than Schoenberg was. Webern expresses the previous generation’s yearning for nature, their feeling of bourgeois alienation and acceptance of society’s constraints rather than forced derivation from them; he combined the radical and the revolutionary and made them conventional.

Table 6.1: The Topics Present c. 1928, Their Topical Classes and Associative Classes.

The discussion of fin-de-siècle Viennese culture here charts a relatively narrow chronological line, leading to the omission of works by other composers who might be deemed just as important to this argument as the ones selected, such as Franz Schreker, Egon Wellesz, Josef Matthias Hauer and Hanns Eisler, not to mention Alban Berg. The lack of space in this thesis accounts for their absence, but cursory analyses of a selection of works by these composers show that they contain topical signifiers of the double similar to the offered examples. As such, where appropriate, footnotes have been added to point to the presence of similar topical nuances in other works. There are also gaps, musically and topically, in the period preceding the starting point of this thesis. Both Monelle and Agawu have offered some views on topics in between the Classical period and 1890, where, with the exception of Die Fledermaus, this analytical treatment begins.\textsuperscript{718} However, Agawu merely provides a catalogue of what topics are detailed by which author, which, while demonstrating an expansion of the topical universe as scholars apply the methodology to different musics, does not suggest ways in which the topical universe interacts with the changes in the surrounding cultures. Monelle does detail how topics operate in works by Wagner and Mahler, and argues ways in which Romantic music acts semiotically, but his essays are not always specifically concerned with topical signification. Both scholars emphasise the works of Mahler: Agawu lists the topics other scholars have found, while Monelle devotes an entire

chapter to the composer in *The Sense of Music*. The existence of a precedent coupled with Mahler’s close association with the Second Viennese School meant that Mahler was an obvious starting point for the argument of this thesis; however, it does create a topical void between the eighteenth and the twentieth century. Looking forward, however, the presence of topics in the non-diatomic, seemingly “abstract” music of Webern opens the application of topic analysis up to music by composers such as Italian composer Luigi Nono, already mentioned in chapter 3 in connection with his use of the glockenspiel. The presence or absence of topics in German music post-1945 (where Nono’s music gained prominence) would provide a vital continuation of this pre- and inter-war cultural investigation. In Vienna, the *Anschluss* of 1938 saw many Jewish composers, writers and philosophers exiled. Beller, in *Vienna and the Jews*, demonstrates that a large proportion of major “famous” cultural figures were of Jewish descent, including Mahler, Freud and Schoenberg. Once these figures emigrated, then, the apparent question is whether Vienna lost its cultural context. If so, the music, and therefore the topical signification, may also have changed, possibly in reaction to the new cultural climate. If the topical signification remains, if the “Viennese-ness” demonstrated in the analysis of works up to 1928 is still inherent in the music, then its employment may reveal something of the response of post-war Vienna. Similarly, an exploration might be made of the works of exiled composers, the Austrian Jews who emigrated to America or Britain, many of whom went on to compose film music or musical theatre, such as the child prodigy Erich Korngold, who was known to Mahler and Richard Strauss. Korngold studied under Zemlinsky as a young boy and, alongside arranging and conducting operettas by Johann Strauss II, achieved success with his own operas. In 1938, after already composing film music in Hollywood, he returned to the USA and made a name for himself composing film scores. His saturation in the Viennese musical culture, particularly his close work with Johann Strauss’s compositions, means that one should find similar topical narratives in his works as have been studied in this thesis. However, once he had moved to Hollywood the expectation would be that these references would transform, integrating with an American topical sphere. The lack of a Viennese cultural context, particularly of an audience that understands that context, may cause the topics to deform, as they utilise signifiers with no referent. The nuances understood in the *Theatre an der Wien* may be misunderstood, or just missed by an American audience and so would disappear, replaced by the learnt conventions of new listeners. The intention of this thesis has been to addresses exactly this issue, aiming to make it possible for
listeners outside of the contemporary culture to hear and understand the Viennese topical conventions of this music by providing the historical trace imperative for a full understanding of the period.
Bibliography


———, “What the Sorcerer Said” *19th-Century Music* 12, no. 3 (Spring, 1989), 221–230.


———, “Gypsy Music or Hungarian Music?” *The Musical Quarterly* 33, no. 2 (1947), 240–225


Bergeron, Katherine, “The Echo, the Cry, the Death of Lovers” *19th-Century Music* 18, no. 2 (Autumn, 1994), 136–151.


Booker, Christopher, *The Seven Basic Plots: Why We Tell Stories* (London: Continuum, 2004).


———, “Three Ways to Read a Detective Story—Or a Brahms Intermezzo” *Georgia Review* 31 (1977), 554–574.


Daube, Johann F. *Anleitung zur Erfindung der Melodie und ihrer Fortsetzung* (Vienna: Funk, 1789).


Frigyesi, Judit, “Bela Bartok and the Concept of Nation and Volk in Modern Hungary” *The Musical Quarterly* 78, no. 2 (Summer, 1994), 255–287.


Gill, Graeme, *Bourgeoisie, State and Democracy—Russia, Britain, France, Germany, and the USA* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008).


———, Review of *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music* by Ramond Monelle. Notes 2, no. 3 (March, 1994), 1,002–1,004.


Kandinsky, Wassily, Complete Writings on Art, ed. Kenneth C. Lindsay and Peter Vergo (Boston: G.K. Hall, 1982).


———, Intertextuality in Western Art Music (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2005).
———, Music and the Crises of the Modern Subject (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2015).
———, and Nicholas Reyland, eds., Music and Narrative since 1900 (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2013).

———, “Suffering Children: Perspectives on Innocence and Vulnerability in Mahler’s Fourth Symphony” *19th-Century Music* 22, no. 3 (Spring, 1999), 233–267.


Mattheson, Johann, Der Vollkommene Capellmeister, trans. E.C. Harris (Hamburg: Herold, 1739).


Mayes, Catherine, “Reconsidering an Early Exoticism: Viennese Adaptations of Hungarian-Gypsy Music around 1800” Eighteenth Century Music 6, no. 2 (September, 2009), 161–181.


———, Review of Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music by Kofi Agawu; Music and Discourse: Toward a Semiology of Music by Jean-Jacques


Niekirk, Carl, *Reading Mahler: German Culture and Jewish Identity in Fin-de-Siècle Vienna* (Rochester: Camden House, 2010).


Notley, Margaret, “Brahms as Liberal: Genre, Style, and Politics in Late Nineteenth Century Vienna” *19th-Century Music* 17, no. 2 (Fall, 1993), 107–123.


Robertson, Gillian, “Variations on a Theme by Paganini: Narrative Archetypes in Nineteenth-and Twentieth-Century Theme-and-Variation Sets” (Phd diss., Florida State University, 2015).


Roth, Michael S., “Performing History: Modernist Contextualism in Carl Schorske’s *Fin-de-Siècle Vienna*” *The American Historical Review* 99, no. 3 (June 1994), 729–745.


———, “Generational Tension and Cultural Change: Reflections on the Case of Vienna” *Daedalus* 107, no. 4 (Fall, 1978), 111–122.


Schwarz, David, *Listening Awry: Music and Alterity in German Culture* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2006).


Seidlin, Oskar. “Eichendorff’s Symbolic Landscape” *PMLA* 72, no. 4 (September 1957), 645–661.


Starr, Mark, “Webern’s Palindrome” *Perspectives of New Music* 8, no. 2 (Spring/Summer, 1970), 127–142.


Swartz, Anne, “The Polish Folk Mazurka” Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae 1, no. 4 (1975), 249–255.


Venn, Edward, “‘Asylum Gained’? Aspects of Meaning in Thomas Adès’s Asyla” Music Analysis 25, nos. 1–2 (2006), 89–120.


Žižek, Slavoj and Mladen Dolar, Opera’s Second Death (New York: Routledge, 2002).